00109141

Digitized with financial assistance from
Government of Maharashtra
on 13 March, 2020

ROYAL COMMISSION ON THE PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA.

APPENDIX

TO THE

REPORT

OF

THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XV.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

relating to the following Departments:—

I. FOREST DEPARTMENT,
II. AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT,
III. CIVIL VETERINARY DEPARTMENT,
IV. SURVEY OF INDIA DEPARTMENT,
V. MADRAS SURVEY DEPARTMENT, and
VI. BURMA LAND RECORDS DEPARTMENT,

Taken at Delhi, Calcutta, Madras, Bombay and London,

WITH

APPENDICES.

Presented to both Houses of Parliament by Command of His Majesty.

LONDON:
PRINTED UNDER THE AUTHORITY OF HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE
BY JAS. TRUSCOTT AND SON, LIMITED, SUFFOLK LANE, E.C.

To be purchased, either directly or through any Bookseller, from
WYMAN AND SONS, LIMITED, 29, BREAMS BUILDINGS, FETTER LANE, E.C., and
28, ABINGDON STREET, S.W., and 54, ST. MARY STREET, CARDIFF; or
H.M. STATIONERY OFFICE (SCOTTISH BRANCH), 23, FORTH STREET, EDINBURGH; or
E. PONSONBY, LIMITED, 116, GRAFTON STREET, DUBLIN;
or from the Agencies in the British Colonies and Dependencies,
the United States of America and other Foreign Countries of
T. FISHER UNWIN, LIMITED, LONDON, W.C.

1915.

d. 7903.] *Price* 3*s.* 3*d.*

CONTENTS.

	PAGE.
I.—FOREST DEPARTMENT	1–190
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	2
Minutes of Evidence	3
Appendices	117
Index	159
II.—AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT	191–296
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	192
Minutes of Evidence	193
Appendices	257
Index	278
III.—CIVIL VETERINARY DEPARTMENT	297–352
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	298
Minutes of Evidence	299
Appendices	327
Index	343
IV.—SURVEY OF INDIA DEPARTMENT	353–406
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	353
Minutes of Evidence	354
Appendices	393
Index	399
V.—MADRAS SURVEY DEPARTMENT	407–428
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	407
Minutes of Evidence	408
Appendices	419
Index	424
VI.—BURMA LAND RECORDS DEPARTMENT	429–440
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	429
Minutes of Evidence	430
Appendices	434
Index	439

2,300. 8/15. J. T. & S.

ROYAL COMMISSION ON THE PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA.

APPENDIX

TO THE

REPORT

OF

THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XV.

109141

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

RELATING TO THE

FOREST DEPARTMENT,

Taken at Delhi, Calcutta, Madras, Bombay and London,

WITH

APPENDICES.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	2
Minutes of Evidence	3
Appendices	117
Index	159

LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION.

PAGE

At DELHI, Tuesday, 4th November, 1913.

P. H. CLUTTERBUCK, Esq., Conservator of Forests, United Provinces 3

At DELHI, Wednesday, 5th November, 1913.

G. S. HART, Esq., C.I.E., Inspector-General of Forests 7

G. O. COOMBS, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, United Provinces 15

L. MERCER, Esq., President of the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun 20

R. MCINTOSH, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Punjab 24

Pandit GOKUL DAS, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Punjab 27

At CALCUTTA, Monday, 19th January, 1914.

H. S. GIBSON, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bengal 30

Lalit Mohan SEN, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Bengal 33

G. E. S. CUBITT, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma 36

R. M. KAVANAGH, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma 41

At CALCUTTA, Tuesday, 20th January, 1914.

T. H. MONTEATH, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bihar and Orissa 46

R. G. A. HANNAH, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bihar and Orissa 49

W. F. PERREE, Esq., Officiating Conservator of Forests, Assam 53

Rai Bahadur Upendra Nath KANJILAL, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Assam 56

At MADRAS, Tuesday, 27th January, 1914.

F. A. LODGE, Esq., C.I.E., Conservator of Forests, Madras 59

M. R. Ry Rao Bahadur V. ALWAR CHETTY Garu, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Madras ... 70

At BOMBAY, Wednesday, 11th February, 1914.

G. P. MILLETT, Esq., Conservator of Forests, Bombay 74

N. D. SATARAVALA, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bombay 81

D. O. WITT, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces 84

Rai Bahadur SRINIVASALU Naidu, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces... ... 89

At LONDON, Monday, 4th May, 1914.

F. C. DRAKE, Esq., Secretary, Revenue and Statistics Department, India Office 92

At LONDON, Tuesday, 5th May, 1914.

Sir William SCHLICH, K.C.I.E., Professor of Forestry, University of Oxford 97

A. M. CACCIA, Esq., M.V.O., Director of Indian Forest Studies 100

At LONDON, Wednesday, 6th May, 1914.

Sir J. D. LA TOUCHE, K.C.S.I., Member of the India Council 106

At LONDON, Wednesday, 17th June, 1914.

William DAWSON, Esq., University Reader in Forestry, University of Cambridge 107

E. P. STEBBING, Esq., Head of the Department of Forestry, University of Edinburgh 111

ROYAL COMMISSION ON THE PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

FOREST DEPARTMENT,

At Delhi, Tuesday, 4th November, 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, ESQ., C.I.E.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, ESQ., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, C.S.I.

And the following Commissioners:—

M. HILL, Esq., Chief Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces.
G. T. WRAFTER, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Dehra Dun.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

P. H. CLUTTERBUCK, Esq., Conservator of Forests, United Provinces.

Joint written Statement relating to the Forest Department, containing the corporate opinion of the Imperial Forest Service Officers of the United Provinces.

66044. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—A large majority of officers consider that under the present system, the aim of which is that the recruit shall obtain an honours degree in natural science before entering on the forestry course, the recruits reach India at too late an age. This affects their whole service and is almost a more serious matter at the end than at the beginning. The majority, then, consider that the recruitment should be by means of nomination followed by a competitive examination between the ages of 18 and 20, of a nature to test a good general education, again followed by a course of training as noted in the next main head. The physical test formerly imposed as part of the competitive examination is thought to have been an excellent thing, and it seems that greater stress should be laid on physical fitness, in general, than at present.

A small minority of officers think the present method of recruitment preferable and that a rule for the prior possession of an honours degree in natural science obtained at a university is likely to ensure the recruitment of a body of men of greater general efficiency and larger breadth of view than can be expected from a class of younger men specialising in forestry and trained perhaps at a special institution.

66045. **(II) System of Training and Probation.** There is complete unanimity that the training of Indian Forest Probationers in England should be carried out at one residential institution. It is felt that now the efficiency of the Imperial Forest Service is being subordinated to the rivalries of the home universities.

The majority of officers of the United Provinces favour training at a university, and that university, Oxford.

It is believed that, with the method of recruitment favoured by the majority, it would be possible for the training to be so arranged that a certain number of probationers could take an honours degree in natural science more or less in combination with the forestry course, gain the diploma in the latter, and still be in India at the age of 22 or 23.

There is every desire that the recruits should come out with an education not inferior to that received by any members now in the service, and the advantage of the possession of an honours degree is fully appreciated, especially in these days when education looms so largely on the Indian horizon. If, however, a degree is taken it is felt that it should be obtained in a subject which may be of practical use in the Forest Officer's career.

Further, more attention should be devoted in the Forestry course to Engineering and also to Surveying, and perhaps less to some other subjects such as Entomology and Chemistry.

The present general arrangement of the practical training on the Continent is approved, but on no account should more than 3 months be spent in the first place visited in Germany; this will afford more time for the remainder of the tour and for the inspection of a greater variety of forests. More time might be spent in the French forests.

66046. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The meaning of this heading is not clear. If it refers to the terms of agreement under which Imperial Forest Officers enter the department, then no desire for any alteration of these terms has been expressed by officers.

If it refers to the physical and climatic conditions of forest life, it is pointed out that these are generally severe and unhealthy and that the life is solitary. The latter being the case, it is both reasonable and desirable that officers should marry. Facilities for their doing so depend largely on the conditions of pay, leave allowances and pension, and on the provision of a family pension fund.

66047. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The majority of officers consider that the pay of officers of all ranks is insufficient in view of the greatly enhanced cost of living, both in India and in England. It is also certain that the cost of living will continue to rise, whereas the recommendations of the Royal Commission as regards pay will not undergo revision for a long term of years.

Accordingly it is almost unanimously proposed—

(*a*) that the payment of officers below the rank of Conservator should commence at Rs. 400 and rise by annual increments of Rs. 50 to Rs. 1,500 in the twenty-third year of service, provided that no further increments beyond Rs. 1,250 be allowed to any officer who is not reported upon as fit for a Conservatorship. In view of the present block in promotion to Conservator's grade, which will probably become intensified in the near future and continue so thereafter, it seems just that this block should be met by giving additional increments to Deputy Conservators of more than 18 years' service who are classed as fitted to hold administrative appointments;

(*b*) that there should be two grades of Conservators only, on Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 2,500 respectively. The present salaries of officers holding administrative posts are very insufficient to enable them to maintain their positions suitably, and the present difference between the pay of Conservators and Deputy Conservators is not proportionate to the greatly increased expenses of the former; and

(*c*) that the pay of Chief Conservators be Rs. 3,000 and of the Inspector-General of Forests Rs. 3,500.

66048. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The present conditions, if modified by the alterations recently proposed by the Government of India, are suitable. To these, however, must be added:—

(*a*) that the minimum allowance for furlough and leave on medical certificate should be £500, or the salary last drawn on duty whichever may be less, and that the maximum allowance should be £1,000. In view of the enhanced cost of living in England it is not considered that an officer can maintain his position on less than £500 a year, and he should be allowed to draw up to £1,000 a year so long as his half pay justifies this limit; and

(*b*) that commutation of long leave on half pay to shorter periods on full pay be permissible, subject to suitable restrictions.

66049. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—If we may assume that the ordinary pension is reckoned to be deferred pay of one-quarter of the amount of the salary drawn on active service, the amount paid in pension compares poorly with the income derivable from the same amount if invested in a deferred annuity policy.

The present pensions allow only partially for the fall in the exchange value of the rupee and not at all for the increased cost of living in Europe. They also suffer by comparison with the pensions obtainable by the officers of the provincial forest service. It is earnestly represented that:—

(*a*) the pensions should be paid in sterling;

(*b*) that pensions should be graduated according to length of service in order to induce officers to remain in the service of Government at a time when their experience is of the highest value to Government;

(*c*) that ordinary pensions be paid according to the scale given below:—

	£
On completing 20 years' service ...	350
,, 21 ,, ...	380
,, 22 ,, ...	410
,, 23 ,, ...	440
,, 24 ,, ...	470
,, 25 ,, ...	500
,, 26 ,, ...	540
,, 27 ,, ...	580
,, 28 ,, ...	620
,, 29 ,, ...	660
,, 30 ,, ...	700

(*d*) that an additional special service pension of £40 per year of completed service be accorded to officers in the administrative grades, subject to a maximum total pension of £940 per annum;

(*e*) that an invalid pension of £150 per annum be given after 10 years' service and be allowed to rise by annual increments of £20 to £350 in the twentieth year; and

(*f*) that the above pension be granted irrespective of pay, or, as an alternative, that half average pay be converted into sterling at the rate of two shillings per rupee.

66050. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—Entry into the Imperial Service is open to non-Europeans under exactly the same conditions as to Europeans, except with reference to marriage, no alterations appear necessary or advisable.

The maintenance of the existing system of Imperial and Provincial branches in the United Provinces is essential, and no increase in the numbers of Provincial officers in the place of Imperial officers can be made without a loss of efficiency. The prospects of the Provincial Forest Service have been very greatly improved in the last few years, but while it is hoped and believed that with the spread of education sufficient recruits of good social, intellectual, and physical qualifications will hereafter be forthcoming, and while there is no desire at all to belittle the work done by the present staff of the Provincial Service, there is a firm conviction in the minds of officers of the Imperial Service that up to the present from one cause or another, and with very few exceptions, we have not succeeded in recruiting officers in the Provincial branch who can claim equality of position with those of the Imperial branch, or are capable of doing the work which the latter have to do. The course of training undergone by Imperial officers in Europe is of a much higher standard than anything possible in India in the present state of scientific forestry in the latter country.

66051. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil and other Services.**—The relations between the local Forest officers and the heads of the districts to whom they are subordinate call for little comment. The present system works well in the United Provinces.

66052. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission.**—With regard to such minor concessions as free steamship passages, free medical attendance for wives and children and increased travelling allowances on transfer, etc., it is considered that they are unimportant and unnecessary provided that the proposed scales of pay, leave allowances and pension, and the formation of a family pension fund are granted.

The institution of a family pension fund is strongly desired. The basis of this fund should be the compulsory deduction of 6¼ per cent. of an officer's pay augmented by an equal contribution from Government in lieu of the deferred pay which now lapses to Government in the event of the decease of officers who have not qualified for pen-

sion. Interest should be allowed at the rate of four per cent. and pensions fixed in accordance with actuarial figures.

Some officers are in favour of the continuance of the General Provident Fund in addition to the proposed family pension fund, but the majority agree that the latter is the more urgently required fund.

Mr. P. H. CLUTTERBUCK called and examined.

66053. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he represented his colleagues in the Imperial Forest Service in the United Provinces.

66054. His general view was that the maintenance of the division into Imperial and Provincial Services was absolutely essential. That view was not entirely based on the ground that facilities for training in India were inferior to those available in England and on the Continent. The chief reason was that the Indian had a dislike for hard physical work. In fact, most educated Indians thought it *infra dignitatem*. A Forest officer was really more or less a free agent; he had enormous areas to control and he could, if so inclined, slur his inspections, and perhaps not do them at all without anyone being very much the wiser. The Provincial Service did excellent work under direct supervision, but for independent charges they had been found very wanting. He considered that the present system produced less anomalies on the whole than the system which had been in force before the introduction of the Provincial Service in 1891. It was not a fact that the Extra Deputies were doing the same work and undertaking the same responsibilities as the Deputies. In the United Provinces there were three Extra Deputy posts, but at present there was only one Extra Deputy Conservator. The other two posts were vacant, because there was no one who could be certified as fit for holding a major charge. Moreover, the one Extra Deputy Conservator who now existed in the Province, was holding a major charge of comparatively very minor importance. It was not true to say that in previous years more Extra Deputies had occupied charges. These Extra Deputy posts had only been instituted on present lines during the last four years, so the system had not yet had time to develop except to the extent of the one charge to which he had just referred. If the standard of future recruits to the Provincial Service became as high as that of Imperial recruits, they would, of course, occupy charges similar in responsibility and work. The charges varied enormously, especially in the matter of area and revenue. But the Department had to do more than control major charges; in addition they had to carry out a great deal of scientific and working plan work, and this had to be done entirely by the Imperial Service. He was not aware that the present system caused any dissatisfaction amongst the Extra Deputy class. He had no doubt that at the present moment the men who were senior in the Extra Assistant grade were probably annoyed at not being promoted to Extra Deputyships, but there was a rule that until such men were certified fit, they could not be promoted. Even assuming that Indians went through a proper course of training in England and on the Continent for a proportion of vacancies in the Imperial Service, his opinion would still remain unaltered that Indians did not rejoice in physical work and would thus be handicapped. His idea was that whoever entered such a service as the Forestry Department should only do so if he was prepared to undertake hard physical work. That was probably the reason why the Department had never had a native of India in the Service, although it was open to them. The officers were recruited in England by a selection committee. If there was a large number of candidates, the Secretary of State might arrange for a competitive examination. He granted that anyone with obvious disqualifications would not be selected.

66055. With regard to the suggestion that the age limits should be reduced from 19 to 22 to 18 to 20, the witness said that he and his colleagues considered that the majority of officers came out to India too old. The quality of the recruits was excellent, but they were at a great disadvantage through coming out at 25, and in some cases at 26 years of age. Such men did not acclimatise easily and lost so much service. He thought the sooner a man came out after College the better. A man was quite old enough at 23 to face the rigours of the climate.

66056. In the witness's opinion the physical test for admission to the service was not sufficiently rigorous. The indications were that there were men in the Department who were not very strong and who gave signs that they might, under severe circumstances, fall ill. Up to five years ago there had been a rule that a man intended for the service should walk 25 miles across country with a walking champion in about five hours, submitting himself the next day to a very severe medical examination. He could not say why that rule had been abandoned. He was satisfied with the medical examination, but he would like to see the physical test revived.

66057. The preference for an Oxford training expressed by the majority of his colleagues was due to Sir William Schlich's presence there at that university. He thought it was unnecessary that the selected probationers should spend part of their training course on practical work in India. Indian forestry differed distinctly in certain respects from European forestry, and it had not reached such a high stage. All his colleagues were of opinion that it would be a very bad thing for the Continental training to be given up. The Continent was the only place in the world where ideal conditions of forestry could be seen and studied, and if a man came out to India without a knowledge of those ideal conditions, they would look upon Indian conditions as the best they had seen, and would not be able to aspire to the European standard. The present system was that a man went to one of the University centres, learnt the principles of forestry, then went for a course of training on the Continent, then came to India, and became attached for one year to a division under a selected officer. He thought that was a sufficient training. As a rule, most officers, after arrival in India, passed the Departmental test within a year, but it was open to them to pass as soon as they could. The Departmental test was considered to be sufficient.

66058. The reason for asking that there should be a difference of Rs. 500 between the pay of the Deputy Conservator and Conservator and the pay of the Conservator and Chief Conservator, was that at present a senior officer in charge of a division on Rs. 1,250 was much better off than a Conservator on Rs. 1,500. A Deputy Conservator on Rs. 1,250 was in charge of one district, whereas a Conservator on Rs. 1,500 had charge of a whole province, or of half a province. An additional Rs. 500 was asked for on the ground of extra travelling and increased expenses all round. The allowance made to the Conservator for travelling was at present Re. 1 a day more than the Deputy Conservator's allowance, and this was found to be absolutely inadequate. A Conservator toured for about seven months in the year, and, according to the country, he had either carts or camels. He had also sometimes to travel by train. With regard to the allowance for the transport of horses when going by train, the Government could sanction, under the Civil Service Regulations, two horses by rail, but special sanction had to be obtained in every case. He would not admit the possibility of reducing initial rates of salary if the age of arrival in India were reduced, nor would it modify his proposal in regard to increased salaries in the higher grades. One of the reasons why he wanted men to come out earlier was because the men who came out later lost so much in pay. When he came out at 21 he began on Rs. 250.

66059. Not many officers took advantage of the

option of retiring after 20 years' service. They could not afford it. He thought in any case that 20 years' service was rather too short a period to qualify for retirement. He considered it was a bad thing for the service if many men did go at 20 years' service, because after 20 years' experience a man ought to be one of the most valuable officers in the service. If the age of the recruit coming out was reduced, the argument for lengthening the qualifying period would be still stronger. Very few officers remained in the service after the age of 55. If they desired to do so, they would have to obtain special permission, which in the administrative rank was not very often granted. There were no sedentary posts in the service, except an occasional position like that of the Assistant Inspector-General of Forests, which could be held for two years. He did not think, if the scale of pensions were improved, that officers in the Forestry Service would be prepared to come into line with other Departments in regard to the period of service qualifying for optional retirement, if the limit laid down was above 25 years; but if the limit was fixed at 25 years he thought they probably would come into line. In his opinion a system which would provide for the payment of retiring allowances, partly in the form of pension, and partly in the form of a lump sum gratuity, would be very favourably considered. He could not say to what extent Forest Officers took advantage of the opportunity of contributing beyond 6¼ per cent. to the General Provident Fund, but he thought a considerable number gave more than the compulsory 6¼ per cent. His colleagues were very keen indeed on having a Family Pension Fund. The majority of officers would like such a fund to be in lieu of the Family Pension Fund. He did not think many officers would be prepared to contribute both to the Provident Fund and to a Family Pension Fund.

66060. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness said the total strength of the Imperial Branch of the Forest Service in the United Provinces was 19 officers, and there was a proposal for an addition of 13 more, making 32 in all. In the Imperial Service there were two Conservators and 17 Deputies and Assistants, and if the proposed increase was granted, there would still be two Conservators with 30 Deputies and Assistants. He admitted that there were a good many Indian Engineers who had to do a great deal of out-door work, but in reply to a further suggestion that if Indians could do the work of engineers they could also do the work of Forest officers; the witness urged that in addition to the argument he had previously put forward it was necessary to remember that engineering was an exact science. It was extremely simple to teach anyone an exact science, and also very easy to supervise men engaged in engineering work. Forestry was an inexact science, and success in forestry entirely depended on the individuality of the officer. If any Indian had a real leaning towards forestry work he could get into the service, and would probably do well.

66061. He had asked a good many educated Indians why they did not try to get into the service, and they had replied that in towns a Forest officer had not much standing.

66062 (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness said that until 1905 entry to the Forestry Department was by open competition. Under the present system of recruitment a science degree had recently been made a qualification for admission to the service. He had not been to a University himself, and was not able to say exactly up to what age a science degree could be obtained, but he understood that if the selected candidates were to go to the Universities at 18, it would be quite possible for them to join the service at 21 or 22 with a science degree and a Forest diploma, provided arrangements were made for taking the two courses concurrently. The proposal of the United Provinces officers was that there should be limited competition at 18 to 20 followed by a three years' course at a University, which would include a science degree. There was no support in the United Provinces for a proposal to establish a central institution other than a University. They thought it was advisable to have one institution, and that that institution should be Oxford.

66063. The present leave reserve in the United Provinces was more than adequate because officers could not afford to take much leave.

66064. The Provincial Service of the Forestry Department was at present recruited partly direct and partly by promotion of Rangers. He was of opinion that, eventually, recruitment from Rangers should be abolished except in cases of special merit, but it would be very unfair to take this step at once. At present the direct recruits to the Provincial Service were nominated by Government. He did not consider it would be desirable to have a system of competition for the Provincial Service because he thought more suitable men could be obtained by nomination. He thought the six months' practical test given to candidates for the Provincial service was suitable, and he would deprecate a proposal to reduce it to three months.

66065. The scale of pay which had recently been sanctioned for the Provincial Forest Service was quite adequate to attract a satisfactory class of recruit to that service.

66066. On the question of leave, the witness said that in his opinion, the proposal that Provincial Forest officers who had shown special merit should be allowed periods of study leave to Europe, was a very good one. On the other hand he did not think that satisfactory results would be obtained by recruiting a certain proportion of Indians in India for the Imperial Service and sending them to England to undergo the same course of training as the English recruits underwent.

66067. (*Mr. Madge.*) In reply to a question he thought the domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians in his Department were sufficiently energetic in their work; the witness replied that the domiciled European was a curious person, whose characteristics were well known. It was difficult to find domiciled Europeans who were really keen on hard physical work. There were no exceptions to that rule among the senior officers in the United Provinces, but it was hoped that new rules for direct recruitment would bring about some improvement. It was not true to say that since the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial divisions, all promotions from the Ranger grades to the Provincial Service had ceased; in fact it was just the reverse in his Department.

66068. The witness stated that it was not the fact that Indian forests in their magnitude and wealth of material afforded as good a training in scientific forestry as much as any other country in the world. Scientific forestry in India was in its infancy. His Department's one ideal was to try and introduce the highest system of scientific management into the quarter of a million square miles of forests which India possessed.

66069. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The witness said that his own personal view was that men in the Provincial Service would never be qualified to do the work of an Imperial officer. He would have no objection to some other division of the Service, say into a first and a second class, which would obviate the feeling which was generated by the use of the terms "Imperial" and "Provincial," provided only that the majority of the work was supervised by Imperial officers.

66070. (*Mr. Hill.*) The witness did not suggest that the increased salary for the Conservator should be given merely on account of travelling and other expenses. He thought the fact that a Conservator was at the head of his Department, was responsible to the Government, and was in charge of a great number of divisions, alone justified the increase. He had heard indirectly of cases where the smallness in the difference of emoluments as between Deputy Conservators and Conservators, and Conservators and Chief Conservators, had led to officers refusing a higher appointment. There were also cases within his own knowledge where Conservators had definitely stated that their appointment had involved financial loss.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Delhi, Wednesday, 5th November, 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, Esq., C.I.E.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

M. HILL, Esq., Chief Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces.
C. T. WRAFTER, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Dehra Dun.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

G. S. HART, Esq., C.I.E., Inspector General of Forests.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Service.

A.—IMPERIAL SERVICE.

66071. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—The present method of recruitment is by selection from among candidates who have obtained an honours degree in Science at the University of Oxford or Cambridge, or who have passed a similar examination at some other University in the United Kingdom, and who are under 22 years of age on the 1st of January of the year in which they present themselves for selection. Subsequent to this selection candidates may be required, at the discretion of the Secretary of State, to appear in a competitive examination. The Board of Selection consists of four members, viz., one member of the India Council (generally a retired Lieutenant-Governor), one officer appointed by the Government of India (generally a retired Inspector-General of Forests), one officer appointed by the India Office (generally a member of the English Board of Agriculture), and the Director of Indian Forests Studies (*ex officio*). Social, moral, and physical qualities are taken into consideration as well as educational attainments, and the composition of the Board is such that the main objection to selection, the chance of favouritism, is adequately guarded against.

All recruits that have arrived in India so far since the closing of the Royal Imperial Engineering College, Coopers Hill, have received the theoretical part of their training at the Oxford School of Forestry, and with the single exception that the average age at which the men reach India is too high, I consider that this method has been satisfactory. So far as I have seen we have secured an excellent stamp of man for the Service, and I believe it to be of the greatest importance that probationers should have received a substantial preliminary training in science before they devote themselves to the study of forestry, pure and simple. I am of opinion, however, that greater attention should be paid to physical fitness, and that for this purpose the physical test should be reintroduced and should precede the appearance of candidates before the medical and selection Board. This test, which consisted of some 20 to 25 miles across country at an average pace of about five miles an hour, was abolished in or about the year 1902. I think this abolition was a mistake, for I have heard complaints regarding the physical fitness of some of the men who have joined the Service in recent years, and I have myself met with one or two instances of this description. Medical examination may not be always sufficient, for it is of more than ordinary importance that recruits for the Forest Service should be thoroughly sound physically, and the test was no more than just enough to exclude those who were not so. It is impossible to express any opinion as regards the results likely to be attained in future under the system which permits probationers to undergo training at one of three or more Universities; but for various reasons, which will be mentioned in the second section of this memorandum, I consider that training at one institution is essential, and, therefore, I fear that the future results are unlikely to be as successful as those of the past.

Method recommended.—If it were possible to ensure the arrival of recruits in India at an earlier age and to revert to training at one institution, I should prefer to continue the selection of probationers from men who have taken science degrees, or passed suitable tests at one of the British Universities. But if this is impossible, I would fix the limits of age for probationers at from 18 to 20 years. I would insist on a physical test first of all, then on a stricter medical examination than at present, then on appearance before a Board of Selection, and then on a competitive examination followed by training at one institution. If this examination were framed so as to ensure that no one could pass it unless he had received a good preliminary training in science subjects, I believe that the necessary theoretical and practical courses in forestry, etc., could be carried out in two years. This would result in recruits joining the Service at an average age of between 21 and 22, which is the best time for a man to start his forest career in India. During the past five years the age of the recruits has averaged 24 years, as compared with an average age of 22½ in the case of the last five years recruited from Coopers Hill, and the former is too old. It means that the recruits do not easily settle down to the conditions of forest life in India, that they expect to be put in responsible positions sooner than is either possible or desirable, that they are unlikely to reach administrative rank until they are within a few years of 50, and that, if they are unlucky as regards promotion, they may even be unable to earn the extra pension which is granted for three years' approved service in the class of Conservator.

66072. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—Before joining the Service in India selected candidates have to obtain a University diploma in forestry and to undergo a course of practical training abroad, either as part of, or supplementary to, the diploma course. The theoretical portion of the diploma course can be taken at either of the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge, or Edinburgh. On arrival in India, the first year passed by the young forest officer is regulated by the orders issued by the Government of India in Circular No. 13.F.-85-2, of 10th May, 1911. These orders are that during this period he is to be considered as still under training, and that he should not usually be utilised for the ordinary purposes of forest administration: that his training should be carried out under a selected officer, or officers, and should include both active work in a division and a period of work at the headquarters of the circle: that he should tour in his own province and possibly visit selected forests in other provinces.

The question of practical training in India.—The question of substituting practical training in India for that now undergone in Europe has been raised on at least one occasion previously. Personally, I am strongly opposed to this suggestion. In the first place, I believe it to be essential that recruits for the Forest Service should have practical acquaintance with the best system of forest management, and this they cannot obtain out of Europe; while, secondly, I hold that on arrival in India young forest officers can best be employed studying the language and conditions of the provinces in which they are destined to pass a large part of their service.

The period of probation.—On the other hand, I am of opinion that, if the present method of recruitment is maintained, there is no necessity to insist on a fixed period of probation, or rather training, after a candidate has been selected and before he

joins the Service. It is quite possible for a student at the Universities to take the theoretical course required for the diploma of forestry along with the science course, and thus, previous to appearing before the Selection Board, to comply with all the Secretary of State's requirements, except the practical course on the Continent and the final examination in forestry. I consider that a man who is willing to go through the extra work to obtain these qualifications should be allowed to join the Service in India as soon as he has completed the practical course and passed the final examination. An alteration in the regulations to this effect would tend to induce men to obtain the extra qualifications previous to selection, would probably reduce the cost of training, and would lessen the average age at which the recruits arrive in India. Still, even if the method of recruitment is changed, there should be no hard and fast insistence on the recruits coming out to India as soon as they have complied with the requirements of the Secretary of State. Recently a few of the men who have shown special aptitude in particular subjects have been permitted to remain on in Europe for an extra year's study. I think that the continuance of this policy is likely to be of great advantage both to the men themselves and to the Service generally, and I would suggest that the necessary alteration be made in the regulations. The extra year spent in Europe should count as service and for pension, and the young officers selected for this purpose by the Secretary of State should receive the usual deputation allowance of two-thirds Indian salary *plus* actual travelling expenses.

Training at one institution.—In the previous section of this memorandum, I have stated my opinion that training at one institution is essential. I hold this opinion because I believe it to be most desirable that the details of technical training should be carried out on the same lines, and because the number of recruits required annually (normally eleven, but now reduced to five owing to previous over-recruitment) is too small to make it worth the while of more than one institution to provide a special course of training suitable for Indian conditions. It is, for instance, of the greatest importance that the training of officers for the Indian Service should comprise more detailed and thorough instruction in surveying and in forest engineering generally, than is given at present. I know that there is a general concensus of opinion that in these respects the training of the recent recruits is defective, and I doubt if it will be possible to remedy this state of affairs without special training at one institution.

66073. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—All the memoranda submitted by Forest Officers serving in the various Provinces lay stress on the fact that the conditions of forest life in India are unusually arduous and often unhealthy. Many of them also quote figures to show the very small proportion of men who have been able to last out the Service long enough to obtain their full pension. I concur in the opinion expressed that these conditions deserve special consideration in the matter of pay and pensions, but otherwise I do not propose to refer to these matters as the facts are notorious and unquestionable.

In addition, I think the conditions of service in the Department would be the better for alteration in the two following respects.

Allotment of recruits to Provinces.—During the past 15 years the 150 men who have joined the Service have been allotted to Provinces as follows:—

Province.	Number of recruits.	Men in first quarter of Lists.		Men in first half of Lists.		Men in 2nd half of Lists.		Men who held either first or 2nd place.	
		No.	Per cent.	No.	Per cent.	No.	Per cent.	No.	Per cent.
Bengal	14	1	7·1	3	21·6	11	78·6	1	7·2
United Provinces	16	11	68·7	14	87·7	2	12·5	11	68·7
Punjab	13	9	69·2	12	92·3	1	7·7	7	53·8
Burma	44	11	25·0	26	59·1	18	40·9	8	18·2
Eastern Bengal and Assam...	13	...	...	2	15·4	11	84·6	...	...
Central Provinces	17	7	41·2	15	88·2	2	11·8	3	17·6
Madras	14	...	...	...	...	14	100·0	...	...
Bombay	17	...	...	5	29·4	12	73·6	...	...
Bihar and Orissa	2	...	...	...	...	2	100·0	...	...
Total	150								

It is to be noted that in all but two cases the men who have gone to Madras have been the last men of their respective lists. Also that the popularity of service in Burma seems to have fallen off, for the eight men who were either first or second on their lists all belonged to the first nine years of the period: an examination of the figures for the last six years shows that Burma has had 28 recruits of whom four were in the first quarter of their lists, 14 in the first half, 14 in the second half, but none either first or second in their lists.

The present method of allotment is that, some six months before the men are expected to reach the country, the Government of India furnish the Secretary of State with a list shewing the distribution they propose to make and the recruits are then permitted to select the Provinces in which they wish to serve according to their standing in the final order of merit list.

The figures quoted above shew that some alteration in this procedure is desirable, more especially when it is remembered that the men who go to Madras and Bombay enter water-tight compartments from which they have a very slender chance of emerging and to which additions by transfers of other officers are equally unlikely. I suggest that the system should be assimilated to that in force in the case of the Indian Civil Service, namely, allotment by groups of provinces. As the number of men recruited annually for the forest service is small, it would be undesirable to have more than three groups which might conveniently be formed as follows:—

(*i.*) Upper India.—The Punjab, United Provinces, Central Provinces, Bihar and Orissa, Assam and Bengal.

(*ii.*) Burma.

(*iii.*) Madras and Bombay.

The first three men on the list should be obliged to elect for service in one or other of the three groups, in order of merit, and so on, the allotment to particular Provinces in groups (*i*) and to Madras and Bombay in group (*iii*) being made by the Government of India in accordance with requirements at the time being. This arrangement would ensure a more even distribution of the recruits, for though it does not necessarily follow that the men who come out at the top of the list will always do better than those below them, the chances are in that direction; also it would free the Government of India from the necessity of definitely deciding on the distribution to be made months before the men reach India, which, with a small Service like the Forest Department, is open to objection.

Transfers among officers.—The other matter in which I think a change is desirable is that of transfers of officers from Province to Province before they reach Conservator's rank. At present such transfers are exceptional and when they do occur they are generally due to the necessity of moving an officer on account of a break-down in his health. In such cases, or whenever a Province is called on to give up an officer for any other reason, I am afraid it is true that the Province in question discards the man whom it is most anxious to get rid of.

I am convinced that it would be to the benefit of the Service and of the officers themselves if transfers were more frequent and if it were understood that the men so transferred were not the undesirables, but those who had distinguished themselves by their ability and energy and marked themselves out as likely to make good administrative officers. Transfers of this kind would have to be regulated by the Government of India and might be carried out on the return of officers from leave. Under these conditions the standard of divisional work in Provinces should improve, the climatic advantages and disadvantages of Service in different Provinces would be distributed more fairly, Conservators would usually have experience of work in at least two Provinces before taking charge of a circle and there would be a greater exchange of ideas and experience, all of which would, I think, be of general benefit to the progress of Forest administration in India. Now that the Service has a time-scale of pay, the only reasonable objection to this proposal that I know of is the difference in the vernaculars of the various Provinces. Undoubtedly, this is a difficulty, but it is not insurmountable. Transfers of this kind have been made from time to time in the past without giving rise to grave inconvenience and, in any case, it is no great hardship for a man to be obliged to pass by the lower standard in a new language.

I think, myself, that if this principle is accepted it should be applied to Madras and Bombay as well as to the Provinces directly under the control of the Government of India. But this could hardly be done without, at the same time, placing the selection of officers for Conservatorships in Madras and Bombay under the Government of India.

66074. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—At present officers of the Imperial branch join the Service on a salary of Rs. 380 per mensem and rise by annual increments of Rs. 40 to Rs. 700 per mensem, thereafter, they rise by annual increments of Rs. 50 to Rs. 1,250 per mensem in the 20th year of service. There are three grades of Conservator of Forests, who receive Rs. 1,500, Rs. 1,700, and Rs. 1,900 respectively. Chief Conservators (in Burma and the Central Provinces only) receive Rs. 2,150 per mensem, and the salary of the Inspector-General of Forests is Rs. 2,650 per mensem.

The pay of the executive grades.—The last permanent promotions to the class of Conservator were gazetted in Government of India Notifications, No. 767, f. 232-2, dated the 13th August, 1913, and No. 788, f. 220-4, dated the 15th August, 1913, and concerned the two first men of the batch which joined the Service at the end of 1889, who therefore had nearly 24 years' service before they received substantive promotion to administrative rank. It is, I think, certain that in future men will not become Conservators with less than 24 years' service. Indeed, I fear that this figure is likely to be exceeded, for though it is possible that one or two more administrative appointments may be created during the next few years, it is still more certain that correspondingly greater additions must be made to the general strength of the Service. During coming years the development of the forests in India is likely to proceed much more rapidly than it has in the past, and though the Imperial forest staff is now slightly over strength in almost every Province, complaints as to the want of officers are constant, and it is known that at least four Local Governments are considering schemes of reorganisation involving increase in the forest staff.

The officers now in the early years of their service will be about 44 years of age before they obtain a salary of Rs. 1,250 per mensem, and may be anything from 47 to 50 before they receive further promotion. I venture to think that if, in addition to the generally arduous and unhealthy condition of service, due consideration be given to the highly specialised nature of the training, to the rate of promotion to administrative rank, to the later age at which men now enter the Service, to the higher standard of work, both as regards quantity and quality, now required from Forest officers, to the immense value of the property for the management and development of which the officers of the Service are primarily responsible, and to the greatly increased cost of living in India, which makes it more and more difficult every year for an officer to provide for the proper education of his children in England, there can be little question that these emoluments are insufficient for an officer of the class concerned. Accordingly, I submit that the following minimum scale should be substituted for that now in force:—

Grade.	Year of service.	Pay per mensem. Rs.
Assistant Conservator ...	1st ...	400
,, ...	2nd ...	450
,, ...	3rd ...	500
,, ...	4th ...	550
,, ...	5th ...	600
,, ...	6th ...	650
,, ...	7th ...	700
Deputy Conservator ...	8th ...	750
,, ...	9th ...	800
,, ...	10th ...	850
,, ...	11th ...	900
,, ...	12th ...	950
,, ...	13th ...	1,000
,, ...	14th ...	1,050
,, ...	15th ...	1,100
,, ...	16th ...	1,150
,, ...	17th ...	1,200
,, ...	18th ...	1,250
,, ...	19th ...	1,300
,, ...	20th ...	1,350
,, ...	21st ...	1,400
,, ...	22nd ...	1,450
,, ...	23rd ...	1,500

With the present age of entry to the Service this scale would give an officer a salary of £1,200 a year at an age of about 46 years, a remuneration which can hardly be considered as extravagant, even if there is no further increase in the present cost of living in India and of education at home. If this scale were granted, I would suggest that no further increment should be given after Rs. 1,250 to officers declared to be unfit to hold charge of a Circle, or after Rs. 1,400 to officers who have not been definitely declared suitable for promotion to administrative rank by the time they reach that salary.

The pay of the administrative grades.—In their despatch No. 371, dated 2nd November, 1905, the Government of India proposed that the pay of the administrative grades should be as follows, excluding exchange compensation allowance which was to be continued:—

	Per mensem. Rs.
Third grade Conservator ...	1,500
Second ,, ,, ...	1,750
First ,, ,, ...	2,000
Chief Conservator	2,250—50—2,500
Inspector-General	3,000

But with the exception of third grade Conservators the salaries now in force are less than the above while exchange compensation allowance has been discontinued in all cases. Apart altogether from the question of raising the limit of pay of the time scale for the executive grades, I venture to hold, and indeed I know from personal experience that a salary of Rs. 1,500 per mensem is quite insufficient to enable an officer to maintain his position as a Conservator and to meet the necessary expenses connected with the maintenance of his

family. I regard Rs. 1,750 per mensem as the minimum upon which this can be done with the moderate comfort which an officer who has gained this position after many years' strenuous service is entitled to expect. I submit, therefore, that the three grades of Conservator of Forests should be paid at the monthly rates of Rs. 1,750, Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 2,250, and that the pay of Chief Conservators and of the Inspector-General should be Rs. 2,500, rising by annual increments of Rs. 100 to Rs. 3,000 and Rs. 3,000 rising similarly to Rs. 3,500, respectively.

66075. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—Certain alterations in the leave rules were proposed some little time ago by the Government of India and are believed to be still under consideration. If these proposals are carried into effect the conditions of leave will be improved considerably, but the following additional improvements appear to me to be desirable:—

(*i*) In cases where, owing to the exigencies of the public service, Government is obliged to refuse the grant of leave when due, the officers concerned should be permitted to accumulate privilege leave without limit until such time as leave can be given to them.

(*ii*) A minimum furlough allowance should be fixed, as in the case of members of the Indian Civil Service. In accordance with the ratio adopted for the maxima allowances (four-fifths) this minimum should be £400 a year, or the pay last drawn on duty whichever is less. The present minimum of £200 a year—and this only on production of a medical certificate—is so small that officers who, in the interests of their health, should take leave are obliged to remain on or return to duty at all costs.

(*iii*) The maximum limit of £800 a year should be raised to the £1,000 a year fixed in the case of the Indian Civil Service. There is no difference in the manner in which officers of the other European Services and of the Indian Civil Service have to maintain themselves and their families when on leave in England, for all come from the same social class. There is no reason therefore why the few officers belonging to the other Services who are in receipt of salaries sufficient for half-pay (converted at the rate of 1s. 6d. to the rupee) to exceed £800* a year should be penalised while on the furlough which they have earned, more especially as officers of the Indian Civil Service become entitled to this maximum much earlier in their service than officers of other departments.

66076. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The present conditions of pension are:—

(*i*) After 20 years' service—Rs. 4,000 per annum.

(*ii*) After 25 years' service—Rs. 5,000 per annum.

(*iii*) An additional sum of Rs. 1,000 per annum to officers who have shown special energy and efficiency during an effective service of 3 years as Inspector-General, Chief Conservator or Conservator provided that voluntary retirement does not take place before the completion of 28 years of qualifying service, unless the officer concerned joined the Department on or before 31st December, 1909, and has rendered 3 years' active service in an appointment not below the first grade of Conservators.

Reasons why these pensions are insufficient.—I consider (*ii*) and (*iii*) of the above rates of pension to be insufficient for three main reasons. In the first place these pensions, which at the conversion rate of 1s. 9d. per rupee are equal to £437 10s. and £525, respectively, do not represent a living wages under present conditions to officers who have been recruited in England and who have spent from 25 to 33 or 34 years in the Service of Government. The pay of the Service is such that if an officer marries and has children, as most men do, it is impossible for him to save to any extent worth mentioning. Indeed, if an officer succeeds in providing for the education of his children, for occasional visits to England, and for reasonably moderate life insurance, and then at the end of his service is able to leave the country without debt and with a few hundred pounds in his pocket, I think he may be considered to have done fairly well. Unless, therefore, an officer has private means the best he can look forward to on retirement is to spend the remainder of his life in comparative indigence and in a perpetual struggle to make both ends meet. If at the time of retirement he has still to provide for the education of children, comparative indigence must become actual. In the second place, the sterling value of these pensions is less now than it was at the time they were fixed very many years ago, when the value of the rupee was two shillings. As in the meantime Government has found it necessary to raise salaries paid in India, owing to great increase in the general cost of living, this state of affairs appears to be indefensible. Thirdly, it is not fair that an officer of the Imperial Service who for any reason is unable to qualify for the extra pension, should only receive the same pension as officers of the Provincial Service, who, under the recent re-organisation, can obtain a pension of Rs. 5,000 per annum, after two years' service in the top grade of Extra Deputy Conservator.

Recommendations.—I venture to urge, first of all, that the pensions for the Imperial branch of the Service, and indeed for all Home-recruited Services, should be fixed in sterling. Officers, who are born and recruited in Great Britain, must be expected to return to their own country at the end of their service and, this being so, it seems anomalous that their pensions should be fixed in anything but the currency of that country.

As regards the amount of the pensions I consider that it would be inadvisable to increase the first pension of £350 per annum for optional retirement after 20 years' service. In point of fact few men have availed themselves of this pension in the past, and in any case it is not in the interests of the Service that Government should hold out any further inducements for retirement at an age when its officers are probably commencing to reach the stage of their greatest utility. Indeed, if it were not for my belief that the possibility of taking this early pension is an aid to recruitment, I should be prepared to advocate its abolition in the case of future entrants to the Service. For the rest, I am strongly in favour of graduating pensions in accordance with length of service, so that there may be inducements to the best men to remain in service and not to retire at a time when for administrative purposes they are most useful to Government, and, at the same time, of giving Government the power to retire compulsorily officers who are comparatively, or actually, inefficient as soon as they have qualified for a reasonable pension. Therefore, I would recommend the following scale:—

	Per annum.
After 20 years' qualifying service ...	£350
After 25 years' qualifying service ...	500
After 30 years' qualifying service, or after 25 years' service and 3 years' approved service as Conservator ...	650
Extra for 3 years' approved service as Chief Conservator or Inspector-General of Forests	100

If this scale of pensions is sanctioned, I would give Government the power to retire compulsorily any officer who after a service of, or exceeding, 25 years is declared unfit to hold charge of a Circle, and of any Conservator who, after 3 years' service in the class of Conservator, is similarly considered unfit for promotion to the post of Chief Conservator.

Medical pensions.—Pensions granted to officers who are obliged to retire under medical certificates of unfitness for further service should be more liberal than those which are admissible under the present rules. I would urge that with 10 years' completed qualifying service an officer so retired should receive £200 a year, and that the pension should rise by annual increments of £20 to £400 at 20 years' service. I can see no reason why an officer, who with this length of service is

* Only officers drawing over Rs. 1,750 per mensem.

compelled to retire on account of a complete breakdown in his health, should not be treated more liberally than a man who retires voluntarily because he has no wish to serve Government further. Similarly, I think that if the scale of ordinary pensions is graduated according to length of service, the invalid pensions between 20 and 25 years' service and between 25 and 30 years' service, should increase proportionately also.

66077. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial Branches.**—The present constitution of the Department is:—

(*a*) *The Imperial Service.*—Recruited in England by the Secretary of State comprises 80 per cent. of the upper controlling staff, *i.e.*, the staff required for the management of forest charges, classed as major, *plus* the usual allowance for leave, training, etc.

(*b*) *The Provincial Service.*—Recruited in India and with few exceptions trained at the Forest College, Dehra Dun. Comprises the remainder of the upper controlling staff and the whole of the lower controlling staff, *i.e.*, the staff required to hold charges classed as minor.

(*c*) *The Subordinate Service.*—Indians are eligible for appointment to the Imperial Service under exactly the same condition as Europeans, except that the restriction against previous marriage is withdrawn in their favour. In my opinion it is unnecessary to make any change in the existing regulations with the object of still further facilitating the entry of Indians into the Imperial Service. For many years past numbers of Indian youths have visited England with the object of completing their education and gaining admission to one or other of the Indian Services, but very few have made any attempt to enter the Forest Service. It would seem that the solitary and rough conditions under which the Indian Forest Officer has to pass a large proportion of his service, coupled with the moderate emoluments obtainable, do not attract Indians who are sufficiently highly educated to comply with the tests for entry to the Imperial Service.

The Forest Department is a scientific service in which the evil effects of even comparative inefficiency are more lasting and more difficult to repair than in the case of purely administrative Services. Again, it is not possible to obtain in India training in forestry, which can be compared to that given to the probationers selected at home, and this state of affairs will continue until the practice of Indian forestry reaches the level attained in Europe. Therefore, although I have no reason to urge against the admission to the Imperial Service of Indians who qualify themselves under the same regulations as apply to Europeans, I think it is essential to maintain a sharp line of division between the Imperial and Provincial Services.

66078. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—In all parts of India with which I am acquainted the relations between Forest Officers and Officers of the Indian Civil Service and other Services are perfectly satisfactory. It is essential that the Forest Officer, while having comparative freedom of action in purely professional matters, should be subordinate to the Revenue Officer in all matters that affect the welfare of the people. From the representation submitted by Madras Forest Officers, it would appear that the conditions in that province may not be altogether satisfactory.

66079. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—(i) Allowances on transfer should cover the actual cost of transport of an officer's family and private effects, subject to reasonable limits.

(ii) Government should institute a widows and orphans fund instead of the existing provident fund. The scheme should be worked out on actuarial principles to yield pensions of from one-half to two-thirds of those guaranteed to the Indian Civil Service.

B.—Provincial Service.

66080. I do not propose to deal with the Provincial Service in detail under each of the nine heads which have been mentioned in connection with the Imperial Service, but there are certain matters in connection with which I think that modification of the existing regulations is desirable.

66081. **(II) Systems of Training and Probation.**—The length of the period of probation after passing through the two years' course of training at the Forest College is left to the discretion of Local Governments. Considering that candidates selected for direct appointment are put through a course of at least six months' preliminary practical training in the jungles before they join the College, and that, if they prove incapable of following the College course satisfactorily, the President has power to reject them at any time, I consider that a further probation of one year is sufficient. At the end of that time, if their work has been satisfactory, I think they should be appointed substantively to the Provincial Service, being regarded as supernumerary if there is no vacancy in the sanctioned cadre.

66082. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—Under the rules an officer of the Provincial Service cannot be promoted to be an Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests until a vacancy occurs. The number of Extra Deputy Conservators in any province bears no ratio to the number of Extra Assistant Conservators, but is fixed at 20 per cent. of the "major" charges. I have known cases in which this bears hardly on deserving officers, and I believe that this state of affairs will be still more pronounced in future, for, as forest administration develops, it will be necessary to increase the number of assistants to Divisional Forest Officers. It is true that the rules provide for the grant of personal allowances to officers who are considered fit for advancement to the class of Extra Deputy Conservator, but for whom no vacancies exist. These allowances, however, are not as good as the time-scale, while naturally the men concerned desire to reach the class of Extra Deputy Conservator. I think, therefore, that it would be fairer to make the time-scale continuous, subject to a provision that increment should cease at a certain point unless an officer is declared fit to hold a "major" charge. The scale which I would suggest is as follows:—

Grade.	Year of Service.	Salary. Rs.
Extra Assistant Conservator ...	1 ...	250
" " " ...	2 ...	270
" " " ...	3 ...	290
" " " ...	4 ...	310
" " " ...	5 ...	330
" " " ...	6 ...	350
" " " ...	7 ...	370
" " " ...	8 ...	390
" " " ...	9 ...	410
" " " ...	10 ...	430
" " " ...	11 ...	450
" " " ...	12 ...	470
" " " ...	13 ...	490
" " " ...	14 ...	510
" " " ...	15 ...	530
" " " ...	16 ...	550*
Extra Deputy Conservator ...	17 ...	600
" " " ...	18 ...	625
" " " ...	19 ...	650
" " " ...	20 ...	675
" " " ...	21 ...	700
" " " ...	22 ...	725
" " " ...	23 ...	750
" " ...	24 ...	775
" " " ...	25 ...	800
" " " ...	26 ...	830
" " " ...	27 ...	860
" " " ...	28 ...	890
" " " ...	29 ...	920
" " " ...	30 ...	950

* No further increment unless declared fit to hold a "major" charge.

66083. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—(i) Privilege leave should be accumulative under the same conditions as recommended for the Imperial Service.

(ii) One year's furlough should be granted after eight years' service, and an additional year after every six years' further service. Three years in 30 should count as service qualifying for pension, whether spent in or out of India. A minimum furlough allowance of Rs. 200 per mensem should be granted.

66084. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—There appears to me to be no necessity to increase the present maximum pension of Rs. 5,000 per annum. But retirement on medical certificate of unfitness for further service should be permitted after 20 years' service and should be optional without any such certificate after 25 years' service. In both cases the pension permissible should be one-half of the average salary of the last three years' service, and, in the case of retirement on medical certificate between 20 and 25 years the pensions should increase in accordance with salary.

Mr. G. S. Hart called and examined.

66085. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he arrived in India in 1887, and served in the Punjab for 18 years. In 1906 he went to the Central Provinces as a Conservator, and was transferred to a similar appointment in Bengal at the end of 1908. In June, 1910, he returned to the Central Provinces as Chief Conservator, and was appointed Inspector General in April of the present year. His present duties were to advise the Government of India on all forest matters which came before them, to control working plans, and to inspect forests generally all over India, except in Bombay and Madras, with which presidencies he had nothing to do, unless his advice was specially asked for.

66086. The duty of a Conservator was to take charge of a circle. He had under him a certain number of divisions manned by divisional officers and the ordinary staff. The duty of a Chief Conservator was to act as adviser to the Secretariat in forest matters, and also to exercise general control over the circles. In the Central Provinces the appointment of Chief Conservator was first made temporarily for five years, but at the end of that time the Government decided that its retention was essential. A Deputy Conservator, unless he was on special duty, such as working plans, was in charge under the orders of the Conservator, of a Forest Division, which might extend from 100 to 1,500 or 2,000 square miles of forest. There was a great difference in the responsibility and work of the various divisions. An Assistant Conservator might be attached to a division, or he might frequently be in charge of a division. Promotion from the grade of Assistant to that of Deputy Conservators depended entirely upon length of service. Asked what was the earliest date at which an Assistant Conservator was placed in a responsible position the witness replied that the Department was so short-handed at the present time that an Assistant Conservator had been put in charge of a division after eighteen months' service, but normally it was preferable that he should not be given a charge until after four years' service. The Provincial Service consisted of Extra Assistant Conservators and Extra Deputy Conservators and before he could be promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy an officer had to be certified as fit to hold a major charge. The forest charges in a Province were divided into major and minor charges, and 80 per cent. of the major charges would be held by Imperial officers. There would also be special charges and 25 per cent. would be added for leave and training. Twenty per cent. of the major charges and a certain proportion of minor charges belonged to the Provincial Service, and a reserve of 14 per cent. was allowed for leave and training. The officers of the Provincial Service were recruited for an entirely different class of work from that discharged by the Imperial Officers. They were recruited for minor charges and to carry out the duties of assistants, but to the extent of 20 per cent. of the major charges might be promoted after long and meritorious service to what was called the upper controlling staff. Not all the appointments of Extra Deputy Conservator assigned to the Provincial Service had been filled up. For instance, Bengal had one such post, but it was not filled up; the United Provinces had three which were filled up; but two of the officers were on deputation. The Punjab had two posts filled up; Burma had 19 posts, of which 14 were filled; Bihar and Orissa had three, all filled up; Assam had two, both filled; the Central Provinces had six, all filled; Madras had eight vacancies, of which six were filled; and Bombay had five, all filled.

66087. Replying to a question as to what amount of accuracy there was in the statement that the posts filled by extra Deputies were of exactly the same responsibility and same onerous work as those filled by the Imperial Officers, the witness said that a certain percentage of the major posts were set aside for the best officers in the Provincial Service, but they were not promoted to them until they had served from 16 to 25 years. These officers occupied positions of exactly the same responsibility as their colleagues in the Imperial Service.

66088. On the question of recruitment, the witness said he thought it would be unnecessary under present conditions for the Secretary of State to arrange for a competitive examination subsequent to nomination, but if recruitment was at an earlier age, he did think competition would be necessary. In his opinion, the ideal age for a young Forest officer to reach India was as soon after 21 as possible. He would so frame the syllabus of the examination that no candidate would have any chance of success unless he possessed a good grounding in natural science. That was the old system, and he thought excellent results had accrued from it. He did not think an Honours degree in Science was in any way necessary provided that a man had received a sufficient grounding in natural science. He would like to see the revival of the physical test which had been abolished some years ago. He could not say why this test had been abolished. He had met men who would not have got into the Service had it been continued.

66089. He would be very strongly opposed to the substitution of practical training in India for the training at present undergone in Europe, his reason being that there were no forests in India which had been treated on scientific principles for two or three hundred years. He was further of opinion that, during his first year, an officer should concentrate his attention on language and local conditions. He laid the greatest stress upon the seven month's course of training in the Continent. The whole period of training in Europe was so important that he would not diminish the year and five months spent in England in order to give more time in India. At present the rate of recruitment for the Indian Forest Service was only five per annum. That was an argument in favour of having all candidates trained at one centre, as it was out of the question to suppose that two or three institutions could each employ a special staff to train at the most 15 recruits a year. He thought Oxford provided as good facilities for teaching survey and forest engineering as any other place in England.

66090. On the subject of the employment of Indians, the witness pointed out that up to the present time the service had always been open to Indians, subject in the old days to competitive examination, and more recently to selection by the Secretary of State; but they had never shown any great desire to get into the Service. With two exceptions no Indians had either passed the competitive examination or been nominated by the Secretary of State. The Service did not seem to

appeal to Indians to any great extent. He thought that for the purposes of the Forest Department greater efficiency was secured from the European; but if it was necessary to provide greater facilities for the entry of Indians into the Service, he was of opinion that open competition in India would be quite useless. If the Government found it absolutely necessary to recruit Indians, a system of nomination combined with competition would be the most successful method. Asked whether he saw any advantage or disadvantage in a scheme of organisation for the Forest Service which would provide for the employment of two classes of officers, one for the superior work and the other for the inferior work, thereby getting rid of the anomalies which at present seemed to exist in the Service, the witness replied that he would prefer to see things left as they were, with a possibility of having to take a certain number of specially good Indians for the Imperial Service. He could not suggest any means of getting rid of the grievance which undoubtedly existed amongst some of the officers of the Service in regard to the Extra Deputy class. It did occur in practice that a senior member of the Provincial Service was placed under a junior member of the Imperial Service, but he was not aware that this had given rise to friction. He would be against promoting Provincial officers into the Imperial cadre as an alternative to direct recruitment in India for the Imperial Service. He presumed that promotion under such a system would go to senior Provincial officers with exceptional qualifications, and there would be great difficulty in carrying out the scheme in practice. In his opinion the Provincial officers had been very well treated in the recent reorganisation of the Provincial Service subject to one or two small exceptions to which he had referred in his memorandum. He thought it was advisable to keep the two services quite distinct, and, if necessary, to recruit Indians specially for the Imperial Service. He did not see how the anomalies to which attention had been called could be avoided.

66091. The present system of recruitment for the Provincial Service the witness considered to be satisfactory. It was of great importance that the Service should be recruited to a great extent by promotion from deserving officers of the subordinate Service. Local Governments had this matter in their own hands, and up to the present time a very considerable number had been promoted. It seemed unnecessary to tie the hands of local governments by making a rule that a fixed proportion of vacancies should be reserved to the Ranger class, but personally he thought that at least one-third of the vacancies should be so reserved. The practical training given in the various Provinces to direct recruits for the Provincial Service prior to their selection was quite satisfactory, and the training of Provincial officers at Dehra Dun was the best that could be given under present conditions. He thought that the standard was steadily improving. Burma and Madras were the only Provinces which had colleges for training Rangers, the remainder being trained at Dehra Dun, but all Provinces except Bihar and Orissa had a small school of their own for the training of lower subordinates.

66092. Turning to the question of pay, the witness explained that he was proposing increased rates, not on the ground that the present rates were attracting an unsuitable class of recruit, but because promotion in the future would be much slower than it had been in the past. It was not likely in the future that a man would rise to the rank of Conservator with less than 24 years' service, and the present time scale stopped at the twentieth year. If the initial rate of salary were reduced below its present limit on account of the age being reduced, it would considerably interfere with recruitment. In his opinion, moreover, Conservators were worth more than they were now paid. In India there was a total area of 242,960 square miles of forest land in charge of the Service. There were 21 Conservators' charges, including one charge in Sind which was held by a Deputy Conservator. The average area of each charge of forest was 11,570 square miles. The total revenue of the Service was 290 lakhs. The average revenue was about 13 lakhs per circle; the average expenditure was 8 lakhs and the average surplus 5 lakhs per circle. He thought an officer who, after 24 years' service obtained a charge of that description, was at least worth the pay which was given to a Deputy Commissioner of a district. The pay now authorised for the Provincial Service was adequate, in his judgment, to attract the right kind of candidate. He would, however, like to improve present conditions so far as to allow Provincial officers to advance to the pay of Extra Deputy Conservators irrespective of vacancies, and subject only to fitness for promotion to the higher rank. The number of Extra Deputy Conservators' posts in a Province depended upon the number of major charges. It was only 20 per cent. of the major charges, and had no reference to the total number of posts in the Provincial Service. A case had occured recently in which a local Government had appointed eight new officers to the Provincial Service, thereby adding eight men to the number of Extra Assistant Conservators, and under the present system no addition could be made to the number of extra Deputies. That meant that there would be an enormous block in promotion in future years.

66093. Regarding leave and training reserves, the witness stated that the present reserve was adequate, but if the new rules laid down a fixed percentage of officers who could be on leave at any one time, the question might require reconsideration. Officers could obtain study-leave under certain rules laid down in the Forest Code. Recently the rules had been relaxed, with the result that more officers were now taking advantage of the concession. He agreed that in proportion as the higher specialisation of officers assumed greater importance, study-leave would be taken to a much greater extent.

66094. The witness regarded the present pension scheme as entirely inadequate, and thought improvement of pension conditions would be of far greater importance to the Service than improvement of pay. The option of retiring at 20 years was not taken advantage of to any very great extent, and he thought it distinctly unfortunate in the interests of the Service that a competent man should have an option of retiring after 20 years' service. The effect of the concession, especially if the age of entry was reduced, was to allow an officer to retire in the prime of life. He would be prepared to lay down the principle that if an officer was given an option to retire after a certain period of service, the Government should have the same unreserved power to retire him after the same term of service.

66095. The witness expressed the view that a Family Pension Fund in substitution for the existing Provident Fund might be usefully established for future entrants to the Service. There might also be Provident Fund in addition up to a certain percentage on salary. He thought it unlikely that the majority of officers would take advantage of both funds. The Family Pension Fund scheme he had in view was based on the same principles as the Indian Civil Service Fund: but if this was impossible he would accept the principle of Government management without Government contribution.

66096. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The witness admitted that it was rather early to judge of what the value of the Provincial Service, recruited as it was being recruited at the present time, would be in the future. He also agreed that the Forest Service was one in which it was far more difficult to judge of the value of a man by any examination or test to which he might be subjected, than by the result of work actually done under supervision. Experience accounted for much more than book-learning in the case of an officer of the Forest Service.

66097. The Department at present was being run on an extremely small cadre. The area of a German Forest division was anything from 15 to 20,000 acres, whereas an Indian Forest division was from 100 to 2,000 square miles. He regarded the

Forest Service of India as a revenue producing Department which should be capable of enormous development in that respect in the future, and he urged that from the economic point of view alone it ought to be treated liberally by the Government.

66098. He did not think the profit from the business of the Department was likely to increase so rapidly in future as it had done in recent years: that depended to a large extent on the money the Government was prepared to spend on establishments, communications and mechanical plant. The importance of the Department did not consist only in the actual development of the forests, but also investigations into the employment of forest products for trade purposes. For instance, owing to the work of the Research Institute, paper was now being manufactured from bamboos and from the pulp grasses, and the Department had induced the Railways to begin using the comparatively inferior timbers after preservative treatment, and also to take a number of their hard wood species after similar treatment. There were endless possibilities in that direction.

66099. With regard to his suggestion that no further increment should be given after Rs. 1,250, unless an officer was declared fit to be in charge of a circle, the witness said that did not necessarily imply that a man was unfit to hold charge of a Forest Division, but that he had not sufficient general ability, or was insufficiently active and useful, to hold charge of a Forest circle. He might, however, be a sufficiently efficient officer to deserve the continuance of the pay he was getting.

66100. (*Mr. Madge.*) In regard to the distinction between the work done by a Provincial officer and the work done by an Imperial officer, the witness said the essence of one man's work was to assist, and the essence of the other man's work was to control major charges.

66101. Supplementary to the view expressed in his written statement that the best training in forestry could not be obtained in India, the witness said there was not the same staff at Dehra Dun as there was at Oxford; there were not the same facilities for instruction. In the next place, India did not possess areas of forest which had been under scientific and proper treatment for two or three hundred years. Efforts were being made to improve the training at Dehra Dun.

66102. (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness said he would have no objection to the institution of open competition in England and the abolition of the Selection Board if the age of entry was lowered. He was of opinion that a University would be the best centre for the training of probationers. The University training should be adapted to Indian conditions. He did not consider that the whole of the University staff should consist of Indian Forest officers, but certainly some proportion of them should have had experience of forest work in India. For that proportion he would select the best men obtainable, irrespective of whether they were on the active or the retired list. On the whole he thought it would be better to take men from the list with between 15 and 20 years' service.

66103. The witness said that Extra Deputy Conservatorships in the Provincial Service were exactly analogous to the listed posts in the Indian Civil Service, and that just as in the Indian Civil Service one-sixth of the superior posts were supposed to be listed for the Provincial Service, so in the Forest Service one-fifth of the major charges had been handed over to the Provincial Service. Asked for his opinion regarding a scheme for abolishing the posts of Extra Deputy Conservator in the Provincial Service, and adding them to the Imperial Service as posts to be filled by selected Provincial Service officers, the witness said it would be very difficult to transfer men of 20 years' service from one branch to the other. The problem would be where to bring the transferred officers on to the time scale. The time scale for a Deputy Conservator in the Imperial Service began at Rs. 580, and for the Extra Deputy in the Provincial Service it began at Rs. 575. He admitted that there was only a difference of Rs. 5 in the minimum pay of the two posts, and that the result of bringing men straight into the Imperial Service time scale, starting at Rs. 580, would be to remove a good deal of the grievance which was now felt.

66104. He could not say why certain Provinces were unpopular in the Forest Service, but he had heard that a Forest Officer was rather badly treated in Madras. He thought the majority of the men who came to India preferred to obtain a post under the Government of India, with a chance of service in different Provinces, and the extra opportunities of promotion, to being kept entirely in one Province.

66105. Dealing with his proposals regarding the salaries of Imperial Service Officers, the witness said he did not consider that Rs. 1,250 was too low a limit to place on the maximum pay that should be drawn by a Deputy Conservator, but he thought that length of service, and the time that it took for a man to get from one class to the other should be taken into consideration. It was true that the pay of Conservators had been improved during the last 10 or 15 years, but not to the extent that the Government of India desired to improve it. In 1890 the pay of a Conservator started at Rs. 1,100, whereas at the present time it started at Rs. 1,500. The appointment held by the President of the Forest Institute at Dehra Dun was analogous to that of a Chief Conservator.

66106. Every candidate nominated by a local Government for admission to the Provincial Service had to go through a preliminary practical training in the forest before he went to Dehra Dun. Six months' practical training was reasonable, but it should not be less than that period. He thought that it would unnecessarily tie the hands of local Governments to insist on a graduate qualification for candidates aspiring to the Provincial Service. The Provincial Service required special physical and constitutional qualifications, and it was not always necessary that a man should have an Indian University degree. As a matter of fact the Forest Department did not attract graduates from among the more highly educated Indian classes to any great extent.

66107. His proposal that the Provincial Service time scale should be continuous up to Rs. 950 was not put forward on the ground that this would be a reasonable scale of pay for the Provincial Service, irrespective of whether an officer was employed or not as an Extra Deputy Conservator. He did not think it was fair to suspend increments at the top of the Extra Assistant class simply because there were no vacancies in the Extra Deputy class. Perhaps he had gone a little too far in saying that the pay should rise as high as Rs. 950.

66108. To a certain extent, he strongly approved of recruitment to the Provincial Service by promotion from the subordinate ranks, because it was important for the Department to obtain good Rangers, and he suggested that one-third of the vacancies in the Provincial Service should be earmarked for the men belonging to this class. There would, he thought, be no departmental objection to the abolition of the titles "Upper controlling staff" and "Lower controlling staff," and "Extra."

66109. He was in favour of a system of study leave for Provincial Service Officers under the same rules as applied to the Imperial Service.

66110. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness said that the 43 vacancies in the ranks of the Extra Deputy Conservators would be filled as soon as suitable men could be found. He could not say why no steps were taken from 1891 until 1906 to provide for direct recruitment of men to the Provincial Service. The special course of training instituted at Dehra Dun last year was exclusively for the Provincial Service. There was a two years' course for Rangers and a special course for the Provincial Service. It might be possible with a sufficient staff for men to obtain a theoretical training at Dehra Dun similar to that given at Oxford, but the practical training was impossible. He agreed that if an improved system of training was instituted at Dehra Dun and the men who passed there were sent to Europe for special study, the actual training would be nearly equal to that given to officers in the Imperial Service. A proposal for

the training of the upper controlling staff in India had been put forward several times. It would be theoretically possible, but it would be most expensive to provide the necessary staff for such a purpose. It was true that when the Forest Department was instituted, and for a long time afterwards, both the Government of India and the Secretary of State expressed the opinion that it was a special Department in which the services of Indians should be utilised as largely as possible, but the more highly educated class in India had made no attempt to enter the Service. It was only within the last few years that candidates had been obliged to go to England on the chance of being nominated by the Secretary of State, but for many years previously they had had an equal opportunity with any other man of entering the service by competitive examination. Young men who left their homes and went to England would naturally be attracted by the Civil Service as offering the most highly paid employment, and those therefore who could afford it would naturally endeavour to enter that Service. This did not necessarily mean that if it had been possible for them to enter the Forest Service in India they would not have availed themselves of the opportunity. He did not agree that if the bulk of the appointments in the Department were filled by men who had undergone their training at Debra Dun, and a few men were brought out from Europe to provide the necessary expert knowledge, that a sufficient European element would be obtained for the Service. Such a European element was undoubtedly necessary. It was essential in his opinion that a large proportion of the officers of the Service should be men with a fondness for outdoor life and work, natural history and science; and certainly so far as had been seen at present those qualities were not possessed by Indians. It did not follow because men in India could be obtained who had the necessary educational qualifications and could be given the necessary theoretical training, that those men would make as good Forest Officers as men who had been through the English Public Schools and Universities. He did not see that any advantage was likely to accrue from the employment of Indians, in consequence of their living in the country after retirement, and being able to place their accumulated experience at the disposal of the Department. The extended employment of Indians might result in a saving of cost, and it would be possible, if the Department was mainly officered by Indians, to have a lower range of salary; but on the other hand if the Department was not efficient a plan of this kind would prove to be extremely expensive. He thought the Government might be prepared to make a beginning in the direction of developing Dehra Dun and of having Indians and Anglo-Indians trained there with a view to their admission to the upper controlling branch, but he would not be willing, at any rate for the present, to accept any such proposal himself. He much preferred that men should be selected and trained in Europe.

66111. (*Mr. Wrafter.*) The Provincial Service was recruited for entirely different work from that discharged by the Imperial Service, and therefore the two branches should be kept separate. The conditions of service of the Provincial Officers were based on Indian requirements; it had to be remembered that the Provincial Service was intended for Indians, and anyone who entered it did so with his eyes open.

66112. It was not necessarily the case that before an Extra Assistant was promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy he had to have 15 to 17 years' qualifying service. The rules laid down that promotion to the class of Extra Deputy Conservator was to be by selection from amongst Extra Assistant Conservators. It was within the powers of the local Government to promote any Extra Assistant Conservator to be an extra Deputy. Before he was selected he had to be specially reported on as fitted for a major charge. Then at intervals of three years he had again to be reported on by his Conservator as being qualified for advancement of pay. As to this, the witness said that in his opinion a man who had got into the Extra Deputy Conservator class should be granted his further increments of pay without any special certificate.

66113. (*Mr Hill.*) The witness said that although there had been a considerable increase in the emoluments of Conservators in recent years, it was important to remember that Exchange Compensation Allowance had been abolished, and that therefore the increased pay was not so large as it would at first sight appear to be.

66114. He only knew of one case where the son of an Indian Provincial Service Officer had chosen the same profession as his father. If Extra Deputy Conservators were admitted to the Imperial list, they would have a comparatively small chance of rising to administrative posts in that Service, but they would certainly be eligible if once admitted. He did not think they need consider the question whether it would lead to friction with European officers if an Extra Deputy Conservator did rise to an administrative post.

66115. The witness added, with regard to his proposals regarding the pay of the Provincial Service, that it might meet the requirements of the case to continue the present rates of salary subject to a periodic re-adjustment of the number of posts of Extra Deputy Conservators.

(The witness withdrew.)

G. O. Coombs, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, United Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Service, being the corporate views of the Provincial Forest Service of the United Provinces.

66116. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—Recruitment for direct appointments should be by an open competitive examination only, exactly as for Provincial Engineers. There should be no nomination as such is not required in a department which is of a professional nature like the Public Works, Survey, and Telegraph Departments.

No recruitment should be made from among Rangers; only such of the Dehra Dun Rangers as have passed out of the Forest College before the opening of the direct appointment class (*i.e.*, before 1907) and have maintained a good record of their work throughout the whole of their service and have been tried in every capacity and are all round fit for the Provincial Service should be promoted. Dehra Dun Foresters should in no case be promoted, and Article 15 (ii) of the Forest Code should be amended accordingly.

66117. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The training at present in force is sufficient, but if it is considered in any way inferior, it should be raised so as to bring it on a par with that which probationers for the Imperial Forest Service receive in England. The period of practical training before admission to the Forest College, Dehra Dun, should not be more than three months.

66118. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—As duties and responsibilites of Provincial Forest Service Officers are the same as officers of Imperal Forest Service, the whole staff of both Imperial and Provincial Services should be borne on one amalgamated list, and the members of the amalgamated staff designated as Assistant and Deputy Conservators.

Charges of divisions should go ordinarily by seniority in the proposed amalgamated list, unless there be anything against any individual officer and senior member of the Provincial Service should not be placed, as is often the case at present, under a junior member of the Imperial Service.

Every Imperial Forest Officer should be required to remain in actual charge of a range for at least

one year, and should not be placed in charge of a division before he has had at least four years of active Forest Service in the Province. The same rule should apply also to the Provincial Forest Officers directly appointed from the Forest College, Dehra Dun.

The classification of divisional charges into major and minor should be abolished, and the present practice in the United Provinces of placing Imperial Service recruits of barely one year's service in charge of major divisions, in preference to more experienced Provincial Service Officers who have been holding charges of major and minor divisions for considerable periods, should be abolished. Such Imperial Service recruits do not understand the vernacular, colloquial or written, a knowledge of which is essential for efficient administrative work in India; they do not know the customs and requirements of the people, are ignorant of the inner working of the Forest Department, and—last, but not least—are unacquainted with fluctuations of the timber trade and the commercial conditions of the country, which knowledge is a very important possession for an officer, especially a Divisional Officer, of a quasi-commercial Department like the Forest. The results of this practice must affect adversely the interests of the Department in every respect, and must result in opportunities for unfair practices by both subordinates and contractors. Moreover, many ways of discovering and improving the sources of revenue in a division must remain hidden. Thus it is clear that the appointment of recruits of short service to the charge of divisions is not in the best interests of Government. In emergency cases, only minor divisions might be placed under new recruits; but major divisions should always be held by experienced officers of either Imperial or Provincial Service. As Imperial Officers are expected to possess a superior technical knowledge of forestry, it is suggested that they should be placed in direct charge of important works, demanding such technical knowledge as for instance preparation of working plans, marking of trees for felling under various methods of treatment, cultural operations, fire protection, demarcation, etc., while divisional charges should be held by Provincial Service Officers, who are much better fitted for the purpose.

The present system of "confidential reports" results sometimes in injustice. When the adverse comments are made against any officer he should be supplied with a copy of the comments and an opportunity given him for self-defence.

The division of the "controlling staff" into upper and lower should be abolished, and officers of the proposed amalgamated list should be known as members of the controlling staff.

66119. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The starting pay which an officer gets on his confirmation to the Provincial Forest Service is not low, but the subsequent low increments and a very limited number of posts of Extra Deputy Conservators (*i.e.*, three in the United Provinces) are disadvantages which, we submit, should be removed by reconstituting the pay as follows—

	Rs.
Assistant Conservators—	
1st year of service	250
2nd " "	275
3rd " "	300
4th " "	325
5th " "	350
6th " "	375
7th " "	400
8th " "	430
9th " "	460
10th " "	490
11th " "	520
12th " "	550
Deputy Conservators—	
13th year of service	590
14th " "	630
15th " "	670
16th " "	710
Deputy Conservators (*continued*)—	
17th year of service	750
18th " "	790
19th " "	830
20th " "	870
21st "	910
22nd " "	950
23rd " "	1,000
24th " "	1,050
25th " "	1,100
26th " "	1,150
27th " "	1,200
28th " " and onwards ...	1,250

The scale of pay for the Imperial Service officers may remain the same as at present, but should it be raised, the scale for the Provincial Service Officers should also be increased proportionately.

Rules and practice regarding the giving or stoppage of annual increments or any other disciplinary measures should be the same for both services.

66120. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The changes suggested to be made regarding long leaves for Indian services in G.G.O. No. 674—C.S.R., dated the 19th October, 1912, are all right.

The rule that privilege leave cannot be allowed within six months after return to duty from privilege leave should be relaxed in respect of leave on medical certificate or on bona fide urgent necessity for forest officers, who have often to labour in malarious surroundings and isolation.

66121. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Invalid and voluntary retirements on one-half of the average salary should be allowed after 20 and 25 years of service respectively.

66122. **(VII) Limitation in the employment of non-Europeans and the division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.**—Indians and Anglo-Indians, although not debarred by the rules, are practically excluded from the Imperial Forest Service; it is therefore suggested that 20 per cent. posts of the Imperial Service should be reserved for them, who should be selected by a competitive examination open to all Indians and Anglo-Indians and deputed to England to receive the training which candidates nominated there are required to undergo to qualify themselves for the Imperial Forest Service, selection being made of only the best successful candidates, irrespective of any other distinction. The competitive examination should be based on the same qualifications as required for recruits nominated in England. One of the three conservatorships or circle charges should be thrown open to Provincial Service, the Provincial Service Conservator getting the same pay as the Imperial Service Conservator.

There is no limitation in the employment of non-Europeans in the Provincial Forest Service, except in the case of selection for the service in Burma, for which we suggest that selection should be made from all Indian communities.

The division of the service into Imperial and Provincial having not proved satisfactory, it is suggested that the distinction should be removed altogether.

In view of the suggestions made in paragraph 63,116, and to keep up the efficiency of the subordinate service a few posts carrying higher pay may be created for them as follows, and designated "sub-assistant conservators" (upper subordinates):—

	Rs.
Sub-assistant Conservator, 1st grade ...	300
" " 2nd grade ...	250
" " 3rd grade ...	200

66123. **(VIII) Relations with Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—It is satisfactory and there is nothing to suggest.

66124. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—Colonials who do not allow Indians to enter their colonies should be refused admission to the Forest Services in India.

Travelling allowance for members of the Provincial Forest Service should be the same as for members of the Imperial Forest Service, and the former should be classed among "first-class officers" irrespective of their pay and posting, as is the case with provincial engineers.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Service, being a Supplementary Memorandum on the Provincial Forest Service, United Provinces, by Mr. Coombs.

66125. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—Recruitment for the service for entry through the Dehra Dun Forest College it is suggested should be first by nomination of properly qualified candidates, as required by the rules in force, and then selection from among the nominated candidates by a competitive examination. This would ensure a good class of recruit as regards respectability, character and physical fitness, with the requisite educational qualifications. In fact, the best men available.

66126. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The training given at Dehra Dun is all that is required, and the best that the ablest men of the Imperial Service can devise and impart. The Government of India, in a resolution dated 21st February, 1913, note "The College at Dehra Dun has recently been improved and a Research Institute has been established in connection with it. Indians can here obtain an education in forestry which approximates to that ordinarily obtainable in Europe."

In the "Indian Forester" for April, 1906, there is an editorial (written presumably by Mr. Stebbing, Indian Forest Service, who was the honorary editor of the paper at the time, and who is now Head of the Forestry Department of the University of Edinburgh, Scotland), in which a comparison is made of forestry tuition at Oxford and Dehra Dun. The writer shows that the course given at Dehra compares very favourably with that given at Oxford. The general remarks at the end of the article read as follows:—

"The above brief résumé of the two standards will, we think, suggest to the minds of our readers that the course given at Dehra compares satisfactorily with that given at Oxford, our opinion being that the latter—or, at any rate, the theoretical portion of it, requires stiffening up very considerably. In some ways the Dehra course is perhaps superior to the Oxford one. Undoubtedly the greatest advantage possessed by the Indian Forest subordinate is that he is trained in the country in which his future work is carried out: that he becomes acquainted in his practical course with forests of a similar nature to those in which he will have in future to work, and is thus the sooner able to apply the knowledge he has acquired in the lecture hall. For, instead of having his mind steeped in minute and precise, and perchance narrow and crystallised, methods of forestry, applicable and peculiar solely to highly civilised small States, he is from the first placed face to face with the larger areas and wider interests in which forest conservancy has to be practised in India; he learns the difficulties which confront the Forest Officer in dealing with ignorant native races; he recognises that innumerable rights will have to be defined and treated with circumspection; and discovers the difficulties that exist in growing and extracting his timber and in collecting and disposing of minor produce, etc., etc.

"To the Home-trained probationer these aspects of Indian Forestry remain practically an unopened book, for without a knowledge of the present conditions of the country he must find it difficult to attach the proper relative importance to what may be detailed upon the subject in the lecture room and impossible to apply his theoretical knowledge in the absence of local experience.

"In other respects the courses greatly resemble one another in the home course of tuition, the student does not acquire a knowledge of forest zoology upon the lines most suitable for India, and he consequently arrives in the country ill-prepared to continue his studies there, while, on the other hand, much of the best work done under this head at present has been carried out by Dehra-trained Forest Officers."

The above will show that the training at Dehra Dun is highly satisfactory, and all that is required for the Forest Department; should there, however, be at any time anything which needs improvement, it will no doubt be done by Government, whose aim should be to keep the Forest Education at Dehra Dun at a sufficiently high standard, so as to leave no room for any doubt as to the qualifications and fitness of the men turned out from the College, and to give the men a fair chance of doing the best possible work for the department. I would also like to add that the men turned out from Dehra Dun under the old rules, say 17 years ago, before the Dehra school was raised to the status of a college, received as thorough a training under the able guidance of some of the best men in the Imperial Service, who had received their training at Nancy and Germany and Cooper's Hill, as they do now, as the old school course was the same as that taught now to the Provincial Service recruits, the Ranger's course having been cut down. The men trained at Dehra Dun therefore deserve every consideration and encouragement, and should not be condemned as a body and have unnecessary barriers placed in the way of their advancement. Good men should be given every opportunity and equal chances of working shoulder to shoulder with the officers recruited in Europe instead of being consigned to a position of subordination, as is the case at present, on the mere assumption that the training in Europe is superior.

The period of probation for the Provincial Forest Service men is at present three years, with two years spent in college; this seems excessive. The Imperial Service Officers when once they are appointed, are not required to serve any probation. After passing out of the College, one year's probation should be sufficient. A period of two years should be allowed for an officer to pass his departmental examinations, failing which his increment should be stopped till he has qualified.

66127. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—Officers serving in the Forest Department have a hard, knockabout life, camping for practically eight months in the year in all sorts of malarious and unhealthy localities, and throughout the hot weather season very often with no better shelter than that provided by small tents. Provincial Service Officers are trained to do the same work as Assistant and Deputy Conservators of the Imperial Service, but the distinction made between the two services are very great. As a matter of fact, the Provincial Service is created more as an inferior and subordinate service. The Provincial Service man is generally kept as an attached officer for long years, or often in charge of ranges and ultimately may hope to get a small division known as a minor charge. The Imperial Service Officer comes out, and in a year or so finds himself posted to the charge of a large division, placed perhaps over old and experienced men of the Provincial Service. The Provincial Forest Service men by being thus kept down for years in subordinate positions lose in efficiency, while the Imperial Forest Service men benefit by the opportunities they get of gaining experience in control work. Equal opportunities should be given to men recruited in India of showing their worth, and it is suggested that the officers of both services should be borne on one list, and the amalgamated members designated Assistant and Deputy Conservators without the prefix "Extra," which is quite unnecessary and only serves to separate the two services. Charges of divisions should go ordinarily by seniority in the proposed amalgamated list unless there be anything against any individual officer, and a senior member of the Provincial Forest Service should, as far as possible, not be placed, as is often the case at present, under a junior member of the Imperial Service.

Imperial and Provincial Officers should both be

required to remain in actual charge of a range for at least one year to gain a thorough knowledge of the inner working of the Department, and a near acquaintance with the people they have to deal with and the staff, and should not be placed in charge of a division until they have had at least four years of active forest service in the Province. It is not merely sufficient to place an officer in nominal charge of a range as has sometimes been done in the case of some Imperial Service Officers, the real range work being carried out by the Ranger. The classification of Major and Minor Divisions is again a distinction which tends to separate the Imperial from the Provincial men, the Minor Division being considered the special province of the Provincial Service, and there being only four or five charges, the Provincial Forest Service men remain at a disadvantage, and do not get the same experience and opportunities as the Imperial men. It is suggested that this classification be abolished, and charges allotted accordingly to seniority as far as possible, the more important charges being held, as a rule, by the older and more able and experienced officers.

The practice in the United Provinces of placing young Imperial Forest Service recruits of barely one or two years' service in charge of Major Divisions in preference to Provincial Service men of many years' experience can hardly be in the interests of Government, owing to their inexperience of local conditions, and is also causing much dissatisfaction among the members of the Provincial Forest Service who find themselves kept down in this way.

The division of the controlling staff into upper and lower is another stigma of inferiority attached to the Provincial Service Officer, the duties and responsibilities being the same as regard control work, there seems no necessity for this invidious distinction.

The practice of confidential reports results sometimes in injustice, an officer having any serious comments made on his work or conduct which would result in stopping his promotion or spoiling his future prospects of advancement should be informed of the nature of his faults and given an opportunity of submitting an explanation in his defence. This principle is provided for in the case of Imperial Service Officers (Article 19, Forest Department Code, 7th edition), and the same rule should be made to apply to officers of the Provincial Forest Service. It seems most unfair to punish an officer merely on the strength of a confidential report which may have no real justification, or for which the officer concerned may be able to furnish a very satisfactory explanation.

There is practically no example in the whole of India in which the increment of a member of the Imperial Forest Service up to Rs. 1,250 has been stopped, but several men of the Provincial Service of the United Provinces have been denied the full pay due to them by the rules introduced by the last re-organisation, which has caused much dissatisfaction generally and left many with personal grievances owing to the interests of existing members not being sufficiently safeguarded. As an example, I might instance my own case where, on the introduction of the re-organisation scheme, I had to refund money which I had earned under the old rules, and arbitrarily deprived of my rank as Extra Deputy Conservator, in which post I was officiating.

At present there is only one Extra Deputy Conservator working in the Province, and, consequently, only one major charge is held permanently by the Provincial Service instead of three, and it would be only fair to the Service that the two posts of Extra Deputy Conservator, which have been vacant in the United Provinces since April, 1911, be filled up soon. A second major charge is held temporarily by an Extra Assistant Conservator and five minor charges by Extra Assistant Conservators, a total of seven divisional charges held by Provincial Service Officers against 12 major charges held by Imperial Service Officers. Any increase of establishment sanctioned for the Department it is suggested should be made from officers trained in India, so as to give them a larger share in the working of the Department for which they are quite competent and well fitted.

66128. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The reorganisation scheme sanctioned in 1911, while introducing a time scale of pay, gave little general satisfaction, as while it provided a better opening for new recruits, it did not safeguard the interests of the existing members of the Service sufficiently, and took no account of the long years of service spent in many cases by men in the subordinate service under the old rules when they were obliged to work as Rangers before entry into the Provincial Service, even though they may have been fully qualified and fit for promotion and recommended for advancement, simply for want of vacancies in the Provincial Service and the special rules in force at the time, and for no fault of theirs. This means that many good men, who are just as able and well qualified as the new recruits, lose the advantage of much past service, which is not counted towards their increment according to the new rules brought into force, and will never rise to the highest grades of pay. This procedure is felt all the more keenly by the better officers, who see their future prospects marred for no fault of theirs; and this might be rectified.

Another point is the low rate of increment and the slow rate of promotion of the Provincial Forest Service when compared with the pay given to the Imperial Forest Service. Although both do the same work, instead of the Provincial Service salary being at least two-thirds of the Imperial, as is the general principle and is the case in the Public Works and Telegraph Departments, we get Rs. 20 a year increment against the Imperial Service Rs. 40 a year, and can only rise automatically up to Rs. 550 in 16 years after promotion to Extra Assistant Conservator, whereas the Imperial Service Officers rise automatically to Rs. 1,250 in 20 years. Further advancement for the Provincial Service needs special orders, and is subject to certain conditions which are liable to be differently applied at different times. It is suggested that the pay of the Provincial Service be reconstituted, as suggested in paragraph 66119, to give them a fair salary and do away with the disadvantages under which the present members of the service suffer.

Provision should certainly be made to give the old members of the Service the benefit of any increased rate of pay allowed by considering the whole of their service, and not only counting such portion since their promotion to the Provincial Service. Under the old rules a man was eligible for promotion from the Subordinate to the Provincial Service after five years of executive work as a Ranger if he passed the Dehra Dun Forestry ccurse without honours, and after two years' service if he passed with honours. If an officer has been kept back longer than this period in the Subordinate Service for no fault of his, but merely on account of want of vacancies, he should in all fairness be allowed to count service for purposes of calculating his salary, according to the new scale, from such time as he was qualified and considered fit for promotion to the Provincial Service. If this provision is omitted deserving men will be greatly handicapped, and the old members of the Service will get little or no immediate benefit by any re-organisation, and will be greatly disappointed.

In the case of the Imperial Service, Assistant Conservators become Deputy Conservators as a matter of course after five years service, and there is no limit to the number of Deputy Conservators. Similarly, Provincial men, it is suggested, should rise to Deputy Conservators when they have put in 12 years' service and reached a salary of over Rs. 550. At present Provincial Service Officers in charge of Divisions are mostly all getting small salaries, and find it very difficult to manage and keep up a proper position. They have all had many years' service, and if a revision of salaries is

granted as suggested it will place them in a better position to support themselves properly, and enable them to meet the Officers of other Departments on an equal footing and keep up the prestige of the Department. In case of Officers getting less than Rs. 550 a month being posted to a division a charge allowance should be given to make up the difference in pay. If the pay of the Imperial Forest Service is increased, that of the Provincial Forest Service should be increased proportionately.

Rules and practice as regards giving and stoppage of increments should be the same for both services.

66129. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The rule that privilege leave cannot be allowed within six months after return to duty from privilege leave should be relaxed in respect of leave on medical certificate or on bona fide urgent necessity for Forest Officers, who have often to labour in malarious surroundings and isolation.

66130. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Invalid and voluntary retirements on one-half of the average salary should be allowed after 20 and 25 years of service respectively, in consideration of the arduous life of a Forest Officer, who has to work in the forests under difficult conditions.

66131. **(VII) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans and the division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.**—Indians and Anglo-Indians, although not debarred by the rules are practically excluded from the Imperial Forest Service. At present it is impracticable for men in India to compete for these appointments owing to the difficulty and expense of sending boys to England for education, while their parents are domiciled in India. If appointments in the Imperial Forest Service are not thrown open to India-trained Forest Officers without a training in Europe, it is suggested that a certain percentage of the posts be reserved for the men from India, and facilities given them to qualify for them. It is suggested that Indian educational tests should be recognised and some standard set up in India equivalent to that required in England, and successful candidates deputed for a training in Europe. It is much to be hoped, however, that it will be held that India can give all the education and training necessary for the Department, and that the limitations imposed in 1891 by dividing the Service into Imperial and Provincial may be removed to give men from India a chance of rising to the top of the Service, even to the administrative rank of Conservators, if they can show their fitness, as is the case with the Public Works Department. In any case it is, I think, very necessary that there should be one list for all Officers of the Department, as in the Public Works Department, and equal opportunities given to Provincial Service Officers as their duties are the same as those of Imperial Officers.

66132. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—There is a difference in the scale of travelling allowance allowed Imperial and Provincial Officers, though the conditions of travelling are the same. In the Public Works Department the travelling allowances of both services, Imperial and Provincial, are the same. Provincial Assistant Engineers getting the same pay as Extra Assistant Conservators are classed as First-Class Officers, though the latter are not when not in charge of Divisions. It is suggested that this inequality be removed, and the same rates of travelling allowance fixed for the Provincial Forest Service as exists for the Imperial Service.

It would be felt as a great boon if free medical attendance were allowed for the wives and children of Forest Officers, owing to the usually unhealthy places in which they have to live.

Mr. G. O. Coombs called and examined.

66133. (*Chairman*). **The witness said he attended before the Commission as the representative of the Provincial Forest Service in the United Provinces.**

66134. As regards recruitment, his personal view was at variance with the recommendation put forward in the joint written statement. He thought the Service required, in a special degree, other than intellectual qualities, and that nomination would be of assistance in securing candidates with the necessary physical qualifications. There should be no recruitment from among Rangers. He did not think that the men who were now passing through the Ranger's course received the same training, or had the same qualifications as the men who entered the Provincial Service direct, and it would lower the status of the Service as a whole to draft in men from the subordinate ranks. He admitted that it had been the rule and practice to recruit the Provincial Service entirely from the Ranger class prior to 1907, but he thought the standard of training for the Ranger class had been lowered since that date. He did not consider the abolition of promotion from the Ranger class would have any injurious effect upon the recruitment of Rangers.

66135. Provincial officers had not been given the same opportunity as Imperial officers of showing whether they could carry out the work of an important charge. Only one officer in his Department had been placed permanently in a charge of this character. He suggested the abolition of the division into Imperial and Provincial Services, and the establishment of one superior service, although Provincial officers might be allowed two-thirds pay of Imperial officers taking equal length of service into consideration, which is not the case at present. Further promotion after 20 years' service is asked for to give the maximum salary of Deputy Conservators in 28 years against 20 years for Imperial officers, as noted in the written statements.

66136. The witness justified his proposal for a continuous time scale for Extra Assistants and Extra Deputies on the ground that they did the same work, carried out the same duties, and had the same responsibilities when placed in command of charges. The Extra Assistant did exactly the same work as the Extra Deputy if he was placed in charge of a division. He did not mean to suggest that as a grade the Extra Assistants were taking the same responsibility and doing the same work as the Extra Deputies. What he meant was that Extra Deputies were given charge of major divisions, and Extra Assistants were given charge of minor divisions. The duties were essentially the same, but perhaps a larger division entailed more responsibility and more work. He agreed that one charge was much more limited in scope than another, but in some cases what was called a minor division might, in area, be larger than a major division. He admitted that the scope of importance and responsibility was not judged by area and that a minor charge could hardly be said to be of equivalent responsibility and importance to the major charge. He suggested a continuous time scale without any selection bar. He did not think there should be a point in the time scale where an officer must obtain promotion by selection before securing an advance of salary. The increment could be stopped if the officer was not efficient.

66137. The witness did not think officers in the Provincial Service took the leave to which they were entitled. They preferred to stay at their work.

66138. The ground on which the witness defended his proposal to reduce the term of service qualifying for optional retirement was that, after a period of 25 years, a man would probably find he was not as fit as he ought to be, and would like to retire.

66139. He thought Indians were anxious to enter the Forest Service; indeed it was, to his own knowledge, a popular service.

66140. With reference to his suggestion that one of the posts of Conservator should be thrown open to the Provincial Service, the witness said he felt

satisfied that the training given in the Provincial Service would qualify an officer to occupy that position.

66141. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness said he began his career in the Service as a Ranger, that being at the time the only way of entering the Provincial Service. He had had to undergo a training for two years at Dehra Dun before being appointed, and had served four and a quarter years in that subordinate class and two and a quarter years on deputation as Forest Officer of the Alwar State, before being promoted to the Provincial service. Before his promotion he had passed a departmental test as required by the rules which make it obligatory after appointment to the Provincial Service. According to the rules, if there were no vacancies, a man would probably have to wait 19 years before being promoted to an Extra Deputy Conservatorship, but if there were vacancies, he could be promoted as soon as he was found fit. As stated in the memorandum, it sometimes happened that Imperial officers who had had only 1½ year's service were put in command of major charges over the heads of men in the Provincial Service who had long periods of service to their credit. Their grievance was that although Provincial officers had been serving long enough to know their work thoroughly, they were considered unfit, where as an Imperial officer who had just come out, and who did not know the conditions of the country, was considered fit.

66142. (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness admitted that the effect of his proposal was to take away from members of the subordinate service the opportunities which they at present possessed of being promoted into the Provincial Service. That might seriously prejudice the subordinate service, but he thought the difficulty would be overcome by allowing subordinate officers to rise to Rs. 300 a month. He agreed that if the Imperial Service were to put forward the same proposal in regard to the Provincial Service, namely, that the Extra Deputy posts should be abolished, with some compensation in the form of salary, the Provincial Service would not like the idea at all.

66143. (*Mr. Madge.*) The witness stated that his reason for suggesting the abolition of the division into Provincial and Imperial officers was that as they did the same class of work the distinction should be one of salary alone according to the two-thirds rule. He knew it was the case in the Public Works Department that Provincial officers did exactly the same work and had the same responsibilities as Imperial officers, and that the distinction there was only one of salary.

(The witness withdrew.)

L. Mercer, Esq., President of the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun.

Written Statement relating to the Imperial Forest Service.

66144. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—Existing arrangements are not entirely satisfactory. Recruits arrive in India at too advanced an age, their physical efficiency is not always satisfactory, and their qualifications in respect of science degrees are not always of much use to them in their Indian career. Moreover, uniformity in training and in rate of recruitment are not attained.

It is considered that candidates should be selected after their 18th and before their 20th birthday, selection being followed by a strict medical examination, a physical test, and a competitive examination. The successful candidates should then undergo in Europe a course of training in forestry and allied subjects for a period of three years (including one year's practical training on the Continent). Selection under the age of 18 is not desirable as this would mean withdrawal from a public school at too early an age.

Owing to the lonely and frequently trying circumstances under which Forest Officers are obliged to serve, general character, a strong constitution, and a love of outdoor life and sport are of primary importance, and in the long run far outweigh academic distinctions. These qualities were conspicuous in the public school boys obtained under the old regulations. Under existing arrangements candidates are required to possess a university degree in some branch of natural science, which necessitates three years' residence at a university. Consequently a large number of desirable recruits are excluded who are compelled to obtain an appointment at the close of their school career, and who cannot afford the risk of a university education with no certainty of an appointment at its close. School recruits, moreover, reach India at an early age (21-22) years when they are able to adapt themselves more easily to the circumstances under which they have to serve. Such recruits also, as a rule, possessing no private means and no special qualifications for other employment, have no inducement to retire prematurely from the Service.

On the other hand, an advanced knodwledge of certain branches of science, *e.g.*, geology, is of little practical value in Indian forestry, while an expert in a particular branch of science is apt to find a large part of his routine forest work in India irksome and uninteresting. Advanced technical knowledge to be of most value in Indian forestry should be acquired after an officer has obtained experience of Indian conditions, and not before. This is noted under III. below.

66145. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The probationary training should be carried out at one residential centre in England under the supervision of the Director of Indian Forest Studies in order to secure a uniform standard of instruction. The instructors should, so far as desirable, be Indian Forest Officers on the active list, who should be deputed from India for a period not exceeding five years, the period of deputation to count as service for an Indian pension. It is suggested that it be submitted for the consideration of the Home Authorities that the Director of Indian Forest Studies be also appointed their technical adviser. The Crown forests would thus have the benefit of his experience, while he would have a *locus standi* in these forests and would thus be in a better position to arrange for forestry training in Great Britain.

During the Continental training special care should be taken to see that students acquire a thorough working knowledge of a few systems of management which are considered most valuable for India, and of the difficulties met with in their practical application rather than a sketchy idea of a larger number. Either on the Continent or in the British Isles students should also be given, if possible, more individual practical work in forest engineering, especially as regards the laying-out and construction of hill-roads and of mechanical transport.

On arrival in India, recruits should be posted for the first year to those divisions in their respective Provinces which are considered to be the most advanced. The Divisional Officers in charge should be held responsible for seeing that during his first year in the country each recruit is given:—

(*a*) Facilities for acquiring the knowledge necessary for his departmental examination; and

(*b*) A thorough practical training in the work of an up-to-date Indian division coupled with an intimate knowlege of the working-plan or plans in force therein.

This procedure necessarily throws considerable extra work and responsibility on the Divisional Officers concerned, and each such selected officer might perhaps be given an extra monthly allowance of Rs. 50 for each recruit in his charge. In this way all recruits will be given an equal and favourable opportunity of adapting themselves to Indian conditions and of acquiring a sound knowledge

of Indian forest work. Lengthy tours in other divisions or other provinces are not required at this stage.

66146. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—In view of the fact that the management of our forests is daily becoming more intensive, there is a steadily increasing demand for higher technical knowledge on the part of our officers, and it is therefore most necessary that picked officers who have a special aptitude for any particular branch of their work, *e.g.*, working-plans, botany, zoology, and so on, should be encouraged, so far as desirable, to specialise therein during their service. This can be done by allowing such officers to work at these subjects during periods of deputation at the Forest Research Institute, which might be advantageously combined with occasional tours in other provinces and with periods of study leave in Europe. Such special training should not commence, however, until an officer has had five years' service and experience of divisional work. In this way men would be brought forward who would be qualified to fill research appointments at Dehra Dun or in the Provinces, and officers of special promise would not have their keenness killed by the continuous monotony of ordinary divisional work. It is considered that this post—probationary higher technical study—is far more valuable than any attempt at such study during the probationary period. An officer, having acquired a good knowledge of Indian conditions, is in a position to know what the peculiar problems of greatest importance in our Indian forests are, and to what extent methods employed elsewhere are likely to be useful and practicable in India. To give full effect to this suggestion it may be necessary to increase the number of Imperial Service posts.

66147. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—There is a general feeling in the Department that the scale of pay is inadequate, and in certain cases it is below that which was recommended by the Government of India in 1905 and 1906. The quality and quantity of work which is demanded of the average officer, however, is advancing steadily as is also the cost of living. At the same time it is believed that the inadequacy of the pay makes itself felt chiefly by rendering it impossible to save with the object of supplementing the retiring pension. The knowledge that at retirement the pension is totally inadequate to maintain an officer in reasonable comfort and to provide a reasonable education for his children is a burden to the average officer throughout the best part of his service, and is liable to seriously handicap his work. It is therefore believed that a liberal policy in the way of increasing pensions, as suggested in VI. below, is of even greater urgency at present than any scheme of improved salaries.

Under present conditions the pay recommended by the Government of India in their despatches No. 371, dated the 2nd November, 1905, and 389, dated the 1st November, 1906, to the Secretary of State for India, may be regarded as the minimum likely to remove the sense of injustice which is unquestionably felt by the Officers of the Indian Forest Service at present. It is generally understood that the highest posts in the Service have been declined on more than one occasion; if this is so it may be taken for granted that the inadequate pay of the posts in question has influenced the decision of the officers concerned. If this state of affairs, which can hardly be considered as altogether desirable, is to be avoided in future, it seems essential that the increase of pay between executive and administrative ranks, between a Conservator and a Chief Conservator and between a Chief Conservator and the Inspector-General of Forests, should not be less than Rs. 500 per mensem. The present pay of the administrative posts in the Forest Department is insufficient to enable the officers who hold them to maintain in the way they should their position as heads of departments, either with Local Governments or with the Government of India. It is held, therefore, that in future there should be two grades only of Conservator Rs. 1,750 and Rs. 2,000, that Chief Conservators should receive Rs. 2,500, and that the pay of the Inspector-General of Forests should be Rs. 3,000. Blocks in promotion among senior Deputy Conservators in individual Provinces should be dealt with on their merits.

66148. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—As at present with the alterations suggested below:—

(*a*) A year's furlough to be available after the first four years' service, if the present rules are to be maintained; but it is suggested that they should be abolished and furlough (including combined leave) be granted whenever an officer can be spared. This will allow of much greater elasticity. If excessive furlough be applied for, which is unlikely as an officer's financial position is generally a bar to this, it can always be refused.

(*b*) A minimum furlough allowance of £400 a year or the salary last drawn on duty, which ever is less, up to a maximum of £1,000 per annum, following the precedent of Article 314, Civil Service Regulations for the Indian Civil Service.

(*c*) Commutation of long leave on half pay into shorter periods on full pay to be permitted.

66149. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—It has been pointed out in paragraph 66147 above that the salary does not permit of any material addition to the pension by means of savings during Indian service. The pension on the other hand is quite inadequate to enable an officer to maintain himself and family and to educate his children. The pension rules have not been altered for many years, and the depreciation of the rupee and the increased cost of living are factors which should be considered. The existing pensions and the proposed scale which is considered essential are given below:—

Years Completed Service.	Existing Pension.		Proposed Pension.	
	Class.	Annual Amount.	Class.	Annual Amount.
		£		£
10	Invalid	88	Invalid	120
11	"	123	"	160
12	"	158	"	200
13	"	193	"	240
14	"	228	"	280
15	"	228	"	320
16	"	263	"	320
17	"	263	"	360
18	"	263	"	360
19	"	263	"	400
20	Retiring	350	"	400
21	"	350	"	440
22	"	350	"	440
23	"	350	"	480
24	"	350	"	480
25	"	438	Retiring	500
26	"	438	"	520
27	"	438	"	540
28	"	438	"	560
28 and 3 Years as Conservator.	"	525	"	650
Chief Conservator and President, Forest Research Institute.	"	525	"	750
Inspector General.	"	525	"	800

It is an undoubted fact that a considerable number of officers now in the Service are understood to intend to retire at the earliest opportunity, *i.e.*, after 20 years' service, and this is chiefly due to the fact that such officers see no prospect of obtaining a competence for themselves and families by continuing to serve in India, whereas employment elsewhere, while they still have health and energy, affords this opportunity. If the pensions

are raised as suggested there is no doubt that many men who, under existing conditions, intend to retire as early as possible, will elect to stay on.

It is held very strongly that all departments recruited in England should have their pensions fixed on a sterling basis, and that no justification exists for paying some England recruited departments on a sterling basis and others on a different basis, nor that such was ever the intention of Government when these pensions were fixed.

If the scale of pensions here proposed is adopted, Government should have the power compulsorily to retire any officer of 25 years' service or more who is considered inefficient.

As the Government of India had decided that no orders upon memorials submitted by Forest Officers could be passed until the Public Services Commission had completed their inquiries and submitted their report, it is urged that the case of all officers who retire subsequently to the date of the issue of the orders referred to and before the orders of Government on these recommendations are issued, retrospective effect should be given whereby such officers may receive the benefit of any enhanced pensions which may be granted.

66150. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial; and (VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—Any alterations are at present considered premature, though some may be necessary when the personnel of the Provincial Service has improved following on the better pay and prospects recently sanctioned for it.

66151. **(IX) Other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not dealt with by the preceding heads.**—The following points are also suggested for consideration:—

(*a*) A Service fund for widows and children.

(*b*) Free medical attendance for wives and families.

(*c*) Favourable passage rates in vessels.

(*d*) Actual expenses incurred on transfer, including those in connection with the transfer of an officers' family, should be reimbursed.

Mr. L. Mercer called and examined.

66152. (*Chairman.*) The witness explained that at Dehra Dun there was a College and an Institute which were quite separate from one another. The training of Rangers was carried out in the College, and Provincial Service officers were trained at the Institute, or would be when the buildings were completed. The syllabi of the two courses were somewhat similar, but the training in Forest subjects at the Institute was more advanced and was, as far as possible, given by experts in their special subjects. There were also two subjects which were included in the Institute course which were not included in the College course; one was Forest Zoology, which had been abolished for the Ranger class, on his recommendation, as being absolutely unnecessary; and the other was Working Plans. Rangers went through a two years' course, and were generally given, on their obtaining the requisite certificate, a post on Rs. 50. The course at the Institute was also for two years, but the classes there were kept entirely separate from the College classes. From the Institute men were appointed as probationary Extra Assistant Conservators; that was to say, probationers in the Provincial Service, the length of time for their probation being left entirely to the discretion of their local Governments. There were at the College quarters for about 80 students. When the Institute buildings were finished, the question of quarters for the students would have to be taken up. Students paid no fees whatever at the Institute and College, and Local Governments had the option of giving Provincial class students a stipend up to Rs. 100 a month, or a bonus on their passing out. The procedure actually adopted varied in the different provinces. In the United Provinces the Government had lately found that there was so large a demand for posts that it was unnecessary to give any stipend. In Burma, on the other hand, the Government had found it necessary to give a stipend. There were also private students who were taken into the Institute when vacancies occurred, and no fee was charged in their case either. These were men who could not obtain a nomination from any Local Government, but who desired a Forestry training in the hope of obtaining, sooner or later, some kind of suitable employment. There were also students from Native States. He had sole discretion as to the admission of students within the maximum number. There were Forestry Schools in the various provinces, but except in Burma and Madras they provided a training only for Deputy Rangers and Foresters, and he believed the instruction was given in the vernacular. He added that no students for Rangerships in Burma or in Madras were taken at Dehra Dun, as Burma and Madras had their own colleges for Rangers. The point to be aimed at was the establishment of Rangers' colleges in all the provinces, in order to take away the Rangers from Dehra Dun, where they were not wanted. As a rule, Imperial officers did not come to Dehra Dun for further training to specialise in any subjects.

66153. The present courses were satisfactory both in the Institute and in the College. The Institute training was as good as could be given anywhere, except that the training grounds in India were very much inferior to those of Europe. In India there were no forests which had been under systematic management, as now understood, for more than 25 years. However the equipment of the Institute was improved, there would be a difficulty in the technical training for the next 50 years or more, on account of the Institute not having at its disposal forests that had been long enough under systematic management, necessary for the training of students. During the rainy season lectures were given, and the balance of the year was spent in the forests themselves. Apart from the disability he had just mentioned, the course at Dehra Dun was practically the same as that given on the Continent. He had never been enamoured of the system of training men at various centres in England; he thought the best system was to train them at one centre in order to obtain uniformity, with one year's practical training on the Continent. He did not consider that at that central institution all the teachers should be men who had had forest experience in India, but he was of opinion that some of them should be, and even if this could be arranged, he did not think the training system would be as good as that which was formerly in existence on the Continent.

66154. In his judgment, the students sent to Dehra Dun by the various local Governments were often unsuitable for the work they would have to do as Forest officers. He thought in certain cases the men were very indifferently selected, especially in the new Provincial Service class. He had had to complain frequently of the inefficiency of the students and of their want of general education. Last year, out of a class of 15 or 16 he had already weeded out three on account of their inability to follow the course. On the whole, there were very few failures to pass the final examination, but he did not think the final certificate was at all a difficult one. He would not at all object to seeing the educational standard of students joining the Provincial Service class raised. The communities from which students were drawn varied greatly in different provinces. There were very few Muhammedan students. He was inclined to think that there should be a competitive examination before the students were sent to Dehra Dun. In the case of Indian students the right class, if it existed,

did not seem to have yet been tapped. He thought the Provincial Service did not appeal very much to the right class of Indians; the recruits were often not educationally, socially, or at times physically, fit for the work. Asked whether local Governments had a large field of selection, he replied that the United Provinces Government received a very large number of applications, and he imagined that there were large numbers of applicants in the Punjab and the Central Provinces. In his opinion there was a considerable number of Indians who were desirous of getting appointments as rangers. He did not know what educational tests were in force for Provincial Service candidates; the local Governments had a wide discretion in this matter. It had been proposed that candidates should be graduates or Bachelors of Agriculture, but he was entirely opposed to any such proposal. As a concrete example, he mentioned that for the Rangers' course he had had within the last two or three years three graduates who had failed to get the ordinary Rangers' certificate.

66155. On the question of recruitment in England, the witness expressed the view that there should be a Forest Officer of administrative rank on the Board of Selection. He was not very keen on the reintroduction of the physical test as it used to be carried out, but he would lay some stress on the previous history of the candidate in sports and so on.

66156. The witness was against any scheme for reserving a certain number of posts for supplementary recruitment of Indians in India because he thought the Indian was, as a rule, unsuited to the Imperial Forest Service; he hated isolation, and he was not too fond of hard physical exercise. The Indian Provincial Service Officer so much disliked isolation that he consorted freely with his subordinates, to the weakening of his own authority.

66157. He suggested that officers under whom recruits were posted should be granted an allowance, because the work of instruction involved a good deal of hard work and responsibility. At present the Divisional Officer had so many duties to perform that he had not time to look after recruits properly. He did not say that even if such an officer were paid, a student would be given a thoroughly efficient training, but he thought it would go a long way towards it.

66158. There were rules under which Forest Officers could obtain study leave. They had to send in an application to the Government of India with a statement showing what they proposed to do in Europe. He thought, on the whole, the rules were satisfactory, but not much use was made of them. He was inclined to think it would be a good thing if they were used more freely.

66159. The witness thought that any scheme for the promotion of Indians from the Provincial to the Imperial Service would be premature, because the personnel of the Provincial Service as now constituted was unsatisfactory, and until it was seen how the Provincial Service was going to improve, it was difficult to say whether promotions should be made on any large scale.

66160. In order to give effect to his scheme for specialisation in Botany and other subjects it would be necessary to employ an additional officer for each special branch of study.

66161. As regards pay and pension, his idea was that the best way to improve the conditions of the Service would be to increase pension rather than pay. He would not give Government unrestricted power to retire inefficient officers before 25 years' service.

66162. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The witness said the method of selection of the candidate depended entirely on the various local Governments. If the local Government had a strong Conservator, they possibly left the selection very much in his hands. If it had not a strong Conservator, the nomination would be in the hands of some high official of Government. He thought it would be more conducive to efficiency if there was in each province a recognised Board of Selection on which a Conservator would serve as ex-officio member, but he thought the Conservator would very likely be overruled by some high official of Government, who had some special man he wished to nominate. He thought a Board of the kind suggested would certainly be of assistance, but doubted whether it would be strong enough.

66163. The witness was of opinion that study-leave would be of great importance and assistance to an officer, and thought it should be given in addition to ordinary leave. If that were done, officers could be encouraged to prosecute their further studies.

66164. (*Mr. Madge.*) The witness said he had found that some members of the domiciled European and Anglo-Indian community who had not been educated in cities, but in the hills or elsewhere, did possess the qualities requisite for the Forest Service. He had found some most excellent boys in the hill schools. He did not consider that such boys should be handicapped because they did not possess university degrees. He thought it was the smaller proportion of domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians in the Department who came up to the desired standard, but that was not the fault of the boys, but of the method of selection. A better system of selection would attract a much better class of Anglo-Indian and domiciled European, but he did not think he could interfere in any way with the discretion of the local Governments in that respect.

66165. (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness agreed that the human element in the Forest Divisional Officer was almost of the same importance as the forest in which he was trained, but he thought it would be found that the most advanced divisions were as a rule held by selected officers.

66166. With regard to his scheme which provided for the grant of a maximum pension after 28 years' service, the witness expressed the view that an officer of 28 years' service was bound to have been made a Conservator if he was of any value. If he was not sufficiently good to be promoted to that rank, then he failed to see why he should get a bigger pension than was proposed under his scheme.

66167. With regard to the proposal that Chief Conservators and Conservators should be appointed as Secretaries or Joint Secretaries to Government, he said that in his opinion the local Governments would rather welcome a proposal of this kind, as it would take so much work off their own Secretariat.

66168. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness said there were comparatively few forests in England that had been under systematic management for any number of years. That was the reason why students who desired to study forestry had to go to the Continent before 1885. With the exception of Oxford, the forestry schools in England were not sufficiently advanced, but latterly the school at Cambridge had made considerable progress. The absence of forests which had been for any length of time under systematic management handicapped the schools in England, and that was why students were sent to the continent. In answer to the question why the same course could not have been adopted in India, he replied that so far as his experience went, not sufficiently good Indian material was forthcoming in India for the Forest Department. The power of selection was vested in local Governments because each local Government naturally desired to offer appointments to men in their own Province. He did not say it was impossible to find Indians who loved out-door life, but up to the present time he had not, except in one or two instances, found any well-educated Indians of this kind. He did not know whether that was the result of the present system of selection.

66169. (*Mr. Wrafter.*) The witness said that Assistant Instructors performed somewhat similar duties to Instructors in the Imperial Service. He thought there would be no objection to their being termed Instructors inasmuch as their role was to assist the instructors, especially in camp. The experiment of placing Provincial Service Officers in charge of the Ranger class had been tried some years ago, and had been absolutely condemned. The Provincial Officers were found to be absolutely unfitted to take charge of the large Ranger class.

(The witness withdrew.)

R. McIntosh, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Punjab.

Written Statement relating to the Imperial Forest Service, containing the views of the officers of the Imperial Forest Service in the Punjab.*

66170. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—The method of recruitment by selection in accordance with qualifications with a competitive examination amongst the selected candidates has given us men as good as any previously obtained from Nancy or Cooper's Hill. The present method, however, is not wholly satisfactory in that recruits now arrive in India at the age of 25 or 26 years, which is much too old. At this age it is not easy for men to settle down to learn the details of their work, often seemingly trivial, yet nevertheless essential; and they are apt to be dissatisfied at not being placed in responsible positions sooner than they are. Also, unless they enjoy perfect health throughout their service the chances are against men who join at such an advanced age being able to serve long enough to get the higher pensions.

Too much stress is laid on probationers having a Science degree, which, to the majority of them, will never be of any use. The advantages of a university education are undoubted, but the requirements of the Forest Service, being what they are, it would be preferable to go back to the previous method of recruitment and get youths fresh from the Public Schools, and to give them a special forest training. Such candidates as showed special aptitude for any Science could, if considered desirable, receive an additional year's training in that Science; but it would be better where specialists are needed in any Science, *e.g.*, Chemistry or Zoology or Botany, to obtain them by the recruitment of special men. This method of recruiting candidates of from 17 to 19 years of age, which was tried after Cooper's Hill was closed, failed because at that time a career in the Forest Department was not sufficiently attractive; now that the pay and prospects of the Forest Officers have been improved in many respects, it is thought that there will be no difficulty in obtaining the necessary recruits.

As the life of the Forest Officer is one of greater physical exertion than that of an officer of any other service in India, except perhaps those of the Survey Department, and he has fewer opportunities of obtaining medical treatment or advice, it is essential that he should be constitutionally stronger, and the test of physical fitness of recruits for the Forest Services should therefore be of the strictest. The importance of this point appears to have been overlooked in recent years.

66171. **(II) Systems of Training and Probation.**—The present system of training Forest probationers at several universities has only recently come into force, so one cannot as yet judge by results; but it does not appear likely to prove so satisfactory as the former system of training all the recruits at one centre, whether Cooper's Hill College or Oxford University. The number recruited annually is so small that it seems improbable that a satisfactory training, suitable for Indian conditions, can be provided at more than one institution. Besides, it tends to the better efficiency of the service if all its members receive the same technical training.

The present practical training in the Continental forests is satisfactory. The probationers should visit as many varieties of forests as possible, and study their systems of management, modes of extracting and utilising the produce, etc., etc.

As regards the employment of the recruits on first joining in India, there appears to be nothing to add to the general instructions issued by the Government of India on this subject.

66172. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—It has been mentioned in paragraph 66170 above that a Forest Officer leads a more (physically) strenuous life than an officer of any other service in India, except perhaps the Survey Department, and that he has not the same opportunities of obtaining medical advice and treatment. As a proof of the extraordinary casualties to which the Forest Service is exposed, it is only necessary to refer to an article in the "Indian Forester" for November, 1912, in which it is shown that out of 49 officers recruited between the years 1877 and 1886 20 *are dead*, five have left the service without pensions, five are drawing reduced pensions, only five are drawing the full pension, and 14 are still in the service. The ages of the officers who joined between the years 1877 and 1886 would range from 49 to 59 years.

Under the conditions of his service the Forest Officer has to spend long periods by himself, and is practically deprived of most of the amenities of social life, added to which, owing to the refusal of the Secretary of State to sanction a second Conservatorship for the Punjab, the work of the present Conservator is of absolute drudgery, and owing to the gazetted staff being undermanned, the officers in charge of the larger divisions are overworked. The present charges in the hill tracts of the Punjab are as large, and at the same time contain forests of such importance from the sylvicultural point of view, that it is quite impossible for the officer in charge to deal efficiently with many important works. In such cases the mere routine work of his charge absorbs a very great part of his time, with the result that important works have time after time and year by year to be postponed for lack of time to carry them out—a state of affairs which must obviously be detrimental to the forests. This state of affairs requires to be remedied as soon as possible if (1) the Forest Officer is to be rendered reasonably contented with his lot and (2) the Province is to be in a position to develop its forest resources to the best advantage. The only remedy that suggests itself is an early increase in the cadre of the Imperial Forest Service in the Punjab. Officers with European training are, it is considered, a *sine quâ non* since the important hill charges of the Punjab contain important coniferous forests, the sylvicultural treatment of which is on general lines precisely similar to that of the large coniferous forests of Europe.

66173. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—No scale of pay below that recommended by the Government of India in their Despatches No. 371, dated 2nd November, 1905, and No. 389, dated 1st November, 1906, can, under the conditions at present prevailing, be regarded as adequate or likely to remove the sense of injustice which, there can be no doubt, is felt by officers of the Imperial Forest Service. It has been stated that some of the highest posts in the service have been refused by Officers on more than one occasion, and if this is the case, the insufficient and, indeed, quite inadequate, pay of these posts has undoubtedly been the largest, or at least a very large, point which has influenced these officers in their decision. It is not possible for Officers of adminis-

* Signed by Mr. J. Copeland, Conservator of Forests, Punjab, on behalf of the Imperial Forest Service officers of the Punjab.

trative rank to maintain their position as Head of Departments either with Local Governments or with the Government of India on their present pay. Moreover, it is considered essential that there should be a difference of at least Rs. 500 per mensem between the pay of officers of executive and administrative rank, between the pay of a Conservator and of a Chief Conservator, and between the pay of a Chief Conservator and of the Inspector-General of Forests. In the opinion of the Department the pay of Officers of administrative rank should be as follows:—

Conservators (two grades only).—

	Per mensem. Rs.
2nd grade	1,750
1st grade	2,000
Chief Conservator	2,500
Inspector-General of Forests	3,000

While admitting that the pay of the Imperial Branch of the Forest Service was considerably improved by the time-scale of pay which was sanctioned by the Secretary of State for India in his Despatch No. 229, dated 21st December, 1906, yet there has prevailed a feeling of some discontent and even irritation on some minor points in the sanctioned scheme. It is thought, in the first place, that the scheme does not err on the side of liberality as regards pay in the early years of an Officer's service. It is generally felt that at least Rs. 400 should be paid to an officer on joining the service, and that his salary should then rise by annual increments of Rs. 50 per mensem until it amounted to Rs. 1,250 in the 18th year of service. Again, there is a great feeling of irritation over the proviso which prevents an officer appointed to the service before the 1st January, 1909, drawing his increment until the 1st of the month following that on which it is earned. Though this may seem a small point, yet the cancellation of the exception to Article 151 (as amended by correction Slip No. 173) of the Civil Service Regulations, 5th Edition, would undoubtedly cause great satisfaction to all Officers affected thereby. The following representation made by Mr. H. M. Glover, Assistant Conservator of Forests, an officer trained at Oxford University, is inserted as expressing a grievance which may be held by other officers of his standing:—

"Prior to 1905 probationers were trained for the Forest Service at Cooper's Hill, and a capable man was able to complete his training and enter service in India by the time he was 21 years of age. In 1905 probationers were recruited from Oxford and other Universities and were desired to take an Honours Degree in Natural Science. This necessitated at least three years at Oxford, and in addition another year had to be spent in Germany in order to obtain a Diploma of Forestry and to qualify for service in India. This actually meant that no probationer could hope to reach India before he was 23 years of age—two years later than he would have done if he had gone through Cooper's Hill.

"He has thus had two years expensive extra training and finds himself two years behind men of his own age already in the service. He feels the effects of this throughout his service as he draws pay on a time scale and suffers a handicap from the very beginning owing to his forced late entry. I would suggest that all men who entered the Forest Service in 1905 and the immediately succeeding years and who did obtain the honours degree asked for be allowed to draw pay on the existing time scale at the same rate as if they had entered the Forest Service two years earlier. In the Army seniority is given to University candidates, and I suggest that the conditions are similar."

66174. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The proposals for the revision of the existing leave rules contained in Government of India letters No. 538 C.S.R., dated 13th September, 1912, and No. 674 C.S.R., dated 19th October, 1912, would be generally acceptable to officers of the Forest Department in the Punjab with the following further amendments:—

(1) The restriction on the amount of privilege leave earned (*vide proviso* to article 246 of the Civil Service Regulations, 5th edition) should be removed or at least privilege leave might be allowed to accumulate up to six months.

(2) The time taken by an officer to reach Bombay or Karachi, whichever is nearest by the shortest route, should be added to the period of privilege leave, thus putting all officers in India on the same footing.

(3) The suggestions as to the commutation of furlough on half pay to furlough for shorter periods on full pay contained in paragraph 4 of the Government of India letter No. 538, dated the 13th September, 1912, are cordially welcomed by the Forest Department, and it is hoped that some such scheme will recommend itself to the Members of the Royal Commission.

(4) There is a strong feeling throughout the Service that the minimum allowance for furlough and leave on medical certificate should at least follow the ratio adopted between the Indian Civil Service and other Services for the maximum furlough allowance, *i.e.*, this minimum should be £400 per annum or the salary last drawn on duty whichever is less. This recommendation represents the minimum demand of the service and many Forest Officers are of opinion that furlough allowances should be the same as those granted to the Indian Civil Service. It has been pointed out that the furlough allowance of an officer with eight years' service is under £280 a year and this, it is clear, is not enough to enable an officer to support himself in any comfort while on furlough.

66175. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The present pension rules are most unsatisfactory, and recently nearly the whole of the officers of the Imperial Service have memorialised the Secretary of State for India on the subject. It is believed that these memorials are now in the hands of the Royal Commission. In the year 1870 or thereabouts the pension allowed to all Civil Services after 25 years' service was £500 or Rs. 5,000 a year at which time these sums were identical. Now owing to the fall in the value of silver this pension is only worth £333 a year if drawn in India, and with the value of the rupee fixed at 1s. 9d. if drawn in England £437 10s. Moreover, the present scale of pensions was fixed *more than 35 years ago* since when the cost of living in England has admittedly risen to a very great extent. Moreover, the present scale of pensions for officers of the Imperial Service is disproportionately small compared with that recently sanctioned for officers of the Provincial Service. An officer of the latter service who serves for two years in the highest grade of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests can earn a pension of Rs. 5,000 per annum, that is to say, exactly the same pension as any Imperial Service Officer except the Inspector-General of Forests, a Chief Conservator or a Conservator who has put in 28 years' service. It must surely be considered just that an officer of the Imperial Service who has undergone an expensive training in Europe, who spends his life in a country far distant from his home, often under climatic conditions most trying to and indeed often entirely unsuited to the European, and whose standard of living is necessarily a far more expensive one than that of the native of India, should draw a pension much larger than that drawn by a Provincial Service Officer. Further, the present scale of pensions compares most unfavourably with the sterling pensions paid to other Scientific Departments, such, for instance, as the Indian Medical Service—a Service composed of men of the same social standing as an Imperial Service Forest Officer and of very similar attainments. There is a strong feeling throughout the Imperial Service that officers should be paid sterling and not rupee pensions. Any pension scheme should be a graduated one so as to give officers sufficient inducement not to retire too early at a time when they are often of most value to Government. The

following scale of pensions is put forward for the consideration of the Royal Commission: there is a very strong feeling among a large number of officers that, in view of the exceptional conditions under which they work and the large number of casualties that occur in the Imperial Service, the minimum pension after 20 years' service should be £500 per annum:—

Ordinary pensions—	Per annum.
After 20 years' service	£500
After 25 years' service	600
After 28 years' service or 3 years as Conservator	700
Extra for 3 years' service as Chief Conservator or President, Forest Research Institute	50
Extra for 3 years' service as Inspector-General of Forests	100

Invalid pensions would be calculated at the rate of £25 for each completed year of service up to 20 years' service.

If the above pensions are granted, Government should have the power of retiring compulsorily on the pension which he has earned any officer of 25 years' service or more who is deemed inefficient.

As the Government of India has decided that no orders upon memorials submitted by Forest Officers can be passed until the Royal Commission has completed its inquiry and submitted its report, it is urged that in the case of an officer who retires subsequently to the date of the issue of the orders referred and before the orders of Government on the Commission's recommendations are issued, retrospective effect should be given whereby such an officer may receive the benefit of an enhanced pension if such be sanctioned.

66176. **(VII) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—As there are no limitations placed on the entry of natives of India into the Imperial Service there is nothing to be said on this point. Entry into the Imperial Service is open to Indians under exactly the same conditions as to Europeans except with reference to marriage, where the Indian has the advantage of the European. No alterations are necessary or advisable.

Any increase in the numbers of the Provincial as compared with the Imperial Service is quite inadvisable and would necessarily mean a loss of efficiency since the training obtained in Europe, with its highly organised and developed forest estates, by an Imperial Service Officer, is necessarily of a much higher standard than anything that is at present possible in India, where Scientific Forestry is a science still very much in its infancy.

66177. **(VII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Servce and with other Services.**—The existing system which makes the Forest Officer for all practical purposes the assistant in forest matters to the District Officer has been evolved after very careful consideration of the subject by the Local Government, and on the whole works with great smoothness. It is not desired that any change in this system be introduced in the Punjab.

66178. **(IX) Other points.**—Consderable loss is often incurred by officers owing to the inadequacy of the amount of travelling allowance allowed in cases of transfer from one station to another—a long distance away. It is suggested that actual expenses might be paid to Imperial Service Officers subject to provisos which would follow *mutatis mutandis* those which apply to non-gazetted officers on transfer (*vide* article 1098 of Civil Service Regulations, 5th edition)

MR. R. McINTOSH called and examined.

66179. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he attended before the Committee to endorse the views of his colleagues in the Imperial Service. The memorandum represented the views of the 14 officers at present serving in the Punjab; the Punjab officers at Dehra Dun had not been consulted. The witness saw no objection to the proposal that a certain proportion of probationerships in the Imperial Forest Department should be reserved for Indians selected in India, the Indian probationer taking the same course in England and on the Continent as the European, provided only that the material was sufficiently good. His opinion was that the material obtained so far was not likely to benefit to the full extent by a training in England. He did not think the promoted Ranger, who formed the bulk of the Provincial Service was of the right class. He had no doubt that under the new system of direct recruitment there would be a marked improvement in the class of officers, but it was very difficult to say at present how great that improvement would be. If it was found desirable to give facilities to a certain number of Indians to enter the Imperial Service, he would prefer that they should enter young and be sent to England for their training, and go through the course which the Imperial Service now went through.

66180. He was very much in favour of a reduction of the age for admission to the Imperial Service. At present men came out between the ages of 24 and 25, and their character was already greatly formed, and they were naturally inclined to resent not being given important work at once. He thought the earlier Europeans came out to India the more easily they acquired the language. If men were recruited at the school-leaving age, he did not think it was necessary that all of them should have a training in advanced science. He thought in a great many cases men made comparatively little use of their scientific knowledge in after life. That, of course, did not apply to those who subsequently specialised. A certain training in science was absolutely necessary, but an Honours degree in Science was not necessary. He would like to see the probationary course extended, partly at some centre where there was a Forestry school and partly on the Continent. He thought there should be at least a year's practical training on the Continent. He did not think seven months was sufficient. He preferred a system of nomination followed by examination for the Imperial Service. The present Board of Selection was quite a competent authority, provided there was somebody on it with an intimate knowledge of recent Forest work in India. He would like to re-establish the physical test. He did not think it was necessary that a probationer for the Imperial Service should spend a portion of his time in India. The course he went through after arrival in India did all that was necessary. There was no advantage in bringing a man out before he had finished what he could learn in England. The conditions of forestry in India were entirely different from those in Europe, but he considered the training that a recruit received in Europe would give him the grounding in the principles of forestry which would enable him to assimilate the different conditions of India with comparative ease in the course of his first year. Newly entered officers were made to pass a Departmental test within two years after their arrival. He thought the examination was adequate.

66181. The witness considered it inadvisable from the point of view of the efficiency of the Service that men should be encouraged to leave the Service after 20 years. It meant that a man had the opportunity of leaving when he was of most value to Government. If the age for entry were reduced, the disadvantage would present itself in a still more accentuated form. In reply to a question whether many officers took advantage of the 20 years' concession, the witness replied that he would take as an instance his own year. Out of 11 officers who came out in 1890, three had died, two had retired with 20 years' service, one had resigned, and five were still in the service. He understood from his brother

officers that many of them were likely to take advantage of the option of retiring at 20 years if the present conditions of service continued. Very few officers remained in the Service after the age of 55. He thought if the scale of pensions were improved, his colleagues would be prepared to come into line with the other Services in regard to the period of retirement. He thought there would be advantages in a system which would provide for payment of retiring allowances, partly in the form of a pension and partly in the form of a lump sum as gratuity. As far as he knew, all the officers in the Punjab contributed 12½ per cent. to the General Provident Fund. He thought a Family Pension Fund would be very popular amongst officers if they were just joining the Service. He did not think many officers of his acquaintance would be prepared to contribute compulsorily to both funds, but he thought if a Family Pension Fund was established, there should also be a voluntary Provident Fund.

66182. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness said that an average Imperial officer ought to be ready for real work in 18 months after arriving in India. Replying to a question whether he thought the conditions of entry into the Service were the same for Indians and Europeans, the witness replied that at present there was this difference that the examination in the one case was held in the Europeans' native country, and in the case of the Indian it was held in a foreign country. He thought that made a very great difference. If it had been necessary in his own case to come out to India, to take a College course and to appear at an examination, the prospects being what they were, he should not have entered the Service.

66183. (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness said that in the opinion of the majority of the officers in the department pension should be payable after 20 years' service, and if the 20 years' service rule were abolished it would be considered to be a grievance by the officers in the Department. He had been specially asked to press that the rule should not be abolished.

66184. In the Punjab the initial selection of candidates from the Provincial Service rested with the Conservator, who recommended names to the local Government. The local Government then made a selection from amongst the men recommended by the Conservator. With regard to the statement made by the President of the Dehra Dun College that the Provincial Forest Service was more popular in the Punjab than in some other Provinces, the witness said his personal opinion was that in the Punjab there was the best material at present for the Provincial Service. He had found some of the hill men excellent. They, of all the different Indian races he had had to deal with, seemed to like an out-door life, and were not afraid of hard physical exertion. Unfortunately, however, their general educational standard was low. So far, candidates had not come forward in the Punjab who possessed both physical and educational qualifications, but possibly if the conditions of the Service were altered, or made sufficiently enticing, a better class of men might be obtained in the Punjab.

66185. He thought the opinion of the officers in the Punjab was that the improvement most urgently required was an increase of pension. So far as he knew the junior officers of the Service would unanimously prefer that their terms of pension, rather than their terms of pay, should be improved, but he was not perfectly sure about that point.

66186. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The witness said that if, as a boy, he had had the alternative put before him of serving in England in a lower service or of coming out to India to study, with the object of finally returning to England and serving in a higher branch of the Service, he would not have given the matter a moment's consideration and would unhesitatingly have accepted the latter alternative.

(The witness withdrew).

Pandit Gokul Das, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Punjab.

Written Statement relating to the Provincial Forest Service.*

66187. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—Candidates for the Provincial Forest Service should hold a degree of B.Sc. of an Indian University. A reference to paragraph 17 of the Syllabus for the Provincial Service will show that without a preliminary training in Science probationers are not able to complete an advanced course of training within a reasonable time. The selection of probationers for the Provincial Service should then be made by the Conservator. Another alternative is to select the candidates and to hold a competitive examination. The examination should be in English, Mathematics, and Science.

The present system of filling up vacancies in the Provincial Forest Service by competent and clearly deserving members of the Subordinate Service to the extent of 50 per cent. may continue until Forest Rangers recruited under the rules in force before the introduction of the Provincial Service course have been pensioned off, and after that only specially efficient Forest Rangers should be appointed to the Provincial Service by Government, and then there will be no use of any fixed percentage.

66188. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The preliminary course of five months of practical training before admission to the Forest College at Dehra Dun should be reduced to three months. The probationers should then undergo a training for two years at the Forest College, Dehra Dun, at Government expense. The successful probationers should then be placed for one year in charge of a Range and for one year on special works. During this probationary period of two years they should get Rs. 150 per mensem, as at present.

After this the probationers should be appointed to the Forest Department, without any further period of probation. The period of two years is quite enough to determine whether a probationer is fit for the Forest Department or not. It is worth mention that in the Punjab the number of probationers is greatly in excess of the requirements, *viz.*, there are eight probationers for a Provincial Service cadre of nine posts. When it is considered that 50 per cent. of the posts ought to go to Forest Rangers already in service before the Provincial Service started, the chances of all of the probationers getting permanent posts within a reasonable time are very remote. Why so many probationers were nominated is due to the fact that the revised scheme for increasing the number of Provincial Service posts in anticipation of sanction of which these probationers were nominated was eventually dropped, or is perhaps still under consideration. Under these circumstances it is just and fair that the probationers who are not appointed Extra Assistant Conservators after three years' probation should get a personal allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem to enable them to maintain themselves in a fitting position.

66189. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—We are of opinion that the Forest staff, comprising both the Imperial and Provincial Services, should be borne on one amalgamated list, as is the case in the Public Works Department. The prefix

* Signed on behalf of the Provincial Forest Service Officers of the Punjab by Messrs. Gokal Das and Fazl-ud-Din, Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests, and Mr. Muhammad Said, Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests.

"Extra" is not in use in either of the Medical, Police, Education or Public Works Department. This prefix lowers the prestige of the Provincial Forest Service.

We are also of opinion that officers of the Provincial Forest Service should be eligible for the highest rank at present open only to Imperial Service officers.

The division of the controlling staff into "Upper" and "Lower" should be abolished. This will give great satisfaction to the officers of the Provincial Forest Service.

66190. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The present time-scale pay system of promotion is a great improvement, but, considering the hardships of the Forest Service, the pay is still insufficient. Forest officers have to serve in out-of-the-way places and in localities that are not always healthy and are away from medical aid. Besides, in places where they have to pass the greatest part of their lives there are no educational facilities for their children, and they have, therefore, to send them to schools at places considerably distant from where they live; and, considering the cost of living, which is daily increasing, it is proposed that an Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests should start at Rs. 250 per mensem, rising with an annual increment of Rs. 30 per mensem to Rs. 1,000. Officers should be called Assistant Conservator of Forests up to Rs. 550 grade, and Deputy Conservators of Forests after that.

Under the present rules there are several disadvantages from which the Provincial Forest Service suffers:—

(*a*) The number of posts of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests which have been allotted in several provinces for the Provincial Service officers is very limited, whereas on the Imperial list there can be as many Deputy Conservators as there are officers entitled to the pay of that grade under the time-scale system of increment. This limitation should be removed.

(*b*) The restrictions laid down in paragraph 11 (*c*) of Government of India resolution No. 17-F.—77-33, dated the 23rd June, 1911, Revenue and Agricultural Department, regarding the promotion of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests from Rs. 650 to Rs. 700, from Rs. 700 to Rs. 800, and from Rs. 800 to Rs. 850 should be removed. The Local Government has already the power to stop the increment of any officer at any stage.

The Provincial Service Forest Officers feel that the scale of pay of the Imperial Service Forest Officers is rather low. The starting pay at Rs. 380 should be raised to at least Rs. 400 and rise to Rs. 1,500 for Deputy Conservator of Forests. The prestige of a Department is judged from the emoluments of the officers. Besides the increase in the cost of living, it is worth noting that only a very small percentage of officers rise to administrative ranks. The pay of Conservators should be the same as that of an Inspector-General of Police or Chief Engineer, Public Works Department.

66191. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The provisions for the grant of leave proposed in Government of India No. 674 C. S. R. (Finance Department), dated the 19th October, 1912, are generally suitable. But, instead of five years' furlough, we would prefer three years in 25 years' service, provided the whole of it counts towards pension. Furlough should be admissible at shorter intervals, say, five years, and not eight years, as is the case at present. The grant of furlough of one and a half years on fully pay, instead of three years on half pay, would be better still.

The Provincial Service Officers think that the furlough allowance should in no case be less than three-fourths of the pay which an officer is drawing at the time he takes furlough.

In the case of officers serving in the hills, such as Kulu, Bashahr, etc., the date of departure and arrival should be considered the date when an officer starts from or arrives at the nearest railway station.

The restriction on the amount of privilege leave earned (*vide* proviso to article 246 of the Civil Service Regulations) should be removed, or at least privilege leave might be allowed to accumulate up to six months.

66192. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—It is suggested that an invalid pension owing to untimely breakdown of health should be fixed in the following ratio: One-third of salary after 10 years' service, and half after 20 years, and retiring pension after 25 years instead of 30 years.

66193. **(VII) Limitation in the employment of non-Europeans and the Working of the Existing System of Division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.**—There are no limitations to the employment of non-Europeans in the Provincial Forest Service, but there are practical difficulties in the way of Indians for entering the Imperial Forest Service. For instance:—

(*i*) Language.—No provision exists in the present day Indian Educational Institutions for the teaching of French or German. This means that an Indian who wishes to join the Imperial Forest Service should go to England at a very tender age, which is impracticable.

(*ii*) The condition that a candidate must have passed with honours in a public examination for a degree in some branch of natural science held by a University of Great Britain or Ireland, is another block in the way of the Indians. Unless an Honours degree of an Indian University is recognised by the rules, in the majority of cases Indians have no chance of entering the Imperial Forest Service.

(*iii*) The age-limit also stands in the way of the Indians. Few Indians take their degrees at 22. The age-limit should be raised to 23.

As we propose only one amalgamated list of Imperial and Provincial officers, the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial should be abolished. There is no doubt that, as at present understood, the Provincial Service is considered to be inferior to the Imperial Service.

66194. **(VIII) Relations with other Departments.**—The existing system of making the Forest Officer Assistant to the District Officer is working well, and no changes are required.

66195. **(IX) Other points.**—All officers drawing above Rs. 500, whether they are or are not in charge of a Division, should get first-class travelling allowance.

In cases of transfers, the travelling allowance should be regulated according to the provisions of article 1098 of the Civil Service Regulations. At present considerable loss is caused to married men on account of transfers from one district to another.

PANDIT GOKUL DAS called and examined.

66196. (*Chairman.*) The witness said the written statement which had been submitted to the Commission contained the views of the large majority of the officers in the Service. He had no opinion to express in regard to recruitment for the Provincial Service other than what was set forth in the written statement, where a scheme was proposed for examination and nomination. He regarded selection as of great importance, but there were some of his colleagues who said that there should be a purely competitive examination. He desired to see the system of nomination retained because men were sometimes obtained by competition who were not suitable for the Forest Service. Although they might be graduates, they might not be fit on other grounds. He did not think hill men would have much chance of entering the Service by competitive examination, as their education was much below that of the men on the plains. He thought, however, that the hill men were a valuable element in

the Service, provided they had a sufficient knowledge of English and Mathematics, and also that they were able to follow the course at Dehra Dun.

66197. He did not think that a certain number of vacancies in the Imperial Service should be reserved for recruitment in India. He thought that, so long as the difficulties mentioned in paragraph 15 of the written statement were not removed, men should rise from the Provincial Service to the Imperial Service, and that there should be one list only.

66198. The witness said he had been in charge of a major division for the last few years. He had held hill divisions and plain divisions. He had also held the post of Personal Assistant to the Conservator, and had also done some working plans. His responsibilities and powers were the same as those of an Imperial officer. The post he occupied was regarded as an important one among the major charges.

66199. The practical training in Forestry given to selected Provincial candidates before their admission to Dehra Dun, consisted simply of three or four months' attachment to a division, in order to see whether they were fit to work in a forest or not. As to whether the probationary period of training subsequent to the Dehra Dun course was satisfactory, the witness said his proposal was to send the probationers for nine months to Europe. That would be a great advantage, although it was not absolutely necessary for the discharge of a Divisional Officer's duty. There had been Conservators and even Chief Conservators who had had no European training or experience. He had had no European experience, but he thought such experience would have been of great advantage to him. There was no opportunity of taking study-leave to Europe at present. That privilege was confined to the Imperial Service.

66200. Generally speaking, officers of the Provincial Service did not take the leave to which they were entitled, because the leave allowances were so small that officers could not maintain their families. He would very much like to see an improvement in the leave rules. The point was that men required leave at special periods. For instance, when any one of his sons or daughters married, an officer would like to have six months' leave for preparation, and under the present rules he could not get it. It would conflict with the work of the Service.

66201. With regard to pensions, he would like to see a pension equal to one-third of salary after 10 years' service, a pension equal to one-half of salary after 20 years, and a retiring pension after 25 years instead of 30. The opinion of the majority of his colleagues was that 30 years was too long for an officer to serve in the Forest Department, but personally he differed from them. He thought 30 years was not too much for an officer in his own country. He had been serving 32 years. Many officers died during the period of their service in the Punjab.

66202. Officers, especially those with families, suffered hardship from the present system of transfers and travelling allowances. Transfers were very frequent, especially in the case of junior officers.

66203. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The career of a Forest officer did appeal to Indians, and they liked the life. That was borne out by the number of applications for such posts in the Punjab. Recently there had been 75 applications for five posts of Rangers. For the Provincial Service there had not been any applications during the last two or three years for certain reasons which were set out in his written statement. So far as the Punjab was concerned he thought it was the conditions of Service rather than the nature of the Service that kept Indians from entering it.

66204. (*Mr. Sly.*) Officers of the Service considered that their pay and pension were in most need of reform. He desired the reduction of the practical test prior to entry at Dehra Dun from five months to three months, because really the practical test was no training at all; it was simply a means of finding out whether a man liked the Forest Service or not, and for that purpose three months was as good as five months.

66205. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness said his present salary was Rs. 600. If he had been an Imperial Service officer of the same standing his salary would have been Rs. 1,250. He entered the Service under the old rules. He had been in the Provincial Service, strictly so-called, for about 15 years and he had served two years as Extra Deputy Conservator.

66206. He proposed that the distinction between the Provincial and Imperial Services should be abolished, but that the rate of salaries should remain the same. At present the Provincial officers received two-thirds of the salary of the Imperial Service officers. They did not complain of that. If, however, arrangements were made at Dehra Dun for the training of young men who desired to get into the Imperial Forest Service and they were then sent to Europe and were finally admitted to the Service on the same terms as English officers, then he considered they should get the same rate of pay as Imperial Service officers. He certainly thought that if facilities were offered to Indians to rise to the higher appointments, a number of Indians would be forthcoming who were qualified both physically and educationally for those posts.

66207. (*Mr. Hill.*) The witness said that one and a half year's furlough on full pay instead of three years' furlough on half pay would be adequate for an Indian. With regard to his statement that on occasions officers required six months' leave, he thought that privilege leave should be allowed to accumulate up to that period.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Calcutta, Monday, 19th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

J. W. A. GRIEVE, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests.
E. A. C. MODDER, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

H. S. GIBSON, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bengal.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being a Memorandum on behalf of the Imperial Forest Service in Bengal.

66208. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The age at which men are taken as probationers to the Imperial Forest Service is at present so high that it is often difficult for them to put in the necessary service to qualify for the maximum pension. The present stipulation that a man must possess a University Degree in Science should be abolished and the age limits for probationers should be fixed at 18 to 20 years. A lower age is undesirable as the men would not be sufficiently developed by the end of their training to withstand the Indian climate properly.

It is of the greatest importance that all probationers should be required to pass a very strict medical examination in addition to a searching physical test.

Candidates should be selected in order to weed out unsuitable men. If the number of suitable candidates is greater than the number of vacancies to be filled, there should be a competitive examination, open only to such men as have been selected as entirely suitable for the Service.

66209. **(II) System of Training and Probation.** The present system of training is not satisfactory. In the first place probationers should all be trained together at one residential institution. If it could be done at one of the leading English Universities it would have several advantages. It might not, however, be possible to arrange it under the reduced age limit proposed above.

The course of training should extend over three full years, and should contain much more practical work than at present, especially in surveying and engineering. A short time at the beginning of the course should be spent in a forest of some sort, and the course should conclude with a year's work in continental forests. It would be advantageous if the students could be together for a great part of this time.

An adequate allowance, sufficient to cover all the expenses of the course of training, should be granted to all probationers whose conduct is satisfactory.

No special probationary course in India is necessary. It is far better that recruits should be placed under selected senior officers for their first two or three years in India.

66210. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The service should be kept truly Imperial. All tendency towards provincialisation should be checked. Every post should be open to any officer who is competent to fill it. All officers when they first join the service are told that all of the highest posts are open to them, but in actual practice it is not always the case.

More facilities should also be given for the interchange of officers between different provinces. This will make conditions fairer for the officers themselves, as a man posted to a bad province will not then be kept there all his service. Interchange broadens the experience of officers, and gives better opportunities of testing their work. A man posted to an easy province may gain the reputation of a brilliant officer, when in reality he is not such a good officer as another man who, posted in a difficult province, has only an average reputation. Finally by interchange of officers a province may benefit by the introduction of new methods.

Better facilities should also be granted for men to study Forestry in other countries.

In order to compensate for inequalities in different Provinces more adequate local allowances should be given in expensive and unhealthy provinces. In unhealthy provinces, too, special facilities for leave should be granted, and every officer should be permitted to enjoy two months' recess during the hot weather and rains unless there are urgent reasons why he should not leave his division.

The service should be more adequately staffed than at present to prevent the overworking of officers and to allow of better supervision of the forests. Owing to the present understaffing of the service it is often impossible to grant men leave so frequently as is desirable in order that they may retain their health.

66211. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The Imperial Forest Service is a small service, and holds charge and is responsible for the development of some of the most valuable property of Government. It is of great importance that the best stamp of men should be attracted into the service. It is only fair therefore that its members should be paid on at least the same scale as other services of similar importance. In fact, however, the prospects offered to a man joining the Forest Service are worse than in any other service of similar standing, though several strong reasons can be given for granting Forest men a higher rate of remuneration than is given to men in other services of similar importance.

At the last reorganisation the actual increase in salary for Assistant Conservators was little more than nominal, and many men are worse off under the present system during their first five or six years than they would have been under the old system of grade pay. At the same time the cost of necessaries has increased enormously.

It is agreed, however, by all that the time-scale should be retained. The salaries should be raised sufficiently to compensate for the increased cost of living, and also, in the higher grades, to place the service on an equal footing with other services of similar standing. The initial salary should be Rs. 400 per mensem, increasing annually by Rs. 50 per mensem up to Rs. 1,250 in the 18th year of service. Thereafter personal allowances increasing annually by Rs. 50 per mensem should be given to officers fit for the post of Conservator, but for whom there is no vacancy, up to a maximum of Rs. 1,500. Conservators should receive Rs. 1,600, Rs. 1,800, and Rs. 2,000 respectively; Chief Conservators Rs. 2,500, increasing annually by Rs. 100 up to Rs. 3,000; and the Inspector-General of Forests Rs. 3,000, increasing annually by Rs. 100 up to Rs. 3,500.

Much hardship is also entailed by placing Junior Assistant Conservators of Forests in charge of a division without any charge allowance. Any Assistant Conservator of Forests placed in charge of a division should receive a charge allowance equivalent to one-fifth of the minimum pay of a Deputy Conservator of Forests or any less amount by which his pay falls short of the minimum pay of a Deputy Conservator of Forests.

66212. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The proposed new leave rules are satisfactory.

Privilege leave should not be allowed to lapse, but it should be possible for an officer to take as much privilege leave as he has earned by active Service. Retrospective effect should be given to this concession, so that officers may have to their credit any privilege leave earned but not taken during the last six years.

There should be a minimum furlough allowance of £400 per annum. Government servants on leave at Home are on the whole worse off than men engaged in commercial concerns. This is not as it should be, as it tends to throw a stigma on Government Service. Men on leave should receive an adequate subsistence allowance, and some concession might be granted to them in the cost of steamship fares.

66213. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The intention of Government in granting a pension is presumably to provide adequate means of subsistence for its retired servants and their families, and enable them to educate their children in a manner suitable to their social standing. The present pension was fixed about 16 years ago, when the value of the rupee was greater and the cost of living far cheaper than at present. Consequently it is now totally inadequate.

The conditions of life in the Forest Service are exceptionally hard, so that when a man retires his health seldom permits him to take up other work. There is little opportunity for saving, so that a retired Forest Officer has to be practically dependent on his pension.

The Forest Officer may then fairly ask to be treated with some liberality in the matter of pension. Few live to enjoy it, and they seldom for very long.

Pensions should not be placed on a contributory basis. They should be paid in sterling.

The minimum pension after 20 years' Service should be £500 per annum, increasing by £20 per annum up to £600 after 25 years' Service. This should be the maximum for officers who do not attain the rank of Conservator. For each year of Service as Conservator an Additional £40 should be granted, subject to a maximum of £800 per annum.

Invalid pensions should be granted on the following scale: £20 for each year of Service below 10 years, £250 after 10 years, and £25 for each additional year's Service up to £475 after 19 years.

66214. **(VII) Such limitations as exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—The present conditions are satisfactory, and no alteration appears necessary.

66215. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The present relations are satisfactory.

66216. **(IX) Other points.**—(*a*) Much hardship is undoubtedly often incurred in transfers. Hardly ever does the present travelling allowance cover the expenses even of an unmarried man. It does not seem just that an officer should be the loser owing to his transfer "in the interests of Government." Some allowance should therefore also be made for the wives of married officers. It should not be difficult to devise a system of allowance based on actual expenses, such as rail fare for an officer and his wife (if married) as well as for two servants and freight on a reasonable quantity of baggage. Even this takes no account of losses owing to the compulsory sale of furniture and other effects.

(*b*) In some divisions the rate of travelling allowance is insufficient to cover all costs of touring, owing to increased cost of means of transport and keep of horses. In such places the rate of travelling allowance should be increased or no charge made for the use of Government elephants when an officer is on tour.

(*c*) Adequate provision should be made for skilled European medical attendance in all headquarters stations. This is not always done and officers have suffered in consequence.

(*d*) The rents which Forest Officers pay for their houses are out of all proportion to the use they make of them. By far the greater part of the year is spent on tour. The Forest Officer then gets no benefit from his house. It is merely a source of extra expense to him, as a chaukidar has to be paid for out of his own pocket. Add to this that the house provided for him is in many cases not a very good one or placed in a remote situation so that even when he is in headquarters the Forest Officer is often not much better off than when he is in camp. Adequate accommodation should be provided in all headquarters stations, for which no rent should be charged, at any rate for the period during which it is not occupied.

(*e*) The officers appointed in recent years from the Universities joined the Service much later in life than their predecessors. They are therefore at a disadvantage as compared with them, as they both draw less pay at any given age, and it is highly probable that many of them will have to retire before attaining the rank of Conservator, owing to the posts being filled by men senior in Service but younger in age. Special consideration should be given to the case of these men.

Mr. H. S. Gibson called and examined.

66217. (*Chairman.*) In the Forest Department in Bengal there was one Conservator of Forests, with headquarters at Darjeeling. Under him there were eight divisions, generally held by either Deputy or Assistant Conservators of Forests. Usually there were eight Imperial officers in charge of divisions, and there were at present two other Imperial officers acting as assistants in divisions. There were six Provincial officers, one of whom was at present temporarily in charge of a division, the remainder being assistants in divisions. One Provincial officer held rather an exceptional position as instructor in a Forest School. There was a considerable number of Imperial officers on leave.

66218. An officer in the Forest Service should be a man of good physique and proficiency in athletics. Brains did not count for everything. The physical test should be revived. He believed the test served an exceedingly useful purpose.

66219. Even if a stiff physical and medical test was imposed, and those who were unsuitable for the rigorous life of a Forest officer were weeded out, selection would still be necessary. There should be some guarantee of character. As a rule, public school men were required for the Forest Service. He would not make a public school education an absolutely necessary condition, but the fact that a man had been through a public school was evidence that he had some experience in the handling of men. It was true that in the old days of Coopers Hill there was open competition, and recruits came from all quarters, but they were mostly public school men.

66220. He recommended that the allowance to candidates undergoing the probationary course should be £150. All officers when they joined the Service were told that all the highest posts were open to them, but in practice that was not the case. He believed it was practically impossible for a man who was appointed to Bombay or Madras to obtain the post of Chief Conservator, or the post of Inspector General, because the Bombay and Madras Services were kept entirely distinct from the rest of the Service in India. A man from Bengal, for instance, could go as Con-

servator to any other Province except Bombay and Madras, where the Service had become almost provincialised. It was laid down that the Inspector-General of Forests should usually have had experience in Burma, so it was absolutely impossible for a man who was appointed either to Madras or Bombay to fulfil that condition. The whole Service should be Imperial, and there should be free interchange between Provinces.

66221. He had never considered the suggestion put before the Commission that the various Provinces should be grouped under three units, Upper India, Burma, and Madras and Bombay, and that each batch of three candidates in the final order of merit should be obliged to elect for service in one or other group according to their one order of merit, but he saw one very great objection to the suggestion, namely, that a man who was appointed to the North-Western group would be at an immense advantage over all the other men in the Service, because that was the place where the conditions of service were most favourable. On the whole, he preferred seeing the appointments in the Service thrown open to the whole of India. Differences of language presented no serious obstacle as, taking the greater part of India, a knowledge of Hindustani would be sufficient.

66222. At present there was no provision to enable officers to study European forestry. It would be a very good thing for an officer after four or five years' service to go to Europe for that purpose.

66223. With regard to the recommendation for the grant of two months' recess for officers working in unhealthy districts, his colleagues considered that it should be left to the discretion of the officer rather than to the discretion of the Conservator to decide whether or no advantage should be taken of the privilege.

66224. The leave reserve was inadequate. Officers found great difficulty in getting leave on account of the shortage of the staff. He knew of several instances where leave was due, and application for leave had been refused for that reason.

66225. Forest Officers should be paid at least as highly as officers in other Services of equal importance. The Public Works Department for instance and the Forest Service were recruited from a similar class, and there appeared to be no reason why officers in the Public Works Department should have higher posts open to them than were open to officers in the Forest Department. The Forest Department had the same time-scale as the Public Works Department, but there was no charge bar in the Forest Department as there was in the Public Works Department. The majority of Forest Officers had paid for the whole of their training. It was only in the last year or two that any allowance had been given during the period of training.

66226. He thought it would be better to keep the continuous time-scale than to have two time-scales, one for Assistants, and the other for Deputies, with promotion from one class to the other by selection; he made this suggestion notwithstanding that all the junior officers in Bengal at present would have benefited enormously if there had been promotion to Deputy Conservatorships in vacancies. He did not think it necessary to establish a time-scale for Conservators.

66227. Of the 28 officers who had served, and were serving, in Bengal three were on pension. The next four had died after 23, 11, 17, and 18 years' service respectively. The next three men were still in service, and there was one man who had retired after 25 years' service. There were two more men who had died in service, and in recent years one man had died in service, another had been compelled to retire owing to ill-health after 10 years' service; another also had died in service after five years, and another man had had to retire owing to ill-health after five years' service. It was upon those figures that the claim was based for a more liberal pension. They also showed the arduous and rigorous character of the Service.

66228. His colleagues generally were not very strongly in favour of a family pension fund; what they would prefer to see would be more liberal provident fund rules, somewhat on the lines of the provident fund on the Indian Railways.

66229. With regard to recruitment of Indians to the Imperial Service, his opinion was that the best method of recruitment of Indians to the Imperial Service was selection from the Provincial Service of officers of from 10 to 15 years standing, who would be sent for study leave to Europe. He regarded that as a better method than the direct recruitment of young Indians to the Imperial Service.

66230. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The new scheme for training Indians at Dehra Dun for the Provincial Service had not been long enough in existence to enable him to form any opinion as to the possibility of Dehra Dun becoming an adequate training ground for Indians, but there was one insuperable objection to the Dehra Dun training as compared with a training which included a tour on the Continent of Europe. In Europe there were forests which had been under systematic management for many years, and a man saw there what a really well-managed forest was like, and he knew what he had to aim at. There were no such forests in India. The theoretical training at Dehra Dun could be brought up to the same level as the training at Oxford.

66231. He saw no objection to promoting picked men from the Provincial Service to the Imperial Service, provided that the men were selected entirely on their own personal merits, and that no definite proportion of officers so promoted was laid down. If a man showed himself to be really competent after a trial in the Provincial Service, and capable of managing his subordinates, there would be no objection to his being promoted to the Imperial Service. A period of training in Europe would be decidedly useful in a case of that sort.

66232. (*Mr. Sly.*) So far as Bengal was concerned there was no material difference in the work and responsibility of the different charges, except in regard to area.

66233. He could quote no Government rule to the effect that the Bombay and Madras Forest Officers were precluded from promotion to the post of Inspector-General, but that was the general opinion. He was not aware of the fact that a Bombay Forest Officer had held the post of Inspector-General. Up till recently it had been generally understood that Burma experience was essential for the post.

66234. He thought it reasonable that a Forest Officer should retire on a £500 pension at the age of 42. Statistics showed that a Forest Officer seldom lived to the age of 50. He had not taken the trouble to calculate the capital value of a pension of £500 commencing at the age of 42.

66235. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He had found a knowledge of German absolutely essential in order to profit by his forest teaching in Germany. Therefore if Indians were sent to Europe, and they had to profit by their Continental teaching, they would have to know German. That would be rather an argument against sending Indians to Europe at a late age, but the objection might be partly overcome by letting Indians go with probationers who knew German.

66236. He desired to abolish the present qualification of a University degree in science, in order that the age of entry might be lowered. He was not aware whether any special science qualifications were required of German forest officers holding responsible posts; Germans specialised in forestry from the very beginning.

66237. He had gone through quite a short course of surveying and engineering at Oxford. There were no opportunities for practical engineering in Oxford; the engineering school there was purely theoretical. He did not think that constituted an objection to concentrating the work at Oxford, because a man could see a great deal of forest engineering during his tour on the Continent.

66238. He would be in favour of making probationers at Oxford pass the ordinary Oxford Science preliminary examination, as this would show they

had a fair knowledge in ordinary elementary science, and in the witness's opinion that was quite sufficient for the average Forest Officer. He was in favour of recruiting a portion of the Provincial Service from the Ranger class. It should be possible for a Ranger who showed exceptional merit to be promoted to the Provincial Service.

66239. (*Mr. Madge.*) Oxford provided a special training for the Indian Forest Service. Other men were permitted to enter and receive the same course of training, and there was no reason why those men, for instance, who wished to enter the British Forest Service, should not be admitted.

66239A. Domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians trained at Dehra Dun, had worked under him, and some of them had done extremely good work.

66240. (*Mr. Grieve.*) A Provincial Service Officer would labour under a disadvantage in holding charge of a division where there was a large European community, such as tea planters. It was very difficult for a man who had been entirely educated in India to deal with men of the planter type in the same way as a man who had been educated in England. The planters regarded a man who had been educated in England in a very different way.

66241. An Assistant Conservator should not be placed in charge of a division until he had had at least two or three years' service under a selected senior man, but owing to the smallness of the cadre in Bengal, the actual position was very different. For instance, he himself held charge of the Sunderbans division for five or six months when he had less than 1½ years' service. The next junior man had held charge of a division after 1¼ years' service, and had been in charge of a division ever since. The next junior man was put in charge of a division for six months after 1¼ years' service, and last year, an assistant who had only been out four months was placed in charge of one of the largest divisions in Bengal for seven or eight months.

66242. He was once in charge of a division when there were three Provincial officers serving under him, all of whom drew a higher rate of pay than himself, and he had one Imperial Service Officer under him who was nominally drawing Rs. 80 a month less than himself. Owing, however, to the deduction of house rent from his pay and extra expenses incurred by the upkeep of the house and grounds, the junior officer actually received more than he did. This was adduced as an argument for granting charge allowances to Assistant Conservators placed in charge of divisions.

66243. (*Mr. Modder.*) It would be most unfair to a Provincial Officer if the rule that a Provincial Officer must hold charge of a division before being promoted to the post of Extra Deputy Conservator, was enforced in Bengal. It would be far better that the Provincial officer should have a regular time scale, proceeding right up to the maximum, and that there should be no distinction between Extra Deputy Conservators and Extra Assistant Conservators. A Provincial Officer could do sufficiently important work as an attached officer.

66244. The Civil Service Regulations laid down that an officer drawing Rs. 500 and over was a first class officer. The maximum pay of an Extra Assistant Conservator was Rs. 550. He did not know any reason why the Extra Assistant Conservator should be classed as a second class officer; he thought it was a great hardship. It was true there were a number of Rangers and clerks getting Rs. 100, who were classed as second class officers. When travelling by train a Provincial Officer had to mix in the same class as his clerks and his Rangers.

(The witness withdrew.)

Lalit Mohan Sen, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Bengal.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being a Memorandum on the Provincial Forest Service, Bengal.

66245. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The existing methods of recruitment to the Provincial Forest Service in Bengal at present are:—

(*a*) by promotion of deserving Forest Rangers.

(*b*) by the selection for direct appointment of candidates who, having successfully passed through the Provincial Forest Service Course at the Forest Research Institute at Dehra Dun, have rendered not less than three years' satisfactory service as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests.

The promotion of Forest Rangers to the Provincial Service should be very cautiously given, preference being given to Forest Rangers who have obtained higher standard certificates at the Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun, and have afterwards rendered not less than five years' satisfactory service, of which at least three years have been service in executive charge. The maximum number thus appointed must not exceed 25 per cent. of the total number at any time.

In view of the above suggestion and to keep up the efficiency of the subordinate service, a few grades carrying higher pay may be created for the Forest Rangers.

The selection of candidates for training for Provincial Forest Service at the Forest Research Institute, Dehra Dun, is done at present by nomination only, the men nominated having certain standard of education.

This should be done: (*i*) by an open competitive Entrance Examination in English, Mathematics and some branch of Natural Science; (*ii*) by a physical test (*e.g.*, walking a fixed distance in a particular number of hours) followed by a medical examination by a Civil Medical Officer or by a Medical Board; (*iii*) on passing the Entrance Examination and the physical test, and, before being sent to the Research Institute, by a compulsory practical training in the forest for a period not less than four months and not more than six months.

Candidates for the Entrance Examination must hold any of the following educational certificates:—(*i*) a certificate of having passed at least I.Sc., I.E., or I.A., Examination of an Indian University in a group of subjects including Mathematics; or (*ii*) the Licentiate of Agriculture Degree of a Government Agricultural College; or (*iii*) the Cambridge Senior School Certificate (higher than the Cambridge Senior Local).

66246. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The training both theoretical and practical given at the Forest Research Institute, Dehra Dun, is satisfactory, but if it is considered in any way inferior, it should be raised so as to bring it on a par with that which the Imperial Forest Officers receive in England.

The probationary period of three years, after pasing out of the Institute, may be abolished. Men successfully passing the course of training in the Institute should be substantively appointed as Extra Assistant Conservators directly with the usual anual increments.

66247. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—As duties and responsibilties of Provincial Forest Service Officers are the same as officers of Imperial Forest Service, the whole staff of both Imperial and Provincial Services may be borne on one combined list of "controlling staff." The members of this combined controlling staff should be designated as Assistant and Deputy Conservators.

Charges of Divisions should go ordinarily by seniority in the proposed combined list, unless there be anything against any individual officer. The senior member of the Provincial Service

should not be placed under a junior member of the Imperial Service as is sometimes done at present.

The classification of Divisional charges into "major" and "minor" may be abolished.

Some picked officers from the senior grades of the Provincial Forest Service may be taken to the Imperial Forest Service.

66248. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The maximum pay for the Provincial Forest Service may be increased to Rs. 1,250. The existing maximum pay for the service with a number of conditions is fixed at Rs. 850.

In the Imperial Forest Service Assistant Conservators, unless very badly reported, can rise to the highest grade of Deputy Conservators with annual increments unconditionally and without any restriction; there can be as many Deputy Conservators as there are officers entitled to the pay of that grade under the title-scale system of increments. But in the Provincial Forest Service the number of posts of Extra Deputy Conservators which have been allotted for several provinces (*e.g.*, one in Bengal) is very limited. This limitation may be removed and an (Extra) Assistant Conservator may be allowed to rise to the highest grade of (Extra) Deputy Conservator with uninterrupted annual increments like the officers of the Imperial Forest Service. The pay for the Provincial Forest Service may be constituted as follows:—

ASSISTANT CONSERVATORS.

Year of service.	Rs.
1st	250
2nd	275
3rd	300
4th	325
5th	350
6th	375
7th	400
8th	430
9th	460
10th	490
11th	520
12th	550

DEPUTY CONSERVATORS.

Year of service.	Rs.
13th	580
14th	620
15th	660
16th	700
17th	740
18th	780
19th	820
20th	860
21st	900
22nd	950
23rd	1,050
24th	1,050
25th	1,100
26th	1,150
27th	1,200
28th and onwards	1,250

If the existing scale of pay for the Imperial Forest Officers be raised, the above proposed scale should also be increased proportionately for the Provincial Forest Officers.

66249. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—(*a*) *Privilege leave.*—At present privilege leave can accumulate only up to three months; it may be extended up to six months.

The rule that privilege leave cannot be allowed within six months after return to duty from privilege leave should be relaxed in case of leave on medical certificate or on *bonâ fide* urgent necessity for Forest Officers who have often to labour in malarious surroundings and isolation.

(*b*) *Long leave.*—The question of long leave for Indian Services is under the consideration of Government.

As the Provincial Forest Officers have to spend most part of their service in unhealthy localities and are, therefore, more in need of frequent medical leave, these officers when drawing a pay of Rs. 400 or less may be allowed an allowance of Rs. 200, or three-fourths of the salary, whichever is less, when on medical leave.

Under the existing rules an officer can take long leave on half-pay for five years, out of which two years are counted as service towards pension. Forest Officers, specially of the Provincial Service, have to live in out-of-the-way unhealthy places for the most part of their service, and are, therefore, in greater need of taking leave on medical certificate. It is a great hardship on the officers if only two years of the long leave is counted towards pension. At least three years of the long leave may be counted as such in 25 years' service.

66250. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Provincial Forest Officers who spend most part of their service in unhealthy isolated places may be allowed to retire on one-half of the salary on completion of 25 years' qualifying service unconditionally or after 20 years' qualifying service with a medical certificate.

These officers may also be allowed to retire voluntarily at any time after completing ten years' qualifying service, in which case the amount of pension should be calculated at two-thirds of the amount of invalid pension for similar length of service.

66251. **(VII) Limitation in the employment of non-Europeans and the division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.**—(*a*) *Limitation.*—There is no limitation in the employment of non-Europeans in the Provincial Forest Service, except in the case of selection for the service in Burma for which it is suggested that selection should be made from all Indian communities.

There is no rule debarring the non-Europeans to enter the Imperial Forest Service.

Graduates with Honours in some branch of Natural Science from any Indian Universities with a fair knowledge of either German or French may be nominated for training in Europe for the Imperial Forest Service.

It has been suggested in paragraph 11 that picked men from the senior grades of the Provincial Service may be taken into the Imperial Forest Service.

(*b*) *Division of Service.*—The division of Service into Imperial and Provincial has not proved satisfactory. Admitting that a certain number of officers of the Imperial Service is necessary for the maintenance of the British character of the administration of the Department, their number is disproportionately too large in Bengal at present. List of officers on the 1st July, 1913, shows, while there are 15 officers of the Imperial Service, including the Conservator, there are only six officers of the Provincial Service. The preponderating number of the officers of Imperial Service could conveniently be reduced by increasing the similar number of officers of the Provincial Service and by stopping further recruitment of the officers of the Imperial Service until a fair proportion be arrived at.

Thorough efficiency can never be secured without a thorough and complete blending of Indian knowledge. Close, intimate and personal knowledge of the people of the country, their ways, circumstances and habits of thoughts come intuitively to a native; more responsible work should, therefore, fall on the officers of the Provincial Service.

Of the six Provincial Officers in Bengal, none was in charge of a Division up to 1st November, 1913 (since when one officer has been given charge of a Division temporarily). Consequently there was no opportunity for them to distinguish themselves in their administrative and controlling capacities.

66252. **(VIII) Relations with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—It is satisfactory and there is nothing to suggest.

66253. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—(*a*) *Travelling allowance.*—When the "Daily allowance" was fixed for the Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests in Appendix 25 of the Civil Service Regulations, Extra Assistant Conservators were officers of the "second class"

acording to Article 1002 of the Civil Service Regulations, the maximum pay of these officers being then Rs. 350. This pay having now been raised to Rs. 550, Extra Assistant Conservators are now "first-class" officers under that article. Similarly, when in the same Appendix the "Daily Allowance" was fixed for the Extra Deputy Conservators, the pay of the lowest grade of that service was Rs. 450. These officers in some grades were, therefore, officers of the "second class" under the Civil Service Regulations. The pay of the lowest grade of Extra Deputy Conservators having now been raised to Rs 575, these officers are "first-class" officers in all grades of that Service. It is, therefore, submitted that the officers of the Provincial Forest Service may be classed as "first-class" officers irrespective of their pay and posting, and that the travelling allowance for the officers of the Provincial Forest Service may be the same as for the officers of the Imperial Forest Service.

(*b*) *Confidential reports.*—These reports, as a rule, are unpopular. If these are to be continued, the officers adversely reported on should be furnished with a copy of the report. Otherwise he does not get any opportunity of rectifying himself or seeking redress. These reports, whether favourable or unfavourable, should be supported by facts by the reporting officer.

(*c*) *Medical attendance.*—Free medical attendance may be allowed on the wives and children of Provincial Service officers on the ground that they have to live often far from ordinary means of treatment and almost always in unhealthy places.

Mr. L. M. Sen called and examined.

66254. (*Chairman.*) The witness held the position of Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests. He had 16 years' Service. He had been trained at Dehra Dun.

66255. He recommended that as the duties and responsibilities of Provincial Forest Officers were the same as those of Imperial Forest Officers, the two branches should be borne on one and the same list.

66256. He also recommended that officers from the senior grade of the Provincial Forest Service should be admitted to the higher service. He meant by that, that Provincial Forest Officers as they were now should be eligible equally with Imperial Forest Officers for promotion to the administrative grades of Conservator and Chief Conservator. A junior Imperial man should not be put in charge of a division while there was a Provincial man senior to him in that division.

66257. He regarded it as important that for officers taken to the higher service there should be a course in England to supplement the course given in India. In his opinion the Dehra Dun course for Imperial officers in the superior grades of the Service would not be complete without a course in England.

66258. He recommended that the maximum proportion of Rangers promoted to the Provincial Service should not exceed 25 per cent. Till within quite recently practically all promotions to the Provincial Service had been from the Ranger class. Officers in the Provincial Service underwent a different training from that undergone by officers in the subordinate Service.

66259. With regard to salary for Extra Assistants and Deputies, he suggested a time scale going from Rs. 250 to Rs. 1,250. Provincial officers in charge of a division were actually doing the same work as Imperial officers in charge of a division. He admitted that officers coming out from Europe should be paid upon a higher basis than those recruited in India. There should be something in the nature of a foreign service allowance for officers coming to a foreign country.

66260. With regard to pensions, he suggested that officers should be allowed to retire voluntarily with a pension at any time after 10 years' service. Government already granted invalid pensions to officers disabled after that period of service. But it sometimes happened that an officer could not easily obtain a medical certificate. He did not suggest that an officer after 10 years' service, finding that the Service was unsuitable to him should be allowed to retire and enjoy a pension.

66261. (*Mr. Fisher.*) Before the system of nomination was adopted, candidates entered by competitive examination, and he thought better men were obtained in that way.

66262. (*Mr. Sly.*) After passing the entrance examination, a man should have a practical training in the forest of not less than four, and not more than six, months. There should be no selection, but there should be a physical test.

66263. He desired to abolish the three years probation in the Provincial Service, because it did not count towards increment, although it counted for service, leave, and pension. If the probationary period was on an incremental scale there would be no objection to it.

66264. When in charge of a division the duties and responsibilities of Provincial Forest Officers were the same as those of officers of the Imperial Service.

66265. (*Mr. Grieve.*) Officers complained that they never received a copy of the adverse confidential reports, although the Government rule was that they should be furnished with them.

66266. (*Mr. Modder.*) The reason why he suggested the abolition of the three years probationary course after passing out from Dehra Dun was because a man had had to do six months' probation before going to Dehra Dun, and in those six months Government could decide whether a man was suitable for the Forest Department or not.

66267. His reason for suggesting that the number of Rangers promoted to the Provincial Service should be limited was that at present the Ranger could rise to only Rs. 150 a month, and that salary was not sufficient to attract a good class of men. There was a tendency at present to promote Rangers with long service to the Provincial Service, in order to give them a little more pay; he desired to give them more pay but wanted some other method to be discovered of giving them that increase without recruiting them to the Provincial Service.

66268. With regard to the suggested increase in salary, it was understood that if a man did not do good work his increments would be stopped. The best men only could rise to Rs. 1,250. He did take it for granted that every man, if he did good work, could rise to the very top. If a man did bad work, Government had the power to stop his increments, not only temporarily, but permanently. The recommendation was put forward in order to attract a better class of men to the Provincial Service, and to place the Forest Department on an equal footing with other Services.

66269. As an Assistant to the Divisional Officer the Provincial Officer had the same responsibilities as the Divisional Officer, in regard to sylviculture, engineering and survey work, but he admitted that the Divisional Officer had to take final responsibility for the work.

66270. He suggested that men should be permitted to retire early because at present there were officers in the Department who desired to retire, and it would be in the interests of Government if they did retire. There were men drawing Rs. 550 doing work which could be done for Rs. 100, and the argument was that by making those men retire on a pension, Government would be saving money, and at the same time they would not be blocking the top of the list by keeping useless men on.

(The witness withdrew.)

G. E. S. CUBITT, ESQ., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department.

66271. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—It is generally held that it is more important for recruits to join the Service at the age of about 22 than to possess a degree in science. Some officers consider such a degree almost useless and in any case its possession tends to raise the age of entry into the Department. Thus in Cooper's Hill days the average age of the newly-joined recruit was 22½ against an average of 24 for the past five years. At 24 it is difficult for a man to become mentally acclimatised to his new environment, while promotion is now so comparatively slow that men joining at such an advanced age may even be unable to earn the extra pensions granted to officers in administrative ranks. One of the best recruits that ever came to Burma resigned disgusted within a year of his arrival, mainly, I believe, because he joined the Service too old. But assuming that the age difficulty can be got over a very grave objection felt by some to the possession of a science degree as a necessary qualification for entry into the Forest Department is that it limits the field of selection, the limits becoming narrower the more the age is reduced. What the Department wants is unlimited choice from amongst the public school boys: what it gets is a choice limited to those who proceed to a University. I have it nevertheless on unimpeachable authority that the recruits now undergoing training are an exceptionally good lot, while a Burma officer, whose opinion is entitled to great respect and who speaks with personal knowledge, states that he was "struck with the keenness and aptitude shown by the probationers on the Continental forestry tour." It has, however, to be borne in mind that the average recruitment for the Department is 10 or 11 per annum; that we are now recruiting only five or six owing to an excess of officers over the sanctioned cadre; that a large increase in the staff, which will probably raise the annual demand to about 15 men, is inevitable in the near future; and that a system of recruitment which may produce excellent results in present circumstances may, unless the conditions of service are much improved, be a total failure when the requirements are doubled or even trebled.

It is therefore very generally considered, except perhaps by Oxford trained men, that it would be preferable to revert to recruitment between the ages of 18 and 20 by means of nomination followed by competitive examination in a wide range of subjects, and then to train the men in forestry and the allied sciences. The nomination of candidates should be by a selection board, of which at least two members should be Forest Officers on leave or who have recently retired. Some lay stress on the desirability of one at least of the Forest members being an officer in active service.

All officers who have expressed any opinion at all on the subject hold that the physical test formerly imposed should be revived, while there is evidence that the medical examination which candidates now undergo is not sufficiently searching.

66272. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The majority of officers naturally have a preference for the particular form of training which they themselves went through, whether this was on the Continent, at Cooper's Hill, or at Oxford; but there is general agreement that recruits should receive their instruction at one and the same residential institution, in the first place because the number of men required annually is too small to make it worth the while of more than one institution to provide the very special course of instruction necessary, secondly to ensure a uniform curriculum, and thirdly to foster *camaraderie* and *esprit de corps*, which certain senior officers consider have of late years sadly declined.

The present system of training is not condemned, and, even if the recruit of recent years does not on the average make so good a forester as his predecessors (which has yet to be proved), it has to be admitted that Oxford has given the Department some exceedingly able men. More attention should, however, be paid to forest engineering (especially road making) and surveying. I also consider (but this is a personal opinion) that every recruit should have some little knowledge of first aid and the early treatment of the more ordinary tropical ailments.

Opinions vary largely as to the value of the period of Continental training and the differences are probably due to the fact that the training is not done together at one place, and therefore depends largely for efficiency on the German officers under whose supervision the students are placed. I have no hesitation in saying that two-thirds of the six months I spent in Germany were absolutely wasted. I saw no protective forestry of any kind, such as the fixation of sand dunes, the control of mountain torrents, and the afforestation of denuded hillsides; nor was I shown any examples of forest engineering and transport, such as aerial ropeways, timber-slides, sledge-roads, etc.; while the influence of forests on rainfall and climate was practically never mentioned out of the lecture-room. Far more time should also have been spent on the study in the field of important forest industries such as resin-tapping, etc. The practical training, as I knew it, was confined almost entirely to sylviculture, and in this respect was on the whole satisfactory, though in my case far too much time was spent in one place, and no attempt was made by the German Forest Officer under whom I studied for five months to teach me anything of German practice in the compilation of working plans. My experience may perhaps be exceptional, but it serves to show that the practical training on the Continent requires the closest personal supervision, and it is considered that this supervision can best be provided by selected officers on the active list on leave who would keep the instruction up-to-date, would ensure students being shown systems and examples applicable to India, and would direct their work generally into useful lines and induce them to take a personal interest in it. It is moreover pointed out by more than one officer that men who have already had practical experience of forestry in India and have had time to realise the responsibilities of their profession would profit far more from a period of study in European forests than students with neither of these qualifications. Therefore, though it is held that the period of Continental training for probationers is still essential and might, some think, even be extended, it is suggested that it would be greatly in the interests of Government if all, or at any rate, selected officers were sent to Europe for purposes of study during, say, their first furlough, which, as urged in section V (*iii*) below, should be after four years' active service. In making this suggestion the rules regarding study-leave have not been over-looked, but after eight years' continuous and strenuous service the keenest of officers feels the need for thorough rest and change and is as a rule loath to spend his furlough away from home.

The policy of allowing selected students to remain in Europe for an additional year's training in special subjects has already proved of value to the Department, but care should be taken that the subjects selected are such as will be immediately and generally useful or the knowledge of which can easily be kept up-to-date. I venture to think that in one instance at least these points have not been borne in mind sufficiently and that special knowledge acquired at considerable expenditure of time and money is likely to be wasted.

As regards the employment of recruits immediately after their arrival in India it is held that the general instructions recently issued by the Government of India meet the case. These instructions are that during his first year of service an officer is to be considered as still under training and that he should not usually be utilised for the ordinary purposes of forest administration; that his training during this period should be carried out under a selected officer or officers, and should include both active work in a division and a period of work

at the headquarters of a circle; and that he should tour in his own province and possibly visit selected forests in other provinces. In Burma, owing to the hopeless inadequacy of the staff, these instructions are a dead letter, and newly joined recruits, as the detailed information I have received shows, have frequently to be sent out alone into the forest, totally ignorant both of the language and of how to look after themselves, and not infrequently to the detriment of their health.

66273. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—Seven years ago the staff which is now sanctioned was considered "inadequate even for the needs of the immediate future," and it is hardly too much to say that most Forest Officers in Burma are now trying to do two men's work. Progress under these conditions is impossible, and one of the most urgent demands of the Department in Burma is for an increase in the establishment commensurate with the amount of work to be done. Moreover, forest work in Burma has to be carried out under conditions which are exceptionally arduous and unhealthy, both in comparison with those obtaining in other services in the same province, and in the Forest Service in other provinces. It can be compared only with the work of the Survey Department, but with this great and important difference, that, whereas Survey Officers are in camp only in the dry season, Forest Officers (or at any rate many of them) have to be out in all seasons and all weathers. Moreover, the Survey Officer is frequently transferred from province to province, and the conditions of service are thereby equalised.

It is maintained that the unhealthiness of forest life is fully borne out by the following statistics:—

Officers who entered the Department up to the end of 1888 would have been entitled to the full pension admissible after 25 years' service at the close of 1912, provided that they had not taken more furlough than counts towards service for pension. Between the 10 years, 1878 and 1887, the number of officers who joined the Service in Burma was 13, who are accounted for at the present time as follows:—

Died while in Service	5
Retired on account of ill-health before earning a pension and now dead	1
Transferred to another Department and died before earning a pension	1
Retired on less than full pension and now dead	2
Still in Service	4

The oldest of these 13 officers, had he lived, would now be only 59 years old.

I do not propose to refer in detail to the peculiar disadvantages of Service in Burma, since they are fully set forth in the Report of the Burma Allowance Committee (1910-11); while the popular idea that the disadvantages are counterbalanced in the case of the Forest Department by an easy and pleasant life with little to do except hunt big game is sufficiently refuted by letters in my possession which are at the disposal of the Commission should they desire to have them.

66274. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The Department in Burma is unanimously of the opinion that the present scale of pay is inadequate and even inequitable, though it is not suggested that any intentional injustice has been done. The claims of the Department are overlooked because its work is not understood, is for the most part in out-of-the way places seldom visited by other officials, is as a rule inconspicuous and totally unapparent to untrained eyes, and may take generations to come to fruition.

The grounds on which the present rates are considered inadequate are:—

(*1*) That the conditions of service are peculiarly arduous and unhealthy.

(*2*) That the nature of the training is highly specialised, and not such as to render it easy for an officer to find other employment, should he, owing to ill-health or other causes, have to leave the Service prematurely.

(*3*) That the quantity and quality of the work demanded has enormously increased.

(*4*) That the rate of promotion to administrative rank is much slower than formerly, and is likely to be still slower in future, since increases in the staff will be proportionately greater in the executive than in the administrative grades.

(*5*) That the cost of living, both in India and in England, has increased largely of late years and is still increasing, and that the present rates of pay of the administrative posts are insufficient to enable the officers who hold them to maintain in the way they should their position as Heads of a Department either with Local Governments or the Government of India.

(*6*) That they (the rates of pay) are not commensurate with the responsibilities involved. Thus a Chief Conservator who is responsible to a Local Government for the forest policy of a province, and whose professional opinion cannot be ignored without grave risk, gets less pay than a senior Deputy Commissioner in charge of a district. Similarly the Inspector-General of Forests who is responsible to the Government of India for the forest policy of the Indian Empire gets less pay than a first class Chief Engineer under a Local Government, and scarcely more than the Commissioner of a Division. It is also felt by the Department as a slight, if not an injustice, that Conservators should be paid less than Superintending Engineers, who can lay claim neither to superior intellectual ability nor a more expensive training.

(*7*) That the highest posts in the Service have been refused.

(*8*) That they (the rates) are actually less favourable in the early years of service than those in force before the introduction of the time-scale, owing to the abolition of officiating promotion and compensation allowance.

(*9*) That the age of entry into the Department is higher than in former years.

It is therefore held that the pay of the newly joined recruit should be Rs. 400 per mensem, this being the least sum that will compensate an officer for the increased cost of living. Calculating compensation allowance at the rate of 1s. 4d. to the rupee, this is only Rs. 28-2-0 per mensem more than 20 years ago, when the initial pay was Rs. 350. It should further be possible to earn Rs. 1,500 per mensem as a Deputy Conservator, within, say, 23 years of service. If this concession is granted many officers are prepared to restrict the pay of a Deputy Conservator to Rs. 1,250 per mensem if he is considered unfit for promotion to administrative rank; but others consider this restriction unnecessary if Government exercises the general power to withhold increments, which it already possesses, and point out that a man unsuitable for a Conservatorship may be an excellent divisional officer. These proposals involve a proportionate increase in the pay of the higher ranks, and it is held that the scale should provide for a substantial difference between the rates of pay for the different classes of officers, and should rise to a possible Rs. 3,500 per mensem for the Inspector-General of Forests. In no case should the pay be less than that of corresponding ranks in the Public Works Department, whose officers join the Service younger than the Forest Officer, and, under present conditions, have as a rule to spend considerably less on their education. Mainly as a matter of administrative convenience the Inspector-General of Forests is not a Secretary to Government, but his duties are very similar in character to those of the Secretary in the Public Works Department and there seems to be no reason why he should be paid at an altogether disproportionately low rate.

I desire also to point out on behalf of those who have only recently joined the Service that, owing mainly to the inadequacy of the staff, officers are frequently posted to the charge of a division within two or three years of their arrival in the country. It is strongly felt that, if a junior officer is called upon to accept unusual responsibility of this sort, he should be correspondingly remunerated, and it is therefore urged that he should in such circumstances receive a charge allowance and that the rules governing the grant of this

allowance and of attainment to the rank of Deputy Conservator should be assimilated to the corresponding rules for the Public Works Department. The application of these rules to the Forest Department, as is only equitable, would enable an Assistant Conservator in charge of a division to draw a maximum salary equal to the lowest pay of Deputy Conservator, and would compensate him for the losses now sustained by the abolition of officiating promotion. A special allowance should also be granted to personal assistants to Conservators (especially in Rangoon), as in the case of officers serving in similar capacities in other Departments. Apart from the expense of living in Rangoon I know from personal experience that it is necessary to maintain, at a cost of about Rs. 80 a month, and simply to take one to office an otherwise totally unnecessary horse and conveyance. Notwithstanding representations on the subject no compensatory allowance is permissible.

Further, the whole Service and especially those appointed before 1910 are aggrieved by the rules regulating the accrual of increments of pay. In the Public Works Department increments accrue annually from the date of appointment to the Service in England: in the Forest Department they accrue annually, in the case of officers appointed prior to 1910, on the first of the month following that in which they arrived in Rangoon, and in the case of other officers on the date of their arrival. Burma officers are specially affected by the present rules and there are numerous instances in which men who left England on the same date as their colleagues in India have lost almost a month's increment annually for many years, solely because it is a longer journey to Rangoon than to Bombay. It is understood that the local Government recognise the inequity of the present rules and recommended to the Government of India that officers should not be penalised for the mere accident that they are serving in Burma, but redress has only been secured for officers recently appointed to the Service and the Department will not be wholly satisfied until placed on an equality with the Public Works Department.

A more serious grievance still is the exclusion of the Chief Conservator and Conservators from the grant of the Burma Allowance. The justice of their claim to the allowance is obvious, and I have nothing to add to what is said in the Report of the Burma Allowance Committee already referred to, except to point out that Service in the third grade of Conservators, which transfers an officer from some up-country station to Rangoon or Mandalay at a net increase of salary of only Rs. 150 per mensem, inevitably involves financial loss, apart from any consideration of the larger scale on which a Conservator should entertain.

Finally it is held that the Rangoon house allowance should be extended to bachelors.

66275. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The conditions of leave will be much improved if the changes now believed to be under the consideration of the Government of India are effected. Forest officers in Burma desire, however, to draw special attention to the following points:—

(*i*) Several officers have recently been refused the grant of privilege leave, and have thus forfeited in some cases several weeks of the leave earned. It is therefore held that if, owing to the exigencies of the public service, the grant of such leave is refused, its accumulation from the date of such refusal to the time when it can be granted should be unlimited.

(*ii*) An officer on leave, other than privilege leave, is as a rule entitled to half his average pay for his last three years of service converted at the rate of 1s. 6d. to the rupee. In the case of the Indian Civil Service leave allowances are subject to a minimum of £500 and a maximum of £1,000 per annum, but whereas the maximum for other Services is fixed at £800, there is no minimum except an exceedingly low sum of £200 in the case of leave on medical certificate. This is totally inadequate, and officers are in consequence frequently compelled to remain on or return to duty who in the interests of their health should be on leave. Accepting the rate of four-fifths now adopted for the maximum allowance as a fair one, it is considered that the minimum furlough allowance should be £400, but that there are no good grounds for limiting the maximum to £800, if an officer's half pay, converted into sterling at the usual rate would exceed this sum. At the present rates of pay only 10 officers can earn the present maximum of £800, and of these only 1 would be entitled to £1,000, if, as is suggested, this latter amount is the maximum for all services.

(*iii*) It is considered that it should be possible to go on ordinary furlough after about four years' service. At present no long leave is possible for eight years other than on urgent private affairs or on medical certificate, while privilege leave, to the extent which may now be accumulated, allows of at most two months at home at an expenditure heavy out of all proportion to the benefits derived from it. Eight years' service in Burma almost without a break is detrimental to an officer's health and is far longer than is expected of Europeans employed by mercantile firms.

(*iv*) It is thought that with suitable restrictions it should be permissible to commute long leave on half pay into shorter periods on full pay.

(*v*) In comparison with India Burma is badly supplied with means of communication, while the journey home takes considerably longer from Rangoon than from Bombay. In order therefore to place officers on a more equal footing the beginning and end of all leave out of Burma should count from the dates of departure from and return to Rangoon respectively.

66276. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The widespread dissatisfaction that exists with regard to the amount of pension that can be earned has been amply testified to by the numerous memorials submitted by forest officers on the subject. It is pointed out that the present pensions were fixed long ago when the rupee was worth two shillings, and that owing to the increased and continually increasing cost of living in Europe the actual loss now sustained is far more than is represented by the difference (viz., 12½ per cent.) between the original value of the rupee and the special rate of 1s. 9d. at which the rupee pensions are now converted into sterling. The present pensions also compare very unfavourably with those earned by the members of the Indian Medical Service, who are moreover able, both during their service and after retirement, to add considerably to their income by private practice. Further, it is an indisputable fact that existing pensions, at any rate after 20 years' service, are insufficient to induce an officer who can secure employment at home to remain in India. Improved pensions would induce good officers, who would otherwise retire, to continue in service; would at the same time enable Government to retire inefficients compulsorily without undue hardship; and should encourage recruitment. The principle on which pensions are now granted is that they increase with increased pay up to half an officer's average emoluments subject to certain maxima. These maxima were fixed at a time when the rates of pay were considerably lower than they are now, and it is consequently held that they should be raised correspondingly, otherwise the provisions regulating the relation of pay to pension become totally inoperative. The raising of their pay afforded no relief in the matter of pensions to officers of the Imperial Forest Service, who now ordinarily earn no more pension than an officer of the Provincial Service who has been two years in the highest grade of Extra Deputy Conservator. This anomaly is likely to be perpetuated by the rule which requires a qualifying service of 28 years before an additional pension of Rs. 1,000 can be earned.

I believe it to be the unanimous opinion of the Imperial Forest Service in Burma that the smallness of their pension constitutes their greatest grievance, and it is desired to recommend it as such to the consideration of the Commission. In a cadre of over 60 officers it is, however, only natural that there should not be complete unanimity as to the exact method of effecting the desired improve-

ments. Some officers propose a scale graduated in almost exact proportion to the length of service; others prefer a scale which would give an officer retiring after a somewhat short service a comparatively low pension and officers of high administrative rank a correspondingly increased one. Particulars of the different suggestions are at the disposal of the Commission should they desire them, but the following principles may be said to underlie them all:—

(*i*) Pensions should be fixed in sterling, both to avoid complications arising from fluctuation in the value of the rupee, and because they will in practically all cases be payable in Great Britain.

(*ii*) The value of the ordinary pension should be some 45 to 50 per cent. higher than the sterling value of the present ordinary pension. Of this increase a third represents merely the re-introduction of a two-shillings rate of exchange for the rupee.

(*iii*) Substantial additional pensions should be given for service in high rank.

(*iv*) The scale of invalid pensions should be specially liberal, and should in the opinion of many officers, be on a graduated scale from one year upwards, the present system of gratuities for a service of less than ten years being abolished.

If pensions on a liberal scale are granted the Department would welcome the compulsory retirement of inefficients.

As the Government has decided that no orders upon memorials submitted by Forest Officers can be passed until the Public Services Commission has completed their inquiries and submitted their report, it is urged that all officers who retire subsequent to the date of this decision and before the orders of Government on the Commission's report are passed should receive the benefit of any enhanced pension which may be granted.

66277. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial branches.**—The Department in Burma is satisfied with existing arrangements and consider they work well, but, without wishing to depreciate the work of the Provincial Officers, considers that any decrease in the proportionate strength of the Imperial Service would mean a loss of efficiency, since the early education of, and the course of special training undergone by, Imperial Service officers are far superior to anything possible in India.

66278. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—These are satisfactory and no changes are considered necessary.

66279. **(IX) Other points not covered by the preceding heads.**—*Transfers* invariably involve an officer in considerable pecuniary loss, and it is believed that a revision of the rules is now under the consideration of the Government of India. A great part of the loss is the result of the compulsory sale and re-purchase at very short notice of furniture and other property, so that a mere revision of the travelling allowance rates to cover the actual cost of the journey is insufficient. Considerable relief would be afforded if each headquarters bungalow were provided at Government expense with all essential articles of furniture, for which a small rent might be charged.

Housing.—Prior to 1907 rent was calculated, in the case of houses built and maintained by the Public Works Department, on the capital cost of the building subject to a maximum of 10 per cent. of an officer's pay. Under the present rules rent is charged at the rate or $7\frac{3}{4}$ per cent. of an officer's pay irrespective of the accommodation provided. Apart from the fact that a Forest Officer has to pay rent for a house which for the greater part of the year he does not occupy, the new rule is objected to as less favourable than the old one, and unfair in its incidence. It is not known exactly how the rate of $7\frac{3}{4}$ per cent. was fixed, but it may be noted that the standard of accommodation provided to an officer is dependent on the average pay of his rank; that since the pay of Deputy Conservators has been raised the accommodation has not in all cases been correspondingly improved; and therefore that if, as is believed, the rent is calculated on the assumption that the accommodation is up to the prescribed standard, more than the prescribed interest on capital expenditure is being recovered. Though recently-joined officers may not in the long run be adversely affected by the new rules, senior officers must inevitably be heavy losers, for they have now to pay more than the calculated rental, having already under the old rules for many years paid rent in full. Finally it is amply proved by the evidence recorded by the Burma Allowance Committee that in Burma rents are higher, and the standard of accommodation provided lower, than in India. In view of the fact that the Burma Allowance is insufficient to cover the difference between the cost of living in that country and in India, it is thought by many officers that houses should be supplied for all rent free, but failing this concession it is urged—

(*i*) That the old system of assessing rent should be reverted to.

(*ii*) That the rate of interest charged should be reduced, and the accommodation provided be brought up to the Indian standard.

It is also considered of great importance that in the interests of their health, if for no other reason, more attention should be paid to the housing of junior officers not in charge of divisions. Such officers are frequently entirely unprovided for, and either have to live with the Divisional Officer, which may be inconvenient or impracticable, or have at great expense to make the best arrangements they can for themselves.

Family Pension Fund.—Amongst married officers there is a strong desire for a Service pension fund for widows and children. The establishment of such a fund would probably be generally approved if it were optional for present members of the Department to join it and if it did not necessarily involve any withdrawal of subscriptions already made to the Provident Fund. It is therefore urged that the matter should be taken into consideration in consultation with the Department.

Other points raised by some officers are the grant of free medical attendance to their wives and families, and the securing by Government from steamship companies of more favourable rates of passage for Government officials. There is also a general complaint of the inadequacy of the elephant transport provided, which suffices only to carry absolute necessities. On the grounds of health, comfort, and efficiency it is considered that the number of elephants at the disposal of each officer should at least be enough to carry the full Government allowance of tents, and a reasonable number of books pertaining to his profession.

Mr. G. E. S. Cubitt called and examined.

66280. (*Chairman.*) The witness held the position fo Deputy Conservator of Forests in Burma. At present he was in Simla as Assistant Inspector-General.

66281. In the Burma Forest Service there were one Chief Conservator, four Conservators, and 61 Deputy and Assistant Conservators. There were 19 Extra Deputy Conservators and 43 Extra Assistants. That was the cadre list. As a matter of fact, at present there were a few in excess on the Imperial Service list, and a certain number of vacancies in the Provincial Service list which would shortly be provided for by probationers already in the Service. There were at least eight or nine statutory natives of India in major charges, who had been trained at Dehra Dun.

66282. With regard to recruitment, there was an overwhelming majority in favour of the opinion that candidates should be selected by nomination and competition between the ages of 18 and 20, and that they should then go through a special course of training. Some of the newly-joined Oxford men

preferred the present system. It might be necessary to sacrifice the Science degree, but he thought that to get the men out to India when they were young was more important than a Science degree.

66283. He would have competition after selection in the event of there being more candidates than there were vacancies. In addition to that he would have a stringent medical and physical test.

66284. Recruits in England should receive their instruction at one residential institution, and he thought Oxford would be the best centre. More attention should be given to Forest engineering and surveying. The sort of engineering Forest Officers required to learn was to be seen on the Continental tours. Adequate training could be given if there were proper supervision. He was not altogether satisfied with the present supervision of the probationers during the tour abroad; too much was left to chance. There should be constant supervision by Officers with Indian experience, who could direct the Continental training into the right channels.

66285. Entry to the Imperial Service was open to Indians. The fact that an Indian candidate had to go to London on the chance of getting selected did not, in his opinion, act as a deterrent, because in past years the conditions of entry into the different Services of India had all been exactly the same. The Indian had not been aided by the State at all. The fact, however, remained, that in past years, although quite a number of Indians had been recruited to other Services, no Indian had till 1909 been recruited to the Forest Service. He inferred from this fact that the Indian did not, as a rule, desire to enter the Imperial Forest Service.

66286. It would be essential for any statutory native of India recruited to the Superior Service direct to have an English training. His training should not begin with his scientific course in Forestry, but earlier, and he should be brought up with the British spirit in him. The public school education was just as much necessary as the subsequent scientific training.

66287. If a man were selected by merit from the Provincial Service for transfer to the Imperial Service on the rate of pay he was then drawing, Government was not likely to make so many bad bargains as they would if a man were selected in India for direct recruitment to the Imperial Service and then sent to England for special scientific training.

66288. He did not desire that interchange of Officers betwen various Provinces should be so frequent as to disorganise existing arrangements, but if the best men from each province could be, from time to time, transferred, the Department would certainly benefit.

66289. At present an officer was called an Assistant Conservator for five years, and then became Deputy Conservator. There might or might not be differences in the work of the two Officers. The suggestion which was made with reference to that point was not so much in regard to the work done by a Deputy Conservator as with regard to the pay which was drawn by an Assistant Conservator when in charge of a division. The point it was desired to draw attention to was that owing to smallness of staff an Assistant Conservator was doing very responsible work which would normally be done by a Deputy Conservator, but was not given any extra pay for it. In practice it would never happen that an Assistant did an Assistant's work, but received a Deputy's pay.

66290. Under present conditions a certain number of officers took advantage of the privilege of optional retirement after 20 years' service. It would not be at all a good thing for the Service to encourage officers to retire after 20 years' service.

66291. In Burma there was a school for the training of Rangers and subordinates. The English class for Rangers had only been established for two or three years, but the subordinate class had been going on for many years. The Dehra Dun Provincial Service course was far better than the Burma Rangers' course, but the Dehra Dun Rangers' course was probably no better than the Burma Rangers' course.

66292. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) When he said there might be transfer to the Imperial Service from the Provincial Service, he did not mean to recommend that that should be the only way of filling the Imperial Service. His reason for not objecting to such transfer was that he desired to see merit rewarded.

66293. Assuming it was decided to make the experiment of trying to recruit Indians for the upper branches of the Forestry Service, the best way of getting the right sort of men would be either to improve the conditions of Service in the Department or to recruit men by selection and examination in India when they were relatively young, and to train them for a few years in England, side by side both at school and college with Europeans. To select men from the Provincial Service and send them to England would be impossible, because they would not understand German or French, and would thus not benefit by the course on the Continent.

66294. (*Mr. Sly.*) The want of knowledge of German and French was a very grave obstacle, even if it was not insuperable.

66295. Although he did not object to transfers from the Provincial to the Imperial Service purely on the ground of merit, he did not suggest that that should be an alternative method of recruiting the Imperial Service.

66296. In Burma there was a distinct difference in the work and responsibility of major and minor charges, but it was very difficult to draw a line between the most important minor charge and the least important major charge.

66297. With regard to his statistics about officers recruited between the years 1878 and 1887, he was pretty sure that no Forest Officer died as the result of the Burmese War, which took place in 1885-86, although that was an exceptional time of stress and strife. It might be that that war affected the mortality figures, but he could not say definitely without analysing the causes of deaths. The work was much harder and more strenuous at present than it used to be, although there might be more amenities. Officers at present were more out in the rains than used to be the case.

66298. (*Mr. Fisher.*) There was a very large preponderance of opinion in favour of lowering the age for entering the Service. He had had 46 replies from different men in Burma, including replies from a large number of Oxford men, and only one had dissented from the view that the age for entering the Service should be lowered.

66299. He would not be in favour of having any kind of linguistic test in England, as he did not think it would be the slightest good. He would have the physical test as early as possible. It would not be necessary to repeat it at the end of a candidate's special training.

66300. (*Mr. Madge.*) The present medical examination had been unsatisfactory, judging by results.

66301. The whole of the Provincial Service in Burma was composed of Anglo-Indians, with the exception of two or three Burmans. Certain of the Anglo-Indians were in charge of divisions, and as far as he knew were doing very good work.

66302. (*Mr. Grieve.*) He did not suggest the admission of men in special cases from the Provincial to the Imperial Service as a system of recruitment. As a system of recruitment he would be very averse to it.

66303. (*Mr. Modder.*) He thought that if a certain number of deserving Provincial men were promoted to the Imperial Service if they did good work it would make the Provincial Service more popular. In regard to the time scale, he wanted the Provincial Forest Service to be in all respects equivalent to the Provincial Service of other Departments.

(The witness withdrew.)

R. M. KAVANAGH, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being the corporate views of the Burma Branch of the Provincial Forest Service Association.

66304. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—*Imperial Service.*—I am directed to invite the attention of the members of the Royal Commission to the following comments in connection with the system of recruitment of the Forest Service both Imperial and Provincial. As far back as the year 1882, the Editor of the "Indian Forester" expressed an opinion in the October issue, page 199, "that the training obtainable at the Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun, was as good as any received on the Continent," and recommended that "if the training at Cooper's Hill, which had just then been started, proved unsatisfactory *the members of the Imperial Forest Service should be trained at Dehra Dun.*" This opinion was several years afterwards confirmed at a Conference of Imperial Officers held at Dehra Dun. These views are obtainable from the Government of India, while in paragraph 38 of the most recent resolution of the Government of India on Education (No. 301-C.D., dated the 3rd February, 1913), it is distinctly stated that the training in Forestry at Dehra Dun College, approximated the technical Education ordinarily obtainable in England or the Continent.

From the above authoritative statements as well as taking into consideration the gigantic spread of Education which will result from the crores of rupees which are being spent in that branch, my association is of opinion that it is not presumptuous to state that the Provincial Forest man educated at Dehra Dun is technically equal to those at present being trained in England and the Continent, especially as regards practical work.

Recruitment for the Imperial Branch of the Service should therefore as an act of justice be thrown open to men technically educated in India in the proportion of 1 to 2 recruited in Europe.

Provincial Service.—If the continuance of such a Service is considered desirable my association is of opinion that the present system appears unsatisfactory, inasmuch that nomination is required, which rests entirely in the hands of the Conservators. A man may be very suitable for one Conservator, whereas he may be extremely unfit in the eyes of another, while favouritism plays a conspicuous part. It is therefore suggested that certain schools and colleges in India and Burma be selected, and the Principals of those institutions asked to nominate two or more candidates from amongst their pupils, preferably with university degrees. Such nominated candidates should then be passed by the Selection Committee of each Province and be required to pass a competitive examination, on the result of which, final selection should depend. In this way alone can it be assured that the best men in the market will be obtained irrespective of caste or creed.

66305. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The present system of education and training at the Forest College, Dehra Dun, is satisfactory. The syllabus might, however, be suitably improved by a more elaborate course in Working Plans and Botany.

If necessary, candidates selected and trained in India for the Imperial Service as proposed under head I. of this memorandum may be deputed to an English University on a year's probation.

This system is being followed with success in Mysore, Ceylon, and other colonies. The members of this Association are of opinion that members of the Imperial Service should serve their probationerships for a year at Dehra Dun in place of the arrangement prescribed in paragraphs (i), (ii), (iii), (iv.) of Government of India Circular No. 13F.—85-2 of 10th May, 1911. Similar method has proved successful with recruits for the Imperial Police.

Provincial Officers should have only one year's probationership as in the Public Works Department and Telegraphs. Sufficient safeguards for their continuing to do good work after confirmation are to be found in their bonds and conditions for the grant of their annual increments. The period of probationership should, in the opinion of the members of the Association, be spent at the Provincial Forest School to which a candidate has been posted, in order that he may learn the vernacular, law, accounts, etc., and familiarize himself with the surrounding conditions of labour and work, as well as become acclimatized.

66306. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—These are without doubt exceptionally arduous, and an article on this subject in the "Indian Forester" will be found especially pertinent. Though this article deals with Imperial men only, the same, if not worse, can be said of the conditions of the Provincial men, as they have to stay in the jungles for longer periods, have as a rule to do all the harder and nastier work, and this on far less pay and transport.

The Survey Department, which is practically the only other service which has a taste of real jungle work in the forests of Burma, has a recess every year at a healthy and popular hill station. The officers of the Public Works Department on the other hand, whose training is akin to that of the Forest men, have metalled roads to travel on and substantial bungalows to live in. The Forester has to camp out in the heart of the forest and make himself as comfortable as he can in a tent generally 8 ft. by 8 ft., and has to depend in the hot weather on a small stagnant pool for his drinking water. Supplies from the nearest villages are often refused on the pretext that no fowls, etc., are obtainable in the village, while rice is obtained very often at famine rates.

Even shooting in a Reserved Forest is prohibited unless a licence is taken out, so that he has not even this small privilege granted him. The conditions of work, of travelling and of responsibilities *are identical in both branches of this Service* up to the rank of Conservator.

This is an admitted fact, an axiom against which no one will gainsay, yet, strange to say, invidious marked distinctions are being continually made. For example, the young Assistant Conservator is entitled to *two Elephants* for his transport, whereas *the Extra* Assistant, however senior he may be, is entitled to *only one, under the same conditions of living and work.* The conditions of service only vary as regards Revenue Ranges. All important Revenue Ranges are managed by Provincial men, some of whom have even obtained the highest honours in Forestry. Very often such officers are kept on such work for several years and usually commended for good work, but when eventually placed temporarily in charge of divisions are adversely commented on. Continued work in a subordinate position is detrimental to ambition and efficiency. On the other hand, his more fortunate brother officer in the Imperial Branch is very often posted to important charges when he is not even qualified in the language, law, accounts, etc., leave alone knowing much about administrative duties or the sylvicultural requirements of the various principal species he has to deal with. It is, therefore, nothing but just that an officer of the Provincial Service should be given a chance of holding charge of a Division after the tenth year of Service.

66307. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—*Salaries.*—The members of this Association are of opinion that if the present system of Imperial and Provincial Service is to be retained the present scale of pay for the Provincial branch is highly unsatisfactory, especially when compared with the Public Works and Telegraph Departments, which are sister Services. This unsatisfactory state is all the more accentuated when it is considered that the duties of a Forester are far more arduous and the life much more unhealthy. I am therefore directed to state that my association is of opinion that it would not only be just but extremely necessary for recruitment if the Provincial Forest Service *was at least put on identical footing with the sister Services* as regards pay and allowances.

Under the present system, a Forester *may* rise after *29 years' service* to Rs. 850 per month *provided* he has managed to have successfully passed the several microscopical examinations and *selections* and is lucky enough to have a vacancy to step into. The Public Works Department and Telegraphs on the other hand rise from Rs. 250 to 850 automatically in 20 years, after which they can rise by selection to the important posts of Superintending or even Chief Engineer and Director of Telegraphs. This is unquestionably a great injustice and will not serve to make this Service popular for recruitment, for we have the extraordinary anomaly that the most arduous worked as well as one of the most revenue producing branches of the Public Service is the *worst paid* (to facilitate comparison a table is annexed). I am therefore, on behalf of the Association, directed to strongly recommend that if a Provincial Service is retained that an officer after a period of ten years should at least draw Rs. 550 and be ranked as Deputy Conservator. This should be the only selection in the whole of his service, for when the Local Government has selected a man for a major charge it should have the courage of its convictions and do away with the many unnecessary and harassing *special selections* as at present enforced. Such selected officers should then automatically rise to a maximum of Rs. 1,250 by annual increments of Rs. 50 per mensem. Officers already in the Service should be brought on to the scale thus proposed and if necessary listed posts created by reduction of appointments in the Imperial Branch—which is already far in excess of the sanctioned cadre. It is further proposed that the Government of India's suggestion regarding the opening up of administrative posts to Provincial men should be acted on, and in a large and prosperous province like Burma, one Conservatorship be reserved for this Service and the *full pay* of the grade as well as privileges as regards pensions, etc., be given to the officer selected for the post. My association regrets that a statement was made in paragraph 5 of Government of India Finance Department Circular No. 263, dated 28th October, 1909, to the effect that "none of the officers in the Provincial Service are at present qualified to take their place as Conservators," and considers the statement *unwarranted* as far as Burma members are considered.

Allowances.—The Local and other special allowances should be *identical for both branches of this Service,* for the deductions on account of transport, rest houses, rent for dwelling houses, servants' wages and prices of the daily necessities of life are *identical* and not reduced a pice *because* an officer belongs to the *Provincial* Service. In connection with this question of allowance my association would invite the attention of the members of the Royal Commission to the report drawn up by the Burma Local Allowance Commission, in which it has been conclusively proved that living in Burma is 50 per cent. more expensive than India and that the present allowances are *inadequate.*

Two very pertinent cases in point of allowances are—(1) That a Provincial Forest Officer when stationed in the expensive Town of Rangoon is *not entitled* to any presidency house allowance, although such allowances are liberally granted to Imperial officers, and strange to say to other Provincial Services, such as the Public Works Department and Telegraphs.

(2) In India and the whole of Burma a Provincial Officer drawing a salary of Rs. 500 and over is, under Article 1002, C. S. R., classed as a first class officer for the purpose of allowance, but not so the poor Provincial Forest Officer whose maximum pay of the class is Rs. 550. He, according to the ruling of the Accountant-General, is a second class officer and is expected to travel with his clerks and subordinates, who, strange to say *are entitled to the same accommodation by rail.* Needless to say that such invidious distinctions are incompatible with the social status of such officers and detrimental to discipline. Therefore in the opinion of the members of this association the Service should be placed on the *same footing* as officers of the sister Services, the *P.W.D.* and *Telegraphs,* the members of which are recruited from the *same source,* have a similar training and can travel about far more comfortably, while as regards elephant transport no invidious distinction should be made between the Imperial and Provincial Officer.

66308. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—Certain alterations in the leave rules have recently been promulgated by the Government of India and it is strongly suggested that the Provincial Forest Service should partake in its benefits. The commutation of long leave on half pay to short periods on full pay is greatly desired, while it is suggested that privilege leave should be allowed to accumulate to the extent of six months so as to enable officers to proceed on leave on full pay, while all furlough, irrespective of whether it is spent in Europe or India, should count towards pension. This being a Service in which the duties are arduous, and both branches of the Service work under *identical conditions* my association considers it fair and equitable that the *same rules* as regards leave should apply to both Services.

66309. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Owing to the extremely arduous life of a Forester, conditions of service, and the extraordinary high death rate, my association is of opinion that the period qualifying for ordinary pension should be reduced from 30 to 25 years including periods *spent on furlough* and a retiring pension of Rs. 5,000 per annum granted at the rate of exchange of 1s. 9d. the rupee, and that if an officer be retained after this period in the interests of the public service. an annual increment of Rs. 400 be given up to the 30th year. After 20 years' service, including furlough, pension on medical certificate be granted on half pay, while an invalid pension to the extent of Rs. 2,000 per annum be granted after 10 years' service, and that this amount should rise automatically by annual increments of Rs. 200 per annum up to Rs. 4,000 after 20 years.

66310. **(VII) Limitations to the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing division into Imperial and Provincial.**—Considering that the duties of officers in both branches of this Service *are identical* the separation of the Service into an Imperial and Provincial is unsatisfactory and a source of grievance, as previous to the re-organisation of 1891 there was no such rigid class distinction and the Imperial door *was opened* to men in India and those recruited under the old rules have risen to the highest administrative posts in India. I am directed to state that the association considers that the closing of the Imperial door by that re-organisation was cruel, unjustifiable, and tends to prevent the best class of youths from joining the Forest Department. The differentiation of pay and allowances cannot under any circumstances be explained —and it is therefore in the interests of the Service absolutely necessary that this undesirable barrier be broken down. This can only be done by bringing the Provincial Service and the same list as Imperial Officers and dropping the derogatory term "extra" as well as paying the men far better salaries and promoting men of merit (not necessarily the most senior) direct into the Imperial Branch and giving them exactly the same pay as the Imperial brother officer.

66311. **(VIII) Relations with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The only relation between this and the Indian Civil Service is that the Divisional Officer is an assistant to the Deputy Commissioner in Forest matters. There is no relation with other services—under this heading however comparisons may be drawn. In the Civil Service of Burma five appointments are listed for deserving superintendentships in the Imperial Police, while superintendentships in the Imperial Police while no such post has been created in the Imperial Forest Service in which Service the members of both Services *do exactly the same work,* and as far as their profession goes having received practically the same technical training. At public and even social functions invidious distinctions are drawn which naturally tend to discredit Provincial officers, whether of high or low grade in the eyes of the other Services, more particularly the people over whom in their official capacity they have to rule. Many high officials are above treating Provincial Officers in the manner above described, but there

are others who do not hesitate to give precedence to the most junior Imperial Officer over Provincial Officers *whose duties and responsibilities alone* should entitle them to proper respect. I am therefore directed to state that the members of this Association strongly suggest that officers of whatever branch of the Service who have attained to such recognised positions as Sud-Divisional Officer, Magistrate or Divisional Forest Officer should be given rank and precedence accordingly, and that this can only be done by *a recognised ruling* from which there should be no deviation. In this connection the Association is also of opinion that it is a mistake on the part of the Local Government to publish periodically translated lists of designations in which attempts to interpret such prefixes as *Extra* usually results in giving agriculturists and residents of the mofussil an impression that officers distinguished as *Extras* are subordinates whose mandates need not be heeded. It is therefore suggested that it would be far better for the prestige of Government officials as a whole if fine distinctions of rank between Imperial and Provincial were left out when not actually required. The *charge held by an officer and the powers delegated should stand as his official designation* and he be given precedence accordingly.

66312. **(IX) Other points.**—(*1*) I am directed to suggest that the members of the Association consider that a great boon would be conferred if the wives and children of officers be given free medical attendance as in the case of Military officers

(*2*) Favourable rates be granted to officers and families proceeding on leave by steamers.

(*3*) That as it has conclusively been proved (*vide* report of the Burma Allowance Commission) that officers on transfer are put to considerable loss, the existing allowances both by rail and steamer *be doubled* so as to more or less cover expenses, and furthermore officers should not be transferred oftener than absolutely necessary in the interests of the Public Service.

(*4*) The attention of the Commission is also invited to the fact that in the Provincial Service in Burma there are five existing vacancies in the Extra Deputy grade and 14 in the Extra Assistant Conservators class which have not yet been filled up, while in the Imperial cadre there are five supernumeraries. It is therefore suggested that the existing vacancies should be filled and the present probationers be confirmed as has been the case with many of those who joined the Service in the Indian Provinces.

(*5*) In conclusion the attention of the members of the Commission is drawn to the resolution of the Government of India Department of Revenue and Agriculture, No. 17F.—37-33, dated Simla, 22nd June, 1911, paragraph 2, clause IV*b* (iii), regarding the promotion of officers under the new re-organisation scheme who were already Extra Deputy Conservator. In the original resolution as sanctioned it was intended that the officers of the Provincial Forest Service *should be dealt with liberally* and existing officers treated as if they had been on the new scale of pay throughout their service (*vide* Government of Burma F. D. No. 64—17A-11, dated 6th May, 1912, and the Accountant-General's letter No. Gaz.-3123, dated 2nd November, paragraph 2), but no such liberal treatment has been meted out in Burma to the senior officers of this Service, and although this is now considered *a time scale service* no allowance has been made for the fact of the first named officer on the list being four years senior to the next and so on downwards, and due promotion withheld in sums varying from Rs. 50 to 100, *and this for no fault of these officers*, whereas in India officers of similar length of services have in all cases been given the *full benefit of the re-organisation.*

(*6*) The members of the Burma Branch of the Association are of unanimous opinion that confidential reports as regards work and character of an officer are unnecessary, and the institution a hateful one, and that it would be far better to make all such charges and reports in the usual official manner so as to give every officer a chance of defending himself publicly.

Difference between Imperial and Provincial.

Engineers and Telegraphs.			Forests.		
Years of Service.	Pay.		Years of Service.	Pay.	
	Imperial.	Provincial.		Imperial.	Provincial.
	Rs.	Rs.		Rs.	Rs.
1	380	250	1	380	250
2	420	275	2	420	270
3	460	300	3	460	290
4	500	325	4	500	310
5	540	350	5	540	330
6	580	375		Deputy Conservator of Forests.	
7	620	400			
8	660	425	6	580	350
9	700	450	7	620	370
10	750	475	8	660	390
			9	700	410
Executive Engineer.	Superintendent of Telegraphs.		10	750	430
			11	800	450
			12	850	470
11	800	535	13	900	490
12	850	570	14	950	510
13	900	605	15	1,000	530
14	950	640	16	1,050	550
15	1,000	675			Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests.
16	1,050	710			
17	1,100	745	17	1,100	375
18	1,150	780	18	1,150	600
19	1,200	815	19	1,200	625
20	1,250	850	20	1,250	650
				Maximum.	
	Maximum pay.		21 to 23		700
			24 to 26		800
			27		850
					Maximum.

Comparison table of Pay in the three sister Provincial Services.

	P. W. D.		Telegraphs.		Forests.	
Serial No.	Per mensem.	Per annum.	Per mensem.	Per annum.	Per mensem.	Per annum.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1	250	3,000	250	3,000	250	3,000
2	275	3,300	275	3,300	270	3,240
3	300	3,600	300	3,600	290	3,480
4	325	3,900	325	3,900	310	3,720
5	350	4,200	350	4,200	330	3,960
6	375	4,500	375	4,500	350	4,200
7	400	4,800	400	4,800	370	4,440
8	425	5,100	425	5,100	390	4,680
9	450	5,400	450	5,400	410	4,920
10	475	5,700	590	6,000	430	5,160
11	535	6,420	535	6,420	450	5,400
12	570	6,840	570	6,840	470	5,640
13	605	7,260	605	7,260	490	5,800
14	640	7,680	640	7,680	510	6,120
15	675	8,100	675	8,100	530	6,360
16	710	8,520	710	8,520	550	6,600
17	745	8,940	745	8,940	575	6,900
18	780	9,360	780	9,360	600	7,200
19	815	9,780	815	9,780	625	7,500
20	850	10,200	850	10,200	650	7,800
						106,200
21		126,800		126,900	700	...
22		+20,400		+20,700	700	
23		* Rising to :—Administrative Posts.			700	...
24		1,200		1,200	800	...
25		1,400		1,400	800	...
26		1,600		1,600	800	...
27		2,750		1,800	850	...

In 20 years alone, an officer joining the Provincial Forest Service loses Rs. 20,700 and has none of the higher administrative posts thrown open to him.

MR. R. M. KAVANAGH called and examined.

66313. (*Chairman.*) Witness held the position of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests. He had had 22 years' service. He was trained at Dehra Dun.

66314. The training in practical forestry obtainable in India was far better and more useful than any training obtainable by a student in a period of six months spent in Germany, France or America. The length of the Dehra Dun course was two years. Of that period half was spent in practical work in forests.

66315. The theory of forestry which was learnt in Germany or France did not apply to Indian forests as the conditions varied considerably. He did not speak with any personal knowledge of the training in Germany.

66316. He recommended that a third of the vacancies in the Superior Service should be definitely allocated to men recruited in India through the Dehra Dun course. He would allot a certain proportion of that one-third to direct recruits, and the remainder to deserving officers of the Provincial Service.

66317. He would give the boys taken direct from the College a European training, but he would not send the promoted men from the Provincial Service to Europe, as he did not think it would be of any value to a man of 15 years' service.

66318. A proportion of the vacancies in the Provincial Service should be filled by Rangers, and the rest by direct recruitment.

66319. He objected to the present system of recruitment by nomination by Conservators for the Provincial Service. It would be far preferable to have a Selection Committee composed of Forest Officers. After five or six candidates had been provisionally selected there should be a competitive examination, any physical fitness and social standing should be taken into consideration. The result of the present method of selection was that there were men at present in the Service who should never have been admitted.

66320. Owing to the re-organisation scheme, men now went direct into Dehra Dun without spending six months' probationary period in the forest. He did not think that system as satisfactory as the former practice, which gave a boy an idea of the sort of life he would have to lead as a Forest Officer.

66321. After the Dehra Dun course, Provincial Officers should be kept on probation for one year only. Sufficient safeguard was to be found in the bond, which laid it down that a man must remain in the Government Service for three years.

66322. Provincial Officers in the Forest Service should be placed on the same conditions as regards salary as the Officers in the Public Works Department. Both received practically the same technical education.

66323. He would regard it as important that an Officer coming from Europe should be allowed in his salary something in the nature of a Foreign

Service allowance. The recommendation that the maximum salary of an Extra Deputy Conservator should be the same as the maximum salary of the Deputy Conservator was based on the supposition that the Imperial Service were going to receive an increase as the result of the Commission's deliberations.

66324. No official reason had been given for denying the Rangoon house allowance to Provincial Forest Officers. Nearly every other Department received it.

66324A. He did not know what his colleagues desired in regard to the establishment of a Family Pension Fund, but personally he thought they should be obliged to subscribe to a fund of this sort.

66325. (*Mr. Madge.*) He had never found that his training at Dehra Dun was inadequate to any responsibility or duty that had been put upon him.

66326 (*Mr. Fisher.*) While he advocated the abolition of the distinction between the Imperial and the Provincial Service, on the ground that Officers of both Services were doing exactly the same work, he agreed that that proposition would only apply to a limited number of the Provincial Service Officers in the higher grades, *i.e.*, Extra Deputy Conservators. The Extra Deputies would not be entrusted with minor charges, because that would be directly opposed to the Government of India resolution that all Extra Deputy Conservators must be placed in major control. It was very difficult to say what was a major and minor charge, because what to-day was a major charge, might to-morrow be a minor charge, and *vice versâ*. As far as Burma was concerned, it would not be true to say that Extra Deputies were given less responsible work to do than officers of the Imperial Service. He advocated a system under which there should be a selection bar after a period of 10 years' service. There should be no further selection bar, because if a man, after 10 years' service, and one year's probation, had done excellent work, and was selected for a major charge, there would be no necessity for exercising further selection. He did not think that the effect of this would be to put a premium upon inertia, because if a man got slack, his increments could be stopped.

66327. There was very considerable feeling in favour of the abolition of the word "Extra."

66328. (*Mr. Sly.*) When an officer got into the Extra Deputy grade he was put on a time scale. There were then three further selections. When he arrived at the Rs. 650 grade he could not expect anything further, unless he was specially selected by the local Government. After he had served that period for another year, he was specially selected again for the Rs. 700, and then when he had done the three years he was once more specially selected for the Rs. 800. Such microscopical examinations of record were not in vogue in any other service, and they should be done away with in the case of the Forest Service.

66329. He could refer to no special order abolishing the rule that a man nominated for Dehra Dun had to undergo a period of practical training in the Forest before he was allowed to enter the college. He did not know of any Extra Assistant Conservator in Burma who had undergone the six months' course in the forest.

66330. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The educational advantages to be gained from a course at Dehra Dun in future were considerably greater than those he obtained during his own term of study there. Therefore it could be assumed that men who left Dehra Dun in future would be even more competent from the outset than they were in his day, to do efficient work in the department.

66331. If, after five or eight years' service, men were chosen from the Provincial Service, for *the Imperial Branch*, and were then sent to Europe for a year's training, it would improve their usefulness in the Imperial Service, and that scheme would not offer the same disadvantages as the other scheme which had been suggested by a previous witness, of sending men to England after 15 years' service, when they were at a less receptive age.

66332. A smart young officer who had had five or eight years actual experience in forestry work would be in a better position to benefit from a European course than a youth who was sent direct to England after a period of training at Dehra Dun without any practical experience of the Service.

66333. (*Mr. Modder.*) He had had two Imperial officers serving under him, and they had not been able to teach him his work, with all the advantage they possessed of their study in Europe, because they had only just come out to the country. Experience in India went a long way, because after all, forestry was a life study, and not a thing that could be learnt in six months or three years. Men could see in Europe the method by which the forests were worked, but a study of conifers and pines could not help a man to decide what method to adopt for teak.

66334. (*Chairman.*) His colleagues asked for the period of service for pension to be reduced from 30 to 25 years. There were some officers at present in the Service who were over the age of 50. They were occupying the positions of Extra Deputy Conservators and were discharging exactly the same duties as Deputies.

66335. It did not matter how far a man climbed up the ladder of the Forestry Department, the arduousness of the work was exactly the same. A Conservator's work was just as hard as that of a Divisional Officer. He made the proposal for a reduction to 25 years because he considered the work of forestry was work which became unduly severe after the age of 50. If the term of service was reduced to 25 years on the present basis of recruitment, an officer would retire between the ages of 48 and 50.

66336. One point which he desired to bring before the Commission was the confirmation of the present Extra Assistant Conservators who were on probation in Burma. Many of the men who came out first on the list with honours in forestry, and who were instructors at the local school were still on probation in Burma and had been so for nearly three years, while officers who passed low down on the list had been confirmed in India.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Calcutta, Tuesday, 20th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

J. W. A. GRIEVE, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests.
E. A. C. MODDER, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

T. H. MONTEATH, ESQ., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bihar and Orissa.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being a Memorandum on the Imperial Forest Service by Mr. H. Carter, Conservator of Forests, Bihar and Orissa.*

66337. **(I) Method of Recruitment.** The present system of recruitment under which it is imperative to have a degree in science has not been in force a sufficiently long time to prove or disprove its merits, but it appears to me to have several serious drawbacks. In the first place it forces officers to start their career in India too late in life. Probably they would be at least 22 before they took their degree and with their special training they would be 25 or older before they entered on their duties. I consider that 20 or 21 is more suitable. In the next place a degree in science may or may not be useful. It shows a mental bent in the proper direction, but an officer might specialise and take his degree in some branch which would be of no practical use to him hereafter. Again the present system must prevent many suitable candidates from entering the Service; many men cannot afford to spend the time and money in obtaining a science degree on the chance of their being then selected for the Forest Department, as a failure to get so selected would make them too old and probably unsuitably trained for most other professions.

It would be preferable to revert to a system more nearly resembling that in force formerly. The conditions of service have been improved and probably sufficient candidates would now come forward. I would recommend a system of nomination combined with competitive examination, such examination to be on fairly wide lines and to include all subjects usually taught on the modern side or in the Army class of a public school. I should like the age limit to be 17 to 19 years to be followed by a two or three years' special course; if the cramming system could be avoided by giving nominations to public school boys who had shown a special physical and mental attitude for the Service, so much the better.

66338. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The present system of training under which candidates can go to any of three universities, appears to me wrong. Probationers for the Indian Forest Service require training on special lines apart from the training which would suit Foresters in general. Such training can only be given if there are sufficient students, and with the small number recruited annually for India, it would be almost impossible, unless the students are in the same institution. By adopting the latter course *esprit de corps* would be developed, and this is a great asset in promoting keenness in the work of the Department. As regards the actual training, I consider sufficient attention is not paid to engineering, especially on the practical side; as every Forest Officer has much engineering work to do it would be preferable for him to come to India trained therein in place of having to pick it up after he arrives.

66339 **(III) Conditions of Service.**—These are particularly hard on officers in the Forest Department, as is evidenced by the large percentage of officers who have died on retired or reduced pension. Such hardships cannot be avoided, but they might be mitigated by the transfer of officers from Province to Province as occasion requires. It is hard on an officer who has been appointed to an unhealthy Province, or to one that does not suit his constitution, to be practically obliged to spend all his service there. More frequent transfers would increase his general knowledge and usefulness, and the only real drawback would be the necessity of acquiring a new language.

66340. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—No change appears necessary in the salary of officers below the rank of Conservator, but the pay of the latter is insufficient compared with that of a Deputy Conservator of Forests, and there should be a rise of at least Rs. 500 per mensem on attaining to that rank, and a corresponding rise on attaining to the special billets of Chief Conservator of Forests or Inspector-General of Forests. Although the Conservator has great administrative responsibilities, is a selected officer and generally has the greater expense entailed by living at Government Headquarters as the Head of a Department, his pay as Conservator is only Rs. 250 more than that of a Deputy Conservator of Forests, and in Burma, owing to the former getting no local allowance, the difference is only Rs. 150, and from personal experience I know the Conservator is worse off there financially, and cases have occurred in which officers have refused these higher posts, probably because they could not afford to take them. In 1905-06 I believe the Government of India suggested that the rates of pay should be—

Rs. 1,500, 1,750, and 2,000 for Conservators.
Rs. 2,500 for Chief Conservators.
Rs. 3,000 for Inspector-General of Forests.

I consider these rates would be suitable if the Rs. 1,500 grade was abolished.

66341. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—With the alternations proposed by the Government of India these would appear suitable provided that—

(*a*) The minimum furlough allowance be £400 or the salary last drawn whichever is least. Under present conditions the present allowance may be too small even for a single man to live on, bene-

* Copies of this Memorandum were circulated to all Imperial Forest Service officers in Bihar and Orissa. The Deputy Conservator of Forests, Singhbhum Division, remarked as follows:—"I beg to inform you that I agree with all the views expressed, except that in regard to the pensions I would propose the following:

	Rs.
After 28 years' service	650
After 28 years' service, of which at least 3 as Conservator	750
After 3 years' as Chief Conservator of Forests ...	850
After 3 years as Inspector-General of Forests...	1,000."

ficially, in England, and as the maximum allowable is £800 the minimum should, on the analogy of the Indian Civil Service, be £400.

(*b*) The option of commuting long leave on half-pay to half the period due on full pay be given to officers. This would have to be subject to certain limitations but would be a change welcomed by most officers.

66342. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The maximum pension at present obtainable appears inadequate: it (Rs. 5,000) was fixed 25 years ago when the rupee was two, when living was cheaper, and when the amount represented half the pay of a senior Deputy Conservator of Forests. The latter has now been increased as has the cost of living while the value of the rupee is less. I consider that the minima should be £350 after 20 years' service, and £500 after 25 years' service.

The principle of an extra pension for specially selected posts such as the Chief Conservator of Forests has been recognised both in the Forest Department and in other Departments, while it might also be desirable to offer inducements to good men to remain in the Service who had not been fortunate enough to get a Conservatorship. On the other hand such inducements might result in ineffective officers, with no great longing for England, to remain on in the Service and draw their pay to the loss of effective administration. I would therefore recommend compulsory retirement of officers of 25 years' service or more who are deemed inefficient or incompetent, and would give the following enhanced pensions:—

After 28 years' service	£600
After 28 years' service of which at least 3 years as Conservator ...	650
After 3 years' as Chief Conservator of Forests	700
After 3 years' as Inspector-General of Forests	800

The present invalid pension after ten years' service does not represent a living wage. As the officer concerned has lost his health in Government service and is very unlikely to obtain other employment the minimum invalid pension should be £150 per annum, increasing by £20 annually for each years' service up to 20 years.

66343. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—At present there are no limitations to the employment of Indians, in fact they enjoy the privilege of prior marriage which is denied to Europeans. I do not think that any changes under this head are called for, nor do the conditions of forest life or the pay appear to appeal to Indians of the best families in the way other Services do. The working of the present system of division into Imperial and Provincial Services is good and no change is advisable, as the present proportion of highly trained and educated officers in the Imperial Service is necessary to maintain the efficiency of the Department.

66344. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—These are laid down by rule and although the practice varies in different provinces, the system generally is satisfactory in that it recognises the Deputy Commissioner as the head of the district generally while allowing freedom of action in purely professional matters.

66345. **(IX) Other points.**—The question of a family pension fund in addition to or in place of the present provident fund should, I think, be dealt with by an expert and the opinion of the Department generally taken as to the advisability of accepting his proposals.

Other points which, I think, require attention and which affect other Departments as well as the Forest Department are the granting of favourable passage rates on steamers and the increase of allowances on transfer. As regards the former, the present high rates prove a deterrent to many officers whose health demands leave in England, and considering the number of officers who go on leave, the support, and I might say advantages, which the steamship companies derive from Government, the servants of the latter might receive some concession, a concession already enjoyed by persons in some ranks of life.

With reference to increased rates of allowance on transfer, the losses incurred by officers have been represented on previous occasions, and have, I believe, met with sympathetic attention from the Government of India without practical result. I would strongly urge that these allowances be arranged on such a scale that an officer does not suffer pecuniary loss in addition to the discomfort necessarily involved in a transfer.

Mr. T. H. MONTEATH called and examined.

66346. (*Chairman.*) The witness held the position of Deputy Conservator and had 17 years' service. The cadre in Bihar and Orissa was a very small one. There were five officers in the Imperial Service, including one Conservator, and five officers in the Provincial Service in charge of divisions, and two attached.

66347. There was not sufficient provision for leave and training in the cadre.

66348. Ordinarily an Officer in the Forest Department remained in one Province. An Officer could be promoted to any Province as Conservator, but in the ordinary course of events an officer was not promoted to a Conservatorship except in the Province in which he was ordinarily serving.

66349. Certain Provinces habitually obtained the pick of the candidates. Those who passed first on the list generaly went to the United Provinces or the Punjab. Such a state of things was not satisfactory. Officers should not be given a choice of provinces; that should be determined by Government. He did not know whether such a system was advisable, but it was the only alternative he could suggest. An Officer who passed out first was not necessarily the best Forest Officer.

66350. With regard to recruitment in England, he suggested recruitment at the school-leaving age by means of nomination followed by competition. He regarded nomination as important. A severe medical and physical test would not be sufficient without selection. He admitted there were serious difficulties in practice in the way of selection. For instance, there was the possibility of a good man being rejected, but, on the whole, selection would be an advantage.

66351. He was anxious to see candidates for the Forestry Service trained in the same institution, either Oxford or Cambridge, and he recommended a course of two years' training.

66352. He suggested the abolition of the Honours degree in science first with the object of lowering the age of arrival in India and secondly because a degree was not absolutely necessary. He thought all the subjects in the Honours course were useful to some extent, but it was not absolutely necessary to specialise in science. The chief consideration, however, was to get an Officer out to India younger.

66353. Taking into consideration the arduous nature of the Service, he considered that when a man reached 50 he probably, with the best intentions, was not profitable to the State, so that the reduction of age at entry would have the additional advantage of establishing what he considered to be the economic age for retirement.

66354. He suggested certain improvements in pay, amongst others a rise to Rs. 1,750 and Rs. 2,000 for Conservators. There would be definite advantages, he thought, in having an incremental scale of Rs. 1,750 to Rs. 2,000 for Officers in this grade. He was not in favour of dividing

the present time-scale for Assistants and Deputy into compartments.

66355. He could not say whether his colleagues were favourably disposed towards a Family Pension Fund. Personally, he would be more in favour of a Provident Fund.

66355A. Officers at present did not take leave owing partly to the exigencies of the service and partly also to their not being able to afford leave on the present allowances.

66356. With regard to the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial branches, he considered no change was advisable. It was necessary to have a proportion of highly trained and educated Officers in the Imperial Service to maintain efficiency. Certain charges now held by Provincial Officers were similar both in character and in responsibility to those held by Imperial Officers. He would regard it as important that all charges of a similar character should be in the same Service, and such charges as those he had referred to should not be marked as inferior to those held by Imperial Officers. The distinction between the minor and major charges was a very artificial one, and it would be a good thing if it were abolished. To that extent he would be prepared to modify the present organisation.

66357. With regard to the admission of statutory natives of India to the superior Service, there would be advantage in sending statutory natives to England, and making them undergo a similar course to that taken by European candidates.

66358. (*Mr. Madge.*) He was of the opinion that an Officer coming out at the age of 22 was sufficiently developed to withstand the rigour of the climate. He was not aware of the fact that it had been proved that the younger a man was when he arrived in India the worse were his prospects of keeping in good health. If that were the case it would affect his opinion about reducing the age at entry. If an officer coming out at 25 years had a very much better chance of keeping his health, it would be a point to be considered.

66359. He did not think desirable men would be excluded if the science degree qualification were abolished.

66360. Under the grade of Conservator the Provincial cadres were kept quite saparate. It was an advantage to a man to have as much experience of the different conditions of the country as possible. If the separate lists were retained all Deputy Conservators were shut out from the chance of that wider experience. From that point of view there should be one Imperial list for the whole country.

66361. He did not believe in recruiting for the Imperial Service in India. He did not say that because he believed the training at Dehra Dun was defective, but because the European training must have obvious advantages. The charges under the control of Provincial men were very well worked, and he admitted that it must follow from that that their training in India must have been sufficient to enable them to work in that way, but they laboured under some disadvantage in not having a knowlege of Continental forests. If a Provincial man did the work efficiently, the question was whether an Imperial man would not do it even more efficiently with his wider experience.

66362. He would remove the distinction between major and minor charges, and have uniform charges.

66363. He had had domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians working under him, and he had found they had performed their duties exceedingly well.

66364. Conditions of forest life did not appeal to Indians generally. He judged that from the infrequency of their applications to enter the department.

66365. (*Mr. Fisher.*) At present a young officer coming out from England was attached to a division, and given, as far as possible, general experience and training in that division under the supervision of a divisional officer. He was then given a range charge for six months, in order to learn the details of the administration work. That was a sufficient period in which to give him a thorough knowledge of the minor details of the work. Then he was given experience of the ordinary work of a division—road making, buildings, sylvicultural work, marking trees, and so on. The present system of training was adequate. Three years ought to elapse before an officer was promoted to a divisional charge, but it often happened that an officer had the entire charge of a division with much less experience.

66366. Half the Rangers in Bihar and Orissa were trained at Dehra Dun and half at Kurseong. He thought the Dehra Dun man was a more highly educated man, but from the practical point of view there was not very much difference between the two colleges.

66367. (*Mr. Sly.*) One reason for his suggesting that a man should come out earlier was that the sooner he started the better it was in his own interest. He could retire earlier, and if a man of 22 years found he was not suited to the life of a Forest Officer, he would still be fairly young and could take up other appointments. His recommendation was made in the interests of the officers themselves, and not in the interests of Government or the Service. If the age was reduced in the manner suggested, and the officer was brought out young, he would still consider that an officer with a minimum of three years' service would be capable of holding charge of a division. A man became a Deputy at the end of his fifth year. He did not know what the idea of Government was in fixing that rule. He was not aware that the scheme of recruitment to the Service was that a man should rise to a divisional charge in his sixth year.

66368. Assuming that the age for recruitment was reduced, as suggested, and assuming also that improvement was made in the pension, he still considered his Service should press voluntary retirement at the age of 42. Optional retirement at 42 would be a good system from the point of view of Government. Men of ambition, and men whose health had not suffered, would stay on after 42, and even apart from ambition, they would remain on for the sake of the extra pension. His Service would welcome an improvement in the pension scale even on condition that voluntary retirement at 20 years should be abolished.

66369. He did not know the exact principles laid down by Government for determining major and minor charges. The reason why he described the distinction as artificial was because a charge at one time might be a major one, and at another time a minor one. He did not mean in the least to suggest that on the whole the major charges were of no greater importance than the minor charges.

66370. He had no experience of the men who had joined the Provincial Service under the new system in vogue in Dehra Dun.

66371. Promotion from the Ranger class to the Provincial Service should not be entirely discontinued; there should still be openings for men of the Ranger class, of approved ability to become Extra Assistant Conservators. He would not suggest any fixed proportion.

66372. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) It was too soon yet to judge what the product of Dehra Dun under the new system would be, so that all the opinions he had expressed with regard to the capacity of the statutory native of India, and of the position assigned to him in the Forest Department were based only upon his experience of a system which was in process of complete transformation. He would not rule the statutory native of India entirely out of the Imperial Service, but for the present, as their value was not known, he would only provide for one or two specially selected men of approved ability being promoted to the Imperial Service above their fifth year of service. If promoted they should be placed in the same grade of pay as they had been drawing, and should rank according to their seniority.

66373. He admitted that if a European trained man was placed in a responsible charge at about 25 or 26 years of age after three years training, he

would have under him a number of natives of India who had been trained at Dehra Dun and elsewhere, very considerably his senior in age, but he did not think that would be a disadvantage. The same thing happened under the old scheme. He did not think the Provincial Service would feel that this reflected on them in any way.

66374. (*Mr. Modder.*) Formerly he had been in charge of the Puri Division. At present a Provincial officer was in charge of that division, and had been specially mentioned by the Conservator for good work. He was quite willing to admit that Provincial officers had done some extremely good work. The making of working plans was of great importance, and a fairly well trained man was required for that sort of work.

(The witness withdrew.)

R. G. A. HANNAH, ESQ., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bihar and Orissa.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being the corporate Memorandum of the Provincial Forest Service Officers of Bihar and Orissa.*

66375. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—The standard of educational qualification deemed necessary has been left in the hands of the Local Government (vide Appendix XI. of the Forest Code 7th Edition), and this arrangement is quite satisfactory and desirable.

The selection of probationers for the Provincial Forest Service should be made by the Local Government as laid down in the Appendix to the Forest Department Code above referred to.

As at present constituted the Imperial Forest Service is solely manned by men recruited in England and practically contains no Indians. On the other hand, it contains several members (Europeans and Anglo-Indians) who have gone home, qualified and entered the Service from England. In the past also often members recruited in India through the Provincial Forest Service were admitted to the Imperial Forest Service and served with distinction.

66376. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The training at present imparted at the Imperial Forest College at Dehra Dun seems sufficient, and the new rule prescribing a separate course for the Provincial Forest Service is an improvement, bringing it into line with that imparted to Imperial Forest Service Probationers. The preliminary course of practical training or primary test before admission to the College at Dehra Dun should be extended to twelve months. The period of training embracing both the preliminary practical test and the two years spent at the College should be treated as Probationary. This would be in accord with the Probationary Rules for the Imperial Forest Service.

66377. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—Probationers who obtain a Diploma of Forestry at the Forest College, Dehra Dun, and who are pronounced medically fit and free from physical defects and satisfy any other tests as may be prescribed, should be directly appointed to posts of Assistant Conservators of Forests as suggested in paragraph 6 (1).

The whole Gazetted Forest Staff, comprising both the Imperial and Provincial Forest Service in a circle, should be borne on an amalgamated list as is the case in the Public Works Department.

Officers in the Provincial Forest Service labour under the following disadvantages:—

(i) Members of the Provincial Forest Service are termed "Extra Assistant Conservators" or "Extra Deputy Conservators." The prefix "Extra" is unnecessary, as they form an integral part of a permanent service and carry out the same duties as are entrusted to members of the Imperial Forest Service. The prefix is not used in the Public Works Department, for example, and no inconvenience seems ever to have resulted.

(ii) When appointed as Instructors in the Forest College at Dehra Dun Provincial Officers are designated "Assistant Instructors," while Imperial Officers are called "Instructors," although the former perform exactly the same duties. There seems to be no reason for this distinction. No such distinction is observed in the Indian University Colleges between the Provincial and Imperial Professors, who are all designated "Professors" only.

The Provincial Forest Service is manned by a fairly large proportion of European and Anglo-Indian officers, who have been recruited and have had their training in India. In the past some of them have risen to be Conservators and one also to be Chief Conservator, while all such officers formerly entered the Imperial Forest Service or Upper Controlling Staff by promotion. There seems to be no adequate reason why this should not be made possible still. We would propose that deserving and capable officers of the Provincial Forest Service, after entering the class of Deputy Conservator (as proposed in paragraph 6 (1)) should be selected for entry into the Imperial Forest Service on equal terms as to pay, leave, and pension rules, and should be eligible for the same appointments. The posts of Superintending Engineer and Chief Engineer are not closed to Provincial Engineers, and our proposal is the more reasonable in view of the new separate and improved course sanctioned for the training of members of the Provincial Forest Service.

In the matter of confidential reports on officers, when adverse comments are made against any officers, the latter should invariably receive a copy of such comments, and an opportunity should be given him to explain or meet such adverse remarks in his own defence.

Charges of Divisions should ordinarily go by seniority in the proposed amalgamated list of the Imperial and Provincial Forest Officers, unless there be anything against any individual officer.

Every Imperial Forest Service Officer should be required to remain in actual charge of a Range for at least two years, and no officer recruited from England should be placed in charge of a Division before he has completed five years' active forest service in India. The same rule should apply also to the Provincial Forest Service Officers appointed after two years' training in the Forest College at Dehra Dun.

As already suggested, the Imperial and Provincial Service Officers should be placed on one amalgamated list, and the division into Upper and Lower Controlling Staff should be abolished.

66378. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—Now that the time scale system of promotion has been introduced, the starting pay of Rs. 250 for members of the Provincial Forest Service is perhaps too low. But several disadvantages remain, as for example:—

(i) The long period of further probation after leaving the College at Dehra Dun deters many suitable candidates from entering the Service, and it therefore seems that the period of probation should be the period before entrance at College and inclusive of the two years' training at Dehra Dun as suggested above.

(ii) In the case of Imperial Service Officers there can be as many Deputy Conservators as there are officers entitled to the pay of that grade under the time scale system of increments, and Assistant Conservators in due course, when they have served

* The Memorandum was signed by Messrs. A. H. Mee, J. P. Haslett, and R. G. A. Hannah, Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests.

long enough, become Deputy Conservators. On the other hand, the number of posts of Extra Deputy Conservators which have been allotted in several Provinces for Provincial Forest Service Officers is very limited. Thus, all deserving officers of the Provincial Forest Service cannot be promoted; so that an officer purely for the want of a vacancy may never become an Extra Deputy Conservator.

(*iii*) The rates of increment provided both for Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests compare very unfavourably with those granted to Imperial Forest Service Officers. Members of the Provincial Forest Service are supposed to receive rates of pay equivalent to two-thirds of those fixed for Imperial Service Officers, and the following statement readily shows the heavy loss to Provincial Forest Service Officers on this basis:—

Years of Service.	Rate of pay calculated on a basis of two-thirds of pay granted I. F. S. Officers.	Actual pay permissible to Officers of P. F. Service.	Consequent loss per mensem in each year.	
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
1	253	250	3	Total loss in whole Service Rs. 63,314, or £4,221.
2	280	270	10	
3	306	290	16	
4	333	310	23	
5	360	330	30	
6	386	350	36	
7	413	370	43	
8	440	390	50	
9	466	410	56	
10	500	430	70	
11	533	450	83	
12	566	470	96	
13	600	490	110	
14	633	510	123	
15	666	530	136	
16	700	550	150	
17	733	575	158	
18	766	600	166	
19	800	625	175	
20	833	650	183	
Remaining ten years' average, omitting pay of Chief C. F. & I. G. F.	1146	790	356	

(*iv*) The rates of pay provided for Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests compare very unfavourably also with those obtaining for Provincial Service Officers in the Public Works Department, although the former have to discharge duties far more arduous than the latter. Provincial Forest Service Officers should therefore be allowed at least the same rates of pay as for Provincial Officers of the Public Works Department, plus an increase to allow for the more strenuous life and hardships encountered by the former throughout their service. The subjoined statement compares the rates of pay for the Provincial Services in the two Departments, and shows the rates of pay we would propose for the Provincial Forest Service compared with the rates of pay of the Imperial Forest Service. (*See* Statement A, page 61.)

(*v*) The scale of Travelling Allowance should be the same for members of both branches of the Forest Service as the conditions under which the allowances are granted are identical. Further, a distinction should be recognised between travelling allowance granted for ordinary touring duty and travelling allowance for journeys on transfer. At present the same rules apply in both cases with the result that the allowance permissible on transfer is notoriously inadequate, especially in the case of an officer with a family.

(*vi*) An Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests temporarily placed in a "Major Charge" is given an allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem. This allowance seems to be insufficient and should be raised to Rs. 100 per mensem subject to a maximum salary of Rs. 600 per mensem.

(*vii*) No distinction is made between an Extra Assistant Conservator attached to a Division and an Extra Assistant Conservator in charge of a Division classed as a "Minor Charge." The former has comparatively no responsibilities, while the latter has the same responsibilities as an officer in a "Major Charge" on a smaller scale. In the latter case an Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests should be given an allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem, subject to a maximum salary of Rs. 550 per mensem.

66379. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The present conditions of leave applying to the Provincial Forest Service are inadequate and should follow the tentative redraft of the Rules in Chapter XIV. of the Civil Service Regulations circulated with India Government No. 674-C.S.R. dated 19th October, 1912, to the address of all Local Governments and Administrations.

It is not always possible to get privilege leave when earned and the result is that such over and above an accumulation of three months when earned lapses and thus very little of it is ever taken. If privilege leave, when earned, cannot be given owing to the exigencies of the Service, or if it cannot be taken for any other reason, it should be given at some other time and not allowed to lapse, subject to an accumulation of not more than six months at a time. This is especially desirable as furlough cannot be taken at lesser intervals than ten and eight years, and also as members of the Provincial Forest Service are practically precluded from taking furlough out of India for lack of funds due to their low rates of pay, the cost of living having advanced so enormously.

The rate of furlough allowances should be fixed at half of the pay drawn at the time of taking furlough instead of half of the average monthly pay for the last three years preceding commencement of furlough.

The condition that an officer cannot avail himself of privilege leave within six months after return to duty from privilege leave should be relaxed in accordance with the proposals of the Government of India referred to in paragraph 13 above.

66380. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—These should be such that it should be possible for all officers to earn the maximum pension admissible by the Civil Service regulations after 25 years' active service. The remedy for any possible failure has been mentioned in paragraph 12 (ii) and (iv). Twenty-five years is suggested as a possible date for retirement on full pension since Forest Officers not only have to serve continuously in the most unhealthy localities, but also have to encounter the same hardships and carry out the same strenuous duties throughout their Service. The form of application prescribed for pensions should be the same for all classes of Gazetted Officers.

We would also suggest that an officer retired owing to an untimely break-down of health should be granted an invalid pension on the following scale:—After 10 years' service, one third of salary; and after 20 years' service, one half of salary.

66381. **(VII) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans and the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial.**—There is theoretically no limitation to the employment of non-Europeans in the Forest Service, and in the Provincial branch none in practice.

The division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial may or may not be good in theory, but members of the Provincial Forest Service find themselves shut in, there being no openings for good and meritorious service or for any amount of capability or genius. The remedy is proposed in paragraph 7 above.

66382. **(VIII) Relations with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The relations of the Provincial Forest Service with other Services are

generally satisfactory and there is nothing to suggest.

66383. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.** It is suggested that at Forest Schools and Colleges it is not necessary to employ Imperial Officers as Instructors for Rangers' Classes on the score of economy, and that the change would not in any way detract from efficiency in teaching or training, as officers of the Provincial Forest Service are quite competent to carry on the work under the President or Director of the College or School, and are usually in a better position to teach and train men of this class.

Members of the Provincial Forest Service when in charge of or attached to Divisions or Ranges should be given the same powers as are allowed to members of the Imperial Forest Service when similarly placed.

Free medical attendance should be extended to the families of members of the Forest Service on the ground that they often have to live far from ordinary means of treatment and very often in very unhealthy places.

STATEMENT A (*vide* paragraph 66378 *iv*).

Year of Service.	Provincial P. W. Service.	Rs.	Provincial Forest Service as at present constituted.	Rs.	Provincial Forest Service as proposed.	Rs.	Imperial Forest Service as now existing.	Rs.	Difference in pay of Imperial and Provincial Foreign Service (proposed).	Rs.
1		250		250		250		380		130
2		275		270		275	Assistant	420		145
3		300		290		300	Conserva-	460		160
4		325		310		325	tors	500		175
5	Assistant	350		330	Assistant	350		540		190
6	Engineers.	375		350	Conser-	375		580		205
7		400		370	vators.	400		620		220
8		425	Extra	390		425		660		235
9		450	Assistant	410		450		700		250
10		475	Conservators.	430		475		750		275
11		535		450		500		800		300
12		570		470		575	Deputy	850		275
13		605		490		610	Conserva-	900		290
14		640		510		645	tors	950		305
15		675		530		680		1,000		320
16		710		550		715		1,050		335
17		745		575		750		1,100		350
18	Executive	780		600	Deputy	800		1,150		350
19	Engineers.	815		625	Conser-	800		1,200		400
20		850		650	vators.	850		1,250		400
21		850		700		850				
22		850		700		900				
23		850	Extra Deputy	700		900				
24		850	Conservators.	800		950				
25		900		800		950				
26				800		1000				
27				850						
28				850						
29				850						
30				850						
	An Exec. Engineer can then rise to Supdig. Engineer on Rs. 1,200, 1,400 and 1,600, and to Chief Engineer.				A Deputy Conservator should be eligible at any time for transfer and promotion to the Imperial service rates of pay and promotion thereafter in the usual course to Conservator and Chief Conservator.		A Deputy Conservator of the Imperial Forest Service can then rise to Conservator on Rs. 1,500, 1,700 and 1,900, also to Chief Conservator on Rs. 2,150, and Inspector General on Rs. 2,650.			

Mr. R. G. A. Hannah called and examined.

66384. (*Chairman.*) The witness had 20 years' service in the Forest Department and had been trained at Dehra Dun. He had been in charge of a major division for the past eight years.

66385. The Imperial Forest Service (generally) contained several members, Europeans and Anglo-Indians, who had gone to England, and qualified for admission into the Imperial Service. The scheme he suggested was put forward with a view to placing the Provincial Forest Department on the same level as the Provincial Branch of the Public Works Department. Officers should be on the same list for promotion, and uniform rates of pay should be granted in the highest ranks of the Service. There should, however, be different standards of pay in the grade of Assistant and Deputy; though he did not think there was any strong reason for making any difference in the scale of salaries as between the European from England, and the officer recruited in India. His proposal for a common list was made with the object of getting rid of the dissatisfaction at present felt in the Provincial Service. He was aware that the list at present in vogue in the Public Works Department had not given complete satisfaction to the officers in that Department, but it was a step towards something better. An ideal state of affairs could not be expected to be reached at once.

66386. The regulation of Government was that 40 per cent. of the major charges should be occupied by members of the Provincial Service. It was difficult for him to say whether the major charges contained in the 40 per cent. were of equal importance to the rest of the major charges, because

he did not know exactly which were the major charges.

66387. In his opinion, the new course at Dehra Dun practically brought the training there into line with that of an Imperial officer. He agreed, however, that the new course had not been long enough in existence to justify any definite pronouncement.

66388. Judging by actual results, he could see no ground for the statement which had been made in evidence to the effect that the training obtainable at Dehra Dun was inferior to the training abtainable in Europe. For his own part, he could see no difference between the two standards. The Provincial officers who had not had an English training held charge of divisions as efficiently as Imperial officers.

66389. As to the limit which should be placed on the promotion of Rangers to the Provincial Service, he was of opinion that the present rules should continue in force.

66390. He proposed that the preliminary course of practical training given to Provincial Service men before being sent to Dehra Dun should last for a year instead of three to five months, as a year would take them through the whole Forest year. He agreed, however, that the object of the present preliminary course was merely to find out whether a candidate had an aptitude for Forest life. From that point of view the present course of three to five months was quite sufficient.

66391. Forest Officers should receive a higher rate of pay than the Provincial Officers in the Public Works Department, on the ground that their responsibilities were equal, and their hardships greater. He would say also that the cost of living of a Forest Officer was higher than that of a Public Works Officer. A Forest Officer was further placed from supplies, had to pay higher wages to his servants, had to keep up a double establishment, and so on. He agreed that the fact that a Public Works Department officer contributed towards the expense of his training should be taken into consideration.

66392. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He claimed better treatment for officers in the Provincial Forest Service first, because they had already proved their efficiency, and secondly, because, as a result of the new course of training at Dehra Dun, they were likely to prove still more efficient. He held very strongly that there was nothing like the same difference between the work done by Provincial officers holding higher charges and the work done by Imperial Officers as there was between their status and pay under the present organisation.

66393. (*Mr. Sly.*) If the Provincial Service Officers were given improved prospects as he suggested he did not think it would be necessary to raise the educational qualifications of the men who entered at Dehra Dun. The present system of selection would be quite sufficient. Government would not select a man below a certain minimum standard of education.

66394. Cases had occurred in which working plans of forests had been made by Provincial Forest Officers, for instance in Angul and Sambalpur.

66395. The statement that camp expenses were very heavy applied equally to Indians and to Europeans. He admitted that nothing was paid by a Forest Officer for fuel or grass, but the Forest Officer's own servants had to collect it, and the Forest Officer must always keep a special servant or grass cutter for the purpose, whereas other officers in more inhabited and civilised districts could usually buy the grass daily. He did not agree that milk was cheaper in the forests than in other parts of the districts, and the prices of fowls and eggs were much the same. The difficulty was to obtain them at all, the villages being so small.

66396. (*Mr. Fisher.*) A period of 12 months practical training before admission to Dehra Dun would be preferable to the long period of three years which was at present prescribed for a student after passing out of Dehra Dun. He knew the latter system acted as a deterrent to recruitment, at least in one case.

66397. Why he said that an Imperial Forest Service Officer should be required to remain in charge of a range for at least two years was because a range charge gave a very good grounding in Forest work. Two years used to be the rule, but it had been relaxed in recent years. A man was much better for going through that two years training, because he would know exactly how things should be done. A man should not be placed in charge of a division until he had completed five years actual forest service. He regarded that as a minimum.

66398. Better results might have been achieved in the past if that rule had been strictly adhered to. Imperial officers came into responsible Forest charges too soon, and the divisions were suffering in consequence.

66399. (*Mr. Madge.*) Provincial and Imperial Forest officers held the same kind of charges, and worked equally well.

66400. Personally he held the view that there should be equal pay for equal work, but that was not the view of the majority of his colleagues, who preferred the system set out in the written statement.

66401. (*Mr. Grieve.*) He knew the present rule with regard to confidential reports was that any bad remarks recorded against an officer were bound to be shown to him, but confidential remarks were put in three classes in the rules, and only certain classes had to be made known to the individual concerned. Personally he had no reason to suppose that reports were not communicated to officers as prescribed by the rules.

66402. (*Mr. Modder.*) The Bengal Provincial Service officers had been complimented on their good work several times.

66403. He did not think the proposal for amalgamating the Provincial list of Bihar with that of Bengal would be popular with the Service in Bihar. Bihar had much more healthy districts, and more chances of holding charge of divisions.

66404. With regard to the cost of training, at present a student at Dehra Dun whilst undergoing his course was allowed Rs. 50, out of which Rs. 17-8-0 was deducted for house rent and instruments. Forest officers would be quite willing to forego the Rs. 32-8-0 for the sake of being put on the same level as the Public Works Department. The good men Government were looking for would be quite willing to pay their own expenses. The Principal at Dehra Dun had recommended that the stipend of Rs. 50 should be abolished.

66405. With regard to the cost of living, conditions in Bengal were not the same as those prevailing in the Central Provinces. He had always found it necessary to provide his own servants. Provincial officers had to pay the same as other Europeans in the various stations.

(The witness withdrew.)

W. F. PERREE, ESQ., Officiating Conservator of Forests, Assam.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being a memorandum of the views of a majority of the Forest Officers serving in Assam, ascertained at a conference held at Shillong on 29th September, 1913, the following officers being present:—Messrs. R. M. Williamson and W. F. Perrée, Officiating Conservators; Messrs. Doxat, Cavendish and Cooper, Deputy Conservators; Messrs. Owden, Simeon, Meiklejohn, David, Thomas and Mackarness, Assistant Conservators.

66406. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The last regulations for the selection and training of probationers issued by the Secretary of State are contained in Government of India Circular No 21F., dated the 18th October, 1912. The Conference, by a majority of one vote, favoured recruitment between the ages of 18—20, the minority favouring the limits of 19 to 22 at present in force.

The general opinion is in favour of selection, as at present, by a Board appointed by the Secretary of State. A severe medical test to be insisted upon, followed by a competitive examination in the following subjects:—

English composition and dictation; mathematics; the elements of the following sciences:—

Botany, chemistry, physics and geology; free-hand and geometrical drawing; and German. A qualifying minimum to be obtained in English, German, Mathematics and Science as a whole.

Simultaneous examinations in India and in England are unanimously deemed undesirable, it being considered preferable to admit selected men from the Provincial to the Imperial Service. The change in the method of recruitment of Provincial men is, however, of recent introduction, and it is not possible as yet to determine whether the new system will supply a class of officers capable of taking their position on the same footing as the men recruited by the Secretary of State, so that it would be premature at present to make a definite pronouncement. It is held that there should be no absolute bar to the transfer of men of special merit from the Provincial to the Imperial branch, but that such cases must be uncommon or the quality of the Imperial recruits will be seriously affected.

66407. **(II) Systems of Training and Probation.**—The majority of officers at the Conference prefer one central training institution to the present arrangement of distributing the recruits over three universities. Such an institution to be attached to one of the universities, distinct from the colleges, and preferably located at Oxford. The institution to be capable of acting as a training centre for all Indian Services. Considering that the normal annual recruitment for the Imperial Forest Service is ten officers, it is felt that it is not worth while for any single institution to organise and develop the best possible course of training for the moiety of recruits that may select any one of the three centres. Uniformity and a healthy spirit of competition are at present lacking, while *esprit de corps* cannot, as things now stand, be engendered. The period of training to be two years at the central institution followed by one year on the Continent. Not more than three months are considered necessary to learn detailed range work in Europe, a wider experience of forestry under varying conditions being of greater importance.

Following upon the practical course in Europe, a year's practical training in a series of the most typical and instructive forests in India is considered essential. Hindustani to be made a compulsory language to be studied during the Indian course of training.

Stipends to be at the rate of £120 per annum during the course of European training, while ordinary pay and service should commence from the date of arrival in India.

From the foregoing it may be assumed that the present methods of recruitment and training are not considered entirely satisfactory.

66408. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The present arrangement whereby certain provinces repeatedly attract the men at the top of the list is considered defective, the Conference being in favour of abolishing the present system, whereby the choice of province is allowed, and substituting a system by which each province will in turn be given the men who pass out at the top of the list.

Other conditions in which amelioration is claimed are—

(*a*) free medical attendance for the families of officers;

(*b*) travelling allowances on steamers and on transfer to be more liberal, so that officers be not out of pocket;

(*c*) rent-free house accommodation to all Government servants;

(*d*) the Assam local allowance to be raised to Rs. 100 per month for Deputy Conservators, and Rs. 75 for Assistant Conservators, while Conservators be also made eligible for local allowances at the higher rate.

66409. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—In 1890 the pay of the Imperial Forest Service was as follows:—

	1st grade.	2nd grade.	3rd grade.	4th grade.
Conservators ...	1,500	1,250	1,000	—
Deputy Conservators	900	800	650	550
Assistant Conservators	450	350	250	—

In 1900 the scale of pay had been altered to:—

	1st grade.	2nd grade.	3rd grade.	4th grade.	
Conservators	1,600	1,350	1,000	...	Exclusive of exchange compensation which was given from 1st April, 1893.
Deputy Conservators	900	800	650	550	
Assistant Conservators	450	350	...	...	

The present scale of pay is as follows:—

Year	Rs.
1st	380
2nd	420
3rd	460
4th	500
5th	540
6th	580
7th	620
8th	660
9th	700
10th	750
11th	800
12th	850
13th	900
14th	950
15th	1,000
16th	1,050
17th	1,100
18th	1,150
19th	1,200
20th	1,250

	1st grade.	2nd grade.	3rd grade.
Conservators ...	1,900	1,700	1,500
Chief Conservators ...	—	2,150	—
Inspector-General ...	—	2,650	—

The existing scale of pay is considered inadequate in order to attract the class of men required for the Service and to admit of the re-introduction of competition among selected candidates. Further arguments in favour of a higher scale of pay are (1) the universal increase in the cost of living both in India and in England, and that (2) India must offer considerably higher salaries as time goes on to attract a class of men willing to serve under the changing conditions of the country, and capable of coping with those changes.

The following scale represents the scale urged by Imperial Forest Officers serving in Assam:—

Year.	Rs.	
1st	400	Assistant Conservator*
2nd	450	
3rd	500	
4th	550	
5th	600	
6th	650	
7th	700	
8th	750	
9th	800	
10th	850	
11th	900	
12th	950	
13th	1,000	
14th	1,050	
15th	1,100	
16th	1,150	
17th	1,200	
18th	1,250	
19th	1,300†	
20th	1,350	
21st	1,400	
22nd	1,450	
23rd	1,500	
Conservator	1,750—2,000	
Chief Conservator	2,500—100—3,000	
Inspector-General of Forests	3,500	

66410. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The following are the principal directions in which amendment of the existing leave rules are considered necessary:—

(*a*) One year's furlough to be admissible after the first four years of service.

(*b*) Half the amount of furlough earned on full pay to be optional in lieu of the amount earned on half pay.

(*c*) Privilege leave to be accumulated up to the full amount earned instead of three months, as at present.

(*d*) A minimum furlough allowance of £500 per annum and the removal of the existing maximum limits in all furlough allowances.

66411. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—It is maintained that the existing scale of pensions is inadequate. This scale was fixed at a time when the rupee was worth two shillings. The pensions of Rs. 4,000 and Rs. 5,000 thus represented £400 and £500, respectively. Since then the rise in the cost of the living has risen by 20 per cent. at least, so that it is not unreasonable to claim a pension equivalent in value to the pensions now admissible, namely £500 equivalent to Rs. 4,000 and £600 equivalent to Rs. 5,000.

All pensions for services recruited through the Secretary of State should also be paid in sterling money and be proportionate to the length of service. In fixing the relative pay of officers of the Imperial and Provincial Services, the latter has generally been assessed at two-thirds of the former. Under present conditions a Provincial Service officer can earn a pension of Rs. 5,000 which is equivalent to the ordinary pension of an Imperial officer of the same status. Obviously, therefore, the pension of the Imperial men should be improved to cover not only the difference in the pay but the extra cost involved in living in Europe in a fashion quite unlike that in which Indians live in their own country.

The power of superannuating any officer who has completed 25 years' service is also recommended and it is considered that Local Governments should be given full authority to exercise that power.

The following scale is unanimously recommended:—

Invalid Pensions.

Years.	£
10	250
11	275
12	300
13	325
14	350
15	375
16	400
17	425
18	450
19	475

Ordinary Pensions.

20	500
21	520
22	540
23	560
24	580
25	600
26	640*
27	680*
28	720*
29	760*
30	800*

It has been accepted that pensions are deferred pay so that an officer who may be invalided at an early stage of his service should be granted a pension proportionate to the amount which he has earned. The death rate in the past has been so high among forest officers that many are debarred from entering the Department owing to the risks incurred. The possibility of retirement on an adequate pension is therefore considered an essential to the recruitment of the class of men required. Arguing on the understanding that pension is deferred pay, an officer should be allowed to make use of that deferred pay in order to make a provision for his widow or his family. The Conference, therefore, recommend that officers be allowed to commute a portion of the pension, not exceeding one-third, for a lump sum with which to buy an annuity or make such other provision for their dependents as may be possible. The officers present were however unanimous in urging that this be entirely optional.

66412. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—There are no limitations to the entry of non-Europeans into the Imperial Service, provided they are recruited through the Secretary of State and are trained in Europe. The standard of training cannot be lowered below that at present in force, and recourse must continue to be had to European forests for object lessons. The admission of selected men from the Provincial to the Imperial Service as suggested above should act as an incentive to entrants into the Provincial Service to make a supreme effort, and there seems to be no objection to opening to men of special merit a possible means of entry into the Imperial branch.

The Imperial and Provincial Services should, however, continue to remain distinct. It is not desirable to improve the status of one branch at the expense of the other. The prefix "extra," as indicative of the Provincial Service, is not without objection and term "Provincial" may be substituted.

66413. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The existing arrangements work satsfactorily, and are in the best interests of the people, so there is no call for remark.

66414. **(IX) Other points.**—*Provision for leave and training.*—Under existing conditions an officer earns furlough equivalent to one-fourth of his active service (Article 302, Civil Service Regulations). Thus, it would be permissible for 25 per cent. of the staff to be on furlough, and this is the percentage at present admissible as reserve for leave and training. It is urged that this does not make sufficient provision for training, as officers have often to be placed in charge of divisions

* *Note.*—A qualified Assistant Conservator in charge of a division to draw a charge allowance of the lowest pay of a Deputy Conservator in addition to his substantive pay, provided the total does not exceed Rs. 700.

† Limited to officers suitable for Conservator.

* Limited to officers holding the rank of Conservator.

before they have had the necessary training, to the detriment of their own and Government interests. Few officers can prepare themselves for independent charge under three years, and this period should be looked upon as the normal length of training. Assuming that the average length of service is 25 years, the leave and training reserve should be $\frac{1}{4} \times \frac{3}{25} = (25 \times 12)$ per cent. = 37 per cent., which urged should be the future allowance for leave and training.

Provident Fund.—Officers of the Department are unanimous in pressing for a higher rate of interest than that at present admissible on their Provident Fund. Certain banks allow 4 per cent. compound interest on Savings Bank deposits, while the present prohibition from investments in concerns within their province acts as a serious hindrance to the investment of any savings, and Government should therefore compensate officers by raising the interest in their Provident Funds to 6 per cent., which is not unreasonable in view of the dividends paid by business concerns in India.

Mr. W. F. Perree, called and examined.

66415. (*Chairman.*) The witness was officiating Conservator of Forests in charge of the Eastern Circle. He had 20 years' service and had served in Bengal, Burma, Assam, and with the Government of India.

66416. In the Assam Service there were 13 Imperial officers, and 12 Provincial Officers. No Provincial Officer was at present in control of a major charge. It was possible for an attached officer to hold a major charge. In an important division there might be a divisional officer with two Imperial Officers, both of whom were considered to be in major control.

66417. There were 11 territorial charges, two of which were held by officers of the Assam Commission. Of the 11 territorial charges only two were minor charges, one of them being occupied by an Imperial Officer temporarily, because of the shortage of Provincial Officers.

66418. There was a very great difference between major charges and minor charges in Assam, but it was not necessarily a permanent difference. The organisation was based on the classification into major and minor charges, and it might be necessary to change a classification even temporarily, from minor to major. Broadly speaking the nomenclature of major and minor charges was dependent largely upon the work which was being, or had to be, carried out within the area of the charge. Those charges which were classed as major charges required the highest trained men.

66419. He thought specially selected men trained at Dehra Dun were capable of assuming control of major charges. His point of view was that the best method of recruitment in India to the Imperial Service would be to select officers from the Provincial Service after some years experience in a minor charge, and to promote them to the Imperial Service. He considered that was a preferable means of recruitment than to appoint officers direct to the Imperial branch from outside the Service.

66420. It was difficult to say how many years a man ought to be in the Service prior to being promoted to a major charge. When a vacancy occurred amongst Extra Deputy Conservators it might be filled from Extra Assistant Conservators of any seniority.

66421. The recent changes had not been long enough in existence to make it possible to judge whether the educational standard of the officer now entering Dehra Dun was high enough to enable him to be placed on an equality with officers of the Imperial Service. He did not consider that the Dehra Dun training was as good as an English training, but he preferred that the present course should be given a thorough trial before any system was adopted of sending statutory natives to England for training.

66422. He thought the present arrangement of recruitment of Imperial men was very unfavourable to certain of the least popular Provinces. His suggestion was that the top men should be posted to the various Provinces in turn.

66423. His proposal in regard to house rent would practically involve putting up salaries by about 7½ per cent., and that would be in addition to the substantial increase of salaries and of pensions proposed in his memorandum. He thought that was reasonable.

66424. He based the proposal for an increase in the Assam local allowances on his knowledge of the cost of living in Assam. Assam was in every way as expensive in Burma. He had been in Burma. The local allowance in Assam was Rs. 80 a month, and in Burma Rs. 100.

66425. The existing scale of pay was inadequate to attract the class of men required for the Service. He thought the true test of attractiveness was competition, and for a number of years past it had not been possible, presumably, to introduce competition. The regulations said that first of all there should be selection, and if more than a sufficient number of selected men were suitable, there should be a competitive examination There had been no competition, and the inference was that the number of suitable men who came forward was not more than sufficient to fill existing vacancies. There had not been a competitive examination for the past seven or eight years.

66426. Officers on probation in India should be given a year's practical training all over India. That was preferable to giving an officer regular work in a forest, taking conditions as they were. It was almost impossible to prevent use being made of an officer immediately on his arrival, owing to shorthandedness; that was to say considerations of his utility rather than of his training prevailed. He did not think the year's training would be of a perfunctory and superficial character, as he would be given object lessons to work up to. An officer required to be taught accurate habits of observation.

66427. With regard to leave, he recommended that officers should receive a year's furlough after four years service, and that they should be given a minimum furlough allowance of £500 a year. Under the present scale of salary an officer in his fifth year of service would get a salary equal to £430, whereas under his scheme of salaries an officer would be receiving a salary equivalent to £480 a year, so that he would be actually getting when on leave more than he would if he remained on duty. He was not sure that that was not the case also in the Indian Civil Service.

66428. (*Mr. Madge.*) If a man came out after the age of 22 he did not settle down so easily to Indian life, and if men were kept too long in the Service after 50 they lost considerably in bodily activity, and in the Forest Department physical activity was essential.

66429. Changes in the categories of major and minor charges were usually determined by the Conservator and the local Government. They were not made arbitrarily, but only when there was a complete reorganisation of the Imperial and Provincial Services in a Province, say once in 10 years. He did not think his suggestion that each Province should have the top men in turn would have any effect on recruitment if men knew they were liable to transfer after eight or 10 years' service from one Province to another.

66430. He objected to recruitment in India for the Imperial Service, although he would not bar Provincial officers from promotion to the Imperial Service on their merits. If they were promoted they would enter the Imperial Service on their existing pay, and thenceforward continue on the scale of pay authorized for Imperial officers.

66431. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The three principal criteria for distinguishing major from minor charges were (*a*) the area of the forest (*b*) the revenue from the

forest, and (c) the importance of the work actually being discharged, or about to be discharged in the division in question. It was quite possible that there might be a division in which there was actually a very small area of forest, and from which very little revenue was derived, but on which important work of afforestation was about to be carried out. That division would be considered a major charge. It was a fact that in recent re-organisations there had been great trouble over the classification of charges, and proposals had been returned by the Secretary of State for reconsideration on that score. Taking Assam, there was, first of all, a large European community to be considered. The Forest Department had probably closer relations with the tea community than any other department, and it was important, as a rule, to put Europeans in charges where they came into contact with Europeans. Accordingly in a division in which there was a good number of white planters, there would, irrespective of the importance of the forest work, be an Imperial Forest Officer in charge. Such a charge might perhaps also be held by an Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests. He considered it would be more difficult to have three classes—major, intermediate and minor—than the present existing division into two classes.

66432. With regard to the promotion of Provincial officers to the Imperial Service, it would not be sufficient for an Indian recruited officer to go through the Dehra Dun course, and then to be taken to a German or a French forest. Such a course would not advance a man sufficiently in theoretical forestry. The theoretical training at Dehra Dun was not sufficient, even plus the Continental forest. Dehra Dun plus Continental practice would bewilder a man.

66433. (*Mr. Sly.*) The best method of recruiting Indians into the Imperial Service was undoubtedly to promote men of tried merit from the Provincial Service.

66434. Why he had left out French in his scheme for an examination for appointments in England was because the practical course was invariably spent in Germany. In France a man was always accompanied by a professor, who could explain and translate things. A knowledge of French was not so important as a knowledge of German, although it was an advantage.

66435. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) With regard to the recruitment of Indians into a proportion of the posts of the Imperial Service, he would not agree to a scheme by which, after a short period of service, a Provincial Officer would be sent to England for two years' training preparatory to his final transfer to the Imperial Service. Ignorance of German would probably preclude this. He would still prefer the other alternative of taking selected men from the Provincial Service.

(The witness withdrew.)

Rai Bahadur Upendra Nath Kanjilal, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Assam.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being the views of the Officers of the Provincial Forest Service as recorded in a Conference held at Shillong on the 2nd October, 1913.

66436. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—It was unanimously agreed that recruitment for direct appointment should be made by an open competitive examination amongst selected candidates. At the time of selection due consideration should be given to respectability, characters, academic career, physique and such other matters so that the possibility of introducing undesirable sorts will be precluded from the outset. In order to raise the status of the Service the Conference considered it desirable that selection should as a rule be made from amongst University men. New admissions into most other Provincial Services, notably the Provincial Civil Service, are made almost exclusively from among graduates; there is therefore no reason why University education should not be insisted upon in making selections for Forest Service. It was also agreed that under the circumstances at present prevailing in Assam the bar to the selection of non-natives of the Province should not be insisted upon. The candidates should be subjected to severe and searching medical examination before proceeding to Dehra Dun.

After selection the candidates should go through a competitive entrance examination to be held in different centres throughout India under the control of the Principal of the Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun. The following subjects were recommended for the Entrance examination:—

(1) *English.*—Conversation and essay.

(2) *Mathematics.*—Geometry, Mensuration and Trigonometry.

(3) *Science.*—Elementary Botany or Physics or Chemistry.

(4) *Drawing.*—Freehand and geometrical.

The age limit at the time of this examination should not exceed 22 years.

The Conference agreed that it was very desirable to recognise the claims and aspirations of the Subordinate Forest Service and suggested that 30 to 40 per cent. of vacancies in the Provincial Service should be filled up by promotion of deserving trained Rangers. None should, however, be so promoted before he has put in 5 years' approved service, nor will as a rule any be eligible for promotion after 35 years of age. A Ranger of 35 will have put in about 10 years of service, which period is considered sufficiently long to give evidence of his fitness for promotion.

The Conference was emphatically against shutting the door of the Provincial Service for members of the Subordinate Service, as in its opinion such a course would demoralise a class of officers who are justly considered the backbone of the Department.

66437. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The separate course of training recently introduced for Provincial Service men was approved of. It was, however, unanimously agreed that the preliminary training be limited to only six months, and the majority were of opinion that during this period an attempt should be made to teach the candidates as far as possible some of the subjects they will be taught at the Forest College.

In view of the prospect of improvement of the status of the Service the Conference recommended the raising of the standard of the college course and the extension of the period of training from two or three years. The standard should be raised particularly in the following subjects:—

1. Working plans.
2. Botany.
3. Zoology.
4. Engineering and Surveying.
5. Mathematics.
6. Better facilities for laboratory work in connection with the study of 2 and 3 as also of Physics and Chemistry.

The majority were of opinion that the college should be affiliated to a University, like most of the Engineering and Medical Colleges in India, Forestry forming a separate faculty of that University. Their idea was that the best possible course of education could only be evolved by a University. Should, however, this be not found feasible, at least the subjects of Surveying, Engineering and Mathematics should be taught by professional experts.

The Conference was unanimous that the period

of probationary service be cut down to one year, which ought to be ample to judge the merits of an officer who has successfully gone through all the severe tests that have preceded it.

66438. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The majority of the Provincial Service Officers were of opinion that the distinction between the Imperial and Provincial Services should be removed, and that all gazetted officers be borne on the same list as in the Public Works Department, Police and Telegraph Departments. The only difference that need be maintained is in the matter of pay which, it was generally recognised, ought to be higher in the case of officers appointed in England. These officers can be shown in the classified lists with a mark or letter to indicate that they were appointed by the Secretary of State.

Whether this can be given effect to or not the officers felt strongly that the prefix "Extra," which was meaningless and misleading, should be dropped, and that all officers performing duties of the same nature should have the same official designation. A Judge, for instance, is known simply as a Judge, and a Magistrate is called a Magistrate, whether appointed in England or in India.

The other points discussed and agreed upon were the following:—

1. That the charge of Divisions should, as far as possible, go by seniority in the general list.

2. That senior officers should not be posted under junior officers of either Service.

3. That officers of both Services must hold *actual* charge of ranges for at least two years to qualify for a Divisional charge.

4. That no officer should be given charge of a Division before completing 5 years of actual service and before passing the Departmental Examinations.

5. That the distinction between "major" and "minor" charges should be removed or at any rate should be clearly defined.

6. That when an adverse confidential report is made against an officer, a copy of it should be given him confidentially to enable him to vindicate himself.

7. That selected India appointed officers be eligible for holding administrative charges.

8. That the relations between India appointed and England appointed officers of the same rank and standing should be improved.

As regards 7, it is to be noted that unlike other Departments there are no "listed" appointments in the Forest Department for officers recruited in India. In many other Departments, officers recruited in India can rise up to the highest appointment in a Province, and in this Department also, India trained officers have risen to be Conservators, and one such officer held the post of a Chief Conservator for years. It cannot be said that the same stamp of men are not to be found from the ranks of men who received similar or perhaps better technical education, simply because they are being shown on a separate list. The Conference felt strongly that no bar should be placed arbitrarily before men of real merit.

As to 8, the officers assembled were of opinion that although they had no complaints to make against the treatment they received from Conservators, they were generally very harshly treated by other Imperial officers even when they were not placed directly under such officers. This was very much to be regretted, but it could not be gainsaid that a mild feeling of antipathy existed which generally resulted in discouragement and discontentedness on the part of the Provincial Service officers.

66439. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The Conference was of opinion that althought the starting pay was not low the rate of increment was not adequate as also the present maximum pay, which they thought ought to be raised to Rs. 1,000. The following scale was considered satisfactory:—

Assistant Conservators.

Year.	Rs.
1st	250
2nd	275
3rd	300
4th	325
5th	350
6th	375
7th	400
8th	425
9th	450
10th	475
11th	500
12th	525
13th	550
14th	575

Deputy Conservators.

Year.	Rs.
15th	600
16th	650
17th	700
18th	750
19th	800
20th	850
21st	900
22nd	950
23rd	1,000
24th	1,000
25th	1,000

In the event of promotion to administrative appointments being sanctioned, the salary of India trained Conservators should be as follows:—

Grade.	Rs.
3rd	1,300
2nd	1,400
1st	1,500

The Conference suggested that the rules affecting increments should be the same for both Services.

The question of travelling allowance having come up for discussion it was agreed that it should be asked that the general rule for classification of officers given in Article 1002 of the Civil Service Regulations be adhered to, and that officers in charge of Divisions should be allowed to draw daily allowances and mileage at first-class rates irrespective of their salary. The officers also felt that the travelling allowance at present admissible for gazetted officers on transfer was very insufficient, so that a transfer aways meant a heavy pecuniary loss.

66440. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—It was agreed that the following concessions should be asked for:—

1. That privilege leave may be allowed to accumulate up to six months.

2. That the certificate now demanded of an officer applying for privilege leave that no leave will be taken within six months after the expiry of the leave should be abolished, and that leave be admissible at any time after it has become due.

3. That furlough up to three years be counted as service.

4. That furlough allowance should be half of leaving pay and not half the average pay of last three years as now.

66441. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—It will be readily admitted that service in the Forest Department is of a very arduous nature and that Forest Officers have to endure hardship and exposure to an extent unknown in most other Departments. In view of this, the Conference urged that the period of service necessary for invalid pension be reduced from 25 to 20 years, and also that for voluntary retirement from 30 to 25 years.

The present maximum pension of Rs. 400 a month or Rs. 5,000 a year was fixed at a time when living was far less expensive, and perhaps the style of living was somewhat lower. In view

of this the Conference urged that the maximum pension for Forest Officers recruited in India be fixed at Rs. 500 a month.

It was also suggested that a prayer should be made to have the rate of interest for amounts deducted from salary for deposit in the Provident Fund be raised from the present rate of 4 per cent. to something like 6 per cent.

66442. **(VII) Limitation in the employment of non-Europeans and the division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.**—In Assam there is at present no limitation in respect of employment of non-Europeans in what is now known as the Provincial Service.

The Conference went a little out of its way to suggest that no Colonials be admitted into the Forest Service of India. It has already been said under III. that the Conference voted against the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial.

66443. **(VIII) Relations with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—Relations of Provincial Forest Officers with members of other services were considered generally satisfactory and no improvement was suggested.

RAI BAHADUR UPENDRA NATH KANJILAL called and examined.

66444. (*Chairman.*) The witness occupied the position of Extra Deputy Conservator. He had 36 years Government service, and had been in the Forest Department for 28 years. He was the senior Forest Officer in the Assam Provincial Service. There were at present only seven officers in the Provincial Service in Assam.

66445. The majority of the Provincial Service Officers in Assam were of the opinion that the division into Imperial and Provincial branches should be abolished. They desired to see a common list established, as in the Public Works Department. He was not aware that Provincial Officers in the Public Works Department were by no means satisfied with the present arrangements. He was, however, certain that they had a much better status than Provincial Officers of the Forest Department.

66446. There should be no bar to the advancement of Provincial Service officers to the highest rank. It could not be said that the same stamp of men as were got from England were not to be found in the ranks of officers who had received similar, or perhaps better, instruction in India. In certain subjects the training given at Dehra Dun was superior to that given in England, although the general training was somewhat lower. His colleagues had suggested that the curriculum should be raised to bring it on a par with the training given in England, so that no excuse might be left for relegating officers recruited in India to a lower status.

66447. The distinction between major and minor charges should be abolished, or at any rate clearly defined. In his opinion it would be quite possible to administer the Department without any classification of this kind. Assuming that all charges were placed on one list, an officer recruited from Europe should be paid on a different scale from the officer recruited in India, simply because the former came to serve in a foreign country.

66448. He suggested that the rate of interest payable for deposits in the General Provident Fund should be raised from 4 to 6 per cent., because 4 per cent. was too small. A better rate of interest could be obtained from investments.

66449. Provincial Officers in Assam did not take the leave to which they were entitled to any very great extent, because many of them could not afford it on account of the furlough allowance being so low.

66450. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He had never been in Europe. He had never felt in the course of his career that it would have been a great advantage to him to have had some practical knowledge of European methods of Forestry. He had never found himself handicapped in his practical work by his want of European knowledge.

66451. (*Mr. Sly.*) Ten or fifteen years ago people in the towns and educated centres had no knowledge of the existence of the Forest Department. It was only recently that they were coming to know of it. From his personal experience he could say that every month he received dozens of letters from friends enquiring about the Forest Department, with a view to entering their sons and their relatives into it. The Service was rising in popularity.

66452. It was right in a modified sense to say that the hard isolated conditions of life in the Forest Department did not appeal much to the educated class of Indians in the towns, and that the country Indians who did not mind isolated and hard conditions of life were, as a rule, not sufficiently educated. But nowadays times had changed a good deal. People were taking more interest in athletics, sports, and outdoor life, and they were beginning to look on forest life with much more favour than they did in former days. From the letters he had received it was evident that the young men for whom their fathers were contemplating a career in the Forest Department possessed good educational qualifications, and were not men who had failed to get into other Departments of Government Service.

66453. Admission to Dehra Dun should be limited to graduates. Preferably they should be graduates in science, but he would not confine admission to that one class of graduates.

66454. Twenty years was the earliest age at which a man could graduate in science in the Indian Universities. A man could not matriculate until 16, and he must then take a four years' course in science. If he was in his 21st year, and had to do a practical test in the forest of six months, it was barely possible for him to go up for the examination if the age was limited to 22, but the Service required the best men, and not those who had failed several times. If a man possessed a degree in science he thought three years at Dehra Dun was still necessary. He thought that even with such a high educational qualification and with three years' training at Dehra Dun, a substantial number of candidates in India would be attracted to Service in the Forest Department, although that Service was as yet not very popular. In the Medical Department, for instance, graduates were now entering, and they had to go through a five years' course. It was not the opinion of those Indians who had come to know the Forest Department that the Medical Service was much more attractive than the Forest Service.

66455. (*Mr. Fisher.*) If the period of preliminary probation in the Forest for Provincial Officers was lengthened to 12 months, he did not think it would have a deterrent effect on recruitment. Twelve months' probation in a forest might be a good thing, but the difficulty would be to make other details fit in without raising the age limit of entering Government Service.

66456. When he suggested improvements in the system of training and probation at Dehra Dun, he had in view the actual course of training at present in force.

66457. (*Mr. Madge.*) The promotion of Rangers to the Provincial Service would only be very exceptional, *i.e.*, limited to men of very exceptional merit. Such promotions would have no appreciable effect in lowering the standing of the Department.

66458. His desire for the removal of the distinction betwen the Imperial and Provincial Services was based on the ground that the men in the two branches were doing the same work, were subjected to the same practical tests of working, and also on the ground that the removal of the distinction would improve the status of Provincial Officers.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Madras, Tuesday, 27th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

H. B. BRYANT, Esq., Conservator of Forests, Madras.
M.R.Ry. V. SUBRAHMANYA AYYAR AVARGAL, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Madras.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

F. A. LODGE, Esq., C.I.E., Conservator of Forests, Madras.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being the corporate opinion of the Imperial Forest Service, Madras.

66459. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—It is considered that although the present method of recruitment has given fairly satisfactory results so far as experience has gone, it means that recruits arrive in India at too advanced an age and with qualifications in the shape of science degrees which do not sufficiently compensate for their late arrival. It would be preferable to revert to recruitment by means of nomination followed by competitive examination in a wide range of subjects between the ages of 18 and 20, and then to train the men in forestry and other allied sciences for a period of three years. The reason why this system broke down in the past was insufficient inducements in the way of pay and prospects. Now that these conditions have been improved in some respects, it is thought that there would be no difficulty whatever in obtaining candidates. Greater stress than at present should be laid on physical fitness and efficiency.

Medical examination should precede the competitive examination.

Recruits should be under 23 years of age on arriving in India; they acclimatise better than when they arrive older, and can put in 30 to 32 years of useful service.

66460. **(II) Systems of Training and Probation.**—It is highly desirable that the successful candidates should undergo some training common to them all at some residential institution with an Indian Forest Officer in charge of the students before they proceed to India. They should not be permitted to go to different universities or centres. In the first place, the number annually recruited is too small to make it worth the while of more than one institution to provide a special course of training suitable for Indian conditions; in the second place, it is essential that the details of the technical training of the recruits should be carried out on exactly similar lines. The training should be in England and Europe only; any subsequent training in India which may be necessary should be left to the Local Government of each province to decide as is now done.

A period of practical study of forestry in some of the Continental forests is an essential portion of the necessary training.

In this connection, it is considered that at present sufficient attention is not devoted to practical instruction in the important subject of Forest Engineering.

66461. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The conditions are exceptionally arduous and unhealthy. It appears from an article published in the "Indian Forester" for November, 1912, that of the 49 officers recruited for all India between the years 1877 and 1886, five left the Service without pension, five retired on reduced pension with less than 25 years' service, five are drawing the full pension, only 14 are still in the Service, while the remaining 20 are dead. As during the period in question, officers joined the Service at an average age not exceeding 22 years, none of these officers could now be more than 58 to 60 years old, and the average age would be about 53 years.

The Department is so scantily manned that off and on for the past 20 years and at the present time, officers are constantly refused the leave which they have earned, and are only granted leave on medical recommendation. Such a state of affairs tells not only very hardly on the health of officers of the Department, but also on the general efficiency of the administration. On this account we cannot too strongly urge an immediate increase in the strength of the Imperial Forest Service with a view to enable the Government to grant to officers the leave to which they are entitled when they apply for it, without forcing them actually to ill-health before leave is granted to them. The unit of area under each officer is too large to allow of thorough control. The special knowledge of Forest experts is largely wasted owing to the amount of ordinary office work which they have to perform. Such untechnical work might be left to office managers.

So far as length of service goes the present conditions are fair and need no change.

Objection has before now been taken to Forest officers comparing their conditions of service, salary, pension, etc., with those of other Services, but such comparisons must naturally be made not only by officers in service, but by parents who have to select a Department for their sons. The natural questions for a parent to ask are—

(*1*) How much shall I have to invest?

(*2*) For how long shall I have to support my son?

(*3*) Have the Departments which entail most capital expenditure advantages over the other Departments commensurate with the increased cost of putting my son into them?

The following table compares the Forest, Public Works and Police departments:—

Forest.

Two or three years' expensive special training, after obtaining a science degree at a university.

Period of training does not count as service for leave or pension.

Service begins from date of reporting for duty in India.

Public Works.

Two years' special training, believed not to be so expensive as Forest training.

Period of training does not count as service for leave or pension.

Until 1893 service began from date of appointment in England.

Police.

No training after leaving school, before joining appointment.

Training given while in Service, drawing pay. Period of training counts as service for leave and pension.

Service begins from date of reporting for duty in India.

Thus it is evident that the cheapest department to enter is the Police, the least technical of the three.

We solicit a comparison between two candidates, one for the Police, the other for the Forests, passing their entrance examination at the same time. Three years after the examination—

The Forest Officer.

has cost his parents nearly £1,000 in training expenses.
has drawn no pay.
has no service to his credit.
is on his way to India to join his first appointment.
is about to draw pay at Rs. 380 a month.

The Police Officer.

has cost his parents nothing.
has drawn pay for three years.
has three years' service to his credit.
is on his way home on his first three months' privilege leave,
is drawing pay and acting allowance at Rs. 500 a month.

It is believed that the Public Works Officer would occupy a position very similar to that shown for the Forest Officer in the above statement. To continue the comparison, the Forest Officer, ten years after passing his entrance examination will be drawing pay at Rs. 620, while the Police officer will be drawing Rs. 800. Later on in service the Forest Officer may overtake the Police Officer in the way of pay, but he never gets ahead of him enough to make up what he has lost at the commencement of his service. Again, the Forest Officer has to spend much of his time in unhealthy localities, but if he has to retire owing to broken health early in service he receives a smaller pension than the Police Officer (*vide* articles 474 and 476, Civil Service Regulations) under similar circumstances. The provisions of article 408, Civil Service Regulations (leave counting as service), used to apply only to technical departments such as the Public Works and Forests; they now apply equally to all departments.

Consequently, neither in prospects as regards pay, leave, or amount of pension is no compensation given to the members of the technical services for the time and money spent in qualifying for those services, but in some cases they are worse off than the members of the untrained services, and this is naturally felt to be an injustice requiring alteration. The only point on which favourable terms are given to the technical services is the length of service required to earn a retiring pension, but this is discounted by allowing them smaller pensions up to 24 years' service than can be obtained on medical certificate by officers of other services.

It is felt that the Forests and Public Works are sister services, they both require technical training and are services of experts; they both entail more exposure and more residence in unhealthy localities than other services (of the two, Forests has the lion's share of unhealthy localities), and for many years the recruits for both services were trained side by side at the same college, and the forest training was the more expensive of the two. It is therefore felt that the conditions of service, salary, allowances, leave and pension in "Forests" should be at least as good as those granted to "Public Works" and distinctly better than those of "Police."

The following actual cases of comparative results of entering the "Forests" and the "Police" emphasise what has already been written:—

In 1892 Fischer passed for "Forests"; Sandell appeared for Forests in 1893 and in 1894 and failed; in 1895 he passed into "Police"; Fischer and Sandell came out to India in the same steamer, and both began service on the same date. Ten years later Sandell was drawing better pay than Fischer.

In 1898 Richmond passed for "Forests"; at the same examination Stevenson failed; in 1899 Stevenson passed for Police, came straight to India, counts service from 1899; Richmond came out after training in 1901 and counts service from then.

Evidence that the Service is (a) exceptionally arduous and unhealthy.—In the year 1883, owing to the short-handedness of the Forest Department (a chronic condition even unto the present day), two Civilians were appointed District Forest officers; one of them, Mr. Sim, held the post for three years and therefore had personal experience of the life of Forest officers; his opinion is therefore of some value, and it is recorded in 1904 in the following words:—"Considering that forest work, as a whole, is beyond all comparison, more arduous, responsible and unhealthy than any other Service of Government."

The Government of India in a dispatch to the Secretary of State reported that the position and responsibilities of Conservators were in no way inferior to those of Superintending Engineers, while the risks they ran from exposure in unhealthy climates were perhaps greater.

Of 29 officers recruited from 1881 to 1885 inclusive, nine have retired, six are still in service, four resigned and ten are dead. The resignations were due to broken-down health.

The history of services of gazetted officers does not show the amount of ill-health there is in the Department, for numerous furloughs granted on medical recommendation are shown as ordinary furlough.

In other Departments some sedentary posts exist in which men unfit for strenuous field work can continue on duty and recover their health; in the Forest Department (Madras) not one sedentary post exists; men must carry on their arduous and unhealthy work until they can obtain furlough. or until they break down.

Evidence that the Service is (b) scantily manned.—This is due to want of provision for the natural expansion of the work of the Department. Every time that an increase of establishment is asked for, it has to be based on "immediate requirements," no provision being made for future development. It takes three or four years to get the asked for increase, so that when it comes it is insufficient even for immediate requirements. The growth of the Department is illustrated by the following figures:—

Year.	Conservators.	Deputy and Assistant Conservators.	Sub-Assistant Conservators.	Extra Deputy Conservators.	Extra Assistant Conservators.	Revenue.	Expenditure.
						Rs.	Rs.
1883	2	24	10	—	—	9,03,914	6,36,558
1891	3	31	—	—	11	17,95,408	12,53,284
1911	4	27	—	8	31	37,71,940	32,18,552
1912	4	27	—	8	31	42,37,795	34,46,441

Correspondence regarding the reorganisation of 1891 commenced in 1888, and that regarding reorganisation of 1911 in 1907.

The results of the undermanning of the Department are—

(*1*) The officers are overworked.

(*2*) Protection and development of the forests is retarded.

(*3*) Leave has to be refused.

(*4*) There are no officers to spare for special works.

(*5*) No officer is allowed to take up foreign service or service under the Government of India.

(*6*) Consequent on (*5*) there is a block in promotion to the class of Conservators.

As regards (*1*).—In an exceptionally unhealthy Department such as Forests, an extra margin of spare officers should be maintained in order to provide for filling leave vacancies.

As regards (*2*).—The area of Madras forests brought under regular working plans is only 7,884 square miles, leaving 11,545 square miles to be dealt with; even the area which on paper is under working plans is not really so, as large areas included in working plans are shown as "unworkable."

As regards (*3*).—Details are given below.

As regards (*4*).—Madras has not had a working plans officer since 1902, though one is required in each circle, and there should be a controller of working plans.

As regards (*5*).—The following are instances of Madras officers not being allowed to take up foreign service or service under the Government of India; practically every such post means a substantial increase of salary.

(i) In 1912 the Government of India addressed the Government of Madras with a view to obtaining the services of an Imperial officer from Madras as Assistant to the Sylviculturist at Dehra Dun, and Madras replied that no officer could be spared. Mr. Wimbush applied demi-officially for permission to accept the billet, and was refused.

(ii) In 1906 volunteers for service on the Gold Coast were called for; Messrs Fischer and Cox volunteered but Government refused to spare their services.

(iii) In 1909 Mr. Fischer's services were asked for by India for employment at Dehra Dun, but Madras refused to sanction his deputation.

(iv) In 1910 Mr. Fischer applied for permission to take up a vacant post at Dehra, and the Board of Revenue regretted that it was impossible to spare him. He was again refused permission in 1912.

(v) Volunteers (Latham) for service in Siam and Southern Nigeria were not allowed to take up the appointments owing to Madras being so shorthanded.

(vi) In 1902 Mr. Cox was strongly recommended for the post of Conservator of the Malay States; the Madras Government could not spare his services. (The appointment would have doubled Mr. Cox's salary.)

(vii) The Government of Ceylon recently applied for the services of Mr. Richmond or other officer as Conservator, and Madras replied that no officer could be spared.

As regards (*6*).—There are at present 13 officers out of a sanctioned total of 27, drawing the highest pay admissible to Deputy Conservators, while on the Government of India list the numbers are 24 and 163 and on the Bombay list 4 and 24. Men who joined the Service in 1889 under the Government of India are now permanent Conservators, while the junior permanent Conservator in Madras dates his Service from 1886.

Evidence that (*c*) *leave is constantly refused, and granted only on medical recommendation.*—This is the natural result of the undermanning of the Department.

The leave taken by the 20 senior Forest Officers in Madras up to the 31st December, 1912, amounts only to 40 years and 27 days, out of a total service of 463 years 8 months and 29 days, or 8·8 per cent. against the 20 per cent. to which they are entitled. This includes all officers of over 16 years' service; for the Civil Service (over 16 years' service) the percentage is 14·0. For reasons already given [III (*a*) 5] Forest Officers need leave more than members of the Civil Service.

(i) Mr. Lodge applied for privilege leave when he had earned three months of that leave in 1886, and was refused, owing to shortage of officers.

(ii) Mr. Lodge's application for furlough in 1904 was refused on the same grounds, and he had to take leave on private affairs.

(iii) Mr. Scott applied for one month's privilege leave from 1st October, 1913, and was offered the leave on condition that he carried on his work during his leave.

(iv) Mr. Barry states that he has three times been refused leave, and twice succeeded in getting it by obtaining a medical recommendation.

(v) Mr. Wimbush, after three years and seven months' continuous service, applied for three months' privilege leave from 5th July, 1911; it was refused.

(vi) Mr. Fischer was refused furlough in 1904; granted furlough on medical recommendation in 1905, but for private reasons was unable to take it; was refused furlough in 1907 after twelve years' service without furlough; was refused one month's privilege leave from 1st March, 1912, and again from 7th November, 1912.

(vii) Mr. Cox, after nine years' service and much fever applied for furlough. The Board of Revenue refused to recommend the grant without the production of a medical certificate, but eventually accepted a letter of recommendation from the District Medical Officer, Vizagapatam. Precisely the same thing happened again in 1907 when Mr. Cox was broken down with fever. As Mr. Cox puts it: "I have only twice asked for furlough during 20 years' service, both times on the ground of inability to continue work. Both times I have been informed that I cannot get leave without a medical certificate owing to the Department being very shorthanded."

(viii) Mr. Tireman was refused furlough without medical certificate in July, 1903, and again in December of the same year, and the decision of the Board was upheld by Government. He was again refused leave except on medical certificate in 1910.

(ix) Mr. Richmond was refused eight months' combined leave from March, 1913.

(x) Mr. Murray was refused privilege leave without medical certificate in July, 1906; refused two months' privilege leave in June, 1912; refused again in April, 1913, as there was nobody to relieve him.

(xi) Mr. Bennett was refused furlough in 1912 on account of paucity of officers. Mr. Lodge reported to the Board on this subject in 1907 as follows: "The absence of sufficient provision in the existing cadre has rendered it necessary for some years to refuse leave to officers except when the state of their health rendered leave absolutely necessary; a premium has thus been placed on bad health, while the officers who have kept themselves fit for duty have been unable to obtain the periodical rest and change which are necessary for the prolonged maintenance of health in every Department and especially so in one notorious for the unhealthiness of the tracts in which many of its officers have to work."

The following are orders of the Government and of the Board of Revenue restricting the grant of leave to Forest Officers on account of the shorthandedness of the Department. G.O. No. 376, Revenue, dated 30th April, 1902; Board's Proceedings, Forest, No. 76, Routine, dated 13th February, 1903; Board's Proceedings, Forest, No. 175, Routine, dated 5th April, 1906, G.O. No. 2315, dated 16th September, 1907, and D.O. No. 2250-E 11-1, dated 11th October, 1911, from the Secretary to Government to the Forest Member of the Board.

Evidence that (*d*) *the unit of area under each officer is too large to allow of thorough control.*—In the Presidency there are 32 Forest districts containing 19,439 square miles of reserved forests and reserved lands; this gives an average of over 600 square miles to each District Forest Officer. On this point Mr.

Beadon Bryant, late Inspector-General of Forests, remarked: "No officer, however energetic, can work areas like these to the best advantage."

In France, with only 4,609 square miles of State forests, 7,603 square miles of communal forests and 20,209 square miles of private forests, the establishment consists of:—

1 Director-General.
3 Administrators.
32 Conservators.
200 District Forest Officers.
442 Assistants to District Forest Officers.

The areas of the charges are:—

Madras.	*Officer.*	*France.*
4,860 sq. miles.	Conservator.	144 sq. miles.
607 sq. miles.	District Forest Officer.	23 sq. miles.

For comparison with Madras the French Conservator may be considered to hold the place of the Madras District Forest Officer.

66462. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—(*1*) *The conditions of life in India at the present day are much less attractive than they were twenty and thirty years ago, and are daily becoming less attractive.*—(*i*) Englishmen do not like serving under Indian officers.

(*ii*) There has been an enormous increase in the quantity and quality of work to be done, both in field and in office, by every officer, and to Forest Officers more perhaps than to any other class, office work is uncongenial. The increase in office work may be gauged by the fact that in Anantapur in 1886 the Forest office staff consisted of two clerks whose work was far from heavy, whereas now it takes six clerks to get through the work, and an application has recently been made for an increase of office establishment.

(*iii*) The Medical Service used to be composed of Europeans, it now contains a large Indian element, and just as Indians object to having European doctors attending the ladies of their families, so do Europeans object to Indian doctors attending their wives and daughters.

(*iv*) The cost of "home remittances" is 50 per cent. higher than it was with the rupee at two shillings.

(*v*) The cost of living has increased largely in recent years; servants, labour, transport, horse-food, and every item of household expense has increased in price.

(*2*) *The conditions of salary (combined with present value of the rupee and cost of living) are such that no married man can make sufficient provision for his family out of his savings, or put by enough to enable him to live in comfort after retiring, or afford to take the leave without which he cannot continue at his best.*—(*i*) There are seven officers in service in Madras who have earned their full pension of Rs. 5,000; not a single officer recruited since 1881 has yet retired on full pension. Of the six trained officers recruited before 1881 four retired on full pension; not one of these officers was able to save enough while in service to make, in addition to his pension, a sufficient income to enable him to spend his old age in comfort.

(*ii*) Although some salaries were increased by the reorganisation of 1907, the benefits of the increase have been swallowed up by the rise in the cost of living in recent years. The rise in the cost of living is probably permanent but not final, *i.e.*, prices of labour, etc., will not fall, but may and probably will rise, and as the recommendations of the Commission will finally fix the pay of officers for the next 20 years or more, it is felt that the fact that some salaries were raised by the reorganisation of 1907 should not be allowed to prevent a full enquiry into the adequacy or otherwise of salaries under existing conditions and under the conditions which can be foreseen as coming into existence within the next 20 years.

(*3*) *The increase in salary resulting from the reorganisation of* 1907 *and introduction of the time scale of pay was irregularly distributed and partly discounted by the withdrawal of compensation allowance.*—(*i*) Before the reorganisation the recruit from England drew pay at the rate of Rs. 350 plus Rs. 21-14-0 compensation allowance; after the reorganisation he drew Rs. 380, a trifling increase of Rs. 8-2-0, while the men of from two to eight years' service are frequently worse off under the reorganised scale than under the old scale.

(*ii*) Under the old system, if a junior officer was placed in charge of a district, it was owing to the absence of men on leave, in consequence of which he received acting allowance, which compensated him to some extent for the extra expense of district charge. Under the new (time scale) system the junior officer receives no acting allowance when placed in charge of a district. The pay of an Imperial Service District Forest Officer should never be less than that allotted to junior Deputy Conservators.

(*iii*) The Senior Deputy Conservators have benefited most by the introduction of the time scale of pay, which has raised the pay of a second grade Deputy of 19 years' service by Rs. 400 or 47 per cent., of a first grade Deputy by Rs. 293-12-0 or 32·64 per cent., whereas the pay of Conservators was increased as follows:—

Third grade by	Rs.	225	0	0 or 17·64	per cent.
Second grade by	,,	212	8	0 or 14·28	,,
First grade by	,,	200	0	0 or 11·76	,,

(*iv*) Under the old system the difference between the highest pay attainable by a district Forest Officer and the lowest pay of a Conservator was Rs. 318-12-0, which was insufficient to cover the extra expenses which an officer in the position of a Conservator has to incur. Under the new system, the above difference has been diminished to Rs. 250, with the result that a senior Deputy Conservator is financially better off than a third or even a second grade Conservator. The difference of pay between the executive and administrative appointments should be not less than Rs. 500.

(*v*) The pay of first and second grade Conservators is less than the pay recommended by the Government of India in their despatch to the Secretary of State No. 312, dated 1st October, 1890, inasmuch as it is less than the pay of Superintending Engineers of corresponding grades.

(*vi*) The stoppage of increments from the twentieth year of service is hard on competent officers who would be Conservators were it not for (a) the irregularity with which the Service is recruited, (b) the refusal to allow officers to take foreign employment, (c) the bar existing against any Madras Forest Officer obtaining the post of Inspector-General of Forests, a bar which it is urged should be removed.

It is felt also very strongly that there should be a Chief Conservator in each Province on Rs. 3,000 and the pay of the post of Inspector-General of Forests to the Government of India should be raised to Rs. 3,500 a month and should most certainly be retained. His advice should be made readily available to the Presidency of Madras. It is deemed essential that the increase of pay between executive and administrative rank, between Conservator and Chief Conservator, and between Chief Conservator and Inspector-General of Forests, should not be less than Rs. 500 a month. The present pay of the administrative posts in the Forest Department is insufficient to enable the officers who hold them to maintain their position as heads of departments in the way they should do, either with Local Governments or with the Government of India.

It is further urged that—

(*a*) Special allowances should be made for special work, such as Working Plans, College, Research work, etc.

(*b*) Special allowances should be made in special localities, for special unhealthiness, cost of living, etc., and

(*c*) A special allowance should be made to officers who have their headquarters in a Presidency Town to meet the increased cost of house rent and living, in the same way as is now done to officers of departments other than the Forest Department at the present time.

These items are dealt with in more detail later on.

(4) *The pay of Forest Officers should be at least equal to that of Public Works Officers of corresponding position.*—The Government of India have expressed their opinion on this point, stating that the position and responsibilities of Conservators are in no degree inferior to those of Superintending Engineers, while the risks they incur from exposure in unhealthy climates are perhaps greater, and that they ought therefore to receive an equal rate of salary. But if position and responsibilities of two posts are equal and the risks in one post are greater than those in the other, the former should carry *better* pay than the latter. Actually the contrary is the case. If the comparison is carried above the class of Conservators, the differences become still more marked, for a Chief Conservator of a Province receives only Rs. 2,150, while Chief Engineers receive Rs. 2,500 and Rs. 2,750, and the Inspector-General of Forests for all India receives less pay than a first-class Chief Engineer of a single Province and is placed far below him in the Precedence list.

After considering all the points connected with the conditions of salary, the Madras Forest Officers are of opinion that the following rates of salary would be fair:—

Year of service.		Rate of pay.
		Rs.
1	Assistant Conservators (provided that any officer placed in charge of a Forest district shall draw the pay of the lowest grade Deputy Conservator).	400
2		450
3		500
4		550
5		600
6		650
7		700
8		750
9		800
10		850
11		900
12		950
13		1,000
14		1,050
15		1,100
16		1,150
17		1,200
18		1,250
19	Limited to officers declared suitable for the post of Conservator.	1,300
20		1,350
21		1,400
22		1,450
23		1,500
Conservators, 2nd Grade		2,000
Conservators, 1st Grade		2,500
Chief Conservators		3,000
Inspector-General		3,500

Special allowances should be made for special work such as Working Plans, College, Research work, etc.—The need for these allowances has been admitted by the Government of India in letter No. 312, dated 1st October, 1890, to the Secretary of State; the allowances are given under the Government of India and should also be given under the Government of Madras.

The Principal of a Forest College has numerous extra expenses; for instance, he has to entertain on a larger scale than any other Forest Officer to support the college games, students' library, etc., and to offer prizes for work or sport. When on tour he has to travel over distances as great or greater than those covered by a Conservator and to keep camp equipment suitable for heavy camping in the plains and light camping in the hills. As regards local and travelling allowances the Principal of the Madras Forest College shoud be placed on a level with the Principal of the Dehra Dun Forest College.

The same remarks apply to the allowances of Instructors.

Officers of other departments called on to serve in the Presidency town are given increased pay or local allowances of house rent, to compensate for the extra cost of living; Forest Officers should be given similar treatment. The following are some instances of the local allowances granted:—

	Local allowance.	House rent.
	Rs.	Rs.
Under Secretary to Government, Public Works	100	45
Secretary to Government, Public Works	250	—
Joint Secretary to Government, Public Works	250	—
Under Secretary to Government, Irrigation	100	45
Secretary to Government, Railway Branch	250	—
Assistant Secretary to Commissioner of Salt and Abkari ...	150	60
Director of Land Records... ...	211	—
Director of Agriculture	150	—
Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department	100	50
Deputy Commissioner of Police...	100	—
Assistant Inspector-General of Police	200	—
Chief Presidency Magistrate ...	Free house	
Domestic Chaplain to the Bishop	75	
The Archdeacon	130	
Sanitary Commissioner	100	

The list is not exhaustive, but is sufficiently comprehensive to show that unless good reasons to the contrary can be produced, Forest Officers should be given similar allowances.

Special allowances should be made in special localities, to compensate for special unhealthiness, cost of living, etc.—This is admitted in all departments, and it is not just to exclude the Forest Department on the grounds that officers joining it knew what to expect.

The allowances for travelling on tour by road, for journeys exceeding 20 miles are eight annas a mile for first-class officers whether they carry tents or not; the allowances for Assistant Conservators are four annas and for Deputy Conservators six annas a mile unless they carry tents. There is no reason for this distinction and it should be abolished.

The rates of travelling allowance require revision, to bring them into line with the modern cost of camping, and rates must differ according to the cost of travelling in different districts, or even in different localities of the same district. Journeys "by road" include journeys where no roads exist, and all luggage and camp equipment has to be carried by coolies. Such journeys are more common to Forest Officers than to others and their cost is double or treble the amount of the daily allowance.

The rate of cart hire has increased everywhere; in 1885 carts could be hired at Rs. 18 per month; now in Coimbatore the cost is Rs. 30 and in the Wynaad Rs. 50, while in South Carara the carts are so small that double the number of ordinary carts has to be employed.

Forest Officers in Madras have now to pay for occupation of Forest rest-houses, which formerly they occupied free of charge. Breakages of camp furniture, etc., are heavy, especially when camp equipment has to be carried by coolies or elephant or pack bullocks.

In this connection it is urged that *the cost of railing horses from one camp to another should be paid by Government.* On one occasion Lodge railed his horses from Coimbatore to Tellicherry, and was refused refund of rail charge on the grounds that he might have had the horses walked to Tellicherry. The distance is 158 miles. Hundreds of similar cases could be quoted in Madras, while it is understood that such charges are always passed in Northern India.

The travelling allowance admissible on transfer is limited to double first-class fare which leaves the transferred officer much out of pocket. When two or more transfers follow at short intervals an officer is financially crippled for some time.

The old days when an officer sold all his furniture and horses to his successor have passed away with the spread of railways, and an officer on transfer now-a-days has to take with him a portion of his furniture, all his personal property, in many cases a family, and in all cases some servants. His expenses are greater than when travelling on tour. As instances:—

(*1*) Wilson was transferred from Coimbatore to South Malabar in June, 1912, from South Malabar to North Salem in September, 1912, and three weeks later from Salem to North Vellore; he was between Rs. 100 and Rs. 200 out of pocket on the transfers.

(*2*) Cowley Brown transferred from Salem to Coimbatore in 1912; received double first class fare, Rs. 12-6-0; actual cost of moving himself, servants, horse and camp equipment was Rs. 350.

(*3*) Latham, transferred from Coimbatore to South Canara in 1899, was about Rs. 140 out of pocket.

(*4*) Bryant, transferred from Kodaikanal to Madras in July, 1911; retransferred to Kodaikanal in November, 1911; transferred again to Madras in February, 1913; was Rs. 150 out of pocket on each transfer.

(*5*) Lodge, transferred from Kurnool to Coimbatore in 1898 was Rs. 600 out of pocket; his pay at the time was Rs. 800.

(*6*) Fischer transferred from Coimbatore to Kodaikanal in July 1911 and back to Coimbatore four months later was Rs. 500 out of pocket on the double transfer.

Instances could be multiplied.

It is felt that even if an officer is transferred while on furlough, he should be allowed the cost of moving his household goods from his old to his new station, on his return from leave; he would (or should) be allowed this amount if transferred while on duty, and his household goods cannot walk from one station to another while he is on furlough, or during his subsidiary leave after furlough.

Special provision should be made to recoup an officer the expenses he has to incur when, being on transfer, his destination is changed en route.—For instance, an officer transferred from Kurnool to South Arcot may receive orders in Madras to proceed to Nellore instead of South Arcot. He then receives travelling allowance from Kurnool to Madras, and from Madras to Nellore, but his goods and his horses having been booked to South Arcot cannot be stopped at Madras, and the officer has to pay for their carriage all the way to South Arcot and all the way back to Nellore.

66463. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The following improvements to existing leave rules are suggested:—

(*1*) The minimum allowance for furlough and leave on medical certificate should follow the ratio adopted between Indian Civil Service and other services for the maximum furlough allowance, *i.e*, to be £400, or the salary last drawn on duty, whichever is less.

(*2*) Commutation of long leave on half pay into shorter periods on full pay with suitable restrictions.

(*3*) Accumulation of privilege leave up to six months; it should never be possible for an officer to lose any of the privilege leave he has earned by leave being refused him, and in the event of such refusal, he should undoubtedly be permitted to accumulate his privilege leave up to the time Government can see its way to permitting him to avail himself of it.

Here again it is pointed out how essential it is to increase the cadre of the Imperial Forest Service so as to allow officers to take the leave which they have earned. Leave has been and is constantly refused except on medical recommendation, whereas it ought surely to be encouraged as much as possible in a department such as the Forest Department, the officers of which are apt to suffer severely in health from the very nature of their duties.

No minimum leave allowance for ordinary furlough is fixed for Forest Officers, although the Civil Service enjoy a minimum leave allowance of £500 a year or full pay, whichever is less. This is apparently a relic of the days when the Forest Department was recruited locally, and is unsuitable for the present conditions of officering the Department. A Forest Officer takes his furlough in England just as a Civil Service Officer does, and should receive such allowances as will enable him to take furlough when necessary and live during his furlough in such a manner that he may return to duty refreshed and invigorated; this is impossible on the furlough allowance admissible to junior officers under existing rules, and still more impossible if an officer is compelled to take leave on medical certificate early in his service; he then has doctor's fees and possibly the cost of an operation and nursing to meet, and the minimum allowance of £200 a year or three-quarters pay, whichever is less, is insufficient. (Compare this treatment with that of the Civil Service minimum, £500 a year or full pay, whichever is less.

As the maximum leave allowance of Forest Officers is 4-5ths that of Civilians, the same rule should apply to the minimum leave allowance which should therefore be £400 a year or full pay, whichever is less.

The revised leave rules—which, it is understood, have been issued to the heads of various departments for opinion and remarks have not been issued to any Forest Officer. A copy having been supplied in reply to a special request for the same, the following appear to be points requiring alteration:—

(*i*) *Article* 301.—It is proposed to credit six months furlough to members of the Civil Service on arrival in India; similar credit should be given to Imperial Forest Officers who have to spend two or more years under training before coming out to India.

(*ii*) *Article* 304-*b* (*ii*).—It is proposed that if a Service has no special leave reserve, the number of officers absent on leave shall not exceed one-eighth of the strength of the Service. The exceptional unhealthiness of the Forest Service has been shown under "Conditions of Service" and under the same head the difficulty of obtaining leave has been dealt with. The Service has recently lost an officer (Barlow Poole) solely because he was refused leave; he stayed on duty and died. The leave reserve in the Forest Service should be greater than in other services, and should be strong enough to allow of one-fourth of the officers being absent at a time.

(*iii*) *Article* 309 (*c*) makes no provision for minimum furlough allowances of Forest officers.

(*iv*) *Existing article* 246 requires modification, so that the privilege leave earned in excess of three months may not be forfeited. Numerous instances could be quoted of Forest officers being refused privilege leave and thereby being deprived of a certain amount of full pay leave which they have worked for.

66464. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The pensions now granted to officers retiring in England are smaller than they were 35 years ago. In the seventies of last century pensions were granted at the rate of "Rs. 5,000 or £500"; the present pensions are granted at 1s. 9d. per rupee, which gives only £437 10s. for Rs. 5,000. Those officers who earn the extra Rs. 1,000 pension (*i.e.*, Conservators of 28 year's service, etc.) receive £525 or an increase of £25 on the pensions of 35 years ago.

The cost of living in England, rents, rates, taxes, education of children, etc., have increased enormously since the maximum ordinary pension was fixed at Rs. 5,000 or £500.

Pensions being deferred pay, an increase in the scale of pay should be followed by an increase in the scale of pension. It has been stated that this does not follow, but a reference to the rules regarding foreign service in the Civil Service Regulations shows that Government calculate on quarter of an officer's pay being deferred to meet the cost of leave allowances and pension, and one-eighth of an officer's pay being deferred to meet the cost of pension alone [*vide* article 755 (i) and (ii)]; therefore an increase in pay means an increase in the amount of deferred pay put aside to meet the cost of pensions.

Under the old scale of pay one officer drew about

Rs. 1,47,775 salary in the first 20 years of service; under the new scale an officer draws Rs. 1,90,320 for the same period (whole time calculated as being on full pay); on these figures alone the Rs. 4,000 pension on the old scale of pay should become Rs. 5,150 on the present scale; if pay for the 21st to 30th year of service be added the difference would be still greater, for under the old scale an officer drew Rs. 1,48,800 (average) and under the new scale he will draw Rs. 1,95,600 during those years.

The high death rate in the Forest Department decreases the charge for pensions.

The facts pointed out under "conditions of salary" [2 (1)] show that present pensions are inadequate; of the four officers therein referred to as having retired on full pension, not one is able to live in comfort on his pension.

It is more difficult for Forest Officers than for others to obtain employment after retiring, for the work for which they are qualified entails a strenuous active life, which is beyond the power of most men after 30 years' service in India.

The retiring pension of Imperial Officers (excepting Conservators) is the same as that of Provincial Officers, although the Imperial Officer—

(*i*) draws more pay than the Provincial Officer, and consequently should be credited with more deferred pay.

(*ii*) retires in England where the cost of living is much higher than it is in India, where the Provincial Officer retires.

(*iii*) incurs considerable expense over his training for service, whilst the Provincial Officer is given his training free of cost.

Therefore, if the pension which can be earned by Provincial Officers is fair the pension which can be earned by Imperial Officers is unfair.

Under existing rules an officer obtains nothing in return for his deferred pay for service subsequent to the completion of 25 years.—An officer retiring after 25 years' service is entitled to a certain pension; if he continues in service, the capital which supplies the pension is increased by (1) interest on capital (2) annual deferred pay; the deferred pay of a senior officer represents a larger sum than that of a junior officer, consequently the accumulation of capital is comparatively rapid after the twenty-fifth year of service.

The longer an officer stays in active service, the shorter the time for which he will draw pension; in other words the older a man is on retiring the larger the annuity which a given sum will secure. Therefore pensions should increase annually according to the length of service of an officer.

The deferred pay of an officer on the present scale becoming Conservator only in his 24th year of service and allowing for four years furlough during his service would buy an annuity of Rs. 7,015 if the officer attained 55 after 30 years of service; of Rs. 8,518 if the officer attained 55 after 32 years of service.

Any improvements in pensions which may now be granted should have retrospective effect.—The inadequacy of existing pensions formed the subject of memorials by forest officers to the Secretary of State in the year 1909, which memorials were withheld by the Government of India on the grounds that "the subject of pensions being one of those referred to the Commission, the Government of India are unable to further consider the matter until the report of the Commission is received." Thus the grant of the relief prayed for has been and is being delayed beyond the date on which—but for the appointment of the Commission—it should have been given, and it is felt that it would be unfair to officers retiring between the date of the Government Order above referred to and the date of orders being passed on the recommendations of the Commission, to deprive them of any improvement in the conditions of pension resulting from the report of the Commission. It is therefore strongly urged that all such improvements may be given retrospective effect from the 7th September, 1912.

The invalid pensions obtainable by Forest Officers are inferior to those obtainable by other officers, although the risk of being compelled to retire on account of broken health is greater in "Forests" than in any other Department. The pensions obtainable are shown in the following comparative table; article 474 applies to all so-called uncovenanted Services except Forests, Public Works and Geological Survey which come under article 476:—

Years of service.	Forest officers' average emoluments.	Annual pension under Civil Service Regulations.	
		Article 474.	Article 476.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
10	703	1,406	1,000
11	750	1,650	1,400
12	800	1,920	1,800
13	850	2,210	2,200
14	900	2,520	2,600
15	950	2,850	3,000
16	1,000	3,200	3,000
17	1,050	3,400	3,000
18	1,100	3,600	3,000
19	1,150	3,800	3,000
20*	1,200	4,000	4,000
21*	1,233	4,200	4,000
22*	1,250	4,400	4,000
23*	1,250	4,600	4,000
24*	†1,333	4,800	4,000
25 and above* ...	1,417	5,000	5,000
Total ...	...	53,556	49,000

* Under Article 476 pensions after 20 years' service are retiring pensions.

† This allows for an officer becoming Conservator after completing 23 years' service.

Thus the Forest Officer compelled to retire before completing 20 years' service on account of ill-health is worse off than officers of other Departments, and if compelled to retire between 20 and 25 years' service on account of ill-health, he would not be allowed the pension admissible under article 474 and would therefore again be worse off than officers of other Departments. The only set off to these disadvantages of the article 476 scale is that no medical certificate is required after 20 years' service, a concession of which very few officers can afford to take advantage. After considering the facts dealt with in the preceding paragraphs it is felt that the following is a fair scale of pensions for Forest Officers:—

Years of service completed.	Sterling pension.	
	£	
10	250	On medical certificate.
11	275	
12	300	
13	325	
14	350	
15	375	
16	400	
17	425	
18	450	
19	475	
20	500	Without medical certificate.
21	525	
22	550	
23	575	
24	600	
25	625*	
26	650*	
27	675*	
27	700*	
29	725*	
30	750*	

If the above pensions are granted, the Government should have the authority of retiring

* Applicable only to officers who have attained the rank of Conservator; £50 to be added for two years as Chief Conservator and £100 for two years as Inspector-General.

compulsorily on the pension he has earned any officer of 25 years' service or more who is deemed inefficient and incompetent.

A large majority of officers consider that an officer's Family Pension Fund should be introduced instead of the present Provident Fund to which all officers should be required to contribute and pensions payable to a deceased officer's widow and children at a sliding scale according to length of service completed, say, after 5 years, after 10 years, after 15 years, after 20 years, and contributions should cease on retirement. The details of this suggestion must be worked out by an actuary and the terms laid before officers of the Department before such system is introduced.

Officers will be capable of better work when they know that a pension is assured to their families and do not have to worry over attempting to make adequate provision out of inadequate means.

66465. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—To enter the Imperial Forest Service now, the only limitation that exists is that a candidate must be a natural born British subject, and unmarried, except in the case of Indians; there is no necessity to make any change in this rule at present.

The proportion of Imperial Forest Officers in Madras Presidency should be increased, and as a general rule an Imperial Officer should be in charge of every Major Forest Division. It is inadvisable to place a junior assistant or an Extra Assistant Conservator in independent charge of a division.

There is in this Presidency no educated class of Indians to whom a forest life is congenial. Indians as a rule enter the Department in all grades as a means of earning a livelihood; not because they like the work and life, and this must and does tell considerably against zeal and efficiency. The number of Provincial Officers ought not, however, to be reduced as there is plenty of work for them all, and provided the men appointed are properly selected, each should prove of very valuable assistance to some district or other Forest Officer. At present, such assistance is greatly wanting owing to the numerical weakness of the Imperial staff.

66466. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—With the Indian Civil Service, at least in the Madras Presidency, Forest Officers are very intimately connected with regard to Forest administration. An essential addition to the Department of a Professional Head in the appointment of a Chief Conservator of each Province is most strongly urged. One very strong reason for the creation of this post is to ensure improvement in the preparation and control of working-plans, impossible when the sanctioning authority is a layman.

It must of course be definitely understood that selections to Chief Conservator's post as well as to that of a Conservator must be made on meritorious and tried work and ability and not solely by seniority.

The present position of District Forest Officer and Collector in this Presidency.—Although perhaps strictly speaking the following matter is not within the scope of the present enquiry, we desire, however, to take this opportunity of respectfully representing for favourable consideration either by the Royal Services Commission, or at least by the Government of His Excellency the Governor in Council the following:—

The position of a District Forest Officer is altogether anomalous.

He has no direct authority except in trifling matters; experience, good work, admitted ability and long service do not alter his position as defined in the Code one iota, and throughout his service he remains as he began with almost complete responsibility for efficient working but with little or no authority personal to his office. We know of no other service in the world where an officer's authority does not increase *pari passu* with his responsibilities.

The old Code put the District Forest Officer in the position of a Collector's Sheristadar, it made the Collector the executive Forest Officer, and the Conservator an advising authority with no power. The new Code has improved matters very little if indeed at all.

It has done nothing for the District Forest Officer beyond throwing on his shoulders the whole responsibility for execution and efficiency. It has given him no additional authority. The new Code bristles with clauses imposing on the District Forest Officer the various duties he has to perform, and responsibilities which he incurs, while the collector in nine cases out of ten is only mentioned in order to insist that the District Forest Officer is entirely under his orders or to force the former to exert his own authority over the District Forest Officer in all forest matters.

The theory underlying the whole system is that the Forest Officer is not to be trusted and that the relations of the Forest Department with the ryot are so intimate that the Civilian must be the directing authority.

On what this old and deep-rooted distrust is based we have no idea, but so long as it is allowed to continue, so long will the Madras Forest Service suffer in efficiency and self-respect.

The only argument we have ever heard is the personal one of inefficient members of the Service. But there are bad bargains in every service—bad Judges, bad Collectors, bad Engineers, etc., and we are not aware that the Madras Forest Department is any worse off in the way of bad bargains than other Departments.

But the Forest Department has a right to resent the idea that it is out of sympathy with the ryot and we do resent it. Many Forest Officers have a much closer knowledge of the people (especially of the jungle tribes) and a more direct sympathy with them than officers of other services.

It may be said that the present system works well in practice: that the District Forest Officer is permitted by the Collector to run the Department and is seldom interfered with, and that most of the restrictions exist only on paper. That is the case, no doubt, in all heavy districts from sheer inability on the part of the Collector to undertake the complete supervision of detail which the Code demands. It is also due to the loyal and tactful co-operation between Collector and District Forest Officer which has enabled a position which in fairness to both must be admitted is quite untenable and impossible, to have been even made practicable at all. But the fact is rather an argument in favour of abolishing the system than of retaining it, and there is real necessity for defining clearly the duties, responsibilities and authority of each officer.

Admitting that in nine cases out of ten the Collector has little knowledge of the inner working of the Department and no time to acquire it, the absurdity remains that on all forest subjects, technical or otherwise, he alone can address the head of the Forest Department. For instance, the Government require a valuation of a forest or a report on some detail of forest working. The Collector is called upon to report. His report may be a mere copy of the District Forest Officer's Office-note, or a paraphrase of it, or may be entirely his own as he is not bound to consult the District Forest Officer at all nor to follow his advice nor even to state that he does not agree with it. No one knows whether it is the opinion of the Chancellor or the District Forest Officer. The presumption is, that although it bears the name of the former, it is really a production by the latter. The presumption is often entirely wrong, and we have known cases in which the District Forest Officer whose opinion was far more valuable than that of the Collector, disagreed entirely with the opinions expressed.

Forest Officers naturally resent the fact that alone of all quasi-scientific departments, the opinion of officers of the Service on matters to which they devote a great part of their life is usually neither asked for nor indeed often acknowledged.

The want of recognition of the District Forest Officer's real position and the refusal to give him

publicly the authority which he in reality has to exert in order to carry out his work, cause grave discontent in the Service. It has the further serious drawback that a Forest Officer's work is seldom on public record; that the Civilian head of the Department has little guide to the ability of the officers over whom he rules; that appointments are made which every Forest Officer knows to be wrong and likely to bring discredit on the Service; and finally that a District Forest Officer has no encouragement to exhibit any initiative and can idle away his time with perfect impunity under the Collector's sheltering wing.

The present system has also a serious drawback adverted to above, which we have never heard any one attempt to justify, namely, the want of differentiation between the authority of an experienced and an inexperienced officer. Both are treated precisely the same except that the former's responsibilities are increased by heavier and more difficult work.

Can anything be more absurd than to give to an experienced District Forest Officer of many years' standing in charge of a heavy division no more authority than is given to a totally inexperienced Extra Assistant Conservator placed in temporary charge of a district? We are aware that powers can be delegated by the Conservator, but delegation is made so difficult that it was obviously the intention of Government that it should seldom occur.

The following remedies are suggested:—

(i) Abandon the attempt to force on already overworked Collectors the technical supervision of the Forest Department in their districts.

(ii) Raise the District Forest Officer's position to that of an officer responsible for the forest management in his own district, armed with sufficient personal authority to carry out his work, and independent of the Collector so far that he shall have the right of access to the head of his own Department and the right of having his own views on forest matters placed on record.

(iii) Differentiate the authority of District Forest Officers according to the responsibilities they have to assume. For instance, officers in charge of major charges should have much greater powers than those in charge of minor charges and than junior officers.

We do not consider that the Collector's administrative powers as head of a district should in any way be reduced. No forest matter should be settled without giving him an opportunity of freely expressing his views.

But we would abandon the hopeless attempt to make the Collector the initial authority for forest matters in his district whilst in practice giving the District Forest Officer the entire responsibility. The system is unfair to the Collector and to the District Forest Officer and especially to the latter, and we believe that all experienced Collectors will agree with our opinion on this subject.

A technical head to the Department, working directly under and in touch with Government is *much needed.* The present head of the Forest Department is the Board of Revenue and for a large number of years, the Forest Member of the Board knew little or nothing of, and cared little for, the Department; consequently no forward step in forest administration which it was thought would at first be acceptable to Government was ever sent up, and nobody upheld the work or the officers of the Department which would have stagnated had it not been for the keenness of its officers. At one time the ignoring of Forest Officers reached such a stage that in the annual report (prepared by the Forest Member) no Forest Officer was mentioned, the praise for all good work being liberally bestowed on Collectors. It is only in recent years that any real progress has been made in placing forests and the officers who work them in their proper position in the economy of the country, and even now numerous mistakes are made, and delays occur because there is no Forest Officer directly under Government to give information and to take an interest in getting forest papers put up for orders in a complete form without undue delay.

The following are a few instances of the results of there being no Chief Conservator or Forest Secretary to Government, occupying a position similar to that held by certain Public Works Officers:—

(*1*) All "forest" papers are submitted to Government by the Board of Revenue, which does not always quote the opinions of Conservators; Government are therefore unaware whether the statements and proposals are those of a specially trained officer, or of the member of the Board in charge of forests, a subject about which it is possible for him to know very little.

(*2*) When the "forest" papers reach Government, they are noted on by various people, and all the drawbacks to the proposals are naturally brought forward; no Forest Officer has an opportunity of defending the proposals, which therefore go up for orders with as last word the uncriticised case against them and consequently frequently are not passed, or are so modified as to defeat their original object.

(*3*) When it was proposed to provide for "Forest Research" in the Madras Forest College, Government enquired of the Board what "Forest Research" consisted of; the Board referred the question to Conservators. With a Forest Secretary to Government, such references would be unnecessary.

(*4*) In 1907 it was pointed out to the Board by a Conservator that in order to obtain recruits for the Imperial Service, it was necessary to indent on the Secretary of State fully three years in advance. In consequence of this representation an indent was framed that year, but since then (six years ago) not a single indent to meet future requirements has been made.

Within the next three years five Imperial Officers will have to retire under the 55 years' rule, and no steps have been taken to ensure the requisite supply of recruits. This failure to indent for recruits in good time besides upsetting the supply provided for the rest of India, leads to irregular recruiting with eventual periodical blocks in promotion to the class of Conservators.

(*5*) The disposal of forest papers is delayed partly because extra references are necessary and partly because there is no officer directly under Government interested in getting papers through promptly—

(i.) In February, 1913, Mr. Deadon Bryant, late Inspector-General of Forests, pointed out the need for a Chief Conservator in Madras; no orders have been issued yet.

(ii.) In March, 1912, the Forest Member applied for an increase of establishment; no orders have been issued yet.

(iii.) Until a few years ago the grant of leave to Forest Officers, their posting after return from leave, etc., were frequently in arrears.

(*6*) In some cases orders have been passed by Government which would not have been passed if they had first heard a Forest Officer on the subject.

(i.) The order declaring the Madras Forest College to be a "Vacation Department" appears to have been issued on a reference from the Accountant-General, Government being in ignorance of the fact that the vacation is only for the students, not for the staff; but the Government order deprived all the staff of privilege leave.

(ii.) In November, 1908, four officers were posted, to Malabar in fourteen days.

(iii.) Conservators have been censured by Government for not realising as much for their sandalwood as was realised at the Mysore sales, in ignorance of the facts that (*a*) the Mysore sales began at rates about equal to those realised by the Conservators, and ran up suddenly and unexpectedly towards the end of the sales; the rise was a surprise to Mysore and to the bidders; (*b*) the sandalwood from South Coimbatore is less rich in oil than the Mysore sandalwood and therefore commands a lower price.

(iv.) Local allowances were refused to Forest

Officers, and even withdrawn from some officers only to be given back eventually after much correspondence.

(7) Continuity of policy cannot be expected when the head of the Department is a stranger to it, and is constantly changed; when one Forest Member goes on leave or is promoted, another Civilian takes up the post; his views may be unformed, or may be diametrically opposed to those of his predecessor. With a Forest Officer at the head intimate knowledge of the Department would be assured.

(8) As a minor point we would bring to notice that under the present system Forest Officers get no say in matters which intimately concern them; suggestions for modifications of the Civil Service Regulations referred by the Government of India are not referred to Conservators; the proposed revised leave rules which, it is understood, were sent for remarks to heads of Departments in Northern India have not been referred to Conservators in Madras; the reason is that Conservators are not heads of departments.

The proposal to place forests directly under Government was made by the Secretary of State in 1894.

The proposal was strongly opposed by the Board of Revenue, because it entailed a reduction in the number of members of that body.

The late Inspector-General of Forests in February, 1913, strongly urged the advisability of appointing a Chief Conservator of Forests in Madras.

66467. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—The necessity for a "Research Institute" in connection with the Madras Forest College cannot be too strongly urged.

Each Imperial Forest Officer should be permitted to go to a hill station at his own expense for a period of six weeks annually to recruit his health. This privilege is already allowed in some provinces and should be extended to Madras. Any officer availing himself of such privilege would remain on duty and continue to carry out all the duties of his office, the only difference being that he would do so in the cooler climate of a hill station instead of in the burning heat of the plains. Such a privilege would be certain to conduce to higher efficiency and probably to fewer leave vacancies, and it is strongly urged that the duties expected of a Forest Officer are arduous and trying enough to entitle him to this consideration.

Until a few years ago Forest Officers had prior claim to occupation of Forest rest-houses and paid no rent. The Government has now ruled that Forest Officers in this Presidency shall have no prior claim to occupation of such rest-houses, and that they must pay rent. Officers of the department feel that in this respect they are being treated on a different footing to their "confreres" in the whole of the rest of India—*vide* section 16 (II.), Government of India Forest Department Code, 6th edition, which allows prior claim and occupation free.

66468. *Imperial Service opinion on Provincial Service.—Conditions of Service.*—Pensionable service should be reduced from 30 to 25 years with two years' furlough. An Indian after 25 years is no longer fit for Forest outdoor work. Many of them struggle on, performing indifferent work and eventually die in harness. A few sedentary posts for Provincial Officers are required for the same reasons as in the case of Imperial Officers. The posts suggested are such as Personal Assistants to District and other Forest Officers.

It is recommended that Provincial Officers may be permitted to go to a hill station on duty for six weeks annually as suggested for officers of the Imperial Forest Service. We desire also to point out that the Provincial Service has mainly to be recruited from the subordinate Forest Service. Such being the case, it is essentially desirable to attract the very best class of recruit obtainable for entry into the latter service. We therefore respectfully request that this service may also undergo re-organisation which it sadly needs. The present pay of the lowest grade of Forest Ranger, viz., Rs. 50, is absurdly inadequate for the position and the responsible duties which a Ranger has to fulfil. We are strongly of opinion that the minimum pay of this class of officer should not be less than Rs. 80 per mensem. We venture therefore to put forward this proposal with the earnest hope that it will meet with the favourable consideration which we are confident it deserves.

Mr. F. A. Lodge called and examined.

66469. (*Chairman.*) The witness held the position of Conservator of Forests. There were four Conservators in the Presidency, each of whom had his own cricle. Each revenue district was held either by one, two or three District Forest Officers. The charges were divided into major and minor for purposes of classification. All the eleven minor charges and eight major charges were held by Provincial Officers. Each Conservator had charge of one-fourth of the territory of the Province. Of the eight or nine districts within each circle, some were major and some were minor.

66470. He suggested that recruitment should be by selection combined with competition. He admitted that selection was a difficult task to perform satisfactorily, and that it was not easy to devise any form of machinery for discovering the suitability of a young man at the age of eighteen. Family history, surroundings of his youth, and so on, would help to a certain extent.

66471. He would be in favour of the re-introduction of the physical test. He recommended also that forestry training should be carried out at one residential institution, and suggested Oxford as being the best centre.

66472. Of the three years' training, it would be desirable that one should be spent in France. He thought the training given in France was more useful than that given in Germany. The training in Germany was too theoretical. He himself received his training in France, but in his time there were too many probationers, and the result was that some of the men did not learn enough French to fully appreciate the lectures. That fact, and the desire to bolster up Cooper's Hill, had led to the abolition of the course in France. It was a very good thing to have a senior officer with recruits on the Continent, as a young Englishman wanted one of his own countrymen to control him.

66473. The witness was the senior man on the all-India list, with the exception of one, for the post of Inspector-General of Forests. He had applied for the post, and had been refused on the ground that his experience was limited to Madras. It was contemplated in the re-organisation of 1911 that the Madras Government should supply two Officers for India List Appointments, but the Officers referred to were primarily those at the Research Institute and College at Dehra Dun.

66474. He agreed with the suggestion that, instead of the present system under which Officers were assigned to separate Provinces, the various Provinces should be grouped into three units. Upper India, Burma, Madras and Bombay, and that each batch of three candidates should be allowed to elect for each unit in order of merit among themselves. That would ensure that Madras did not get so many men from the bottom of the list.

66475. There were many difficulties in the way of a system of interchange of forest officers between the various Provinces. The language, the different conditions, and the people of the various Provinces had all to be taken into consideration, and the language difficulty would be especially acute in the case of Madras. From the point of view of administration he thought there was more to be said against such a scheme than for it.

66476. The strength of the Imperial Forest

Service in Madras was very inadequate, and required immediate increase. The present leave reserve was supposed to be six Imperial Officers, but there was so much ill-health in Madras that more than six men required leave every year. The Government had practically said that only four men were to be granted ordinary leave in order that a reserve of two might be kept for sick leave vacancies.

66477. In order to emphasise the necessity for an increased cadre, he had cited in his written statement five instances of officers who had applied for Foreign Service and were refused, and he considered that the cadre should be strong enough to enable officers to be spared for such work. Foreign Service was allowed in other parts of India.

66478. He agreed that when the cadre was fixed no account was taken of the possible appointment of an officer to the Gold Coast or Siam or Southern Nigeria, but if the cadre was strong enough to provide for emergencies owing to sick leave, it would also be strong enough for a man to be occasionally spared for a good billet elsewhere.

66479. One of their grievances was the slowness of their promotion compared with what it was in other parts of India. In other provinces senior men frequently obtained outside appointments, and this expedited the promotion of their juniors.

66480. With regard to his comparison of the forest areas in India and France, he did not think that an Indian subordinate Forest Officer could be expected to do better and harder and more thorough work than a subordinate Officer in France. The conditions of Service in India were much more difficult than in France, where they had all the forests beautifully opened out with roads, inspection paths, and forest guard houses. In India there were fever-stricken forests with very few roads through them. Officers had to fight against organised timber thefts, and the result was that the Indian Forest Service required, if anything, a stronger establishment than the French Service. He agreed that it would be many years before the same intensive system of forest management as was in vogue in France could be applied to all the forests in India. If there was a large increase of staff in India, they would be able to bring under forest management a very much larger area than was at present possible, and the result would be a very much larger revenue to Government. His contention was that an immediate increase in the cadre would correspondingly result in an immediate increase in revenue. He would like to see an increase of 50 per cent. in the staff immediately. Of that 50 per cent. three-fourths should be major charges.

66481. With regard to the conditions of salary, he compared the position of the Forest Service with the Public Works Department, and maintained that it should be at least as well paid as the engineers. As to whether the training of the Forest Officer would cost a considerable sum to the State as compared to the cost of the training of an engineer, it all depended on what contribution the State made during training. At present the State was giving probationers £120 a year, but when the witness joined the Service, the whole of the expense of training fell on the parents of the student. If in one Service the State paid for the training, and in another Service it did not, this consideration should undoubtedly be taken into account when fixing rates of salary.

66482. He agreed that objection might be taken to a continuous time scale without any charge bar on the ground that it had rather a deadening effect on an officer.

66483. He proposed that special allowances should be given in exceptional cases. He referred principally to the Forest College. The officer of that College had not a free house as the officer at Dehra Dun had. Since the written statement was sent in, the Government of India had sanctioned an allowance of Rs. 150 a month for the Principal of the Forest College, but had not sanctioned house rent.

66484. With regard to pensions, not much advantage was taken of optional retirement after twenty years' service. From the point of view of the interests of the State, a scheme for optional retirement after twenty years was open to objection. If improved pensions were granted, his colleagues would be in favour of foregoing optional retirement at twenty years.

66485. He recommended the establishment of a family pension fund in place of the present provident fund. He would accept a fund administered by Government, and supported entirely by officers' contributions.

66486. Provincial Officers holding major charges were engaged on work of the same responsibility as Imperial Officers holding major charges, but the work done was not always of the same value. A major charge might at one time be held by an Imperial Officer, and at another time by a Provincial Officer. It certainly would conduce to the contentment of Provincial Officers if all Officers discharging the same work and responsibility and value were included in the same service, but he did not know that it would add to the contentment of the Imperial Officers.

66487. He thought it would be extremely difficult to find suitable Indian recruits for major charges in the future. Forest life was specially arduous, and it was a life for which very few Indians had any real liking, or were really fit. They were not fond of physical exercise for the sake of physical exercise. Apart from that abstract point of view, he agreed that under the present constitution of the Service there were several charges which were in essence of the same responsibility as the charges held by Imperial Officers, and which were occupied by Indians. The best method of recruitment of Indians was direct appointment to the superior service; the selected candidates to be given exactly the same training as the Europeans.

66488. (*Mr. Madge.*) A European Forest training had to be supplemented by some kind of special training in India before an officer could become quite efficient. They had to learn to adapt their Continental training to local conditions. At present they allowed a year for training in India.

66489. A training solely in India would be inadequate. There were no highly developed forests in India which could be utilised for the training of officers, and the officer who had not seen a Continental forest did not know what he had to aim at in India.

66490. The forest divisions were not co-terminous with the Public Works Department divisions. They overlapped in certain cases. The Public Works Department had six circles in the Presidency, held by Superintending Engineers, and the Forest Service had four circles, held by Conservators.

66491. He had had some experience of the Anglo-Indian and domiciled community, and he must say that he found that they were affected by the languor of the East, and had not the energy required for the life of a Forest Officer.

66492. By concentrating the forest training at one central college, a great waste of resource would be avoided and *esprit de corps* would be cultivated.

66493. (*Mr. Fisher.*) In order to enter the French Forest Service a man had to possess high academic qualifications.

66494. (*Mr. Sly.*) Owing to the fact that the cadre of the Provincial Service was below its full strength, officers of the Imperial Service were holding some of the major charges which, according to the reorganisation scheme, should be held by provincial officers. He did not agree that when the provincial cadre was strengthened there would be no necessity for an increase in the leave reserve. The complaint as to leave had been chronic for the last 30 years. The reason why the provincial cadre was short was because men of the required standard were not available to fill the upper posts. He ad-

mitted that, in spite of that fact, the number of charges handed over to the Provincial Service had been increased even recently. He contended that the explanation of the present difficulty with regard to leave reserve was that the work had expanded much faster than the cadre.

66495. An Imperial Assistant, before being put in charge of a division, was under training for one year. In addition to that he was for at least six months on tour, among other things visiting other districts than the one in which he received his training. He considered that an Imperial Forest Officer within one and a half years of his arrival in India was fit to take charge of a minor district, but not of a major district.

66496. In asking for special allowances, he was thinking of out of the way places, where the cost of living was higher than in large centres.

66497. With regard to his statement that selection for the post of Inspector-General was confined to officers with experience of Burma, he referred to a letter in which some years ago the Government of India had proposed to place all the Conservators on one list. In asking the Government of Madras to agree to the proposal the Government of India pointed out that if they did not do so, it would probably debar Conservators in Madras from becoming Inspectors-General, as it was considered essential that an officer holding that post should have had experience in Burma. It was the case that an officer from Bombay had held the post of Inspector-General for a time, and that the present Inspector-General had never been in Burma. It was also the fact that an officer was offered a transfer to a Conservatorship in Burma, and refused to accept the offer, but at the same time the offer was about to be withdrawn. The refusal to accept the offer was due to the fact that at that time it was proposed to abolish the post of Inspector-General; the officer refused to go to Burma if it was to lead to nothing better.

66498. At the last Board of Selection there were 20 or 22 candidates of all classes, who appeared for two vacancies in the Provincial Service. As a rule the domiciled European had poor educational qualifications. The Indian candidate had the necessary education, but had not either the physique or the energy, or a real liking for forest life.

66499. He would be in favour of introducing a system of competitive examination combined with selection as a test for entry to the Provincial Service. He was in favour of the system of filling a certain proportion of vacancies arising in the Provincial Service by promotions from the subordinate Service. At present it was very difficult to get a good class of recruits for the subordinate service, and the fact that some of them might get promoted to the Provincial Service would raise the standard. He thought that just as good a recruit for the Provincial Service would be obtained from the subordinate Service as by direct appointment.

66500. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He considered that at present a provincial officer in charge of a major district could never be as efficiently equipped for the duties of that charge as were officers of the Imperial Service, owing to lack of experience of forestry in its highest form. That defect could, he thought, be remedied by recruiting a certain number of officers, direct, and sending them to Europe to be trained for the Imperial Service.

66501. He did not think that the Forest Service was one in which a man's ability could be sufficiently tested by mere examinations before entrance. According to his idea, a competent Board of Selection would include a medical officer, one or two officers with experience of India, a forest officer and a revenue officer.

66502. (*Mr. Bryant.*) He did not think that the language difficulty would constitute any great objection to the interchange of officers in the administrative grades from one province to another.

66503. The Imperial Forest Service was at present open to Indians in the same way as it was open to Europeans.

66504. The Imperial cadre was too small, and consequently the leave reserve also was too small. If there was a larger Imperial cadre, the present percentage might suffice.

66505. He did not consider that the Indian officers of the Department had made sufficient progress to entitle them to claim equality of treatment with Imperial Service officers. There might be exceptional cases.

66506. (*Mr. Subrahmanya Ayyar.*) He agreed that English was a foreign language to Indians, but he did not admit that it was just as difficult for a native to learn it as German or French, because Indians were taught English from their childhood. It was, of course, not impossible for an Indian to learn German or French.

66507. There was no educated class of Indians to whom a Forest life was congenial. That was not due to the fact that prior to 1911 prospects in the Department were not so good as they were in other Services. Improvement in pay and prospects would not make the work any more congenial. The best students did not enter other Services solely because of the better prospects which those Services held out, but because they offered more congenial conditions. If it were possible to establish Dehra Dun as a central institution for the training of Indian recruits, and it were also possible to collect there a teaching staff of the very highest quality and if the pupils from Dehra Dun could be sent for a year to the continent together with the English probationers, that would be a satisfactory system, but it would be very difficult to send an Indian student with no knowledge of European life straight off with a lot of English students on a foreign tour. If those difficulties could be overcome, the training might be effective.

(The witness withdrew.)

M.R. Ry. Rao Bahadur V. Alwar Chetty Garu, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Madras.

Written Statement relating to the Provincial Forest Service, Madras.

66508. *Preliminary.*—The Provincial or Madras Forest Service consists of:—"Extra Assistant Conservators on Rs. 250 rising by annual increments of Rs. 20 to Rs. 550 and Extra Deputy Conservators on Rs. 575 rising by annual increments of Rs. 25 to Rs. 650. After an extra Assistant Conservator has attained to Rs. 550 a month, promotion to the class of Extra Deputy Conservator will depend upon the occurrence of permanent vacancies in that class, always provided that no Extra Assistant Conservator will be eligible for promotion as Extra Deputy Conservator unless he is considered by the Local Government to be fit for a major charge. An Extra Assistant Conservator who has served for not less than three years on Rs. 550 a month, and who is considered by the Local Government to be fit to hold a major charge, but for whom no vacancy exists in the Upper Controlling staff, may, however, be given a personal allowance of Rs. 50 a month, and in the case of officers whom the Local Government considers fit for further increase of pay, this allowance may be augmented to Rs. 100 a month on the expiry of a further period of four years and to Rs. 150 a month on the expiry of a second period of four years. The Local Government may, by special order, in each case promote an Extra Deputy Conservator after one year's service on Rs. 650 a month to Rs. 700 a month for a period of three years and again to Rs. 800 a

month for a further period of three years and may then promote him to Rs. 850 a month until the close of his service; but promotion to Rs. 700, Rs. 800 and Rs. 850 a month should only be made when the Local Government is satisfied at each step that the individual is thoroughly deserving of such promotion."

The recruitment to the Imperial Forest Service is made by the Secretary of State in England. The process is essentially of selection with the aid of a board of advisers, combined under certain circumstances, with a competitive examination.

The Provincial or Madras Forest Service is recruited either by direct appointment of outsiders or by the promotion of officers in the Department. The minimum general educational qualification of the nominees to the former, is fixed at a standard not lower than that of the matriculation examination.

At the outset we must state that this division of the service into Imperial Forest Service and Provincial or Madras Forest Service is impolitic. Officers who discharge the same duties under similar conditions with identical responsibilities should in the public interest be treated alike. To treat one section of this service as inferior all along the line must inevitably tend to demoralisation. The present system deliberately excludes a whole class of officers from rising to the highest posts in the Department and it is not too much to say that such a method is sure to depress and deteriorate the submerged lot, and it is most undesirable that this state of affairs should be prolonged a moment longer and be allowed to create a natural feeling of intense discontent among the officers. In the course of transfers of officers from one place to another a charge held to-day by an Imperial Forest Service Officer comes under the control of a Provincial or Madras Forest Service Officer. The inferior status of the latter is not lost sight of by not only the members of the other services in the locality but also by the men in the subordinate Forest Service. In actual practical working this difference in status is a handicap for the Provincial or Madras Forest Service Office. But we prefer to rest our position on the higher ground of common fairness and justice that men who discharge the same duties should, as far as possible, be put on the same level.

Our submission is that the division of the Service into Imperial Forest Service and Provincial or Madras Forest Service should be done away with, and with it the nomenclature "upper controlling staff" and "lower controlling staff," and the prefix "extra" attached to Provincial or Madras Forest Service men should also go. That the dual cadre should be abolished and members of the Imperial Forest Service and the Provincial or Madras Forest Service should be borne on a combined list, as has recently been decided in the Public Works Department.

The distinction between Imperial Forest Service and Provincial or Madras Forest Service being done away with, there will be one cadre comprising all the officers that now fall under the two heads Imperial Forest Service and Provincial or Madras Forest Service.

66509. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—To maintain the present proportion of officers recruited in England and also not to weaken the British tone and character imparted by them to the Service, we propose that not more than a third of the number of men required for any year may continue to be recruited in England as heretofore, Indians also being eligible to be selected and admitted. Of the remaining two-thirds not more than a half will be recruited by promotion of officers serving in the Department, and the remainder being not less than a third of the whole number required should be recruited by direct appointment of candidates outside the Department. At present the general educational qualification of the last class of men is the Matriculation examination. The Matriculation examination offers hardly the necessary general educational equipment for an officer who even under the present conditions, will hold a district charge. With the advance of education in the country in general and of the distinct rise in the educational qualifications of officers in the other Government Departments, it is needless to labour the point that the Matriculation standard is undoubtedly low. The standard of general education must not be lower than that required of candidates recruited in England. A graduate's Diploma in some branch of Natural Science of an Indian University, or probably in some exceptional cases and with regard to certain communities such as Muhammadans and domiciled Europeans, the F.A. or Intermediate standard should be the minimum required of a candidate.

Physical fitness must necessarily form an important element in the selection of men to serve in this Department. After the candidate has satisfied the two requirements of physical fitness and general education, and if the number seeking admission in any one year is more than the number of vacancies to be filled, selection may be made by a special committee appointed by the Local Government. The candidate thus selected should not be more than 23 years old, and will be sent to the Dehra Dun College as at present.

66510. **(II) Systems of Training and Probation.**—The present system provides adequate training for men recruited by direct appointment in India, but it is desirable to modify it to make it quite on a line with the training received by the men recruited in England. Instruction in riding may be added. The present period of three years' probation after the College course is too long. It works a great hardship. During these three years the full pay is not allowed. For testing the actual fitness of a man for the Service and for discovering the latent qualities of a young man, it is submitted three years is a very long time. A year's probation after the completion of the college course is quite sufficient. The probationary period may be extended in particular cases for special reasons. It must be noted that the Imperial Forest Service men have no probation after they have finished the special training in England. A young man in India of the requisite physique would be 20 or 21 years when he takes a graduate's diploma in a University, and by the time he finishes the Dehra Dun College course he would be 23 or 24 years, and a year's probation would take him to his 24th or 25th year. While we welcome any change in the training in the Dehra Dun College tending to make it more efficient, we consider that the three years' probation is needlessly long.

66511. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—At present the post of Conservator is barred against the Provincial or Madras Forest Service men. An Extra Assistant Conservator has to serve (exclusive of three years of probation) sixteen years before he can attain the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator, and even then, only if there is a permanent vacancy in that class, whereas, an Assistant Conservator after five years can become a Deputy Conservator. There is a rule that after four years' service an Extra Deputy Conservator's work has to be reported upon specially for further promotion at each step, whereas, a Deputy Conservator rises to the maximum without any impediment. The rates of travelling allowance allowed to the Provincial or Madras Forest Service men are lower than those allowed to the Imperial Forest Service men. These rules cannot be held to be reasonable ones. There are other distinctions which may be termed invidious. Under the method of recruitment proposed above, it would be seen that the men recruited by direct appointment in India, are bound to be of high mental calibre and education and may fairly be presumed to do justice to their positions. It is always within the discretion of Government to keep back a man for bad or unsatisfactory work. The men recruited by promotion from the department generally not being young men, in their case the present conditions work a greater hardship. The cadre should be one for the two sets of men—those recruited in England and those recruited in India, and opportunities should be the same. The department affords a peculiar field for bringing

into play an intimate knowledge of the wants and habits and the needs and requirements of the people, who are not of towns, but of the villages and outlying parts of the country far from the influences of English education. In dealing with such people and trying to meet their needs and requirements, it may safely be said that men born and bred in the country possess an advantage over those of other lands and climes. No less an authority on Indian Forest matters than the late Sir Dietrich Brandis, says in his book on "Indian Forestry," published so far back as 1897, "the larger the number of the natives employed in responsible positions the more forestry will cease to have the character of an exotic plant, or a foreign artificially fostered institution." He further observes in the same book, "the aim should be, gradually, in a few carefully selected districts, say, in Berar, or the Central Provinces to fill all appointments with pure natives of India, and when this has proved a success, to proceed further. It will be a great point gained, when the first native is appointed to the post of the Conservator of Forests in Berar or in one of the forest circles of the Central Provinces." Although it was 16 years ago that one of the most eminent of European Foresters that India ever had as the head of her forests gave expression to the above views, yet not a single Indian has ever been given a chance of being at the head of a forest circle. That Indians have not proved unequal to the duties of such responsible posts may, we venture to hope, be inferred from instances afforded by the neighbouring native States of Mysore, Cochin and Travancore. The Department, therefore, is one in which indigenous talent should be pressed more largely into the service of controlling positions. Our plea for the larger employment in controlling positions of men of Indian birth or domicile is not thus without the support of good administrative reasons. The outlook of the men in the Service must be widened not only to get the best out of the existing men but also to attract to it as good a material as is drawn to the other departments of Government service. The men, after receiving considerable general education, undergo a course of severe training in the Forest College at Dehra Dun. Work in the Department is strenuous. The men's lot is cast in unhealthy localities and just now a number of us are down with malarial and other fevers, the prevailing disease, we may say, amongst us. A considerable amount of tact is required of us in dealing with matters of forest administration, the points arising, as is well known, giving room for soreness and irritation among the people. These are some of the special features of service in the Department. The cadre should therefore be one, promotion being earned by good and approved work. All alike should have equal chances and equal opportunities to rise in the Service.

66512. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The scale of salaries laid down in Sections 20 and 21 of the Madras Forest Code has been quoted above. The conditions are stringent and the chances of a man rising to a higher salary than Rs. 550 are impeded by restrictions unfamiliar in other branches of the Government service. As compared with the men recruited in England, the conditions are palpably harsh. It takes 27 years (exclusive of probation) for an officer recruited in India to become eligible to draw the maximum pay of an Extra Deputy Conservator. And although a salary of Rs. 850 is held out as the ultimate goal of the Provincial or Madras Forest Service men, the road being barred at several stages, it is well nigh hopeless for many a man in the Service to reach it.

We think it should be open to a man recruited in India to reach the maximum pay at the 20th year of service. The whole cadre should carry a uniform pay in each grade for the reason stated in paragraph 66508 supra—"that officers who discharge the same duties under similar conditions with identical responsibilities should in the public interest be treated alike." If any difference is made in the rate of pay between the men recruited in England and those recruited in India, it will perpetuate the present attitude of superiority of the former towards the latter. If, however, it is considered that men recruited in England should be paid more than those recruited in India, the excess should be in the form of personal allowance. Our submission is that the pay of the whole cadre should be fixed at Rs. 300 rising to Rs. 1,000 in the 20th year of service, the men recruited in England being granted a personal allowance of 25 per cent. so that the latter may continue to draw their present salary of Rs. 300 plus 75 (the existing starting salary is Rs. 380) rising to Rs. 1,000 plus 250. An officer recruited in India when appointed Conservator, should, however, get the present full sanctioned pay of the appointment.

66513. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The present rules regarding leave of the Provincial or Madras Forest Service officers do not meet the special difficulties under which they labour. It is beyond dispute that Forest Officers have to work in very unhealthy tracts of the country and the unhealthiness of the work is therefore greater than in other Departments. If an officer takes leave he comes back after the expiration of the leave in improved health and his outturn of work must be better. Not only in the interests of the officers but also in the interests of the Department, the leave rules should be so framed as to let an officer go on leave when he feels run down in health. We therefore propose that after eight years' service an officer should be eligible to take one year's furlough. Subsequently every five years he would be eligible for a year's furlough, the intervals between two furloughs being reduced to four years. The allowances to an officer on furlough should be half the salary he was drawing just before the commencement of the leave. Many a man in the higher grades hesitates to take leave because the leave allowances are comparatively small and puts off taking leave in order to earn a higher average. This, while injurious to the health of the officer himself, is not advantageous to the Department. There need be no apprehension that more favourable leave rules would bring in a crowd of applicants for leave. The exigencies of the Department and the judgment of the controlling authority will always check applications on unsubstantial grounds.

66514. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—At present a Provincial or Madras Forest Officer can retire, voluntarily, after 30 years' service, and after 25 years if invalided, on full pension. The 30 years' rule is unsuitable to this Department. A man would be past 50 after 30 years' service. The work of an officer of the Department is not at his desk nor does it lie on even ground which he could traverse in a car. His work is literally uphill and a man past 50, however strongly he may be impelled by a sense of duty, cannot really do justice to his work. Here again it is in the interests of the State to let a man voluntarily retire when he thinks that he is not equal to the arduous duties of the Department. But it is too much to expect of a man to invalide himself and leave the Service at considerable loss because he believes in his conscience that he cannot discharge his duties as efficiently as he did five or six years earlier. There need be no apprehension that the more favourable pension rules would induce any large numbers of men to retire on half pay From the knowledge and experience of Government in the various departments retirements generally are not quite voluntary. Applications for extensions of service are numerous enough. We therefore propose that after 25 years' service including three years of leave with allowances, an officer should be permitted to retire on full pension, i.e., half his salary and that after 20 years' service he should be permitted to retire if he is invalided. A distinction must be drawn in the pension rules between officers whose work is more at the desk and those whose duties require in addition to vigour of mind capacity to stand a considerable amount of physical endurance and hardship such as Forest Officers are called upon in their usual work to bear.

66515. **(VII) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans, and division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.**—Under the heads Pre-

liminary and Conditions of service and salary the limitations in the employment of non-European officers and their disabilities have been set forth and commented upon. It has also been submitted that the terms Imperial and Provincial should be abolished.

66516. **(VIII) Relations with Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The District Forest Officer is in many matters subordinate to the Collector. So far as administrative matters go the dependence of the Forest Department on the executive head of the District has worked for good. Apart from the purely technical side of the Forest Officers' work the co-operation and advice and guidance of the executive head of the District makes for smooth working. The one influences the other, and the result is so far satisfactory. If this dependence were removed and the Forest Department thoroughly dissociated from the Revenue the complaints and cavil against the Forest Department would increase in volume and vigour. In purely technical matters we do not think officers of the Indian Civil Service have interfered. The Police and Magistracy being under the control of the Collector and District Magistrate their co-operation is also secured to the Department by the present conditions.

In this Province the Conservators are subordinate to the Board of Revenue, one member of which holds the portfolio of forests. The members of the Board of Revenue are Indian Civil Service Officers who had distinguished themselves in District administration as Collectors. The head of the forest administration in this Province therefore possesses in addition to a wide knowledge of the wants and conditions of the people a high degree of administrative ability. This arrangement should in our opinion be continued.

RAO BAHADUR V. ALWAR CHETTY called and examined.

66517. (*Chairman.*) The witness at present held the position of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests. He was in charge of one of the eight major charges. Any major charge could be given to a provincial officer. His own predecessor was an Imperial officer. Senior Imperial officers were also in charge of minor charges. He had been in the Service 27 years.

66518. He recommended the abolition of the division into Imperial and Provincial branches. He would recruit for the combined superior posts, one-third in England, and the remaining two-thirds in India.

66519. In his opinion the eleven minor charges were posts of as great responsibility as the eight major district charges. The only difference between the major and minor charges was a difference of size.

66520. Of the two-thirds recruited in India, one-third should be drawn from the ranger class, and one-third recruited direct. The qualification he suggested for admission to the superior Service in India would be a degree in Natural Science, and he would also put candidates through an examination after nomination if the number of candidates coming forward was more than the number of vacancies.

66521. He was not in a position to say whether the proposal he made for a very considerable increase in recruitment in India, and therefore a corresponding diminution of the European element, would have any effect on recruitment in England. The general educational standard of the ranger was not sufficiently high to warrant his being given one-third of the posts in the senior Service, but his experience would make up for any lack of educational attainments. A ranger should not be put in command of a major charge; he should only be given a minor charge.

66522. Provincial officers did not receive the leave to which they were entitled. For instance, he himself had served for 27 years, and had been refused furlough. He attributed that to the scarcity of officers. He did not consider that the provincial cadre was inadequate, but there were many vacancies which were not filled up. Out of the eight sanctioned appointments, only six were filled up and of the six officers only four were on active duty.

66523. Very few provincial officers lived long enough to enjoy their pension. Twenty-five years was quite a long enough term to have to serve in order to qualify for pension.

66524. (*Mr. Sly.*) He was recruited to the Forest Department by selection. He was appointed as Probationary Sub-Assistant Conservator on a salary of Rs. 75. He had never served as a ranger.

66525. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He approved of the dependence of the Forest Department on the executive head of the Department. His reasons for this view were set out in the written statement. The strict enforcement of the forest laws was unpopular with the people, and the function of the Collector was to look after the interests of the peasantry. Orders which received the sanction of the Collector received better attention from the people than orders which did not.

66526. (*Mr. Madge.*) Possibly one reason why Imperial officers had been put into minor charges was because they were rather old, and at an advanced age a man could not do such hill-climbing as a younger man. Provincial officers had been entrusted with major charges and had done well. He contended therefore that whatever the theoretical advantage might be of an English training, Indian forest training sufficed for the charge of Indian forests.

66527. (*Mr. Bryant.*) He considered that Indian district forest officers generally carried out their duties as efficiently as Imperial forest officers. He did not agree there was a tendency on the part of an Indian to fill every subordinate post within his gift with his own relations, or at any rate, with those of his own caste. In his view provincial officers had up to the present shown the same initiative and organising powers as the Imperial officer and this justified their claiming equality with Imperial officers.

66528. He admitted that the Provincial Service as at present constituted was a well paid one for Indians, but it was not as well paid as it ought to be, considering the nature of the Service.

66529. (*Mr. Subrahmanya Ayyar.*) He had entered the Department because he had a liking for forest life. At the time he joined he had received from a Collector the offer of an appointment carrying higher pay, so it was not merely a question of salary which decided him in joining the Forest Department.

66530. Until 1899 Indians were not allowed to compete in England for the Forest Service. Since that date he could quote ten instances of Indians who had gone to England and had received a forestry training there.

66531. A knowledge of the very best managed model forests on the continent was helpful for the successful management of Indian forests.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Bombay, Wednesday, 11th February, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

G. E. MARJORIBANKS, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bombay.
V. D. P. REBEIRZ, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bombay.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

G. P. MILLETT, Esq., Conservator of Forests, Bombay.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department.

(*I*) IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.

66532. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—I do not consider that the present method of recruitment is the best. It is an arrangement which was rendered necessary by the failure of candidates to present themselves at the competive examinations after the system of training at Cooper's Hill had been abolished, and that of training at Oxford University had been introduced. The expenses of the latter method of training prevented the parents from attempting to put their sons into the Forest Service.

Under the present method of recruitment, candidates are selected by the Secretary of State for India acting with the advice of a Selection Committee, after applications for appointments have been made by them. In order to be eligible the candidates must be not less than 19 but under 23 years of age, and they must have obtained a degree with Honours in some branch of Natural Science in a University of England, Wales, or Ireland, or have passed the Final Bachelor of Science examination in pure science in one of the Universities of Scotland, and they must have a fair knowledge of either French or German.

The above is according to the latest regulations which have been published, and the choice of candidates is limited practically to men who have already undergone a University training. The selected candidates have then to undergo a period of probation of two years at one of the Universities, Oxford, Cambridge, and Edinburgh; and for this they are to receive payments at the rate of £120 a year, or £240 in all.

Under the above regulations the average age of the successful candidates can hardly be less than 22 years, and by the time they have finished their training and are ready to proceed to India, the average age will be between 24 and 25 years. It is not advisable that officers should commence their work in India at an age of nearly 25, and I give the following three main reasons for holding this opinion:—

(*1*) At 25 men are less able to adapt themselves readily to the peculiar conditions of work in the Indian Forests—the solitary life and absence of comfortable surroundings to which they have become accustomed by long residence at a University are apt to be irksome.

(*2*) An officer who commences his service at the age of 25 has only 30 years to put in before reaching the age of 55, at which he is bound to retire. Under the present regulations he has small chance of earning his highest pension, since to attain this 28 years' effective service in India is required. This only permits him two years' furlough for the whole of his service, which is manifestly too little.

(*3*) At 25 men are already thinking of settling in life; some come to India already engaged to be married, and numbers of them marry before they have been five years in the country. Early marriage detracts from the efficiency of Forest Officers since they are unable to tour so freely as when single; also they are unable to save money from their pay, and ill health in their families or themselves frequently leads to debt.

In my opinion previous University training and the holding of Science degrees are not of advantage for Indian Forest Officers; what we want are good practical men, of good social standing, fond of sports and of an out-door life. Only a few specialists in Science are required, and these will always be forthcoming in the future as in the past if encouragement for further study is afforded to these men who possess a liking or a genius for the subject. I advocate therefore a reversion to a lower age for recruitment, and for selection by means of competitive examination combined with nomination as was formerly the case. This system has provided an excellent type of officer in the past, and though it failed after Cooper's Hill College had been abolished, for reasons that I have stated, it will now, I am confident, be successful if the period of training at a University after selection is placed at about two years and the present system of payments amounting to £240 in all is maintained, or preferable increased to £300. The limits of age should be not less than 18 nor more than 20, and the subsequent training may be as at present arranged at a University. If the limits of age be fixed as above we shall obtain young men who have just completed their education at a public school, or some of whom have had further tuition at a University or other institution, but who are still young enough to be shaped for an Indian career. Also—which is a powerful consideration—parents will be more ready than at present to bring their sons forward for entrance into the Forest Service if they can do so at an age which will still permit of the boys turning their attention to other professions in the event of failure at the Forest examination. At present many parents whose boys desire to enter the Forest Service are unwilling to take the risk of sending them to a University on the chance that they will obtain an honours degree and be selected subsequently for the service.

In selecting by the competitive examination marks should also be given to candidates who have been in the Officers Training Corps, according to their length of service in it. This training is not only of value to the boy, but the willingness to undergo it affords proof of the boy's liking for out-door work.

66533. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—It is a great pity that the Cooper's Hill College was abolished. The training for a Forest career in India that was afforded at that institution was in my opinion superior to that which can be obtained now at a University. The work was centralised and the probationers were collected in one institution; they worked together and developed *esprit de corps*; they had not the temptations to neglect work that exist at a University; and they had not the opportunity which they have at a University to contract habits of ease and

comfort and to develop into young men of the world. They had already been selected for the Indian Forest Service and knew what was in store for them.

At present candidates for appointments to the Forest Service are apt to apply for them as an afterthought. This of course will not be the case, even if the present system of training at an University is continued, if the candidates are selected at the earlier ages of between 18 and 20 which I have suggested. They will then be at the commencement of a University career and not at the end of it as at present. In the absence of a special college the present system of training probationers at an University must be continued, but I am against the system of having several centres of instruction. For the development of a proper spirit and an intelligent interest in the work they are to do in India, which has been an invaluable agency for good practical work and administration in the past, the selected candidates should know each other and work together during their period of probation. Let Government select one University—Oxford, Cambridge, or Edinburgh—for the training of their Forest probationers. The number of the latter selected annually will rarely exceed 12, and it is bad policy to have the probationers scattered at different Universities, even if the course of study at each is arranged on similar lines.

Owing to the absence in Great Britain of large forests to which the principles of forestry have been applied for a series of years it is essential that the probationers should undergo as at present a course of practical training in the forests of Germany and France. The period of instruction must be of sufficient length to permit of this being carried out. The training at the University should extend over two years, and it should be followed by a practical training of at least six months in Germany or France. The total length of the period of training will thus be about two and a half years. The selection of the candidates should be made in January and not in July or August as at present. The probationers could thus complete their course of training and be ready to proceed to India, after a short stay at their homes, at the beginning of November in the third year following their selection.

66534. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—Service in the Forest Department is more arduous than in other branches of the administration. Long periods have to be spent in remote parts, for the forests are generally situated in the regions of hills and valleys at a distance from the more civilised portion of the district. Forest Officers are more exposed to malaria and the influences of bad climate, bad water, and often poor food. The mortality amongst forest officers in India has been very great, though Bombay has been less unfortunate in this respect than most of the other Provinces. Married men also have much sickness in their families, and have to leave the latter at headquarters, when visiting unhealthy regions where their work lies—or to send them to England—all of which add to the expense and discomfort of his life. In spite of these drawbacks the Service is liked by the men in it, but they work under the sense that they do not receive adequate compensation in the matter of pay, leave, and pension. Each of these conditions will be dealt with under its head later. But some ways in which the amenities of Service might be improved are the following:—

When unhealthy districts have, in addition, an unhealthy place as the headquarters where officers stay during the rainy season, June to October, it should be permissible for an officer to move himself and his establishment temporarily to some more healthy station where, whilst performing his routine work, he can also recuperate his health, which has generally suffered during the working season from November to May.

Owing to the long distances over which transfers have occasionally to be made in the Bombay Presidency, a transfer of an officer is often equivalent to a heavy fine. This, of course, applies also to officers of other departments. The allowances for the transport of house and camp furniture, family and servants, and horses, etc., should be on a more liberal scale than at present.

In some Headquarter stations the bungalows which have been constructed for Forest Officers have entailed very heavy expenditure, the interest on which implies the fixation of a high rent, and the officer occupying the bungalow may be called upon to pay the maximum which can be taken from him as rent, namely, 10 per cent. of his pay. This is a fair arrangement during the recess season when he is in residence, but is not fair in the touring season, when the officer is away from his Headquarters and incurring other expenses whilst having still to pay the rent of the bungalow. It would be a fair arrangement if only half the ordinary rent due from him should be paid during the touring season, or during the time he may be absent on privilege leave and the bungalow not occupied by another officer.

At present there is no appointment of Chief Conservator in Bombay though it is hoped that the Government of Bombay may shortly apply for and obtain the constitution of that appointment. Bombay Forest Officers feel that under their present conditions of service their chances of obtaining a high paid appointment are not equal to those of their brother officers who serve directly under the Government of India, since not only can they not obtain a Chief Conservatorship, but their appointment to the highest post of Inspector-General of Forests is in fact barred, though not in theory.

Also they consider it hard that the Sind Circle should be constituted a Deputy Conservator's charge instead of a Conservator's charge as was formerly the case. Although not so important as the other Forest Circles, the Sind Circle is still one that requires capable officers. At present it is made the harbour of refuge of an officer who is not deemed worthy of promotion to a Conservatorship. This is bad for the officer and bad for the Service, and there is every reason for restoring a Conservator to Sind and so giving the Bombay Officers a fourth Conservatorship.

66535. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—These have been much improved since the pay of Conservators was raised in 1906 and Time scale pay for Deputy and Assistant Conservators was introduced in 1907. The fixing of the pay of Conservators at Rs. 1,500, Rs. 1,700 and Rs. 1,900 instead of at Rs. 1,500, Rs. 1,750 and Rs. 2,000 which are the rates granted to Superintending Engineers in the Public Works Department who correspond in rank with Conservators of Forest has always been a source of dissatisfaction to Forest Officers. Also Rs. 1,500, the pay of the third grade Conservator, is considered as too little for an officer holding such a responsible position, in view of the expenses which he has to incur and the increase in the cost of servants' wages and of living in India generally.

The pay of the third grade Conservator should be raised to Rs. 1,750, and the other two grades should carry pay of Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 2,250 per mensem respectively. The pay of the Chief Conservator should be Rs. 2,500 with annual increments of Rs. 100 up to a maximum of Rs. 3,000.

The incremental pay of Deputy and Assistant Conservators has been fixed at Rs. 380 per mensem on first appointment as Assistant Conservator, with increments of Rs. 40 per mensem for the first eight years when a pay of Rs. 700 is reached, and thereafter Rs. 50 until a maximum of Rs. 1,250 per mensem is attained in the 20th year of service. A Deputy Conservator drawing Rs. 1,250 per mensem can get no further addition to his pay unless and until he is promoted to a Conservatorship. Whilst appreciating the benefits of the Time Scale pay, Junior officers of the Forest Department find that in the first eight years of their service they are generally losers in the amount of pay they draw, compared with the time when, commencing on Rs. 350 as second grade Assistant Conservator, they ordinarily received promotion to first grade Assistant Conservator on Rs. 450 after being about a year in that grade, and thereafter were eligible for acting allowances when officers above them

were absent on leave. The Junior Officers contend that their initial pay should in fairness be Rs. 400 and that their incremental pay should be Rs. 50 per mensem annually thereafter; their maximum pay would then be attained in the 18th year of service, which is the time when promotion to the rank of Conservator should ordinarily be nearing attainment. The promotion to Conservator's rank depends however upon the occurrence of vacancies, and officers who are fully qualified to perform the duties of a Conservator often find their promotion blocked, and that they have to remain for several years longer on the maximum pay—Rs. 1,250—of a Deputy Conservator. After 18 years' service it is possible to judge whether a Deputy Conservator is fit for promotion to a Conservatorship or not. If not fit, then his pay need not be further increased; but if he is deemed worthy of promotion to Conservator on the occurrence of a vacancy then his pay should continue to rise by increments of Rs. 50 to a maximum of Rs. 1,500 in the 23rd year of service unless promoted to a Conservatorship before that date.

66536. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The Government of India about a year ago circulated proposals for revising the present leave rules in the Civil Service Regulations. If the new rules suggested are brought into effect, the conditions of leave will be much more favourable than at present and will leave little to be desired. The disabilities which are felt at present in the matter of leave are that though an officer may earn one year's furlough for each four years of service, he may not take any furlough except on medical certificate until he has been eight years in India after first arrival. Also an officer may not take a fresh period of furlough until he has put in three years' service since his last furlough; and if he takes more than six weeks' privilege leave combined with other leave he may not take such combined leave or furlough again until he has put in 18 months' service after his return from the former leave. If the new rules are sanctioned an officer will be permitted to take leave, when such is due to him, at any time when his services can be spared; and this is what officers now desire.

The minimum leave allowance for an officer on furlough is not now sufficient. It was fixed at a time when the expenses of living were much lower at £200 a year. We consider that this should now be raised to £400 a year as this amount is not more than sufficient to permit of an officer living in England when on leave, in such decent amount of comfort as will enable him to recover his health and fit himself for further service in India.

66537. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—There is a great deal of dissatisfaction with the present rates of pension. Whilst the pay of officers has been increased, the pensions which can be earned have remained practically at the same amount as they were when the Forest Service was first constituted 50 years ago. Many memorials have been made by Forest Officers, but little redress has been obtained. Originally the highest pension attainable was Rs. 5,000 equivalent to £500. When the exchange value of the rupee declined to about half its former value, the Secretary of State recognised that some redress was called for, and he then fixed the rate of exchange at 1s. 9d. in the case of Indian pensions drawn in England. The value of the Rs. 5,000 pension thus became £437 10s. which was still considerably short of its former equivalent of £500. Later, an additional pension of Rs. 1,000 a year was granted to Forest Officers who had served as Conservators for not less than three years and who had 28 years of effective service to their credit. This raised the highest attainable pension to £525. A Forest Officer is also allowed to retire voluntarily after 20 years' service of which 18 must be effective on a reduced pension of Rs. 4,000 a year or £350.

With the great rise that has taken place in the cost of living in England and the consequent reduced purchasing power of the sovereign the above pensions have become quite inadequate to afford Forest Officers on retirement the comfortable subsistence in England which was intended when the amounts were fixed. The ordinary Forest Officer can save little from his pay during his career in India. The Provident Fund which has been established now for 17 years provides for some compulsory saving and the amount thus put by during his service, when taken out on retirement and invested will give him some enhancement of his yearly income. But the Provident Fund serves the purpose more of furnishing some provision for the officer's widow in the event of his predeceasing his wife, than of reinforcing the amount of his pension. The purchasing power of the sovereign having decreased by about 25 per cent. it is fair to conclude that pensions of officers should be increased by a corresponding amount, and Forest Officers consider that they have an equitable claim now to pensions on the following scale:—

	£
After 20 years' service	500 a year
After 25 years' service (provided the officer has attained the rank of Conservator)	600 ,,
After 28 ,, ,, ...	700 ,,
After 30 ,, ,, ...	750 ,,

It is further considered that in the case of officers who have to retire between the above periods on account of ill health the pension granted should be increased proportionately to the length of their service. This would imply an increase of £25 a year for each year of service, so that an officer retiring on account of ill health after 21 years would receive £525 a year and so on.

Finally we consider that the amount of the invalid pensions which are granted to Forest Officers who are compelled to retire before they have rendered 18 years of effective service, are insufficient. The cases of Forest Officers who have been forced to retire on account of ill health before they have completed the 20 years' service which qualifies them for their first pension have not been numerous in the past, and it need not be expected that they will be numerous in future. There is all the more reason therefore that the allowances in the way of pension should be liberal. A Forest Officer compelled to retire prematurely on account of ill health has very little chance of obtaining employment in England. The present maximum scale of pensions which can be given to an officer drawing his pension in England is as follows:—

Years of completed service.	£	s.
10	87	10
11	122	10
12	158	0
13	193	0
14	228	0
15 to 19	262	10

We submit that an officer who has lost his health under the conditions of his service in India should not be reduced to poverty in England when compelled to retire prematurely. His pension should be on a scale that, with the aid of his savings or any other money he may possess he may be able to subsist with some degree of comfort; and we consider that this cannot be managed unless a minimum pension of £250 be granted to him after 10 years' service, with an increase of £25 for each further year of service up to 20 years, at which period he becomes eligible for his first pension on voluntary retirement. It is not to the advantage of Government that an officer should struggle on in active service when on account of his health having broken down, he is incapable of performing his duties in an efficient manner. But an officer in ill health is at present compelled to do this since the pension he can obtain if he is allowed to retire on medical certificate is totally inadequate for his needs.

66538. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—The only limitations which exist to the employment of non-Europeans in the Imperial Forest Service consist in the fact that they must make themselves eligible for appointment by taking

an Honours degree at a University in Great Britain. When we consider the number of Indians who proceed annually to England for purposes of study and who distinguish themselves there at the Universities, we can only conclude from the very small number of them who seek to enter the Forest Service that that Service does not attract them. Non-Europeans have an equal chance with Europeans of selection by the Secretary of State for India and his Selection Board, but they do not appear to present themselves for selection, since only one Indian has joined the Imperial Forest Service under the present regulations, whilst a large number have joined the Indian Civil Service and the Indian Medical Service by means of competitive examinations. Indians of means and social position who proceed to England to study do so with the aim of either joining one of the above Services, or of qualifying themselves for a profession. The nature of the work of the Forest Officer in India, or the prospects of the Forest Service, do not seem to attract them, and it is doubtful if Indians of the above class would be attracted to the Service even if entry to it were made possible in India. In any case it is in my opinion not an experiment which should be tried. Technical training in Europe is essential for the production of an efficient Forest Officer, and a lowering in the present standard of recruiting would result in a serious set-back to Forestry in India accompanied by a permanent loss of revenue. On the other hand the class of men, both of European and Non-European extraction who seek to enter the Forest Department in India find ample scope for their aspirations in the Provincial Forest Service which now offers to them an excellent career.

The scales of salary, leave and pensions fixed for the Imperial Forest Officers are rendered necessary in order to attract to India Europeans of good education and social standing, capable of making good administrators. There would be no justification to pay such salaries, etc., to men who were serving in their native country, under conditions to which they were accustomed, and who had no need to lay by money out of their pay to meet the expenses of their own occasional furlough to England, or of sending their families there, or of educating their children in England. If the present division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial were abolished and the two services merged into one the scale of salaries would in fairness to the people of India who are taxed to pay them, require to be fixed on the basis of living in India. In that case the Europeans appointed as at present by the Secretary of State would require to be given personal allowances and privileges of leave and rates of pension which would place them on the same footing in regard to emoluments, leave and pension, as they are at present or as advocated. If the Indians considered that invidious distinctions were caused by higher rates of emoluments being shown in the Civil Lists for Europeans as compared with Indians, such personal allowances would be omitted and record kept of them only in such manner as Government would arrange—the monthly pay to be drawn by each officer being regulated by pay slips from the Audit Department as at present. But I consider that the present system of dividing the Service into two Branches, viz., an Imperial and a Provincial Service, is satisfactory, and I deprecate any change being made in it. The Provincial Service is recruited mainly from Non-Europeans. The type of recruit which is being obtained for that service is improving, and the rules now in force for the selection and training of the recruits for the Provincial Forest Service will provide for the admission of better officers than has been the case hitherto. The Forest Service is a small Service compared with most of the other Indian Services, but it comes largely into contact with the agricultural population and has to deal with a great amount of valuable property. It makes, therefore, great demands upon its officers for strict probity in their dealings. Careful selection and training of the men required for the Service is essential. Indians are generally found wanting in the capacity to initiate new undertakings for the development of the forests, in the willing acceptance of responsibility and the power of performing their duties in the face of opposition and pressure brought to bear against them. But they have proved capable of doing good work under the guidance of European Officers. The Protective Establishments—Rangers, Foresters and Guards, who number many thousands, prefer to have European Officers at the head of affairs in their districts, and it is only thus that the full value of their services is obtained. Officers in the Provincial Service will doubtless develop greater capability and reliability for the due performance of Forestry work in the future, and the present conditions of the Service offer scope for such improvement; and it would be inadvisable to attempt to accelerate it by special measures taken with a view to extending the employment of Non-Europeans in the highest offices of control. The course of training which is given to Probationers for the Provincial Forest Service at Dehra Dun is excellent for the purpose for which it has been instituted, but it could never be made to take the place of a European training.

66539. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The only other Service besides the Indian Civil Service with which the Forest Department ordinarily has dealings with is the Public Works Department, and the relations of the Forest Service with all other Services are good. In former times there had been a tendency for friction since the Forest Service was young compared with the others, and it took time for the other Services to understand and appreciate the great value of the Forests to the Country and the need for their maintenance and development. The Forest Settlement, which fixed the lands, out of those which had been provisionally gazetted, which were to be retained as Reserved Forest, and which was made by members of the Indian Civil Service, had been followed by the introduction of Working Plans for the forests drawn up by the Forest Officers. The needs of the agricultural population in regard to forests have been borne in mind in carrying out both the above operations, and former conflicting interests between Forest and Revenue Officers in the matter of the public welfare have been eliminated.

A tendency to antagonism between the Forest Department and the Public Works Department, more especially in Sind, where the construction of canals and the regulation of the water supply from the river Indus for irrigating agricultural lands interfered with the conservation of the forests by cutting off their water supply, has given place to one of agreement and a policy of mutual give and take which leaves nothing to be desired.

66540. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—It is not to the interests of efficient administration that officers who have been passed over as unfit for promotion should be permitted to continue in service until obliged to retire under the age rule at 55 years of age. Government should have the power of retiring such officers compulsorily when they have earned the pension for which they are eligible after 25 years' service, *i.e.*, provided their effective service amounts to 22 years. On the other hand, the voluntary retirement of capable officers after 20 years' service when they are generally at the maximum of their utility to the State is much to the disadvantage of the State. Yet such voluntary retirements must be expected to take place if officers at that stage find their promotion blocked.

The Government of India refused to take any steps on the Memorials submitted by a large number of Forest Officers in 1909 on the subject of the inadequacy of their pensions, because the matter would be considered by the Public Services Commission. The benefit of any enhanced pensions which may be sanctioned as the result of the Public Services Commission should in fairness be given retrospectively to all Forest Officers who have retired between the date on which the above order of the Government of India was passed and the date from which the enhanced pensions were granted.

The introduction in 1896 of the General Provident Fund for Forest Officers has enabled them to make some provision for their wives and children in the event of their decease in active service. But this is not sufficient, and at present a Forest Officer who dies during his service gets no benefit at all from any pension which he may have earned. We advocate the establishment of a Widows' and Orphans' Pension Fund on similar to those already established for the officers of the Indian Civil Service and Indian Medical Service.

The present system of dividing Forest charges into Major and Minor Divisions, of which a proportion of the former and all the latter are to be held by officers of the Provincial Forest Service, is not satisfactory. Even a seemingly unimportant Forest Division requires at times the services of an able officer; and if Minor Divisions are to be held always by the less capable officers there will be an absence of development of their forest resources. The posting of officers should be entrusted to the head of the Department acting in his capacity of advisor to the Local Government, and there should be no arbitrary limitation to the exercise of his powers in the appointment of officers such as now exists by the classification of Divisions into Major and Minor. The fitness of an Extra Assistant Conservator for promotion to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator may be determined upon other grounds than his fitness to hold charge of a Major Division, which is the rule at present.

(*II*) Provincial Forest Service.

66541. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The present Rules for appointment to the Bombay Provincial Forest Service have been printed as Appendix XII. on page 75 of the Memorandum of the Government of Bombay on the Forest Department in the Bombay Presidency. These provide for the recruitment of the Service—(*a*) by the promotion of trained Rangers after not less than five years' satisfactory service as such, and (*b*) by the direct appointment of candidates who have completed the two years' Provincial Service course at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun.

We have not yet had any experience of the (*b*) method of recruitment since it has been started only in the last two years and no appointments have yet been made. A candidate has just been selected and will enter the College for training in July, 1914.

The present method of recruitment is the most satisfactory that can be recommended, though I think efforts should be made to keep the Rangers as a separate branch from which promotions should only be made to the Provincial Service as a reward for exceptionally good Service and merit. It is only in this way that the status of the Provincial Service will be raised and that well educated Indians of good local position will be led to come forward to enter the service. At present there is very little difference in class between the candidates who seek to join the Ranger grade and who seek to enter the Provincial Service direct, and a continuous flow upwards to the Provincial Service of the best men from the Ranger grade after about five years' service as Rangers causes a starving of the Ranger branch. It is impossible to provide any immediate remedy for this state of affairs, as the claims of Rangers already in the Service have to be considered. But as the class of candidate for direct appointment improves more dependence should be placed on this method of recruitment. The prospect of promotion after five years' service now held out to Rangers should be withdrawn, and in its place it might be enacted, *e.g.*, that the fifth of each sequence of five vacancies in the Provincial Service shall be filled by the promotion of a Ranger of approved merit and ability. To compensate Rangers for this lowering of their prospects, the pay of the higher grades should gradually be increased to the extent that there should be grade promotion of Rs. 25 per month from the present highest pay of Rs. 150 up to Rs. 250 per month.

66542. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The course of training which extends over two years, now provided at Dehra Dun for Probationers for the Provincial Forest Service is very thorough. I consider it to be satisfactory, and I can offer no suggestions for its improvement. The recruits which the College turns out at the end of the course may be expected to be well grounded in the theory, and to a less degree in the practice of Indian Forestry; and subsequent experience should develop them into good practical Foresters. The training also pays attention to their physique and encourages habits of activity which, it is hoped, will be maintained after the recruits take up the appointment for which they have qualified; since it is only thus that the tendency noticeable in the past and to some degree in the present of the Indian officer to become fatter and heavier as his pay becomes greater can be checked.

A period of probation of one year as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators which may be extended to three years or more at the discretion of Government is enforced in the case of recruits to the Bombay Provincial Forest Service. I consider this to be a very useful provision, as the recruit is made to feel from the beginning that his advancement in the Service will depend upon the amount of interest and ability he displays in his work, and habits of application to duty are inculcated from the first. This probationary period is distasteful to many of the officers since owing to the absence of vacancies in the cadre of the Service, the period of probationership may sometimes be prolonged beyond the time when the probationer may have merited a permanent appointment. This cannot be avoided except by under recruiting, and it is provided for in the Rules which permit of increased pay being granted after three years of probation have been spent. If the promotion of Rangers to the Provincial Service is made of rarer occurrence as I have suggested should be done, this tendency to prolongation of the periods of probation will be lessened, since there will be less chance of over recruiting taking place.

66543. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The conditions of Service of the Provincial Officer, being as he is in almost all cases, a native of India, are very different from those of the European officer in the Imperial Service. The Provincial Officer, whether European or non-European, is domiciled in the country. He has not to meet the expenses of voyages to and from Europe, for himself, and if married and a family man—for his wife and family. His children are brought up in India where education is cheap, and on retirement he makes his home in the country amongst friends and in surroundings to which he has been accustomed. There is therefore no need for the payment of salaries to officers of the Provincial Forest Service at the rates which are granted to officers of the Imperial Forest Service. The Provincial Service Officer is in fact in the position of the European who takes service in the Civil Service of his own country, and the pay and prospects of higher pay and future pension of a Provincial Officer in India compare very favourably with those of the European situated in similar circumstances in his own country. The European element is as fully necessary in the Forest Service in India as in any of the other Government Services, and more necessary than in most. If the European element however were eliminated the Imperial Forest Service could go also; the present conditions of service of the Provincial Service would be sufficiently favourable for officers who would then compose the Government Forest Department, allowance being made for appointments of Extra Conservators, which do not exist in the Service as at present constituted.

66544. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators receive Rs. 150 per mensem for the three years of probation and thereafter Rs. 200 per mensem.

Extra Assistant Conservators receive on first appointment Rs. 250 per mensem and thereafter annual increments of Rs. 20 up to a maxium of Rs. 550 attained in the 16th year of service. An officer's increments may be stopped by Government if his work has been unsatisfactory.

After not less than three years at the maximum pay an Extra Assistant Conservator who is to be considered fit for a major charge but who cannot be promoted to Extra Deputy Conservator in the absence of a vacancy may be given a personal allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem which may be increased to Rs. 100 on the expiry of four years and to Rs. 150 on the expiry of another four years.

The appointments of Extra Deputy Conservators are limited to the number in the cadre and are made by selection. On first appointment as Extra Deputy Conservator the officer gets Rs. 575 per mensem, rising by annual increments of Rs. 25 to Rs. 650. After one year on this pay he may be promoted to Rs. 700 and after three years on this pay he may be promoted to Rs. 800 per mensem. After a further period of three years on Rs. 800 he may be promoted to Rs. 850 per mensem, which is the highest pay provided for an Extra Deputy Conservator.

These conditions of salary are a very great advance upon what were formerly obtainable, and are practically equal to those offered to Imperial Officers of the Assistant and Deputy Conservators' grades between the years 1870 and 1907. They afford the means of a comfortable career and are in my opinion sufficiently liberal.

66545. **(V) Conditions of Leave.** — Privilege leave, which is the same for officers of the Provincial Forest Service as for officers of the Imperial Forest Service, is taken freely and to its full extent by officers of the Provincial Service; leave on medical certificate is taken when necessary, but ordinary furlough is little required by them. The conditions of leave are therefore in a general sense sufficient, but they may be made somewhat more liberal, except in the matter of privilege leave, to meet exceptional cases without causing any appreciable additional charges to Government. The officers of the Service being generally natives of India do not require to take lengthy periods of leave. Instead of one year's leave being allowed after 10 years' service six months might be allowed after five years' service, and one year after ten years' service if the previous leave had not been taken; and thereafter six months' further leave might be allowed after every four years' service instead of one year after each eight years. The total amount of leave which may be taken in the service of 25 years when an invalid pension can be earned is two years. Also after 30 years' service when voluntary retirement is possible, only two years' service may be counted. The amount of furlough permissible might be raised to three years in the 30 years of service without fear of causing large additional cost to Government, since that amount of furlough would only be taken rarely by officers of the Provincial Forest Service, but it might be necessary to a few officers from bad health.

66546. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The increase in the salary of Provincial Service Officers has been accompanied by a considerable rise in the pensions which they can earn. All officers may expect to attain the full pay of the Extra Assistant Conservator at least. After three years of service on that pay they would be entitled to pensions of Rs. 3,300 a year. If promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator an officer would be eligible for a pension ranging from Rs. 3,450 to Rs. 5,000, the latter being at present the maximum pension which can be earned by an officer of the Imperial Forest Service unless he is able to qualify for the additional pension of Rs. 1,000 which is granted to Conservators after serving three years in that grade. As the above pensions can be earned at the age of 55 by men serving all the time in their native land they compare quite favourably with the pensions granted to their Civil Servants by European countries which can be earned only at the age of 60 or more.

66547. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.** I have dealt with this in my remarks on the Imperial Forest Service (paragraph 66538).

66548. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The remarks I have made under the heading on the Imperial Service (paragraph 66539) apply with equal force to the Provincial Service.

Mr. G. P. Millett called and examined.

66549. (*Chairman*). The witness occupied the position of senior Conservator of Forests. He was in his 30th year of service, and had spent the whole of his career in the Bombay Presidency.

66550. He would not go so far as to say that the candidates obtained under the present system of recruitment were not up to the standard of the men who came from Coopers Hill, but they were a little too old when they first came to the country, and did not really settle down to forest life. They had to be shaped very carefully. He would like to see men come out younger. He did not consider that science degrees were either necessary or useful for forest officers. Some of the work they had to do in order to get a science degree was really of no use to them in their profession, and was apt to make them too theoretical: at least, that was so in the case of an Honours degree in science.

66551. He would like to see the physical test reintroduced. If it were, he would not regard nomination as important.

66552. The training of recruits for the service would be best carried out at one centre, either Oxford, Cambridge, or Edinburgh. He had not compared the syllabuses of these three institutions, but he believed they were framed as far as possible on uniform lines.

66553. He considered the existing system of the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial was satisfactory, and he would deprecate any alteration.

66554. The course of training given to candidates for the Provincial Forest Service fell short of that required of men to fill posts in the Imperial Service. He regarded the Dehra Dun course as distinctly inferior to the training given in England.

66555. He would not be in favour of the proposal that a certain number of Indians should be recruited direct to the Service, subject to the condition of their going through exactly the same course of training as European officers. If Government, however, really desired to get non-Europeans into the Imperial Service, then decidedly such a system would be better than promotion to the Imperial branch on the strength of a training at Dehra Dun, followed by a certain number of years' service in the Provincial Service.

66556. The Dehra Dun course was inferior, both on the theoretical side and on the practical side, and he did not think it was capable of much improvement.

66557. There was no lack of *esprit de corps* as between the Provincial and Imperial branches of the Service in Bombay. In Bombay, Provincial officers were not doing the same work as Imperial officers. It was true they were in charge of certain specified divisions, but it would be quite out of the question to put Provincial officers in charge of other and more important divisions. If an Indian could obtain the very best training, equal to that given to the European, he might become in future fully qualified to hold the more important major charges, provided he developed the necessary qualifications in the course of his service.

66558. He would not say that the Forest officer was worse off in regard to serving in unhealthy districts than officers in certain other services, but a forest officer's work in the rains was largely office duty, and his going away to healthier places would not affect his work. There had been cases of

officers in the Bombay Forest Service who had fallen ill on account of having to stay in unhealthy districts during the rainy season.

66559. The Forest Service was not worse off in regard to transfer allowances than other services.

66560. He recommended that the present maximum of Rs. 1,250 should be retained for Deputy Conservators, but he would allow any Deputy Conservator who was qualified for promotion to Conservator to advance by annual increments of Rs. 50 up to a special maximum of Rs. 1,500. He did not think that was too long a run; it was to meet the case of a qualified officer whose promotion to a Conservatorship was blocked. Some men obtained promotion to a Conservatorship after 18 or 19 years' service, whereas other men equally fit might be kept back until their 22nd or 23rd year of service.

66561. His reason for recommending the appointment of a Chief Conservator in Bombay was that there was no official head to the Department at present. The Bombay Government made their senior Conservator do the work of a Chief Conservator. He found that the work which he had to do of the senior Conservator interfered with the discharge of his duties as Conservator, and moreover he had not the powers of administration which he ought to have. For instance, if it came to his knowledge that an officer who had lately been appointed Conservator was following a course which did not seem quite advisable, the witness could do nothing. There would be a full day's work for a Chief Conservator in the Bombay Presidency.

66562. If a fourth Conservatorship was created for the Sind circle, it would be only restoring to the Service what it had before. The post had been abolished in the time of Lord Reay in 1890. The officer who then held the post was a Staff Corps Colonel. That gentleman was asked to report about the work in Sind, and he said he could manage all the divisions in Sind with Indian officers and two Imperial officers. Government agreed, and when the Colonel retired, they decided that a circle which required only two Imperial officers did not require a Conservator in charge, and that a Deputy Conservator would be sufficient.

66563. The staff of the Sind circle consisted of the Deputy Conservator in charge, two Imperial officers, and five Provincial officers. The central circle consisted of seven divisions, five of which had a Provincial officer in addition to the Imperial officer. The southern circle had seven divisions with Imperial officers, and the northern circle was about the same size. The revenue of the Sind circle was slowly increasing, but it was smaller than that of the other circles.

66564. Three officers had taken advantage of the rule which enabled them to retire after 20 years' service. He himself considered that a forest officer was at the height of efficiency after he had completed 20 years' service.

66565. Officers would welcome the establishment of a widows' and orphans' fund, which would be managed but not supported by Government.

66566. He desired that there should be fewer promotions from the Ranger class. Rangers did not make the best Provincial officers. If it was desired to improve the Provincial Service, it should be filled by direct recruitment as much as possible. The Ranger class was certainly being starved by the promotion of so many of its men to the Provincial Service. He would improve the prospects of the Ranger class as a compensation for non-promotion. He would have grade promotion up to Rs. 150 a month as at present, and beyond that it should be in the power of Government to give further promotion to selected men up to Rs. 250 a month. He thought that would satisfy the Ranger class.

66567. He would make a definite distinction between the qualifications of candidates for the Provincial Branch and the qualifications of candidates for the Ranger class, and he would put the Provincial recruit through a different course at Dehra Dun from that which the Rangers had to go through.

66568. (*Sir Valentine Chirol*). None of the Indians in the Bombay Provincial Service had been through the new course at Dhera Dun, so that his views as to the capacity of the Indians in the Provincial Service was based upon past experience. In his opinion, however, the new course at Dehra Dun would only slightly raise the standard, as the teachers were practically the same as before, and the revised course of study was only a little more advanced.

66569. With regard to invalid pension, on the Bombay side there was hardly a single instance of an officer having to retire before he had earned his first pension, *i.e.*, after 20 years' service.

66570 (*Mr. Madge.*) The Bombay Government would, he considered, profit more by having a Chief Conservator than by having an increased cadre.

66571. Judging by his experience of 30 years in the Service, he did not consider there was any need for promotion from the Provincial Service to the Imperial. The Provincial Service as at present constituted was a first-rate Service for the native of India. The officers began on a salary which was double what was paid to a German or a French Forest Officer. A Conservator of Forests in France or Germany received £350, whereas a native of India in the Forest Service could rise to £800 a year.

66572. There might be exceptional cases where an Officer might be promoted from the Provincial to the Imperial Service, but as long as the door was left open, so long would every man in the lower service consider he had a claim for promotion.

66573. In India the Provincial Service did not attract a good class of Europeans, although the pay and prospects were quite good enough. Hardly a single application to enter the Service had been received from a domiciled European.

66574. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The travelling allowance of Rs. 100 a month for the Provincial Service was quite sufficient.

66575. He did not desire to abolish the present rule under which a certain number of charges were held by Provincial Officers, but he wanted power himself to say whether a charge should be a minor or a major charge, *i.e.*, power to appoint an Imperial Officer to a minor charge if considered desirable in the interests of the charge.

66576. He had not had much experience of the University candidates who now came to India, but he considered that they arrived in India much too old.

66577. (*Mr. Sly.*) He considered that the examination, which was held at the time he himself was admitted to the Service in 1882, and which demanded a knowledge of the elements of Botany, Geology, Mineralogy and cognate subjects, was a model examination.

66578. The rule which obtained in some Provinces, that Forest Officers should be permitted to spend two months at a hill station if they could do their work conveniently there, would not meet the case of Officers in Bombay.

66579. It was a fact that a Bombay Officer had actually held the appointment of Inspector-General, but the witness knew a great deal about that case which was not on record. The Officer in question, Mr. Wroughton, was put in to act while Mr. Hill, the Inspector-General, was on leave. Mr. Hill died, and it was the first intention of the Government of India to pass over Mr. Wroughton. The witness complained that the Government did not even consider Bombay Officers for the post.

66580. He had had no experience of the selection of recruits for the Provincial Service before sending them to Dehra Dun, but he could say that the class from which candidates were selected was just the same as that which came forward for the Ranger class in the ordinary way.

66581. He would not agree with the opinion that the improvement in the time-scale for Senior Deputy Conservators, was a matter of considerably less importance than an improvement in the pay of the administrative grades.

66582. (*Mr. Rebeiro.*) He was not aware of the fact that the Government of India had stated that the training obtained at Dehra Dun was practi-

cally as good as could be obtained in some of the European institutions, but even if that were the case, it was not his own opinion.

66583. He agreed there was some ground for the complaint with regard to the length of the period of probation to the Provincial Service, but it was always within the power of the local Government to remedy that; it was not a question for the Commission. It was not considered desirable that a Provincial Service man should hold the post of Conservator. The Conservatorship was a high administrative appointment which required to be filled by an Imperial Officer. It was not a question of training; it was a question of the quality of the officer in the first place.

66584. He would not favour Provincial Officers being deputed for study leave abroad for a period of six months in order to qualify for promotion to the Imperial Service. He did not wish to see Provincial Officers recruited into the Imperial Service at all.

66585. He would not recommend that Imperial recruits should be trained for six months at Dehra Dun; neither did he think that such a system of training would encourage mutual understanding between the two branches of the Service.

66586. Prior to the formation of the Commission, he had never heard any complaint on the Bombay side as to the division into Provincial and Imperial branches.

66587. The best men in the Provincial Service still fell short of the standard for admission to the Imperial Service, but he would have no objection to the promotion of any Provincial Officer who was duly qualified.

66588. He was in favour of the proposal that Provincial men should retire after 25 years' Service.

(The witness withdrew.)

N. D. Sataravala, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bombay.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department, being the corporate views of officers of the Provincial Forest Service, Bombay.

66589. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—(*a*) The revised rules for appointment to the Provincial Forest Service (Government Resolution No. 10618, dated 19th November, 1912) are acceptable to most officers, with the proviso that two candidates for direct appointment should be selected for training at Dehra Dun for every one selected for appointment from amongst the trained Rangers. Also that a physical test should be imposed before a candidate is finally selected.

(*b*) One of the present systems of recruitment to the Provincial Forest Service, viz., by direct nomination of selected candidates of high qualifications for special training at the Imperial Forest College at Dehra Dun, has a great deal to recommend itself, and should in course of time be the only source of recruitment if Government is to derive full benefit of the money it spends on this branch of the Service. As it is, this course of recruitment is sadly neglected, for up to this time there have been only two direct nominees, of whom only one remains, the other having resigned and subsequently died. Applications were called for from candidates in one instance, but no one was nominated; hence up to this time we have only one* direct nominee in the Provincial Forest Service of this Presidency since the introduction of the above rule, which could hardly be considered satisfactory if the Service has to be strengthened by fresh and vigorous men of high ideals and good qualifications.

(*c*) No doubt Government has to look to the claims of old Rangers trained at Poona and at Dehra Dun, and really good men from these should also be taken up as Extra Assistant Conservators; but the men so selected should be really deserving men capable of doing honour to the Service they want to enter. At present every Ranger coming into the first or second grade wants to become an Extra Assistant, and succeeds somehow in getting into the Provincial Forest Service; but he is incapable of doing justice to the work entrusted to him and the whole Service comes into bad odour.

(*d*) During recent years frequent changes have been made in the mode of recruitment of the Provincial Forest Service, which, judged by results, has proved very detrimental to the well-being of the Service on the whole.

(*e*) As long as highly educated University graduates with a degree in Engineering were selected for these posts, they were well able to hold their own and give satisfaction to their superior officers, but when the selection of those graduates was discontinued in favour of the Poona Forest Class men and others with distinctly inferior education, the Service began to lose ground and it has come into such ill odour of late.

(*f*) The constant change of rules had also another bad effect, viz., all sorts of men began to think that they were fairly entitled to posts in the Provincial Service under one set of rules or other, and, as it was often laid down that vacancies should be filled up by turns, the result was that many men of better parts had to give way before some others coming forward on the ground of "it being their turn" then.

(*g*) Thus the Service has suffered greatly, and will continue to suffer as long as this mode of selection is not done away with. Their can and should be only one mode of selection, and that of "fitness" alone. Unless fitness is made the *sine qua non* of selection, no better results can be expected.

(*h*) Fortunately, the system of Direct Nomination has been introduced of late, and these nominees, if properly selected, are expected to prove a source of strength and usefulness to the Service. The nominations, however, should be more frequent, and full 75 to 80 per cent. of the vacancies should be filled up by these men and the remaining vacancies only by a careful selection of men from the Protective Establishment.

(*i*) As long as this is not done the Provincial Service can hardly hope to acquire the respect or esteem of its brothers in the Imperial Branch, nor can Government be expected to derive full benefit of the money it spends on this Service.

66590. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—(*a*) As a special and separate course of training at Dehra Dun has been fixed for the Direct Nominees for the Provincial Forest Service, and since they no longer go through the same course as the Ranger Class men, as they did during the first two years of their training in times past, there does not seem anything special to be said on the subject; for these men will have now to undergo a higher course of training than what the Ranger Class men will have to do, which seems very desirable. The training they receive at Dehra Dun is very good, and will, in course of time, compare most favourably with the training given in Continental Institutions.

(*b*) Three years' probations after first appointment as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator is altogether too long for the type of men that would be selected for the Provincial Forest Service; one year's probation is quite sufficient for them to grasp the routine of Range Office work and all other details of Forest life. Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators should then be put on special duty to learn any special works going on in

* One more Probationer has been selected since writing the above.

their own or in other Circles, or put in charge of Sub-divisions. To keep them longer in charge of Ranges is to frustrate the object with which direct nominations are made.

(*c*) Again, the period of probation is not fixed. The present rules require that a Probationer must undergo a probation of at least one year, but which "may extend to three years," and he may not be made permanent even after three years' probation if a vacancy does not occur. This is all very vague and indefinite. It may deter suitable candidates from coming forward to join the Service. Moreover, it inflicts unnecessary hardship on a young man without any fault of his if he has to wait until a vacancy occurs. Take, for instance, the case of two men, the first becoming permanent after one year's probation and the next having to wait for three years or more for want of a vacancy. The latter will suffer a pecuniary loss all throughout his service, and even in his pension, so it will be better if the period of probation is fixed once for all, and the probationers are made supernumerary Extra Assistant Conservators after the period of probation is over until a vacancy actually occurs, when they may be absorbed in the regular cadre.

66591. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—(*a*) The conditions of service of a Forest Officer in India are very arduous and trying, and there is a general feeling amongst the Provincial Forest Service men that they are not dealt with as liberally as other Provincial Services are in point of pay and prospects. Highest administrative posts are open to other Provincial Services, while they are altogether debarred from them, hence they ought to be put in a line with the other Provincial Services by giving them similar openings. While in the matter of pay, it was expected that they would get two-thirds of the pay drawn by officers of the same length of service in the Imperial Branch, but in practice it was found that the pay drawn by Provincial men was actually much less, which should be rectified by so arranging the scale of pay that it should always be at least two-thirds of the pay drawn by officers of the Imperial Branch of the same length of service. As arranged at present, the maximum pay is out of the reach of over 90 per cent. of the men now in service. Some officers even advocate that the pay of Provincial Service men should be three-fourths or four-fifths of the pay drawn by Imperial men as times and circumstances have so changed since Government had fixed the ratio of two-thirds to one for the two services, but it is for the Commission to determine what should be the proper ratio.

(*b*) Similar amelioration of conditions in the matter of Furlough, Furlough pay and Pension is called for and it will suffice if the amelioration is carried out on the same lines as for the Imperial Officers.

(*c*) Compared with the figures in other Provinces the number of Extra Deputies in this Presidency is very small. There are only five Extra Deputies in this Presidency, and lately Government was obliged to have recourse to giving personal allowances to satisfy the claims of a senior man who had had to wait long for want of vacancies. If the number were increased to seven or eight or if the Local Government were, in special cases, empowered to create Extra Deputy Conservators in excess of the sanctioned cadre as supernumerary appointments, this difficulty could be got over and no hardships would be caused in future as was the case in the past, when another Senior Extra Assistant had to wait 10 years before he could be made Extra Deputy, and so was neither able to attain maximum pay nor will he get full pension.

(*d*) It is considered that the distinctions of Major and Minor Divisions should be abolished, since it causes annoyance and creates a grievance.

66592. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The recent reorganisation of the Provincial Forest Service and the introduction of the Time-scale pay has greatly improved the prospects of the Service, but the improvement is not such as to bring the Service on an equal footing with other Provincial Services, and it is still unattractive to induce men of good training and high qualifications to join it; more so, as it is notoricus that the men in this Department have a very bad time of it on the whole. An initial pay of Rs. 300 per month is advocated, with an annual increment of Rs. 30 or at least Rs. 25 per month.

It is therefore necessary to bring this service also in a line with the other Provincial Services, not only in pay but in prospects also. Highest administrative posts in the Service are open to men in other Provincial Services while the Provincial Forest Service is fully debarred from it.

The present arrangement of the scheme is such, that hardly any officer at present in this Service will be able to obtain the maximum pay to be able to earn his full pension. A man having exceptional opportunities may attain the maximum pay, but such instances will be rare. Hence unless the yearly increment is raised from 20 to 25 rupees in the case of Extra Assistant Conservators, and to Rs. 35 or so for Extra Deputies, the scheme won't give much satisfaction. If the Rs. 25 increment were granted to Extra Assistant Conservators, and if the scheme were readjusted so as to bring the maximum of pay within the reach of all men the scheme would become more popular.

As said above, the pay given to the Provincial Forest Service is much behind the other Provincial Services. So all these services should be put on an equal footing and the salary given to Provincial men should in no case be less than two-thirds the pay of Imperial Officers of the same length of service.

The minimum and maximum pay as well as the increment of pay per annum should always be at least two-thirds of that fixed for Imperial men of corresponding length of service; Government reserving to itself the right to stop the promotion of such men as may not be considered deserving. Unless the rate of increments also be kept up in the above ratio, there is hardly any chance for men now in service to be ever able to secure the maximum pay.

66593. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—Leave Rules and leave allowances should be modified on the same lines as those for the Imperial Branch of the Service. At present, officers of the Indian Services cannot have Furlough except at intervals of eight years (Article 338, C. S. R.) but this interval is too long, so if it was reduced to three years after the first Furlough as in the case of the European Services (Article 308, C. S. R.) it would prove of material benefit both to the Officers and the State itself.

Some officers make the following suggestions:—

(*a*) Men in the Forest Department have to undergo great hardships and their work is very trying. They break down in health so often that they require many more facilities for the enjoyment of their leave than are wanted by men in other Departments. Under the circumstances some officers consider that it would not be out of place if they were allowed to accumulate their Privilege leave to six months instead of three as at present, and if they were allowed 30 days of casual leave in a year in periods not exceeding 10 to 15 days at a time.

(*b*) Privilege leave in excess of three months at a time to be granted in cases of illness or when an officer wants to proceed to Western Countries for purposes of study or general culture.

(*c*) Furlough may be granted for four years in all. All the four years' furlough may be taken in India and should qualify as service for pension. Except for the above remarks the leave rules will be considered satisfactory if the tentative redraft of rules which accompanies Government Resolution No. 3752, dated 18th December, 1912, is sanctioned.

66594. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—For reasons given above a man in the Forest Department should be allowed to retire early. He has to work in most unhealthy places, and his work is so hard and exacting that his health breaks down at an early age, and he becomes unfit for hard work long before his compeers in other Departments.

Very often he does not live long enough to receive his hard-earned Pension so it is quite necessary that the present limits of 25 and 30 years for invalid and optional retirements should be reduced

to 20 and 25 years respectively; for the hard Forest life, involving the ascent of steep hill-sides falls very heavily on a person of advanced age.

If the period of effective service be reduced there need be no apprehension that all officers will take advantage of it and retire early. On account of several causes the tendency is, and will be to go on serving to the end. The concession will be taken advantage of only by those who will be continuing service with shattered health.

It will therefore be a great boon if after 20 years' service invalid pensions are granted at full rates; the amount of invalidating pensions for services under 20 years being calculated at one fortieth of the number of years of active service, as follows:—

Nineteen-fortieths for 19 years' service; eighteen-fortieths for 18 years' service, and so on.

66595. **(VII) Working of the existing System of Imperial and Provincial Services.**—Though some officers advocate it, it is hardly possible at this stage to do away with the Division of Services into Imperial and Provincial, but it would tend greatly to the raising of the status of the Provincial Service if there were only one list as in the Public Works Department. Men in the Provincial Service being shown with an asterisk or some other mark indicating that they were appointed in India, and their pay being calculated at two-thirds of the pay of Imperial Officers.

66596. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—Very few Officers have made any observations under this head, but some have remarked that it would be just and reasonable if Provincial Services of all Departments were put on an equal footing, and that ordinarily an Officer of one Department with certain service at his back were to receive the same remuneration as one in another Department with like service. This would do away with a great deal of petty bickerings and all would work more contentedly.

66597. **(IX) Other points.**—(*a*) The fitness of an Extra Assistant Conservator for promotion to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator should be based upon grounds other than fitness to hold charge of a Major Division only. That may form one of the considerations, but his previous work, uprightness and antecedents should be the main or sole considerations. It would be no loss to Government if the distinction of Major and Minor charges were done away with altogether.

(*b*) It is generally considered very desirable by all Provincial Forest Service men that the keeping of only one list will tend greatly to bring the two branches of the Forest Service closer together, and will thereby tend to elevate the tone and status of the Provincial Branch. There is only one list in the Public Works Department, and there should be only one in the Forest Department also.

(*c*) There is a universal feeling amongst Divisional Forest Officers of the Provincial Branch that the Travelling Allowance they now get, viz., Rs. 100 a month, is not adequate to meet the expenditure that they incur, and that they should be given the same Travelling Allowance as is given to Officers of the Imperial Branch (viz., Rs. 150), both having to do the same amount of travelling. In no other Department less travelling allowance is paid to the Provincial Officers holding similar office as the Imperial Service Officers. This difference exists in the Forest Department only, and may be removed.

(*d*) The minimum and maximum pay, daily or monthly Travelling Allowance status and the Leave and Pension Rules for the Provincial Service of all Technical Departments, such as the Public Works, Forest, and Survey should be the same.

Mr. N. D. Sataravala called and examined.

66598. (*Chairman.*) The witness occupied the position of Extra Deputy Conservator. He had 27 years' service. He had been directly recruited to the Provincial Service.

66599. He suggested that in course of time all officers to the Provincial Service should be recruited direct. Promotion from the Ranger class should be gradually done away with. At present the Provincial Service was almost entirely recruited from the Ranger class. Two-thirds of the present Provincial Service were Rangers, and one-third had been recruited direct. A Ranger had not a sufficient training to make a good Provincial Officer. Exceptionally good men of the Ranger class might be recruited to the Provincial Service. In saying this he was referring to the Poona Forest-class-men only. Dehra Rangers got better training and would eventually do better, both as Rangers and as Provincial Officers.

66600. The period of probation did not depend upon the efficiency of the probationer, but upon vacancies. Although a probationer might be found suitable at the end of his first year, if there was not a vacancy he would have to continue as probationer up to three years, and perhaps more, during which period he would be losing his increments of pay and incurring a possible loss of pension at least. The period of probation should arbitrarily be reduced to one year. If all the Services were placed on one list he would be prepared to give the officer recruited from Europe a higher rate of salary than the Officer recruited in India. To some extent the cost of living of the officer from Europe was higher than the cost of living of the Officer recruited and domiciled in India.

66601. Certain openings should be provided for the promotion of Provincial Officers to administrative posts. It was not the fact that it was already in the discretion of Government to promote officers. The present rules did not permit of it.

66602. The number of appointments of Extra Deputy Conservators should be increased. The present proportion was too small altogether as compared with the proportion in other Presidencies.

66603. He recommended that the initial rate of pay of Provincial Officers should be two-thirds of that paid to Imperial Officers.

66604. He suggested that privilege leave in excess of three months should be granted for the purpose of study leave. If men went to Europe and studied the conditions of Forestry there, they would become better qualified.

66605. Under present conditions a Provincial Officer could not draw full pension until he had done 25 years' service. He could draw pension equal to one-sixth of salary after 10 years, to one-fourth of salary after 15 years' service, and to one-third of salary after 20 years' service. He proposed that a full invalid pension should be given after 20 years' service, and that a man should be able to retire voluntarily after 25 years' service.

66606. He did not know whether his colleagues would be in favour of a Family Pension Fund, but personally he would be.

66607. Five Bombay Provincial Service Officers were holding major charges.

66608. (*Mr. Sly.*) He had served first in the Public Works Department, and within four months Government transferred him to the Forest Service as a gazetted officer of the Sub-Assistant Conservator class.

66609. At one time in Bombay there was a system for recruiting graduates to the Forest Department. He did not know why that system had been abolished. In his opinion the graduates had proved themselves the better class of officers; they stood out as markedly better than the other men.

66610. All the five Extra Deputy Conservatorships in Bombay were filled at the present time.

66611. (*Mr. Fisher.*) In his opinion an engineering degree was far better than any other degree for members of the Provincial Forest Service. He considered that the training for the engineering

degree at Bombay was better than the training for the Forestry Department given by the new course at Dehra Dun.

66612. He desired that the distinction of major and minor charges should be abolished, as it caused annoyance and created a grievance, because very often there was no difference between the work of the two charges, except that one might be bringing in more revenue than another, or one might be producing better products than another.

66613. (*Mr. Marjoribanks.*) He admitted that Indians did not actually incur the same amount of expense when travelling as European Officers, as they could not afford to do so, since they got much less travelling allowance than European Officers. The reason he asked for the same travelling allowance for Provincial Officers as for Imperial Officers was that this was the rule in all other Departments.

66614. (*Mr. Rebeiro.*) Many of his colleagues who were at the college with him, and who obtained the engineering degree, were now Superintending Engineers in the Public Works Department, but no such appointments were offered to Provincial Officers in the Forestry Department.

66615. It was not his experience that Indians would not go to England in order to be trained for the Forestry Service. He knew of four Indians who had applied for posts in England.

(The witness withdrew.)

D. O. WITT, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department.

66616. *INTRODUCTION.*—In placing before the Public Services Commission a memorandum relating to the Imperial Forest Service, Central Provinces, as requested in the Joint Secretary's letter, dated the 1st August, 1913, to the Chief Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces, I desire as the chosen representative of the Department in these Provinces to bring to the notice of the Commission that the orders appointing me representative and requesting the submission of a memorandum, were received by me on the 29th September, 1913, that I have been requested to submit the memorandum by 15th October, 1913. I have therefore been given a period of 15 days within which to communicate with my brother officers and submit a memorandum, embodying their unanimous views and opinions. It is obviously practically impossible to do so within the limited time given me. I have, however, done my best in the circumstances stated. I desire, however, to reserve to myself the right to modify or add to the opinions expressed in the attached memorandum, in the light of any fresh views or information received from my brother officers between the date of the submission of this memorandum and the date of giving evidence before the Commission.

In the introduction to the memorandum already submitted by Mr. Hill, Chief Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces, attention has been drawn to the main grievances of the Department to which we have little further to add. We would, however, emphasise and particularly draw the attention of the Commission to the arduous and unhealthy conditions of service to which officers of the Forest Department are exposed, which should go a long way to justify the claims we are submitting for consideration. Secondly, we would draw attention to the continually increasing importance to the State of the forests managed by the Forest Department. Only those who have worked for years in these forests and can see the slow but sure improvement that is going on in them can fully realise what a valuable asset the Government of India possess in their State-managed forests. The process is a slow one but none the less sure. Trees do not grow in a season like crops so that the progress is not always easy to detect, but it is there nevertheless.

Knowing this we are confident that any improvements whether in pay or pension which may be recommended by the Commission will at no very distant date be more than compensated for by a corresponding rise in the revenue derived from the State forests. The following statistics relating to the Forest Department in British India bear out the above remarks and may be of interest to the Commission:—

Period.	Area under the Forest Department.	Area under Working Plans.	Revenue.	Expenditure.	Surplus.
	Sq. miles.	Sq. miles.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1885–86 to 1889–90	94,437	Not available	1,26,90,828	76,24,157	50,66,671
1890–91 to 1894–95	113,947		1,62,46,077	88,75,505	73,70,572
1895–96 to 1899–1900	133,171	18,679	1,81,59,902	1,01,26,418	80,23,484
1900–01 to 1904–05	221,600	31,941	2,06,62,489	1,16,71,964	89,90,525
1905–06 to 1909–10	239,784	45,053	2,61,02,330	1,44,96,388	1,16,05,962
1910–11	243,478	50,183	2,74,05,454	1,52,44,023	1,21,61,431

66617. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—Although the present method of recruitment has given fairly satisfactory results, some improvements are needed. Recruits now arrive in India at too advanced an age. At the time Coopers Hill was closed the average age at which the recruit reached India was approximately 22 years. For the last three years 1910-11-12 the average age was 24 years, while for 1912 it was 24 years 3 months.

One recruit has joined at the age of 25 years, 11 months. Under existing pension conditions it is possible that he may be retired under the 55 years' rule before he has served the 28 years necessary for full pension.

This advanced age is brought about mainly by the stress laid on recruits obtaining science degrees which are not necessarily of use to them in their future career.

It would be preferable to revert to recruitment, if necessary by nomination, between the ages of 18 to 20, followed by competitive examinations, and then to train the men in forestry and allied sciences for a period of 3 years. Much greater stress should be laid on physical fitness than is done at present, and all tests imposed as well as medical examination should precede the competitive examination.

66618. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—It is highly desirable that recruits trained in England should receive their instruction at one residential institution. In the first place,

the number annually recruited is too small to make it worth the while of more than one institution to provide a special course of training suitable for Indian conditions. In the second place, it is essential that the details of the technical training of the recruits should be carried out on exactly similar lines. It was the advantage to be obtained from this system that led to the training of all recruits at Coopers Hill, and this was one of the reasons why the abolition of Coopers Hill was so strenuously opposed by the Government of India. The further concentration of all recruits at one College at the chosen training institution is also desirable. The training of the recruits should be in the hands of, or at any rate, supported by, a lecturer or reader with Indian Service experience.

As regards practical training we agree with what Mr. Hill, Chief Conservator of Forests, has already said in his memorandum.

The period of probation in England should be allowed to count as service, as in the case of the Police. It appears to be an anomaly and is a source of great discontent, especially to those Forest Officers who passed the examination for the Forest Department and Police, and elected for the former, that the Police Officer (who like the Forest Officer is appointed as a probationer) draws pay and counts service to pension, while the Forest Officer is undergoing an expensive training largely at his own cost, and in the case of those who joined the Service up to about 1907, wholly at their own cost. It seems very unreasonable, because the Forest Officer spends his probationary period in Europe while the Police Officer spends his in India, that the former is not permitted to count his period of probation as service towards pension, whereas the latter counts the whole of his probationary period and draws pay at the same time.

66619. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—We entirely endorse the remarks made by Mr. Hill in his memorandum under this head. We cannot too strongly draw the attention of the Commission to the unhealthy conditions to which the Forest Officer is exposed.

In consequence it stands to reason that the cadre should be of such a strength that there should be no difficulty in replacing casualties and permitting officers to take leave whenever it is due to them and they require it. Such however is not the case. The Service has been persistently undermanned with the result that officers are constanly refused the leave which they have earned and are only granted leave on medical recommendation. Such a state of affairs tells not only very hardly on the health of officers but also on the general efficiency of the Administration.

A further effect of the deficiency in the cadre is that many officers have to hold charge of a Division and draw up a working plan at the same time, a task which not only tends to a breakdown in health but is generally unsatisfactory. Nobody would ever dream of expecting a Deputy Commissioner of a district to carry out a settlement of his district at the same time, though with the number of assistants a Deputy Commissioner always has it would be more reasonable than a Forest Divisional Officer drawing up a working plan for his own Division.

On this account we would strongly urge an increase in the strength of the Imperial Forest Service quite apart from the general increase which must come with increased development and more intensive working of the existing forest area.

In many parts of India Forest Officers are badly housed or not housed at all. Bearing in mind the long periods spent in camp under trying conditions it is very necessary that special attention should be paid to the housing of Forest Officers in headquarters and if necessary a Government bungalow should be provided.

66620. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—Before definitely stating what we consider to be fair and adequate rates of salary it is as well to place before the Commission in a concise form the grounds on which our opinions are based. They are as follows:—

(*1*) The continually increasing importance of the Forest Department as a revenue-producing Department as explained in some detail in the introduction to this memorandum.

(*2*) The exceptionally arduous and unhealthy conditions to which Forest Officers are exposed (see paragraph (*i*) under (III) "Conditions of Service") call for particularly generous treatment as compared with other Services.

(*3*) That the pay of the Forest Department should in view of the grounds stated in (*2*) compare favourably with the pay of such sister services as (*a*) the Public Works Department (*b*) the Indian Police.

In comparing the pay of the Forest Department with the Indian Police the fact that the Police Officer is drawing pay and counting service towards pension, while the Forest Officer is paying for his training must be carefully kept in view, also that Indian Police still draw exchange compensation allowance whereas the Forest Department do not.

(*4*) The present pay of Assistant and Deputy Conservators at the existing rate of exchange is less than it was under the old rates of pay when the rupee stood at two although the cost of living as is well known has more than doubled since that time.

(*5*) There has been a great advance not only in the quantity but also in the quality of work required of a Forest Officer, and the latter will continue to advance as the forests improve and require more intensive working.

(*6*) The existing rates of pay, especially amongst officers of Administrative rank compare most unfavourably with those of the Indian Civil Service in corresponding posts.

The following facts illustrate some of the points mentioned above:—

(*a*) The scale of pay for Assistant and Deputy Conservators before the incremental scale was introduced commenced at Rs. 350 and went up to Rs. 900 per mensem. At the time this scale was introduced these sums represented £420 and £1,080 per annum. The pay of the newly appointed Assistant Conservator is now Rs. 380 rising to Rs. 1,250 corresponding at the present rate of exchange to £304 and £1,000 per annum. But from these sums there are deductions on account of income tax which were not imposed until about 1885. The pay now after deduction amounts to £296 and £974 respectively.

Thus the pay now given when measured in English money is actually less than was considered fair about 40 years ago.

(*b*) During the first 10 years of a Forest Officer's service his pay compares most unfavourably with that of other Departments. Very considerable discontent is felt by the junior members of the Service on this account, and not without reason. For instance, Mr. J. A. Baker, of the Public Works Department, who left Coopers Hill at the same time (1904) as Mr. P. S. Corbould, was officiating Executive Engineer on Rs. 700 in March, 1908, whereas Mr. P. S. Corbould was only drawing Rs. 500 and had been in charge of a Division for some time.

The explanation is that no officiating or charge allowance is given to Assistant or Deputy Conservators. Public Works Department men on an average officiate as Executive Engineers with four to five years' service; Indian Police officiate as District Superintendents of Police not uncommonly with two to three years' service. The latter at once draw, if first class Assistant, Rs. 700, and if second class Assistant Rs. 600 per mensem.

An Assistant Conservator may be put in charge of a Division after two to three years' service, sometimes even less. He gets no officiating allowance and cannot draw pay at Rs. 700 per mensem until the ninth year of his service.

(*c*) The present pay of the Administrative posts in the Forest Department is insufficient to enable the officers who hold them to maintain in the way they should their position as Heads of Departments either with Local Governments or with the Government of India.

Conservators are Heads of Departments. Their position corresponds closely to that of Commissioner of a Division. A Chief Conservator's position is presumably higher.

Yet at the present moment the writer of this note is serving in a district where the Deputy Commissioner (let alone the Commissioner of the Division) draws higher pay, not only than a first grade Conservator, but even than the Chief Conservator of the Province.

In view of the above we are of opinion that:—

(*1*) The average pay of all grades should be raised and brought closer to that received by members of the Indian Civil Service.

(*2*) To alleviate the very real grievance of junior members of the Department officiating allowances should be given to all Assistant Conservators in charge of Divisions.

(*3*) That by reason of the conditions of their service and the liberality of their education, Forest Officers should receive even more generous treatment than that afforded to the Public Works Department and Indian Police.

(*4*) That in the event of an incremental time scale of pay being introduced for Executive Officers of the Civil Service the pay of Executive Officers of the Forest Service should be fixed at not less than three-quarters of that scale.

The actual scale of pay based on existing conditions, now proposed by us, is as follows:—

(*1*) Assistant Conservators should begin on Rs. 400 per mensem rising by annual increments of Rs. 50 to Rs. 1,500 in the 23rd year, with the exception of officers not considered suitable for Conservators. These latter should not rise above Rs. 1,350 which would be reached in the 20th year of service.

(*2*) A qualified Assistant Conservator in charge of a Division should draw a charge allowance of one-fifth of the lowest pay of a Deputy Conservator in addition to his substantive pay provided the total does not exceed Rs. 700.

(*3*) There should be two grades of Conservators only, Rs. 1,750 and Rs. 2,000.

Chief Conservators should receive Rs. 2,500 rising by annual increments of Rs. 100 to Rs. 3,000.

The pay of the Inspector-General of Forests should be Rs. 3,000 rising by annual increments of Rs. 100 to Rs. 3,500.

66621. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—Here again the peculiar conditions of service should be recognised, *viz.*, that from the very nature of their duties officers of the Forest Department are apt to suffer more severely in health than those of other Departments, and treated accordingly.

The following improvements in the existing leave rules are urgently called for:—

(*i*) The minimum allowance for furlough and leave on medical certificate should follow the ratio adopted between Indian Civil Service and other Services for the maximum furlough allowance, *i.e.*, it should be £400 or the salary last drawn on duty whichever is less. The present allowance of £200 is quite inadequate and results in officers not taking leave when it would be better for them, as well as for Government, to do so. Similarly on furlough other than ordinary the minimum should be raised from £100 to £200.

(*ii*) There should be no limit to the accumulation of privilege leave. It should never be possible for an officer to lose any of the privilege leave he has earned by leave being refused to him, and in the event of such refusal he should undoubtedly be permitted to accumulate his privilege leave up to the time Government can see its way to permitting him to avail himself of it.

(*iii*) The restriction which lays down that an officer must have rendered eight years' active service before he can be granted furlough appears to serve no useful purpose. It would be greatly in the interests of the Service to permit officers to take furlough after four years' active service.

(*iv*) It should be permissible to commute long leave on half pay into shorter periods on full pay, with suitable restrictions.

(*v*) The rule that furlough cannot be taken until an interval of not less than 18 months has elapsed since last return from privilege leave of over six weeks' duration should be relaxed.

66622. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—It is strongly felt that the present pensions are totally inadequate, and require revision in the light of existing conditions. This matter has been for some time a very great grievance with Forest Officers. Numerous memorials have been submitted on the subject, the last of which have been withheld on the grounds that the matter would be taken up and considered by the Public Services Commission. We beg to represent that the Forest Department has very special claims to generous pensions on the following grounds:—

(*1*) The arduous and unhealthy conditions of service to which attention has already been drawn in paragraph 66619 (Conditions of Service). It was calculated about three years ago that the average length of service in the Forest Department (based on actuals of trained men, subjected to specially strict medical examination before admission) is only 22 years, and of these 30 per cent. died on active service.

(*2*) More than 40 years ago it was laid down that the ordinary limit of an uncovenanted pension was £500 or Rs. 5,000 at the then current rate of exchange. Since then the cost of living has increased enormously both in India and England. Yet the normal pension after 25 years' service is now calculated in English money, only £437 10s. or £62 10s. less than was considered reasonable 40 years ago.

(3) That on the present pensions it is impossible to live in comfort and to educate our children in a fitting manner. Forest Officers having no private means have a very hard task before them to make both ends meet on retirement.

(4) Under existing rules an officer of the Provincial Service, who serves for two years in the highest grade of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, can earn a pension of Rs. 5,000 per annum, that is to say, exactly the same pension as an Imperial Service Officer, other than the Inspector-General of Forests, Chief Conservator and Conservator who has put in 28 years' service. This is obviously not just.

(5) The relatively large number of retirements at an early age through ill health call for very generous invalid pensions under 20 years' service.

(6) It is not fair there should be one rate of pension for service from 15 to 19 years, another rate from 20 to 24 years, and a third rate for 25 years and above. For instance, a Forest Officer with 19 years' service gets a pension of Rs. 3,000, whereas officers of other Departments drawing pension under Article 474, Civil Service Regulations, get Rs. 3,800. There should be a graduated scale of pension for each year of service.

We therefore recommend a re-adjustment of the existing pension rules with a scale of pensions as under:—

(i) Pensions for the Imperial Service to be in sterling and not in rupees. This is absolutely essential.

(ii) Pensions to be on a graduated scale for each year of service.

(iii) The invidious distinction drawn against the Forest Department in paragraph 475, Civil Service Regulations, by which a Forest Officer must have completed 28 years' service if below the 1st grade of Conservators to qualify for an additional pension should be withdrawn.

Proposed scale of pension.

Years.	Invalid Pension.	Years.	Ordinary Pension.
10 ...	... £250	20 ...	... £500
11 ...	... 275	21 ...	... 520
12 ...	... 300	22 ...	... 540
13 ...	... 325	23 ...	... 560
14 ...	... 350	24 ...	... 580
15 ...	... 375	25 ...	... 600
16 ...	... 400	26 ...	... 620
17 ...	... 425	27 ...	... 640
18 ...	... 450	28 ...	... 660
19 ...	... 475	29 ...	... 680
		30 (or three years as Conservator) ...	700

Chief Conservators and President, Research Institute, £800, Inspector General of Forests £900.

The pension of officers not considered fit for Conservators not to exceed £600.

As the Government of India had decided that no orders upon memorials submitted by Forest Officers could be passed until the Public Services Commission had completed their enquiries and submitted their report, it is urged that in the case of all officers who retire subsequently to the date of the issue of the orders referred to and before the orders of Government on these recommendations are issued, retrospective effect should be given whereby such officers may receive the benefit of any enhanced pensions which may be granted.

66623. **(VII) Employment of non-Europeans and working of existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—We have nothing to add under this head to the remarks already made by Mr. Hill, Chief Conservator of Forests, in his Memorandum.

(Mr. Hill's remarks under this head were as follows:—

Entry to the Imperial Service is open to Indians under exactly the same conditions as to Europeans except with reference to marriage. No alterations appear to be necessary or advisable.

The existing system of dividing the service into Imperial and Provincial branches works satisfactorily and no alteration is required. On the whole, the members of the Provincial Service do the work given to them fairly satisfactorily; but any increase in the numbers of Provincial as compared with Imperial Officers must mean a loss of efficiency, since the course of training undergone by Imperial Officers in Europe is of a much higher standard than anything possible in India in the present state of scientific Forestry in the latter country.)

66624. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—We are in accord with the remarks made in Mr. Hill's Memorandum, but we would like to add that in our opinion a mistake was made when it was determined to call the District Forest Officer the "Assistant to the Deputy Commissioner." It would have been quite sufficient to state that in certain matters the Divisonal Forest Officer shall not act without consulting or without the assent of the District Officer.

It results sometimes in the anomalous position of an experienced Forest Officer of some 15 to 20 years' service finding himself as an Assistant to a very junior and inexperienced District Officer.

66625. **(IX) Other points.**—(*1*) The question of travelling allowance is a permanent source of grievance with Forest Officers. The rates fixed many years ago are no longer adequate. It must be remembered that the Forest Officer spends more time in camp (never less than six months of the year) and frequently longer than any other touring officer. That his work takes him to those parts of a district where the common amenities of life are the most difficult to procure, and that he frequently has to be out at the most trying and unseasonable times of the year. That whereas Public Works Department or Police Officer can often make a tour passing from one bungalow to another along a main road, a Forest Officer has practically always to take his tents, furniture, crockery, etc., along with him involving him in much greater expense. Taking into account the present cost of cart and camel transport, coolies, etc., we consider that the existing daily rate of Rs. 5 should be raised to Rs. 7, so as not to involve an officer in actual loss on his touring expenses. The existing rates for Administrative Officers should be raised in the same proportion. Assistant Conservators should be given the same rate as officers in charge of Divisions. At present Assistant Conservators draw Rs. 4 per day, while Assistant Commissioners draw Rs. 5, a distinction which is hardly fair.

The question of travelling allowance on transfer has frequently been brought up. It affects the officers of all Departments equally. It will hardly be necessary to go into details, but it should be recognised that officers should not be put to pecuniary loss when transferred in the interest of the Public Service.

(2) Free medical attendance should be provided for the wives and families of officers, as in the case of Military Officers.

(3) The creation of a Family Pension Fund on the principle of the scheme appertaining to the Indian Civil Service would be a source of great satisfaction to the Department. The existing Forest Officers' Provident Fund is not altogether suitable for family provision.

(4) The possibility of arranging for favourable passage rates to assist officers and their families when proceeding home on leave.

(5) It should be recognised that certain Forest Divisions are much more unhealthy than others and local allowances should be attached to them.

Supplementary Written Statement.

66626. In placing before the Public Services Commission this Supplementary Memorandum, I beg to refer the Commission to the introductory remarks made in my memorandum submitted on 15th October last, in which I pointed out that, owing to the hurried manner in which I had been called on to submit a memorandum, I had been unable to consult my brother officers and obtain their views and opinions.

I, therefore, desired to reserve to myself the right to modify or add to the opinions expressed in that memorandum after discussing matters with my brother officers. In accordance with the above, I now beg to place before the Commission the following amendments to the memorandum already submitted.

66627. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The general consensus of opinion is that recruitment should be by open competition without nomination.

66628. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The statement "The Indian Police still draw exchange compensation allowance, whereas the Forest Department do not" should read "that those members of the Indian Police who were appointed before 6th June, 1907, still draw exchange compensation allowance, whereas no members of the Forest Department do."

Junior members of the Service desire that special attention should be drawn to the insufficient pay which they receive during the first ten years of their service. Some instances have already been given. The grant of officiating allowances to all Assistant Conservators in charge of Divisions has been suggested. The opinion that "the average pay of all grades should be raised" shoull be amended to read:—"(1) The average pay of all grades, but more especially that of the lower grades, should be raised." The proposal that the salary of officers unfit for Conservators should not rise above Rs. 1,350 per mensem should be cancelled, no officers in these Provinces being in favour of this restriction.

66629. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The scale of pensions proposed from the 20th year of service onwards has not been favourably received by the majority of officers, who consider them inadequate. The general consensus of opinion is that ordinary pensions should not continue to increase after 25 years' service, thus bringing it into line with the regulations applicable to the Indian Civil Service. In consequence the following revised scale of ordinary pensions should be substituted for those already proposed:—

Years.	Pension.
	£
20	500
21	530
22	560
23	590
24	620
25	650

£100 extra for three years' service as Conservator of Forests irrespective of total length of service.

£800 for three years as Chief Conservator of Forests and President, Research Institute. £900 for Inspector-General.

The restriction that the pension of officers not considered fit for Conservators should not exceed £600 should be omitted.

66630. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—In connection with the remarks already made under this head the Forest Officers of the Central Provinces wish particularly to point out that, whereas they are aware that in other Provinces their brother officers frequently suffer considerably through the subordination of their authority to that of the District Officer, the same cannot be said to be the case in the Central Provinces, where the relations between the Forest Department and the Civil Service are most cordial. Personally, in 17 years' service I have never experienced anything but the greatest consideration in official dealings with the District Officer.

66631. **(IX) Other points.**—With regard to traveling allowance, the opinion is generally held that from the nature of a Forest Officer's duties he should be given a higher rate of travelling allowance than that granted to other Services.

That Assistant Conservators should only be given the same rate of travelling allowance as Deputy Conservators when in charge of a Division, but that in the event of higher rates of travelling allowance not being granted to the Department, an Assistant Conservator should not draw less travelling allowance than an Assistant Commissioner.

That provided improved pay and pension schemes are sanctioned, officers do not lay much stress on (1) Free medical attendance; (2) The grant of favourable passage rates.

MR. D. O. WITT called and examined.

66632. (*Chairman.*) The witness was a Deputy Conservator in the 18th year of his service. There were three Conservators and one Chief Conservator in the Central Provinces. Each circle in the Central Provinces was divided into seven or eight divisions.

66633. He recommended for recruitment to the Imperial Service a system of nomination, followed by competitive examination, at the school-leaving age. If a careful physical test was imposed along with the medical examination, he would then favour open competition.

66634. He had a preference for Oxford if it was decided that recruits should be trained at one residential University, as the arrangements there seemed to be better than elsewhere.

66635. The advantage of giving a recruit on first coming out to India a tour in the different Provinces was that he was liable later on in his service to be removed to other parts of India.

66636. He suggested that part of the period of probation should be allowed to count as service. It did count as service in other Departments. Of two men passing the same examination, one entering the Police Service and the other the Forestry Service, the former at once came to India and started earning salary, whereas the latter had to remain in training in England and spend nearly £800, and he received nothing in return. Any increase in the number of Provincial Service Officers as compared with Imperial Officers would mean a loss of efficiency in the Service. That assumption was based not only on the belief that the academic training in England was much superior to the training in India, but on considerations of character. It would be many years before the training in India could be raised to the level of the training in England.

66637. If it were desired to recruit Indians to the higher branches of the Service, he would be in favour of promotion from the Provincial Service. No definite proportion of vacancies to be filled by promotion should be laid down; it should be left to the discretion of Government to choose suitable men. He would not give any assurance to Indians that they would have an opportunity of getting into the Imperial Service. The conditions of Service in the Provincial Branch were extremely good. For instance, a senior Indian officer obtained more pension than an Imperial Officer. If a Provincial man was on Rs. 850 in the last years of his service, he could obtain Rs. 5,100 pension, whereas the pension of an Imperial Officer after 25 years' service was Rs. 5,000.

66638. As far as recruitment was concerned, whilst he was strong in his belief that Dehra Dun gave a very inferior training as compared with the University training in England, he would prefer to have in the Service a Dehra Dun trained Indian rather than an Indian trained in England, because an officer during his service in the Provincial Branch would be able to bring himself up to the standard of qualification for admission to the Imperial Service. The experience such a man would get in the Provincial Service would make up for any deficiency in his training.

66639. The discontent among the junior officers in regard to their pay chiefly arose from the fact that when they were given officiating appointments they were not given an acting allowance.

66640. He suggested an increase of cadre because officers at present found difficulty in obtaining leave on account of shortage of staff. There was room for a large expansion of the Forest Department in the Central Provinces. In certain cases the divisions were too large, and they would gradually have to be split up into smaller divisions. The revenue from forests in the Central Provinces had been on the increase during the last few years. The more the scientific branches of forestry were developed, the larger would be the revenue obtained from minor products.

66641. An officer should not be placed in charge of a division until he had been in the Service for at least two years. There were instances, however, where officers of under two years' service had been put in charge for short periods. That was very detrimental to efficiency.

66642. Very few officers in the Service exercised their option to retire at 20 years, but a large number had been obliged to retire on account of ill-health. Assuming that there was proper provision for invalid pensions, he would admit that 20 years was a short period. He thought his colleagues would be prepared to forego that privilege if satisfactory invalid pensions were granted. Of the 132 officers who were recruited between 1866 and 1890. 26 per cent. died on active service, 36 per cent. retired, 7 per cent. had resigned, and 30 per cent. were still in the Service.

66643. He advocated the institution of a Family Pension Fund, which should be managed by Government in the same way as the Indian Civil Service Fund was managed.

66644. He laid stress upon the importance of increasing travelling allowances. A Forest Officer had to spend at least six months on tour, he was always in unhealthy parts far removed from towns and villages where the necessaries of life were easily obtained, and on the present rates of allowances he was distinctly out of pocket.

66645. He desired to amend the statement that the General Provident Fund was not altogether suitable for family provision. Since the written statement had been sent in he had found that Provident Fund contributions might be applied to the payment of insurance premiums.

66646. (*Mr. Sly.*) With the reduction of the age limits and admission by competititon, he considered the period of probation should be three years. A certain amount of weight should be attached to a science degree.

66647. He agreed that the proposal to give Imperial Officers officiating allowances would practically mean that every Forest Officer after three years' service would get a charge allowance in

addition to his pay under the time scale. In the Central Provinces there had been many instances of quite junior men being put in charge of districts in the Public Works Department and Police Department. What junior Forest Officers in the Central Provinces asked for was a higher rate of pay, or for an allowance if they were put in charge of divisions.

66648. It was the case that a Forest Officer received an extra allowance when he constructed a working plan, but if a man was put on special duty to do working plans he did not receive an allowance. It was giving an officer too much work to do to ask him to run his division, and to make a working plan of the division at the same time. He did not think that was in the best interests of the State. It would be better to have more men in the Service, so as to be able to release officers for special duty on working plans.

66649. All the posts of Extra Deputy were not at present filled, but that was not the explanation of the complaint about the shortage of officers for leave. There were 14 major charges. On the 1st October, 1913, there were only 13 Imperial Officers qualified for holding those 14 posts.

66650. Only one of the present officers in the Provincial Service was fit for promotion into the Imperial Service.

66651. (*Mr. Fisher.*) His proposal as to unlimited accumulation of privilege leave might tend to make officers defer taking their leave unduly.

66652. Personally he had found the Provident Fund was adequate to his needs, but he did not think the Provident Fund was really more suitable to the conditions of his service than a Family Pension Fund.

66653. It was the general opinion of his colleagues that they should not receive less remuneration than three-quarters of what the Civil Service received, but he himself thought that this was putting their demands a little too high.

66654. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He suggested that a newly arrived recruit should have a tour of inspection of three months, in order that he should gain at once some idea of the great variety of conditions existing in India. It might be better to let a man take the tour after he had got familiar with the conditions in his own Province, but he himself did not think the matter was a very important one.

66655. If in the course of his work as a Forest Officer questions arose upon which he desired to have the assistance and advice of the Scientific Department, the channel through which he communicated was the Conservator of Forests, who communicated with the President of the Research Institute at Dehra Dun. If any particular line of investigation was started, orders were generally issued that the Research Officer at Dehra Dun should communicate direct with the officer in whose division the work was going on. This arrangement had worked very well.

(The witness withdrew.)

Rai Bahadur Srinivasalu Naidu, Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Forest Department.

A.—Imperial Forest Service.

66656. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The rules at present in force for the appointment of probationers for the Indian Forest Service practically exclude His Majesty's Indian subjects from that Service.

Rule 5 of the rules published in Government of India Circular, No. 21-F-280-2, dated the 18th October, 1912, states that the candidates must have obtained a degree with Honours in some branch of Natural Science or an examination of similar standard in any University of Great Britain.

Indian parents cannot, as a rule, afford to send their sons to England before their education in India is so far advanced as to admit of their being taken into the English Universities as Senior Students. As a graduate of an Indian University is given such admission, an Indian degree obtained in any of the Natural Sciences should be recognised as sufficient qualification for appointment to a probationership, provided the successful candidate obtains the Honours degree in some branch of Natural Science in the university of which he becomes a member in accordance with Rule 8 within two years, the period allowed him for obtaining a diplomacy in Forestry.

This rule was in force in 1911 and a graduate of the Bombay University (Mr. F. R. Madan) got the chance of entering the Imperial Service in the autumn of that year.

As the Honours degree in an English university is taken before the candidates come out to India, there can be no objection to this concession being made in favour of Indians.

Again, Rule 6 makes the holding of a competitive examination conditional on the number of applications received exceeding the number of appointments to be made. This uncertainty should be removed. The probationers should, as heretofore, be appointed by nominations in which the recommendations of the Local Government in India should receive adequate consideration, or invariably by means of competitive examination held simultaneously in India and England in good time before the terms begin.

The age limit should continue to be, as heretofore, 19 to 23 years. The lowering of this limit is likely to adversely affect the chances for Indians.

According to the educational system in India at the present day, a student who has a successful career right through cannot graduate before he is 20 to 21 years old, and about one year is required for preparation to appear for the competitive examination. The maximum limit of 23 years, therefore, does not give an excessive margin.

B.—Provincial Forest Service.

66657. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—The method of nomination for direct appointment is suitable for some time to come, as aptitude for forest work has to be carefully estimated in the candidates, but the minimum standard of educational qualifications should be raised to the obtaining of a certificate of having passed the F.A. or the Intermediate examination of any Indian university. In the case of Rangers specially recommended for direct appointment, whose number, however, should not exceed 25 per cent. of the yearly vacancies, their having obtained the Ranger's certificate in any of the Forest Colleges in India or Burma may be accepted as sufficient.

The examination prescribed in Rule 7 of the rules published in Central Provinces, Secretariat No. 98 —XIV-1-4, dated the 25th January, 1913, is by itself insufficient, and without some years of training in an Arts College a student will be unable to follow the advanced course of study in Forestry which will henceforth be taught in the Provincial Service Class.

66658. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—During the preliminary course of training a probatoner is introduced into Forestry and cognate sciences, and his aptitude for forest work is tested. It is important that this test should be thorough before Government is put to the expense of training him. One year's practical course should, therefore, be prescribed, while he should not undergo any further probation when he has obtained the diploma in Forestry at the Dehra Dun College. The Principal of the College is the best judge of the competency of a candidate in every respect. He has not only the opportunity of watching his career for two years but also has the advan-

tage of comparing his progress with that of several others. In the absence of vacancies a successful probationer could be appointed a supernumerary Extra-Assistant Conservator. This places the newly trained Provincial Service Officer on the same footing as the newly trained Imperial Service Officer. In the case of both the practice of not giving them independent charges till they have become acquainted with local conditions should be followed.

66659. **(IV) Conditions of Salary**—The minimum and maximum pay fixed by Government for the Provincial Forest Service is in conformity with those sanctioned for the sister services of Provincial Engineering, Provincial Executive and Judicial branches, etc., etc., for the regulation of promotion is not sufficiently liberal and presents striking disparities.

Firstly, the number of appointments (Extra-Deputy Conservatorships), the pay of which is fixed at Rs. 575 to Rs. 850, being limited, an officer could only get the highest rate of pay on the eve of his retirement on rendering 29 years' service, including the two years' probation. The Provincial Service Forest Officer is no less exposed to privation and causes that shorten life than the Imperial Service Forest Officer or even the Provincial Service Engineer, and it is not unreasonable, therefore, that once the Provincial Service cadre is fixed, the promotion should be regulated on the lines sanctioned for them. In the enclosed statement the present position as to promotion is compared with that now prayed for.

Secondly, an officer permanently appointed has now to be specially nervous of his fate four times during his service—once when he reaches a pay of Rs. 550 and has to ascend to Extra-Deputy Conservatorship; a second time when he reaches a pay of Rs. 650; a third time when he reaches a pay of Rs. 700, and the fourth time when he reaches the Rs. 800 stage, in addition to his being solicitous of rendering satisfaction at each annual step. These painful restrictions cannot but have a discouraging or even demoralising effect upon the members of the service They should, therefore, be removed. They are entirely redundant as Government is always at liberty to stop promotion to any officer at any stage.

Lastly, the members of the Provincial Forest Service are now entirely ruled out of administrative rank while there can be no objection to officers of conspicuous ability being admitted to it like the Provincial Service Engineers and officers of similar other services.

The Provincial Service Officers that have hitherto been deputed to Foreign Service and have had the opportunity of serving in administrative rank have vindicated their intrinsic worth and the valuable training they have received in British service which benefitted them for such employment.

Excluding the special appointments, such as the Inspector-General of Forests, the Chief Conservator of Forests and the President of the Research Institute, there are 21 Circle charges in the whole of India and Burma. Five appointments out of these should be set apart for the promotion of selected Provincial Service Officers, the gift being left in the hands of the Government of India based on the yearly recommendations made by the various local Governments. The salaries would be the same as those given to Superintending Engineers promoted from the Provincial Service, viz., Rs. 1,200, Rs. 1,400 and Rs. 1,600 respectively, for the three grades of Conservatorships.

This would amount to only one officer out of about 45 in the whole of India getting a chance of special promotion, but it would be a practical token of the liberal and generous policy of Government.

Travelling allowance is granted to facilitate the discharge of duties entrusted to officers, and so long as those duties are identical there should be no differentiation in the rates of travelling allowance whatever service the officer may belong to. The present rate of travelling allowance granted to the Provincial Service Officer is inadequate and it should be the same as that granted to the Imperial Service Officers.

66660. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The present long leave rules relating to Indian Services are not of much benefit to the Provincial Service Officers.

The initial waiting for 10 years or 16 years if leave on urgent private affairs happens to be taken, combined with the fear that a subsequent period of eight years must elapse before applying for any more furlough makes officers, as a rule, postpone taking furlough till very hard pressed by circumstances and even do without any furlough throughout the service. The object of Government, which is to maintain the efficiency of the Services by allowing their officers reasonable facilities to enjoy periods of relaxation from duty, is not hitherto adequately fulfilled.

The simplification of these rules is under the consideration of Government and it is hoped that for all Services these restrictions will be done away with and that leave to the extent of one-sixth of one's active service will be given at any time, subject of course to the exigencies of service and to certain necessary limitations as to periods of leave to be given each time and collectively during the whole of one's service.

66661. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The limit of 30 years' service for retirement fixed more than half a century ago is proving too long for any branch of the Indian Services. It operates particularly hardly on the Forest Service, the members of which, owing to exposure to malaria and adverse climatic conditions, become shortlived. It is, therefore, urged that the age limit for retirement should be reduced to 25 years.

If the comparative longevity of Europeans and Indians is given due consideration Provincial Service Officers richly deserve being treated exactly on the same lines as Imperial Service Officers, the amount of pension at each step being reckoned at two-thirds of that sanctioned for the Imperial Service Officers. Officers who have shown special energy and efficiency during an effective service of three years as Extra Deputy Conservators or Conservators should be entitled to an additional pension of two-thirds of Rs. 1,000 per annum as in the case of Imperial Service Officers, at the discretion of the Government of India.

66662. **(VII) Such limitation as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—There are no limitations levied in the employment of non-Europeans but the disabilities represented above will have the effect of practically keeping out Indians from the Imperial Service and administrative rank which is probably not the intention of Government.

Owing to the difference in the initial training and the scope of pay and promotion the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial branches is probably a necessary measure, but the division is too rigid and the Provincial Service is stamped with the ban of inferiority to an undue extent and treated altogether like a disjointed member instead of its being allowed to exist like the branch of a great tree.

Forestry is essentially a science which is mastered in the field for which one's initial training is but an introduction. With the careful training received at the hands of experts, specially chosen for their ability in the Dehra Dun College, and of equally skilful Conservators thereafter, a considerable number of Provincial Service Officers become so proficient and useful to Government that they cannot be said to be much behind their senior brothers in the Imperial Service. If, therefore, a few of the deserving Provincial Service Officers are raised to the administrative rank they form the tissues which fuse the branch into the main stem and the Service would at once rise, not unjustly, in public estimation.

There is yet another measure commended for consideration. It is the abolition of the unsavoury

prefix "Extra" in the nomenclature adopted for the members of the Provincial Service. It proclaims the ban even to people who want to know nothing about it, while the distinction could be of interest only to the account department.

66663. **(VIII) Relations of the Services with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The ill-effects of the rigidity of the division of the Forest Services into Imperial and Provincial described above, are naturally accentuated in the treatment received from services outside the Forest Department.

Statement comparing the present and proposed position of promotion to Provincial Service Forest Officers (vide paragraph 66659).

Year.	Existing position.	Proposed position.
	Rs.	Rs.
Period of probation ...	Two years after passing ...	*Nil.*
1st ...	Extra Assistant Conservator ... 250	Assistant Conservator ... 250
2nd ...	Do. ... 270	Do. ... 275
3rd ...	Do. ... 290	Do. ... 300
4th ...	Do. ... 310	Do. ... 325
5th ...	Do. ... 330	Do. ... 350
6th ...	Do. ... 350	Do. ... 375
7th ...	Do. ... 370	Do. ... 400
8th ...	Do. ... 390	Do. ... 425
9th ...	Do. ... 410	Do. ... 450
10th ...	Do. ... 430	Do. ... 475
11th ...	Do. ... 450	Deputy Conservator ... 535
12th ...	Do. ... 470	Do. ... 570
13th ...	Do. ... 490	Do. ... 605
14th ...	Do. ... 510	Do. ... 640
15th ...	Extra Assistant Conservator ... 530	Deputy Conservator ... 675
16th ...	Do. ... 550	Do. ... 710
17th ...	Extra Deputy Conservator ... 575	Do. ... 745
18th ...	Do. ... 600	Do. ... 780
19th ...	Do. ... 625	Do. ... 815
20th ...	Do. ... 650	Do. ... 850
21st ...	Do. ... 700	Promotion to administrative rank only to officers of exceptional merit
22nd ... 23rd ... 24th ... 25th ...	Do. ... 800	
26th ... 27th ... 28th ... 29th ...	Do. ... 850	
30th ...	Retirement.	Retirement.

RAI BAHADUR SRINIVASALU NAIDU called and examined.

66664. (*Chairman.*) The witness was an Extra Deputy Conservator with 23 years' service. He had been recruited direct to the Provincial Service from Dehra Dun.

66665. He recommended that Indians should be eligible for the Imperial Service on the strength of having obtained an Indian degree in Natural Science. In addition to that he would suggest a physical test. The reason he put forward the first suggestion was that the rules now required that candidates should be graduates of an English University. That rule completely shut out Indians.

66666. All Indian candidates who had taken their degree in Natural Science in India should be sent to England, and should undergo the same course of training as the European probationers.

66667. He would also promote men from the Provincial Service.

66668. Not more than 25 per cent. of the posts in the Provincial Service should be given to Rangers, because the course now instituted at Dehra Dun for a Provincial recruit was of a very much higher standard than the course taken by Rangers. He would improve the prospects of the Ranger class as compensation for non-promotion to the Provincial Service.

66669. Six mnths was a sufficient period in which to find out whether a young officer was suitable for the Service. He had recommended a period of one year as a substitute for the six months now spent before going to Dehra and the three years after the completion of the Dehra Dun course. He considered that no probation was necessary after passing out from Dehra Dun. If the period after a man was trained was the time for testing whether he was going to be an efficient officer or not, it should be limited to one year. Three years' probation was too long, and he would himself prefer that the whole period of probation after passing out of a college should be abolished.

66670. Officers of the Provincial Service were entirely ruled out of administrative rank. It was not the fact that Government had any discretion in the matter. Five out of the 21 circle charges in the whole of India and Burma should be reserved for selected Provincial Officers. He agreed that at present most of the officers in the Provincial Service were those who started as Rangers, but there were others who started as gazetted officers, and who had rendered excellent service. There as at present a sufficient number of Provincial Officers to fill five circle appointments.

66671. Owing to differences in training, and also in conditions of pay and promotion, the division between the two branches of the Service must remain, but it need only do so in a modified form. The present division engendered silent antipathy. Both branches rendered the same services to Government, and there ought therefore to be one common list. He did not think that if there was one list his colleagues would in a very short time be making the same complaints as officers in the Public Works Department, as the conditions of the two Services were slightly different.

66672. If invidious distinctions were removed, and an extra allowance were given to the European in virtue of his serving away from his own country, he thought his colleagues would be satisfied.

66673. Twenty-five years was a sufficiently long period for an Indian to serve in the Forest Department, in view of the arduous nature of the Service. He knew of a few instances where officers were suffering from physical afflictions on account of the hard work.

66674. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) When he put in the claim on bealf of the candidate with an Indian Natural Science degree, it was not because he attached very much value to the usefulness of that degree for the work to be done in the Forest Department, but simply in order to place the Indian and European on an equal footing.

66675. (*Mr. Madge.*) There was a good deal in the ordinary Arts course which was very useful for forestry work.

66676. He desired to press the claim that the best Provincial men should be promoted to the administrative ranks.

66677. (*Mr. Sly.*) He had been to Europe on study leave, and he had found it a valuable training. He would like a system of study leave for all the Provincial Officers. He would also submit that in view of the small pay given to the Provincial Service, liberal consideration should be given them in the matter of allowances when on study leave.

66678. For both Indians and Europeans he considered a system of nomination in India necessary, provided the candidates had the required University qualification.

(The witness withdrew.)

At the India Office, London, Monday, 4th May, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. } *Joint Secretaries.*
R. R. SCOTT, Esq. }

F. C. DRAKE, Esq., Secretary, Revenue and Statistics Department, India Office.

Written Statements relating to the Indian Forest Service.

(*1*) *Extract from a Memorandum on appointments made by the Secretary of State for India in Council.*

66679. The Selection Committee has since 1910 consisted of (i) a representative of the Secretary of State; (ii) the Director of Indian Forest Studies; (iii) a person appointed by the Secretary of State who is not connected with the India Office; (iv) a person nominated by the Government of India. The Committee has been composed as follows:—

1911 and 1912.
(i) Sir James La Touche, K.C.S.I., Member of the Council of India.
(ii) Mr. A. M. Caccia, M.V.O.
(iii) Sir E. Stafford Howard, K.C.B., Commissioner of Woods and Forests.
(iv) Sir S. H. Eardley Wilmot, K.C.I.E., late Inspector-General of Forests in India.

1913.
(i) Sir James La Touche, K.C.S.I.
(ii) Mr. A. M. Caccia, M.V.O.
(iii) Mr. T. H. Middleton, C.B., Assistant Secretary, Board of Agriculture and Fisheries.
(iv) Mr. F. Beadon Bryant, C.S.I., late Inspector-General of Forests in India.

Only holders of a University degree with Honours in Natural Science, or equivalent degree, are admitted as candidates to appear before the Selection Committee. The regulations provide that "should there be more candidates considered to be qualified in every respect than vacancies to be filled, the Secretary of State reserves the right to require them to pass a competitive examination conducted by the Civil Service Commissioners, on the results of which their final selection would depend." Up to the present no competitive examination has been held.

(*2*) *Supplementary Note by Mr. Drake on selection of probationers for the Indian Forest Service.*

66680. *A.—Method of Selection.*—(*1*) Between the years 1867 and 1904 forest probationers were selected by a competitive examination. Up to 1890 the examination was held in science subjects, the age limits being 17 to 21 years. In 1891, the examination was reorganised so as to correspond generally with the Indian Police and the Sandhurst examinations (with which at a later period it was amalgamated), and so ceased to be exclusively a science examination; the maximum age was reduced to 20 years. Up to 1884 the probationers went to the Continent for a 2½ years' training*; from 1885 to 1890 they had rather over two years' training at Coopers Hill College and on the Continent; after 1891 the training at Coopers Hill and abroad was extended to nearly three years.

* The examinations were at that time usually held in November or January.

66681. The year 1891 therefore marks an important change, namely, the abandonment of the idea of recruiting (at about the school age) candidates with training in the elements of science. The occasion of the change was a dearth of candidates during the years 1887, 1888, and 1889, in each of which it was found impossible to secure ten or twelve candidates, all of whom could pass the—not very exacting—standard of qualification in the examination. The chief reason for this difficulty was no doubt the insufficient pay of the Service—which was accordingly improved—but other reasons may have existed, and the change was made with the view of widening the field of selection by taking in other than science students, with the necessary corollary of an extended period of probationary training.

(*2*) The Secretary of State for India in Council decided in 1905, on the closing of Coopers Hill College, that as an experimental measure, subject to reconsideration after three years, the forest probationers should be obtained by open competition among candidates between the ages of 18 and 21 who had passed Responsions at Oxford, or an equivalent examination elsewhere, the subjects of the competitive examination being mechanics and physics, chemistry, zoology, and botany; and that they should be trained at Oxford and on the Continent, the length of the course being three years as before. Oxford was selected as the place of training in the United Kingdom on the recommendation of Dr. Schlich, the Professor of Forestry at Coopers Hill.

(*3*) The Regulations for the recruitment of 1905, as first issued, were based on the above scheme. Certain modifications were subsequently introduced, namely, candidates who had not yet passed Responsions, or an equivalent, were to be admitted to the competition on giving an undertaking that they would do so by October, 1905; and zoology was made an optional subject. Further, the date for receipt of applications was postponed for one month. There were 13 vacancies; only four candidates applied; and of these only two passed the examination. There remained 11 vacancies, which it was decided to fill by means of selection. This was done, 28 candidates being obtained by sending circulars to the Universities of the United Kingdom.

66682. The Regulations for 1906 were practically the same as the revised Regulations of 1905, with the omission of zoology from the list of subjects for the competitive examination. Nineteen vacancies were advertised and the regulations were widely distributed, but only two candidates offered themselves, of whom one passed the examination. As in 1905, a Selection Committee was appointed to fill the 18 remaining vacancies, together with five vacant posts in the Colonies, 23 in all. An advertisement was issued, applications were received from 40 candidates, and 13 vacancies were with difficulty filled. Shortly after this, the University of Oxford waived the requirement of passing Responsions in the case of candidates for the

Oxford Diploma in Forestry who had been appointed probationers for the Indian Forest Service, provided that such candidates had received a good general education; and in response to a second advertisement issued on these lines 19 candidates offered themselves, and from this and the former list the remaining 10 vacancies were filled.

66683. For the Regulations of 1907 and 1908 the following changes were introduced, as a temporary measure, pending the reconsideration of the whole matter which had been promised by the Secretary of State:—the attempt to obtain candidates for a competitive examination was dropped, selection by a Committee being substituted; the maximum age limit was raised from 21 to 22, and the necessary qualifications were stated as "a good general education, and, if possible, a knowledge of chemistry and of mechanics and physics." As the result of these changes, 63 candidates offered themselves in 1907 for 22 vacancies in response to advertisement; and 21 vacancies were filled, but with some difficulty, as many of the candidates were entirely unsuitable, or withdrew. In 1908, 76 applications were received, for 19 vacancies, and 19 appointments were made.

66684. (*4*) To sum up, before 1908 four periods may be distinguished—

(*a*) *1867 to 1890.*—Competitive examination in science subjects. Training, from 1885 onwards, at Coopers Hill.

(*b*) *1891 to 1904.*—Competitive examination. Subjects, those commonly taught in public schools and secondary schools throughout the country. Specialisation after selection, the candidates selected being men with a satisfactory general education. Training at Coopers Hill, at a cost to the candidates of about £550 for the three years. The number of candidates was usually double the number of appointments.

(*c*) *1905–6.*—Abolition of Coopers Hill. Opportunity is taken to substitute a highly specialised examination in order to get recruits already trained to some extent. The experiment was made. Result :—

1905, 13 vacancies, 4 candidates, 2 appointed.
1906, 24 vacancies, 2 candidates, 1 appointed.

(*d*) *1905–8.*—In 1905 and 1906, selection necessary to make up deficiencies of competition. In 1907 and 1908, selection adopted as temporary system. Result :—

1905, 11 vacancies, 28 candidates, 11 appointed.
1906, 23 vacancies, 59 candidates, 23 appointed.
1907, 22 vacancies, 63 candidates, 21 appointed.
1908, 19 vacancies, 76 candidates, 19 appointed.

66685. (*5*) In 1908 the systems of selecting and of training probationers were reconsidered, in accordance with the undertaking referred to in paragraph 1 above, by a committee under the chairmanship of Mr. (now Sir R.) Munro Ferguson. The Committee recommended that candidates should appear before a Board of Inquiry, with a view to the elimination of those falling below the standard in respect of physique or character; that preference should be given to candidates possessing a degree or diploma in forestry or a degree in science; and that if the number of candidates satisfying the Board of Inquiry exceeded the number of vacancies, a competitive examination should be held among the approved candidates to determine the selection of probationers.

66686. (*6*) The Regulations for 1909 and later years were based generally on these proposals, and contained provisions to the following effect :—

(i) Two classes of candidates were provided for, viz., if those with an Honours degree in Natural Science (it was decided not for the present to accept a Forestry diploma as a special qualification), and those without a degree but possessing "good general education." The former were given preference, but it was not until 1911 that they applied in sufficient numbers to fill the vacancies and to render unnecessary the appointment of candidates with the lower qualifications. In the Regulations for 1912 the distinction was abolished, all candidates being required to have an Honours degree, or equivalent degree, in Natural Science.

(ii) A Selection Committee examines the applications, and the Secretary of State reserves the right to require candidates to sit for a competitive examination if the number of candidates considered by the Committee to be qualified in every respect exceeds the number of vacancies. Arrangements for holding such examination, if required, have been made with the Civil Service Commissioners, but no examination has up to now been held.

66687. (*7*) I submit the following conclusions :—

(*a*) Competitive examination of candidates at the school-leaving age, in the subjects of general education, worked fairly satisfactorily as a means of recruiting probationers to be trained at Coopers Hill; when, after the closing of Coopers Hill, the examination was confined to science subjects in 1905 and 1906 it failed altogether to secure candidates. This may have been partly due to the fact that the Oxford authorities at that time insisted on the requirement that probationers should have passed Responsions, or an equivalent, involving a knowledge of Greek.

(*b*) On the question whether probationers should be recruited at the school-leaving age or the University leaving age, there are the following considerations :—

(i) Schoolboys would need a three years' probation in forestry, unless the standard of training hitherto accepted were lowered.

(ii) There would be more risk of getting unsatisfactory men if the probationers were selected at the less mature age, and the need for supervision of their studies would be such as to necessitate their being trained together at one centre.

(iii) The three years' course would entail larger expenditure in probationers' allowances from Indian revenues.

(iv) The only argument in favour of the school-leaving age is that it might enable the probationers to go to India a year earlier. This is examined in the next paragraph.

(*c*) The present maximum age limit—22 on the 1st January (*i.e.*, about 22½ at the time of selection)—is designed to catch men just three years after their leaving school, this being the time required for taking their degree. An increasing number of the candidates who come up have already taken a forestry degree or diploma besides the Honours Science degree. For such probationers one year of probation should be ample, to enable them to comply with purely Indian requirements. Therefore, by selecting candidates at the school-leaving age* and putting them through a three years' course, only one year could ordinarily be gained in their age on arrival in India; and this only if none but candidates who have *just* left school were accepted, with a maximum age limit of 19 on the 1st January in the year of competition.

66688. In the case of the probationers who have gone out in the last three years (excluding six men who for exceptional reasons had been kept in this country for an extra year) the mean of the ages on arrival in India was 24 years, the oldest being 25 years and 10 months (after 3 years' probation) and the youngest 21½ years. All these had at least two years' probation after their selection. As has been remarked there is reason for holding that in future one year of probation will be sufficient, in respect of the increasing number of candidates who have already taken a degree or diploma in Forestry.

66689. Of the 18 candidates who presented themselves in 1913 (all with Honours degrees in Science) the ages ranged from 21 to 22½ years on the 1st July in that year. In eight cases, including three of the men appointed, the age did not exceed 22 years. Under present regulations, therefore, if the probation can be reduced to one year, the men can

* N.B.—By "school-leaving age" I mean the age at which boys in the highest forms, who stay on to work for scholarships, leave school. Since it is our object to get the best material, it cannot be desirable to take boys who either are not of this class or who have, in order to get an appointment, sacrificed the last and most valuable year of their school career.

arrive in India at an average age not exceeding 23 years.

66690. *B.—Training.*—(*1*) On the details of the training of probationers I do not offer remarks, as these are matters for the Director of Indian Forest Studies. It may, however, be convenient to summarise the facts as to the action of the India Office regarding the centres at which the training is conducted.

On the closing of Coopers Hill in 1905, Oxford was selected as the place of training in the United Kingdom, on the recommendation of Sir William Schlich, and the Regulations, up to and including those for 1911, provided that probationers would be required to obtain the Oxford Diploma in Forestry. This provision was from the first stated to be subject to reconsideration, and in 1911 orders were passed allowing probationers to be trained at any University possessing a Forestry School approved for that purpose by the Secretary of State in Council. As a result of this it was decided that the payments made to Oxford University in respect of the Forestry School, that had been made since 1905, amounting to £395 a year, should be discontinued after the year 1913.

Cambridge and Edinburgh were invited to furnish evidence that their course was a suitable one; and Cambridge made arrangements that met with approval. Edinburgh, where the course for the Forestry degree takes three years, has for that reason not been able to comply with the requirements in the same way, and there is no question of sending probationers, having no forestry training, to spend their probationary period at Edinburgh; but the Secretary of State has made arrangements that will admit of the selection of Edinburgh Forestry graduates, who have also taken part of the final examination for the degree in Pure Science.

66691. (*2*) Of the probationers selected in the last three years (five in each year) two went to Cambridge for their probationary period in 1911, three in 1912, and one in 1913. The rest went to Oxford. Of the 18 qualified candidates who came forward in 1913, 11 had taken their degree at Oxford, three at Cambridge, one at Bangor, one at Bristol, one at Edinburgh, and one at University College, Dublin. It seems probable that, under the arrangement just noted, the number of candidates from Edinburgh will be higher in future.

66692. (*3*) The Secretary of State has thus advanced some way in the direction of availing himself of all the high grade forestry teaching that has been established in this country in recent years. Ultimately it may perhaps be possible to appoint Forest Officers, as the result of a competitive examination in Forestry, with a short probationary course following selection. It would seem a retrograde step to revert to the Coopers Hill plan of a State subsidised school for the training of Indian forest probationers, whether at Oxford or elsewhere; except in the event of the establishment in this country of a Central Forestry School that would take the place of the Universities in this respect. But there is, I understand, not the slightest prospect at present of such a school being established. The only thing that is being done is to develop the School in the Forest of Dean, which has hitherto trained woodmen only, so that it may supply part of the practical training of high class foresters, in place of part of their practical training in Germany. There is no idea of turning it into a school that would offer the teaching now obtainable at the Universities.

Mr. F. C. Drake, called and examined.

66693. (*Chairman.*) The witness was secretary in the Revenue and Statistics Department of the India Office. In that capacity he was a member of the Committee of Selection for many Services, and was also concerned with the selection of candidates for other Services for which no formal Selection Committee had been constituted. In filling vacancies in the Factory and Mines Department, the India Office had usually endeavoured to obtain men from the Home Office inspection staff, as it was considered that the Government of India wanted men who had had experience of inspection in this country, and selections were usually made with the advice of an officer on leave from India. It was very important in making selections to have the advice of someone with Indian experience.

66694. The witness put in a return relating to the Agricultural, Veterinary, and Geological Services,* showing the number of appointments made to those Services and the proportion of European to non-European candidates. Only three or four appointments had been made to the Mines Department and to the Factory Department. No Indian had been appointed to the Veterinary Department, and so far as he knew, no Indian had ever applied for appointment.

66695. In the selection of candidates for the Geological Department, as for other Departments, an attempt was always made to obtain the advice of an expert who was not connected with India as well as of one connected with India.

66696. Candidates for the Veterinary Department were interviewed by Colonel Queripel. The number of vacancies was very limited, and Colonel Queripel's practice was to keep in touch with Sir John McFadyean, the Principal of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons in London, who knew all the good men likely to come forward. Colonel Queripel had a knowledge of India, as he was Inspector-General of the Department a good many years ago, but he had no recent experience of Indian conditions.

66697. The witness had no suggestions to make for the improvement of the machinery of selection. He had been trying to improve the system during the last year or two, and he thought it had become more systematised. They required on the one hand an independent expert, with an intimate knowledge of the conditions governing the supply of candidates in Great Britain, and on the other, a man who had actual experience of the Department in India. It was of value to have up-to-date experience, and that experience was not at present available in connection with the Veterinary Department.

66698. There was no Selection Committee for the Agricultural Department, but of recent years Mr. Middleton, of the Board of Agriculture, had been asked to go through the applications, and when possible an officer of the Agricultural Service on leave was called in to advise. Last year Mr. Coventry, the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India, assisted in the selection of candidates. There were two agricultural posts to be filled in the course of a month or two, and it would be necessary then to ascertain whether there was a member of the Agricultural Department in England; if not, no doubt Sir Edward Maclagan, who had been Secretary of the Revenue Department, would help.

66699. There were two chains of communication between the India Office and the various institutions from which candidates were obtained for the Agricultural Department. In the first place, advertisements were put in all papers that were thought of value for the purpose, but that resulted in obtaining very few good candidates. In the second place, a notice was sent round to the heads of colleges and institutions asking them to bring the matter to the notice of their men, and if they knew of any good men to send up their names. Even that was very disappointing, as professors seemed to pay little attention to the notice. As a rule application was made to the Professor of Agriculture or the Professor of Botany as well as to the head of the college. The letter sent out was always couched in more or less conversational

* This return will be found in the Notes at the end of the Minutes of Evidence relating to the Agricultural, Veterinary and Geological Services (Volumes XV and XVIII).

form; it was not a printed circular, but a letter explaining that a vacancy was available, and asking them to be good enough to assist the Secretary of State if they knew of any candidates. The letter practically constituted the professors and principals agents of the Department. It might be that there were no candidates forthcoming, but he could not help feeling that more might be done. A list was kept of applicants and their qualifications, so that when a request was received from the Government of India for a specialist in any branch of agriculture the list could be immediately referred to, but the appointment would not be made without advertising afresh.

66700. With regard to the Forest Service, an increasing number of candidates now had a diploma in Forestry. At Oxford, where the diploma involved a considerable amount of practical work, the men who came up with a view to becoming probationers would not actually have taken the diploma, but would have only taken the two years theoretical work. They missed the practical work necessary for the diploma, thinking that as they would have to do the practical work in their probation it was not worth while doing it at their own expense, at a cost of something like £70. At Edinburgh the students were given a good deal of time on the Continent, but much of that time was spent in attending lectures given by a German forest officer, who lectured in English. The same remark would apply more or less to Cambridge. The course for the diploma lasted three years at Edinburgh and two years at Oxford and Cambridge.

66701. With regard to the age of candidates, he had worked out the figures for the men who had gone out to India during the last three years—a great number of whom had undergone a three-years' probationership after taking their degree—and he found that the average age was almost exactly 24. In any case, two years was the maximum now for men with a science degree, so that it might be reckoned that the average age in future would be 23½, and if men could be obtained with one year's probation it certainly ought not to exceed 23.

66702. The reason for insisting on a science degree was that it was desired to cut down the period of probation. Formerly, and as would be the case again if selection were made at the schoolboy age, it was necessary to give probationers a three-years' training. Sir William Schlich had said that if a man came up with a pretty good knowledge of botany, chemistry, or some other science, he could do the work in two years. The present regulations certainly resulted in getting very good men, who had come out well at the university, and who were old enough to know their own minds and competent to select their career. If a man in his three years at the university had taken not only his degree but also his forestry diploma, as would be the case in a great many instances, it was all to the good, as he could be sent out to India at the age of 23.

66703. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The field open to a man who had studied forestry was not a very large one outside India, and yet a considerable number of men went up to Oxford, and most of them obtained forestry appointments elsewhere. The number of candidates undergoing a forestry course at Oxford last year was something like 40, out of which not more than 10 were destined for India.

66704. The selection of candidates was not restricted to men who had taken the diploma in forestry: it was only restricted to men who had taken an honours degree in some subject of natural science. He would not himself suggest any restriction to men who had taken a diploma, but he would give them preference. His real objection to a schoolboy examination was the expense of training the candidate. Also, if schoolboys were selected they would have to be sent to a place where they would be under proper supervision, and that would involve the establishment of one central school. It would be necessary to establish and endow a school somewhere or other, possibly at Oxford. It would be no doubt within the realms of possibility to have a schoolboy examination with a condition that the boys should take their diploma at one of the three universities, under the direction of the Director of Forest Studies, but the supervision would be inadequate, and it could confidently be anticipated that there would be a number of failures.

66705. A large number of people now took their diploma without the prospect of going out to India. At Edinburgh a good number of men took up forestry with a view to obtaining employment on estates in Scotland.

66706. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He did not wish to make a definite complaint that it was difficult to interest people connected with universities or agricultural institutions in Great Britain in the selection of candidates, as he believed it was simply an oversight on their part. He felt quite sure that some of the people circularised had a knowledge of the extremely interesting wor kdone by the Agricultural Service in India. For instance, the Professor of Agriculture at Edinburgh, Professor Wallace, was intimately acquainted with the conditions of Indian agriculture. The real reason why candidates were not available might be that Professors and Principals did not keep very closely in touch with a great many of their men after they had left the colleges.

66707. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) When Indian candidates applied they were always considered with the other candidates, but no special steps were taken to secure Indian candidates for any of the Services. No advertisement was issued specially with a view to obtaining Indian candidates, and no request for Indian candidates was made to the heads of the universities and colleges. Indian students coming to England generally applied to the secretary of the Indian Students Department, and from him would obtain full information as to the various Services open to them. So far as he was concerned, no advice was given to any Indian students to study for particular Services. Indians had every facility for studying forestry in England, either at Oxford or Cambridge or Edinburgh, and could obtain facilities for practical work.

66708. He could not remember any Indian candidates who had come up for the Veterinary Department, and did not believe that Indians came to any of the veterinary colleges in Great Britain. As regards the Agricultural Department, one Indian had been appointed last year, and a few applications from Indians had come in. There were two applicants last year, and for two vacancies which would soon occur one of last year's men had applied again. There were very few Indian applicants for the Forest Service, but one Indian Forest Officer was appointed about two years ago.

66709. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness said he was not a member of the Selection Committee for the Forest Department.

66710. (*Mr. Sly.*) He could not say why the physical test which used to be in force for candidates for the Forest Department was abolished, but it was a test of absolutely no value; it depended more on whether a man had a good pair of boots than anything else. Candidates were taken out for a 20 miles run in one day, and if a man happened to be off colour on that day he came in late. He could only explain the evidence in India in favour of the test by saying that as people grew old they always looked back with favour upon the things of their youth, but it did not seem to him a reasonable and sensible way of finding out a man's physical condition. It was much better to see if he had been in the Rugby team of his school or prominent in the school sports.

66711. He thought that a probationer for the Forest Department who had obtained a science degree at a university and a diploma in forestry, and had subsequently undergone one year's probation, could get out to India about the age of 23½. The usual course now was for men to take the degree and the diploma in three years after leaving school, and the ordinary age of leaving school was between 18 and 19. Taking the average age of entrance to the university as nearly 19, and adding three years, with a further year for probation,

made the age 23. The men who went up to Oxford went up in October, and as they went out to India in November they would go out just about the age of 23. It might be true that the statistics for Oxford showed that only two out of six students taking the diploma of forestry last year were 22 years of age or less, and that the year before only three out of 12 were 22 years of age or less, but one or two candidates were obtained last year under the new arrangement with Edinburgh, and he quite anticipated there would be several men this year with the Edinburgh forestry degree. He did not think the scheme suggested by him would restrict recruitment to Edinburgh men.

66712. A man could take the theoretical course at Oxford and postpone his practical course. The practical course at present consisted of about six months altogether, spent in Germany; two months in the first long vacation, a month at Christmas, a month at Easter, and two months in the last vacation. He thought they would usually take it with Mr. Caccia, the Director of Indian Forest Studies.

66713. If a man had a full theoretical training he could certainly take his practical training in one year. The full theoretical training for the diploma of forestry at Oxford was adequate for the Indian Forest Service, and was the qualification actually taken. In addition, one or two Indian subjects were required, but those could be taken up in the probationary year.

66714. With regard to his objection to recruitment at the school-leaving age on the ground of increase of cost, the probationer's allowance at present was £120 a year. He was not aware that there was a monetary advantage in getting candidates out to India at an earlier age.

66715. With regard to the Agricultural Service, Mr. Middleton was not nominated by the Board of Agriculture, but was personally asked to advise. He did not think that the Agricultural Service occasionally missed very good men who had applied for service in India but who had been unable to obtain an appointment on account of there being no vacancy. The vacancies occurred fairly regularly once or twice a year. It was conceivable that a good botanist who might be willing to go out to India could not do so owing to no post being available for some years, but his experience did not confirm that. Irregularity of recruitment was, however, a distinct factor in decreasing the number of candidates. When the Department became larger, as it would no doubt do in course of time, and the number of vacancies was sufficient to justify a regular rate of recruitment, it would undoubtedly be easier to obtain candidates. He did not think any proposal had ever been made for a regular rate of recruitment to the Agricultural Service up to the present.

66716. The only case in which a gentleman employed to assist in the selection of candidates was paid a fee was the case of Colonel Queripel, who, under an old standing arrangement, received a fee in respect of each candidate selected.

66717. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The change made in the standard of the competitive examination for the Forest Department, owing to the dearth of candidates, was not a change from a higher standard to a lower; it was a change from an examination in science to an examination in general education. The standard of education in science required for the examination did not give a sufficient number of candidates, and therefore a standard of general education was introduced.

66718. The technical scientific knowledge required for the purposes of the Indian Forest Service no doubt could be as easily acquired in India as in England, but there were no facilities for teaching the higher branches of forestry in India. Possibly, forestry might be introduced as a subject of study in some of the existing institutions in India, but he could not say that practical experience in India was more valuable for an officer who was going to serve in India than practical experience in Europe. The opinion of Forest Officers who had spoken to him on the subject was that practical experience in Germany was essential for a high-class Forest Officer. The matter had been discussed at very great length during the last few years, and it was said that the Indian forests had not been attended to for a sufficient length of time to make it possible to obtain the education from them that could be obtained from German forests, which had been under management for hundreds of years. It was, however, a point on which he hardly felt competent to give an opinion. He did not think it was possible to obtain men trained in India who would turn out quite as capable officers as the officers turned out under the present system. In the first place, there was no staff available competent to teach forestry in India; the only possible staff were the Dehra Dun professors, who were expert laboratory officers, advisors to the Government, and it had been established in the course of discussions that those officers could not duplicate the work of training Forest Officers *ab initio* and, at the same time, carry on their advisory work.

66719. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) He did not wish to put forward the present system of selection as perfect, but it was as perfect as they had at present been able to devise. The India Office would welcome any suggestions that would give them a selective system above suspicion, but he thought that requirements in this respect were already met by the arrangements in force for the publication of vacancies. The vacancies were usually advertised in about three issues of several daily papers, and, if time permitted, in three issues of several of the more important technical journals, though he did not think advertisement was of very much use in obtaining the kind of men usually required for expert Departments. The appointments made were always published, but he did not think it possible to publish the names of all the candidates, as very often men came up who were employed by firms and did not want their names made public. The only possible form of publicity was to announce in the papers that so-and-so had been appointed to examine candidates and to advise the Secretary of State in the selection.

(The witness withdrew.)

At the India Office, London, Tuesday, 5th May, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E.
R. R. SCOTT, Esq. } *Joint Secretaries.*

SIR WILLIAM SCHLICH,* K.C.I.E., Professor of Forestry, University of Oxford, called and examined.

66720. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he had been Professor of Forestry at the University of Oxford since 1905, and before that was Inspector-General of the Indian Forest Department. For many years prior to going to Oxford he was a professor at Cooper's Hill. During those years a great number of candidates for the Forest Department had passed through his hands, and he thought he was approximately correct in saying that out of the 220 officers of the Imperial Forest Staff about 212 had been his pupils.

66721. With regard to the comparative merits of the present method of recruitment and recruitment at the school-leaving age, he impressed upon the Commission that it was a mistake to send men out too young. It should be remembered that the Indian forest officer, besides being an expert in his own line, was also to a very considerable extent an administrative official. The Indian Forest Department managed 240,000 square miles of forest—*i.e.*, one-quarter of the total area of India—and many places in that area were rarely or never visited by a superior officer of the ordinary administrative establishment. Under those circumstances he considered that forest officers should be men and not boys when they arrived in India, as the contentment and happiness of millions of people depended upon the Forest Officer being a man of considerable tact. Accordingly it was of the greatest importance that men on their arrival in India should be fairly well-developed. The age at which they went out ought to be sufficient to allow of a thorough education and to a considerable extent the formation of character, and he put that age at from 23 to 24; in fact, they should be about the same age as civilians. It was true they were not in the same position as the civilians, but they had many duties to perform which were really similar to those performed by the Civil Service. On the forest officer reaching India, after having gone through a complete course of training in England, he had not more than one year's probation, and was then posted to some isolated subdivision.

66722. He laid great stress on a university education for forest officers. Although he considered it desirable, on account of the development of character which was always involved in the process of a man taking an honours degree at a university, there was no absolute necessity to insist upon a science degree, provided that young men chosen at the school-leaving age were sent to a university and went through a course of not less than three years. If a complete university career was prescribed there was practically nothing to choose between the present method of recruitment and recruiting at the school-leaving age with a career at the university. If recruitment at the school-leaving age meant that no university course was to be taken, he should prefer the present system of an honours course at a university. Men should go out at about 23, or better still 24. The present staff in India had been all recruited under the school-leaving age system, and might therefore be possibly in favour of the younger age. Those who had gone out since 1908 had not enough experience probably to be called to give evidence on the subject.

66723. He had always held the opinion that it was a disastrous mistake to scatter a handful of men over a number of universities. He warned the Committee that sat at the India Office three or four years ago that men should be sent to Oxford or Cambridge, or to Edinburgh, he did not care where, but that it was of the utmost importance to keep them together, because whatever universities might say at the present moment, it could not be expected that satisfactory arrangements would be made at a number of universities for one or two probationers a year. Up to the present only a few men had gone to Cambridge and none to Edinburgh. He had no positive information, but from what he heard he believed that up to the present time only Oxford had a School of Forestry up to the required standard, but on that point the Commission might usefully examine the Director of Indian Forest Studies. Under any circumstances, he would have all the candidates at one university. Some of the universities had said that they would make all the necessary arrangements, but the question was how far that had been done. By keeping the men together it would be possible to make sure that proper arrangements were made for a good standard of education.

66724. If men were recruited at the school-leaving age there was not much on which they could be judged, but when men had spent two or three years at the university there was something to go upon in seeing whether the men who applied for appointments were the kind of men required. He had always advocated a preliminary nomination by interviewing all the applicants, and if there were more candidates than the number of appointments a competitive examination might be held of those who were considered in other respects qualified. He was inclined to make the very bold statement that if Great Britain was to keep India she would have to send out men of a certain class, and if she did not do that the greater the danger of her not keeping India for ever. It was a mistake to send out any men except those who were thoroughly qualified for the duties they had to undertake. In the Forest Department he would rather develop what was now called the Provincial Service than send out men who were not of the very highest calibre. There would have to be a great extension of the Provincial Service because the area was far too large to be managed by the Imperial staff now in India. The revenue was rising, the management becoming more minute, and the demands on the staff were becoming greater and greater. Therefore he advocated that for a number of years to

* This witness did not submit a written statement, but see Appendix XI.

come the Imperial Forest Service might be kept at its present strength, and additions, as far as possible, made by the development of the Provincial Service.

66725. With regard to the school-leaving examination, he had always advised parents who came to him to let their boys have a classical education up to the standard of Responsions at Oxford or the previous examination at Cambridge. Anyhow, he would insist on one of the old languages, especially Latin. There was a good deal of talk about the abolition of Greek, but a man who was going in for science, although he did not want an intimate knowledge of Greek, would find it a great help to know something of both Latin and Greek, as it would enable him to understand scientific expressions. Therefore, the education of candidates up to the time of leaving school should be a classical education and under any circumstances should include Latin. In the competitive examination a certain knowledge of chemistry and physics might be added. He would not ask students to spend their school time on botany or zoology, but to concentrate on their classical education so as to be as well prepared as possible for the specific course of instruction in their university training.

66726. With reference to the allocation of time to practical and theoretical work in the university course, the course had been two years theoretical and one year practical, but owing to the pressure brought to bear by the Committee of the India Office three or four years ago the practical course had now been reduced to six months. A certain amount of practical work was done during the time set apart for theoretical instruction. The practical part should under no circumstanecs be less than six months, and it might usefully be more. When he first started the course it was nine. Although there might possibly be room for some small improvements the practical course abroad was on the whole thoroughly satisfactory. The men were stationed with Continental forest officers. They had to keep a diary, which was submitted every Saturday to the forest officer, who discussed it with them, and at the end of each month the diaries were sent to him at Oxford and he went over them and wrote to the forest officer if there was anything he was not satisfied with. That was done throughout the whole of the practical course. Until he met with an accident which interfered somewhat with his walking powers he invariably at the end of the course spent the last six weeks with the students, taking them to different districts to study certain conditions under his direct control. He did not see how a better control than that could be established unless a special officer was appointed to be with them throughout the whole year. During the last few years he had visited them every year, generally twice, in the Easter holidays and in the summer, and had made enquiries on the spot into the general condition of things and given them advice on their work. It was very important whilst the students were in the German forests that there should be at headquarters an officer who was thoroughly conversant with the language.

66727. With reference to the possibility of a change to the school-leaving age affecting recruitment, the witness stated that in the first two or three years after the change in 1905 was made there were very few applicants. In the first year after the change there were four candidates, two of whom qualified; in the second year there were two, of whom one qualified. Therefore a system of selection had to be devised, and he canvassed the university and obtained in that way the number of men required. During the last six years, when things had settled down, there had been more candidates than were required for the appointments, and there were a considerable number of others who had not taken a degree. For some 10 appointments there were 50 or 60 applicants every year, so that at present the field was quite wide enough.

66728. He considered the allowances which were given to candidates during their probationary period at present to be adequate. It was calculated at the rate of £150 a year, which included about £30 for fees to the instructors while on practical work. That sum, he thought, would attract quite a sufficient number of applicants, because after all parents were expected to do something towards the education of their children.

66729. Assuming that the candidates were brought together in one university, and a course was arranged with regard to the requirements of India, it would naturally be expected that the Government should make some contribution. He could only speak of Oxford, and he thought he was justified in saying that Oxford would be quite ready to fall in with such an arrangement, and would be willing that the men selected as professors should be selected by a joint committee of the University and the India Office. If the India Office would find the salary of one officer he believed the university would find the remainder, but the matter would have to go before Convocation. When the Oxford University was given its *congé* by the Secretary of State in 1911 there were 26 forest students who were not probationers for India, and the university then had to make some arrangement for them.

66730. Two natives of India had passed through the course at Oxford and gone out to India as members of the Imperial Forest Service, one having been appointed to Madras and the other to Bombay. Seven others had been sent to Oxford from native States, and several had taken the diploma and a degree and joined the Forest Service of the native States. At the present moment there were four natives of India under instruction, two having been sent by native States and two coming of their own accord. One was 35 years of age. Some of these had done very well indeed.

66731. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) With regard to men of the Provincial Service being allowed study leave for the purpose of attending a course of instruction in Europe, the witness said that out of the seven men who had gone back to India five were men who had been at Dehra Dun. They had been for some years in the service of native States and then had come to Oxford and taken the diploma, including the theoretical and the practical work. On the whole it was very useful for Indians to come to England, but a great deal depended upon how the forest teaching at Dehra Dun developed. Indians coming to Europe should do one of two things; they should either come to Oxford, or some other University, and go through the regular course, or be placed for six or nine months under a Continental forest officer who knew English. During the last ten years he had trained by the latter method upwards of 30 officers, quite apart from his Oxford work, for Colonial appointments. They went for three months to Kew to pick up the special botany of the country they came from, and then were placed under a German forest officer for a six months' course. In Ceylon and the Malay States the conditions of the Imperial staff had been improved and officers who were already in the Service were given the option of going through the course if they wished to be promoted to higher appointments. As things were at present arranged, ignorance of the French or German language by Provincial officers would not be an obstacle to their training to Europe for a six to nine months' training on the Continent.

66732. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) It is very difficult to say whether the two years' course at Oxford or the six or nine months' course on the Continent or an extended course at Dehra Dun should be made an essential condition for promotion from the Provincial Service to the Superior Service. If the Imperial Service of 220 members trained in Europe was kept up to the proper standard it would be better to extend and improve the school at Dehra Dun. On the whole he would rather improve the Dehra Dun course for the Provincial Service so long as the Imperial forest staff was kept up to the proper standard. The present Imperial staff recruited from Europe might be kept as at present, and if any additions were made there was no reason why they should not be made from men who had received an extended training at

Dehra Dun, and who had proved by meritorious work afterwards that they deserved such promotion. It was not essential that a man belonging to the Provincial Service in India and promoted into the Superior Service should have practical training on the continent of Europe, as the 220 Imperial Service men recruited in England would furnish the European experience and provide the necessary teachers at Dehra Dun or other Indian schools. Such teachers should, however, be selected from the *best* men in the Service. If recruitment in Europe was cut off a very serious mistake would be made.

66733. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Most of the Indians who had been trained at Oxford did very well in their studies, and they also showed appreciation of the practical work they had to do, although they were not so good in practical work as they were in theoretical work. They generally did better in the theoretical examinations. He had had cases where a native of India had stood at or near the top in the theoretical work, but had not come out on top in the practical work, while others had done very well in practical work. He would not exclude Indians from the Imperial Service, but would make sure that they were fully qualified to enter it.

66734. He always took care to make it known to Indian students as well as European students that the Forest Service was open to them and was a profitable Service to study for. One reason why perhaps Indians did not go in so much for the Forest Service was that it was far more difficult to take the diploma in forestry than any other diploma at Oxford. There was a saying in Oxford that forest students had more work to do than any others. Many of the Indians who came to the university preferred something which was a little easier.

66735. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) It was absolutely necessary that forest students should go to the Continent for their practical work at present, as the development of forestry in Great Britain was not sufficiently far advanced to give the required training.

66736. He laid great emphasis upon a classical foundation for a forest officer's training. A student need not be a scholar in Latin, but he certainly should know a certain amount. Having regard to the fact that most of the public schools now had fairly well-equipped laboratories, it might be possible to include a certain quantity of chemistry and physics, and in any examination at the school-leaving age he should restrict the science part to those two subjects, especially chemistry. His long experience had shown him that the knowledge boys had on leaving school of botany, geology, and zoology did not help them very much. They had to go over the same ground again in a more satisfactory manner.

66737. (*Mr. Fisher.*) If boys were chosen at the school-leaving age and had to pass through a three-years' course in a forest school at one university he should give to those who had fulfilled the other conditions the chance of taking a science degree with their diploma. They would not all do it, but there would be probably men who had been already a year at the university and who had taken up chemistry and physics, and they ought to be given a chance of obtaining a degree, which they could do in three years. At Oxford there was an arrangement whereby a student taking the diploma was excused all preliminary examinations; in fact, if he took only Part I. of the diploma examination he was excused all the preliminary examinations for the science degree, and had only afterwards to take one subject for his final. For an intelligent boy it would not be an extra strain to take a degree in science as well as the diploma, but of course a three-years' residence would be required. Moreover, a student who had taken the diploma in forestry was excused two groups out of three for a pass degree.

66738. With regard to engineering training for forest officers, if an endeavour was made to make an engineer of a student he would probably turn out an indifferent forest officer. The course at present was pretty full, and even a boy who came at the school-leaving age for three years had as much as he could do. Perhaps a little engineering might be added in connection with the construction of bridges, culverts, etc. That added to the course of instruction would increase the expense by about £20. If additional knowledge was required in road-making there would be an extra charge of about £50 or £60, because the instructors would have to be specially paid. In the early years, when forest officers did more engineering, he had received a complaint from the Head Conservator of Madras that the men who were being sent out were far more engineers than foresters.

66739. (*Mr. Sly.*) With regard to the comparative merits of training at Cooper's Hill and at Oxford, the witness on the whole was in favour of a university education, as it broadened men's minds. Cooper's Hill trained for three different branches of the Service, and in that way the men were brought into contact with each other. Training at a university developed men much better in the long run. At Oxford the students were first of all given a thorough grounding in the first year in botany, spending nine hours every week on that subject alone, also in geology, which was preceded by a certain amount of instruction in chemistry and physics for those who had not come with any knowledge of those subjects. In the second year they had another six hours a week in forest botany and nine hours a week in zoology, including forest entomology, etc. They were also given a certain amount of instruction in geometric drawing, engineering, and surveying, and those subjects were taught very well indeed. The course of instruction in forestry at Oxford was as high as ever it was at Cooper's Hill, and probably higher. Many of the men who were not probationers for India took, during the first two years, the diploma in forestry because that exempted them from a preliminary examination, and then in the third year they prepared for an honours degree in science. Out of the 33 who were not probationers for India and had taken the diploma, 13 had taken the science degree as well. Out of the 84 probationers for India, 51 had taken both the diploma and science degree, and 33 had taken only the diploma. If they had a chance they liked to go in for the science degree as well, especially natives of India.

66740. In the Oxford diploma course every facility was given for practical work. There were small excursions during term time and generally one excursion during the first year to French forests. That excursion usually lasted three weeks, and just gave them an idea in the middle of their course of the systematic management of forests. Then they had a minimum of six months on the Continent, generally in Germany, and sometimes in Switzerland. During that six months the professor of forestry had them under his supervision whether they were Indian or European students.

66741. *Until within the last year or two probationers for India had done no extra work at all, but now that the Director of Indian Forest* Studies had undertaken to supervise the practical course himself he was very likely to extend it, if he had not done so already. At Oxford they had some work in Indian botany and Indian geology and forest law in the ordinary forest course; for the probationers for India it was obligatory. If any additional course was necessary for students who had passed the ordinary Oxford school he would not have a general additional course all round, but would select men who showed a special tendency in a certain direction and give them some extra instruction in that line. To make men spend a great portion of their time on engineering when they might not have any engineering work to do throughout their lives would be a great waste, but those who took the extra course might be specially employed in forest engineering. The alternative to splitting them up in that manner would be to let them come home after some years service for the extra study.

66742. When the whole Department was transferred from Cooper's Hill to Oxford the India

Office paid £397 a year for expenses, plus the salary of the professor and assistant professor, but now they paid nothing. When the Government withdrew their support there were 26 forest students at Oxford who had to be provided for in the middle of their course, and, as there was no endowment for a professorship, rather than see the whole thing broken up he offered to go on for a little while until arrangements could be made, even if no salary was paid to him at all. The University did not accept that and found £300 from what was called the Common University Fund, and appointed him as reader with the status of a professor. Then the Council sent a round-robin to the colleges, and a number of the colleges provided another £300 a year. When Mr. Caccia ceased to help in the instruction the Committee of the Chancellor's Fund provided another £250 for an assistant for three years. In order to put the thing on a more permanent basis he himself started an endowment fund for a professorship and up to date had received £4,000. At present the Oxford Forest School was on a temporary foundation, as the £4,000 was not sufficient to establish it permanently.

66743. It was essential in training officers for the Indian Forest Department at one university to have professors with Indian experience.

66744. Any control which might be exercised by the India Office would depend on the arrangements made by the Secretary of State with the university. His own idea was that there should be an arrangement between the university and the Secretary of State to determine who was to be the professor, and that professor should be certainly a man with an Indian experience.

66745. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Out of the three years' probation he would not advise that any period should be spent in India. He would rather not send men out at all than send them out without proper training. After the probationary course in England they would go straight into the Service, the first year being spent in becoming acquainted with local conditions and local matters, as in all the other Services.

66746. He had spent 20 years in India and Burma, and had an extensive knowledge of the duties of Forest Officers in that country.

66747. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) He was not against a competitive examination, but it should be combined with a preliminary nomination. Men should be interviewed, and only those allowed to go on to the examination who were considered in other respects suitable for the Service. A system of nomination had been actually in force for about ten years now, and if there was an examination he should like the same system of preliminary nomination to continue.

(The witness withdrew.)

A. M. CACCIA, Esq., M.V.O., Director of Indian Forest Studies.

Written Statement relating to the recruitment and training of probationers for the Indian Forest Service.

66748. (*1*) *RECRUITMENT.*—Experience has shown that there are two practicable methods of recruitment:—

(*1*) By competitive examination at school-leaving age from candidates with a good school education (in force from 1891-1904), and

(*2*) By selection at university-leaving age from candidates who have obtained a university degree in some branch of science.

66749. Under the latter method of recruitment, which is at present in force, candidates are obtained who have already received a good grounding in science, and who have received some training in scientific methods. Such candidates have already passed certain prescribed university examinations in science subjects. It is therefore possible to determine with greater certainty the qualifications of the candidates appearing for probationerships.

66750. As a result of the university training, the candidates so obtained are better able to assimilate and to follow the specialised forestry courses. On taking up their probationerships, such candidates have already reached a more responsible age. They are generally more anxious to learn, and almost without exception take a personal interest in their training. It is therefore possible to deal with the requirements of each probationer separately, without that constant personal control which is so necessary in the case of youths first joining a university with an assured appointment. The qualifications of such probationers at the time of their appointment, as regards a knowledge of forestry, are, however, very unequal. Thus, while some probationers have no knowledge of forestry, others may have more or less completed the course of theoretical instruction required for the forestry diploma at Oxford or Cambridge, or for the forestry degree at Edinburgh, etc. The probationers consequently require differential treatment both as regards their theoretical and practical forestry course. This greatly increases the difficulty of arranging for satisfactory probationary training, though the difficulty is by no means insurmountable.

The one objection which appears to have been almost unanimously raised against the present method of recruiting from university graduates is the question of *age*. Probationers recruited at a university-leaving age are, at the time of their proceeding to India, somewhat older than when recruited at a school-leaving age, and though the difference is not very great, yet this occurs at a period in the officer's life when every additional year probably tells very seriously on his capability to adapt himself readily to the somewhat trying conditions of life in the Indian Forest Department. Moreover, late recruitment is more likely to lead to discontent later on, owing to the impossibility of reaching the Conservator grade. The remedy for this evil would appear, however, to be promotion to the administrative grades by "selection" instead of purely by "seniority," as at present.

66751. Recruitment from candidates at a university-leaving age would, in all cases, have to be followed by one or two years' additional special forestry training. Probationers so obtained would, therefore, have to undergo, firstly, a three or four-years' university training in order to obtain a science degree, followed by one or two years' special forestry training, as compared with three years' forestry training to be prescribed in the case of recruitment at school-leaving age. In both cases, the age at which candidates would, in the first instance, proceed to the university would be about the same.

66752. *Conclusion.*—The question of recruitment cannot be disassociated from the question of training. Considered independently, both methods of recruitment (whether at a university- or school-leaving age) possess certain important advantages, and both methods can be made, under certain conditions, to work satisfactorily. It is obvious, however, that youths recruited at a school-leaving age require constant personal supervision during the whole period of their training, and such supervision could only become possible when the probationers are all trained together at one centre under the direct control of a staff appointed for the purpose by the India Office.

66753. On the other hand, with recruitment at a university-leaving age, the candidates have already reached a more responsible age, and they may already have qualified in a number of the subjects prescribed in the forestry degree or diploma courses. Consequently, each candidate must be

dealt with separately, and the necessity for bringing all the probationers together at one centre is not so insistent.

66754. (*II*) *TRAINING OF PROBATIONERS.*—To arrive at a correct conclusion on the subject of the training of probationers for the Indian Forest Service, due consideration should be given to the following points:—

(*1*) There is, at present, no thoroughly equipped School of Forestry in the British Isles where a satisfactory high-class training in Forestry, *such as is required by the Indian probationers*, can be given. The demand, in so far as home forestry is concerned, is, and for many years to come will continue to be, chiefly for elementary instruction suitable for agricultural students and others desiring appointments as land-agents, etc.

(*2*) Sufficient money is not at present available for the adequate organisation of the Forestry Schools at Oxford and Cambridge (which have been approved by the India Office), and, even granting that these schools will develop in the future, their development will proceed on the lines best suited to meet the requirements of home forestry, and not of Indian probationers.

(*3*) The theoretical instruction now given at Oxford and Cambridge is very unequal, and the Director of Indian Forest Studies has at present no power in any way to supervise or control these courses, although they constitute the essential basis for the practical training for which he is responsible. Inspection of a printed syllabus, moreover, obviously affords no criterion of the suitability or otherwise of a course of instruction.

(*4*) Apart from the fact that a generally higher standard of instruction is required, certain subjects which are not considered to be of importance to students of home forestry are considered to be necessary for Indian forest probationers. Such are Indian forest engineering, Indian geology and soils, systematic botany with special reference to the Indian forest flora, Indian forest working plans, forest law, silviculture of Indian trees, book-keeping.

(*5*) The Schools of Forestry at Oxford and Cambridge possess no provisions for giving instruction in practical forestry. Apart from this, however, work in and visits to selected continental forests under proper supervision are essential in the case of the Indian probationer. This practical training requires the closest personal supervision, and the University Readers in Forestry have no means of personally supervising the practical training of the probationers, even if they possess sufficient knowledge regarding suitable continental practical training grounds.

66755. It follows from the above that the instruction given at the universities will always have to be supplemented by special theoretical and practical instruction for which the India Office must make itself responsible. The exact manner in which this additional instruction should be given must, however, depend very largely on the method of recruitment, *e.g.*, whether the probationers are recruited (i) at a univesity-leaving age or (ii) at a school-leaving age, and on the amount of special Indian theoretical courses which it may be considered necessary to prescribe for the Indian forest probationers, *vide* (*4*) above.

66756. (i) *Recruitment at university-leaving age.*—In this case the present arrangement of appointing a Director of Indian Forest Studies, who is responsible for the practical training of the Indian Forest Service probationers will continue to work satisfactorily, provided the Director is a good linguist and has been given an opportunity to acquire a thorough knowledge of suitable continental training grounds. Provided also that he has opportunities of keeping constantly in touch with the work going on abroad.

In addition to this, however, it is essential that the India Office should make suitable grants of money to the approved universities, contingent on the fulfilment of certain definite conditions to be laid down by the India Office. The vital points to be insisted on should be: (*a*) a voice in the selection of the University Forestry Instructor, and (*b*) a right to inspect the schools and to insist on the special subjects required by the Indian forest probationers being taught in a satisfactory manner.

The annual grant to be made by the India Office would depend to a great extent on the special requirements of the India Office, and in some cases (*e.g.*, instruction in Indian forest botany) a portion of the assistance to be rendered to the universities may take the form of a temporary instructor paid for and appointed by the India Office.

In this connection it may be mentioned that the necessity for prescribing a large number of special Indian subjects would appear to be open to question. It is suggested that many of these subjects (especially systematic botany of Indian trees, Indian geology, Indian forest working plans), could be far better dealt with by prescribing a departmental examination to be passed by recruits within a certain period of time after joining the Service in India. The recruits would, as a result of their training in England, be quite capable of carrying out these simple studies independently, in conjunction with any other work that might be given to them during their first year of service. On the other hand, provisions could easily be made, provided funds are supplied to the universities, to extend the course of studies in forest engineering, and in other selected subjects.

66757. (ii) *Recruitment at a school-leaving age.*—Under this method of recruitment, all the probationers without exception would, at the commencement of their probationary period, be on the same footing, and they would all be required to follow the same prescribed course of studies (*e.g.*, as regards an approved curriculum). But, owing to the youth of the probationers, they would be required to be kept under proper control and supervision during the whole of their probationary period. This could only be done satisfactorily by establishing approved Indian Schools of Forestry at one or more centres. The exact constitution of a University Indian School of Forestry, as above contemplated, need not be entered into here; but in view of the fact that the University Professor of Forestry will always be required to devote himself more especially to home forestry and to the training (it may be of a very large number) of other than Indian forest probationers, and bearing in mind the necessity for the India Office to maintain some control over the management of such a school, the following scheme is suggested, namely:—

(*i*) The Director of Indian Forest Studies should be made responsible for the training, theoretical and practical, of the Indian Forest Service probationers. With this object in view, he should be attached to such university as may be prepared to agree to the establishment of an Indian School of Forestry, and to give the Director of Indian Forest Studies an official position in the university by recognising him as the University Professor for Indian Forestry.

(*ii*) The Indian Forest probationers, whilst under training, should then be placed under the orders of the Director of Indian Forest Studies who, in consultation with the university authorities, would prescribe the course of study in each subject to be followed by the Indian Forest probationers. Advantage would be taken *as far as possible* of the existing university lecture courses. But the Director of Indian Forest Studies himself would be required to give lectures in Indian forestry and to arrange for special lectures in other subjects as required.

(*iii*) The Director of Indian Forest Studies would be responsible for the practical training of the Indian forest probationers

(*iv*) The Director of Indian Forest Studies should only be permitted to lecture to Indian Forest Service probationers, to Indian students, and to such other students from India as may be deputed by the Government of India. He should not be permitted to take part in the training of other university students.

(*v*) The above arrangement would necessarily entail the training of all the Indian Forest Service

109141

probationers at one and the same university, unless a Director or Assistant Director of Indian Forest Studies is appointed at each of the selected universities. In view of the small number of probationers annually appointed, it appears difficult to justify the latter procedure.

(*vi*) The period of training, including the practical training, should be three years.

66758. *Conclusion.*—It would appear that two methods of recruitment and training of probationers for the Indian Forest Service are possible, viz.:—

(i) Recruitment by competitive examination at school-leaving age from candidates with a good (modern side) school education, followed by a three years' course of training at an approved Indian School of Forestry to be established at one (or more) university centres, under the direct control of the India Office. The three-years' course of training to include the necessary (Continental) practical training under the closest personal supervision. In view of the small number of probationers annually recruited, the establishment and endowment by the India Office of more than one Indian School of Forestry could not be justified. It is essential for the success of this method of training that the probationers should, during the whole of their probationary period, be kept under careful control.

(ii) Recruitment by selection at university-leaving age from candidates who have passed some recognised university science examination. Candidates so recruited will require individual attention, both as regards their further theoretical and practical training. This can be given by an officer specially appointed for the purpose by the India Office (*e.g.*, a Director of Indian Forest Studies), who would be responsible for the practical training of the probationers, and also for arranging the course of studies to be followed by the probationers at the approved centres. Further, in order that the theoretical training of the probationers at the selected centres may be satisfactorily given, it is essential that certain grants be made to the approved universities, contingent on the fulfilment of certain definite conditions to be laid down by the India Office.

66759. Though both methods are practicable, I am personally, on the whole, in favour of recruitment at a school-leaving age, followed by a regular prescribed three-years' course of studies at one centre for the reason (*i*) that recruits will proceed to India at an earlier age, (*ii*) that much of the best material for the Forest Department which was obtained under the older regulations will no longer be excluded owing to the fact that many parents cannot afford the expense of a university education with no certainty of an appointment at its close, and (*iii*) that it would be posible then to arrange for an approved university course of study, applicable to all probationers alike, and confined merely to those subjects which bear immediate application to a forestry training.

It must be clearly understood, however, that in my opinion the balance turns in favour of this scheme only on the distinct understanding (*a*) that a satisfactory Indian School of Forestry can be established at one university centre on a sound, permanent footing, a controlling voice in the management of the same being retained by the India Office; (*b*) that suitable provisions can be made for the supervision of the probationers during their course of training; and (*c*) that satisfactory arrangements are made for the carrying out of the practical training under the closest personal supervision.

Otherwise, if these vital conditions cannot be fulfilled, recruitment from university graduates, with its undoubted inconveniences, should be continued, for the reason that better material is obtained, and the graduate has sufficient experience to enable him to profit from a further university training without constant personal supervision, except as regards the practical course.

66760. (*III*) *APPOINTMENT OF PROBATIONERS.*—(i) *Recruitment at school-leaving age.*—Recruitment should be by competitive examination, so arranged as to cover all those subjects which a boy who has received a good *modern-side* education may be expected to know. Experience has shown that no useful purpose is served by introducing a large number of science subjects in an entrance examination designed for candidates recruited at school-leaving age.

(ii) *Recruitment at university-leaving age.*—Recruitment should be by selection from candidates who have passed some recognised university science examination. At the present moment this is confined to candidates (*i*) who have obtained a degree in natural science in a university of Great Britain or Ireland, and (*ii*) to graduates in forestry at the University of Edinburgh. It is possible that the field of recruitment may in the future be advantageously extended to candidates who have obtained university degrees in the applied sciences.

66761. Regulations or suggestions as to the manner in which selection should be exercised would appear to be called for. At the present moment, the greatest stress appears to be laid on academic, scientific attainments, physical qualifications being only given secondary consideration, and a desire generally appears to exist to apportion the appointments as far as possible to various university centres.

I would suggest that in making selections from university graduates for probationers in the Indian Forest Service attention should be paid, first and foremost, to the candidates "*personality*," and, secondly, to *academic qualifications*. Under the first head (personality) I would include:—

(*a*) Experience in dealing with fellow students (*e.g.*, captains and secretaries of athletic and social clubs, etc.);

(*b*) Physique (*e.g.*, share taken in games, athletics, etc.);

(*c*) Possession of a sense of discipline (*e.g.*, membership of the O.T.C. or School Cadet Corps, etc.);

(*d*) Indian connections.

Mr. A. M. Caccia, called and examined.

66762. (*Chairman.*) The witness occupied the position of Director of Indian Forest Studies, which he had held for two and a-half years. It was a five years' appointment. Previously he had spent 23 years in India in the Indian Forest Service. For three years he had been at Dehra Dun as instructor, four years at the Research Institute, and for nine months was President of the Research Institute and College at Dehra. Altogether he had spent seven years at the Research Institute and 16 years in divisional work as an ordinary Forest Officer. His main duty now was to carry out the practical course of training, to consult with the students about their theoretical training, and to supplement the training which they received at the universities. At the present moment there were men at Cambridge and at Oxford, but none had yet been allowed to go to Edinburgh after being selected as probationers, as Edinburgh insisted on a three years' course and the Department wished to have a two years' course. Men could be taken from Edinburgh when they came up with their Forestry degree for appointment as probationers, but none had yet been selected. He understood that in the present year there would be three or four candidates from Edinburgh. He had not visited the Edinburgh School lately, but he understood it was not sufficiently equipped to meet the requirements of the Department, and the training there would have to be supplemented by practical training on the Continent.

66763. The average age at which men went to India now was 24, but in future it would vary between 23 and 24. The particular course they

now underwent would enable men to go out at 23½. Under the present regulations when a man had already done part of his forestry course his subsequent course on appointment as probationer could be cut down to one year instead of two.

66764. At present there were two men at Cambridge and two more Cambridge men were undergoing practical training. The syllabus at Oxford and that at Cambridge was exactly the same, but the question was how far the syllabus was followed. Cambridge was now in a transition stage; certain new regulations were before the Senate to establish the school on a proper basis. The great trouble at all the universities was the question of funds.

66765. Apart from the supervision that he had over the probationers in the different institutions, he had also to accompany them on their tours abroad. At present the practical course consisted of two parts. In the first part they had to learn the conditions of one particular forest division, and for that purpose they stayed about three or four months in one place and were directly under the orders of the Forest Officer, he himself visiting them and staying with them for a certain time, but not the whole time. In the second part, when the students visited particular places, he went with them if it could possibly be managed. It was always necessary to have someone looking after the students and supervising their work in the forests in Germany, as otherwise they were liable to waste their time. Now that a Director of Indian Forest Studies had been appointed there would be always someone to assist them in their work. He did not think that the continuous presence of the Director was so necessary during the first part of the practical training provided that the men the students were sent to were carefully selected. The selection of the men under whom the students were placed was made by himself, and he was in touch with many of the leading Forest Officers in Germany.

66766. The total time occupied in the tours varied between seven and eight months. For about three or four months they were allowed to remain in one place and for three or four months they were visiting different places. They were not abroad continuously, because the practical training in most cases was now done in the vacations. In the summer vacation the students could be abroad for two and a half months, but at Christmas and Easter only for five weeks. He thought the period was quite adequate. In details it was always possible to go on making improvements, particularly in the selection of new training grounds, but generally the practical course was as good as it could be made.

66767. On the whole, balancing the two forms of recruitment, he favoured that at the school-leaving age provided an Indian School of Forestry was provided. That would mean a change in the present system which had been in force for about two years. Every change naturally dislocated recruitment for a certain time. Whether more recruits would be obtained at the school-leaving age depended altogether on what the cost would be after recruitment. If recruitment was made at the school-leaving age a number of candidates would be obtained who would otherwise not have been able to go up to a university on the chance of obtaining an appointment, whereas in recruiting graduates there would be a number who had taken a science degree and made up their minds to go in for the Forest Department. If the training expenses were covered probably more candidates would be obtained at the school-leaving age. His only reason for advocating a change was that it might be possible to obtain a proper school of forestry, such as was required by the Indian probationers, which he saw grave doubts of obtaining under the present conditions. Under the system now in force, if the candidates were graduates, the instruction given at the universities could be supplemented, but he believed there would never be a proper school of forestry within reasonable time unless the India Office assisted in establishing one. He laid very great stress on a school of forestry for India definitely controlled and subsidised by the India Office, and if such a school was established it would be absolutely necessary to go back to the school-leaving age, as if recruitment was made from graduates men would be obtained who had already done forestry courses elsewhere. A man who had taken a forestry degree at Edinburgh could not be asked to proceed to Oxford or Cambridge and go through a two or three years' course at that university. Young men taken at the school-leaving age had done no forestry and therefore could be sent to an approved school. He had no objection to the India Office establishing three or four forestry schools, but it was a question of whether it was worth while to run three good schools for twelve men. He did not think one school would limit the area of selection if the recruitment was at the school-leaving age.

66768. With regard to allowances during the probationary period, if the candidates were recruited at the school-leaving age £100 a year might be sufficient, but that would probably limit the number of recruits. He calculated that the expenses of training in forestry at the university could not possibly be less than £175 to £200 a year, including the continental practical course. Therefore to cover the whole of the expenses the allowance would have to be £200, but the recruits might well be expected to pay half of that themselves.

66769. With reference to the cost of a school of Indian Forestry at Oxford, two professors were formerly paid for by the India Office, including their travelling allowance, which was a very important point, and in addition there was a grant of about £500. At that time the grant was not nearly enough, although it might be sufficient now, as the university required to have a School of Forestry apart from the India Office. The actual cost of establishing an Indian Forest School could only be settled by going into details, but roughly it might be said to correspond with the pay of two professors, with an additional £500 a year.

66770. There were certain things that might be better learned in India than in England, as, for example, forest engineering in certain practical directions, and that was becoming an essential element in forest work, especially in connection with roads. He had made inquiries at Oxford and Cambridge, and he thought that for an additional £100 or £150 a year it would be possible to obtain all the forest engineering required.

66771. The remark in his written statement that the Director of Indian Forest Studies should be made responsible for the training, theoretical and practical, of the Indian Forest Service probationers was not intended to mean that he must himself give the instruction, but that he must supervise. His position would be rather like that of a tutor at a university, and he would see that the students did what they ought to do.

66772. It was of great importance that there should be officers of Indian experience in the forest school.

66773. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) In recruiting at the school-leaving age it was difficult to have any form of selection. Under the present system the candidates had been to the university for three years more or less on their own responsibility, and had passed recognised public examinations, and therefore there was a good deal to go on as to their suitability, whereas if candidates were recruited from public schools it would be more difficult to apply the method of nomination. With an open competitive examination, and no previous nomination, there was a possibility of a certain number of candidates being successful who would not be considered suitable in other respects. That was what happened during the whole time of recruitment at Cooper's Hill. He was certainly in favour of selection if any suitable scheme could be worked out, but he saw difficulties in devising a feasible scheme at the school-leaving age. He would reject a candidate subsequent to the examination if he did not follow the course prescribed for him. He laid much stress on selection when dealing with recruitment at the university-

leaving age, because at that time it was possible to judge, but for school boys he did not see how it was to be managed.

66774. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) There were several arguments against probation at Dehra Dun if boys were chosen at the school-leaving age. In India the forests were being developed from their abnormal condition into a more normal condition and the transformation would occupy a very large number of years and there was no place in India where it was now possible to see the objects and results of a fully-developed system of forest management. There was also the objection that it would not be good to take schoolboys and send them out to India for training.

66775. A forest officer should have a sound scientific training, which could be better acquired at the universities. Summing up briefly, the forests in India were not suitable for demonstration purposes, scientific training in Dehra Dun could not be made equal to that of the training of the universities, and it was undesirable that boys should go out to India for their preliminary training. No doubt professors could be sent out to Dehra Dun, but even then there would not be the scientific atmosphere which was to be found in the universities in England.

66776. (*Mr. Sly.*) He had heard the opinion expressed by Sir William Schlich that the scientific course of forestry for the Oxford diploma at present was a higher standard than that which used to be given at Cooper's Hill. The forestry course as established at Oxford by the India Office on the abolition of Cooper's Hill was a forestry course such as he himself contemplated for an Indian School of Forestry. The kind of course that Sir William Schlich spoke about was the course that had been arranged by the India Office, *i.e.*, a school equipped and financed and controlled by the India Office, as Oxford was up to a few months ago. Owing to the generosity and public spirit of Sir William Schlich, who was willing to continue that course at Oxford without payment, the School of Forestry at Oxford was in existence at present, but should Sir William Schlich disappear the school would in all probability disappear also. That was what he meant when he said that no thoroughly equipped School of Forestry existed at the present moment.

66777. The ordinary diploma course followed by the various students, irrespective of Indian requirements, did not include Indian subjects, which were optional. The witness put in the syllabuses of Edinburgh, Oxford and Cambridge, which he said were all practically alike.* In the case of Cambridge and Oxford, all the Indian subjects were optional. They were taught in a way, though he did not think the word "taught" could at the present moment in all cases be used in its literal meaning except in connection with Oxford.

66778. The practical course of training followed by students of the Oxford school on the Continent was not satisfactory on account of lack of supervision. Sir William Schlich had an enormous knowledge of forests in Germany and a great acquaintance with German forest officers, and therefore could arrange a quite satisfactory course, but in the hands of any other Professor the whole thing would most probably collapse. If supervision was required on the part of the university Professor of Forestry it would be necessary to pay his travelling expenses, and there was no money at the university to do that. Then again, he thought it would be found that the university Professor of Forestry would not always be prepared to give up the whole of his vacations to go abroad in order to superintend the studies of probationers unless he was paid for doing so.

66779. With regard to the suggestion that the Indian Forest Service should be recruited from candidates who had qualified in forestry by taking a diploma at a recognised school, very few persons would be found to go to a university and study forestry, because there was no employment for them at the present moment. The number of private students taking the diploma in forestry was exceedingly small. There was an arrangement at Oxford whereby the science subjects of the forestry diploma course could be taken as a preliminary for a science degree, and consequently any man who had a liking for forestry or a desire to enter the Forest Service might take the preliminary course for his science subjects in forestry, and that tended to swell the number taking the forestry course, but the students did not go on to the diploma unless they were appointed probationers, except in the case of one or two Rhodes scholars.

66780. The probation necessary to qualify men who were recruited at the university age and had taken the diploma in forestry would be one year, which would be sufficient to give the additional theoretical instruction required in Indian subjects plus the additional practical instruction required on the Continent.

66781. His scheme contemplated that one of the professors at the university would be appointed and paid for by the India Office. There was a parallel for such a proceeding, as a certain number of professors at universities were appointed and paid for by outside bodies There were several cases in which the university accepted subventions from bodies subject to certain conditions. Up to a few months ago there were two Professors of Forestry appointed and paid for by the India Office, and he thought the university would agree to a scheme of that kind. The supervisor would not be able to dictate to the universities, but would be there more or less as a tutor, and if any special lectures were required he could arrange for them, the India Office paying. The cost to the India Office would not be very much greater than it was at present, because they already employed a Director of Forest Studies. It was a great pity that the whole scheme should be spoilt for a few pounds. Large sums of money were spent on training for the Provincial Service, and he did not see why something should not be done for the training of Imperial officers.

66782. Amongst the conditions of service that specially influenced the decision of candidates for the Forestry Department, he should think the chief consideration was initial salary. Men required enough to live on when they went out to India, and that was the first thing they looked at. Also they would like to come home fairly early for their first leave, the present limit of eight years' service being rather too long. There was also an impression that the present rates of pension were not sufficient. In some cases the fact that they could take a pension at 20 years' service was looked upon very favourably, as most men thought it very nice to be able to retire after 20 years' service, although very few of them were able to do it when the time came. The abolition of the 20 years' rule would not affect recruitment substantially, but the rule was a very cheap inducement as very few could afford to retire on £300 a year.

66783. (*Mr. Fisher.*) On the balance of considerations, he was in favour of recruitment at the age of 19; assuming that an Indian School of Forestry was established. Considering recruitment simply, he thought better men were obtained as graduates, and there was more certainty in the officers thus obtained. Assuming that recruitment was at 19, if an exceptionally good man was obtained it would be better for him to take an honours school as well, but he did not think all men could do it. If they could, he would be in favour of it. In view of the fact that a large part of the forestry course really coincided with scientific studies taught in the universities, it would be an economy for the forest school to make as much use as possible of the course. To obtain an honours degree at Oxford it was necessary to specialise during the last year in one subject, and it required a very good man to be able to specialise in that subject in addition to such other subjects as might be included in the forestry course. He had a probationer now, who, in addition to the forestry course, had taken up the botany school and had

* Not printed.

obtained a first-class certificate, and that was a thing he would encourage.

66784. A probationer recruited at the school-leaving age would require a great deal more supervision than was required under the present regulations. Most undergraduates when they came up to the universities, especially if they had an appointment in their pockets, were apt to sow their wild oats during the first year or two, and they might come a crash in their examination. The temptations would be greater than they would be at such a place as Cooper's Hill.

66785. He was decidedly in favour of direct appointments of Indians to the Imperial Service rather than by promotion from the Provincial Service. To begin with, he did not think the Provincial Service in the past had been getting quite the right stamp of man required for Imperial appointments. If men were promoted from the Provincial Service the question would arise as to how long a man would have to wait before being sent to England for his training. A man who had been a long time in the Provincial Department could not be expected to make a good Imperial officer, although there might be some exceptions. Selection was always a matter of difficulty, but if a system of proper selection could be devised he would be in favour of bringing some Provincial men to England and putting them through a practical training, which was very necessary before they entered the Imperial Service. That practical training would have to be on the Continent. He had not had much experience of Indians recruited to the Imperial Service. One man was recruited last year and had gone out in the present year, but had somewhat broken down in health during his course of training.

66786. (*Chairman.*) There was no supervision by the Director of Indian Forest Studies of the men sent over from the native States.

66787. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) He could not speak with any decided authority as to what was being done at Edinburgh at the present time, as the course there had been rearranged. It was a three-years' course, and the last five months of it was carried out on the Continent. It was only in the sense that no Forestry School in Great Britain was as yet complete on its practical side that he said Edinburgh was not fully equipped, although he could not speak with authority regarding the theoretical training at Edinburgh

66788. In Germany every stage of education was controlled by Government, so that a boy was obliged to go through certain definite stages, the standard of which was set by Government. A man going in for the Forest Service in Germany would have to reach a stage corresponding to the university stage. In Bavaria students had to go to a forestry school at a university. In Prussia there were special forestry schools not connected with the university. There was a great controversy at the present moment in Germany as to whether the forestry school should be at a university or at a separate centre. In Saxony the school was separate. The courses lasted about four years, and the students had also to go to a university for lectures on law and subjects connected with jurisprudence. In Germany also the students were permitted to change about from one school to another. Very many of them took two years at one forestry school and another year at another school. The course was a lengthy one, and all the recruits had to reach the same standard of qualification.

66789. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) There were no fully developed forests in India for the purpose of demonstration, but there was no reason why a student should not obtain a very good theoretical training in India. He believed the theoretical training at Dehra Dun was quite good enough for the Provincial Service, though not good enough for the Imperial Service. It was defective, for instance, in the study of management, valuation, finance, and similar subjects, which were very important points from the fully trained forest officer's point of view. Then again, a large number of different methods of management had been worked out in various parts of Europe, and they had to be observed in connection with the lectures. It was of little value lecturing to beginners on forestry subjects unless examples could be shown. The theoretical and practical training might be separated to some extent, but not altogether. Taking as an example the group system of regenerating forests, it was quite possible to lecture on the subject, but if proper examples could not be shown the lecture was largely wasted. At the present moment, in the case of the Universities, in one term lectures were given on certain cultural systems, and when the students next went abroad they went into the forests and were shown examples, and had to write reports. That would not be a practicable system in India, and consequently the only course at present for Indian students would be to come to Europe. He did not think a system of scholarships would bring about a very large increase in the number of Indian forestry students, as forest life did not on the whole appeal to them, and probably the pay of the Service was not as good as they could get elsewhere.

66790. He believed Indian students were quite well aware that a career was open to them in the Forest Service.

66791. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) It might be that in thinking of the Provincial Service he was thinking of it rather as it had been in the past than as it had been since the course at Dehra Dun had been reorganised, and to that extent the answers he had given had to be modified.

66792. When acting as Director in India he insisted very strongly on having direct appointments to the Provincial Service, as it was impossible to get good men by promoting rangers who had reached an advanced age, as was then the normal practice.

66793. He did not think that for years past the various Governments of Germany had devoted an enormous amount of thought and study to the promotion of forestry education; the greatest advancement had been brought about by forestry experts themselves, people like Hartig and Heyer, who had done a tremendous work in establishing the training on a proper basis. Undoubtedly forestry training had been recognised and encouraged by the State, as all education in Germany was encouraged.

66794. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The final position of probationers was not entirely governed by the marks obtained in the final examination. Fifty per cent. was given for practical work and 50 per cent. for the final written and oral examination. The marks for the practical course were largely based upon reports of work the men had done abroad. For instance, the students had to make a working plan and received marks for that, and they had to write reports on specific subjects they had studied. They received no marks for class work, which was somewhat of a drawback under the present system, but as long as there were men at Cambridge and men at Oxford it was impossible to place a proper value on any marks, even if the universities would give marks. At the end of the course a special examination was held by an Examining Board consisting of two forest officers on leave and the witness himself, and the candidates had to pass that examination in addition to the university examinations.

66795. (*Chairman.*) The Director, proposed in his scheme ought to be made a professor of the university, as that would give him more power of supervision. At the present moment, according to his orders, he was not supposed to supervise or control the courses of studies at the Universities. It would be necessary for the Director to have up-to-date experience. He did not think there would be any difficulty whatever in having an official with this status at the university. Already professors of Indian law were there, and there was someone, he believed, looking after the Indian civilians.

(The witness withdrew.)

At the India Office, London, Wednesday, 6th May, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E.
R. R. SCOTT, Esq. } *Joint Secretaries.*

Sir J. D. LATOUCHE,* K.C.S.I., Member of the India Council, called and examined.

66796. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he had been Chairman of the Selection Committee for the Forest Department for the last three or four years.

66797. He thought the present system of recruitment was working very well, the chief difficulty being that men went out to India too old. Men recruited at the age of 25 or later did not adapt themselves readily to Indian conditions, and did not easily accept the position of a subordinate. For all the Services he thought it would be a good thing if men came out not later than 23, but he could not say that it would be a good thing to take boys from school and send them out to India at a very early age. Under the present arrangements men were obtained who had been up to the University. It was suggested at one time that more value might be given to a diploma in forestry, and if that was done he did not think it was necessary to keep the men on probation so long. If it could be arranged to reduce the probation in England on account of the fact that the men had been doing in the universities the kind of work they would do on probation, then he thought they could be sent out to India earlier, or at the same time they might take a higher course of education in the universities before they came up for selection or examination. It was necessary to have a certain amount of practical experience on the Continent, but he believed a year would be enough.

66798. All the Committees with which he had had to deal had included a retired Forest Officer, and they had been generally up-to-date in their knowledge of India. In choosing candidates an endeavour was made to obtain men who were suited both by physique and character for the particular Service and men who would take kindly to the hardships of a lonely forest life. The Committee had nothing to do with their intellectual qualities. The Committee examined the certificates which were given to the candidates before seeing them, and when the candidates came up inquired into their record in the way of games, and noticed whether they were manly in appearance and likely to do well. Men who were accustomed to judge of men could make up their minds on questions of that kind very quickly. The candidates were classified in three grades, A, B, and C, and when all the candidates had been seen the Committee compared their notes and generally found no difficulty in discovering the best men of the lot. The medical test came afterwards, but the Committee had nothing to do with that. At one time there was a walking test and a riding test and the latter was still taken into consideration. The former physical test was a very good thing, as it showed that a man was vigorous.

66799. It was not a function of the Committee to keep themselves in personal touch with the Appointments Boards of the universities. The present rule was that no one could come before the Committee unless he had taken his degree, and a list of all the candidates who had taken degrees was made up. During the last few years, there had only been about five appointments a year and about 20 candidates had appeared each year. If the number of candidates was larger the system of selection would be rather difficult. There was a rule by which candidates could be made to pass a competitive examination, but that rule had never been exercised as there was no real difficulty in coming to a final decision without the further test of an examination.

66800. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) It was important that the candidates should show they had taken a keen interest in things connected with country pursuits.

66801. *Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) No Indian had been appointed by the Secretary of State to serve on the Committee. Mr. Caccia was always appointed, or Sir William Schlich, and generally the Chairman of the Revenue Committee, an ex-Forest Officer who knew the class of men required, and also someone from the Home Civil Service. He certainly thought it would be an advantage to have an Indian on certain Committees.

66802. (*Mr. Sly*) The Ex-Forest Officer was a man who had had recent Indian experience.

66803. The number of Indian candidates for the Forest Service did not exceed three a year at the outside.

66804. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The Selection Committee was appointed every year, and was not a standing Committee. They merely made recommendations to the Secretary of State which the Secretary of State could accept or not as he chose. He thought there would be a little difficulty in getting a representative of the universities to serve on the Committee.

66805. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The Secretary of State sometimes modified the recommendations of the Committee to a slight extent.

(The witness withdrew.)

* This witness did not submit a written statement.

At the India Office, London, Wednesday, 17th June, 1914.

PRESENT:—

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.
GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, Esq., C.I.E.
WALTER CULLY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., M.P.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E.
R. R. SCOTT, Esq. } *Joint Secretaries.*

WILLIAM DAWSON, Esq., University Reader in Forestry, University of Cambridge.

Written Statement relating to forestry teaching at Cambridge University, and also to the selection and training of probationers for the Indian Forest Service.*

66806. *Description of Course of Study, etc.*—The course for the Diploma in Forestry extends over two years. It has recently been re-organised, and considerably extended, and is now conducted on the modern line of training adopted at the old established Forest Schools and University Departments in Germany. The examinations for the Diploma are held in two parts. For Part I the subjects are:—

(*a*) Principles of Forestry.
(*b*) Forest Botany, Part I.
(*c*) Silviculture.
(*d*) Forest Entomology, Part I.
(*e*) Forest Engineering and Surveying, and
(*f*) Geology.

In Part II the subjects are:—

(*a*) Forest Management.
(*b*) Forest Botany.
(*c*) Forest Utilisation.
(*d*) Forest Protection, and
(*e*) Forest Entomology.

Candidates must also have devoted a minimum period of six months to Practical Forestry in a forest. Arrangements have been made for part of this practical work taking place on an estate in England, where it will be carried out under the direction of the school. Part of the time may also be spent on the continent, where specified work will be done under approved direction. The whole course is designed to give a thorough training in the theory and practice of forestry, on which there may be superimposed the special technical knowledge demanded by the practice of forestry under any conditions.

66807. The School of Forestry at Cambridge occupies buildings which have been erected by the University at a cost of £7,500. They contain lecture rooms, laboratories, research rooms, an Indian Forestry room, a library, a workshop, and private rooms for lecturers. The building is well adapted for the work and is now in process of being equipped.

The school has the advantage of the uses of the University Botanic Gardens, which are excellently equipped with specimens of all the common trees, native and exotic, and also with many of the rarer species. Arrangements have been made for the starting of a small forest nursery adjoining the Gardens in the coming season. In the neighbourhood of Cambridge there is a variety of woodlands, partly in the hands of some of the Cambridge colleges, and partly privately owned, which are used for excursions with the students throughout the course.

The school is already actively engaged in research work in various branches of forestry. Several bulletins have been published within the last year, and others are in preparation. Investigations on a number of subjects are now in progress, but they have not yet been long enough on hand for definite conclusions to be formed.

66808. The staff of the school consists of:—

Reader in Forestry (Silviculture, Forest Management, Forest Botany, etc.).—W. Dawson, M.A.
Lecturer in Forest Utilisation, and Director of Timber Research.—E. R. Burdon, M.A.
Lecturer in Botany.—F. T. Brooks, M.A.
Lecturer in Entomology.—C. Warburton, M.A.
Lecturer in Engineering.—R. H. Adie, M.A.
Lecturer in Indian Forestry.—H. Jackson.
Lecturer in Indian Geology.—T. D. la Touche.
Assistant Investigator in Timber.—A. P. Long, B.A.
Adviser in Forestry.—Charles Hankins.

66809. *Special Provisions for Indian Forestry.*—The University of Cambridge has conformed with the regulations issued by the India Office on 2nd February, 1911, which took effect as regards probationers selected in or after 1912.

A Lecturer on Indian Forestry was appointed on 14th May, 1912, to give lectures on Indian Silviculture, Indian Trees, and Indian Forest Law. Mr. H. Jackson, ex-Conservator of Forests in India, was appointed to the position. He has recently completed 25 years' service in different parts of India, and was engaged for three years at the College at Dehra Dun as Deputy-Director, and principal Instructor in Forestry. The University has recently raised the status of the post to that of University Teacher. Mr. T. D. la Touche, an ex-member of the Indian Geological Survey, gives special courses of lectures on Indian Geology for Indian Forest students

Special collections of materials for the teaching of Indian Forestry have been formed, or are in course of formation. There is an exceptionally good series of Indian timbers in four-feet planks, and the herbarium will be completed before long. A room in the new Forestry School is set aside for the Indian Forestry work, and will be used for the special teaching needed for this branch. These arrangements have been made, and the collections formed, by the University out of the general funds of the Forestry School, since the present regulations issued by the India Office took effect three years ago. The Forestry Committee of the University further contemplate extension of the general teaching in directions which will have a direct bearing on Indian Forestry. This applies specially to the course in Forest Engineering.

66810. *Selection of Probationers.*—The best type of forestry student is found to be the man who has already received a broad education, and who has studied a variety of subjects, preferably not science subjects. His mind is trained, and he approaches the subject from the proper point of view, and learns quickly.

For the Forest Service, either in India or at home, the best type of man can be got from those who have had a chance of proving themselves at

* See also Appendix XI.

general work, and then by inclination have taken up the study of forestry. Under a system by which the probationers were selected, on leaving school, candidates would come forward not so much on their own choice, as on the recommendations of their teachers. The candidate at the early age would not be qualified to exert his own judgment, and might start a course of training for specialised work, which he would afterwards find he was not suited for, and might even cordially dislike, and the fact of his having taken a specialised training, before he has completed a broad general education, would place him at a grave disadvantage in other work. Thus there is the chance of harm, both to the Service, and to the individual. Candidates who have already received a wide general University education are likely to benefit more by the specialised training in forestry, and also, from the greater breadth of education, to make better officials.

66811. The system of selecting from men who have so far proved themselves during their University course gives a much bigger selection, and the field might with advantage be still farther opened by accepting as a qualification a degree in branches other than natural sciences. Many men who are eminently suited to forestry work start their University careers in subjects other than natural sciences, and before they can fulfil the present conditions have passed the age limit.

The objection is often raised to the present system of selection and training that the men are too old before reaching India. This seems to be based on the fact, not that it makes for inefficiency in the Service, but that under the present pensions scheme individuals often have difficulty in putting in the period of service which entitles them to the full pension before they arrive at the age at which they are compulsorily superannuated.

66812. As far as the centre at which the special forestry training is given is concerned the matter is not of importance, provided the school at which the training is given is efficient. The advantage of accepting existing centres is that the training can be got from the organisation which the Universities are providing. The courses of instruction for any diploma or certificate in Forestry ought to aim at the inculcation of the general principles of the science of forestry and not merely at the teaching of rules and precepts which will suit any particular set of circumstances. The latter is apt to happen at any institution set up for a special purpose, and all the more so when the students in attendance are young. The existence of more than one possible centre of training also makes for increased efficiency in the individual institutions, and affords an enormous convenience to the probationers, many of whom have associations with one or other of the many British universities.

66813. From the point of view of a School of Forestry the reduction in the number of students resulting on their withdrawal from the school would be comparatively insignificant, but the fact remains that the schools are now in existence, and are firmly established, and are becoming steadily more efficient and thorough. They thus provide a means by which the men for any special Service can receive their general training, and, in addition, Cambridge University, out of its own funds, has made special provision for the complete training of the probationers for the Indian Service. If it were decided that probationers were not to receive their training in the University, the school would thus be left with special teachers and special equipment which are not required in the general work of the school.

Already six probationers have received their training at Cambridge.

66814. Under the present system:—

(i) A large selection of suitable candidates is available.

(ii) The men receive a broad education and are likely to make good officials.

(iii) The probationers have the advantage of the teaching in complete Forestry Schools established and being developed by the Universities, besides of the special teaching which these institutions have provided voluntarily to meet their special needs.

(iv) The objection to the comparatively late age at which probationers proceed to India, not being founded on any suggestion that this is detrimental to the Service, but on the ground that the men themselves suffer some disadvantage as regards pensions, can be met by altering the present pensions scheme.

Mr. William Dawson, called and examined.

66815. (*Chairman.*) The witness was University Reader in Forestry at Cambridge University, to which post he was appointed in May last year. He was in charge of the school, which was founded seven years ago, but which had been completely re-organised within the last 12 months, new courses and a new diploma having been instituted. A sum of £7,500 had been spent by the University on buildings and equipment within the last year.

66816. The number of students had never been large. From the books he found that the average number was about 10 or 11; at the present time there were 10 students, but he knew of a large number who were coming up next year, and the prospect was hopeful.

66817. Since the present regulations for recruitment to the Indian Forest Service came into force six probationers had gone to Cambridge for their training, *i.e.*, an average of two per annum.

66818. Mr. Jackson, an ex-Conservator of Forestry in India, had been recently appointed as Lecturer on Indian Silviculture. Mr. Jackson left the Service about three years ago. The witness had general charge of the students preparing for the Indian Service, Mr. Jackson merely giving the special lectures instituted for Indian probationers.

66819. Formerly the men took their practical work mostly abroad, and the school did not undertake the actual direction of the work, but he was now instituting a system by which, on an estate of which he had charge, the men could be kept under his own eye for their practical training, at any rate for a considerable part of the six months, and the rest of the time they might spend abroad for further experience. The experience gained by a student in the forests of Great Britain would not be of equal value to that which could be obtained abroad as far as finished forestry was concerned, but the principles of forestry could be taught in an incomplete forest in Great Britain. From the students' point of view there was perhaps as much to learn in an English forest for a certain part of the time as in a forest abroad.

66820. The main reason why an English course was instituted was that it made it possible to have someone in direct control of the students. Students going abroad were not accompanied by a member of the teaching staff; the Indian forest probationers were under the direction of the Director of Indian Forest Studies, but it was hoped to institute a system by which it would be possible for the University to look after them abroad as well as at home.

66821. When students were in Germany they were put under the charge of a German forest officer, who would see that they carried out certain works and performed certain exercises; generally the German forest officer would act under the direction of the school, and that would be sufficient.

66822. With regard to the relative values of German and English training, he himself had had five years' experience of German training and was prepared to say that a student could be taught in an English forest, in the earlier part of his career at any rate. There were now certain estates in England where good principles of forestry were to be seen. The place he had in mind was in the county of Sussex, and there was also an estate in Aberdeenshire. Those estates would serve well

from a training point of view, but would not do for a training in finished forestry.

66823. Unless the number of students for the Indian Forest Service were large it would hardly be possible for Cambridge to make arrangements by which students going abroad would be under the control of an English officer, as it would be a serious expense on the school to send someone with the students. The school had already incurred considerable expense in connection with the teaching of Indian Forest students, and unless the Government guaranteed the expense it would be impossible for the school to send a man abroad with a small number of students. It might be possible to place the men under the charge of the Director of Indian Studies, as at present. Mr. Caccia now took the students both from Oxford and Cambridge during the time they were abroad, and he understood, though he did not know, that Mr. Caccia was with them during the whole time. There would be no difficulty in making an arrangement whereby students from two or three schools, Oxford, Cambridge and Edinburgh, could all go simultaneously to the same forest, and in that case the number would be sufficient to justify placing a British officer over them.

66824. The Cambridge course was a two years' course, but those two years were actually employed in applied forestry work. The Edinburgh course was three years, including preliminary scientific subjects. The Cambridge course was really a five years' course as compared with Edinburgh, because the Cambridge man had already studied three years for the Natural Science Tripos before taking up the study of forestry, and the two years for the diploma of forestry was spent exclusively in forestry work. The Oxford school would be the same as Cambridge as regards time.

66825. The question whether a diploma in forestry would be a sufficient qualification for the Service depended upon the preliminary qualifications demanded. Cambridge had now brought out new regulations in which considerable qualifications in pure science were demanded before men were admitted to the diploma, and in that case he thought the qualification would be sufficient.

66826. The number of students he believed would increase very largely in the near future. It was proposed that a special examination should be instituted at Cambridge for a B.A. degree in forestry, and that would be certain to attract large numbers of men. This would be separate from the diploma course which was at present in force.

66827. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) He did not attach much importance to a man having taken a science degree before he went to the School of Forestry, and he would throw the school open to candidates who had taken any degree. Very good students were often obtained who had specialised in classics to begin with. Such students would have to go through the scientific work afterwards, but they would do that work much more quickly. If men came to the school who had only taken a classical degree, or some other than a scientific degree, they would have to prepare themselves for the preliminary work for the diploma. According to the new regulations the men must have passed the preliminary examination in science, or the first M.B. examination, or a certain number of parallel examinations with a basis of scientific subjects.

66828. On the subject of the age limit, he thought the present limit of 22 excluded a number of excellent men, especially those who came to the University and started a course of study without knowing specially what to go in for, and then, too late in the day, desired to prepare for the Forest Service. He had met several such men within the last year who would have been very suitable. The old limit of 23 years would cover such cases.

66829. (*Chairman.*) The present regulation, 19 to 22, was not by any means unsatisfactory, but it would open the field a little more, and might get one or two good men, if the limit was raised to 23. He would not, however, suggest that that should be done.

66830. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) If men entered at the maximum age with the two years period of probation, they would be 24 before they had finished their education in forestry in England. The majority of men entered Cambridge at about 19, and a good many at 18, and they generally took the Natural Science Tripos examinations in two years and had the third year free in which to start forestry work; so that a man entering at 19 could finish both branches by the age of 23 and might finish by the age of 22 if he started with the idea of going into the Forest Service. If those limits of age were specified in the regulations one or two men might qualify, but the numbers would not be large unless the men were selected, to begin with, with the definite idea of entering the Forest Service; they would have to be earmarked and put through the course. With schoolboy or pre-university selection it would not be possible to obtain a large field of candidates who had got their degree and diploma at the age of 22.

66831. Under the present regulations the practical training abroad was given by the Director of Forest Studies and was the same for probationers coming from all the Universities. He thought there would be no difficulty in one man managing the students coming from different Universities. The regulations he proposed would apply to all students, not merely to those coming under the regulations for Indian forestry work. The training of the Indian probationers was as complete as it could be made in a student's course, and compared favourably with the training which was given in any of the German schools to the officers of the German Service. German students had greater facilities for practical training than could be found in England, but in the University of Munich, where the Bavarian officers were trained, the training was entirely theoretical and in no way directly associated with woodlands. The men received their academic training and then put in a period of six months practical work in a forest, not necessarily continuous work. Under the new regulations at Cambridge the Indian forestry probationer would have to put in six months practical work, as that was insisted upon for the Cambridge diploma. The Indian forest probationer had to take the Cambridge diploma within two years of being adopted as a probationer.

66832. With regard to the staff of the Cambridge Forestry School, the whole-time men were the Reader in Forestry, himself; the Lecturer in Forest Utilisation and Director of Timber Research, Mr. Burdon; the Lecturer in Indian Forestry, Mr. Jackson; the Assistant Investigator in Timber, Mr. Long; and the Adviser in Forestry, Mr. Hankins. The Lecturer in Botany, Mr. Brooks, was Lecturer on Plant Pathology in the School of Botany in Cambridge. The Lecturer in Entomology, Mr. Warburton, was Lecturer on Entomology in the School of Agriculture. The Lecturer in Engineering, Mr. Adie, was Lecturer in Engineering in the School of Agriculture, and Mr. la Touche, the Lecturer in Indian Geology, was attached to the School of Geology. They were part-time officers employed to give special courses.

66833. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The School of Forestry in Cambridge was founded seven years ago, and the school at Oxford a little before. After the schools were founded a special course for Indian forestry was added. The schools were started as university departments for general forestry, and special provision was made for the teaching of foresters for India. No contribution was received from the State towards the expenses of training Indian probationers.

66834. (*Mr. Sly.*) The normal course of students taking the diploma of forestry was three years in the science course plus two years in actual diploma work, or five years at the University at the present time, but a man could arrange to do it in less time. The witness promised to send in statistics showing the number of students who had taken the diploma and the age at which they had taken it, in order to show how many men with diplomas were available for selection for the Indian Service.

66835. With regard to the whole-time or part-time teachers in the school of forestry, the Adviser in Forestry had no teaching to do in the school. The others were all engaged in teaching and gave their whole time to the forestry school. The primary duty of the Assistant Inspector in Timber was investigation, but he also took part in the teaching. Each member of the staff was engaged in research work for a certain part of the time, but their services were available for teaching, and especially for tutorial work. The Investigator in Timber was an official of the school, not of the Government. A grant was given by Government, but the teachers were appointed by the school and were under the direction of the school. The responsibility for the work was on the school, which had to devise schemes and carry them out. The only two members of the staff having experience of India were Mr. Jackson, who had had experience of Indian forestry, and Mr. la Touche, who had had experience of Indian geology.

66836. According to the regulations the practical course hitherto had consisted of ten weeks abroad and ten weeks in England, but under the new regulations passed by the Senate in the previous week the men would now have to spend a full period of six months in forests approved by the Committee, either abroad or at home. The Continental training might be substantially less than six months. A student might spend the whole of his six months on the Continent or might receive permission to spend them at home. There was no hard and fast rule as to the period which must be spent at home and abroad.

66837. For the proposed B.A. degree in forestry there would be two special examinations. The examination would correspond to part 1 of the diploma of forestry and was especially intended for young landowners and would not affect Indian forestry. It was designed to give an elementary knowledge of forestry to landowners and not to turn out a trained forester, so that the B.A. course would be of no use for Indian purposes. The question of starting a regular course in higher forestry *ab initio* from the time of entrance to the University had been considered during the last year, but the general University regulations would hardly admit of a special degree being provided. However, in order to meet the case the scope of the teaching for the diploma had been considerably increased within the last year.

66838. At present the regulations provided for five years at the University. A man could concentrate it into four without any difficulty, provided he made up his mind in time, but to do the work thoroughly the period could not be less than four years. It would not be necessary to extend it to five in order to include special Indian instruction as the whole of it could be done without difficulty in the four years.

66839. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) With regard to the reason for the change in the regulations as to the redistribution of time between Germany and England, the witness explained that the long vacation was the one period when there was no actual work going on in a forest, so that a man might spend his period of practical work in a British forest without seeing any work performed. Also it was compulsory upon students to reside for a period of ten weeks in France or Germany, which it was highly desirable they should do, but for a British diploma in forestry it seemed a little out of place to insist on men being taken by Continental foresters. The school had no jurisdiction over the forests, and if anything arose which caused France or Germany to say they would not take the men no one would be able to obtain the diploma. Students ought to see as much of Continental forestry as possible, but the principles of forestry could be learned in a British forest, as the British forests were now being put under decent management and brought into order. While it might not be absolutely essential that the men should go either to France or Germany to complete their training, they would gain valuable experience by doing so.

The case was comparable with what was done in the medical profession. Men from the medical schools frequently went to Vienna although the schools in England were efficient. Whilst it might be advisable for a man to go to France or Germany or India or Timbuctoo in order to widen his experience it was not essential for him to do so before he obtained his diploma. The regulations had been changed partly because it was the opinion of the Cambridge school that the facilities for practical training at home were increasing and would ultimately be sufficient, and partly because the regulations formerly in force were extremely complicated. Under the new regulations the curriculum had been much simplified and the scope of the teaching had been considerably extended. A series of new classes had been started.

66840. Forest work was seasonable, and in order to see it a student had to be in the forest in the particular seasons when work was going on. There was no difficulty in placing students in forests in France or Germany at a time when the maximum profit might be gained, the authorities being willing to take students at the time which was considered best for their training.

66841. With regard to the steps that had been taken by Cambridge University to make the teaching in Indian forestry efficient, since the school became a recognised centre for the teaching of Indian forestry in 1912 it had voluntarily got together material which would make the teaching efficient, the work having been done under no promise from the India Office or the Government, and with no encouragement that amounted to a pledge. It was a purely voluntary development on the part of the school itself.

66842. (*Mr. Madge.*) It was quite possible for a student to obtain a complete training in forestry in Great Britain. The principles of forestry had been known in Great Britain for many years, but they had not been applied. Now, however, on a large number of estates the correct principles of forestry were being applied, and the more or less natural woods were being brought into order. That had been going on for a period of twenty years or more, especially on certain Highland estates in Scotland where there were records of actual work on the forests for over twenty years. There was one estate in Scotland, N——, which was better than most English estates in that there was a variety of woodlands and a variety of soil, and this afforded an excellent training ground for general forestry.

66843. An imperfectly managed forest which had been brought into order was as useful a training ground as an immaculate forest which had been kept in order for a very long time.

66844. On the estate now under his management a good training could be obtained, quite as good as could be obtained anywhere. If there was the same teaching organisation in India the training could be obtained there, and he had mentioned in his memorandum a particular locality in which the teaching was given.

66845. With regard to the age at which a man should go to India, a man of mature years was more satisfactory than an extreme youth.

66846. He was rather in favour of having several forest schools as centres of training than one at either Oxford or Cambridge, and would not give preferential treatment to any.

66847. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) At present in the Cambridge school there were two English students who had been accepted for the Forest Service. There was only one Indian student. He had just taken his diploma and was not a probationer. The Indian Forest Service was extremely popular amongst English students.

66848. There was no regular State Forest Service in England, but the Board of Agriculture took a man now and again. Practically all the forests in Great Britain were private estates, not more than 2 per cent. of the forest area being in the hands of the State.

66849. The course of teaching at Cambridge was mainly intended to benefit the land-owning class, the proposed special examination in forestry was intended to give that class a slight training in the economics of forestry. The two years' course was a complete training for a forester, and there was also a shorter course. There was not much demand for a completely trained forester except for foreign service.

66850. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) In the School of Forestry at Cambridge the students had to pass the ordinary diploma examinations throughout the course, and at the end had a final examination on the results of which they were placed in classes. The final examination was partly oral, partly practical, and partly in written papers. At present 200 marks were given to the paper examination and 100 to the oral. There were two papers each of which was given 100 marks. At the end of the course the student could not possibly be a complete forester; however good his college course might have been he had only learned the rudiments of the industry. A student needed a great deal more than the six months practical training demanded in order to give him all the experience he required of practical forestry. The course was merely intended to put him on the right lines.

66851. He was satisfied with the relative importance given to theoretical knowledge and practical knowledge, because the theoretical knowledge was largely based upon practical experience. The questions asked were based on the knowledge acquired by the students in practice, or at all events, dealt with things they had seen in practice. For testing a knowledge of forestry a competitive examination might be satisfactory, but it would not determine whether a man would be a good officer or not. Personality was very important, and it was difficult to test that by examination.

66852. (*Chairman.*) He had no Indian forest experience himself, his career having been confined to Europe

66853. The fees of students attending the Cambridge School of Forestry would amount to a little over £20 a year, over and above the cost of living at the University.

66854. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The Forestry Committee of the University had put forward suggestions to the Senate that a degree should be instituted and that degree would be an ordinary degree with forestry as a special subject.

66855. (*Mr. Sly.*) The Cambridge Forest School was designed to meet the requirements of English landowners, which were entirely different from the requirements of the large State forests of India. From his experience of Continental forests and British forestry, and his knowledge of the needs of a student in forestry, he believed that a man could obtain the instruction he required in an imperfectly managed British forest and could derive as much benefit from it as he would from staying in a highly developed German forest. The Continental training simply widened the students' experience. As he had said, the forest student was in much the same position as the medical man who after receiving his training in England was none the worse for having a Continental experience. Just as a medical man could be made an efficient doctor by his English training so an efficient forester could be made out of his training in British forests. English forests were continually improving. It was true that they would take another century before they would be in the same condition as the German forests, but that was a matter only affecting financial results. A man could be taught upon an unfinished subject quite as well as upon the finished, and could see enough of the best models and practical results of the principles to suit his case. He could mention four estates in England and Scotland where a complete training in forestry could be given suitable for the great State forests in India. Those estates were being raised to the highest standard of forest management.

66856. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) If he had been giving evidence to the Commission ten years ago it would certainly not have been as strong as it was at present in favour of a British training, and he believed that if he had to give evidence ten years hence it would be much more strongly in favour of the British forests than the evidence he was giving to-day. The advance in British forestry during the last five to ten years had been very marked, and consequently a man who had been out in India during that time would not be in touch with British development. At the time he took his own training he had to go abroad for his practical work.

66857. (*Chairman.*) A forest in its complete form simply gave better financial results; as a medium of teaching it was of value at any period of its development, once the right system was started. A forest could be moulded into a good training ground in a comparatively few years. The American schools within the last few years had become extremely efficient institutions, yet less than ten years ago the men had to be sent to Europe for training. He did not wish to say that a man ought to dispense with a Continental training, but he maintained that he could receive his actual training in British forests. He did not regard a Continental training as indispensable.

(The witness withdrew.)

E. P. Stebbing, Esq., Head of the Department of Forestry, University of Edinburgh.

Written Statement relating to Forestry Education in the University of Edinburgh.*

66858. The last few years have witnessed a great development in forestry in this country. With the generous aid accorded by the Agricultural Departments and the Development Commissioners this great advance has, it is thought, proceeded upon sound lines. It was clearly recognised that the first essential was to place forestry education throughout the British Isles upon a firm basis.

The University of Edinburgh began to teach forestry in 1888, Dr. Somerville being appointed Lecturer in Forestry in that year. Some two years later he was succeeded by the late Colonel F. Bailey. The latter resigned in 1910, the writer being appointed to the post. A course of lectures was delivered annually during the Winter Session up to Colonel Bailey's retirement. The course was chiefly taken by students proceeding to the Degree of Agriculture within the University.

During the above period up to 1906 the only courses in advanced forestry in all its branches delivered in this country were given by Sir William Schlich, K.C.I.E., and the late Prof. W. R. Fisher at the Royal Indian Engineering College, Cooper's Hill.

From 1906 onwards the position of affairs materially changed.

66859. *The Ordinance for the Degree of B.Sc. in Forestry at Edinburgh.*—So impressed were the University of Edinburgh authorities with the importance of providing forestry students with a full curriculum of study based on a scientific foundation, together with the necessary practical training, that they prepared an ordinance which perscribed regulations for a course of study extending over three years and with two series of examinations, which, on being passed successfully, would empower the University to confer the Degree of Bachelor of Science in Forestry. The ordinance was approved by His Majesty in Council

* See also Appendix XI.

in 1906, and the University authorities thereupon made provision for the requisite courses of study and examinations. Special lecturers in Forest Botany and Forest Entomology were appointed in 1908, and other special courses were arranged for in Forest Engineering and Forest Chemistry.

66860. *The Curriculum for the Degree.*—As regards the curriculum for the Degree of Forestry at least one year of study of pure science subjects (Botany, Zoology, Chemistry, and Natural Philosophy) is required before candidates can complete the first examination; and not less than two additional years are required to enable candidates to complete their study of the applied science subjects (Forest Botany, Forest Mycology, Forest Zoology, Forest Engineering, Surveying, Forest Chemistry, and Geology*), including forestry, elementary and advanced, in all its branches, theoretical and practical; these subjects are taken at the second or final examination. The courses in practical forestry are extensive. The first courses, which are taken in Scotland, are designed to ensure that each student should thoroughly learn the manual part of forestry labour, such as work in the nursery, planting, felling, thinning, etc. Several weeks are spent by the students in performing these operations with their own hands under suitable guidance. The advanced practical courses are taken partly in Scotland and partly in Germany. These practical courses cover a period of six to seven months in all.

66861. *Graduates in Forestry.*—As at least three years had to elapse before the education for the degree in forestry could be completed no degrees were conferred until 1911, when three candidates received it, and up to the present 12 degrees have been granted. It is expected that five to seven more will be given in July next. The forestry graduates have mostly received appointments in the Colonial Forest Services, or at home, or in commercial companies in the East. One is in the Indian Forest Service.

66862. *Students in the Department.*—The number of students entered in the University registers as aspirants for the forestry degree according to the latest return is as follows: In the first year, 21; in the second year, 13; and in the final year, 16; altogether 50 students. Three of the final year have graduated since the return was made up. Several of these students are working with the object of qualifying themselves for selection as probationers in the Indian Forest Service, Edinburgh having received from the Secretary of State the distinction of being approved as a training school for probationers in that Service.

66863. *Indian Students from Native States.*—Other students (there are some ten in the three years) are Indian students from Native States in India. They have come to Edinburgh with the sole object of obtaining the degree in forestry, and so qualifying for employment in the Forest Departments of their own States. These students and others are attracted to Edinburgh owing to its cheapness, both as regards University fees and living expenses.

66864. *Equipment and Staff.*—The University authorities, impressed with the importance of improving the building accommodation and equipment and of enlarging the staff of the department, applied through the Treasury to the Development Commissioners for a grant of money to enable improvements to be effected. £4,500 was voted for a new building with lecture rooms, museums, laboratories, and rooms for research, on condition that the University provided at least an equal sum. The building is now completed. £2,000 was also voted for furnishings and equipment, which have now been placed in their appropriate rooms. The building is now in occupation, and the museums are now being fitted up. £500 a year for five years was promised for the payment of additional teachers, and a lecturer-assistant and demonstrator-assistant have been appointed. £2,000 was also voted for a forest garden, a site for which is now being acquired.

66865. *Training of Indian Forest Probationers.*—Graduates in forestry of Edinburgh, who have at the same time passed a public examination of the University of an honours standard in some branch of natural science, are qualified, being of suitable age, to present themselves as candidates for probationership in the Indian Forest Service.

At the desire of the Secretary of State arrangements have been made to deliver within the University to accepted Indian Forest probationers (holding the degree of B.Sc. in Forestry of this University) courses in the systematic botany of Indian Trees, Forest Law, Geology of India, Indian Forest Working Plans and German, *vide* letter of 22nd October, 1913, from the Vice-Chancellor and Principal, University of Edinburgh, to the India Office.

* Geology is a pure Science Subject.

Mr. E. P. Stebbing called and examined.

66866. (*Chairman.*) The witness was the head of the Department of Forestry in the University of Edinburgh, having been appointed to that post on the 1st May, 1910. He was a member of the Indian Forest Service, and was due to retire on pension in July next. He was placed by the Department on foreign service at Edinburgh.

66867. In recent years a considerable sum of money had been spent on the Forestry School at Edinburgh, money which had been drawn from the Agricultural Department, the Development Commissioners, and the University itself. There were at the present time 50 students on the books. Two of those students were presenting themselves this year for the Indian Forest Service, and there were two or three prospective candidates in their second year. He could not say how many first year men would present themselves as they were still engaged in doing their first science course.

66868. The Edinburgh course occupied three years. The first year was devoted to pure science and the other two years to forestry and applied sciences. As a matter of fact very few students took the course in three years as the first science course nearly always occupied a year and a half, so that it was nearer four than three. The men entered the University at any time after 17 years of age, the average age being probably 18 to 18½, though some came as late as 19. The men who came at 18 in the ordinary course would be trained and ready to go to India between the ages of 21½ and 22. If men entered at 17 and got their first science in a year they would be able to leave at 20½ years with their degree.

66869. With regard to the facilities offered by the school for students who anticipated entering the Indian Service, the Secretary of State had asked whether the University would be willing to give courses to probationers, to men who had already taken their forestry degree, and arrangements had been made to deliver the courses which the India Office desired, *i.e.*, in Forest Botany, Indian Geology, Indian Forest Law, and Indian working plans. There was a very complete course of Forest Engineering, and as an Indian Forest officer he could not say that any addition would be required to the present course in Forest Engineering, which was laid down by the present Dean of the Faculty of Science, Professor Hudson Beare. None of the subjects were taught by men with Indian experience except Indian Forest Law, for which he believed arrangements had been made with a retired Indian civilian, and Indian working plans. Indian Forest Geology would be taught in the Geological Branch by Professor Geike or one of his assistants, and Indian Forest Botany would be given probably by the present lecturer in Forest Botany in the Botanical Department at the Royal Botanic Gardens. There would probably be no

difficulty in arranging with Prof. Bayley Balfour to have a course of Indian Botany given by one of his assistants who had Indian experience.

66870. Six to seven months were allotted to practical work, part of which was done in Scottish forests and part in Continental forests. For the practical work throughout the theoretical curriculum there was no doubt that some of the Scottish areas around Perth were extremely good for the training of a forester. He did not think they could be better for that part of the course because it was necessary to give students elementary work, nursery work, planting, sowing, felling, and so on; and he considered it was possible to give them a better course in that part of the training in this country than they could obtain abroad, owing to the fact that the German forest officer to whom they went had not time to devote to the work. For parts of the higher training the German training was very good. At Edinburgh the men, after they had had their advanced theoretical forestry course and before they graduated, went abroad. That was indispensable at present. One great value of foreign experience was the training it provided in forest engineering. In Great Britain it was impossible to see any large export works, large timber slides, water slides, works that had been put up in the mountains to prevent erosion and avalanches, and so on, but these could be seen on the Continent and they were indispensable to the Indian Forest Service probationer. So that on that score alone it would be necessary for the Indian forest probationer to go abroad.

66871. In the course of University training only a certain number of weeks could be devoted to practical work as a man had to be at the University during the session. At Edinburgh a minimum of ten weeks' practical work abroad was fixed for a degree, and the student had to spend those ten weeks in Germany or in France, doing the rest of his practical work at home. Up to now Germany had been always selected. At present there were eight men from Edinburgh in German forests under his supervision. Between April and July he would spend a considerable part of the summer vacation in Germany or France inspecting the men. He did not leave one of his assistants with the men when he himself was not there. It was questionable whether it was necessary to have an assistant constantly there, because the men were sent to a German forest officer with whom arrangements had been made, and it was rather difficult, even unnecessary, for another person on the spot to interfere. He quite agreed that a periodical inspection should be made, but while the inspector was there the students were probably doing what might be called show work. Provided the students were brought into touch with a German forest officer and placed on the right lines it was not necessary to have a man always there supervising them. For a man to be constantly there and do any good he would want to take charge of the area himself. This used to be the case in India in the old days when the head of the forest school was also conservator of the circle.

66872. The forests in India had not undergone a sufficient amount of treatment to make them suitable for a complete training, and he did not think they would reach that position for another 50 years. Throughout the greater part of India, when the forests were taken over by the Department, large portions of forest were more or less in a ruined condition. After the Mutiny, when railways were started, throughout the Central Provinces and Central India, the forests were simply cut to pieces for sleepers. The contractors went into the woods with bags of rupees and the native tribes hacked down the trees by the thousand and large numbers were never taken out. There was a tremendous boom and the amount of timber which was cut could not be used in the time. In many parts of the country the forests were ruined in that way, and a ruined forest required considerably more than 50 years to get into good condition again. Scientific conservation in the forests was not started when they were taken over, as years were spent in demarcation work; so that it was only within comparatively recent times that the real principles of forestry had been put into force. The forests were being gradually brought back into fair condition, but they were forests which even before being hacked about were only primeval forests. There had been similar conditions in America. It was true that a certain amount of training was being given in the American forests, but he believed it would be found that a good many of the best American foresters also came to Europe; at any rate, they were thoroughly acquainted with the European forests and made extensive tours through them. It would be rather putting the cart before the horse if an Indian forest probationer were entirely trained in India and did not see a properly managed European forest until he came home on his first furlough. At such a time he could not assimilate what he could assimilate as a student.

66873. All the elementary part of the training and parts of the more scientific training could be given in forests in Scotland, although the forests there were not absolutely under scientific treatment. The elementary part of forestry, nursery work, planting, methods of cutting down trees, etc., was done as well in Scotland as anywhere else in the world. The Scotch forester was a very good man indeed; it was only in the scientific branches of knowledge that he was backward, and portions of these scientific branches could be studied better in Germany than in Scotland. Then there was also the method of managing well-ordered forests by means of working plans, which was almost unknown in Great Britain.

66874. At Edinburgh the whole of the University fees for a forestry degree were calculated by the University head clerk to amount to £65, from beginning to end. That was the cost of being at the University and taking the course in the forest school and obtaining a forestry degree, covering a period of three years. It was possible for a very careful man to take his degree at Edinburgh for £300, including living expenses and everything, and he certainly could do it for £350. The £65 was the sum the University obtained from any man who desired to take a forestry degree, from the moment he matriculated until he took his degree.

66875. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The course at Edinburgh did not conclude with a competitive examination. There was a system of class examinations which came before the examination for the degree. The class examinations were competitive. A medal was given and also certificates for honours or pass according to the position of the men in the class, so that at the end of any particular course the men were placed in order on the results of the special class examinations. Practical work formed a considerable part of the examinations, the practical course gaining half again as many marks as the theoretical; if the marks for the theoretical were 100 the marks for the practical course would be 150. There were two practical courses, the first elementary and the second advanced, and a medal was given for each. He attached very great importance to practical work, and it was stated almost at the beginning of the course and went right through. The whole of the practical work in Scotland was done under the supervision of the forestry staff. A competitive examination on those lines might test the relative value of candidates for the Forestry Service, especially if it included practical work. He did not think a competitive examination consisting of only two or three papers in forestry would be of any value from the Indian Forest Service point of view, but he saw no difficulty in adding examinations in which practical work could be thoroughly tested. Such an examination might form only one of the tests required, as it would not discover the personal qualifications of the men for the Service. No mere examination test could do this. When he himself went up for the Forest Service he had to appear first at the India Office to be inspected and then to go for a 25 mile walk. That eliminated one or two of the

candidates, and the medical examination which followed eliminated more. After that there was a fortnight's competitive examination.

66876. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) If those tests were held to begin with and a competitive examination followed a good class of men might be secured.

66877. In the last three years there had been ten Indian students from Native States and one from British India, a Mr. Masters of Bombay, who hoped to present himself as a candidate for the Indian Forest Service when he was qualified. There was also Mr. Das from the Punjab and Mr. Chandy from Madras. Mr. Das had not quite made up his mind whether he would try for the Agricultural Department or Forestry and Mr. Chandy was going to try next year for the Indian Forest Department. The greater number of the Indian students came from Travancore. His explanation of the fact that a comparatively large number of students came from Native States was that the Native States during the last few years had been turning their attention to obtaining better trained men than they had had in the past, and they had discovered that by sending men home they could get a good article which was worth the money. Probably half of the men came with scholarships, the other half paying their own expenses.

66878. The work on the Continent came at the end of the course. The men now in Germany would graduate on the 10th July if they did well. The Continental work was part of the work for the forestry degree. The heavy expense of the practical courses was an important factor. He proposed next year to take men in their second year, who could afford the expense, abroad in the summer vacation. At present, in their second year they did six weeks' practical work in the summer vacation, and that might be done in Scotland or abroad. He proposed spending a fortnight of it abroad.

66879. There were undoubtedly some good examples of forestry at Dehra Dun and throughout the United Provinces. The forest conservancy there was probably on the whole more advanced than it was in many other parts. There was a denser population and a smaller area of woods.

66880. With reference to the statement that American forestry schools were now independent of European experience, America might go ahead but could not force Nature to make the trees grow quickly. It was impossible to get a forest into order even in America in a short time. It was well known that American forests had been lumbered and cut to pieces, and they could not be got into order in ten years.

66881. For some time the Forest Department in India was engaged in demarcation work before taking up real forestry work, which was taken up the moment the demarcation was finished. He could not say the exact date at which forestry work commenced in India, but it would be probably 35 or more years ago.

66882. (*Mr. Madge.*) The training in Scotland was as good as could be obtained anywhere else. A man to become a competent forester required to have the elementary parts of the course, including the elementary practical work, rubbed into him thoroughly, and unless a man did that part of the work as a junior student he would never do it afterwards. Therefore, the Scottish student had an advantage over the student whose practical training was entirely in Germany. A man might be sent out to India with a first-class knowledge of scientific forestry, but if he had not learned all the elementary practical and theoretical work thoroughly he was not as good a man when he came to instruct his own subordinates.

66883. Afforestation in India on scientific lines varied in the different provinces. The United Provinces would probably show as good a collection of forests as could be found in the whole of India, but that might be a matter of dispute as other conservators would no doubt declare they could show something quite as good. It might be something like another half-century before there would be perfect forests in India, but it was rather difficult to speak on the subject. There had been steady advance towards the goal.

66884. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The Forest School at Edinburgh kept in touch with the forests in Scotland and knew what forests were being worked scientifically. In Edinburgh they more or less kept to that side of Scotland because there was a Forestry School at Glasgow Agricultural College, and also one at Aberdeen. That, however, did not prevent students being taken anywhere in Scotland. There were a fair number of forests in Scotland now working on scientific plans properly plotted out for periodicity, and some of those forests were now approaching the completion of their periodicity, and in some cases had been cutting and planting scientifically. He had been to Novar and a good many other places, but he could hardly say that they were up to the Continental standard yet, although they were on the road to it. As a professional forester he could not subscribe to the opinion that Novar was as good as the forests of Germany for higher scientific training purposes. Another drawback was that the areas in the Scotch forests were very small compared with the areas in Germany. Also on the Continent one could study the different silvicultural systems over thousands of acres, showing the growth of different species on a very large scale. Experience of large forests like that was very desirable for an Indian forest probationer. When students were sent to Germany very definite instructions were given as to the things they must do and see, and amongst those things were always included the preparation of a working plan, proper systems of road making, the export of timber in difficult country, the method of running tramways and sledges, and so on. The drawback to a practical course entirely in Germany, apart from its being now-a-days unnecessary, was that the men were not allowed to do the work with their own hands; the German forest officer would not undertake the risk and the German Government would hardly want to have 16 or 20 students working in their woods. An English student simply saw what was being done and had no chance of doing any work with his own hands. If a student wanted to specialise in forest engineering he would do so after he had taken his degree, and if the Government wanted a specialist in forest engineering, or in any other branch, they could train him quite easily at Edinburgh.

66885. (*Mr. Sly.*) A candidate for admission to the Indian Forest Service had to have a degree in forestry and, in addition, to take honours in one branch of natural science. The pure science degree in Edinburgh consisted of honours in three branches, but forestry students had to take honours only in one. To take honours in one branch of natural science meant a year's work. If a man were smart enough he might take his forestry course in three years, but ordinarily speaking it would take four, including the one year's extra pure science. Consequently, in order to be qualified to become a candidate for the Indian Forest Service a man had to serve anywhere between three and a half and four years at the Edinburgh University.

66886. The witness promised to put in some statistics showing the number of students who had taken the forestry degree and the ages at which they graduated during the last three years.*

66887. Edinburgh was recognised as a place where an Indian forest probationer might undergo his probationary course. In 1913 the University was recognised as a suitable training place for probationers, but, as a matter of fact, there had been no probationers at Edinburgh yet. The probationary course had not been quite fixed. If a man had a forestry degree already and was only required to take an extra Indian course the chances were that it might only occupy a year, but that matter rested with the Secretary of State.

66888. Assuming that entry to the Indian Forest Service was made at the school-leaving age, as was the case in the days of Cooper's Hill, the selection might be restricted to students who had passed

* See Appendix XI.

through the modern side of school education, as that would be best from the forest point of view, but he fully recognised the value to the forester, or to any scientific man, of Latin and Greek. His own recommendations would be that the boys should be taken from the modern side of a public school with some knowledge of Latin.

66889. The opinions he had given regarding training on the Continent related solely to the course gone through by Edinburgh student for the degree of B.Sc. in forestry and had nothing to do with the probationary course for the Indian Forest Service. The practical courses obtained by present day students were more than he had himself. As things advanced practical training was increased, but there must be a limit to the amount of practical training that could be given.

66890. With regard to the future training of the forest probationer, his belief was that when a man had been accepted as a probationer with a forestry degree the best training that could possibly be given would be in India, at Dehra Dun. A man would do more in a year in India than he could do in Europe, and it seemed difficult to see how it could be otherwise because the subjects to be taught were Indian subjects. It was surely preferable that a man studying Indian forest botany should go out into the Dehra Dun jungles and into the Himalaya close by to do his practical work than go to Kew. At the same time they had the equipment and were prepared to give the training at Edinburgh, if required.

66891. Personally he considered the Continental training of ten weeks which the Edinburgh students obtained, added to the 4½ months practical training they had in Scotland, was sufficient for the Indian Forest Service. It was a continuous period of ten weeks, during which the men lived at one centre and paid visits to desirable types of woods. At present the whole of the training was in Germany, none of the men having yet visited French forests.

66892. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) It was possible to teach Indian students at Dehra Dun the elementary portion of the work done by students at Edinburgh, *i.e.*, the ordinary nursery work, the use of tools, and so on. Two or three years ago Dehra Dun was ahead of Edinburgh, but during the last two and a half years Edinburgh had received considerable sums of money and had now got together a very complete equipment, and also a new and commodious forestry building. He would not go so far as to say that all the training and instruction which Edinburgh students received before going to Germany could be given at Dehra Dun or at any other place in India. He did not think it was a hopeless dream to think of giving the same instruction to Indian boys in India as was now given in Edinburgh. From his knowledge of India as it was when he left four years ago he did not think it could have been done then at Dehra Dun, but it was only a matter of years before India would have a well ordered forest conservancy which would be as good as could be found in any other part of the world. In some directions it might be possible now to do as well at Dehra Dun, but in others not so well. Assuming that Dehra Dun was placed on a proper footing and young men were trained there up to the required standard (which would be possible when the forests had been brought into well-ordered management), and then brought over to Europe to see the Continental forests, he saw no reason why such a course should not be quite as efficient as was provided by institutions in England and Scotland.

66893. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) Probationers for the Indian Forest Service from Edinburgh would have had ten weeks practical work on the Continent under his supervision, and on becoming probationers would, under existing arrangements, have a further period under the direction of Mr. Caccia. The only advantage he could see in the further period was that the student would have a more extended knowledge of Germany; it would be difficult for a student to learn more in the extra ten weeks, as he had reached a stage where it was necessary that he should go into the forest as an assistant to a divisional officer. The State might pay for the luxury of giving him another 10 or 15 weeks, but it was not required, and, he thought, was a waste of money. The forestry centres had laid down a course which if worth anything should be good enough to produce forest probationers ready-made. That was what was aimed at in Edinburgh, and that was, he believed, what was being done. Men had been already taken from Edinburgh by the Colonial Office and sent out to join their appointments straight away, two men having gone in the last few months. In other words, in his opinion, the Indian forest probationer could now be obtained by the Government of India free of cost in the open market ready made. The forestry centres did not now depend for their existence, as formerly, on supplying forest probationers to India. Other demands had sprung up and the number of probationers required annually for the Indian Service was too small to affect the well-being of the larger training centres one way or the other. Edinburgh, whilst keenly desirous to assist the Government of India in this matter, looked to a wider field.

66894. The number of men studying forestry in the Edinburgh University had increased very much during the last two or three years. The total number of men in the final year at Edinburgh was now about 13 each year. Probably the number of graduates (including diplomas) from all the forestry schools each year would be about 30.

66895. The witness said he had received applications from men in the Provincial Forest Service in India who wished to go to Edinburgh to take part of the forestry degree in order to improve their position, and it seemed to him that that was a point of some importance.

66896—68043. (*Chairman.*) During the last year he had received at least five applications, and he had recommended the University to accept the men. Some of them were endeavouring to get grants and others were coming on study leave. It was a matter well worth considering, because it would considerably improve the value of the men to the Department. Three of the men he had known in Dehra Dun when he was there, and he supposed their ages would be 27 or 28, and they would be men with about five years' service, perhaps more. It struck him as being a very good thing indeed, to encourage smart men, and it would be very valuable for them to see well-orderer Continental forests. It was true that in a two years' course they would be repeating a great deal of the work they had presumably done in India, but on a more advanced standard, and also true that the arrangements at Dehra Dun for teaching were approximating to the British standard, and it might be that one year's course would be sufficient, but if a man were willing to take a year's furlough and was allowed another year the Service would not lose, as the man's value to the Service would be much increased if he took the full course for the degree. The Provincial Service now was very different from what it was when he joined the Forest Department. Men in the Provincial Service now had charge of divisions, and the course suggested would qualify an Indian to attain to a position in the superior Service, and he saw no reason why a Provincial man who had taken a forestry degree course should not be able to occupy a position in the Imperial Service, as he would have had a training in Europe.

(The witness withdrew.)

LIST OF APPENDICES.

PAGE.

I.—Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, No. 447 (Forests), dated the 29th October, 1913, relating to the Forest Department 118

II.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh relating to the Forest Department 120

III.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bengal relating to the Forest Department ... 121

IV.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bihar and Orissa relating to the Forest Department 123

V.—Memorandum prepared by the Assam Administration relating to the Forest Department ... 126

VI.—Note dated the 9th April, 1913, by the Hon. Sir Archdale Earle, Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Forest Department 133

VII.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Forest Department ... 134

VIII.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Forest Department ... 137

IX.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bombay relating to the Forest Department ... 145

X.—Memorandum prepared by the Administration of the Central Provinces and Berar relating to the Forest Department 148

XI.—Statistics furnished by the Forestry Schools of the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge, and Edinburgh regarding the students who have taken the degree or diploma in Forestry at those Universities during the last few years 150

XII.—Statement (with details by Provinces) of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Forest Service 153

XIII.—Regulations as to the Appointment of Probationers to the Indian Forest Service, 1914 ... 156

XIV.—Officials who furnished written evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their inquiry into the Forest Department, but who were not orally examined 158

APPENDIX I.

Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab and its Dependencies, No. 477 (Forests), dated Lahore, the 29th October, 1913.

SIR,—In continuation of my letter* No. 422 (Forests), dated 11th October, 1913, I am directed to forward herewith 20 copies of a letter No. 3249 (B. O. 151—11) of the same date, from the Conservator of Forests, Punjab, and of its enclosures, giving the further information required by the Royal Commission about the organisation, etc., of the Forest Department in the Punjab.

Letter from W. Mayes, Esquire, Imperial Forest Service, officiating Conservator of Forests, Punjab, to the Chief Secretary to Government, Punjab, No. 3249 (B.O. 151—11), dated Lahore, 11th October, 1913.

I have the honour to reply to your endorsement No. 2216 S., Home, dated the 23rd August, 1913, forwarding a copy of a letter dated the 1st August, 1913, from the Joint Secretary to the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India, to your address, regarding further information required by the Commission about the organisation, etc., of the Forest Department in the Punjab. I give below the information required as far as possible under the heads enumerated in the Joint Secretary's letter.

2. *Head* (*i*).—The officers of the Imperial Forest Service are recruited in England under covenant with the Secretary of State, according to regulations issued yearly by the India Office. With regard to the general suitability of the regulations, I would refer the Commission to paragraphs 1—6 of the memorandum submitted with my letter No. 274, dated the 14th April, 1913, to the Revenue Secretary to Government, Punjab. The Provincial Service is recruited from two sources—(*a*) from candidates selected for direct appointment, and (*b*) from amongst members of the Subordinate Service (Forest Rangers), who are considered specially suitable in accordance with Article 15 (*ii*) of the Forest Department Code, 7th erition. The regulations for direct appointment are contained in Forest Department Code, 7th edition. The regulations the 30th April, 1908, a copy of which is attached (*vide* Annexure) Since this notification was issued the course of training for direct appointment nominees at the Imperial Forest College has been reduced from three years to two. At present the Service is recruited by direct appointment nominees and promoted Forest Rangers in equal proportions. The existing system of recruitment is on the whole satisfactory.

3. *Head* (*ii*).—The following statement compares the rates of pay for the Imperial Forest Service in force in the years 1890, 1900, and 1913:—

Grade of Officers.	Pay in rupees per mensem.		
	In 1890.	In 1900.	In 1913.
Conservator—Grade I.	1,500	1,600	1,900
Do. do. II.	1,250	1,350	1,700
Do. do. III.	1,000	1,100	1,500
Deputy Consertor of Forests—Grade I. ...	900	900	From Rs. 580 to Rs. 1,250, rising by an annual increment of Rs. 40 per mensem up to Rs. 700, and thereafter by an annual increment of Rs. 50 per mensem.
Do. do. do. II. ...	800	800	
Do. do. do. III. ...	650	650	
Do. do. do. IV. ...	550	550	
Assistant Conservator of Forests—Grade I.	450	450	Rs. 380 to Rs. 540 by annual increment of Rs. 40 per mensem.
Do. do. do. II.	350	350	
Do. do. do. III.	250	Grade abolished	

NOTE.—In 1907 grade pay among Deputy Conservators of Forests and Assistant Conservators of Forests was abolished in favour of a system of annual increments.

A similar comparison of the pay of the Provincial Forest Service is as follows:—

Grade of Officers.	Pay in rupees per mensem.		
	In 1890.	In 1900.	In 1913.
Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests—Grade I...	The service was not in existence.	Rs. 600	From Rs. 575 to Rs. 850, subject to the conditions laid down in Government of India resolution No. 17 F.—77-33, dated 23rd June, 1911, paragraph 2.
Do. do. do. II .		550	
Do. do. do. III ..		500	
Do. do. do. IV ...		450	
Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests—Grade I.		350	From Rs. 250 to Rs. 550, by an annual increment of Rs. 20 per mensem
Do. do. do. II.		300	
Do. do. do. III.		250	
Do. do. do. IV.		200	
Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests (*vide* paragraph 2 of Punjab Government notification No. 241, dated 30th April, 1908 annexed to this Appendix).		..	150

Note (*i*).—An Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests placed in a "major" charge is entitled to an allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem.

Note (*ii*).—Attention is specially invited to paragraph 2 (*i*) (*c*) of Government of India resolution No. 17 F.—77-33, dated the 23rd June, 1911, on the subject of personal allowances to deserving Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests whose promotion is blocked.

* Not reprinted. The letter referred to forwarded the Written Statement by Officers of the Provincial Forest Service in the Punjab, which has been reproduced as Mr. Gokal Das's written statement.—*Vide* paragraphs 66, 187-95.

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

As regards the adequacy of the existing scales of pay in the two Services, attention is invited to paragraph 8 of the memorandum submitted to Punjab Government with my No. 274, dated the 14th April, 1913, and to my criticism of the memorandum of the Provincial Forest Service submitted to Punjab Government with my letter No. 3050, dated the 20th September, 1913. There are two additions which I wish to make to the proposals regarding the pay of the Imperial Forest Service. The pay of Deputy Conservator of Forests should rise from Rs. 1,250 in the 18th year of service to Rs. 1,500 in the 23rd year. I make this proposal because it appears probable that in the future an officer will not rise to the rank of Conservator before his 23rd year of service; and I think it undesirable that he should remain on Rs. 1,250 per mensem for a period of five years. Secondly, an Assistant Conservator of Forests holding a "major" charge should receive an allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem, subject to the proviso that his salary (including the allowance) does not exceed Rs. 650 per mensem. I have nothing to add regarding the pay of the Provincial Forest Service.

4. (*Head iii*).—The present cadre of the Imperial and Provincial Forest Service in the Punjab is as follows:—

Conservator	1	Total Imperial Forest Service	12
Officers of the Imperial Forest Service below the rank of Conservator and exclusive of one post which still remains for transfer to the Provincial Forest Service	11		
Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests	2	Total Provincial Forest Service	9
Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests	7		
	21		21

There is a provision of 14 per cent. for leave and training in the Imperial Forest Service cadre, but no provision in the Provincial Forest Service.

5. *Head (iv)*.—The following statement shows the officers holding appointments outside the authorised cadre of the Punjab:—

Imperial Forest Service

Dr. A. D. Blascheck, Oec. D. (Munich), Deputy Conservator of Forests.	On deputation to the Imperial Forest College.
Mr. R. N. Parker, Deputy Conservator of Forests.	
Mr. C. F. C. Beesen, Assistant Conservator of Forests	

6. *Head (v)*.—I have already stated in paragraph 7 of the memorandum submitted to Punjab Government with my letter No. 274, dated the 14th April, 1913, that an early increase in the cadre of the Imperial Forest Service in the Punjab is necessary. Officers with European training are essential for the charge of the important hill divisions; in addition the extension of irrigated plantations in the plains will involve an increase in the number of charges for which Provincial Forest Service officers are suitable. I consider that the cadre for the Punjab, exclusive of the Conservator, should consist of 15 Imperial Forest Service officers and 17 Provincial Forest Service officers; and I give below a statement showing how these figures are arrived at:—

MAJOR CHARGES.			MINOR CHARGES.		
Divisions.	Divisional Forest Officers.	Assistants.	Divisions.	Divisional Forest Officers.	Assistants.
Hazara (North-West Frontier Province	1	2	Jhelum	1	...
Rawalpindi	1	1	Baluchistan	1	...
Chenab-Shahpur	1	†1	Punjab Forest School	1	...
Chamba State	1	...			
Kangra	1	1			
Kulu	1	*1			
Bashahr	1	1			
Simla	1	...			
Lahore	1	†1			
Montgomery-Multan-Pir Mahal	1	†2			
Direction	1	...			
Working Plans	1	...			
Total	12	10	—	3	...

* For Mandi State.

† For new irrigated plantations.

ABSTRACT.

Imperial Forest Service.

80 per cent. of 12 major charges... ...	10
Officer for Government of India... ...	1
Officer for research work	1
25 per cent. for leave and training ...	3
Total	15

Provincial Forest Service.

20 per cent. of 12 major charges ...	2
All minor charges	3
Assistants in major charges	10
14 per cent. for leave and training ...	2
Total	17

ANNEXURE TO ABOVE.

FOREST DEPARTMENT.

The 30th April, 1908.

No. 241.—*Notification.*—The following rules for the appointment, training, and promotion of candidates for direct employment in the Punjab Provincial Forest Service are published for information: —

RULES.

1. For the present five posts in the Punjab Provincial Forest Service will be filled by direct appointment. Candidates for these appointments will be sent to the Imperial Forest College at Dehra Dun, United Provinces, to follow the ordinary curriculum for a period of two years, during which they will receive a stipend of Rs. 50 a month. If, at the end of this period, they have obtained the Higher Standard certificate of the College, they will follow the third years' course at the College, receiving a stipend during that year of Rs. 100 a month.

2. On the expiry of the third year's course, provided the Principal of the College gives them a certificate that they have satisfactorily completed their training, they will enter the Punjab Forest Department as probationary Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests on Rs. 150 a month. After three years' approved service on probation they will be appointed permanently to the Punjab Provincial

Forest Service on the occurrence of a vacancy in one of the posts reserved for them. These posts carry pay varying from Rs. 200 a month to Rs. 550 a month, promotions from grade to grade being regulated by seniority combined with practical efficiency. Proposals for the improvement of the pay of the Provincial Forest Service are now under consideration.

3. Applications must be forwarded to the Conservator of Forests, Punjab, through the Deputy Commissioner, or the Divisional Forest Officer, of the district in which the candidate resides. They must reach the Conservator of Forests, Punjab, not later than the 1st July each year.

4. Nominations will be given by the Lieutenant-Governor on the recommendation of the Conservator of Forests, Punjab.

5. Candidates for direct appointments must possess the following educational qualifications. They must have passed either:—

(*i*) the B.A., F.A., B.Sc., or Licentiate of Agriculture Examination; or

(*ii*) the matriculation examination, where no school final examination exists; or

(*iii*) the school final examination, provided the candidate can show that he has qualified in English and Mathematics up to the matriculation standard, or, for European candidates, a certificate of having passed the High School Examination with a similar proviso.

They must also satisfy the Conservator of Forests, Punjab, by means of an interview, that they have sufficient command of the English language to be able to understand the Dehra Dun College lectures.

6. They must also have the following qualifications:—

(*a*) A candidate must be a native of India, as defined in statute 33 Vic., chapter 3, section 6, or a subject of a Native State in India; he must be domiciled in the Punjab or a Native State under the political control of the Punjab Government, and must have recently resided for not less than three years in the Punjab or such Native State; or he may be a European British subject who has resided for not less than three years in the Punjab.

(*b*) He must not be less than 18 years of age, nor, except in special cases, more than 25 years of age* [on the date on which he actually enters the College].

(*c*) He must have a health certificate in the form prescribed by article 49 of the Civil Service Regulations, 4th edition, signed by the Civil Surgeon of the district through whose Deputy-Commissioner or Divisional Forest Officer the application of the candidate is forwarded, and testifying to the candidate's sound constitution, good vision, and hearing, as well as to his general physical fitness for a rough outdoor life in the Forest Department, and to the fact that he bears on his body marks of successful vaccination or of small-pox.

(*d*) He must give satisfactory evidence of (*i*) good moral character; (*ii*) good physique; (*iii*) habits of personal activity; and (*iv*) gentlemanly bearing.

(*e*) If Urdu is not his vernacular, he must have passed the examination in that language by the Lower Standard, as laid down in the Army Regulations, India. If it is his vernacular, he must give satisfactory evidence that he can read Urdu fluently and write the Persian character with facility.

7. In addition to the qualifications mentioned in Rule 6, the applicant must possess at least one of the following further qualifications—that is to say, he must either—

(*a*) a member of a family of tried loyalty and distinguished service; or

(*b*) a person of good social status and influence in the country; or

(*c*) a member of a class whose introduction into the public service the Government desires specially to encourage.

Explanation.—Clause (*a*).—The mere fact that a man's father or other relation has served with credit as an official does not give a claim under this clause. Such claim arises only by reason of really distinguished services, or some conspicuous act of loyalty performed by the father or grandfather or other very near relative.

Clause (*b*).—A claim under this clause does not arise from mere respectability of status, or influence, such as that which a member of a municipal committee may have in his town, but from high social status, such as that of a member of a family having an unofficial seat in Darbar or territorial influence due to great wealth.

8. Should it happen that there are not sufficient vacancies at the college for all the students nominated for the third year's course immediately they have completed the first two years' course:—

(*a*) they will be allowed to take the third year's course immediately vacancies occur; and

(*b*) while they are waiting for such vacancies they will be appointed as Forest Rangers on the Punjab Establishment on the pay of Rs. 80 (rupees eighty) a month, for the first year they may be kept waiting, and thereafter they will receive pay at the rate of one hundred rupees a month until they are sent to the college for the third year's course.

9. With five direct appointments one may be expected to fall vacant every four years; should the number be extended, vacancies will of course occur with greater frequency.

W. M. HAILEY,
Secretary to Government, Punjab.

* These words were substituted for the original wording by Notification No. 385, dated 24th August, 1908.

APPENDIX II.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh relating to the Forest Department.

A.—IMPERIAL FOREST OFFICERS.

I.—METHODS OF RECRUITMENT TO SERVICE, AND II.—SYSTEM OF TRAINING AND PROBATION.—The Lieutenant Governor agrees with the proposal made by the majority of the members of the Imperial Service to alter the present method of recruitment. In view of the smallness of the number of candidates and the probationers in each year His Honour agrees that it would be better that the training should be carried out at one residential institution; preferably the Oxford University.

IV.—CONDITIONS OF SALARY.—His Honour is of opinion that the scale of pay for assistant and deputy conservators should be the same as that of the assistant and executive engineers in the Public Works Department (Imperial branch), and that there should be three grades of Conservators on Rs. 1,600, Rs. 1,800, and Rs. 2,000. The Chief Conservator should draw Rs. 2,500 and the Inspector-General Rs. 3,000.

V.—CONDITIONS OF LEAVE.—No need for a change has been disclosed.

VI.—CONDITIONS OF PENSION.—His Honour cannot agree to support any increase in pension charges.

VII.—LIMITATIONS IN THE EMPLOYMENT OF NON-EUROPEANS, AND THE WORKING OF THE EXISTING SYSTEM OF DIVISION OF SERVICE INTO IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL.—This matter has been dealt with in regard to the Provincial Service. There seems no case for altering existing arrangements.

VIII.—RELATION OF THE SERVICE WITH THE INDIAN CIVIL SERVICE AND OTHER SERVICES.—This subject does not call for any remarks.

IX.—ANY OTHER POINTS WITHIN THE TERMS OF REFERENCE TO THE COMMISSION.—The only proposal which His Honour proposed to support is for the creation of a family pension fund, provided this can be established on

a sound actuarial basis, and without extra cost to the State.

B.—PROVINCIAL FOREST OFFICERS.

I.—METHODS OF RECRUITMENT. — His Honour considers that nomination by the Conservator and final selection by Government is the soundest principle. He is not prepared to agree to the suggestions in the Memorandum. As regards the proposal that 20 per cent. should be fixed as the maximum of vacancies in the Provincial Service to be filled by promoting rangers of tried ability and probity, His Honour is of opinion that no change is required. This opinion covers the suggestion made in the revised joint Memorandum as to the promotion of rangers. As regards the promotion of foresters who hold the certificate of the old vernacular course, Dehra Dun (D. D. Fs.), His Honour considers that the existing system should be maintained.

II.—SYSTEM OF TRAINING AND PROBATION. The period of practical training before admission to the Forest College at Dehra Dun should be at least six months. There does not appear to be any sufficient reason for altering the present period of three years' probation after the completion of training at the College.

It must obviously be a matter of time to raise the training in India to the level of that of the officers of the Imperial Service.

III.—CONDITIONS OF SERVICE.—The present division into Imperial and Provincial Service should be maintained. The time is not yet ripe for any alteration. The Provincial Service has recently been reorganised and the pay now is good, but the duties and responsibilities of officers of Provincial and Imperial Services are not the same, and in the opinion of His Honour, Provincial Service men cannot be found at present fit to rank with the Imperial Service Officers.

The charges of divisions must necessarily go by efficiency. Seniority even in the Imperial Service is not recognised as a claim to any particular division. There is no objection to the proposal that both Imperial and Provincial Forest Officers should remain in actual charge of a range for at least one year so far as this can be arranged with a due regard to the administrative necessities. As regards the suggestion in the revised Memorandum that the distinction between major and minor divisions should be abolished and that the more important divisions should be allotted only to senior men, whether in the Imperial or Provincial Service, His Honour is of opinion that the distinction should be maintained. He considers that there is a marked difference between the qualifications and class of the Imperial and Provincial Forest Officers—that the Imperial Officers should hold charge of the more important divisions. In practice no officer is placed in independent charge until he has passed his examinations.

Confidential reports.—His Honour has accepted the principle that adverse comments likely to affect promotion should be communicated to the officers concerned.

IV.—CONDITIONS OF SALARY.—The present scale of pay was fixed only in 1911. There is no reason for a revision at present. Further, His Honour is unable to agree to any scale which would give automatic promotion all the time.

V.—CONDITIONS OF LEAVE.—The proposal as to privilege leave has been dealt with generally for all Services.

VI.—CONDITIONS OF PENSION.—The present rules seem sufficiently liberal. His Honour cannot agree to any increase of non-effective charges.

VII.—LIMITATION IN THE EMPLOYMENT OF NON-EUROPEANS AND THE DIVISION OF SERVICE INTO IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL. —The present principle, whereby charges are divided into major and minor and one-fifth of the former and the whole of the latter are reserved for the members of the Provincial Service, satisfies all present requirements. There is no evidence at present to show that it will be possible to obtain suitable Indians for higher administrative ranks in the Forest Department. The proposal made in paragraph 16 of the revised Memorandum to throw open one of the three circle charges of the Province to the Provincial Forest Service is premature.

IX.—ANY OTHER POINTS WITHIN THE TERMS OF REFERENCE TO THE ROYAL COMMISSION NOT COVERED BY THE PRECEDING HEADS.—The proposal as to travelling allowance cannot be supported. This allowance is meant only to cover the extra cost of touring, and it is not a matter of prestige.

APPENDIX III.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bengal relating to the Forest Department.

(*I*) THE IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The officers of the Imperial Forest Service are appointed under covenant with the Service are appointed under covenant with the Secretary of State either under the regulations laid down from time to time by the Secretary of State or in such other manner as may be approved by him. Candidates must not be less than 19 and more than 23 years of age. Every candidate must be a natural born subject of His Majesty. He must be prepared to give an undertaking, if selected, that he will not marry before he reaches India. A native of India, however, is not barred by early marriage in accordance with the customs of his race. Candidates for appointment in the Imperial Forest Service must have obtained a degree with honours in some branch of natural science in a University of England, Wales or Ireland, or have passed the final Bachelor of Science examination in pure science in one of the Universities of Scotland. A degree in applied science is not considered as fulfilling these conditions. Candidates are also required to produce evidence that they have a fair knowledge of either German or French.

The Secretary of State for India in Council appoints probationers for the Indian Forest Service in accordance with the advice of a selection committee. Any University in the United Kingdom which possesses a Forest school approved by the Secretary of State, is permitted to train Forest probationers, and for this purpose he has approved of the Forest schools existing at the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge and Edinburgh. The ordinary period of probation is two years; during that time probationers are required to pass through the Forestry course at one of the Universities named above, becoming members of that University, if not so already, to obtain the degree or diploma in Forestry which it grants and to satisfy such other tests of proficiency as may be deemed necessary.

The only objection which has been raised to the present system of recruitment is that it results in men coming out to India at too late an age. The Governor in Council has considerable sympathy with this point of view, which he has recently supported in connection with the Indian Civil Service. There can be no doubt that, as a rule, men of 25 are less pliable and find greater difficulty in settling down to their work in India than officers who come out four or five years earlier. At the same time the possession of a science degree is of great advantage to most Forest Officers, now that forest work in India is expanding and developing on scientific lines, and if a University training in natural science is considered essential it will be impossible to select candidates at a much earlier age than at present.

It is understood, however, that certain Universities, such as Oxford and Edinburgh, offer facilities to candidates for undergoing the theoretical portion of the course for the diploma in forestry in conjunction with the course for the science degree, and the Government of Bengal would be glad to see this arrangement developed, if possible, so as to enable the period of probation after selection to be reduced ordinarily to one year. It has also been suggested that the physical test now imposed on candidates is not sufficiently stringent, and that the old test of a lengthy cross-country run, which was abandoned some years ago, should be reinstituted. In view of the life of exposure and hardship which Forest Officers have to undergo during their service, particularly in a Province with climatic conditions like those of Bengal, the Government of Bengal consider this suggestion worthy of consideration.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The rates of pay in 1890 and 1900 were as follows:—

	Appointment, 1890. Rs.	Salary, 1900. Rs.
Assistant Conservator of Forests—		
3rd grade	250	Abolished.
2nd ,, ...	350	350
1st ,, ...	450	450
Deputy Conservator of Forests—		
4th grade	550	550
3rd ,, ...	650	650
2nd ,, ...	800	800
1st ,, ...	900	900
Conservator—		
3rd grade	1,000	1,100
2nd ,, ...	1,250	1,350
1st ,, ...	1,500	1,600

At present, on appointment to the Indian Forest Service, an officer is styled "Assistant Conservator" and draws pay at Rs. 380 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 40 to Rs. 700 a month, and thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 50 up to a maximum of Rs. 1,250 a month, which is reached in the twentieth year of service. Until he has passed the examination prescribed in the Forest Department Code an Assistant Conservator is not entitled to draw pay at a higher rate than Rs. 460 a month. On passing the examination he is entitled to resume drawing pay under the time scale at the rate to which his length of service entitles him. Whilst drawing pay up to and including Rs. 540 a month an officer is styled "Assistant Conservator," and when drawing pay at Rs. 580 to Rs. 1,250 a month he ranks as "Deputy Conservator."

Promotions to the rank of Conservator are made by the Government of India on the recommendation of the Local Government. There are three grades of Conservators carrying salaries of Rs. 1,900, Rs. 1,700 and Rs. 1,500, respectively.

Forest Officers are admissible to certain special allowances which are governed by article 39 of the Forest Code, 7th edition.

The Government of Bengal consider that the pay of Conservators is inadequate in view of the responsibilities of their work and position as advisers to the Local Government in Forest matters, and administrators of the Local Forest Department. An increase of Rs. 250 a month is not sufficient recognition of the greater responsibilities and expenses which fall upon a Deputy Conservator who is promoted to be Conservator, and it is accordingly suggested that the pay of the lowest grade of Conservators should be raised to Rs. 1,750 and of the other two grades to Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 2,250 respectively.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—The existing cadre of the Imperial Forest Service in Bengal consist of one post of Conservator and 11 posts of Deputy and Assistant Conservators (the latter including one India list appointment). Two posts have been provided in the cadre for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—Mr. F. Trafford, Deputy Conservator of Forests, is acting as Conservator of Forests in the Central Provinces.

Mr. E. P. Stebbing, Deputy Conservator of Forests, is on deputation to the Edinburgh University pending retirement.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The present cadre of the Imperial Service in Bengal is sufficient, provided 20 per cent. of the major charges are held by Provincial officers as required by the existing orders on the subject. But the conditions of the Bengal forests are such that great difficulty is experienced in finding suitable Provincial officers to hold charge of the major forest divisions, and consequently the Imperial staff is barely sufficient for present actual requirements. An addition to the staff will probably be required shortly to cope with developments which are taking place in regard to the commercial working of the Bengal forests.

(*II*) THE PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The Provincial Forest Service consists of—

Extra Deputy Conservators and Extra Assistant Conservators.

Appointments to the Provincial Forest Service are made—

(*a*) By the promotion of Forest Rangers of long service and tried probity, irrespective of the educational qualifications they may hold;

(*b*) By the selection for direct appointment of candidates who must successfully pass through the Provincial Forest Service course at the Forest Research Institute, Dehra Dun, and thereafter render not less than three years' satisfactory service as probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests before being confirmed.

Candidates for nomination to the Provincial Service course at the Forest Research Institute must possess the following minimum educational qualifications:—

(*a*) A certificate of having passed the I.Sc., I.E. or I.A. examination of an Indian University in a group of subjects, including mathematics, or

(*b*) The Licentiate of Agriculture degree of a Government Agricultural College, or

(*c*) If a European, the Junior School certificate awarded in connection with the Cambridge Local examination in a group of subjects including algebra, geometry and trigonometry:

Provided that in the case of candidates who were above the age of 16 years on the 31st December, 1910, other certificates may be accepted if they show the candidates to possess knowledge of English sufficient to follow the course and also knowledge of arithmetic, algebra—up to and including quadratic equations and simple problems, geometry — the first three books of Euclid and the elements of trigonometry, including the solution of triangles and the use of logarithms.

On the nomination of candidates they are required—

(*a*) To sign an agreement binding themselves to work diligently while at the institute and to serve Government for not less than five years after passing out of the institute;

(*b*) To find two sureties to execute a bond in the prescribed form guaranteeing that, under special circumstances therein detailed, they will refund all money expended by Government on the nominee's behalf, etc.

These regulations were only brought into force in March last. They were devised after very careful consideration, but it is too early to come to any definite conclusion as to their working.

2. *The rates of pay in the Provincial Forest Service in* 1890 *and* 1900 *are noted below:—*

Appointment.	Salary. 1890. Rs.	Salary. 1900. Rs.
Sub-Assistant Conservator of Forests—		
4th grade	No post of 4th grade	200
3rd „	150	250
2nd „	200	300
1st „	250	350
Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests—		
4th grade	No post of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests.	450
3rd „		500
2nd „		550
1st „ ...		600

The existing rates of pay are as follows:—

On appointment an officer is styled Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, and draws pay at the rate of R. 250 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 20 to Rs. 550 a month in the sixteenth year of service.

On reaching a salary of Rs. 550 a month an officer may be promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator, provided he is considered fit to hold a major charge. An Extra Deputy Conservator draws pay at the rate of Rs. 575 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 25 to Rs. 650 a month.

After one year's service on this pay the Local Government may, by special order in each case, promote an officer to a pay of Rs. 700 a month for a period of three years and again to a pay of Rs. 800 a month for a further period of three years, and finally to a pay of Rs. 850 a month until the close of his service. Promotions to these three higher rates of pay will, however, be made only when the Local Government is satisfied at each step that the individual officer thoroughly deserves it.

These rates of pay which were introduced in 1911 are satisfactory.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—There are no grades. Pay is drawn according to time-scale, as stated above.

The Bengal Provincial Forest cadre consists of one post of Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests and six posts of Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests.

For leave and training provision has been made for one post in the Provinical Forest Service.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—None.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The cadre is at present sufficient, but additions will probably be necessary in the near future for the reasons given in the case of the Imperial Service.

APPENDIX IV.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bihar and Orissa relating to the Forest Department.

A. IMPERIAL SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The regulations are the same as for the rest of British India. The Local Government are generally satisfied with them and have no recommendation to make.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The present rates of pay are the same as those obtaining throughout British India. It is unnecessary to discuss the rates previously obtaining as this Province came into existence in April, 1912. There are no local allowances in force generally in the Province but a special allowance is granted to the Divisional Officer and staff in Angul to compensate for the inaccessibility of the district.

The present rates of pay are generally adequate, but the Local Government would recommend that the salaries of administrative officers be assimilated to those now obtaining in the administrative ranks of the Public Works Department. At present they compare as follows:—

Public Works Department.

	Rs.
Superintending Engineers, 3rd grade ...	1,500
Ditto 2nd „ ...	1,750
Ditto 1st „ ...	2,000
Chief Engineers, 2nd grade	2,250
Ditto 1st „	2,750

Forest Department.

Conservators, 3rd grade	1,500
Ditto 2nd „	1,700
Ditto 1st „	1,900
Chief Conservators of Forests	2,150
Inspector-General of Forests	2,650

The principle was accepted in paragraph 7 of the Government of India's Despatch, No. 312 of 1890, to the Secretary of State that Conservators should receive equal rates of salary with Superintending Engineers, and the inadequacy of the remuneration of the Inspector-General of Forests was recognised in the Government of India's Despatch, No. 389, of 1906, to the Secretary of State.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave or training.*—The present sanctioned Imperial cadre is that which was transferred from Bengal on the formation of this Province with the addition of a post of Conservator and consists of:—

1 Conservator.
4 Deputy and Assistant Conservators of Forests.

The present cadre does not include sufficient provision for leave and training (*vide* 5 below).

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—One Assistant Conservator of Forests out of the four Deputy and Assistant Conservators is on deputation temporarily to the Feudatory States of Orissa, and the deficiency has been made good by the addition of a Provincial officer to the staff employed within British territory. A supernumerary Assistant Conservator has been posted to this Province.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The present cadre is insufficient and proposals have been submitted to the Government of India, for strengthening it, *vide* letter No. 3505R, dated the 24th July, 1913, from this Government, a copy of which is attached (Annexure 1).

B. PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The present regulations for Bihar and Orissa were framed in 1912 and are contained in the Notification of the Local Government, No. 3581R (B), dated the 6th November, 1912, an extract from which is attached (Annexure 2). Government are satisfied with the present regulations but consider that the educational qualifications demanded of candidates should be gradually raised in the manner contemplated in paragraph 2 of the Secretary of State's Despatch No. 8 Revenue of the 19th January, 1912, as the standard of the Provincial Service is raised more nearly to the level of that obtaining in the Imperial Service and the improved prospects recommended in paragraph 2 below attract a higher type of candidate.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The rates of pay and allowances drawn by Provincial Forest Officers in this Province are those sanctioned in the Government of India's Resolution, No. 17F—77—33, of 23rd June, 1911. The Local Government regard with general sympathy the suggestion that the Provincial Service be reconstituted on the same basis as the Provincial Service of the Public Works Department. Such reconstitution would improve the pay and allowances of Provincial Officers, raise their status and remove many of their existing grievances.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—The cadre as transferred from Bengal consists of two Extra Deputy Conservators and six Extra Assistant Conservators. It does not include sufficient provision for leave and training (*vide* paragraph 5 below).

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—In addition to the two posts of Extra Deputy Conservator there is one temporary post in that grade which has been created to make good the deficiency in the strength of the Imperial Service cadre due to the deputation of an Imperial officer to the Feudatory States in Orissa. Of the two posts of Extra Deputy Conservator one is held by an officer deputed to the Mayurbhanj Feudatory State in Orissa.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The present cadre is insufficient and proposals have been submitted to the Government of India for strengthening it. *vide* letter No. 3505R, dated the 24th July, 1913, cited above.

Ranchi.
Dated the 24th October, 1913.

ANNEXURE 1.

No. 5305R, dated Ranchi, the 24th July, 1913.

From—The Hon'ble MR. H. MCPHERSON, I.C.S., Secretary to Government of Bihar and Orissa, Revenue Department.

To—The Secretary to the Government of India, Department of Revenue and Agriculture.

I am directed to refer to the correspondence ending with Mr. Holme's letter No. 918F.—297-3, dated the 31st of October, 1912, and to submit, for the consideration and orders of the Government of India, the following proposals for the revision of the cadre of the Imperial and Provincial Forest Services of Bihar and Orissa.

2. In accordance with the distribution of the Forest cadres between Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, and Assam sanctioned in your letter No. 412F.—126-9, dated the 24th April, 1913, a staff of four Imperial and eight Provincial officers, excluding the Conservator and two probationers, has been allotted to this Province. The apportionment follows the arrangement made by the Government of Bengal that each of the Forest Divisions falling within the territory of Bihar and Orissa should be transferred to this Province with the whole of its staff as it stood on the 1st of April, 1912. Since the formation of the new Circle one supernumerary Imperial Officer has been added to the cadre. The adequacy of the staff has been carefully examined by the Conservator of Forests with reference to the requirements of the circle and his recommendations have been duly considered by the Lieutenant-Governor in Council.

3. In accordance with the principles laid down in the Government of India's Circular No. 35F.—388-1, dated the 11th October, 1907, the Conservator has classified the posts in his circle into seven major and six minor charges as follows:—

Major.	*Minor.*
1. Direction.	1. Sambalpur.
2. Singhbhum.	2. Santal Parganas.
3. Chaibassa.	3. Mayurbhanj.
4. Angul.	4-6. Three attached officers in the Singhbhum Division.
5. Puri.	
6. Palamau.	
7. Orissa Feudatory States.	

In doing so he has made four changes in the classification accepted in connection with the reorganisation of the Imperial and Provincial Forest Services of Bengal which was sanctioned in the Secretary of State's Despatch, No. 6-Revenue, dated the 15th January, 1909. These changes consist of the addition of the Chaibassa Division and the Orissa Feudatory States to the major charges, and of the Mayurbhanj Feudatory State and a third post of attached officer for the Singhbhum Division to the minor charges. The Chaibassa Division has recently been enlarged by the transfer to it of two ranges from the Singhbhum Division. It now includes 160 square miles of reserved forest and 207 square miles of protected forest, and the receipts during the current year are estimated at Rs. 55,200. It has been placed under the charge of an Imperial Officer since October, 1911, and in view of its importance the Lieutenant-Governor in Council is satisfied that it should in future be classified as a major charge. The addition of a minor charge within the Singhbhum Division is necessary because a third attached officer is required to supervise the important timber depots on the railway.

4. The Lieutenant-Governor in Council has given his careful consideration to the proposal of the Conservator that permanent provision should be made in the cadre of the Forest Department for one major and one minor charge within the Feudatory States of Orissa, and is fully convinced that there is an overwhelming case for the acceptance of the proposal. It is unnecessary to reiterate the arguments which were adduced in the Government of Bengal's letters No. 2223P., dated the 25th March, 1907, and No. 2441P.-D., dated the 6th November, 1909, to the Foreign Department of the Government of India in support of the proposal that an officer of the Imperial Forest Department should be deputed to assist the Political Agent in supervising the working of forests within the Feudatory States, a measure which was necessary alike in the interests of the States themselves and for the protection of the adjoining British territory. These arguments were accepted and the necessity of the appointment recognised in Mr. Wood's letter No. 11431.B., dated the 16th June, 1910. While, however, the necessity was recognised as permanent and continuing, financial considerations rendered it impossible to make full provision for the charge, and an arrangement was sanctioned whereby the deputation of an Imperial officer was made good by the addition of a Provincial officer to the staff employed within British territory. The financial difficulty no longer exists, and in considering what are the total requirements of the Province as a whole for the purposes of the present re-organisation scheme, the arrangment of 1910 must be ignored. The Feudatory States appointment is a major charge, and its recognition as such does not affect the classification of charges within British territory.

There remains the proposed addition of a minor charge for the forest administration of the Mayurbhanj Feudatory State. The services of Mr. A. H. Mee, an Extra Deputy Conservator, were lent to this State at the particular request of the lae Maharaja. The arrangement will hold good during the minority of the present of the present Maharaja, who is only 14 years of age, and there is every reason to believe that it will be continued indefinitely after he attains his majority. Mayurbhanj, the largest of the Feudatory States, has an area of 4,110 square miles, and includes 1,054 square miles of reserved forest and 741 square miles of protected forest. The most valuable portions of these have been leased to a contractor for 30 years, and the services of a competent forest officer are necessary to control this lease alone. Apart, moreover, from these considerations based on the special requirements of Mayurbhanj, there is no reason to expect that the time will ever come when the services of an additional Provincial officer will cease to be required within the Feudatory States. On the contrary, there is every likelihood that the demand for such officers will increase in the near future, for the subject of forest con-

servation is receiving enhanced attention, and the Chiefs are rapidly becoming alive to the importance of the interests at stake.

An extract from the Political Agent's Report for 1911-12, which shows the excellent work done by the Agency Forest Officer and the ever-increasing interests of the Chiefs in the better administration of their forests, is annexed to this letter for the information of the Government of India (Enclosure No. 1).

5. The following calculation, which is based on the above classification of charges, shows that a total staff of eight Imperial and eight Provincial officers might fairly be claimed for the Province:—

Imperial.

80 per cent. of major charges	... ...	6
25 per cent. for leave reserve	... ...	1
1 officer for the India List	... ...	1
Total	...	8

Provincial.

20 per cent. of major charges	... ...	1
6 minor charges	... ...	6
14 per cent. for leave reserve	... ...	1
Total	...	8

The Conservator, however, having regard to the principle enunciated in paragraph 6 of Circular No. 35F.—388-1, dated the 11th October, 1907, does not desire to press for the full complement of Imperial officers, but proposes that in lieu of one Imperial post an additional post of Extra Deputy Conservator should be created in the Provincial Service, making a total of seven Imperial and nine Provincial officers. The net result of these proposals, in which the Lieutenant-Governor in Council concurs, would be an increase of two Imperial officers and one Provincial officer over the staff shown in paragraph 2 of your letter No. 412F.—126-9, dated the 24th April, 1913.

6. As regards the grading of these posts, the seven Imperial officers have been shown in the accompanying proposition statement (Enclosure No. III) as consisting of one Conservator on an average pay of Rs. 1,700, and six Deputy and Assistant Conservators on an average pay of Rs. 817 a month. The nine officers of the Provincial Service have been distributed in the proportion of four Extra Deputy Conservators to five Extra Assistant Conservators. In fixing this proportion regard has been had to the principles laid down in paragraph 2 (ii.) of the Resolution of the Government of India in the Revenue and Agricultural Department, No. 17F.—77-33, dated the 23rd June, 1911, which requires that Provincial officers shall not be promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator unless they are fit to hold major charges, and that Extra Deputy Conservators shall, except for special reasons, actually be placed in charges classed as major. At present in this Province three major charges (Puri, Angul and Palamau) are held by Provincial officers, of whom one only (Mr. Hannah) is an Extra Deputy Conservator under the temporary arrangement sanctioned in Mr. Holme's letter No. 918F.—297-3, dated the 31st October, 1912. The two others are Extra Assistant Conservators who have administered their major charges with credit, and are considered by the Local Government eligible for promotion to the upper controlling staff. The two permanent Extra Deputy Conservators at present on the staff of the Province (Messrs. Mee and Haslett) are employed on minor charges (Mayurbhanj and the Santal Parganas) which, for special reasons, require to be administered by officers of superior rank. In these circumstances, and in view of the facts that a disproportionately small number of Imperial officers has been allotted to Bihar and Orissa as compared with the number allotted respectively to Bengal and Assam and that it has been proposed in paragraph 5 to surrender one Imperial post, the Lieutenant-Governor in Council does not consider it unreasonable that the Conservator should ask for four appointments of Extra Deputy Conservators. Any other distribution of the Provincial staff will cause stagnation of promotion and militate against the efficient administration of the Department.

7. The ultimate additional annual expenditure involved amounts to Rs. 14,123-4-0, as shown in the proposition statement; but in view of the immediate needs of the Province the Conservator does not wish to ask for the additional Imperial officer at present. He proposes to leave a vacancy against the India List appointment, and His Honour in Council agrees that the existing staff of six Imperial officers, including the supernumerary officer as a permanent appointment, is sufficient for present purposes. Against the increase in cost it will appear from the accompanying statement (Enclosure No. II.) that the revenue derived from the circle is growing steadily, and there can be little doubt that more adequate control and improved supervision will bring about considerable further expansion.

8. In conclusion, the Lieutenant-Governor in Council requests that should his proposals meet with the approval of the Government of India, he may be permitted at his discretion to fix the date from which they will take effect according as funds permit.

ANNEXURE II.

The 6th November, 1912.

No. 5431R(B).—The following revised rules are published for general information in supersession of the rules published under Notification No. 1010T.R., dated the 23rd June, 1910:—

* * * * * *

III—Rules for the recruitment of the Provincial Forest Service in Bihar and Orissa.

1. Subject to the satisfaction of the claims of persons already qualified under the rules hitherto in force, appointments to the Provincial Forest Service shall be made:—

(*a*) by the promotion of Forest Rangers of long service and tried ability and probity, irrespective of the educational qualifications they may hold;

(*b*) by the selection for direct appointment of candidates who must successfully pass the two years' course at the Forest Research Institute, Dehra Dun, and thereafter render a term of service as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, the length of which will depend among other things upon the quality of work done by them during the course.

Government reserves to itself the right to fill all vacancies in such of the two ways described, as it may consider best, in the interests of public service.

2. Candidates for direct appointment will be nominated by the Local Government with special reference to high educational and social qualifications and to physical fitness for work in the Forest Department.

3. The pay of the Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests will be Rs. 150 per mensem during the period of their probation and thereafter Rs. 200 per mensem until they can be appointed to vacancies in the sanctioned cadre of the Provincial Forest Service.

4. Selected candidates may, during the two years' course at the Research Institute, receive a stipend which will be dependent upon their work and progress. Such stipend will in no case exceed Rs. 2,400 for the two years, *i.e.*, shall not exceed an average rate of Rs. 100 per mensem.

5. Except for special reasons, and under the special orders of the Local Government in each case, candidates must be between the ages of 18 and 25 on the 1st November in the year in which the course begins.

6. The Inspector-General of Forests has the power to relax the above rule.

The following certificates must be forwarded with applications.

(*a*) A certificate that the candidate is a "Native of India" within the meaning assigned to these words* by section 6 of 53 Vict., Cap. 3.

N.B.—This certificate may be omitted in the case of private students and of students deputed by the British Colonies.

(*b*) A certificate of age.

(*c*) A health certificate in the form prescribed by article 49 of the Civil Service Regulations, 5th Edition, signed by a Civil Surgeon or such other qualified Medical Officer as may be approved by the President, and testifying to the candidate's sound constitution, good vision and hearing and general physical fitness for a rough outdoor life in the Forest Department, and to the fact that he bears on his body marks of successful vaccination or of smallpox.

(*d*) A certificate showing that the candidate is of good social standing and good moral character.

The certificates (*c*) and (*d*) must bear date not further back than the 1st January of the year previous to that in which the candidate desired admission to the College.

(*e*) A certificate that the candidate possesses a thorough knowledge of colloquial English which will permit of his following a highly technical course, and is generally of good education.

Certificates (*d*) and (*e*) must be signed by a Conservator of Forests, District Officer, Political Agent, or a British Government Gazetted Officer of high standing.

The Inspector-General of Forests may, should he consider it desirable, relax any of the conditions imposed under this rule.

(*f*) A certificate of having passed one of the following examinations, viz. :—

(1) The B.A., F.A., B.Sc., or Licentiate of Agriculture.

(2) The Matriculation where no School Final Examination exists.

(3) The School Final Examination, provided the candidate can show that he has qualified in English and Mathematics up to the Matriculation Standard or, for European candidates, a certificate of having passed the High School Examination with a similar proviso.

7. Nominated candidates will be required (*a*) to execute a bond and agreement as attached, (*b*) to undergo a preliminary practical training in such Forest Divisions as the Conservator of Forests Bihar and Orissa, may direct in order to prove his fitness for Forest work. Such training may extend to a period of not more than six months. During this preliminary training candidates will receive such consolidated allowance as may be ordered by the Local Government.

* * * * * *

J. F. GRUNING,
Secretary to the Government of Bihar and Orissa.

* "Native of India" means any person born and domiciled within the dominions of His Majesty in India, or within the territories of Indian Princes tributary to or in alliance with His Majesty, of parents habitually resident in India and not established there for temporary purposes only (Art. 37, Civil Service Regulations).

APPENDIX V.

Memorandum prepared by the Assam Administration relating to the Forest Department.

A.—IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The regulations regarding recruitment, training and probation are those prescribed by the Secretary of State in the Government of India's Circulars No. 21 F.—280-2, dated the 18th October, 1912, and No. 13 F.—85-2, dated the 10th May, 1911. The Chief Commissioner's opinion on these regulations will be found in his note dated the 9th April, 1913, already submitted to the Commission.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The rates of pay of the Imperial Forest Officers in 1890 were as follows:—

	1st grade.	2nd grade.	3rd grade.	4th grade.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Conservators... ...	1,500	1,250	1,000	—
Deputy Conservators	900	800	650	550
Assistant ,, ...	450	350	250	—

The scale was modified in 1891 and the rates of pay in 1900 were accordingly as follows:—

	1st grade.	2nd grade.	3rd grade.	4th grade.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Conservators... ...	1,600	1,350	1,100	—
Deputy Conservators	900	800	650	—
Assistant ,, ..	450	350	—	—

The present rates of pay of Conservators are:—

	Rs.
First grade	1,900
Second grade...	1,700
Third grade	1,500

In 1907 the grading of the officers below the rank of Conservators was abolished and a time-scale introduced in its place. According to this scale an officer of the Imperial Forest Service starts with a pay of Rs. 380 per mensem rising by annual increment of Rs. 40 to Rs. 700 per mensem, thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 50 a month to Rs. 1,250 per mensem in the twentieth year of service.

In 1908 the Secretary of State sanctioned the grant of local allowances to Forest Officers below the rank of Conservators, serving in Assam districts other than Sylhet and the plains portion of Cachar. Under these orders an officer in charge of a forest division receives an allowance at the rate of Rs. 80 per mensem and other officers at the rate of Rs. 50 per mensem.

As regards the pay of Conservators of Forests, the Chief Commissioner considers that these officers should get the same pay as Superintending Engineers, except in the case of provinces where there is no Chief Conservator, where an allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem should be given to them. The rates of pay and allowances of the other officers appear satisfactory.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—There are at present two Conservators of Forests and thirteen (including two supernumerary) Deputy and Assistant Conservators of Forests in this province in the sanctioned cadre. When the cadre of the Forest Department was last revised in 1909, a provision of 25 per cent. was made for vacancies for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—One officer has recently been placed on foreign service under the Manipur Darbar for seven months.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The present cadre is insufficient for the needs of the province. A proposal, which has been submitted by the Conservators of Forests for the increase of the number of Deputy and Assistant Conservators of Forests from 11 to 20, is now under consideration.

B.—PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—Recruitment is made by promotion in exceptional cases from the Rangers class under

APPENDIX V. (*continued*).

Article 15 of the Forest Department Code, 7th edition, and more ordinarily from candidates selected for direct appointment. The selected candidates undergo at the Forest College, Dehra Dun, a course of training which is regulated under the rules approved by the Government of India. On their successfully completing the College course the candidates are appointed as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests for a minimum period of one year in the case of those who obtained certificates with Honours from the Forest College, and of two years in the case of others. After the probationary period the candidates are eligible for permanent appointment on the occurrence of vacancies in the cadre. A copy of the rules issued by the Local Administration containing extracts from the Dehra Dun Forest College rules is enclosed herewith.

The rules as to recruitment, probation and training appear to the Chief Commissioner to be satisfactory.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—In 1890, the rates of pay of these officers, who were then designated as Sub-Assistant Conservators, were Rs. 175, Rs. 200 and Rs. 250. The scale was revised in 1891, and the rates in force in 1900 were accordingly as follows:—

	1st grade.	2nd grade.	3rd grade.	4th grade.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Extra Deputy Conservators	600	550	500	450
Extra Assistant Conservators	350	300	250	200

With effect from the 1st March, 1911, a time-scale has been introduced under which an officer appointed to the Provincial Forest Service on a permanent appointment receives a pay of Rs. 250 per mensem which rises by annual increment of Rs. 20 per mensem until it reaches Rs. 550 a month after 15 years' service. If an officer is considered fit to hold a major charge he is promoted to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservators on a pay of Rs. 575 per mensem rising by an annual increment of Rs. 25 per mensem to Rs. 650. He may then, after one year of service, be specially promoted to Rs. 700 per mensem for a period of three years and then to Rs. 800 per mensem for a further period of three years and finally to Rs. 850 per mensem (*vide* Government of India Department of Revenue and Agriculture Resolution No. 17 F.—77-3, dated the 23rd June, 1911).

Local allowances varying from Rs. 40 to Rs. 80 were sanctioned for these officers, serving in districts other than Sylhet and the plains portion of Cachar, in 1908.

The present rates of pay and allowances are sufficiently liberal as regards the ordinary Provincial Service Officer. In Sir Archdale Earle's opinion, however, as explained in his note of the 9th April, 1913, an officer of this Service, who is promoted to a divisional charge, should be allowed to enter the time-scale of the superior Service.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—There are at present two Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests and ten Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests in the sanctioned cadre of this province. At the last revision a provision of 14 per cent. was allowed for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—No appointments are held by any officers outside the cadre, but an Extra Deputy Conservator has been placed on special duty for 22 months in connection with the preparation of descriptive lists of trees in Assam.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—Additions to the cadre are required. A proposal, which has been submitted by the Conservators of Forests to increase the number of Extra Deputy Conservators from two to four and of Extra Assistant Conservators from 10 to 17, is under consideration.

REVENUE DEPARTMENT.

The 17th September, 1913.

No. 6366R.—The following rules, relating to the recruitment of the Provincial Forest Service in Assam and the selection of Assam candidates for deputation to the Ranger's Service Course at the Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun, are published for general information:—

(I) RULES FOR THE RECRUITMENT OF THE PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE IN ASSAM.

Extract from the Rules of the Forest Research Institute at Dehra Dun relating to the Provincial Service course.

* * * *

15. The maximum number of students that will be admitted in any one year will be decided by the President, subject to the orders of the Inspector-General of Forests. Within this number, nominations will be assigned to the various provinces by the President who, after satisfying their requirements, may also assign vacancies to British Possessions, Native States, etc. The President is empowered to refuse an application for a nomination without assigning any reason.

16. All applications for nominations must be communicated to the President by the 15th October of the year preceding that in which the course will commence. All nominations will be allotted and communicated to Local Governments, etc., concerned by the 1st November. Should any nomination not be accepted, the President should be informed by as early a date as possible so as to permit of his transferring the nomination to some other Local Government, Native State, etc.

17. It is left to Local Governments to prescribe what educational qualifications they please, including any examination, competitive or otherwise, for candidates that it is proposed to depute to the Provincial Service course. The attention of Local Governments is, however, invited to the fact that the President is authorised to hold an examination in English and Mathematics of any candidate on arrival at Dehra. Experience has shown that even candidates, who have graduated at some Indian University, have often a wholly inadequate knowledge of both English and Mathematics. Unless, therefore, a candidate is thoroughly conversant with these subjects, as indicated in Rule 18, it will be merely waste of time to send him to the Institute.

Local Governments will also no doubt bear in mind the importance of giving a preference to candidates who are in all respects qualified by previous examinations to follow and profit by the course of instruction, it having been found that without a preliminary training in Science, probationers are not able to complete an advanced forest course within a limited time.

18. The President is authorised to hold an examination of any candidate on arrival at Dehra in English and Mathematics.

Candidates are expected to know sufficient English to follow the course, and in Mathematics should know Arithmetic, Algebra, up to and including Quadratic Equations and simple problems, Geometry—the first three books of Euclid, and the Elements of Trigonometry, including the solution of triangles and the use of Logarithms.

The President is authorised to refuse admission to any candidate who, in his opinion, does not possess sufficient knowledge of these subjects to properly follow the course.

19. *Physical test.*—Candidates, on arrival at Dehra, will undergo such physical tests as may be prescribed by the President, to be followed by a medical examination before a Medical Board.

Local Governments should take every precaution to ensure that the candidates selected by them will be such as will be able to pass these tests.

N.B.—At present the physical test is a walk from Dehra to Mussoorie and back, distance some 26 or 28 miles, to be completed within the number of hours that may be prescribed.

20. There are four categories of students—

(*a*) Private students.

(*b*) Government probationary students, stipendiary or non-stipendiary.

(*c*) Students deputed by Native States and British Colonies.

(*d*) Students already in Government service.

21. (*a*) *Private students* can only be admitted if there are vacancies for such after satisfying the demands of (*b*), (*c*), (*d*) above. Their chief *raison d'être* is to meet a possible demand on the part of large landowners who may wish to place their forest areas under professional management.

(*b*) *Government Probationary students* are those nominated by a Local Government for direct appointment to, or as probationers for the Provincial Service.

(*d*) *Students already in Government Service* may be deputed at the discretion of Local Governments, provided that they pass the examination prescribed in Rule 17.

22. In the case of *Private students*, application for nominations must be made to the President direct, supported by a certificate from a Conservator of Forests, District Officer or Political Agent, that the candidate possesses the necessary social qualities and *a good general* education and appears likely to make a good executive Forest Officer.

23. In the case of *Government Probationary students* and *those already in Government Service*, applications must be made to the President direct by Local Governments concerned.

24. In the case of students from *Native States* and *British Colonies*, applications must be made to the President direct by the State Durbar, countersigned by the Political Agent, or by the Governor of a Colony or his representative.

25. *Age.*—Except for special reasons and under the special orders of the Local Government in each case, candidates must be between the ages of 18 and 25 on the 1st November in the year in which the course begins.

The Inspector-General of Forests has the power to relax the above rule.

26. *Certificates.*—With applications must be forwarded the following certificates:—

(*a*) A certificate that the candidate is a "Native of India" within the meaning* assigned to those words by section 6 of 33 Vict., cap. 3.

N.B.—This certificate may be omitted in the case of private students deputed by British Colonies.

(*b*) A certificate of age.

(*c*) A health certificate in the form prescribed by Article 49 of the Civil Service Regulations, 5th edition, signed by a Civil Surgeon or such other qualified Medical Officer as may be approved by the President, and testifying to the candidate's sound constitution, good vision and hearing, and general physical fitness for a rough, outdoor life in the Forest Department, and to the fact that he bears on his body marks of successful vaccination or of smallpox.

(*d*) A certificate showing that the candidate is of good social standing and good moral character.

The certificates (*c*) and (*d*) must bear date not further back than the 1st January of the year previous to that in which the candidate desires admission to the College.

(*e*) A certificate that the candidate possesses a thorough knowledge of colloquial English, which will permit of his following a highly technical course, and is generally of good education.

Certificates (*d*) and (*e*) must be signed by a Conservator of Forests, District Officer, Political Agent, or a British Government gazetted officer of high standing.

The Inspector-General of Forests may, should he consider it desirable, relax any of the conditions imposed under this rule.

* "Native of India" means any person born and domiciled within the dominions of His Majesty in India, or within the territories of Indian Princes tributary to or in alliance with His Majesty, of parents habitually resident in India, and not established there for temporary purposes only. (Article 37, Civil Service Regulations.)

27. *Preliminary training.*—It is left to the discretion of Local Governments, etc., to test the suitability of their candidates for a forest career by a period of practical training in the forests before they enter the Institute. During such training candidates will receive such consolidated allowance as may be ordered by the Local Governments, etc.

28. *Stipends or scholarships*—

(I) *Government Probationary students.*—It is left to Local Governments to award stipends or scholarships in such manner as they please, provided that the total for 24 months' course does not exceed Rs. 2,400, *i.e.*, does not exceed an average rate of Rs. 100 per mensem. In the event of scholarship being awarded, the general method of assigning such will be—

(*a*) A stipend not exceeding Rs. 100 per mensem for the duration of the course or a portion thereof.

(*b*) In lieu of the above, a lump sum to be paid on a candidate's successfully obtaining such certificate as may have been agreed upon.

(*c*) Partly the one, partly the other of the above.

(II) *Students already in Government Service.*—Such officers will, while at the Institute, draw the pay and travelling allowances of their grade in the service, or a stipend not exceeding Rs. 100 per mensem in place thereof as the Local Government may decide.

* * * *

43. *Travelling allowance of Government Probationary students.*—Such students will not ordinarily be entitled to travelling allowance, being expected to defray their expenses when on tour; but it is left to Local Governments to sanction the payment of actual expenses for journeys by rail or steamer.

Rules for the recruitment of Candidates for the Provincial Forest Service in Assam.

1. Appointments to the class of Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests will be given by the Local Government—

(*a*) To candidates specially selected for direct appointment to the Provincial Service, or to Rangers, who have satisfactorily completed the course of training prescribed for such candidates at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun, and who have obtained from the President of the Institute a certificate to that effect;

(*b*) In exceptional cases to Rangers of long service and tried ability and probity, irrespective of the educational certificates they may hold.

2. Candidates must be between 18 and 25 years of age on the 1st November of the year in which the course begins, and must possess sufficient knowledge of English, mathematics and science to follow the College course.

3. Applications for appointment should be submitted to the Conservator of Forests, Western or Eastern Circle, Assam, either direct or through a Deputy Commissioner or a Divisional Forest Officer of rank not below that of a Deputy Conservator and should be accompanied by the certificates prescribed by rule 26 of the College Admission Rules and by certificates indicating the educational qualifications of the candidate. The Conservator should, on each occasion on which nominations are called for, consult the Principals of the Cotton and Murarichand Colleges as to whether they have candidates to recommend. From the applications received the Local Government, in consultation with Conservators of Forests, will select those to be deputed to the course in the ensuing year, giving preference to candidates born or domiciled in Assam. Candidates so selected will be required to undergo a preliminary course of practical training which will ordinarily extend to one year under the direction of the Conservator of Forests. During this course candidates will be granted a consolidated monthly allowance of Rs. 100 inclusive of travelling allowance. The Local Government will remove any candidate whose work or conduct during this period may prove unsatisfactory, or who is not considered likely to make a good Forest Officer. Candidates who have undergone

the preliminary course of training to the entire satisfaction of the Conservator of Forests will be eligible for nomination by the Local Government for training at the Forest Research Institute and College at Dehra Dun.

4. While at the Forest College candidates will be given a monthly stipend of Rs. 100, subject to satisfactory progress. Rule 54 of the College Admission Rules authorises the President to reduce or withdraw the stipends if necessary. Students already in Government service will, while at the College, draw and pay and travelling allowances of their grade in the service, or a stipend not exceeding Rs. 100 per mensem in place thereof, as the Local Government may decide.

5. The actual expenses incurred by probationary students on journeys by rail or steamer while proceeding to and from the college and while undergoing the course, will be defrayed by Government. For the purpose of this rule, probationary students will be considered as officers of the second class under Article 1002, Civil Service Regulations.

6. Before proceeding to the Imperial Forest College, candidates will be required:—

(i.) To sign an agreement in the form prescribed in Appendix A to these rules, binding themselves to work diligently while at the college, and to serve Government for not less than five years after passing out of the College.

(ii.) To find two sureties to execute a bond for Rs. 1,500 in the form prescribed in Appendix B to these rules, guaranteeing that, under special circumstances therein detailed, they will refund the total amount that has been drawn as stipend and travelling expenses.

7. A Forest Ranger selected for appointment to the Provincial Service will be appointed in the first instance to officiate as Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests for a period which shall be at the discretion of the Local Government, and will not be eligible for confirmation in that class until he has passed the departmental examinations prescribed in Article 40, Forest Department Code.

8. Candidates who have fulfilled the conditions prescribed in rule 1 (*a*) above will be appointed by the Local Government as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests on a salary of Rs. 150 per mensem.

9. A Probationary Extra Assistant Censervator of Forests who has rendered two years approved service in that class and has passed the following departmental examinations, viz.:—

"(*1*) Vernacular by the Lower Standard in one "principal" language of the Province, as may be prescribed by the Local Government;

(*2*) Land Revenue;

(*3*) Forest Law;

(*4*) Procedure and Accounts;

will be eligible for permanent appointment to the class of Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests on the occurrence of a vacancy. In the case of a Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, who obtained a certificate with Honours in the Provincial Service course at the Forest Research Institute and College, the minimum period of probation will be one year, and the passing of the above departmental examinations before permanent appointment will not be required.

Pending the occurrence of a vacancy in the class of Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, a probationer in the class who is thus eligible for permanent appointment and has completed three years' satisfactory service on probation, will draw pay at the rate of Rs. 200 per mensem provided that his work continues to be satisfactory.

10. The rates of pay and the promotion of officers in the Provincial Service are regulated by Articles 14 and 36, Forest Department Code, subject to the condition that the increments admissible under Article 14, Forest Department Code, shall not, except as provided in rule 11 below, be drawn by an officer until he shall have passed by the Higher Standard the examination in the vernacular prescribed under rule 9 above.

11. An Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests who obtained a certificate with honours in the Provincial Service Course at the Forest Research Institute and College will not be entitled to draw the increments admissible under Article 14, Forest Department Code, until he shall have passed all the departmental examinations prescribed in rule 9 above, nor to draw a higher pay than Rs. 270 per mensem until he shall have passed by the Higher Standard the examination in the prescribed principal language.

12. The above rules are framed under the prescriptions of the Forest Department Code and Government of India Resolution contained in Circular No. 10F.—76-3, dated 22nd June, 1912, and should be read with the rules issued to regulate the constitution of, admission to, and studies and discipline at, the Forest College and Research Institute, Dehra Dun.

(II) RULES FOR THE SELECTION OF ASSAM CANDIDATES FOR DEPUTATION TO THE RANGER SERVICE COURSE AT THE IMPERIAL FOREST COLLEGE, DEHRA DUN.

Extract from the Rules of the Forest College at Dehra Dun relating to the Ranger Service Course.

* * * *

5. The total number of students of each category, who can be admitted into the College each year, will be limited to such number as the President, subject to the orders of the Inspector-General of Forests and the Government of India, may decide, from time to time, can be educated at the College. The number of studentships to be allotted each year to the respective provinces, as well as the number of nominations to be made by the President, will, with due regard to the total prescribed, be decided by the latter not later than the 1st August, after consultation with the various Administrations as to their requirements, and communicated to them.

6. In allotting nominations to Local Governments, Colonies, or Native States, the President will allow a margin for possible casualties between the dates of nomination and actually entering the College. And when a Local Government, Colony or Native State cannot for any reason utilise the full number of studentships allotted, it should immediately inform the President, so that the vacancies may be filled up with other candidates in time to permit of the prescribed preliminary training being undergone.

7. There are four categories of students:—

(*1*) Private students;

(*2*) Government probationary students, stipendiary or non-stipendiary;

(*3*) Students deputed by Native States and British Colonies;

(*4*) Students already in Government service.*

8. *Private students* comprise all those students who are without appointments in any Forest service, who have not entered into an agreement to serve any Government or Administration, and whose object it is, by becoming possessors of the Forest College certificates, to obtain employment either in the Forest Service of the Government of India, or in that of a Native State or some other owner of forest property.

Government Probationary students comprise those who have been seleced by any Government for an appointment in its Forest Service. They may be stipendiary or non-stipendiary.

(i) Candidates for admission to the Ranger class of the Forest College as private students or Government probationary students, or students deputed by Native States must not be less than 18 or more than 25 years of age on the 1st April of the year in which they desire admission to the College, and in the case of students from British India, their applications must be sent to a Con-

* *Vide* rules regarding Native Non-commissioned officers of His Majesty's Army.

servator of Forests,† either direct or through a Divisional Forest Officer of rank not below that of a Deputy Conservator, or through a Collector or officer in charge of a district, in such time that the applications may reach the President not later than the 1st August in each year. None of the abovementioned officers need belong to the Forest Circle or Province in which the candidate seeks employment; but Divisional Forest Officers, Collectors, or other officers in charge of a district may not forward to Conservators applications unsupported by the five certificates enumerated below.

In the case of Native States, candidates should submit their applications supported by the same five certificates to, and in the manner prescribed by, their respective Durbars:—

(*a*) A certificate that the candidate is a "Native of India" within the meaning‡ assigned to those words by section 6 of 33 Vict., Cap. 3.

(*b*) A certificate of age.

(*c*) A health certificate in the form prescribed by Article 49 of the Civil Service Regulations, 5th edition, signed by the Civil Surgeon of the district in which the said Divisional Forest or District Officer's duties lie and testifying to the candidate's sound constitution, good vision and hearing, and general physical fitness for a rough outdoor life in the Forest Department, and to the fact that he bears on his body marks of successful vaccination or of smallpox.

(*d*) A certificate of respectability and good moral character from two or more persons whose social or official position can be accepted as a guarantee of reliability.

The certificates (*c*) and (*d*) must bear date not further back than the 1st April of the year previous to that in which the candidate desires admission to the College.

If any person giving certificates as above under (*c*) and (*d*) is in a position to mention anything more to the credit of the candidate than the certificates actually called for, he may do so.

(*e*) A certificate of having passed one of the following examinations, viz.:—

The B.A., F.A., B.Sc., or Licentiate of Agriculture.

The Matriculation, where no School Final Examination or school-leaving certificate exists.

The School Final Examination, provided the candidate can show that he has qualified in English and mathematics up to the Matriculation standard, or, for European candidates, a certificate of having passed the High School Examination, with a similar proviso.

The school-leaving certificate, as prescribed in the United Provinces, Central Provinces and Bombay.

(*f*) A certificate that each candidate has a sufficient knowledge of colloquial English to assimilate lectures delivered in that language without the aid of dictation.

The President is authorised to admit candidates, as an exceptional measure, who for some valid reason (such as being the subjects of a Native State or foreign country) have had no opportunity of securing any of the certificates mentioned above, provided that, in his opinion, the candidates possess the educational qualifications necessary to profit by the College course.

The Inspector-General of Forests may, should he consider it desirable, relax any of the conditions imposed under this rule.

(ii.) Upon the receipt by the Conservator of any application in respect to which the preceding conditions shall have been observed, that officer may reject the application without assigning any reason for so doing; but if he accepts it and the applicant is a candidate for Government service, he should be seen by a Conservator of a Forest Circle, when this can be conveniently arranged, or by some officer of the Imperial Forest Service, who should record his personal opinion in regard to the suitability of the candidate.

(iii) Those candidates who have been approved will, with the permission of the Local Government in the case of Government probationary students, and under the Conservator's recommendation in the case of private students, and that of the Durbars in the case of candidates from Native States, be eligible for nomination to the College.

(iv) *Preliminary training.*—All candidates not already in the service of Government, who have been accepted by the President for admission to the College will be required to undergo, before joining the College, a course of practical training in the forests of the province from which they come, lasting at least three and a half months. Such candidates will not be allowed to join the College unless they can produce a certificate signed by the Divisional Officer under whom they have served, and countersigned by the Conservator of the Circle, or in the case of Native States by the Durbar, that they have undergone the course of practical training in a satisfactory manner, and are likely to become useful Forest officers. The President may exempt a candidate from the whole or a portion of the practical course above prescribed, after satisfying himself that the omission to complete the minimum prescribed term was due to no fault of the candidate, and that the Conservator, under whom the candidate had undergone part of this period of training, has certified that he has given promise of making an efficient Forest officer.

(v) *Stipends or Scholarships.*—It is left to Local Governments to award stipends or scholarships in such manner as they please, provided that the total for the 24 months' course does not exceed Rs. 1,200, *i.e.*, does not exceed an average rate of Rs. 50 per mensem. In the event of scholarships being awarded, the general method of assigning such will be—

(*a*) A stipend not exceeding Rs. 50 per mensem for the duration of the course or a portion thereof;

(*b*) In lieu of the above a lump sum to be paid on a candidate's successfully obtaining such certificates as may have been agreed upon;

(*c*) Partly the one, partly the other of the above.

(vi) *Allowances.*—Government Probationary students, while under training in the forests of the province from which their names have been sent up, will receive travelling allowance at the rate of Rs. 25 per mensem to enable them to defray their travelling expenses during the course of the practical training referred to in (iv). This allowance will be met from the budget grants of the Local Forest Departments, and will be paid only under the countersignature of the Conservator of the Circle concerned.

9. Candidates *in Government Service*, who may be deputed to the Forest College, will be ordinarily—

(*a*) Forest Rangers who have not previously obtained the Higher Standard certificate of the College and who desire to qualify themselves for further promotion in their own or to a higher class.

Such officers may be deputed by Local Governments, provided that they are certified by the Conservator under whom they are serving to possess a knowledge of English and general edu-

† Conservator of Forests, Bengal Circle, at Darjeeling.
Conservators of Forests, Assam—
Eastern Circle at Shillong.
Western ,, ,,
Conservators of Forests, United Provinces of Agra and Oudh—
Eastern Circle at Naini Tal.
Western ,, ,,
Conservators of Forests, Central Provinces—
Southern Circle at Nagpur.
Northern ,, at Jabalpur
Berar ,, at Amraoti.
Conservator of Forests, Punjab Circle, at Lahore.
Conservator of Forests, Bihar and Orissa, at Ranchi.
Northern Circle at Bandra.
Central ,, at Poona.
Southern ,, at Belgaum.
Deputy Conservator of Forests in Charge, Sind Circle, Karachi.

‡ "Native of India" means any person born and domiciled within the dominions of His Majesty in India, or within the territories of Indian Princes tributary to or in alliance with His Majesty, of parents habitually resident in India, and not established there for temporary purposes only. (Article 37, Civil Service Regulations.)

cation and ability sufficient to enable them to profit by the course. They must not be above 30 years of age on entering the College, and need not go through the practical training referred to in rule 8 (*iv*). While at the College, they will draw the pay of their grade and travelling allowances to which they may be entitled under the Civil Service Regulations.

(*b*) Other members of the Subordinate Forest Service (Deputy Rangers, Foresters, and other subordinate officials) similarly desirous of qualifying for promotion, who may be deputed by Local Governments, provided that:—

(*i*) They have been in the service for not less than two years;

(*ii*) They are under 25 years of age on entering the College;

(*iii*) There is accommodation at the College and that the President is satisfied that the candidate possesses the necessary qualifications.

Note.—The Inspector-General of Forests is empowered to relax rules (*i*) and (*ii*).

Such officers will, while at the College, draw the pay and travelling allowances of their grade in the service, or a stipend not exceeding Rs. 50 per mensem in place thereof as the Local Government may decide. They will not be required to undergo the practical training.

* * * *

43. *Travelling allowance of Government Probationary students.*—Such students will not ordinarily be entitled to travelling allowance, being expected to defray their expenses when on tour; but it is left to Local Governments to sanction the payment of actual expenses for journeys by rail or steamer.

Rules for the selection of Assam candidates for deputation to the Ranger's Course at the Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun.

1. The number of candidates to be selected annually will depend on the requirements of the Department. Applications from bona-fide natives of Assam, or from candidates domiciled in Assam, will alone be considered.

2. Candidates for these appointments should apply to the Conservator of Forests, Western or Eastern Circle, Assam, through the Deputy Commissioner or the Divisional Forest Officer of rank not below that of a Deputy Conservator of the district in which the candidates reside. Applications should be accompanied by the certificates prescribed by rule 8 (i) of the Rules of the Forest College relating to the Ranger's Course.

From the applications received the Conservators of Forests will make a preliminary selection of not more than twice the number of men to be deputed to the Ranger's course at the Forest College in the ensuing year, and candidates so selected will be required to undergo the preliminary training which is referred to in rule 8 (iv) of the College Rules relating to the Ranger's course, but which will ordinarily extend to one year. While undergoing this preliminary training, candidates will be granted a consolidated monthly allowance of Rs. 50, inclusive of travelling allowance.

The Conservators of Forests will remove candidates whose work or conduct at any time during this training is unsatisfactory.

The final selection of candidates for deputation to the Forest College will be made by the Conservator of Forests, subject to the approval of the Local Government in accordance with the results of the preliminary training, candidates who are not considered likely to make good Forest officers being rejected at this stage.

3. While at the Forest College the selected candidates will be granted a monthly stipend of Rs. 50, subject to satisfactory progress. Rule 54 of the admission rules authorises the President to remove or withdraw the stipend, if necessary. Selected candidates will be required to execute the agreement and security bond for Rs. 1,000 prescribed by Government, in the forms shown in Appendices A and B to these rules.

Note.—Copies of the agreement and security bond to be executed under rule 3 can be obtained from the offices of the Conservators of Forests, Western and Eastern Circles, Assam.

4. The actual expenses incurred by probationary students on journeys by rail or steamer, while proceeding to and from the College, and while undergoing the course, will be defrayed by Government. For the purpose of this rule, probationary students will be considered as officers of the third class under Article 1002, Civil Service Regulations.

5. Candidates who obtain the Higher Standard certificate of the Forest College at the completion of the two years' course, with or without "honours," will be appointed Rangers on monthly salaries of not less than Rs. 50. Under similar circumstances, candidates who obtain the Lower Standard certificate will be appointed Deputy Rangers on monthly salaries of not less than Rs. 30. Such appointment will, however, be conditional on the existence of permanent vacancies in the establishment. In the absence of vacancies, and pending their occurrence, successful candidates will be employed as supernumeraries on the pay which they would otherwise draw if appointed to the permanent establishment.

ANNEXURE A.

Form of Agreement to be executed by students already in the service of, or in receipt of stipend from, Government, previous to entry into the Forest College, Dehra Dun.

ARTICLES OF AGREEMENT made and entered into this day of 19 .

BETWEEN

of

of the first part

of

son of the said

of the second part, and the Secretary of State for India in Council, hereinafter referred to as the Secretary of State, of the third part. Whereby each of the parties hereto so far as the covenants and conditions on his own part are to be observed and performed covenants with the other of them as follows:—

1. The said

hereby of his own free will and consent and with the approbation and consent of the said

, testified by the execution by him of these presents, agrees with and to the Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns, that he, the said

shall well and faithfully pursue his studies at the Government Forest College, Dehra Dun, and use his best endeavours to qualify for the Forest Service of the Government of British India or of any Local Government.

2. The said

shall after completing his studies at the said Forest College, and if so required to do, serve the Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns in the Forest Department of the Government of British India, or of any Local Government, for a period of not less than five years, and shall during the whole of such period diligently and sufficiently do all acts and discharge all duties which may be required to be done by him in his capacity as an officer of the said Department.

3. The Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns hereby engages to educate the said

at the Dehra Dun Forest College in all matters relating to forest science, forest work and forest administration that it may be deemed necessary by the President of the said College to teach the said

4. The Secretary of State shall pay the said

during the whole period of his stay at the said College at and after the rate of Rs. per month and thereafter while the said

shall faithfully and diligently serve as an officer of the said Forest Department at and after the rate of not less than Rs. per month, and the said

shall be entitled to all the rights and privileges in respect of pay, pension and promotion accorded to officers of the said Depart-

ment for the time by the Rules and Regulations of the Department.

5. Lastly, it is hereby agreed and declared that the Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns shall be at liberty to rescind this agreement on account of the negligence, failure to attend to duty, idleness, or any insubordination or misconduct on the part of the said , and to dismiss him from the said Forest College or the service of the said Department, and the said shall not be entitled to any of the privileges hereby granted to him, but the said or shall thereupon refund to the Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns the total amount paid to the said as stipend and travelling allowance while at the said College by the Secretary of State or his successors in office or assigns in respect of the education of the said at the said College. In witness thereof, the said parties to these presents have hereunto set their respective hands and seals the days and year first above written.

Signature and seal of _____ (SL.)

Signature and seal of _____ (SL.)

Signed, sealed and delivered by the above-named in the presence of—

_____ } *Signature of two witnesses.*

_____ }

Dated _____

_____ *Signature of Deputy Commissioner.*

ANNEXURE B.

Form of Bond to be executed by students already in the service of, or in receipt of stipends from, Government, previous to entry into the Forest College, Dehra Dun.

KNOW ALL MEN by these presents that we, of (principal obligor) , of and , of (sureties) are jointly and severally bound to the Secretary of State for India in Council in the sum of Rs. to be paid to the said Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns, or his or their certain attorney or attorneys, for which payment well and truly to be made we bind ourselves, our heirs, executors, administrators and representatives, and each of us binds himself, his heirs, executors, administrators and representatives firmly by these presents sealed with our seals and dated this day of , 19 .

Whereas the Secretary of State for India in Council for himself and his successors in office and assigns has engaged to educate the said at the Dehra Dun Forest College in all matters relating to forest science, forest works and forest administration that it may be deemed necessary by the President of the said College to teach the said , and has also agreed to pay him during the whole period of his stay at the said College at and after the rate of rupees per month, and whereas in consideration of such education and pay to be given to the said as aforesaid by the said Secretary of State and his successors in office and assigns the said has agreed with the said Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns that he will after completing his studies at the said College, and if required to do so, serve in the Forest Department of the Government of British India for a period of not less than five years, during the whole of which time he will diligently and efficiently do all acts and discharge all duties which may be required of him to be done in his capacity as an officer of the said Department.

And whereas the Secretary of State has also on his part agreed that the said shall be paid for such service at and after the rate of not less than Rs. per month, and shall be entitled to all the rights and privileges in respect of pay, pension and promotion accorded to officers of the said Department for the time being by the Rules and Regulations of the Department.

And whereas for the purpose of securing and indemnifying the said Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns against all loss and damage which he or they might or may in any way suffer by reason of the said being dismissed from, or leaving without permission, the service of the said Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns in less than five years after the completion of his studies at the said College, and for the purpose also of securing the refund to the said Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns of the total amount paid to the said as stipend and travelling allowance while at the said College by the said Secretary of State, or his successors in office or assigns in respect of the education of the said at the said College; and in consideration of the payment and education so as aforesaid to be made and given to the said at the said College, and as one of the conditions of to the admission of the the said College, it has also been agreed that the said and the said and , as his sureties, should execute the above-written Bond, subject to the condition hereinafter contained.

Now the condition of the above-written Bond of obligation is such that if the said shall well and faithfully and diligently pursue his studies at the said College and qualify for the said Forest Service, and shall also after completing his studies at the said Forest College, and if so required to do, serve the said Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns in the Forest Department of the Government of British India, or of any Local Government, for a period of not less than five years, and shall during the whole of such period diligently and efficiently do all acts and discharge all duties which may be required to be done by him in his capacity as an officer of the said Department, and if the said and , or either of them, their or either of their heirs, executors, administrators and representatives shall well and truly indemnify the said Secretary of State, his successors in office and assigns against all loss and damage which he or they might or may in any way suffer by reason of the said giving cause for dismissal either while at the said College or while in the service of Government thereafter, or of his leaving the service of the said Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns without permission in less than five years after the completion of the studies of the said at the said College, and if the said and , or either of them, their or either of their heirs, executors and administrators or representatives shall also pay to the said Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns all sum or sums in any way expended, paid or incurred by the said Secretary of State, his successors in office or assigns in respect of the education of the said at the said College, then the above-written Bond of obligation shall be void, otherwise the same shall remain in full force and virtue.

Provided always, and it is hereby expressly agreed and declared, that these presents shall be treated and considered as entered into under the orders of the Government of India for the performance by the said and and

of a public duty, and an act in which the public are interested within the meaning of section 74 of Act IX. of 1872 of the Legislative Council of India.

In Witness whereof the said parties to these presents have hereunto set their respective hands and seals the day and year first above written.

Signature and Seal of principal obligor _____ SL.

Signature and seal of first surety _____ SL.

Ditto second surety _____ SL.

Signed sealed and delivered by the above-named in the presence of—

_____ } *Signature of two witnesses.*

_____

Date _____

_____ { *Signature of Deputy Commissioner.*

A. W. BOTHAM,

Offg. Second Secretary to the Chief Commissioner of Assam.

APPENDIX VI.

Note, dated the 9th April, 1913, by the Hon. Sir Archdale Earle, Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Forest Department.

A.—IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *Recruitment of Indians to the Imperial Service.*—Indians are eligible to this service, and on general principles I am of opinion that they should be so appointed whenever suitable candidates are forthcoming. It is *primâ facie* probable that in this way a class of Indian officers best suited to hold the important posts held by members of the Imperial Service will be obtained. I consider it essential, however, that, in nominating Indian candidates, the Secretary of State should bear in mind, as far as possible, the due representation of the various communities of India. It is generally undesirable to send to a province an officer recruited from another province. In the Assam Valley, for instance, any Indian other than an inhabitant of that Valley, would be regarded as a comparative foreigner. Scope should also be left for the appointment to the superior service of specially selected Indian officers of the Provincial Service. Such appointments would, however, be the exception. It may also be added generally that, in view of the large European non-official population with which the Forest Department has to transact business, the recruitment of Indians to the superior service must necessarily be limited for the present.

2. *System of recruitment to the Imperial Service and training.*—As regards recruitment to the Imperial Service and the training of Imperial Officers, I cite the views of Mr. Perrée, Officiating Conservator of Forests, with which Mr. Monro, Conservator of Forests, is in accord:—"I am strongly in favour of a special training at an institution with an Indian atmosphere and traditions, where some *esprit de corps* can be engendered. I saw a good deal of the Forest probationers both at Oxford and Cambridge, when last at home, and I was struck with the lack of efficient control and supervision over their work. The duties of an officer in India demand the early acquisition of a strict sense of duty and habit of work. It will not do to make up arrears periodically by burning the midnight oil! For these reasons I consider the Universities unsuitable for our purpose.

"A central institution thoroughly equipped to train officers for the Indian Civil Service, Public Works, Forest, Telegraph and perhaps Police Departments would, I feel sure, supply this country with recruits much better equipped in every way (not excepting manners) than present arrangements. The value of such an institution to Indian recruits is of importance. Indians who go to England do not make the best use of their opportunities at present, they hold aloof and keep too much to themselves. The closer intercourse necessitated by the conditions of a central institution would be specially beneficial to them and probably to the others. I am, therefore, entirely in favour of a central institution and the training of Forest probationers there after selection.

"As regards recruitment, I think that competition after nomination within age limits of 18 to 20 would be the best; the examination to be in English composition and dictation, mathematics and elementary science subjects, and German to be made a compulsory language. The entrance to Coopers Hill prior to 1890 was somewhat on the above lines, but was changed, on agitation from Public Schools, because the subjects required could only be obtained at a crammer's. It is imperative, however, that Forestry, which is based on the sciences, should be properly understood from the outset, and the disadvantages, if any, that existed prior to 1890 outweighed the advantages that were supposed to have followed, because the very elements of each science had to be taught, and much time taken up thereby which could have been devoted to the applied part of the sciences. After selection, the course at the central institution, which would include forestry, botany, engineering, organic chemistry, geology and physics, should extend over five terms, followed by a six months' course in Germany, or a total training of 27 months in Europe. Following this course, I recommend a full year in India, where conditions require special study. During this period important subjects like surveying and forest engineering should be taught, and typical Indian forests inspected. The results of any measures could be observed and explained. The actual condition of Indian forests and their present or future requirements could be brought home to the probationer. Much of the present rawness would be obviated, and Indian ideas would naturally be acquired, instead of by the present crude method of finding European theory and practice inapplicable, and having to work out some problem unaided, or finding out things by trial and error.

"The syllabus should be drawn up in consultation with the Government of India, who have recently elaborated a scheme of training for provincial officers, and the Imperial recruits will have to compare favourably in their training with the provincial men.

"At present the Dehra Dun Rangers have a superior training in survey and engineering to the Imperial men.

"Practical training in England is practicable only to the extent of excursions to a few private estates. For an exposition of scientific forestry recourse must be had to the Continent, especially Germany, where the different States afford examples of very highly developed forests fulfilling local demands, whether as physical or economic assets. This is of extreme value for India, where conditions vary enormously, and the true position of the forests in the future economy of the country is scarcely yet realised. The course in India, following upon practical illustration in Europe, should therefore be of special value. According to my proposals, a young man would ordinarily enter the service at 22, which is a suitable age."

The above views fully accord with the proposals which I have made in connection with the Indian Civil Service and other services. I approve of competition after nomination on general grounds, and in the case of Indians also because a fair representation of the inhabitants of the different provinces of India is impossible under a system of competition.

3. *Pension for officers of the Imperial Service.*—I gather that a large number of memorials are pending on the subject of pensions, but I can say nothing in regard to these, as I am not acquainted with their contents.

B.—PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *Recruitment and pay of officers of the Provincial Forest Department.*—I have no remarks to offer under the head of recruitment. As regards pay, a Provincial Service Officer receives a salary which approximates to two thirds of the pay of an Imperial Service Officer, and this is sufficiently liberal as regards the ordinary Provincial Service Officer. When an officer of the Provincial Service is promoted to a divisional charge, his salary can be advanced from Rs. 550, by stages, up to a maximum of Rs. 850 (excluding local allowance), as compared with Rs. 1,250 (excluding local allowance) given to an Imperial Service Officer. On general principles, I am of opinion that officers considered qualified for promotion to such important charges as major divisions should be allowed to enter the time-scale of the superior service on their own pay or the nearest pay of the superior time scale, and thereafter to receive increments in the same way as an officer of the superior service. Officers so specially promoted should, I think, be eligible for any post in the superior service. I do not think that more than this is required at present.

2. *Number of officers of the Provincial Forest Service to be promoted to the superior Service.*—Mr. Monro, Conservator of Forests, is of opinion that if promotions are made save in the case of exceptional officers, there will be loss of efficiency, and to avoid this, the number of Circles will have to be increased. He writes: "Any Provincial Service Officer fit for a charge, receives one, but it is impossible to lay down mathematically the number of charges which can be held by Provincial Service Officers and fix the Imperial and Provincial cadres accordingly; it may be that, with the great improvements in pay and prospects of the Provincial Service, the average officer will be more efficient and able to take larger responsibility than in the past, but I strongly deprecate any forcing in the matter. Local Governments and Conservators are very ready and willing to put Provincial Service Officers into charges as they are fit for them. It is much better to leave it at that. In a few years' time it will be more possible than at present to say whether the members in the two cadres can be re-adjusted." As I have advocated in the case of other services, we must, I think, recruit the best class of Indians direct to the superior service, and give promotion to Provincial Service men only when they prove themselves fully qualified. At any rate, as regards this province, the rule prescribed by the Government of India that 20 per cent. of the major charges should be held by Provincial Service Officers is more than adequate at present.

3. *Status and nomenclature.*—I think that the term "Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators" might suitably be dropped, and that the officers of the Provincial Service might be called Deputy Conservators and Assistant Conservators.

C.—GENERAL.

The Forest Department list.—As in the case of other services, I recommend a single Forest Service list with Divisions comprising (1) officers recruited by the Secretary of State, to consist of Conservators, Deputy Conservators, and Assistant Conservators, (2) locally-recruited Deputy Conservators and Assistant Conservators, and (3) the Subordinate Staff of Foresters and Rangers.

APPENDIX VII.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Forest Department.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory. — Imperial Service.* — The Imperial Branch of the Department consists of the Chief Conservator, Conservators and Deputy and Assistant Conservators of Forests. The Imperial Branch of the service is recruited solely in England, and is appointed under covenant with the Secretary of State. Candidates must be over nineteen and under twenty-three years of age, natural-born British subjects and unmarried. At present they are appointed on the nomination of a selection committee, and are allowed to undergo their training at any University which possesses a Forestry School approved by the Secretary of State. Oxford, Cambridge and Edinburgh Universities have been so approved already. The period of training extends over two years, and includes seven months abroad for the study of practical forestry. An allowance of £120 a year is made to Probationers during this period, and a passage allowance to Burma of £43. The regulations have been found to give satisfactory results, but they are susceptible of improvement in the following directions:—

(1) The officers now joining the Department arrive at an age at which their characters and dispositions are too fully formed to allow of their accommodating themselves to the new environment in which they find themselves. The age limit at time of selection should therefore be reduced.

(2) The experience gained in the last few years shows that the medical examination to which probationers are now submitted is not nearly searching enough. It is most essential that Forest Officers should have exceptionally good physiques, as they have to undergo, throughout the greater part of their service, hardships and exposures which no other branch of the public services in India are called upon to endure. The physical test which was formerly insisted upon should most certainly be re-introduced.

(3) The University Degree in a branch of Natural Science is unnecessary and is of no practical value to a Forest Officer. Specialists in any particular branch of Natural Science are not wanted, but men with a good all-round knowledge. The old system, where sufficient knowledge of Natural Science was required from candidates for admission to the service to allow of their following the more advanced courses of Natural Science, which formed part of their training, and thoroughly assimilating the science of Forestry, is better than the new system, and should be reverted to.

(4) The existing bodies in Great Britain who teach Forestry do not give a special course of training suitable for Indian conditions, and cannot afford to engage a lecturer qualified to give such a course for the very small number of men who join the Indian Forest Department. A special course of this nature is necessary, and can only be obtained by sending the recruits for the Indian Forest Department to the same institution and appointing properly qualified men to teach them, replacing the present Director of Indian Forest Studies. Another advantage of being trained at the same institution would be the wholesome spirit of "camaraderie" or "esprit de corps" which used to be very strongly marked, and resulted in Forest Officers taking a pride in their work and in bringing credit on the institution in which they were trained. Of late years there has been a very distinct falling off both in the matter of "esprit

APPENDIX VII. (*continued*).

de corps" and "discipline" owing to the officers being practically strangers to one another, instead of friends of some years' standing, when they join the service.

(5) The six months' practical training on the Continent has not been as profitable as it should have been, because the probationers have not been properly supervised and taught by an officer who has had Indian experience, who can direct the work of the students into useful lines, and can induce the men to take personal interest in it. This defect can be easily remedied by sending the students to one and the same place and in charge of a selected Indian Forest Officer (who may be on leave).

(6) There can be no doubt that men who have done no practical Forestry and who have no sense of responsibility do not profit nearly so much by what they see as men who have both these qualifications, and it would therefore be very greatly in the interests of Government to send all the men of the same year to the Continent to study selected forests and forest problems for six months, after they have been out here three years, and do realise the seriousness of their profession. Even three months spent on the Continent with a competent experienced Indian Forest Officer as a guide would be of infinitely more value than six months spent with their eyes unopened in Continental forests before they come to India.

(7) The present training in Forest Engineering and Surveying is most inadequate.

Provincial Service.—The Provincial Branch of the Department consists of Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests. The Sub-Assistant Conservators at the date of the 1887 Commission were recruited partly by promotion of Rangers and partly by direct appointment of candidates with F.A. qualifications. After the re-organisation of 1891 the Sub-Assistant Conservators became Extra Assistant Conservators, and subsequent appointments to this service were made exclusively from among promoted Rangers. In 1906 a system of direct recruitment, concurrently with the promotion of Rangers, was re-introduced. The same training was laid down for officers recruited by both methods, viz., a special third year's course at Dehra Dun after the completion of the ordinary two years' course for Rangers, but in the case of promoted Rangers this rule might be relaxed where length and excellence of service as a Ranger warranted an exception. From November, 1912, a further development has been made by the institution for Provincial Service candidates of a two years' course at Dehra Dun entirely distinct from the course prescribed for Rangers; but appointments as Extra Assistant Conservators may still be given to Rangers not more than 30 years of age and with not less than five years' satisfactory service (three of which must have been in executive charge), who have obtained the higher standard certificate at Dehra Dun or at the Burma Forest School. Such Rangers must be sufficiently acquainted with English to carry on their correspondence and keep their accounts in that language. It may be added that a recruit to the Provincial Service on satisfactorily completing the two years' training at the Forest Research Institute and College is required to complete two years' satisfactory service as a Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests on Rs. 175 per mensem and to pass the departmental examination in Burmese by the Lower Standard before he can be appointed as an Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests on Rs. 250 per mensem.

The present system of recruitment is satisfactory. The improved prospects of the Provincial Forest Service are beginning to be more generally appreciated, with the result that the class of men entering the service has improved considerably, and will continue to do so. There will be no dearth of suitable candidates for this branch of the service in the future. The present system of a special two years' course of instruction at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun, is also satisfactory, and a great improvement on the old method of training.

2A. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time.*—The information required under this heading for both the Imperial and Provincial Services is given in the statement below.

—	Imperial charges.	Imperial Reserve (25 per cent.).	Provincial charges.	Provincial Reserve (10 per cent.).
New scale ...	45	11	55	5
Increase	13	4	26	2

2B. *Whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.—Imperial Service.*—The rates of pay drawn by the Inspector-General of Forests, Chief Conservators and Conservators are too small considering the amount of work and responsibility these posts involve. A Deputy Conservator of Forests drawing Rs. 1,250 plus a Burma allowance of Rs. 100 is much better off financially than a Conservator, 3rd grade, on Rs. 1,500 without a Burma allowance. Deputy Conservators who are considered fit for promotion to Conservators should be given an annual increment of Rs. 50 per mensem up to a maximum of Rs. 1,500 or until such time as they reach administrative rank. Assistant Conservators of Forests placed in charge of Divisions should be given a charge allowance on account of the increased work and responsibility involved. The present scale of pay of Assistant and Deputy Conservators is adequate. The subject of a Burma allowance has been specially dealt with by the Burma Allowance Committee, and is, therefore, not touched upon here.

Provincial Service.—The time scale of pay sanctioned for this service is quite adequate, taking into consideration the intellectual and educational qualifications of the officers at present in the service. The local allowances of officers of this service should be regulated in accordance with the rates of pay drawn as suggested in the case of Imperial officers. (Provincial) officers stationed in Rangoon should be granted house allowances as in the case of Imperial officers.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—The number of officers in the Forest Department and the number in each grade, where there are still grades, are shown below—

Chief Conservator of Forests (ungraded)	1	
Conservators, 1st grade ...	2	
Conservators, 2nd grade ...	*Nil*	
Conservators, 3rd grade ...	1 sub *pro tem.* 1 officiating.	
Deputy and Assistant Conservators	61	On time-scale of pay.
Extra Deputy Conservators ...	19	
Extra Assistant Conservators	43	

The table in paragraph 2 of the General Memorandum shows the provision made in the Imperial and Provincial Service cadre for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held temporarily or otherwise by officers of the various services.*—One of the instructors at the Imperial Forest College is an Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests from Burma (Mr. G. T. Wrafter). This post is not included in the Burma Provincial Service cadre sanctioned in 1907. Mr. Wrafter remains seconded on the Burma list.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The sanctioned cadre in 1909 was as follows:—

Imperial charges	45	
Reserve (25 per cent.) ...	11	
	—	56
Provincial charges	55	
Reserve (10 per cent.) ...	5	
	—	60

Burma contributes five officers to the India list, thus raising the total Imperial cadre for the Province to 61 officers. The total Provincial cadre was raised to 62 officers by the inclusion of the entire Provincial staff of the Andamans in 1910. The classification of charges for which this cadre was sanctioned has been found to be not in accordance with the orders on the subject. Conservators have now re-examined the position with a view to rectifying this error. In doing so they have taken advantage of the opportunity to revise the scheme on which the sanctioned cadre is based in the light of recent experience in so far as regards the total number of Divisional and other charges that are likely eventually to be required. The Conservators proposals show that 81 major charges and 90 minor charges are required, including two major charges on account of a fifth circle, necessitating the following revised cadre:—

86 Deputy Conservators of Forests and Assistant Conservators of Forests.
18 Extra Deputy Conservators of Forests.
103 Extra Assistant Conservators of Forests.

The Chief Conservator is of opinion that the present cadre is inadequate for the work required of it and calls for material strengthening. He considers that the additions proposed by the Conservators are absolutely necessary, and has advanced the following grounds in justification of his views.

A fifth Circle should be constituted at once and a sixth Circle as soon as the necessary staff can be recruited and buildings for them constructed. The majority of the existing Divisions are much too large to allow of their being efficiently administered. Practically the whole of the efforts of officers attached to Divisions is devoted to girdling teak trees for purchase contractors, *i.e.*, the removal of the marketable materials standing in the forests. The removal of timber-producing trees from unclassed forests is practically not controlled in any way for want of staff, and this class of forest in many parts of Lower Burma, at any rate, has been practically denuded of all marketable timber by timber-dealers and by villagers for domestic purposes in a most wasteful manner, and unless steps are promptly taken to make reserves in the more thickly populated and more developed districts in Lower Burma, the unclassed forests in the course of a few years will not be capable of meeting even the requirements of the agricultural population, much less the demands of the larger villages and towns who depend upon local timber-dealers to meet their requirements.

Working plans and felling schemes are everywhere urgently required to prevent forests from being overworked, and so to ensure a supply of forest produce in the future, but cannot be made for lack of officers.

The most serious matter is, however, that practically nothing is being done to assist and improve the young crop which is coming on—or should be—to replace the mature marketable material that is now being removed and is producing revenue. Extraction has, to a very large extent, been limited up to the present time, so far as the reserved forests are concerned to the most valuable species such as teak, pyinkado, and a few others of the better species of wood which grow in a mixed forest made up very largely of other inferior species. It is absolutely necessary if the proportion of these more valuable species is to be maintained that heavy, extensive and carefully executed improvement fellings should be made by trained and capable Imperial Service officers in order to give the more valuable species that amount of growing space which is necessary for their normal development, to ensure that the poles, saplings of these species are not suppressed by the faster-growing, inferior species of little economic value, and that the natural reproduction of these species is assured. It has been impossible to do this most necessary work because there have been no officers, and it would be useless to provide funds for this work as long as there are no officers to carry it out.

Cart roads to open up the less accessible forests, as well as forests containing timber trees which are too heavy to float, are urgently required, and until they are constructed the mature and overmature timber standing in them cannot be profitably extracted. Graded elephant-paths are required everywhere to facilitate the inspection of the forests, the supervision of the work of firms extracting timber as well as the work of the girdling officers and the protective work of the subordinate establishment, but until officers and funds are provided these most necessary works cannot be carried out.

In the Tenasserim and parts of the Pegu Circle considerable additions should be made to the existing reserves in the interests of the timber supplies of the Province in the future, and the agricultural population, but no officers are available for this work either.

In Sir George Shaw's opinion this statement of the present situation, in which no attempt to undertake the most important measures of Forest Conservancy can be made owing to the want of the necessary staff, is conclusive on the point.

The Lieutenant-Governor has deferred the submission of his detailed proposals on the subject to the Government of India pending the issue of the report by the Public Services Commission and the decision of the question regarding the distribution of posts between the Imperial and Provincial Services.

Rates of pay and allowances of Imperial and Provincial Officers in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time.

	1890.		1900.		1918.	
	Pay.	Local Allowance	Pay.	Local Allowance.	Pay.	Local Allowance.
IMPERIAL SERVICE.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Chief Conservator of Forests	...	...	...	...	2,150	Nil
Conservators, 1st grade	1,500	Nil	1,600	Nil	1,900	Do.
„ 2nd grade	1,250	Do.	1,350	Do.	1,700	Do.
„ 3rd grade	1,000	*100	1,100	‡Rs. 100 in Upper Burma.	1,500	Do.
Deputy Conservators, 1st grade	900	100	900	100	‖Time-scale rates of pay.	100
„ „ 2nd grade	800	100	800	100		
„ „ 3rd grade	650	100	650	100		
„ „ 4th grade	550	100	550	100		
Assistant Conservators, 1st grade ...	450	100	450	100		
„ „ 2nd grade ...	350	100	350	100		
„ „ 3rd grade ...	250	100	...	...		

* The Conservators in Lower Burma ceased to enjoy local allowances in 1891.
‡ The Conservators in Upper Burma ceased to enjoy local allowances in 1901.
‖ The time-scale starts from Rs. 380 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 40 a month to Rs. 700; thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 50 to Rs. 1,250 in the 20th year of service. Whilst drawing pay up to and including Rs. 540 a month an officer is styled "Assistant Conservator," and when drawing pay at Rs. 580 to Rs. 1,250 a month he ranks as "Deputy Conservator."

APPENDICES VII. (*continued*) AND VIII.

Rates of pay and allowances of Imperial and Provincial Officers—continued.

	1890.		1900.		1913.	
	Pay.	Local Allowance.	Pay.	Local Allowance.	Pay.	Local Allowance.
PROVINCIAL SERVICE.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Sub-Assistant Conservators on	250	†Nil	...	...	...	...
" "	200	Do.	...	...	...	...
" "	175	Do.	...	...	...	...
Extra Deputy Conservators, 1st grade ...	...	...	600	§ Rs. 50 in Lower Burma. Rs. 80 in Upper Burma.	¶ Time-scale rates of pay.	65
" " 2nd grade ...	...	...	550			
" " 3rd grade ...	...	...	500			
" " 4th grade ...	...	...	450			
Extra Assistant Conservators, 1st grade...	...	...	350			
" " 2nd grade...	...	...	300			
" " 3rd grade..	...	...	250			
" " 4th grade...	...	...	200			

† They got allowances called "local allowances" at the following rates:—Rs. 60 when in charge of a Division; Rs. 30 when in charge of a Sub-division. These allowances were more in the nature of "charge" than "local allowances."

§ Extra Assistant Conservators got an additional local allowance of Rs. 50 when placed in charge of major forest divisions, but the number of officers entitled to this allowance was limited to eight for the whole of India.

¶ The time-scale starts at Rs. 250 a month, and rises by annual increments of Rs. 20 a month to Rs. 550 in the 16th year of service. Promotion to the class of Extra Deputy Conservator is made by Local Government by selection. An Extra Deputy Conservator begins to draw Rs. 575 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 25 a month to Rs. 650 a month. Subsequently, by the special orders of the Local Government in each case, an Extra Deputy Conservator's pay may be raised to Rs. 700, Rs. 800, and Rs. 850 a month respectively. Extra Assistant Conservators temporarily placed in major charge receive an additional local allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem.

APPENDIX VIII.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Forest Department.

FOR THE PUBLIC SERVICES COMMISSION.

(I) *ADMINISTRATION OF THE FOREST DEPARTMENT.*—The general administration of the forests in the whole Presidency is under the control of the Board of Revenue, which is, therefore, the head of the Forest Department, Madras. Collectors and Conservators are subordinate to, and receive their orders and instructions from, the Board in its Forest Branch. The orders of the Government on forest business are issued from the Revenue Secretariat, to which all correspondence on such matters is addressed.

2. The Collector is the head of the Forest Department in his own district, and, as such, has the control of, and is responsible for, the general management of the forests situated therein, the District Forest Officer being the Collector's Assistant in forest matters.

3. The Conservator is the Chief Forest Officer in the circle under his charge, and, though an inspecting and advising officer, he has powers of direct control over the District Forest Officer in certain departmental and technical matters. In matters of finance, the Conservator exercises a general control over the revenue and expenditure of his circle. He is responsible for the audit and control of accounts, and is vested with independent authority in the matter of the appointment, transfer and punishment of the forest subordinate of certain classes and with special functions connected with the preparation and control of working plans. The Collector is in no way under the orders of the Conservator, but on all important matters the Conservator should be consulted before definite action is taken.

4. A Conservator's charge or circle is ordinarily divided and sub-divided into—

(*a*) Forest districts or *controlling charges.*

(*b*) Sub-divisions and ranges or *executive charges.*

(*c*) Beats or *protective charges.*

The unit of management is the range which comprises a number of beats. A forest district usually coincides with a revenue district, though, in some cases, the latter includes two or more separate forest districts. Each forest district is divided into a number of ranges, and a group of ranges is styled a sub-division.

(*II*) *CONSTITUTION AND ORGANIZATION OF THE FOREST SERVICE.*—5. *Prior to the Public Service Commission of* 1886-1887.—At the time of the appointment of the Public Service Commission of 1886-1887 the Forest Department comprised three branches, viz.:—

(i) Control—including (*a*) Conservators, (*b*) Deputy Conservators, and (*c*) Assistant Conservators.

(ii) Executive—including Sub-Assistant Conservators and Forest Rangers, and

(ii) Protective—including Foresters and Forest Guards.

6. The members of the controlling staff were ordinarily appointed by the Secretary of State in England. But deserving Sub-Assistant conservators could be promoted to the class of Assistant Conservators by the Governor in Council on the special recommendation of Conservators, but they could not, save in cases of exceptional merit, rise to the class of Deputy Conservators. The district charges were ordinarily held by the Deputy and Assistant Conservators. Sub-Assistant Conservators could not by virtue of their office hold charge of districts. But Sub-Assistant Conservators and even Rangers had held charge of districts, in rare cases, for want of Deputy and Assistant Conservators.

7. *Proposals of Sir D. Brandis.*—In 1886, about the time the last Public Service Commission were prosecuting their inquiries in India, Sir D. Brandis submitted certain proposals to the Secretary of State for India regarding the organisation of the Forest Service. As some of these proposals helped to shape the policy of Government in officering the Department, it seems necessary to refer to them here. His proposals were briefly as follows:—

(*1*) That any increase in the number of officers to direct the executive management of the forests must not be met by augmenting the number of the

controlling staff, but by employing the less expensive agency of the executive staff.

(*2*) That some prospect of earning promotion to the ranks of the superior or controlling staff must be held out to the executive staff, as every instance in which it might be possible to make such promotion would tend to elevate the aims and character of this staff, and to increase its efficiency:

(*3*) That the Home authorities should resist any tendency on the part of the local authorities in India to meet the expansion of work by addition to the superior staff, and that the necessity should be impressed upon the Government of India of expanding the operations of the Dehra Dun Forest School, of employing on a larger scale native officers trained at that institution, and of more rapidly completing the organisation of the executive forest staff in the different provinces; and

(*4*) That as the duties of the controlling staff consisted chiefly in initiating all important measures and in exercising a proper supervision over the operations of the Department, the men sent out from England should have undergone a more thorough professional training and have learnt the practice and science of Forestry.

8. *Recommendations of the Public Service Commission of* 1886-1887.—These recommendations were as follows:—

(*1*) That the staff be divided into an Imperial Branch and a Provincial Branch;

(*2*) That, as in the Imperial Civil Service, the Imperial Branch of the Forest Service should be a *corps d'élite* limited to the number of officers necessary to fill the superior controlling appointments and such a proportion of the Assistant Conservators' posts as would ensure a complete training for the junior officers;

(*3*) That the Imperial Branch should be recruited in England;

(*4*) That the conditions of service as to leave and pension should be assimilated to those of the Imperial Branch of the Public Works Department;

(*5*) That the rule regarding marriage should be modified, inasmuch as it might operate to debar native candidates from competing for appointments in England; and

(*6*) That the Government should keep in view the policy of training the India men qualified to take charge of the higher administrative appointments so as to avoid, as far as possible, the necessity of expanding the Imperial Branch of the Service.

9. *Reorganization of* 1891.—Prior to 1891 the Imperial Service officers provided the whole of the upper controlling staff; but in that year, in order to meet the proposals made by Sir D. Brandis in 1886 and the recommendations of the Public Service Commission in 1887, proposals for reorganising the Forest Service in order to supply the recognised deficiency in the numerical strength of that service—chiefly by providing for the gradual development of indigenous agency—were approved by the Secretary of State. The service as reconstituted was as shown below:—

(*1*) Upper controlling staff for major charges consisting of (*a*) Imperial officers, who included Conservators, Deputy Conservators and Assistant Conservators; and

(*b*) Provincial officers who were styled Extra Deputy Conservators.

(*2*) Lower controlling staff for minor charges and sub-divisions consisting of Extra Assistant Conservators.

(*3*) Executive staff for Range charges consisting of Rangers and certificated Foresters; and

(*4*) Protective staff consisting of uncertificated Foresters and Forest guards.

10. The Imperial officers of the Upper controlling staff were to be recruited in England under covenant with the Secretary of State for India. The Provincial officers of the Upper controlling staff were to be recruited in India by promotion from the Lower controlling staff. It was ordered that they should have obtained the Higher Standard Certificate in Forestry of the Dehra Dun Forest School or of the Poona College of Science, and that they should have done good service of not less than five years as Extra Assistant Conservators in either of the two Upper grades of that service. It was further provided that, at the outset, the Upper controlling staff should comprise only officers of the Imperial Branch, but that, as opportunities occurred, they should be replaced by officers of the Provincial Branch up to a limit of 20 per cent.

11. *Reorganisation of 1896.*—In 1896 the Forest Service was brought into line with the other Services by being classified as follows:—

(*1*) The Imperial Service—comprising that part of the Upper controlling staff which was recruited in England;

(*2*) The Provincial Service—comprising the rest of the Upper and the whole of the Lower controlling staff; and

(*3*) The Subordinate Service — comprising Rangers, Deputy Rangers, Foresters, and Forest guards.

By the above classification a definite line was drawn between the Provincial and the Imperial Services. But the former Service was not complete, as no transfers were made from the latter as contemplated in the reorganisation of 1891. In order to effect these transfers automatically the Government of India directed the institution of what is known as the "Pilot" system. It seems unnecessary to describe this system here as it did not answer the purpose originally in view, and was done away with in 1907. A self-contained cadre of the Provincial Service, consisting of Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators was subsequently sanctioned under the reorganisation of 1911, which is described below.

12. *Reorganization of 1911.*—The object of this reorganisation was only to augment the controlling Forest Service, the constitution of the Service as established in 1896 being followed in its entirety. The need for the augmentation was recognised as due to the rapid development of the forests in the Presidency, the redistribution of districts under Sir W. Meyer's scheme, the sub-division of heavy districts into two or more Forest divisions, and the contemplated establishment of a Forest College at Coimbatore. The following principles were followed in this reorganisation:—

(*1*) That, in accordance with the declared policy of His Majesty's Government to foster the larger employment of the indigenous agency in the administration of the forests:—

(*a*) The major charges should be divided between Imperial and Provincial officers in the proportion of 75 and 25 per cent., respectively, instead of the usual 80 and 20 per cent.

(*b*) The proportion of the minor charges should be greatly enlarged.

(*2*) That the Presidency should be divided into four circles instead of three.

(*3*) That the Madras Government should supply two officers to fill certain appointments on the India list, such as Inspector-General, Assistant Inspector-General, Staff of the Forest College, Dehra Dun, etc., whenever called upon to do so.

This reorganisation provides for the staff required for the Madras Forest College, Coimbatore.

(*III*) *THE IMPERIAL SERVICE.*—13. *Recruitment.*—The Imperial Branch of the Forest Service is recruited solely in England. Its officers are appointed under covenant with the Secretary of State, either under the regulations which may from time to time be laid down by him or in such other manner as may be approved by him. The regulations for the appointment prescribe that every candidate must be—

(*a*) A natural-born British subject, and

(*b*) Unmarried.

The former term has been held by the Government of India to be equivalent to a natural-born subject of His Majesty anl to include natives of India. Similarly, as regards marriage, the rule attracted the notice of the Public Service Commission of 1886-87 as unsuited to natives of India, and the Secretary of State, in 1899, decided that a native

of India was not barred by early marriage in accordance with the customs of his race. The regulations have been amended in order to make this clear. As yet there has been not a single case of an Indian belonging to this Presidency having qualified himself for entry into the Imperial Service.

14. *Training and selection of probationers.*—(*i*) In 1885 a course of instruction in Forestry had been inaugurated at the Royal Engineering College, Coopers Hill. In 1905, when the Coopers Hill College was closed, the Secretary of State for India in Council decided, as an experimental measure, subject to reconsideration after three years, that the forest probationers should be obtained by open competition as before, held by the Civil Service Commissioners, among candidates who had passed Responsions at Oxford, or an equivalent examination elsewhere, the subjects of the competitive examination being mechanics and physics, chemistry, zoology, and botany; and that they should be trained at Oxford and on the Continent.

(*ii*) Three years afterwards the Secretary of State appointed a committee to "enquire into and report on the present system of selecting and training, after selection, candidates of the Indian Forest Service, and to make recommendations." The committee's report was considered in consultation with the Government of India, and in 1911 the Secretary of State formulated and approved certain resolutions with regard to the arrangements for the selection of probationers and their training in England and on the Continent of Europe. These resolutions, fifteen in number, mainly provide—

(*1*) That any University in the United Kingdom which possesses a Forest School approved by the Secretary of State should be permitted to train forest probationers, and for this purpose he approved the forest schools existing at the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge, and Edinburgh.

(*2*) That a course of training in practical forestry in Germany or elsewhere, a certain standard of knowledge in an Indian vernacular, and any other special qualification required by the Secretary of State should be imposed on all probationers.

(*3*) That their studies should be controlled by a paid Director of Indian Forest studies, who should be a selected officer of the Indian Forest Department.

(*4*) That for the purpose of reporting on the qualification of candidates for appointment as probationers, the Secretary of State should constitute in each year a Board of Enquiry which should select probationers, provided that, should there be more qualified candidates than vacancies, the Secretary of State should reserve the right to require the candidates to pass a competitive examination conducted by the Civil Service Commissioners, on the result of which their final selection would depend.

15. *Period of training of probationers.*—Originally the period of training was confined to two years, but in 1888 a change was introduced by which the senior students were placed in charge of Sir D. Brandis during an annual tour on the Continent of Europe after they had completed the two years' course at Coopers Hill. In 1890 the course was further extended to three years, the greater portion of the last year being spent on the Continent in practical training. At present it ordinarily extends to two years, including seven months abroad.

16. *Grant of allowances to probationers during training.*—The cost to the probationers of the whole training, including fees, board and lodging while at the Coopers Hill College and the payment for the Continental course, but not including pocket money, clothes or out-of-term expenses was £427 in 1889 and rose to £576 in 1901. No allowances of any kind were granted to the probationers during their training except free passage to India, which was discontinued in 1905, but during the years 1905-1908 each probationer received on signing his agreement an allowance, the amount of which varied from £50 to £100 according to the proficiency and diligence shown by him during his Continental training. Since 1909 this allowance was raised to £120 a year, or a total of £240 in two years, and it was granted only to such probationers as possessed a degree in Natural Science or a Diploma in Forestry. This condition has, however, been abolished from 1912 and a passage allowance is also now paid to each probationer on appointment to the Indian Forest Service to the amount of £37 10s. for a passage to Calcutta, Madras or Bombay and £43 for a passage to Rangoon.

17. *Age of probationers.*—The age limits for admission as probationers in 1887 were 17 to 21 years and from 1891 to 1904 17 to 20 years. In 1905 they were raised to 18 to 21 years. In 1907 the maximum age limit was raised from 21 to 22, in 1909 to 23 and the minimum age to 19 in 1912. In 1914 and following years the age limits will be 19 and 22 on the 1st January of the year in which the selection is made.

18. *First appointment of probationers.*—Probationers who successfully pass the course are appointed Assistant Conservators. Prior to the introduction of the time scale of pay, Assistant Conservators were as a rule appointed to the third grade on Rs. 250, and they were not eligible for promotion successively to the second (on Rs. 350), and the first (on Rs. 450) grades unless they passed certain examinations and obtained the necessary certificates of qualification from the Conservator. Assistant Conservators of the third grade who were not qualified for promotion to the second grade were not ordinarily placed in charge of a District Forest Office, but were posted to do duty under an experienced Forest officer, and generally placed in charge of a Forest range. Since the introduction of the time scale of pay probationers are appointed to the class of Assistant Conservator, their seniority being reckoned from the date on which they were made permanent in the class of Assistant Conservator. Special instructions have been laid down for the training of Junior Assistant Conservators and about the vernacular examinations to be passed by them.

19. *Pay of Imperial officers.*—At the time of the Public Service Commission of 1886 the pay of the Controlling Staff was as follows:—

——	First grade.	Second grade.	Third grade.	Fourth grade.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Conservators	1,250—1,500	1,000—1,250	—	—
Deputy Conservators	900	800	650	550
Assistant Conservators	450	350	250	—

In 1891 the scale was altered to the following:—

——	First grade.	Second grade.	Third grade.	Fourth grade.	Remarks.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Conservators	1,600	1,350	1,100	—	Exclusive of exchange compensation allowance which was given from 1st April, 1893.
Deputy Conservators ..	900	800	650	550	
Assistant Conservators .	450	350	—	—	

In February, 1906, exchange compensation was abolished and the pay of Conservators was fixed at Rs. 1,900, Rs. 1,700, and Rs. 1,500. In January, 1907, the grading of officers below the rank of Conservator was abolished and a time scale introduced. The scale starts from Rs. 380 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 40 a month to Rs. 700 a month; thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 50 a month to Rs. 1,250 a month in the 20th year of service. No officiating grade promotions are now permitted within the class of Deputy and Assistant Conservators.

20. *Leave and pensions.*—The leave and pensions of the officers of the Imperial Branch are regulated by Chapters XIII and XIX of the Civil Service Regulations, under which they obtain the benefit of the European leave rules and may receive a retiring pension after 20 years' service (article 476). There has been no change in respect of the leave and pension rules since 1887 except in the matter of study leave (introduced in 1892) and special pensions under article 475. Conservators of the second and third grades were added on certain conditions in 1908 and the present orders are contained in this article as revised on 1st December, 1910.

21. *Number of officers and Provident Fund.*—(Please see paragraphs 29 and 30 under Provincial Service).

(*IV*) *PROVINCIAL SERVICE.*—22. *General.*—This Service comprises the Lower controlling staff as organised in 1891 after the report of the Public Service Commission and that portion of the Upper controlling staff which was not recruited from the Imperial Service. It consists of officers who are designated Extra Deputy Conservators and Extra Assistant Conservators. The term "Extra" in the designation of these officers was prefixed in 1891 when a definite line was drawn between officers recruited at Home and those recruited in India.

23. *Recruitment.*—Prior to 1891 there were only Sub-Assistant Conservators and these were recruited from the class of Rangers. Before promotion to the class of Sub-Assistant Conservator a Ranger should have passed (1) the language test, (2) the surveying test and (3) the departmental test, and be reported to be otherwise properly qualified, active and intelligent and capable of carrying out the duties of a District Forest officer. The language test was dispensed with in the case of men who had passed at least the Middle School Examination in the first class or the Matriculation Examination with the Handwriting Test. In 1891 the Government of India laid down that Extra Assistant Conservators should be recruited chiefly from the class of Forest Rangers, subject to the following conditions:—

(*a*) who had obtained at the Dehra Dun Forest school the certificate in Forestry (Higher standard) with honours, and who had afterwards rendered not less than two years' satisfactory service as Rangers in executive charge; or,

(*b*) who had obtained this certificate without honours, and had afterwards rendered five years' satisfactory service as Rangers in executive charges; or,

(*c*) in exceptional cases who were members of the department on 1st December, 1881, and who had done specially good and faithful service for at least five years as Rangers, and who had received a good general education and possessed a sufficient knowledge of English.

Provision was also made for direct appointment, in exceptional cases, to the class of Extra Assistant Conservators of selected candidates while undergoing training at the Forest School.

In 1906 the Government of India laid down the following rules for recruiting to the Provincial Service:—

(*1*) The Provincial Forest Service will be recruited either by direct appointment of candidates outside the department or by the promotion of officers in the department;

(*2*) candidates for direct appointment should be—

(*a*) persons under 25 years of age educated up to a standard not less than that of the Matriculation Examination.

(*b*) Native Commissioned Military officers possessing a sufficient general education, provided that they undergo the three years' course of training at the Dehra Dun College.

Candidates may be selected either before or after completion of the ordinary two years' course at Dehra Dun, but, before being allowed to enter on the third year's training, they must have obtained the Higher Standard certificate of the College, and on its completion must have received from the Principal a certificate that they have satisfactorily completed the third year's course.

(*3*) Appointments in the Provincial Forest Service which are filled by promotion of officers in the department will be given to—

(*a*) Rangers who have obtained the Higher Standard certificate at the close of the second year's course at Dehra Dun, and have thereafter obtained a certificate from the Principal that they have satisfactorily completed the third year's course; and

(*b*) Selected Rangers of long service and tried probity and ability, provided that no Ranger under 40 years of age shall be so promoted until he has undergone the third year's training at Dehra Dun and obtained the necessary certificate.

These rules are now practically in force except that, instead of the two years' training along with the Rangers and a subsequent one year's training, a separate course of two years' training for the Provincial Service candidates has been established at Dehra Dun.

24. *Training and selection.*—As already stated, candidates for the Provincial Service, whether Rangers or others, must have passed through a course of training at Dehra Dun College. A Forest school had been started at Dehra Dun in 1878, and previous to 1906 this school provided only a two years' course for the training of Rangers. In 1906 a third year's course was added at Dehra Dun, which was prescribed in addition to the two years' course for such Rangers as desired to enter the Provincial Service by this means and for all candidates for direct appointment. From November, 1912, a further development has been made by the institution for Provincial Service candidates of a two years' course at Dehra Dun entirely distinct from the course prescribed for Rangers. The direct appointments introduced in 1906 were intended to attract "men of good education and good social standing," but no express qualifications, educational or other, were then prescribed by the Government of India, and the latest orders for the nomination of such candidates leave the Local Governments considerable freedom as regards the age and qualifications of candidates for direct appointments. The arrangements recently prescribed are as follows:—

(*1*) It is left to Local Governments to prescribe what educational qualifications they please, including any examination, competitive or otherwise, for candidates it is proposed to depute to the Provincial course.

(*2*) Local Governments are to bear in mind the importance of giving a preference to candidates with a previous knowledge of science who are in all respects qualified by their education to follow and profit by the course of instruction, it having been found that without a preliminary training in science, probationers are not able to complete an advanced forest course within a limited time.

(*3*) Candidates are expected to know sufficient English and Mathematics to follow the course. The President of the Forest College is empowered to subject any candidate about whom he has a doubt to a special examination in these subjects, and as a result of the examination, or at any time during the course, to remove from the College any candidate whom he considers unable to follow the course prescribed.

(*4*) A physical test is undergone by candidates on arrival at Dehra Dun, followed by an examination by the Medical Board.

(*5*) The number of candidates to be sent for instruction will be fixed for each year for the Local

APPENDIX VIII. (*continued*).

Government, and so long as the number of candidates prescribed is not exceeded, Local Governments will be at liberty to send either candidates for direct appointment or Rangers already in service.

25. *Period of training.*—After selection candidates for direct appointment undergo a preliminary training under a District Forest Officer for a period of about one year before proceeding to Dehra Dun. After completing the course at Dehra Dun they undergo a further practical training for one year under the supervision of a District Forest Officer.

26. *Grant of allowances to probationers during training.*—During the period of their preliminary training candidates for direct appointment are paid an allowance of Rs. 40 plus a conveyance allowance of Rs. 25. Until recently they were paid a monthly stipend of Rs. 100 during the course of training at Dehra Dun, but not actual expenses by rail or steamer while on tour. But recently it has been ordered that they should receive only a monthly stipend of Rs. 80 plus actual expenses by rail or steamer, and that a bonus of Rs. 480 should be paid on completing the course successfully to help them to purchase their equipment. On return from Dehra Dun these men are styled Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators on a pay not exceeding Rs. 150 per mensem until they are absorbed into the regular line as Extra Assistant Conservators. If they are not confirmed within three years after completing the course they could be paid at Rs. 200 per mensem.

27. *Pay of Provincial Officers.*—The rates of pay of Sub-Assistant Conservators who were subsequently merged into and designated as Extra Assistant Conservators were originally as follows:—

		Rs.
Sub-Assistant Conservator,	1st grade ..	200
Do.	2nd ,, ...	175
Do.	3rd ,, ...	150

In 1891 the pay of this class of officers and officers of the Provincial service belonging to the Upper controlling staff was fixed as follows:—

		Rs.
Extra Deputy Conservators,	first grade ...	600
Do.	do. second grade	550
Do.	do. third grade	500
Do.	do. fourth grade	450
Extra Assistant Conservators,	first grade	350
Do.	do. second grade	300
Do.	do. third grade	250
Do.	do. fourth grade	200

Note.—A local allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem was granted to officers of the Lower Controlling staff (Extra Assistant Conservators) who were placed in charge of major forest charges, but the number of officers entitled to this allowance was limited to two in this Presidency.

Since 1st April, 1911, a time scale of pay has been introduced for this service, which approximates to nearly two-thirds of that for the Imperial Service. It starts at Rs. 250 a month and rises by annual increments of Rs. 20 a month to Rs. 550 in the sixteenth year of service; thereafter promotion to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservator is by selection. On appointment to the class of Extra Deputy Conservator an officer is paid Rs. 575—25—650. After one year's service on Rs. 650 a Local Government may by special order in each case promote an officer to a pay of Rs. 700 a month for three years and again to Rs. 800 for a further period of three years and thereafter to Rs. 850 until the close of his service.

Note.—Extra Assistant Conservators temporarily placed in a major charge could now receive a local allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem, but not any officiating allowances, without any limit as to the number of such officers.

28. *Leave and pension.*—The leave and pension of this branch of the Forest Service are regulated by Chapters XI, XII, XIV, and XIX of the Civil Service Regulations.

29. *Number of Imperial and Provincial Officers:*—

(i) In 1886 the superior controlling staff consisted of the following officers:—

Conservators	2
Deputy Conservators	14
Assistant Conservators	12
	28
Sub-Assistant Conservators	13

The Sub-Assistant Conservators at this time belonged only to the Executive staff. But as they formed the nucleus of the Provincial Service their strength is mentioned here

(ii) Under the re-organisation of 1891 the service was divided into the Provincial and Imperial branches for the first time. The cadre of the two branches was as follows:—

	Nos.
Imperial—	
Conservators	3
Deputy Conservators	21
Assistant Conservators	10
	34
Provincial—	
Extra Deputy Conservators	*Nil.*
Extra Assistant Conservators... ...	11

(iii) Subsequent to this there was no comprehensive scheme of re-organisation but appointments were created whenever necessity arose. Thus in 1898 one Extra Assistant Conservator was added to provide for the post of Forest Assistant to the Board of Revenue. In 1899 one Deputy Conservator and one Extra Assistant Conservator were added to provide for officers for Coorg. In 1904 one Extra Assistant Conservator for the new district of Guntur was sanctioned. In 1905 two Deputy Conservators were added temporarily for five years. Under the scheme for the transfer of appointments from the Imperial to the Provincial Service formulated under the scheme of 1896 it was ordered that three appointments of Deputy Conservators and four appointments of Assistant Conservators should be transferred to the Provincial service, but of these seven appointments only three were actually transferred until the "Pilot" system was abolished in 1907. It must also be mentioned that two appointments of Assistant Conservators were transferred from the Punjab to the Madras list under the orders of the Government of India (1 in 1903 and 1 in 1905). Thus prior to the final reorganisation of the Provincial and Imperial services in 1911 the cadre stood as follows:—

	No.
Imperial—	
Conservators	3
Deputy Conservators	15*
Assistant Conservators	8
Total ...	26
Provincial—	
Extra Deputy Conservators	7†
Extra Assistant Conservators... ...	18
Total	25

(iv) The reorganisation of 1911 fixed the cadre of the service as follows:—

(*a*) *Imperial.*

	No.	Pay.
		Rs.
Conservator, first grade	1	1,900
Do. second grade	2	1,700
Do. third grade	1	1,500
Deputy and Assistant Conservators..	27	(Time scale of pay.)
Total	31	

(*b*) *Provincial.*

Extra Deputy Conservators ...	8	(Time scale
Do. Assistant do. ...	31	of pay.)
Total	39	

* This excludes four pilot posts which remained to be transferred to the Provincial service and the two posts temporarily sanctioned for a period of five years in 1905.

† This includes four pilot posts which remained to be transferred from the Imperial Service.

(v) There are at present 32 Forest divisions in the Presidency—21 being major and 11 minor. The 70 officers are intended to hold the above charges as well as other special appointments as shown below:—

Imperial Officers.

Major district charges	13
Coorg	1
Forest College	2
Leave and training reserve (25 per cent.) ...	6
Conservators	4
Working plans duty	3
India posts	2
Total	31

Provincial Officers.

Major district charges	8
Minor do.	11
Coorg	1
Forest College	3
Leave and training reserve (14 per cent.) ...	5
Board's Forest Assistant	1
Assistants to District Forest officers	8
Minor district charges under contemplation ...	2
Total	39

30. *Provident fund for Imperial and Provincial officers.*—A Forest Officers' Provident Fund was instituted in 1896, to which all officers of the Imperial and Provincial branches of the Forest Service were permitted to subscribe. In the case of officers in Government service on 1st July, 1896, the subscription was not obligatory, nor was it so in the case of officers of the Provincial branch who were not of European or Eurasian descent. It was made obligatory in the case of all officers joining the Imperial branch and all European and Eurasian officers joining the Provincial branch after the above date. In 1909 a General Provident Fund was established on the basis that contribution is compulsory up to 6¼ per cent. on salaries with voluntary contributions of not more than a further 6¼ per cent. The Forest Officers' Fund has been closed to future entrants and officers in whose case subscription to this fund was optional or compulsory have been permitted to join the new fund as optional or compulsory subscribers while for those who do not exercise the option of joining the new fund the rules applicable to them remain unchanged.

II.

Additional Statement called for in the Joint Secretary's letter dated 1st August, 1913.

1. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.

(*a*) *Imperial officers.*—The present regulations as to recruitment, training, and probation were framed after full consideration only five years ago, and there is no reason to revise them at present. But, in view of the large expenditure incurred annually on forest roads and buildings and the possibility and desirability of introducing wherever possible systems of mechanical transport for timber, it is desirable that greater attention than at present should be paid to practical instruction in Forest Engineering.

(*b*) *Provincial officers.*—The present regulations as to recruitment, training, and probation have so recently been introduced that it is premature to express an opinion whether they are satisfactory. But so far they have apparently resulted in the recruitment of a better class of men than formerly.

2. The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time; and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

(*a*) *Imperial officers.*—The rates of pay in force in 1886, 1890, 1900, and 1912 are shown in the subjoined Annexure. The scale of pay for the Imperial Forest officers having been fixed only in 1906-1907, there are no very cogent reasons for altering it or for holding it to be not satisfactory. As regards allowances, the existing rules provide for the grant of local allowances to officers deputed for the preparation of working plans. The grant of local allowance has recently been sanctioned for the Principal of the Forest College, Coimbatore, and the question of extending a similar concession to the Instructors of the College has been referred to the Government of India.

(*b*) *Provincial officers.*—The rates of pay in force in 1886, 1890, 1900, and 1912 are shown in Annexure I. The prospects of the Service have been so greatly improved at a very recent date that it is quite unnecessary to do anything more at present.

3. The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.

The cadre of the Service is at present as follows:—

(*a*) *Imperial.*

	No.	Pay.
		RS.
Conservator, first grade	1	1,900
Do. second grade	2	1,700
Do. third grade	1	1,500
Deputy and Assistant Conservators	27	(Time scale of pay.)
Total	31	

(*b*) *Provincial.*

Extra Deputy Conservators ...	8	(Time scale
Do. Assistant do. ...	31	of pay.)
Total	39	

The cadre provides 25 per cent. (*i.e.*, six officers) as leave and training reserve for the Imperial Service and 14 per cent. (*i.e.*, five officers) for the Provincial Service. It has been found by experience that the reserve of 25 per cent. is inadequate in the case of the Imperial Service. At the present time the Provincial cadre is not by any means at full strength and for some years to come a very large proportion of the Service will consist of probationers, either at Dehra Dun or under training in this Presidency, and consequently until the Service is at full strength the reserve for leave and training for the Provincial Service will be insufficient. But when the cadre is fully established the reserve should be adequate.

4. What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the Forest Service.—There are no appointments outside the authorised cadre held temporaily or otherwise by the Imperial officers; but one of the Provincial officers has been lent to the Travancore Durbar for employment as Conservator of the State Forests.

5. Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.—The great need for a revision of the reorganisation sanctioned in 1911 has been pressed upon Government by the Inspector-General of Forests (Mr. Beadon Bryant), who considered that many of the minor charges in this Presidency should be raised to major charges and that many of the present charges are too large and unwieldy and will have eventually to be subdivided. Another reason why an addition to the Imperial Service is found to be necessary is that there are at present very few officers in the Extra Assistant Conservators class fit for promotion to the rank of Extra Deputy Conservators and in consequence Imperial officers are now in charge of divisions which ought to be held by Provincial men. The compilation of working plans is also at a standstill and the Government of India have recently been addressed to lend this Government three Imperial officers for the prosecution of this important work. Until, therefore, better qualified men reach the top of the Provincial Service the proportion of Imperial officers will have to be increased. As regards the Provincial Service, until the cadre is full, and that will not be for many years, it is impossible to say whether or no the cadre is adequate.

APPENDIX VIII. *(continued).*

ANNEXURE TO PRECEDING ADDITIONAL STATEMENT.

Cadre of the Forest Department (Higher Grades) on 1st April, 1886, 1890, 1900 and 1912.

Comparative statement showing the cadre of the department with the number of posts and the pay of the Imperial grades and Provincial grades:—

Designation of the posts.	Grades.	Sanctioned cadre.		Actual cost of the establishment as it stood on 1st April, 1886, 1890, 1900 and 1912.		Remarks.
		Number.	Pay of grade.	Details.	Total.	
1886.						
Imperial Service.			Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Conservators, 2	1st grade ...	1	1,250—1,500	1 × 1,400	1,400	
	2nd „ ...	1	1,000—1,250	1 × 1,150	1,150	
		2				
Deputy Conservators, 14...	1st grade ...	3	900	2 × 900	1,800	
	2nd „ ...	3	800	3 × 800	2,400	
	3rd „ ...	4	650	4 × 650	2,600	
	4th „ ...	4	550	4 × 550	2,200	
		14				
Assistant Conservators, 12.	1st grade ...	5	450	5 × 450	2,250	
	2nd & 3rd grades	5	350	5 × 350	1,750	
	Supernumeraries	2	250	2 × 250	500	Excludes Rs. 250 drawn by T. Muhammad Ali Sahib who was only *Acting* Assistant Conservator in April, 1886.
		12			16,050	
Provincial Service.						
Sub-Assistant Conservators, 13.	1st grade ...	6	200	4 × 200	800	
	2nd „ ...	7	150	4 × 150	600	
				1 × 100	100	
				1 × 90	90	
		13			1,590	
1890.						
Imperial Service.						
Conservators, 2	1st grade ...	1	1,250—1,560	1 × 1,500	1,500	
	2nd „ ...	1	1,000—1,250	1 × 1,250	1,250	
		2				
Deputy Conservators, 14...	1st grade ...	3	900	3 × 900	2,700	
	2nd „ ...	3	800	3 × 800	2,400	
	3rd „ ...	4	650	4 × 650	2,600	
	4th „ ...	4	550	4 × 550	2,200	
		14				
Assistant Conservators, 12. ...	1st grade ...	5	450	5 × 450	2,250	
	2nd & 3rd grades	5	350	3 × 350	1,050	
	Supernumeraries	2	250	2 × 250	500	
		12				
Provincial Service.						
Sub-Assistant Conservators, 13. ...	1st grade ...	6	200	2 × 200	400	
	2nd „ ...	7	150	7 × 150	1,050	
		13				
1900.						
Imperial Service.						
Conservators, 3	1st grade ...	1	1,600	1 × 1,600	1,600	
	2nd „ ...	1	1,350	1 × 1,350	1,350	
	3rd „ ...	1	1,100	1 × 1,100	1,100	
	Total ...	3				
Deputy Conservators, 15...	1st grade	2	900	3 × 900	2,700	
	2nd „ ...	3	800	4 × 800	3,200	
	3rd „ ...	5	650	6 × 650	3,900	
	4th „ ...	5	550	7 × 550	3,850	
	Total ...	15				

ANNEXURE I.—*cont.*

Comparative statement showing the cadre of the department, etc.—*cont.*

Designation of the posts.	Grades.	Sanctioned cadre.		Actual cost of the establishment as it stood on 1st April, 1886, 1890, 1900 and 1912.		Remarks.
		Number.	Pay of grade.	Details.	Total.	
1900—*cont.*						
			Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Assistant Conservators, 8...	1st grade ...	5	450	5 × 450	2,250	
	2nd „ ...	3	350	3 × 350	1,050	
	Total ...	8				
Provincial Service.						
Extra Deputy Conservators, 6.	1st grade ...	1	600	...	...	
	2nd „ ...	1	550	...	...	
	3rd „ ...	2	500	...	...	
	4th „ ...	2	450	1 × 450	450	
	Total ...	6				
Extra Assistant Conservators, 16.	1st grade ...	4	350	2 × 350	700	
	2nd „ ...	5	300	5 × 300	1,500	
	3rd „ ...	3	250	3 × 250	750	
	4th „ ...	4	200	4 × 200	800	
	Total ...	16				
1912.*						
Imperial Service.						*NOTE.—The rates of pay on 1st April, 1913, were the same as those on 1st April, 1912.
Conservators, 4	1st grade ...	1	1,900	1 × 1,900	1,900	
	2nd „ ...	2	1,700	2 × 1,700	3,400	
	3rd „ ...	1	1,500	1 × 1,500	1,500	
		4				
Deputy Conservators, 22†	Rs. 580 to 1,250	10	1,250	‡9 × 1,250	11,250	†Deputy and Assistant Conservators —sanctioned Nos. number 27
		4	1,200	4 × 1,200	4,800	
		2	1,100	2 × 1,100	2,200	
		1	1,050	1 × 1,050	1,050	
		1	950	1 × 950	950	Supernumeraries—
		1	850	1 × 850	850	G.O. No. 3,024, Revenue, dated
		1	800	1 × 800	800	11th October,
		2	660	2 × 660	1,320	1911 3
		22				30
Assistant Conservators, 8...	Rs. 380 to 540 ...	2	540	2 × 540	1,080	‡Excludes Mr. J. S. Battie shown as Conservator, 3rd grade, above.
		4	500	4 × 500	2,000	
		2	380	2 × 380	760	
					33,860	
Provincial Service.						
Extra Deputy Conservators, 8.	Rs. 575—25—650	3	Vacant.	...	...	
	Rs. 700, 800, 850.	1	700	1 × 700	700	
		3	600	3 × 600	1,800	
		1	In foreign service.	...	...	
		8				
Extra Assistant Conservators, 31.	Rs. 250—20—550.	1	550	1 × 550	550	
		1	490	1 × 490	490	
		1	470	1 × 470	470	
		4	450	4 × 450	1,800	
		1	390	1 × 390	390	
		1	370	1 × 370	370	
		3	350	3 × 350	1,050	
		2	290	2 × 290	580	
		8	270	8 × 270	2,160	
Probationers	...	7	...	2 × 150	300	
				5 × 100	500	
Vacant	...	2	...	...	...	
Special appointments.		31			11,160	Excludes the pay (Rs. 600) of Mr. M. Rama Rao in foreign service.
Special Forest Officer, Parlakimedi Maliahs, 1.	Rs. 350—30—500.	1	...	1 × 440	440	
Special Veterinary Inspector, 1.	200	...	...	1 × 200	200	

APPENDIX IX.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bombay relating to the Forest Department.

IMPERIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—Forest Officers appointed to the Bombay Presidency receive their appointments from the Secretary of State for India. A copy* of the regulations relating to the appointment of Probationers to the Indian Forest Service in 1914 is appended.

2. With regard to the probation of the officers after their arrival in Bombay, it is recognised that a period of probation in India of about a year's duration is essential, mainly in order to give the new arrivals an opportunity for learning the vernacular, for gaining a general acquaintance with the conditions for working the local forests, and for acquainting themselves with the systems of forest and revenue laws and with the details of forest office work and accounts; and the following general principles have been adopted:—

(i.) That during the first year of service in India the youngest Forest Officer should be considered to be still under training and that during this period he should not usually be utilised for the ordinary purposes of forest administration.

(ii.) That the training should be under a selected Officer or Officers.

(iii.) That it should include both active work in a division, and a period of work at the headquarters of the Circle for the purposes mentioned above.

(iv.) That some arrangement should be made for Officers under training to tour in their own Provinces, and possibly for visits to selected Forests in other Provinces.

3. As at present advised, the Governor in Council considers that the regulations regarding recruitment, training and probation are satisfactory.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The 1st April has been taken for each of the above years in the following schedule. The Provincial Service is included for facility of comparison:—

RATES OF PAY.

Imperial Forest Service.

	1890.	1900.	1913.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Conservators—			
1st grade ...	1 on 1,500	1 on 1,600	1 on 1,900
2nd grade ...	1 on 1,250	1 on 1,350	1 on 1,700
3rd grade ...	1 on 1,000	1 on 1,100	1 on 1,500
Deputy Conservators—			Time-scale (19 appointments).
1st grade ...	2 on 900	2 on 900	4 on 1,250
2nd grade ...	3 on 800	4 on 800	2 on 1,200
3rd grade ...	4 on 650	7 on 650	2 on 1,150
4th grade ...	7 on 550	5 on 550	1 on 1,100
			1 on 1,000
			2 on 950
			1 on 850
			1 on 800
			1 on 750
			1 on 700
			2 on 620
			1 on 580
Assistant Conservators—			Time-scale (8 appointments).
1st grade ...	5 on 450	5 on 450	1 on 540
2nd grade ...	1 on 350	2 on 350	1 on 500
3rd grade ...	4 on 250	—	2 on 460
			3 on 420
			1 on 380

Provincial Forest Service.

	1890.	1900.	1913.
		Extra Deputy Conservator—4th grade. Rs.	Time-scale (32 appointments). Extra Deputy Conservators— Rs.
		1 on 450	1 on 850
			2 on 700
			2 on 650
Sub-Assistant Conservators—	Rs.	Extra Assistant Conservators— Rs.	Extra Assistant Conservators— Rs.
1st grade ...	3 on 200	4 on 350	3 on 550
2nd grade ...	4 on 175	6 on 300	1 on 510
3rd grade ...	6 on 150	6 on 250	1 on 490
4th grade ...	—	5 on 200	1 on 470
			1 on 450
			4 on 390
			4 on 370
			1 on 350
			4 on 330
			2 on 310
			1 on 250
			Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators—
			1 on 200
			3 on 150

ALLOWANCES.

1890.

Travelling Allowances.—Conservators were allowed a permanent travelling allowance of Rs. 200 per mensem and Deputy and Assistant Conservators were allowed a permanent travelling allowance of Rs. 150 per mensem. But Assistant Conservators did not become entitled to this allowance until they had passed their first Vernacular examination.

Acting Allowances.—Officers were allowed to officiate in a higher grade when vacancies were caused by a senior officer being absent on leave or deputation. They then drew the pay of the higher grade, and the difference between their substantive pay and that of the higher grade was termed acting allowance.

Charge Allowances.—Officers who were employed in making Working Plans of forests were granted a special allowance of Rs. 100 per month in consideration of the more arduous nature of the work they had to perform.

1900.

Travelling Allowances.—As in 1890, except that the Deputy Conservator of Forests in charge Sind Circle, which had been reduced from being a Conservator's charge, was also allowed Rs. 200 per month, *i.e.*, the permanent travelling allowance of a Conservator.

Acting Allowances.—As in 1890.

Charge Allowances.—Officers who were employed as Working Plans Officers were granted an allowance not exceeding the rate of Rs. 100 per month for the period occupied in the preparation of a Working Plan, after the Plan had been sanctioned by Government, provided that Government was satisfied that the Officer had undergone exceptional exposure or incurred additional expenditure.

Local Allowances.—An allowance of Rs. 100 per month was granted to the officer employed as Professor of Forestry at the College of Science, Poona.

1913.

Travelling Allowances.—As in 1900, except that Assistant Conservators are eligible for permanent travelling allowance of Rs. 150 per month when they are placed in charge of forest divisions, or when they have passed their first Vernacular examination.

Acting Allowances.—A Deputy Conservator, who is appointed to act as Conservator in the vacancy caused by the absence of an officer on leave or

* *Vide* Appendix XIII.

deputation, draws the pay of a 3rd grade Conservator. Conservators officiating for the same reason in a higher grade draw the pay of that grade. Owing to the introduction of Time-Scale pay for Deputy and Assistant Conservators acting allowances to these officers are no longer admissible.

Charge Allowances.—As in 1900, except that a charge allowance of Rs. 100 per month was granted to the Deputy Conservator of Forests in charge Sind Circle. The grant of the allowance was sanctioned by the Government of India in 1905 with a view to making the two appointments in the 1st grade of Deputy Conservators available for grade promotion and to preventing hardship in the case of a 2nd grade Deputy Conservator appointed to the charge of the fourth Circle.

2. As at present advised the Governor in Council considers that the rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—The sanctioned cadre of the Imperial Forest Service, Bombay, on 1st April, 1913, and the number of posts in each grade was as follows:—

A. Sanctioned *cadre*:—

Conservators	3	1st Grade	1
		2nd „	1
		3rd „	1
Deputy and Assistant Conservators on time-scale	24	On time-scale.	
Total ...	27		

B. Actual number of posts in each grade was—

Conservators		1st Grade	1
		2nd „	1
		3rd „	1
Deputy Conservators...			19
Assistant Conservators			8*

2. Up to the year 1907 no provision had been made in the cadre for leave and training. In October, 1907, the Secretary of State directed that the policy of developing a Provincial Branch of the Service should be strictly adhered to, that proposals for adding to the Imperial Branch should not be submitted for his sanction without careful inquiry as to the possibility of providing for the increased operations of the Forest Department by strengthening the Provincial Branch, and that the ratios of 80 and 20 per cent., which were adopted in 1890 for distributing the cadre of appointments of the superior or upper controlling establishments between the Imperial and the Provincial Branches, should not be departed from without special reason. In accordance with instructions from the Government of India, in calculating the total strength of the Imperial Branch of the Forest Service 25 per cent. of the number of posts required to fill the 80 per cent. of the major charges which were to be held by Imperial Officers was added to allow for officers on leave or on training. As this 80 per cent. of the major charges required 20 officers, the provision of additional posts made in the cadre on account of leave and training was 5, and it has remained at this number since that date. In addition to these 25 appointments, there are two appointments in the Bombay cadre which are required to fill two appointments on the India list.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—No appointments were held by Bombay Imperial Forest Officers outside the authorised cadre on 1st April, 1913, except the three appointments of Assistant Conservators which have been referred to under (III) as due to over-recruitment. Since 1st April, 1913, one of these supernumerary Assistant Conservators has been absorbed into the authorised cadre by the retirement of a Deputy Conservator. An appointment outside the authorised cadre has since the above date been given to an officer of the Bombay Forest Service who has been lent temporarily to the Government of India as an Assistant in the Forest Research Institute at Dehra Dun.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—Government consider the appointment of a Chief Conservator of Forests is needed in this Presidency, and have decided to move the Government of India and the Secretary of State in the matter.

[* The excess in the number of officers in this Grade on the above date was due to the arrival of new recruits. This over-recruitment was caused by the necessity of providing appointments for the whole number of the successful Probationers of 1911 who were due to come to India. The number of candidates to be selected annually in England for training will be reduced until the supernumerary appointments have been absorbed.]

PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The regulations have been stated fully in Government Notification* No. 10618, dated 19th November, 1912, and as at present advised the Governor in Council considers that they are satisfactory.

RATES OF PAY.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—1890.—The officers were all classed as Sub-Assistant Conservators. There were three grades with pay as follows:—

	Rs.
1st Grade	200 per mensem.
2nd Grade	175 „
3rd Grade	150 „

1900.—The officers were now classed as Extra Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators. There was only one appointment of Extra Deputy Conservator. The rates of pay were as follows:—

	Rs.
Extra Deputy Conservator, 4th Grade ...	450
Extra Assistant Conservator, 1st Grade	350
Do. do. 2nd Grade	300
Do. do. 3rd Grade	250
Do. do. 4th Grade	200

1*st April*, 1913.—Grades had been abolished and rates of pay were as follows:—

	Rs.	
Extra Deputy Conservator	850	per mensem
Do. ...	700	„ each.
Do. ...	650	„ „

Extra Assistant Conservators were on time-scale, and the Officers were drawing pay as under on 1st April, 1913:—

Extra Assistant Conservators	Rs. 250 per mensem on first appointment, rising by annual increments of Rs. 20 to Rs. 550.
Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators	3 on Rs. 150 and one on Rs. 200.

The circumstances under which these rates of pay are granted were that in 1908-09 the Government of India considered that the conditions of service in the Provincial branch as then existing had failed to secure an adequate supply of candidates of the quality required for the responsible duties entrusted to Extra Deputy Conservators and Extra Assistant Conservators, and that it was necessary in the interests of recruitment to make the prospects of the Forest service approximately as favourable as those of other Provincial Services.

ALLOWANCES.

1890.

Travelling Allowances were permanent and were Rs. 100 per month to officers in charge of Forest Divisions and Rs. 60 per month to officers in charge of Sub-divisions.

Charge Allowances were given only to officers who were employed on Working Plans under the Imperial Working Plans Officers, and were at the rate of Rs. 50 per mensem.

1900.

Travelling Allowances.—Permanent travelling allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem was granted to an

* Vide Addendum.

Extra Deputy Conservator and of Rs. 75 per mensem to an Extra Assistant Conservator in charge of Forest Divisions. Forest Officers who were in charge of Sub-divisions were allowed Rs. 60 per mensem as in 1890.

Charge Allowances.—These were of two kinds.

(*a*) Allowances drawn by Working Plans Officers which were the same as those allowances in 1900 for Imperial Officers under similar circumstances.

(*b*) Allowances for being in charge of a Forest Division. There were two allowances only of Rs. 50 each of this description, the recipients of them being determined by Government.

1913.

Travelling Allowances were as in 1890, viz., Rs. 100 per month to officers who were in charge of Forest Divisions and Rs. 60 per month to officers who were not in charge of Divisions.

Local Allowances are granted at the rate of Rs. 50 per month to Extra Assistant Conservators who are placed temporarily in charge of major Divisions and are drawn by the officers only during the time that they hold such charges. The charge of major Division can be held by Extra Assistant Conservators only when exceptional circumstances demand that such appointments should be made. On 1st April, 1913, such Local Allowances were being drawn by three officers in the Bombay Forest Department.

Personal Allowances.—The rule for the grant of these allowances is as follows. An Extra Assistant Conservator who has served for not less than three years on Rs. 550 per mensem and who is considered by Government to be fit for a major charge but for whom no vacancy exists in the Upper Controlling Staff (as Extra Deputy Conservator) may be given a permanent allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem. In the case of officers whom the Local Government considers fit for a further increase of pay this allowance may be increased to Rs. 100 per month on the expiry of four years, and to Rs. 150 per mensem on the expiry of another period of four years. On 1st April, 1913, one officer of the Bombay Forest Department was drawing a personal allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem.

(*2*) As at present advised the Governor in Council considers that the rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—*Number of posts.*—The posts were as follows:—

1890.		Appointments.
Sub-Assistant Conservator,	1st grade ...	3
,, ,,	2nd ,, ...	4
,, ,,	3rd ,, ...	6
	Total ...	13
1900.		
Extra Deputy Conservator,	4th grade ...	1
Extra Assistant Conservator,	1st ,, ...	4
,, ,,	2nd ,, ...	6
,, ,,	3rd ,, ...	6
,, ,,	4th ,, ...	5
	Total ...	22
1913.		
Extra Deputy Conservator ...	... ...	5
Extra Assistant Conservator ...	... ...	23
Probationary ,,	... ...	4
		32

(*2*) No provision had been made in the cadres of 1890 and 1900 for leave and training.

In the cadre of 1913 an addition of 14 per cent. of the posts—Major (5) and Minor (20) charges combined—which were to be filled by Provincial Service Officers was made to the total number of posts included in the cadre to provide for leave and training. The actual number of these posts was three. As this proved to be insufficient in practice, the number of Probationary Extra Assistant Conservators, which had been fixed at two when the above cadre was sanctioned and introduced, was increased to four.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—No appointments were held as above on 1st April, 1913. The services of one officer had been transferred to the Rājpipla State from 20th May, 1897; and in October, 1913, the services of another officer have been similarly transferred to the Junágadh State. The names of these officers have been retained on their places in the list of the Bombay Provincial Service Officers, but they are removed from the cadre in so far that other officers have been appointed to the vacancies temporarily caused by their transfers.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—No addition to the cadre is considered necessary at present.

ADDENDUM.

REVENUE DEPARTMENT.

Bombay Castle, 19th November, 1912.

No. 10618.—The following revised rules for appointment to the Provincial Forest Service of Bombay are published for general information, in supersession of those promulgated in Government Notification No. 10632, dated 29th October, 1907, printed at pages 1815 and 1816 of the *Bombay Government Gazette* of the 31st idem, Part I:—

REVISED RULES FOR APPOINTMENT TO THE BOMBAY PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE.

1. The Governor in Council is pleased to direct, in supersession of all previous rules and orders regulating admission to the Provincial Forest Service of Bombay, that subject to the satisfaction of the claims of persons already qualified under the rules hitherto in force, from the date of publication of these rules appointments to this Service shall be made:—

(*a*) By promotion to Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests of Forest Rangers of approved efficiency and satisfactory conduct who have passed through the course of training at the College of Science, Poona, and have obtained a Ranger's certificate or its equivalent; or who have obtained the Higher Standard certificate at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehran Dun, and thereafter rendered not less than five years' satisfactory service as Rangers;

(*b*) By direct appointment of candidates who have completed the two years' Provincial Service course at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun.

2. The Governor in Council reserves to himself the right to fill all vacancies in either of the ways described in Rule 1 as he may consider best in the interests of the public service, and in such order as may be deemed advisable.

3. The senior Conservator of Forests will keep a list showing the names of all Rangers in order of seniority for the whole Presidency, and their general qualifications for promotion as recorded from time to time by each Conservator or Deputy Conservator in charge of a circle.

4. When Government propose to nominate to a direct appointment notice inviting applications will be given in the *Bombay Government Gazette*.

5. A candidate for direct nomination must be not less than 18 nor more than 24 years of age. He will be required to produce the following certificates:—

(*i*) A certificate that he is "a Native of India" as prescribed in section 6 of 33 Victoria, Chapter 3.

(*ii*) A certificate of age.

(*iii*) A health certificate in the form prescribed by Article 49 of the Civil Service Regulations (Fifth Edition), signed by a Commissioned Medical Officer or by a Medical Officer in charge of a Civil Station and certifying to the nominee's sound constitution, good vision and hearing and general physical fitness for an outdoor life in the Forest Department, and to the fact that he bears marks of successful vaccination or of small-pox.

(*iv*) Certificates of the examinations which have been passed by him.

(*v*) A certificate of respectability and good moral character from two or more persons whose social or official position can be accepted as a guarantee of trustworthiness.

6. In selecting from amongst the candidates a person for direct nomination, very great weight will

be given to high educational qualifications, and only candidates who are in all respects qualified by previous education, more especially in Science, English and Mathematics, to follow the course of instruction will be nominated. The scope of the candidate's actual attainments, more especially in English, Science and Mathematics will, if necessary, be tested at the time of selection. In Mathematics the candidate should know Arithmetic, Algebra up to and including Quadratic Equations and simple problems, Geometry (the first three books of Euclid) and the elements of Trigonometry including the solution of triangles and the use of logarithms.

7. (1) A candidate selected for direct nomination will be required:—

(*a*) To find two sureties to execute a bond guaranteeing that under special circumstances they will refund all monies expended by Government on the candidate's behalf, etc.;

(*b*) To undergo a practical training extending over not less than six months in such forests as may be prescribed to him in order to give proof of his fitness for forest work. Such course of training will ordinarily commence on 1st November, *i.e.*, one year before entry to the College, and the candidate's final selection for nomination will depend upon the proof which he gives during this training of his suitability for service in the Forest Department.

(2) While undergoing the training prescribed in clause (1) of this rule the selected candidate will receive a stipend of Rs. 50 per mensem and will be entitled to travelling allowance under the Civil Service Regulations.

8. A candidate finally selected under rule 7 (1) (*b*) will be required:—

(*a*) To proceed to the Forest Research Institute College, Dehra Dun, and go through the two years' Provincial Service course at the College;

(*b*) To sign an agreement binding himself to work diligently while at the College and to serve Government for not less than five years after passing out of the College.

9. A selected candidate may on arrival at the College be required to undergo an examination in English and Mathematics. Failure to pass this examination will entail the cancellation of his nomination.

10. While at the College the selected candidate will receive a stipend of Rs. 100 per mensem payable from the date of his entry into the College. The stipend is not payable for periods of vacation. Should the periodic report of the nominee's progress or conduct be unsatisfactory, the payment of the stipend will be stopped until improvement is reported, and should the periodic reports continue to be unsatisfactory, the nomination will be cancelled and the nominee will not be allowed to complete the course.

11. After the conclusion of the Provincial Service course a selected candidate who is certified to have passed it satisfactorily will be appointed to the Bombay Provincial Forest Service as Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, on probation for a period of one year, which may be extended to three years or more at the discretion of Government. A Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator will be placed in executive charge of a Range or Forest Sub-Division, and will receive during the first three years of his probation a salary of Rs. 150 per mensem, and thereafter Rs. 200 per mensem until he is appointed to a vacancy of Extra Assistant Conservator in the sanctioned cadre of the Provincial Forest Service.

12. Every officer appointed to the Provincial Forest Service, whether by promotion or by direct nomination, will be required to pass, if he has not already passed, an examination according to the Higher Standard in at least one language of the Presidency other than his own vernacular.

By order of His Excellency
the Honourable the Governor in Council,
G. CARMICHAEL,
Chief Secretary to Government.

APPENDIX X.

Memorandum prepared by the Administration of the Central Provinces and Berar relating to the Forest Department.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—(*a*) *Imperial Forest Service.*—The present regulations as regards the Imperial Forest Service of India are given in the Government of India's Circular No. 2-F.—280-2, in the Department of Revenue and Agriculture, dated the 18th of October, 1913.

(*b*) *Provincial Forest Service.*—The regulations for the Provincial Service in the Central Provinces are contained in the pamphlet entitled "Rules for the selection of candidates for the Provincial Forest Service in the Central Provinces" of which a copy is attached.

(*c*) *Remarks.*—For the Imperial Forest Service the present method of recruitment has, in the Chief Commissioner's opinion, proved fairly satisfactory, but he is inclined to think that recruits arrive in India at too advanced an age and that it would be preferable to resort to recruitment by means of nomination, followed by competitive examination, of candidates between the ages of 18 and 20, and then to train the men selected for a period of three years. Sir Benjamin Robertson considers that great stress should be laid in the selection of candidates of physical fitness.

As regards training and probation the Chief Commissioner thinks it advisable that the recruits trained in England should receive their instruction at one residential institution. He favours the suggestion of the Chief Conservator of Forests, Central Provinces, that on their arrival in India the successful probationers should make a tour of inspection of some of the more important types of Indian Forests for three months, so as to gain a general insight into Indian conditions at the outset of their career.

With regard to the Provincial Forest Service Sir Benjamin Robertson considers that the regulations for its recruitment, training and probation, which were framed so recently as February, 1913, are generally satisfactory.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—(*a*) *Imperial Forest Service.*—The following statement gives the required information in respect of the years 1890 and 1900:—

Year.	Inspector General of Forests.	Conservators, Grade,			Deputy Conservators, Grade,				Assistant Conservators, Grade,		
		1st	2nd	3rd	1st	2nd	3rd	4th	1st	2nd	3rd
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1890	2,000—100—2,500	1,500	1,250	1,000	900	800	650	550	450	350	250
1900	2,000—100—2,500	1,600	1,350	1,100	900	800	650	550	450	350	...

NOTE.—In 1900 Exchange Compensation allowance was drawn.

APPENDIX X. (*continued*).

The rates of pay at the present time are as follows:—

		Rs.
Inspector-General of Forests	... ...	2,650
Chief Conservator of Forests	... ...	2,150
Conservators of Forests ...	1st Grade ...	1,900
	2nd „ ...	1,700
	3rd „ ...	1,500
Deputy Conservators of Forests.	From Rs. 580 (in the sixth year of service) to Rs. 1,250 (in the 20th and following years of service) with a yearly increment of Rs. 40 up to Rs. 700 and afterwards of Rs. 50.	

Assistant Conservators of Forests start on Rs. 380 and with an annual increment of Rs. 40 rise to Rs. 540 in the fifth year of their service.

No Exchange Compensation Allowance is given.

(*b*) *Provincial Forest Service.*—The information required for the years 1890 and 1900 is given in the table below:—

Year.	Extra-Deputy Conservators, Grade.				Extra-Assistant Conservators, Grade.				
	1st	2nd	3rd	4th	1st	2nd	3rd	4th	
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
1890	...	...	...	...	250	200	150	100	Sub-Assistant Conservators.
1900	600	550	500	450	350	300	250	200	

Under the present regulations for the Provincial Service emoluments are fixed according to a time-scale. The provisions of the scheme, which relates to the whole of India, are given in the Government of India's Circular No. 17-F—77-33, in the Department of Revenue and Agriculture, dated the 23rd June, 1911.

(*c*) *Remarks.*—An incremental rate of pay having been fixed for both the Imperial and Provincial branches of the Service after mature consideration, within recent years, the Chief Commissioner does not consider that the time has come for reopening the question of the pay of either branch. For officers holding administrative rank he would, however, support the recommendations for increased emoluments made in the Government of India's Despatch to the Secretary of State, No. 371, dated the 2nd November, 1905.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—(*a*) *Imperial Forest Service.*—Chief Conservator.—There is one post of Chief Conservator and this post is not a graded one.

Conservators.—There are three posts of Conservators sanctioned for these Provinces. The grades are always varying according to the officers who are posted to the Provinces by the Government of India.

Deputy and Assistant Conservators.—Twenty posts of Deputy and Assistant Conservators have been sanctioned for these Provinces. The time-scale pay system is in force for these officers, and hence they are not classified by grades. These 20 posts include two posts for India List appointments.

(*b*) *Provincial Forest Service.*—The sanctioned scale of this Service for these Provinces is five Extra-Deputy Conservators and 20 Extra-Assistant Conservators, the time-scale pay scheme being also in force for this Service.

A provision of 25 per cent. in the Imperial Service, and of 14 per cent. in the Provincial Service, has been made for leaving and training reserve.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—In the sanctioned cadre of the Imperial Service a provision of two posts has been made for the India List appointments, while at the present time the following Imperial and Provincial Officers are serving outside the Provinces or are holding other appointments:—

(1) Mr. A. M. Caccia, Conservator of Forests, at Oxford, as Director of Indian Forest Studies.

(2) Mr. R. S. Hole, Deputy Conservator of Forests, at Dehra Dun, as Forest Botanist in the Forest Research Institute (at present Officiating President of the Institute).

(3) Mr. J. Donald, Deputy Conservator of Forests, at Dehra Dun, as an Instructor in the Forest College.

(4) Mr. E. Benskin, Assistant Conservator of Forests, at Dehra Dun, for training in Forest Economics at the Forest Research Institute.

(5) Mr. W. G. Gilmore, Extra-Deputy Conservator, at Indore, as Conservator of Forests of the Indore State.

(6) Mr. F. J. Langhorne, Extra-Assistant Conservator, Dewan of the Bastar State.

(7) Mr. Ghansiyam Prasad, Assistant Conservator, at Dehra Dun, as an Instructor in the Forest College.

(8) Mr. Shiyam Sunder Lal, Extra-Assistant Conservator, at Indore, as a Divisional Forest Officer in the Indore State.

(9) Mr. Nazir Abbas, Extra-Assistant Conservator, at Bhopal, as Forest Officer of the Bhopal State.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The present cadre for both branches of the Forest Service was sanctioned in 1909 in the Secretary of State's Despatch No. 27 (Revenue), dated the 19th February, 1909. But for the large number of officers on deputation outside the Provinces the existing cadre would suffice. On account of the depletion of the cadre by these deputations, considerable difficulty is being experienced in carrying on the administration of the forests.

RULES FOR THE SELECTION OF CANDIDATES FOR THE PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE IN THE CENTRAL PROVINCES.

1. *Nominations for direct appointment to the Provincial Forest Service will be made by the Local Government. Applicants for such nominations must not be less than 18 years or more than* 23 years of age on the 1st of July in the year in which their applications are submitted.

2. Applications must be accompanied by the certificates noted in paragraph 26 of the Forest College Rules, and must be submitted to the Conservator of a Circle or the Commissioner of a Division, not later than the 30th of June in each year. The officer to whom the application is submitted will forward it to the Local Government, through the Chief Conservator, with an expression of his opinion regarding the candidate's qualifications.

3. On the 30th June in each year each Conservator will report to the Chief Conservator the name of any Forest Ranger serving under him whom he may consider deserving of deputation to the special Provincial Service course at the Imperial Forest College, and of subsequent direct appointment to the Provincial Service. No Forest Ranger should be recommended who is not educationally qualified to follow and profit by the course of instruction.

4. Candidates are expected to know sufficient English to follow the course, and in mathematics should know arithmetic, algebra, up to and including quadratic equations and simple problems, geometry, the first three books of Euclid, and the elements of trigonometry, including the solution of

triangles and the use of logarithms. In addition, candidates should possess a substantial knowledge of one or more branches of natural science.

5. Nominated candidates will be required to undergo a preliminary course of five months' practical training under the orders of the Chief Conservator, and their nominations will be cancelled should they fail to pass through this course satisfactorily or should it be considered that they are physically unsuitable for the Forest Department. Ordinarily this course of instruction will extend from the 15th November to the 15th April, commencing in the year in which the candidates are nominated. During this practical course candidates will be given a consolidated allowance of Rs. 40 per mensem.

6. During the course of instruction at the Imperial Forest College, candidates will be granted the following monthly stipends to assist them in meeting their expenses while at the Imperial Forest College:—

During the first year a stipend of Rs. 50 per mensem.

During the second year a stipend of Rs. 75 per mensem.

This increased stipend in the second year of the College course will not be given unless the President of the College considers that the candidate's general conduct and progress with his studies are satisfactory.

In addition any candidate who obtains the Honours Certificate of the College will be granted a bonus of Rs. 300.

Forest Rangers selected under Rule 3 will draw the pay of the grade during their stay at the College, subject to a minimum of Rs. 75, and travelling allowance under the ordinary rules.

7. On arrival at Dehra Dun and before the commencement of the College course, candidates or Forest Rangers selected under Rule 3 may be called on to undergo a special examination in English and mathematics, a physical test and a medical examination. Failure to satisfy any of these tests may involve removal from the College under the orders of the President. The President is also empowered to remove from the College at any time during the course any candidate selected under Rule 1 or 3 whom he considers unable to follow the course prescribed.

8. The Agreement and Security Bond to be executed by candidates nominated under Rule 1 above, or by Forest Rangers deputed under Rule 3, are as appended to these rules.* They shall be executed before the candidates or Forest Rangers concerned join the Imperial Forest College, and shall be submitted to the Local Government by the Chief Conservator.

9. Candidates who fulfil the conditions of the Agreement referred to above will be eligible for substantive appointment to the Provincial Forest Service after two years' service as Probationary Extra-Assistant Conservator of Forests and on the occurrence of an actual vacancy in that Service. If, owing to no actual vacancy occurring, they are not so appointed after two years' satisfactory service on probation, their pay will be raised to Rs. 200 per mensem. Any period of training or probation served after candidates attain the age of 23 years may be allowed to count as service for pension. Forest Rangers who are deputed to the Provincial Service course at the Imperial Forest College, and who similarly fulfil the conditions of their Agreements, will be eligible for substantive appointment to the Provincial Service on the occurrence of a vacancy in that Service, and without any period of service as a Probationary Extra-Assistant Conservator, provided that they are also eligible under Article 30 (*b*) of the Forest Department Code.

* Not reprinted as similar forms appear in Appendix V.

APPENDIX XI.

(*Vide the Evidence of Sir William Schlich, Mr. W. Dawson, and Mr. E. P. Stebbing.*)

Statistics furnished by the Forestry Schools of the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge and Edinburgh regarding the students who have taken the degree or diploma in Forestry at those Universities during the last few years.

Telegrams, dated 20th June, 1914, addressed to—

(*a*) Sir William Schlich, Professor of Forestry, Oxford University.
(*b*) W. Dawson, Esq., Reader in Forestry, Cambridge University.
(*c*) E. P. Stebbing, Esq., Head of Forestry School, Edinburgh University.

Royal Commission on Indian Public Services would be much obliged if you could let them have as soon as convenient a statement showing for each of the last six years, or shorter period, if statistics are not available for six years—(i.) the number of students at Oxford (*b*. Cambridge, and *c*. Edinburgh) who have taken the degree or diploma in Forestry; (ii.) the age of each student at the time of taking the diploma or degree; (iii.) whether such students have or have not in addition a science or other degree. It would be convenient if the statistics in regard to Indian Forest Service probationers could be shown in a separate statement.

(*a*) *Letter from Sir W. Schlich, dated Oxford, June, 21st,* 1914.

In reply to your telegram of the 20th instant I have the honour to forward herewith a Statement showing the ages at which Probationers for the Indian Forest Service took an Honours Degree in Natural Science and the Diploma in Forestry during the last six years.

As regards *other students,* who took the Diploma in Forestry during the last six years, I beg to point out that there is no age limit at which the Diploma must be taken; hence these students vary very much in age as the following remarks will show:—

In 1908 four students took the Diploma in Forestry at ages ranging from 23 to 26 years. All four took the Honours Degree in Science.

In 1909 eight took the Diploma in Forestry at ages ranging from 22 to 33 years. Three of these took an Honours Degree in Science and three a Pass Degree.

In 1910 four took the Diploma at ages ranging from 22 to 25 years. One of these took an Honours Degree and one a Pass Degree.

In 1911 seven took the Diploma at ages ranging from 22 to 34 years. Four of these took an Honours Degree in Science.

In 1912 six took the Diploma at ages ranging from 22 to 30 years. Four of these took an Honours Degree in Science, one took the B.Sc. degree and one a Pass Degree.

In 1913 four took the Diploma at ages ranging from 21 to 29 years. Of these one took an Honours Degree in Science, one a Pass Degree and the other two are taking an Honours Degree this year.

APPENDIX XI. (*continued*).

Enclosure in above.

STATEMENT SHOWING THE AGE AT WHICH PROBATIONERS FOR THE INDIAN FOREST SERVICE TOOK AN HONOURS DEGREE IN SCIENCE AND THE DIPLOMA IN FORESTRY.

Name.	Honours Degree in Science, Age.	Diploma in Forestry, Age.	Remarks.
Diploma taken in 1908.			
Clear, T.	21	22·4	
Dawkins, C. E. E.	23	26·4	
Gaunt, C. C.	23	24·1	
Gibson, H. L.	22	24·0	
Glover, H. M.	22	23·2	
Miller, W. A. H.	23	27·6	
Milroy, A. J. W.	22	25·2	
Minchin, A. A. F.	—	21·1	
Smythies, E. A. H. D.	22	23·9	
Wilson, C. C.	22	23·2	
Average age at which Honours Degree was taken—22 years.			
Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken—24 years and 1 month.			
Diploma taken in 1909.			
Benskin, E.	—	21·5	
Butterworth, G. S.	—	22·2	
Carr, J.	—	24·2	
Clarence, G. C.	24	24·7	
Davis, A. P.	—	22·5	
Fields-Clarke, W. H. T.	—	21·10	
Herbert, V. A.	—	26·3	B.A. Pass Degree.
Holland, L. B.	—	24·10	B.A. Pass Degree.
Lawton, W.	23	23·1	
Milner, C. E.	—	22·3	
Oliphant, J. N.	—	22·7	
Owden, J. L.	—	21·10	
Sitzler, E. A.	23	23·8	
Wright, H. L.	21	22·11	
Young, J. V.	24	25·4	
Average age at which Honours Degree was taken—23 years.			
Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken—23 years and 3 months.			
Diploma taken in 1910.			
Alington, G. H.	22	23·8	
Bradley, W.	—	23·7	
Collier, J. V.	—	24·1	B.A. Pass Degree.
David, A. N.	—	22·0	
Goldberg, G. H. A.	—	23·0	
Greswell, E. A.	—	25·6	B.A. Pass Degree.
Gwyer, C.	—	24·11	B.A. Pass Degree.
Hiley, A. C.	—	23·0	
Inder, R. W.	22	25·4	
Lewis, H. T.	—	25·3	Honours Degree in History.
Lyall, J. H.	—	25·4	Honours Degree in History.
Mason, L.	—	24·4	B.A. Pass Degree.
Meiklejohn, W.	—	24·0	
Meridith, H. R.	—	21·10	
Nixon, A. B.	—	25·0	Honours Degree, History.
Shirley, G. S.	—	22·5	
Silvanus, D. H. M.	—	24·7	
Simeon, G. N.	—	22·8	
Villar, A. R.	26	26·6	
Average age at which Honours Degree was taken—23 years.			
Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken—24 years and 1 month.			
Diploma taken in 1911.			
Beeson, F. C.	22	23·9	
Bourne, R.	21	21·10	
Brooks, J. B.	22	21·10	
Cheyne, G. C.	—	24·11	M.A. B.Sc., Aberdeen.
Clifford, M. W.	24	25·11	
Cooper, G. M.	—	21·7	
Gent, J. R. P.	—	24·9	
Hargreaves, C. K.	—	22·11	
Harlow, C. M.	20	22·11	
Howard, S.	24	24·7	
Mackenzie, J. M. D.	20	22·7	
Madan, F. R.	22	23·7	
Marriott, R. G.	—	25·8	B.A. Pass Degree.
Milne, W. C.	—	25·2	M. A. Aberdeen.
Moodie, A. W.	—	24·7	M.A. and B.Sc. Edinburgh.
Ogilvie, G. H.	—	24·10	B.Sc. Edinburgh.
Patterson, C. B.	—	25·1	B.A. Pass Degree.
Sothers, D. B.	20	22·7	
Starte, H. W.	24	24·10	
Thomas, A. R.	—	23·11	
Unwin, R.	21	24·0	
Walters, O. H.	23	25·3	

Average age at which Honours Degree was taken —22 years.
Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken —24 years

APPENDIX XI. (*continued*).

Name.	Honours Degree in Science, Age.	Diploma in Forestry, Age.	Remarks.
Diploma taken in 1912.			
Bailey, W. A.	23	24·6	
Cochrane, R. A.	22	24·9	
Glasson, A. K.	21	23·2	
Hay, E. F. A.	—	25·0	B.A. Pass Degree.
Jenkin, R. T.	23	25·4	
Jollye, H. C. B.	22	24·3	
Mackarness, C. G. M.	—	22·8	
Makins, F. K.	22	23·5	
Millers, J. T.	23	25·0	
Nicholson, A. R.	22	24·4	

Average age at which Honours was taken—22 years.
Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken—24 years and 3 months.

Diploma taken in 1913.			
Carroll, E. W.	22	23·2	
Eden, A. E.	20	22·1	
Sathé, D. L.	22	24·5	
Shepherd, W. S.	21	22·10	
Simmons, C. E.	22	24·9	
Trotter, H.	—	23·1	

Average age at which Honours Degree was taken—21 years and 5 months.
Average age at which Diploma Degree was taken—23 years and 5 months.

(*b*) *Letter from Mr. W. Dawson, School of Forestry, Cambridge, dated* 23*rd June*, 1914.

I now forward the particulars asked for, regarding the age and qualifications of the candidates for the Diploma in Forestry. I have been able to get records for the last three years only—

Diploma in Forestry—In 1914 two Diplomas in Forestry were granted. One candidate possessed the Honours Degree in Natural Sciences, and one the Ordinary Degree. The ages of the candidates were 23 and 24 years.

In 1913 three Diplomas were granted. All three candidates possessed the Honours Degree in Natural Sciences. The ages of the candidates were 22, 22, and 23 years.

In 1912 two Diplomas were granted. Both candidates possessed the Honours Degree in Natural Sciences. Both candidates were 23 years of age.

(*c*) *Letter from Mr. E. P. Stebbing, Indian Forest Service, Head of the Department of Forestry, University of Edinburgh, dated* 23*rd June*, 1914.

With reference to your telegram, dated 20th June, 1914, asking for a statement detailing the number of students who have graduated in Forestry at this University during the last six years, their ages, and other degrees taken by them, I have the honour to forward herewith a memorandum giving the information required for the four years ending July, 1914—

2. The first degree in Forestry was conferred in this University in March, 1911.

3. Two of the graduates were selected as Indian Forest Probationers. At the time of their selection as Probationers, however, neither had completed his courses for graduation at this University. As Edinburgh had not at the time been recognised as a centre for the training of Indian Forest Probationers, the two students in question proceeded to Oxford, the first in 1909, the other in 1910.

Enclosure in above.

LIST OF BACHELORS IN SCIENCE OF EDINBURGH UNIVERSITY.

Name.	Date of Birth.	Year of Graduation in Forestry.	Age when Graduated in Forestry.	Other Degrees taken.
J. Lyford-Pike	1877	March, 1911	34	B.Sc. in Agriculture.
J. W. Munro	1888	July, 1911	23	" "
*G. H. Ogilvie	1888	October, 1911	23	
*G. P. Gordon	1887	March, 1912	25	B.Sc. in Agriculture.
J. W. Newton	1889	March, 1912	23	" "
Robert Veitch	1890	March, 1912	22	" "
James Fraser	1891	July, 1912	21	B.Sc. in Pure Science.
R. N. Chrystal	1891	July, 1913	22	
S. Lauchlan	1891	July, 1913	22	
P. T. Pillai	1890	March, 1914	24	M.A.
R. A. W. Taylor	1892	March, 1914	22	B.Sc. in Agriculture.
G. A. Whyte	1888	March, 1914	26	

The following will graduate B.Sc. in Forestry on 10th July, 1914:—

I. D. Macpherson	1892	July, 1914	22	
R. D. Robertson	1891	July, 1914	23	
H. C. Smith	1893	July, 1914	21	Honours in one branch of Natural Science.
J. A. Master	1892	July, 1914	22	" " "
P. R. Pillay	1884	July, 1914	30	B.A., Madras University.
H. V. Lely	1891	July, 1914	23	
W. A. Fraser	1893	July, 1914	21	

* Indian Forest Probationers, *vide* below.

INDIAN FOREST PROBATIONERS.

The following two students took the existing Forestry Courses for the Degree at Edinburgh University in 1908–1909 and 1909–1910 respectively. Before completing their courses for graduation they were selected as Indian Forest Probationers and proceeded to Oxford. Both men subsequently came back to Edinburgh to sit the examinations necessary to enable them to graduate B.Sc. in Forestry:—

Name.	Date of Birth.	Year of Graduation in Forestry.	Age when Graduated in Forestry.	Other Degrees taken.
G. H. Ogilvie	1888	October, 1911	23	
G. P. Gordon	1887	March, 1912	25	B.Sc. in Agriculture.

APPENDIX XII.

Statement (with details by Provinces) of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Forest Service.

TOTAL STATEMENT.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).												
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs																
200—300	28	—	10	5	2	2	1	2	1	13	—	—	13	1	3	1
300—400	61	13	9	19	3	—	1	3	3	29	—	2	31	1	3	4
400—500	69	43	13	5	—	—	—	—	2	7	—	2	9	3	1	—
500—600	51	29	9	4	2	—	—	1	2	9	—	2	11	1	1	—
600—700	34	16	12	1	—	—	—	2	1	4	—	1	5	—	1	—
700—800	26	18	7	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
800—900	20	12	2	2	—	1	1	—	—	4	—	1	5	—	1	—
900—1,000	9	9	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	29	29	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	46	46	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	8	8	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	8	8	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	6	6	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	397	239	62	37	7	3	3	8	9	67	—	8	775	6	10	5

DETAILS BY PROVINCES.

I.—*Madras.*

Rs.																
200—300	11	—	4	1	1	—	—	2	—	4	—	—	4	1	2	—
300—400	5	—	—	2	—	—	—	2	—	4	—	—	4	—	1	—
400—500	8	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	1	—
500—600	7	5	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
600—700	3	—	2	—	—	—	—	1	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
700—800	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	2	1	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
900—1,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	13	13	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	60	33	10	4	1	—	1	5	—	11	—	1	12	1	4	—

II.—*Bombay.*

Rs.																
200—300	1	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
300—400	16	1	—	9	1	—	—	—	2	12	—	2	14	—	1	—
400—500	8	5	—	2	—	—	—	—	1	3	—	—	3	—	—	—
500—600	7	2	—	1	—	—	—	—	2	3	—	2	5	—	—	—
600—700	5	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	1	—
700—800	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	3	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	—
900—1,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	6	6	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	58	31	—	13	1	—	—	—	5	19	—	6	25	—	2	—

APPENDIX XII. (*continued*).

III.—*Bengal.*

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).												
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	1	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
300—400	4	3	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
400—500	4	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
500—600	3	2	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
600—700	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	21	17	—	2	—	1	—	—	1	4	—	—	4	—	—	—

IV.—*Bihar and Orissa.*

Rs.																
200—300	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
300—400	3	1	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
400—500	3	1	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
500—600	2	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
600—700	3	1	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	15	6	7	1	—	—	—	1	—	2	—	—	2	—	—	—

V.—*The United Provinces of Agra and Oudh.*

Rs.																
300—400	6	3	—	—	1	—	1	—	—	2	—	—	2	—	1	—
400—500	2	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
500—600	6	4	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	1	—	—
600—700	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
700—800	4	3	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
800—900	3	2	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	5	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	31	22	1	1	2	1	1	—	1	6	—	—	6	1	1	—

VI.—*Punjab.*

Rs.																
200—300	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
300—400	3	—	—	1	1	—	—	1	—	3	—	—	3	—	—	—
400—500	4	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—
500—600	4	3	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
600—700	4	3	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—
1,000—1,200	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	22	14	—	2	2	—	1	1	—	6	—	—	6	1	1	—

APPENDIX XII. (*continued*).

VII.—*Burma.*

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).												
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	6	—	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1
300—400	11	2	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	4
400—500	28	20	7	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—
500—600	15	7	7	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—
600—700	8	5	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	10	4	6	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	5	3	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	10	10	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	12	12	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	114	72	34	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	2	5

VIII.—*The Central Provinces.*

Rs.																
200—300	5	—	1	2	1	1	—	—	—	4	—	—	4	—	—	—
300—400	10	2	3	4	—	—	—	—	—	4	—	—	4	1	—	—
400—500	7	2	—	3	—	—	—	—	—	3	—	1	4	1	—	—
500—600	4	3	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	7	1	5	—	—	—	—	1	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
700—800	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	5	4	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
900—1,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	54	28	10	10	1	1	—	1	—	13	—	1	14	2	—	—

IX.—*Assam.*

Rs.																
200—300	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	1	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
300—400	3	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	1	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
400—500	5	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
500—600	3	2	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
600—700	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	1	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	22	16	—	4	—	—	—	—	2	6	—	—	6	—	—	—

APPENDIX XIII.

Regulations as to the appointment of Probationers to the Indian Forest Service, 1914.

1. *Appointments.*—The Secretary of State for India in Council will, in the summer of 1914, make not less than five appointments of Probationers for the Indian Forest Service, provided that so many candidates are considered to be in all respects qualified.

In making these appointments, he will act with the advice of a Selection Committee.

2. *Applications for Appointment.*—Applications for appointment must be made on a printed form to be obtained from the Secretary, Revenue Department, India Office, Whitehall, London, S.W., and to be returned to him not later than Wednesday, the 1st July, 1914. Candidates must be prepared, if called upon, to attend at the India Office, at their own expense, for a personal interview with the Selection Committee within three weeks from that date.

3. *Age Limit.*—Candidates must be not less than 19 but under 22 years of age on the 1st January, 1914.

Note.—For the year 1914 only, candidates who have taken honours course (or other course specified in paragraph 5) which, under the Regulations of the University, occupies four years, will be subject to the age limits which have hitherto been in force, *viz.*, 19 and 23 on the 1st July of the year in which selection is made.

4. *Nationality, etc.*—Every candidate must be a natural-born subject of His Majesty. He must be prepared to give an undertaking, if selected, that he will not marry before he reaches India. If he does so, he will forfeit his appointment. He must be of good physique, and must produce evidence of character to satisfy the Secretary of State for India in Council that he is suited for the Indian Forest Service.

5. *Qualifications.*—Candidates must have obtained a degree *with Honours* in some branch of Natural Science* in a University of England, Wales, or Ireland, or have passed the Final Bachelor of Science Examination in Pure Science in one of the Universities of Scotland.† A degree in Applied Science will not be considered as fulfilling these conditions. Candidates will be required to produce evidence that they have a fair knowledge of either German or French.

Note.—Applications for appointment will be accepted from candidates who, on the 1st July, 1914, have already sat at an examination for a degree as mentioned above, but have not learned the result of the examination.

6. Should there be more candidates considered to be qualified in every respect than vacancies to be filled, the Secretary of State reserves the right to require them to pass a competitive examination conducted by the Civil Service Commissioners, on the results of which their final selection would depend. Particulars of this examination which would be held in August, will be found in Annexure I.

7. *Medical Examination.*—Selected candidates will be required to undergo a strict examination by a Medical Board at the India Office, at which particular stress will be laid on good vision and hearing, and to satisfy the Secretary of State for India that they are physically fit for service in the Indian Forest Department (*see* Annexure VI).

Candidates who do not satisfy the Secretary of State for India that they are physically fit for appointment to the Indian Forest Service will not be admitted to the competitive examination mentioned in Regulation 6.

8. *Period of Probation.*—Before appointment to the Indian Forest Department, a probationer will be required:—

(i) to have obtained, either before selection as probationer or within the period of two years' probation, the degree or diploma in Forestry at one of the Universities named below.*

(ii) to have undergone a special course of instruction in Forestry, under the direction and supervision of the Director of Indian Forest Studies appointed by the Secretary of State for India in Council, in such British and Continental localities as may be selected for the purpose;

(iii) to have passed an examination in certain special subjects, namely, Systematic Botany of Indian trees, Indian Geology, Forest Law, Indian Working Plans, and, if required, an Indian vernacular language;

(iv) to have undergone a final competitive examination in Forestry (*see* Annexure II);

(v) to have satisfied the Secretary of State, in such manner as may be determined, of his ability to ride.

The period of probation will in ordinary cases be two years The Director of Indian Forest Studies will instruct probationers in each case as to the order and manner in which they should fulfil these various requirements.

9. *Charges.*—The Probationers will be required to defray all expenses of lodging, board, tuition, and excursions, while at the University, and on practical instruction in Great Britain and on the Continent, with the exception of fees payable to local Forest Officers in Great Britain and on the Continent.

10. *Allowances.*—The Secretary of State for India in Council will make payments to each probationer at the rate of £120 annually, not exceeding a total of £240 (besides the fees to local officers mentioned above). These payments will ordinarily be made on the following dates in each year:—

	£
On the 1st December	30
On the 1st March	30
On the 1st June	60

The cases of probationers whose probation does not extend over the full two years will be specially considered.

The grant of the allowances is subject to the following conditions:—

(*a*) That the progress of the probationer in his studies is satisfactory;

(*b*) That the probationer gives security to refund the payments in respect of this advance, as well as such payments not exceeding £60 in all, as may have been incurred by the Secretary of State on the probationer's behalf in respect of fees to local Forest Officers, in the event of his failing to qualify for an appointment in the Indian Forest Service, or not signing the articles of agreement as specified in paragraph 13, or failing to join the Indian Forest Service at the end of the period of probation.

* A Moderatorship in Natural Science or in Experimental Science at the University of Dublin will be considered as fulfilling these conditions.

† Graduates in Forestry at the University of Edinburgh are regarded as satisfying the requirements of this paragraph if they pass the Final Examination of that University in some one branch of Natural Science embraced in the degree in Pure Science.

* Cambridge, Oxford, or Edinburgh.

11. *Conduct.*—Every Probationer will be required to conduct himself during the period of probation in a manner satisfactory to the Secretary of State, and to give evidence of satisfactory progress in his studies in such a manner as may be required, failing which, or in the event of serious misconduct, he will be liable to have his name removed from the list of Probationers.

12. *Appointment and Seniority.*—Probationers who comply with the requirements of Regulation 8 within the sanctioned period of time, and also satisfy such other tests as may be prescribed, will be appointed Assistant Conservators in the Indian Forest Department, provided they are of sound constitution and free from physical defects which would render them unsuitable for employment in the Indian Forest Service. Their position in the Provincial Forest Lists will be determined by the Secretary of State for India in Council on the report of the Director of Indian Forest Studies; but in making selections for the post of Conservator, officers joining the Service in the same year are reckoned as equal in seniority unless the Secretary of State for India in Council shall for special reasons have directed otherwise in any particular case or cases.

Probationers will be allowed at the end of the period of probation to state their preference in respect to the Provinces to which they desire to be allotted; but the distribution will be made to the several Provinces according to the needs of the public service, at the discretion of the Secretary of State for India in Council. Officers are, however at all times liable to be transferred from one Province to another at the pleasure of the Government of India.

13. *Articles of Agreement.*—A Probationer is required, on qualifying for appointment as Assistant Conservator, to sign articles of agreement setting forth the terms and conditions of his appointment; he must embark for India when required to do so by the Secretary of State, and must engage his own passage. Failure to embark at the stated time will, in the absence of satisfactory explanation, lead to forfeiture of appointment.

14. *Passage Allowance.*—An allowance on account of passage to India will be paid to each probationer on appointment to the Indian Forest Service, to the amount of £37 10s. for passage to Calcutta, Madras, or Bombay, and £43 for passage to Rangoon.

Note.—The above is the normal rate of passage allowance. In consequence of the surtax of 10 per cent. at present charged by shipping companies in respect of passages to India the above rates of passage allowance have been raised to £41 5s. and £46 5s. respectively. Should this surtax be removed, these rates will be reduced to those given in paragraph 14.

15. *Salary.*—An Assistant Conservator of Forests will draw pay at the rate of Rs. 380 a month (equivalent to £304 a year, when the rupee is at 1s. 4d.) from the date of his reporting his arrival in India.

16. *Promotion, Leave, Pension, and Provident Fund.*—Promotion, leave, and pension will be governed by the Regulations laid down by the Government of India, and applicable to Forest officers, such regulations being subject to any modifications or alterations which may be made in them from time to time by the Government of India, and their interpretation in case of any doubt arising being left to that Government. A copy of the existing regulations can be seen on application at the India Office.

Certain information regarding appointments in the upper controlling staff of the Indian Forest Service, the pay of which has been recently improved, will be found in Annexure III.; a summary of information regarding leave is contained in Annexure IV.; and regarding pensions and the provident fund in Annexure V.

INDIA OFFICE,
October, 1913.

ANNEXURE I.

COMPETITIVE EXAMINATION.

In the event of the Civil Service Commissioners being requested by the Secretary of State for India in Council to hold an examination in any year of candidates nominated by him to compete for appointment as Probationers for the above Service, the following will be the subjects in which such candidates will be examined:—

	Maximum Marks.
1. English Composition	100
2. German or French	100
3. Elementary Chemistry	50
4. Higher Chemistry	100
5. Physics	100
6. Geology	100
7. Botany	100
8. Zoology	100

Not more than three of the subjects numbered 4 to 8 may be offered.

Candidates must pass to the satisfaction of the Civil Service Commissioners in the first three subjects.

In the subjects numbered 4 to 8, only marks showing real attainment will be counted towards the order of merit, so that a candidate who has a thorough knowledge of one or two of the optional subjects may obtain on that knowledge alone as many marks as a candidate who offers the maximum number of the optional subjects on a lower standard.

SYLLABUS.

Languages.—The examination in German and French will include translation, composition, and conversation.

Sciences.—The standard of the examination in Higher Chemistry, Physics, Geology, Botany, and Zoology will be that of the Honours Schools of the Universities.

The examination in Elementary Chemistry will consist of a written paper on the more elementary parts of Inorganic Chemistry, together with the outlines of Organic Chemistry.

ANNEXURE II.

FINAL EXAMINATION.

1. With a view to the allocation of the annual Currie Scholarship for Indian Forest Students (value about £35), and to facilitate the allotment of probationers to the several Provinces in accordance with paragraph 12 of the Regulations as to appointments in the Indian Forest Service, probationers who have completed their prescribed course of training will be required to undergo a competitive final examination in Forestry.

2. A list of the probationers in order of merit will be prepared by adding together (*a*) the marks obtained at the final examination, and (*b*) the marks obtained during the course of practical training in forestry under the control of the Director of Indian Forest Studies. The maximum of marks obtainable under (*a*) will be the same as under (*b*).

3. The final examination will consist of an oral examination and three or more papers, as follows:—

(i.) One or more papers in Silviculture, Forest Protection (including Forest Botany and Forest Entomology), and Forest Utilisation (including Forest Engineering).

(ii.) One or more papers in Forest Management, Forest Mensuration, Forest Valuation, and Forest Administration.

(iii.) A paper in General Forestry (Practical) dealing with the work done and with the forests visited during the course of practical training.

4. The final examination will be held at the beginning of October. Arrangements as to the date and place of examination will be made by the Director of Indian Forest Studies. Probationers will not be required to pay any fee for the examination.

ANNEXURE III.

LIST OF APPOINTMENTS OPEN TO MEMBERS OF THE IMPERIAL BRANCH OF THE INDIAN FOREST SERVICE.

[NOTE.—*This list is liable to alteration at any time.*]

		Appointment.	Salary. Rs.
(*a*)	1	Inspector-General of Forests	2,650 a month.
(*b*)	*1	Assistant Inspector-General of Forests	—
(*c*)	2	Chief Conservators (Burma and Central Provinces)	2,150 ,,
(*d*)	22	Conservators, in three grades (including President, Forest Research Institute and College)	1,900 ,, / 1,700 ,, / 1,500 ,, respectively.
(*e*)	187	Deputy and Assistant Conservators	‡Rs. 380 a month, rising by annual increments of Rs. 40 a month to Rs. 700 a month; thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 50 a month to Rs. 1,250 a month, in the twentieth year of service.
	Total 213†		
These appointments are included in (*d*) and (*e*).	5	Foreign Service appointments	
	§10	Officers employed at the Forest Research Institute and College, Dehra Dun	

ANNEXURES IV. and V. (*not reprinted*).

[*Note.*—Annexures IV. and V. are intended merely to show the principal leave and pension rules in the Civil Service Regulations at present applicable to officers appointed to the Indian Forest Service by the Secretary of State from the United Kingdom, without going into minute details, and do not profess to deal with every case that may arise. The rules are subject to alteration, and any disputed question must be decided with reference to the authorised text of the Civil Service Regulations for the time being.]

ANNEXURE VI.

GENERAL PHYSICAL REQUIREMENTS (*not reprinted*).

* The officer holding this appointment draws in addition to the pay of his grade a minimum local allowance of Rs. 200 a month.

† These appointments are allotted to the various Provinces as follows: Burma, 66; Madras, 31; Bombay, 27; Central Provinces, 24; United Provinces, 19; Punjab, 12; Bengal, 12; Assam, 13; and Bihar and Orissa, 5; and 4 Imperial Instructors at Dehra Dun.

‡ Until he has passed the prescribed Departmental Examinations, an Assistant Conservator is liable to stoppage of increments of pay. On passing the examinations he will resume drawing pay under the time scale at the rate to which his length of service entitles him.

§ These draw a local allowance of Rs. 150 a month in addition to their grade pay, with the exception of the President, Forest Research Institute and College, in whose case the allowance is at the rate of Rs. 200 a month. Of these 10 appointments, the four posts of Imperial Instructors have been sanctioned for five years from 1912, for the present.

NOTE.—Under the improved scale of salary shown above, no Exchange Compensation Allowance is granted.

APPENDIX XIV.

Officials who furnished written Evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their enquiry into the Forest Service but who were not orally examined.

1. R. S. Hole, Esq., Offg. President, Forest Research Institute and College (Imperial Forest Service.)
2. Officers of the Imperial Forest Service at Dehra Dun.
3. Officers of the Provincial Forest Service at Dehra Dun.
4. Fazl-ud-din, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Chenab Forest Division, and five other officers of the Punjab Provincial Forest Service.
5. E. E. Slane, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Chittagong Division
6. F. W. Collings, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Shwegyin Division.
7. H. R. Meredith, Esq., Assistant Conservator of Forests, Kado Division, Moulmein.
8. L. E. S. Teague, Esq., Deputy Conservator of Forests, Chittagong Hill Tracts Division.
9. J. W. Ryan, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma.
10. Cyril Hopwood, Esq., Deputy Conservator, Lower Chindwin Division, Burma.
11. J. L. Hefferman, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Burma.
12. T. W. Forster, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests.
13. E. M. Buchanan, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Myitkyina Division.
14. C. W. Allan, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Henzada-Maubin Division, Pegu Circle, Burma.
15. V. H. T. Fields-Clarke, Esq., Assistant Conservator of Forests, Myittha Division.
16. R. L. Pocock, Esq., Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, South Tenasserim Division, Tavoy.
17. A. J. Butterwick, Esq., Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator, Pegu.
18. D. A. Allan, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Burma.
19. E. B. Powell, Esq., Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Burma.
20. F. P. Thomson, Esq., Probationary Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Burma.
21. H. B. Bryant, Esq., Acting Conservator of Forests, Central Circle, Madras.
22. A. N. Master, Esq., Senior Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Bombay.
23. R. H. Madan, Esq., Licentiate of Civil Engineering (Bombay), Extra Deputy Conservator of Forests, Bombay.

INDEX.

(The numbers refer to paragraphs.)

Forest Department.

A

Administrative Posts:
- Additional pensions advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66049; *Gibson*, 66213; *Cubitt*, 66276; *Monteath*, 66342; *Lodge*, 66464; *Witt*, 66622, 66629.
- no Bar advocated to advancement of Provincial Service officers, *Gokul Das*, 66189; *Kanjilal*, 66438, 66446; *Sataravala*, 66601, 66614; *Srinivasalu*, 66659, 66670, 66676.
- Interchange from one province to another, language difficulty would not constitute objection, *Lodge* 66502
- Pay should be assimilated to that of Public Works Department ... p. 123, p. 126

(*see also* Chief Conservators, Conservators, *and* Inspector-General of Forests.)

Allowances (*see under* Leave *and* Pay).

Alwar Chetty Garu, M. R. Ry., Rao Bahadur, evidence of 66508–31

Anglo-Indians, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 153

Anglo-Indians and domiciled community not suited to, *Lodge* 66491, 56498

Assam:
- Administration, memorandum by ... p. 126–133
- Bar to selection of non-natives of Province should not be insisted on, *Kanjilal* 66436
- Candidates for deputation to Ranger Service Course at Imperial Forest College, Dehra Dun, rules for selection ... ... p. 129–131
- CHARGES:
  - Great difference between major and minor, *Perree* 66418
  - Major, no Provincial officer in, *Perree* ... 66416
  - Minor, two temporarily occupied by Imperial officers, *Perree* 66417
  - Number, *Perree* 66417
- LOCAL ALLOWANCES:
  - Conservators should be made eligible for, at higher rate, *Perree* 66408
  - Increase advocated, *Perree* 66408, 66424

(*see also subject headings.*)

Assistant Conservators:
- Duties, *Hart* 66086
- Placed in charge of division should receive charge allowance, *Gibson*, 66211, 66242; *Cubitt*, 66274, 66289; *Witt*, 66620, 66647, 66648; p. 119.
- Promotion to Deputy Conservator, dependent entirely upon length of service, *Hart* ... 66086

B

Baniyas and Vaisyas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 153

Bengal:
- Charges, divisional, no material difference in work and responsibility of different, except in regard to area, *Gibson* 66232
- Extra Deputy Conservators, promotion to, rule that charge of division must be held, enforcement unfair, *Gibson* 66243
- Forest Department, organisation, *Gibson* ... 66217
- Government, memorandum by ... p. 121–3
- Provincial Service, complimented on good work several times, *Hannah* 66402

(*see also subject headings.*)

Bihar and Orissa:
- Government, memorandum by ... p. 123–6
- PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE:
  - Amalgamation with Bengal would not be popular with service in Bihar, *Hannah* ... 66403
  - Rangers, half trained at Dehra Dun and half at Kurseong, *Monteath* 66366

(*see also subject headings.*)

Bombay:
- Appointment to Inspector-General of Forests barred in fact, though not in theory, *Millett* 66534, 66579
- Charges, major, number held by Provincial officers, *Sataravala* 66607
- Chief Conservator, appointment recommended, *Millett* 66534, 66561, 66570
- Extra Deputy Conservators, all five appointments filled at present time, *Sataravala* ... 66610
- Former system of recruiting graduates to Forest Service, *Sataravala* 66609
- Government, memorandum by ... p. 145–148
- PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE:
  - not Doing same work as Imperial Service, *Millett* 66557

(*see also subject headings.*)

Brahmans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 153

Buddhists, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 153

Burma:
- Allowance, exclusion of Chief Conservator and Conservators from, serious grievance, *Cubitt* 66274
- Charges, major and minor, distinct difference between, *Cubitt* 66296
- CONDITIONS OF SERVICE:
  - Mortality figures, *Cubitt* 66273, 66297
  - Peculiar disadvantages, *Cubitt* 66273
- Extra Assistant Conservators on probation, confirmation advocated, *Kavanagh* ... 66312, 66336
- Government, memorandum by ... p. 134–7
- HOUSING:
  - of Junior officers not in charge of divisions, more attention should be paid to, *Cubitt* 66279
  - Old system of assessing rent should be reverted to, *Cubitt* 66279
  - Rate of interest charged should be reduced, and accommodation brought up to Indian standard, *Cubitt* 66279
- Leave, beginning and end should count from dates of departure from, and return to, Rangoon respectively, *Cubitt* 66275
- PAY:
  - Increments, rules regulating accrual of, unsatisfactory, *Cubitt* 66274
  - Reorganisation, officers have not been given full benefit, *Kavanagh* 66312
- PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE:
  - Vacancies in cadre not yet filled, *Kavanagh* 66312
  - Wholly composed of Anglo-Indians, with exception of two or three Burmans, *Cubitt* 66301

Burma—*continued.*

RANGOON HOUSE ALLOWANCE:
Extension to bachelors advocated, *Cubitt* 66274
no Official reason given for denying, to Provincial officers, *Kavanagh* 66324

Selection from all Indian communities advocated, *Coombs* 66122

School for training Rangers and Subordinates, *Cubitt* 66291

Training on first arrival in India, instructions a dead letter owing to hopeless inadequacy of staff, *Cubitt* 66272

(see also subject headings.)

C

Caccia, A. M., M.V.O., evidence of ... 66748–66795

Cadre:

Appointments held outside, Assam, pp. 126–7; Bengal, p. 122; Bihar and Orissa, pp. 123–4; Bombay, pp. 146–7; Burma, p. 135; Central Provinces and Berar, p. 149; Madras, p. 142; Punjab, p. 119.

Increase advocated, *Hart*, 66097; *Mercer*, 66146; Assam, pp. 126–7, *Perree*, 66414; Bengal, pp. 122–3, *Gibson*, 66210, 66224; Bihar and Orissa, pp. 123–5; Bombay, pp. 146–7; Burma, pp. 135–6, *Cubitt*, 66273; Central Provinces and Berar, p. 149, *Witt*, 66619, 66640, 66649; Madras, p. 142, *Lodge*, 66461, 66476–8, 66480, 66494, 66503; Punjab, p. 119, *McIntosh*, 66172; United Provinces, *Clutterbuck*, 66059.

Number of posts in each grade, and the provision for leave and training, *Hart*, 66086, 66093; Assam, pp. 126–7, *Perree*, 66414; Bengal, pp. 122–3; Bihar and Orissa, pp. 123–4, *Monteath*, 66346–7; Bombay, pp. 146–7; Burma, p. 135, *Cubitt*, 66281; Central Provinces and Berar, p. 149; Madras, pp. 141–4; United Provinces, *Clutterbuck*, 66063.

Cambridge, School of Forestry:

Buildings, equipment, etc., *Dawson* ... 66807, 66815

Date of foundation, *Dawson* 66833

DIPLOMA:
Course of study, etc., *Dawson* 66806, 66824, 66834, 66838, 66849–51, 66855
Syllabus same as other universities, *Caccia* 66777

Fees, *Dawson* 66853

INDIAN PROBATIONERS:
no Contribution received from State towards expenses, *Dawson* 66833
Number having received training at, and number at present, *Dawson* 66813, 66817, 66847

PRACTICAL TRAINING COURSE:
in England instituted, and relative value of German and English training, *Dawson* 66819–20, 66822, 66842–4, 66855–7
no Hard and fast rule as to period which must be spent at home and abroad, *Dawson* 66836

Proposed B.A. degree in forestry, *Dawson* 66826, 66837, 66854

Special provisions for Indian forestry, *Dawson* 66809, 66818, 66833, 66841

Staff, *Dawson* 66808, 66832, 66835

Statement showing age at which probationers for Indian Forest Service took an Honours Degree in Science and the Diploma in Forestry ... ... p. 152

TRAINING ON CONTINENT:
not Possible to make arrangements for control of students by English officer unless number large, *Dawson* 66823
Redistribution of time between Germany and England, *Dawson* 66836, 66839–40
Students put in charge of German forest officer, *Dawson* 66821

STUDENTS:
Increase in number anticipated, *Dawson* 66826
Number, *Dawson* 66816

Central Provinces and Berar, Administration, memorandum by ... ... pp. 148–150
(see also subject headings.)

Charges:

Administrative (*see* Administrative Posts).

Changes in category of minor and major not made arbitrarily, *Perree* 66429

DISTINCTION BETWEEN MAJOR AND MINOR:
Abolition advocated, *Coombs*, 66118, 66127; *Sen*, 66247; *Monteath*, 66356, 66362, 66369; *Kanjilal*, 66438, 66447; *Sataravala*, 66591, 66597, 66612.
Difference of size only, *V. Alwar Chetty* ... 66519
should be Maintained ... ... p. 121

Divided into major and minor, *Hart* ... 66086

DIVISIONAL:
not Co-terminous with Public Works Department divisions, overlapping in certain cases, *Lodge* 66490
Duties and responsibilities of Provincial Forest officers same as those of officers of Imperial Service, *Sen* 66264, 66269
should be Held by Provincial officers ... 66118
Period which should elapse before officer should hold, *Hart*, 66086, 66118; *Gibson*, 66241; *Monteath*, 66365, 66367; *Hannah*, 66337; *Kanjilal*, 66438; *Witt*, 66641.
Placing of junior assistants or extra assistant Conservators in independent charge inadvisable, *Lodge* 66465
Promotion to, by efficiency, advocated ... p. 121
Provincial Service officer would labour under disadvantage in holding, where there was large European community, *Gibson* ... 66240
Same powers should be given to Provincial officers as to Imperial, *Hannah* 66383
by Seniority, advocated, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127; *Sen*, 66247; *Hannah*, 66377; *Kanjilal*, 66438.

MAJOR:
Certain percentage set aside for best officers in Provincial Service, *Hart* 66087
Eighty per cent. held by Imperial officers, *Hart* 66086
Held at one time by Provincial and at another by Imperial officers, *Hannah*, 66399; *Lodge*, 66486; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66526, 66575.
should be Held by Imperial officers as a general rule, *Lodge* 66465
Provincial officer in charge never as efficiently equipped for duties as Imperial officers, *Lodge* 66500
Rangers should not be given, *V. Alwar Chetty* 66521
Rule that 20 per cent. should be held by Provincial officers, *Hannah* 66386
Service necessary prior to assuming control, question difficult, *Perree* 66420
Specially selected men trained at Dehra Dun capable of assuming control, *Perree* ... 66419
Suitable Indian recruits will be extremely difficult to find in future, *Lodge* 66487
Three principal criteria for distinguishing from minor, *Perree* 66431

MINOR:
Officers of Provincial Service have not been given opportunity of showing whether they could carry out work of important charge, *Coombs* 66134
Proportion held by Provincial Service, *Hart* 66086
Time elapsing before Imperial officer fit to hold, *Lodge* 66495

RANGES:
Period officers should be required to hold, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127; *Hannah*, 66377, 66397–8; *Kanjilal*, 66438; p. 121.
Same powers should be given to Provincial officers as to Imperial, *Hannah* 66383
Senior officers should not be posted under juniors of either service, *Kanjilal* 66438

Special, *Hart* 66086
(see also under name of province.)

Chetty, Garu, M. R. Ry., Rao Bahadur, evidence of 66508–31

Chief Conservators:
Appointment to each province advocated, *Lodge* 66466
Duties, *Hart* 66086
Local Governments would welcome proposal that appointments of Secretaries should be held by, *Mercer* 66167
Pay, scale advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66047, 66070; *Hart*, 66074; *McIntosh*, 66173; *Mercer*, 66147; *Gibson*, 66211; *Monteath*, 66340; *Lodge*, 66462; *Witt*, 66620; p. 120, p. 135.

Civil Appointments at Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, on 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 153

Clutterbuck, P. H., evidence of ... 66044–66070

Conditions of Service, Imperial Forest Service:
Allotment of recruits to provinces, method, alteration desirable, and groups suggested, *Hart* 66073
Arduous and unhealthy, and life solitary, *Clutterbuck*, 66047; *Hart*, 66073; *McIntosh*, 66172; *Gibson*, 66210, 66223, 66227; *Cubitt*, 66273; *Monteath*, 66339; *Lodge*, 66461; *Millett*, 66534; *Witt*, 66619.
Arrangement by which certain provinces repeatedly attract men at top of list defective, and alternatives suggested, *Hart*, 66104; *Monteath*, 66349; *Perree*, 66408, 66422, 66429; *Lodge*, 66474.
Comparison with Public Works and Police Departments, *Lodge* 66461
one Imperial list for whole country advocated, *Gibson*, 66210, 66220–1, 66233; *Monteath*, 66360.
Interchange of officers between various provinces, difficulties in way, *Lodge* 66475
Specialisation, encouragement advocated, *Mercer*, 66146, 66160; *Gibson*, 66210.
Temporary removal of officers from unhealthy places to healthy stations should be permitted, *Millett* 66534, 66558
Transfers of officers from province to province, more frequent, advocated, *Hart*, 66073; *Gibson*, 66210, 66220; *Cubitt*, 66288; *Monteath*, 66339.

Conditions of Service, Provincial Forest Service:
Arduous and unhealthy, *Coombs*, 66127; *Kavanagh*, 66306; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66511; *Sataravala*, 66591.
Confidential reports, injustice sometimes resultant, and officers should see copies, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127; *Sen*, 66253, 66265; *Kavanagh*, 66312; *Hannah*, 66377, 66401; *Kanjilal*, 66438; p. 121.
very Different from those of European officer in Provincial Service, *Millett* 66543
Extremely good, *Witt* 66637
Marked distinctions from Imperial Service made, and should be removed, *Kavanagh*, 66306; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66511; *Sataravala*, 66591.
Prefix "Extra," abolition advocated, *Kavanagh*, 66327; *Perree*, 66412; *Hannah*, 66377; *Kanjilal*, 66438; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508; *Srinivasalu*, 66662; *Earle*, p. 134.

Confidential Reports (*see under* Conditions of Service).

Conservators:
Assistant (*see that title*).
Chief (*see that title*).
Deputy (*see that title*).
Duties, *Hart* 66086
Extra Deputy (*see that title*).
Two grades only suggested, and salaries advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66047, 66058, 66070; *Hart*, 66074; *McIntosh*, 66173; *Mercer*, 66147, *Gibson*, 66211; *Monteath*, 66340; *Lodge*, 66462; *Witt*, 66620.
Local Governments would welcome proposal that appointments of Secretaries should be held by, *Mercer* 66167
Officer not promoted to, in ordinary course of events, except in province in which ordinarily serving, *Monteath* 66348
One post should be thrown open to Provincial Service, *Coombs* 66140

Conservators—*continued.*
Pay, scale advocated for three grades, *Millett* 66535; pp. 120, 122
Personal assistants to, special allowance should be granted, *Cubitt* 66274
Post should be held by Imperial officer only, *Millett* 66583

Controlling Staff, division into upper and lower should be abolished, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127; *Gokul Das*, 66189; *Hannah*, 66377; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508.

Coombs, G. O., evidence of 66116–66143

Cubitt, G. E. S., evidence of 66271–66303

D

Dawson, William:
Evidence of 66806–66857
Statistics furnished by ... ... pp. 150, 152

Dehra Dun Forest Research Institute and College:
Affiliation to a university advocated, *Kanjilal* 66437
Communities from which students drawn varied, *Mercer* 66154
Competitive examination before sending students to, would be an advantage, *Mercer* ... 66154
Compulsory practical training before admission advocated, *Sen* 66245, 66262
Cost of training, *Hannah* 66404
Distinct courses for Rangers and Provincial Service advocated, *Millett* 66567
Domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians trained at, standard of work satisfactory, *Gibson* 66239A
Final examination, very few failures, but examination not at all difficult, *Mercer* 66154
Form of agreement to be executed by students already in service of, or in receipt of stipend from, Government previous to entry into p. 131–3
Indian students, right class not yet tapped, *Mercer* 66154
Inferior training to that given in England, *Perree*, 66421; *Millett*, 66554, 66556, 66582; *Caccia*, 66775.
Inferior training to that obtainable in Europe, no grounds for statement, *Hannah* 66387–8
Instructors:
Assistant, duties somewhat similar to Instructors in Imperial Service, *Mercer* 66169
Distinction between Provincial and Imperial officers unnecessary, *Hannah* 66377
Insuperable objection to training as compared with training on Continent of Europe, *Gibson* 66230
Modification of system to bring it in line with training received by men recruited in England advocated, *V. Alwar Chetty* ... 66510
very few Muhammadans, *Mercer* 66154
Particulars, *Mercer* 66152
no Probationary period spent in Forest before admission, *Kavanagh* 66320, 66329
Provincial Forest Service, new rule prescribing separate course, and improvement, *Hart*, 66110; *Hannah*, 66376.
Raising of standard course and extension of period from two to three years advocated, *Mercer*, 66154; *Kanjilal*, 66437, 66446, 66454, 66456.
Ranger class, experiment of placing Provincial officers in charge of, tried, but absolutely condemned, *Mercer* 66169
no Reason why training should not in future be as efficient as that provided by institutions in England and Scotland, *Stebbing* ... 66892
not Same facilities for instruction as at Oxford, *Hart* 66101, 66106
Students sent by Local Governments often unsuitable, *Mercer* 66154, 66164
Training equal to that on Continent, *Kavanagh* 66304, 66314–5, 66325, 66330, 66333
Training grounds, disability in that India has no forests which have been under systematic management for more than 25 years, *Mercer* 66153
Training of Imperial recruits at, not advocated, *Millett* 66585

Dehra Dun Forest Research Institute and College —*continued.*
Training satisfactory, *Hart*, 66091, 66110, 66117; *Coombs*, 66126; *Mercer*, 66153; *Sen*, 66246; *Kavanagh*, 66305; *Hannah*, 66376; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66510; *Millett*, 66542; *Sataravala*, 66590; p. 135.

Deputy Conservators:
Classed as fitted to hold administrative rank, and of more than 18 years' standing, should continue to draw increments, *Clutterbuck*, 66047; *Millett*, 66535, 66560.
Duties, *Hart* 66086
Extra (*see that title*).

Division into Imperial and Provincial Branches:
Abolition advocated, and establishment of one superior service, *Coombs*, 66122, 66131, 66135, 66143; *Gokul Das*, 66193, 66206; *Kavanagh*, 66310, 66326; *Kanjilal*, 66438, 66442, 66445, 66458; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508, 66515, 66518.
Abolition hardly possible at present stage, *Sataravala* 66595
Amalgamated list for whole of Imperial and Provincial Services advocated, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127; *Gokul Das*, 66189, 66197; *Sen*, 66247, 66255; *Kavanagh*, 66310; *Hannah*, 66377, 66385; *Kanjilal*, 66438, 66445; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508, 66511; *Sataravala*, 66595, 66597, 66600; *Srinivasalu*, 66671–2; *Earle*, p. 134.
Maintenance advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66050, 66054, 66060; *Hart*, 66077, 66090, 66111; *Cubitt*, 66277; *Monteath*, 66343, 66356; *Perree*, 66412; *Millett*, 66533, 66553, *Witt*, 66623; p. 121.
Provincial Service shut in, and no openings for good and meritorious service, *Hannah* 66381
Retention necessary, but modified form advocated, *Srinivasalu* 66671–2

Divisions (*see under* Charges).

Drake, F. C., evidence of 66679–66719

E

Earle, Hon. Sir Archdale, note by ... p. 133–4

Edinburgh School of Forestry:
Degree in Forestry:
Applications received from Provincial Service, and considered important, *Stebbing* 66895–6
Forestry Curriculum, *Stebbing* 66860, 66868, 66875–6
Graduates in, *Stebbing* 66861
Diploma course, syllabus same as other universities, *Caccia* 66777, 66787
Equipment and staff, *Stebbing* ... 66864, 66867
Fees, *Stebbing* 66874
Indian students from Native States, *Stebbing* 66863, 66877
Practical work partly in Scotland and partly on Continent, *Stebbing* 66870–1, 66873, 66878, 66882, 66884, 66889, 66890–2
Statement showing age at which probationers for Indian Forest Service took an Honours Degree in Science and the Diploma in Forestry ... ... p. 152
Students, number, *Stebbing* ... 66862, 66867, 66894
Training of Indian Forest probationers, *Stebbing* 66865, 66869, 66885, 66887, 66893

Europeans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 153

Extra Deputy Conservators:
Abolition of posts in Provincial Service and adding them to Imperial Service as posts to be filled by selected Provincial Service officers would be difficult, *Hart*... ... 66103
Analogous to listed posts in Indian Civil Service, *Hart* 66103
Appointments:
not all Filled up, *Hart* 66086
Number of, should be increased, *Sataravala* 66602
Number of posts dependent on number of major charges, *Hart* 66092
Vacancies will be filled as soon as suitable men can be found, *Hart* 66110
would have Comparatively small chance of rising to administrative posts in Imperial Service if admitted to Imperial list, *Hart* ... 66114

Extra Deputy Conservators—*continued.*
Promotion to:
Fitness should be based upon grounds other than fitness to hold charge of major division only, *Sataravala* 66597
Requirement of certificate of fitness to hold major charge, *Hart* 66086
Rules laid down, *Hart* 66112
not doing Same work nor undertaking same responsibilities as Deputies, *Clutterbuck* 66054

F

Family Pension Fund:
Institution advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66052, 66059; *Hart*, 66079, 66095; *Mercer*, 66151; *Gibson*, 66228; *Cubitt*, 66279; *Kavanagh*, 66324A; *Monteath*, 66345; *Lodge*, 66464, 66485, *Millett*, 66565; *Sataravala*, 66606; *Witt*, 66625, 66643, 66652; p. 120–1.
Voluntary provident fund should be established also, *McIntosh* 66181

Furlough (*see under* Leave).

G

General Provident Fund (*see under* Provident Fund).

Germany, forestry courses, *Caccia* ... 66788, 66793

Gibson, H. S., evidence of 66208–66244

Gokul Das, Pandit, evidence of ... 66187–66207

H

Hart, G. S., C.I.E., evidence of ... 66071–66115

Hannah, R. G. A., evidence of ... 66375–66405

Hindus, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 153

Horses, cost of railing from one camp to another, should be paid by Government, *Lodge* ... 66462

House Accommodation:
Headquarters Bungalows:
Half rent only should be paid when officer absent on privilege leave and during touring season, *Millett* 66534
Provision at Government expense of all essential articles of furniture advocated, *Cubitt* 66279
in Headquarters, special attention should be paid to, and, if necessary, a Government bungalow provided, *Witt* 66619
Rent free, advocated, *Perree* 66408, 66423
Rent out of all proportion to use made, and adequate accommodation should be provided at all headquarters stations, *Gibson* ... 66216
(*see also under* Burma, Madras.)

I

Imperial Forest Service:
List of appointments open to ... ... p. 158
Suggested placing of officers in direct charge of important works demanding technical knowledge 66118

Indian Christians, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 153

Indians:
Conditions of service do not appeal to, *Clutterbuck*, 66061; *Hart*, 66077, 66090, 66106, 66110; *Mercer*, 66154, 66168; *Gokul Das*, 66203; *Monteath*, 66364; *Lodge*, 66465, 66487, 66507; *Millett*, 66538.
Considerable number desirous of getting appointments as Rangers, *Mercer* 66154
English a foreign language to, but not as difficult for native to learn it as French or German, *Lodge* 66506
Forest Department popular with, *Coombs*, 66139; *Kanjilal*, 66451–2.
Limitations in Employment:
Change in existing regulations unnecessary, *Hart*, 66077; *Mercer*, 66150; *McIntosh*, 66177; *Gibson*, 66214; *Cubitt*, 66277; *Monteath*, 66343, 66356; *Lodge*, 66465; *Witt*, 66623; p. 121.
None theoretically to Imperial Service and none in practice to Provincial Service, *Hannah*, 66381; *Kanjilal*, 66442.

Indians—*continued.*

One case only known of where son had chosen same profession as father, *Hart* ... 66114

Recruitment to Imperial Service:

if Admitted on same terms as English officers should get same pay, *Gokul Das*... ... 66206

Advantage in sending statutory natives to England and making them undergo similar course to that taken by European candidates, *Monteath* 66357

Age limit 19–23 advocated, *Srinivasalu* ... 66656

Difference in conditions of entry from Europeans, *McIntosh* 66182, 66186

Diploma in forestry far more difficult to take than any other, and probably one reason for small numbers, *Schlich* 66734

Direct appointment preferred to promotion from Provincial Service, *Millett*, 66555; *Caccia*, 66785; *Earle*, p. 133.

Exclusion not advocated, but qualifications should be required, *Schlich* 66733

Indian university degree should be recognised, *Srinivasalu* 66656, 66665

Limitations in employment:

Entry to Imperial Service open under exactly same conditions as Europeans except with regard to marriage, *Clutterbuck*, 66050; *Hart*, 66077; *McIntosh*, 66176; *Sen*, 66251; *Cubitt*, 66285–6; *Monteath*, 66343; *Perree*, 66412; *Lodge*, 66465, 66503; *Millett*, 66538; *Witt*, 66623.

Practically excluded, although not debarred by rules, *Coombs*, 66131; *Gokul Das*, 66193; *Hannah*, 66375; *Srinivasalu*, 66656, 66662.

by Nomination and competition advocated, *Hart*, 66090; *Srinivasalu*, 66656.

Number having taken advantage of opening, *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66530; *Sataravala*, 66615; *Drake*, 66708; *Schlich*, 66730, 66733; *La Touche*, 66803.

Physical test advocated, *Srinivasalu* ... 66665

Practical difficulties in way of entering, *Gokul Das* 66193

Reservation of posts in India:

Advocated, selected candidates to be sent to Europe for training, *Coombs*, 66122, 66131; *McIntosh*, 66179; *Cubitt*, 66293–4, *Lodge*, 66487; *Srinivasalu*, 66666.

not Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66066; *Mercer*, 66156; *Gokul Das*, 66197; *Monteath*, 66361; *Perree*, 66430.

Simultaneous examination in England and India:

Advocated, *Srinivasalu* 66656

not Advocated, *Perree* 66406

no Special steps taken to secure, but always considered with other candidates, *Drake* 66707

Undesirable to send officer to province other than that in which recruited, *Earle* ... p. 133

(*see also* Promotion from Provincial Service *under* Recruitment, Imperial Forest Service.)

Relations with Europeans of same rank and standing should be improved, *Kanjilal* 66438

Inspector-General of Forests:

Pay, scale advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66047; *Hart*, 66074; *Mercer*, 66147; *McIntosh*, 66173; *Gibson*, 66211; *Cubitt*, 66274; *Monteath*, 66340; *Lodge*, 66462; *Witt*, 66620; pp. 120, 135.

Selection confined to officers with experience of Burma, *Lodge* 66473, 66497

K

Kaiyasthas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 153

Kanjilal, Rai Bahadur Upendra Nath, evidence of 66436–66458

Kavanagh, R. M., evidence of 66304–66336

Kshatryas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 153

L

La Touche, Sir J. D., evidence of ... 66796–66805

Leave, Imperial Forest Service:

Allowances, scale advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66048; *Hart*, 66075; *Mercer*, 66148; *McIntosh*, 66174; *Gibson*, 66212; *Cubitt*, 66275; *Monteath*, 66341, 66355A; *Perree*, 66410, 66427; *Lodge*, 66463; *Millett*, 66536; *Witt*, 66621.

Commutation of long leave on half pay to shorter period on full pay advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66048; *Mercer*, 66148; *McIntosh*, 66174; *Cubitt*, 66276; *Monteath*, 66341; *Perree*, 66410; *Lodge*, 66463; *Witt*, 66621.

Conditions ... ... p. 140

Concession in cost of steamship fares advocated, *Mercer*, 66151; *Gibson*, 66212; *Monteath*, 66345; *Perree*, 66408; *Witt*, 66625.

Credit of six months' furlough on arrival in India should be given, *Lodge* 66463

Furlough:

after Four years' service advocated, *Cubitt*, 66275; *Perree*, 66410, 66427; *Witt*, 66621.

Grant whenever officer can be spared advocated, *Mercer* 66148

Privilege:

Cumulative period, extension advocated, *Hart*, 66075; *McIntosh*, 66174; *Gibson*, 66212; *Cubitt*, 66275; *Perree*, 66410; *Lodge*, 66463; *Witt*, 66621, 66651.

Rule *re* not allowing taking of furlough within interval of 18 months after return to duty should be relaxed, *Witt* 66621

Time taken by officer to reach Bombay or Karachi should be added to period, *McIntosh* 66174

Proposed new rules satisfactory, *Clutterbuck*, 66048; *Hart*, 66075; *McIntosh*, 66174; *Gibson*, 66212; *Cubitt*, 66275; *Monteath*, 66341; *Millett*, 66536.

Reserve should be greater than in other services and should allow of one-fourth of officers being absent at a time, *Lodge* 66463

Study, rules considered satisfactory, but not much use made of, *Hart*, 66093; *Mercer*, 66158.

Leave, Provincial Forest Service:

Allowances, scale advocated, *Hart*, 66083; *Gokul Das*, 66191; *Sen*, 66249; *Hannah*, 66379; *Kanjilal*, 66440; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66573.

Changes suggested satisfactory, 66120; *Gokul Das*, 66191.

Commutation of long leave on half pay to short period on full pay advocated, *Gokul Das*, 66207; *Kavanagh*, 66308.

Conditions ... ... p. 141

Conditions in general sense sufficient, *Millett* 66545

Concession in cost of steamship fares advocated, *Kavanagh* 66312

Date of departure and arrival of officers serving in the hills should be considered when starting from or arriving at nearest railway station, *Gokul Das* 66191

Furlough:

Four years, should qualify as service for pension, *Sataravala* 66593

One year at end of eight years' service advocated, *Hart*, 66083; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66513.

at Shorter intervals advocated, *Gokul Das* 66191

Officers do not take amount to which entitled owing to inadequacy of allowances, *Coombs*, 66137; *Gokul Das*, 66200; *Kanjilal*, 66449.

Officers do not receive amount to which entitled owing to scarcity of officers, *V. Alwar Chetty* 66521

One-sixth of active service at any time advocated, *Srinivasalu* 66660

Privilege:

Cumulative period, extension advocated, *Hart*, 66083; *Gokul Das*, 66191, 66207; *Sen*, 66249; *Kavanagh*, 66308; *Hannah*, 66379; *Kanjilal*, 66440; *Sataravala*, 66593.

Rule not allowing taking of, within six months after return to duty from, should be relaxed, 66120; *Coombs*, 66129; *Sen*, 66249; *Hannah*, 66379; *Kanjilal*, 66440.

for Study leave, advocated, *Sataravala* 66593, 66604

Leave, Provincial Forest Service—*continued.*
Same as Imperial Service advocated, *Kavanagh* 66308
Same rules for all Technical Departments advocated, *Sataravala* 66597
STUDY:
Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66066; *Hart*, 66109; *Mercer*, 66163; *Srinivasalu*, 66677.
no Opportunity at present, *Gokul Das* ... 66199
Three years in 25 years' service, provided whole counts towards pension, preferred to five years' furlough, *Gokul Das* 66191
Three years should count as service, *Hart*, 66083; *Sen*, 66219; *Kanjilal*, 66440.
Lodge, F. A., C.I.E., evidence of ... 66459–66507

M

McIntosh, R., evidence of 66170–66186
Madras:
Civil appointments at Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 153
FOREST DEPARTMENT:
Administration ... ... p. 137
Organisation, *Lodge*, 66469; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508.
Government, memorandum by ... pp. 137–144
Hill stations, Imperial and Provincial officers should be permitted to spend period of six weeks at, on duty annually, at own expense, *Lodge* 66467, 66468
Promotion, slowness, compared with other parts of India, *Lodge* 66479
Rest houses, decision of Government that Forest officers no longer have prior claim to, and that rent must be paid, *Lodge* 66467
(*see also subject headings.*)
Madras Forest College Research Institute, establishment advocated, *Lodge* 66467
Medical Attendance, free, for wives and children advocated, *Coombs*, 66132; *Mercer*, 66151; *Gibson*, 66216; *Sen*, 66253; *Cubitt*, 66279; *Kavanagh*, 66312; *Hannah*, 66383; *Perree*, 66408; *Witt*, 66625.
Mercer, L., evidence of 66144–66169
Millett, G. P., evidence of 66532–66588
Monteath, T. H., evidence of 66337–66374
Muhammadans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913... p. 153

O

Organisation:
Constitution of department, *Hart* 66077
Constitution and organisation, history p. 137–8
Technical head, working directly under and in touch with Government much needed, *Lodge* 66466
Oxford, School of Forestry:
DIPLOMA:
Course, and every opportunity given for practical work, *Schlich* 66739–41
Syllabus same as other universities, *Caccia* 66777
Statement showing age at which probationers for Indian Forest Service took an Honours Degree in Science and the Diploma in Forestry ... ... p. 151–2
Transfer from Coopers Hill, arrangements made, *Schlich* 66742

P

Parsis, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 153
Pay, Imperial Forest Service:
should Commence from date of arrival in India, *Perree* 66407
Comparison of rates in force in 1886, 1890, 1900, and 1913 pp. 118, 122, 123, 126, 135, 136–7, 142, 143–4, 145–6, 146–7, 148–9

Pay, Imperial Forest Service—*continued.*
Conditions ... ... p. 139–40
Higher than officer recruited in India, *Sataravala* 66600
Increments, cessation at Rs. 1,250 and Rs. 1,400 to officers not definitely declared suitable for promotion to administrative rank advocated, *Hart* 66074, 66099
Local allowances for service in Presidency town, grant advocated, *Lodge* 66462
Leave allowances (*see under* Leave).
Satisfactory ... ... p. 146
Scale inadequate, and increase advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66047, 66058, 66070; *Hart*, 66074, 66092, 66105, 66113; *Mercer*, 66147; *McIntosh*, 66173; *Gokul Das*, 66190; *Gibson*, 66211, 66225–6; *Cubitt*, 66274; *Monteath*, 66340, 66354; *Perree*, 66409, 66425; *Lodge*, 66462, 66481–2; *Millett*, 66535, 66560, 66581; *Witt*, 66620, 66628, 66639, 66653; pp. 119, 120, 122, 135.
SPECIAL ALLOWANCES:
for Special unhealthiness, cost of living, etc., advocated, *Lodge*, 66462, 66496; *Witt*, 66625.
Special work, grant advocated, *Lodge* 66462, 66483
TRAVELLING ALLOWANCES:
Distinction between Assistant and Deputy Conservators should be abolished, *Lodge* 66462
Revision of rates advocated, *Lodge*, 66462; *Witt*, 66625, 66631, 66644.
on Transfer:
Inadequate, and actual cost should be covered, *Hart*, 66079; *McIntosh*, 66178; *Mercer*, 66151; *Gibson*, 66216; *Monteath*, 66345; *Perree*, 66408; *Lodge*, 66462; *Millett*, 66534; *Witt*, 66625.
Service no worse off than other services, *Millett* 66559
Pay, Provincial Forest Service:
Allowances, same as Imperial Service advocated, *Kavanagh* 66307
on same Basis as Public Works Department, advocated ... ... p. 124
Comparison of rates in force in 1886, 1890, 1900, and 1913 pp. 118, 123, 127, 135, 136–7, 142, 143–4, 145–6, 146–7, 149
Comparison with Imperial rates, and with Imperial and Provincial rates in Engineers and Telegraphs, *Kavanagh* ... ... p. 43
Comparison with three sister Provincial Services, *Kavanagh* ... ... p. 44
Conditions, *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508; *Millett*, 66544; p. 141.
Increments, low rate, and slow rate of promotion as compared with Imperial Service, and promotion asked for, *Coombs* ... 66128, 66135
Local Allowances, should be regulated in accordance with rates of pay drawn ... ... p. 135
Provision should be made to give old members of service benefit of any increased rate, *Coombs* 66128
REORGANISATION SCHEME:
Increments stopped by, *Coombs* 66127
Little satisfaction given, as interests of existing members not safeguarded, *Coombs* 66128
Revision not needed ... ... p. 121
Rules and practices should be same for both services, 66119; *Coombs*, 66128; *Kanjilal*, 66439.
SAME AS OFFICERS RECRUITED IN ENGLAND:
Advocated, *V. Alwar Chetty* 66512
not Advocated, *Millett* 66543
Same for all Technical Departments advocated, *Sataravala* 66597
Scale adequate to, *Clutterbuck*, 66065; *Hart*, 66092; *Millett*, 66544; pp. 127, 134, 135, 146.
Scale advocated, *Coombs*, 66119, 66128, 66135–6; *Gokul Das*, 66190, 66204, 66205; *Sen*, 66248, 66259, 66268; *Kavanagh*, 66307, 66322–3, 66328; *Hannah*, 66378, p. 51, 66391–2, 66400; *Kanjilal*, 66439; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66512, 66528; *Sataravala*, 66592, 66603; *Srinivasalu*, 66659, p. 91.
Specific disadvantages, and removal advocated, *Gokul Das* 66190
TIME-SCALE:
Continuous, advocated, *Hart*, 66082, 66092, 66107, 66115; *Coombs*, 66128, 66136.
Officers fit for promotion to major charges should be put on, *Earle* ... . p. 134

Pay, Provincial Forest Service—*continued.*
TRAVELLING ALLOWANCES:
Officers classed as second class, those drawing above Rs. 500 should get first class, *Coombs*, 66124, 66132; *Gokul Das*, 66195; *Gibson*, 66244; *Sen*, 66253; *Kavanagh*, 66307; *Kanjilal*, 66439; *Sataravala*, 66597, 66613; *Srinivasalu*, 66659.
Same for all Technical Departments advocated, *Sataravala* 66597
Sufficient, *Millett* 66574
on Transfer, cost should be covered, *Gokul Das*, 66195, 66202; *Kavanagh*, 66312; *Hannah*, 66378; *Kanjilal*, 66439.

Pensions, Imperial Forest Service:
Conditions ... ... p. 140
should be Fixed in sterling, *Clutterbuck*, 66049; *Hart*, 66076; *Mercer*, 66149; *McIntosh*, 66175; *Gibson*, 66213; *Cubitt*, 66276; *Perree*, 66411; *Witt*, 66622.
Inadequate, and scale advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66049; *Hart*, 66076, 66094; *Mercer*, 66149, 66161, 66166; *McIntosh*, 66175; *Gibson*, 66213, 66227, 66234; *Cubitt*, 66276, 66290; *Monteath*, 66342, 66353, 66368; *Perree*, 66411; *Lodge*, 66464, 66484; *Millett*, 66537, 66540, 66564; *Witt*, 66622, 66629, 66642.
Increase not advocated ... ... p. 120
Invalid, inadequate, and scale advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66049; *Hart*, 66076; *Mercer*, 66149, 66161, 66166; *McIntosh*, 66175; *Gibson*, 66213; *Cubitt*, 66276; *Monteath*, 66342; *Perree*, 66411; *Lodge*, 66464; *Millett*, 66537, 66540, 66569; *Witt*, 66622, 66629, 66642.
Option of commuting advocated, *Perree* ... 66411

Pensions, Provincial Forest Service:
Conditions ... ... p. 141
Invalid, scale advocated, *Hart*, 66084; 66121; *Coombs*, 66130; *Gokul Das*, 66192, 66201, 66204; *Sen*, 66250, 66260; *Kavanagh*, 66309; *Hannah*, 66380; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66514; *Sataravala*, 66594.
Retrospective effect should be given to any improvements which may be sanctioned, *Mercer*, 66149; *McIntosh*, 66175; *Cubitt*, 66276; *Lodge*, 66464; *Witt*, 66622.
Rules sufficiently liberal, *Millett* 66547; p. 121
Same rules for all Technical Departments advocated, *Sataravala* 66597
Scale advocated, *Hart*, 66084; 66121; *Coombs*, 66130, 66138; *Gokul Das*, 66192, 66201, 66204; *Sen*, 66250, 66260, 66270; *Kavanagh*, 66309, 66334–5; *Hannah*, 66380; *Kanjilal*, 66441; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66514; *Sataravala*, 66594; *Srinivasalu*, 66661.
after 20 and 25 years advocated, *Lodge*, 66468; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66514, 66523; *Sataravala*, 66594, 66605; *Srinivasalu*, 66661, 66673.

Perree, W. F., evidence of 66406–66435

Probation and Training, Imperial Forest Service:
Allocation of time to practical and theoretical work, *Schlich* 66726
Candidates selected and trained in India, deputation to an English university on a year's probation advocated, *Kavanagh* ... 66305
Comparison with German training, *Dawson* 66822, 66831
ON CONTINENT:
Care should be taken that students acquire thorough working knowledge of few systems of management considered most valuable for India, *Mercer*... 66145
given by Director of Forest Studies, and same for probationers coming from all universities, *Dawson* 66831
Extension of period advocated, *McIntosh*, 66180; *Gibson*, 66209.
Giving up, would be bad thing, as ideal conditions of forestry can be studied, *Clutterbuck* 66057
in France, one year advocated, *Lodge* ... 66471
Importance of, *Hart*, 66089; *Lodge*, 66460; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66531; *Millett*, 66533; *Schlich*, 66735; *Earle*, p. 133.
One year adequate, *La Touche* 66797
after Period of service in India advocated p. 135

Probation and Training, Imperial Forest Service—*continued.*
ON CONTINENT—*continued.*
Satisfactory, *McIntosh* 66171
Supervision necessary, *Cubitt*, 66272, 66284; *Caccia*, 66777; *Dawson*, 66823, 66831; *Stebbing*, 66871; p. 135.
Supplementing by some special training in India necessary, *Lodge* 66488
not more than Three months should be spent in first place visited in Germany, and more time spent in French forests, *Clutterbuck* 66045
Departmental test, open to men to pass as soon as they can, and considered sufficient, *Clutterbuck*, 66057; *McIntosh*, 66180, 66182.
Diploma course, Indian subjects not included, but optional, *Caccia* 66777
Director of Indian Forest Studies should be made responsible for, and should be made professor of university, *Caccia* 66757, 66771, 66795
in Engineering, would probably turn out indifferent Forest officer, *Schlich* 66738
in England, schools handicapped by absence of forests, and, with exception of Oxford, not sufficiently advanced, *Mercer* 66168
no thoroughly Equipped School of Forestry existent at present moment, *Caccia*... ... 66776
in Europe, stipend advocated, *Perree* ... 66407
Extra instruction to selected men advocated, *Schlich* 66741
Final examination, regulations ... ... p. 157
Final position of probationers not entirely governed by marks, *Caccia* 66794
ON FIRST ARRIVAL IN INDIA:
Concentration on language and local conditions advocated, *Hart* 66089
General instructions recently issued by Government of India meet case, *Cubitt*... ... 66272
Method, *Monteath* 66365
Recruits in India should be posted to divisions considered to be most advanced and allowance given to Divisional Officer, *Mercer* 66145, 66157
Tour in different provinces, advantage of, *Witt* 66635, 66654
IN INDIA:
Advocated, *Perree*, 66407, 66426; *Earle*, p. 133.
not Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66057, 66068; *Hart*, 66072, 66089, 66101; *Lodge*, 66489.
not Considered possible to turn out as capable officers as present system, *Drake* ... 66718
no Facilities for teaching higher branches of forestry, although technical scientific knowledge could be as well acquired as in England, *Drake*, 66718; *Caccia*, 66789.
Forests not suitable, and would not be for fifty years, *Stebbing* ... 66872, 66879–81, 66883
AT ONE RESIDENTIAL INSTITUTION:
Advocated, preferably Oxford University, *Clutterbuck*, 66045, 66057, 66062; *Hart*, 66072, 66089, 66102; *Mercer*, 66145; *McIntosh*, 66171; *Gibson*, 66209, 66237–9; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66284; *Monteath*, 66338, 66351; *Perree*, 66407; *Lodge*, 66460, 66471, 66492; *Millett*, 66533, 66552; *Witt*, 66618, 66634; *Schlich*, 66723; p. 120; *Earle*, pp. 133, 134–5, 148.
Definitely controlled and subsidised by India Office advocated, *Caccia* 66767, 66769–70, 66781
Government contributions would naturally be expected, *Schlich* 66729
not Important, provided school at which training is given is efficient. *Dawson* 66812–3, 66846
Professors with Indian experience necessary, *Schlich* 66743–4, 66772
Period ... ... p. 141
Policy of allowing selected students to remain in Europe for additional year's training has already proved of value, but care should be taken in selection of subjects, *Cubitt* ... 66272
PRACTICAL:
should in no Case be less than six months, *Schlich* 66726
on Continent, course, *Drake*, 66712; *Schlich*, 66726; *Caccia*, 66765–6.
PROBATIONARY PERIOD:
Allowances adequate, *Schlich*, 66728; *Caccia*, 66768.
should be Allowed to count as service, *Witt* 66618, 66636.

Probation and Training, Imperial Forest Service —*continued.*
PROBATIONARY PERIOD—*continued.*
in India unnecessary, *Hart*, 66072; *McIntosh*, 66180; *Gibson*, 66209; *Schlich*, 66745.
Period advocated, *Witt*, 66646; *Drake*, 66687, 66688, 66713; *Caccia*, 66780; *La Touche*, 66797; p. 122.
PROBATIONERS:
Age limits ... ... p. 139
First appointment ... ... p. 139
Grant of allowances, *Gibson*, 66220; p. 139.
Period of training of ... ... p. 139
of Recruits at university- or school-leaving age, methods advocated, *Caccia* ... 66756–60
Sound scientific training at universities advocated, *Caccia* 66775
System, *Clutterbuck*, 66057; *Hart*, 66072; *Caccia*, 66762; *Drake*, 66690–2; p. 139.
System satisfactory ... ... pp. 142, 145
System unsatisfactory, *Perree* 66407
Two years at Residential Institution, followed by period on Continent, advocated, *Perree*, 66407; *Millett*, 66533.
University, supplementary, special theoretical and practical instruction for which India Office must make itself responsible advocated, *Caccia*... 66754–5
(*see also* Cambridge, Edinburgh, *and* Oxford Universities.)

Probation and Training, Provincial Forest Service:
on Continent of Europe, sufficiently good Indian material not forthcoming, *Mercer* 66168
Departmental examination, two years should be allowed for passing, failing which, increments should be stopped until qualified, *Coombs* 66126
no Handicap from want of European training, *Kanjilal* 66450
Method and rules ... ... pp. 140–1
Period embracing preliminary test and two years spent at college should be regarded as probationary, *Hannah* 66376
PRELIMINARY COURSE BEFORE ADMISSION TO DEHRA DUN:
Extension to twelve months advocated, *Hannah*, 66376, 66390, 66396; *Srinivasalu*, 66658, 66669.
Limited to six months advocated, *Kanjilal*, 66437, 66455; p. 121.
Reduction to three months:
Advocated, 66117; *Gokul Das*, 66188, 66204
not Advocated, *Clutterbuck* 66064
Suitable, *Clutterbuck*, 66064; *Hart*, 66091.
PROBATIONARY PERIOD:
Reduction to one year advocated, *Hart*, 66081; *Coombs*, 66126; *Sen*, 66246, 66263, 66266; *Kavanagh*, 66305, 66321; *Hannah*, 66377; *Kanjilal*, 66437, 66455; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66510; *Sataravala*, 66590, 66600.
Three years advocated ... ... p. 121
Unnecessary, and abolition advocated, *Srinivasalu* 66658, 66669
Useful, *Millett* 66542, 66583
Probationers, grant of allowances ... ... p. 141
Satisfactory ... ... p. 148
Study leave (*see under* Leave).
Two years at Dehra Dun at Government expense, followed by one year in charge of range and one year on special works advocated, *Gokul Das* 66188, 66199
(*see also* Dehra Dun.)

Provident Fund:
Conditions ... ... p. 142
Considerable number of officers contribute more than compulsory 6¼ per cent., *Clutterbuck* 66059
Interest, higher rate advocated, *Perree*, 66414; *Kanjilal*, 66441, 66448.

Provincial Forest Service:
Cadre, adequate, but many vacancies not filled up, *V. Alwar Chetty* 66522
Considered inferior to Imperial Service as at present understood, *Gokul Das* 66193
Constitution, *Hart* ... ... 66086; p. 140
Difficult to judge what value, would be in future recruited as at present, *Hart* 66096
Equality of treatment with Imperial officers, sufficient progress not made to justify, *Lodge* 66505

Provincial Forest Service—*continued.*
Excellent work done under direct supervision, but for independent charges found very wanting, *Clutterbuck* 66054
great Extension advocated, *Schlich* 66724
Extremely good work done by, *Monteath* ... 66374
Increase in number as compared with Imperial officers would mean loss of efficiency in Service, *Witt* 66636
Precedence given to most junior Imperial officers whose duties and responsibilities alone should entitle them to proper respect, *Kavanagh* 66311
Promotion to Imperial Service (*see under* Recruitment, Imperial Forest Service).
Recruited for entirely different class of work from that discharged by Imperial officers, *Hart* 66086, 66100, 66111
Same initiative and organising powers shown as Imperial officer, *V. Alwar Chetty* ... 66527
(*see also* Conditions of Service, Leave, Pay, *etc.*)

Punjab:
Government, memorandum by ... pp. 118–120
Probationers, number greatly in excess of requirements, *Gokul Das* 66188
PROVINCIAL FOREST SERVICE:
Method of recruitment, *McIntosh* ... 66184
more Popular than in some other provinces, but candidates have not yet come forward possessed of both physical and educational qualifications, *McIntosh* 66184
(*see also subject headings.*)

R

Rangers:
Classes, employment of Imperial officers as Instructors unnecessary, Provincial officers quite competent to carry out work, *Hannah* 66383
Creation of a few grades for, carrying higher pay, advocated, *Sen* 66245
Promotions to Provincial Service (*see under* Recruitment, Provincial Service).
Reorganisation of service advocated, *Lodge* 66468

Recruitment, Imperial Forest Service:
AGE LIMIT:
18–20 advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66044, 66055; *Hart*, 66071, 66088, 66102; *Mercer*, 66144; *Gibson*, 66208; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66282, 66298; *Monteath*, 66337, 66350, 66352, 66358, 66367, 66373; *Perree*, 66406, 66428; *Lodge*, 66459; *Millett*, 66532, 66550, 66576; *Witt*, 66617, 66633; *Earle*, pp. 133, 148.
Recruits reach India at too advanced age under present system, and reduction advocated, *McIntosh*, 66170, 66180; *La Touche*, 66797; pp. 121–2, 134, 148.
School-leaving *v.* university-leaving age, *Drake*, 66687–9, 66701, 66704, 66711, 66714; *Schlich*, 66721–3, 66727, 66737; *Caccia*, 66748–60, 66763, 66767, 66773–4, 66753–4; *La Touche*, 66797; *Dawson*, 66810–11, 66828–30, 66845; *Stebbing*, 66888.
Candidates, qualifications requisite, *Drake*, 66679, 66700, 66702, 66703, 66704, 66705; *Schlich*, 66725, 66736.
COMPETITIVE EXAMINATION:
Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66044, 66054, 66055, 66058, 66062; *Hart*, 66071, 66088, 66102; *Mercer*, 66144; *Gibson*, 66208; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66282, 66283; *Monteath*, 66337, 66350; *Perree*, 66406, 66434; *Lodge*, 66459, 66470; *Millett*, 66532; *Witt*, 66617, 66627, 66633; *Schlich*, 66724, 66747; *Earle*, pp. 133, 148.
Provision for but none yet held, *Drake*, 66679, 66686; *La Touche*, 66799.
Conditions specially influencing decisions of candidates, *Caccia* 66782
DIPLOMA IN FORESTRY AS SUFFICIENT QUALIFICATION:
Dependent upon preliminary qualifications demanded, *Dawson* 66825
not Practicable, *Caccia* 66779
Linguistic test in England not advocated, *Cubitt* 66299
Method, *Clutterbuck*, 66054, 66062; *Hart*, 66071; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66508; *Millett*, 66532; *Drake*, 66680–6, 66717; pp. 118, 121, 134, 138.

Recruitment, Imperial Forest Service—*continued.*
PHYSICAL TEST:
Importance of, and revival of test advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66044, 66056; *Hart*, 66071, 66088; *Mercer*, 66144, 66155; *McIntosh*, 66170, 66180; *Gibson*, 66208, 66218; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66299–300; *Perree*, 66406; *Lodge*, 66459, 66471; *Millett*, 66551; *Witt*, 66617, 66633; pp. 122, 134, 148.
Valueless, *Drake* 66710
PROMOTION FROM PROVINCIAL SERVICE:
Advocated, *Gibson*, 66229, 66231, 66235; *Sen*, 66247, 66256; *Cubitt*, 66287, 66292, 66295, 66302–3; *Hannah*, 66377, 66385; *Srinivasalu*, 66667.
not Advocated, except in cases of exceptional merit, *Perree*, 66406, 66412, 66419, 66432–3, 66432; *Millett*, 66571–2, 66584, 66587; *Earle*, p. 134.
Course of training in England advocated, *Sen*, 66257.
after Five or eight years' service advocated, *Kavanagh*, 66331–2, *Monteath*, 66372.
Improvement of course at Dehra Dun advocated, *Schlich* 66732
Proportion advocated, *Kavanagh* 66304, 66316–7
Only one officer at present fit for, *Witt* 66650
Schemes premature, *Mercer* 66159
Proportion advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66050, 66069; *Hart*, 66110; *McIntosh*, 66176; *Sen*, 66251; *Cubitt*, 66277; *Monteath*, 66343, 66356; *Lodge*, 66465; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509, 66518, 66521.
Rate of, *Hart* 66072, 66089
Recently joined recruits having entered service later in life than predecessors should receive special consideration, *Gibson* 66216
Regulations as to appointment of probationers to Indian Forest Service, 1914 ... p. 156–7
Science degree, stipulation should be removed, *Clutterbuck*, 66044; *Hart*, 66088; *Mercer*, 66144; *McIntosh*, 66170, 66180; *Gibson*, 66208, 66236; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66283; *Monteath*, 66337, 66352, 66359; *Lodge*, 66459; *Millett*, 66532, 66550; *Witt*, 66617; *Dawson*, 66827; p. 134.
SELECTION:
Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66044; *Hart*, 66071; *Mercer*, 66144; *McIntosh*, 66170; *Gibson*, 66208, 66218; *Cubitt*, 66271, 66282, 66283; *Monteath*, 66337, 66350; *Perree*, 66406; *Lodge*, 66459, 66470; *Millett*, 66532; *Witt*, 66617, 66633; *Schlich*, 66724, 66747; *Earle*, pp. 133, 148.
Candidates:
Classified in three grades, and no difficulty in discovering best men, *La Touche* 66798
Degree, requisite qualification, *La Touche* 66799
Committee:
Appointed annually, and not a standing committee, *La Touche* 66804
Constitution, 1911, 1912, and 1913, *Hart*, 66071; *Drake*, 66679.
Constitution advocated, *Mercer*, 66155; *Cubitt*, 66271; *Lodge*, 66501.
not Function to keep in personal touch with Appointments Boards of the universities, *La Touche* 66799
no Indian yet appointed, *La Touche* ... 66801
Recommendations made to Secretary of State which he could accept or not as he chose, *La Touche* ... 66804, 66805
Representation of universities on, would probably be difficult, *La Touche* ... 66804
Retired Forest officer always included, *La Touche* 66798, 66802
Importance of sending out men of certain class, *Schlich* 66724
Intellectual qualities of men not part of, *La Touche* 66798
Medical test not within province of, *La Touche* 66798
Men suited by physique and character, aimed at, *La Touche*... ... ... 66798, 66800
Men with obvious disqualifications would not be selected, *Clutterbuck* 66054
System as perfect as can be devised at present, *Drake* 66719
System satisfactory, *Hart*, 66071; *Dawson*, 66812–4; pp. 123, 142, 145.
System unsatisfactory, *McIntosh*, 66170, 66180; *Perree*, 66407; *Millett*, 66532; *La Touche*, 66797.

Recruitment, Imperial Forest Service—*continued.*
Uniformity in training and in rate of recruitment not attained, *Mercer* 66144
Vacancies advertised, *Drake* 66719

Recruitment, Provincial Forest Service:
AGE LIMIT:
22 advocated, *Kanjilal* 66436, 66454
23 advocated, *V. Alwar Chetty* 66509
Competitive examination advocated, *Coombs*, 66125; *Gokul Das*, 66187, 66196; *Kavanagh*, 66304, 66319; *Lodge*, 66499; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509, 66520.
Direct nomination of selected candidates for special training at Dehra Dun should, in course of time, be only source, *Sataravala* 66589, 66599
Direct appointments advocated, *Caccia* ... 66792
Europeans, good class not attracted, *Millett* 66573
Frequent changes in method to detriment of well-being of service, *Sataravala* ... 66589
Method and rules, *Clutterbuck*, 66064; *Sen*, 66245; *Millett*, 66541; pp. 118, 122, 127, 135, 140.
Method suitable for some time to come, *Srinivasalu* 66657
NOMINATION:
Advocated, *Srinivasalu*, 66678; p. 121,
not Advocated, 66116; *Kavanagh*, 66304, 66319.
OPEN COMPETITION:
Advocated, 66116; *Sen*, 66245, 66261; *Kanjilal*, 66436.
not Advocated, *Clutterbuck* 66064
Qualifications advocated, *Sen* 66245
Physical test and medical examination advocated, *Sen*, 66245, 66261; *Kavanagh*, 66319; *Kanjilal*, 66436; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509; *Sataravala*, 66589.
PROMOTION OF RANGERS:
Advocated, *Lodge*, 66499; *Srinivasalu*, 66657.
not Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66064; 66116; *Coombs*, 66134, 66142; *Caccia*, 66792.
has not Ceased since division of service into Imperial and Provincial, *Clutterbuck* ... 66067
of Great importance, *Hart* 66091, 66108
Limitation to exceptional merit advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66064; *Gokul Das*, 66187; *Monteath*, 66371; *Kanjilal*, 66457; *Millett*, 66541, 66566; *Sataravala*, 66589, 66599; *Srinivasalu*, 66657.
Present rules should continue in force, *Hannah* 66389
Proportion advocated, *Sen*, 66245, 66258, 66267, 66318; *Kanjilal*, 66436; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509, 66520; *Sataravala*, 66589; *Srinivasalu*, 66657, 66668; p. 121.
Rules, *Coombs* 66141
Proportion advocated, *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509, 66518, 66521; *Sataravala*, 66589.
Regulations, Assam, pp. 127–9; Bihar and Orissa, pp. 125–6; Bombay, pp. 147–8; Central Provinces and Berar, pp. 149–50; Punjab, pp. 119–20.
Regulations satisfactory, but educational qualifications of candidates should be gradually raised ... ... p. 123
SELECTION:
Advocated, *Clutterbuck*, 66064; *Coombs*, 66125, 66134; *Gokul Das*, 66187, 66196; *Kanjilal*, 66436; *Lodge*, 66499; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509; p. 121.
Board, reorganised, in each province, desirable, *Mercer* 66162
Class of candidates, *Millett* 66580
Field, question as to extent, *Mercer* ... 66154
Indian University Degree:
should be Required, *Gokul Das* 66187, 66196
Requirement not always necessary, *Hart* 66106
Method dependent on various Local Governments, *Mercer* 66162, 66164
Reason for power being vested in Local Governments, *Mercer* 66168
Standard of educational qualification left in hands of Local Governments, and satisfactory, *Hannah* 66375
from University men advocated, *Kanjilal*, 66436, 66453; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66509, 66520; *Sataravala*, 66611; *Srinivasalu*, 66657, 66674–5.
System satisfactory, *Hart*, 66091; *Hannah*, 66393–4; pp. 127, 135, 148.

Relations with other Services:
Dependence of department on executive head approved, *V. Alwar Chetty* 66525

Relations with other Services—*continued.*
Ill-effects of rigidity of division into Imperial and Provincial naturally accentuated in treatment received from services outside Forest Department, *Srinivasalu* ... 66663
Mistake in calling District Forest Officer Assistant to the Deputy Commissioner, *Witt* 66624
Position of District Forest Officer and Collector, particulars, *Lodge* 66466
Putting Provincial Services of all departments on equal footing would benefit, *Sataravala* 66596
Satisfactory, *Clutterbuck*, 66051; *Hart*, 66078; *Coombs*, 66123; *Mercer*, 66150; *McIntosh*, 66177; *Gokul Das*, 66194; *Gibson*, 66215; *Sen*, 66251; *Cubitt*, 66277; *Monteath*, 66343; *Hannah*, 66382; *Perree*, 66413; *Kanjilal*, 66443; *V. Alwar Chetty*, 66516; *Millett*, 66539; *Witt*, 66630.

Retirement, Compulsory for Inefficiency:
Advocated, *McIntosh*, 66175; *Lodge*, 66464.
Unrestricted powers should not be given, *Mercer* 66161

S

Sataravala, N. D., evidence of 66589–66615
Sen, Lalit Mohan, evidence of ... 66245–66270
Schlich, Sir William, K.C.I.E.:
Evidence of 66720–66747
Statistics furnished by ... ... pp. 150–2
Sikhs, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 153
Sind Circle:
Conservator, appointment recommended, *Millett* 66534, 66562
Staff, *Millett* 66563
Srinivasalu Naidu, Rai Bahadur, evidence of 66656–66678
Stebbing E. P.:
Evidence of 66858–68043
Statistics furnished by ... ... pp. 150, 152
Subordinate Service:
Creation of few posts carrying higher pay advocated, *Coombs* 66122
Lower, small schools in provinces for training, *Hart* 66091
Promotion to Provincial Service (*see under* Recruitment, Provincial Service).
(*see also* Rangers.)
Sudras, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 153

T

Training (*see* Probation and Training).
Travelling Allowances (*see under* Pay).

U

United Provinces:
Charges, practice of placing Imperial Service recruits in charge of major divisions in preference to more experienced Provincial Service officers should be abolished, 66118; *Coombs*, 66127, 66141.
Domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians, character of work, *Clutterbuck* 66067
Extra Deputy Conservators:
Holding major charge of comparatively very minor importance, *Clutterbuck* 66054
Posts vacant because no one could be certified as fit for holding major charge, *Clutterbuck* 66054
Two posts vacant and should be filled up, *Coombs* 66127
Government, memorandum by ... pp. 120–1
(*see also subject headings.*)

W

Witt, D. O., evidence of 66616–66655
Work (*see under* Conditions of Service).

APPENDIX

TO THE

REPORT

OF

THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XV.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

RELATING TO THE

AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT,

Taken at Delhi, Calcutta, Madras, Bombay and London,

WITH

APPENDICES.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	192
Minutes of Evidence	193
Appendices	257
Index	278

N

LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION.

At DELHI, Tuesday, 11th November, 1913.

PAGE.

J. MACKENNA, Esq., I.C.S., Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India and Director of the Agricultural Research Institute, Pusa 193

G. CLARKE, Esq., Agricultural Chemist, Indian Agricultural Service, Cawnpore 201

Lala MADAN MOHAN LAL, Esq., Assistant Professor of Entomology, Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur 205

At CALCUTTA, Thursday, 22nd January, 1914.

E. J. WOODHOUSE, Esq., Principal of the Sabour Agricultural College, Bihar and Orissa 212

Jatindra Nath CHAKRAVARTI, Esq., Agricultural Supervisor, Rangpur, Bengal 220

At MADRAS, Tuesday, 27th January, 1914.

C. A. BARBER, Esq., M.A., D.Sc., Government Sugar-cane Expert 223

M. R. Ry. Rai Bahadur K. RANGACHARIAR AVARGAL, Government Lecturing Botanist, Agricultural College, Coimbatore 227

At BOMBAY, Tuesday, 10th February, 1914.

G. F. KEATINGE, Esq., C.I.E., I.C.S., Director of Agriculture, Bombay 229

Dr. H. H. MANN, Principal, Agricultural College, Poona 233

S. L. AJREKAR, Esq., Assistant Professor of Mycology, Agricultural College, Poona 238

E. J. BUTLER, Esq., Imperial Mycologist 241

S. MILLIGAN, Esq., Imperial Agriculturist 241

C. E. LOW, Esq., C.I.E., I.C.S., Director of Agriculture and Industries, Central Provinces 246

At LONDON, Monday, 4th May, 1914.

F. C. DRAKE, Esq., Secretary, Revenue and Statistics Department, India Office 255

At LONDON, Tuesday, 5th May, 1914.

T. H. MIDDLETON, Esq., C.B., An Assistant Secretary to the Board of Agriculture and Fisheries ... 254

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT,

At Delhi, Tuesday, 11th November, 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, Esq., C.I.E.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—
B. C. BURT, Esq., Deputy Director of Agriculture, Central Circle, Cawnpore.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

J. MACKENNA, Esq., I.C.S., Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India and Director of the Agricultural Research Institute, Pusa.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68044. In this memorandum I propose to deal with the various points of reference as affecting the following branches of the Service:—

(*1*) The Imperial Staff at Pusa and serving under the Government of India.
(*2*) The Imperial Staff in the Provinces.
(*3*) The Provincial or Gazetted Subordinate Staff at Pusa.
(*4*) The Provincial Staff in the Provinces.
(*5*) The Subordinate Staff.

To take these in order: the terms of reference apply equally to the Imperial staff at Pusa and that in the Provinces.

(I AND II) IMPERIAL STAFF AT PUSA AND IN PROVINCES.

68045. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The Indian Agricultural Service is recruited by the Secretary of State in England, and Indians possessing the necessary qualifications may be selected by the Secretary of State. It was decided in 1910 that the time had not yet come for the Government of India to make appointments to this Service by direct selection in India as is done in the case of the Enrolled List of the Finance Department and certain other Services, but the Government of India have, since January, 1912, arranged, on the occurrence of a vacancy, to ascertain before addressing the Secretary of State whether Local Governments have any recommendations to make on behalf of the members of the Provincial Services.

The qualifications required from candidates for appointments are laid down in rules (copy attached) prepared by the Secretary of State in 1910. Candidates must ordinarily be between 23 and 30 years of age, and preference is given to British-born subjects and to distinguished graduates of some University in the British Empire. Officers selected are on probation for three years and must (unless specially exempted) pass an examination in a vernacular language within two years.

These arrangements have worked satisfactorily and have on the whole secured a good class of men. But, as other qualifications than mental capacity and practical experience are necessary for successful work in India, I would suggest that the Secretary of State be assisted in his selection by one or two Anglo-Indians—either members of the Indian Civil Service or of the Indian Agricultural Service—who might help in gauging the general aptitude of candidates and the likelihood of their success in an Indian career.

The above remarks apply to first appointments.

With regard to the recruitment of a staff for Pusa, I consider that the appointments at Pusa should be considered the prizes of the Service and that, when vacancies occur there, the best men from the Provinces should be selected to fill them. This principle should be applied also in officiating vacancies of six months or over. It is absurd (though in some cases inevitable) that a Supernumerary of a few months' service should, as has happened, officiate as an Imperial Expert.

68046.—**(II) System of Training and Probation.**—In theory recruits for the Department join as Supernumeraries on probation and receive a considerable amount of training either at Pusa or in a Provincial Department before they are posted to an independent charge. In practice, however, it has been found practically impossible to do this and, in many cases, men have had to learn local conditions as they could; being posted to independent charges almost immediately on arrival.

Agricultural recruits should, as a rule, be trained in the Provinces to which it is intended to post them ultimately. They can thus begin at once the study of the language. If possible, they should also put in at least three months at Pusa.

Other specialists, *e.g.*, Chemists, Botanists, Entomologists, etc., should have at least one year's training at Pusa before they are posted to provinces. Probationers if not found suitable should be dispensed with and not be retained for the full period of probation.

68047. **(III), (V), and (VI) Conditions of Service, Leave, and Pension.**—These, except in individual cases governed by special agreement, are determined by the European Service Leave Rules and the ordinary Pension Rules of the Civil Service Regulations. Representations on these points, asking for an improvement in the Leave Rules and a pension after 25 years together with a Family Pension Fund on the lines of the Indian Civil Service Fund, have been made by various members of the Service, but it is presumed that the decision of these points as affecting the Agricultural Service will follow the general recommendations made with reference to other Services similarly constituted. As in the case of the Indian Educational Service (Article 403, Civil Service Regulations), a member of the Indian Agricultural Service, if appointed at an age exceeding 25 years, should reckon as service qualifying for pension (Superannuation) the number of completed years by which his age may at the time of appointment have exceeded 25 years.

It should be open to a probationer and to Government to terminate his services before the expiry of the due date on three months' notice on either side and a return passage should be given to him.

The members of the Indian Agricultural Service enjoy the benefits of the General Provident Fund.

68048. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—At first the pay of each officer was determined according to circumstances as he was recruited, but in 1905 a general scale of pay was adopted which followed the lines of that in force in the Education Department. For the first three years the pay was fixed at Rs. 400—30—460 and afterwards at Rs. 500—50—1,000, no exchange compensation being allowed. The bulk of the Imperial officers and all officers in charge of Colleges were given in addition a local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem. Officers serving in Burma are given a local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem provided their aggregate pay and allowances do not exceed Rs. 1,000 per mensem.

Special arrangements have, however, been made in certain cases, either (*a*) by the addition of personal allowances, or (*b*) by granting special rates of pay. There is no fixed pay for the Head of the Department; that enjoyed by the first Inspector-General of Agriculture being put at Rs. 1,750—100—2,250 for him personally, and that now drawn by the Agricultural Adviser being Rs. 2,000. Special terms outside the ordinary rates are also prescribed for Agricultural Engineers.

The scale of pay for Imperial Officers at Pusa and for Imperial Officers in the Provinces is the same; but, as will be seen from paragraph 10 of the rules for appointments to the Indian Agricultural Service, officers filling appointments directly under the Government of India are eligible for local allowances on the following scale:—

	Per mensem. Rs.
From 4th to 10th year of service ...	100
From 11th to 15th year of service ...	150
Over 15 years' service	200

In some cases also personal allowances are given.

I do not consider that the present arrangements as to pay are satisfactory. As at present arranged, a member of the Indian Agricultural Service reaches his maximum pay after 13 years; or probably before he is 40 years of age; and has to continue serving till 55 on the same scale of pay. This is very apt to damp enthusiasm and produce discontent, if not actual indifference. I think, therefore, that the scale of pay should be revised somewhat as follows:—

Probationary years—

	Rs.
1st	400
2nd	430
3rd	460
Confirmed 4th to 13th	500—50—1,000
14th and 15th	1,000
16th to 20th	1,050—50—1,250
21st to end of Service... ...	1,300—50—1,500

The local allowances at Pusa and for Principals of Colleges and the Burma allowance should be retained and the right to grant personal allowances in very exceptional cases when the maximum of salary had been reached might be reserved. In view of the very great importance I attach to Pusa attracting the very best men in the service, I would raise the local allowance to Rs. 250 per mensem irrespective of length of Service.

With regard to Supernumeraries: Officers in the Supernumerary grade should draw the pay of the grade so long as they remain Supernumeraries. But should they, while still Supernumeraries, be gazetted to officiate in a substantive post, they should draw a salary of Rs. 500 per mensem. At present the scale of pay for Supernumerary Officers is Rs. 400—30—430, with rent-free quarters or equivalent house allowance. If the officer is confirmed he is promoted to the grade of Rs. 500—50—1,000, but in this grade 10 per cent. is deducted for house rent, the result being that in the 4th year of his service he draws at least Rs. 10 per mensem less than in his third year. I would suggest that in his 4th year or first year of confirmation an Officer should be exempted from the payment of house rent.

Considerable dissatisfaction has been felt by members of the Service on account of the recruitment of various Officers—in some cases their contemporaries at Cambridge and below them in the class lists—on special rates of pay higher than men of equal standing, who joined the Service in the ordinary way as probationers, are drawing. Without, however, an adequate reserve to meet leave vacancies and to fill permanent vacancies that may occur it is perhaps difficult to prevent this. If a direct appointment has to be made to fill the post of Agricultural Chemist, Entomologist or Economic Botanist it is only natural that a more senior man with some experience should be required; and naturally he expects a higher rate of pay than a probationer. The grievance will disappear as the Service grows older, *i.e.*, as the staff recruited as probationers grow older the chance of pay higher than or as high as they draw being offered to a newly-appointed Officer will become less and less. But up to the present it certainly has been a source of irritation to some of the junior members of the Department.

68049. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—It may be said that no limitations exist in the employment of non-Europeans. Whenever suitable Indians are available their cases are considered, and it may be said that this is a policy which will be steadily pursued. But there are natural limitations which have, up to date, militated against a large employment of Indians. Most of the Indian gentlemen who have obtained the necessary educational qualifications come from the literary and not from the cultivating classes, and in consequence are somewhat deficient in the sympathy which is absolutely essential to success-

ful working with cultivators. For the same reason the efficiency of an Indian Agricultural Officer is greatest when he is employed in the province to which he belongs. Considerations of language, customs, religion, etc., lessen his efficiency when he is taken out of his local conditions. I am of opinion that, for the present, the educated Indian agricultural expert can best be employed on the teaching side or on scientific research: though in the latter case this will mostly be confined to the more accurate sciences like chemistry. The present Mendelian cult in botany requires a scientific imagination, which can only be stimulated by long residence in the scientific atmosphere where it flourishes, and although I am far from suggesting that an Indian student is incapable of acquiring this bent we have not as yet found any instances of its acquisition.

Similarly, I consider that for the present the driving force necessary to stimulate agricultural development must come from Deputy Directors recruited in Europe. That the Department will ultimately contain many Indian gentlemen in its higher grades I have no doubt, but the necessary recruitment of Europeans should not be stopped on that account. The Department must expand, and in a few years the bulk of the recruitment will come from Indian graduates. But at the beginning the leaven must be supplied by European officers till an indigenous agency is available. But expansion should not be delayed till this local material is available.

It is, however, I may say, the fixed policy not only of the Government of India, but of Provincial Departments of Agriculture to recruit Indian candidates whenever suitable ones can be found: and, even at present, there are one or two suitable candidates who will probably receive early appointments.

With regard to the working of the existing division of service into Imperial and Provincial, it may be said that in most Provinces the Provincial Service has not yet been finally graded, but that proposals for revision will come up for sanction as Departments expand and the qualifications of members of the Service become better standardised: at present the Provincial Service is recruited from the best graduates of the Agricultural Colleges of India and, in the higher grades, by men who have had a European or American training.

The members of the Provincial Agricultural Service are not barred from appointment to the Indian Agricultural Service if selected by the Secretary of State, but there is no regular promotion from the Provincial to the Imperial Service, nor are there any "listed" posts. Posts ordinarily held by the Indian Agricultural Service may be held by members of the Provincial Agricultural Service or Subordinate Agricultural Service, but such tenure does not connote promotion to the Indian Agricultural Service, the officers holding the posts remaining as before in the inferior services, and receiving an allowance for the charge. The Provincial Services for Pusa and for the different Provinces are each on a distinct cadre, and Provincial and subordinate officers are recruited and transferred, etc., entirely by the Local Government concerned. It may be added that it is from the Provincial Service that promotion of Indians to the Imperial Service will, as a rule, be made. In the Provincial Service they receive that further practical training which proves their initiative and worth: and obtain the local experience which qualifies them to be useful officers. Promotion from these grades is, I think, on the whole, in the case of Indians, preferable to direct appointment from an English University.

68050. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The relations with the Indian Civil Service are very close, as, since 1906, Provincial Directors of Agriculture have been members of the Indian Civil Service. In 1911 it was decided that the post of the Director should, for the present, be filled by Civilians, but that it should not be specially reserved for them, and that Agricultural Officers should be tried in officiating vacancies as opportunities occurred.

There is now an unanimous demand from the service that Directors of Agriculture should be recruited from the members of the Indian Agricultural Service, the main argument being an analogy with the Forest Public Works Department, Police, etc. This, in my opinion, is no analogy at all. The Departments with which a comparison is made deal with one branch of work only, in which the technical supervision and administrative control can easily be exercised by a member of the Department. In the Agricultural Service we have many branches—Agriculture, Chemistry, Botany, Entomology, Veterinary Science, etc. From what branch are we to take our Director? But apart from the administrative control, the functions of a Director are quite different from those of the head of any other Department. It is in the relations with the general agricultural community that the necessity for a Civilian Director is justified. There is no Department that has such close relations with the people; and, to establish these relations, it is desirable to have an officer who has, by settlement training, get an intimate knowledge of local requirements, a sympathetic appreciation of difficulties and, above all, a thorough knowledge of the vernacular. I do not say that these qualifications cannot be obtained by members of the Agricultural Service, but it seems to me somewhat strange that there should be such a general desire to abandon the special scientific work for which they were recruited in favour of administration. In certain cases when chemists have been appointed principals of colleges they have, on their own admission, done practically no research work; and the administrative duties of a Directorship will practically mean that the officer appointed will absolutely abandon the special line of work for which he was appointed. We must have specialists in administration as well as in science. In agriculture this is especially necessary. It is the link between the research work of the Agricultural Expert and the cultivator that we want to forge, and for this an experienced Indian civilian is, I think, the best qualified.

I do not wish to suggest that intersectional jealousy might seriously affect efficiency; though I think there is reason to anticipate this. There is considerable resentment on the part of the Civil Veterinary Department at the idea of being subordinated to an officer of the Indian Agricultural Service—a junior Service—though they accept a member of the Indian Civil Service as a solution of the position. In my opinion any success achieved up to date has been due to the unity of purpose which has been possible by having a disinterested head. Where this has not been achieved things would have been much worse if a member of the Agricultural Service had been Director.

In my opinion it will be a much better thing for the Department and the agriculture of the country if the legitimate ambitions of the Service are met by a suitable enhancement of pay which will permit of research under conditions of security and contentment. But, if the Civilian Director is retained, there are certain qualifications which should be insisted on. He should be an Officer of about 10 to 12 years' service, who has proved a successful Settlement Officer, well up in the vernacular and known for his sympathy with the people and interest in rural problems. It would be an advantage if he had some training in the principles of agriculture, and he should hold the appointment for five years.

The importance of the question of Rural Development in India appears to me to be assuming such proportions that it is for consideration whether it would not justify the creation of a post of Rural Commissioner in all provinces with a similar appointment in the Government of India. Under this Officer would be placed the Departments of Agriculture, Veterinary Science, Co-

Operative Credit, Industries and Famine or Scarcity. In the provinces he would have such junior assistants for each branch as are necessary; he would continue to be Director of Agriculture, but would be given as Personal Assistant a senior member of the Agricultural Department with a substantial personal allowance, he would be Registrar of Co-operative Credit Societies, and would have, as assistants, a sufficient number of trained juniors.

In the Government of India, the Directorship at Pusa would be revived and given to one of the members of the Pusa Staff. In Veterinary matters the Rural Commissioner would be advised by a senior member of the Civil Veterinary Department to whom, as to the officer at Pusa, an allowance of say Rs. 200 per mensem would be given. In this way the work of the Indian Empire on the lines of rural development would be systematised, and steady and uniform progress along definite lines guaranteed.

I am aware that these proposals go somewhat against the principles of decentralisation; but the development of measures for rural progress is one which must be co-ordinated and studied as a whole and for this reason a centralised controlling agency seems desirable.

Of the other departments of Government with which the Agricultural Department has relations, the Education and Irrigation are the most important. There has been a gratifying amount of collaboration with these Departments in questions which concern both, and the tendency is on the increase.

(III) THE PROVINCIAL (OR UPPER SUBORDINATE) SERVICE AT PUSA.

68051. *GENERAL.*—With the expansion of the Agricultural Department in the superior ranks from 1903 onwards it became necessary to add assistants to experts, but the men then appointed had not for the most part received any previous agricultural training, and it was not possible to lay down any general scale of remuneration. The pay given was fixed tentatively for only a few years ahead, and not infrequently was personal to individual officers and based on their individual merits. This method has not even yet been wholly departed from, and no complete Provincial Service with fixed prospects from recruitment to pension yet exist either in the Imperial Sections or in any province. Some whose position approximates to that of a Provincial Service have been given gazetted rank, but even so the dividing line between "Provincial" and "Subordinate" service is not clearly defined. The reasons for this state of affairs are, briefly, that it cannot yet be said what conditions must eventually be offered to attract suitable candidates, and the present assistants have not reached a stage at which it can be said that they will be qualified to fill the highest posts that would have to be created to make the complete service attractive.

It has been considered unnecessary and impossible to create high posts in a service to which no present officers could hope to rise for a considerable number of years and to fill which it is not certain that they will be qualified. The present position is, therefore, inchoate.

In connection with the Pusa Institute, in 1904 the following staff was sanctioned:—

	Rs.
1. Assistant Agricultural Chemist	250—300
2. Assistant to the Cryptogamic Botanist	200—5—250
3. Assistant to the Entomologist	200—5—250
4. Assistant to the Economic Botanist	200—5—250
5. Veterinary Graduate	200—5—250
6. Teacher of Physics and Mechanics	200—5—250
7. Surveyor	150—5—200

These posts were created on the condition that they should not be filled until the actual necessity arose. The rates of pay were then considered to be the maxima rates for such men as were then obtainable, and it was proposed to employ them on a probationary pay of Rs. 100 per mensem for three years in the first instance and to give them a training for the work required.

Experience, however, showed that it was not necessary to keep the men recruited on the long probationary status, as they were found qualified, and consequently they were confirmed and given the sanctioned scale of pay, viz., Rs. 200—5—250. When it was decided that Pusa should give only post-graduate courses instead of the complete course of five years (three years ordinary and two years post-graduate) the posts of teachers of physics and of surveying were kept vacant for a time and ultimately absorbed.

With the development of the work of the Institute additional posts of assistants on lower scale varying from Rs. 50—75 and Rs. 75—125 were created. In 1907 proposals were made for raising the pay of the subordinate officers, on the strength of development indicated in two Memoranda drawn up by the Imperial Entomologist and the Imperial Mycologist, in which these officers submitted proposals for a Provincial Service on the following scale:—

Pusa.

		Rs.
10	Assistants	100—5—150
10	Do.	200—5—250
5	Do.	250—30—400
6	Do.	300—50—600
31	(total)	

These proposals were not, however, considered by the Government of India because they thought that as the Agricultural Department was in an experimental stage, it was difficult to find suitable candidates for the highly paid posts, and that it was no use creating theoretical posts. It was left to the Inspector-General of Agriculture to employ good men on suitable salaries as they became available, and to submit proposals for such increases as he might consider necessary, treating each case on its own merits and not appointing them on posts created as a general scheme.

Thereafter, on various occasions, the heads of the Sections proposed that the appointments of First Assistant in each Section of the Pusa Institute should be made of sufficient standing, both as regards emoluments and status, to attract the most highly qualified students available in the Science Faculties of Indian Universities or from Agricultural Colleges. As at first constituted, these posts were non-gazetted and carried a pay ordinarily of Rs. 200—5—250. In 1908 the pay of the First Assistants in the Botanical, Mycological and Entomological Sections was raised and that of the First Assistant in the Chemical Section was raised in 1909, the promotion being regarded as personal to incumbents. A scale of Rs. 200—20—500 was sanctioned for each of the First Assistants in the Mycological Section (Mr. Basu) and in the Botanical (Mr. Shevde) who had specialised in English Universities. The same scale was granted for the First Assistant in the Chemical Section (Mr. Sen) as his high Indian University qualifications were considered equal to those of men who had studied in European Universities. The pay of the First Assistant in the Entomological Section (Mr. Misra) was raised to Rs. 200—10—400, and a similar personal rate of pay was also granted to the Second Assistant in the Chemical Section (the late Mr. Kar). Thus the increase varied according to the qualifications and the duties of the Assistants concerned. At this time all the posts of First Assistants and also of the Second Assistant in the Chemical Section were, with a view to improve the status, admitted to gazetted rank. The First Assistant in the Mycological Section subsequently resigned, and the post has been filled up by a fresh recruit, who was at first appointed on Rs. 200—5—250 and subsequently promoted to Rs. 200—20—300. The post of First Assistant in the Botanical Section has been brought under reduction. The First Assistant in the Agricultural

Bacteriological Section, who was originally appointed on the sanctioned scale of Rs. 200—5—250 in 1910, was granted subsequently the increased rate of personal pay of Rs. 200—20—300. At present there is no senior gazetted Assistant in the Section of the Imperial Pathological Entomologist, as this Section is not yet fully developed.

Personal rates of pay of Rs. 150—10—200 were also granted to the 2nd (Mr. Ghosh), 3rd (Mr. Dutt) and 4th Mr. Nowroji) Assistants in the Entomological Section, and the 2nd Assistant (Mr. Mitter), and the 3rd Assistant (Mr. Mitra) in the Mycological Section, who were originally in the grade of Rs. 75—10—125. Thus it will be seen that so far the appointments and the pay have been given on the principle of actual requirements and personal considerations.

Thus, so far, no regular graded Provincial Service has been sanctioned for Pusa. The subordinate staff now consists of men on varying scales of pay, shown in the attached statement (A), from which it will be seen that there are at present 12 different scales:—

	No. of posts.
(1) Rs. 200—20—500	1
(2) Rs. 200—20—400	1
(3) Rs. 200—20—300	3
(4) Rs. 200—10—300	1
(5) Rs. 200—5—250	1
(6) Rs. 150—10—200	5
(7) Rs. 100—10—200	1
(8) Rs. 100—10—150	1
(9) Rs. 75—10—125	15
(10) Rs. 60—8—100	1
(11) Rs. 50—5—75	1
(12) Rs. 50	1
	32

The question of pay and prospects of the subordinates of the Agricultural Department was referred to the Board of Agriculture of 1908 for opinion (*vide* paragraph 43 of the Proceedings)—"The Board considers that the present prospects in the Agricultural Department are insufficient to attract the right stamp of men for the upper subordinate posts, such as First Assistants, Assistants to Experts, Superintendents of Experimental Stations and the like. That the prospects of the upper subordinate staff should be somewhat better than those offered in the Provincial Executive Service, in view of the fact that the service is new and specialised." The Government of India passed no orders on this recommendation, and it was left to Local Governments to take action according to their needs.

68052. No scale has yet been fixed for the pay to be given to officers of the Provincial Service in the Agricultural Department, but the Secretary of State for India has authorised the Government of India to create appointments for the Provincial Agricultural Service on a higher pay than Rs. 400, subject to the financial powers of the Government of India. The pay now given in different Provinces is not uniform, as will be seen from the printed statement of appointments prepared for the Board of Agriculture of 1911 (copy attached). The maximum pay given in the Provinces does not exceed Rs. 400, exceptions being, the two posts of Extra Deputy Directors in Bombay on Rs. 350—50-2—550, and the post of Assistant Director of Agriculture in the United Provinces on Rs. 400—700.

68053. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—As a rule, distinguished science graduates or diplomates of Provincial Agricultural Colleges, or those who have qualified themselves by special training in Indian or foreign universities are selected for appointments for the upper subordinate posts. In some cases, however, men trained in the Department showing special aptitude are, as stated above, promoted to these posts from the lower grades.

This arrangement is satisfactory, but as in the case of the Imperial Service, I would make the higher posts at Pusa the prizes for the best men of the Service, so that from there they may have a prospect of promotion to the Imperial Service. In like manner it is hoped that the provinces will indent on Pusa for its scientific staff to an extent.

68054. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—Newly appointed men are kept on probation for periods varying from six months to one year, and only such men as give promise of following a scientific career and evince sufficient interest in the work of the Department are confirmed in their appointments.

68055. **(III), (V), (VI) Conditions of Service, Leave and Pension.**—Follow the usual rules in the Civil Service Regulations and the Civil Accounts Codes. Any modfications should follow the general decision arrived at for similar grades in other services of like standing, *e.g.*, education.

68056. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—As explained above no regular Provincial or Subordinate Services have been organised for Pusa; the members of the upper subordinate staff are given rates of pay based on special and personal considerations.

The time is, however, rapidly approaching when it will be possible to have a fixed grading, with the understanding that the possibility of promotion to the Imperial Service lies beyond, and the grading might be somewhat on the following scale:—

A.—PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

(Teaching Assistants.)

II Grade.—4 posts on 200—20—500 (16 years).

I Grade.—1 post on 500—30—800.—Very special merit should be insisted on for appointment to this grade.

Should such men not be available the post should not be filled up, and one appointment should be made in the lower grade in lieu of it.

Qualifications necessary for appointment to this Service:—

D.Sc.'s, First Class M.Sc.'s, the best L. Ag.'s who have successfully undergone a post-graduate course at Pusa, or men of equivalent educational qualification, will be eligible for appointment to this Service. Meritorious men may be appointed on promotion from the Subordinate Service—their merit being judged from the standard of their work.

B.—SUBORDINATE SERVICE.

(Laboratory Assistants, Farm Overseers, Veterinary Overseer, etc.)

25 posts on Rs. 75—10—125; 125—5—150; 150—10—250, *i.e.*:—

	Rs.
1st to 6th year of service	75—10—125
7th to 12th year of service	125—5—150
13th to 23rd year of service	150—10—250

Efficiency bar at the stage of Rs. 200. To have gazetted rank on promotion to Rs. 200 stage.

One or two posts on Rs. 300 might be placed on this grade for exceptional qualifications.

Qualifications necessary for appointment to this Service should be the B.Sc. or the L.Ag. degrees. Meritorious men from the Lower Subordinate Service may also be promoted to this Service. But the number of such men in the Service must not ordinarily exceed one-fourth of the strength of the establishment. Those of the present incumbents who do not satisfy the conditions should continue in their present grades.

68057. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—This part of the note deals with the Provincial Service only which is wholly manned by Indians. The limitation of the employment of Europeans and non-Europeans does not therefore come under consideration.

(IV) PROVINCIAL (OR UPPER SUBORDINATE) SERVICE IN THE PROVINCES.

68058. **(I) and (II) Recruitment and Training.**—In the Provinces, particularly in Bengal, Central Provinces, United Provinces, Bombay, Punjab and Madras where the beginnings of a separate Provincial Agricultural Service exist, recruitment may be either by promotion from below, by direct recruitment from outside, or by seconding from other services. As far as is known no definite rules have yet been laid down. Those recruited direct from outside have generally special qualifications acquired either in India, in Europe, or in America or Japan. Some have been deputed to Europe and America at Government expense to fit them for the Service. The Agricultural Colleges at Pusa, Sabour, Coimbatore, Poona, Nagpur, Cawnpore, and Lyallpur are, however, being now more generally utilised for training of candidates for the Service.

It is difficult to see how a competitive examination could be instituted for the Agricultural Service, which needs specialists in different sciences, and selection must remain the only feasible method of recruitment.

When agricultural knowledge is of first importance, that is, for posts on the strictly agricultural side, only distinguished graduates of the Agricultural Colleges or distinguished officers of the Subordinate Agricultural Service should be eligible for appointment.

When, however, an advanced knowledge of a particular science is necessary, other men possessing the necessary qualifications and university distinction, *e.g.*, a graduate with Honours in Chemistry or Botany, may be appointed. In such cases they should undergo special training at Pusa for a period of from one to two years.

The present course of training provided at the Agricultural Colleges, together with some practical experience, seems adequate.

68059. **(III), (V), (VI) Conditions of Service, Leave and Pension.**—The members of the Provincial Service of the Agricultural Department are under the Indian Leave and Pension Rules, as embodied in Chapters XIV to XIX of the Civil Service Regulations.

It is presumed that any conclusions which the Public Services Commission may come to with regard to these Rules will apply also to the Provincial Agricultural Service.

68060. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—*Pay under Local Governments.*—From 1909 to 1911 the Secretary of State's orders were held to preclude creation of any Provincial Agricultural Service post in the Provinces on pay exceeding Rs. 400 per mensem, but the limit has now been removed. The Provinces in which an approximately distinct Provincial Agricutural Service exists are noted separately below:—

(i) *Bombay.*—In 1907, a Provincial Agricultural Service, consisting of Divisional Inspectors and Assistant Professors, was sanctioned, the pay being graded from Rs. 200, rising by biennial increments of Rs. 30 to Rs. 350. In 1911 the appointment of two Extra Deputy Directors of Agriculture on a salary of Rs. 350—50—2—550 was sanctioned.

(ii) *Madras.*—The Service as originally constituted in 1902 was as follows:—

	Rs.
Managers, 1st grade ...	100—10—150
Managers, 2nd grade ...	50—5—100
Assistant Manager ...	25—5—50

In 1909, the appointment of two Assistant Directors of Agriculture on pay of Rs. 250—15—400 was sanctioned by the Government of India.

(iii) *Bengal.*—In 1910, a Provincial Agricultural Service was sanctioned, consisting of:—

	Rs.
5 posts on	250—10—400
3 posts on	150—10—250

(iv) *United Provinces.*—The Service as originally constituted in 1906, consisted of an Upper Division with grades of Rs. 250, 200, 175, 150 and 125.

In 1911 this was superseded by a scheme under which 2 years would be spent on probation on Rs. 200; on confirmation the pay would be Rs. 250—20—500. In the same year one special appointment of Assistant Director with personal pay of Rs. 400—100—3—700 was sanctioned, and 3 other posts of Assistant Director on Rs. 250—20—500. A charge allowance of Rs. 100 is given when an Assistant Director holds charge of a Circle.

(v) *Punjab.*—The staff sanctioned in 1908 consisted of:—

	Rs.
5 Assistant Professors ...	150—10—300
1 Assistant Director ...	300—10—400
2 Assistant Directors ...	150—10—300

The pay of Assistant Professors was subsequently raised to Rs. 150—12-8—400.

(vi) *Assam.*—The staff consists of three Agricultural Supervisors on Rs. 200—10—400, sanctioned in 1906.

(vii) *Central Provinces.*—The staff originally sanctioned in 1907 consisted of fixed grades on Rs. 150, 175, 200, 250. In 1911 an enlarged staff on higher pay was sanctioned, consisting of 12 appointments as follows:—

	Rs.
Two years' probation ...	100—150
On confirmation	200—10—250
And thereafter	30—2—400

(viii) *Burma.*—

	Rs.
1 Superintendent of Farm	150—15—250
3 Overseers	75—5—100
4 Sub-Overseers ...	50—5—75
2 Probationers	30
6 District Agriculturists	50—5—100
3 Specialists Assistants...	150—10—200
2 Junior Assistants ...	75—15—150

I do not think that any general scale can be laid down for the Provincial Services. The rates of pay must be decided by Local Governments. But in any case, they should not be less than those in the Educational Department, and good men should have an opportunity of rising to the Imperial Service by merit.

The other heads of references as regards the Provincial Service do not, in my opinion, call for any remarks.

(V) LOWER SUBORDINATE SERVICE.

68061. Besides the Subordinate and Provincial Services referred to above there are other posts such as those of Assistants, Fieldmen, Laboratory Attendants Setters, etc., on lesser rates of pay ranging from Rs. 10 to Rs. 50, and rising to Rs. 75. It is unnecessary to consider this part of the Service in detail. It may, however, be mentioned that such men who, after experience and training, show special aptitude for scientific or field work are promoted to the Subordinate Service. The subordinate ranks of the Settlement Department form the best recruiting ground for this grade.

MR. J. MACKENNA called and examined.

68062. (*Chairman.*) He had occupied his present position since the beginning of March of the present year. He joined the Indian Civil Service in 1895, since when he had been closely in touch with the economic development of agriculture in India. The Imperial Branch of the Agricultural Department consisted of 65 to 70 officers, two-thirds of whom were engaged in research, and one-third in practical work as Deputy Directors of Agriculture. In the Provinces research and professional functions were combined. For instance, the agricultural chemist was not only engaged in research, but was also a Professor of Agricultural Chemistry. The Deputy Directors had generally been selected

for district work alone, though in one or two cases they might also be employed as Principals of Colleges and Lecturers on agriculture. It was not desirable that one officer should perform double duties; and he thought the positions should be separated. He would like to see Pusa undertaking higher research work, pure and simple, and teaching reduced to a minimum except in the case of very advanced post-graduate Indian students. He had no objection to a very good post-graduate student coming from a Provincial college to work in the Pusa laboratories under specialists. It did not interfere to a great extent with the ordinary work of the laboratories, and it was a great incentive to an Indian student to work under such men as Dr. Butler, Dr. Leather and Mr. Howard. Beyond that, however, he would not have any regular course of teaching at Pusa. He thought it would handicap the work of the specialists there if they had to give set courses of lectures.

68063. Recruitment for the Imperial Service was made by the Secretary of State, who gave weight in his selection to certain qualifications such as a University degree in Arts and Science, or the diploma of a recognised school of agriculture, or practical experience, according to the nature of the vacancy to be filled. He thought the method of selection at present employed was fully satisfactory, provided that the advice of an agricultural officer on leave from India was taken at the time the selection was made. As a matter of fact, that was generally the present practice.

68064. He should recruit Deputy Directors entirely from the sons of English farmers. He did not think the instinct for Deputy Directors' work, except in very exceptional cases, would be acquired unless a man came from the agricultural class in England, and had worked on a moderately sized farm. A man with the practical experience of a farmer's son and a Bachelor of Science degree in agriculture was the best material which could be obtained for the Service. A very large percentage of the present Deputy Directors in the Department were sons of farmers, and performed their work satisfactorily. In the case of Scotsmen, he would prefer them to take an M.A. degree before taking their Bachelor of Science degree. He did not think it was necessary that a chemist should have gained any practical experience in England before being sent to India. A good chemist would soon adapt himself to Indian agricultural chemistry with the help of the special course he had taken in England. It was advisable that a botanist should have been at Cambridge. He suggested that a man arriving from England should be placed under an experienced teacher, in order to obtain the local colour.

68065. Up to the present time, neither in teaching, nor in the research branch, nor in the outdoor work of the Department, was the Indian officer doing the same standard of work as the Imperial Officer, except in one or two special appointments like those of Extra Deputy Director in Bombay where he imagined the powers were almost the same as those of the Deputy Director. The Provincial Service was below the standard of the Imperial Service, and was under the guidance of Imperial Officers. Such a state of affairs was not unnatural because the Service was quite young. The Provincial Service Officer was in charge of one or two farms at the most, while the Deputy Director probably had control of seven or eight farms in a circle. There was at present one Indian in the Imperial branch. He obtained entry by taking a degree at Cambridge, and was selected by the Secretary of State in the ordinary way. Since the written statement had been sent in, the Secretary of State had appointed another Indian from the Punjab to the Imperial Service, with a diploma of the Royal Agricultural Society. A certain number of Indians did apply to the Secretary of State in England for appointment. The Service had attracted a good deal of attention during the last seven or eight years, largely from sections of the community who had no particular connection with agriculture. The acquisition of an agricultural degree in England was not a matter of very great difficulty, and was not of much use unless a candidate had other qualifications. He looked forward to the time, a few years hence, when a considerable proportion of Indian graduates would come into the Service, and his idea was that the Department would best be recruited if some means could be devised for educating the sons of landholders.

68066. He would prefer to make the selection in India, and then send the selected candidate to England to take a special course which would fit him for a post in the Imperial Service as a Deputy Director.

68067. He would not care to make any comparison between the Indian standard of teaching in agriculture and the English standard. He had no doubt that the standard of lecturing was as good in the Indian colleges as in the English colleges. The whole question of agricultural teaching had been giving a great deal of trouble, and it was going to be discussed by the Board of Agriculture in December. He emphasised his desire to see one large centre purely for research. At the present time there were six teaching colleges, one at Cawnpore for the United Provinces, one at Poona for Bombay, one at Nagpur for the Central Provinces, one at Lyallpur for the Punjab, one at Sabour for Bengal and Bihar, and one at Coimbatore for Madras. These colleges were supposed to be teaching up to a standard prescribed by the Board of Agriculture, but some of them did not get very many students to teach. He advised a re-casting of the whole Educational policy, and a multiplication of short courses for actual cultivators, accompanied, if possible, by an alteration of the general educational system of the country; but he had not worked out the details of this. In some ways a college of an up-to-date character, furnishing the best skilled teaching, and of sufficient size to accommodate any number of students, would be preferable to distributing the work over six Provinces; but, after all, a boy liked to study near his own home, and it was necessary to take into account considerations of language and environment. He would hope that a degree from one of the agricultural colleges would sufficiently qualify an Indian for service in the Imperial Branch, but the mere acquisition of a degree was not a difficult task.

68068. He did not know whether the amalgamation of the post of Inspector-General with that of the head of the Pusa establishment was due to considerations of economy. He thought it was part of a policy following the findings of the Decentralisation Commission. The duties of the Inspector-General of Agriculture or Advisor, necessitated a good deal of touring all over the country. He was at present occupied to a very small extent with college work. Things had settled down at Pusa fairly well. All the big administrative problems had been worked out, and the Director was able to devote a large portion of his time to inspection and touring. He thought the two functions could efficiently be combined. If a very difficult point in scientific controversy arose, it might be advisable to have a scientific head who could solve it, but up to the present time there had not been any such problem.

68069. The number of officers now in the Service under the Government of India was certainly not sufficient for teaching and research and outdoor work. He thought the number of Deputy Directors should be largely increased. Some of the larger Provinces would probably require to dissociate teaching and research, and to duplicate their chemists and botanists. He was quite well satisfied from his experience in India that since the Department had been organised, and the post of Deputy Director had been established, there had been an appreciable rise in the standard of agricultural methods owing to the introduction of better varieties of seeds and implements, and improved methods of well-boring and cultivation. There was room for a large increase in the number of experimental farms mainly for seed distribution. There were no scientific seed merchants in India, and for many years to come the Government must

fill that position. The supply of seeds was the vital crux of Indian agriculture. It was essential that there should be an adequate number of Deputy Directors, as apart from mere agriculture, these officers had to do a great deal of administrative work in keeping in touch with the people, either through seed societies or co-operative credit societies. In a word, he considered that in the interests of the country, and especially of the agricultural industry, there was room in the immediate future for a very considerable extension of the Department.

68070. The Director of Agriculture was the head agricultural officer in each province. He (the witness) had no provincial control at all. He visited the Provincial Directors of Agriculture, and advised them on any matter regarding which they required advice. He did not think there was any necessity for the interchange of teachers and Deputy Directors between the various Provinces. The question whether it was better to have an outside officer as head administrator or an officer from inside the Department was complicated. He could not imagine a botanist or chemist coming out from England, and, after four years, clamouring for an administrative appointment. He did not see why a good chemist or a good botanist should have any desire for such a position, and he did not know whether such men would make good administrators. A scheme had been drawn up for his own Province of Burma which, on general lines, would be applicable to other Provinces.

68071. He took the view that the economic development of the country was of as much importance as its administrative development, but agriculture, co-operation, veterinary arts and crafts, were at present lumped together, and for administrative purposes put under a Financial Commissioner or a Board of Revenue, who probably knew nothing about such subjects. He thought every Government ought to have a senior officer to control the rural development of the country. He would like to see a Commissioner at the head of each Province. He thought a post of Rural Commissioner should be created. The various branches which he had just mentioned would derive advantage from a scheme of this kind because the Commissioner would know something about the subject; he would be more or less an expert under whom the agricultural and co-operative and veterinary branches of the work would be placed. He would have no objection to the senior veterinary officer in the Province being attached to him as adviser. In the Agricultural Department difficulty would arise from the fact that the number of chemists and botanists was not very large, but he thought if their pay was sufficiently increased and they were given the prospect of a Pusa appointment, they might be satisfied. The Deputy Director's work was largely administrative, and he thought when there were three or four Deputy Directors in each Province, there was no reason why a senior Deputy should not be called a Director of Agriculture, simply advising on agriculture and not touching chemistry or other scientific subjects.

68072. He would not bring co-operative officers into the agricultural cadre, because the agricultural man had quite enough to do without gaining the technical knowledge necessary for co-operation. The linking up of these two Departments was the main object at the present moment of all Governments that were progressive. He desired to co-ordinate all kindred branches which were working towards the same economical development. The post of Rural Commissioner would normally be held by an Indian Civil Service officer.

68073. With regard to the period of training, he thought in the case of chemists and botanists six months at Pusa under a good man would be sufficient. As regards the agriculturist, he thought it would be as well if he had about a year's training in the Province in which he was to be posted before beginning actual work.

68074. The present training reserve was not adequate. It was with the greatest difficulty that officers obtained leave.

68075. The present time scale was at first adequate to attract a good class of men, but there was now the greatest possible difficulty in the matter of recruitment. He thought the question of pay might have something to do with that.

68076. He would be very much in favour of special regulations with regard to study leave.

68077. There was a general demand for a Family Pension Fund on the same basis as the Indian Civil Pension Fund. He thought the demand put forward by some of the officers of the Service for a pension after 25 years' service was reasonable. They would then retire about 50 to 52. At present men entered the service at an average age of 24 to 26. If optional retirement was allowed after 25 years the Government should have the discretion to retire an officer after the same term of service.

68078. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) There was practically no difference between the duties of the Inspector-General and the office which he held at the present moment. The salary of the Inspector-General rose to Rs. 2,250, and the salary of the post of Agricultural Adviser was Rs. 2,000. He did not know that the local Governments had objected strongly to an officer from one Province advising other Provinces in agricultural matters. His whole service had been spent in Burma, and he admitted that he might feel it inconvenient to criticise operations in Bombay.

68079. There had been a suggestion in the past that Pusa should inaugurate a post-graduate course, but personally he was glad that it had not materialised. He thought it would be bad for the college if some of its best men were tied down to a curriculum. So far, there had not been seen in Indians any evidence of research capacity without supervision. There were some very good Indian Assistants in Pusa, and some very sympathetic specialists, but the general opinion was that Indians were capable of excellent work only if they were supervised. He had heard of Indians who were doing distinguished work in Physical Science in Calcutta, and also of Indians who had proceeded to America and had distinguished themselves in agricultural colleges, and had done excellent research work there. He agreed there might be an advantage in the fact that after retirement Indians would remain in the country, and would push forward scientific agriculture in every direction, but on the other hand Indians desired to obtain a pension at the earliest possible date. Provided that the method of selection which he had mentioned was adopted, he was absolutely in favour of the best Indians being selected and sent abroad with scholarships rather than that the country should be fed constantly with men from outside, who retired at the first opportunity.

68080. (*Mr. Sly.*) There had been several cases of selected men of the Provincial Service being sent to England for training either at the end of their college career or a few years later. The result in one case had been exceedingly promising, and in the other exceedingly doubtful. In the former case the man came from a cultivating class before he entered the agricultural college. He supposed there might be strong objections from the scientific side to a proposal to send Indians to England to be trained in agriculture under conditions which were absolutely different from those of India, but the argument would apply also to Europeans sent out to train Indians. He thought a scheme under which Indians should be wholly trained in India at a high class institution with post-graduate research, such as was contemplated at Pusa, was preferable to a course in England.

68081. In some cases under existing conditions a Deputy Director got into as close touch with the agricultural community as the Director, but in other cases he did not, and never would do so. The objection that an officer appointed to the Directorship from within the Department would have to give up research work in order to take on administrative work would not be valid in cases

where an officer had performed the bulk of his research work by the time he was appointed. If the appointment was to be filled from within the Department instead of by a Civilian, he thought it must be thrown open to all the branches of the Service.

68082. With regard to leave, it had not been brought to his notice that the rule that leave could not be taken until after eight years' service was a serious obstacle to satisfactory recruitment. The present position in regard to the leave reserve of the Department was as follows. There had been a considerable increase in some Provinces in the number of Deputy Directors. The Central Provinces and Madras had said that if they could obtain the number of officers they desired they would make their own leave arrangements. The reserve for his own Department, which used to consist of three agriculturists, had now been reduced to two. That might be sufficient when the Provincial Service had been strengthened to the extent contemplated.

68083. At the present moment the supernumeraries were all fully employed. It would depend upon what duties a man was required to perform whether he was recruited direct to the Provincial Service from the agricultural colleges, or direct from the science graduates of universities. On the agricultural side he thought a student should come from the provincial agricultural colleges, and for the post of Assistant in Botany or Chemistry, a good degree candidate should be selected and be given a special course.

68084. The only College which had been affiliated to a University was Poona. He had not considered the question whether agricultural colleges should or should not be affiliated to a University, but he did not think there was any particular advantage in it. The policy of the Government of India was at present against affiliation, the argument being that dual control was not yet desirable.

68085. (*Mr. Madge.*) In his opinion there was no kind of farming in India which corresponded in any measure with the farming in England. He had never yet seen a man who owned 600 acres in India driving a plough. He should like to see the agricultural student recruited from the sons of zemindars, but the difficulty was to get sufficient agricultural equipment in the ordinary village school, which would bring the son of a cultivator more or less into line with the student at the colleges. His Department were trying to provide that link.

(The witness withdrew.)

G. CLARKE, Esq., Agricultural Chemist, Indian Agricultural Service, Cawnpore.

Written Statement containing the corporate opinion of the officers of the Indian Agricultural Service, United Provinces.*

68086. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—Under the present conditions, the appointments to the Indian Agricultural Service are made by the Secretary of State, without reference to any board of technical advisers, as is the case in other technical services. This system of appointments is unsatisfactory, as it does not provide for the experience and knowledge, necessary to form a correct judgment of the scientific training and qualifications of candidates. Recruitment to the Agricultural Service, therefore, should be by a small Board appointed by the Secretary of State, consisting of agricultural and scientific men of established reputation. One or more officers of Indian experience, preferably from the Agricultural Service, should be on the Board to judge of the probable suitability of a candidate to work under Indian conditions. In any special case this committee should be supplied with full details of the nature of the vacancy to be filled.

68087. **(II) Systems of Training and Probation.**—It has been customary for supernumeraries to be posted to Pusa to undergo a period of training. This has been found in practice to be unsatisfactory. It is suggested that a leave reserve be organised on a provincial basis, in which Provinces with similar conditions are grouped into units. Postings would, in general, be made to this leave reserve, and the period of probation would thus be passed under conditions which the probationer will, in all probability, for some years have to work. It is not by this intended to exclude transfer from one unit to another on appointment to a substantive post. Suitable units would be—(*a*) Punjab, Central Provinces, United Provinces, North-West Frontier Province, Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, Assam; (*b*) Madras, Bombay, and (*c*) Burma. Under present conditions an officer has to pass an examination in a vernacular language within two years of his appointment. This examination is merely qualifying. The present higher standard examinations are not suitable and there is, therefore, little inducement to pass them. It is suggested that the period for passing a qualifying examination be reduced to one year, during which period facilities should be given for learning the language and inducements offered for passing a suitable higher standard examination.

68088. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The present sanctioned pay of the Service is at the rate of Rs. 400, 430, 460 during the first three years in the case of supernumeraries, and after that the pay of the regular establishment rises by annual increments at the rate of Rs. 50 per month, from Rs. 500 to 1,000, reached at the end of 10 years. The Service at present suffers a marked disability in that all officers reach their presumed maximum pay in from 10 to 13 years' service. In this respect the Indian Agricultural Service is worse off than any other Imperial Service. In the Public Works Department Imperial Engineers have a practical certainty of rising to Rs. 1,500, a very fair chance of reaching Rs. 1,800, and a considerable proportion have the opportunity of becoming Chief Engineers on Rs. 2,500. If the Indian Agricultural Service is to continue to attract suitable recruits it must offer approximately equal prospects. It must be remembered that appointments to the Service are, or should be, from men fully qualified professionally. They have had to bear the entire cost of their training. This is not the case in certain other services, *e.g.*, Forests and Police. The injustice of the present scale has been admitted, and some attempt to remedy it has been made by granting a limited number of personal allowances. This system is unfair and would be difficult to administer. It would be impossible to form a fair judgment of the relative claims for allowances of officers performing such diverse duties as Entomologist, Agricultural Chemist and Principal of an Agricultural College. With increase of the number of posts in Home and Colonial Services for men with a scientific training, competition is on the increase. The present pay and prospects, though perhaps sufficient at the time of introduction, fail now to attract to the Service the best men available, and fail to keep good men after they have performed a few years' service.

The following scale of pay is considered sufficient to meet the present disabilities—

Supernumerary.—Rs. 400-430-460.—Officers under this head would only draw the pay of the grade so long as they remain supernumeraries. If gazetted to a substantive post, they should commence drawing salary at the rate of Rs. 500 p.m. from the date of gazetting.

* This statement was signed by the following officers:—Messrs. H. Martin Leake, A. W. Fremantle, G. Clarke, A. E. Parr, B. C. Burt, and A. Wilson.

Establishment.—The time scale as at present in force should be extended to a maximum of 1,500, and, excluding the post of Director of Agriculture, dealt with under section VIII, a provision made for a small percentage of posts at a higher pay.

68089. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The revised rules, as notified under G.G.O. No. 538 C.S.R., dated 13th September, 1912, and now under the consideration of Government, appear satisfactory. In no branch of Government service is frequent leave so important as in a scientific service if officers are to maintain their touch with current work in other countries. It is therefore recommended, in addition, that provision be made for study leave on lines similar to that granted in the case of the Indian Medical Service.

68090. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Under present conditions voluntary retirement can only take place after 30 years' service, or on the attainment of the age of 55. That these terms are severe is generally admitted, and it is strongly recommended that voluntary retirement should be possible, after 25 years' service for pension, as defined in the Civil Service Regulations. It would further add to the attractiveness and, hence, the efficiency, of the service if a system such as is in force in the Indian Medical Service and Forest Service, of progressive pensions which would start after 17 years, were introduced.

68091. **(VII) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans.**—The Service is broadly divisible into two sections, that mainly devoted to research and that mainly devoted to practical agriculture, including the district work.

There is at present no institution, at least in these Provinces, teaching up to the standard required for research. The difficulty arises very largely from the weakness of the elementary education which spoils the student before he comes to college. There is little chance, therefore, even when the college teaching is satisfactory, of his being able to take up research. The difficulty being so deep rooted there does not seem to be any immediate prospect of employing in research any person trained in these Provinces.

As regards the other branch, suitability depends not only on the standard of attainment but on the class of man. It is useless to send a man of the literary classes to instruct cultivators in agricultural procedure. Whatever his attainments, there is small chance of his being acceptable. In that education is now almost entirely limited to the literary classes there seems small chance for for the present of recruiting suitable men for this branch. An attempt to attract men for the Agricultural classes and to give them a training which will fit them either for the Service or to return to their own estates is a most promising line of development. This is, however, hardly the place to develop such a scheme. It suffices to say that for the present no commencement has been made along these lines.

There does not appear therefore to be any immediate possibility of throwing open the Imperial Service to men trained in India. It cannot be too clearly stated that a short course such as an Indian takes when sent to England does not give a broad enough outlook to form a qualification for the Imperial Service. The system of scholarships to England for special training is to be deprecated, and the employment of non-Europeans is therefore limited to men who have spent their early years in England, the Continent, or America. It is possible that at some future date men of sufficient promise will be trained out here. Such men would first enter the Provincial Service, from which opening to the Imperial Service might be given by submission of qualifications, to be considered by the advisory board recommended under I, along with other applications, to the Secretary of State.

While natives of India are at present unsuited for independent charges, they are of considerable value as subordinates, and, in order to attract the best class of men, the pay and prospects of the Subordinate Agricultural Service should be improved. This can be done by the improvement of the initial pay (Rs. 40 per month), and by the creation of better paid posts, with the propects of rising to the pay and status of Deputy Collectors, for men who can hold semi-independent charges.

68092. **(VIII) Relation with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The Service is a highly professional one and it is not merely essential, but inevitable, that its head should be drawn from the Service itself. For a member of the Service holding the appointment of Director, it is recommended that the emoluments be the grade pay with a personal allowance of Rs. 400 per month. It is also suggested that this post be added to those quoted in Article 475, C.S.R., rendering the incumbent eligible for an additional pension of Rs. 1,000 per annum.

Arising out of the mode of origin of the Department from a Department of Land Records and Agriculture, in which the Director was the entire Department, a system has arisen by which the Director in person assumes the role of Professional Advisor. References on professional matters from Government come to him; he may or may not, at will, consult his staff, and, even if he does so, he may in his reply go directly against their opinion. It is his opinion and not that of his staff which goes to Government and is accepted by them as the professional opinion of the Department. This system of what are, in practice, confidential reports is wrong. The Director should in such matters forward the opinion of his staff, and, as a matter of procedure, forward copy of his covering remarks to the officers of his staff who are concerned. This procedure is doubly necessary so long as the Director is not taken from the ranks of the Service, but it is a principle which requires to be permanently accepted.

A minority are in favour of pointing out the obvious danger of adopting the principle, stated in the 1st paragraph of this section, at too early a date. The age of the Agricultural Officers in the United Provinces with scientific technical training in no case exceeds 35 years, and if any one of these were appointed Director at an early date, he would ordinarily hold the appointment until his retirement 20 years hence. If the appointment was only partly a success change would be difficult, and, in any case, a prolonged tenure of such appointment is undesirable. The minority are in favour of adopting as a guiding principle in this matter the view that the appointment should not be held for a longer period than five years.

68093. **(IX) Other points not covered by above.**—It is only natural that, in a young Service, undergoing gradual evolution, certain minor points for dissatisfaction should arise. In that these lead to preferential treatment and consequently give grounds for personal grievances, they are objectionable and require to be removed. The chief are:—

(1) Allowances. No allowances should be granted for the normal work of a post. Allowances should only be given where extra work or extra expense (*e.g.*, entertainment) is involved.

(2) Lack of uniformity in titles. To ensure uniformity similar posts should throughout the Provinces be given indentical titles, and all officers should be gazetted and referred to in official publications as officers of the Indian Agricultural Service. This, for instance, is not done at present in the United Provinces Quarterly Civil List, where some of the titles differ from those used in other Provinces and where the names of officers of the Service appear with those of the Indian Civil Service, Civil Veterinary Department, and Subordinate Services.

MR. G. CLARKE called and examined.

68094. (*Chairman.*) Witness said he was an officer of the Indian Agricultural Service and posted to the United Provinces as Agricultural Chemist to the Department of Land Records and Agriculture. He also carried out the duties of Professor of Chemistry at the Provincial Agricultural College. He attended before the Commission to represent the views of the Imperial officers serving in the United Provinces. He did not represent the Provincial Service.

68095. He was generally satisfied with the regulations for recruitment, but desired to see a Board set up to advise the Secretary of State. The present system of selection by a permanent official of the India Office was considered unsatisfactory, as the permanent official did not possess the necessary qualifications to judge of a candidate's suitability. He would like to see a regular Board of Selection established, consisting of men of known agricultural and scientific reputation. He had been seven years in the service, coming out at the age of 28. He should say the average age at which officers were at present recruited was 25 or 26. He considered 26 a more suitable age than 28, because a man of 26 could have gone through the whole of his course in England and have done original research work, which was very important in the case of specialists.

68096. He would like to see a change in the organisation of the Agricultural Department with regard to the employment of Indians. He would propose to have the service recruited in India divided into two distinct parts. There should be a purely subordinate service, consisting of what might be described as fieldsmen, persons drawn from the cultivating castes and skilled in agricultural operations, beginning at a salary of Rs. 20, rising to Rs. 80. For such a class he suggested that only a vernacular educational test was necessary. Then he would like to see an entirely distinct Provincial Service, divided into two branches, a Lower Provincial Service and an Upper Provincial Service. The Provincial Service would be recruited from distinguished graduates of the Agricultural Colleges, on the nomination of a Selection Committee consisting of the Director of Agriculture, the two senior Deputy Directors of Agriculture, and one or more officers attached to the research section. The lower Provincial Service would have charge of circle farms, act as assistants in the research laboratories, and do the general work of an Upper Subordinate Service. The Upper Provincial Service would consist of men promoted from the Lower Provincial Service after three years' service. The idea was that the best of the Lower Provincial Service men should be passed by selection into the Higher Provincial Service. After serving in the Higher Provincial Service for a number of years, an officer would be eligible for selection for the Imperial Service, and should undergo a course of training at a central college in India providing the highest type of agricultural education, equal to that obtainable in American and English Colleges. He considered the training received in a college of that kind by an Indian who came into direct contact with the agricultural conditions that prevailed in India, was an infinitely superior method of training to that received in an entirely foreign environment, such as the American and English agricultural colleges. Assuming such a central college were established in India, he would not admit the Indian direct into the Imperial Service; he would prefer him to go into the Provincial Service for three years, and then to serve five to seven years in the Higher Provincial Service. That meant that a boy would go to the agricultural college at 17 years of age and pass out at 21; serve three years in the Lower Provincial Service, five to seven years in the Higher Provincial Service, and would then be eligible for selection to the Imperial Branch when he reached the age of 29 or 30, by which time a very fair estimate could be formed of his capacity. Pusa seemed to be the best place for establishing a central institution. He did not think if Pusa was converted to such a purpose it would be lost to India as a research centre. He thought its specialists could undertake the training of a limited number of students in addition to their laboratory research work. It might prove necessary to increase the staff. What he was trying to emphasise was the importance, in his judgment, of the establishment of a first-class college in India with the Indian environment. He thought a young Indian would receive a better training in such an institution than if he were sent to England.

68097. The present salaries paid to officers were affecting recruitment. There was tremendous difficulty in finding officers to come out to India who had really done research work. People who had just left college, and had not learnt methods of research, could be obtained, but when they arrived in India they had to be taught their business. He thought the low prospects offered in the Agricultural Department was the reason for that state of affairs. It compared very unfavourably with any other service requiring a professional training. He thought if the present time scale was raised to Rs. 1,500, with a special increase up to Rs. 1,700 for 25 per cent. of the officers, the disability under which officers were at present labouring would be removed. He felt sure that a concession of this kind would react on recruitment in England.

68098. Facilities for study leave were also asked for. He thought that specialists in particular should keep in touch with the progress of research. In India they were absolutely isolated.

68099. With regard to pensions, he considered 25 years' service was a sufficient period for an officer in the Agricultural Service. The only justification for the proposal that an officer should be given an opportunity of voluntarily retiring after 17 years' service was that it would add to the attractiveness of the Service. For 20 years he thought a very good case could be made out.

68100. The ground for the argument that the head of the Service should be drawn from within the Service was that a scientific head was more sympathetic in dealing with scientific workers. It did not necessarily follow that a specialist in a particular branch of an industry had no faculty for administration. He knew men of highly specialised knowledge in the Department who were great administrators. He did not think an officer drawn from another Service and selected to be head of the Department would normally attribute due importance to the preliminary "spade-work" that the Agricultural Service was doing for agriculture.

68101. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) It would be absolutely necessary for the head of the Department to have special knowledge, in order to appreciate both the importance and the value of the work done by officers.

68102. No great expenditure would be required in order to give effect to his scheme for a central college. The organisation already existed; it merely needed utilising. Pusa was at present a central institution for research. Formerly, it was an institution for teaching and research, but the teaching branch had been abolished. Under his proposal the teaching branch would be revived, and Pusa would again become a college for the highest agricultural training. He considered the original Pusa scheme failed because the Provinces did not support it as a teaching institution. Under his scheme it would be compulsory for all Provinces to send to Pusa the men whom they wished to promote to the Imperial Service.

68103. (*Mr. Madge.*) In his opinion there was no reason why a training in chemistry should not be given in India side by sile with a training in agriculture. The objection to having an Imperial head for the whole of the country he understood was that he would be unable to keep in the closest possible touch with local conditions. He did not think any advantage was gained by sending Indians to England to study. Facilities should be

offered in India for giving a scientific and practical training equal to that given in England.

68104. (*Mr. Sly.*) It was not an absolute necessity, but it was a distinct advantage for a chemist or botanist or mycologist to have a bent for agricultural work. On the assumption that the best chemist was at Pusa, he would send a specialist in chemistry there for one year's training in preference to training him in the Province to which he was to be attached, but it was difficult to lay down any hard and fast rule. He was not in favour of a scheme whereby a certain proportion of specialists, instead of being recruited for the Imperial Service in India, should be engaged for short terms at special rates of salary for the investigation of particular problems in India. He thought if Government desired a man to do his best work in India, it should attract him to an Indian career. It would not be well for the country for a man to come out merely to make as much scientific reputation and money as he could, and then clear out. He did not think there would be any objection to having an efficiency bar, say, at Rs. 1,000 or even at Rs. 1,200, provided that some provision was made to ensure that an officer's case was fully considered by the higher authority. To leave the matter to the caprice of any one person acting without consultation, he thought, would be very much resented. If such a scheme were adopted, Local Governments should be compelled to call in the advice of the Agricultural Adviser.

68105. He thought the scheme for a leave reserve suggested in the written statement was a good way of providing such leave with a minimum of expenditure. It was not an ideal scheme; it was a "halfway house." The ideal system seemed to be far beyond the reach of public funds. He thought a separate leave reserve was required for every particular branch of the Department. The unanimous opinion of the Imperial Officers of the United Provinces was that the strength of the Imperial Service must be increased. Assuming funds, and the present rate of expansion of the Department, there should be room for an addition of twelve officers to the Imperial cadre, half of whom should be Indians. The present number was six. That would simplify leave arrangements considerably.

68106. The unanimous opinion of the Department was that the Directorship should be held by a member of the Department, the particular reason being that it was difficult for a civilian to keep thoroughly in touch with the scientific work of the Department, because he had, as a general rule, no knowledge of science, and could not differentiate between good and bad work. A civilian who had taken honours in science supplemented by an agricultural course, and possessed the same qualifications as were laid down in the rules for recruitment to the Imperial Service might, however, be suitable for the post. Witness added that personally he had not met such. He thought educated Indian agriculturists could be found in the United Provinces suitable for recruitment to the Imperial Service, but he was speaking without experience, because the agricultural college in the United Provinces had been entirely wrongly organised, and was now only beginning where the other Provinces began seven years ago. Very careful selection was required for the Provincial Agricultural Service. He thought the prospects held out by his scheme of three years' service in the Lower Provincial Service and five years in the Higher Provincial Service, with subsequent training and promotion to the Imperial Service, would attract a large number of educated Indians, even although other Provincial Services held out much better prospects and paid a higher initial salary. He thought a sufficient number would be attracted to the Higher Provincial Service, from which he hoped a very good proportion of the Imperial officers would be obtained in the future. He did not think an initial salary of Rs. 125 was too low. He thought the number recruited from the Provincial to the Imperial Service would be a considerable percentage, if it was borne in mind that the Provincial Agricultural Service would always be a small body compared with other Provincial Services.

68107. The course he contemplated for his proposed central Indian college for Provincial officers would be on similar lines to the diploma course in Agriculture at Cambridge. It would be a post-graduate course, partaking of the nature of study leave. It was true that a post-graduate course at Pusa had been tried, and generally condemned as a failure, but he did not think the causes of the failure had been properly enquired into. One of the chief causes was that the courses of instruction were not suitably arranged, and another that the Provinces were not compelled to send selected candidates for the Imperial Service, as should be the case. He considered the course of instruction given at Cawnpore could easily be made equal to that given in the Agricultural Department of the University of Cambridge, and that the work done in the chemical section compared with any bio-chemical work which was being done in any part of Europe. The scientific atmosphere at Cambridge and in England generally was a thing of recent origin, and he did not see why it should not be created in India. He thought every effort should be made to do so.

68108. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The ideal system would be a first-rate agricultural college in each Province, but until sufficient funds were available for that purpose, he thought one central college should be formed, and Pusa might be so reorganised as to serve for the purpose. The difficulty arising out of different conditions in different provinces could be overcome by the Pusa officers touring in the country, and thus acquiring acquaintance with various local conditions. He did not think if Pusa was utilised in the way he suggested there would be any taint of inferiority in the education. The whole essence of his scheme was that the education given at the central college should not bear the taint of inferiority. If it did, then his scheme at once failed. He did not think it would be possible for India to supply her own needs in agricultural science for many years. He could give no definite reason why he suggested there should not be more than 50 per cent. of Indians in the Imperial Service, except that he considered scientific qualifications were not at present highly developed in Indians, and it would take a large number of years to develop them. Many English agricultural officers were showing distinct scientific aptitude in special Departments in India. Many of them were doing a large volume of original work which would bear comparison with the best work that was being done in any part of the world.

68109. (*Mr. Burt.*) Beyond supplying the fullest details of the qualifications required, he did not think the Indian Government should have any voice in the selection of candidates.

68110. It was a fact that the present scale of pay had always been held out as a purely temporary measure, and that every officer on joining had received more or less definite assurances that it was not intended to be the maximum. He, personally, had been told that unofficially. Want of definite prospects above Rs. 1,000 per month had already caused one or two men to leave the service just when they were becoming useful officers.

68111. As far as his personal knowledge went, the Agricultural and Civil Veterinary Departments were at present the only Departments in the United Provinces with a Civilian at the head, except the Judicial, Excise and Revenue Departments, which were purely administrative. In every other country in the world the Agricultural Department had a specialist in charge. With regard to the argument as to the extreme variety of the work in the Agricultural Department he pointed out that the same conditions prevailed in the Forestry Department, which had a specialist at the head, so that this objection to appointing a member of the Indian Agricultural Service to the

post of Director disappeared altogether. He thought that Mr. Mackenna's statement that the Director formed the link between the expert and the cultivator was not correct. From his own experience he should say that the Deputy Director was the connecting link. One point in favour of having a central college was that it was desirable that a man, after working in a Province for several years under certain men, who were working along certain lines, should have the advantage of a further course of training, and of doing research work under men working in another school of thought and along different lines. This fresh experience could be better acquired in a central college than in the Provincial colleges.

68112. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He thought it was only a temporary advantage to the Service to have its interest and claims represented by a man who did not actually belong to the Department. A reasonable Government ought soon to learn the value of an expert opinion. As things were at present, he should say that nobody's views would be received so well as a Civilian's, and it was useful to have a Civil Servant at the head of the Department as a temporary measure until this changed.

68113 (*Chairman.*) Witness considered that Mr. Mackenna's scheme for placing all the kindred branches of work concerned with the rural development of the country under the control of a Rural Commissioner was quite practicable, but he would prefer that the officer in charge of all these branches should also be a Secretary to Government.

(The witness withdrew.)

LALA MADAN MOHAN LAL, Assistant Professor of Entomology, Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur.

Written Statement containing the views of the members of the Provincial Agricultural Service, Punjab.*

PREAMBLE.

68114. Before giving our evidence under the nine heads mentioned in the Press *Communique* of the Government, Punjab, dated 3rd March, 1913, we wish to explain that our aims regarding agricultural service in India are (*a*) efficiency of management; (*b*) efficiency of training, so that the Department of Agriculture may find men in its own ranks to fill up the highest posts; and (*c*) popular agricultural development in the light of modern scientific discoveries, so that India may occupy an honoured place among the advanced agricultural countries of the world.

Efficient management may be obtained by employing imported scientists, but it is also attainable under qualified Indian scientists. Efficiency of training and popular agricultural development, however, will not be brought about, unless:—

(1) The best Indian intellect is attracted towards agriculture. The term "Indian" applies to all statutory natives of India;

(2) The men of substance find it worth while spending large sums of money in giving their boys specialised scientific training. Adequate scientific training not being obtainable in India, Indian parents sending their boys to foreign countries incur greater expenses for the same training which European boys can get more cheaply in their own countries.

It should be recognised:—

(1) That no lucrative agricultural career is open to the Indian youth; and

(2) That the majority of Indian landowners educate their boys not for managing their own lands, which may sometimes not be considered extensive enough for a man to devote himself entirely to them, but usually the profits derived from them under the management of an agent are regarded as sufficient. They educate them instead for entering into some department of public service, in which alone they find "Izzat." We find no reasons to hope that any number of foreign scientists will ever bring about the desired result, viz., the agricultural development of India on an extensive scale. They may carry on experiments, and may establish valuable data, or solve some problems of economic interest, but this will be far short of the progress of the Indian people as a nation. We therefore think (*a*) that side by side with the employment of foreign scientists, which must more or less continue at present, steps should be taken to induce the development of Indian scientists in large numbers; (*b*) that under the present circumstances this development will not be induced unless Indian intellect and money are attracted towards agriculture; (*c*) that this attraction can only be exerted by Government's ensuring that Indian agricultural scientists in Government employment will have a career about as lucrative as that in any other department of public service; and (*d*) that the best way of doing this would be to have a general Agricultural Service in India, not divided into Imperial and Provincial, so that Indians of merit and character will have the incentive of expecting to rise to the highest post in the Service. This, as we will explain later on, would present no administrative difficulties.

On all these considerations the basis of our evidence therefore is:—

(1) That the present division of the Agricultural Service into Imperial and Provincial is harmful to Indian development, and should be abolished: a purely scientific Department such as that of Agriculture does not possess administrative needs in favour of such a distinction;

(2) That other measures may be taken to promote the growth of Indian scientists; and

(3) That gradually as these measures succeed the importation of foreign scientists into India should be checked, and ultimately stopped. If a special case should afterwards arise, when it may be advisable to import a foreign scientist, it can be treated specially.

68115. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—Before dealing with the method of recruitment, we wish to say a few words about the recruiting ground.

The Recruiting Ground.—There is at present no adequate recruiting ground, *i.e.*, specialists are not available in sufficient numbers in India for agricultural service to start independent work immediately. Even many of the imported scientists are no better in this respect and need just as much training as an intelligent Indian would before they are fit for an independent charge. The aim, therefore, should be that India may become exclusively the recruiting ground for all agricultural appointments, exceptions occurring only when importation may be specially desirable. A proper recruiting ground for the agricultural service should have adequate provisions for general education as well as for specialised training. The Indian recruiting ground, therefore, should be:—

(1) The lower grades of service in the Agricultural Department, which should be so systematised that men in the lower ranks will have opportunities to make themselves fit and show their fitness for higher posts;

(2) Men outside the Department, consisting of Indian scientists of merit and character, who will have got their training at their own expense and

* This statement was signed by the following officers: Messrs. Kharak Singh (Assistant Professor of Agriculture), R. Gopal (Assistant Professor of Economic Botany), Jagat Singh (Assistant Professor of Chemistry), Madan Mohan Lal (Assistant Professor of Entomology), all of the Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur; and by Jagat Singh, for M. Fatteh-ud-Din (Assistant Director of Agriculture, Punjab).

responsibilities. We will speak about the lower grades of Agricultural Service under head II., but concerning the provision for scientific training of Indians in India, we would suggest (*a*) that each Indian University should have a Faculty of Agriculture, and every Agricultural College should be affiliated to some such University; (*b*) that the only degree in Agriculture which these Universities may award to successful students should be that of Bachelor of Agriculture (B.Ag.), so that post-graduate work may not come to be regarded as preparatory for a higher degree examination, but may remain to be judged by the quality of the work done; and (*c*) that the Faculty of Agriculture should have its own matriculation examination, so that on students attaining the middle school standard of education their parents may have to choose the future line of training for them. Thus Indian boys will start specialised training fairly early, which would surely produce a better average agricultural graduate than if the choice is made at a comparatively later stage.

Method of recruitment.—No competitive examination can be instituted for Agricultural Service, which needs specialists in different sciences, and selection must remain the only feasible method of recruitment. It is a general principle that the number and quality of prizes being adequate, the wider the field for selection, the keener will be the competition, for every one will try to do the very best one can so as to excel among many. Such a keen competition tends to produce a better average candidate, and we would recommend—

(1) That selections for all posts carrying a maximum salary higher than Rs. 250 per mensem, whether they be promotions from lower grades of service or direct appointments, should be made for the whole of India by a Selection Committee, which should be composed of—The Agricultural Advisor to the Government of India (President), the Directors of Agriculture of Provinces and the Principals of Agricultural Colleges (members). The selected candidates may be usually appointed to their own respective Provinces, but there should be nothing to prevent their being sent to another Province.

(2) That selections for all posts, the maximum salary for which does not exceed Rs. 250 per mensem, may be made by each Director of Agriculture for his own Province, on the recommendation of a Deputy Director of Agriculture or Principal of an Agricultural College, according as the post may be under one or the other of these officers. These men will remain in their own Provinces until they happen to be selected for a post carrying a higher maximum salary than Rs. 250 per mensem, when they may, if necessary, be sent to another Province.

(3) That for the recruitment to the posts at present held by the Indian Agricultural Service men who are recruited abroad, a method should be introduced by which Indian youths may be selected as probationers and sent abroad for two or three years to work in the most up-to-date laboratories under eminent scientists, on the understanding that if they should work there satisfactorily they will be retained to serve another year of probation in India, which, if satisfactorily completed would entitle them to be made permanent. Our subsequent recommendations regarding allowances to these men will show that this experiment will cost only about as much as importing European young men on Rs. 400—30—460 per mensem on three years' probation, but will give a strong impetus to the development of India. We believe that while this method will not be an extravagant one, it will have far-reaching effects in inducing Indians (who can afford the expenses to go abroad on their own account and become specialists, which they cannot do inside India), so that they may be available for selections when opportunities arise. They will have got into scientific work sufficiently, however, not to give it up, if they do not get Government appointments, and they will certainly do their best to find scientific work elsewhere. As the above advocated method of recruiting Indians may succeed, the recruitment from abroad of young European graduates should be curtailed and ultimately stopped. In time (say, in 20 or 30 years) even such recruitment of Indians involving their being sent abroad on probation, would stop altogether. The impetus for scientific learning will have been given, and fully qualified Indians who will have gone abroad and widened their knowledge at their own expense and responsibility will be available for recruitment under the usual rules concerning probation.

68116. **(II) Systems of Training and Probation.**—Under this head we would recommend—

(*1*) That where a man is promoted from a lower to a higher grade of Service, it should be understood that he has had the requisite training for the higher post, and he should not be required to serve another period of probation. He should also receive the salary of the permanent grade from the date of his appointment to the higher post.

(*2*) That in cases of direct appointments the system of training and the period of probation should vary according to the grade of the post, viz.—Concerning the Indian graduates directly recruited as experts to spend part of their probation period abroad, their training would consist of work in Western laboratories under eminent scientists for a period of two or three years, as the case may be, and in India for a period of one year. The probation period should in these cases be calculated to begin from the time the recruit leaves his home, and on his being made permanent it should count towards furlough and pension. Concerning direct recruits to other posts, a probation period of two years, as at present, which counts towards leave and pension (if the appointment is made a permanent one) is satisfactory.

68117. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The conditions of the Agricultural Service should be such that the best Indian intellect will labour for it, and after entering remain therein. Also they should be such that men of means will spend freely in giving their boys the best agricultural training which cannot be obtained without very considerable expense, inasmuch as the aspirants will have to go abroad. The present conditions of the Provincial Agricultural Service men compare very unfavourably with those of other Services, for instance, the Provincial Civil Service, as the following table will show—

Service.	Starting salary per mensem.	Maximum per mensem.	Average number of years taken for reaching the maximum.	Average number of years for reaching the grade of Rs. 400 per mensem.
	Rs.	Rs.		
Provincial Civil Service (Extra Assistant Commissioners, Sub-Judges, Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioners	250	800	20 years ...	4—7 years.
Provincial Agricultural Service (Assistant Professors and Assistant Directors)	150	400	—	20 years for Assistant Professors, 25 years for Assistant Directors.

The data for the Provincial Civil Service has been obtained from the quarterly Civil List of the Punjab, volume CLX-II., corrected up to 1st January, 1913.

In the Provincial Education Service of the Punjab which was organised in the seventies or eighties the starting salary for Assistant Professors was fixed at Rs. 200 per mensem, but for the Provincial Agricultural Service, organised within the last ten years, it was brought down to Rs. 150 per mensem, while the standard and cost of living has greatly increased since that time.

Inside the Department the responsibilities and duties of Officers of the Provincial Agricultural Service are such as to place them high above the subordinate men in the Service; but their position in other matters (*e.g.*, the distinct mark of inferiority attached to the Provincial Agricultural Service, resulting in the absence of friendly intercourse between the Provincial Agricultural Service and Indian Agricultural Service men; their being in some cases assigned such limits, by their immediate Officers as make them (the Provincial Agricultural Service men) look small and reduce them to all appearances to the level of subordinate non-gazetted assistants, some of whom may be only 3rd class Officers drawing less than Rs. 100 per mensem salary; and their being 2nd class officers (even as some subordinate assistants) their position in other matters, we say, is of such inferiority, that they feel themselves in an uncomfortable situation. The Provincial Agricultural Service men in the College are also without a proper number of assistants due to the undermanning of the Department, so that they are seriously handicapped in attending to research as much as they desire, and which it is very important that they should do.

The Provincial Agricultural Service men, when they were made gazetted Officers, were like the Officers of the Provincial Educational Service, put in the Provincial Government's list, but sometime ago they were transferred to the Financial Commissioner's list, in which their names appear together with those of the Tahsildars. This has affected the status of the Provincial Agricultural Service adversely.

The conditions of salary are such that those who are married cannot afford to give their children even the same standard of education which they themselves have attained.

Their conditions of leave are so rigid that they can get no proper recuperation of their energies, so necessary if one is engaged in teaching which may extend through one's lifetime. It is down on paper (see Director of Agriculture Punjab's letter No. 2904, dated 15th September, 1910), that the Provincial Agricultural Service men are eligible for the experts' posts, but their opportunities to improve themselves under the present conditions are practically *nil*. We are suggesting proper improvements under the respective heads of Salary and Leave.

The need for larger salaries is felt in the various Departments of public service owing to—

(*1*) increased cost of living due to (*a*) dearness of food; Rs. 2 with difficulty go as far as one rupee did some years ago; (*b*) a general rise in the standard of living; and (*c*) a rise in servants' wages. Servants who could be engaged on Rs. 4 per mensem with food are now obtained at Rs. 10 per mensem, with food and clothing.

(*2*) increased expenses of travelling, the railway fares, too, have recently been increased by 50 per cent.;

(*3*) higher expenses of educating one's children. A student's expenses in an Indian College now average Rs. 45 per mensem, whereas some years ago Rs. 20 or Rs. 25 per mensem was enough.

For men busy with scientific work, this need for increased incomes is rendered still greater by—

(*4*) scientific hobbies being expensive;

(*5*) need to go abroad occasionally to widen one's own knowledge and get into line with the latest researches. This need is felt by all scientists, including the Indian Agriculture Service men now imported into India;

(*6*) the fact that the scientific education of their children, combined with post-graduate work and special training, which for higher posts cannot at present be obtained in India and necessitates going abroad, would be much more costly than any other education in the Arts Colleges of India, and costlier than the same scientific education of European children, who have not to go far, and are in many ways helped to obtain their training on comparatively easier terms.

It is only proper to expect that scientists will try to give their children the best scientific education they can afford. In fact, on that hope would rest the future scientific development of India, for if those who would be knowing science intimately may not be inclined to let their boys follow the footsteps of their fathers who else would? In time India will be able to train most of her scientists at home. We would therefore recommend—

(*1*) that the prospects of the Agricultural department as a whole should be improved;

(*2*) that there should be no division into Imperial and Provincial Agricultural services, so that differences will consist in the kind of work and scale of pay without the attachment of an indelible mark of inferiority to one grade of service. The abolition of this division would result in greater harmony throughout the service and its single-hearted devotion to one common good—the agricultural development of India;

(*3*) that the department should from top to bottom be open to Indians, so that the expectation of rising to the highest post in the service would be strong in the hearts of men serving in the lower ranks of the department, and will be an incentive for greater exertions both to them and to students preparing themselves as specialists. There can be no question of listed appointments in the agricultural service, as no administrative needs exist herein (as they do in the Civil Service) rendering a minimum of British officers necessary;

(*4*) that the different grades in the Agricultural Service should so approach each other that in no case a change from a lower grade into a higher one should appear to be a revolutionary one;

(*5*) that the present Assistant Professors and Assistant Directors should be made first class officers with an increased starting salary, rising by annual increments to within the first class limits (*i.e.*, above Rs. 500 per mensem). We have suggested a scheme under head IV., and there should be at least one Professor or Assistant Director, first grade, according to that scale for each province;

(*6*) that rules concerning leave and leave allowances may be so modified as to enable the men to go abroad occasionally on their own responsibility and expense in order to fit themselves for better work. These special rules may be rendered applicable to Indians only when the applicants desire to actually go out of the country;

(*7*) that there should be no difference in the pay and prospects of Indians and Europeans in the Agricultural Service. We have already shown that the needs of Indian scientists in several important respects (*e.g.*, the scientific education of their children) are higher than those of their European brethren;

(*8*) that the present posts of Assistant Professors should be styled Professorships. Similar posts in all the private colleges and in some Government institutions are styled Professorships;

(*9*) that the present "Teaching and Research Assistants" should be styled "Assistant Lecturers and Demonstrators," and one should be attached to each Professor (now styled Assistant Professors);

(*10*) that men should get up to the maximum of their respective grades, automatically, by annual increments;

(*11*) that promotions should be on merit and not on mere seniority;

(*12*) that it may not be essential for a man to wait until he should obtain the maximum of his grade before being appointed to a higher grade.

Thus really capable men will be able to rise quickly, and at no time will there result a block in promotions either for the exceptionally clever or for the average man.

For lower grades than those of the present Assistant Professors and Assistant Directors we would recommend—

(*1*) that men who have drawn a salary of Rs. 150 per mensem in the general agriculture line for three years be eligible for Tahsildarships;

(*2*) that men who have drawn a salary of Rs. 250 in the general agriculture line for five years may be eligible for Extra Assistant Commissionerships. We believe that these men, on account of their intimate knowledge of the agriculture of the province, would make good revenue officers. This will also be a harmless additional attraction for Indians to turn towards agriculture.

68118. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—We have already shown that the conditions of salary of the present Provincial Agricultural Service compare very unfavourably with those of the Provincial Civil Service, for instance. It is essential, however, that the best Indian youths should come forward to join and remain in the Agricultural service. We also explained why there should be no differentiation in the pay and prospects of Indians and Europeans employed in the department. Our recommendations concerning conditions of salary fall under three heads—

(*1*) For the present Provincial Agricultural Service men;

(*2*) for the Indians to be directly recruited as experts according to the method recommended in suggestion (No. 3) under method of recruitment;

(*3*) for the Agricultural Service, as a whole, incorporating the above two.

(1) For the present Provincial Agricultural Service men, to be styled Professors and Assistant Directors as already recommended, we would suggest that their posts be divided into four grades as under:—

Grade.	Scale of pay.	Time taken to reach maximum salary of scale.	Permanent grade or probationary period.	Recruitment.
	Rs.	Years.		
IV. ...	250—20—270	1	2 years probationary ...	Direct.
III. ...	275—25—600	13	Permanent	From other lower grades of permanent service by selection on merit and from grade IV.
II. ...	600—50—800	4	Ditto	From grade III. by selection on merit.
I. ..	800—100—1000,	2	Ditto	From grade II. by selection on merit.

This scheme presents the following advantages:—

(*i*) Probationers would be only 2nd class officers during the two years' period of their probation.

(*ii*) When made permanent they will be 1st class officers, and will therefore be able to mix more freely with officers still higher in rank. Thus there will be closer friendly relations between the two classes, which will be a decided advantage. On the other hand, they will not be far removed from the officers below them, for in the majority of cases they will have been recruited from among them, and in cases of direct appointment to Professorships and Assistant Directorships, the men will have served as 2nd class officers during their two years of probation.

(*iii*) Apart from the higher salaries, the travelling allowances of College Professors will be negligible. The cases of the persent Assistant Professor of Entomology and the Assistant Director of Agriculture, however, who have to do considerable touring, will be different. But they already deserve to be given 1st class travelling allowances on the same considerations as hold good for Superintendents of Post Offices and for Sub-Divisional Officers who, no matter what their salaries may be, draw 1st class travelling allowances.

(2) As for the Indians to be directly recruited as experts, who should serve part of their probationary period abroad under training, as already recommended, we would suggest the following conditions of salary:—

Rupees 250 per mensem plus travelling expenses (2nd class steamer and rail) and all tuition fees during the whole period of their absence from India.

Rupees 400 per mensem during their one year's probation in India.

Rupees 500 in the grade of Rupees 500—50—1,000, on being appointed permanent.

(3) Incorporating the above suggestions we would recommend the following scheme for the whole of the department:—

——	Grade.	Permanent or probationary.	Scale.	Time taken to rise to maximum salary of scale.
			Rs.	Years.
Demonstrators or Assistants in Colleges and Agricultural Assistants	III.	Probationary, two years...	60—5—65	1
Do. ...	II.	Permanent	75—5—100	5
Do. ..	I.	Do.	105—9—120	5
"Assistant Lecturers and Demonstrators" or Sub-Assistant Directors	II.	Probationary, two years...	150—5—155	1
Do. ..	I.	Permanent	160—10—250	9
Professors and Assistant Directors ...	IV.	Probationary, two years...	250—20—270	1
Do. ...	III.	Permanent	275—25—600	13
Do. ...	II.	Do.	600—50—800	4
Do. ...	I.	Do.	800—100—1,000	2
Experts	IV.	(*a*) European probationary in India for three years	400—30—460	2
		(*b*) Indian probationary abroad	Rupees 250 per mensem and travelling expenses and tuition fees	Pay fixed for two or three years as the case may be.
		(*c*) Indian probationer on return to India for one year	Rs. 400	
Experts	III.	Permanent	500—50—1,000	10
Do.	II.	Do.	1,000—100—1,500	5
Do.	I.	Do.	1,500—100—2,000	5

The Imperial experts at Pusa may be in any of the three permanent grades given for experts. The Directors of Agriculture of Provinces and the Agricultural Advisor to the Government of India, however, should be appointed from among the experts, 1st grade, and given such acting allowances as may be considered to be sufficient in the respective cases.

It will be seen from the suggested scheme that direct appointments may be made to four grades carrying starting salaries of Rupees 60, Rupees 150, Rupees 250, and Rupees 400 per mensem, respectively, so that there will be sufficient latitude for dealing with all grades of intellect when Indians will have specialised themselves in India or abroad on their own expense, and will want to get into Service.

Professors and Assistant Directors of the 3rd grade, viz., those in the grade of Rupees 275—25—600 should be eligible for experts grade III. (Rupees 500—50—1,000), and Professors and Assistant Directors of the 2nd and 1st grades should be eligible for experts grade II. (Rupees 1,000—100—1,500).

68119. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—We have already spoken about the importance of going abroad for all scientists. The need is realised by the Indian Agricultural Service men concerning themselves. Much more do Indians stand in need of the same, for simply their living in India will never make them scientists. The conditions of leave under the Civil Service Regulations for the Provincial Services in all departments of public service are not so lenient as for the Imperial Services on the basis, we suppose, that Indians who throng the *provincia* services have not to go so far to their homes as the Europeans, who practically monopolise the *Imperial* ranks. That basis is a reasonable one so far as it goes, for a good many departments of public service, but for scientists, whether they be Indians or Europeans, their needs, as we have already shown, are practically the same, with the balance slightly in favour of Indians, if it leans at all. Indians will be going away from their homes into foreign lands, and their expenses on such trips may in many cases be even more than those of people returning to their homes.

We are therefore of opinion—

(1) That the Civil Service Regulations concerning leave, study leave, and furlough now current and as they be modified in future for the Imperial Services, should be applicable to all officers of the Agricultural Service, the maximum salary of whose grades may be at least Rupees 400 per mensem. A reservation may be made that advantage may be taken of those rules only when the applicants are to actually go out of India. In other cases the rules made for Indians in the Provincial Services should apply;

(2) that for all men drawing less than Rupees 500 per mensem the minimum leave allowance should be Rupees 250 per mensem when they go out of India;

(3) that experts, whether Indians or Europeans, should be treated equally for leave and in all other respects. Concerning officers employed in colleges we would submit that the duties connected with teaching are very exacting, so that they stand in special need of recuperating themselves when vacations begin. The European experts go away to the hills, when summer comes, and are all right, but the Indian members of the staff are not allowed to leave the place, where they have been labouring so that they might also get refreshed by a change of surroundings. We do not find it necessary in the interest of work, nor do we regard it of any ultimate advantage that the Indian members of the staff should be compelled to stay in the College throughout the vacations. If any special work requires their presence they would always be found willing to stay, and it will be their own interest that they should spend their vacations so well that it will help them towards their fitness for better employment. We would, therefore, recommend that the same rules should apply as regards vacations in the Agricultural Colleges as are current for the Educational Service in Arts Colleges, viz.:—(*i*) that college vacations should be allowed on full pay; (*ii*) that privilege leave, if necessary, may be taken at other times on half pay. It is, however, only occasionally that officers in the Educational Service take any privilege leave besides enjoying the vacations; and (*iii*) that college vacations may not be combined with privilege leave, on half pay, except in exceptional cases.

68120. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Considering that the average age in India as compared to that in the British Isles is very low, and that Indians age comparatively early so that many of them do not live to draw any pension at all, and many of those who fortunately see that day are not able to enjoy their pensions for any considerable length of time; we would suggest:—

(*1*) that Indians may be allowed to retire on pension at the age of 50 on medical certificate, and at 55 without medical certificate;

(*2*) that a service of 20 years with medical certificate, and of 25 years without medical certificate should entitle Indians to a pension amounting to half the average salary for the last three years.

In accordance with suggestions made under other heads we would recommend—

(*1*) that the period spent by Indian Agricultural Officers abroad under the rules usually applied to the Imperial Services should count towards pension;

(*2*) that the period of probation spent abroad by Indian graduates recruited directly for experts' posts should count towards pension.

68121. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services in Imperial and Provincal.**—Non-Europeans are at present practically excluded from the Imperial Agricultural Service. The reason for this exclusion does not appear to be a difference in educational qualifications, for there have been Indians who have had similar European qualifications to those of many of the European graduates appointed to the Imperial Agricultural Service, but they have been excluded from the Imperial rank just as much as those possessing only Indian qualifications. We believe that the division of Services into Imperial (recruited from abroad) and Provincial (recruited within India) with a distinctive mark of inferiority attached to the latter, naturally creates the impression in people's minds that the Imperial Service is meant exclusively for Europeans and the Provincial Service for Indians. The distinction, coupled with the fact that higher officials soon get so accustomed to meeting only Europeans in the Imperial grades, that the suggestion of any change in that respect gives them an unpleasant start. We believe that officials in the highest places who can and do take a statesmanlike view of things are free from such prejudice, but it does exist in the lower ranks, and the attitude of responsible recommending officials is often able to neutralise the good intentions which may exist in higher quarters.

Another limitation which exists in the employment of Indians for higher appointments is that in many cases they are denied those posts on the excuse of their being too young, while men considerably younger and with less experience are continually imported for those very posts from abroad. It has become a general rule that before an Indian should be appointed to a post in the Imperial grade he must get pretty nearly old. It seems to us that at the back of it all is the fear that if an Indian is appointed to a higher post while he is in the vigour of his manhood, he may become a very senior officer before the time of his retirement should approach. There can be nothing else against it except that some junior European officers may feel it as an unpleasant situation.

The working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial is not satisfactory as a system. It brands one service as inferior, rendering it of a very low status and leading many men in the Imperial Service to treat the Provincial Service men with insufficient consideration. Exceptions do occur in this respect, but they

only prove the rule. There is thus no friendly intercourse between the two services, and a common *esprit de corps* is not created.

We believe that the abolition of the distinction into Imperial and Provincial Agricultural Services, and the having of one general Agricultural Service for India which would include posts in various grades of salary, as already suggested, would meet the difficulty, and ensure the service being such a contented one that not only will it reflect itself in an evident popularisation of the department, but a decided start of the Indian people in the path of agricultural progress will soon become manifest.

68122. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—We have submitted that in our opinion men employed in the general agriculture line would make useful Revenue Officers. We have suggested that from among these men (*i*) officers who have been drawing a monthly salary of Rs. 150 (the maximum of their scale of pay) for three years, should be eligible for Tahsildarship; (*ii*) officers who have been drawing Rs. 250 per mensem salary (which may be the maximum of their scale of pay) for five years should be eligible of Extra Assistant Commissionership.

68123. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—Lately Government has issued a rule that those serving in the Civil Departments of service as opposed to the military, will in future not be awarded any agricultural land on their retirement from service, as was done previously. We believe that in many cases it will be a good thing for agricultural officers to be given agricultural land on their retirement, to which they may continue to devote their attention in their old age. In many cases their boys too will be found to have interested themselves in agriculture, so that the awarded land will usually remain in good hands. In our opinion, therefore, it would be well if Government would make that rule inapplicable to the Agricultural Service. It will also be a desirable thing, in our opinion, if men employed in the Agricultural Service are treated as "agriculturists" under the Punjab Land Alienation Act, so long as they continue in, or retire on pension, from that service.

LALA MADAN MOHAN LAL called and examined.

68124. (*Chairman.*) Witness was an Assistant Professor of Entomology and also did research work. He had only been in the Service about two years. He had spent one year at Pusa. He had not been to Europe, but obtained his specialised training in Entomology at Pusa.

68125. He would like to see India made the exclusive recruiting ground for the Agricultural Service. He did not suggest any immediate reduction of European Scientists, but only gradually as the measures for promoting the growth of Indian Scientists succeed. A great deal must be done to give further facilities than at present existed for that advanced teaching which was necessary to qualify an Indian for higher posts of independent original work in the Agricultural Department. He must be sent abroad for a couple of years to receive a scientific training as soon as he showed any special capacity for scientific work. At present the Agricultural Service was not popular among Indians, owing to the lack of prospects. Other departments of public service offered better lucrative careers for Indian youths. He agreed with the view that in selecting Indians for primarily practical agricultural posts, *e.g.*, Deputy and Assistant Directorships and Professorships and Assistant Professorships of Agriculture, preference should be given to those who had lived on the land and to those who have gained by education an intimate knowledge of the land. But no very close association with land is essential for specialised sciences such as Entomology or Mycology. He thought most of the sons of landowners received a good type of education at the Indian universities, but they did not do so with a view of entering the Agricultural Department. Given the opportunity and a fair field and open prospects, he thought they would turn their minds in that direction. He had derived full benefit from the year he had spent at Pusa. He did not think it would have benefited him to stay there longer. In his opinion, the man who had received his general agricultural education in India, or had passed through a regular university course in science and then had undergone a post-graduate course at Pusa and in England, would become the best officer for the Service. Thus at present two methods of recruiting Indians in the Imperial Service are available in India:—

(i) Education at the Agricultural College plus Pusa training for directly agricultural posts.

(ii) Education at the universities plus post-graduate work at Pusa, for posts in specialised subjects as Entomology, Mycology, Chemistry, etc.

68126. In both cases European training should be given. With regard to the proposal that Pusa should be made into a central training institution and facilities should not be given to Indian youths for going abroad for scientific studies, he did not think there was in India the same scientific atmosphere as there was in European and American countries, and men got wider views by going abroad. In the interests of proper scientific development in India, Indians should be encouraged to go abroad as often as possible. There was no professor of Entomology in his college, so that he was carrying out the whole work of the Province in the Entomological branch. In other branches where there were professors, the assistant professors had to do most of the teaching work. They did about three or four hours' lecturing every day, with the result that there was practically no time left for research. Practically, the professors were doing the research work and the assistants were doing the teaching.

68127. With regard to the suggested scale of salaries proposed in his written statement, his idea was that the Provincial Agricultural Service men who are gazetted officers should rise automatically to Rs. 600. At present they go up to Rs. 400 only and remain second-class officers. They should be made first-class officers; it would improve their status, which is very desirable, as some of them, *e.g.*, the Assistant Directors of Agriculture and the Assistant Professor of Entomology daily come in contact with the District Officers all over the Province.

68128. Beyond Rs. 600 rise to second and first grade should be on ability. Only men who show special capacity would get to them.

68129. He recommended that pension should be payable to officers after 25 years' service because the work of the Department was so exacting, and Indians in India became comparatively old at an early age. Most Indians died before they had enjoyed their pensions many years. He believed the average age of recruitment to the Provincial Service at the present time was 24 to 25, so that the average age for a Provincial Officer on retirement was about 55. A comparatively small proportion of Indians survived that age.

68130. He desired to see the amalgamation of the Imperial and Provincial Services into one general Agricultural Servie for India, which should be divided into four grades, carrying starting salaries of Rs. 60, Rs. 150, Rs. 250, and Rs. 400 per mensem, respectively. Recruitment into each of those grades would be from the next lower class, as well as by direct entry. The double entry would be a distinct gain, as it gives latitude for dealing with all grades of intellect. The scheme involved a considerable upheaval of the present system. But it would overcome all practical difficulties of the amalgamation of the Imperial and Provincial Services. An imported European would always begin in the highest grade

—the grade of experts—hence under the scheme he was recommending the amalgamation of the two services would not adversely affect his status. And an Indian who comes in the Provincial Service now would begin in the humble grade of Rs. 250 and he would go into the higher grades only when he earns it by hard meritorious work. And this gradation of the Service would improve the status of Indians. The idea was that the Indian element in the higher Agricultural Service must be strengthened. And there should be no such invidious distinction between the Europeans and Indians in the service, as the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial necessarily creates. Agriculture was a domestic industry, and if Indians were available, they should be given an opportunity of service. The present grades of pay for the Indians in the Service were very low and did not attract a suitable class of man to stick to the Service. He comes to the Department for a short period to gain experience. If the prospects were made better, if there was no division of the Service into Provincial and Imperial, and if there was no invidious distinction between men in the same grade, Indians of higher education would be attracted to the Department and stick to it. He admitted that those objects could be in part at any rate attained without such a complete reconstruction as he suggested. The chief thing was to encourage scientific training along with agricultural studies amongst Indian youths and the abolition of distinction into Imperial and Provincial Services, so that Indians could expect to rise to higher posts, and in the opinion of the members of the Provincial Service the scheme they have suggested regarding posts in various grades of salary will give about the best and most practical solution of the problem.

68131. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The reason why Mr. Gopal had not attended before the Committee was because he had left the Service for another appointment in Kashmir. Mr. Gopal had been in the Agricultural Provincial Service, and his qualifications were excellent. He was an M.A. of the Punjab University and an M.R.A.C. and N.D.O., etc., of England. He had left the Department because the prospects were not good enough for him. His grade here was Rs. 250—Rs. 400, yearly increment Rs. 12-8. His salary in Kashmir started at Rs. 400, rising to Rs. 800. Witness, himself, before he joined the Department, took a Bachelor of Science Degree in the Punjab Institute, getting into the second class. He was then deputed by the Government to undergo a course of training at Pusa while he was holding the post of Assistant Professor. All the research work in the Department was performed by himself, in addition to which he had to do five hours' teaching work a week. A European with European qualifications holding the post witness at present held would have been designated Professor and would have been in the Imperial Service.

68132. It would be of great advantage to the country that qualified men after retirement should stay in the country. The practical experience they had gained during their term of office would not be lost to the country. Thus an Indian could serve his country even after retirement and could do work which would be useful to the country. He admitted having made a mistake when, in answer to the Chairman, he said most men connected with the land received a good education. What he meant was that the big landowning class who derive their income from land, mostly through agents, give their boys good education and seek careers for them in the Public Services of the country, and a sufficient number of these young men could be available for the Agricultural Department. But the vast majority of men who in practice are directly connected with land, who work on it, do not send their boys to Universities or to higher schools. He drew a line between these two classes who have connection with land. One has only an indirect connection while the other has a real and direct connection. The vast majority of such men did not go to the Universities, but stayed at home. He saw the necessity of developing some one institution in India, so that Indians could cease to depend altogether upon foreign countries for their training, but under the present conditions there was no such institution in India. He would, therefore, institute a number of scholarships to send suitable young men to foreign countries, and fill whatever vacancies occurred in the Department from among the scholarship-holders. He believed such a scheme would give satisfaction to the young men of the country. There was considerable dissatisfaction amongst men of his own class who felt that a sufficient number of practical careers were not open to them.

68133. So far as he was aware, the Agricultural Colleges were not full. The instruction was given in English. The education at these Colleges was too expensive for the small zemindars and the large zemindars did not seem to be attracted by it. It does not pay them to educate their boys for managing their lands and so they send them to schools and Universities which offer better prospects for getting out into service. He believed if the course of instruction was made satisfactory, and if better Government appointments, both in the Agricultural Department and in the Revenue Service, were thrown open to College diplomates who show interest in land, they might be attracted to the Colleges.

68134. (*Mr. Sly.*) He had not been connected with the land prior to starting his career, nor did he find at the Punjab University any large proportion of students directly connected with the land; there were some sons of cultivators, but not a very large number. One reason why that class had not been attracted to the Agricultural Colleges was that the Department, during the comparatively short period of its existence, had not been able to any great extent to win the confidence of the cultivating classes. They also desired Government appointments, and they would accept positions in the Indian Agricultural Service provided the prospects were good enough. In India, owing to economic conditions, there could be very few workers in the field of science outside the ranks of Government officers.

68135. The course of Entomology at the College was very elementary; it did not compare with the course that had been laid down with regard to Chemistry. That was the reason why there was only an Assistant Professor for this particular subject, but he has all the Provincial work and an Imperial Service man in his Provincial capacity is not called a Professor but an Economic Entomologist or Economic Botanist or Agricultural Chemist, as the case may be.

68136. (*Mr. Madge.*) The only suggestion he could put forward for attracting zemindars to join the Department was the affiliation of the Colleges to a University. Under present conditions scope is very limited for Agricultural students, but if they be given a University degree they can get out into all branches of the Public Services. There were small vernacular classes for small landholders in the Colleges meant for those who cannot afford much time and money on education.

68137. At Lyallpur he performed research, professorial and provincial work. By the last he meant popularising the work of his section amongst the people. When an experiment had been carried out, he tried to introduce it amongst the people. A couple of zemindars were selected in the beginning to test the method, and if it was successful, it spread from place to place. That work was done under his advise and supervision. Most of the administrative work was performed by the Director of Agriculture. He (the witness) undertook provincial work under the Director's supervision.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Calcutta, Thursday, 22nd January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.
R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

E. J. WOODHOUSE, Esq., Principal of the Sabour Agricultural College, Bihar and Orissa.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department, being letters from E. J. Woodhouse, Esq., Principal, Agricultural College, and Economic Botanist to the Government of Bihar and Orissa, to the Director of Agriculture, Bihar and Orissa. (A) No. 287, dated Sabour, the 5th-10th March, 1913; and (B) No. 1,330, dated the 13th July, 1913.

(A)—LETTER OF 5TH–10TH MARCH, 1913.

68138. On behalf of the members of the Imperial Agricultural Service stationed in this province I have the honour to request you to be kind enough to address Government on the subject of the pay and prospects of our Service with a view to the discussion by the Civil Service Commission of the disadvantages under which we labour. I would suggest the following points for consideration:—

(*1*) The present sanctioned pay of the Service is at the rate of Rupees 400, 430, and 460 during the first three years in the case of supernumeraries, and after that the pay of the regular establishment rises by annual increments at the rate Rupees 50 per annum from Rupees 500 to Rupees 1,000 at the end of ten years, but it has been always more or less hoped that this was a temporary measure only intended to tide over the first years of the existence of the Service. At the present time this scale of pay is augmented by extra allowances in the case of some few officers who have reached the maximum and have particular qualifications for bargaining with Government.

(*2*) Under the present system candidates are either appointed as supernumeraries on Rupees 400, 430, and 460 with a view to their undergoing further training in India before being posted to the regular establishment, or are appointed on Rupees 500 direct to posts on the regular establishment. It might be expected that when supernumeraries have completed their training and been posted to substantive appointments similar to those held by persons appointed on the Rupees 500 grade, they should also be promoted to this grade pay, but this has not been the case. Supernumeraries have frequently been promoted to substantive posts, but are always retained on the pay of the supernumerary grade, and so continue throughout their Service to draw Rupees 150 per mensem less than other officers, who have in some cases been appointed to precisely similar posts at the same time and after the same length of service.

(*3*) Again, in the case of those who commence on the Rupees 400, 430, and 460, grade free quarters are allowed, but house rent is deducted from officers on the Rupees 500 grade, with the result that when supernumeraries have served three years and are judged worthy of confirmation in the Service on the Rupees 500 grade they find that they are drawing less pay than in the previous year. In my own case I drew (Rupees 460 less income tax Rupees 10-7-6—) Rupees 449-8-6 per mensem in my third year and (Rupees 500 less Rupees 50 house rent and Rupees 11-6-1 income tax—) Rupees 438-9-11 per mensem in my fourth year. It would seem hardly fair that officers should suffer in pocket from receiving nominal increases of pay.

(*4*) Under the present rules officers reach their maximum pay (Rupees 1,000) in from 10 to 13 years of entering the service and then they remain on that pay until the date of their retirement, while the pay of officers of equal standing in other services is steadily increasing. It is believed that the Secretary of State had decided to consider the whole question when a sufficient number of officers are within reasonable distance of the maximum. Whether this is admitted or not, however, it does not alter the fact that there is at present nothing to tempt good men to remain in the Department for more than the time necessary to enable them to show their worth with a view to obtaining appointments elsewhere. Some of the best men have already left the Service on obtaining more satisfactory posts elsewhere. Moreover, the present low rates of pay are bound to influence recruiting adversely. There are perhaps always a very large number of applicants for appointments in the Indian Agricultural Service, but it is obviously very difficult to obtain candidates of the required standard.

(*5*) I would also point out that the smallness of our numbers precludes any addition to our pay by frequent appointment to posts on a higher grade, while officers of that grade are on leave. In other services it is found that the income of officers is sensibly augmented by such acting allowances.

(*6*) In addition to these considerations it must be remembered that prices are steadily rising, and so even apart from the above considerations pay that might have been considered adequate before 1905 is not adequate at the present time. Reference to the official figures for prices and wages in India will show that the price of common rice at Patna stood at an average of Rupees 2-8 per maund during the years 1901-1905, when the organisation of the Department was being worked out and recruiting was first commenced, while the price has since risen to an average of Rupees 4 per maund for the years 1906-11, an increase which has, of course, also influenced the price of labour.

(*7*) That the Service is beginning to justify its existence can be readily seen from a perusal of the published reports of the Agricultural Departments. In the case of this province, for example, the work done against one insect pest alone has enabled the cultivators over an area of ten thousand acres to reap a full crop for the first time for some fifteen years. The annual saving of some three or more lakhs of rupees as a result of one piece of the Department's work would seem to justify liberal treatment of the Service responsible for this result.

(*8*) In view of the above considerations I would put forward the following tentative proposals for improving the pay and prospects of the members of the Indian Agricultural Service.—

(*i*) That officers only draw pay on the supernumerary grade until such time as they are gazetted to substantive posts.

(*ii*) That the maximum pay of the Service be increased from Rs. 1,000 to Rs. 1,750 in the marginally-noted grade.

Supernumerary Rs. 400, 430 and 460.
Establishment grade 3 Rs. 500—50—1,000.
,, ,, 2 Rs. 1,000—50—1,500.
,, ,, 1 Rs. 1,750.

(*iii*) That the post of Director of Agriculture be thrown open to members of the Service on an additional allowance of Rs. 300 per month, with such other local or house allowances to which heads of other Departments are entitled.

(*iv*) That the maximum pension be earned after 25 years' service (and not after 30 years as at present) and that a smaller pension be granted after 20 years' service, as in the case of the Forest and other Departments.

(*v*) That the amount of the pension be increased in proportion to the increase in salary proposed in paragraph 3) and that additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 now granted only to the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India be granted also to holders of the posts of Provincial Directors of Agriculture and to a proportionate number of those who have devoted themselves with marked success to research rather than to the no more arduous duties of administration.

(B)—Letter of 13th July, 1913.

(*9*) I have the honour to address you on the subject of the work that has been placed in my charge as Principal of the Sabour Agricultural College and Economic Botanist to the Bihar and Orissa Government. The duties of Principal were added to my other duties from 18th June, 1911, and since then my time was taken up largely in getting to understand this branch of work, and studying the problems involved. As a result of the experience that I have gained, I should like to inform you that I am thoroughly dissatisfied with the present state of affairs at Sabour, and to warn you that no useful results whatever are likely to be obtained under the present conditions.

(*10*) *ECONOMIC BOTANIST'S WORK.*—Before discussing the College work, I propose to deal briefly with that of the Biological Section.

Botanical work up to 1911.—Previous to my appointment as Principal, I had been able to devote all my time to botanical work, and was producing satisfactory results on the following lines. As soon as I arrived in Bhagalpur in April, 1908, I took steps to start plant-breeding work without delay. In the absence of any suitable paddy land at Sabour at that time, I devoted myself to the study of the millets and pulses, and later took up sugarcane work with Mr. Taylor. Up to the present time this work has resulted in the publication of a Memoir on Soybeams, a short note on Setaria Italica, besides which sufficient material has been collected for Memoirs on sugarcane and the genus Phaseolus, which will be published whenever I have any time available to write up my notes.

In addition, I was placed in charge of the work of reorganising the exhibitions, and as a result of three years' work, during which time I collected samples of and compiled information concerning all the crops of the province, and made a careful study of the results obtained by the Department and the best methods of attracting and retaining the interest of the public in the Department's recommendations, I worked out an efficient system of conducting exhibitions, and prepared summaries of the Department's recommendations, and also two handbooks containing full directions for the conduct of exhibitions for the use of Secretaries of Exhibitions and the Department's officers. Owing to the neglect of my recommendations as regards the staff required by any scheme for getting into touch with the public, no further progress has been made since I relinquished the supervision of the work in 1912.

The crop-pest work of the Department was placed under my charge from its initiation, and in addition to the publication of a handbook on the pests of the province, the field work has resulted in the prevention of the destruction formerly caused each year by Agrotis on 15,000 bighas of the Mokameh Tal (the value of the crop saved being 2½ lakhs of rupees), and in the introduction of a method of storing potatoes to prevent the very considerable losses caused by the potato moth at Patna and elsewhere.

The teaching work necessitated the formation of a botanic garden, the collection of materials for teaching morphology and the compilation of a descriptive and biological account of the local flora—all of which was making steady progress up to June, 1911.

Position in 1911.—At the time when I was called upon to take over charge of the Principal's duties it was my intention to complete the scientific side of the plant-breeding work on soybeans and sugarcane as soon as possible, and to take up the subject of paddy as soon as I had put the teaching work on a satisfactory footing by the preparation of a text book or a series of lecture notes, and by the publication of a local flora. The organisation of a commercial market garden and a nursery garden (attached to the Botanic Garden) for the supply of seeds and plants of ornamental varieties would also be required if the horticultural teaching was to be made a practical success. The crop-pest work only required extension on the same lines.

(*11*) *Present position.*—Since June, 1911, I have attempted to carry on the above programme of botanical work, but I have found it quite impossible to give sufficient time to it to enable the efficiency hitherto attained to be maintained. I have been able to continue the crop-pest work already in hand but in a very much less thorough manner. Very little field-work in plant-breeding has been possible, with the result that I am not able to follow up the results already obtained. The only time available has been devoted to the preparation of reports or to the routine work of carrying on my cultures until such time as I may be able to deal with them. A vegetable garden has been started, but I am not able to give proper attention to it or to the Botanic Garden. No time can be devoted to the improvement of the courses of instruction or to the training of the staff.

(*12*) It will be seen from the above that, whereas between May, 1908, and June, 1911, I was able to place the Biological Section of the Department's work on a sound footing and to produce results of value (it will be found that about three-quarters of the original papers published by the Department in recent years have originated in my section), since June, 1911, I have only been able to write up the results previously obtained, and to carry on some of my unfinished work, but in a much less efficient manner. It is not surprising, therefore, to find that this branch of the work no longer affords me any satisfaction, and can produce no further results likely to be of economic value. If it is desired to continue both the plant-breeding and teaching work on efficient lines, I should recommend that two botanists be stationed at Sabour, one of whom will do plant breeding and the other supervise the teaching and crop-pest work. Such a scheme is, I believe, already in operation in Madras. I should of course prefer to continue my plant-breeding work, as I consider that there are great possibilities before it. While the botanical work has only recently given cause for dissatisfaction, the same cannot be said of the college work which would appear to have been founded upon a misapprehension. To understand the difficulties of the situation it will be necessary to study the College work in all its bearings.

(*13*) *PRINCIPAL'S WORK.—Duties of Principal.*—I was placed in charge of the College work in June, 1911, in place of Mr. Dodds transferred to Pusa. I undertook this branch of the work in addition to my own duties, as it appeared to be obvious that the problem of the College teaching was then the largest problem before the Department and on it depended the future of the Department.

The amount of miscellaneous work which has to be done by the Principal is very large; in the first place, there is a considerable amount of administrative work in connection with the management of the estate. This work is greater than it should be on account of the delays that have occurred in laying out the estate due to the absence of funds. In the second place, the routine work of organising the teaching work, managing the hotel, checking the accounts and answering correspondence is heavy. This amount of work is quite sufficient to occupy the Principal's time, in addition to the supervision of the teaching of his own subject; and it is quite impossible for him to carry out satisfactory research work as well. The clerical staff is by no means large, and the pay offered has not been sufficient to attract really first-class men, so that an unnecessarily large part of my time has to be devoted to routine work which

should be done by an efficient head clerk. The appointment of a head clerk on Rs. 100 per month would undoubtedly take a great deal of unnecessary routine work and worry off my shoulders, and would leave me free to tackle the larger problems.

In addition to his routine duties, the Principal is presumably expected to work out a proper scheme of education for the College and it is because I am certain that the policy which has led to the founding of the College on its present lines is a hopeless one that I am addressing you now. To make my position clear, it will be necessary to preface a statement of my views with a brief account of the history of the College.

(*14*) *Objects of the College.*—As regards the origin of the College I have always thought that the Provincial Agricultural Colleges scattered over India were founded by Lord Curzon as a part of his general scheme for providing facilities for technical education with the object of encouraging the educated classes to turn their attention to a business life rather than to Government service. The policy laid down for these colleges, has not, however, followed these lines hitherto. The standard curriculum drafted by the Board of Agriculture at Pusa, in 1906, laid down that the object of the colleges was to turn out students (*vide* proceedings of the Board of Agriculture, 1906, item 5*a*) "with a general knowledge of agriculture which would fit them for upper subordinate posts in the Agricultural Department and for employment as Managers of Court of Wards and private Estates." Subsequent experience modified the opinion of the Board, and in 1908 the Board made the following alteration in the above sentence (*vide* proceedings of the Board of Agriculture, 1908, item 73)— "which would fit them for managing their own or private estates, for employment as Managers of Court of Wards Estates, and for upper subordinate posts in the Agricultural Department."

In his speech, made on the occasion of the opening of the College in August 17th, 1908, Sir Andrew Fraser touched on the importance of technical education and drew attention to the uselessness of attempting to train men who were not hereditary agriculturists, but he laid particular stress on the fact that it was experts and executive officers for the Agricultural Department that it was expected to train at the College. In addition, he hoped that land stewards for zamindars' estates would come to the college and that short courses for zamindars would be established at the College or in schools staffed by passed students of the College. The next official pronouncement as regards the purpose of the College will be found in Government Resolution No. 770, of February 19th, 1910, in which it is stated that "the training in the College is not intended to provide an avenue to theProvincial and Subordinate Executive Services and that Government will not recognise the agricultural degree as a qualification for appointment to those services or for the managership of an estate under the Court of Wards. The gist of this pronouncement was incorporated in the prospectus, paragraph 3." "The training will fit students for employment in the Agricultural Department and on private estates .....The diploma will not be regarded as a qualification for Government employment outside the Agricultural Department."

(*15*) *Curriculum of Diploma Course.*—A standard curriculum for the Provincial Agricultural Colleges in India was first prepared by the Board of Agriculture, in 1906, and this was slightly modified at the subsequent Board Meeting in 1908. In 1909 it became necessary to consider the curriculum for the Sabour College and it was decided to follow the spirit of the Board's recommendations (*vide* resolution 9), that the preliminary science training should occupy the first two years of the course and the technical instruction in Agriculture should be given in the later years (*vide* Mr. Dobbs' demi-official, No. 528, of 5th June, 1909). These proposals were accepted by Government. Mr. Dobbs was transferred in 1911, and Mr. Sherrard expressed himself incapable of undertaking the sole charge of the students in the third year, so that it became necessary to alter the Time Table to that given in the standard curriculum, page 1. In June, 1912, Mr. McGowan took over the agricultural teaching.

(*16*) *Previous proposals of increasing popularity of College.*—In the course of my work I could not fail to notice that the students were extremely dissatisfied with the openings before them on leaving the College, and that it was likely that the numbers of students admitted would therefore decrease. On this account, in February, 1912, I wrote a note on the policy of the Department with regard to the College, in which it was shown that the number of admissions to other agricultural Colleges appeared to depend almost entirely on the number of posts under Government that were available. In the absence of such inducements to enter this College the passed students would have to depend on private service, and so I proposed that an Appointment Bureau should be created for the purpose of bringing together land-holders and students requiring posts as land-stewards. At the same time the steady fall in the numbers of admissions due to the uncertain prospects made it appear necessary to take steps to ensure that the Department obtained sufficient recruits annually to replenish wastage and to fill new posts, as they were necessitated by the development of the Department. It therefore appeared to me to be advisable to publish some three years in advance an approximate list of the prospective annual vacancies. These suggestions were not accepted. I have also consulted various people regarding a scheme for starting one of the students on a farm at Government expense, but in view of the difficulty of obtaining lands and the chances of failure in our present state of knowledge and the harm such an occurrence would do. I have not pushed it.

(*17*) *Short Courses.*—A short vernacular course in Agriculture was first organised by Mr. McGowan in August, 1912, for the purpose of teaching improved methods of agriculture to cultivators and zamindars. The course lasted six months. In addition to the practical field work a few lectures were given in Botany, Horticulture, Surveying, Zamindari and Veterinary work, as it was considered not to be advisable to keep the students working in the field continuously. Nine students attended the course, of whom only one did not know English. The course has been continued during the present year and has been divided into two three months' courses covering the *bhadoi* and *rabi* seasons, respectively. It was also intended that the English-speaking students who would take both courses should be given some instruction in elementary science, but only one student has availed himself of this. There are seven students taking this course at present.

(*18*) *Admission of students into Diploma Course.*—In selecting students for admission into the first session of the College care was taken by Mr. Dobbs to impress on each candidate that Government service was not guaranteed to successful students. Since then, this policy has been continued and all applicants for admission are informed that Government service is not guaranteed to passed students of the College, but they are expected to make use of their knowledge in farming or in the management of private estates. The figures for admission give a good indication of the relative popularity of Government service and private enterprise. In 1910 there were 550 applications for 20 vacancies, but these were reduced to 190 when it was understood that there were no prospects of employment outside the Agricultural Department. Eventually 24 students were admitted of whom two were wards of Government. In 1912, 39 applications were received for 40 vacancies and 12 students entered the College. In 1913, 31 applications were received for 40 vacancies and six students, including two scholars, eventually joined, of whom one student and one scholar have since left. A large proportion of the applicants only desire Government service, and on being informed that such employment is not guaranteed to passed students they immediately find that

family or other reasons prevent them from attending the College.

It is probable that a slightly larger number of students would seek admission if the last date for receiving applications for admission was postponed until June, and the commencement of the first session till July, in order to enable students who have just passed the Matriculation to apply and to take the course immediately after passing the Matriculation. This suggestion was made by Mr. Taylor in May, 1912, but was not accepted. In any case, the increase in the number of students is likely to be small. It is difficult, therefore, to consider the figures cited above as anything but a proof of the unpopularity of the College.

(*19*) *Reason for failure of College.*—The figures for admissions show clearly that the College has steadily decreased in popularity since it has been realised that it is not likely to be an avenue to Government Service. The absence of any demand for agricultural education can be ascribed to numerous causes. First, as regards the artificial demand caused by appointments in Government Service:—

(*1*) The diploma given by the College is of no value as a qualification for service outside the Agricultural Department; in 1910 the applications were reduced from 550 to 190 when this was made known.

(*2*) No statement has ever been made as to the number and pay of the appointments that are likely to fall vacant in the cadre of the Agricultural Departments of the Provinces concerned, so that there is no encouragement for prospective candidates for such posts to attend the College.

In the absence of any definite proposals for appointments in Government Service the guardians of prospective students must naturally consider very carefully the prospects of employment which are likely to result from the three years spent in obtaining the diploma. Such prospects of employment can only be of two kinds: (1) private service under land-holders as land-stewards or farm managers, or (2) farming.

A few applications for men to fill posts of land-stewards have been received and such applications always lay stress on the fact that experienced practical men are required. It is not likely that the demand for this class of men will increase until passed students of the College have proved their mettle. The fact that Government refuses to employ them in khasmahals and estates under the Court of Wards does not tend to encourage other land-holders to do so.

In coming to the question of the possibilities of farming as a profitable occupation for the educated middle classes, we have reached the crux of the problem. I have talked over this question with many people competent to judge regarding it and the general consensus of opinion would appear to be that under the conditions brought about by the permanent settlement it would be extremely difficult for a man to become a tenant farmer on a large scale and a zamindari manager or owner would not be able to make adequate profits from the cultivation of his scattered khas lands. It must also be borne in mind that a farmer who had undergone an expensive education would expect to be able to realise sufficiently large profits to enable him to maintain a position befitting his education. To do this he would require considerable capital and it is extremely improbable that this will be available in the case of a young man of the class under consideration. Again, up to the present a sufficiently large body of fact has not been collected to prove either that capitalist agriculture can be made to pay or to show what system of agriculture should be employed.

(*20*) *Criticism of present agricultural policy.*—Enough has been said above to show what is the position of the diploma course to-day; it now remains to indicate the lines on which the College teaching should be developed if it is to be of any service to the agricultural interests of the province. But before considering the educational edifice itself, it is necessary to make absolutely certain of the foundations.

(*21*) *Foundations of technical instruction omitted.*—The first essential to any scheme of scientific or technical education is a sufficient ground work of fact. It appears, however, that this principle was lost sight of when it was decided to improve Indian agriculture by the foundation of a College in each province simultaneously with the laying out of the experimental stations for the purpose of accumulating facts on which to base an improved system of agriculture.

In Bengal and in Bihar this mistake has been accentuated by the fact that the experimental stations have been multiplied without an adequate complement of expert officers to work each one of them. Such a mistake would naturally arise where the control of scientific work is put in the hands of officers accustomed to administrative work in which the independent work of a number of scattered offices is usually supervised by one superior officer. In consequence, the single Deputy Director has spent all his time in trains instead of on his farm and so has been unable to obtain any results himself, and has also been unable to ensure that any of the results produced by any of the managers of any of his farms are in any way reliable, with the result that the expenditure of large sums of money has produced no results of value.

This will appear to be a sweeping statement, but I can speak with some authority, as I have studied the farm reports very carefully, as can be seen from the summaries of the recommendations made by the Department which I compiled from the farm reports when in charge of the exhibitions. In perusing them it must be remembered that the list of recommended crops noted therein was objected to by me as unsuitable for distribution on account of their being impure local varieties instead of pure strains produced under careful supervision; and that Mr. Sherrard's observations on the work of the farm managers has since shown that it is very unlikely that their work has been sufficiently accurate to produce reliable results from the experiments carried out by them.

It is therefore necessary to preface any suggestions regarding the future of the College by pointing out that the College had to commence giving a course of technical instruction in Agriculture to prospective farmers before any improved system of farming has been worked out. At the present time an educated man who wished to farm would probably find it less expensive to spend his time learning the rule of thumb technical methods of agriculture from the ordinary cultivators. The College teaching must at present be confined mostly to science and to the principles of good agricultural practice as worked out in Europe, and is therefore only suitable to training Government servants for the purpose of working out the problems of Indian agriculture. The only private persons who would be likely to take such a course would be wealthy men who are willing to do pioneer work for the pleasure of it rather than for hope of profit. Unfortunately such a class does not appear to exist in India. In these circumstances it is not likely that the diploma course will attract many students until a paying system of agriculture has been worked out.

The means hitherto used to work out a paying system of agriculture have been ineffectual because it has been assumed that the amount of progress made depends on the number of farms opened by the Department under the supervision of a minimum qualified supervising staff. It is to be hoped that the complete failure of the agricultural work hitherto will lead to the provision of a largely increased staff of well-qualified Deputy Directors who will each be given a farm and a uniform tract in which to work. When such an organisation has been in existence some years and has made itself felt in the local agriculture, then only will a genuine economic demand for advanced agricultural technical education begin to be felt.

(*22*) *Defects in personnel.*—The next essential in technical instruction is an expert instructor provided with the best equipment. In this case no attempt has been made to meet thes requirements.

The first Professor of Agriculture started work here on 12th August, 1907, and since that time four officers have been in charge of the farm and agricultural teaching, a new officer being appointed to take charge of the agricultural teaching yearly (*vide* the subjoined table). The difficulties of the Professor of Agriculture are also increased by the frequent transfer of the more efficient of his overseers to other farms.

Name. (1)	Date of arrival in India. (2)	Appointments. (3)	Date of appointment. (4)	Date of transfer. (5)	Remarks. (6)
H. H. Corbin ...	.....	Principal and Professor of Agriculture.	12th August, 1907.*	24th August, 1908.	*Office transferred to Sabour
A. C. Dobbs ...	17th October, 1906.	Principal and Professor of Agriculture, also Acting Deputy Director of Agriculture.	24th August, 1908. / 30th March, 1911.	15th June, 1911.	
G. C. Sherrard ...	19th November, 1908.	Professor of Agriculture and also Acting Deputy Director of Agriculture.	15th June, 1911.	2nd October, 1912.	
N. S. McGowan ...	23rd February, 1912.	Professor of Agriculture ...	2nd October, 1912.	...	Also does wheat work in Bhagalpur Division.

The objections to this arrangement are sufficiently obvious. The new officers are usually less experienced than those transferred elsewhere. No officer has been permitted to stay here long enough to study local conditions and to understand the local difficulties. Each new officer has differed from his predecessor in some points and so has not carried on his predecessor's work in those points; he has also taken some time in picking up the work, so that much time and money has been wasted in laying out the farm and initiating the experimental work. Many of the officers have been given district work to do in addition to the College work, which has prevented them from giving proper attention to the College work. It is, therefore, to be expected that the management of the Sabour Farm has never been brought up to that degree of efficiency which must be attained to make the technical instruction in any way convincing.

The frequent transfers have also resulted in hopeless want of continuity in the teaching. The views of each succeeding officer have differed from those of his predecessors, but none of them have had sufficient time to study the question properly. The unpopularity of the teaching work as compared with independent research and the frequency of transfers have led each agriculturist to think and hope that his stay at Sabour will be short, and so proper attention has not been paid to the working out of a suitable course of agricultural teaching. It must be recognised that in this Department it is the man that counts, and that one officer cannot possibly carry on the work of his predecessor in the same way as in the administrative branches of Government Service.

A sound course of agricultural teaching can never be worked out until a whole-time officer with considerable Indian experience has been in charge of the teaching at Sabour for some years and has made a thorough study of the teaching work, and brought the farm management up to a high state of efficiency. It must also be recognised that the best of the Indian farm staff are required on the Sabour Farm. It should be obvious that the present policy of treating the Sabour Farm as a depot from which any efficient overseer can be drafted elsewhere is fatal to the efficiency of the farm.

(*23*) *Standard curriculum.*—When the standard curriculum which was prepared in 1906 for the guidance of the staff of the colleges is examined in the light of our present experience several defects come to light. The entrance-passed students on arrival at the College usually have an insufficient knowledge of English, so that they cannot understand the lectures and oral work, besides which their general education is defective so that much time is wasted while they are being grounded in English and mathematics. Much time could also be saved if only students who had been well grounded in science at the university were admitted. The curriculum also contains obvious defects which are attributable to the fact that it was prepared before any experience of agricultural teaching in India had been obtained.

In the first place the syllabus of each scientific subject contains much more material than can be properly taught in the time available, if due attention is to be given to agriculture. This is largely due to the fact that it was expected that the whole of the appointments in all sections of the Department's work would be filled from the ranks of the passed students and so it was thought advisable to give all the students a complete training to fit each student for any post in the Department in case he happened to show natural aptitude for it.

The course has also naturally taken this line in view of the fact that its framers possessed a very limited amount of personal experience of Indian agriculture at that time, and so the natural tendency was to base the teaching on the principles on which sound agricultural practice is based rather than to attempt to teach practices about which nothing was then known. In accordance with this idea the curriculum laid down the principle that the scientific subjects should be taught first and the applied subjects, such as agriculture, afterwards when a ground work of science had been laid.

Our study of the history of the College and the reasons for the failure has placed us in a position to consider what modifications are necessary to put the work on a sound foundation.

OBJECT OF COLLEGE.

(*24*) We are now in a position to reconsider the future of the College. It appears to have been originally intended to provide the English-educated middle classes, who normally try to obtain Government appointments or some form of office work, with the technical knowledge necessary to enable them to take up farming or to obtain posts as land-stewards. In addition a certain number of recruits for posts in the Agricultural Department would be required. At the same time it was recognised that it was useless to train any but hereditary agriculturists. It will be seen, therefore, that while it appears to have been intended to attempt to train the educated middle classes to become agriculturists, at the same time it was admitted that such an attempt was not likely to be successful unless they were hereditary agriculturists. It is probable that in the future we shall be more likely to obtain success if no attention is paid to the interests of any particular class, but our policy is directed solely to promote the interests of Indian agriculture. Especially

is it important that an artificial atmosphere should not be created by the admission of students who are merely candidates for service under Government outside the Agricultural Department.

The types of education which have attained popularity in England may serve as a useful guide to the future needs of India. In the first place there are a few colleges which cater for landowners' sons or science students who possess some education, and who wish to study the scientific principles of agriculture with a view to applying them in practice as land-agents or in scientific or expert posts. In this case only a small amount of attention is devoted to the details of agricultural technique. In the second place there are many colleges which cater for farmers' sons with a much smaller amount of education. In this case less science is taught but special attention is paid to the teaching of sound technique, no pains being spared to make the students understand farming as a business. Colleges of this type usually cater for the agriculturists of the particular tract in which they are situated and demonstrate the best systems of agriculture for that tract. Thirdly, comes the technical instruction given to employés in particular trades or branches of agriculture. For this only the most elementary education is required, and the instruction is intended to show the labourer how to get the best work out of his tools.

A comparison of the present system in use in India with the English one shows that the Indian Colleges are attempting to train simultaneously both scientific experts and practical farmers, and this work is being done under the following disadvantages:—

(i) The training of prospective experts must include a thorough grounding in all the sciences on which the art of agriculture is founded and the technical training in each of these sciences as applied to agriculture must be thorough in order that the students on graduation may be drafted into any post for which they have shown aptitude. This amount of scientfic training is not required by a practical farmer. The amount of instruction in each subject could therefore be considerably reduced if the recruits required to fill special vacancies in the scientific branches were trained separately in the subjects concerned.

(ii) The education has to be given in English on account of the difficulty of giving scientific instruction in the vernacular and on account of the difficulty of finding any other language common to Bihar, Orissa, Bengal and Assam. Most of the students suffer from an imperfect acquaintance with English.

(iii) The course also differs from the English courses, in that the students have neither a foundation of science on which to build an understanding of technical agriculture, nor have they any stock of agricultural experience into which to graft the teachings of science.

(iv) In the absence of a proper basis of experience founding on experiment and observation it is only possible to teach the principles of scientific agriculture and such instruction, though suitable for the production of experts, is wholly unsuitable for the production of a class of practical farmers. It is probable that only a small proportion of the best students will be able to apply the principles successfully and the other students who attempt to farm are more than likely to fail. For such students a course with a minimum of science and a maximum of purely technical work will be most suitable, and its cost should be reduced to be commensurate with their future prospects.

It is likely therefore that eventually we shall find a demand for instruction of the following kinds:—

(i) In the first place we can provide recruits to to fill vacancies in the scientific sections and to meet any private demand by offering post-graduate courses in such subjects as Agricultural Chemistry, Plant-breeding, Horticulture and Fruit Farming, Economic Entomology. Only a very limited number of students in any one subject would be taken yearly, but they would work directly under the eye of the head of the section in his research laboratory. Only students with a sound grounding in science with particular reference to the subject concerned would be admitted. The course would probably be complete in one year.

(ii) The second course would be a technical course in agriculture, including horticulture, for the benefit of would-be farmers, land-stewards, etc. Very little science would be taught and that would be taught on nature study lines. The duration of the course would be reduced to two years if possible; it would probably have to be given in English on account of the number of languages spoken in the provinces concerned, but a vernacular course of the kind would probably prove more attractive. Students who pass through this course should make useful farm managers and land-stewards and should be suitable for all the general work of the Department.

It will be seen that the above scheme would avoid the waste of time involved in the teaching of an excessive amount of pure science in order to remedy the defects in the elementary education of the students, and the reduction in length of the course would enable us to deal with a larger number of students.

(iii) Besides these two courses there would be a series of short technical courses for the benefit of cultivators. These courses would either last for some time, e.g., the present *bhadoi* and *rabi* course, and so would enable the cultivators to see any improved technical methods in use during that season, or they would deal with special subjects, e.g., dairying, *eri* silk or lac cultivation, use of Rajah plough, horticulture, etc., etc. If necessary, instructors may also be sent out from Sabour to give certatin of these short courses elsewhere.

I must repeat that I can see no useful purpose in continuing either the present course or the second of the above courses for the present. In case more recruits are required for the Department I should recommend that the exact number of candidates likely to be required be determined and that this be published and the necessary number of students be admitted in one year and after these have been through the course, it should be closed down until we are in a position to recommence teaching on proper lines. The scheme for the first proposed course can be brought into force at once, though it will take time to work out some of the courses. In the meantime the present short course can be continued as we can recommend a sufficient number of isolated improved methods to enable such a course to be of some value.

For many years to come we can expect no genuine spontaneous demand for agricultural instruction of any kind, but such a demand is likely to make itself felt as soon as the district staff begins to demonstrate effectively the advantages to be gained by improved methods of cultivation.

(25) *Organisation of College teaching.*—As regards the organisation of the College teaching the general arrangements for the College are placed in the hands of the Principal, but owing to the fact that the European officers have always been of almost equal standing and also to the fact that the efficiency of the teaching has depended on the quality of the work done by each officer in working out his own course of instruction, the European expert officers have been directly responsible to the Director of Agriculture only for the efficiency of their work. This system was tacitly acquiesced in by Mr. Gourlay (*vide* Mr. Dobbs' demi-official No. 1103 of 19th September, 1909, to which no reply was received) and no alterations have since been made. The only advantage that can be claimed for it is that it has been found to work satisfactorily and without undue friction. It practically means that the Principal is responsible for the efficiency of the arrangements for the teaching work but has no power to control the actual teaching work carried out by the staff under the charge of his European colleagues, except by reporting to

the Director any cases in which he thinks the teaching is not being efficiently carried out. The Principal's position therefore cannot be considered an easy one.

It will probably be found that the solution of the above difficulty will eventually be found when a really enthusiastic and experienced Professor of Agriculture has been obtained for Sabour and when the courses of instruction in each subject have been worked out, when it would be possible to make the Professor of Agriculture Principal and put him in sole charge of the whole of the teaching staff, while the European expert staff will assist him with advice as regards the teaching of their subjects when required to do so.

In the meantime I do not consider that any good can come of laying down rules for the conduct of the agricultural teaching. This subject is better left entirely to the officer in charge of the work, who will profit by his mistakes and work out a sound course provided that he is allowed time enough to do so. If this course is not adopted I can assure you that the agricultural teaching will never be efficient.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS. —(*26*) *General policy.*—Enough has been said to show that the work of the Department has hitherto been directed on wrong lines. In the first place a commencement has been made with an advanced course of teaching before the local conditions had been studied sufficiently to enable any improved system of agriculture to be worked out. In the second place the work of investigation has been reduced to a farce, and an expensive one, by the attempt to organise scientific investigation on similar lines to administrative work. As a result this Province has been left miles behind those Provinces which have developed the Agricultural Department on rational lines, and it will take a great effort to catch up with them.

I am convinced that no progress in agricultural education is possible until steps are taken to push on the work of agricultural investigation, and in doing this it must be recognised that the progress made will depend on the number of trained European investigators employed. At present only sufficient Indian officers are required to act as assistants to the European experts. Any attempt to build up a large Indian executive staff under the supervision of a few European experts will end in failure. At present it would appear that four additional Deputy Directors are required (1) for Tirhut and North Bhagalpur (2) Patna and South Bhagalpur, (3) Chota Nagpur and (4) Orissa The officer in charge of the sugar station should probably be a Botanist or a Chemist with a good knowledge of Agriculture.

(*27*) *Education.*—It has been shown that the teaching work has hitherto suffered from absence of material to teach and the absence of a permanent and experienced officer to work out a proper agricultural course. A definite arrangement regarding the appointment of an officer to carry through the agricultural instruction here must be made as soon as possible if the teaching is to attain to any degree of success. It will probably be admitted that the courses of instruction undertaken by the Department should be designed with the object of making known (1) sound systems of agriculture and (2) improved technical methods. It should avoid wasting its time on giving a preliminary general scientific education if that can be avoided. The advanced teaching work should eventually be carried out for the benefit of those employed in capitalist farming, who will require a thorough knowledge of the best systems of agriculture and of the technical methods by which they can be made a success. The necessity for this type of teaching will depend on whether it is found that capitalist farming is economically sound or otherwise desirable in India. Smaller cultivators cannot afford to give so much time to education and so instruction for their benefit should consist almost entirely in the practical demonstration of the best technical methods. There may also be a slight demand for persons trained in the technique of the sciences useful to agriculture. It is not, however, a part of the Department's duty to give a training that will fit persons for appointments in Government service outside the Department and any time given to this may be regarded as wasted.

Three types of courses have been proposed to meet these requirements. The post-graduate course will be of service in training graduates of science colleges for the purpose of filling vacancies in the scientific branches of the Department. It will then be possible to reduce the science taught in the diploma course and to make it a technical course for those interested on the land. It is not, however, possible to start such a course until our knowledge of farm management under Indian conditions is much more advanced than it is at present. For the present the College may either be closed or used for the training of the staff required by the Department, the numbers of vacancies likely to be required in three years' time being published annually. The third item in the scheme, the short courses for cultivators, have been in progress for two years and they will be expanded as new material is accumulated. No course, however, can be expected to prove a thorough-going success until there is something to teach and until the quality of the Department's district work is such as to show clearly the advantage of the technical methods recommended by it.

The question of agricultural education is a very large subject and sufficient experience has nowhere been obtained in India to enable us to lay down a final policy. I would therefore suggest that steps be taken to lay the question of the most suitable types of agricultural education for India before the Board of Agriculture in December next.

(*28*) *Staff.*—At the present time I am quite unable to carry out the work of the Economic Botanist in addition to that of the Principal's office. I therefore propose that an additional Botanist be appointed to share a part of the work. Such a step can be fully justified when it is considered that the only conspicuous success to the credit of the Department has been obtained by me as Economic Botanist. This position would not however be necessary if it is decided to close the College at once and to put the whole of the teaching work in the charge of an experienced Professor of Agriculture as Principal. In order to take off as much routine work as possible from the Principal's shoulders a good Head Clerk is required. They also pointed out the absolute necessity of increasing the district staff by at least four officers if any results are to be obtained by the Department.

In view of the past policy of the Government in regard to the Agricultural Department it would appear unlikely that all the above additions to the staff will be sanctioned. There is perhaps a natural tendency for controlling officers who do not possess an expert knowledge of the work controlled by them to keep down the staff under them until they are certain that each officer is fully employed in doing routine work of a nature which can be easily checked. Scientific work which cannot be easily checked tends to be treated as a recreation for leisure moments. I would like to point out, however, that the Agricultural Department has no prospects whatever of producing the valuable results within its reach unless it is directed on very different lines from those common in executive work. The smaller the amount of administrative work demanded from each man the more thoroughly will he be able to do his legitimate work. For this reason I am convinced that the amount of progress in agricultural improvement will be found to be out of all proportion to the increase in the expert staff sanctioned, provided of course that good men are obtained.

I trust that you will find it possible to came to a decision regarding the above questions at an early date, as the existing state of affairs should not be allowed to continue for a day longer than necessary. In case it is not possible to carry through either the above or an improved scheme for putting the educational work of the department on a sound footing, I hope you will be able to see your way to allow me to revert to a branch of the Department's work in which I have some confidence.

Mr. E. J. Woodhouse called and examined.

68139. (*Chairman.*) The witness had been employed as economic botanist since his appointment in 1907. He had been at the Sabour Agricultural College since May, 1908, and was still carrying on the work of economic botanist in addition to his work as principal.

68140. His view was that the prevailing organisation at Sabour was not suitable. He would not propose to close the College entirely, but he would reduce its activities. He was originally in favour of closing the College until the Department had done a good deal more investigation work, but in view of the necessity of providing recruits for the subordinate posts in the Department, it would be necessary to continue the College work and to have a two years' course, mostly in agriculture. He contemplated an expansion in the cadre of the Agriculture Department. Such expansion was undoubtedly necessary.

68141. There were three research officers at Sabour, the agricultural chemist, the professor of agriculture, and himself. The research work, however, was done in spare time, after the teaching and administrative work was over. He did not approve of that system. He desired to continue the research work, as it was the most important work in the Department at present. He would therefore retain Sabour as a research centre, and he would set the officers in the research department entirely free from teaching duty. In some cases it would be of advantage to increase the staff by employing Indian professors for teaching work.

68142. He would not object to receiving highly-educated Indians at Sabour for a post-graduate course in the research department, provided they worked under the research officers.

68143. The best method for getting Indians into the higher branches of the Department on the agricultural side was to provide scholarships for schoolboys belonging to the cultivating classes and to give them a simple agricultural training with a view to their entry to the subordinate Agricultural Service. Then, when they had been tried in the subordinate service for a time, they might be promoted to the superior branches of the Service on their merits. This method did not apply to recruitment for research and teaching posts. For such posts men might be appointed from the University.

68144. It might be an advantage to give Indian officers study leave to England after some years' service.

68145. In his opinion there was room for a research college both at Sabour and at Pusa. There was ample scope for both institutions.

68146. Officers recruited in England had hitherto come up to a high standard. Most of them had been obliged to take charge of their duties with very little guidance, and on the whole they had done their work very creditably. There were indications, however, that the present conditions were no longer attracting a good class of man. He therefore looked upon it as urgently important that the conditions of service should be improved. The rates of pay he proposed were inclusive of allowances (except those of Principal and Director of Agriculture). He regarded the scheme for continuing the pay of the Service as at present and giving allowances to selected officers as extremely unsatisfactory.

68147. The post of Director of Agriculture should be thrown open to members of the Service. In some cases a civilian selected for the post had not sufficient knowledge of agriculture to enable him to direct the operations of the Department and, as the Department increased, such knowledge would become more and more essential. The head of the Department need not necessarily be a scientist in any particular branch; he must have a general knowledge of agriculture in its broad aspects, and should also possess a knowledge of administration. He agreed that an officer of the Indian Civil Service who had had many years' experience in settlement work, would come to agriculture with a not inconsiderable knowledge of the subject, but the great drawback was that such a man would have no knowledge of the possibilities of improvement in agriculture by scientific means. Personally he was very much in favour of appointing members of the Agricultural Service, who knew what those possibilities were, to the post of Director. A Civilian Director was liable to go astray in taking too much pains over organisation for organisation's sake, and to that extent neglecting to assist Departmental operations, the efficient conduct of which was really essential to the rapid development of Indian agriculture.

68148. He would approve of the principle, as applied in the Education Department, that officers entering the Service after 25 years of age should be allowed to count for pension the number of completed years by which their age on entry exceeded the age of 25. All the officers at Pusa (except the supernumeraries) were recruited after the age of 25.

68149. He was in favour of obtaining men at a somewhat older age in order that they might have had experience of research work under proper direction in England.

68150. (*Mr. Madge.*) He thought a start in advanced agricultural education should not have been made until a sound basis of knowledge had been established as a result of experimental investigation. He was not afraid that the proposal he had made to reduce the educational and increase the investigation work would react adversely on agricultural development. Practically all the men obtained for the College so far had been of the educational standard required by the college prospectus. The difficulty was that students of the landlord class had not come to the College, and, if they did, they had not the necessary qualifications to comprehend the present college course. The standard was therefore being reduced with the object of attracting people from land.

68151. His experience of the Indian lecturer was that he was better at teaching than at research work. He thought it was possible to obtain in a short time a class of first-rate Indian lecturers in all subjects taught at the College.

68152. He agreed that what was wanted in a college like Sabour was practical experience combined with theory, and that was one of the reasons why he suggested that the College should be closed down for a number of years, and investigation work carried on, and more knowledge obtained about the various agricultural subjects. It might be an advantage to have English lecturers in all the subjects teaching in the vernacular, but it would take five or ten years for the men selected to attain a really high standard of efficiency.

68153. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He would like to have four scientific experts on research work at Sabour—a botanist for plant-breeding work, an agricultural chemist and two agriculturists, one in charge of arable work, and the other in charge of animal industries. This referred only to Sabour. It should be understood however that research work in the districts should also be made possible by a considerable increase in the number of qualified Deputy Directors. Without such a staff it would be impossible either to discover and introduce improvements in the local agriculture or to provide material for an agricultural course suitable for students from all parts of the Province.

68154. When the college was reopened, his conception of its function would be that it should contain, first, a research department, organised as he had said, and, secondly, an elementary teaching department, the teachers to be Indians. It would probably be necessary in the case of agriculture at first to have European teachers. The students at the College would be confined to the agricultural side.

68155. Asked whether, in such circumstances, there was any reason why there should be a research establishment at Sabour at all, the witness explained that research work on plant-breeding, for example, would be devoted to improving the

local crops for the benefit of the people of the Province; it would not necessarily have any reference to the teaching.

68156. At the present juncture research at Sabour was much more important than the teaching. The research work would have two ends, one the direct improvement of the agriculture of the Province, and, secondly, the provision of material for the teaching work.

68157. (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness was recruited to the Agricultural Department when he was 23 years old. He was three years at Cambridge, taking the Honours Degree in natural science and one year at Cambridge taking the agricultural diploma. He then came straight out to India. He considered that was a bad method of recruitment. In addition to the college course, recruits should have had a longer period of training in practical research in England before coming to India. He himself did get some practical research at Cambridge in the summer of 1907. It was an advantage for recruits to expert appointments to have had at least some acquaintance with practical agricultural methods. And it should be laid down as an essential qualification for the post of Deputy Director that a man filling that position should have had at least a year's experience on the land.

68158. With reference to the proposals made to recruit a certain number of men of considerably older age, and of more established reputation, on short term agreements, he considered that such officers could be employed advantageously on special problems of which they had had previous experience but could not be economically employed in the ordinary district work of the Department.

68159. A young agriculturist on first coming out to India should be placed under an experienced Deputy Director, or agriculturist, in his own Province. As regards other subjects men should be deputed for a short time to work under the best of the specialists in their subjects, either at Pusa or elsewhere.

68160. With regard to the possibility of the employment of Indians in the Imperial Department, he proposed to have a two years' course of training in practical agriculture at Sabour. The matriculation standard for admission to that course would probably have to be abandoned. Having obtained the men, they would be employed in the Department on agricultural work in the districts. It was from the class he proposed to promote men into the Imperial Service. The idea was to have a two years' course to start with, and also to have a more advanced two years' course dealing more especially with agricultural sciences, which men might take after the first two years' course, either at once or at some later date. He agreed that if a man possessing only the matriculation standard or even a lower standard was taken and was given a two years' course, he would not be very promising material from which to obtain an officer of the class required to fill a Deputy Director's post, but the college was looking at the question from the point of view of agricultural development rather than from any other point of view. The aim at present was to make use of the born agriculturist.

68161. With regard to the specialist side he proposed taking graduates in science as assistants to the European specialists, and also as teachers for some of the subjects at Sabour. From those two classes he thought it would be possible to select a certain small proportion of men for promotion to the Imperial Department. Selected men would take an extra post-graduate laboratory course. He was not of the opinion that it was necessary to give them any course of training in England; but it might be an advantage to send a man to Pusa, where he might get a rather wider outlook.

68162. The proposal put before the Commission that the Civilian Directorship of Agriculture should be abolished, that the head of the agricultural service should be filled by a suitably qualified departmental officer, and that a post of Rural Development Commissioner should be created, was quite a sound one.

68163. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) Recruitment in England was adversely affected by poorness of the prospects held out to officers in the service.

68164. One great difficulty which had been found was that the landlords of India were not qualified by their education to benefit by the instruction which Sabour was prepared to give. Therefore, to bring teachers out from England to teach that class of pupil would be a pure waste of money at the present time.

68165. One of the chief objections entertained by his service to the appointment of an Indian Civil Service officer to the post of Director of Agriculture was that posts of that kind were apt to be given rather as a convenience to the Indian Civil Service than from the point of view of the advantage of the service concerned.

68166. If it were laid down that the appointment of an Indian Civilian should only be made when there was a man in the Indian Civil Service who was known to have taken an interest in, and to be experienced in agriculture, that would considerably remove the objection to a considerable extent, but at the same time there was a danger in appointing a man of that kind, because he might not after all have a thorough knowledge of agriculture.

68167. (*Chairman.*) A candidate had no agricultural education prior to his entrance at Sabour, and his contention was that the Indian candidates who now entered the college were unsuited to the agricultural profession.

68168. (*Mr. Fisher.*) If his recommendation were carried out, and the college were temporarily closed, agricultural diplomas could not be granted for Bengal, Bihar and Orissa and Assam. That would not create a grievance, because Government had stated that they could guarantee no Government service of any kind. The college had not up to the present given any agricultural diplomas; the first agricultural diploma examination would be held next March.

(The witness withdrew.)

Jatindra Nath Chakravarti, Esq., Agricultural Supervisor, Rangpur, Bengal.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68169. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The present system of nomination form among distinguished Agricultural graduates and of promotion from the subordinate officers is quite satisfactory. Two-thirds of the total number of appointments should be filled up direct from among Agricultural graduates and one-third by promotion.

68170. **(II) Systems of Training and Probation.**—There are no fixed rules. All new officers should be appointed on probation for one year and put under training, at least six months of which should be spent on an experimental farm.

There is no regular system of training for the officers now. The courses in the Agricultural colleges are good as far as they go. But the officers selected direct from these colleges for the Provincial Service should undergo a further post-graduate training for two years either at Pusa or in one of the British or American Agricultural Colleges. The larger part of this period should be spent in practical work. They should be given a small allowance by Government during this period, as private students will have very little inducement to follow these courses. On completing the course satisfactorily, they should be appointed on probation for one year. Six months should be spent on

an experimental farm in practical work and six months in touring under the direction of an Imperial Officer or a Senior Provincial Officer. Officers promoted from subordinate ranks should be appointed on probation for one year.

Provincial Officers promoted to the Imperial Service should spend at least a year in an approved European or American Agricultural College, if he has not already done so. This period might be treated as study-leave. The rule might be relaxed in exceptional cases.

68171. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The present salary is Rs. 200—10—400. The present salary is quite inadequate and has been always a matter of grievance. The Provincial Service, it is understood, was created mainly for the purpose of organising and supervising agricultural demonstrations. The officers have to go about in the country, study the local conditions, and make out suitable programmes of demonstrations for each tract. They have then to carry these out through the influential people of the localities. They have to meet a good deal of prejudice and sometimes active hostility among the cultivators. Their work can be only effectively done with the assistance of the District Officers and zamindars. Their duties are no less heavy nor less onerous than those of the Provincial Officers of the other Departments. If this Service is to command the necessary amount of influence among the people, and if they are to carry out their work successfully, it is essential that this Service should be put on the same footing as the other technical Provincial Services. In most of the departments one can usually expect to rise to the grade of Rs. 1,000, and also of promotion to the Imperial Branch.

There are at present four appointments in the Provincial Service. This is quite inadequate. In addition to the officers needed for supervising demonstrations, there should be one officer in each of the following departments: Chemistry, Fibres, Economic Botany, Mycology and Entomology. There should also be two officers to assist in the supervision of farms. The Experts belonging to the Imperial Service find very little time to study local conditions by touring, and it will be the duty of the Provincial Officers to study special problems on the spot and carry the results obtained in our laboratories by the Experts to the houses of our cultivators.

Our people are ignorant and superstitious. With the resignation of fatalism they submit to the ravages of diseases and insects as necessary evils. Judging by appearances they got on well enough without an Agricultural Department at all, and if we wait for their demand for a more efficient manning of the Department we shall wait for ever. Very often when they resort to any remedies, they try fanciful remedies suggested by superstition. The only way to help people is to show them the value of true scientific remedies. The Department should have a well-trained staff to do their work properly. Not properly carried out, our recommendations will be no better than their own remedies and will have the effect of bringing the Department itself into discredit. At present one Mycological Collector and one Entomological Collector on Rs. 50 each, trained at Pusa, are our only allowance of officers dealing with disease and insect-pests. This allowance is sadly inadequate for the needs of the province both in quality and number.

The following scheme is submitted for consideration:—

There should be 15 appointments:—

(1) Five for supervising Agricultural demonstrations in each of the five divisions.

(2) Five for each of the departments of Chemistry, Fibres, Economic Botany, Mycology and Entomology.

(3) Two for assisting in the supervision of experimental Farms.

(4) One Personal Assistant.

(5) One for special enquiry and one supernumerary officer for filling leave vacancies.

It is desirable that the Personal Assistant should be an officer with a knowledge of Agricultural matters, and it may not be always easy to find such an officer in the Executive Service.

The grade of these officers should be fixed at Rs. 250—25—800, or they should receive two-thirds the salary of the Imperial Officers. Those who are specially capable should also have a chance of being promoted to the Imperial Service.

The discrepancy in the salaries between the Imperial and Provincial Services is much greater than in any other technical departments. As a matter of fact, the annual increment of the Provincial Officers is Rs. 10 only, the same as obtains in the subordinate service. The usual practice in most of the other technical departments is to fix the salary at two-thirds that of the Imperial Officers. As an alternative to the previous scheme, the same scale might be introduced into the Agricultural Department. At present the average salary works out at about one-third the average salary of the Imperial Service. In some departments, Public Works Department, Telegraph, etc., even subordinate officers enjoy very nearly the same salary as the Provinical Officers of the Agricultural Department—a maximum of Rs. 400 only.

A statement is annexed herewith as Appendix I, giving the names and qualifications of the present officers of the Bengal Provincial Agricultural Service. This will, I venture to submit, show that their qualifications are in no way inferior to the members of any other Provincial Service. As a matter of fact, they are in many cases superior, and some of them have received the same training as the officers of the Imperial Service.

It has been previously pointed out that the officers of this branch of the Agricultural Department are required to be almost constantly on tour. As a matter of fact, they have to be out nearly 300 days in the year and most of this touring is in the interior where conveyance is expensive and inspection bungalows scarce. The charge of Provincial Agricultural Officers is very large in area, and they have to cover long distances and have to be away from head-quarters for considerable periods at a time. For the above reasons, they have to carry a considerable amount of equipage with them and one or two servants also. The second-class rates travelling allowance allowed are very often insufficient to meet these charges. They should, therefore, be allowed first-class travelling allowances, as in the Public Works Department and Telegraph Department.

68172. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The officers of this Department can very rarely avail themselves of Sundays or of the ordinary holidays. On account of the very technical nature of their work, as well as on account of shortage of officers, very few of them can obtain privilege leave when due. They should, therefore, be allowed to accumulate their privilege leave up to six months.

68173. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Having regard to the arduous nature of the duties of officers of this Department, most of whose time is spent in outdoor work and in continuous touring, 25 years' service should be enough to earn full pension.

68174. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—Under the present conditions, it is very difficult for an Indian to get into the Imperial Service. As a matter of fact, out of about 70 Imperial Officers in the whole of India, there is only one Indian. At least one appointment in each province should be reserved to be filled up by promotion from among members of the Provinical Services.

The sharp line which now exists between the Imperial and Provincial Officers should be abolished. As in the other cognate departments

(Public Works Department, Telegraph and Forest), the duties of the Provincial and Imperial Officers should be, at least in the beginning of their services, similar, and Provincial Officers should be given independent charges, subordinate directly to the Director of Agriculture. Officiating vacancies in the Imperial Branch should also be invariably filled up by Provincial Officers instead of by officers from another province.

68175. **(VIII) Relations of the Services with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—(1) The Co-operative Societies and our Department must work together, and closer co-operation is also desirable with the Educational Department in the matter of Agricultural training in the primary schools.

(2) The Agricultural Department can do very little useful work in the way of demonstrations without the help of District Officers.

(3) It is possible that, when the Department is fully developed and organised, the Head of the Department should be an Agricultural Expert. But for a long time to come the Department, if it is to carry out its work successfully, must be presided over by a member of the Indian Civil Service. It is he who alone can command the necessary amount of influence among the District Officers and the public. The Department, as at present constituted, consists of the Agricultural Statistics, Fisheries, Sericulture and Veterinary branches and it will be difficult to get a suitable expert who will take an impartial interest in all these.

68176. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—The designation of Provincial Officers should be changed to Assistants to the Director of Agriculture. The present term "Agricultural Supervisor" is misleading as, in some other departments, the term is used only for subordinate officers. As the Department is new, the public and even officers of the other departments very often take them to belong to the same class and this sometimes leads to awkward situations.

68177. *ANNEXURE TO THE ABOVE.*—Names and qualifications of the officers of the Bengal Provincial Agricultural Service :—

(1) Jotindra Nath Chakravarti, B.A. (Calcutta University); Diplomate, Higher Agricultural Class (Sidpur Government Engineering College), M.S.A. (Master of Science in Agriculture, Cornell, U.S.A.). Received practical training at Pusa for nine months on return from the U.S. Appointed in 1908.

(2) Rajeshwar Das Gupta, Higher Agricultural student (Sidpur). Promoted from the Subordinate Service for special merit. Served in the Agricultural Department in various capacities for nearly nine years before receiving his promotion. Appointed Agricultural Supervisor in 1912.

(3) Dwijadas Datta (temporary). B.Sc. (Calcutta), M.S.A. (Cornell, U.S.A.). Was managing a farm of his own when appointed to the Agricultural Service. Appointed in 1913.

(4) Nagendranath Gupta (Temporary). B.A. (Calcutta), B.Sc. (Edinburgh). Appointed in 1913.

Messrs. J. N. Chakravarti and D. Datta went to the U.S.A. with Government scholarships.

Mr. JATINDRA NATH CHAKRAVARTI called and examined.

68178. (*Chairman.*) The witness was appointed to the service in 1908. He was a graduate of the Calcutta University, and received the agricultural diploma of the Sibpur Government College. He was then sent for two years to Cornell University where he received a degree of Master of Science in Agriculture. Then he went to Pusa for nine months. At present he was in charge of a Government farm. He had four subordinates under him in addition to clerks.

68179. A certain proportion of vacancies should be set aside for subordinates in order to encourage them.

68180. It was difficult to find a class of landholder in Bengal who cultivated his own land with his own hands or by direct personal supervision, and at the same time possessed educational attainments.

68181. It was advisable, if possible, to get men into the agricultural service who had been intimately associated with the land all their lives. Landlords were gradually exhibiting more interest in agricultural education.

68182. The courses at the agricultural colleges were good, as far as they went, but they did not provide a wide enough training for admission to the higher branches of the service. That did not apply to the Pusa course. He thought the training given at Sabour was quite sufficient for present needs. Those who required higher training could go to Pusa. He suggested that all officers desirous of entering the Provincial Service should go through a course at Pusa, except in special cases.

68183. He considered that officers, under his scheme of promotion from the Provincial Service to the Imperial Service, should, prior to entering the Imperial Service, take a course in some foreign country. It would give them a wider outlook. They should go away on study leave and obtain a certificate from an agricultural institution. Some of the officers now in the Provincial Service were qualified to fill higher posts, as they had had a scientific training abroad.

68184. The Provincial officer was carrying out work of a subordinate character to the Imperial Officer, but the difference in pay between the two officers was too great.

68185. Full pension should be payable after 25 years' service. Officers now entered the service at about the age of 25, so that a man would have reached 55 under the present conditions by the time he had served 30 years.

68186. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) It would be difficult to give any figures in support of his statement that an increased interest was being taken by the classes associated with the land in the work of the Agricultural Department, but he could say from his own personal experience that that was the case. It could be fairly assumed that when it was a question of familiarising the Indian agriculturist with improved methods of agriculture, the Indian himself was in many ways much better fitted to bring that knowledge home to those whom it was desired to reach than a European. The duties of the witness's branch of the service consisted entirely of propaganda work.

68187. (*Mr. Sly.*) It took him four years to pass as a science graduate, that being the minimum period prescribed by the University. He held a Government scholarship of Rs. 10 for two years whilst in the University. He did not obtain a scholarship at Sibpur. He went there because he liked agriculture. He went to America with a scholarship worth Rs. 150 a month, with all tuition fees and other similar expenses paid. He was then sent by Government to Pusa with pay at the rate of Rs. 250. His American training had been of very great value to him in his work in India, in that it gave him an insight into American methods of propaganda work in addition to the necessary technical training. In his opinion men trained abroad were superior to men trained in India.

68188. An Indian who had his cultivation done by hired labour was not looked down upon. The total number of such men was small, and the number of educated men amongst that class was still smaller; but it was increasing. In the future he expected a considerable number of men from that class would be attracted to the college.

68189. (*Mr. Fisher.*) One or two landholders came

to Sibpur College, not in order to enter Government service but in order to obtain agricultural knowledge, which might be useful to them on their own estate, but their educational qualifications were not very high. He was of the opinion that the number of landowners likely to avail themselves of the educational opportunities in Bengal in order to increase their own estates was likely to increase. He thought the courses undergone at the Provincial Colleges of Poona and Sabour were quite sufficient to fit an Indian for an advanced course at Pusa. It was not necessary that candidates for admission to the agricultural classes should have taken a scientific degree at the University.

68190. (*Mr. Madge.*) Zamindars might to some extent be compared with English landlords who took to agriculture for the sake of their estates and their tenants. There was a prospect of their number increasing with the encouragement they received from Government in agricultural colleges as well as from the scientific officers of the Agricultural Department; in fact it was increasing. He looked forward to a time when zamindars would be more deeply interested in agriculture than they were at present.

68191. There was no reason why the Indian agricultural training should not be raised to the highest standard in a reasonable time. And in so far as conditions of agriculture were peculiar to India, an Indian (or Anglo-Indian) had an advantage over a man from England.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Madras, Tuesday, 27th January, 1914.

Present:

The Right Hon. the LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

Sir Valentine Chirol. | Frank George Sly, Esq., C.S.I.
Walter Culley Madge, Esq., C.I.E. | Herbert Albert Laurens Fisher, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

Ll. E. Buckley, Esq., I.C.S., Commissioner of Revenue Settlement, Madras.

R. R. Scott, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

C. A. Barber, Esq., M.A., D.Sc., Government Sugar-cane Expert.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68192. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—I consider that the present class of recruits to the Agricultural Department in India is by no means uniformly satisfactory, in that the men joining are good, bad and indifferent. The reasons for this are not far to seek. The selection of new men is usually done in haste; those who are responsible for their recommendation are not in a position fully to grasp the local conditions and the candidates themselves are often very ignorant in the subject; the starting and the ultimate scale of pay are inadequate to attract the best class. The inclusion of good men is a matter of chance either because they happen to be out of employment for the moment or are at present unaware of their own value.

To remedy this state of affairs—which is very serious—I would make two suggestions: (1) A permanent selecting Board should be organised consisting of recognised heads of Agricultural Departments in England; these should be kept fully informed as to the local conditions, and at least one member of the Board should be a retired member of the Indian Agricultural Department. (2) It is advisable to inaugurate a definite policy with the object of forming a regular reserve of officers to draw upon. The Department, judging by the numbers in the Agricultural Department of other countries, is bound to increase for many years to come and there will always be plenty of work to do for members of this reserve as will be detailed below. As an example of such a policy I might suggest that two agriculturists (and scientific specialists to a less degree) be entertained on probation for each year for some time to come.

68193. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The period of probation is at present three years. This is a long time for a young trained man to be in suspense, and there is no reason why, if greater care is taken in selection in the first instance, this period should not be reduced to two years. This, however, I think is the minimum.

A reserve of agriculturists should usually be kept in each province according to its probable ultimate needs. These could be utilised by being placed in charge of sections of the country, in supplying leave appointments for which there is no provision at present and in the investigation of special problems. The day of special enquiries has only commenced and these will, I believe, form an increasing factor in agricultural progress for some years to come. I regard it as useless at present to send agriculturists for training in Pusa and think that they should be trained in their own province in order to assimilate the local conditions and language.

The case is somewhat different with regard to scientific specialists, although the danger of unsuitable selection is greater than in the case of agriculturists. There are far fewer men available and, as the standard required is higher, any mistake made is much more serious. I would suggest that the reserve in this case should be under the control of the Imperial Section with whom it would rest to place the specialists as early as possible in the provinces likely to need them. Speaking specially for Madras I consider that an additional Botanist could now be usefully employed under training, and I have no doubt that the same may be said of other sections.

68194. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—I do not know the conditions of service in the Agricultural Department as my agreement is a separate one, but I am informed that in several respects they are inferior to those of other recognised Services. This is a very serious matter, considering the class of university recruits aimed at, which is exactly similar to that in the Educational Department. If it is objected that the Agricultural Department is a small one I would point out that the

recruitment of an unsuitable officer is a far more serious matter in a small than in a large Department. I consider that for the life of the Department the class of recruits should be unexceptionable.

68195. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—I consider that the salary offered at present is generally insufficient, both as regards initial pay and ultimate maximum. The initial pay does materially affect the class of recruits and will continue to do so until the Service is recognised as a good one. The tendency of those leaving the Agricultural Department at present is inevitably not to recommend it.

I have some experience in the recruitment of officers for the Agricultural Department, for during my last furlough I visited almost all the Agricultural Colleges and Universities in the Kingdom and was freely used by Sir Thomas Holderness in obtaining officers for various appointments. And I found that the prospects were quite insufficiently attractive to induce anyone to leave England who had a reasonable prospect of obtaining an appointment at home, frequently on a much lower scale of pay.

It is not desirable that an officer entering into service should reach his maximum rate of pay after 14 years' service and should then remain at this rate for another 15 or 16 years without the chance of improvement.

I would, however, here draw my first distinction between the agriculturists and scientific specialists. On the average the training of the latter is longer and more laborious and they enter the Services with a better equipment than the former. While it is perhaps possible to obtain young agriculturists at the rate of pay offered in other larger Services. I consider that it is idle to expect specialists to come out for the same salary.

I would recommend that it should be possible for all officers of the Department to rise to at least Rs. 1,500 a month, and that special inducements as regards initial pay should be held out to scientific specialists. And that there should be a chance for higher maximum pay than that named for the better men in each province.

68196. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—It is generally admitted that the present leave rules are out of date and antiquated in several respects and I would merely desire that, if improvements are effected in this respect with regard to any of the other services (excepting the Civil Service and Military Service), they should be extended to the Agricultural Department as well.

68197. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The pension at present offered is insufficient for anyone with a family to live in England. It is therefore necessary to seek employment upon retirement. I do not think that this is fair after 25 to 30 years in Government service in India. I would suggest the abolition of the Rs. 5,000 limit, that the rate of pension should depend upon the length of service and scale of pay during the last five years in India, and that an additional sum of Rs.1,000 should be allowed to Provincial Directors of Agriculture, to the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India and to certain selected officers in the scientific section.

68198. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—Non-European officers—that is natives of the country—should be employed wherever possible in the higher posts. It is unnecessary to fix any limit for this at present because it is unfortunately the case that, in spite of careful search, hardly a single one has as yet been found to be suitable. Thus far we have met with a lack of administrative ability and power of independent research which probably indicates that we have not succeeded in attracting the best class of Indian to the Agricultural Department. The only openings at present available are those of Professors in the local colleges, and such appointments should be made where possible in order to attract a better class of Indians to the Service.

The present division of the Imperial Service into "Imperial" and "Provincial" is a good one. But it is not ideal. It is, in my opinion, of absolute importance that there should at least be an Imperial section. Otherwise we should have a series of detached Provincial services, some successful, others gradually atrophying and ultimately disappearing. There is, however, at present a serious dislocation between the Imperial and Provincial Services. It is difficult, without fuller knowledge, for me to indicate the remedy, but I put the following suggestions forward in the hope that they may be of use.

There should be one Imperial Department of Agriculture with a chief officer responsible to the Government of India. There should be a special research establishment at Pusa with reserve scientific men to be placed in those provinces where it has been demonstrated that useful work can be done. There should also be a reserve of agriculturists drafted to the various provinces where expansion is most probable in the near future. Once in a province, specialists, and especially agriculturists, should be moved as little as possible, although in the former case a special problem will sometimes have to be studied in several provinces.

It is difficult to indicate the exact amount of control to be exercised by the Chief of the Imperial Department, but with capable local Directors there should be little cause for interference and in matters of administration the local Government should have complete control of all officers serving under it. The permanent staff of the Research Institute would, however, naturally be recruited by selection from the Provincial Scientific Experts.

68199. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service.**—The Directors of the Provincial Agricultural Departments should be selected with much greater care than has sometimes been the case in the past. At present it has been found "convenient to appoint a member of the Civil Service" as Director. He is usually a better trained man and, when qualified, the results have been admirable. This arrangement is, however, anomalous and it cannot be expected that a suitable member of this Service will be usually available. The appointment of a Civilian Director should be dropped as soon as possible for the following reasons—

(*1*) He is usually insufficiently master of his subject.

(*2*) Cases have occurred where the appointment has been used with less regard to the needs of the Department than that of Civil Service.

(*3*) A capable member of the Department with administrative ability would obviously have an advantage over a civilian in directing its policy. There would also be fewer changes of Director.

(*4*) It would definitely raise the status of the Department to have a Director recruited from its ranks. This is an extremely important matter at the present moment, for, unless the Department is recognised as a good one it is idle to expect an improvement in the class of recruits.

It is of great importance for the success of the Provincial Agricultural Department that its Director should have as free a hand as possible in carrying out his work. In Madras the Director is under Commissioner in the Board of Revenue, who is responsible to Government for the Department. This officer is a very busy man, and the Agricultural Department with its multiplicity of detail of necessity can occupy a very small part of his time. There appears to be no reason whatever for this arrangement, for the Agricultural Department has nothing to do with the collection of revenue. The Madras arrangements (I cannot speak as regards other provinces except that they regard our system as extremely curious) of placing the Director of Agriculture under the Board of Revenue leads, in my opinion, to endless delay and confusion.

68200. **(IX) Other points.**—I would call attention to another matter in which the Madras Agricultural Department differs from those elsewhere in India. The scientific officers are under a disadvantage as compared with the agricultural recruits.

I have already referred to the longer time involved and greater expense incurred (to put it on the lowest plane) in the training of a scientific specialist than in that of the average agriculturist. It is ruled in Madras that the post of Principal of the Agricultural College should be filled by agriculturists and not by scientific specialists. This is one of the posts carrying additional emoluments and I regard this treatment as likely to react unfavourably on the recruitment of scientific specialists for Madras. There is no reason why the Principal of the Agricultural College should be an agriculturist to the exclusion of scientific men, and the latter usually hold the position in other provinces. As regards the Director of Agriculture, I would leave the matter open but if two men of equal ability are available, one a scientific specialist and the other an agriculturist, I would choose the latter for the post. This being the case, I think it only fair that there should be a grade open to the scientific members of the Service with equal emoluments, after approved service to that of the Director. The matter is of some importance in view of the fact that in the general recruitment to the Department a mediocre scientific specialist would be much more of a disaster than a mediocre agriculturist because of the character of the work required of them.

Dr. C. A. Barber called and examined.

68201. (*Chairman.*) The witness was recruited to the Service under special contract. He came out as Government Botanist on Rs. 700 a month with a free house. He had been fifteen years in India. At present he was Government sugar-cane expert for India on Rs. 1,500 a month with a free house.

68202. The present class of recruits to the Agricultural Department was by no means always satisfactory, and he suggested three methods for bringing about an improvement—first of all, the reorganising of the Selection Board; secondly, the forming of a reserve of officers in the Department, and thirdly, an improvement in conditions of service. With regard to the reorganisation of the Selection Board, he desired to associate on the Board gentlemen with Indian agricultural experience. At present officers coming out to India knew nothing about the Service, and after a few years they always showed signs of dissatisfaction that they had not been better informed at the time of their first appointment.

68203. With regard to forming a reserve of officers in the Department, he suggested that agriculturists, and to a less degree, scientific officers, should be entered on probation, irrespective of vacancies. If that scheme were carried out it would not entail an unnecessary expense, because it was certain that there would be a large expansion of the Department in the near future. Even if the contemplated expansion did not take place, there would not be any serious block in promotion, as the additional officers could be employed at once in every province. He knew roughly what the conditions were in each province, and he could definitely say that there was room for such an increase of staff. His proposal was in fact based on a very strong assumption that the whole Department was about to undergo considerable expansion. He thought that if these measures were adopted the present system under which officers were selected rather hurriedly might be avoided.

68204. He had recently visited almost all of the institutions in England, and had found that there was a large field from which suitable candidates could be recruited to the Department. In 1912 there were thirty diplomates at Cambridge, one of whom had been induced to join the Department after considerable difficulty. None of the other twenty-nine men had made any offer to come into the Service. He thought that was due to the fact that they did not consider that the pay and prospects were adequate. If pay and prospects were improved eligible candidates would, he thought, be tempted to offer themselves for appointment.

68205. The point he mainly insisted on was that there must be a large increase* in the Department in order that it might play its proper part in the agricultural development of the country. At present the Department only dealt with one small spot at a time, and obtained good results if it was able to concentrate its attention and its staff on that spot. There had been in Madras during the last five years two District Officers, one of whom had had to deal with 23,000 square miles of crops, and the other with 29,000 square miles. Great portions of the country had not been touched, and many questions were started, only to be dropped for lack of staff. Where the Department had been able to concentrate its attention on certain definite questions it had met with enormous success. He might refer, for example, to the case of single seedling paddy. The Department had discovered that instead of planting four or five or six seedlings, one was sufficient for the purpose and that saved Rs. 3 per acre. This improvement was now carried out on 100,000 acres. The increase in the Department which he considered necessary, and which would inevitably come, stood or fell by the inclusion of a large number of Indians in the Department. The Department could not have a great force of Europeans in it; the number of Europeans would have to be increased, but the Service would have to depend very largely upon the higher subordinates. If those upper subordinate posts were thrown open, a very much better class of men would enter the Department. What he had said with regard to the class of man entering the European Service applied even to a greater extent to the class of Indians the Service was able to recruit. It was not getting the best men, as the pay and prospects were so poor, and the number of posts open to them were so few. In that respect the Department suffered in comparison with the comparable sections of the Forest Department, the Public Works Department, and the Educational Department.

68206. He would like to see one Deputy Director in every district, which would mean an addition of twenty-two men in Madras alone. Even then the charges would be far more than a man could really manage, but attention could be concentrated on individual problems, with the result that there would be a great increase in the prosperity of the country, and ultimately in the revenue to Government.

68207. He felt satisfied as the result of his own experience that Deputy Directors when sent into the country districts succeeded in inducing the Indian farmer to take up improved methods of agriculture. It took three to four years to introduce the most obvious improvement, and then it was only done by obtaining the friendship and confidence of the people.

68208. He based his desire for an increase of Indians on the following facts. Indians formed a very large proportion of the Agricultural Service, and unless their number was increased largely, he did not think the Department would be justified in increasing the number of its District Officers. He did not say that those District Officers should be Europeans. There was no feeling against any Indian officer in the Service, provided he was as good as the European.

68209. He thought Indians intended for promotion to the upper branches of the Service should be trained in the Department, should pass up through the upper subordinate grades to a Provincial Service, and should then be selected from the Provincial Service into the Imperial Service. He was strongly against any direct recruitment in England of Indians who had passed through a University course, unless they had been thoroughly tested out in India first. He had quoted in the

* The witness afterwards put in two notes which have been printed as Appendices VIII. and IX.

written statement the report of the Commission on Technical Studies Scholarships, which pointed out that it was no use sending any Indian to England to go through a technical course there, unless he had had practical experience of the subject in India first, and unless he had been selected by the local authorities. He laid stress on the necessity for local selection in India, as the local authorities had intimate knowledge of a man's capacity and the work for which he was wanted.

68210. Having got his man, and assuming that he had been through a course of training in India, he would not suggest sending him to England, although there were certainly advantages to be gained from an English training. If a good man was found in the District Service, it would be a good thing for him to go to England for a couple of years, with the object of broadening his ideas. With regard to research, on the other hand, he did not consider at present the Indian colleges were sufficiently equipped to give a complete training. If a promising man was discovered on the research side, he would recommend sending him to an English University in order to be trained in his special subject. He would prefer to send a man to England for research purposes to sending him to Pusa, as Pusa was not sufficiently equipped with the necessary training staff. He agreed that the research work going on at Pusa was peculiarly adapted to Indian conditions, but he laid great stress on a thorough grounding in general principles. Moreover, Pusa was not in the tropics, and the crops on the whole were more similar to the crops of Europe than they were to those of southern India. The Provincial Colleges would be perfectly capable of training men in district work, and to a certain extent they would be capable of training them in teaching, but they would certainly not be capable of training them in research.

68211. The present standard of training in the Madras College was adequate for the class of man needed for the Service. He did not favour any method of direct recruitment of an Indian to the higher branches of the Service. Very occasionally a man might be appointed direct to the Provincial Service, but nobody should be appointed direct to the Imperial Service. An officer who had been in the subordinate ranks a considerable number of years would make an effective superior officer, and would hold his own with his colleagues. It was very difficult to say whether an officer recruited in that way would be likely to take the position of authority better than an officer highly trained and appointed direct. There was no doubt that a directly recruited officer would enjoy a certain amount of kudos, and he might possibly have more authority, but he would not be able to enforce that authority, as he would not know the Service so intimately as the promoted man and would not be respected by his subordinates in the same manner as the man who had risen from the ranks.

68212. The service would attract the best class of candidates if a prospect was held out of selection to the Provincial Service, and finally of promotion to the Senior Service. It should, however, be understood that a good man would be pushed on rapidly.

68213. In Madras the scientific specialist laboured under a special disability in that it was laid down that the post of Principal of the Coimbatore Agricultural College should be filled by an agriculturist. He did not know if there was a definite Government Order on the subject, but the practice was well defined. He did not say he would like the position to be open to both sections, but if it was a rule that the Principalship should be taken from the Deputy Director class, then he thought that some post carrying an equivalent rate of pay should be open to the scientific section. His whole object was to establish as fair conditions of service all round as possible. It was far more difficult to attract the scientific expert than to attract the ordinary agriculturist into the Department. He agreed that other things being equal, an agriculturist would be likely to be better qualified as an administrator, but the position of Principal required academic qualifications also.

68214. There was not the close contact which he would like to see between the research work at Pusa and the research work going on in Madras. He did not suggest the appointment of an officer with general authority over the whole of the agricultural service throughout India, because every province must be in charge of its own men, but he would like to see the authority of the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India increased. He agreed that it would be a good thing if, in each province, there was an officer in general control over the Agricultural Department, the Veterinary Department, Co-operative Credit Societies, and possibly Village Industries. Assuming that a suitable officer could be found, it would be an extremely good idea, but what he was afraid of was that the scheme might result merely in the employment of an additional Secretary, and that he particularly wished to avoid. He disapproved of the present arrangement under which the Director of Agriculture was placed under the Commissioner of the Board of Revenue; he thought it was unnecessary.

68215. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) If the Department of Agricultural in Madras desired to bring any point to the notice of the Government of India, it should communicate direct with the Agricultural Adviser of the Government of India. What happened now was that a proposal would be made by one of the Scientific Experts to the Director of Agriculture, who had to forward it to the Board of Revenue. The Board of Revenue then sent it to the Government, and the Government might or might not send it on to the Government of India. The proposal might, however, be dropped at any stage, without reference to the expert by whom it was originated. If the question was merely one of scientific procedure, or co-ordination of scientific results, which had no reference to revenue or administration, then there were facilities for communicating direct with the Agricultural Adviser, and through him to the Government of India.

68216. The Agricultural Service was not one which required mere mental ability. Agriculture was a business, and anyone who was not a capable business man was of no use to the Service. A man could not be a successful man of business without technical knowledge, and for district work what they wanted was technical knowledge combined with business capacity.

68217. (*Mr. Sly.*) Local recruits to the Agricultural Department started on a salary of Rs. 35 rising to Rs. 50. He considered that such officers could in time be trained up to the standard required for the Imperial service. He agreed that better material might be obtained for the Imperial Service if officers were recruited direct to the Provincial Service on Rs. 200 a month, but they would not have had the necessary initial training. His suggestion was to recruit Indians from the subordinate to the Provincial Service; to test their capacity for a certain number of years; then, if necessary, to put selected officers through a post graduate course, preferably in India; and ultimately to promote them to the Imperial Service.

68218. The present average age of entry of the sixty men in the Imperial Department was 27 years and eight months. The ages at entry ranged from 20 to 40. Agriculturists should, he considered, have obtained a diploma from a recognised college, and should also have completed at least one year's training on a farm in England. That would make them 23 years of age. The research officer should have taken an honours degree at a recognised school, and should have completed at least two years on research, which would bring him to about 25 or over.

68219. On the whole he would be against bringing out a number of short-term specialists for the Department, as it would take a number of years for them to get accustomed to the conditions of the country. He quoted the instance of an eminent geologist who came out and proved an utter failure. He would be prepared to admit a possible exception in the case of a man who was engaged

for a short term simply for the investigation of a special subject, but it would be an enormously expensive arrangement. Taking the post of bacteriologist, he explained that the bacteriological conditions of the soil in India were so different from those of the soil in England or in any temperate clime, that it would be useless to bring out a man of established reputation in England for a short period. It would be much better to appoint permanently men from England who had been trained as researchers.

68220. His colleagues considered that, if possible, the post of Director should be filled from the Agricultural Service and not by an Indian Civil Service officer, but personally he was not in favour of an immediate change. At present officers in the Agricultural Service were too young to fill the posts and if a Departmental officer were appointed he would hold the position for too long a time; and possibly also there were not enough officers in the Service from whom a selection could be made. He did not think it would be a suitable system to select an officer for a provincial directorship from the whole of India. There would be no objection to bringing a man from one part of the Gangetic plain to another part, provided the local Service was safeguarded against any injustice, and there might be no difficulty in taking a man from Bombay and putting him in the Central Provinces, but it would be a great mistake to bring a man from the Gangetic plain down to Madras.

68221. The position of Director should be open to the expert as well as to the agriculturist, but if there were two men available, one an expert and the other an agriculturist, he would chose the district officer for the post, other things being equal.

68222. It was not the case that experts (who should be a much smaller body than the Deputy Directors) were given compensation in the form of appointments at Pusa and special allowances. He was afraid the special allowances at Pusa were absolutely illusory. He believed that if the posts at Pusa were thrown open to the Department they would all go begging. If an officer from Madras was transferred to Pusa his provincial work would come to an end, and he would have to start all over again under entirely different conditions, in which he would not be interested. It was this consideration more than anything else which prevented men from going to Pusa. The theory under which the best of the provincial experts were selected to hold appointments at Pusa had broken down completely.

68223. A scheme providing that the Agricultural Service should have one of its own officers at its head that the Veterinary Department and Co-operative Credit Department should also be placed in charge of one of its own officers and that above these three branches of the Service, there should be an officer of the Indian Civil Service acting as Commissioner and dealing direct with the Government was a step in the right direction; but it was not an ideal scheme. A better system would be to have a trained technical officer acting as Commissioner. He agreed that one man could not be an expert in all three branches, but an officer trained in the technical work of any one of them would be much better fitted for the post of Commissioner than a mere administrator. He would not in the least mind a veterinary officer holding the position; he would be better qualified than an Indian Civil Service officer. What Government wanted was an expert adviser and not a mere secretary.*

68224. (*Mr. Fisher.*) For the purposes of agriculture India could be divided into four main tracts, and there would no difficulty in transferring experts within the limits of those tracts, but if he was transferred from one tract to another, he would at first be under very great disadvantages.

68225. He would certainly not recommend that all candidates for the Agricultural Department in India should have passed through the agricultural course at Cambridge; there would be no advantage at all in that, and the Department would not obtain as good a class of man as it did at the present time.

68226. Nor would there be any advantage in selecting men at a comparatively young age, and in putting them through a course in an Agricultural College afterwards. The present plan was quite satisfactory.

68227. The starting pay of specialists and agriculturists would have to vary, because of the different qualifications required. For a scientific expert the Department would have to bargain directly in every case. There was no way of commanding the services of a good scientfic expert in India, unless he was paid a very high figure. In his view a man might become a scientific expert two years after he had taken his degree. If an Indian obtained a good degree in India, and afterwards did well as a scientific research student at Cambridge, he should certainly be admitted straight into the Imperial Service, but he had never yet come across such a case.

68228. It would undoubtedly be more desirable at the present moment to strengthen the agricultural side of the Department than to increase the number of scientific and research officers.

68229. (*Mr. Madge.*) He fully believed that the operations of the Agricultural Department were sufficiently remunerative to justify a large measure of development. That view had been pressed upon the Government of India and a series of reports had been sent up at different times. During the recent meeting of the Board of Agriculture at Coimbatore, the dominant note was that great expansion must take place in district work.

68230. There was a class of landowner in Madras which corresponded with the landowners in Bengal who really took an interest in their estates, with the view of improving them, and the department had many friends amongst them.

68231. It was very hard upon a young man straight from college to be put in full administrative charge, and he would prefer that newly entered officers should have a certain amount of training before being placed in full control.

68232. (*Mr. Buckley.*) On the whole he thought it would be advisable to have a selection bar at Rs. 1,000 provided that there were not only a limited number of appointments above Rs. 1,000.

68233. He looked forward to the time when there would be a Deputy Director in each district. The first step, however, would be to get assistant directors in each district working under Deputy Directors who were in charge of four or five districts.

* The witness afterwards wrote: "I wish to modify this paragraph in that my answer had to be on the spur of the moment. After thinking the matter over and considering the type of Government in India and the excellence of the Civil Service, I withdraw my objection to a member of that Service occupying the post of Pusa Commissioner."

(The witness withdrew.)

M.R. Ry. Rai Bahadur K. Rangachariar Avargal, Government Lecturing Botanist, Agricultural College, Coimbatore.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68234. A Provincial Service is necessary for this College, and some additions also to the executive branch. In all the other provinces, except Madras, there is a Provincial Service attached to the Agricultural College. At Poona there are four or five men in the provincial grade. At Nagpur five, and in the Agricultural College at Pusa a number of them. In Bombay there are four divisional inspectors in the provincial grade, and in the Central Provinces there are seven men.

In the Agricultural College, Coimbatore, there are 21 assistants at present and not even one in the Provincial Service. In the Forest College, which is also a technical college like our college, all the assistants are in the Provincial Service. The course in the Forest College is simpler and shorter than our college course.

Even at Saidapet there were two persons in this grade. (One was acting as Vice-Principal for ten years.)

This step will add to the prestige of the college, and the college will become more popular. Further, this will certainly attract superior type of men, and they will stick on to the Department and all the experience they gain will be an advantage to the college. Good men will take up appointments even in the lower grades, for there is every chance of their getting promotion. At present there is no inducement.

68235. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The conditions of service so far as leave and such other privileges are concerned, the officers are at a disadvantage. They have lost all the advantages they have been enjoying while under the Educational Department, and even the few advantages of the Revenue Department are denied to them. The work of the assistants in this college is more arduous than in the Educational Department. Officers in the Educational Department have more pay, better prospects of promotion, and plenty of leisure besides the vacation leave.

68236. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—For our college we must have at least five appointments in the gazetted Service. All these may be on same pay, one being attached to each section. Or we may have different grades as in the Forest College, inasmuch as our college is in no way less important or inferior as regards the training.

At present there is a stop at Rs. 250, and comparatively speaking this is not fair. This college is more important, or at least as important as any other professional college, and as such it is only fair to bring this college in line with the other colleges, as regards pay, staff and conditions of service. This college certainly deserves, at least as much consideration as the Forest College, if we bear in mind the needs of the country. At present there may not be a great need for men of a superior type, but as soon as the college and the Department pass beyond the initial stage, there will be a great need for a better class of men.

[See also the supplementary statement by Rai Bahadur K. Rangachariar, immediately below.]

Supplementary Written Statement.

68237. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—(*A*) *Indian Agricultural Service.*—Officers of this Service may be considered under two distinct classes: (*1*) Specialists and (*2*) Agriculturists proper, as the type of men required for the two branches are different.

(*1*) *Specialists.*—For some more years the specialists intended for research work of a higher order in the Department have to be recruited entirely from amongst Europeans, or Indians that have received a sound training in foreign Universities. Arrangements should, however, be made to bring into existence Indians capable of doing research work. Graduates in science of the Indian Universities that show special aptitude for science may be selected and sent to foreign countries for special training and drafted into the Department after the training. The scientific experts must consider the training of the Assistants under them for research work and the improving of the laboratories so as to bring them to the level of the model laboratories in Europe and America as a part and the foremost of their duties.

(*2*) *Agriculturists proper.*—As regards the officers who are to be pure agriculturists, recruitment should not be confined to the Europeans only. Indians should have a greater share in this cadre than Europeans, because agricultural experts have to deal more directly with the ryot than the officers of other Departments. The officer for the agricultural side should possess a very intimate knowledge of the ryots' ways of thinking, their language and their needs to gain the confidence of the ryot. An European officer, however sympathetic and enthusiastic, cannot be expected to be able to do this work with the same facility as an Indian.

The present system of recruitment to the Indian Agricultural Service is that, when a vacancy occurs or is about to occur, the Secretary of State is informed and he selects a man, no nomination being usually sent up by the Local Government. This leads to the restriction of the selection to men resident in England and to the exclusion of Indians with foreign University qualifications who may have returned to India.

(*B*) *Provincial Agricultural Service.*—Recruitment for the Provincial Service, which, it is hoped, will be brought into existence soon, must be partly from the Subordinate Service and partly by direct nomination of men possessing high qualifications.

If the Scientific Assistants are trained properly by the experts, there need not be a special leave reserve in the Indian Agricultural Service. In the Educational Department the vacancies occurring by the granting of leave in the Indian Educational Service are filled up by selecting men from the Provincial Service.

68238. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—All Assistants and officers of the grade of the Provincial Service should invaribly be graduates in science and they should be made to undergo a course of training in Agriculture proper for a year. This system should be adopted until the local Agricultural College is able to turn out Licentiates in Agriculture of the right type, that is, men with good general education.

68239. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—At present the officers are expected to do both research and training work. This is not a satisfactory arrangement. An officer engaged in research work cannot devote sufficient time to teaching, without detriment to his research work. Teaching in this college is of a different type, and is far more taxing than in Arts colleges. Much time and previous preparation are needed for teaching and this, by itself, is a very hard task. So it is unfair to expect men who are teaching to take part in regular research work.

The primary duties of the experts being research work, the teaching has to be left entirely to the Indian Assistants and it is necessary that they must be in the Provincial Service.

68240. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The Agricultural Department must be on a par with the Educational or Revenue Department as regards pay, prospects, etc.

68241. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—Rules as regards privilege leave so far as applicable to the teaching section are a very great hardship. At present they are allowed to take privilege leave only during the vacation time. The principle on which vacation leave is given to teachers and professors in schools and colleges should not be ignored in this Department, as teaching work in this college is more arduous.

68242. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, etc.**—There is no need for any limitation as regards the employment in any branch of this Department, unlike the Indian Civil Service, for which such limitations may be considered necessary for political reasons.

68243. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service.**—The post of the Director of Agriculture should be held only by an experienced officer of the Indian Civil Service who is specially trained. In view of the varied experience he gains in district work and his intimate knowledge of the conditions of the ryot, he is best fitted to be the head of this Department.

RAI BAHADUR K. RANGACHARIAR called and examined.

68244. (*Chairman.*) The witness had occupied the position of lecturing botanist at the Coimbatore College for the past two years. He had been 16 years in the Service. He had previously been connected with the Educational Department, from which he was lent to the Agricultural Department, and subsequently he became permanently attached to the latter Service.

68245. His first written statement consisted mainly of recommendations as to the organisation of the Provincial Service in the Agricultural College. The present scale of pay which he received in his present position rose from Rs. 330 to Rs. 660. He had modified his view as to the Provincial Service in a second written statement which he had forwarded to the Commission. His present idea was that there should be an intermediate Service leading to the Imperial Service. He preferred that method of recruitment of Indians to the higher Service to direct recruitment. He had two objects in view. If there were capable Indians they should be put straight away into the Provincial Service, with a view to being promoted to the higher Service. He would also give some encouragement to those who entered the subordinate Service, in that they would have higher pay when they retired. For that double object, it was necessary to have an intermediate grade.

68246. There were five definite scientific sections in the College, and at least one assistant ought to be on a higher grade of pay, so that he might have a better status. At present there was a good deal of difference between the assistant and the expert. The latter naturally did not consider an assistant as his equal. He recommended the establishment of a grade on Rs. 250 to Rs. 500. He meant that men would be promoted into the Rs. 500 grade, and if satisfactory there they would move on into the higher Service. His suggestion applied both to the teaching side and to the agricultural side.

68247. He thought the qualifications for entry into the college should be a distinct aptitude for science, and a subsequent agricultural training. He would test a man's aptitude for science by an ordinary examination in one of the local colleges.

68248. He would sooner see recruitment to the superior service by promotion from the Provincial Service than by a double process of promotion from the subordinate service to the Provincial Service, and from the Provincial Service to the Imperial Service.

68249. He did not agree with the suggestion that 10 per cent. of the vacancies in the Imperial Service should be reserved for Indians. There should be no limitation whatever, but there should be a preponderance of Indians in the purely agricultural line.

68250. With regard to the system of training at the College, he was of the opinion that the College should provide training for the higher class of agriculturists of India, and also a training for the ryots.

68251. Another point he wished to bring forward was that at present an agricultural graduate suffered very much in comparison with an ordinary graduate. Both took a four years' course. The arts graduate, however, was eligible to enter any department of the public service, whereas an agricultural graduate was supposed to be unfit for such positions. He was not considered as equal to the ordinary arts graduate. As a matter of fact if he was properly trained in the Agricultural College he ought to be superior to the ordinary arts graduate, because the scientific course in the Agricultural College was of a superior kind. He had been told that the training given at the Agricultural College in India was as good as that given in England.

68252. (*Mr. Madge.*) He thought a general admission to the effect that only people who were capable would be selected for promotion to the higher posts of the Service would give greater encouragement than the setting apart of a number of listed posts.

68253. (*Mr. Fisher.*) Assistants in the Agricultural Department had no chance of rising beyond Rs. 250, whereas in the Educational Department they could rise to Rs. 700. He admitted that no definite offer was made to teachers entering the College that they would rise to Rs. 700.

68254. (*Mr. Sly.*) There were two provincial appointments in the Agricultural Department, on Rs. 250 rising to Rs. 400, and there were five appointments on Rs. 150 rising to Rs. 250. He suggested the creation of a further intermediate service with five appointments ranging between Rs. 250 and Rs. 500. Officers for such posts should be recruited from amongst science graduates of the Indian Universities, who had undergone a subsequent period of training.

68255. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He was not transferred at his own request from the Educational Department to the Agricultural Department. When he was transferred the conditions of service in the Agricultural Department were the same as they were at present, but he was not aware that he would be retained in the Agricultural Department. He was lent on a five years' agreement, but after four years had elapsed, it was thought necessary that he should stay in the Department, and he did not object.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Bombay, Tuesday, 10th February, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, Esq., C.I.E.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

V. H. GONEHALLI, Esq., Extra Deputy Director of Agriculture, Bombay.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

G. F. KEATINGE, Esq., C.I.E., I.C.S., Director of Agriculture, Bombay.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68256. *PRELIMINARY.*—I am called upon to submit my remarks at very short notice on my return from furlough after two years' absence. I therefore propose to deal with the matter in general terms. I shall be prepared to give detailed reasons for my opinions, if called upon to do so.

Our Imperial and Provincial Staff consists of two classes (*a*) District Staff, consisting of the Deputy Directors and Inspectors of Agriculture, (*b*) the Staff of the Poona Agricultural College and Re-

search Institute, consisting of the Professors and Assistant Professors of the various Sciences involved. It has been repeatedly pointed out that the multifarious duties of both the District and the Teaching Staff are such that they do not admit of an adequate amount of research taking place, and it cannot be long before it is recognised that we cannot make satisfactory progress as a Scientific Department without the services of men who possess both the training and the leisure necessary for adequate research. I would therefore add a third class to the two already mentioned and divide the Department into three branches, namely: (*a*) District Staff, (*b*) Teaching Staff, (*c*) Research Staff, without, of course, meaning to imply that branches (*a*) and (*b*) are not to do any research.

68257. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—Members of the Imperial Service are appointed by the Secretary of State for India. Members of the Provincial Department are appointed by the Bombay Government. I can suggest no better method of recruitment.

68258. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—It has been customary to post new probationers for the Imperial Service to Pusa. When such men are destined for the District or Teaching branches, it is desirable that they should be posted at once to a Provincial Department, if possible to the Province in which they are likely to serve in order that they may become acquainted with the natural conditions, rural problems and departmental organisation, with which they will have to deal.

As regards probation, the period of three years should be sufficient if the probationer is serving throughout the period under the same supervision, but may be insufficient in cases where either he or the Supervising Officer is transferred. For the purpose of a general rule, however, I think that the period of three years is suitable.

As regards research men, it will be necessary to have the widest field of choice either from our existing District and Teaching Staffs, with or without additional special training, or from men from other countries who are actually engaged in research work. In the latter case, the conditions of service, either permanent or temporary, would have to be fixed to meet each individual case, and there should be no hard-and-fast-rules. It would be an essential and important part of the duties of such research workers that they should associate with them in their research work other selected members of our staff in such a way as to train them to take up independent research work.

I think it must be confessed that at present our District Staff as a whole are not in sufficient touch with research work and that the Department is suffering from this cause.

68259. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The existing conditions of service appear to me to be suitable.

68260. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The pay of any class of men must be fixed on a consideration of the market rate of pay that such men can command, and the conditions under which they will have to perform their work. In the case of the Agricultural Officers, brought from England, the rate of pay must be fixed so as to attract the right class of men, to compensate them for the disadvantages and expenses of foreign service, and to keep them satisfied that they are getting adequate remuneration for their work as compared with other similar services in this country and in other countries. I think that the present rates of pay sanctioned for the members of the Imperial Agricultural Service fairly meet the case—at any rate, in the earlier period of their service. As regards the latter part of their service, it is to be noticed that they reach the maximum, viz., Rs. 1,000 per mensem in the fourteenth year of their service, and in the case of the men who have been appointed direct on Rs. 500 per mensem, in the eleventh year of their service. The only increment in pay that then remains for them to look to under the existing arrangements is the chance of a special allowance as Principal of an Agricultural College or a Member of the Pusa Staff, which, from the nature of the work that some of them perform, they are very unlikely to obtain, however efficient they may be. I think that this should be provided for, but I am not prepared to make definite suggestions on the spur of the moment. I made enquiries in Java as to the rate of pay given to the scientific experts recruited in Holland for the Java Agricultural Department, and ascertained that the rates of pay were very similar to ours, viz., Rs. 500 to Rs. 1,000 per mensem for the great bulk of the staff, and a few posts of Rs. 1,000 to Rs. 1,200 or Rs. 1,200 per mensem for the men in the most responsible positions. A Government post in Java, however, includes amongst its attractions a free passage to and from Europe for the officer and his family, and in some cases a rent-free house. It must be realised that the average rate of pay obtained by men doing this kind of work in their own country is much lower than we have to pay for European experts in India. At the College where I received my agricultural instruction, the salary of the Professors was £300 a year and of the Assistant Professors £120 a year, and some very capable men had been working at the latter rate of pay for many years, with little chance of promotion. At the Agricultural College, Utah, U.S.A., a large institution with a teaching and research staff of 80, the rates of pay are as follows:—Graduates are engaged in the first instance on a salary of 800 dols. a year (Rs. 200 per mensem); those that prove themselves capable will become Assistant Professors, after a period of from 3 to 10 years, on a salary of from 1,200 dols. to 2,000 dols. a year (Rs. 300 to 500 per mensem), and those who eventually become Professors get a salary of 1,800 dols. to 3,600 dols. a year (Rs. 450 to Rs. 900 per mensem). There are no pensions. These rates are extraordinarily low when consideration is paid to the cost of living and the rate of salaries in America; indeed, the salary of 800 dols. a year, which is all that a selected graduate will get for a period which may extend to 10 years, is just about the pay that an unskilled labourer will get in the same locality; but there is no difficulty in getting good men to take the jobs, because of the interest that they take in the work and the dignity that is attached to the position.

As regards the scale of pay sanctioned for our Provincial Department, viz., Rs. 350—50-2—550 for Extra-Deputy Directors, and Rs. 200—30-2—350 for Divisional Inspectors and Assistant Professors, I think that these rates are suitable. Having regard to the cost of living in India, they compare favourably with rates of pay given in other countries to men doing this class of work in their own country. We have hitherto had no difficulty in recruiting for the Department the best of our Agricultural Graduates. It is necessary, however, to keep the rates on a level approximating to the rates paid for similar work in other Departments in the Presidency, or we should not obtain the men, and it may be necessary eventually to raise the maximum rates for men in the Provincial Service who are appointed to positions involving much responsibility. The rates are certainly lower than those given to the European staff, and it may be asked "Why not substitute Indian for European staff?" I am dealing with this matter in my remarks under Heading VII.

68261. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—I gather from the reports submitted by some of the members of the Provincial Service in this Presidency that they have three main objections to the existing division between the Imperial and Provincial Departments. The first objection is regarding the different rates of pay. I have already dealt with this matter under Heading IV.

The second objection consists in the allegation that Members of the Provincial Department are not given sufficient freedom or scope for independent work, but are unduly subjected to the

Members of the Imperial Service. Whatever system of division or classification of officers may be adopted, some officers must serve under the general orders and supervision of others. The amount of independence granted by an officer to any officer who serves under him will depend on the temperament and experience of the controlling officer, on the one hand, and on the capacity, resourcefulness and reliability of the subordinate officer on the other hand. It is certainly very desirable that officers in the Provincial Service should be given a large degree of independence, and anything like excessive departmentalism is to be deprecated in the Agricultural Department; but this is a matter that depends very much on the personal equation, and I do not see how it can be provided for by any hard and fast rules. The Department is a new one from top to bottom, and we are all in need of criticism. It is perhaps too much to expect that such criticisms as are made shall never hurt anyone's feelings. In so far as any genuine grievance exists, however, under this head, it points to defective administration rather than to defective rules.

The third objection, that the division of the Department into Imperial and Provincial is derogatory to the latter and checks esprit de corps seems to have little substance apart from the two objections already noted. I do not see that there is anything in the terms Imperial and Provincial that is objectionable; but if any sentimental grievance exists on this point, I should have no objection to the abolition of the terms, and to place all the officers on one list.

As regards the employment of Europeans and Indians in the Department, I see no reason why any man should not be promoted to any post for which he is qualified. Indians have already been appointed to high posts in this Department. But speaking as Director of Agriculture, with reference to the present generation and the work in hand, I think that a proportion of European officers is essential in both the District and Teaching Branches (*vide* classification of branches made in paragraph 2). As regards the Research Branch, which does not yet exist apart from the two branches already mentioned, but which I hope to see shortly created, the only qualification needed is capacity for and experience in research work. At present I think we must look outside India for the men we want, but the sooner they can be obtained in India the better for all concerned.

68262. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—It is very important that close and friendly relations should exist between the Agricultural Department on the one hand and the Indian Civil Service and Irrigation and Forest Departments on the other hand; and this need will increase as time goes on. Hitherto our relations with other departments have been most friendly, and many officers in the Indian Civil Service and other Departments have co-operated with our work in the most cordial way. The Department is expanding rapidly, gaining experience daily and improving its organisation. I anticipate that in the near future it will be expected to advise and co-operate in matters with which it has hitherto had little concern; and it is probable that questions will arise regarding its exact position in the general scheme of administration. Such questions must be disposed of as they arise.

68263. In conclusion, I would suggest that the future of the Agricultural Department is not yet sufficiently defined to make it possible at this stage to provide for future contingencies, and would deprecate any attempt, at this stage of development, to fetter our expanding activities by hard and fast rules. Rules which are suitable for one Province to-day are often inapplicable to another Province to-day, or even to the same Province in a few years time.

Mr. G. F. Keatinge called and examined.

68264. (*Chairman.*) The witness had occupied his present position for six years. He had been 19 years in the service. Prior to his taking up the Directorship he had undergone a two years' agricultural course in England.

68265. He had suggested dividing the department into three branches, but he did not intend to imply that there should be any hard and fast division. With regard to the suggestion of other witnesses, that there should be no further separation between research and administration than existed at present, and that it would be injurious to the progress of agriculture if such were the case, he said that to some extent there might be difficulties in that respect under the scheme he had put forward. Under present conditions men who ought to be in a position to undertake research work had not sufficient time to do so; they were occupied with teaching work, with administrative work, and with a mass of correspondence with the public. They ought to be relieved of some of this work, in order that they could devote more exclusive attention to research. He would like to have some men whose primary work was research, and who would form a definite branch of the service recruited in a different way. How they would be recruited would depend on how it was possible to recruit them. It would be difficult to obtain suitable men, and there would have to be an absolutely free hand in the matter of recruitment. He certainly thought that research work could be combined with a certain amount of teaching.

68266. The suggestion that the Pusa staff should consist of officers who had attained high positions and who were near the end of their service, and that they should form an Advisory Board for agriculture for all India, was no doubt a valuable one, but he had always understood that the primary object of Pusa was to provide for post-graduate research, and that research would be carried on by the members of the institute, who would be prepared to train other people in their methods. Certainly, in so far as a staff could be brought into existence there, which would be able to advise the Provinces generally on matters which they were investigating, it would be, and was at present, very valuable. The conditions at Pusa, however, were very different from what they were in other parts of India and the distances to be covered were so large that Bombay, for instance, very seldom saw members of the Pusa staff. Although he would like to see Pusa raised to the highest possible standard, he regarded it as essential that there should be other research centres in appropriate localities. He did not think in practice it would work out that Pusa could be a senior research centre with authority over the other centres. He thought each Province must do a great deal of its own research work, as the conditions in different Provinces were so very varied. There were problems in the drier parts of the Bombay Presidency which were not known at Pusa.

68267. He thought in years to come a certain number of the Deputy Directors would be qualified to hold the post of Director of Agriculture. It was mainly a matter of personal characteristics. The main part of the work which a Director had to do was administrative, and so long as a man had the capacity to do that kind of work, it did not matter whether he belonged to the agricultural service or to some other service. Of course, the man occupying the post should know something about the subject. As the work of the service expanded it would tend to become more administrative, and it would train men to become better administrators in the higher branch.

68268. He regarded it as important that provided competent men could be found, there should be an indigenous agency in India in the Department of Agriculture.

68269. The Bombay Presidency was divided into four divisions, one of which was in charge of an Extra Deputy Director, a member of the Provincial Service. That gentleman had been selected from amongst a number of candidates about 7 or 8 years ago, and was sent to Cambridge for a special agricultural training. Having taken his diploma he returned to the Presidency, and was appointed first of all as Divisional Inspector of Agriculture, and was subsequently promoted to the position of Extra Deputy Director. He came from the cultivator classes.

68270. Difficulty was experienced in the Bombay Presidency in getting men from the cultivator classes with sufficient education to make capable administrators. There was, however, a certain number of such men. Another difficulty was that a man might come from the cultivator classes but have no experience of cultivation.

68271. The only way in which active steps could be taken with a view to getting into the Service officers who had previous agricultural associations was to try and catch such men young, and get them to join the Department. Some years ago he had visited most of the High Schools in the Presidency, and had tried to pick out boys of the cultivator classes for scholarships at the agricultural college. He picked out some, but a good many of them failed to get through their examinations. Others were doing successfully. On the research side, it was less important to attract men from the cultivator class.

68272. Assuming that they had discovered a man who showed promise of making a good research officer, the decision as to sending him for a post-graduate course to Pusa would depend entirely on whether Pusa was offering facilities in that particular branch of research. He would sooner send a man to Poona for some classes of work than to Pusa. There existed at Poona all the arrangements and equipment for efficient post-graduate work in some of the scientific branches of research. The scientific staff at Poona consisted of an agricultural chemist, an agricultural botanist, a professor of agriculture and six assistant professors in various branches. That was not an adequate staff; there should be an increase, because the officers had to do a number of other duties in addition to their teaching and research work.

68273. He regarded it as important that there should be an increase on the administrative side of the Service. The charges were still very big, and might with advantage be further sub-divided.

68274. The best training an Indian could have for the Imperial Service was to serve in the first instance in the Provincial Branch, and having shown his capacity, he should then be sent to Europe to broaden his experience and to carry out further studies. In his opinion that was a better method than direct recruitment.

68275. He regarded the scale for the Provincial Service as adequate, except possibly towards the end of a man's service. The deficiency here had however, not yet arisen, as the service was still young.

68276. As to whether the salary of an Extra Deputy Director who was in charge of a division, and doing work of the same responsibility as the Deputy Director, was adequate by comparison with that of officers in the Imperial Service doing the same work alongside of him, it was a matter of the relative cost of living, and of the market rate of the European on the one side, and of the similarly trained Indian on the other. An Extra Deputy Director received up to Rs. 550 whereas Deputy Directors might rise to Rs. 1,000. He would not consider that an undue disparity in pay for work of comparable value. He regarded the matter entirely from the point of view of market values.

68277. If the work developed to any considerable extent, he agreed that there might be a senior officer who would have general control over the whole of the Services which dealt with agriculture, and who would be a connecting link between those Services and Government, each of them having its own departmental head. There would be plenty of work for such an officer to perform.

68278. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The assistance which the Bombay Agricultural Service had hitherto obtained from Pusa had been mainly in the direction of training members of its staff in entomology and mycology. Pusa was not of very great use in co-ordinating the work which was performed by different branches of the Agricultural Department in different Provinces. Asked whether it would not be an improvement to have an institution which would help to co-ordinate the work, and prevent overlapping, the witness said that each department published its own report, in addition to which the Deputy Directors of one Province for the most part knew the Deputy Directors of another, and wrote a good deal, demi-officially, to each other. In that way the several Provinces kept in touch. The Department in Bombay followed the work which was being done by Pusa through the medium of the Pusa Bulletins. The Department was in demi-official correspondence with Pusa, but to a less extent than with the neighbouring Provinces. Some of the men in the Bombay Service who had been trained at Pusa kept in touch with Pusa officers; he was thinking specially of the entomologist and mycologist, who derived considerable help from the officers who had trained them at Pusa.

68279. It was suggested to him that at present Departments connected with Agriculture were under some official of the Civil Service, who might or might not be experienced or interested in them. In future they should all be grouped under one Officer, who would be called a Commissioner for Rural Development, and who should be *ex hypothesi* a man who had devoted a certain amount of time in his Service to gaining knowledge of, and taking an interest in, the agricultural problems of the country, and in all problems connected with agricultural life. Therefore, each of those Departments would be certain, when it came into contact with the big machinery of Government, of obtaining a hearing, and of putting its suggestions before a man who would be sympathetic, and who would be able to co-ordinate their work, and to balance the claims of one or other Department to favourable treatment by Government. It seemed to him, however, that the Rural Commissioner would really be what the Director of Agriculture at present ought to be, only under another name. In the Bombay Presidency the Director of Agriculture did at present control the Veterinary Department, and the Co-operative Credit Society. He agreed, however, that the principle had a good deal to recommend it. It would be desirable that a person so appointed should be called a Rural Commissioner rather than a Director of Agriculture, so as to avoid friction with certain Services.

68280. An Indian certainly possessed qualities which made him more valuable than a European in popularising the work of the Department. The extent to which he did so would vary in different tracts, but, taking it generally, an Indian was necessary in order to popularise the work. The reason he said it would vary in different tracts was because in some tracts cultivators were more, and in other tracts were less, impressed, when a European arrived on the scene. Some Indians had shown very great aptitude for that special class of work. It was in that direction that he looked for the greatest benefit to the country from the larger employment of Indians.

68281. (*Mr. Madge.*) There would be no objection to interchanges between Research Officers and Administrative Officers, provided that they were limited to suitable cases. The advantage of having research work going on in Bombay Presidency would be enormous, partly because the conditions were different from those which pre-

vailed in other provinces, and partly because there would be created in the midst of the Presidency an atmosphere of research, which would have an extraordinarily educative influence on the students and staff.

68282. It might be necessary to import specialists in research work for short periods, but it would be very difficult to get suitable men to break their connections in England in order to come out to India for a short time.

68283. He did not know that many landlords indulged in scientific study themselves, but they were interested in results obtained, and they were interested in the subject of agriculture generally. There was a short course at the College which was attended by young landowners, or the sons of landowners who wished to improve the cultivation on their own lands. Some of the bigger landowners also sent their sons to the College.

68284. Many of the cultivators' methods were extremely good, and the Department did not try to work against them. The difficulty of introducing many scientific methods was lack of means on the part of the cultivator to adopt them. Cheapness had driven him to methods which he would abandon if he were better off.

68285. (*Mr. Fisher.*) Some of the six assistant professors at Poona College were trained in the College; others had been to Cambridge, and others had not been to either Poona or Cambridge. Those who had been to Cambridge had profited by the training they had received there. It was to the advantage of their general education that agricultural students should go to Cambridge in order to become qualified for teaching work in agricultural colleges. The mere fact of seeing another country greatly enlarged their experience.

68286. Some of the assistant professors were doing original research work, and were good at it. He would be in favour of sending assistant professors of Provincial Colleges to Pusa for a term of study in mycology and entomology.

68287. His main desire was to get such a strengthening of the staff at Poona as to enable them to devote more time to research, but he did not want any hard and fast separation between teaching and research work. He also thought that research and teaching should be combined with district work. It would be difficult for district men to keep in efficient contact with research work, as their time was fully occupied. He agreed that the spreading of the results of the work of the Department depended a good deal on district inspectors, but he thought a man of the calibre of Deputy Director kept himself in touch with research work. The difficulty had been felt more keenly in the case of the members of the Subordinate Staff, who, after leaving the College, did not keep sufficiently in touch with scientific knowledge generally.

68288. Some extremely good men had been obtained in the Bombay Presidency under the present method of recruitment, and he knew of no better system.

68289. (*Mr. Sly.*) When he referred to the District Staff, he included under that term the Deputy Director. He would like to give that Officer time for research. From the nature of the case research must always form the smaller part of his work. What his recommendation really came to was that he desired more staff, and not mere sub-divisions into classes; he wanted more Deputy Directors and more specialists. He did not mean to suggest there should be any firm line of division of function between the Deputy Directors who were going to do administrative work, and the Deputy Directors who were going to do research work.

68290. It was very desirable that young Europeans coming out to the Agricultural Service in India should have had previous practical experience. On the whole men who had been recruited at an older age in England, and who had practical experience were more suited for the work of the Department.

68291. The Indians who had been sent for special training to England had been sent immediately after their College course. There were four such men. He did not regard that as an ideal method, but the men thus sent to England had profited in their general education, and had widened their general experience. It depended entirely on the man himself whether that was a satisfactory method of recruiting Officers for the Imperial Service.

68292. There were young men in the present Provincial staff who were fit for promotion to the Imperial Service.

68293. He would not like to see Poona College without some European Professors in it.

68294. He would not contemplate the transfer of the Senior Officers of the Department from one part of India to another in order to fill the post of Director; this would involve sacrificing the great advantage of their local experience. The transfers should be mainly within the provinces themselves. If the Directorship was to go to a member of the Agricultural Service, he would support the proposal for the appointment of a Rural Development Commissioner.

68295. He would much prefer a system under which a man would be sent to serve under the Officer best qualified to give post-graduate instruction, rather than that Pusa should be made the one centre for post-graduate study.

68296. (*Chairman.*) With reference to his evidence that there was no firm line of distinction between the Deputy Director who was doing administrative work, and the research officer, he did not necessarily mean there should be interchange between those branches. What he meant was that he would not prevent a Research Officer from taking up some other work in addition, provided it did not interfere with his primary functions as a Research Officer. A District Officer was well informed as to the methods of modern agriculture, and he had to show his subordinates how to educate the agriculturists in the district. The Research Officer was the discoverer of those methods, either in the laboratory or in the field. Whilst he desired that there should be close contact between such officers, he would not suggest that there should be any interchange between them except on very rare occasions.

68297. (*Mr. Gonehalli.*) He considered that the present prospects in the Provincial Agricultural Service were sufficient to attract a superior class of students to the college. He doubted whether students at the time of joining the College paid much attention to what the ultimate salaries of the higher posts were. They would primarily look to the fact whether, in the earlier stages of their service, they could obtain congenial work. As time went on, the Service would not be able to offer employment to a large portion of the students, and it was to be hoped that they would look out for employment elsewhere than in the Agricultural Department.

(The witness withdrew.)

DR. H. H. MANN, Principal, Agricultural College, Poona.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68298. Before attempting to answer the questions which have been issued by the Commission regarding the agricultural services, I should like to make a few remarks on the purpose of the services which will indicate the reasons for the views which I take on the questions issued.

In the first place, the agricultural departments are essentially, if not wholly, missionary depart-

ments. Their administrative, their purely educative, functions are wholly secondary. They have a very small amount, relatively, of work set which they must do, and which, having done, they may count their purpose accomplished. The work they do, on the other hand, is essentially that of missionaries. We believe that we can, by the aid of science and knowledge of what has been and is being done elsewhere, bring about more profitable methods of agriculture than those in vogue. We are not going to carry out these ourselves except as an illustration: our purpose is to carry the knowledge which we possess or find out and persuade the people to carry out the resulting methods. This position places us in an entirely different position to any other department of Government. In all of them the missionary work, though important, is secondary, the administrative predominant: in ours we want to do nothing permanent ourselves, but to bring the people to do everything.

If this be the case, then we may define, in my mind, more closely what the immediate aims of each department should be. They are these:—

(*1*) To find out what the cultivators and other agricultural classes want, and, if we know a means of meeting these wants, show them the way of meeting them; if we do not know, then to investigate till we find out.

(*2*) To find out what, beyond their wants, the cultivators, etc., need and, again, if we know a way of meeting these needs, proclaim such ways abroad; if we do not know, then to investigate till we find out.

(*3*) After investigation and discovery, to act as missionaries of what we have discovered through the tracts in which our work lies.

If this definition is true, then all work must begin with a knowledge of the people, with acquiring their confidence; in short, to know the people, to acquire their confidence, to investigate with their benefit solely in view, to have the power to get them, either singly or as local bodies, to try what is suggested: this is the work of the most important man in an agricultural department, of the man who must be the leader of all. Such a man may be a civilian: I have known such. He may be a pure farmer: I have known such. He may be himself a scientific investigator: I have again known such. He may have devoted much of his time to teaching: I have again known such. But if we once recognise that missionary power, as I have tried to define it above, is the most essential thing for the real purpose of an agricultural department to be fulfilled, then I think the answering of the questions set by the Commission will be much simplified.

This is the central point and leads to the general question of qualifications for positions in an agricultural department, whether in Imperial, Provincial, or other services. The first qualification which any member of the agricultural department must have is ability to get into touch with the people, and to inspire confidence in them. This is important for all members: it is important for men who are purely investigators; it is more important for those who are educators; it is all important for those who are directly and constantly in touch with the people in farm and district work.

The second qualification which any member must have is that he is himself an agriculturist, and a good one in some line, so that his knowledge in one direction at least may inspire confidence with those with whom he has to deal. If a man is a chemist, I want him to be more than a chemist, to be a man who has studied, both in the laboratory and in the field, the relations of chemistry to agriculture; if a man is a botanist, I want him to be an agricultural botanist, more interested in the problems that are important to cultivators than in any other, and able to judge himself of the practicability of what he suggests; if a man is an entomologist, I want him to study entomology from the agricultural point of view, and especially to know, as an agriculturist himself, the value and use of the methods he suggests, and so on. We have had and have men chemists, botanists, entomologists, etc., who have been all this; we have had and have men who have been pure scientific men, and whose interest in the great industry to which we are missionaries is purely incidental.

The third qualification which any member of the agricultural departments must possess is knowledge of the country, of local conditions, of agricultural possibilities. Without depreciating in the least the value of high scientific attainment, nay, while insisting that it has not been enough considered in the past, yet without intimate local knowledge, far more intimate than most of the European and a large proportion of the Indian members of the departments have usually had, a great deal of damage may easily be done, confidence destroyed and the work of years spoilt.

These qualifications being recognised, I may proceed to answer, from my point of view, the questions which have been put by the Commission.

68299. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—The recruitment of the Imperial Agricultural Service is on the whole unsatisfactory. If the qualifications which I have laid down be the chief ones, then there can be no distinction between Indians and Europeans in the Service. Missionary power, devotion to agriculture, either as "farming" or through his science, knowledge of local conditions: if these are the qualifications, then it must be recognised that no method of college training alone can give what is required. And few colleges, Indian or European, attempt to do so. They give the technical knowledge of farming, or of a connected science certainly, but beyond that a student is not equipped with the qualifications desired when he leaves college, whether in England or India. And in England there is the additional disadvantage that the agriculture which is before the eyes as an illustration is an agriculture which in its organisation is quite foreign to most parts of India, and will be for a long time to come.

Therefore, I would say that any attempt to bring to India, or engage in India, young men who have just left even the best of colleges as responsible heads of offices giving agriculture advice or doing agricultural teaching (whether in agriculture as a business or in the sciences on which it depends) must result in failure in a large proportion of cases, and long delay in getting what you want. It seems to me that this may be all very well as a preliminary training, but a man must have had long experience before he takes such a position, either in the agricultural departments in a non-responsible position, or outside in another sphere. This probation, whether of Englishmen or Indians, whether in the departments or elsewhere seems to me essential. Given this, and, as I shall indicate directly, a definite process of weeding out at the end of each year of probation, I do not think there should be any difference between equally qualified Europeans and Indians, and those trained in England or India.

68300. **(II) System of Training and Probation.** I have already stated that I consider that special agricultural training is important for all members of the Department. If the terms of probation are strictly defined, I am not prepared to say that a specially good chemist, botanist, or entomologist should not be engaged, provided that he fully understands that his work afterwards must specialise along agricultural lines, and that his probation will be judged by his success in specialising along those lines.

68301. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—If a man joins the Imperial Agricultural Service as a man without experience, I would insist on three years probation, which may be terminated at the end of each year if there is not promise of the man developing the character and missionary power we want. I look on the training of Indian agricultural students as one way in which missionary power may be shown. I would make it a real probation, with probably 25 per cent., at

least, of rejections. The standard for rejection should be as severe for Indians as for Europeans, and as severe for Europeans as for Indians. I would rather have no agricultural department as get it staffed by men who have not the qualifications I want, at least in some measure: without them it will be merely a costly and all but useless luxury.

During probation I would make it essential—

(1) That a man must have a fairly easy conversational knowledge of a vernacular, and I would give him *time* to acquire it. The literary knowledge required in some other services is not needed, but easy conversational knowledge he must have. This has not by any means been insisted on in the past, but seems to be absolutely essential, and no excuse should *ever* be given.

(2) That a man should work in the Province, one of whose languages he is learning, under a man with Indian service, who is able to inspire.

(3) That a man, whatever be his line, should spend a considerable time in the field.

(4) That a man should be given full opportunity of doing investigation on problems suggested by himself, or suggested to him.

I doubt whether training at a central institute like Pusa is right or wise. I hardly think it can be so, except in technical training in some cases for a few months, and I feel that a man ought to get to know the conditions of the country in which he is to work, and its special problems, whether he be chemist, botanist, or anything else.

At the end of each year the man's papers, opinions on him, etc., and especially on his possibilities in the directions already indicated of adapting his knowledge to the needs of the people, should be submitted to the agricultural adviser to the Government of India, together with any statement by the man himself; and on his report the Government of India should act, and continue the probation and make the man permanent, or close the contract, as seems wise.

I think the older agricultural officers should consider the training of the new men as a peculiarly important part of their work, should consider them as juniors and trusted colleagues, and strive to give them an insight into all that is going on, and the reason for it. I do not think this has by any means always been done in the past.

The pay during probation in the Imperial Agricultural Service is, in my mind, satisfactory.

68302. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—I have little to say with regard to the pay in the Imperial Service. But if you insist on a high standard of men, even if these are few, you must pay well. In a service which will, and I think must, be staffed by Englishmen and Indians without distinction, there is something to be said in favour of what I may call an "exile allowance" for the former, of definite amount, and not proportionate to the pay, but I am not sure of this.

I think the present rate of pay is high enough for average men, but I think that a proportion—say not exceeding 25 per cent. of the service in each Province or at Pusa at any one time, might rise to a grade with a maximum pay of Rs. 1,500 per month at least.

To my mind it is very important to have an easy passage from the Provincial Service to the Imperial. A Provincial Service must exist, and a very considerable proportion of the members should have the chance to rise to the Imperial Service. The qualifications should be excellence in the qualifications already laid down. At present, in Bombay, there is more than one member of the Provincial service whom I should like to see in the Imperial, and who, I believe would be an ornament to it. It should be easy for a man in the Provincial Service to act for an Imperial officer, and, if so, he should, for the time being, be given the ordinary acting allowances for doing so.

I want the Imperial service to be ultimately very largely recruited from the Provincial Service: hence the development of the Provincial as a highly-paid independent service is doubtful policy in my mind. If such large recruitment does not take place, then the possibilities of rising much higher in the Provincial Service itself must be made much greater.

68303. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—I think it is likely to be much more advantageous for men in the Provincial Service, or Indians in the Imperial Service, to go abroad to gain experience, whether of agricultural organisation or research, after some years of actual work in the Agricultural Department, than to go as students. They will know better what they want: they will know better what is adapted to the conditions with which they have to deal. I would give every member of the Provincial Service and the Indian members of the Imperial Service facilities for one year's leave after about five years' service for this purpose, the exact method of employing the time being, of course, fully understood before the man goes.

68304. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, etc.**—I have already stated that I strongly feel that there should be no limitation to the employment of Indians in the Agricultural Service. Rather would I look forward to the time when all are Indians, provided they have the qualifications I have named to the full. This is not an administrative department, it is a missionary department, and if the proper man is available, an Indian will be a better missionary than an outsider. In this department no difficulty ought to arise. I would be stringent indeed in making appointments and casting out unsatisfactory men on probation. I would make it easy, relatively, to cast a man out if he becomes slack in his subsequent service, with no pension or a diminished pension; but, if these matters are attended to, there seems no reason for any distinction. Some of the most successful missionaries in the Bombay Department are Indians, and would do brilliantly if they were in the highest positions in their particular branch.

I do not think foreign training as students is necessary: it has, in my mind not always done good in the past. The abandonment of this idea would involve, I think—(1) Definite post-graduate Preliminary training for men suggested for the Provincial service, and (2) the possibility of going abroad after a certain amount of service has been satisfactorily performed.

68305. **(VIII) The Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—I do not think that the teaching and research and administrative functions should be divorced more than is the case at present. Give additional assistance if you like; create associate professors or associate chemists, etc., to assist if you like. But, for my own part, I would not like to teach as I do if I had not the close contact with the needs of the cultivators which my position as Agricultural Chemist to Government gives. I rarely take a class without what I say being modified by inquiries from outside or observations I have myself made in the field, and 75 per cent. of my illustrations while teaching are from my own Indian experience. I should welcome an associate agricultural chemist or an associate professor of chemistry as a colleague, but I should feel it fatal if I were cut off and limited to academic teaching work. It would tend soon to be nothing else than "academic."

I find I have been able to carry out and keep in close touch with research work being done by my assistants under my control, without interfering with administrative and teaching work, and this while being at the same time Principal of the Poona Agricultural College. This is precisely what is done by the great Professors of Europe, who are nearly always also consulted as experts.

Then again the consulting work which any of us undertake is largely personal, and will always remain so. It is no use sending an inquiry to someone else to deal with: in many cases if the inquiry is made to one man, an answer from another does not satisfy, and is not what is wanted.

The power of Director of Agriculture is one

which should be held by a man with missionary power. If he is a member of the Indian Civil Service it is well. We have had excellent directors of this type. If he is not, it is also well. But missionary power including the power of organisation of such work there must be. And I would use it in this position whenever I found it, and keep a man in the position for long enough to have the chance to make his policy effective. I would use any man available in the department, limiting my selection to no group, neither to Deputy-Directors, to experts, or anything else. The best agricultural missionary and organiser of missionary effort as I have defined it at the beginning of this paper—this is what I want. It evidently cannot be found without careful knowledge. The fact of a member of the Indian Civil Service having taken a two years' course at an English University may be an additional qualification if the man is right and has proved his missionary power in other ways before: otherwise it is no qualification, and may be a nuisance.

68306. **(IX) Other points.**—I do not think the suggestion that Indians cannot do research in agriculture and the associated societies has any real foundation in fact. A number of those who have been trained at the Poona Agricultural College have done such work under my supervision, and have done it well. This is not the case with all: very few Europeans ever get the research faculty. But some have shown initiative and capacity at least as great as one is accustomed to find among young men of the same age and chances in England.

DR. H. H. MANN called and examined.

68307. (*Chairman.*) The witness had occupied his present position for six years and had been 14 years in India. He was previously holding the position of scientific adviser to the tea industry.

68308. He laid down three qualifications for entry into the agricultural service, facility to keep in touch with people, practical experience or applied knowledge, and knowledge of the country. He agreed, in regard to selection from England, that the only one of these three qualities which could be ensured was experience of farming and specialist qualifications, but his point was that he would not put such men into a superintending or superior position until he had acquired a knowledge of the country.

68309. He laid very great stress on the probationary period. The length of that period would depend altogether on the man. He knew men who, within two years of being in India, had acquired all the necessary knowledge, and he knew others who had not done so after being 10 years in India. He agreed that there must be a normal probationary period, but it could very easily be made elastic. He would not allow a man to go from his first year of probation to the second year of probation unless he was satisfactory. He had introduced a rule of that sort in dealing with his own subordinates.

68310. He suggested very extensive weeding out under the probationary process; he expected that at least 25 per cent. of the men would have to be discharged, judging by the standard of men already in the Department. If so rigid a system was introduced, he agreed that it would have a serious effect on recruitment, but the conditions of the Service should be made sufficiently attractive to overcome that difficulty. Government should not attempt to satisfy the needs of the Service by making probation easy, but by improving the terms which a man would get when his probation was over. Perhaps he was taking almost an unduly pessimistic view of the recruits now coming out by assuming that a quarter of them would always be unsuitable for the Service, but he was judging from actual experience. Since the service had been instituted, about six men had been discharged during the probationary period.

68311. He attached importance to the college diploma, because it was a guarantee of a certain amount of intellectual attainment, but he attached more importance to post-graduate experience. A diploma was not of much value in itself unless it was backed up by efficient practical attainments. If he himself had taken a responsible post out in India after he had obtained his degree, he felt that he would have made a complete failure in it.

68312. There were some Indians in the Presidency who were competent to occupy superior posts in the Imperial Service; he knew of three such men, one of whom had been to England for his education, the second had not been to England, and the third had been to Europe not for his education, but in order to gain practical experience.

68313. Of the three alternatives—(1) work in the Provincial Service and then direct promotion into the Imperial Service with merely Indian experience; (2) work in the Provincial Service with early promotion and a course in England; and (3) training in England and direct recruitment to the Imperial Service—the second would be most likely to give the best results.

68314. On the whole he was satisfied with the present system of recruitment for the Provincial Service.

68315. The educational qualification for admission to the Poona College was Matriculation, plus one year at an ordinary arts college. There was not very keen competition to enter the college, but for the last five or six years the college had been fairly full. About 25 per cent. of the students came from the cultivating classes. They had the educational qualification he had just referred to.

68316. Many men came to the college who did not contemplate entering the Service, but who merely attended with a view to taking up agriculture on their own account. Out of 14 graduates last year, six had actually gone back to work connected with agriculture, and had no idea of entering the Service. The number of these men was on the increase.

68317. There was a rule in Bombay that the Revenue Service should take a certain proportion of qualified students for whom there were no Government vacancies in the Agricultural Department. The figure was not not more than 5 per cent. A certain number of students went into the Agricultural Service, some took up farming on their own account, and there was now an increasing demand for students from private land owners.

68318. This was a very satisfactory development, and he would say that it was the result, to a considerable extent, of the work of the Agricultural Department. On the other hand, to attribute it wholly to the Agricultural Department would be wrong. The cultivator was becoming more and more appreciative of the more scientific methods of cultivation. The difficulty in the past had been to meet the cultivators' needs. Now they were able to meet them, and they were being met. With a view to furthering agricultural profits, there was room for an increase in the Agricultural Department, but the personnel of the increase would have to be very carefully considered. He would rather let the Department wait for the men than create a big department straight away. He would most emphatically like to see an increase on the demonstration side, and also on the side of research. He desired to see an increase in the amount of research work done on problems laid before them by the cultivators themselves. The first preliminary was to find out what the cultivators needed, and when that was done there would be plenty of opportunity for research.

68319. One of the difficulties in the past had been that men had come into the Agricultural Department who had been trained to recognise the difficulties which were felt in Europe and America. Those were not the difficulties which were met with in India, and a great deal of time and money had been spent in making investigations on questions which really did not interest the people of India. Agricultural science had to be applied to the peculiar and indigenous conditions of India. Future research officers coming to India would have to be men possessing a good deal of patience, and capable of applying their knowledge to local conditions. Their chief ambition would have to be to satisfy the people's needs.

68320. (*Mr Sly.*) The outcome of his suggestions was that he desired to recruit men of a somewhat older age, who had been tested in practical work in England before joining the Department. He thought, however, that England and America were the two worst countries in the world for a man to get that preliminary training. In England and America more than in any other country in the world the conditions of agriculture were markedly different from Indian conditions. For appointments on the district side men were wanted who had done a certain amount of practical work elsewhere than in England before joining the Department. If officers of the Service obtained their preliminary training in Belgium or Italy, they would do very much better than by getting it in England or America. For the specialist appointments men were required who had not only had a college course, but had also carried out practical research in connection with some agricultural problem.

68321. He would lengthen, and very much stiffen, the course of probation which a man had to undergo in India. At present a man could not be discharged until his three years' course of probation had been completed. He would make it possible to get rid of an unsuitable man at the end of each year.

68322. The best method of recruiting Indians for district demonstration work would depend very largely on the nature of the college course. If the college course was a good one, the best plan would probably be to recruit men straight from college, but in any case a man who had merely been through college course could not expect to be anything more than a student.

68323. With regard to the best method of recruitment to the specialist branch, his own strong feeling was that if the college course was efficient, an agricultural graduate who could get subsequent training in science under a good man was probably the best material, because it was much more difficult to get the agricultural bias afterwards than it was to get the scientific bias.

68324. He went so far as to say that the present courses of scientific teaching in universities were calculated not to bring out the right type of man required for work in the Agricultural Department, and that in many cases it was a distinct disqualification. The science course at a university was designed to prepare a man for one thing, and one thing only, namely, to become science teachers. The university science courses, though they were good in their own line, did not prepare men for fruitful work. When he himself took the Science Honours degree, he had an altogether unreasonable bias against all the work which he was at present doing, and that was due to the training he had received in college.

68325. Five per cent. of the students in the college were drawn from agriculturists in the strict technical sense of people who had lived and worked on the land. That five per cent. was distinctly better material for pure district work than the remaining 95 per cent., but they were not better material for the research and teaching appointments because they had less natural ability.

68326. The Poona College did not attract men who were likely to take a high degree; it started with less promising material than the ordinary Indian arts college, or science college. That was not due to lack of prospects in the Provincial Service, but to the fact that agriculture was still looked upon by the student world, and by those who inspired them, as a rather derogatory career.

68327. He did not support the recommendation for a liberal system of study leave, because in his opinion India itself was the best place for studying agricultural problems. He agreed that conditions in India were not altogether conducive to habits of study and research, but the keen men would remain in India.

68328. The best method of filling the Pusa appointments would be to promote the best men from the Provinces, but the best men from the Provincial Service would probably not go there because they could do better work in their own Provinces. If the atmosphere of Pusa could be made more like that of the central bureau in Washington, then probably everybody would be ambitious to go to Pusa. Pusa should be so developed as to become a central bureau for the whole of India, and it should be recruited from the very best men in all India.

68329. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The object of the central bureau at Washington was to minister to the needs of the whole country. Pusa should be a central bureau for those who were working in the Provinces. That did not involve divesting Pusa of its functions in research. Its particular function must always be research. It did research work now, but the work was very largely of its own choice. The main criticism he had to make of Pusa at present was that the questions they were looking at were viewed not in relation to the actual conditions which prevailed in various parts of India, but in relation to ideal conditions, which were for the most part non-existent in India. His suggestion was that the Provincial Department should provide the scientific staff at Pusa with the problems on which Pusa should work. It was not to be inferred from this statement that all the scientific papers hitherto published by the researchers at Pusa had no useful bearing on agricultural conditions in India, but the proportion of valuable papers was nothing like what it ought to be.

68330. He did not think that measures need be taken to prevent overlapping in agricultural research in India All that was necessary was to secure free inter-communication between research officers. It would paralyse research if any attempt were made at over-organisation.

68331. The three Indians in the Agricultural Department in Bombay, whom he regarded as fit to be in the Imperial Service, were all district workers. Some of the Indians at present in the Agricultural College were capable of carrying on independent research without close supervision, and their number would be increased in the future.

68332. There was considerable discontent in the Provincial Service with regard to rates of pay, but that was only because the avenue from that Service to the Imperial Service was blocked, or made difficult. He did not think there would be any discontent if the avenue to the Imperial Service were made easy. If the initial pay of the Provincial Service were raised, a better class of recruit would be attracted to the Agricultural College, and so to the Provincial Service; but he doubted whether it would be a good policy to get men by that means. It was much more important to provide a free passage from the Provincial Service to the Imperial Service than to raise the salaries of the Provincial Service.

68333. (*Mr. Madge.*) In the applied sciences of Chemistry, Botany and Entomology, he desired men who had either a decided bias towards agriculture, or who had given to agriculture a very large proportion of their time and study. Those conditions could only be obtained in an Agricultural College such as Poona, in which, after a certain stage, a man could devote himself specially to a certain side of the subject. He

did not think that for the purposes of the Indian Agricultural Service the English universities gave any better training than the Indian universities.

68334. Research could not be divorced from district work. In the districts a research officer found a large field for putting into practice the lessons which he had learnt in research, and in the process he got suggestions for further research, which he would not otherwise get. It was only in field work that one could obtain useful suggestions for research work.

68335. He looked forward to the time when India might be so far advanced as to be wholly independent of foreign recruitment to the Agricultural Department. Speaking for the Bombay Presidency, he would say that this time was not more than a generation ahead.

68336. The methods which cultivators used were, very many of them, quite sound in themselves, and deserved to be persevered in for all time. In many cases all that was wanted was slight modification. For instance, the Indian method of interculture of the crops on the Deccan was an admirable one.

68337. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He could not quote any instances in which problems arising out of local conditions of Provinces had been suggested to Pusa for further investigation and which had not been so investigated. If any important problem arose, and the help of Pusa was desired, the Service simply wrote to the head of the department at Pusa. It was extremely difficult for him to put in words the suggestions he would make for quickening the relations between Pusa and the different Provincial centres, because it depended so largely on the attitude which Pusa adopted towards the Provincial Departments. It was extraordinarily difficult to describe. He could not make any suggestions; after all it was a matter of personality.

68338. (*Mr. Gonehalli.*) There must be either an easy passage into the Imperial Service for the Provincial Service officers, or they must receive higher pay.

68339. He was aware that the Government of Bombay had sent five students in all to England, of whom one died. Of the remaining four, one had been placed in the Imperial Service, and he himself had been able to testify that two were quite as competent for the Imperial Service as English graduates of the same standing. He did not in the least agree that this proved that the policy of the Government of Bombay in sending students to Cambridge had been successful. Nor did he consider that the method of recruitment of Englishmen for the agricultural service was an ideal one. The English graduates who came out to India were not suitable for the positions which they were expected to occupy.

(The witness withdrew.)

S. L. Ajrekar, Esq., Assistant Professor of Mycology, Agricultural College, Poona.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68340. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—Selection is the only feasible method of recruitment. The lower grades in the Service should be recruited from graduates from the agricultural colleges and the higher grades from men in lower grades who have distinguished themselves, or by direct appointment of men who possess the suitable qualifications. Indians should be preferred whenever available.

In selecting experts in the various sciences bearing upon agriculture, like botany and chemistry, clear evidence of capacity for original work should be insisted on. In selecting officers for district work, a good knowledge of practical agriculture and capacity for organisation have to be taken into consideration. A knowledge of the vernacular of the district is essential, especially to District Agricultural Officers. Sympathy with Indian agriculturists and the desire and ability to mix with them freely are absolute conditions of success for an Agricultural Officer.

Selection for the higher grades should be made by the Secretary of State in consultation with a special committee of experts with Indian experience. Selection for the lower grades should be made by the Provincial Director of Agriculture in consultation with the Deputy Directors and the Principal of the local agricultural college.

As long as facilities for research in India remain poor, scholarships should be instituted to encourage the best Indian agricultural graduates to go abroad and obtain the necessary training in research and selection to the higher grades may be made from the most successful of such scholars.

68341. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—Agricultural training is essential to every member of the Service. All employés who do not possess an agricultural diploma or degree should devote part of their probationary period to the study of the agriculture of the district in which they are employed. A working knowledge of the vernacular of the district should be made an absolute condition of confirmation. The present standard of the vernacular test should be raised.

The probationary period for the lower grades should be two years, and for the higher grades three years in the case of direct appointments. No probation is necessary when the appointment is to a higher grade from the next lower one. In the case of Europeans appointed direct to the higher grades the period of probation should be five years, which should be divided into two parts. The first two years should be devoted to the general study of Indian agricultural conditions and the vernacular of the district where the final appointment is to be made, and during the next three years the officer should be given independent work. Before confirmation his work should be subjected to a test by an independent, competent agency, like the Board of Scientific Advice.

68342. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The present conditions of the Provincial Agricultural Service compare very unfavourably with those of the other Provincial Services. If the distinction between the Imperial and Provincial Services is not abolished and the highest places in the Service are not thrown open to Indians, the pay and prospects of the Provincial Service should be at least so improved that the change from the Provincial to the Imperial Service should not appear too violent.

In making new appointments to the Imperial Service, careful inquiry should be first made whether a member of the Provincial Service is available for the place, and, if so, he should be preferred. Notice of such vacancies in the Imperial Service should be given to members of the Provincial Service in due time, so that they may be in a position to bring their claims to the view of the selecting authorities. Men who have distinguished themselves in the Provincial Service will then have something to look forward to and the present wide gulf between Provincial and Imperial will disappear.

A greater independence is necessary than at present to members of the Provincial Service, especially to those engaged in research.

68343. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The present scale of salary in the Provincial Service is quite inadequate: the maximum is too low and the increments too small and too slow. If the distinction between Provincial and Imperial is not abolished, the maximum of the Provincial must be raised to at least Rs. 800 per month, any further lift, if deserved, being given by promotion to the Imperial Service at a starting salary of Rs. 900 per month. It is extremely urgent, however, to abolish the distinction between the two branches of service, and the attached statement giving scales of pay, periods of probation, mode of recruitment, etc., will show how this is feasible.

Increase in salaries is demanded also by the increase in the cost of living, education and travelling.

There should be no difference in the pay and prospects of Indians and Europeans in the Agricultural Department.

68344. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—All officers should be entitled to study leave for a maximum of two years after five years of service, and this may be taken all together or in parts of six months at a time, and may be combined with furlough, privilege leave or any other leave except leave on medical certificate. An officer proceeding on study leave should be given half the pay that he may be getting at the time and, in addition, a sufficient daily allowance. Officers with a salary of less than Rs. 500 per month should be allowed passage-money if they leave India for the purposes of study.

68345. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Members of the Agricultural Service may be allowed to retire on full pension after 25 years, and on a proportionately reduced pension after 20 years of active service. It is likely that many of the District Agricultural Officers would take advantage of this permission and take up private agriculture and thus indirectly help the work of Agricultural Departments by increasing the co-operation between cultivators and Government.

68346. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—There are no limitations in the employment of Indians in the higher grades of the Service, except the present absence of proper facilities for training in research, due, chiefly, to the employment of inexperienced men in the position of experts. This state of affairs could be improved, however, by exercising greater care in the seelction of Professors and experts, and then there would be no limitations. There is no evidence to prove the supposed inherent incapacity for research, want of originality and of organising capacity of Indians. Experience points rather to the contrary. Indeed, in the Agricultural Department, other things being equal, Indians should be even preferred to Europeans, because the difficulties of language, the totally different conditions of soil, climate, crop and society, the aloofness and inaccessibility of the average European officers, are serious difficulties in the way of the cultivators deriving the greatest benefit from them. District Agricultural Officers, especially if they are Indians, would be more useful and would understand the needs of the people better.

Another reason why Indians should be preferred is that the experience obtained in service remains in the country and can be utilised in advancing the cause of agricultural improvement among the people. The retired Agricultural Expert, if he is an Indian, will be a valuable source of inspiration to the people among whom he lives, because of his accessibility and of his experience and interest in Indian Agriculture.

Further, it is felt that the present prospects of the Imperial Agricultural Service do not attract the best class of European Scientists. The compensation is not regarded as sufficient for the exile which service in India involves. This difficulty does not apply to Indians, and if the highest posts in the service are thrown open to them there is every possibility that the service will be rendered more efficient, without further increase of expenditure, by the best Indian intellect being attracted to it.

The present distinction into Imperial and Provincial does not work satisfactorily. It does not create an *esprit de corps* between the two branches of service, and it throws undue responsibility on the members of the Provincial Service for producing work of a quality comparable to that of the Imperial but with opportunities and remuneration far inferior to those of the latter. Also under the present system members of the Provincial Service are regarded as assistants rather than colleagues, and the credit of much work that they do goes to a member of the Imperial Service under whom they happen to be placed for administrative reasons. The Provincial posts do not carry with them a sense of sufficient dignity and independence.

For these reasons the distinction between Imperial and Provincial should be abolished, and one general Agricultural Service, including various grades of salary, with no difference in the pay and prospects of Indians and Europeans, should be established. (*Vide* attached statement.)

The advantages of such an arrangement may be pointed out as follows:—

(1) An unfair distinction will be removed.

(2) The legitimate aspirations of Indians will be recognised.

(3) A much better class of Indian students will be attracted towards agricultural education than at present.

(4) The higher places in the Department will only go to men who have proved their worth.

(5) The filling up of temporary and permanent vacancies will be more conveniently managed than at present, there being a larger field for selection. Under the present system, supernumeraries are appointed in the Imperial Agricultural Service, who are intended to relieve officers on leave, transfers, etc. This arrangement is not always the happiest, especially when a supernumerary having experience amidst one set of agricultural conditions is likely to be planted in totally different conditions.

68347. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The post of Director of Agriculture should be preferably held by a member of the Indian Civil Service with agricultural training and for not less than eight years by one man. In exceptional cases the post may be filled by non-civilian members of the Department if they possess the necessary administrative capacity and influence.

There should be a closer inter-relation between the agricultural and the Revenue Departments. Agricultural education should have greater value attached to it in making appointments to the Revenue Service, subordinate and superior. It should be possible for District Agricultural Officers to get transferred to the Revenue Department under certain conditions.

It is desirable to separate purely administrative duties from those of teaching and research.

68348. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—The present strength of the staff of Agricultural Departments is inadequate to the work they are called upon to do. Considering the enormouse sizes of the charges of the District Agricultural Officers, and considering the great variety of agricultural problems dealing with an immense diversity of crop, soil and climate, it is very necessary to increase the strength of the staff considerably.

Statement showing proposed scale of salaries, grades, &c., of a general Agricultural Service without distinction between Provincial and Imperial (vide paragraphs 68343 and 68346).

Grade.	Designation.	Probation in case of direct appointment only.	Salary.	Recruited from
Higher Grades.			Rs.	
1	Director	3 years ...	1,500–100–2,000	The I. C. S., and in special cases from members of the 2nd Grade.
2	Deputy Directors, Senior Experts and Professors	Do. ...	1,100–75–1,400	From the 3rd Grade—rarely by direct appointment.
3	Assistant Directors, Junior Experts and Junior Professors	Do. ...	500–50–1,000	From the 4th Grade, or by direct appointment, selection being based on practical experience, educational qualifications, clear evidence of capacity for original work, and organisation and sympathy with the Indian agriculturist.
Lower Grades.				
4	Lecturers, Divisional Inspectors, Assistants to Experts	2 years ...	250–20–450	From the 5th Grade, and from graduates in science with specially good record, experience in teaching and training in research obtained in India or abroad.
5	Senior Agricultural Overseers...	Do. ...	120–10–200	The 6th Grade, exceptionally from distinguished non-agricultural graduates.
	Do. Scientific Assistants ...			
	Do. Demonstrators			
6	Junior do.	Do. ...	50–6–110	Agricultural graduates.

Mr. S. L. Ajrekar called and examined.

68349. (*Chairman.*) The witness was Assistant Professor of Mycology in the Poona Agricultural College. He had been four years in the Service. He had been trained at Cambridge in his particular subject. He took the B.A. degree there, and a diploma in agriculture. He had obtained no practical agricultural experience in England before returning to India.

68350. He objected to putting into two classes men with the same qualifications, who were required to do the same duties. The post of Extra Deputy Director of Agriculture was a provincial post, and both the Extra Deputy Directors of Agriculture in the Bombay Presidency did exactly the same duties as Imperial officers holding similar positions in other parts of the country. Both had charge of divisions. It was on that ground that he proposed that the distinction between Imperial and Provincial should be abolished. If that suggestion were not carried out, the pay and prospects of the Provincial Service should be improved. The pay should be at least as high as that which prevailed in the Provincial Civil Service. Rs. 800 would be a reasonable maximum. The present maximum was Rs. 550. He preferred easier access to the Imperial Service to an increase of pay in the Provincial Service.

68351. If the best European specialists were not to be had for the ordinary Imperial prospects Government ought to be prepared to pay a higher salary. They should insist on qualifications and not on any scale of salary. Each specialist should have his own terms and be employed for short periods only for any special work; but in the immediate future he was of the opinion that there would be a sufficient number of Indians of high qualifications in scientific branches of agricultural study to man the ordinary Imperial service without resort to England.

68352. (*Mr. Madge.*) At present the members of the Provincial Service were not free to select their own work or problems in research, and there should be greater independence in that respect than at present existed.

68353. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He did not frame his lectures from text books. He had read some literature on the subject. He took his notes from the papers on Indian agricultural subjects published either at Pusa or elsewhere. Only two of the papers used for his lectures had been written by Indians. The science of Mycology had been practically built up by Europeans, and was being extended mainly by Europeans, but not exclusively.*

68354. (*Mr. Sly.*) His complaint was that the provision for Mycological work in the Poona College was inadequate if he was expected to do work which was to be compared with the work of officers in the Imperial Service. Nor was he allowed a sufficient measure of freedom to do what work he considered necessary. The lecturer on contomology, who was placed directly under the Principal of the College, put forward the same complaint. The sense of over interference from Imperial officers was general in the Provincial members.

68355. During his four years of service he had published two small papers, one in the Annales Mycologici, Berlin, and the other in the Bombay Natural History Society's Journal. He had not yet published any in the Memoirs of the Agricultural Department, nor had he submitted any.

68356. His reason for recommending that the Agricultural officer should be permitted to retire at the end of 20 years' service was that it was desirable to encourage some of the district officers to take up private agriculture. That might be a very expensive method of popularising the work of the Agricultural Department, but the results would be well worth the expense. He also wished that it should be made possible for agricultural officers to be transferred occasionally to the Revenue Department, because the Agricultural Department depended very largely on the co-operation of the Revenue Department in the work of popularising agricultural improvements.

68357. (*Mr. Gonehalli.*) His object in proposing a five years' probation for Europeans was to give them a better chance of acquiring a knowledge of the language. He did not think the fact of keeping a man in suspense for five years would be a hardship; he would know the conditions before joining the Service. Opportunities were not given to Provincial officers for promotion to the Imperial Service. He was aware there was a Government Resolution on the subject, but it was not always acted on. Vacancies in the Imperial Service were never actually announced, and members of

* The witness subsequently explained that this was due to the fact that all the Imperial posts of Mycologist were held by Europeans.

the Provincial Service did not know when vacancies were likely to arise.

68358. There were some Indians who were fit to enter the Imperial Agricultural Service, as judged either by the qualification which was at present considered necessary for admission to the Imperial Service, or by the higher standard of the qualification which he himself considered necessary.

(The witness withdrew.)

E. J. Butler, Esq., Imperial Mycologist; and
S. Milligan, Esq., Imperial Agriculturist.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department, being the corporate views of the members of the Indian Agricultural Service (Imperial).

68359. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The present system of recruiting for each vacancy as it occurs is unsatisfactory. It leads to hasty selection from amongst such candidates as may present themselves. Even though there may be a large number of applicants, there appears to be a difficulty in obtaining suitable men. There is no inducement to good men to prepare specially for the Service. The institutions from which such men might be obtained are not always aware of vacancies, and in any case cannot foresee them. The technical advisers of the Secretary of State do not appear always to be fully informed of the conditions of service in India, nor of the standard required not only in academic qualifications, but still more in character, energy, breadth of view and initiative.

We suggest, therefore, that there should be a definite policy of recruitment for the agricultural section of the Service, spread over a fixed period of time, so that the Secretary of State could announce that there will be not less than, say, two appointments for agriculturists annually for the next five years. For specialists it is not usually possible to foresee requirements, but the longest possible notice of impending vacancies should be given.

We attach great importance to the formation of a small permanent Selection Board to deal with all appointments. It should consist of men of established agricultural and scientific repute, with not less than one retired member of the Indian Agricultural Service.

In addition to academic qualifications and character, we consider that post-graduate experience of at least two years should be insisted on.

68360. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—Under the present system probationers are posted, on appointment, either to Pusa or direct to a Province. In the latter case they have usually been given an independent charge at once. This has been due to the insufficient number recruited and should be remedied by the formation of a reserve.

We consider that each Province or small group of Provinces with similar conditions should have its own reserve. Probationers should be trained either at the headquarters station or under one of the district officers of the Department, according to requirements. The period of training before assuming independent charge should be at the discretion of the Provincial Government. For specialists a short period (three to six months) at Pusa may be advisable.

The present period of probation (three years) is unnecessarily long. It should be possible to judge of the suitability of a probationer in two years. If it is desired to retain the three years' probation, we would strongly urge the advantage, both to Government and to the officer concerned, of being able to terminate service at any time after the first year, if the probationer is judged to be unsuitable, without the additional fine of a refund of his passage-money to India. If the service is terminated by the Government, passage-money home should, of course, be granted. If terminated at the request of the officer, at any time after the second year, it is better to pay his passage than to induce him to remain for his full period in order to avoid having to pay it himself. It does not pay Government to keep a probationer in the Indian Agricultural Service, under training, if he means to go at the end of his time.

68361. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—We consider that the aim should be to attract the best type of university man with post-graduate experience. It is not less important to keep good men once they have entered in service. There is, perhaps, a greater prospect for men in the Indian Agricultural Service of obtaining employment on good terms elsewhere, than in most other Indian Services, and our losses in this manner have already been severe. A further point to be borne in mind is that the age at which men enter the Service is frequently greater than in, possibly, any other Indian Service. There are eight senior posts at Pusa (seven heads of Sections and the Assistant Agricultural Adviser) and of these all but one are held by men who were more than 30 when they entered the Service.

The present conditions of service are, we suggest, unsatisfactory in the following points:—

(i) *Total length of service.*—This is at present 30 years, which is, we believe, the maximum period in any service, and now only applies to a few, in which, besides, the age of recruitment is generally low. We consider that the length of service should be reduced to 25 years. We do not believe that Government would suffer by this change as it is probable that few men engaged in original scientific work, or in the very exacting life of a Deputy Director of Agriculture, will preserve their freshness of outlook and capacity to initiate new work, after 25 years' service in this country.

With a view further to attract men with post-graduate experience, we recommend that the system, under which certain officers appointed for professional or other special qualifications are allowed to count as service the number of years (up to a maximum of five) by which their age exceeds 30 at the date of appointment, be extended to the Service as a whole. There is, we believe, ample precedent for this.

(ii) *Ultimate prospects.*—At present these are poor. The maximum salary is reached in from 10 to 13 years' service. There are no high posts, all being at present held by members of the Indian Civil Service. All officers being on the same grade there are no acting appointments carrying increased emoluments as in most other Services. In one or two cases personal allowances have been granted to officers who have had special facilities for bargaining with Government, but this system has little in its favour.

To remove these disabilities, we recommend that the time-scale of the Service be extended to a higher maximum, reached towards the end of the full period of service (this will be more fully dealt with under the next Section) and that the post of Agricultural Adviser and Provincial Directors of Agriculture be reserved for the members of the Service (this will be more fully dealt with under Section 8 below).

68362. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—Under the present system a man is ordinarily posted to the Supernumerary list on appointment, and draws progressive pay of Rs. 400, 430 and 460 during his three years' probation. But a considerable number of direct appointments to posts on the regular establishment have been made on initial pay of Rs. 500. This has acted unfairly in several cases, where men junior both in years and university standing commenced service on higher pay in a post on the establishment list, than their less fortunate colleagues appointed supernumeraries. In such cases the man appointed direct continues to draw Rs. 150 per mensem more than the supernumerary until he reaches his maximum pay.

While recognising that in some cases it may be necessary to offer a higher initial salary than the normal, we consider that care should be exercised in securing that men so recruited are senior in age and standing to the ordinary run of recruits.

We further consider that Supernumeraries posted to full charge of a gazetted post on the regular establishment should be at once brought on to the establishment list in the Rs. 500 grade.

From the fourth to the fourteenth years of service the pay progresses from Rs. 500 by annual increments of Rs. 50 to Rs. 1,000, the present maximum possible pay, except in the case of Imperial Experts who get local allowances of Rs. 100 after 3 years' service, Rs. 150 after 10 years' service, and Rs. 200 after 15 years', and Principals of Colleges who get an allowance of Rs. 100. Thus the maximum pay is reached before the period of service is half completed (a man at the end of his service may be drawing the same pay as one 20 years' his junior) and is less than half the maximum pay of such services as the Public Works Department, Forest, Education and Indian Medical Service. It cannot be contended that the required standard of educational or other attainments is less than in these Services; in length of training and educational equipment required it is at least equal, and the age of recruitment is generally greater. Nor are the duties less onerous. The district work of Deputy Directors is at least as severe a strain on health and energy as in the Forest or Public Works Departments. The officers on the staff of the Agricultural Colleges are much harder worked than in the Educational Department, as they have research and routine work outside their teaching duties, and, besides, do not get the long vacation of that Service. For men holding research posts the strain in this country is admittedly very severe. That the Service cannot compete in attractiveness with other Indian professional Services is evident from the difficulty in obtaining suitable recruits. On every ground, therefore, in justice to its officers, for the sake of efficiency, in view of the value of the work of the Department to the country, we hold most strongly that the pay and prospects of the Indian Agricultural Service should not be inferior to those of any other Indian professional Service.

In the earlier years the pay is not inadequate, though the absence of any chance of extra emoluments in acting appointments may be used as an argument for more liberal treatment. Even Supernumeries appointed to act in higher posts get no extra allowances, and as the charge frequently involves greatly increased responsibility and very heavy work we consider that this rule operates unjustly, and should be modified. Higher initial pay is required in the case of recruits whose age and experience demands special treatment.

The normal time-scale of pay should, we consider, be extended to Rs. 1,500 per mensem, reached in 23 years, irrespective of any special appointments. A good proportion of men in the Service should be able to rise to higher pay than Rs. 1,500, as in the Public Works and other professional Services. We do not wish to claim more than an equality with these Services, and do not think we are doing so in holding that good men should have a good prospect of reaching Rs. 1,750 before retirement.

Provincial Directors of Agriculture, when recruited from the Service, should get an additional allowance of Rs. 300 or Rs. 400, together with such local and other allowances to cover increased cost of living in headquarters' stations and of maintaining their position as are granted to other heads of Departments.

The local allowances now given to Imperial Experts are insufficient to ensure that the Imperial branch should, as is desirable, consist of the best men available for research work. We are of opinion that Imperial officers should receive additional pay of Rs. 250 per mensem after three years' service.

68363. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—We understand that the leave rules at present in force are under revision by the Government of India. The present rules are antiquated and full of harassing restrictions. We do not know what modifications are proposed, but believe that the principle that an officer should be allowed to take what leave he has earned subject only to the exigencies of the Service is recognised. It is of special importance in the Indian Agricultural Service that this principle be accepted, as it is a decided advantage that the members should take home leave at frequent intervals so as to keep in touch with the developments of agricultural science, which are so marked in Europe and America at the present time The period of eight years' service at present required before the first furlough can be taken is too long, and should be reduced to four years.

As the age of recruitment is frequently higher than in other Services, many members of the Service cannot afford to take any furlough except the limited amount which counts as service, which in a total service of 25 years is, at present, only three years. Otherwise they reach the age of 55 before qualifying for full pension. This is not sufficient to enable an officer to preserve his health and to keep in touch with the progress of work elsewhere, and we consider that four years' furlough should be counted in 25 years' active service. Failing this concession, we consider that officers should be allowed to count as service, for furlough only, the number of years (up to a maximum of eight) by which their age exceeds 25 at the date of appointment, the first furlough becoming due after four years' actual service.

At present the leave reserve is insufficient to permit officers taking leave when due. Early action in increasing the reserve is called for, as a large number of officers will soon have completed eight years' service and will want to take furlough.

There is a very general feeling that the present scale of leave allowances is too low. The cost of living, both in India and in England, has risen. Officers find it difficult or impossible to live on half pay at home, especially in the earlier years of service, and it is equally difficult to save towards leave expenses while on full pay in India. We understand that the Government rules in this respect do not compare favourably with the practice of business firms in India, and consider that the whole question of leave allowances should be carefully examined. There is no doubt that many officers are afraid to face the expense involved in taking long leave, and that this is detrimental to their efficiency. We are confident that the result of such an inquiry would be to show that the present Government rules require modification either in the direction of increasing the furlough allowances or of defraying the cost of passage to and from Europe. The demand which has come from some Departments that officers should be allowed to commute a certain proportion of furlough on half pay to half that proportion on full pay is evidence of the genuine nature of this feeling. We do not, however, believe that the adoption of any system which would lead to the reduction of the total amount of leave taken by officers would be an advantage either to Government or to the officers themselves. Freshness of

outlook, energy and readiness to undertake new work are of the utmost importance in our Service, and these are attributes which are bound to suffer through long, unbroken periods of service in the country.

It is desirable that officers should be encouraged to keep in touch with new developments of agricultural science in other countries by the granting of study leave, on conditions similar to those in force in the Indian Medical Service. It is inevitable that officers of a scientific department in India (particularly where such rapid developments are occurring as in the agricultural sciences) should find that in certain directions they are getting left behind, and should desire to improve their knowledge. The extra efficiency thus gained at small cost to Government has not received sufficient recognition in the past, and the granting of study leave has been unwisely discouraged.

68364. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—As already stated under Section III above, we consider that the qualifying period of service should be reduced from 30 to 25 years.

To enable men who find the conditions of life in India too severe as they grow older, to retire earlier, we suggest that a smaller pension be given after 20 years' service, as in the Forest and some other Services. Really efficient men are not likely to wish to retire as long as they feel capable of doing good work.

The present rates of pension entitle an officer to £437 10s. per annum after 25 years' service. The arbitrary maximum of Rs. 5,000 per annum allowed, renders the sliding scale under Article 640 of the Civil Service Regulations practically inoperative. In practice the amount of pension does not increase according to length of service in the case of senior men. The maximum fixed is insufficient to allow an officer to live in any comfort at home or to provide adequately for his family after retirement. We believe that the limit of Rs. 5,000 per annum was originally fixed to be equivalent to £500. It is probable that the equivalent of this at the present time would be not less than £600 or £650, instead of the £437 10s. to which it has been reduced by the fall in the rupee. This is in a large measure due to the increase in both the cost and the standard of living in England. Wages increased by nearly 20 per cent. in the last 20 years of the last century and have remained at the higher level ever since, and the incomes earned by accredited professional men have increased in at least as great a proportion. A salary or pension of £600 a year now would thus correspond to one of £500 30 years ago. It may be said that the members of this Service, nearly all of whom joined since 1903, accepted the conditions of pension then obtaining; but there was at that time no reason to suppose that the great rise of prices that began about the time of the South African War was not only permanent but would be intensified to such an extent that the prices of a large number of representative articles in daily use are now on the average 30 per cent. higher than in the middle 'nineties, instead of having fallen as was previously the tendency.

We submit, in effect, that the cost and purchasing power of gold have been permanently lessened by recent developments in the mining industry, and that pensions, which are paid in gold, should be increased accordingly.

We suggest, therefore, that the pension earned after 25 years' service should be made equivalent to what was considered a fair rate when the present regulations were introduced, and that taking this amount as standard, voluntary retirement at a reduction of £40 per annum of each year less service down to 20 years, be permitted, while on the other side a progressive increase of £20 be given for each completed year up to 30 years' total service.

Invalid pensions should be at the same rates, but the reduction for each year less service below 20 years should be £20.

The scale proposed would thus work out as follows:—

Year of completed service.	Nature of pension.	Rate of pension.
10	Invalid	£200
11	,,	220
12	,,	240
13	,,	260
14	,,	280
15	,,	300
16	,,	320
17	,,	340
18	,,	360
19	,,	380
20	Invalid and Retiring	400
21	,,	440
22	,,	480
23	,,	520
24	,,	560
25	,,	600
26	,,	620
27	,,	640
28	,,	660
29	,,	680
30	,,	700

An officer who receives promotion above Rs. 1,500 should, we consider, receive a proportionally higher pension, say £750 per annum if he reaches Rs. 1,750, and £800 if he reaches Rs. 2,000.

There is a wide-spread feeling in the Service in favour of a Family Pension Fund of a nature analogous to that in force for the Indian Civil Service. This should be contributory and compulsory for all new recruits, but should be optional to officers at present in the Service.

68365. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—We wish at the outset to deprecate the tendency which has been apparent at times to regard the minor and largely scientific departments as offering a suitable field for the employment of non-Europeans, regarless of efficiency. There is a feeling apparent in some quarters that the natural aspirations of Indians to an increased share in Government employment in the higher posts, can be met in the lesser departments without the same injury which diminished efficiency would cause in the larger and more administrative Services. We contend that in a Department such as ours an inefficient man is a greater deal loss to the State than in the administrative Services. The value of the Service to the country depends entirely on the efficiency of the individual members of it; there is little routine work of importance, and there is no possibility of effective control of the actual work of the individuals, particularly in the more specialised posts. No outside person can make an inefficient botanist or chemist do work of any permanent value. The position of a Deputy Director is also one in which it is exceedingly difficult to get work done except by a thoroughly efficient officer and much actual harm may result from misdirected activity.

The Service consists of district officers, generally termed Deputy Directors, specialists engaged in research work, and the staff of the Agricultural Colleges, some of whom do research work when their college duties allow of sufficient time to be devoted to it.

The very general experience in the Service, hitherto, has been that it is only in the last of these three divisions that there is any considerable field for the employment of Indians. In teaching they have shown capacity. Effective supervision is also more readily exercised than in the other divisions.

As district officers the class of men available does not appear to be satisfactory. It is difficult to attract recruits of the classes more directly connected with the land and the educated literary classes carry little weight in practical matters when brought into contact with cultivators.

Until conditions are greatly altered in the direction of the improved education of the classes directly connected with the land, we do not con-

sider that there is much scope for the employment of Indians as Deputy Directors.

As specialists engaged on research work, very few indeed show any promise of capacity to fill the higher posts. The Department contains a large number of Indian University graduates holding posts as Assistant Professors, and scientific assistants, in the colleges and research laboratories. Several of these have been through English Universities. Scarcely any have done independent research of value, though they have carried out a considerable volume of work under the guidance of European members of the Service. They have, in many cases, ample facilities for independent work. A glance at the list of publications of the Imperial Department will show how far they have availed themselves of these facilities. It is probable that in this section of this Service there is a better opportunity for the discovery of real merit than in any other, and while we should be prepared at once to recognise such merit should it appear, there is little indication that any appreciable proportion of the specialist posts in the Imperial Service can be efficiently filled by recruitment in this country for some time to come.

The employment of a large provincial service, predominantly Indian, is necessary. There is a large demand for good men as Agricultural Supervisors, Managers of the Farms and the like. These should be mostly recruited from the Agricultural Colleges. Difficulty is experienced in getting suitable recruits, and it is probable that the pay and prospects are insufficient. The conditions at present compare very unfavourably with such services as the Revenue, Education, Forests, etc., and should be made such as to keep officers from constantly seeking employment in these services.

The gazetted assistants at Pusa should be placed on the same footing, as regards pay and prospects, as the Provincial Service Officers in the provinces, which is not the case at present.

68366. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—In a highly professional Service such as ours, we consider that it is not merely important but inevitable that the controlling posts, such as those of Directors of Agriculture in the Provinces and that of Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India should be filled from the Service itself, as is the case in the Public Works, Education, Forest and other professional services. At present all those posts are held by members of the Indian Civil Service. It is recognised that this is largely due to the fact that there are few senior men available within the Service. There are obvious disadvantages in appointing as Director of Agriculture an officer who has many years of service before him. But the argument can be pushed too far and it would not be difficult to point to cases where the development of the Department has been probably less effectively promoted by the appointment of untrained Civilians, who ordinarily hold the post of Director for a short period only, than if a member of the Service, even if relatively junior, had been selected.

We desire to urge that a start be made at a very early date by the appointment of members of the Service as Directors in, say, two or three provinces, and that this policy be steadily adhered to in the future as occasion arises and competent men are available until all the posts mentioned are so filled.

It follows as a corollary to this recommendation that the Civil Veterinary Department, which is at present under the control of the Director of Agriculture, should be separated administratively from the Agricultural Department.

Messrs. E. J. Butler and S. Milligan called and examined.

68367. (*Chairman.*) Mr. Butler said his colleague and himself were elected to represent the whole Imperial Service, which numbered about 60, and included officers of the Imperial Service serving in the Provinces.

68368. The present system of recruiting for each vacancy as it occurred was unsatisfactory. The posts were not sufficiently advertised. What happened at present when a vacancy occurred, or a new post was created, was that the Government of India applied to the Secretary of State for an appointment to that specific post, generally in a hurry. The Secretary of State consulted individual advisers. There was always a feeling of urgency. There was no machinery at the India Office for keeping fully informed the institutions that might have likely men. There was an absence of that considered selection which he regarded as important. He would surmount the difficulty by instituting a roster of candidates, and inaugurating a permanent Selection Board which should have on it a representative conversant with Indian Agriculture. It would be better to have a retired Agricultural officer on the Board, rather than a senior man on leave. If the former got out of touch with the rapidly changing conditions of India, his appointment could be limited to five years.

68369. His scheme assumed there would be very substantial increase of staff. At present it was increasing at the rate of three or four a year, and that rate was likely to be kept up for the next five years. It was very probable that the Service would have to engage two, and possibly four Deputy Directors annually for the next five years. The pressure from the Provinces for an increase was becoming very strong.

68370. Mr. Milligan said that in the case of agriculturists the post-graduate experience should consist of two years' actual work in the field. It would be useful also for a man to have had such experience as could be gained by working under the Board of Agriculture in England. What was really wanted was to know more about the man before he was selected.

68371. Mr. Butler said he would require that specialists should have done some research work before coming out to India. That was absolutely essential. A man who has just taken his degree was not ordinarily fitted to undertake the class of work which he would have to do in India. A training in research methods, an opportunity of seeing the application of science to economic problems, and increased technical experience such as could only be got after the ordinary college course was completed, were exceedingly important qualifications. In fact, for both branches of the Service they require practical experience as well as educational qualifications.

68372. Six or eight Indians had been tried on independent district work. He did not consider any of them were qualified to occupy positions in the Imperial Service—at any rate, not for the work which the Deputy Director at present was called upon to do. Many of them were quite satisfactory for demonstration work, but he considered that the demonstration work proper was work which could be carried out by a less highly paid agency than the Deputy Director. The function of a Deputy Director was to carry out experimental research on his farms, and to control the demonstration work.

68373. Mr. Milligan agreed, and said that the Deputy Director should not do propaganda work himself, but merely control it. A Deputy Director was a research officer just as much as a chemist or botanist was.

68374. Mr. Butler said the time occupied by research officers in teaching depended on the subject. In Mycology the average course was only about three months in the year, and the Assistant Professors in that subject had an immense amount of time available for research work. At Pusa there was plenty of time for research work.

68375. Pusa ought to be an institution for the promotion and encouragement of research. The

only training that could be undertaken at Pusa was post-graduate research training, and it was a decided advantage to have a certain number of research students there. He had written a note on the position of Pusa in that respect, which he would be pleased to hand in.*

68376. In his view it was essential that at Pusa they should carry out research work of an Imperial character; that was to say, referring to the whole of India. Local research was a class of work which ought not to be performed in Pusa. The problems to be undertaken by the Pusa staff ought to refer to the whole of India, or they ought to be problems which were too large to be taken up by any one Provincial Department. He did not agree with the witness who said that the work now carried out at Pusa was more or less of a local character. It would be very regrettable if that were the fact. The authorities had steadily aimed at avoiding that. He quite agreed with the witness who said that Pusa ought to model itself on the lines of the central Institution at Washington, and that was what they were trying to do. He thought Pusa would always be criticised by other workers, and this was all to the advantage of agricultural science. He had no fear of the injury which would accrue from any overlapping which might take place. It was rather a healthy form of rivalry. In other words he would make Pusa, as far as possible, the centre of scientific research in India, but he would do it without in any way detracting from the research work which might be carried on by the local Provincial Departments.

68377. He thought if Indian Officers for the research side were recruited, they should be recruited in India from among the men who were actually working in the Government laboratories. He was more in favour of that method of recruitment than of recruitment by direct appointment. After recruiting such men, or with a view to preparing them for recruitment, he would send them to England on study leave after they had completed their post-graduate training in India.

68378. Mr. Milligan said that the best system of recruiting Indians for the demonstration side was a system of selection. It was absolutely essential to know as much as possible about the men before making appointments, and one would be much surer of getting a suitable man by selection than by taking him at random from one of the Universities in England, or even a man trained in India at one of the Indian Universities. A man might be quite good on paper, but might fail utterly afterwards. His course would be to keep men under close observation whilst they were working in the Provincial Service, and if it was seen that they possessed singular merit and quality, they should be promoted, and sent home on study leave. The work these men had been doing in the Provincial Service of a more subordinate character would in no way disable them for the superior positions they would occupy in the Imperial Service. Provincial officers after some few years' service generally were given some independent work, and were left a good deal to themselves.

68379. He suggested that each Province or group of Provinces should have its own leave and training reserve. He would group the Provinces in the following way. There would be the Indo-Gangetic group, consisting of the Punjab and Sindh, the United Provinces, Bihar, Bengal and Assam, where the conditions were all very much the same from one end to the other. An officer who knew something about agriculture in Bihar could easily take up work in the Punjab. Another group would be the Central Provinces and Bombay, which would certainly be able to work together, and probably Madras and Burma might be included as another group.

68380. He recommended optional retirement after 25 years, because some officers were afraid that they would not retain their efficiency for a longer period of service.

68381. Mr. Butler said that he could not agree with the suggestion that departmental officers should not be promoted to the rank of Director with less than 15 years' service. Previous Directors had been appointed after a shorter period. He agreed that an officer ought to be over 35 before he became a Director, but it largely depended on the man.

68382. He generally agreed with the scheme that there should be an officer in general control over all the different services connected with agriculture, and that he should be the intermediary between those services and the local Government. In principle the idea was very sound.

68383. Mr. Milligan agreed. The scheme was sound from the point of view that it would bring the co-operative movement and the agricultural movement together, and he regarded that as very important.

68384. (*Mr. Sly.*) Mr. Butler said he would be opposed to a longer period of probation than two years. He would discard unsuitable officers freely. He did not think the rejections would be so many as to affect recruitment.

68385. He contemplated that Pusa should be recruited by selection from the best officers of the Provincial Department rather than by officers directly appointed from England. He did not think there was much in the argument which had been raised against the former system, namely, that it took away from a Province its best men. He did not think either that there was much in the statement that a good man would never consent to leave his provincial work in order to go to Pusa unless he was paid a very substantial salary. He agreed, however, that the salaries at Pusa ought to be improved. Service there ought to be made specially attractive. The present allowances to the Pusa staff were not sufficient to attract the best men of the Provincial Service, but it was largely a matter of climate. An officer serving in some of the Provincial Departments could remain with his family during the whole of the hot weather at the head quarter station but if he came to Pusa he would practically have to keep up two establishments for six months.

68386. It would not be desirable to recruit direct from England on more or less special salaries for a short period men who had made their reputation. Appointments of that sort were not at all likely to be successful in the Agricultural Department. Local experience was necessary in all branches of the work. Men were not likely to prove useful until two or three years after coming out, and a scientific man with a reputation would not come out for ten years. He might come out for five years, but if out of that he had to spend two or three years picking up local conditions, there was not much time left for productive work. Again, an expert of that kind coming out for a short time might be able to write useful reports, or to make specific discoveries, but he would not be able to put his discoveries into practice; his driving force would be lost at the very moment it was required. Very useful work might be done in certain subjects by bringing senior men out in permanent posts at the age of, say, 35, but they would have to be paid a very substantial salary. The practice of bringing men into the Agricultural Service on special agreements had caused great discontent. At present the most satisfactory system was to have a service in which all the men were employed on more or less uniform terms.

68387. For employment of Indians on the research side, he did not consider that a course in an agricultural college was essential, though it was desirable. Science graduates of the universities, and even in some cases non-graduates, had provided in the past suitable material, and from some of the universities he thought Pusa might hope to obtain useful material for the science side, but they ought to enter the laboratories as scientific assistants, as was at present the practice. It was by their research work in the laboratory that their work had to be judged in the long run.

* Vide Appendix XI.

68388. Indians employed at Pusa had full facilities for carrying out any research work which they desired, and so had some of the officers in the Provincial Colleges.

68389. Up to the present time Indians had not been good enough for recruitment to the Imperial Cadre, except in teaching posts. He had had experience of men from some of the universities, and he was of opinion that in the future good research workers would be obtained from that source. The scientific standard of education in the universities was not likely at present to turn out such officers. He was most emphatic on that point. There was, for instance, no full-time Professor of Botany in any college affiliated to the Calcutta University, and it could not be expected that research workers in Botany would come out of that university. There had been, however, a great awakening in that direction, and he would not be at all surprised if good research officers were obtained in future.

68390. He did not think there was much in the objection put forward in regard to the filling of the Directorship from the Department itself, namely, that it was undesirable to transfer an officer of the Department from one Province, where he knew local conditions, to be Director in another Province. A good man would very quickly pick up new conditions. It should be possible to transfer a man to a Province where the conditions of agriculture would not be very widely dissimilar.

68391. Very few research men would be willing to take on demonstration work until they were old enough to lose their keenness for research work, and in such cases it would be quite a good thing for them to be taken off research work.

68392. He agreed that there was no real necessity for a leave reserve for specialists.

68393. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He would not like to say that there was provision at Pusa for carrying on every branch of agricultural research which might be required in India.

68394. It should be possible to have a staff at Pusa composed simply of the most distinguished agricultural experts in India, but there would be some difficulty in recruiting the whole of the staff from the Provinces. No Provincial Department had an Agricultural Bacteriologist, for instance, and it might be better to bring out a man direct from England for that post. The real remedy was to strengthen the Provincial Departments, and there would then be no difficulty in getting suitable officers for the Institute at Pusa.

68395. Pusa sometimes received requests from different parts of India for the solution of special problems. Under the internal rules of the institution, its officers were obliged once a year to write to every Province in India, to inquire whether there were any problems of this kind, but the Provinces, so far as he was aware, very seldom made any suggestions.

68396. There were means of assessing the value of the research work done in the different Provincial colleges, first by touring, and secondly by means of reports received under arrangements with the local department. At present the authorities at Pusa were in a position to give advice as to the general direction of the scientific agricultural work of India, where a Province had shown any indication that it required assistance.

68397. In his opinion, a great increase in the staff devoted to scientific agriculture in India was required.

68398. He would not care to say whether it would be more desirable to increase the staff of researchers than to increase the staff of practical agriculturists. He would not care to make any distinction at all. He thought the Deputy Director did a good deal of experimental research himself. That there was any doubt on this point had not struck his colleagues when they were preparing the written statement, and they had, he feared, rather helped to foster the impression that the district officers were not primarily concerned with research. Such was not their intention. They held that experimental research was a very important part of the Deputy Director's work.

68399. (*Mr. Madge.*) The India Office ought to have some method of registering the names of candidates for the Service. Candidates would probably be able to find some sort of employment in England, or even abroad, while they were waiting for an appointment in India.

68400. By Imperial research he meant research into fundamental problems which affected India as a whole, and not merely one Province. Whatever affected the whole country should be done at Pusa, and what peculiarly affected the Province should be done locally.

68401. With a good scientific education and some post-graduate experience in England as a basis, an officer could adapt himself readily to local conditions.

68402. It was far more important to have at the head of the Department a man who was a technical expert in the work of the Service than a Civilian who had had an agricultural training at home, even although the latter might bring the Department into touch with Government on a number of points which would not occur to specialists. He believed suitable men were available for making a start in this direction at once.

68403. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) Research workers wanted all the facilities they could obtain for study leave. At present study leave was discouraged.

68404. He would be satisfied with the regulations which now existed in theory for study leave, if they were applied in a more liberal spirit. Possibly the period of one year allowed during total service was too short. He thought the period might with advantage be raised to 18 months or two years.

(The witnesses withdrew.)

C. E. Low, Esq., C.I.E., I.C.S., Director of Agriculture and Industries, Central Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Agricultural Department.

68405. I have been Director of Agriculture in the Central Provinces and Berar during three periods, aggregating some three years in all, from the year 1905 onwards. I am at present on furlough, but am returning to take up the same appointment in October. I am not a member of the Indian Agricultural Service.

Unlike the Police, Judicial, and Medical Departments, whose existence in any civilized community is usually taken for granted, in the case of the Agricultural Department I feel it necessary to explain why I believe in its future, and why I look upon it as affording the most beneficent expression of the spirit of the British Government in India.

The work of cotton improvement was first seriously undertaken in the Central Provinces in the year 1903. Up to three years ago, some 40 private farms for the growing of improved seed had been started. There are now 120 such farms supplying improved seed for 100,000 acres, and adding six lakhs of rupees to the yearly profits of the growers. An increase in the number of farms sufficient to supply the 3½ million acres of cotton grown in the Central Provinces is prevented by the lack of supervising staff, but an attempt is being made to render organisation and supervision possible by co-operative management, and 25 unions were formed for that purpose this year.

A very large proportion of the rice grown in the Central Provinces, some two or three million acres

at least, is broadcasted instead of transplanted. After five years' work the area transplanted by the cultivators reached in the year 1910 some 6,000 acres, with a saving of 80 per cent. of the seed, and a gain of some 700 lbs. of grain per acre, valued at about Rs. 17. This year the area transplanted is, I hear, about 30,000 acres, and the annual gain to the cultivator is valued at over five lakhs of rupees.

Similarly in wheat, oil seeds and sugar-cane, a great advantage has been gained by the cultivator from the improved methods and varieties introduced by the Department. It has helped the cultivators of one or two of the northern districts to destroy some 20,000 wild pig in the past two years. A large number of improved implements have also been sold.

The cash benefit to the cultivator, as ascertained by actual measurement and experiment, exceeded 11 lakhs of rupees this year.

The points that have especially impressed me are—

(1) The rapid rate at which the improvement has been taken up after the first few years. (2) The fact that Agriculture and Co-operative Credit are the only public Departments with which the cultivating, as opposed to the intellectual, classes actively and willingly co-operate. The deduction from this is, that the work of the Department should be extended as rapidly as funds allow and should be permitted to have its fullest effect in elevating and organising the agricultural community. This is the first chance the Indian farmer has had of being anything else but a passive payer of taxes. Let us help him to make the most of it.

IMPERIAL SERVICE.

68406. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—Candidates are at present recruited by the Secretary of State. In doing this, his office freely avail themselves of the opinion of scientists and educationists of repute and of members of Indian Services when at home on leave. I do not think this procedure could be bettered. A formal committee, constituted for the express purpose of examining and recommending candidates, would possess several disadvantages in comparison with the present procedure, and it might be apt to look with too friendly an eye upon combinations among the scientific professions to raise salaries or obtain other advantages. At present recruitments are made to fill actual vacancies. This is objectionable, because (1) there may not be such suitable men forthcoming at that particular time as at some other period when no vacancy happens to exist; (2) an irregular demand does not help to create a regular and good supply; (3) considerable delay is often caused; (4) a man often had to proceed straight to responsible work without time for preliminary training.

A preferable course is to recognise at once that the Department will have to be largely expanded; to estimate its probable strength some ten or fifteen years hence, and recruit annually the number required, on actuarial considerations, to reach and maintain the total. Recruits for whom no vacancies exist can be placed under training, and, when trained, used as a reserve (Provincial rather than Imperial) until absorbed. Even if any Province, from financial or other considerations, does not work up to its estimated figure at first, other Provinces are certain to exceed it, and the net excess or deficiency is not likely to be large or long continued. I am strongly opposed both to the training of all supernumeraries at Pusa and to the maintenance there of the entire leave reserve. The men under training should be allotted, as far as possible, to individual Provinces, especially those to be employed on demonstration work. Such men require a thorough knowledge of local conditions, which vary widely in different parts of India. It has been well said that the problem of agricultural improvement in India is almost entirely a local one. Crops, even varieties of crops, and methods of cultivation, that are suitable in the Indus and Gangetic alluvial soils, are unsuitable in the black soil tracts. Chemical and probably bacteriological facts regarding the one are not true for the other. Equally wide differences exist between the irrigated tracts and the dry areas of the Deccan or the tropical tracts of high rainfall below the Central Indian table-land. In demonstrating to the cultivator, it is useless to appeal to general agricultural theories; he must be shown that the actual fields he cultivates or the crops he grows can be made to yield him more money by certain definite methods. Thus, for the purpose of demonstration, the control must be divided according to areas of similar agricultural circumstance. The field in any one of these areas, each of which will extend over tens of thousands of square miles, is so large that it will be more than sufficient for a single man. An intimate knowledge of the existing methods of cultivation and of the complex of past effort in experiment and demonstration in any one of these areas is as much as one man can be responsible for. The difference in language between one part of India and another is a further argument for keeping a man in his original Province. No success can be gained in demonstration work without close personal acquaintance with the leading cultivators, who are proverbially slow in giving their confidence to a new comer. A man brought in from another Province or from an Imperial Reserve to fill a leave vacancy will not be able to do more than mark time for a few months for which such a vacancy usually lasts. If the vacancy is filled by a man who has been under-studying the permanent incumbent, progress will be continuous.

The above arguments do not apply so strongly in the case of men engaged on research, though even here it is difficult for a man coming from outside to pick up the lines of an investigation, while work done under such circumstances often leads to friction and recriminations. The pure scientist pays the penalty, in a somewhat jealous susceptibility, for that disinterested devotion to the progress of knowledge which in his case takes the place of the personal ambition usually found among the best men engaged in executive work.

I would, therefore, propose that the reserve should be mainly Provincial, and that men should be recruited for, or at any rate immediately appointed to, a particular Province.

The present method of selection has hitherto secured men of suitable qualifications. Scientists intended for research, however, should have done post-graduate work in Europe before coming to India, and no such man should be appointed merely on his success in examinations. Emphasis should also be laid on the necessity of practical experience in farming in the case of candidates required for demonstration work. In order to carry conviction to the minds of cultivators, a demonstrator must see things from the farmer's point of view, must thoroughly understand the *minutiæ* of indigenous agricultural practice and must be able himself to perform the ordinary operations of Indian farming. But little regard will be paid to a demonstrator who explains the advantages of an improved plough, for instance, if he cannot himself use the ordinary country implement. The sympathy engendered by a common pursuit and by a common point of view renders it easy for a European agriculturist, to whom a scientific training has given a cosmopolitan standpoint, to gain the confidence of Indian farmers.

68407. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—As explained in the last part of my note regarding recruitment, probationers should be posted for their training to the Province in which they are to work throughout their service. In addition to the administrative advantages already described, the recruit will himself be a gainer. He is more likely to develop original ideas of value, in the presence of concrete problems awaiting solution, of which the economic importance is always before him; and the individual attention of the man whose helper and under-study he is to be, is likely to be of more use than the more theoretical and general training by an expert at Pusa. I do not consider the results of the training of European supernumeraries at Pusa, so far as I have had the opportunity of observing them, entirely satisfac-

tory. If men who have had some post-graduate experience, whether in research or in the practice of agriculture, are selected, the period of training need not be long. It should include, even in the case of a man destined for research, enough experience of general agriculture to enable him to appreciate the relative importance of the various factors. A thorough training in one at least of the local vernaculars is essentual for men intended for demonstration.

The question of probation represents a serious difficulty. In a small and new service where no established tradition exists, it is especially necessary to avoid unenthusiastic or inefficient recruits. Each man must be a centre of energy for his subordinates and a standard of devotion to the cause of scientific progress. He has no predecessors and few contemporaries to counteract to some extent his example if it be bad, but the difficulty of determining the undesirables is especially great when scientific qualifications are in question. A Civilian head of a Department or a Local Government has not the scientific knowledge. Their fellow scientists in the Province have not the standing, nor, as the Pusa Institute is at present constituted, are the Imperial Officers in any better position. The officer who has the charge of a probationer's training ought not to bear the main responsibility for reporting on what may be considered as to some extent dependent on that training, *viz.*, his fitness for retention. Though the ultimate responsibility must of course rest on Government, still the initiative must be taken and the *data* supplied by a scientific authority that will command general respect. For other and much more important reasons, I think it necessary that the Agricultural Institute at Pusa should be remodelled; and its reconstitution would, it is to be hoped, furnish a body with the requisite status and qualifications to act as technical advisers to the Imperial or Local Government on this and other more important questions. The longer the period of probation, the harder it is to get rid of an undesirable. In the case of men recruited, as I propose, with post-graduate experience, two years is ample; but the standard should be rigid and no mercy shown to the unfit. One of the duties of the Imperial scientific experts should be to examine, while on tour, the work of probationers and the manner of their training. They should consider the reports of probationers and recommend to the Local Government or, in the case of Pusa supernumeraries, to the supreme Government, their retention or rejection. The final responsibility, however, must lie on the Government concerned, who should not be bound to follow the opinion of the Board in either case.

68408. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The posts of Provincial Director of Agriculture should be held as a rule by members of the Indian Agricultural Service, as soon as the time is ripe for it. The reasons that have been hitherto urged against the proposal appear to be: (1) that the members of the Indian Agricultural Service are at present of such nearly equal seniority that the appointment in one would block the others indefinitely; (2) that the Director of Agriculture at present holds also the charge of other Departments, such as veterinary, factories, co-operative credit, etc., for which a wide general knowledge of the country, especially in its economic aspect, is required. None of these reasons have much force. The first is illogical, for it involves an injustice to the whole service in order to avoid an injury to a portion of it. As for the second, many members of the Indian Agricultural Service have gained in the course of their work, especially on demonstration, plenty of administrative experience and economic knowledge; and I see no reason why such men should not be well fitted to hold charge of the other minor Departments. There is, however, a real difficulty, in that the other members of the Indian Agricultural Service, and of the Veterinary Department, would probably be deeply aggrieved by the appointment of any one member of the Indian Agricultural Service as Provincial Director, seeing that individual merit has not yet had time to gain general and assured recognition; and the result might even be the resignation of capable officers. I do not think that it is desirable, on general grounds, to place a man in charge of a Department over officers of his own Service unless he has had at least 15 years' administrative experience, or is, at any rate, over 35 years of age.

But the prospects of the Service, apart from the increase in the maximum salary, to which I shall allude later, ought not to end with the ultimate chance of a Provincial Directorship, a post which is after all more suited to the special faculties developed by executive work, and I find it necessary at this point to discuss the organisation of the Imperial Institute at Pusa and to state, as briefly as possible, the lines on which I think it might be improved. I must admit that I have not the scientific knowledge to enable me to pose as a critic of the work of such an institution; but the points which I desire to raise are mainly administrative; while the feeling that Pusa is hardly justifying its existence and needs extensive remodelling, is one shared by a large number of persons interested in the future of Indian agriculture. In paragraph 8 of Resolution No. 8 of the Revenue and Agricultural Department of the Government of India, dated the 29th February, 1904, the following were stated to be the main functions of the Institute:—

(*1*) It was to serve as a model for provincial farms. Here it is surely *functus officio*.

(*2*) It was to initiate and test lines of experiment. Except in a few matters of a fundamental or highly technical nature, there are not many experiments that cannot be pursued with more advantage in the soil and climate to which their results are to be applied; and, as already stated, most of the problems of Indian agriculture are local ones. Further work by the Provincial Departments is likely, however, to increase the number of lines of research which may properly be handed over to a central institute; but here the necessity of Provincial Departments is logically prior to that of an Imperial one.

(*3*) The production of improved seeds. This is pre-eminently a local problem.

(*4*) To test the results of local experiments and to secure continuity. There are many experiments, which relate to a soil or climate not found at Pusa, which could not be so tested.

(*5*) To train students. A training in general at Pusa is of little use to men who are to work in a Province, for reasons already stated; training in special lines of research and demonstration can no doubt be given, and could be given to even greater advantage, if the experts there were to cease from doing work which more properly belongs to Provincial Departments.

(*6*) A field for local research work, especially in matter likely to benefit the planting community. It is doubtful if the latter have reaped much advantage from the work of the Imperial Institute, or have provided quite as ready a means for disseminating improved methods in Behar as was evidently expected at the time the Institute was founded.

Similarly, the work of the Imperial expert staff was declared to be:—

(*1*) To serve as a higher teaching body.

(*2*) To prosecute lines of research applicable to all India.

(*3*) To train supernumeraries.

(*4*) To collate the results of the working of Provincial Departments.

With this dictum, except in so far that supernumeraries can obviously be better trained as a rule in the Provinces to which they are to belong, I am in complete agreement; but I think there are other and even more important functions which can be performed by them and arise necessarily from the above.

But in order to fulfil any of these purposes, the Pusa research staff must possess a status far higher than it does at present. Each man must obviously be the best in his own line in the Indian

Agricultural Service. This is not the case at present. The Provincial experts do not admit the superiority of the Imperial experts; they were in most cases recruited at the same time and from the same class of men. Both Provincial and Imperial experts alike are capable, and have done much excellent work; but none can claim that the latter are a class apart. This is not at all as it should be. But the pay and prospects of the Pusa staff are not such as to tempt the best men to leave their Province for what are to many the uncongenial surroundings of Pusa. The difference in pay should be substantial; at present it is small. No candidates should be appointed to the Imperial staff who falls short of a high and well recognised standard of scientific attainment. If a suitable Provincial man is not to be found, a short-time appointment might be offered to a scientist of reputation from elsewhere; in default of this, the post should be left in abeyance for the time and the current duties carried on by an assistant in charge.

The duties required of the staff so reconstituted should be:—

(*1*) Investigation into matters referred from the Provinces and into questions more fundamental and of wider application than Provincial Departments can undertake. Lines of enquiry which are too technical or lengthy, or do not offer reasonably early prospects of economic results, may well be handed over by the Provincial Departments.

(*2*) They should form a Board to advise the Government of India or Local Governments on scientific or technical questions regarding agriculture.

(*3*) They should study the work of probationers when they inspect the work of Provincial Departments, and advise for or against their retention.

(*4*) They should inspect and review the work of Provincial experts, especially those engaged on research.

(*5*) They should advise as to appointments to the higher Departmental posts. It is important for the last two purposes that there should be no possibility of their work overlapping that of Provincial experts, as it does at present in very many cases, otherwise their position of disinterested and respected critics of scientific work would cease to exist.

(*6*) They should be responsible for the higher training in special branches of research or agricultural practice, of members of the various Provincial and subordinate staffs, and of the general public.

Generally speaking, they should be men who have achieved high reputation, and are near the end of their service; and their duties should be more those of responsible advisers than of active investigators. From such men, whose lines of work did not clash with their own, Provincial experts would readily ask and accept advice. Any special temporary research work that could not with advantage be placed under a Provincial Department might be also in their charge.

The proposal could be worked up to as follows: With the reconstitution of salaries proposed in the next section, the present incumbents of Imperial posts should be retained on ordinary Departmental salaries, unless there are any whom the Government of India think fit to appoint as Imperial experts under the new scheme. But for the most part it would be better to add the existing Imperial officers to the Provincial staff on the proposed new scale of salary, and to fill their posts, if possible, by direct appointment from abroad of senior and highly qualified men on five year contracts. Even if the posts lay vacant for some time, the loss would be more than covered by the ultimate gain. The best work which is now being done at Pusa is really Provincial, and could be done better at one or other of the Provincial centres.

There is no doubt that the Pusa Institute has for the greater part of its existence lost much from its inability to obtain a head of the proper type. It has only once secured an Inspector-General of high scientific qualifications. A civilian Inspector-General was a suitable selection when the Institute was first started and the main work was merely organisation. But what is wanted now is an all-round scientific agriculturist, whose abilities will command the respect of the staff, and whose knowledge will be sufficient to secure that his fellow workers keep to their proper lines. Much of the present unsatisfactory working of the Pusa Imperial Institute is due to the lack of a head with suitable qualifications. With such a man the staff would be kept to its proper work; overlapping of Provincial research would be avoided, and though I do not propose that his control should be autocratic, he would serve as a president for the Board, and his personal influence should suffice to maintain a strong scientific *esprit de corps* among its members, which would help him to prevent slackness as well as jealousy and encroachment on other officers' fields of work. If it were thought necessary, the strength of his position as regards his colleagues could be greatly increased by making him the channel through which all references were made to or received from other Government Departments, and by giving him the responsibility for the allotment of work among them. The primary duty of such a man would be the management of the Pusa Institute; he would be the head of the Board in their dealings with the Government of India, Local Governments and Provincial Agricultural Departments. Each expert would have, under the scheme I am proposing, the position of the late Inspector-General in respect of his special subject, backed up, if necessary, by the authority of the Board.

The inspection of the work of Provincial experts and probationers would not take more than six or eight weeks at most in any one year; and it is necessary for the Imperial staff to keep in close touch with Provincial work on general grounds. Their principal duties would be the higher training of Indian members of the staff, and of their special research work. Their advisory duties could be fulfilled during their Provincial touring.

68409. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The present maximum limit of Rs. 1,000 is absurd, and the point need hardly be laboured further, as it has been accepted in principle by the Government of India and, I believe, by the Secretary of State. I would propose an incremental scale of Rs. 500—50—1,500 for the Service as a whole with an efficiency bar at Rs. 1,250 to be passed on the recommendation of the Imperial Board. Provincial Directors should draw Rs. 1,500—50—1,800; and Imperial experts the same. The head of the Board should draw Rs. 2,000. Appointments to the post of Imperial expert would be made by the Government of India after considering the recommendations of the Board; in the case of a Provincial Director the Financial Commissioner or member of the Board of Revenue of the Province concerned should have a seat on the Board, which should present its recommendations to the Local Government. Directors would as a rule be appointed from the demonstration and members of the Imperial Board from the research staff.

There are at present 18 Deputy Directors with about eight more agricultural experts working as Professors or College Principals; and 34 research men (42-8 agriculturists on educational work). These figures are probably only approximate, but errors are of the less importance, when one considers the disproportion in strength between the research and demonstration staff; the latter should certainly be increased as soon as possible up to a total of 40 or 50. This would give a relatively fair allotment of superior posts between the two branches.

The alternative to the above scheme is to provide some form of talent money. The allotment of this is difficult, if not impossible, in the present absence of any generally respected scientific tribunal; to obtain the latter, an improvement in the status and an alteration of the functions of the Imperial research staff are necessary in any case, while, if higher responsibilities are attached to the grant of superior salary, it is consistent with human nature to believe that the Government will exercise a more careful and impartial choice than in

bestowing a mere pecuniary reward for good service.

The present travelling allowance of Rs. 5 per diem is notoriously insufficient. Most men tour at present at some pecuniary sacrifice; all married men do so. To take only one instance: the daily hire of carts in Nagpur has increased in the last 14 years from 8 to 20 annas; while supplies and wages have all gone up in a nearly similar proportion. This is a matter, however, which must be considered for all services together, European and Indian.

68410. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The proposed rules regarding leave recently circulated for opinion by the Government of India should be made applicable to the Indian Agricultural Service. I do not think the proposal of half furlough on full pay is a good one. If the pay during service and the allowance on furlough are not sufficient to enable men to take as much leave as is necessary for the proper performance of their duties, one or both should be increased. The proposal would have the effect of discouraging men from taking as much leave as they need, would increase the cost to the Government with no corresponding increase in the efficiency of its employees, and would, in a graded service, cause loss to the junior officers. I do not think the idea of a leave reserve solely attached to the Pusa Imperial Institute is a good one, because, as already explained in Part 2 of this note, it will not ensure the reserve being employed on really useful work in the intervals of filling Provincial vacancies, and because the Provincial vacancies themselves will not be filled in the most effective way.

I prefer to express no opinion on the subject of study leave. The Service is so understaffed at present that it would be extremely difficult to spare men merely for study leave. If the Service is recruited up to the strength which the programme of work before it logically requires, the matter might then be considered. I am unaware what is the experience of the use or abuse of study leave in other Services.

68411. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—An officer invalided before ten years' service should receive a gratuity; and he should have the option of retiring on a reduced pension after 20 years, or on full pension after 25 years. It would improve recruitment were an officer allowed the option of retiring after 10, 15 or 20 years on a gratuity. Agriculture is emphatically a profession in which a man can make good use of capital, and many suitable candidates might be attracted by such a proviso, who would not care, with no experience of Indian life to commit themselves in the first instance to 25 or 30 years' service in a foreign country. The amount of the pension should follow the decision taken in the case of other Services. Admittedly, the pension has remained stationary, while the cost of living has increased very greatly.

In considering the question of furlough and pension it must be remembered that officers employed on demonstration work perhaps under the hardest conditions of any Service in India. I may fairly contrast their lot with that of the Indian Forest Service, whose pensionable period was recently shortened, owing, it is believed, to the arduous nature of their work. This Department, it may be noted, spend a month of the rains at a hill station in most cases, and the whole of that season in office. The Agricultural Department, on the other hand, apart from the fact that the rains are their busiest season, throughout the hot weather, too, are constantly travelling by rail and road making preparations for the programme of work in the rains. Life under canvas at that period, even with the occasional unpleasant interlude of a forest fire, is infinitely preferable to train journeys interspersed with long trips on cycle, horseback or country cart, as I can say from personal experience; and I have year by year noted with regret and apprehension the injury to the health of officers employed under me at this time of the year.

68412. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—In the Central Provinces we have not yet succeeded in evolving a type of Indian who combines a scientific knowledge with executive ability. We have two or three men, mostly of cultivated castes or from land-holding families, who do excellent work under close supervision; but they have not the all-round education to enable them to rise beyond a subordinate outlook. I have seen very little in the Provincial Department of Indians of a more intellectual type and better education, but with such as I have seen I have not been favourably impressed. Generally speaking I am of opinion that elementary education has not so far been sufficiently good to form a basis for scientific training. Again, the domestic opinion of the class whence our men are taken is as yet untouched by the spread of scientific truth. An English youth is brought up in a home and taught at school by parents and teachers who have been profoundly influenced by the knowledge of fundamental scientific truths, where his father and masters held it as a matter of course that for every physical ill or inconvenience that arises or exists the remedy is to be sought in scientific investigation. There is a large body of scientists in any Western country whose influence is far-reaching, and who believe that all investigation faithfully conducted on proper lines is bound to lead to results of value. This state of things is not a matter of to-day or yesterday; it is based on the traditions of two or three centuries and has been reached by the toil of generations of workers, who have seen the reward in commercial or sociological improvement for investigations that perhaps seemed useless at the time. The lack of this tradition in India shows itself in two ways. It is obvious that a man developed in such surroundings has not the same deep-seated belief in the results of scientific investigation, the religious adherence to its laws, the same scientific faithfulness, as are to be found in the ranks of English workers. The phrases of science are on his lips, but its truths are not always in his heart.

Again, very few, if any, Indian boys take up any form of scientific study for the love of it. Schoolboys do not collect plants, flowers, or fossils as a hobby. Those youths who are studying for a scientific degree have chosen their subject either because they have reason to think that it will in their case lead more easily to subsequent employment, or because their special abilities are more likely to yield them success in a science examination. Though these causes are not without their effect among our English youth, quite a large proportion of our science scholars, including nearly all who subsequently attain any degree of eminence, choose a science course because their personal tastes lead them to do so.

I do not wish to be understood as implying that the Indian youth is, as an individual, inferior to his English co-eval. But he has not, as things are at present, the same chance of being influenced in his early youth by the Western attitude towards science; nor, perhaps it is unnecessary to add, are the institutions that profess to teach him later on in any way equal to those in England.

For these reasons I do not think that there will be forthcoming for many years more than an inconsiderable number of Indians suited for the higher ranks of the agricultural service. The best means of generating in India the atmosphere necessary for the growth of such men is to be found in an extension of the operations of the Agricultural Department and in a wider public recognition of its success, not in the mere increase of the numbers passed through our Agricultural Colleges. It is idle to talk of permeating the country with the product of Agricultural Colleges as a means of familiarising the people with the truths of agricultural science. The only result of such a policy will be to fill with unsuitable men a departmental cadre whose work will have very little hold on the agricultural population, and to send abroad among the people a number of unpaid emissaries to preach the blessings of agricultural science, the study of which

has led them to nothing better than starvation. But make the people accept as an every-day truth that the farmer can earn more money by improved methods; and some of them will then come forward to learn the science by which these methods have been evolved. In no Provinces in India, save to a very limited extent in Bombay, do more than an infinitesimal number of youths enter an agricultural college except to obtain Government employment. I have, in discussing the suitability of Indians for higher agricultural employment, purposely confined myself to generalities. That is not because I am unable to quote instances enough of the effect of the various factors I have discussed on individuals, but because I think it a mistake to introduce personalities of pillory subordinate officials who are doing their best, and for many of whom I feel a personal liking and respect.

All who have the welfare of the country at heart are agreed that, in order to fit the people for self-government they must be admitted to a larger share in administrative responsibility, even at the cost of some probable falling off in efficiency. The gain must be balanced against the loss. But where the loss to a very large and important section of the public vastly exceeds the gain to a few individuals of a very much smaller section, we cannot apply the general rule. The Agricultural Department exists for the direct and personal benefit of the farmer, not to supply a few educated Indians with employment. The farmer can be benefitted first and most of all by improving his agriculture; next, and to a less extent, by inducing him to accept agricultural education, and to help in the work of teaching his brother farmers. There is no doubt whatever but that the few agriculturists who have so far joined the department are as a class far better demonstrators and farm managers than the members of the intellectual castes. Tradition and custom are at present against us in our endeavour to recruit the farmer; but a determined effort is being made, and will be successful as soon as our demonstration work has sufficiently popularised the improvement of agriculture with the cultivating classes.

I look forward with confidence to a time when the higher ranks of the Department will be wholly or mainly officered by Indians, whose intimate knowledge of the details of every-day life and thought among their fellow-countrymen will produce a service that will exercise an even greater and more beneficent influence with the cultivating classes than our European experts do at present. But such anticipations are, as regards the Agricultural Department, merely the prophecies of hopeful minds, and have as yet hardly emerged from beneath the administrative horizon.

To dilute the strength of the Department before it has had time to gain a hold on the people or form its own traditions would be a grievous error. Let the cadre approach more nearly its ultimate development; and it will then be both possible and necessary for it to include a larger proportion of Indians than would be safe at present.

I may note, incidentally, that it is a complete mistake to consider agricultural demonstration work as other than very largely administrative. Although we do not consider that demonstration work in the Central Provinces has in any way approached its final development, a Deputy Director has in his charge at present three or four large farms; he has to supervise the demonstration work of some 25 assistants working over an area of 40,000 square miles of country; he has to create and maintain close relations with 10 or 12 agricultural associations, sub-associations and a dozen or more agricultural co-operative societies; he has to see that from 50 to 100 private seed farms are looked after and kept up to the mark; he has dealings with Bombay and Calcutta firms and local traders, to say nothing of numerous district officials and irrigation engineers; and his duty is to see that neither money, work nor time is wasted, but that all agencies act together to produce the results which he has in view. His work, in fact, though its tone is given by the scientific spirit he should possess, is mainly administrative. Perhaps, too, the above remarks will suffice to show, without the necessity for entering into elaborate statistics, that the work of agricultural improvement has begun to gain, in the Central Provinces at any rate, sufficient hold on the cultivating classes to warrant the sanguine forecast of its future success, which is the basis of most of the suggestions in this note.

I would, therefore, provide for the direct recruitment into the Indian Agricultural Service of Indians in exceptional cases only. I think that very few of them are fit to take their place therein, unless they have thoroughly won their spurs in the Provincial Service. An occasional appointment not exceeding one in ten, if a limit be desired, might be made from picked members of the Provincial cadre, who should be sent after four or five years' service to a Western country for training. Practical responsibility and hard manual work are just as necessary an experience for Indians as for Europeans; a man who goes to an English college directly after passing through an Indian one will never gain these. The light manual labour on a college farm under non-commercial conditions is no adequate substitute for the kind of work I refer to. Every man, when he leaves college, must come into contact with practical agriculturists; he must work under them as a pupil or employee, or at any rate have to do with them as a demonstrator. They will laugh at many of his college notions; he will find many difficulties in practice that have never occurred to him in the course of his education, and unless he can learn to surmount these difficulties and to equal the practical farmer on his own ground, he will never gain his respect.

PROVINCIAL AND SUBORDINATE DEPARTMENTS.

68413. On the pay and prospects of the Provincial and Subordinate Departments I have little to say. This is not because I am not keenly interested in the subject. But it has been the policy of the Administration, in respect of my Department, to encourage recruitment by the offer of an ultimate rather than an intermediate cadre: and in the higher grades our establishment rolls offer more promotion than there are men fitted for it, and will do so for several years to come. Turning to the Provincial Department, we have in the Central Provinces a cadre which provides for 12 appointments on a salary of Rs. 200 on confirmation, rising to a maximum of Rs. 400. This scale, though perhaps more liberal than that of any other Province, taking into account the comparative smallness of the Central Provinces, does not go far enough; and I see no reason why the Provincial Agricultural Service should have a lower initial or maximum salary than that of any other service, due regard being had to the relative strength of the respective cadres. Only some three or four appointments have been made so far, from a lack of suitable men; but in four or five years' time a far more rapid rate of recruitment is probable. By that time, too, the existing members will be drawing nearly their maximum salary; and the time will then have come to raise the maximum limit to a figure not much below that which may by then have been determined on for the Provincial Civil Service. For the higher ranks the rate of increment—Rs. 30 every other year—will be too little, considering that direct appointments are not at present made to the Provincial Agricultural Service, and a man is not likely for some time to come, at any rate, to reach it with less than five or ten years' service. Two years ago I tentatively introduced a more rapid scheme of promotion for men who had done specially well in the College final examination; but found it a failure. All-round agricultural experience takes a long time to acquire; for two or three years a passed student is of comparatively little use even in the subordinate service, and I know no other means of fitting him to take his place in the Provincial Service than some years of practical work. In the research and teaching lines, experience is less vitally important; promotion may be more rapid; and for this reason demonstration on the one hand and research and teaching on the other require separate cadres. A considerable improvement in the pay and prospects

of the subordinate cadre was proposed for the Central Provinces before I left India, and has, I believe, since been sanctioned; this should suffice for some years to come. The difficulty is, how to offer sufficient prospects at a reasonably early date for men on demonstration work; and I can see no alternative but that the latter should be recruited, as far as possible, from the cultivating classes, and be recompensed by their ultimate prospects for the slow promotion that they will receive at first. It seems unnecessary to make any more detailed suggestions for the improvement of cadres which are not likely to be fully worked up to for some years to come.

68414. To sum up, my recommendations are as follows:—Recruitment for the demonstration appointments in the Indian Agricultural Service through the Provincial Service, by sending promising men to England for training after a few years' experience, and in the case of one or two, perhaps, of the present members of the Provincial Service even without such training; for the research branch, the first-named procedure should obtain as a rule, though direct appointments might be made in exceptional cases. The limit for Indian members of the Indian Agricultural Service should be fixed at present at 10 per cent; and I do not think that even this figure will be reached at first. The Provincial Service should be divided into a Demonstration Branch and a Teaching and Research Branch; the latter should be on a time scale, allowing for more rapid promotion to start with than the former would receive. The maximum limit of salary should be fixed slightly lower than in the case of the Provincial Civil Service.

MR. C. E. LOW called and examined.

68415. (*Chairman.*) The witness was at present employed on special duty as a member of the Bengal District Administration Committee. He belonged to the Central Provinces, and had been Director of Agriculture there for some time. He was in his 21st year of service. He had acted as Director of Agriculture on various occasions since 1905.

68416. He had put before the Commission a scheme for the development of the Department, the two most important features of which were the modification of the relationship which now existed between Pusa and the Provincial Agricultural Departments, and a proposal to increase very considerably the staff of Imperial Officers employed on district work. His intention was not to convert Pusa into a central bureau for research to which the Provinces might refer. What he had in mind was to delegate to the Pusa staff the more fundamental and general questions of research, and to make them responsible for advising on questions of the appointment and confirmation of officers in the Provinces. They would not interfere with the work done by the Provincial experts, unless the latter were clashing with work which ought more properly to be done at Pusa. Pusa ought to be in a position to form a fair estimate of the quality of the work done by officers in the Provinces, and in this way they could serve as advisers to the Local Government and the Government of India, when a decision had to be taken in such matters as the retention of probationers, the appointment of members of the Indian Agricultural Service as Directors of Agriculture, the advancement of officers beyond the efficiency bar which he proposed, or the appointment of research officers to posts at Pusa. He regarded it as very important that the work done by officers at Pusa should not clash with or overlap the work done in the Provinces, so as to eliminate as far as possible any question of personal jealousy. He agreed that it would not be easy to define what work should be done at Pusa and what work should be done in a Provincial centre, but some working principle would have to be arrived at. His opinion was that Pusa at present was doing a certain amount of work which more properly belonged to the Provinces. He hesitated to give examples, but he would say, for instance, that the work on wheats was work which could more suitably be done in the Provinces.

68417. Officers undertaking the work at Pusa should be men of a certain age and seniority. He would recruit them from the Provinces wherever possible, and if there were not suitable men in the Provinces he would bring them out from England as a temporary measure.

68418. He did not apprehend that if his scheme were carried out there would be in years to come a body of men at Pusa who had spent the best years of their life in the Provinces, and whose activity was declining. The intellectual energy of a man did not diminish at the same rate as his physical energy.

68419. With regard to his suggestion that Pusa officers should give their opinion as to the confirmation of probationers, there would of course be no necessity for the whole of the research staff from Pusa to assemble in Madras, for instance, in order to undertake a function of that character; they would probably be visiting Madras on other business. He thought that in practice the Pusa experts would be the best people to decide on the merits of a probationer, as they could give something like a final opinion on certain features of his work. He did not agree that the local officials who had been brought into contact with the probationer would be in a better position to do so. He could not give instances, but he had heard in practice that one or two probationers who ought not to have been retained had been retained in deference to the opinion of the Local Government. It would greatly strengthen the hands of the Local Department of Agriculture if it could have the support of the experts at Pusa, or the Pusa Board as it would be called under this scheme.

68420. In recruiting Indians to the Service he would apply different considerations to officers who were to join the research branch of the Service, and to officers who were to be employed in district work. He would choose them differently, and train them differently. A research officer should go on to Pusa for a post-graduate course of two years if he was selected for the Provincial Service. With regard to district officers, it was no good giving these officers a higher course in agriculture and demonstration. The only training of any value was experience and practical responsibility.

68421. He felt considerable doubt as to the best method of recruiting Indians to the Imperial Service, because there was no one in the Central Provinces who showed any immediate signs of being fit for that service. On the whole, he would say that a man ought to be given a fair amount of practical experience in actual responsible positions, and that he should then be sent to England for a certain amount of extra training. Under no circumstances should a man be sent to England for training unless he had done a reasonable amount of responsible work as a Government official in India. Great difficulty was experienced in the Central Provinces in getting Indians associated with the land and possessing the necessary educational qualifications to come forward, but as the prestige of the Service and of agriculture increased, that difficulty would gradually be overcome.

68422. There were three Indians in the Central Provinces in charge of divisions, but they were under the Deputy Directors. They were allowed as much latitude as possible. They were in immediate charge of the demonstration work, and

in general charge of farms over the Farm Superintendents, who were immediately responsible for the details of the experimental work.

68423. He did not think there was any present necessity for separating research and teaching in the Central Provinces. They were gradually turning over more of the teaching to Indian Assistant Professors, and the members of the European staff were now doing more research work and less teaching.

68424. At the Agricultural College at Nagpur there was a European agriculturist who was also Principal, a European botanist, and a European agricultural chemist. There were also one assistant agriculturist, one assistant botanist, one assistant chemist, and one assistant entomologist. There were at present 55 students. The average number was 60. The length of the college course was three years. They tried to work up to practically the same standard as other colleges but he would not say that their average standard was as high as it was at Poona. There were a very few students coming to the college who desired to get a training in agriculture without any idea of joining the Service. That number was gradually increasing.

68425. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) One of his objections to any overlapping of research work in India was that under existing conditions there was far more research work to be done than the present staff could cope with; but his main objection was the personal one (*i.e.*, the possibility of friction).

68426. They offered at the Nagpur College 8 or 10 scholarships a year. Half of the students were scholarship holders, and nothing was charged to them, except their food, books, and expenses for games. A scholarship of Rs. 10 would be sufficient to pay for the whole of the college expenses, if the student was careful.

68427. (*Mr. Madge.*) An administrative staff of six or eight officers would very likely be sufficient for the Central Provinces for the next 10 years.

68428. It would depend entirely on a man's efficiency whether the system of recruiting Englishmen from England, and Indians from India might be departed from in the case of Indians who had an English education. It would not be a good thing to appoint an Indian to the Department simply on his college training, unless he had shown a capacity for practical work. The same applied to a European.

68429. Many landlords in the Central Provinces were actually cultivating their own land. They were rather more intelligent than the rest of the people, and were quite ready to take up any scheme which showed financial results. They did not trouble about the scientific side of the question. Some of them were sending their sons to the experimental farms to learn certain definite processes, but not to get a general agricultural training.

68430. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He agreed that his recommendation consisted in taking a number of officers who had spent the greater part of their lives working at local problems and transferring them to Pusa where they would have to work on problems affecting the whole of India. He admitted that such officers would at Pusa have to deal with problems with which they were unfamiliar or else that they would continue under less favourable circumstances the research work which they had been carrying out in their Provinces, and that in the latter case there was a chance of their overlapping with the work of their successors. He admitted that there were difficulties in his scheme.

68431. (*Mr. Sly.*) His recommendation that a man should be able to retire after 10 or 15 years' service was made in the interest of recruitment. At present an officer might not care to sign on for a life service in the tropics, but he would be perfectly willing to do 10 or 15 years, at the end of which period he might find the work more congenial than he expected and would be prepared to stay on. Another point was that a man would always have a certain feeling of security, in case private circumstances compelled him to go, that he could leave with money in his pocket. On the whole, the Government would gain by treating the Service generously. Government always tended to lose by any uncertainty in prospects.

68432. With regard to the appointment of a Rural Commissioner, he felt the paramount necessity of co-ordinating co-operative credit work and agriculture. Although he hoped to see at an early date an agricultural officer appointed as Director of Agriculture, it would still be a good thing to keep the Indian Civil Service connected with the Department, in order to ensure the close touch which had hitherto existed between the demonstration staff and the district staff, and also in order to strengthen the position of the head of a technical Department with the local Government. He had read the Agricultural Adviser's proposals, but although he agreed with them in principle he did not agree with all their details. For instance, it would be a mistake to attach a member of the Indian Agricultural Service to the Rural Commissioner as a Personal Assistant. He himself would prefer to have a member of the Indian Agricultural Service as Director of Agriculture occupying the same position as the civilian Director did at present; the same thing applied also to the Veterinary Department, co-operative credit, and industries. The officer in general control over all these Departments would have the status of a Financial Commissioner in a province like the Central Provinces; he would enjoy within certain limits the powers of a local Government and he would therefore not be merely a functionary who would delay work. He would be in a position to combine inside knowledge with outside control.

68433. (*Chairman.*) In the Agricultural Adviser's scheme* the responsibility of the Indian Agricultural Service Officer acting as Personal Assistant to the Rural Commissioner would be very much less complete than what he himself would desire that it should be.

* The witness afterwards explained that this referred to a draft of the Agricultural Adviser's scheme sent to him by the Revenue and Agriculture Department of the Government of India, but he understood that the Agricultural Adviser had subsequently modified the proposal.

(The witness withdrew.)

At the India Office, London, Tuesday, 5th May, 1914.

PRESENT:—

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E., R. R. SCOTT, Esq., } *Joint Secretaries.*

T. H. MIDDLETON, Esq., C.B., An Assistant Secretary to the Board of Agriculture and Fisheries,* called and examined.

68434. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he was Assistant Secretary to the Board of Agriculture and at one time spent six and a half years in Baroda College as Professor of Agriculture.

68435. For the last three or four years there had been some difficulty in getting the type of man wanted for the Indian Agricultural Service, owing to the great demand for men in England, especially since the Development and Roads Improvement Acts were passed. The supply for India had been temporarily affected, but he believed the deficiency was purely temporary and when the immediate demand in England had been met the supply of candidates ought to be better than ever, because the facilities for education had been very greatly increased within the last few years. There might perhaps be a little prejudice in some quarters against going to India, but he did not think that would be sufficient to curtail recruitment if it were not for the home demand.

68436. With regard to the essential qualifications for appointment as an agriculturist in India, the applicant should have a first-rate university training in England and a fair knowledge of ordinary farming. If he did not come from the farming classes, he ought to have two or three years on a farm in England before going out to India. For an agricultural chemist post-graduate laboratory experience was necessary. Scientific men should have the equivalent of Part II. of the Cambridge Natural Science Tripos and subsequently some experience in a research laboratory.

68437. With regard to the machinery by which agricultural candidates were selected, recently there had been a small informal committee consisting of Mr. Drake, Mr. Coventry, and himself. In the first place they called for applications and then he, or someone else, wrote to the teachers for their opinions of the candidates. The candidates were then interviewed and the men were selected whom the Committee thought were most suitable for the Service. All the institutions were notified of vacancies by the India Office. He believed in that way every likely candidate had a knowledge of the appointments.

68438. He quite agreed with the suggestion that there should be a Committee of Selection set up, representative of agriculture in this country, of up-to-date agriculture in India, and of the India Office, with a specialist added when any candidate had to be selected for a special branch. It would be quite easy to arrange for such a committee to have a list of applicants always before them as a basis upon which to work. To some extent that was done already, as a list was kept of all suitable people. Practically everybody available applied for work at one time or another and their names were registered, and thus the Committee knew exactly the possible field of recruitment.

68439. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) He was well acquainted with all the agricultural colleges and had some knowledge of many of the persons trained in them, and knew the value of the kind of education provided There were six or eight departments of agriculture in the universities and university colleges, and in addition there were certain agricultural colleges. He preferred the university training for Indian purposes. The ordinary agricultural college diploma in itself did not as a rule postulate sufficient scientific knowledge. Certain men who came from the colleges were occasionally qualified, but, as a rule, it was preferable to draw the men from the universities, as the scientific education given at a university, supplemented by practical knowledge, was what they chiefly required.

68440. (*Mr. Sly.*) For the last few years there was such a demand for men in England that students had not been looking to the Indian Service, and India had not been attracting the class that was wanted, but he did not think that condition would long continue. He always advised the right type of man that the Indian Service was a good one, and in that way he had persuaded some very suitable men to go to India. It might be that India occasionally missed very good men who would be willing to go to India at a particular time when there happened to be no vacancy for them, but he had not come across any such case. As a rule, men wanted to know what was going when they were just ready for work and would often take the first thing that came along. If a system of regular annual recruitment for agriculturists could be devised, it might have a slight effect, but not a very substantial one. It would not tempt men to go to universities; they would go for general agricultural work and in the course of their career would think of India.

68441. Men recruited from the farming classes would not require two or three years' experience on a farm, but a lad who had been at an ordinary public school and had then gone to Cambridge would have had no opportunity of getting any farming experience, and if he was going into the Indian Agricultural Service it would be necessary for him to have a year or two on an English farm. The knowledge of English farming required was not very great, as the conditions in India were entirely different, but some training was wanted which would enable a man when he went to India to tackle agricultural questions effectively.

68442. The fact that a considerable number of the administrative posts in the Agricultural Department were held by members of the Indian Civil Service might affect recruitment in England, and he had heard it put forward as a factor which injuriously affected recruitment, but he did not think that influenced the students very much. The main thing influencing students at the present time was the

* This witness did not submit a Written Statement.

prospect of employment at home. If men had to look for employment elsewhere quite a sufficient number would come forward for India.

68443. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The desirable age for recruitment to the Agricultural Service was about 24, but the age should be kept rather elastic, and men as young as 23 and as old as 26 or even more might be taken if they were good men, and specialists might be taken even up to 30 years of age.

68444. It was necessary that men, when they went out, should settle down in particular areas, because the conditions varied so greatly that if a man was moved about a great deal he was not so useful as he might otherwise be, but it would not be possible to say, from a man's educational antecedents in England, what sort of area he would be best suited for. Occasionally a man might be found who would be especially valuable in connection with the improvement of some special crop as, *e.g.*, cotton, and such a man would naturally be sent to the cotton areas.

68445. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) There had been one or two Indians on the list each year, but he could not say how many were on the list at the present time. There was no process of elimination before candidates were put on the list. The applications were gone through very carefully and the names, with the academic qualifications, placed on the list, and then the men were interviewed after they had been put on the short list. No one was put on the short list whose academic qualifications were not sufficient.

68446. It would be possible for an Indian student to obtain experience of farming in England, but he should come rather older than he came at the present time. An Indian student of 21 or 22 was too young to benefit by the experience. The Mysore Government had sent an older man to study both in America and in England, and that man benefited much more by his experience than the younger lads, who had been sent home in some numbers. English candidates received their practical training at an earlier age, but there was no comparison between the English and the Indians; the conditions for the Indian were so novel that it was very difficult for him to acquire the experience in the two or three years available. Even if he had gone through a university course in England, it would still be difficult to acquire a satisfactory knowledge of practical farming in so short a time.

68447. There was no difficulty in giving a proper course of education in agriculture to Indian students in India, and, in fact, it was much better given in that country. The position as he saw it was as follows. For the Service in India a very much greater number of men was required than the 70 or so at present in the Indian Agricultural Service, and that extra number could be trained and recruited in India. If they were members of the college staffs they might be given the same status as European professors. As he had had no experience of the administrative work of the Department of Agriculture in India, he could not say anything about that side of the Service. For higher teaching work the training could be given in India.

68448. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) When a candidate was interviewed, an endeavour was first made to find out whether his training had been a satisfactory one. He first of all went through a candidate's academic record. Then he tried to find out whether the candidate had an open, inquiring mind and was the type of person likely to respond to the new conditions he would meet with in India. The questions to candidates varied greatly. The candidate was asked where he had lived; what his experience had been, whether in the country or in a town; and every effort was made to find out whether he was likely to interest himself in Indian work. The great possibilities of doing important work in the Agricultural Service in India were not sufficiently realised by the class of young men who came forward as candidates, but, personally, he had done something to make them known. In that connection he thought it would be well to approach the Secretaries of the Universities' Appointments Boards, as if they were interested in the Indian Agricultural Service it would be of great assistance in obtaining candidates. When at Cambridge he wrote an article for the "University Appointments Board Journal" indicating the openings in the Indian Service, but he did not know that anything had been done since.

68449. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The Selection Committee circularised the Appointments Boards, but his suggestion was that the Boards might bring the attraction of the Indian Agricultural Service to the notice of students.

(The witness withdrew.)

NOTE.

68450. Attention is also invited to the evidence given by Mr. F. C. Drake, Secretary in the Revenue and Statistics Department of the India Office on Monday, 4th May, 1914. This will be found generally in paragraphs 66679–66718 in the section of this volume (XV) relating to the Forest Service, and in particular in paragraphs 66694, 66698-9, 66706-8, and 66715.

68451. Mr. Drake also put in the following notes:—

Notes on the Selection of Recruits for Agricultural, Veterinary, Geological, and Miscellaneous Appointments, by Mr. F. C. Drake, Secretary, Revenue and Statistics Department, India Office.

1. The appointments to which these Notes refer are technical appointments. It is necessary, if possible, to fill them by men who have not only had a technical education but have also proved their ability by practical work in field, mine, laboratory, etc. The selection has to be guided more by the performances of the candidates in the direction of research or original work than by their scholastic successes; the men selected ought to be proved men who can at an early period take an independent part in the work of a small Department without requiring to be taught how to apply their knowledge.

The conditions are thus different from those arising in the selection of candidates for the Public Works Department or the Forest Service, for which men who have just finished their education are recruited.

2. Two considerations result from this, viz.:—

That the posts cannot be filled by competitive examination, which is not a suitable method of testing the kind of qualities required.

That the Secretary of State requires to have, in the selection, the assistance of some person or persons thoroughly acquainted with the conditions of work in the profession concerned and able to gauge accurately the value of the candidates' performances.

3. These are, in effect, the considerations on which the practice of the India Office is based.

The appointments are so numerous and varied that it would be wearisome to give in detail the proceedings in respect of each. The following are given as examples:—

(*a*) *Geological Survey.*—The Director of the Geological Survey of the United Kingdom, and Sir Thomas Holland, K.C.I.E., F.R.S. (late head of the Indian Geological Survey and now Professor of Geology at Manchester), have on recent occasions been asked to examine the applications

and testimonials and to interview the candidates who appear *primâ facie* to have the required qualifications. They discuss the merits with the Secretary in the Revenue Department, who also sees the candidates. The interview with the geological experts takes the form of a searching *vivâ voce* examination in respect of the candidates' knowledge and their capacity to do original work.

The conclusions arrived at are laid before the Secretary of State in Council, with all the pros and cons, and the decision is made after this has been considered by the Revenue Committee of the Council.

(*b*) *Agricultural Service* (other than Botanists, Entomologists, etc.).—Mr. Middleton, Assistant Secretary to the Board of Agriculture, who has a wide acquaintance with agricultural education and the progress of agricultural research in the United Kingdom, examines the applications. On the last occasion, Mr. Coventry, Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India, who was at home on leave, was associated with Mr. Middleton in this work.

The procedure is the same as that described above in the case of geological candidates.

[It is to be noted that in the case of botanists it is usual to get the assistance of Sir David Prain, and of entomologists that of Mr. Lefroy, of the Imperial College of Science.]

(*c*) *Assistant Mathematical Instrument Maker, Survey of India.*—This was an appointment recently made. The Astronomer Royal was asked to nominate a gentleman qualified to weigh the merits of the candidates. He nominated Professor Dalby, F.R.S., Dean of the City and Guilds Engineering College, who consented to act. With Professor Dalby was associated Major H. L. Crosthwaite, R.E., Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India, who had held charge of the Mathematical Instrument Office, and was at the time on leave.

These instances could be multiplied freely, but perhaps enough has been said to show that the object aimed at is to enlist the assistance of the best available expert, preferably a gentleman holding some official position unconnected with the India Office, and to associate with him a prominent member of the Department for which the recruitment is being made, in order that any peculiar requirements of the Department may not be lost sight of. The arrangements made in each case are such as seem the best available at the time of the vacancy, and none of the selectors are continuously engaged, excepting in the case of the Veterinary Department, for which Colonel Queripel, formerly Inspector-General of the Department, has for many years conducted inquiries with a view to securing candidates of good quality and choosing the best of them.

The part taken by the Secretary of the Revenue Department is that of seeing that the candidates understand the conditions of appointment, have been passed by the Medical Board, and comply generally with the requirements of the Government of India, and of reporting to the Secretary of State in Council the views and recommendations arising out of the interviews.

4. The methods above indicated may be open, perhaps, to the objection that the number of the selectors is small and that the suspicion of "jobbery" more readily attaches to a small than to a large body of selectors. It is not enough for a selective system to be pure; it ought to be beyond suspicion, if such a thing can be. While it is the case that the existing system is free from any kind of undue influence, there is no doubt the India Office would welcome any suggestions that would make even vague suspicions impossible, while retaining the present system of basing the selection on independent expert advice.

68452-69243. Mr. Drake further put in the following statement with special reference to the Agricultural Department:—

Statement to show the number of Officers appointed by the Secretary of State to the Indian Agricultural Service from 1904-1914 (*end of April*), *inclusive.*

Year.	Europeans.	Indians.
1904	4	—
1905	6+2†	—
1906	16	—
1907	13+1†	—
1908	4	—
1909	3	—
1910	3	—
1911	3	1†
1912	2	—
1913	3+1†	1
1914 (to end of April) ...	2	1†
Total	59+4†	1+2†

† Figures marked thus represent appointments, made in consultation with the Government of India, of men already in India at the time of appointment.

LIST OF APPENDICES.

PAGE.

I.—Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, No. 238 (Revenue and Agriculture—Agriculture) of 22nd October, 1913 258

II.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh relating to the Agricultural Department 258

III.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bengal relating to the Agricultural Department 259

IV.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bihar and Orissa relating to the Agricultural Department 260

V.—Memorandum prepared by the Assam Administration relating to the Agricultural Department 261

VI.—Note dated the 9th April, 1913, by the Honourable Sir Archdale Earle, Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Agricultural Department 262

VII.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Agricultural Department 262

VIII.—Note by Dr. Barber on the need for expansion in the district work of the Agricultural Department 263

IX.—Note by Dr. Barber on the inclusion of Indians in the higher posts of the Agricultural Department, especially in district work 265

X.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Agricultural Department 266

XI.—Note by Mr. E. J. Butler on the position of Pusa in the Agricultural Department ... 269

XII.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bombay relating to the Agricultural Department 271

XIII.—Memorandum prepared by the Administration of the Central Provinces and Berar relating to the Agricultural Department 272

XIV.—Statement of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Agricultural Department (Appointments under the Government of India) 273

XV.—Statement (with details by Provinces) of the Provincial establishment of Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April 1913, in the Agricultural Department (excluding Appointments under the Government of India 274

XVI.—Rules for Appointments in the Indian Agricultural Service 276

XVII.—Officials and non-officials who furnished written evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their enquiry into the Agricultural Department, but who were not orally examined 277

APPENDIX I.

Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, dated Lahore, No. 238 (Rev. and Agri.—Agri.), 22nd October, 1913.

With reference to your letter dated the 1st of August, 1913, I am directed to forward 20 copies of a letter from the Director of Agriculture and Industries, Punjab, No. 3453, dated the 2nd of October, 1913, and of its enclosures, furnishing the information required in connection with the Civil Veterinary and Agricultural Department in the Punjab.

ENCLOSURE IN COVERING LETTER FROM THE DIRECTOR OF AGRICULTURE AND INDUSTRIES, PUNJAB, NO. 3453, DATED LAHORE, 2ND OCTOBER, 1913.

Statement showing supplementary information as to the organisation of the Agricultural Department in the Punjab.

The present regulations as to the recruitment, training and probation, and whether these rules are satisfactory.	The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890, in 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.	The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.	What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held temporarily or otherwise by the officers of the various services.	Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.
The latest rules regarding the emoluments and conditions attached to four appointments in the Punjab held by the members of the Indian Agricultural Service are contained in Punjab Government Proceedings Nos. 14–17 of March, 1913. There are no special rules regarding the members of the Provincial Agricultural Service. They are recruited as far as possible from Diplomates of the Lyallpur Agricultural College. Not satisfactory for Imperial Officers. See Memorandum of Imperial Officers. Satisfactory for Provincial Service.	There was no organised Agricultural Service in 1890 and 1900 in the Punjab. The present rates are for Imperial Agricultural Service :— Rs. Per mensem. For the 1st year 400 For the 2nd year 430 For the 3rd year 460 For the 4th and subsequent years ... ... 500 rising by annual increments of Rs. 50 a month to Rs. 1,000 a month. Provincial Agricultural Service and Subordinate Agricultural Service :— For Assistant Professors— Rs. 150—12-8-0—400. For Assistant Directors— 1 on Rs. 300—10—400 and 1 on Rs. 150—10—300. Not satisfactory. See Memorandum referred to in paragraph 1 and also Memorandum of Provincial Officers.	The number of posts in each grade are:— 4 men on Rs. 500—50—1,000—Imperial Agricultural Service. 5 Assistant Professors, Rs. 150—12-8-0—400. 1 Assistant Director Rs. 300—10—400. } * 1 Assistant Director Rs. 150—10—300 } No provision exists in the cadre for leave or training. Leave reserve is very urgently needed.	There is no such appointment held by any member of the Agricultural Service in the Punjab.	A new Deputy Director has recently been sanctioned and sanction for one more Deputy Director of Agriculture and an Agricultural Engineer has been applied for. Two more Assistant Directors of Agriculture are required.

* Both the present incumbents are in the lower grade.

APPENDIX II.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh relating to the Indian Agricultural Service.

(I) *Methods of Recruitment.*—The Lieutenant-Governor is in favour of selection of officers for this department by a committee on the lines suggested. At the same time the power to reject candidates, who have been found unsuitable after probation, should be strictly exercised, and it should be made clear to candidates that this will be done. The period of probation should be extended to at least three years, within which period a strict language test should be passed.

(II) *System of Training and Probation.*—In respect of the proposed re-organisation of the leave reserve His Honour is of opinion that the department is so small that an Imperial reserve seems indicated. In this connection he desires to express his opinion that officers of the Provincial Service are not likely in the near future to be sufficiently well qualified to take the places of officers in the Indian Agricultural Service on leave.

The question of the language is an important one. Even the research officers should keep up their power to speak in vernacular. The standard of knowledge required from officers in this department should be at least as high as that required for members of the Civil Service or Police.

(IV) *Salary.*—The present scale of salary does not run sufficiently high to enable the Government to retain the services of the officers of the required calibre. His Honour is prepared to support the recommendation that the time scale at present in force should be extended to Rs. 1,500 per mensem. This maximum would be reached in 15 years. Above this there could be a special grade on Rs. 1,750, to be filled by selection from officers of 20 years' service and above. The Lieutenant-Governor is entirely opposed to the proposal that the head of the department should be a departmental officer. The work in the department is now very specialised, and is carried on by specialists in different lines. It would be a mistake to put an expert in one line at the head of all experts. Further, the business capacity and the administrative experience which

are required from the head of the department are, in His Honour's experience, rarely to be found among the specialists who come to the department. In His Honour's opinion the present arrangement by which the post of Director is filled by a member of the Civil Service is by far the most suitable. He is an officer with general experience of the whole subject, and is in a better position than any individual expert to co-ordinate the different lines of advance.

(V) *Conditions of Leave.*—The leave rules for this Service should be the same as those for other European Services. There does not appear to be any necessity to grant study leave to this department. Scientific journals keep officers abreast of new developments, and all keen officers will always visit institutions in England during their leave.

(VI) *Conditions of Pensions.*—The conditions of the Agricultural Service are peculiar, and His Honour thinks that it would be fair to allow officers in it to retire for pension after 25 years of service; but, if this is granted, His Honour is entirely opposed to the proposal as to progressive pensions after 17 years' service.

(VII) *Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans.*—His Honour agrees with the conclusions of the memorialists, but for somewhat different reasons. There can be no doubt that at present agriculture as a pursuit and a scientific study has not yet begun to attract the best intellects among the Indian community. This is the main reason why suitable candidates cannot be obtained for the higher posts in this department. Scientific agriculture is a very recent introduction into India, and the more promising students cling to the older professions. Further, the nature of the agricultural work does not appeal to the temperament of the educated Indian, involving, as it does, a keen liking for an active out-of-door work instead of desk work and literary pursuits. On the other hand, the class of Indians whose natural tendency is towards the more active occupations has not as yet arrived at a sufficiently high standard of education. The position is therefore that the educated classes, who alone are capable of assimilating scientific instruction, are not by habits or inclination suited for the department; while those whose natural qualifications are of the proper kind are unable to take advantage of the training offered. The result is that those persons who do come to this department are such members of the educated classes who can obtain no other employment. Indians so far employed in the higher branches of this province have proved comparative failures, and their endeavour had always been to try and get out of the agricultural line and employ themselves in some side pursuits. The present attitude of educated classes towards agriculture is well illustrated by an actual remark made by one of them to the Director to the following effect: "Here is nothing but looking after crops and coolies; there is no book work." It follows, therefore, that until the attitude of the present educated class towards agriculture changes, or candidates from classes generally interested in this pursuit are available, the higher posts in the department must be filled by Europeans.

(IX) *Other points.*—The matter raised in the third sub-paragraph of VIII appears to come in most conveniently under IX. The Lieutenant-Governor is of opinion that it would not be to the advantage of the work generally that the views of Director, as submitted to the Government, should necessarily be forwarded to any member of the department.

Lack of uniformity in titles.—His Honour cannot see that there is any sufficient ground for this proposal. He would continue to gazette officers according to their official appellations.

APPENDIX III.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bengal relating to the Agricultural Department.

(1) *THE INDIAN AGRICULTURAL SERVICE.*—1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The appointments in the Indian Agricultural Service in Bengal include those of Deputy Director, Agricultural Chemist, Economic Botanist and Fibre Expert.

Appointments to the Indian Agricultural Service are made by the Secretary of State for India as occasion may require. In some cases candidates are appointed direct to these posts, but in most cases they are appointed as supernumeraries, undergo a further course of training in India in Indian agriculture and are appointed to posts as vacancies occur. Candidates must, as a rule, be not less than 23 nor more than 30 years of age. Exceptions are made as regards the maximum only in the case of appointments requiring special qualifications. Candidates must furnish evidence of having received a good general education and of possessing a thorough knowledge of the science of agriculture or of the particular science required for the appointment applied for. Preference is given to British-born subjects and to distinguished graduates of Universities in the British Empire. Importance is also attached to bodily activity and ability to ride, and selected candidates have to undergo an examination by the Medical Board of the India Office as to their physical fitness for service in India. Newly-appointed officers are required, before leaving England, to enter into an agreement with the Secretary of State embodying the conditions of their appointment.

An officer appointed to the Agricultural Service, whether as a supernumerary or otherwise, and whatever his initial salary may be, is on probation in India for three years. He is required to pass an examination in a vernacular language within two years of his arrival in India or of his first appointment to the Service, whichever is later. His appointment may be cancelled for failure to pass this examination, or at any time for unfitness or misconduct. At the end of his three years' term of probation the Government of India decide whether to retain or dispense with his services.

The present regulations are satisfactory.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—In 1890 and 1900 the Indian Agricultural Service as such was not in existence.

The present rates of pay are ordinarily as follows:—

	Rs.
For the 1st year	400 per mensem.
,, 2nd ,, ...	430 ,,
,, 3rd ,, ...	460 ,,
,, 4th and subsequent years	500, rising by annual increments of Rs. 50 a month to Rs. 1,000 a month.

Candidates who are required to undergo a further course of training in India are appointed on the above scale of salary commencing on a pay of Rs. 400. Where, for special reasons, a candidate is recruited for direct appointment to one of the regular posts, his initial pay is determined with reference to the special qualifications and the length of European experience required for the appointment for which he is specially selected, but his subsequent increments of salary are regulated by the foregoing scale.

No exchange compensation is given, and free

quarters are not usually provided, but officers receive either free quarters or a house-rent allowance during the period for which they draw the supernumerary rate of pay, *i.e.*, until their pay rises above Rs. 460 a month.

The existing rates of pay are generally regarded as unsatisfactory, in that an officer rises to the maximum open to the Service generally after 12 or 13 years' service, unless he is fortunate enough to be selected for some special appointment under the Government of India. An officer serving under local Governments cannot, under the present rules, rise above Rs. 1,000 a month, unless he is the Principal of an Agricultural College, in which case he is given a local allowance of Rs. 100 in addition to his time-scale pay. As the Service is of recent creation, comparatively few officers have yet reached their maximum on the time-scale, but it cannot be expected that officers under local Governments will serve contentedly on the same rate of pay for the last 15 or 20 years of their service, and it seems probable that the maximum will have to be raised. The Government of Bengal are not, however, in a position to suggest a detailed scheme.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—There are no special grades. Officers of the Indian Agricultural Service draw time-scale pay as specified above. The present pay of the existing members of the Service in Bengal is as follows:—

	Rs.
(*i*) Deputy Director	900
(*ii*) The Fibre Expert	850
(*iii*) The Agricultural Chemist	700
(*iv*) The Economic Botanist	550

There is no provision in the Provincial cadre for leave and training. The leave vacancies in the Indian Agricultural Services of the various Provinces are ordinarily filled by the supernumerary officers on the Imperial Department of Agriculture.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the various Services?*—No appointment outside the authorised cadre is held temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the Indian Agricultural Service.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—An application has recently been submitted to the Government of India for the appointment of a second Deputy Director of Agriculture. No other additions are required to the Bengal cadre at present, but the Imperial leave reserve is inadequate. Great inconvenience and a considerable set back to the work in this Province have recently been caused by the inability of the Government of India to supply an officer to act for the Fibre Expert while on leave, and similar difficulties would probably occur in the event of any other of the small staff of Bengal experts requiring leave. The remedy is either to increase the number of officers under the Government of India or to add to the cadre of the Provincial Service, so as to provide assistants for the Imperial officers serving under the Local Government. The Government of Bengal have the matter under consideration.

(II) *THE PROVINCIAL AGRICULTURAL SERVICE.*—1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—No definite rules for recruitment for the Provincial Agricultural Service have been framed as yet. Most of the posts in the Provincial Service in Bengal have been given to young men who have been trained in America. Promotion to the Provincial Service is also made from deserving officers of the Subordinate Agricultural Service. There are also no fixed rules for training and probation. The selected candidates usually remain on probation for a period of one year.

The staff is at present small and no formal regulations are necessary at this stage.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay are satisfactory.*—In 1890 and 1900 the Provincial Agricultural Service was not constituted.

The rate of pay at the present time in Bengal is Rs. 200—10—400. The maximum will probably have to be raised as soon as a regular service is formed.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—There is only one grade, viz., Rs. 200—10—400. Two officers are at present employed and three temporary officers have recently been appointed on probation. There is no provision in the cadre for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the various Services?*—No appointment outside the authorised cadre is held temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the Provincial Agricultural Service.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—It is proposed to raise the number of officers in the Provincial Agricultural Service to six, and this number will be increased in the near future with the progress of work in the various directions. For several reasons, the most important of which are connected with the territorial re-arrangements effected in 1905 and 1912, the development of the Agricultural Department in Bengal has been seriously hampered. It is only about three years since the laboratories of the experts on the Dacca farm were built and equipped, but they have now obtained results which can be demonstrated to the people at large, and they are still engaged in experiments and research work which will require a very wide field for test and demonstration before they can bear any valuable fruit. The time will shortly come, therefore, when a considerable expansion of the Provincial Service will be required in Bengal, and the Government of Bengal are of opinion that ultimately it will be necessary to constitute a regular service with prospects little, if at all, inferior to those of the Provincial Civil Service.

APPENDIX IV.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bihar and Orissa relating to the Department of Agriculture in Bihar and Orissa.

(A) *IMPERIAL SERVICE.* — 1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The conditions of recruitment have been described in the Memorandum prepared by the Government of India and the Local Government have no recommendations to make.

Government consider it desirable that before a newly recruited officer is entrusted with the duties of any particular appointment he should undergo at least one year's training in Indian conditions. This training might with advantage be obtained at Pusa. The period of training would count as probationary service.

Government are disposed to think that the present period of probation is unnecessarily long and might be reduced from three years to two years. The present rates of probationary pay are Rs. 400—430—460. These might be altered to Rs. 400—450, and the concession of free residence during the probationary period, which is not enjoyed by the members of other Services, might well be withdrawn, as a grievance is made of the fact that confirmation in the Service is attended with reduction in net pay.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The rates of pay and allowances now drawn are given in the statement attached to the Director of Agriculture's note which forms an appendix to this Memorandum.

The present maximum of Rs. 1,000 was adopted tentatively. Its continuance up to date has militated against the contentment of officers, has in some cases led to their resignation, and has adversely affected recruitment. The Local Government are disposed to recommend that the pay of Agricultural Officers should be fixed on the same basis as that drawn by or proposed to be granted to Indian Educational Officers.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—The Service, as already explained, is not a graded Service, and there is no provision for leave and training.

Government are disposed to think that provision for leave and training should be made within the Province, but, pending the settlement of the question by the Government of India, have made no recommendations to this effect in the scheme which is now under submission for the reorganisation of the Department (*vide* paragraph 5 below).

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the various Services?*—There are no appointments in this Province outside the authorised cadre.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The Local Government are about to submit a scheme of reorganisation which provides for the addition of two Deputy Directors of Agriculture to the Imperial branch. A copy of this scheme will be forwarded for the information of the Commissioners as soon as it is ready.

It is also proposed to recruit a European officer on special contract to be Superintendent of a combined sugar-cane station and cattle-breeding farm in North Bihar. This appointment will be outside the regular cadre of the Service.

(B) *PROVINCIAL SERVICE.*—1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The nature of the Provincial Agricultural Service has been clearly explained in the Memorandum prepared by the Government of India, and the appointments which are held in this Province are shown in the statement attached to the Director's note. Of the five officers in the higher grade of Rs. 250—10—400, four were trained at the Cornell University at the cost of the Government of Bengal, the fifth was educated at Cambridge at his own expense and had a subsequent training at Pusa.

The four officers in the inferior grade were educated in India.

The recruitment of the Provincial branch was made with a view to the special requirements of individual posts and the Local Government have no recommendations to make at present. With the development of the Imperial Institute at Pusa, it should be possible to provide for future appointments in the Provincial Service from students educated at Pusa.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—For the previous history and present rates of pay and allowances of the Provincial Service reference may be made to the Director's note.

The local Government are inclined to think that a clearer distinction should be drawn between the Subordinate Agricultural Service and the Provincial Agricultural Service, that the rates of pay in the latter should be assimilated to those obtaining in the Provincial Executive Service, and that provision should be made for a limited amount of promotion from the Subordinate Agricultural Service to the Provincial Agricultural Service and from the latter to the Imperial Agricultural Service. There should be a time scale of Rs. 250—25—500 in the Provincial Agricultural Service and thereafter promotion should be by special selection to grades of Rs. 600, Rs. 700 and Rs. 800.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—The number of posts in the Provincial Agricultural Service has been shown in the statement attached to the Director's note. No provision exists for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the various Services?*—There are no appointments outside the authorised grade.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—In the scheme for the reorganisation of the Agricultural staff to which reference has been made in paragraph 5 of the memorandum on the Imperial branch, provision has been made for the appointment of an Assistant Director who will be an addition to the cadre of the Provincial Service.

APPENDIX V.

Memorandum prepared by the Assam Administration relating to the Agricultural Department, Assam.

(I) *INDIAN AGRICULTURAL SERVICE.*—1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—At present there is only one officer of the Indian Agricultural Service, represented by the Deputy Director of Agriculture. An Agricultural Chemist has recently been sanctioned and an officer is expected to join in December next.

The regulations regarding recruitment, training and probation are as prescribed by the Secretary of State (*vide* Government of India's Circular No. 9—37-2, dated the 15th February, 1913). As regards recruitment a reference is invited to Chief Commissioner's Note,* which contains his views on the subject.

The Chief Commissioner has no remarks to offer with reference to training and probation.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The Indian Agricultural Service was first constituted in 1905. The salary attached to the service is Rs. 400—30—460 for the first three years, to be followed by Rs. 500—50—1,000 per mensem. No allowance except the usual travelling allowance is attached to Provincial appointments (*i.e.*, appointments in a Province as opposed to the Imperial Department at Pusa).

The present rate of pay is not in the Chief Commissioner's opinion satisfactory. A reference to the memorandum on the Agricultural Department, Assam, submitted to the Public Services Commis-

* *Vide* Appendix VI.

sion, will show that the maximum is reached after 13 years' service, and therefore there is no prospect of promotion except to the post of Director of Agriculture, from which members of the Indian Agricultural Service are not debarred. In the opinion of the Chief Commissioner a continuation of the increments up to a maximum of Rs. 1,500, which should be reached after 23 years' service, should be allowed.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—Only one post of Deputy Director of Agriculture and one post of Agricultural Chemist are sanctioned for this Province. No provision is made for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services?*—None.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—A second Deputy Director of Agriculture may be required with the development of the Department, when the full number of the Provincial and subordinate staffs will be recruited.

(II) *PROVINCIAL AGRICULTURAL SERVICE.*—1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The Provincial Agricultural Service comprises the following appointments:—

(*a*) Agricultural Supervisor (one).

(*b*) District Agricultural Officers (two) (experimental).

(*c*) Farm Superintendents (three).

(*d*) Entomological Assistant (one) (under training).

In selecting candidates for the Provincial Service weight is given to the possession of a diploma of a recognised College of Agriculture and to practical experience. Before appointment, candidates are subjected to a post-graduate training which is ordinarily for two years. The period of probation is three years in the case of Agricultural Supervisor and two years in the case of other officers.

The present regulations are satisfactory.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The Service has been newly constituted in Assam. The rates of pay are as follows:—

(*a*) Agricultural Supervisor.—During the period of probation of three years, Rs. 150, Rs. 165 and Rs. 180 per mensem, and on confirmation Rs. 200—10—400.

(*b*) District Agricultural Officers and Farm Superintendents.—During the period of two years' probation, Rs. 75 and Rs. 80, and on confirmation, Rs. 100—10—200.

(*c*) Entomological Assistant.—Not yet fixed, but will be similar to that of District Agricultural Officers.

In the opinion of the Chief Commissioner the present rates of pay are satisfactory. These officers get the usual travelling allowance.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—1, Agricultural Supervisor; 2, District Agricultural Officers, and 3, Farm Superintendents.

No provision is made for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services?*—None.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—Should the scheme of the District Agricultural Officers, which has been sanctioned experimentally for two years by the Government of India, be successful, there will be one officer for each district, and consequently another Agricultural Supervisor may be required.

APPENDIX VI.

Note, dated 9th April, 1913, *by the Hon. Sir Archdale Earle, Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Agricultural Department.*

1. As the memorandum drawn up by the Government of India in regard to this Department shows, the Department is still in a state of formation, and it appears to be impossible at present to lay down hard-and-fast principles for the selection of candidates. All that I would venture to suggest in regard to this Department is that the principles which I have advocated in connection with other Services should be borne in mind. The chief of these are (1) that Indians required for superior posts should be recruited by the Secretary of State on the same terms as Europeans, (2) that the door of preferment to superior posts should be kept open for selected locally recruited officers, and (3) that though the latter class of officers should be recruited on a lower rate of pay, all unnecessary distinctions between Officers recruited by the Secretary of State and locally recruited Officers should be avoided.

2. I have only to add that in recruiting Indians direct to the superior Service, the Province from which a candidate hails and for which he is required must be borne in mind as far as possible, as it is important for many reasons, administrative, personal and political, that officers should usually belong to the Province to which they are posted.

APPENDIX VII.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Agricultural Department, Burma.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The present expert staff was appointed by the Secretary of State. The two Deputy Directors of Agriculture, as the expert Agriculturists are now called, are graduates in Science at a British University and are Europeans, while the Agricultural Chemist is an English graduate and also a European. The Subordinate Scientific Staff is recruited from Science graduates of Indian Colleges; while the staff for the farms is drawn from the Settlement and Land Records Departments. The intention, however, is that with the establishment of a College the 1st grade posts shall be filled only by promotion from the 2nd grade, that admission to the 2nd shall be confined to those who have passed the Entrance examination of the Calcutta University or an accepted equivalent for it, and have taken the licentiates' or the three years' course of Agriculture at the College; and that, although admissions to the 3rd grade posts, such as that of Sub-Overseer, might be made from the Settlement and Land Records Departments, without these educational qualifications, their absence must debar promotion to the 2nd grade. A scheme of three years' probation, after which candidates will be eligible for promotion according to ability to the higher

appointments in the Department has also been formulated. The following rules of recruitment have been adopted as a temporary measure. Agricultural Assistants are ordinarily to be recruited from the rank of Settlement Holding Markers and Revenue Surveyors who have passed the 7th Standard Vernacular or Anglo-Vernacular examination and the examination for certificates for the appointment of Subordinate Revenue and Land Records Officers in Burma, in Arithmetic, Surveying and Revenue Law. During the period of training in practical field work which may extend to two years they are ranked as probationers and receive an allowance of Rs. 30 per mensem. The educational qualification for Scientific Assistants in the higher grade is the Matriculation or the High School Final examination. For the lower grade of Scientific Assistants the minimum qualification is the 7th Standard Anglo-Vernacular. Probationers in the higher grade receive an allowance of Rs. 40 and probationers in the lower grade Rs. 30 per mensem.

The present Regulations for recruitment training and probation are generally satisfactory. It is, however, desirable that Officers intended for administrative posts should have some training in Agricultural Economics and Account-keeping. The popularisation of improved methods of agriculture among the cultivating classes of the Province depends very largely on their applicability to the financial conditions actually existing, and unless this fact is present to the mind of the agricultural expert his research work and experiments are apt to prove of little practical value. The administration of large farms on a sound and economical basis also requires considerable acquaintance with the principles of accounting. Some acquaintance with Tropical Agriculture is desirable, but as conditions differ from Province to Province this knowledge can best be acquired after arrival of the Expert in the Province to which he is posted. A thorough acquaintance with the vernacular of the Province is a *sine quâ non* for success in this Department, and it should be made an express condition of employment that no officer shall in the future be confirmed in his appointment in the Department until he has passed in the Vernacular by the Higher Standard.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay are satisfactory.*—The Agricultural Department only came into separate existence in 1906. The rates of pay and allowances then sanctioned are still in force. The Directorship, which is for the present held by a member of the covenanted Civil Service, drawing his regular grade pay, has a special allowance of Rs. 150 a month attached to it. The two Deputy Directors and the Agricultural Chemist draw Rs. 500 rising to Rs. 1,000, and are in receipt of a Burma allowance of Rs. 100. The Agricultural Botanist (when appointed) will draw Rs. 400 rising to Rs. 1,000 per mensem, plus Burma allowance of Rs. 100.

The Subordinate Scientific staff are paid as under:—

	Rs.
The three Assistants (*i.e.*, Botanist, Entomologist and Chemist) ...	150—200
The two Junior Assistants in Chemistry	75—150
The Artist's Assistant	50—75

The Farm Staff receive:—

	Rs.
Superintendent	150—250
Overseers	75—100
Sub-Overseers	50—75

Leave and pension are regulated by the ordinary rules in the Civil Service Regulations.

The unsatisfactory feature of the present scale of pay, Rs. 500—50—1,000, of the Superior Scientific Staff is that after the Experts reach the maximum salary (*i.e.*, Rs. 1,000) at the beginning of the eleventh year of their service they have no further prospects. An increase of Rs. 100 per annum after three years on Rs. 1,000 and a second increase of the same amount after 20 years' service would be desirable additions.

The scale of salaries of the Subordinate Scientific Staff is also unsatisfactory in that the Subordinate Civil Service offers better and more attractive terms.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—Early in 1906 the Secretary of State sanctioned the creation of a separate appointment of Director of Agriculture to be held by a member of the Indian Civil Service and the engagement of an expert staff consisting of an all-round Agriculturist to be Principal of the College, an Agricultural Chemist and an Agricultural Botanist, and at the end of the year sanction was also accorded to the entertainment of a second expert Agriculturist as Superintendent of Experimental Farms. The post of Agricultural Botanist, however, has never yet been filled.

In 1907 the following subordinate staff was sanctioned:—

3 Assistants to the Agricultural Chemist (in two grades).
3 Assistants to the Agricultural Botanist (in two grades).
6 Field-men (in two grades).
2 Farm Superintendents.
4 Overseers.
8 Sub-overseers.

But in view of the financial stringency and the decision that it would be premature to establish an Agricultural College as yet the subordinate staff actually entertained was as follows:—

A.—*Subordinate Scientific Staff.*

1 Assistant to the Agricultural Chemist.
2 Junior Assistants to the Agricultural Chemist.
1 Assistant to the Economic Botanist.
1 Artist's Assistant.
1 Assistant to the Agricultural Entomologist.

B.—*Farm Staff.*

1 Superintendent of Farms.
2 Overseers.
6 Sub-Overseers.

Up to the present only two experimental farms have been started—one at Mandalay and one at Hmwabi.

There is no provision in the Subordinate Scientific Staff for leave and trainng.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services?*—None.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The addition of a Botanist and a Mycologist will ultimately be required. Proposals for an increase in the Subordinate Scientific Staff are now under consideration.

APPENDIX VIII.

(See also paragraph 68205—Dr. Barber's evidence.)

Note by Dr. Barber on the need for expansion in the District Work of the Agricultural Department.

The dominant note in all the discussions of the recent meeting of the Board of Agriculture at Coimbatore was that the most pressing need of the Department was the expansion of the district work may be brought into contact with the great advantage of a specially strong staff of scientific specialists but, in order that the results of their work may be brought into contact with the great body of the agricultural population, a large increase in the number of district officers will be necessary.

(2) The Department is in a very different posi-

tion from what it occupied eight years ago. At that time, after many years of formless effort, the Agricultural Department was given definite shape ; various experts were sanctioned, a large College built, and a whole-time Director appointed. During the period which has elapsed since this reformation, two most important changes have taken place.

(*a*) The attitude of Government, from one of spasmodic interest or easy tolerance, has become one of definite and earnest encouragement. In support of this statement I would quote a few words from a recent speech by Sir Harold Stuart, the Finance member of the Governor's Council :— " His Excellency the Governor has commissioned me to say that he earnestly desires to see the work of the Department developed. To that message of encouragement I will add that the Government are ready to increase the Budget grants of the department, whenever reasonable cause for that course is shown to us. Already this year we have made special grants to the Department of Rs. 67,000, of which the College has obtained a substantial share. I repeat that we are quite ready, not only to give special grants of a non-recurring nature, but to make a substantial increase to the recurring grants."

(*b*) Public opinion has undergone a still more marked change. In place of the stock assertion that " we could teach the ryot nothing," the various activities of the Agricultural Department are eagerly watched and the help and advice of the experts frequently sought and eagerly followed. A weeping ryot will now allow the officers of the Department to cut down his best cocoanut trees to prevent the spread of disease.

(3) Perhaps the simplest way in which to analyse the causes of this change of attitude will be to mention some half dozen directions in which work has been done together with the results thus far achieved, although this list is by no means exhaustive.

(*a*) *Sugarcane.*—As the result of several years' work at the Samalkota farm, the growth of sugarcane in the Madras Presidency, threatened in many places with extinction from disease, has taken on a new lease of life. New and better canes have been introduced capable of resisting the prevailing disease, and these canes are already grown on from 7,000 to 10,000 acres ; the area under them is still increasing and they have spread to every part of India.

(*b*) *Cotton.*—The detailed work on two farms in cotton tracts has resulted in the general improvement of the local staple which has received generous recognition by the trade. During the last three years enough seed of improved local cottons has been sold to sow 60,000 acres in these tracts, while in several villages the ryots have taken this work out of the hands of the Department and are saving their own seed of the farm-improved kinds.

(*c*) *The drill and harrow* have been introduced, after much difficulty, into a region where they were entirely unknown, and the ryots are now using these implements, much to their advantage, on 7,000 acres.

(*d*) *Sowing green-manuring crops* in rotation with paddy, resulting in a profit of from Rs. 10 to Rs. 15 per acre, has been introduced in other tracts, and this is now regularly done on some thousands of acres, the Department supplying the seed wherever required.

(*e*) *Paddy.*—A new method of transplanting paddy has been evolved whereby Rs. 3 per acre is saved, and this improvement is already adopted on 100,000 acres.

(*f*) As the result of the Mycologist's work, the method designed by Dr. Coleman of fighting " mahali " disease in areca palms has come into extensive use in South Malabar. Last year 13,520 trees were sprayed by the officers of the section, and 1,300 by the villagers, and the latter are now wishful to purchase the machines themselves.

Concurrent with these successes, it may be noted that the publication branch of the Department has grown enormously. Besides the ordinary bulletins and farm reports, an Agricultural Calendar was issued in 1908, in English and four vernaculars. This met with an instantaneous success, and the distribution during the last three years has been 49,996, 70,000 and 71,000, respectively. In 1909 a series of leaflets on special subjects was started and these have proved surprisingly popular. Fifty-six subjects have been dealt with, and the distributions have been as follows :—English, 108,930 ; Tamil, 217,340 ; Telugu 148,630 ; Malayalam, 17,380 ; Canarese, 16,170 making a grand total of over half a million.

(4) From previous experience we have learnt only too well that the mere distribution of pamphlets has little effect on agricultural practice and, until the results mentioned above had been obtained, there was practically no demand for the publications of the Department. Frequent requests are now the order of the day, and it is fair to assume that this change from apathy to interest on the part of the people is largely due *to the successes obtained.*

But the fact should here be emphasised that every one of these achievements has been the result of patient work in individual localities, often at the outset attended by disheartening lack of interest. Each has needed the focussing of the whole local strength of the Department upon a small area, in order to obtain effective control of the operations, a mastery of the local conditions, and the sympathy and friendship of the cultivators. It seems fair to conclude that, with an increased staff, the study of other problems, at present tentatively attacked, will yield equally gratifying results.

(5) During the past eight years the district work in the Madras Agricultural Department has been under the charge of two European Deputy Directors, with a small staff of Indian subordinates. The officer in charge of the Southern Division has to study the crops over 24,335 square miles of cultivated land, while the one in the Northern Division has 29,017 square miles of crops under his control. The total cropped area in Egypt is under 13,000 square miles. Each officer has hundreds of miles to travel from one of his farms to another, and the country between is left largely untouched, excepting for occasional tours of observation. The dissipation of energy in these frequent long journeys is considerable, and it is not too much to say that the successes thus far achieved in district work have been obtained rather in spite of than because of the facilities offered for useful work.

(6) These being the facts of the case, I would suggest that the time has now come to look the matter squarely in the face. The figures and instances given above would seem amply to justify the sums of money spent in the development of the Department, and the question arises whether it would not be an exceedingly profitable investment on the part of Government to place all parts of the Presidency within the reach of agricultural advice and assistance. The infant Department has been on its trial, and has, I contend, emerged from this trial with flying colours.

While adverse to any sudden change or expansion, I would strongly press upon the Members of the Commission my view that our aim should in future definitely be to provide each district with its local agricultural officer, just as, say, in the Forest Department. The conditions in this Presidency are of such extraordinary variety, due primarily to the configuration of the country and racial differences, that it is practically impossible for one or two officers to obtain a grasp of the agricultural needs of each portion. As a first step in the direction of an agricultural officer for each district, I would suggest the early division of the Presidency into, say, nine circles, as follows :—The dry area of the Northern Circars ; the deltas of the Godavari and Kistna rivers ; two circles in Guntur and Nellore with the Ceded tracts ; the two Arcots and Chingleput ; Salem, Coimbatore, and the dry portion of Trichi-

nopoly; the Delta of the Cauvery; Madura and Tinnevelly; Malabar and South Cahara. These form natural divisions.

The revenue at stake appears to me to justify this large increase in the cadre of the Agricultural Department. To continue the comparison with the Forest Department, the land revenue, pure and simple, in the Presidency amounts to 670 lakhs of rupees, and the total produce of the Forests is some 42 lakhs. While not pressing the analogy too closely, it may be noted that the cost of the Agricultural Department in 1911-12 (the latest printed accounts) was 3½ lakhs, while that of the Forest Department was 34 lakhs.

(7) But I would not lose sight of the idea of the district being the ultimate unit of the Agricultural Department for several cogent reasons.

(*a*) The carefully elaborated local machinery of the district would be at the disposal of the Department, whose officers would be able to count on the assistance and advice of the other services to a much greater degree than at present. The local agricultural officers would be in close touch with the Collector and his assistants, the Tahsildars, and all the Revenue Officials, down to the Revenue Inspectors. In such conditions, the chances of successful experimental farms and demonstration plots, agricultural associations and co-operative societies would be immensely increased, in that there would be, in the district, a nucleus of experts to guide their progress with an intimate knowledge of the resources and needs of the people.

(*b*) I would also venture to suggest that the Collector of the district would receive material assistance in his work by having what would practically be a local agricultural department. There have been complaints that the Collector, owing to pressure of work, is in less intimate touch with his people than formerly, and I believe that the active and intelligent interest which he would be able to take in agricultural matters would be a very efficient means of checking this tendency

(8) Lastly, the increase in district work would react beneficially on all branches of the Service. There would inevitably be a large increase in the number of Indian subordinates. This I regard as an extremely desirable result. With a scale of pay similar to, say, that in the Forest Department, we should be able to attract a better class than we have succeeded in getting hitherto. The Department suffers at present in that it is less able to offer a certain career to clever and hard-working assistants than other similar departments, and the way is thus barred for the inclusion of Indians in the higher posts of this section of the Agricultural Department. The safest and surest way in which this inclusion can be effected is by the formation of a strong subordinate and Provincial Service in the country. I regard it as impossible to test the suitability of an Indian candidate until he has had experience in actual district work. The reaction would also be felt by the Central College where there would be no difficulty in recruiting a better class of students than can be done at present.

APPENDIX IX.

(See also paragraph 68205—Dr. Barber's evidence.)

Note by Dr. Barber on the inclusion of Indians in the higher posts of the Agricultural Department, especially in District Work.

1. The opening of the higher posts in the Agricultural Department to Indians is a matter by no means so simple as it appears. I consider it eminently desirable to keep it in view, but there are difficulties, and I think that it is best to look these squarely in the face and to be perfectly open on the subject. To ignore them will endanger the success of the Department and, incidentally, the ultimate chances of the Indians themselves.

It is, in the first place, advisable to separate clearly the district work from research and teaching, as the qualifications required for these three branches are entirely different, and the chances of the employment of Indians also differ widely. At present the problems regarding teaching and research are confined to much simpler issues, but it is in the district work that expansion in the near future must take place, and it is, *pari passu*, all the more necessary that Indians should share in this expansion.

We have, perhaps, in the Madras Agricultural Department, a larger staff of Indians than in any other province in India. They are employed regularly in all branches of the Service, and I believe them equal, if not superior, in many respects to any in India. I contend that we have some criteria for forming general conclusions.

2. It cannot be too strongly insisted on that Agriculture is not a science—rather an art, trade or business, and a very difficult and important one. The Department differs in this from most Services. We have to influence people, not to rule them; we have not the law behind us in cases of difficulty. General business capacity and resourcefulness are of more importance than mere mental ability.

Judging broadly, there is no question that, at the present moment, Europeans are better fitted than Indians for the work, by character and training and, so to speak, the "genius of the nation." But, as will be seen later on, I do not consider that we have been able to attract the best or most suitable class of Indians.

I consider that the Department, in its expanded form, will largely stand or fall by the possibility of including a large number of Indians in the higher posts, and my criticisms and suggestions must be read with the knowledge that there is this opinion behind them.

The qualities required for successful district work appear to me to be chiefly the following: Administrative ability, soundness of judgment and the sense of proportion, energy and initiative, willingness to accept responsibility, power of enforcing respect and obedience, a sense of the dignity of labour and a marked liking for physical exercise and an out-of-door life, and to these may be added a sound general education.

It cannot be denied that the natives of this country are deficient in some of these characteristics. It is a country of service by substitutes. Too much stress should not be laid upon connection with the soil and ownership of land. In Europe this means a good deal, but here, owing to the half-share system, it is an unusual thing and a sign of considerable enlightenment for a land-owner to have any practical knowledge of agriculture. Physical exercise, and particularly manual labour, are unpopular. This I trace to the high value placed upon mental capacity as contrasted with handicraft. A lack of initiative, independence of judgment and willingness to accept responsibility, I regard as due to the general standard and style of education in the country, but more especially to centuries of oral instruction, learning by rote and inculcated reverence for authority. All these latter are especially antagonistic to the spirit of independent enquiry and investigation.

3. The inclusion of Indians in the higher posts of the Agricultural Department therefore appears to me to be a problem of considerable complexity, and deserves to be approached with caution. I do not regard it as impossible of solution, but I would point out that wrong appointments, in the present

state of agricultural development, would not only undo the results thus far achieved with great labour, but, if these appointments should happen to be held by Indians, react most unfavourably upon their future chances. There is, I find, a strong feeling among the European officers of the Department on this subject, but I have convinced myself that this feeling is almost entirely due to the fear lest incompetent officers may be forced into the Department for political reasons. I have met with practically no objection to the inclusion of Indians among the Deputy Directors, provided that they are equal to the work.

I claim that this small and struggling Department is an unsuitable ground on which to try experiments of this nature, and that it is at present impossible to ear-mark any percentage of the higher appointments for the natives of the country. Such experiments should be tried in large and stable Departments, where there are a great number of settled appointments available. If the Agricultural Department is selected, the net result will be to emphasise inefficiency, the weaker men will be quickly detected and, for self-preservation, will be placed in such circumscribed conditions that the amount of harm they can do will be minimised.

Selection should be the rule as heretofore, and selection *out here*. Examinations at home do nothing but test the mental ability of the candidates, and to appoint direct as the result of these examinations is to ignore all the qualifications required for successful district work. Connection with the land, sometimes urged as a justification, is, as shown above, often illusory.

In these conclusions I am supported by the findings of the Committee appointed by the Secretary of State to enquire into the system of State Technical Scholarships in India. I would especially draw the attention of the Commission to the results recorded in mining and textiles, which show that previous practical acquaintance with industries in this country is indispensable for capacity to profit by European technical training. The Committee lay special stress upon the selection of candidates being made by the local authorities out here. Direct selection at home for the higher posts of the Agricultural Service is practically barred by the findings of the Committee on Technical Scholarships.

There are other ways in which such a selection will prove unsatisfactory. It is, for instance, a distinct hardship to the carefully trained and promising Indians in the Department already, and likely to cause dissatisfaction among the members of the subordinate and Provincial Services. Further, Indians appointed direct from home, unless first carefully selected and trained by the local authorities, are bound to suffer in comparison with the European officers. This will react adversely on the class of European coming out. Is this desirable at the present juncture?

4. Thus far criticism, which is all intended to clear the way for what I consider the only means by which the aspirations of Indians can be satisfied in the Agricultural Department. While keenly interested in the advancement of Indians, I am still more anxious that the Department should be a success. The first move in the future, as I have drawn attention elsewhere, should be a great expansion in the district work; this will necessitate a considerable employment of Indians as Assistant Directors and Managers. But we shall fail, as we have always failed hitherto, in attracting the right class of men, unless we can offer them the same prospects, in initial pay and promotion, as are offered in the comparable sections of the Forest, Public Works, and Education Departments. Candidates for the Agricultural Department are at present penalised in respect of these kindred services and, until this matter is set right, we shall have to content ourselves with the inferior men. I would pray for a revision of the scale of pay and rate of promotion of the manager class in the Agricultural Service; I would also increase the number of Assistant Directors, and I would place these in independent charges, wherever possible, for training. In both cases I would make free use of acting appointments, until permanent ones could be safely granted. I think that these concessions would meet the present need, but I would carefully guard against any premature action, as it will take some time for these improvements to have their effect. Lastly, I would devote considerable attention to the training work in the Central College at Coimbatore. While this College has, I claim, fully justified its existence, the training is not at present sufficient for the higher posts. It is not at all derogatory to Indian Agricultural Colleges to say that, in the matter of personnel, they are far behind those at home.

APPENDIX X.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Agricultural Department.

At the time of the last Public Services Commission the Department of Agriculture in this Presidency had no separate existence as at present. The history of agricultural development in this Presidency dates back to 1863, when Sir William Denison, the then Governor of Madras, drew the attention of Government to the need for improvement in the agricultural practices of the country and indicated the action to be taken in the matter.

While attempts were being made to give effect to his suggestions, the establishment of a farm at Saidapet was proposed by the Collector of Madras. The Government accepted the proposal, and in course of time an agricultural expert was appointed in 1868 as Superintendent of the Farm. In 1874 the appointment of two European Assistants who were called Assistant Superintendents of Farms was sanctioned to help the agricultural expert. In 1876 an agricultural school, which in 1878 became a college, was also opened at Saidapet for imparting agricultural instruction and was placed under the Superintendent of Farms, who was, in his capacity as Principal of the institution, under the control of the Director of Public Instruction.

Up to 1881 there was no Agricultural Department proper; the work of the Department was carried out by the Board of Revenue with the assistance and advice of the Superintendent of the Government Farm and his assistants at Saidapet. In their Circular No. 6—340—50 G., dated 8th December, 1881, the Government of India directed with reference to the recommendations of the Famine Commission of 1880 that a separate department of Agriculture should be constituted in each Province. The Agricultural Department was thus organised in 1882. As the duties proposed by the Government of India to be entrusted to the new Department were being already performed to some extent by the Board of Revenue in Madras, the Board reported that no new agency was required to carry out the duties of the Department and was of opinion that the new Department should not be a separate one but should be worked by itself. Though the Government generally concurred in the views of the Board of Revenue they considered that a separate Director should be in charge of the Department and accordingly the appointment of Director of Revenue Settlement which had been abolished in 1879 was revived under the title of Director of Revenue Settlement and Agriculture. The Director was assisted by the Superintendent of Farms who became also Agricultural Reporter to Government.

APPENDIX X (*continued*).

The Director in submitting detailed proposals for the working of the Department suggested that the new Department should be merged in the Board of Revenue. But the Government negatived this proposal. The outcome of the discussions that then took place was, however, that the Director became also a member of the Board of Revenue. This arrangement continued till 1885. On the reorganisation of the Board in 1887 the Agricultural Department was constituted a branch of the Board of Revenue and placed under one of its members and the Department was styled "the Department of Land Records and Agriculture."

As already mentioned, when the Department was organised in 1882, there was an Agricultural Expert who was both Superintendent of Farms and Principal of the Agricultural College controlled in his latter capacity by the Director of Public Instruction. This dual control was considered unsatisfactory as it led to an entire severance of the farm at Saidapet from the Agricultural College, separate officers being appointed in April, 1884, for—

(*1*) The Principalship of the College; and

(*2*) The duties of Agricultural Reporter and Superintendent of Government Farms.

In 1885, it was decided to abandon the Agricultural farm at Saidapet. The closure of the farm resulted in the abolition of the post of Agricultural Reporter and the officer in charge of the work was appointed Assistant Director of Agriculture. Thus at the time of the last Public Services' Commission (1886-87) the strength of the Agricultural Department was as follows:—

(*1*) Director of Agriculture (one of the Commissioners of the Board).

(*2*) An Assistant Director.

(*3*) A staff of seven Agricultural Inspectors.

In 1888 an addition was made to the staff by the appointment of an Indian to be a Sub-Assistant Director of Agriculture. In 1891, the Government of India sanctioned provisionally for a period of five years, the appointment of an Assistant Director of Land Records, to be in immediate charge of the Land Records Branch of the Agricultural Department. Subsequently, however, both the Assistant Directors were styled Deputy Directors of the Department of Land Records and Agriculture, the words "Land Records Branch," "Agricultural Branch," being added to the designation of the officers respectively in charge of each branch.

In 1894, the post of Deputy Director (Land Records branch) became vacant and the remaining Deputy Director was appointed to be in charge of both the branches of the Department.

The constitution and duties of the Provincial Department of Agriculture came under the review of the Government of India in 1897 in connection with the Agricultural Conferences of 1893 and 1895-96. The Government of India insisted on the employment of a strong and efficient staff of experts in all Provinces. The Board of Revenue was then called upon to report on the strength of the staff required for the Agricultural Branch of the Department of Land Records and Agriculture. It stated that, in addition to the staff of one Deputy Director and one Sub-Assistant Director, another European expert as Assistant Director and a second Indian Sub-Assistant Director should be appointed. The Government agreed with the Board as to the need for a second European expert, but negatived the proposal to appoint a second Sub-Assistant Director. The Government of India were addressed accordingly.

Meanwhile the post of Government Botanist, which had been combined with that of the Director of Cinchona Plantations, was made separate, and a European officer was appointed to that post in 1899. This officer was placed under the immediate control and orders of the Board of Revenue, and was engaged primarily for a period of five years. In 1901 the Board of Revenue submitted proposals—(1) for strengthening the scientific staff of the department by the addition of an Agricultural Chemist; (2) for making the teaching at the College of Agriculture at Saidapet more efficient; and (3) for making the appointment of Government Botanist permanent. These proposals were accepted by the Government and submitted to the Government of India for sanction. The Secretary of State to whom the Government of India referred the proposals, sanctioned the permanent retention of the Botanist, but held in abeyance the proposals to appoint a second European Agricultural expert and an Agricultural Chemist.

Meanwhile, in 1902-1903, Mr. Mollison (the then Inspector-General of Agriculture) visited the Saidapet College, which was then under the Educational Department, and submitted a report which showed that that college was in every way unsuitable as an institution for agricultural training. He recommended that a new institution, under the control of the Agricultural Department, should be established. He also advised the Government as to the necessity for employing the following staff of European experts:—

(1) A Deputy-Director of Agriculture.
(2) A Government Botanist.
(3) An Agricultural Chemist.
(4) A Principal of the College.

He proposed that the Deputy-Director of Agriculture should be assisted by a staff of Native assistants. While the Inspector-General's report was under consideration, the Government of India, with a view to accelerating the improvement of Indian agriculture, announced their intention to make large allotments to various Local Governments to be devoted to the purpose. The Government of India also took up the question of the expansion of the Imperial as well as the Provincial staff of agricultural experts, and addressed the Secretary of State in their Despatch No. 356, dated 26th October, 1905. The Secretary of State sanctioned the Government of India's proposals in his Despatch No. 17 of 26th January, 1906. These proposals contained, among other items, a provision for the appointment of a separate head for the reorganised department with the designation "Director of Agriculture."

In connection with the reorganisation of the Agricultural Department, the Government decided to abolish the Saidapet College and to establish an Agricultural College and Research Institute at Coimbatore. Several scientific and agricultural experts have been recruited and the Department is now placed on an improved footing. The reorganised Department is under the control of the Director of Agriculture who is subordinate to the Board of Revenue in the Settlement Department. Thus the Department took its present form in 1905.*

Recruitment, training and probation.—The early recruits were Europeans; but the Secretary of State in according his sanction to the proposals of the Government of India for reorganising the Agricultural Department expressed the opinion that the Agricultural Department should eventually be, as far as possible, manned by the natives of the country. The Indian Agricultural Service is recruited by the Secretary of State in England. Indians possessing the necessary qualifications may be selected by the Secretary of State. Candidates must, as a rule, be not less than 23, nor more than 30 years of age, and preference is given to British born subjects and to distinguished graduates of Universities in the British Empire. Officers selected are on probation for three years.

Every officer of the Indian Agricultural Service is required to pass an examination in a selected vernacular language within two years of the date of his arrival in India, or of his first appointment to the Service whichever is later; but this period may be extended for special reasons by the Local Government. Failure to pass within the prescribed period entails loss of appointment or stoppage of increments of pay. The compulsory vernacular is fixed by the Local Government and the examination is conducted by such officers as the Local Government may appoint for the purpose.

* Letter to Government of India No. 375, dated 2nd May, 1905. Letter from Government of India No. 1,265, dated 25th July, 1905. Letter to Government of India No. 885, dated 15th September, 1905.

Organisation.—The officers of the Indian Agricultural Service correspond to Imperial officers of other Departments. The officers serving in this Presidency are under the control of the Local Government and are paid from Provincial revenues; but they are liable to transfer from one Province to an other. It was decided in 1906 that the post of Director of Agriculture should be ultimately filled by officers of the Agricultural Department, but that it should at first, for a period of five years, be held by an officer of the Indian Civil Service of the grade of a collector. When this period expired in 1911, the question of the continuance of a civilian at the head of the Department was considered and it has been decided to retain the civilian officer. The Secretary of State has, however, remarked that as temporary vacancies occur the officers of the Department should be given a chance to prove their fitness for the post.†

Officers serving under special agreement for five years may be offered by Local Governments permanent appointments at the end of the third year of their service and those serving under an agreement for three years on the expiration of that term provided their service has been satisfactory. Confirmation does not require the sanction of the Government of India. The Local Government should, however, report its action to the Government of India. Cases, in which a Local Government proposes to dispense with the services of an officer at the end of the probationary period, should be reported for the previous orders of the Government of India.

Numbers.—In 1886 there was only one Deputy Director of Agriculture. This was the strength of the Department until it was reorganised in 1905-06. The reorganised Department consists of the following officers:—

(1) Director of Agriculture (for the present a Civilian).
(2) Two Deputy Directors of Agriculture (a third Deputy Director has recently been sanctioned by the Secretary of State).
(3) An Expert Agriculturist as Principal of the College.
(4) One Government Economic Botanist.
(5) One Lecturing Botanist.
(6) One Government Agricultural Chemist.
(7) One Government Mycologist.
(8) One Government Entomologist (sanctioned for five years).
(9) One Government Sugar-cane Expert (sanctioned for five years).

An additional appointment of "Scientific officer for the purpose of assisting the planting industries" has been sanctioned by the Secretary of State for five years from April, 1909. This officer works under the immediate control of the United Planters' Association of Southern India.‡

Pay.—At first there was no regular scale of pay fixed for the agricultural experts in the Presidency. The scale of pay in 1886 of the only officer in charge of the department was Rs. 750—50—1,000. But in 1905 a general scale of pay was adopted and it is as follows:—

(*a*) during the probationary period of three years, Rs. 400—30—460 per mensem (with no exchange compensation allowance);

(*b*) from the commencement of the fourth year, Rs. 500—50—1,000 (with no exchange compensation allowance).

The Principal of the College is also the Superintendent of the Central Farm and he gets a local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem. The pay of the officers of the Indian Agricultural Service is personal.

The officers of the Indian Agricultural Service are admitted to the scale of pay (Rs. 500—50—1,000) mentioned above from the date of their services becoming permanent and will as a rule be protected from loss by Article 157-A of the Civil Service Regulations; but where this is not the case, the officer concerned is allowed the option of remaining on the scale of pay fixed by his agreement until the termination of the period specified in it.

Supernumerary officers when appointed to fill substantive posts in the Service or to officiate in leave vacancies are not entitled to draw more than the supernumerary rates of pay (Rs. 400—30—460 per mensem) even though they may have increased responsibilities. If, however, a supernumerary is to discharge his work as such as well as carry out the work of an absentee and thus carry on double work he should then be given a charge allowance under Article 161, Civil Service Regulations, the amount admissible being decided by the Audit officer. Supernumerary officers should not be denied the privileges (including the right to rent-free quarters while in training at Pusa) which that status may confer when they hold substantive posts or act for officers on leave, if their pay is subject to the restrictions of the supernumerary status.

PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

There is no main line of division between the Provincial and subordinate Services of the Department. In the early days there were Agricultural Inspectors appointed to assist the Deputy Director of Agriculture. Later on in 1888, as a result of the consideration of the proposals of the Board of Revenue for the reorganisation of the Department, a Sub-Assistant Director of Agriculture was appointed. The Board recommended in 1898 the grading of this post with that of Deputy-Collectors but the proposal was negatived by Government. This post existed till 1908 when on the death of the incumbent it was abolished. Thereupon under the scheme for the reorganisation of the Department inaugurated in 1905, two Assistant Directors of Agriculture were appointed. Generally speaking the Provincial Service may be said to consist at the present day of these appointments as well as those of the teaching assistants at the College of Agriculture who are in the first grade on Rs. 150—20—250, though it is not strictly correct to include the latter in the Provincial Service as they are non-gazetted officers.*

Recruitment and training.—The Assistant Directorships are gazetted posts, whereas the posts of Assistants at the College are not. These posts are intended for men of superior educational qualifications. The Assistant Directors should possess a good scientific training so that they may be eligible to act for, or in course of time rise to the post of, Deputy Directors of Agriculture. Diplomates of the College of Agriculture are eligible for the posts of Assistant Directors and of teaching Assistants. One of the Assistant Directors underwent a three years' course of instruction at the Madras College of Agriculture and has secured the degree of Bachelor of Science of the Edinburgh University. He was recruited direct. The other has passed the B.S. examination of the Californian University and has obtained the diploma of that University. This officer was for some months prior to his appointment employed as Assistant Manager at the central farm.

Organisation.—The members of the Provincial Agricultural Service are not barred from appointment to the Indian Agricultural Service if selected by the Secretary of State, but there is no regular promotion from Provincial to the Indian Agricultural Service. The Provincial officers are all appointed by the local Government. Provincial

† Government of India Letter No. 13-211-1, dated 26th August, 1910, and letter of Government of India No. 3,924, dated 10th December, 1910.

‡ Letter from Government of India No. 1-14-4, dated 25th January, 1907. Letter to the Government of India No. 2,084, dated 12th July, 1912. Government of India Letter No. 1-186-6, dated 2nd January, 1913. Government Order No. 1,632, dated 4th June, 1913. Letter to the Government of India No. 3,763-A/10-1, dated 25th November, 1910. Letter from the Government of India No. 659-185-2, dated 19th June, 1911. Letter to the Government of India No. 4,110-A/08-1, dated 9th April, 1909. Letter from the Government of India No. 1,016-127-6, dated 27th September, 1909.

* Letter to the Government of India No. 1,411, dated 21st May, 1909. Letter from the Government of India No. 760-173-2, dated 16th July, 1909.

officers may be appointed to act in short vacancies in the Indian Agricultural Service.*

Assistant Directors of Agriculture are required to pass the compulsory vernacular test prescribed for Deputy Collectors in two languages prior to confirmation and pending their passing in these examinations they will be on probation. The test in two languages must be completed at or before the fifth half-yearly examination after the officers' appointment, and an officer failing to pass within the prescribed period will be liable to forfeit his appointment.

Numbers and pay.—In 1888 there was one appointment designated Sub-Assistant Director of Agriculture carrying a pay of Rs. 200—10—250. The number of Assistant Directors of Agriculture is at present two, but is ultimately to be four. The pay of the post is Rs. 200—25—400. The teaching assistants who draw Rs. 150—20—250 are five in number, three under the Principal, one under the Botanist and one under the Agricultural Chemist.

II.

[*Additional Statement called for in paragraph* 1 *of the Joint Secretary's letter dated* 1*st August*, 1913.]

INDIAN AGRICULTURAL SERVICE.

(i) *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—(*a*) An addition of one Agricultural Expert as reserve to the present cadre of Agriculturists in the Presidency seems desirable. It is considered better to have one officer as a special reserve in the Presidency than to indent on a general reserve for India.

As regards selection the suggestion of Dr. Barber in regard to the constitution of a permanent Board of Selection in England (paragraph 1 of his Statement) and the suggestions in paragraphs 4 and 5 of the Memorandum† of the officers of the Indian Agricultural Service in this Presidency, deserve consideration.

(i) (*b*) The present arrangements for training are unsatisfactory, inasmuch as many of the recruits are posted to executive work immediately after arrival in India. If the addition referred to above be made it will allow of suitable training being given. It is considered essential that an Agriculturist destined for this Presidency should be trained here, where the conditions are different from those prevailing elsewhere. The specialists should at present be trained at Pusa.

(i) (*c*) No alteration in the period of probation seems called for.

(ii) *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The rates of pay are as follows :—

1890.

One Assistant Commissioner of Agriculture, Rupees 750—50—1,000.

1900.

One Deputy Director, Rs. 750—50—1,000 with exchange compensation allowance.

One Government Botanist, Rs. 700.

Local allowance, Rs. 200.

House-rent allowance, Rs. 125.

1913.

Rs. 400—30—460 *plus* free quarters (for probationers).

Rs. 500—50—1,000 (from the fourth year onwards).

The Principal gets an allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem.

(No exchange compensation allowance.)

(iii) *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—There are no grades in the Department. Besides the Director of Agriculture there are eight officers in the Department. The third Deputy Director of Agriculture is intended to be utilised also as a leave reserve. The training of officers is arranged for by the Government of India.

(iv) *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the Service.*—No appointments are so held.

(v) *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—It is very probable that in the near future further additions to the staff of agriculturists will be required.

PROVINCIAL AGRICULTURAL SERVICE.

(i) *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation seem satisfactory. It seems premature to suggest any change.

(ii) *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—It is too early to offer an opinion as to the adequacy of the rates of pay and allowances.

(iii) *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—There are two Assistant Directors of Agriculture and a Lecturing Botanist. No provision exists for leave and training in the cadre.

(iv) *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the Service.*—No appointments are held.

(v) *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—It has not yet been found possible to recruit suitable men for all the four sanctioned posts of Assistant Directors. It is too soon therefore to say to what extent that number will have to be increased.

---

* Letter from the Government of India No. 10-181-1, dated 10th July, 1912. Letter to the Government of India No. 2,697, dated 6th September, 1912. Government of India letter No. 2-188-12, dated 9th January, 1913.

† 1. *Specialists.*

4. It is our opinion that specialists should not be recruited directly from College. The work in India on the sciences connected with agriculture is still in its initial stages, and the men who come out as specialists must possess initiative and knowledge which can only be obtained from actual practical experience after completion of their college course. If they are sent out direct from college for training under specialists already in India, there is danger that they will merely follow in the same lines already laid down by the men under whom they may be trained in India, and that their inquiries will consequently not be developed as widely or broadly as they ought to be. These men require much more specialised training and knowledge than men in the other services of India—*e.g.*, Police.

2. *Agriculturists.*

5. There is no objection to these men on recruitment being younger than those selected to fill appointments as specialists, but it is essential that they should have post-graduate experience—as, for instance, one year's practical work on a general mixed farm, or practical work as closely connected with land and farming as possible.

APPENDIX XI.

(Referred to in paragraph 68375—Mr. Butler's evidence.)

Note by Mr. E. J. Butler on the position of Pusa in the Agricultural Department.

When the establishment of a Central Agricultural Station for India at Pusa was first proposed, there was little provision for technical agricultural education in India. Bombay alone had an Agricultural College, with a three years' course. There were Agricultural schools at Cawnpore and Nagpur with a course of two years. In Madras and Bengal agricultural instruction was given at Saidapet and Sibpur, but these colleges were very inefficient and were shortly after condemned. It was natural,

therefore, that education should bulk large in the original Pusa scheme; there was to be a two years' course of elementary instruction in agriculture, followed by a third year to train men for employment in the Department as farm overseers and the like, and, finally, selected students were to continue for a fourth and fifth year to qualify for higher subordinate posts, scientific assistantships in the Department and private employment as managers of estates.

Concurrent with education it was always understood that Pusa was to serve as a centre for scientific research. This was, indeed, the avowed purpose of the munificient donation of £30,000 placed at the disposal of the Government of India by Mr. Henry Phipps, in 1903, which served as the nucleus of the funds out of which the Institute was constructed.

Whether the primary function was to be education or research does not appear to have been definitely decided by Government up to, at any rate, 1905. In that year the head of the Department gave expression to a view which was becoming widely held by Directors of Agriculture in the Provinces and by the expert staff of the Department, namely, that research was the main object to be held in view at Pusa; impressed by the danger of development into a teaching institution only and the swamping effects on the energies of the staff of a large influx of students, he proposed the abandonment of the lower courses and the provision of well-equipped Agricultural Colleges in the Provinces, leading up to a post-graduate course at Pusa. As a consequence, elementary agricultural education was never undertaken at Pusa; had it been, it is certain that it would have failed to meet the very diverse requirements of the rest of India and proposals for the foundation of the Provincial Colleges would not have been long delayed.

The attention which was directed to the teaching function of Pusa in the early days of the scheme left an impression on the minds of Government and of the general public which was not soon effaced. Thus Lord Curzon, in his speech at the ceremony of laying the foundation stone on the 1st April, 1905, looked forward to the prospect in 50 years' time of finding Pusa the centre of a great organisation, with ramifications extending to all parts of the Indian continent, training a series of native students to devote their acquired knowledge to the practical pursuit of agriculture. In 1910, Mr. (now Sir) R. N. Mukerji, President of the All-India Industrial Conference, referred to Pusa as a technical college, making no mention of its research function, and expressed the gravest misgivings as to the amount of direct good, in proportion to the money expended, to be derived from the training of the sons of the middle classes, with either no land or no capital, for a career as practical cultivators as opposed to their traditional occupation as clerks and the like.

Nothing could be more striking than the contrast between these views and the opinions held and repeatedly expressed by the Agricultural Department itself, throughout India, as to the proper functions of the Pusa Institute. The Department maintains that the primary objects of Pusa are to conduct research into the fundamental principles of Indian agriculture, and to serve as a centre for such investigations in the agricultural sciences, chemistry, botany, entomology, mycology and bacteriology, as cannot, either from their magnitude or the extent of their application to India as a whole, well be undertaken by Provincial Departments.

The Board of Agriculture in 1906 stated that the research work at Pusa should be distinctly imperial in character, involving the application of the principles of each science to broad general problems of Indian agriculture, and that investigations of local importance only, should not, as a rule, be undertaken. In 1908 the Board considered the teaching functions of Pusa, and recommended that the class of instruction provided should be a post-graduate course for students who have already obtained a degree at a Provincial Agricultural College and, exceptionally, to other science students likely to derive real advantage from the course; the courses should be specially framed for (*a*) students who will afterwards discharge the duties of Assistants to Provincial Experts in Agriculture, Agricultural Chemistry and, in particular, in Economic Botany, Mycology and Entomology; and (*b*) students sent for special purposes. Again, in 1909 the Board expressed the opinion that the aim of the higher teaching at Pusa should be to produce a class of men who would be able to carry out original investigations themselves and also be qualified for teaching or specialised work in the Provinces. At the same time the Board recognised that it is impossible to separate the research work and the training to be given at Pusa; the two are intimately connected, and the training that the staff can undertake depends on the class of work being done in the laboratories and experimental fields at Pusa.

Hence, research and the encouragement of research are considered by the Department to be the chief functions of Pusa. The provision of practical agricultural education has been relegated to the Provincial Departments, and there is no doubt as to the wisdom of this course. The organisation is developing, though of course very modestly, on the lines of the United States Department of Agriculture at Washington. Just as in the United States it has been found advisable at times for the Washington Department to undertake, or to co-operate in, demonstration work or large campaigns (as in work against the cotton boll weevil) in individual States, so in India, Pusa has co-operated in the work of individual Provinces, in such matters as the suppression of cotton boll worm in the Punjab and palm disease in Madras.

As to the need in India of research work of the type which Pusa is designed to supply, it is impossible to be too emphatic. The general level of crop production in India is low, and the quality of the produce often inferior. Crop improvement, both in quality and yield, in such staple crops as wheat, tobacco, oil seeds, fibres, pulses, is one of the primary requirements in the development of the agricultural industry, and may be most readily obtained by the application of modern methods of plant breeding, an exceedingly laborious and time-absorbing pursuit. An understanding of the chemistry and physics of tropical soils in their relation to availability of the plant food contained in them, to the water requirements of crops, to the deleterious alkali salts sometimes present in them, and such matters, is greatly needed. Then there is the very large subject of the bacteriological activity in tropical soils, to which we look to solve many of the problems concerned with the proper use of manures and irrigation water, and to explain some at least of the apparent paradoxes in the growth of such crops as rice. A subject which requires very considerable facilities in regard to staff, time and equipment, is the investigation of the various insect pests and fungus diseases which do enormous damage to the agricultural produce of the country. To co-ordinate all this work with agricultural practice, to conduct permanent experiments on the effect of different methods of cropping on the land, to test and improve agricultural implements, and to experiment with a view to the improvement of agricultural stock, are essential features of a well-equipped agricultural research station. These are some of the lines on which the work at Pusa is developing and which are necessary foundations for any considered scheme for the permanent raising of Indian agriculture to a level with that of other countries. It may be said with some show of truth that it would be impossible, in the present state of our knowledge, to write an elementary text book of Indian agriculture, similar to those of which there is a plentiful supply in Europe, which would not soon be shown to contain glaring misstatements of fact in regard to crop physiology and similar fundamental matters as applied to India. The demand which is coming from the Provincial Colleges for further information before the teach-

ing of even elementary agriculture can be satisfactorily carried out, is thus easily comprehensible.

Research of the nature referred to, as being the most pressing need of the Department, should be as free and unfettered as possible. Any considerable deflection of the energies of the research staff to teaching would most seriously hamper its efficiency. This argument does not apply with the same force to the training of research students, and there are compensating advantages in having such students. The syllabus of studies in the prospectus of the Pusa College makes provision for research training in the scientific sections of the Institute and I attach a statement* of the students who have undergone higher or special training at Pusa. On the whole the material has been unsatisfactory in so far as it is intended to turn out men capable of independent research. For scientific assistants, working under the guidance of officers of the Department, the results have been better and a number of useful assistants have been trained. Whether there is any real demand for research training in science as applied to agriculture, outside of the limited prospect which it opens for government employment, is doubtful; there is, indeed, no evidence whatever of such a demand at present. It would seem as if we must be content to confine our energies largely to training men for employment in the various Agricultural Departments, until such time as the prospect of private employment improves or there is an influx of students willing to pursue knowledge for its own sake.

* Not printed.

APPENDIX XII.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bombay relating to the Agricultural Department.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these are satisfactory.*—(*a*) *Director of Agriculture.*—Members of the Covenanted Civil Service should be selected for this post as long as there are no Agricultural Officers in the Province qualified for the appointment, but the latter officers should be given full opportunity as time goes on of proving their fitness for the post, and they should be tried when temporary vacancies occur. For this purpose members of the Indian Civil Service should be selected to go through an agricultural course in England, and in their case the following concessions should be granted:—

(*1*) The rule which restricts furlough to officers who have served at least eight years in India be so far relaxed as to allow Local Governments to select for the contemplated training any officer of not less than five years' active service who is willing to avail himself of the furlough.

(*2*) Each Local Government should be authorised to select an officer with reference to the prospective demands of the Department; the selected officer should be on furlough in England on furlough allowances and should go through a complete course of study in agriculture in England; the officer who succeeds in obtaining a diploma or equivalent certificate should be reimbursed his college fees and should count one year of his furlought as service for pension.

(*b*) *Agricultural Officers* (*Imperial Agricultural Service*).—The regulations are given as Appendix XVI.

(*c*) As at present advised, Government consider that the regulations as to recruitment, training and probation for the Agricultural Department are satisfactory.

2. *Rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890, 1900 *and on* 1*st April*, 1913, *and whether these rates are satisfactory.*—(*a*) They are as follows:—

1890.		1900.		1913.	
(1)	Pay. (2)	(3)	Pay. (4)	(5)	Pay. (6)
		(a) Officers of the Indian Agricultural Service.			
	Rs.		Rs.		Rs.
Director of Land Records and Agriculture	900	Survey Commissioner and Director of Land Records and Agriculture	2,325	Director of Agriculture and of Co-operative Societies	1,800
Personal allowance	300			Local allowance ...	150
Superintendent of Experimental Farms	500—50—700	Deputy Director of Agriculture	700—30—1,000		
				Indian Agricultural Service.	
				Principal, Agricultural College	1,250—50—1,500
				Professor of Agriculture Economic Botanist ... Deputy Director of Agriculture, Bombay Presidency Deputy Director of Agriculture, Sind	500—50—1,000
				*Supernumerary Agriculturist	400—30—460 500—50—1,000
				Agricultural Engineer	550—50—750
		(b) Officers belonging to the Provincial Service.			
Personal Assistant of the grade of Deputy Collector	500	Personal Assistant of the grade of Deputy Collector	400	Extra Deputy Director of Agriculture, Konkan	350—50-2—550
				Personal Assistant of the grade of Deputy Collector	400
				Divisional Inspectors of Agriculture Assistant Professors...	200—30-2—350 each.

* An appointment of Third Deputy Director of Agriculture has since been sanctioned for this Presidency, and Mr. T. Gilbert, who was Supernumerary Agriculturist, has been appointed to it.

(*b*) Government reserve their opinion on the question whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*

	No.
Director of Agriculture—	
Grade of Junior Collector, Rs. 1,800 ...	1
Indian Agricultural Service—	
Rs. 1,250—50—1,500	1
Rs. 500—50—1,000	4
Rs. 400, 430, 460, 500—50—1,000	1
Rs. 550—50—750	1
Provincial Service—	
Rs. 350—50-2—550	2
Rs. 400*	1
Rs. 200—30-2—350	10

There are two supernumerary appointments in the Indian Agricultural Service. With this exception no provision exists in either cadre for leave and training. Leave vacancies are filled by appointment of officers from the Provincial or Subordinate Services.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—There are no such appointments.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—Government consider that the addition of a second Economic Botanist is needed in this Presidency.

* The sanctioned grades of Deputy Collector are Rs. 300, 400, 500, 600, 700 and 800.

APPENDIX XIII.

Memorandum prepared by the Administration of the Central Provinces and Berar relating to the Agricultural Department.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—The regulations for the recruitment, training and probation of the Imperial Service, which apply to all the Provinces of India alike, are contained in the rules circulated with the Government of India's Circular No. 9—37-2, dated the 15th February, 1913. It is presumed that the Royal Commission are in possession of this Circular.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—Recruitment to the Provincial Service may be either direct, or by promotion from the Subordinate Service. For direct appointments to the Executive posts and for the Assistant Lecturership in Agriculture, the Licentiate in Agriculture (L. Ag.) Diploma in the first class is the essential qualification. For the other College appointments recruitment is made from Graduates in Science specially qualified in the subject with which they will have to deal. The probation is for a period of two years.

(*c*) *Remarks.*—The present system of recruitment for the Imperial Service, viz., selection by the Secretary of State, is, in the Chief Commissioner's opinion, sound.

As regards training, it may be noted that the members of the Agricultural Service are divided into—

(*a*) Experts dealing with scientific research, such as Agricultural Chemists, Botanists, Entomologists, Geologists, etc.

(*b*) Executive experts dealing with the general improvement of agriculture.

The training of the first class of experts can probably be secured best by a short course of probation at Pusa under the supervision of the specialists in their branch, though this should be followed by a short course in general agriculture in the Province to which they are to be attached, so as to enable them to realise the problems with which they will have to deal. In regard to the executive experts of the second class, it is essential to secure men thoroughly acquainted with the local conditions of the Province, for the methods of agriculture and the climate of one province differ so much from those of another that any training outside the one in which they are to serve is likely to be of little use. A probationer selected for the executive branch of a given province could therefore be best trained by attaching him to a circle in that Province and placing him under the supervision of one of the experts employed in executive work in it.

As pointed out in regard to the Imperial Service, the officers of the Provincial Service may be divided into the same two classes.

For the research branch an officer should receive the highest technical training that the Province can give in the branch of work selected, to be followed by a further course at Pusa, after which he would undergo a further probation in the Province before confirmation.

In the case of the members of the executive branch, the essentials before confirmation are a thorough scientific training in agriculture followed by a practical training in the field.

The scientific training can be secured by selecting candidates from those who have obtained the diploma of Licentiate in Agriculture. Such candidates would then be appointed on probation to the Provincial Service, but the period of two years at present allowed is not sufficient to secure their thorough training in the field, and it should be extended to three years. As the practical training in the field is quite as important as the scientific training, the confirmation at the end of this period should only be made if they have shown themselves thoroughly suitable.

The selection of members of the Subordinate Service for the Provincial Service might also be allowed in exceptional cases in respect of members already in employment, as such promotion has been recognised in the past, but such promotion as a rule is undesirable, as though these officers have no doubt great practical experience their scientific training will not be sufficient to justify their selection to the Provincial Service.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—The rates of pay and allowances at the present time for the Imperial branch of the Agricultural Service are given in paragraphs 9—14 of the Circular referred to above.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—The pay of the Provincial Branch during probation is Rs. 100 per mensem, rising to Rs. 150 after one year upon good report, and to Rs. 200 on confirmation. After confirmation the pay is Rs. 200—10—250. and then Rs. 250 rising to Rs. 400 by biennial increments of Rs. 30, the maximum pay being reached in 17 years. There are also six field allowances of Rs. 50 per mensem each for Superintendents of Agriculture.

This Department was not in existence in 1890 or 1900.

(*c*) *Remarks.*—As regards the Imperial Service, the Chief Commissioner thinks that the present maximum of Rs. 1,000 per mensem, reached after 10 years' service, is not an adequate remuneration for the highly scientific and arduous work performed by the officers of the Department. He believes that it will no longer suffice to secure or retain competent and trained men for appointments

in which experience and continuity of service are of paramount importance. It must be remembered that the demand for trained agriculturists exceeds the supply, and after a successful career of some years in India, the members of the Service are able to secure posts on equal pay in England, or higher pay in other countries. He suggests, therefore, that there should be an ordinary time-scale rising to Rs. 1,250 with a second scale rising to a maximum of Rs. 1,500, promotion to which would only be granted in cases of high efficiency. The adoption of such a scale, together with a prospect of attainment to the Directorship, would give much needed encouragement to recruitment, and go some way to remove the existing dissatisfaction among the officers of the Department.

In the case of the Provincial Service, the rates of pay and allowances were determined in 1911, and the Service is still in its infancy. But the Chief Commissioner considers that if the Provincial Agricultural Service is to attract the proper stamp of men, a scale of pay and advancement more nearly approximating to that of the Provincial Civil Service is necessary. With the extension of the period of probation to three years as proposed above, the present scale of pay would only secure Rs. 400 per mensem after 18 years' service, and the Chief Commissioner recommends the following scale:—

During probation—

	Rs.
First year	100
Second ,, ...	150
Third ,, ...	200

On confirmation, Rs. 200 rising by biennial increments of Rs. 40 to Rs. 400 with a further scale of Rs 500—25—800, appointment to which would be made by selection.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—There are, excluding the Directorship, which is at present held by a Civilian, six appointments, viz., two Deputy Directors of Agriculture in charge of Circles, one Agricultural Chemist, one Economic Botanist, one Principal of the Agricultural College and one Assistant Director of Agriculture. The Secretary of State has sanctioned another post of Deputy Director of Agriculture or Assistant Director of Agriculture as the case may be.

There is no reserve for leave or training in the cadre.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—The sanctioned cadre contains 12 appointments. The actual staff at present consists of 4 Extra-Assistant Directors of Agriculture, who are employed as Superintendents of Agriculture on executive and field work. The allotment of definite functions to the 12 posts has been left to the Chief Commissioner, and will be considered in relation to the necessities of the Province, as the work of the Department develops, and as competent men become available.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the Service.*—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—One appointment is held outside the cadre, viz., the Directorship of Agriculture, and the present incumbent is an officer of the Central Provinces Commission.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—There is no such appointment.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—In addition to the post recently sanctioned by the Secretary of State but not yet filled, two more appointments are required to complete the proposed organisation of the Department, so as to have three circles corresponding to the three main crop divisions of the Provinces, each in the charge of a Deputy Director of Agriculture, with an Assistant Director of Agriculture. Later on the appointment of an Agricultural Bacteriologist may also be found necessary. The cadre will then be:—

Three Deputy Directors.
Three Assistant Directors.
One Principal, Agricultural College.
One Agricultural Chemist.
One Economic Botanist.

This will secure a leave reserve, for an Assistant Director could be withdrawn to act as a Deputy Director proceeding on leave without much loss of efficiency at present, but with the rapid expansion of the work of the Department, and the development of new lines of demonstration it is impossible to say for how long this staff will suffice, and it may be necessary before many years have passed to ask for a further increase.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—No addition to the sanctioned cadre of 12 posts is required for the present, but it will probably be found necessary in future to work up to the staff of 17 posts proposed in 1911, and probably, as the work of the Department increases, to add further posts.

APPENDIX XIV.

Statement of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a Month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Agricultural Department (Appointments under the Government of India).

Pay	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.														
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).									Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
				Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).			
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	6	—	2	3	—	—	—	—	—	3	—	1	4	—	—	—
300—400	1	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
400—500	5	4	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
500—600	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	24	16	2	5	—	—	—	—	—	5	—	1	6	—	—	—

APPENDIX XV.

Statement (with details by Provinces) of the Provincial Establishment of Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a Month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Agricultural Department (excluding Appointments under the Government of India).

TOTAL STATEMENT.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).												
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	39	1	1	14	1	5	2	3	2	27	4	1	32	3	1	1
300—400	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	1	—	1	2	—	—	—
400—500	9	4	—	2	—	1	—	—	—	3	—	—	3	1	1	—
500—600	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	6	6	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	7	7	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	14	14	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	88	43	1	16	1	6	2	4	2	31	4	2	37	4	2	1

DETAILS BY PROVINCES.

I.—*Madras.*

Rs.																
200—300	7	—	1	3	1	—	—	1	—	5	—	—	5	—	1	—
500—600	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	15	8	1	3	1	—	—	1	—	5	—	—	5	—	1	—

II.—*Bombay.*

Rs.																
200—300	8	1	—	5	—	—	—	—	1	6	—	—	6	1	—	—
300—400	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	1	—	1	2	—	—	—
400—500	2	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
500—600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	18	8	—	5	—	1	—	1	1	8	—	1	9	1	—	—

III.—*Bengal.*

Rs.																
200—300	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	1	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
400—500	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—
600—700	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	7	4	—	1	—	—	—	—	1	2	—	—	2	—	1	—

APPENDIX XV. *(continued).*

IV.—*Bihar and Orissa.*

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.														
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).											
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	9	—	—	3	—	5	1	—	—	9	—	—	9	—	—	—
400—500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
500—600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	13	4	—	3	—	5	1	—	—	9	—	—	9	—	—	—

V.—*The United Provinces of Agra and Oudh.*

Rs.															
200—300	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	1	—	—
400—500	3	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	1	—	—
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	10	6	—	2	—	—	—	—	—	2	—	—	2	2	—	—

VI.—*Punjab.*

Rs.															
200—300	6	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	4	—	5	1	—	—
400—500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	10	4	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	4	—	5	1	—	—

VII.—*Burma.*

Rs.															
200—300	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	1
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Toral -	5	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	1

VIII.—*The Central Provinces.*

Rs.															
200—300	3	—	—	1	—	—	—	2	—	3	—	—	3	—	—	—
400—500	1	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
600—700	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	9	5	—	2	—	—	—	2	—	4	—	—	4	—	—	—

IX.—*Assam.*

Rs.																
600—700	1*	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

APPENDIX XVI.

Rules for Appointments in the Indian Agricultural Service.

1. The appointments in the Indian Agricultural Service include those of Deputy Director of Agriculture, Agricultural Chemist, Economic Botanist, Mycologist, Entomologist, Bacteriologist, Professors of Agriculture, Chemistry and Botany, at Agricultural Colleges, and the like. Some of these are included in the Imperial Department of Agriculture under the direct control of the Government of India, but the majority are included in the Departments of Agriculture of the several provinces of India. In some cases candidates will be appointed direct to these posts, but in most cases they will be appointed as supernumeraries, will undergo a further course of training in India in Indian agriculture, and will be appointed to posts, for which in the opinion of the Government they are considered suitable, on the regular establishment as vacancies occur.

2. Appointments are made by the Secretary of State for India as occasion may require, and applications regarding them should be addressed to the Revenue Secretary, India Office, London, S.W.

3. Candidates must, as a rule, be not less than 23, not more than 30 years of age. Exceptions will be made as regards the maximum limit only in the case of appointments requiring special qualifications. Candidates must furnish evidence of having received a good general education, and of possessing a thorough knowledge of the science of agriculture or of the particular science required for the appointment applied for. Preference is given to British-born subjects and to distinguished graduates of Universities in the British Empire.

4. Applications should be submitted upon the form provided for the purpose, and should be accompanied by testimonials setting forth fully the candidate's personal and professional qualifications and practical experience.

5. Candidates whose applications are selected for consideration will be required to present themselves for an interview with an official at the India Office. In selecting candiates for appointment, weight will be given to the possession of (*a*) a University degree in honours in science, or the diploma of a recognised school of agriculture, or other like distinction; (*b*) qualifications in a special science according to the nature of the vacancy to be filled; (*c*) practical experience. Importance is also attached to bodily activity and ability to ride, and selected candidates have to undergo an examination by the Medical Board of the India Office as to their physical fitness for service in India.

6. Newly appointed officers are required, before leaving this country, to enter into an agreement with the Secretary of State embodying the conditions of their appointment. They are also required to leave for India within three months of their appointment by the Secretary of State, and are provided at the expense of Government with a first-class passage to India, the cost of which they will be required to refund if they voluntarily relinquish the service of Government before the close of three years from the date of appointment. If an officer's service be determined at the expiration of the term of three years, or if prior to the expiration of that term he be compelled by ill-health (certified to the satisfaction of Government) to give up the service, a first-class passage to England will be provided at the expense of Government. Pay commences from the date of arrival in India.

7. An officer appointed to the Agricultural Service, whether as a supernumerary or otherwise, and whatever his initial salary may be, will be on probation in India for three years. He will be required to pass an examination in a vernacular language within two years of his arrival in India or on his first appointment to the service, whichever is later. His appointment may be cancelled for failure to pass this examination, or at any time for unfitness or misconduct. At the end of his three years' term of probation the Government of India will decide whether to retain or dispense with his services.

8. Officers of the Agricultural Service are expected to give their whole time to the duties of the service, and are liable to transfer from one appointment or province to another.

9. The salary attached to posts in the Indian Agricultural Service will ordinarily be:—

	Rs.
For the first year - -	400 per mensem.
„ second year - -	430 „
„ third year - -	460 „
„ fourth and subsequent years	500 rising by annual increments of Rs. 50 a month to Rs. 1,000 a month.

Candidates who are required to undergo a further course of training in India under paragraph 1 above will be appointed on this scale of salary, commencing on a pay of Rs. 400. Where, for special reasons, a candidate is recruited for direct appointment to one of the regular posts under paragraph 1, his initial pay will be determined with reference to the special qualifications and the length of European experience required for the appointment for which he is specially selected, but his subsequent increments of salary will be regulated by the foregoing scale.

10. In addition to this scale of pay, officers filling appointments directly under the Government of India, as distinguished from appointments under Local Governments (but not including officers holding supernumerary posts, or the post of Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India and Director of the Pusa Institute) will be eligible for local allowances* on the following scale:—

	Rs.
From the 4th to the 10th year of service† - - - -	100 per mensem.
From the 11th to the 15th -	150 „
Over 15 years' service - -	200 „

An officer appointed on an initial pay exceeding Rs. 400 will be allowed to count service for the local allowance (but not for leave or pension) as if he had served for the period entitling him to that rate of salary on the ordinary scale. For instance, if he commences service on an initial salary of Rs. 500 he will be eligible for a local allowance of Rs. 100 in the first year of his service.

The grant of the local allowance is, in each case, conditional on approved good work, and the Government reserves to itself the fullest discretion as to granting, withholding, or withdrawing them.

11. An officer appointed to be Principal of an Agricultural College under a Local Government will be entitled to a local allowance of Rs. 100 a month in addition to the emoluments otherwise admissible to him. But if personal allowances are hereafter sanctioned, and he is admitted to one of them, he will cease to draw this allowance. An officer serving in Burma will be entitled to a local allowance of Rs. 100 a month in addition to the other emoluments admissible to him, provided that his pay and allowances (exclusive of travelling and conveyance allowances) do not exceed Rs. 1,000 a month.

12. No exchange compensation allowance will be given, and free quarters will not usually be provided; but officers receive either free quarters or a house-rent allowance during the period for which they draw the supernumerary rate of pay, *i.e.*, until their pay rises above Rs. 460 a month.

13. Members of the Indian Agricultural Service draw travelling allowance for journeys on duty as officers of the first class under the Civil Service Regulations.

14. On being confirmed in his appointment, a probationer will become eligible, as from the date

* *Note.*—A local allowance does not enter into the calculation of pension or leave allowances and is drawn in full by the person actually doing the work of the appointment to which it is attached.

† Including service on a Provincial Staff.

of his arrival in India, for leave allowances and pension, under the provisions of the Civil Service Regulations applicable to the Department. These regulations are liable to be modified by the Government of India from time to time. A copy of an abstract of them will be supplied on application to the Revenue Secretary, India Office, London, S.W.

15. Retirement is ordinarily required at 55 years of age, but an officer may, for special reasons, be retained after attaining that age.

INDIA OFFICE,
June, 1913.

APPENDIX XVII.

Officials and non-officials who furnished written evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their enquiry into the Agricultural Department, but who were not orally examined.

1. J. Sen, Esq., and 24 other members of the staff of the Agricultural Research Institute, Pusa.
2. J. H. Barnes, Esq., Principal, Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur.
3. (*a*) Letter from G. Sherrard, Esq. (Deputy-Director of Agriculture, Bihar and Orissa);
   (*b*) Memorandum by N. C. Chaudhury, Esq., Travelling Inspector, Provincial Agricultural Service, Bihar and Orissa; and
   (*c*) Memorandum from S. N. Sil, Esq., and other members of the Provincial Agricultural Service, Bihar and Orissa.
4. R. C. Wood, Esq., and other European Gazetted officers in the Indian Agricultural Service, Madras.
5. Ananda Rao, Esq., and Ramasastrulu Nayudu, Esq.
6. J. B. Knight, Esq. (Professor of Agriculture), and W. Burns, Esq. (Economic Botanist), Agriculture College, Poona.
7. Bhimbhai Morarji Desai, Esq., D. Ag. Divisional Inspector of Agriculture, Northern Division.
8. William Burns, Esq., B.Sc., Economic Botanist, Bombay.
9. G. Henderson, Esq., and T. F. Main, Esq., Deputy-Directors of Agriculture in the Bombay Presidency.
10. J. B. Knight, Esq., Professor of Agriculture, Agricultural College, Poona.
11. The officers of the Agricultural Department of the Central Provinces.
12. The members of the Provincial Agricultural Department of the Central Provinces.
13. The Imperial officers of the Agricultural Department, Bengal.
14. Members of the Indian Agricultural Service in Burma.

INDEX.

(The numbers refer to paragraphs.)

Agricultural Department.

A

Agricultural Adviser to Government of India:
Additional pension recommended, *Barber* ... 68197
should be Appointed from experts, I.—V. grade, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68118
Filling of, from within department, for members of Service, advocated, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68361, 68366
Objection to Imperial head for whole country, *Clarke* 68103
Pay, *Mackenna* 68048

Agricultural Colleges:
Affiliation to a University:
Poona the only affiliated college, and no particular advantage in affiliation, *Mackenna* 68084
Suggestion, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68136
Assistant Professors:
Present posts should be styled Professorships, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117
should be First-class officers, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117
Comparison of training with English universities, *Rangachariar*, 68251; *Mann*, 68333.
Criticisms, *Madan Mohan Lal* ... 68133-5
Foundations of technical instruction omitted, *Woodhouse* 68138 (21)
Objects of, *Woodhouse* 68138 (14)
Personnel, inferior to English colleges, *Barber* p. 266
Present colleges and one large centre purely for Research desired, *Mackenna* 68067
System, comparison with England, and disadvantages under which work done, *Woodhouse* 68138 (24)
Vacations, recommendation, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68119
(*see also particular names.*)

Agricultural Engineers, pay, special terms, *Mackenna* 68048

Agricultural Service, scheme for a general, *Madan Mohan Lal*, 68118, 68130; *Ajrekar*, 68346, p. 240

Agricultural Teaching (*see under* Agricultural Colleges, *under* Cadre, *and under* Work and Duties of Department).

Agricultural Supervisor, title, change to Assistant to Director of Agriculture advocated, *Chakravarti* 68176

Ajrekar, S. L., evidence of 68340-68358

Allowances (*see under* Leave *and* Pay).

Anglo-Indians, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 273, p. 274

Assam:
another Agricultural Supervisor may be required in future ... ... p. 262
Deputy Director, second may be required in future ... ... p. 262
Imperial Service, two posts only, and no provision for leave and training ... ... p. 262
Memorandum by Administration ... p. 261-2
Rates of pay in Assam considered unsatisfactory by Chief Commissioner and increased maximum advocated ... ... p. 261-2
Provincial Service:
Appointments in, and method of selection p. 262
Number of posts in each grade ... p. 262
no Provision for leave and training p. 262

Assistant Directors of Agriculture:
should be First-class officers, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117
Language test ... ... p. 269
Pay, proposed scale, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68118-68127

Assistant Lecturers and Demonstrators or Sub-Assistant Directors, pay, proposed scale, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68118

B

Baniyas and Vaisyas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by 1st April, 1913 p. 274-5

Barber, C. A.:
Evidence of 68192-68233
Note on inclusion of Indians in higher posts p. 265-6
Note on need for expansion in district work p. 263-5

Bengal:
second Deputy Director applied for, but no other additions needed ... ... p. 260
Memorandum by Government ... p. 259-60
Pay:
Of certain officers ... ... p. 260
Rates and increase in maximum will be necessary in future ... ... p. 260
Provincial Service:
Constitution of regular service, with prospects little if at all inferior to P.C.S., will become necessary ... ... p. 260
no Fixed rules *re* probation and training, but one year's probation usual ... ... p. 260
one Grade only, and no provision for leave and training ... ... p. 260
Increase in number of officers, proposed p. 260
Recruitment, method, and most posts given to men trained in America ... ... p. 260
(*see also under subjects.*)

Bihar and Orissa:
Assistant Director, proposed by Government p. 261
Deputy Directors:
Addition of two, proposed by Government p. 261
Increase advocated, *Woodhouse* ... 68138 (26)
Leave and training, no provision for, and provision suggested within province ... p. 261
Memorandum by Government ... p. 260-1
North Bihar sugar-cane station and cattle-breeding farm, proposed recruitment of European officer on special contract to be superintendent of ... ... p. 261
Provincial Service:
Appointments might be made in future from Pusa, with development of ... p. 261
Places where officers educated ... p. 261
(*see also under subjects.*)

Bombay:
Administrators, difficulty in getting suitable men from cultivator class and method of training, *Keatinge* 68270-1
Cultivators:
becoming more Appreciative of scientific methods, *Mann* 68318
Many methods of, good, and difficulty of introducing many scientific methods, *Keatinge* 68284
Deputy Director, should have time for research, *Keatinge* 68289

Bombay—*continued.*
District men, difficulty of keeping in sufficient contact with research work *Keatinge* ... 68287
Economic Botanist, second, needed ... p. 272
Extra Deputy Director, qualifications, etc., *Keatinge* 68269
Extra deputy directors, same duties as those of Imperial officers in other parts, *Ajrekar* 68350
INDIANS:
Certain, fit for Imperial service, *Mann*, 68312, 68331; *Ajrekar*, 68358.
Sent to England for training and opinion *re*, *Keatinge*, 68291; *Mann*, 68339.
LANDOWNERS:
Extent of interest in scientific study, *Keatinge*, 68283
Increasing demand from, for students of Poona College, *Mann* 68317-8
Leave and training, no provision for, beyond two supernumerary appointments ... p. 272
Memorandum by Government ... p. 271-2
Number of posts in each grade ... p. 272
ORGANISATION OF DEPARTMENT IN:
Division into three branches, suggestion, *Keatinge* 68256, 68265
Increase of staff needed, but must be carefully done, *Mann*... 68318
Relations with Pusa, *Keatinge* 68278
Pay, rates of, and allowances ... 1890, 1900, 1913, p. 271
PROVINCIAL SERVICE:
present Prospects sufficient to attract superior class to, *Keatinge* 68297
Some young men in, fit for promotion to Imperial service, *Keatinge* 68292
RECRUITMENT:
Graduates not suitable for intended positions, *Mann* 68339
of Indians only will be possible in future, *Mann* 68335
Research work in, advantages, *Keatinge* 68266, 68281, 68295
Specialists on short term agreements might be necessary, but difficulty, *Keatinge* ... 68282
Staff, *Keatinge* 68256
(*see also under subjects.*)

Brahmans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 273-5

Buddhists, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 274-5

Burma:
Botanist and mycologist will be required in future, and proposals for increase in subordinate scientific staff under consideration p. 263
Experimental farms ... ... p. 263
Memorandum by Government ... p. 262-3
Pay, rates of, and proposal, etc. ... p. 263
Recruitment, probation, and training, method and scheme for, with establishment of college p. 262-3
Staff ... ... p. 263
SUBORDINATE SCIENTIFIC STAFF:
no Provision for leave and training p. 263
Scale of pay unsatisfactory ... p. 263
Vernacular, knowledge of, essential, and should be made condition of employment p. 263

Butler, E. J.:
Evidence of 68359-68404
Note by, on the position of Pusa in the Agricultural Department ... ... p. 269-71

C

Cadre:
Administrative side, increase desirable, *Keatinge* 68273
Agricultural side should be strengthened rather than scientific, *Barber* 68228
DEMONSTRATION STAFF:
Arduous nature of work and injury to health of, *Low* 68411
Increase necessary, *Low* 68409
Increase in, advocated, *Barber*, 68205-6, 68229; *Ajrekar* 68348
Increase needed, and might be trained and recruited in India, *Middleton* ... 68447
Indigenous agency desirable if competent men to be found. *Keatinge* 68268

Central Provinces and Berar:
Administrative staff, number required, *Low*, 68427
Demonstration work, *Low* 68412
IMPERIAL SERVICE:
Additional appointments required p. 273
One appointment held outside cadre p. 273
Staff, and no provision for leave or training p. 273
INDIANS:
in Charge of divisions, *Low* ... 68422
None at present combining scientific knowledge with executive ability, *Low* 68413, 68421
Landlords cultivating their own land, *Low* 68429
Memorandum by Administration ... p. 272-3
PROVINCIAL SERVICE:
Cadre and scale of pay and increase in pay advocated, *Low* 68413
Increase will be necessary ... ... p. 273
Pay:
Rates and allowances ... ... p. 272
proposed Scale ... ... p. 273
Staff ... ... p. 273
Recruitment system, and qualifications p. 272
Provincial and subordinate services, position of, and opinion *re*, *Low* 68413
Separation of research and teaching, no present necessity for, *Low* 68423
Work of department, extension desirable, *Low* 68405
(*see also under subjects.*)

Chakravarti, Jatindra Nath, evidence of 68169, 68191

Chemists and botanists, if pay increased and given prospects of Pusa appointment might be satisfied, *Mackenna* 68071

Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 273-5

Civil Veterinary Department, should be separately administered from Agricultural Department, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68366

Clarke, G., evidence of 68086, 68113

Coimbatore Agricultural College:
Agricultural graduate, disadvantage compared with ordinary graduate, *Rangachariar*... 68251
Conditions of service unsatisfactory, *Rangachariar* 68235
Five appointments at least in gazetted service, advocated, *Rangachariar* ... 68236
Leave, hardship *re*, *Rangachariar* 68241
Officers should not be expected to do both research and training work, *Rangachariar* 68239
PAY:
Improvement needed, *Rangachariar* 68236
Recommendations, *Rangachariar* 68246
Principal, rule *re* appointment of agriculturists not scientific specialists complained of *Barber* 68200, 68213
should Provide training for higher class of agriculturists and for ryots, *Rangachariar* 68250
Provincial service necessary for, and some additions to executive branch and comparison with other colleges, *Rangachariar* 68234, 68239
Qualifications for entry into, should be distinct aptitude for science and subsequent agricultural training, *Rangachariar* 68247
Research work, closer contact with work at Pusa desired, *Barber* 68214
Training adequate for class of men needed. *Barber* 68211
Training work, more attention should be paid to, *Barber* ... ... p. 266

Colleges (*see* Agricultural Colleges).

Commissioner, Rural (*see* Rural Commissioner).

Conditions of Service:
Aim should be to attract best type of university men with post-graduate experience, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68361
Compare unfavourably with other services, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68365

Conditions of Service—*continued.*
Determined by European Service Leave Rules and Civil Service Pension Rules, *Mackenna* 68047
Improvement, need for, *Woodhouse*, 68146; *Barber* 68193, 68202.
proposed Improvements, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117
of Indians and Europeans should be the same, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117
Recruiting adversely affected, *Barber* 68195, 68204
Service should be on a par with Educational or Revenue department, *Rangachariar* 68240
should be Such as to attract best Indian element, and suggestions, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117
Suitable, *Keatinge* 68259
(*see also* Leave, Pay, etc.).

Co-operative Societies must work with Agricultural Department, *Chakravarti* 68175

Confidential Reports, procedure regarding, *Clarke* 68092

Cost of living, increase, *Madan Mohan Lal*, 68117; *Woodhouse*, 68138 (6); *Butler* and *Milligan*, 68363, 68364.

Cultivators, many methods of, good and worth continuing, *Mann* 68336

D

Demonstrators or Assistants in Colleges, pay, proposed scale, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68118

Deputy Directors of Agriculture:
in each District desirable, and assistant directors in each district suggested as first step, *Barber* 68232
in Districts, value of *Barber* 68207
Europeans necessary for the present, but Indians recruited when suitable, *Mackenna* 68049
Experimental research an important part of work of, *Butler* 68398
Functions, *Butler* and *Milligan* ... 68372-3
Increase number desirable, *Mackenna*, 68069; *Butler* 68369.
Indians as, little scope for employment of, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68365
Interchange between various provinces, no necessity for, *Mackenna* 68070
in Future certain number will be qualified for post of director, *Keatinge* 68267
Man arriving from England should be placed under experienced teacher to obtain local colour, *Mackenna* 68064
One, in every district desired, *Barber* ... 68206
Qualifications desired, *Mackenna*, 68064; *Woodhouse* 68157.
Recruitment entirely from sons of English farmers, suggestion, *Mackenna* 68064

Directors of Agriculture in the Provinces:
Additional pensions advocated, *Woodhouse*, 68138 (8); *Barber* 18197.
Age and length of appointment, opinion *re*, *Clarke* 68092
Greater care should be exercised in selection, *Barber* 68199
Functions, *Mackenna* 68070
Post filled by Civilians but not specially reserved, *Mackenna* 68050
I.C.S. OFFICERS AS:
Abolition advocated, *Barber* 68199
Advantages of member of Service over, *Woodhouse* 68147
Appointment only when man known to have taken interest in, and to be experienced in agriculture, objection would be removed to considerable extent, *Woodhouse* 68166
Approved, *Rangachariar* 68243
Approved as temporary measure, *Clarke* 68112
Essential and inevitable, *Clarke* 68092
Immediate change to appointment of members of agricultural service not advocated, *Barber* 68220

Directors of Agriculture in the Provinces—*continued.*
I.C.S. OFFICERS AS—*continued.*
Necessary for a long time, but Agriculture expert as, may be possible when Department fully developed and organised, *Chakravarti* 68175
since 1906, *Mackenna* 68050
Post should preferably be held by, with agricultural training, and for not less than 8 years, *Ajrekar* 68347
Post should be reserved for members of service, *Mackenna*, 68081; *Butler* and *Milligan*, 68361, 68366.
certain Qualifications advocated, *Mackenna* 68050
Reply to arguments *re* need for, *Clarke* 68111-68112
Suggestions *re* agricultural course in England p. 271
MEMBER OF DEPARTMENT AS:
Additional allowance advocated in case of, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68362
Advocated, *Clarke* 68106–68111
Advocated as long as no agricultural officers in provinces qualified, but latter should be tried in temporary vacancies ... ... p. 271
Claim to, and reasons against, *Mackenna* 68050
no Objection to transfer from one province to another, *Butler* 68390
Officer should have had 15 years' service or be over 35, *Low* 68408
Post should be held as a rule by, but one difficulty *re*, *Low* 68408, 68432
Posts should be reserved for, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68361, 68366, 68402
Post should be thrown open to, *Woodhouse* 68138 (8), 68147, 68162, 68165–6
Question of, *Clarke* 68100
Suggestion that 15 years' service should be insisted on, not agreed with, but officer should be over 35, *Butler* 68381
Pay, recommendation *Clarke* 68092
Post must be held by man with missionary power whether civilian or not, *Mann* ... 68305
Qualifications required, *Keatinge* 68267
Question of outside officer or officer from inside department as, *Mackenna* 68070
Recruitment, proposed method, *Low* ... 68409
Selection from whole of India not advisable, *Barber* 68226
Special knowledge essential, *Clarke* 68101
Transfers from one part of India to another to fill post would not be approved, *Keatinge* 68294
(*see also under names of provinces.*)

Drake, F. C., attention called to evidence of, and notes of 68450–1

E

Earle, Sir Archdale, K.C.I.E., note by ... p. 262

Engineers (*see* Agricultural Engineers).

European Element:
Necessity for, *Keatinge*, 68261; *Butler*, 68372; *Barber*, p. 265.
(*see also* Indians.)

Europeans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 273–5

Experts:
Indian, should be treated equally with Europeans as regards leave, etc., *Madan Mohan Lal* 68119
Pay, comparison with Java and United States of America, *Keatinge* 68260
Pay, proposed scale, *Madan Mohan Lal* ... 68118
Transfer within limits of four main tracts, no objection to, *Barber* 68224
(*see also under* Pusa, *under* Research, *and under names of provinces.*)

Extra Deputy Directors in charge of division, salary question, *Keatinge* 68276

F

Family Pension Fund, demand for, *Mackenna* 68077

Farms:
Improvement in agricultural methods since post of Deputy Director established, but room for increase in number of experimental farms mainly for seed distribution, *Mackenna* 68069
Question of farming as profitable occupation for educated middle classes, *Woodhouse* 68138 (19)
(*see also under* Bihar and Orissa, Burma, *and* Saidapet.)

Furlough (*see under* Leave).

H

Higher Posts (*see under* Indians).

Hindus, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 273–5

I

Imperial Service:
Best men not attracted to, owing to present pay and prospects, *Clarke* 68088
Cadre and functions, *Mackenna* 68062
Increase needed, *Clarke* 68105
Indians in (*see under* Indians).
Memorandum of members 68359–366
Opening of, to men trained in India, difficulties, *Clarke* 68091
no Posts outside authorised cadre held by officers p. 262, p. 269, p. 258, p. 260, p. 261, p. 272
Post outside authorised cadre held in Central Provinces ... ...p. 273
poor Prospects, *Butler* and *Milligan* ... 68361
Qualifications advocated, *Barber* 68218
Similar posts throughout the Provinces should be given identical titles and be gazetted and referred to as officers of the Indian Agricultural Service, *Clarke* 68093

Division of Service into Imperial and Provincial:
Abolition advocated, *Madan Mohan Lal*, 68114, 68117; *Ajrekar*, 68343, 68346, 68350.
Objections to, and abolition advocated, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68121
Reply to complaints *re*, *Keatinge*... 68261
Satisfactory, but suggested improvements, *Barber* 68198
Sharp line existing between, should be abolished, and suggestions, *Chakravarti* 68174
(*see also* Conditions of Service, Indians, Leave, *etc., and under names of provinces.*)

Indian Christians, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 274

Indians:
Advantages of, in popularising work, *Chakravarti*, 68186; *Keatinge*, 68280.
Agricultural Service not popular among, owing to lack of prospects, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68125, 68130, 68134
Appointment as specialists, recommendation, *Rangachariar* 68237
Capabilities of, *Mackenna* 68079
as Deputy Directors, little scope for employment of, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68365
no Difference should be made between Europeans and, given proper probation, etc., *Mann* 68299
Directly appointed as experts, proposed scale, of pay, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68118

Employment in Higher Posts:
Agricultural side, scholarship scheme, *Woodhouse* 68143
Advocated wherever possible, but seldom suitable at present, *Barber* 68198, 68205, 68208
Difficulty of problem, and proposals, *Barber* p. 215–6
no Objection to, if qualified, but proportion of European officers essential in district and teaching branches, *Keatinge* 68261

Indians—*continued.*
Employment in Higher Posts—*continued.*
not Suitable for Imperial service except in teaching posts up to present, but good research workers may be obtainable in future, *Butler* 68389
Unsuitability at present for, and reasons, *Low* 68412
Employment in research, difficulties owing to weakness of teaching in provinces, *Clarke* 68091
Graduates, admission of considerable proportion looked forward to, and education of sons of landholders the best means, *Mackenna* 68065

Imperial Service:
practically Excluded from, and reasons, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68121
One in, *Mackenna*, 68065; increase advocated, *Chakravarti*, 68174.
Promotion to, from Provincial Service (*see under* Provincial Service).
Some on list of candidates each year, *Middleton* 68445
(*see also* Recruitment, *and under names of provinces.*)

Leave:
Facilities for, for study abroad, suggestion, *Mann* 68303, 68304
Recommendations *re*, owing to need of Indian scientists being able to go to Europe, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68119
no Limitation on employment of, advocated, *Mann* 68299, 68304
no Limitations advocated and preference should be given to, *Ajrekar* 68346
no Limitation on employment needed and preponderance in agricultural line advocated, *Rangachariar* 68242, 68249
Number tried on independent district work, and none considered suitable for Imperial Service or for post of Deputy Director, *Butler* 68372
Pay and prospects should be same as those of Europeans, *Ajrekar* 68343
for Practical agriculture, suitability dependent on class of man, and suggestion *re* training, etc., *Clarke* 68091
Research capacities of, and comparison with Europeans, *Mann* 68306
no Restriction on employment of, but some natural limitations, *Mackenna* ... 68049
whole Service should be open to, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117
as Specialists or for research workers, few suitable for higher posts, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68365
Teaching the most suitable field for, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68365
Tendency to consider minor and largely scientific departments as suitable field for, regardless of efficiency, deprecated, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68365
Value as subordinates, *Clarke* 68091

Inspector-General:
Amalgamation of post with that of head of Pusa establishment, working of, *Mackenna* 68068
Pay, scale, *Mackenna* 68048, 68078

K

Kaiyasthas (including Parbhus), civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ...p. 274, p. 275

Keatinge, G. F., C.I.E., I.C.S., evidence of 68256, 68297

Kshatryas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ...p. 274

L

Landholders, number availing themselves of educational opportunities in Bengal likely to increase, *Chakravarti* 68189

Language (*see under* Vernaculars, *under* Probation and Training, *and under* United Provinces).

Leave, Imperial Service:
Allowances inadequate, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68363
Conditions satisfactory, *Clarke* 68089
after 8 years' service only, no knowledge of rule being serious bar to recruiting, *Mackenna* 68082
Furlough:
Commutation not desirable, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68363
Eight years' service before, should be reduced to four, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68363
Half, on full pay, proposal not approved, *Low* 68410
Recommendations *re*, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68363
any Improvements in other Services (excepting Civil and Military Services) should be extended to, *Barber* 68196
Officer should be allowed to take leave earned subject only to exigencies of the Service, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68363
Reserve:
Inadequacy of, *Butler* and *Milligan* ... 68363
Inadequacy and proposed remedies ... p. 260
Position, *Mackenna* 68082
no Real necessity for specialists, *Butler* 68392
Solely attached to Pusa, not approved, *Low* 68410
Special, will not be necessary if scientific assistants properly trained by experts, *Rangachariar* 68237
proposed Rules circulated for opinion of Government of India should be applicable to agricultural service, *Low* 68410
Rules should be same as for other European services, and study leave not necessary p. 259
Study:
Advocated, *Clarke* 68089, 60098
Desirable, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68363
Difficulty at present as Service understaffed, but might be considered if strength increased, *Low* 68410
not Necessary ... ... p. 259
Proposal for liberal system of, not supported, as India the best place for studying agricultural problems, *Mann* 68327
Regulations satisfactory if applied in more liberal spirit, but period might be raised, *Butler* 68404
for Research workers, necessary, *Butler*... 68403
Special regulations *re*, would be approved, *Mackenna* 68076
Vacancies filled by supernumeraries p. 260
(*see also under* Indians.)

Leave, Provincial Service:
Civil Service regulations should apply to all officers with maximum salary of at least Rs. 400 per annum, for leave out of India, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68119
Conditions, *Mackenna* 68055, 68059
Hardship of conditions, and proposed improvement, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117
Privilege, cumulative up to six months should be allowed, *Chakravarti* 68172
no Reserve for ... ... p. 260, p. 261
Study, recommendation *re*, *Mann*, 68303; *Ajrekar*, 68344.
(*see also under* Indians.)

Low, C. E., C.I.E., I.C.S., evidence of, 68405, 68433

Lower Subordinate Service, conditions, *Mackenna* 68061

M

Mackenna, J., I.C.S., evidence of ... 68044–68085

Madan Mohan Lal, Lala, evidence of ... 68114–68137

Madras:
Assistant Directors, not possible to recruit suitable men for all four posts of ... p. 269
Agriculturists, increase will probably be necessary in future ... ... p. 269
additional Botanist might be employed, *Barber* 68193

Madras—*continued.*
Director:
under Commissioner in Board of Revenue, and objection to system, *Barber* 68199, 68214, 68215
should be Open to both scientific specialists and agriculturists, *Barber* ... 68200, 68221
Post filled by civilian, but officers of Department given chance to prove fitness in temporary vacancies ... ... p. 268
District staff not in sufficient touch with research work, *Keatinge* 68258
District work, qualities required, *Barber* p. 265
Agricultural Expert, addition to service advocated ... ... p. 269
Imperial Service, staff ... ... p. 268, p. 269
Indians:
Europeans better fitted for work than, at present, *Barber* ... ... p. 265
Inclusion in higher posts, difficulty of problem and proposals, *Barber* ... ... p. 265–6
Recruitment system ... ... p. 267
Landowners, class taking interest in estates, *Barber* 68236
Memorandum by Government ... p. 266–9
History, Organisation, and Work of Department in *Barber* ... ... 68205–6, p. 263–7
Pay:
Rates, 1890, 1900, 1913 ... ... p. 269
Rates and allowances ... ... p. 268
Probation and training, arrangement unsatisfactory, and agriculturist should be trained in province ... ... p. 269
Provincial Service:
History of ... ... p. 268
Number of posts ... ... p. 269
Numbers and pay ... ... p. 269
Pay, too early to give opinion *re* ... ... p. 269
Qualifications ... ... p. 268
Recruitment method and language test p. 268–9
Recruitment, system ... ... p. 267
Scientific officers, disadvantage as compared with agriculturists, *Barber* 68200
(*see also under subject headings.*)

Mann, Dr. H. H., evidence of 68298–68339

Middleton, T. H. C. B., evidence of 68434–49

Milligan, S., evidence of 68359–68404

Muhammadans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 274–5

N

Nagpur Agricultural College:
Number of students, course, etc., *Low* ... 68424
Scholarships, *Low* 68426
Staff, *Low* 68424
Teaching, more being gradually turned over to Indian assistant professors, *Low* ... 68423

P

Parsis, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 273–5

Pay, Imperial Service:
Agriculturists, rate approved, but maximum reached too early, *Keatinge* 68260
Allowances should be given only where extra work and expense involved, *Clarke* ... 68093
Conditions, and comparison with other services *Clarke* 68088
Exile allowance for Europeans, question of, *Mann* 68302
Efficiency bar at Rs. 1000 or Rs. 1200, no objection to, with provision to ensure case being considered by higher authority, *Clarke* ... 68104
should be Fixed on same basis as that of educational officers ... ... p. 261
Grievances, *Woodhouse* 68138
Improvements advocated, *Barber* 68195
Inadequacy of, *Barber* 68193
Incremental scale advocated, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117
Initial:
Cases of, in direct appointments being higher than that of supernumeraries, and hardship, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68362

Pay, Imperial Service—*continued.*
INITIAL—*continued.*
Higher, required in some cases, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68362
of Specialists and agriculturists, must vary, *Barber* 68195, 68227
Leaving of service by officers for want of definite prospects above Rs. 1,000, *Clarke* ... 68110
LOCAL ALLOWANCES:
Insufficient and recommendation, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68362
Pusa, increase advocated, *Mackenna* ... 68048
MAXIMUM:
Inadequate, and increase proposed p. 263, p. 272–3
too Low, *Low* 68409
Reaching of, after 12 or 13 years service considered unsatisfactory by Bengal Government ... ... p. 260
Officers given definite assurances that present scale not intended to be maximum, *Clarke* 68110
DURING PROBATION:
Satisfactory, *Mann* 68301
Suggestion *re* rates and withdrawal of concession of free residence ... ... p. 261
Prospects should not be inferior to those of other professional services, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68362
Rate high enough for average men, but proportion might rise to higher maximum, *Mann* 68302
Rates of, and allowances ... ... p. 259–60
Recruitment of officers on special rates higher than that of men of equal standing, dissatisfaction caused by, but will disappear in future, *Mackenna* 68048
Recruitment being affected by, and increase advocated, *Clarke* 68097
Remedying of grievances by granting personal allowances, objections to system, *Clarke* 68088
Scale, *Mackenna*, 68048; *Woodhouse*, 68138; *Butler* and *Milligan*, 68362.
present Scale with allowances to selected officers unsatisfactory, *Woodhouse* 68146
proposed Scale, *Mackenna* 68048; *Clarke*, 68088; *Woodhouse*, 68138 (8), 68146; *Low*, 68409.
Scientific experts, comparison with Java and U.S.A., *Keatinge*, 68260.
Selection bar at Rs. 1,000 would be approved if not only a limited number of appointments above, *Barber* 68232
Supernumeraries posted to full charge of gazetted post on regular establishment should be brought on to establishment list in Rs. 500 grade, *Butler* and *Milligan* ... 68362
Talent money, as alternative to proposed scale, *Low* 68409
Time scale should be extended to higher maximum, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68361, 68362
Travelling allowance, insufficiency, *Low* ... 68409
(*see also under names of provinces, and under* Coimbatore.)

Pay, Provincial Service:
should be Assimilated to that of Provincial Civil Service ... ... p. 261
Discontent *re*, but would be removed if promotion to Imperial Service made easier, *Mann* 68332, 68338
Discrepancy between pay in Imperial Service and, too great, and suggestion *re* proportion, *Chakravarti* 68181
Inadequacy, *Madan Mohan Lal*, 68117; *Chakravarti*, 68171.
Inadequacy of, and recommendations *re* increase, *Ajrekar* 68343
Rates considered suitable, but maximum may have to be raised in future, *Keatinge* ... 68260
Scale adequate, except possibly towards end of service, *Keatinge* 68275
proposed Scales, *Madan Mohan Lal*, 68118, 68127–8; p. 273.
Scales under different Local Governments, *Mackenna* 68060

Pay, Provincial Service—*continued.*
Teaching assistants and subordinate service, proposed grading and scale, *Mackenna* ... 68056
Time scale, suggestion *re* ... ... p. 261
TRAVELLING ALLOWANCE:
First class, claim to, *Chakravarti* ... 68171
Insufficiency, *Low* 68409

Pensions, Imperial Service:
Additional, recommendation, *Woodhouse*, 68138 (8); *Barber*, 68197.
Gratuity to officer invalided before ten years' service advocated, *Low* 68411
Improvement, recommendation, *Barber* ... 68197
Indians, recommendations *re* period and period of probation, etc., abroad to count for, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68120
Insufficiency of, *Barber* 68197
Maximum, inadequacy of, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68364
Member appointed above 25, should count as service for, number of completed years age exceeded 25, *Mackenna*, 68047; *Woodhouse*, 68148.
Option of retiring after 10, 15, or 20 years on gratuity suggested, *Low* 68411, 68431
Recommendations, *Woodhouse* ... 68138 (8)
proposed Scales, *Butler* and *Milligan* ... 68364
System of progressive pensions starting after 17 years' service advocated, *Clarke* 68090, 68099
(*see also* Retirement, *and under names of provinces.*)

Pensions, Provincial Service, conditions, *Mackenna* 68055, 68059

Poona Agricultural College:
Assistant professors, qualifications and work of, *Keatinge* 68285–6
Comparison of training with English universities, *Mann* 68333
Educational qualification for admission, *Mann* 68315
Employment could not be offered to large portion of students in future, *Keatinge* 68297
some European professors desirable, *Keatinge* 68293
the Only college affiliated to a university, *Mackenna* 68084
Postgraduate work, facilities, *Keatinge* ... 68272
Staff, increase needed: research staff advocated, *Keatinge* 68256, 68272, 68287, 68289
Students, class of, etc., *Mann* 68315–7, 68325–6
Teaching, research and administrative functions should not be more separated, *Mann* 68305
Training at, sufficient for present needs, *Chakravarti* 68189
inadequate provision for certain classes of Work in, *Ajrekar* 68345

Probation and Training, Imperial Service:
Central college, advantage, *Clarke* ... 68111
at Central institution like Pusa not favoured, *Mann* 68301
in Chemistry, side by side with training in agriculture, possible in India, *Clarke* ... 68103
in England, university training preferred to that in agricultural colleges, *Middleton* ... 68439
in English farming desirable, *Middleton* ... 68441
Experts, proposals by Central Provinces Administration ... ... p. 272
Importance of, *Mann* 68299, 68300, 68309
OF INDIANS:
in England, no advantage to be gained, *Clarke*, 68103; suggestion *re*, *Barber*, 68210.
Going to England for experience in training, should go at older age than at present, *Middleton* 68446
High-class institution in India with post-graduate research preferable to course in England, *Mackenna* 68080
in India, preferable, *Middleton* 68447
Need for developing training in India, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68132
Scholarships for training abroad, suggestion, *Madan Mohan Lal*, 68132; *Ajrekar*, 68340.
Scientific, in India, scheme, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68115
Study leave in England after some years' service might be an advantage, *Woodhouse* 68144
Suggestion *re*, *Mann*, 68304; *Low*, 68420–1.

Probation and Training, Imperial Service—*continued.*
OF INDIANS—*continued.*
Suggestions, and importance of establishing first-class college in India with Indian environment, *Clarke* ... 68102, 68096, 68107–8
System of scholarships to England for special training not sufficient, *Clarke* 68091
Knowledge of agricultural economics and account keeping advocated ... ... p. 263
Men destined for district or teaching branches should be posted at once to provincial department, *Keatinge* 68259
Men trained abroad superior to those trained in India, *Chakravarti* 68187
Men under training should be allotted to individual provinces, *Low* 68406, 68407
One year's training in Indian conditions at Pusa, suggested by Government ... ... p. 260
Opinions *re*, *Woodhouse* 68159
Organisation of leave reserve on provincial basis, grouping Provinces with similar conditions into units, and posting of men to, for probation, scheme, *Clarke* ... 68087, 68105
Pay during (*see under* Pay).
PERIOD:
no Alteration necessary ... ... p. 269
One year advocated, and at least six months on experimental farm, *Chakravarti* ... 68170
Opinion *re*, *Mackenna* 68073
Reduction suggested ... ... p. 260
Reduction to two years suggested, *Barber* 68193
Three years advocated for officers without experience, and scheme, *Mann* 68301
if Three years retained, termination of service at any time after first year should be possible, and suggestion *re* passage money, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68360
Two years long enough, and rejections should be free, *Butler* 68384
Probationers, if unsuitable, should not be retained for full period of training, *Mackenna* 68046
of Provincial officers promoted to Imperial Service, year in approved European or American college advocated, *Chakravarti* ... 68170
Pusa officers might give opinion *re* confirmation of probationers, *Low* 68416, 68419
Recommendations *re* probation and deciding *re* suitability or not, *Low* 68407
Regulations considered satisfactory p. 262, p. 271
Reserve, inadequate, *Mackenna* 68074
Scheme, *Mann*, 68309–10, 68321; *Ajrekar*, 68341, 68357.
Scheme, and each Province or group of Provinces should have its own reserve, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68360, 68379
Scientific, suggestions by Central Provinces Administration ... ... p. 272
Specialists should have at least one year's training at Pusa, *Mackenna* 68046
System, *Mackenna*, 68046; considered satisfactory by Government, p. 259.
Termination of probationer's service before due date, on three months' notice, suggestion, *Mackenna* 68047
some Training desirable before men placed in full control, *Barber* 68231
Training of recruits in Province to which to be posted desirable, *Mackenna* 68046
VERNACULARS:
Examination, period for passing qualifying examination should be reduced and facilities given for learning language and inducements offered for passing higher standard examinations, *Clarke* 68085
System ... ... p. 267

Probation and Training, Provincial Service:
Course adequate, *Mackenna* 68058
Officers selected direct from colleges should undergo postgraduate course at Pusa or British or American college, and scheme, *Chakravarti* 68178, 68182
no Provision for ... ... p. 260, p. 261
Recommendation, *Rangachariar* 68238
Regulations considered satisfactory p. 261, p. 269
Scheme, *Ajrekar* 68341
System, *Mackenna* 68054

Professors, pay, proposed scale, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68118
(*see also* Assistant Professors.)

Promotion:
by Merit and not only seniority advocated, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117
further Period of probation should not be required, and salary of higher grade should be received from date of appointment, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68115
Waiting to reach maximum of grade before, should not be necessary, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117

Provincial Service:
Additional appointments advocated and scheme, *Chakravarti* 68171
Comparison of standard, etc., with Imperial service, *Mackenna* 68065
CONDITIONS:
Comparison with Provincial Civil Service and education service, *Madan Mohan Lal* ... 68117
Complaint *re*, *Madan Mohan Lal* ... 68117
DIVISION BETWEEN IMPERIAL SERVICE AND:
Division into demonstration branch and teaching and research branch, suggestion, *Low* 68414
(*see also under* Imperial Service.)
Indians only, *Mackenna* 68057
Names and qualifications of officers, *Chakravarti* 68177
Need for, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68365
Pay and prospects must be improved unless distinction from Imperial Service abolished, *Ajrekar* 68342, 68350
no Posts held outside authorised cadre p. 260, p. 261, p. 262, p. 269, p. 273
PROMOTION TO IMPERIAL SERVICE:
Course in foreign country advocated for, *Chakravarti* 68183
should be Easy, *Mann* 68302
System, *Mackenna* 68049
(*see also under* Indians.)
Provinces, recruitment system, *Mackenna* ... 68058
Provision should be made for promotion from Subordinate Service ... ... p. 261
at Pusa, explanation and position, *Mackenna* 68051
should be Put on same footing as other technical Provincial Services, *Chakravarti* ... 68171
Qualifications, *Mackenna* 68056, 68058
Selection of members of Subordinate Service for, suggestion by Central Provinces Administration ... ... p. 272
Service recruited in India, division into purely subordinate service, and distinct Provincial Service divided into lower and upper, scheme, *Clarke* 68096, 68106
Training of selected men in England at end of college careers or later, *Mackenna* ... 68080
(*see also under names of provinces.*)

Punjab:
Agricultural engineer asked for ... ... p. 258
more Assistant Directors required ... ... p. 258
Deputy Directors, increased number of ... p. 258
Number of posts in each grade, and need of leave reserve ... ... p. 258
PROVINCIAL SERVICE:
Comparison of conditions with Provincial Civil Service and provincial education service, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117
Memorandum 68114–68123
Rates of pay and allowance, and opinion of Government *re* ... ... p. 258
Recruitment, training and probation, regulations and opinion of Government *re* ... ... p. 258

Punjab College, class of students, criticism of teaching, etc., *Madan Mohan Lal*... 68134–5

Pusa Agricultural College and Research Institute:
Appointments, filling of, by promotion from Provinces, proposed, *Mann*, 68328–9; *Butler*, 68385, 68394; *Low*, 68417–8, 68430.
sending of Assistant Professors of provincial colleges to, for term of study in mycology and entomology would be approved, *Keatinge* 68286
as Central bureau for those working in Provinces, suggestion, *Mann* 68328–9

Pusa Agricultural College and Research Institute —*continued.*
as Central college for training of Indians, scheme, *Clarke* ... 68096, 68102, 68107–8, 68111
should be Centre of research in India, *Butler* 68376
as Central training institution, not the same scientific atmosphere in India as in Europe and America, *Madan Mohan Lal* ... 68126
Functions, *Low* 68408
Gazetted officers should be on same footing as regards pay and prospects as provincial officers in Provinces, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68365
Higher research work and reduction of teaching to a minimum except for very advanced post-graduate Indian students desired, *Mackenna* 68062
IMPERIAL EXPERT STAFF:
Functions of, and need for higher status in order to fulfil, *Low* 68408
Recruitment, proposed method, *Low* ... 68409
Inspector-General, lack of suitable qualifications in the past, and suggestion *re* qualifications and improving position, *Low* ... 68408
should be Institution for promotion and encouragement of research, and post-graduate research training should be only training undertaken, *Butler* 68375
Officiating vacancies of six months and over should be filled by selection from best men from Provinces, *Mackenna* 68045
Opinion *re* work of, and training, *Barber* ... 68218
Pay, Provincial, rates of, *Mackenna*... 68081, 68052
Position of, in Agricultural Department, *Butler* p. 269–71
Post-graduate course, reasons for failure, *Clarke* 68107
Purpose of, *Butler* ... ... p. 276
Reconstitution of staff and duties, scheme, *Low* 68408, 68416–9
Recruitment, Imperial Service, by selection from best men in Provinces advocated, *Mackenna* 68045
Recruitment, Provincial Service system, and considered satisfactory, *Mackenna* ... 68053
Relations with Provinces, *Butler* ... 68393–7
Relations with provincial departments, proposal, *Low* 68416
Reluctance of men to take posts at, *Barber* 68222
Remodelling advocated, *Low* 68407
RESEARCH WORK:
Importance of ... ... p. 270–1
Nature of work that should be undertaken, *Butler* 68376
(*see also* Research Work.)
Salaries should be improved, *Butler* 68385
Special allowances at, illusory, *Barber* ... 68222
Staff to consist of officers in high positions near end of service to form advisory board, question of, *Keatinge* 68266
Staff sanctioned in 1904, and pay, and since, *Mackenna* 68051
Subordinate staff, grades and number of posts, *Mackenna* 68051
Training of European supernumaries at, results not entirely satisfactory, *Low* 68407

R

Rangachariar Avargal, evidence of ... 68234–68255

Recruitment, Imperial Service:
Adversely affected by poor prospects and low pay, *Woodhouse* 68138, 68163
Adverse effect on, of posts being held by members of Indian Civil Service not a serious factor, *Middleton* 68442
AGE:
Average, 25 and 26, *Clarke* 68095
Higher, would be approved, to obtain more experience of research work in England, *Woodhouse* 68149, 68157
Question, *Middleton* 68443
Twenty-six more suitable than twenty-eight, *Clarke* 68095
Allotment of men to particular areas desirable, *Middleton* 68444
Candidates, passing through agricultural course at Cambridge should not be insisted on, *Barber* 68225
Class, etc., of recruits, *Woodhouse* 68146
by Committee would be approved, with strict power to reject probationers ... ... p. 258
Competitive examination unsuitable, *Drake* 68451
no Difference need be made between Europeans and Indians and those trained in England or India, given proper probation, etc., *Mann* 68299
Difficulty, and possibly due to question of pay, *Mackenna* 68075
Difficulty in getting right type owing to demand in England, but improvement anticipated, *Middleton* 68435, 68440, 68442
of Europeans, should gradually stop under scheme for recruitment of Indians, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68115, 68125
Example of methods, *Drake* 68451
preliminary Experience desirable, but training in Belgium or Italy better than England or America, *Mann* 68320
India should become exclusively the recruiting ground, and suggested sources, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68115, 68125
India Office should have method of registering names of candidates, *Butler* 68399
Indian Government should have no voice in, beyond supplying details of qualifications required, *Clarke* 68109
OF INDIANS TO IMPERIAL SERVICE:
Admission that only those capable would be appointed would be better than setting apart listed posts, *Rangachariar*... ... 68252
Applications to Secretary of State in England for appointment, *Mackenna* 68065
Best class would be attracted with prospect of selection to Provincial Service and promotion to Imperial Service, *Barber* ... 68212
Degree from agricultural college in India should qualify, *Mackenna* 68067
for Demonstration side by selection preferred, and scheme, *Milligan* 68378
Desired and method preferred, *Mann* 68312–3, 68322–3
Direct:
would be Approved if Indians obtained degree in India and afterwards did well as scientific research student at Cambridge, *Barber* 68227
Objected to, *Barber* 68211
Objected to unless first thoroughly tested in England, *Barber* 68209
Probation, scheme, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68116
Increase advocated, *Rangachariar*... ... 68237
Indians only will be possible in future, *Mann* 68335, 68351
Limitation to 50 per cent. suggested, *Clarke* 68108
Probation of certain youths abroad in most up-to-date laboratories, scheme, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68115, 68116, 68125
by Promotion from Provincial Service:
Preferred to promotion from Subordinate Service to Provincial, and then from Provincial, *Rangachariar* 68248
Preferred to direct appointment from English university, *Mackenna* ... 68049
Subsequent training in England preferred, *Keatinge* 68274
Recommendations and suggestions *re*, *Clarke*, 68096; *Barber*, 68209, 68217; *Earle*, p. 262; *Rangachariar*, 68245; *Low*, 68412, 68414.
for Research side, recruitment from men working in Government laboratories, with subsequent study leave to England preferred, *Butler* 68377, 68387–8
Scheme, *Woodhouse* 68160–1
Selection in India, scheme, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68115
Selection in India, and subsequent special course in England preferred, *Mackenna* 68066, 68079
Trained in India, difficulties, and suggestions, *Clarke* 68091
Method, list kept of all suitable people, *Middleton*... ... ... 68437–8, 68445, 68448
Number of officers (Europeans and Indians) appointed by Secretary of State, 1904-14, *Drake* 68452

Recruitment, Imperial Service—*continued.*
of Officers under special agreement, permanent appointments may be offered to, and suggestion *re* ... ... p. 268
of Older men on short term agreements, opinion *re, Woodhouse* 68158
Preference should be given to members of Provincial Service, *Ajrekar* 68342
Proposals by officers of Madras service worth consideration ... ... p. 269
from Provincial Service (*see under* Promotion *under* Provincial Service).
Qualifications advocated, *Keatinge*, 68290; *Butler* and *Milligan*, 68359, 68370–1; *Low*, 68406; *Drake*, 68451; *Middleton*, 68436.
Qualifications required in, *Barber*, 68216–36; *Mann*, 68298, 68308, 68311, 68319–20; *Ajrekar*, 68340.
Recruits not satisfactory, reasons and suggestions for improvement, *Barber* ... 68192
Regular Annual Recruitment:
might have some Effect, but probably not much, *Middleton* 68440
Scheme, *Low* 68406
Reserve should be mainly provincial, and men be immediately appointed to a particular province, *Low* 68406
Rules for appointments ... ... p. 276–7
Secretaries of universities' appointments boards might be approached, *Middleton* 68448–9
Selection:
Advocated, with preference to Indians, and scheme, *Ajrekar* 68340, 68346
Assistance of persons thoroughly acquainted with conditions desirable, *Drake* ... 68451
Board:
Advocated, and proposed constitution, *Butler* and *Milligan*... ... 68359, 68368
Proposal approved, and possibility of, *Middleton* 68438
Suggestion deserves consideration ... p. 269
at Early age and subsequent course in agricultural college not advocated, *Barber* ... 68226
by Secretary of State, unsatisfactory and selection by Board advocated and proposed constitution, *Clarke* 68086, 68095
of Senior men in certain subjects to permanent posts at about 35, useful in some cases but substantial salary necessary, *Butler* ... 68386
of Short term specialists, not approved, *Barber*, 68219; *Butler*, 68386.
System, *Mackenna* 68045, 68063
Approved and formal committee of selection not desired, but objection to making recruitments to fill actual vacancies, *Low* ... 68406
and Regulations considered satisfactory p. 259, p. 271, p. 272
Unsatisfactory, and definite policy advocated, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68359, 68368
Satisfactory, *Keatinge*, 68257, 68288; *Mann*, 68299, 68314.
Vacancies not announced, and members of Provincial Service not aware of, *Ajrekar* ... 68357

Recruitment, Provincial Service:
Class of recruits unsatisfactory owing to conditions of service, *Barber* ... 68206, 68192, 68202
Difficulty in getting suitable recruits, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68365
Direct from agricultural college or from science graduates of universities, dependent on duties to be performed, *Mackenna* ... 68083
Regulations satisfactory ... p. 261, p. 262, p. 269
by Selection advocated, with preference to Indians when available, and scheme, *Ajrekar* 68340, 68346
Selection Board, suggestion *re*, *Barber* 68192, 68202
partly from Subordinate Service and partly by direct nomination advocated, *Rangachariar* 68237
from Sons of zemindars desirable if agricultural equipment in village schools adequate, *Mackenna* 68085
System, *Mackenna* 68049

Recruitment, Provincial Service—*continued.*
System approved, *Chakravarti*, 68169; *Keatinge*, 68257.
Two-thirds of total number of appointments should be filled from agricultural graduates and one-third by promotion, *Chakravarti* 68169, 68179

Relations with other Departments:
Closer co-operation with Educational Department desirable as regards agricultural training in primary schools, *Chakravarti* 68175
closer Inter-relation with Revenue Departments desirable, *Ajrekar* 68347
Relations with Education and Irrigation Departments, *Mackenna* 68050
Relations with Indian Civil Service, *Mackenna* 68050
Relations with other services and importance of close and friendly relations with Indian Civil Service and Irrigation and Forest Departments, *Keatinge* 68262
Transfer of officers to Revenue Department occasionally, desirable, *Ajrekar*... 68347, 68356

Research:
Officers:
Few willing to take on demonstration work until keenness for research work lost, *Butler* 68391
Free inter-communication between officers needed, not measures to prevent overlapping *Mann* 68330
Interchanges between administrative officers and, no objection to, if limited to suitable cases, *Keatinge* 68281
Need for wide field of choice, and conditions of service must depend on individual case, *Keatinge* 68258
Time occupied by, in teaching, *Butler* ... 68374
Work:
Centres in Provinces desirable, *Keatinge* 68266, 68281, 68295
Combination with certain amount of teaching possible, but some men whose primary duty would be research desired, *Keatinge* 68256, 68265
Divorce from district work impossible, *Mann* 68334
Objection to overlapping of, *Low* 68425
(*see also under* Indians, *and under* Pusa.)

Reserve, suggestions *re*, *Barber* 68193, 68202–3, 68198

Retirement:
Officers over 30 on appointment should be allowed to count as service number of years by which age exceeds 30, *Butler* and *Milligan* ... 68361
Recommendations *re* period of service, *Mackenna*, 68077; *Clarke*, 68090, 68099; *Madan Mohan Lal*, 68120, 68126; *Woodhouse*, 68138 (8); *Chakravarti*, 68173, 68185; *Ajrekar*, 68344, 68356; *Butler* and *Milligan*, 68361, 68364, 68380; *Low*, 68411.
After 25 years' service would be approved by Lieutenant-Governor of United Provinces, but if granted, proposals as to progressive pensions after 17 years' service would be objected to ... ... p. 259

Rural Commissioners:
suggested Appointment, *Mackenna* 68050, 68071, 68072
would be Approved if work developed to any considerable extent, *Keatinge* ... 68277, 68279
Opinion *re* proposal, *Low* 68432–3
Post would normally be held by Indian Civil Service officer, *Mackenna* 68072
Proposal approved, *Woodhouse*, 68162; *Barber*, 68223.
Proposal approved, if scheme did not result merely in appointment of additional secretary, *Barber* 68214
Scheme practicable, but desire that officer should also be a secretary to Government, *Clarke* 68113
Scheme generally agreed with, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68382–3

S

Sabour Agricultural College:
Appointment bureau, proposal, *Woodhouse* 68138 (16)
Biological section, particulars *re* work done by, present position, and need for two botanists, one to do plant breeding and the other to supervise teaching and crop-pest work, *Woodhouse* 68138 (9–12)
additional Botanist necessary, *Woodhouse* 68138 (28)
Candidates now entering, unsuited to agricultural profession, *Woodhouse* ... 68150, 68167
Closing of, not advocated, but activities should be reduced, *Woodhouse* 68146
Courses, and scheme, *Woodhouse* 68138 (24) (27)
Diploma Course:
Admission of students, and suggestion, *Woodhouse* 68138 (18)
Curriculum, *Woodhouse* 68138 (15)
Education at, recommendations, *Woodhouse* 68138 (27)
Failure, reasons for, *Woodhouse* 68138
Indian professors might be employed in some cases for teaching work, *Woodhouse* ... 68141
Indians for post-graduate course, no objection to, if they worked under research officers, *Woodhouse* 68142
Object of, *Woodhouse* 68138 (14), (24)
Principal, duties of, *Woodhouse* ... 68138 (13)
Proposals for increasing popularity of, *Woodhouse* 68138 (16)
Recommendations, *Woodhouse* ... 68138 (26–8)
as Research Centre:
Retention advocated and suggestion *re* staff, *Woodhouse* 68141
Room for, as well as Pusa, *Woodhouse* ... 68145
Scheme *re*, *Woodhouse* 68150–6
Short courses, *Woodhouse* 68138 (17)
Staff, frequent transfers and objection to, *Woodhouse* 68138 (22)
Standard curriculum defects, *Woodhouse* 68138 (23)
Teaching, organisation of, and recommendation, *Woodhouse* 68138 (25)
Training at, sufficient for present needs, *Chakravarti* 68182, 68189

Scientists:
present Courses in universities not calculated to bring out right type, but a distinct qualification in many cases, *Mann* 68324
From outside India, employment of, should be gradually stopped as Indians develop, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68114
Indians, increase of, steps should be taken and suggested means, *Madan Mohan Lal* ... 68114
Need for training abroad, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68125

Sibpur College, landholders at, *Chakravarti*... 68189

Sikhs, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 274, 275

Specialists:
Special recruitment of, for short terms, etc., not favoured, *Clarke* 68104
Terms of service should depend on circumstances, *Ajrekar* 68351
Training, proposal, *Clarke* 68104

Study Leave (*see under* Leave).

Subordinate Service, pay and prospects should be improved to attract best class, and suggestion, *Clarke* 68091
(*see also under* Provincial Service *and* Burma.)

Sudras, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 274–5

Supernumeraries:
all Fully employed, *Mackenna* 68083
Pay:
Continuance on pay of supernumerary grade even after posting to substantial appointments, and complaint, *Woodhouse* ... 68138
Proposed, *Clarke* 68088
Scale and recommendation, *Mackenna* 68048; p. 268
(*see also under* Probation and Training, Imperial Service.)

T

Tahsildarships, men having drawn salary of Rs. 150 in general agricultural line for three years should be eligible for, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117, 68121

Teachers, interchange between various provinces, no necessity for, *Mackenna* 68070

Teaching and Research Assistants, should be styled Assistant Lecturers and Demonstrators, and one attached to each Professor, *Madan Mohan Lal* 68117

Training (*see* Probation and Training).

Travelling Allowances (*see under* Pay).

U

United Provinces:
Agricultural college, position, *Clarke* ... 68106
Director of Agriculture in, departmental officer as, proposal objected to by Lieutenant-Governor ... ... p. 258–9
Indians, unsuitability for higher posts, reasons p. 259
Memorandum by Government ... p. 258–9
Memorandum of officers of Indian Agricultural Service 68086–68093
Pay, increased maximum advocated by Lieutenant-Governor, with special grade on Rs. 1750 to be filled by selection ... p. 258
Provincial Service, officers not likely in near future to be able to take place of officers of Imperial Service on leave ... ... p. 258
Vernaculars, high standard desirable ... p. 258

V

Veterinary Department (*see* Civil Veterinary Department).

W

Woodhouse, E. J., evidence of 68138–68168

Work of Department:
Administrative duties should be separated from teaching and research, *Ajrekar* 68347
more Interest being taken in work of, by classes associated with the land, *Chakravarti* 68180–1, 68186
Large number of men leaving for other employment, *Butler* and *Milligan* 68361
Missionary functions of, and aims, *Mann* ... 68298
Teaching, research and administrative functions should not be more separated, *Mann* ... 68305
Value of, *Woodhouse* 68138 (7)
Teaching:
Raising of, to highest standard possible, and advantage of, *Chakravarti* 68191
Recasting of policy, suggestion *Mackenna* 68067
Standard of lecturing in India probably as good as in England, but no comparison made as regards teaching, *Mackenna* 68067
(*see also* Agricultural Colleges *and under names of provinces.*)

APPENDIX

TO THE

REPORT

OF

THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XV.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

RELATING TO THE

CIVIL VETERINARY DEPARTMENT,

Taken at Delhi, Calcutta, Madras, Bombay, and London,

WITH

APPENDICES.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	298
Minutes of Evidence	299
Appendices	327
Index	343

LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION.

PAGE.

At DELHI, Tuesday, 11th November, 1913.

COLONEL H. T. PEASE, C.I.E., Principal, Punjab Veterinary College 299
LIEUTENANT-COLONEL J. FARMER, Chief Superintendent, Veterinary Department, Punjab 299

At CALCUTTA, Thursday, 22nd January, 1914.

MAJOR A. SMITH, Principal of the Bengal Veterinary College 305
E. H. BRAND, Esq., Assistant Principal, Bengal Veterinary College 307

At MADRAS, Monday, 26th January, 1914.

D. A. D. AITCHISON, Esq., Principal, Madras Veterinary College 310
G. T. D'SILVA, Esq., Assistant Principal, Madras Veterinary College 311

At BOMBAY, Monday, 9th February, 1914.

J. D. BUXY, Esq., Deputy Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, Bombay 313
K. HEWLETT, Esq., Principal, Bombay Veterinary College 315

At LONDON, Monday, 4th May, 1914.

F. C. DRAKE, Esq., Secretary, Revenue and Statistics Department, India Office 326

At LONDON, Wednesday, 6th May, 1914.

LIEUTENANT-COLONEL A. E. QUERIPEL 321

At LONDON, Thursday, 7th May, 1914.

SIR JOHN M'FADYEAN, M.B., B.SC., M.R.C.V.S., LL.D., Principal, Royal Veterinary College, London ... 324

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

CIVIL VETERINARY DEPARTMENT,

At Delhi, Tuesday, 11th November, 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, Esq., C.I.E.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

COLONEL H. T. PEASE, C.I.E., Principal, Punjab Veterinary College; and
LIEUTENANT-COLONEL J. FARMER, Chief Superintendent, Veterinary Department, Punjab.

Written Statement by the officers of the Civil Veterinary Department serving in the Punjab.*

69244. (*1*) *Establishment of the Veterinary School.*—So far as Northern India is concerned the first serious attempt to train Indians in veterinary science was the establishment of the Veterinary School at Lahore by the Military Department of the Punjab Government. This was carried out in 1882 on the recommendation of a special committee. The original scheme contemplated the provision of assistants sufficiently well trained to assist the Veterinary Officers in the horse-breeding districts, transport, and Indian Cavalry. The Committee decided that what was required was a class of men who would be satisfied with moderate pay and who could take the place of the old salutris who had no training at all.

(*2*) *Course of study.*—The standard of education was very elementary, the men being taught to treat simple diseases by rule of thumb. An attempt was made to advance from this position in 1886, but the proposals were disapproved by the Government of India, who, in the letter No. 124 D, Military Department, dated 14th January, 1887, remarked that the course of study appeared to be in advance of the class of man from which the pupils were taken and possibly of what would be required of them in the posts to which they were likely to be appointed. They recognised that the primary education of the students was very low and recommended an even more elementary and practical course of veterinary instruction.

(*3*) *Standard of education raised.*—The question of cattle disease in the districts was discussed in 1882 and it appeared that some districts had already employed unqualified men to attempt to deal with it. With the extension of cultivation and the consequent rise in value of draught cattle the question of dealing with cattle plagues assumed more importance and the districts began to employ veterinary assistants for the purpose. It was soon found that the duties expected of the men had become far more important and that the standard of education which they had received was not sufficiently high. In the year 1900 therefore a conference on veterinary education was held at Ambala and the present course was prescribed, the period of training being extended from two to three years. Many new subjects were added to the course, but no increase of staff was obtained until 1904 when the Ajmer College was closed, and the students and teachers transferred to Lahore.

(*4*) *Subordinate Department created.*—In 1901 a subordinate veterinary Department was created by

* This statement was signed by the following officers:—Colonel H. T. Pease (Principal, Punjab Veterinary College), Lieut.-Col. J. Farmer (Chief Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, Punjab), Major G. K. Walker (Professor of Sanitary Science, Punjab Veterinary College), Mr. V. de V. H. Woodley (Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, N. W. F. Province and North Punjab), Mr. H. E. Cross (Camel Specialist), Mr. G. Taylor (Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, South Punjab), Mr. R. Branford (Superintendent, Government Cattle Farm, Hissar), Mr. W. A. Pool (officer under training), Mr. E. Burke (Professor of Surgery, Punjab Veterinary College), Khan Sahib S. Mahtab Shah (Professor of Anatomy, Punjab Veterinary College), Khan Sahib S. Sardar Shah (Professor of Cattle Pathology, Punjab Veterinary College), Mr. Ghulam Hussain Khan (Hospital Surgeon, Punjab Veterinary College).

amalgamating the men hitherto employed under local bodies with the staff already working in the horse-breeding department. The number of men was 102, of which 31 were occupied in horse-breeding work only. They were under three Superintendents, who were Imperial Officers. Two of these officers devoted their time entirely to horse-breeding duties. In 1903, owing to the transfer of Imperial horse-breeding to the Army Remount Department, the staff was reduced by one superintendent and 34 assistants. In 1904 the grade of Veterinary Inspector was sanctioned and six selected veterinary assistants were appointed. In 1905 a third Imperial Officer was sanctioned for the district work and a third Imperial Officer for the College. These appointments had become necessary owing to the rapid development of the Department and the increase in the work.

(5) *The present position.*—The staff employed in the districts at the end of the year 1911-12 consisted of three superintendents of which one was shared with the North-West Frontier Province, 15 inspectors, and 169 assistants. In the past 11 years the number of hospitals has increased from 7 to 109 and the number of animals treated from 76,796 to 300,719. In 1901-02 when animals were first inoculated against disease in the field, 1,306 inoculations were carried out and in 1910-11 103,714 were performed. It has recently been found necessary to still further improve the standard of education to provide more highly trained graduates and a scheme for this purpose is under consideration. Another scheme for the creation of a grade of Deputy Superintendents for district work has been submitted to Government and it has been proposed to select these officers from the grade of inspector.

In order to improve the qualifications of inspectors a post-graduate course of one year at the College has been sanctioned. It will be brought into effect as soon as the necessary accommodation has been provided.

(6) *Present staff.*—The present constitution of the Civil Veterinary Department in the Punjab is:—

(*a*) *Imperial Officers*—(1) Army officers transferred to Civil employ; (2) Civil officers appointed by the Secretary of State for India.

(*b*) *Provincial Officers* appointed by the Local Government.

(*c*) *Veterinary Inspectors.*

(*d*) *Veterinary Assistants* appointed by the Chief Superintendent with the approval of the Director of Agriculture.

The Imperial Officers transferred from the Army Veterinary Corps accepted the rules which relate to their conditions of service in 1901. All the officers had been for some time in Civil employ. Their services were permanently transferred. Their rules have been repeatedly revised and have been the subject of considerable controversy.

69245. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—No more Military officers are now being recruited. The present system of selection of Imperial officers by the Secretary of State for India appears to be satisfactory. The system of recruitment of the Provincial Service is also satisfactory.

69246. **(II) Systems of Training and Probation.**—*Training of Imperial officers.*—The system of training officers in the Punjab is satisfactory in principle. Newly joined officers are posted for training under senior officers. It is considered necessary that the period of training should extend to at least two years and that officers should not be called upon to officiate in responsible appointments before the expiration of this period. Every facility should be given to newly joined officers to learn the vernacular. If possible, young officers should be deputed during their first hot weather to the Imperial Laboratory to gain experience in contagious diseases as they occur in India. With regard to probation it is agreed that five years is too long. Three years should be sufficient.

Training of Provincial Staff.—The system of training the Provincial Staff has already been referred to. Sanction has been given for a post-graduate course for Inspectors. In order to improve the standard of training it appears necessary to establish a second vernacular college for Northern India. The classes in the present College are far too large as has repeatedly been pointed out by the Board of Examiners. A somewhat higher preliminary education standard should be demanded and the professional course of study should be extended to four years.

69247. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—*Abolition of Inspector-Generalship.*—The fact that the rules for the officers transferred from the Army have proved controversial has already been stated. The Department was started as an Imperial Service with an Inspector-General at its head and the best men were tempted from the Army Veterinary Corps to transfer to the Indian Civil Veterinary Department on the understanding that they would remain under the direction of a professional head and that the best appointments in the various provinces would be open to the best qualified officers including that of Inspector-General. Later Civilian officers were recruited under practically the same conditions of service and the fact that there was a desirable appointment in the shape of the Inspector-Generalship has been held out as an inducement to join. On the 31st March, 1912, the post of Inspector-General was abolished and the result is that owing to his loss there is no cohesion in the professional work in the various Provinces and the Government of India have no veterinary adviser. The abolition of this appointment has had a most disheartening effect on the officers of the Department, who regard it as a breach of faith on the part of Government. It is bitterly resented and there is not a single military officer who does not regret that he transferred his services from Military to Civil employ.

Appointments and selection.—The policy adopted by the Government of India in filling important appointments carrying extra allowances in the various Provinces has operated very unfairly on many senior officers and is contrary to the spirit of the rules. Experienced and approved officers have not been treated with any consideration in this matter, young and inexperienced ones having been given desirable appointments irrespective of the claims of senior men. In a small Department the tendency to the provincialisation of the officers is bound to cause irregular promotion and consequent dissatisfaction. At present Imperial officers are uneasy, as they do not know in whose hands their official careers are placed, and this gives rise to much uncertainty. This is especially the case in regard to promotion to the rank of Lieutenant-Colonel, which under the rules for Army officers is to be made by selection. It is not understood how it is possible to exercise selection fairly, now that there is no professional head of the Department to give advice in the matter, and the Government of India have no adequate means of judging the relative claims of officers employed immediately under them and under the provincial Government.

Provincial Staff. Insecurity of Service.—In regard to the provincial staff employed in the Punjab, one matter which causes considerable dissatisfaction is the insecurity of the conditions of service. So long as the Service is provincial, carrying pension and ensuring supervision and direction by professional officers who understand the work and conditions, the men are contented and work well. Any attempt to change the conditions of service leads to great unrest and uncertainty, reacts unfavourably on the recruitment of students, the training at the College, and is prejudicial to the interests of Government and of the public.

69248. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—*Rates of pay.*—The salaries of the different branches of the Service may be briefly summarised as follows:—

(*a*) Army officers in Civil employ receive their army pay plus Civil allowances ranging from Rs. 150 to Rs. 500 per mensem according to rank.

(*b*) Imperial officers appointed by the Secretary of State commence on Rs. 500 per mensem and receive an annual increment of Rs. 40 up to Rs. 1,100 when the increments cease. On attaining 21 years' service the pay is Rs. 1,200 per mensem.

(*c*) The salary of the abolished post of Inspector-General was Rs. 2,000 per mensem.

(*d*) The pay of the Provincial Officers at the Punjab Veterinary College ranges from Rs. 200 to Rs. 400 per mensem. One officer is in receipt of Rs. 625 per mensem; but this is a special case. Deputy Superintendents, when appointed, will probably receive Rs. 200 to Rs. 400 per mensem.

(*e*) The assistant teachers at the College draw salaries ranging from Rs. 45 to Rs. 200 per mensem.

(*f*) Veterinary Inspectors commence on Rs. 75 per mensem and receive two septennial increments of Rs. 25 per mensem to bring their pay up to Rs. 125.

(*g*) Veterinary Assistants are paid Rs. 30, Rs. 40 or Rs. 50 per mensem, according to their grades. All the above are subject to the ordinary rules regarding leave, and all ranks are pensionable. The pension of the Inspector-General was £700 per annum.

The Provincial Staff employed at the College and the Veterinary Assistants have had their salaries revised fairly recently. The pay of the Imperial Officers and the Inspectors was fixed when the cost of the necessaries was considerably less. Better conditions are indicated. The abolition of the post of Inspector-General has affected the prospects of some of the Imperial Officers very seriously, and compensation in both pay and pension should be given.

Increase of pay necessary.—The civil allowances of Lieutenant-Colonels and Colonels should be increased. At present there is no increase in the Civil allowances after 20 years' service.

Military officers.—The pay and pension of military officers depend on their rank promotion and not on length of service. When the Department was formed this fact did not receive sufficient consideration, and the consequence is that a number of officers of very much the same standing were recruited and a serious block in promotion has resulted. If the present rules are adhered to, it is possible that some officers might never be promoted to the rank of Lieutenant-Colonel, however deserving they might be, whilst a more fortunately placed officer has been promoted Lieutenant-Colonel at 17½ years' service. The only way to remedy this anomaly is to introduce a time-scale as in other Services. Majors should be promoted to Lieutenant-Colonels at 20 years' service as in the Indian Medical Service.

Civilian officers.—Civilian Veterinary Officers should have their pay increased by annual increments of Rs. 50 per mensem up to the pay of a Lieutenant-Colonel and a senior selected officer *should receive Rs. 1,800 per mensem.*

Provincial Staff.—It may be stated that none of the provincial staff are satisfied with their present rates of pay, and this is a matter which militates against obtaining better material for training. It is hardly to be expected that men who have passed the entrance examination of an Indian University will be induced to take a four years' course in scientific training by the pay now offered to Veterinary Assistants.

69249. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—It is understood that improved conditions of leave are contemplated for the Civil Service, and these will naturally be applied to all officers serving under the conditions laid down in the Civil Service Regulations. All officers should be allowed furlough pay at the minimum rate of £500 per annum.

Furlough reserve.—The question of furlough reserve in each Province is an important one. Since the abolition of the post of Inspector-General no adequate arrangements appear to have been made to carry out the rules regulating furlough. Arrangements for filling furlough vacancies should be made in each Province, an adequate reserve being maintained. In the Punjab two reserve officers at least are required in addition to the officers under training.

Study leave.—Imperial officers should be encouraged to avail themselves of post-graduate instruction when on furlough. The recent reduction in study leave allowances for Military officers of the Department has caused dissatisfaction.

69250. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Military officers of 30 years' service should be entitled to a consolidated pension of £700 per annum to bring them in line with other Services (Indian Army and Indian Medical Service). Civilian officers should be allowed good service pensions of Rs. 1,000 per annum as granted to other Departments.

69251. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, etc.**—It has been shown above that until better prospects are offered and the standard of education is improved, it is not possible to give many more higher appointments to non-Europeans than those offered at present.

As many superior appointments as possible are at present held by non-Europeans at the Veterinary College. The men have been specially selected and trained by the European Staff and are quite satisfactory as teachers. Deputy Superintendents should he capable of carrying out the work of Superintendents under the general supervision of the latter, who must be European officers.

There should be one Superintendent or Deputy Superintendent for each revenue division of five or six districts, and eventually, as qualified men become available, charge of half the number of divisions might be held by Deputy Superintendents (non-Europeans). It is recommended that eventually each district should have its own district Veterinary Officer, the district being the most convenient administrative unit.

69252. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—*The Director of Agriculture.*—The arrangement under which the local head of the Department is a Director of Agriculture has hitherto worked fairly well, but it is felt that when the Department grows stronger it would be more satisfactory to select its head from among its own members. So long as a civilian Director of Agriculture is prepared to accept the advice of his veterinary officers and content himself with administration only, there is no great objection to the present system, but any interference in professional matters is naturally resented. It has been stated that the appointment of Director of Agriculture might eventually be given to an officer of the Agricultural Department. This would not be acceptable to this Department even if the appointment of Director of Agriculture was made equally open to a veterinary officer.

A Bureau of Agriculture.—It is suggested that a Bureau of Agriculture should be formed by the Government of India in charge of a senior officer of the Civil Service and that he should be given the assistance of two advisers, one veterinary and one agricultural, on an equal footing. These officers would practically be the heads of their respective Departments and would have the benefit of the administrative authority of a member of the premier Service. This is a system very generally adopted in western countries and is found to work satisfactorily on the whole.

Colonel Pease and Lieutenant-Colonel Farmer called and examined.

69253. (*Chairman.*) Colonel Pease said the written statement which had been sent to the Committee represented the unanimous views of the Veterinary Service in the Punjab. Recruitment from the Army to the Veterinary Service had ceased in 1901, but there were still ten military officers remaining in the Department.

69254. He did not think the present method of selection could be improved. In selecting candidates the Secretary of State took the advice of Sir John M'Fadyean, the Principal of the Royal Veterinary College in London, and he also had the assistance of a retired member of the Civil Veterinary Department, Colonel

Queripel, so that in practice, Indian experience was represented on the Selection Committee. The work of the Veterinary Department at the present time was almost entirely devoted to cattle. He thought all candidates for the Imperial branch of the Service should have a diploma of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons, and take a post-graduate course in one of the branches of veterinary science. He did not think insistence on those qualifications would in any way unduly limit the area of selection. The average age of recruits was 27, which he thought rather old, but it had been impossible to obtain men who had been through a post-graduate course at a younger age. There was no precise age-limit, but he thought it would be better from the point of view of the service that a man should come out younger; he would fall into the ways of the country more quickly and learn more easily.

69255. With regard to the comparative merits of a system for the direct recruitment of Indians and of a system for the promotion of Indians from the subordinate ranks, witness said it was very difficult to give an answer in the case of the Veterinary Department. Veterinary education in India was started in 1882 by the Military Department, who found a lack of men who could assist veterinary officers in minor operations. Those men were supposed to work in the Army Remount Department, and also in the native cavalry regiments, and they dealt largely with horse veterinary work. Men were selected who had some knowledge of animals and how to handle them. They went through a very short and elementary course of training at a veterinary college in the Punjab. This went on until 1886, when the Department thought it was not obtaining good enough men and suggested that the course should be somewhat improved. After consideration, the Military Department decided that they did not want any better men and would not improve the course, because they said that the men who were being taken into the Service were not qualified to go through any severer course of training. Nothing was done to improve veterinary education until the time of the conference to which reference had been made in the written statement. Then a three years' course was inaugurated, and certain subjects were added to the curriculum.

69256. It was found at the present time that this course was not sufficient for the requirements of the Department, and a course lasting as long as the English course had been suggested, which it was thought would provide the Department with Indians who would be capable of becoming Deputy Superintendents. Such Deputy Superintendents would be placed either in teaching institutions as teachers, or in charge of districts under the general supervision of English superintendents. So far the Department had not produced any Indians who were capable of taking independent charge. There were certain selected men in the Department who had been doing the work of a European in so far as teaching was concerned, under supervision, and they had worked exceedingly well. It was hoped that in the future Deputy Superintendents would be able to take charge of divisions. At the present time there were three such Deputy Superintendents sanctioned for districts in the Punjab, and there were three in the Punjab Veterinary College. Men in the rank and file would be eligible for promotion to the post of Deputy Superintendent. The best men would be selected, sent to the Punjab College to take a post-graduate course, and if they passed the examination which would be held at the end of the course, they would be given the appointment. From the present time, therefore, there would be two methods of recruitment. There would be officers entering direct after a post-graduate course and promoted officers coming up from the subordinate ranks. It would be very difficult to suggest any fixed proportion of these officers as the Civil Veterinary Department was a growing concern. It was of recent origin, and in many of the Provinces there was only one Superintendent. He thought the pioneer work should fall on the men recruited in England, but he thought when the Department as a whole arrived at the stage at which it was in the Punjab, it could look to the indigenous material to supply some of its wants. His Department had suggested for the Punjab that there should be one Provincial Superintendent in charge of each revenue division —which consisted of five or six districts, and that half of the divisions should be held eventually by English trained men, and half by Indian trained men. The Indian trained men would occupy a somewhat different status and position from that of the European trained men, but it was difficult to give any opinion as to how the experiment would succeed. He did not apprehend that as the Indian officer's responsibility increased the same difficulties and the same grievances would be encountered as had been found in other Services, but he could give no reason for his opinion on this point.

69257. At present there were five Veterinary Colleges, one in the Punjab, one in Bombay, one in Bengal, one in Madras, and one in Burma. There was a very excellent supply of candidates for the vernacular colleges and a very fair supply for the English colleges. The vernacular colleges had not sufficient room to accommodate the number of men wishing to join. Very nearly all the students from the colleges obtained Government appointments. Those who did not do so went to foreign countries, or to Native States. He would like to see the educational standard for entry to the Punjab College improved a little, provided there was a four years' course, but he would not insist on raising it very much. He should like the period of training to be lengthened. A loophole should be left for men who had not the necessary educational qualifications, but who were suited to the work. Many of the men in the Service were agriculturists who had not had opportunities of acquiring an education. There were Government scholarships for college students. He could not tell how many scholarships there were in the Punjab, but they were sufficient for all Civilian students. A certain number of Indians have the diploma of the R.C.V.S; he could not say the exact number. He did not think the possession of a diploma would be fair evidence of fitness for the Imperial Service. The test was a high one, but he thought men who were coming out to India should be selected. He did not think there would be any great objection to the Government providing facilities to enable some educated Indians to go to England with a view of obtaining the diploma of the R.C.V.S., but it would give rise to some dissatisfaction in the Department unless these men were selected from the rank and file.

69258. If Indians had to be given the opportunity of entering the Imperial Service of the Veterinary Department, he thought the most effective course would be to select them from the Provincial Service rather than to adopt a method of direct recruitment. Although the possession of a diploma was evidence that a man had been through a very considerable course, he thought there was a considerable difference between a man's ability in college and at work. The colleges gave very little practical experience of a technical nature, and this applied especially to an English college, where it was hardly possible to acquire any knowledge of Indian conditions. At the present time the Indian college was very much behind the English college owing to the shortness of the course. For instance, in physiology, an Indian college had no time to give a laboratory course, and in pathology a student could not do histology and practical microscopical work. The Indian colleges had sufficient staff, but not sufficient time. The subjects were now so numerous in the final years' examinations, that no teacher got students for more than an hour a day, and that left no margin of time for practical work. Such a state of things should be rectified by extending the training to four years, but even so he was afraid the Indian

colleges had not the equipment or the general machinery to be able to give as good an education as the Royal College gave in England, unless the services of special teachers were secured.

69259. He did not see any very great objection to officers engaging in private practice, but the idea of Government was that it would be as well to prevent officers from doing so, from a fear that possibly in a very large town, where a very lucrative private practice could be obtained, they might devote more of their time to their own private practice than to Government work. The demand for the revival of the post of Inspector General was put forward on the ground that such a post was required in the interests of the Service, and also because it would afford means of improving the prospects of officers in the Department. In the first place, there was no one to give advice and assistance to Veterinary Officers in Provincial appointments. They were not represented in any way. When a discussion arose with regard to veterinary matters, there was no one to advise the Government of India. The work of Veterinary Officers was not understood by the people who were supposed to supervise it. Under the present system there was no one to judge whether a man was doing good work or bad work, and the bad man had just as much chance as the good man. Again, there were certain posts for which men had to be selected, and some opinion had to be formed as to their qualifications, and there were no means at present of that being done. The present method of selection was unsatisfactory from the point of view of the Military Officers in the Department who urged that there was no one to say when they deserved promotion, and so on. His colleagues did not agree that the discretion in matters of promotion lay with the Director of Agriculture. Veterinary Officers claimed that it was impossible for a layman to take up such a position. The main reason why it was desired to see a revival of the post of Inspector-General was in order that he might make selections for promotion, and co-ordinate the work of the Department. He admitted that the latter was administrative work, but he did not think that an officer without technical qualifications could undertake such work. For instance, if the Veterinary Department desired to make an enquiry into some disease in India, there were no methods by which it could do so. It could not arrange what was to be done or what material was to be collected. The instructions for such work would come from the Adviser of Agriculture, but there ought to be somebody to advise him.

69260. He was opposed to the idea of organising the Service on a Provincial basis. He thought it was far too small. Officers had entered the Service on the understanding that if desirable appointments fell vacant in other Provinces, suitable officers would be transferred to those appointments. That had, so far, not been done, with the result that a great deal of dissatisfaction had arisen. Junior officers had been given desirable posts by Provincial Governments over the heads of fully qualified senior officers from other Provinces. He knew of at least two instances of that nature which had caused a great deal of heart-burning in the Service.

69261. At the present time the Department in the Punjab was sufficiently staffed and had an adequate leave reserve.

69262. Cattle breeding and horse breeding was supposed to be under the control of the Veterinary Department, but he believed the Agricultural Department undertook certain experiments with milch cattle. In the course of their ordinary work in regard to stock, Veterinary Officers were very seldom brought into contact with Agricultural Officers, as very few of the latter are working in the districts.

69263. The complaint that the maximum salary of Civil Officers in the Department was reached after 16 years' service could be met by lowering the minimum salary of Rs. 400 by increasing the maximum, and by slightly lowering the annual increment, but he did not think if such a scheme were adopted a sufficient number of recruits would come forward. The present position was that the Civil Veterinary Department, which formerly was one of the most popular Departments amongst graduates in England, had now become one of the least popular. A Departmental Committee had been appointed in England to consider the question of veterinary training, and evidence had been given to the effect that "the best men now qualifying at home preferred going into the Army Veterinary Corps to going into the Indian Civil Veterinary Department." Owing to the abolition of the Inspector General and to the lack of any prospects after 15 years' service the impression had got abroad that the Service was not worth the attention of good men. Many of the best men who came out to the Service seven or eight years ago had resigned and had obtained better appointments in other countries. The salary offered in the first place seemed very good to a man who did not know anything about India, but after he arrived in India, he found that in 15 years he came to the end of his prospects, and that he had to serve 30 years before obtaining a pension. He desired to see the salary raised after 15 years' service, his contention being that the civilians in the Department were doing the same work as men who came from the Army, and had in fact in some instances longer training. He laid stress on the importance, in the interests of the Service, of an advance in pay, because unless such an increase was granted good recruits would not be obtained, and, if they were obtained, they would not remain in the Service.

69264. The pay of Deputy Superintendents varied in different Provinces, possibly because the cost of living varied in different parts of India. His opinion was that Deputy Superintendents should start from Rs. 250, rising by annual increments of Rs. 25 up to Rs. 500.

69265. Under present conditions officers did fail sometimes to obtain the leave and furlough due to them. One officer had been refused leave twice, not so much because the leave reserve was inadequate as because there was no one to see that the regulations regarding furlough were carried out. With regard to the suggestion which had been put forward by certain witnesses, that the Director of Agriculture should be appointed from within the Department, and should not be an Indian Civil Service Officer, the witness said that the Veterinary Department would rather have an unbiassed head. There was such a thing as Departmental jealousy, and Veterinary officers feared that if they were placed under the head of another Department, which was junior to the Veterinary Department, they would have a bad time. His objection applied both to Provincial Directors of Agriculture and to the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India.

69266. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He objected to being placed under the Agricultural Adviser because such an officer would not be in a position to know what were the interests and desires of the Service. The Veterinary Department would not regard him as competent to represent to the Government of India what were the real interests and wants of the Department. If veterinary officers were not placed under a member of their own Department they would prefer to be placed under a Civilian. At the present time there was nobody who could voice their claims or their interests to the Government of India, and to whom the authorities of the Department in the Punjab could appeal.

69267. Of the Indian Colleges two were vernacular, one in Burma and one in the Punjab, the rest were English. Such colleges were very much behind the Royal Veterinary College as regards staff, but not in regard to equipment. He thought the Punjab Veterinary College was as well equipped as any other. The present professorial staff was satisfactory for the four years' course, but if it was proposed to establish a degree of a standard equal to that obtained in England, then better qualified specialists would

have to be secured. This inadequacy of resources was far greater in other parts of India than in the Punjab, where the organisation was much more advanced than it was elsewhere.

69268. (*Mr. Madge.*) The Veterinary Department and the Agricultural Department were, in his opinion, of equal importance to the industrial development of India. If a veterinary officer were promoted to be the head of both Departments he would be absolutely disqualified to advise the Government with reference to agriculture, unless he happened to have had Agricultural experience. His Department did not ask to be put in charge of agriculture. The suggestion was that there should be a Civilian Minister for agriculture, who would have under him an Agricultural Adviser and a Veterinary Adviser. He did not set much store by the diploma obtained after four years' study, because it was of little value without practical experience.

69269. (*Mr. Sly.*) It was the case at present that in matters of importance the Director of Agriculture consulted not only the senior officer of the Veterinary Department, but also all other Veterinary Officers; but in so doing he only got confused.

69270. With regard to the Provincial Service, Deputy Superintendents were recruited by promotion from the lower grade in the Service after having undergone a special post-graduate course at the Veterinary College. None of them were recruited direct to the Department. He preferred a scheme under which Deputy Superintendents should be recruited by promotion from the subordinate Veterinary Department, rather than by direct recruitment. At present in the Punjab, recruitment was made to very low grades. That was one of the chief difficulties which had to be dealt with. The pay of Veterinary graduates on first entry was really no better than that of a coolie—Rs. 30 a month. In the past it had been possible, on account of the cadre having to be filled up, to recruit men direct to the first or second grade, but the prospects to the Veterinary graduate in future were that after three years hard work he would get an appointment worth Rs. 30 a month. He thought if the salary was raised to Rs. 50, officers would be obtained of sufficient ability to fill the post of Deputy Superintendent. He thought a scheme for entering direct recruits on a scale of salary comparable with that of the Provincial Service in other Departments would cause dissatisfaction to the rank and file of the Service. An Inspector who had proved himself a satisfactory officer, would not like to see a man who had been sent home at the expense of Government brought in over his head. No doubt the solution of that difficulty in other Departments had been found in setting aside a certain number of appointments to be filled by the promotion of exceptional subordinates, but in the Punjab Veterinary Service there were so few appointments that he did not think it would be possible to apply the same remedy.

69271. He did not think, taking into account the very limited demand for graduates in the Veterinary Department, that there would be any justification for suggesting to the Government of India the institution of an Imperial College in India for the training of Indians to become members of the Imperial Service of the Veterinary Department; the expense would be too great. He thought it would be cheaper to send men to England for training. He agreed, however, that in a first class Veterinary institution in India, and amid his own surroundings, a Veterinary Officer could be taught better, and on a higher standard than he could in England. He thought English surroundings were to be avoided.

69272. (*Chairman.*) He was assuming the institution of an entirely new college, and not the utilisation of material already available in India.

69273. (*Mr. Sly.*) He thought the allowances granted to Principals of Colleges were necessary and justifiable. He did not know of any other Province where the Principal of an institution did not get more than his Professors.

69274. With regard to the claim put forward by certain Provincial Officers that they should be permitted to retire at 25 years' service instead of 30 years, he thought the latter period was far too long to ask a man to serve for a pension. The pension question was creating a great deal of dissatisfaction.

69275. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The three members of the Provincial Service who had signed the written statement had done so in their personal capacity. All the 175 members of the Provincial Service had not been consulted, and therefore the statement could not be taken to represent the views of the entire Service, Imperial and Provincial.

69276. The Provincial Officers at the Punjab Veterinary College, whose present rate of salary ranged from Rs. 200 to Rs. 400 per mensem had entered the Service 25 years ago on Rs. 15 per mensem and had risen to the rank of professor. The assistant teachers in the college, whose present pay was from Rs. 45 to Rs. 200 per mensem had begun on Rs. 30.

69277. He reiterated his opinion that there was no demand at the present time for an Imperial College in India, although it had been the ideal of many officers that in the course of time the Veterinary Department would be sufficiently developed to allow of such an institution being inaugurated. Until that time arrived, he agreed it would be an advantage to send selected Indian graduates to England from the different colleges, and if they qualified then recruit them into the Imperial Service, but he did not recommend the adoption of any such scheme. If some of the best graduates of the colleges were selected to be sent to England with scholarships, he did not think any objection could be raised by the rank and file of his Department.

69278. (*Chairman.*) The fact that the allowances for study leave of the Imperial Officers had been recently reduced from Rs. 8 to Rs. 6 a day had had a discouraging effect. He would recommend that study leave to Europe should be given to Provincial Deputy Superintendents, provided they did not go to Camden Town, but were sent to some place, such as a University, where they would be looked after. But personally he was of opinion that such men would obtain more benefit from the post-graduate course which was going to be started in India.

69279. COLONEL FARMER said it was suggested that the salary for Veterinary assistants on joining the Service should be Rs. 50, Rs. 65 and Rs. 80 instead of the present rates of Rs. 30, Rs. 40 and Rs. 50. He thought these rates were urgently required and would in fact be adequate to induce better men to enter the College.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Calcutta, Thursday, 22nd January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.
R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

MAJOR A. SMITH, Principal of the Bengal Veterinary College.

Written Statement relating to the Civil Veterinary Department.

69280. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—The present method is considered satisfactory.

69281. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—It is suggested that all officers on arrival in India should be considered as under training for at least two years, more especially as during this period he is required to pass his vernacular tests, and would allot their periods of duty somewhat as follows:—

(*a*) Nine months attached to a college;
(*b*) Three months at the Muktesar laboratory; and
(*c*) One year touring in the district under a Superintendent.

The probationary period might remain as at present.

69282. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The abolishment of the post of Inspector-General has materially changed the conditions of service and prospects. In addition to the loss of an appointment carrying extra pay and pension, it deprives the Department of an officer to whom the other officers of the Department could appeal for professional advice and assistance.

69283. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The civilian officers of the Department attaining their maximum salary at 16 years' service (with the exception of a rise of Rs. 100 at 20 years) is unsatisfactory. An improvement of salary between the 16th and 30th years of service might, with advantage, be considered.

69284. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—Unsatisfactory, for the reason that sufficient provision is not made for leave reserve officers.

69285. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—As mentioned in paragraph 69282 the loss of the special pension attached to the abolished post of Inspector-General detracts from the conditions under which we were induced to join the Department.

It is considered that officers of the Department should become entitled to the special pension of an extra Rs. 1,000 per annum for long or meritorious service.

69286. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—I am not aware of any limitation to the employment of non-Europeans in the Department.

The existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial is satisfactory.

69287. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services** are satisfactory.

69288. **(IX) Any other points.**—The Department, since the post of Inspector-General has been abolished, is working at a great disadvantage. It is considered that a professional head is most necessary in a country like India.

The Department is very much undermanned in Bengal, perhaps more so than in any other Province in India. There is urgent need for a second Imperial officer at the Bengal Veterinary College. Other colleges doing similar work in India, have at least two and at the Punjab Veterinary College five Imperial officers are sanctioned.

To bring the Bengali students up to an efficient standard in the veterinary profession, they require a considerable amount of personal attention from the European staff. With only one officer, as at present, who, in addition to his duties as Principal, is also Superintendent of Glanders and Farcy operations in Calcutta and its suburbs, it is impossible for him to give necessary time and personal attention to the students.

Again, there is a well-equipped laboratory at the College which requires a specially trained European officer whose time would be well occupied in routine diagnostic work, research work, teaching bacteriology and serum therapy in connection with contagious diseases and in conducting the post-graduate classes.

In Bengal a second officer could well be employed in the districts. It is most difficult for one man to efficiently supervise his staff distributed over such a large area. His time is so taken up with routine work that little time is left to personally attend outbreaks of infectious diseases, to investigate the numerous diseases which at present are little understood, or give attention to the important subject of the improvement of cattle.

The Province of Bengal could very advantageously employ a second permanent Superintendent, with a third temporary junior or temporary officer who could be called on to officiate when either of the first named were either ill or on leave.

MAJOR A. SMITH called and examined.

69289. (*Chairman.*) The witness had occupied his present position for two years and he had been 21 years in the Service.

69290. The best means of recruiting Indians to the Imperial Service of the Veterinary Department would be by direct recruitment with an English qualification.

69291. There were no Indians in the service at the present time who held the English qualification of R.C.V.S. There had been one, who had died.

69292. He would also agree to Provincial Officers of exceptional merit being promoted to the Imperial Service.

69293. Since the post of Inspector-General had been abolished, the Veterinary Department had been working at a great disadvantage. In the first place, without any direct representation to the Government of India, it was very difficult for anyone in Bengal to ascertain what work was being done in other Provinces. Then, if an officer wanted leave, it was very hard for him to obtain anyone to officiate in his place. The greatest objection to not having an officer of the rank of Inspector-General was that no two Provinces in India were working on the same lines. The subordinate officers were paid differently, their work was not co-ordinated; they were either under the Local Government or under district boards and municipalities, and the system in every Province was different.

69294. The post of Inspector-General had been abolished two years ago. The unsatisfactory conditions he had just described did to some extent obtain even during the period in which there was an Inspector-General, but there were signs of improvement and all Provinces were being brought

into line. As soon, however, as the post was abolished, every Province was left to its own account, and progress became very difficult.

69295. At present the witness communicated with the Director of Agriculture in Bengal, and any communication to him went through him to the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India. The objection to that procedure was simply that it had no value, as the adviser was incapable of giving advice to the service on any point. The service was suffering from the absence of an expert official adviser.

69296. He did not think a Commissioner of Rural Development if appointed would be of any value outside the Province, but in the Province he would be of great assistance. The service would gain much more help from him than was possible under the present arrangement, as he would be a stronger representative with the Local Government than the present Director of Agriculture; but he could not see how such an officer was going to replace the Inspector-General of Veterinary Services.

69297. The veterinary staff in Bengal was undermanned for the outdoor work. It was very difficult for an officer efficiently to supervise a staff distributed over so large an area. A man's time was taken up with routine work and little time was left for him to attend to outbreaks of infectious diseases. He did not admit that that suggested the desirability of increasing the staff for routine work, rather than the desirability of increasing the Imperial staff. Bengal required at least two Imperial Officers; in fact three could be well employed, especially as each Province would have to keep up a leave reserve, for which at present no provision was made. For instance, *only the previous day he had had a communication from one end of the Province to say that glanders had broken out, and he had had another communication from the other end saying that* there was an outbreak of hæmorrhagic septicæmia of a virulent form.

69298. The outbreak of disease entailed much work of a routine character, but at the same time it was essential that an Imperial officer should get to the spot as soon as he could. In outbreaks of glanders, an animal was never allowed to be destroyed without the sanction of an Imperial Officer, as compensation had to be given by Government. There were no reliable Provincial Officers in the Department who could undertake the work, because there was no one higher than an Inspector in the Province.

69299. With regard to leave, the witness was doing the work of two men at present. An extra officer was required as a leave reserve. The whole Department had been undermanned for some years, especially in regard to routine work.

69300. He suggested an improvement of salary between the 16th and 30th year of service. After the 16th year there should be a rise of Rs. 200 at intervals of four or five years.

69301 (*Mr. Madge.*) One of the first difficulties in the way of raising the standard of training for the veterinary profession in India would be expense. There would have to be a separate college, a separate staff of English teachers, and there would have to be insistence on a certain standard of general education before students were admitted. Students would have also to be given some guarantee of future prospects. If those difficulties could be overcome, and if Government would guarantee recruitment to the Imperial Service, he saw no paramount obstacle. It would take some years before competent men were turned out. Again, the expense of such a system as compared with the present scheme of sending specially selected men to Europe to qualify would be very large.

69302. There were certain conditions so peculiar to India as to give an advantage to the locally trained man, provided a higher standard of training was possible.

69303. There was nothing to prevent any suggestions made provincially being communicated through the Secretariat to the Supreme Government, and being carried out in that way, if only there was someone at the head who could receive the communication, and intelligently interpret it from a professional point of view. He did not agree with the opinion that what was required by the head of a Department was statesmanship and not professional knowledge.

69304. It was possible to train subordinates so as to make them qualified for the time being to meet and report on crises as they arose in different parts; but it would be better for the subordinate, for the owners of the cattle and for Government, if the Imperial officer himself was able to go and advise on the spot.

69305. (*Mr. Fisher.*) There were about 90 students in the Bengal Veterinary College, most of whom were Hindus and non-agriculturists. Their object was to enter the Government Service. The course was three years. A four years' course was not necessary, but he would suggest a five years' course for the superior grades. There was a decline in the number of students wishing to enter the college. He attributed that to bad prospects. The posts offered were insufficiently paid, and other departments paid their subordinates better. He had often admitted 50 students at the beginning of a session, and at the end of two months had lost 20. Practically no test was exacted for admission. The college was not in a position to do so. He would favour an entrance test, such as the matriculation examination. Students undergoing their course of training at the Veterinary College were usefully employed.

69306. (*Mr. Sly.*) There were signs in India of the rise of the independent veterinary practitioner. He knew of six successful Indian private practitioners, all of whom came from the Punjab College. They were not students who had failed to secure Government appointments; they simply preferred private practice. There was not much scope for private practice in Bengal.

69307. The proposal that the Directorship of Agriculture should be filled from the ranks of the Agricultural Service would be very unpopular with the Veterinary Department. He would much prefer a system under which the Veterinary Service would have direct representation with the Revenue Member as in Madras.

69308. It would be a suitable system of management in Provinces like the Punjab, where there were several veterinary officers, for the senior veterinary officer not only to hold charge of his own particular circle, but also to be an adviser to Government.

69309. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He agreed that information as to what was being done in other Provinces might still be obtainable through ordinary official channels, but when it arrived it would not be of much value, as six months would probably elapse between the time of writing and reply. If there was an Inspector-General, he might wire to him and ask him what to do under certain circumstances, and he would get a reply at once. What he meant was that the service, by the abolition of the post of Director, had lost the brains of a man who knew the conditions of the service, and who was able to advise as to whether they were working on the right lines in one Province or not. The service wanted a man who was able to travel from one Province to another, and see the conditions of work and diseases as they existed in the various Provinces.

(The witness withdrew.)

E. H. Brand, Esq., Assistant Principal, Bengal Veterinary College.

Written Statement relating to the Civil Veterinary Department.

69310. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The Provincial Veterinary Department at present consists of:—(1) Deputy Superintendents, who are gazetted, and (2) Inspectors, who are non-gazetted, officers. These officers are recruited from graduates of the Bengal and other Indian Veterinary Colleges either directly or by promotion from the Subordinate Service.

I am of opinion that appointment to the Provincial Service should be as a rule direct; a small proportion of appointments, not exceeding 10 per cent. of the total, may be filled by promotion of specially capable and deserving men from the Subordinate Service. The Provincial Service should consist of Inspectors and Deputy Superintendents; Inspectors recruited under this system should be gazetted after five years of approved service. Candidates for the Provincial Service should have passed at least the Matriculation examination; this standard should be raised as soon as practicable to the I.A. or I.Sc. examination in the case of Indians, or the Matriculation or an equivalent examination in the case of Europeans or Anglo-Indians. Appointment to the Deputy Superintendent grade may be made direct in the case of exceptionally capable or qualified graduates. Promotion from the Inspector to the Deputy Superintendent grade should be by selection, with due regard to seniority.

69311. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—Candidates would first go through the ordinary college course, and on passing their final examination would go through a post-graduate course of at least one year under a specially qualified and experienced officer appointed as post-graduate Professor. On completion of this course, they would again appear before the Examining Board to pass in selected subjects. They would then be appointed as Inspectors or, in special cases, Deputy Superintendents. In the former case they should be on probation and under training in their actual duties for one year, receiving the minimum pay of the grade; in the latter they should be on probation for two years, one of which should be under training, receiving Rs. 150 per mensem, after which they may be confirmed in the lowest grade of Deputy Superintendent, or placed in the Inspector grade (if found unsuitable). The prospect of direct appointment to the Deputy Superintendent grade would tend to attract a still better class of candidates. Officers promoted from the Subordinate Service should go through the one year post-graduate course and subsequent examination.

In the course of a few years, as these higher trained men become available, a number of higher posts may be thrown open to the Provincial Service, at two-thirds the salary of the Imperial Service, especially as the establishment of a School of Tropical Medicine in Calcutta will enable them to go through as high a course of post-graduate scientific training, as will be obtainable anywhere. That well-trained graduates can be turned out from Indian colleges is shown by the remarks of Professor Steel and Colonel Raymond.

Professor Steel was Principal of the Bombay Veterinary College, before which he was Lecturer on Anatomy at the Royal Veterinary College, London. So he had considerable knowledge of both English and Indian students. Moreover, he was one of the most eminent Veterinary Surgeons of his time. In his annual report of the Bombay Veterinary College for the year 1887-88 he says:—"I am in hopes that the average amount of knowledge conveyed to our students before they become practitioners will equal that given in British schools, but differ somewhat in adaptation to Indian practical needs. Doubtless our best men will not equal the best European graduates, but they will not fall far short, and the discrepancy will disappear with time and the further development of the college."

Colonel Raymond, who was Principal of the Bengal Veterinary College for over 15 years, at the meeting of the Veterinary Board, in 1908, stated that the standard had been raised in Bengal to such a point, that in bacteriology, pathology and chemistry it was below the standard of any English college, but as regards cattle diseases, surgery and infectious diseases and other things likely to be of use in this country he ventured to say that the standard was as high as any college anywhere.

As the Provincial Service will, to an extent, be recruited from the Subordinate Service, and as candidates who fail to qualify for the higher service will have to fall back on the Subordinate Service, the pay and prospects of the latter should be improved. I would suggest that the starting pay should be Rs. 50, rising by annual increment of Rs. 2-8 to 100 (in 20 years), and after 25 years of approved service the pay should be raised to Rs 120.

69312. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The Deputy Superintendents of the Provincial Service are uncovenanted gazetted officers recruited in India, and liable to be transferred from the college to the department and *vice versâ*. The Inspectors are non-gazetted Provincial Officers recruited in India, and are also liable to be transferred from the college to the department and *vice versâ*. The conditions of the Service are regulated by the Civil Service Regulations.

69313. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—At present there are three grades of Deputy Superintendents, as under:—

1st grade	...	...	Rs. 250—15—400
2nd ,,	...	...	Rs. 200—10—250
3rd ,,	...	...	Rs. 150—10—200

The number of officers in the Deputy Superintendent grade being small, they have to wait a long time before they can expect, by casualties or retirement, promotion to the next higher grade, and thus have to draw the maximum pay of their present grade for an indefinite period; the pay and prospects of the sister Provincial Services in Bengal, such as Executive, Judicial, Educational and Public Works, are much better than those of the Provincial Veterinary Service. Moreover, in the case of the former, certain appointments ordinarily held by Imperial officers are open to the Provincial Services. I would suggest that the minimum and the maximum pay of the Deputy Superintendent grade should be raised, and a system of progressive pay, which would result in an equitable flow of promotion instead of leaving this to chance, be introduced. The Deputy Superintendents should get from Rs. 250 to Rs. 500 by an annual increment of Rs. 25 (in ten years).

There are seven grades of Inspectors at present as follows:—

1st grade	...	...	...	Rs. 150
2nd ,,	...	...	...	130
3rd ,,	...	...	...	115
4th ,,	...	...	...	100
5th ,,	...	...	...	90
6th ,,	...	...	...	80
7th ,,	...	...	...	70

As regards the Inspectors, considering their hard and arduous work in the district, and also in connection with the glanders work in Calcutta and the suburbs, I suggest a progressive pay of Rs. 100, rising to Rs. 200 by annual increments of Rs. 10 (in ten years).

69314. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—Study leave should be given on full pay. Privilege leave should be allowed to accumulate for six months; an officer should be allowed to take half the furlough due to him on full pay, provided he forfeits the remaining half; this would allow poorly-paid officers, and those with large families, who cannot afford to go on half pay, to take long leave, which they often need but cannot take. Otherwise leave and furlough rules should be the same as adopted for other Provincial Services.

69315. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Full pension should be allowed on completing 25 years' service.

69316. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working**

of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.—(*a*) No limitation exists.

(*b*) In Bengal there are two Imperial officers; one as Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, and the other as Principal, Bengal Veterinary College. The rest of the staff belongs to the Provincial and the Subordinate Veterinary Services. In the Department there are no Deputy Superintendents at present. In the college there are six Deputy Superintendents, the senior being designated Assistant Principal and the rest Lecturers. The actual teaching staff consists exclusively of Provincial Officers. Some of these officers have to lecture on subjects and perform duties similar to those lectured on and performed in other colleges by Imperial Officers. They have discharged their duties during the past 15 years with conspicuous success, inasmuch as the results and general standard of efficiency of this college for that period have been the most satisfactory of all colleges. This is borne out by the appended remarks of the Boards of Examiners and extracts from reports of the Inspectors-General, etc.

As regards the Inspectors, those working in the Department are placed in charge of a Division, and are responsible for the inspection and proper supervision of the work done at the dispensaries, horse and cattle fairs, checking outbreaks of infectious diseases, study of different breeds of cattle, etc. While those engaged in glanders work are responsible for the proper inspection of all stables and byres in their districts, and for combating outbreaks of infective diseases in cattle. There is also a Chief Inspector who supervises the work of the District Inspectors.

The Assistant Principalship of the Bombay Veterinary College is held by an Imperial officer, but in Bengal by a Provincial officer, where the duties have been carried on creditably since the establishment of this college. I, therefore, suggest that the Assistant Principalship should be reserved for the Provincial Service on special pay of Rs. 600, rising to Rs. 800 by annual increments of Rs. 40. I would also here cite the case of a former Bengal Provincial Officer, Mr. Burke, who has been appointed to fill an Imperial post of Professor in the Lahore Veterinary College on special pay. On appointment to these posts officers may be required to undergo a recognised post-graduate course in England or India.

69317. **(VIII) Relation of Veterinary Service with other Services.**—It bears no direct relation with other Services, but may be compared with other Provincial Services.

69318. **(IX) Any other points.**—The pay and prospects of the Veterinary Provincial Service at present compare unfavourably with other Provincial Services; the result is that very few well educated and better class men are attracted to it; and the veterinary profession, as a profession, is unpopular in Bengal for several reasons, religious and other. These prejudices are gradually dying, and the improvement in pay and prospects will materially help in this direction.

The Secretary of State, in his despatch of the 23rd January, 1903, states:—"And in this connection I would suggest that as the Department is now to be more or less closely confined to agricultural cattle, the veterinary colleges which are at work in India might, in future, be more largely drawn upon for suitable officials, and the staff recruited in Europe kept at the minimum necessary for the purposes of supervision." In a later despatch, in reply to a demand for an additional officer on the Imperial cadre, he gives the Government of India to understand that they need no such addition.

From the spirit of the aforesaid despatches it follows that indigenous agency should be trained for higher posts in preference to foreign enlistment. Provincial officers, as has been shown, have for years been carrying out the duties of higher posts satisfactorily; and in future, if specially selected men of approved service are appointed and undergo a course of post-graduate study, there is no reason why they should prove unequal to the higher charges that have already been, and may hereafter be, thrown open to their division of the Service. The Board of Veterinary Conference held at Calcutta in 1908 suggested that suitable veterinary graduates may be sent to go through a special course to an English Veterinary College. The same procedure is adopted in the Agricultural Department.

In view of these declarations of the Secretary of State, I suggest that, if it is found necessary to create any additional appointments of the class at present held by officers of the Imperial Service, a proportion of such appointments should be added to the Provincial Service on a special rate of pay of Rs. 600 rising to Rs. 800 by annual increments of Rs. 40. This would not only be more economical, but would also have the effect of attracting a better class of men to join the Provincial Service.

69319. *ANNEXURES TO THE ABOVE.*

1. Extracts from Resolutions on the Annual Reports.

1911-12.—"The results of the final examination were satisfactory."

1909-10.—"The uniformly satisfactory result from year to year reflects great credit on Colonel Raymond and his staff."

1908-09.—"The high percentage (86.2) of the third year students who passed the diploma examination testifies to the efficiency of the instruction."

1906-07.—"The results of the last annual examination are highly satisfactory."

1904-05.—"The results of the examinations are, in the opinion of the Lieutenant-Governor, highly creditable to the principal and teaching staff."

1903-04.—"The results of the examinations of the three classes were extremely satisfactory, and the Lieutenant-Governor agrees with the Director of Land Records that they are highly creditable to the principal and the teaching staff of the college."

1902-03.—"These results reflect the greatest credit on the principal and his staff."

1901-02.—"The results of the examinations at the end of the year were creditable both to the students and the lecturers."

1900-01.—"The results of the examination were creditable to the students and their instructors in all three classes, more especially in the Diploma examination, in which all the candidates were successful."

1899-1900.—"The results of which were very creditable to the Principal and tutors.

1898-99.—"The results of the annual examination of the institution were most satisfactory."

2. Extracts from Inspector-General's Administration Reports.

1910-11.—"Taking the percentage of passes, Bengal stands first."

1909-10.—"This year the Bengal Veterinary College takes the lead as regards the percentage of graduates passed by the Board of Examiners. The results were considered to be very good."

1908-09.—"The results of the year's work are good; 38 out of 51 students passed the first year's, 37 out of 45 the second and 25 out of 29 the final year's test. Taking all things (College) into consideration, the results of the work done are satisfactory."

1901-02.—"The Examining Boards have reported very favourably the results of the Punjab and Bengal Veterinary Colleges."

1900-01.—"Bengal again heads the list so far as the percentage of passes are concerned."

1899-1900.—"Bengal heads the list, and it is satisfactory to learn that in the important subject of operative surgery the students showed scientific skill."

1898-99.—"The success obtained at the Bengal Veterinary College is most satisfactory."

1897-98.—"This school has made most rapid strides during the past year."

3. Examiners' Remarks.

1911-12.—"We consider the results to be satisfactory."

1910-11.—"We consider the results to be very satisfactory, reflecting credit on the teaching staff."

1909-10.—"We are glad to be able to report a considerable improvement in the standard of education; this is specially marked in the practical subjects. We consider the results to be very good."

1908-09 and 1907-08.—"We consider that the results are very satisfactory."

1906-07.—"The Board is of opinion that the above results are very good, and reflect great credit on the Principal and teachers."

1904-05.—"The Board considers that as a whole the students display a very good knowledge of the various subjects."

Mr. E. H. Brand, called and examined.

69320. (*Chairman.*) The witness was Assistant Principal of the Bengal Veterinary College, and was a member of the Provincial Veterinary Department.

69321. The salaries in the Provincial Veterinary Service in Bengal did not compare favourably with other departments. The Inspector grade started at Rs. 70, rising to Rs. 150. He suggested it should commence at Rs. 100, rising to Rs. 200. He also recommended that the Deputy Superintendents who now received Rs. 150 rising to Rs. 400 a month should go from Rs. 250 to Rs. 500.

69322. There were six Deputy Superintendents in Bengal, all of whom were employed in the college. None were employed out of doors. They were graduates of an Indian college. Some had gone through a post-graduate course. They were specially selected men. None of them had been to England. Some of them had to perform duties similar to those performed by Imperial Officers. For instance, the Assistant Principal of the college in Bengal was a Provincial Officer, whereas the Assistant Principal in the college at Bombay was an Imperial Officer. Yet the Assistant Principal's duties in Bengal were heavier and more responsible than those of the Assistant Principal in Bombay, or the corresponding officer in the Punjab (who was also an Imperial Officer), inasmuch as in Bengal the Assistant Principal was the senior teaching officer, while in Bombay and the Punjab the Principal was the senior teaching officer. The hospital duties in Bengal were heavier, owing to a different system of management and to the fact that the Assistant Principal was also senior resident officer. The witness's salary started at Rs. 150 rising to Rs. 400, and Imperial Officers started at Rs. 500, rising to Rs. 1,200 in the course of time. He sometimes discharged the duties of Principal in the absence of the head of the college. During the vacation he took charge of the college.

69323. He suggested that in the course of time, as men were trained more highly, more opportunities should be open to the Provincial Service to enter the Imperial Service.

69324. The best means of recruiting officers to the Imperial Service would be by direct appointment, but capable provincial officers of experience, who had done good work, should have a chance of being promoted. He would not at present recruit direct to the Imperial Service in India; he would insist on a course in England. He had not himself been to England. The Provincial Officer promoted to the Imperial Service should take a post-graduate course in England. If a Central Veterinary College was instituted in India the course in England might be obviated, but the Veterinary Department was so small, and there were so few vacancies that there would be very few students available, and a central college would not be worth the cost.

69325. Under his scheme, the men who were appointed direct as Inspectors at Rs. 100 a month would have been trained in the same classes as the men who would enter direct as Deputy Superintendents. He did not anticipate that that would lead to any administrative difficulties. A specially qualified Deputy Superintendent might be recruited direct without having to pass through the Inspector grade.

69326. Twenty to twenty-five students took diplomas every year. The majority of those entered the service as veterinary assistants. Of the rest, some went to other provinces, or waited for appointments, and a few went into private practice. Those who did not obtain the diplomas went into other departments. There was accommodation at the college for about 160 students. Students from other provinces than Bengal were taken in, and the majority of them obtained appointments in the Service.

69327. It was reasonable that Europeans coming out to India should be paid upon a higher basis of salary to the officer recruited in India. If opportunities were given to Provincial officers to enter the Imperial Service, the promoted officers would be satisfied with lower rates of pay than those granted to Imperial Officers.

69328. The ground on which he recommended that study leave should be given on full pay was that an officer was going to improve himself in order to take up a higher post, and also he probably would be a man with a family.

69329. His reason for pressing that full pension should be allowed on the completion of 25 years was that in the Veterinary Department an officer's work was continuous; he had to work on holidays and Sundays. Further in Technical departments, officers had to spend several years in acquiring their technical training before they began to serve. The average age of recruitment was 23 to 25. In asking for a reduction in the period of service, he did not consider 53, 54 and 55 too advanced an age for an officer to be serving in the department.

69330. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) Poor prospects in the subordinate service accounted for the disparity between the numbers contemplated and the actual number at present in the college.

69331. He would not press the claim for full pay while on study leave if the salaries of the officers in the department were increased.

69332. (*Mr. Madge.*) If a man failed the first time, he was allowed to go up on two or three subsequent occasions. There was no strict limit laid down.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Madras, Monday, 26th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL. | FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E. | HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

LL. E. BUCKLEY, Esq., I.C.S., Commissioner of Revenue Settlement, Madras.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

D. A. D. AITCHISON, Esq., Principal, Madras Veterinary College.

Written Statement relating to the Civil Veterinary Department.

69333. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—I think the present method is probably the best which could be adopted, and I have no suggestions to make.

69334. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—A newly appointed officer to the Department will, as a general rule, be young and inexperienced. It is essential that such men, even though they possess the most up-to-date professional training, should also be trained in the special work they will have to do in this country. They should therefore be posted under experienced officers for a period of about two years before they are given independent charge. Unfortunately, a shortness of officers in the department has not always permitted such a system to be followed, and junior men with not more than a few months' experience of India have been posted as "Reliefs" to act in independent charge. It is only in such cases that I consider the present system of training falls short of what is desirable.

The present period of probation might, with advantage and justice to junior officers, be reduced from five years to three years. Five years is a long period of probation to serve if one does not happen to be selected for continuation of service. Government work is of an entirely different nature to that of a private practitioner. In the first place, an officer is debarred, and very unjustly I consider, from private practice—even the examination of a horse for soundness. After five years' loss of experience and being out of touch of practice for that period, it would be most difficult for any one to return to it with much hope of success for several years. Three years would seem a more reasonable period of probation.

69335. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—Since the abolition of the appointment of Inspector-General of this department on 1st April, 1912, we are a department without a single higher paid appointment, and we have been deprived of the only opportunity we had of earning the enhanced pension of Rs. 6,000 per annum. In consideration of this admitted hardship, it seems reasonable to expect that the Government of India will be willing to consider such representations as the officers of this department have already submitted in the form of memorials. The increase of pay, which I suggested as best calculated to meet the requirements of equity, was that the annual increment of Rs. 40 should continue unbroken to the close of the twenty-fifth year.

69336. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—Apart from any reason mentioned above in connection with "Conditions of Service," why the officers of this Department should be given an increased scale of pay, it has been the experience of myself and many other officers that a salary which, before we came out to India, we considered liberal, we find in reality that it is inadequate to meet the requirements of a home in India. By the time an officer of this department reaches his maximum pay, viz., Rs. 1,200 after 20 years' service, it is reasonable to presume that he has household and family expenses. Were all the advantages of home education and surroundings available out here, there would not be the same ground for discontent at the amount of our maximum pay. It is necessary, however, to send children home for education and home influences, and I think it is not expecting too much that one's maximum pay should be sufficient to meet such necessary expenditure. Each year, unfortunately, living becomes more expensive in India, and one's pay more inadequate, so that the necessity for readjustment of salaries in this department is strongly justified.

69337. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—Very few departmental officers can afford to take more than about one-quarter of the leave due to them on account of leave being on half-pay. I believe that, if only half of the present amount of leave could be earned on full pay instead of the full amount on half-pay, the majority of officers would avail themselves of it and would, consequently, remain much fitter and more energetic than men who are compelled to live for long stretches of time in India could possibly do.

69338. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—My remarks on this are necessarily in continuation of those on Heading 3. In view of our present inability to attain to the enhanced pension of Rs. 6,000, which was previously within our scope, the amount of pension should be increased so as to be equivalent to the sum of £500 sterling at 25 years' service, an amount which is considerably less than that for which I might have made myself eligible if the conditions prevailing at the time of my joining the Service had not been altered.

69339. **(VII) Limitations to the employment of non-Europeans.**—There are no limitations in the Indian Civil Veterinary Department.

Since the abolition of the Inspector-Generalship of the department there does not appear to be the same necessity for the department remaining Imperial except that it is a very small department, and that for the purpose of leave a small relief staff is necessary.

I believe that, if the department were provincialised, the local governments would rescind the rule that officers of the department are not allowed to practice. At present, this rule operates in Madras, to the great disadvantage of the public, who have to put themselves under an obligation to either Mr. Ware or myself if they want the opinion of European Veterinary Surgeon.

69340. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—Both the educational and the executive branches of this department come directly under the control of the Board of Revenue.

I consider this arrangement works admirably and could not be improved upon.

MR. D. A. D. AITCHISON called and examined.

69341. (*Chairman.*) The witness had occupied his present position since February, 1909. He had completed nearly eight years' veterinary service in India, and five and a half years in South Africa.

69342. He looked forward to the time when the Service would be largely staffed by Indians, if the proper men were selected, and sent to England for training. Before Indians were promoted to the Inperial Service they should be sent to England with the object of passing through the Royal Veterinary College, and of seeing English veterinary practice. An English qualification for

the superior ranks of the Service was essential. He did not consider the veterinary colleges in India could educate up to the required standard at the present time. The staff in the Madras Veterinary College consisted of himself, as Principal, an Assistant Principal, and three Indian lecturers. His contention was that under the present circumstances the Provincial College fell appreciably short of what was essential.

69343. It would hardly be worth the while of Government to go to the enormous expense which the institution of a central college in India would entail for the sake of filling the higher ranks of the Veterinary Departments by direct recruitment in India. He did not see where the overflow from such a college would be employed. There was no private practice, and if the central college was going to try to compete with the English colleges, special professors would have to be recruited. Therefore, both on the score of economy, and of efficiency, the English training was the best. He would let the Indian veterinary colleges develop with the advancement of agriculture and scientific work, provided the necessity for private practitioners was established. He had to admit, however, that he did not see any likelihood for the native practitioner, as Government at present did the work free.

69344. The Department was decidedly understaffed for the purpose of leave and training. He suggested that the Imperial Department should be increased. He wanted another officer for duty at the college. The work of the college had increased considerably during the last five or six years, and would go on increasing, and he himself could do no more work than he was at present doing.

69345. He suggested as a compensation for the loss of the Inspector-Generalship a considerable increase in the general time-scale. Since the Imperial horse-breeding was handed over from the Civil Veterinary Department to the Remount Department there had not been the same necessity, as there was formerly, for an Inspector-General. With regard to the complaint that the Service was suffering from the lack of a technical head, that difficulty could be surmounted by the appointment of the senior Superintendent as Veterinary Officer to the Government of India.

69346. He recommended that officers should be allowed private practice. There was no room for an independent private practitioner in the Province, and therefore any member of the community who desired help had to put himself under an obligation to the Government Veterinary Officer. He thought the privilege of private practice could be allowed, without undue prejudice to the work of the Department, because up to the present he had never refused to oblige people. He did not suggest that if private practice were allowed the salaries should be correspondingly decreased, but he would lay it down as a rule that an officer should only be allowed to practise with the permission of his Government, and he would limit the concession to consulting practice.

69347. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The cattle and dog practice was all done free at the College.

69348. (*Mr. Sly.*) The salary of the Assistant Principal of the College was Rs. 200 rising to Rs. 400. The lecturers' salaries were respectively Rs. 120 to Rs. 200, Rs. 100 to Rs. 150, and Rs. 80 to Rs. 120. There are 20 students in each year. The full course lasted three years. The scale of salary attracted the best class of officer obtainable. They were all young men, and to all appearances they were very satisfied to be in the College. As the work increased, and the College expanded, and the men got older, he would suggest that there might be a revision of grade pay.

69349. The prospects in the Provincial Service for Veterinary Assistants, Veterinary Inspectors and Veterinary Deputy Superintendents were sufficient to attract a certain class to the profession, but the best class of Indians would never be attracted to the veterinary profession at all, except in very exceptional cases.

69350. At present there were two Imperial officers in the Veterinary Department in Madras. Both worked independently of each other, and both reported independently to the Board of Revenue. They were not under the Director of Agriculture, but directly under the Board. That had been found to be a most satisfactory system. If there was an increase in the number of Imperial Veterinary Officers in Madras the present system would be still satisfactory, provided the Commissioner could undertake the work, but as the Department grew, the Commissioner might think it would relieve him of some of his work if they were put under the Director of Agriculture. Provided the Director of Agriculture was an Indian Civil Service man with a certain amount of experience and service, well and good, but if the Director of Agriculture was taken from the Agricultural Department it would be very unsatisfactory indeed for Veterinary officers to serve under him. The position would be intolerable. A system under which the senior officer in the Civil Veterinary Department would hold the position of Adviser-General for veterinary work to the Government would be quite satisfactory.

69351. (*Mr. Fisher.*) To all intents and purposes the Veterinary Service was a Provincial Department, except in name.

69352. He did not think there was anything in the argument put forward to the Commission, that one of the reasons for re-establishing the Inspector-Generalship was that the Inspector-General enabled theVeterinary Department in one Province to become acquainted with what was going on in another Province. He thought the Inspector-General might occupy the whole of his time on inspection duties throughout India, but that would be a life which no man could stand.

69353. No religious objection was taken to the Veterinary Department. That was a question he had put to all Brahman students when they entered the College, but they all replied that they had no objection.

69354. (*Mr. Madge.*) He did not think men trained in India were equal to men trained at home, because results of experiments in India were reported to the central schools in England, and they were probably as well up to date in England in Indian diseases as the latest research man in India. The training received in England would fit a man for service in any part of the world.

69355. (*Mr. Buckley.*) Five years was too long a term of probation. If a man did five years' Government work in India he gradually became unfitted for private practice in England. He thought a man would easily prove himself fit, or otherwise, within three years.

69356. Private practice kept a man up to date in his work.

(The witness withdrew.)

G. T. D'Silva, Esq., Assistant Principal, Madras Veterinary College.

Written Statement relating to the Civil Veterinary Department.

69357. **(I) Method of Recruitment,** *and* **(II) Systems of Training and Probation.**—Under both these heads I consider the existing systems and methods suitable, and have no suggestions to offer.

69358. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—I suggest that:—

(*a*) In regard to promotions to higher appointments no distinction be made or preference given to graduates possessing higher educational qualifications. The matter should depend upon professional capabilities.

(*b*) The system of requiring newly-passed graduates to enter into agreements to serve the department for a period of five years be discontinued and that they be permitted to take up service in the department voluntarily. The necessity of the agreement system arose from the

difficulty experienced in getting the majority of passed graduates to enter the service chiefly owing to the low scale of salary upon which they had to begin service; if then the starting salary were increased to Rs. 50—5—75, it would encourage and attract graduates and do away with the necessity of adopting the method of compulsory service.

(c) The rules and conditions relating to private practice, as at present exist, be cancelled, and *all officers of the department permitted to practise, without any restrictions as to scale of fees, etc., provided it in no way interferes with the performance of their legitimate duties.*

(d) Instead of tuition being free and students joining college having to enter into agreements for three years, a nominal tuition fee of, say, Rs. 5 monthly be prescribed and no agreement be entered into.

69359. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—As the starting salary in the executive branch of the department is too little I suggest that the following scale of salaries with grades be adopted:—

Annual increments:—

Second-grade Veterinary Assistant—Rs. 50-5-75.
First-grade Veterinary Assistant—Rs. 75-5-100.
Second-grade Veterinary Inspector—Rs. 100-10-150.
First-grade Veterinary Inspector—Rs. 150-10-200.

For the educational branch of the department I suggest that the teaching staff be placed on the same footing in regard to salaries, allowances, etc., as those in Veterinary Colleges of other Presidencies.

69360. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—There are no limitations to the employment of non-Europeans.

69361. **(VIII) Relations of Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The educational and executive branches of the department are under the control of the Board of Revenue.

Mr. G. T. D'Silva called and examined.

69362. (*Chairman.*) The witness held the position of Assistant Principal of the Madras Veterinary College. He had fourteen years' service. He had occupied his present position since December, 1903. He passed out of the Bombay Veterinary College in 1895 and was appointed to be one of the inspecting officers at Penang, where he stayed only for three months. He returned on account of ill-health, and was appointed to the Bengal College as one of the teaching staff. In 1897 he was again taken ill, and was obliged to resign. He held no other appointment until 1900, when he was appointed as Veterinary Overseer in the Civil Veterinary Department of the United Provinces. His services were later transferred to the Army Remount Department at Babugarh. From there he was applied for by the then Superintendent to join him as an Assistant Principal in Madras. He had therefore had considerable experience in different parts of India. He himself had no education qualification, but his colleague at the College was a matriculate.

69363. No preference should be given to graduates possessing high educational qualifications in making selections for higher appointments, but promotion should depend entirely on capacity as shown in the Service, the work being more of a practical nature which could only be gained from experience. Educational qualifications should be taken into account, but first consideration should be given to practical capacity. He agreed that officers recruited direct from India should have the full advantage of an English training, *i.e.*, take special courses in England to render them more fit for service in higher appointments than those of Inspectors and Deputy Superintendents, which latter appointments should be given upon consideration of fitness, seniority, experience, and class, without English training, but where a man displayed exceptional ability in the subordinate Service, he should be given the opportunity of promotion, without an English education.

69364. He desired to abolish the agreement which recruits had to enter into, of remaining in the Department five years. That agreement was peculiar to Madras. The object of Government in insisting on the agreement was to prevent men, after obtaining their diplomas, from refusing to serve in the Department. Students when they entered the College had now to sign a three years' agreement. That arose in the following way. When the College was first organised it was proposed that graduates passing the College should start on a salary of Rs. 50 to Rs. 75 a month. Under those conditions no less than 600 to 1,100 applications were made. Subsequently the rate of salary was lowered to Rs. 30 rising to Rs. 50, and from that time the number of applications fell off. The students at the College on hearing that their starting salaries would be reduced, left in large numbers. In order to overcome those difficulties, the agreements just referred to were drawn up. He would ensure the same result by offering a sufficient inducement in the way of salaries. If the salaries were increased there was no particular reason why the agreement should be abolished, but he thought that if the pay was raised the necessity for an agreement would disappear.

69365. He asked permission to take up private practice. Private practice was at present permitted but under undesirable restrictions and conditions which should be cancelled. The same concessions were asked for as had already been granted to the Medical Service. He would have time to spare for it. The amount of practice—which should be of the consulting kind—would be quite substantial.

69366. With regard to the educational branch of the Department, he suggested that the teaching staff should be placed on the same footing as regards salary, etc., as officers in other Provinces. In the Madras Veterinary College there were five men in the Subordinate Service. In the Bombay Veterinary College the Principal and Assistant Principal were Imperial Officers, and had six lecturers under them. In Bengal College there were six. He recommended that the salaries, allowances, grades, etc., should be on the same footing as those of Bengal, as the amount of work in the two Colleges was much the same. The educational Staff should receive higher salaries than Deputy Superintendents engaged in out-door work, because their responsibilities were much greater.

69367. It would be very difficult to suggest any means of encouraging private practice, because there was very little private practice to be had in India among cattle. All work was done free by Government. The only method he could recommend was to enlarge the Department, and spread it over a large area, so as to enlighten the natives of India to the fact that veterinary surgeons desired to do good. He thought the expenditure involved by this would be remunerative. It was so at present as regards work in connection with inoculations against cattle plague, and so on.

69368. (*Mr. Sly.*) Students in the College paid no fees. They were given twenty scholarships in each year, eighteen of which were of Rs. 10, and two of Rs. 20, the latter being granted only to graduates. Practically the students received their education at Government expense.

69369. The reason why a good many posts in the cadre of Deputy Superintendents were unfilled was that there were no competent men available at present.

69370. The College had no post-graduate course for graduates, but such a course could be arranged.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Bombay, Monday, 9th February, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, Esq., C.I.E.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

J. D. BUXY, Esq., Deputy Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, Bombay.

Written Statement relating to the Civil Veterinary Department.

69371. **(I) Method of Recruitment** *and* **(II) Systems of Training and Probation.**—The present method of recruitment of men in the Subordinate Civil Veterinary Department is as follows:—

Men who have some knowledge of English and who are above 16 years of age and below 19 can join the Bombay Veterinary College provided they are physically fit. Here a course of three years has to be undergone and three examinations for the three years taken by a Board of Examiners, and when at the end of three years the student has passed according to the rules laid down, the student is qualified as Graduate of the Bombay Veterinary College. All the examinations are oral and practical.

After passing the examinations a graduate may get a service in the Subordinate Civil Veterinary Department, if there happens to be a vacancy. This very much depends on the various District Local Boards who maintain the Veterinary Dispensaries; if the financial circumstances of the District Local Boards are poor no dispensaries are opened and the Veterinary Assistants must either join some other Service or go away from this Presidency. No guarantee for service is given by Government.

Government, however, give a monthly scholarship of Rs. 15 to deserving students during their three years' studies. There are 21 such scholarships.

The present system of recruitment was so far workable when this science was hardly understood by the mass of uneducated people, and even educated people availed themselves of this science to a limited degree. But times have much changed within the last two decades, and this Service has made a headway so far as to make the people understand its utility, and with this progress, together with the progress of education in India, people take or like to take much more advantage of this science, but it is regrettable to note that the development is so slow that no appreciable benefit can be made visible. But there is no doubt that the science is making a very steady progress in very good, deserving, and useful work. However, it is very urgently necessary that a more and fuller scope be given and a better system be now adopted, and that higher knowledge in this respect be imparted.

It was all well and good for the men who had passed years ago, with a very preliminary knowledge, to advertise veterinary science, but now it does not require any advertisement but high professional knowledge to work out good results, and thus make this science more popular and of further utility both to the public and to State. To do this thoroughly it is very desirable to go to the very root and first of all to start this profession on a better basis and impart an up-to-date and thorough knowledge of the veterinary science to the students who pass out from the Veterinary College. It is, therefore, quite necessary that the present curriculum of the College be changed and a higher course of studies be introduced. To do this the College staff requires to be strengthened by at least three European professors from home who have a thorough knowledge of their subjects. The three professors required should be specialists in their subjects, viz., a "Pathologist," an "Anatomist," and a "Hygienist." When the staff is thus strengthened it would be desirable that the entrance to the college be raised to at least Previous examination.

Every year only a limited number of the most suitable type of Previous students should be selected from the candidates that may apply for admittance. The course in the college should be raised from three years to four years, and a thorough grinding in the different subjects be given, more attention being particularly paid to work in connection with cattle than horse. The college should be affiliated to the Bombay University, and a university degree granted. Besides practical and oral examination a written paper in important subjects should be set. To make this service more popular, Government should at least guarantee every year two posts to the first who pass out in their final examination.

Probation.—On passing out, those men who are selected for service in the Subordinate Civil Veterinary Department should further undergo a course of training in bacteriological work at the Imperial Laboratory at Muktesar for a further period of ten months and then put in a period of two months in the office of the Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, to undergo a knowledge of office work. From the date the man has been selected for appointment to the Subordinate Civil Veterinary Department he should receive his pay until he completes his period of deputation, at the rate of Rs. 50 a month. After this period he should be given charge of a dispensary but still kept on probation for two years when he should receive Rs. 60 a month until he is confirmed, when he should draw Rs. 75 per month. (Within two years he must know the language of the district where he is stationed.) During the probation at the laboratory if a student does not prove to be fit he may be given a further chance for two months, and even at the end of this period if he still proves a failure he may be dispensed with. Thus, after passing out of the college until he is confirmed the man will draw within three years his pay at Rs. 75. If after a probation of two years in a dispensary he shows no initiative power or he is unable to spread the veterinary knowledge in a satisfactory manner his services should be dispensed with.

69372. **((III) Conditions of Salary.**—After seven years' approved service a man must be promoted from Rs. 75 to Rs. 100, and after further service of ten years he should draw his maximum of Rs. 125 as a Senior Veterinary Assistant.

The Inspectors, who should be selected from the most able men, irrespective of seniority, should start on Rs. 125 (if selected from the Rs. 75 or Rs. 100 grade) and put on a probation for two years before getting the pay of the Inspector, which ought to be Rs. 150 per month, rising to Rs. 200 by Rs. 10 increment every year.

The Deputy Superintendents should be selected from the most able men serving in the Inspectors' grade, irrespective of seniority. They should start on Rs. 250, rising to Rs. 450 by annual increment of Rs. 25.

69373. **(IV)** *and* **(V) Conditions of Leave and Pension.**—Leave and pension rules for this depart-

ment should be on the same lines as prescribed for the Provincial Civil Service.

Some consideration of pension should be made regarding the past services of the Veterinary Assistants when they were Local Board servants and then transferred to this department. A majority of them are prepared to pay half pension contribution.

69374. **(IX) General.**—The pay shown here seem very liberal, but a close scrutiny will show that if we want this service to be more popular, productive, and efficient it is absolutely necessary to give these pays, looking at the hard work that will be required of them to do and the thorough studies they will have to undergo. Their work in their respective charges will not be limited only to treatment of animals but as Veterinary experts in their own areas. They will do original and research work as well as advise people on live-stock and popularise the science all round. They can be useful helpers to Revenue officials during famine and scarcity; they can look after improvement of cattle, etc.

With such a staff, well paid and well educated, it is quite certain that the work in this direction will within a very short time show very useful and interesting results. To supervise such a staff it is quite necessary that there should be two officers of the Imperial Department in a Presidency like Bombay, and at headquarters of each of these men there should be a small laboratory for practical and research work.

If the Government were to see their way this Service can be still further made popular if two or three appointments of Superintendents in India are specially reserved, as in other Provincial Services, for Indians. These men should be experienced men, who have at least put in 20 years' service in the department, of which at least five as Deputy Superintendent. The pay of these men should be at least Rs. 550, rising to Rs. 700 by Rs. 30 per annum increment. The name Subordinate Civil Veterinary Department should be changed into Bombay Civil Veterinary Service, and the Veterinary Assistants to be called Veterinary Assistant Surgeons.

In conclusion, it will be seen that looking at the arduous nature of the work a veterinary man has to do dealing with animals, the suggestions made above to better their prospects and at the same time better the Service and make it popular and efficient are quite necessary. Even Arts graduates will be found to join the Veterinary College if they find the salaries suitable, and with educated men joining the department the department must develop, and there is ample field in India for its development, not only as regards treatment of animals but in all respects which deal with live stock. Contagious diseases and famines have been constantly carrying off cattle worth lákhs of rupees, which means a great loss both to public and to State in revenues. This department is still in its infancy and must be made attractive to entice the best young men to join and with their combined labour to find out means and ways to combat with diseases and scarcities.

If compared with any other professional service, it will be seen that the Veterinary Service is not only the most poorly paid for the work it has to do, but has no future. This is a most important branch of the Agricultural Department, and as such it ought to receive all help and impetus in its birth to make it efficient and useful in future. With the very poor pay offered at present the men recruited are only third class, and with such a staff it is quite impossible to even develop this department to any great utility.

The pays suggested in these notes are most absolutely necessary if good men are required to join. The pays mentioned are in no way exorbitant if compared with the present sanctioned scale. According to the present scale a man receives Rs. 30 per month, rising to Rs. 100 within 25 years, while the scale suggested here is that a man starts on Rs. 50 and rises to Rs. 125 in 20 years, which cannot be said to be too much. Only the starting pay and for the first three years the salary is kept high because at this time only when a man is just starting in life he feels the pinch, and taking into consideration the high price of living, which has increased by nearly 25 per cent., the pay suggested is very essential. In this Service in the Presidency up to date the majority is of Bráhmins, who are supposed to be very economical in their living, but even they feel that Rs. 30 a month with a family of about four or five persons to maintain in such dear days is quite impossible, and what could they save or lay aside for their children at the time of death or incapacity to work? The work of Veterinary men is fraught with dangers—they have to work with animals and not with human beings. Their constant travelling in all climes, etc., generally deter their health sooner than of men serving in other Services.

If as I have noted above Bráhmins, who are proverbial for their economy, feel the difficulty in these days, it is best imagined what men of other castes, like Christians, Pársees and Mahomedans would feel. Their ways of living are quite of a different type, and it is next to impossible for them to accept service in this department on Rs. 30 a month, with hardly any prospects in the future. It is, therefore, for this reason only that we have hardly five or six men of other castes serving as Veterinary Assistants in this Presidency.

There is at present much importance given to higher education. I do not see why education in the Veterinary Science should not receive its due share.

From my personal experience of nearly 12 years in this Presidency, I say that the men just now recruited from the Veterinary College may be good, but not of the type one requires to popularise a new service and make it efficient and useful, and I am of opinion that a thorough revision of the department is necessary, keeping only one point in view and that is "the efficiency of the Service." Some may think that these proposals are very expensive, but I can confidently say that what little expense the State will have to make in the beginning will be thoroughly recompensed in the near future when it has been efficiently worked up.

MR. J. D. BUXY called and examined.

69375. (*Chairman.*) The witness was a Deputy Superintendent in the Civil Veterinary Department. He entered the Service in 1901, at which time he was a passed student of the Bombay Veterinary College. The other four members of the Provincial Veterinary Service had the same qualification.

69376. Men of a suitable class would be attracted to enter the Veterinary College by the prospect of a salary of Rs. 50 a month.

69377. There would be no objection to recruiting men from outside for the higher appointments, but it would be far better if they rose through the ranks, as they would have more experience, and practical knowledge of the work.

69378. Men who after completing their course in the Veterinary College did not enter Government Service, usually joined the service in some other Province, or went into other departments of the State, or started in private practice. There was very little private practice to be had. The majority of students entered Government Service.

69379. It would improve recruitment if guaranteed posts were given to the two or three top men passing out from the College.

69380. He agreed with the proposal that State aid might be given to exceptional students to enable them to go to England. If the standard of the Indian college course was raised, students might fit themselves for an English course

leading up to a degree. He would make it an essential condition that before an officer joined the Imperial Service of the Veterinary Department, he should undergo a course in England for a short period.

69381. The years of service which men served formerly under local boards should be counted towards pension. Some of these men had put in as many as 10 or 15 years' service under the old conditions.

69382. He suggested the reservation of two or three appointments of Superintendent in India for Indian officers of at least 20 years' service. He considered that such officers would be able to carry out their administrative work in that responsible position with the same ability as younger officers who had received a higher training. A great deal of experience was required for carrying out the work of a Superintendent and men with 20 years' service would have that experience.

69383. He admitted that the training in the local colleges was very deficient at the present time. His aim was to get the standard of the college course raised, so that men might be made fit to hold higher appointments. It would be of great benefit to have one central college for the whole of India. An alternative was to have colleges in the various Provinces, with a uniform course and a uniform standard.

69384. (*Mr. Madge.*) One of the reasons why there was but very little private practice was that ryots had not progressed sufficiently to take advantage of veterinary science; they had their own views of treating animals, and did not require the services of Veterinary Assistants. There was nothing to commend their treatment of animals; it was simply prejudice.

69385. The other reason was that these were Local Board Veterinary dispensaries which treated animals free and hence people do not care to call in a Veterinary Assistant and pay him.

69386. With regard to his recommendations for improving teaching in Indian Veterinary Colleges, he had not calculated what would be the cost of bringing out suitable men as professors. At present it would be far better that qualified men should be brought out from England, than that Indians should be sent to England, but when veterinary science had progressed to a much greater extent in India, it would then be a question whether men should not be sent to England.

69387. With reference to the facilities which existed in India at the present time for original work and research work, there was the Imperial Bacteriological Laboratory at Muktesar, and in certain of the Provinces there were smaller laboratories attached to the Superintendent's office. He was of the opinion that all research work should be carried out in one central institution.

69388. (*Mr. Fisher.*) No Indian University granted a degree in veterinary science. If the course was raised, as he proposed, there was reason to suppose that the Universities would grant such degrees. One particular advantage which would ensue if his recommendation was carried out would be that the English Universities would recognise the degree, and thus give students exemption from a certain number of years' study.

69389. This would enable many young men to go to England and get experience and an English degree, which at present was very difficult owing to the heavy expense of living in England for 4 or 5 years in order to get an English qualification.

69390. (*Mr. Sly.*) He joined the department as Special Assistant to the Superintendent to carry out work in connection with inoculations against rind pest, and to diagnose certain contagious diseases in the Presidency. He started on Rs. 75. He had previously undergone a three years' course in the Bombay Veterinary College.

69391. Private students in the college of whom there were very few paid Rs. 60 a year. Students holding Government scholarships paid nothing. The whole of the students of the college were being trained with the idea of entering Government service.

(The witness withdrew.)

K. Hewlett, Esq., Principal, Bombay Veterinary College.

Written Statement relating to the Civil Veterinary Department.

69392. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The present practice of recruitment is briefly as follows. The Principals of the chief Veterinary Colleges in the United Kingdom are informed of impending vacancies, and invited to suggest names of likely candidates, and the vacancies are also in some cases advertised in the Press. Independent confidential inquiries are made regarding candidates whose names are received through these and other sources by Veterinary-Colonel A. E. Queripel, late Inspector-General of the Indian Civil Veterinary Department. The more promising candidates are then interviewed in the Revenue Department of the India Office, and selected by the Secretary of State, who bases his selection on a consideration of the information collected from different sources. Endeavour is made to obtain men who have either taken the post graduate course of the Royal Veterinary College, Camden Town, or who have laboratory experience as demonstrators or assistant lecturers, and candidates are encouraged to improve their qualification by taking the post graduate course. Candidates must not (except on special grounds, to be approved by the Secretary of State) be over 26 years of age, and must possess a diploma of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons. Evidence of a knowledge of bacteriology and of capacity for carrying out original research is specially taken into account in estimating the claims of candidates. Good health, a sound constitution and active habits are essential, and candidates must be physically fitted for service in India.

The present method of recruitment is satisfactory.

69393. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The standard of professional knowledge required by the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons, combined with the post-graduate course at the Royal Veterinary College, Camden Town, is quite sufficient professional training for a newly joined officer of the Indian Civil Veterinary Department. The young officer on arrival in India is supposed to be trained in the ways of the country and administration by a senior officer, and is posted for training for that purpose. This is quite satisfactory in theory, but in practice it is not considered satisfactory, because, owing to a shortage of officers, the new recruit is put into a responsible position long before he has been sufficiently trained. It is generally held that a newly joined officer should be under training for two full years, and that this time should be spent partly at a Veterinary College, partly under a Superintendent of a Province, and partly at the Muktesar Laboratory. During these two years full facilities also should be given the recruit to learn the vernacular of the Province to which he is posted.

The present period of probation extends to five years. It is generally held that this is an excessive period, and that three years' probation would be sufficient. It has been urged that, if a man's services could be dispensed with after five years' service in India, under the special conditions of the department, he would find very great difficulty in obtaining other suitable employment, and that it is quite possible to arrive at a correct opinion as to a man's suitability after three years. This is probably quite true, and the period of probation might be reduced to three years with advantage both to Government and to the probationers.

69394. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The conditions of service have changed very considerably since the department was reconstituted in 1901, when it was determined to recruit Civilian officers for the department, and when the Government of India published the terms of service for these officers.

In 1901, horse breeding for the Government of India was one of the chief duties of Civil Veterinary Department officers, but the Imperial horse breeding was taken away from the Civil Veterinary Department in 1903, and handed over to the Army Remount Department.

In 1901, the Civil Veterinary Department was a separate department, and officers served under the Inspector-General, Civil Veterinary Department, a member of their own profession and department, but the Inspector-General's authority was weakened after 1903, and steadily declined until the appointment was altogether abolished in 1912. Now Civil Veterinary Department officers are entirely subordinate to Indian Civil Service Directors of Agriculture.

In 1901, the Civil Veterinary Department offered a congenial, pleasant life, and one which would appeal to anyone keen on horses, but now the life of the Civil Veterinary Department officer is one of considerable responsibility, much discomfort and hardship.

In 1901, the Civil Veterinary Department officer in many cases lived in a small, cheap station, now nearly all the headquarter stations are in Provincial capitals.

In 1901, the administration work of a Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, was inconsiderable. He now has to administer a whole department with a large staff of subordinates.

In 1901, the educational work in the Veterinary Colleges was inconsiderable, whereas now the Colleges are large, thoroughly equipped institutions, with extensive hostels for resident students.

(See also Heading II.)

69395. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The salary of Civilian members of the Civil Veterinary Department commences at Rs. 500, and rises by annual increments of Rs. 40 to Rs. 1,100, which rate continues from the beginning of the 16th year to the end of the 20th year of service; after the beginning of the 21st year Rs. 1,200 a month. Before 1912, there was the prospect of obtaining the appointment of Inspector-General on a salary of Rs. 1,800 per mensem. Certain appointments carry extra allowances of Rs. 100-200 per mensem and a house rent-free, or house-rent is allowed in certain cases. In addition to this, exchange compensation allowance, amounting to 6¼ per cent. is permitted.

The conditions of salary are generally considered to be unsatisfactory and to call for revision.

(See also under Heading IX.)

69396. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The conditions of leave of Civilian members of the Civil Veterinary Department are governed by the ordinary Civil Leave Rules for European Services which are considered to be satisfactory on the whole. But it is considered that the furlough pay is insufficient, and that an enhanced minimum allowance per annum should be granted. It is also considered that the furlough reserve required should be one-fifth of the number of active posts, that is to say, that there should be at least five fully-trained officers for this purpose, and that recruits under training should not be counted as furlough reserve officers, but as supernumerary.

69397. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The pension rules are those contained in the Civil Service Regulations for European services. Civilian officers of the Civil Veterinary Department were eligible for the extra pension of Rs. 1,000 per annum, if they had held the Inspector-Generalship for three years of approved service, in the same way as other officers of some other Indian Services are eligible for the increased pension if they have served as head of their department. The possibility of obtaining this increased pension was withdrawn when the appointment of the Inspector-General was abolished in 1912.

The pension rules are considered most unsatisfactory, both as regards the period at which voluntary retirement is permitted and as regards the amounts of the pension. The pension of the Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officers not only compares most unfavourably with the Military Civil Veterinary Department officers but also with the pension of Veterinary Surgeons in the Army Veterinary Corps.

(See also under Heading IX.)

There is some demand among members of the department for a family pension on similar lines to that of the Indian Civil Service.

69398. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing divisions of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—No limitations exist as to the employment of non-Europeans, and in my opinion no limitation should exist, and Indians of suitable qualification and education should be freely admitted to the department. In addition to admitting Indians who possess the requisite qualifications to the department in the same way as any other recruits, I consider that, in time, some of the superior appointments should be held by Indian officers, who have been selected from the Provincial service. I do not consider it practicable, at present, for Provincial officers to hold these appointments, as the department constituted on its present basis is too young a department for a radical change of this nature. For the present, I consider that the professional knowledge and scientific training of the more promising members of the Provincial service should be improved by deputing them to Europe for study, so that they may be better fitted professionally for the Imperial service than they are now. Later, certain of those men of the Provincial Service who have been through the courses of study in Europe and are considered to be professionally qualified, might be taken into the Imperial Service, provided they have proved their suitability for administration and capability of taking responsibility.

69399. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The only services with which the department is brought into close connection are the Civil Service and the Agricultural Department.

Civil Veterinary Department officers are, with the exception of the Muktesar staff, who serve under the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India, serving under the various local Governments and are usually under the control of the Director of Agriculture or Director of Land Records and Agriculture or similar official, who is in all cases, at present, an Indian civilian. In the Madras Presidency, however, the Civil Veterinary Department officers serve directly under the Commissioner of Revenue Settlement Survey, Land Records and Agriculture of the Board of Revenue.

The internal administration of the various Civil Veterinary Departments varies somewhat, and in Burma the entire internal administration is left to the Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department.

It is generally understood from one of the Secretary of State's despatches that eventually, and perhaps shortly, the Directors of Agriculture of the various Provinces are to be members of the Agricultural Department and not members of the Indian Civil Service. If this were to come about, the Civil Veterinary Department officers would be controlled by members of the Agricultural Department.

The Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India has been given certain powers over the Civil Veterinary Department officers, and such powers are much resented in certain quarters, as the powers deal with the publication of scientific work done by members of the Civil Veterinary Department.

The present arrangements are considered to have worked fairly well, and so long as a Civilian Director of Agriculture is prepared to accept the advice of his veterinary officers and content himself with general administration only, there is no great objection to the present system, but any

interference in professional matters is naturally resented. It is, however, very generally considered that the arrangement at present in force in Madras is preferable, and might be adopted elsewhere.

It is without doubt necessary that the Veterinary and Agricultural Departments should work cordially together, and they must in each province be under one officer to co-ordinate the works of the two branches of the service. But neither Veterinarian nor Agriculturist is a suitable officer for this, as the co-ordinating officer must be impartial and unbiassed. In my opinion the officer who co-ordinates should be a senior Indian Civil Service man with the rank of Commissioner. This officer should have wide experience of district life and conditions, but should not be specially trained in Agriculture. The two departments, that is to say the Agricultural Department and the Veterinary Department, should be co-equal, one not subordinate to the other, and a professional agriculturist and a professional veterinary surgeon should each manage his own department respectively and have wide powers. But the co-ordination and supreme control should be in the hands of the Commissioner.

The above suggestions would satisfactorily solve the questions of control of the department in the various Provinces, but it is generally considered that the Government of India should not be without an adviser on veterinary matters affecting the live-stock of the country generally, a position in which they have been since the abolition of the appointment of the Inspector-General of the Civil Veterinary Department in 1912. It is not necessary, or even desirable, that the appointment of Inspector-General should be re-created, for the reasons for that officer's existence largely disappeared when the Imperial Horsebreeding was taken from the Civil Veterinary Department and handed over to the Army Remount Department in 1903. But it is very necessary that there should be a veterinary adviser to advise about the many questions dealing with live-stock, animals, diseases and sanitation which must continue to arise from time to time, and it is essential that such an adviser be intimately acquainted with the ways of the civil community and the needs of the rural population. The work of a veterinary adviser to the Government of India would not be heavy, if strictly confined to technical advice, as it should be, and it is not necessary to have a whole-time officer for the purpose. It is suggested that one of the officers of the department be appointed veterinary adviser to the Government of India in addition to his own duties, and that an extra allowance be given to him for doing the work in addition to his own proper duties.

69400. **(IX) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—(A) The chief causes of dissatisfaction among civilian officers of the Civil Veterinary Department; (B) the remedies suggested for the above; (C) minor causes of dissatisfaction.

(A) There is considerable dissatisfaction among the civilian members of the Imperial Civil Veterinary Department arising out of the changed conditions of their service, the alteration in their relative position and status, and the changing conditions of life in India; and it is considered that an improvement in their terms regarding pay, retirement and pension should be conceded.

The following are the chief causes of dissatisfaction which are considered to afford grounds for making the request for improved terms:—

(i.) The appointment of Inspector-General has been abolished, and so a well-paid appointment with increased pension has been removed from Civil Veterinary Department officers' prospects. This appointment was held out as one of the inducements to join the department. It was distinctly stated in the rules embodying the terms to be offered to civilian candidates for employment in the Civil Veterinary Department published for general information under Government of India Resolution No. 10-8-4, dated 2nd August, 1901, under the heading of pay that "The pay of the Inspector-General, the administrative head of the department will be Rs. 1,800 a month" and again under paragraph 7 dealing with pension that "The Inspector-General will be eligible for the extra pension of Rs. 1,000 per annum admissible to an officer after at least three years' approved service as head of a department, if considered deserving of the special concession."

By abolishing the appointment of Inspector-General the prospects of Civil Veterinary Department officers have been curtailed, by removing their chance of well-paid appointment of good position and of the increased pension attached thereto

(ii.) The Civil Veterinary Department has been greatly reduced in status, and has become to all intents and purposes a Provincial Service. The Civil Veterinary Department was in 1901, for all practical purposes, a self-contained Imperial Department serving under an Inspector-General of its own, who was a member of the same profession and department as the officers subordinate to him, and to whose appointment any officer of the department could aspire. The Inspector-General, although for all practical purposes the head of the department, never had been the administrative head of the department in theory, although candidates were led to believe by the printed conditions of service supplied to them that he was so. Nevertheless, the powers of the Inspector-General were considerable. He controlled several officers serving directly under him and all the Imperial Horsebreeding, and as this in several appointments was almost the sole work of Civil Veterinary Department officers, he practically controlled most of the Civil Veterinary Department officers entirely. But the Inspector-General, Civil Veterinary Department, had very real authority over Civil Veterinary Department officers not engaged in Imperial Horsebreeding or serving directly under him. He arranged their postings, transfer and leave; confirmed officers on probation; recommended officers for promotion; was consulted about posting officers to particular appointments; reviewed their annual reports, and expressed his opinion on their work, etc., etc. But certain changes have taken place which have altered all this. First, the Imperial Horsebreeding was taken away from the Civil Veterinary Department and given to the Army Remount Department. This change really destroyed the department as an Imperial one, because the work to be done ceased to be Imperial and became Provincial. But notwithstanding this the department continued to be more or less an Imperial service and the Inspector-General to hold some authority for some years. But the Inspector-General's authority was weakened from time to time, and eventually his appointment was abolished in 1912. In this way the service became entirely a Provincial service for all practical purposes, and Civil Veterinary Department officers became entirely subordinate to the Provincial Government under the control of the Director of Agriculture (in most cases) or under the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India.

(iii.) The removal of Imperial Horsebreeding from the Civil Veterinary Department in 1903 deprived officers who had entered the department in 1902 because they were fond of horses and horsebreeding of a congenial life.

The horsebreeding duties of a Civil Veterinary Department officer, which before 1903 had been considerable and almost the exclusive duties of a large proportion of officers became after 1903 inconsiderable and of a different nature. It is true that Provincial and District Local Board horsebreeding continued over large areas under the Civil Veterinary Department. But District Local Board stallions are scattered widely over the country, are not taken up into depots, and the Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, only inspects them occasionally and checks returns. But with Imperial Horsebreeding things were different; the Civil Veterinary Department officers were in charge of studs and depots as at Nagar, Babugharh and Abottabad and had a great deal to do with practical horsebreeding and horse management, and their work necessitated a great deal of

their time being spent among horses. To most veterinary surgeons the love of horses and being among horses is one of the greatest pleasures in life, and it is usually the prospect of being able to spend their lives among horses that makes them select their profession. It was, therefore, a very great hardship on those who entered the department in the beginning of 1902 with the prospect of doing horsebreeding to find themselves within a little more than a year deprived of the opportunity of devoting themselves to the side of the profession which appealed to them.

(iv.) The removal of the horsebreeding resulted in the Civil Veterinary Department officers having to abandon as headquarters small Mofussil stations and the change of work necessitated their headquarters being situated in Provincial capitals or large stations. This resulted in the Civil Veterinary Department officer having to spend very much more than formerly on his living expenses, because all things are more expensive in big stations than small ones; and besides this the standard of living is much higer in Provincial capitals than in outstations. The above is of very great importance when comparing the pay of the Civil Veterinary Department officer with the pay of officers of other departments. In nearly all other departments a very fair proportion of stations may be classed as cheap stations, and officers may obtain such stations and economise if they desire to do so. But for the Civil Veterinary Department officer all stations are expensive stations, and he has no chance of obtaining a transfer to a station in which he can economise.

(v.) The terms of the civilian members of the Civil Veterinary Department were prepared and published in 1901, and at that time the department offered a pleasant life with congenial work and without wide responsibility. But since then the conditions of work have been greatly altered, the scope of the department vastly extended, and the department now offers a life of hard, strenuous work. This change is partly due to the removal of the horsebreeding, but chiefly to the very rapid extension in all branches of veterinary work in India, to the rapid expansion of the veterinary departments in all Provinces, and to the fact that in most provinces these departments have been provincialised and are immediately subordinate to the Civil Veterinary Department officer.

(vi.) The terms of pay, etc., for the civilian members of the department were settled in 1901, and were settled for the work and the conditions which then pertained. Moreover, the terms were settled at the same time as certain terms then deemed suitable for the military members were sanctioned. The terms for the civilians were so arranged that they were about the same or slightly better than those of the military members. But subsequently the terms for the military members were raised because of great improvements being made in the terms of the Army Veterinary Service which were improved in consequence of the great strides which had been made in the veterinary profession. But the terms of the civilians remain the same as in 1901 and have not been improved, and so the relative position which the civilian was supposed to hold to the military man in 1901 has been altered at the expense of the civilian. This is a very great hardship. The civilian officers of the Civil Veterinary Department are men who have spent more time and money on their qualifications and education than the military men, the civilians having been through a four years' course before they could take their diplomas, whereas the military men only went through a three years' course. Several of the civilian officers hold additional qualifications to the diplomas of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons, which additional qualifications they have taken at their own expense. No military officer possesses any additional qualification except two, and these officers obtained them at the expense of Government. The civilian officers are better qualified for their professional work than the military men; they do the same work, hold the same appointments and have the same responsibility as the military officers, but notwithstanding this their terms are inferior to those given to the military men. This inferiority in the terms is especially noticeable towards the end of service, *i.e.*, from the 16th year onwards. The poor prospects for future advancement have no doubt been responsible for the resignations of civilians from the department which have occurred from time to time, it being felt by the best men that the department is not sufficiently attractive to induce them to remain in it.

In 1901 the Indian Civil Veterinary Department was considered the best veterinary service open to veterinary surgeons, and there was keen competition for entrance into it, but of late years the popularity of the service has declined, and now it is not such a popular service with graduates of the British Veterinary Colleges as the Army Veterinary Corps. The decline in popularity is due to many causes, but among them are the causes mentioned in this written statement.

(B) The following are the improvements in the terms which are suggested to remedy the above causes of dissatisfaction:—

Pay—The pay should be improved by the annual increment of Rs. 40 per mensem, being continued up to 25th year of service, so that the pay would be Rs. 1,500 per mensem. Exchange compensation allowances should be allowed as at present.

Retirement—(*a*) Voluntary retirement should be permitted after 20 years' service on pension.

(*b*) Voluntary retirement should be permitted after 25 years' service on full pension.

Pension—(*a*) The amount of the pension for 20 years' service should be £365 per annum.

(*b*) The amount of the full pension should be £500 per annum.

(*c*) A good service pension of Rs. 1,000 at 1s. 9d. to be awarded to those officers who have done meritorious service.

The following gives some idea of the pay of the Military Civil Veterinary Department officers as compared with the Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officers:—

The scale of pay for civilians was in 1901 Rs. 500 for the first year, rising by annual increment of Rs. 40 up to Rs. 1,100 per mensem after 15th year, and then rising after 20th year of service to Rs. 1,200 per mensem. The pay of the Inspector-General's appointment was Rs. 1,800 per mensem.

The following was the scale of pay for military officers of the Civil Veterinary Department sanctioned in 1901 (*vide* Government Resolution, Revenue Department, No. 6194, dated 3rd September, 1901, and its accompaniments):—

	Indian Military pay and allowances.	Civil allowances.	Total.
Veterinary Lieutenant—	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Under 5 years	400	150	550
After 5 years	450	200	650
After 10 years	500	250	750
Veterinary Captain	600	300	900
After 5 years as such	650	350	1,000
Veterinary Major—			
After 10 years as Veterinary Captain	750	400	1,150
After 5 years as Veterinary Major	750	500	1,250
Veterinary Lieutenant-Colonel	1,020	500	1,520

The pay of the Inspector-General, Civil Veterinary Department, will be Rs. 1,800 a month, irrespective of rank.

At that time lieutenants became captains after 10 years' service and majors after 20 years' service (*vide* Classified List, July, 1902).

The following is the scale of pay sanctioned by the Secretary of State in 1908, superseding a similar scale which was sanctioned in 1905, which in its turn superseded the scale of 1901 (*vide* Government Resolution, Revenue Department, No. 3419, dated 1st April, 1908). This scale was in force on 1st April, 1913, except that the Inspector-General's appointment had been abolished:—

—	Indian Military pay and allowances.	Civil allowances.	Total.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Lieutenant—			
Under 5 years	480	150	630
Captain—			
After 5 years' total service	570	200	770
„ 7½ „	570	300	870
„ 10 „	650	300	950
„ 12½ „	650	350	1,000
Major—			
After 15 years' total service	750	350	1,100
„ 17½ „	750	400	1,150
„ 5 years' service as such	800	500	1,300
Lieutenant-Colonel	1,120	500	1,620
Colonel	1,220	500	1,720

The pay of the Inspector-General, Civil Veterinary Department, will be Rs. 2,000 a month, irrespective of rank.

At present all the majors in the department have obtained their majority at 15 years' service, and all lieutenant-colonels at 25 years' service or under.

It may be seen, therefore, that the Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officers' prospects do not compare at all favourably with the Military Civil Veterinary Department officers' prospects. The civilian can never obtain more than Rs. 1,200, whereas the military man can obtain Rs. 1,750. The military man gets Rs. 1,300 after 20 years, the civilian only Rs. 1,200; the military man gets Rs. 1,620 after 25 years, and may reach that salary earlier (in one case in 17½ years), the civilian has no such prospects.

The reason for wishing retirement at the times stated are that there are reasons which may make a residence in India prolonged beyond a certain period distasteful or positively hateful, and it is unwise to retain by compulsion officers who entertain such feelings with regard to their surroundings. The reasons I refer to are domestic reasons and temperamental reasons.

Most Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officers come into the department late, and to complete 30 years' service will have to remain until they are 55 years of age, but the nature of the work necessitates a good deal of exposure at all seasons of the year and a very trying mode of life (in the case of superintendents), and it is not to be expected that all men over 50 can or care to stand such a life.

Military Civil Veterinary Department officers are permitted to retire after 20 years' service if they wish to do so, and there are no just grounds for distinguishing between Military and Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officers in this way, more especially as some Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officers joined the department under the impression that they would be allowed to retire after 20 years' service.

Again, retirement before 30 years' service is permitted to some other services. The Indian civilian can retire after 25 years' service, the Forest officer after 20 years' service, and the Indian Medical officer after 17 years' service. What is deemed necessary and just for these services is equally necessary for the Civil Veterinary Department officers.

If the proposed amounts of pension for Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officers be compared with the pensions now permissible to the Military Civil Veterinary Department officers, it will be seen that the suggested pension will place the civilian more nearly on an equality with the military man, but still he will not be so well off. The Military Civil Veterinary Department officer as a major after 20 years' service gets a combined pension of £396. The Civilian Civil Veterinary officer after 20 years' service would get a pension of £365. The Military Civil Veterinary Department officer as a lieutenant-colonel after 25 years' service gets a combined pension of £520. The Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officer after 25 years' service would get a pension of £500.

Besides this the Military Civil Veterinary Department officer has prospects of obtaining pensions of £570 or £620, whereas the Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officer would have no such prospects unless he obtained the good service pension, which would then only amount to £587 10s.

If the present pensions for Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officers be compared with the pensions now permissible to the veterinary surgeon serving in the Army Veterinary Corps it will be seen that the Army Veterinary Corps officer is treated better than the Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officer is now treated and that in spite of the fact that the Army Veterinary Corps man will have spent a considerable portion of his service in Europe.

In the Army Veterinary Corps a major after 20 years' service can retire voluntarily on £300 per annum; whereas a Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officer after 20 years' service can only retire if he is invalided or superannuated, and in that case gets £350. Again, in the Army Veterinary Corps a lieutenant-colonel after 25 years' service can retire voluntarily and gets £400 per annum pension, whereas the Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officer gets £437 10s. if he is invalided or superannuated.

In the Army Veterinary Corps a lieutenant-colonel gets £450 after 30 years' service, whereas a Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officer gets only £437 10s.

In the Army Veterinary Corps a colonel after 30 years' service gets £500.

It is generally considered that the pensions of Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officers, who have to spend their whole lives in India, should be somewhat better than those of the veterinary surgeons of the Army.

The proposed pensions for the Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officers place the Civilian Civil Veterinary Department officer in a suitable relative position with regard to pension to the Army Veterinary Corps officer.

(c) There are two minor causes of dissatisfaction, which are felt keenly by certain members of the department.

(i.) Private Practice.—In the terms of service published by the Government of India in 1901 it is laid down that officers of the Indian Civil Veterinary Department are debarred from private professional practice in India. This rule has very awkward results in certain stations both to horse owners and to veterinary officers. In the case where no other veterinary surgeon is available in the locality horse owners have to ask the Civil Veterinary Department officers to do gratuitous work for them as a personal favour, and have to put themselves under an obligation, which many people dislike. The veterinary officer who does the work does it because he wishes to oblige his fellows and not to be considered churlish. He does not like doing work gratuitously, and he sees no reason why he should receive no remuneration for work done in his spare time. In the case where other veterinary surgeons are available in the locality the prohibition against private practice deprives the Civil Veterinary officer of the only effective means of protecting himself from undue calls on his good nature, as some people either from thoughtlessness or other cause make constant requests to have their animals attended to privately.

The Military Civil Veterinary Department officer under the rules applicable to him is debarred from private practice unless he obtains the permission of the Local Government under which he serves.

This rule, it is suggested, should be made applicable to civilian officers in place of the present regulations.

(ii.) Publication of professional papers.—Under present orders the publication of scientific papers is restricted. Some years ago a journal entitled the Quarterly Journal of Tropical Veterinary Science was started by certain officers of the department as a private concern, but later this journal was taken over by Government and conducted as a Departmental paper. It was resolved at the Veterinary Conference held in 1908 at Calcutta that officers should only publish papers in the Departmental Journal. This restriction narrowed the field of possible papers to subjects dealing with Tropical Veterinary Science. The paper did not deal with surgery or with clinical cases and so no publications on these subjects were permitted. But now things are far worse as the Quarterly Journal of Tropical Veterinary Science is defunct, and the officers of the Civil Veterinary Department have been informed that the Agricultural Journal is open to them and that papers for other Journals must be submitted to the Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India for scrutiny before publication. The Agricultural Journal is no doubt an admirable paper for agriculturists, but it is not read by Veterinary Surgeons or research workers into animal diseases, and should an article be published in it, it would be overlooked by all and would be absolutely buried.

The other alternative necessitates the submission of articles to the Agricultural Adviser for scrutiny, and he is not a professional man and is therefore incapable of judging of the merit of the article.

It is considered that the whole policy in this respect is wrong. In other services it is customary to encourage as much as possible keenness on scientific work, but in this it is discouraged by prohibiting publications of papers except under conditions which are difficult to comply with.

It is suggested that the present orders be modified so that papers may be published in any of the recognised Veterinary publications.

Mr. K. Hewlett called and examined.

69401. (*Chairman.*) The witness came before the Commission to represent the Civilian members of the Veterinary Department. He was Principal of the Veterinary College, Bombay. He had occupied that position since 1910. He had 12 years' service.

69402. He looked forward to a time in the future when the Veterinary Department would be largely staffed by non-Europeans. One way of getting qualified natives of India into the Imperial Service was by promotion from the Provincial Service, but he was not prepared to say it was the best. The best class of recruit for the Imperial Service would consist of men who had been to England of their own accord in order to go through the Veterinary College there, and had then been selected by the Secretary of State. There should, however, be openings also for the promotion of a certain number of officers from the Provincial Service after a course of training in England. He would insist on an English qualification for any Indian officer recruited direct to the Imperial branch, but this would not be necessary in the case of officers promoted from the Provincial branch.

69403. The training given in Indian Veterinary Colleges was not nearly as good as that given in England. It would be almost impossible for some years to bring it up to the same level. He was not in favour of the suggestion of the institution of one central college. It would be very expensive, and there would not be sufficient openings for the graduates of such a college. He would rather proceed on the lines of improving the local colleges.

69404. When he referred to the abolition of the Inspector-Generalship, he did not mean to suggest that there had been any breaking of faith on the part of the Government. He would not favour the re-establishment of the post: but there should be a Veterinary Adviser to the Government of India. He would appoint a selected officer of the department to the post of Veterinary Adviser. His duties would be to advise the Government of India on technical subjects, but he should not be called upon to advise the local Governments with regard to the management of their own departments.

69405. He would favour the appointment for each Province of an officer, preferably from the Indian Civil Service, who would be placed in general charge over the Veterinary and kindred departments. Such an officer need not have had any practical training in Veterinary science; his value would consist in his administrative knowledge, and his knowledge of the country, and his duty would consist in co-ordinating the work of the several departments.

69406. Private practice should be allowed to the members of the Service at the option of the local Governments. Under present conditions private persons had to put themselves under obligations to officers of the departments. He had never received any orders to the effect that a fee could be charged, and be handed over to Government.

69407. (*Mr. Sly.*) It was a fact that the abolition of horse-breeding had prejudicially affected the recruitment of the Department. Most Veterinary Surgeons were very keen on horse-breeding and on horses, and the prospects of being able to do horse-breeding work had been a great attraction to men desiring to enter the Department—much more so than the prospects of doing original research work.

69408. His reason for putting forward the suggestion that a pension should be granted after 20 years' service, was that it was desirable to permit men who found their surroundings uncongenial, and their work unsuitable, to retire. He agreed it would also give an opportunity to the very best officers in the service to leave, but they would not want to go if they were well treated. He was quite prepared to agree that Government should have the power of compulsorily retiring an officer after 20 years' service.

69409. With regard to the scrutiny of papers before publication, the orders of Government referred to technical matters, and scientific theses. All officers of the Civil Veterinary Department in India were prohibited from publishing purely professional technical papers without previous

scrutiny. A similar rule was not in force in any other technical professional department in India. The matter had been brought up at the Veterinary Conference in Calcutta in 1908. The quarterly Journal of Veterinary Science was started by the Department, and officers were only allowed to publish in that journal. When that journal was done away with, the same orders applied to the Agricultural Journal which took its place.

69410. (*Mr. Fisher.*) A Veterinary Surgeon in England would make on the average about £500 or £600 a year in private practice.

69411. (*Mr. Madge.*) The training at present given in Indian Veterinary Colleges was sufficient for the agricultural requirements of the present day. The Veterinary Assistants which the colleges now turned out were quite good enough for the work they had to do.

69412. As far as he had seen it, the treatment of cattle disease by the ryots was wholly unsound, and barbarous in many cases.

69413. Private practice, if allowed, would not interfere in any way with the performance of official duty; if it did, it ought to be at the option of the local Government to prohibit the continuance of it.

69414. Officers of the Department should be allowed to publish their own original papers in any of the Veterinary Journals published in England. Officers could be trusted not to go outside their subject.

69415. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The function of the Veterinary Adviser to the Government of India would be to advise on technical points. Such an officer could be located at his own headquarters, and any question on which the Government of India required his advice could be referred to him there. There would be no personal intercourse between him and the Government of India. The functions could be discharged by correspondence. The Revenue Department of the Government of India would be the department which the Veterinary Adviser would address officially.

69416. At present the Government of India obtained information with regard to Veterinary questions arising in the Bombay Presidency by writing to the local Government, who consulted the Director of Agriculture, who probably consulted the Superintendent of the Veterinary Department, and also the Principal of the Bombay Veterinary College. The effect of his proposal would be to remove the fifth wheel in the coach and also to enable the Government of India to gauge correctly the advice received from all sources.

69417. Some guarantee should be required that the Indian Civil Service man appointed as Rural Commissioner should be an officer who had taken some general interest in agricultural problems and that he was not simply taking the appointment as a convenience to himself, or to the Indian Civil Service.

69418. (*Mr. Sly.*) He would not recruit direct to Deputy Superintendentships, but he would not recommend the abolition of the present rule, as there might be an exceptionally good man who could be appointed direct from the college.

69419. On the whole, he would prefer that a man should go through a long course in the Provincial Service, and then be promoted to the Imperial Service rather than that a young Indian should be selected from the college and sent to England. He admitted that that was not the view he had expressed to the Chairman, but the apparent inconsistency was explained by the fact that in his answer to the Chairman he had not regarded the question as being one of selecting young Indians from the College and sending them to England.

69420. He disapproved of both of these courses. He considered it inadvisable for Government to bear the cost of educating officers for the Imperial Service and disapproved of Indian officers being treated with greater liberality in this respect than Europeans, especially if the status and pay were to be the same in both cases.

69421. (*Mr. Fisher.*) His real view was that the man he would like best would be the Indian of a good class who went to England of his own accord and passed through the Veterinary College and obtained his degree there. The second best man for the Imperial Service would be a Provincial Officer, who had been to England for a short course of training.

(The witness withdrew.)

At the India Office, London, Wednesday, 6th May, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. } *Joint Secretaries.*
R. R. SCOTT, Esq. }

LIEUT.-COL. A. E. QUERIPEL,* called and examined.

69422. (*Chairman.*) The witness had been Inspector-General of the Civil Veterinary Department and now acted as adviser to the India Office in connection with the selection of candidates for appointments to the Indian Veterinary Service. He had held the post of Inspector-General for seven years, when the Department was differently constituted from what it was now. At that time recruitment was entirely from the Army Veterinary Corps, whereas since 1902 the recruitment had been purely civilian. The Selection Committee for the last ten years had consisted of himself and the Revenue Secretary at the India Office.

69423. He did not think the conditions of the Service had altered since he left it, except that the work was now more directly connected with cattle than with horses. He had always divided the work of the Department into three branches: First, the work done by Superintendents, who were in charge of either a Province or a series of districts; secondly, the educational work; and thirdly, the higher research work. Original research work was

* This witness did not submit a written statement.

very difficult to obtain in England before a man went out to India, but there were sometimes men who had been specially trained, such as Major Holmes, who had two years' training at Cambridge and Paris and Berlin. Every Presidency or Province should have a research officer. Men who trained for research work went as a rule to Cambridge in the first place, and there was a post-graduate course under Sir John MacFadyean at the Royal Veterinary College, but it was not sufficiently long. He advocated a post-graduate course for every man who went to India, and his advice hitherto had been to select the men carefully, put them through the post-graduate course, and send them to India for five years, which would really be a probationary period for the Civil Veterinary Department, and then bring them home.

69424. The qualifications laid down were that a man should have obtained his diploma and should have had a successful college career. Occasionally a man might fail to pass one of his examinations and would get through in five years, but it was better still if he went through the course for his diploma in four years. No man was accepted for the Service who had not taken a diploma.

69425. Having obtained a diploma, the men should go through a two months' course at the Royal Veterinary College before being sent to India. At the college they would be taught all the simpler rudiments of laboratory work, sufficient to enable them to take specimens, prepare slides, and generally perfect themselves in knowledge of the microscope. With their previous training, two months were sufficient for that, because it was quite preliminary work. Then the officer should be sent to India for five years and make himself acquainted with the country and with the work to be done, and then he would be in a position to come home and profit by further training. That was a system which was in practice now, not a single man being taken who had not gone through the post-graduate course and he was selected on the understanding that he would go through the course. It was a very great hardship that he had to go to the college at his own expense, because a young man had to spend something like £500 in order to get a diploma, and he was not as a rule recruited from the monied classes. Ordinarily a veterinary surgeon as soon as he had taken his diploma obtained work either as an assistant or as a *locum tenens*, getting probably £3 or £4 a week. When he came up for an appointment in India, he was told that he would have to go through the post-graduate course, and he then had to relinquish his appointment and come up to London for two months and pay 10 guineas for the course. He had also to get an outfit. He received no pay until he landed in Bombay, and consequently he was rather crippled financially, and a knowledge of that prevented good candidates from coming forward. To meet that difficulty the fees of the post-graduate course should be paid and a subsistence allowance of £2 or £3 a week should be given to the candidate, contingent on a certificate of satisfactory work.

69426. At one time there was an ample field of selection, but difficulties would be experienced if many men were required in future. As it was, only one or two men were required each year, and in some years none at all. In 1902, four officers had to be selected; in 1903, none; in 1904, two; in 1905, four; in 1906, six; in 1907, five; in 1908, one; in 1909, none; in 1910 and 1911, one each; and in 1912 and 1913, two each. In 1906, eight had to be selected but two refused the appointments. There were very often two or three very good men up for one vacancy and several men in that way had to be sent adrift. In the following year, perhaps, when the men were written to in connection with other vacancies, they were found to be employed in Rhodesia, Egypt, or some other out of the way place. As a rule, the India Office made the vacancies known at once, but there were many unexpected vacancies. Having regard to the small numbers, averaging about two a year, it would no doubt always be possible to get good men.

69427. The method of selection was for the Secretary of the Revenue Department to write and say there would be one or two vacancies to be filled up in the next July, and those vacancies were advertised in the different Veterinary Journals. Being in close touch with all the colleges, he himself approached the Principals, and found their help of very great assistance. No man was selected for the Indian Veterinary Department unless he was recommended by the Principal of the college from which he had graduated, as the Principal had known the candidate for four years and would not recommend any man who was not suitable. The candidates recommended by the Principals were asked to submit their applications and the applications were considered by the Revenue Secretary and by himself. As a rule it was possible to tell at once, by looking through the applications, whether the general education of the candidates would qualify them for appointment, and candidates who were considered suitable were brought before the Committee, generally about half a dozen candidates for one or two vacancies. He did not think the presence of someone on the Committee who was still in the Service and knew the conditions would be of very material assistance, as veterinary work in India had not changed much since he himself was in India. He was certainly of opinion that the present system was quite sufficient. His objection to having a Senior Officer home on leave to assist in the selection was that the officer would have many friends in England and would be continually asked to say a good word for some special candidate. A large amount of interest was brought to bear to help a candidate through; in fact, he had had one candidate up before him three times who was strongly recommended by a late Member of Council because he knew the candidate's father very well.

69428. No Indians had come home to undergo the course and no applications had been received from Indians. He did not think any Indians were on the register of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons. Indians would not be allowed to take the diploma of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons without going through the course at one of the recognised colleges, and he did not see how facilities could be given to Indians to attain a position in the superior ranks of the Service by coming to England and going through a good post-graduate course. It was a recognised thing in England and in all the Colonies and Protectorates that every candidate for the post-graduate course should be a qualified member of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons. He did not think any college would take an unqualified man from India to train; in fact, it would be rather an unprofessional thing to do. The qualifications obtained in India were not recognised in England, and any Indian trained in India could only obtain a subordinate position in a Colony or Protectorate, as he would not be considered a qualified man. Many Indians came home to qualify in medicine, but up to date no Indians had come home to qualify for the diploma of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons, and he had never been able to understand why. Probably the Department was too young and not sufficiently known, and probably it had not sufficient attractions for Indians. He did not see how teaching could be obtained in India which would qualify a man to take his diploma, as the curriculum and training in the colleges in England and in India were as different as chalk and cheese, one being quite a scientific training and the other simply a preliminary training. The only way an Indian could get into the Service was by coming to England and going through the college and obtaining a diploma, and no man in the superior Service should have a qualification lower than that of M.R.C.V.S. It would be a great pity to lower the standard of qualification for the Indian Veterinary Service below that which was recognised all over the world.

69429. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) No one who had not obtained the diploma of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons could under any circum-

stances go in for a post-graduate course in England. It was laid down in connection with the Royal Veterinary College: "Post-graduate courses, open only to qualified veterinary surgeons and medical men, in veterinary pathology and bacteriology will be held in October and November of each year." He did not think the governors of the College would sanction an exception in the case of Indians recommended by the India Office.

69430. He did not think a Board of Selection would be less liable to the influence of outside pressure than a single individual, because pressure could be brought to bear on each individual member of the Board of Selection. It might be that each individual on the Board would have pressure brought to bear upon him by different people in the interests of different candidates, and the pressure might thus be neutralised, but he thought the best thing was to have one or two people who did not care a rap for anybody.

69431. The Indian Veterinary Service had recruited a very high class of men but India had not had sufficient attractions to keep them, and he instanced the case of Sir Stewart Stockman, Mr. Montgomery, and Mr. Martin. In order to keep good men in India it would be necessary to offer the attraction of an increased scale of pay and that was why he recommended that men for research work should receive higher pay.

69432. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) At present the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons did not admit training in any other part of the Empire as part of the qualification for a diploma, but he believed it was proposed, though the scheme was not yet passed, that men who had taken their degree in arts at one of the universities should be allowed to cancel their first year, *i.e.*, that they should go through a three years' course at the veterinary colleges instead of four.

69433. The Principals of veterinary colleges kept closely in touch with their old pupils, and he was very careful in inquiring, when a candidate came up, what he had been doing from the time that he qualified to the time of his application, and if he had any doubt on the matter he wrote to the different members of the profession under whom the candidate had been working.

69434. He recognised that it was very necessary there should be confidence in the Board of Selection, but he did not think that that confidence would be considerably increased if there were upon the Board men who were still actually in the Service.

69435. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) For the past ten years the average number of men who had qualified as veterinary surgeons by taking the diploma of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons had been about 80, as compared with 120 in the previous decade. Taking all Public Services in the Colonies and Protectorates and India and Great Britain, there were about 400 appointments in which vacancies had to be filled up. The Army Veterinary Department consisted of about 180 to 200 members and vacancies had to be filled up there. Private practice also absorbed a good many.

69436. It was impossible to train Indians in India as no veterinary institution there would go to the expense of maintaining a very expensive teaching staff from England for the purpose of training men to fill one or two vacancies per annum in the Indian Civil Veterinary Department. It would certainly be possible if money was spent on getting the best professors out from England, but he could not see why that expense should be incurred when there were already institutions in England where the men could be trained. He would like to see Indians appointed to the Superior Service so that by living in the country amongst the people both during their service and after retirement they might create the right kind of scientific atmosphere, but it was absolutely necessary for them to obtain the diploma before they entered the Service.

69437. (*Mr. Sly.*) The statistics he had given with regard to the number of candidates each year for vacancies related only to candidates selected for appointments; he was unable to give statistics of the number of candidates who applied. In the year when six were required 14 were selected to come up for interview by the Secretary.

69438. With regard to the attractions of the Indian Veterinary Service as compared with the attractions of the Army Veterinary Department, candidates preferred the Army, which had other attractions besides pay. India undoubtedly got better men than the Colonial Service. If vacancies occurred in India and in the Colonies or Protectorates the men preferred to go to India; they only took appointments in the Colonies when they found there were no vacancies to be had in the East. He placed the Army first, India second, and the Colonies third in point of attractiveness. It was difficult to compare home appointments as there were so many which were not pensionable.

69439. There had been a material diminution in the number of candidates since the abolition of the Inspector-Generalship. That had directly influenced recruiting and he had evidence from men who said they would have applied had the Inspector-Generalship not been abolished. Their objections were based both on professional reasons and material prospects; the men had a very strong objection to being under laymen who could not judge of their professional abilities.

69440. During recent years there had been a very large increase in the number of official appointments for veterinary surgeons in England, as veterinary officers of health under local bodies, inspectors of meat, milk inspectors, etc., but there had been no difficulty in filling those appointments. A Committee had sat in England to consider the question and came to the conclusion that it would be a false policy to try to increase the number of men without being able to guarantee appointments for them, and thought it was better to leave things as they were.

69441. There had been a movement to endeavour to impose a university education on veterinary surgeons, but if the proposal was adopted it would interfere with the whole of the Services as it would materially reduce the number of candidates. The expenses connected with the training of veterinary surgeons were sufficiently great now without adding to them. There was a great hardship on the men who were recruited when the Inspector-Gneralship was in existence, as then they had a possibility of rising to Rs. 1,800, with Rs. 1,000 extra pension on retirement, whereas now they could only rise to Rs. 1,200 a month.

69442. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The main work of the Veterinary Department in India now concerned cattle, not horses, but that change had not greatly affected recruitment in the Civil Veterinary Service. The change caused by the disappearance of horses had not involved any change in the curriculum of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons, as the training in the various colleges had as much to do with cattle as with horses.

69443. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) He saw no use in having a competitive examination, because if the candidate had gone throught the college satisfactorily and had the diploma, he was fully qualified. A competitive examination might bring in very undesirable men. There were a certain number of men who went into the college and just scraped through the bare matriculation; their education was absolutely deficient before entering, and yet they might do very well in the professional examinations.

69444. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The only suggestion he could make in regard to Indians was that they should go through the diploma course in England. It would be impossible to guarantee appointments for Indians who did this, but having obtained their diploma they would be eligible for any Government appointment either in England or in the Colonies or in India. A good man always had his chance. Men who had been sent out from India to subordinate appointments in the Straits and Ceylon and other places had been very well treated. If an Indian student's choice was limited to India and he took his veterinary diploma and was not selected he would be stranded, although there was

no doubt that there was a good field for private practice in India at the present time. As a member of the Army Veterinary Corps, when he was in India he had no difficulty in obtaining in private practice Rs. 400 or Rs. 500 a month, and sometimes Rs. 900, although he did not lay himself out for it.

69445. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) There was no means now by which a man who had had a certain amount of education elsewhere and desired to acquire a higher education in veterinary science could acquire it in England without going through the College. There was a Veterinary College in London, one in Edinburgh, one in Glasgow, one in Dublin, and a school attached to the Liverpool University, and there was a post-graduate course at the University of Manchester. No qualification was recognised for a post-graduate course in England except the diploma of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons.

69446. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) He believed there were certain colleges in Canada and Australia that were recognised in Great Britain, but he could not say definitely.

69447. He had made himself acquainted with the advance in veterinary instruction which had taken place in India since he left, especially in Madras. He did not think it would be well to have somebody sitting on the Board of Selection in England who was in touch with the recent developments in India, as he believed there was no difference in the conditions of service in Madras or Calcutta or Lahore.

(The witness withdrew.)

At the India Office, London, Thursday, 7th May, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.S.I.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. } *Joint Secretaries.*
R. R. SCOTT, Esq. }

SIR JOHN M'FADYEAN, M.B., B.SC., M.R.C.V.S., LL.D., Principal, Royal Veterinary College, London, N.W.

Written Statement relating to the Civil Veterinary Department.

69448. (*1*) From the nature of the duties which members of the Civil Veterinary Department in India have to carry out, and the circumstances in which they are placed, it is desirable that the best of the recent graduates in point of intelligence and education should be induced to enter the Service.

(*2*) During recent years the attractions of the Service have been reduced, while competition for suitable officers on the part of other public Services has increased, and the total number of suitable candidates has fallen considerably.

(*3*) The chief competitor for candidates is the Army Veterinary Service, but there are also now more numerous appointments for whole-time veterinary officers in the self-governing Dominions and the Colonies.

(*4*) If the present conditions of service are not substantially improved it will soon be quite impossible to recruit the Department with men possessing the desirable qualifications.

(*5*) To prevent this the scales of pay and pension ought to be equal or slightly superior to those of the Army Veterinary Service.

(*6*) The number of officers in the Service ought to be increased to such an extent as will allow the youngest officers on probation to be adequately trained before they are thrown on their own responsibility in carrying out field work. Probably two years would not be too long for that training.

(*7*) With a view to providing a reserve of officers capable of filling up vacancies on the staff of the Veterinary Colleges and of the Muktesar Laboratory a system of study leave for selected junior officers is very desirable.

SIR JOHN M'FADYEAN called and examined.

69449. (*Chairman.*) The witness was Principal of the Royal Veterinary College, Camden Town. He had nothing to do with the selection of candidates for the Veterinary Department in India, except that when consulted by Colonel Queripel he might be called in to advise regarding students whom he knew personally. He believed he had known personally 80 per cent. of the students who had been recruited for the Department in the last ten years or more, so that to that extent, he had taken part in the selection, when his opinion had been called for.

69450. Of recent years the attractions of the Service had been considerably reduced and there was a falling off in the candidates. He saw no other way of reviving the popularity of the Service than by improving the prospects. He did not know that an Indian career would ever be a very popular one, and he believed that to get recruits equal to the standard of those who went into the Army Veterinary Service it would be necessary to make the attractions in respect of pay and pension better than those offered in the Army Service; otherwise the Indian Service would have to take the leavings of the Army. There were special cases where men for some reason or other would not enter the Army under any circumstances, and yet would like to go to India, but, speaking generally, he was quite satisfied that what he had said was true.

69451. The work in the Civil Veterinary Department was different from that of the Army Veterinary Service, and within recent years the differences had become more marked. He did not think, however, that this would have the effect of diminishing the competition between the two Services. Both Services had to take young men. The qualifications for one Service were substantially the same as those required for the other. What was desired was the highest possible intelligence, the best possible general education, and the best

possible professional education, combined with certain personal qualifications, and those things were wanted equally for both Services.

69452. In the Civil Veterinary Service the men ought to have a more specialised knowledge, but as the candidates were young any great amount of specialisation could not be looked for. That was why he had made suggestions with regard to study leave in his written statement, and proposed to allow a period of a couple of years in which an officer of the Department, after a term of service in India, could go through a post-graduate training in particular Indian diseases.

69453. There were five veterinary colleges in Great Britain, two in England, two in Scotland, and one in Ireland. The college with which he was connected was much the largest, turning out nearly as many candidates as the other four put together. All the colleges had to educate to the same standard and the students had to take the M.R.C.V.S. diploma.

69454. At present there were no Indian students in the Royal Veterinary College, but generally there were one or two. He did not think any Indian student had completed the course and obtained the diploma for the past ten years.

69455. There were post-graduate courses held at the Royal Veterinary College, to which Indians could be admitted, and Indians had been admitted to them from colleges in India. There were, however, no post-graduate courses which could be utilised for the purpose of giving Indians who had not a European qualification a training sufficient to enable them to take their place in the higher branches of the Service. The nature of the work in the post-graduate courses was partly based on the tuition the student had received before graduation and the courses were very short. If it was suggested that a post-graduate training should bring the professional knowledge of a student who had studied in one of the Indian Veterinary Colleges up to that of the European graduate, his answer was that it would be possible but it would require a long post-graduate course, owing to the fact that the training in the Indian colleges was admittedly inferior to the training in England. But although it would be possible it had to be remembered that at present Indian students were recruited of a different standard of general education, and this was a very important point. Assuming that such a course could be devised, it would take one or two years for an Indian from an Indian Veterinary College to take a post-graduate course that would bring him on an equality with the European entering the Service, but it would require to be a special course, as the existing classes would hardly do. The numbers were not sufficient to make it worth while establishing such a course. It could be done, but from the money point of view it would appear to be impracticable. All the subjects, as he understood, were taught in a more elementary fashion in India than in England. Men came from all parts of the Empire to attend the post-graduate course —Australia, Canada, New Zealand, etc.—but all of them had taken the British diploma before they came. It was very rare that men came straight from Australian or Canadian veterinary colleges to take the post-graduate course. There were no veterinary colleges in South Africa. There was a veterinary college in Canada and one or two veterinary graduates had come over. He did not think an Australian graduate had ever come from Australia for the course. Veterinary education in Australia had within recent years been brought up to the European standard, but in Canada it had not.

69456. There should be an extended period of training for the younger officers after their arrival in India; and he suggested this should be two years, so that the officer might acquire knowledge of the country and of the language and have some knowledge of the special diseases of India. It was also important to provide a reserve of officers capable of filling up vacancies on the staffs of veterinary colleges and a system of study leave. A few years ago he had recommended that study leave should be granted to some of the officers in the Civil Veterinary Department, and arrangements were made accordingly, but study leave had been only granted to two of the officers and he understood the system had been stopped. Provided study leave was granted he would leave the selected officers considerable latitude. He would be prepared to grant facilities for a post-graduate course in his own college or allow them to spend the time at any place where they could get a proper training in research. It was possible that they might also be allowed to see the research which was going on at other recently established research institutes for the study of animal pathology in this country. They should also be given the alternative of going to Paris or spending part of their time in England and part in Paris or in Berlin or Budapest. The period of study leave would be definitely fixed and the officers should have permission to divide it up between the different selected places. The same course of study leave could not be provided for a candidate coming from an Indian Veterinary College. The average Indian veterinary graduate would not be qualified for a research course; he would not be like officers who had had a good general education and professional education on the top of which they had had practical experience. Such officers would be able to take part in research investigations and that was the best sort of training. He did not see any simple way by which an Indian trained in an Indian college could perfect his education in the colleges in England. Th only way was to endeavour to improve the education in the Indian colleges. If an Indian student simply came to England and put in one complete year in attending the final courses of instruction at a British veterinary college it would considerably improve his knowledge, and if on the top of that he attended a short post-graduate course in pathology and bacteriology that would still further improve his knowledge. That was quite practicable. But he could not make suggestions for giving courses to Indian veterinary graduates which would bring them up to the same level as European graduates. A year, together with a certain amount of research, was the nearest approach possible, without organising a special class; and unless there was a sufficient number of students the organisation of a course would be difficult and costly.

69457. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) It was a mistake on Colonel Queripel's part to say that no one who did not possess the British diploma could attend the post-graduate course at any of the British colleges. The College did not admit to the post-graduate courses any other persons than qualified veterinary surgeons or medical men, but for that purpose a student was recognised as qualified who had obtained a diploma from one of the Indian Veterinary Colleges; and several Indian graduates had gone through the course.

69458. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The standard for admission to the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons for the last sixteen or eighteen years had been the same as for admission to the profession of medicine; the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons had adopted the regulations of the General Medical Council with regard to general education and those regulations were accepted. Latin was compulsory. He did not know whether that operated to keep Indian students out. As a matter of fact, the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons at present were revising the rules with regard to general education, and a proposal had been put forward that Latin should not be insisted upon as a compulsory subject, as it was rather preferred that candidates should take modern languages like French or German. All the higher educational qualifications throughout the civilised world were accepted as equivalent to an entrance examination, especially those of British Possessions and India. The degrees in Arts of the different universities in India and some of the tests for admission to universities were accepted by the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons. The Indian B.A. degree would not be accepted at present if it did not include Latin. There might be 70 or 80 different

qualifications granted throughout the world that were accepted provided they satisfied certain conditions.

69459. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Indians had come from Indian colleges to attend the post-graduate course, but he did not think a special course could be formed to enable Indians to become qualified up to the standard of the English qualification even by special lectures and special teaching, because their professional education from top to bottom had been elementary. An exceptional Indian student who had a good educational qualification and had taken a diploma from an Indian Veterinary College would be permitted to attend any of the ordinary courses of instruction given to undergraduates and if he had a qualification from an Indian Veterinary College he would be admitted to the post-graduate course, but not otherwise.

69460. (*Chairman.*) There had been several Indians who had done that, but no examination had been conducted to test the benefit they had derived from the post-graduate training.

(The witness withdrew.)

NOTE.

69461–70043. Attention is also invited to the following:—

I. Evidence given by Mr. F. C. Drake, Secretary in the Revenue and Statistics Department of the India Office, on Monday, 4th May, 1914. This will be found generally in paragraphs 66679–66719 in the sections of this volume (XV.) relating to the Forest Service and the Agricultural Department, and in particular in paragraphs 66696–7, 66708 and 66716.

Mr. Drake also put in the following statement with special reference to the Civil Veterinary Department:—

Statement to show the number of Officers appointed by the Secretary of State to the Indian Civil Veterinary Department from 1904 *to* 1914 (*end of April*) *inclusive.*

Year.	Europeans.	Indians.
1904	2	—
1905	4	—
1906	6	—
1907	5	—
1908	1	—
1909	1*	—
1910	1	—
1911	1	—
1912	2	—
1913	2	—
1914 (to end of April) ...	2	—
Total	27	—

* Includes one appointment to Muktesar in each year.

II. Memorandum on appointments made by the Secretary of State for India in Council to certain branches of the Government Service in India—*vide* Vol. I., Appendix.

LIST OF APPENDICES.

PAGE.

I.—Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, No. 238, dated 22nd October, 1913, forwarding the views of the Punjab Government 328

II.—Letter from the Government of the United Provinces, Industries Department, to the Secretary to the Government of India, Department of Revenue and Agriculture, No. 1293, dated the 15th September, 1913, containing the views of the Government of the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh on the Civil Veterinary Department 329

III.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bengal relating to the Civil Veterinary Department 329

IV.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bihar and Orissa relating to the Civil Veterinary Department 330

V.—Memorandum prepared by the Assam Administration relating to the Civil Veterinary Department 331

VI.—Note, dated the 9th April, 1913, by the Honourable Sir Archdale Earle, Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Civil Veterinary Department 332

VII.—Note, dated the 1st August, 1913, by the Honourable Sir Archdale Earle, Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Civil Veterinary Department, supplementary to his note of the 9th April, 1913 332

VIII.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Civil Veterinary Department 333

IX.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Civil Veterinary Department 334

X.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bombay relating to the Civil Veterinary Department 337

XI.—Memorandum prepared by the Administration of the Central Provinces and Berar relating to the Civil Veterinary Department 338

XII.—Statement of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Civil Veterinary Department (appointments under the Government of India) 339

XIII.—Statement (with details by Provinces) of the Provincial Establishment of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Civil Veterinary Department 340

XIV.—Regulations for appointment to the Indian Civil Veterinary Department 342

XV.—Officials and non-officials who furnished written evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their enquiry into the Civil Veterinary Department, but who were not orally examined 342

APPENDIX I.

Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, No. 238 (Rev. and Agri.—Agri.), dated Lahore, 22nd October, 1913.

With reference to your letter* dated 1st August, 1913, I am directed to forward 20 copies of a letter from the Director of Agriculture and Industries, Punjab, No. 3453, dated 2nd October, 1913, and of its enclosures, furnishing the information required in connection with the Civil Veterinary . . . Department in the Punjab.

Enclosures in covering letter from the Director of Agriculture and Industries, Punjab, No. 3453, of Lahore, 2nd October, 1913.

Statement showing supplementary information as to the organisation of the Civil Veterinary Department in the Punjab.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation and whether these regulations are satisfactory.—(a) Army Officers of the Civil Veterinary Department.*—The practice of recruiting Civil Veterinary Department Officers from amongst the Army Veterinary Officers has been discontinued.

(*b*) *Indian Civil Veterinary Department Officers.*—The rules on these points are contained in the Government of India resolution, No. 10—8-4, dated 2nd August, 1901.

Satisfactory.

(*c*) *Provincial Service Officers.*—There are at present one Professor of Surgery and three Senior Assistant Professors in the Punjab Veterinary College who belong to the Provincial Veterinary Service. Recruitment is from graduates of the Punjab Veterinary College.

Not satisfactory. Post-graduate training is necessary.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890, 1900 *and the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.—(a) Army Officers of the Civil Veterinary Department.*—

	1900. Military pay.	Civil allowance.
	Rs.	Rs.
Veterinary Lieutenants under 5 years' service	400	150
Veterinary Lieutenants after 5 years' service	450	200
10 years' service	500	250
Veterinary Captains	600	300
Veterinary Captains after 5 years' service in that class ...	650	350
Veterinary Major after 10 years' service as Veterinary Captain	750	400

Army Veterinary Officers serving in the Civil Veterinary Department were entitled to military rank and title and all other advantages conferred on Army Veterinary Officers by the Royal Warrant of pay and promotion.

The salary and rank of the Inspector-General, Civil Veterinary Department corresponded with those of Provincial Veterinary Officers in India, his total emoluments being Rs. 1,620 per mensem irrespective of rank.

	1913. Military pay.	Civil allowance.
	Rs.	Rs.
Lieutenants under 5 years' service	480	150
Captains—		
After 5 years' total service ...	570	200
After 7½ years' total service ...	570	300
After 5 years' service as such (or on completing 10 years' total service, if he received his commission before 5th October, 1898)	650	300
After 2½ years' total service ...	650	350
Major—		
After 15 years' total service ...	750	350
After 17½ years' total service ...	750	400
After 5 years' service as such (or after 20 years' total service if promoted on or before the 20th March, 1902) ...	800	500
Lieutenant-Colonel	1,120	500
Colonel	1,220	500

* Not reprinted.

The post of Inspector-General, Civil Veterinary Department, carrying a salary of Rs. 2,000 per mensem, had been abolished with effect from 1st April, 1912.

Not satisfactory. See paragraph 69248.

(*b*) *Indian Civil Veterinary Department Officers.*—The Civil Veterinary Department came into being in 1901. The pay is progressive. The pay on appointment is Rs. 500 per mensem, rising to Rs. 1,110 by annual increments of Rs. 40. After 20 years' service Rs. 1,200. The post of Inspector-General, Civil Veterinary Department, carrying a salary of Rs. 2,000, has been abolished from 1st April, 1912.

There are two allowances, viz., a local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem, attached to the post of the Principal, Punjab Veterinary College, and a conveyance allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem has recently been sanctioned for the Superintendent, Government Cattle Farm, Hissar.

Not satisfactory. See paragraph 69248.

(*c*) *Provincial Service Officers.*—The post of Professor of Surgery in the Punjab Veterinary College is usually held by an Imperial Service Officer, but is at present held by a Provincial Service Officer drawing pay Rs. 600—25—700. The pay of the three senior Assistant Professors is Rs. 200—20—400.

Not satisfactory. See paragraph 69248.

3. *The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.—(a) Army Officers of the Civil Veterinary Department.*—Further recruitment into Civil Veterinary Department of this class of officers has been discontinued. There are only three offcers of this class serving in the Punjab, one of whom is Colonel, one Lieut.-Colonel, and one Major of 17½ years' standing. There is no reserve for leave and training in the Punjab.

(*b*) *Indian Civil Veterinary Department Officers.*—Apart from the three posts held by the Army Officers in Civil employ seven officers of the Indian Civil Veterinary Department are employed in the Punjab, one of whom is in transit from long leave. There is no leave or training reserve for the Punjab.

(*c*) *Provincial Service Officers.*—Three posts in the grade. No leave or training reserve.

4. *What appointments outside the cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by the officers of the various Services.—(a) Army Officers of the Civil Veterinary Department.*—None.

(*b*) *Indian Civil Veterinary Department Officers.*—One temporary appointment of Camel Specialist is held by a member of the Indian Civil Veterinary Department.

(*c*) *Provincial Service Officers.*—The post of the Professor of Surgery is held by a Provincial Service Officer temporarily. On his vacating it it will be filled up by an Imperial Officer.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.—(a) Army Officers of the Civil Veterinary Department.*—None.

(*b*) *Indian Civil Veterinary Department Officers.*—It is not clear what is regarded as our existing cadre. The posts required are:—

College.
1 Principal.
4 Professors.

District Work.
1 Chief Superintendent.
2 Superintendents.

Special.
1 Superintendent of Cattle Farm.
1 Camel Specialist.

Total ... 10 Indian Civil Veterinary Department Officers.

(*c*) *Provincial Service Officers.*—Yes. Three more Deputy Superintendents on Rs. 200—20—400 are required.

APPENDIX II.

Letter from the Government of the United Provinces, Industries Department, to the Secretary to the Government of India, Department of Revenue and Agriculture, No. 1293, dated the 15th September, 1913, containing the views of the Government of the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh on the Civil Veterinary Department.

I am directed to invite a reference to the correspondence* ending with Letter No. 2666, dated the 12th May, 1913, from the Appointment Department of this Government, submitting for transmission to the Public Services Commission a copy of the memorials* of Messrs. E. W. Oliver and C. W. Wilson of the Civil Veterinary Department of this Province, and to convey the opinion of the Lieutenant-Governor on the points raised in the memorials.

2. As regards the request for some compensation for the loss of the post of Inspector-General of the Civil Veterinary Department, it is obvious that although a very small number may be prejudiced by the abolition of the post the majority of the members of the Service could not hope to hold it. But at the same time its abolition does remove one desirable post from some of the ablest men of the Service who had reasonable hopes of attaining to it. Moreover, while the Secretary of State, in order to compensate the members of the Military Veterinary Officers in civil employ, has directed that no reduction should be made in the number of posts of Colonels, nothing has been done for the civilian members of the Department.

3. As regards the request for some general improvement in the conditions of the Service the complaint of the members of the Civil Veterinary Department is that their scale of pay was fixed before the recent rise in prices, that they have to live in expensive centres such as Lucknow, and that a great deal more work and responsibility is being imposed on them than formerly. Such drawbacks are common to most Services and but slowly reduce their popularity; combined, however, with other circumstances they may seriously affect recruiting. It is stated that appointments in the Veterinary Department are becoming unpopular in England owing to the fact that the emoluments do not compensate for the expenses of the scientific training now demanded. The great fall in the number of students at various British colleges within the last ten years is evidence of the decrease in attraction, and the reasons for this unpopularity are readily understood. A good deal of the work is of a distasteful nature, and it is probably the fact that the profession is not held in a very high social esteem. At the same time, partly owing to the spread of knowledge of the nature of animal diseases and partly owing to their intimate connection with public health, a much higher standard of scientific knowledge is being demanded from the members of the profession. This is specially true of India, where the Service calls for a sound bacteriological training. It therefore seems probable that some action will be necessary to improve the prospects of the Indian Civil Veterinary Department if a sufficient number of recruits to man the Department is to be forthcoming.

4. His Honour trusts, however, that this probable increase in the cost of the Service will be fully provided for before the Service is provincialised. I am in this connection to refer to my letter No. 571, dated the 19th April, 1913.

Sir James Meston is unwilling to regard this increase as an additional burden in the future on Provincial revenues, and hopes that the Imperial Government will see its way to cover the improvement by an assignment from the Imperial revenues.

5. I am to add that for the reasons already mentioned it appears to the Lieutenant-Governor to be highly improbable that Indians will be forthcoming of sufficient training to be appointed to the higher posts in the Department. Veterinary work has always been unpopular among educated Indians, and a man with the education and means to go through a course in an English veterinary college would almost certainly prefer some other line of life, while the Indian veterinary colleges must develop greatly before they could turn out men sufficiently well trained. They have not yet begun to attract the class of men who would profit by a higher scientific education.

* Not printed.

APPENDIX III.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bengal relating to the Veterinary Department.

THE IMPERIAL VETERINARY SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The Imperial Civil Veterinary Department, as at present constituted, is composed of officers of the Army Veterinary Department electing to remain permanently in civil employ and of civilian officers recruited from the Veterinary Colleges in England. It has been decided that the Department in future is to be recruited entirely from the latter source.

The civilian officers are selected by the Secretary of State for India from among candidates ordinarily under twenty-seven years of age and possessing a diploma from the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons. They are first appointed on probation for five years and are required to qualify in the vernacular within two years. It is usual for all officers on arriving at this country to obtain some training partly in the Bacteriological Laboratory at Muktesar and partly under a Superintendent in the provinces before being entrusted with responsible work.

The present regulations are working satisfactorily.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The Imperial Service was not organised before the year 1892. In 1900 the salary of Civil Veterinary Officers who were recruited from the Army Veterinary Department consisted of the Indian military pay and allowances of rank and a staff or civil allowance on the following scale:—

	Indian Military pay and allowances.	Civil allowances.
	Rs.	Rs.
Veterinary-Lieutenant—		
Under 5 years' service ...	400	150
After 5 ,, ...	450	200
After 10 ,, ...	500	250
Veterinary-Captain—		
After 5 years' service in that class	650	350
Veterinary-Major—		
After 10 years' service as Veterinary-Captain ...	750	400

The present rates of pay are as follows:—

(*a*) The pay of the civilian officers of the Department is on a time scale beginning on Rs. 500 a month and rising by Rs. 40 each year to Rs. 1,100, a further rise to Rs. 1,200 being given in the 21st year of service.

(*b*) The scale of pay for the military officers now in force (omitting ranks below that of Major, which are no longer represented in the service) is—

	Indian Military pay and allowances.	Civil allowances.
	Rs.	Rs.
Major—		
After 15 years' total service	750	350
After 17½ ,,	750	400
After 5 years' service as such	800	500
Lieutenant-Colonel	1,120	500
Colonel	1,220	500

Both the Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, and the Principal, Bengal Veterinary College, get house-rent according to salary under the special conditions applicable to the Calcutta House Allowance Scheme. The latter also gets a local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem. They both get exchange compensation allowance.

So far as the Government of Bengal are aware suitable candidates are obtained for the present rates of pay, and if this assumption is correct, there seems to be no necessity to alter them.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—These officers are borne on a single cadre for the whole of India, and their pay being on time scale there are no grades. There are two officers attached to this Province. The Imperial cadre provides for a leave reserve.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—None.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—Yes; proposals are being formulated for the appointment of (1) an additional Veterinary Superintendent and (2) an additional Imperial Officer at the Belgachia College.

THE PROVINCIAL VETERINARY SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The Provincial Veterinary Service consists of Deputy Superintendents and Veterinary Inspectors.

The Deputy Superintendents are recruited from specially selected veterinary graduates who have undergone a post-graduate course of study and have received the necessary training. They are appointed with the sanction of the Local Government.

Inspectors are recruited by selection from among the Veterinary graduates at the Bengal Veterinary College and by promotion from the ranks of Veterinary Assistants and are appointed with the approval of the Local Government.

There are no special rules for the recruitment, etc., of the officers of the Provincial Service. The Service is at present a small one, and the existing methods of recruitment are satisfactory.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—In 1890 the Provincial Veterinary Service had not come into existence. In 1900 there were only three lecturers on Rs. 150—10—200 in the Provincial Service.

The existing rates of pay are shown below:—

Deputy Superintendents.

1st grade	Rs.	250—15—400
2nd ,, ...	,,	200—10—250
3rd ,, ...	,,	150—10—200

A local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem is drawn by the Assistant Principal of the Bengal Veterinary College.

Inspectors.

1st grade	Rs.	150
2nd ,, ...	,,	130
3rd ,, ...	,,	115
4th ,, ...	,,	100
5th ,, ...	,,	90
6th ,, ...	,,	80
7th ,, ...	,,	70

Local allowances of Rs. 50 per mensem are attached to the posts of the Chief Inspector under the Glanders and Farcy Act and of the Prosecuting Inspector under the Cruelty to Animals Act.

The Government of Bengal are of opinion that in view of the important and responsible work falling on the Provincial Service the rates of pay of Deputy Superintendents should now be raised to Rs. 200—500 and of Inspectors to Rs. 100—200.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*

Deputy Superintendents.

			Number of posts.
1st grade	Rs.	250—15—400	1
2nd ,, ...	,,	200—10—250	2
3rd ,, ...	,,	150—10—200	3

Inspectors.

1st grade	Rs.	150	2
2nd ,, ...	,,	130	Nil.
3rd ,, ...	,,	115	3
4th ,, ...	,,	100	1
5th ,, ...	,,	90	1
6th ,, ...	,,	80	2
7th ,, ...	,,	70	5

N.B.—There are also two Inspectors on Rs. 100 and Rs. 110 each transferred from Eastern Bengal and Assam.

There is no provision in the cadre for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise by officers of the various Services.*—None.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The sanctioned cadre is sufficient for the present, but will have to be raised gradually as the staff of the Subordinate Service of Veterinary Assistants, who are mainly employed by local bodies, is increased.

APPENDIX IV.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bihar and Orissa relating to the Civil Veterinary Department.

IMPERIAL SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The Superintendent of the Civil Veterinary Department in this Province is the only officer who belongs to the Imperial branch of the Service. The appointment of superintendents rests with the Government of India, and the conditions of recruitment, training and probation are described in the memorandum prepared by the Government of India. The Local Government have no recommendations to make under any of these heads, except that the period of probation might with advantage be curtailed from five years to three years. The objection to the longer period is that after the lapse of five years it is difficult for an officer to strike out a fresh career for himself and the resulting tendency must be to retain officers who are not altogether satisfactory and whose services might have been dispensed with more freely after the shorter term.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The present limit of pay is Rs. 1,200 per mensem which is attained in the 21st year of an officer's

service. The Local Government are disposed to think that a special grade limited to 10 per cent. of the Service might be created on Rs. 1,400, promotion to it being made by selection after 23 years' service.

This addition to the rospects of the Service would be a compensation for the loss of prospects entailed by the abolition of the Inspector-Generalship in 1912.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training; and* 4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—There is only one appointment of superintendent in the Province and there are no appointments outside the authorised cadre. The provision for leave and training is an Imperial arrangement. One officer has recently been posted to Bihar and Orissa for training.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—Proposals have recently been submitted by the Director of Agriculture for strengthening the supervisional staff of the Veterinary Department by the immediate addition of one superintendent and the ultimate addition of four superintendents. Government are disposed to think that the whole Province is too big a charge for a single officer, but they have not yet considered the Director's proposals in detail and are unable to say at present what increase, if any, will be recommended to the Government of India.

PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

According to the Memorandum prepared by the Government of India, the Provincial branch of the Veterinary Department includes Indian professors, assistant professors, lecturers, deputy superintendents, and inspectors. The first three classes are not represented in Bihar and Orissa as the Province does not yet possess a separate Veterinary College.

Provision exists in the present sanctioned staff for two Deputy Superintendents on pay ranging from Rs. 150 to Rs. 400 and for twelve Inspectors on pay ranging from Rs. 70 to Rs. 150. Hitherto no candidates of satisfactory qualifications and experience have been found to fill the two posts of Deputy Superintendent; and the Local Government experience very considerable difficulty in recruiting duly qualified inspectors and the subordinate staff of Veterinary Assistants, whose pay ranges from Rs. 30 to Rs. 70. At present an annual contribution of Rs. 20,000 is made by this Government towards the maintenance of the Belgachia Veterinary College in Calcutta from which its supply of Veterinary Inspectors and Assistants is obtained. The Local Government have now under consideration a proposal of the United Provinces Government for the establishment of a joint Veterinary College at Cawnpore. Before making any recommendations on the subject of the Provincial or subordinate services of the Veterinary Department the Local Government desire to consider the probable effects of the projected joint scheme of veterinary education. The educated middle classes of this Province do not take readily to veterinary work. It is possible that the necessity for obtaining the requisite preliminary training in Calcutta acts as an impediment, and that the difficulty might be lessened by the institution of a Veterinary College at Cawnpore where the language, manners, and character of the people are akin to those of Bihar. The recruitment and training of duly qualified Deputy Superintendents might thus be rendered possible, and this would affect both the strength of the superior supervisional staff and the prospects of the subordinate supervisional staff.

APPENDIX V.

Memorandum prepared by the Assam Administration relating to the Civil Veterinary Department.

IMPERIAL VETERINARY SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The Imperial Veterinary Service in Assam comprises only the appointment of the Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department. The methods of recruitment and probation are as prescribed by the Secretary of State. The existing rules contain no provisions regarding training. As regards recruitment, the remarks made in Chief Commissioner's note, dated the 13th December, 1912, on the Agricultural Department, apply generally to this Department also. The Chief Commissioner has no suggestions to offer with reference to training and probation.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The constitution of the Veterinary Department dates from 1907. The pay of an officer begins with Rs. 500 a month rising by Rs. 40 each year to Rs. 1,100, which rate will continue from the beginning of the 16th to the end of the 20th year of service; after the beginning of the 21st year, the salary will be Rs. 1,200 a month. No allowance is given to the incumbent except the usual travelling allowance.

The prospects of the Service have suffered owing to the abolition of the post of the Inspector-General on Rs. 1,800 a month. The Chief Commissioner would be glad to see the maximum rate of pay raised to Rs. 1,450 with, or to Rs. 1,600 without, private practice, the discretion resting with the Local Government. This would place a senior officer approximately on the same level as a senior Civil Surgeon. The Chief Commissioner would also support the grant of an extra charge allowance of Rs. 100 a month to Superintendents.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—One appointment only. No provision is made for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—None.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—When the full cadre in the Provincial and Subordinate Services of the Department is worked up to, Assam may require a second Superintendent.

PROVINCIAL VETERINARY SERVICE.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The Provincial Veterinary Service consists of Veterinary Inspectors. They are recruited from among the Veterinary Assistants in the Province with due regard to their professional merit, academical and general qualifications and seniority in the Service. Their probationary period is one year during which the Inspector is deputed to undergo a post-graduate course in a selected Veterinary College for training in bacteriological work. In the opinion of the Chief Commissioner, the present regulations are satisfactory.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The present rate of pay of Veterinary Inspectors is Rs. 100—5—175 per mensem. They get no allowance except the usual travelling allowance. The present scale of pay is inadequate, and should be raised to at least Rs. 100—10—200. The Chief Commissioner, however, would not object to a scale of Rs. 100—10—300 as suggested in the memorandum prepared by Mr. Harris.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—There are three posts of Inspectors and no provision is made for leave and training.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—None.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The Provincial cadre may eventually include two posts of Deputy Superintendents for the Brahmaputra and Surma Valleys and more Inspectors, but no immediate increase is required.

APPENDIX VI.

Note, dated 9th April 1913, by the Hon. Sir Archdale Earle, Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Civil Veterinary Department.

1. The remarks made in my note on the Agricultural Department apply generally to this Department also.

PROVINCIAL VETERINARY SERVICE.

2. The present rate of pay of Veterinary Inspectors in this Province is Rs. 100—5—175. The Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam originally proposed to pay Rs. 100—10—250, but were overruled. Experience has shown that it is impossible to secure suitable candidates in this Province on the present rate of pay, and that the lowest pay which will attract such candidates is Rs. 100—10—200.

SUBORDINATE VETERINARY SERVICE.

3. The present sanctioned pay of Veterinary Assistants in this Province is Rs. 30—10-5—70 with the following allowances.—

Stationary Assistant.

Pay plus house allowance of Rs. 5 a month or free quarters.

Hill District Assistant.

Pay plus local allowance of Rs. 10 a month and house allowance of Rs. 5 a month or free quarters and fixed travelling allowance from Rs. 15 to Rs. 25.

Plains District Itinerant Assistant.

Pay plus local allowance of Rs. 12-8 a month and fixed travelling allowance from Rs. 15 to Rs. 25.

Staff Assistant.

Pay plus personal allowance of Rs. 30 a month with travelling allowance under the Civil Service Regulations.

Reserve Assistant.

Pay plus personal allowance of Rs. 10 a month when on duty in the moussil.

This rate of pay has been found by experience to be insufficient to attract the class of man required, and a rate of Rs. 45—10-5—75, with the same allowances, is required.

APPENDIX No. VII.

Note, dated the 1st August 1913, by the Hon. Sir Archdale Earle, Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Civil Veterinary Department, supplementary to his note of the 9th April 1913.

Clause 3 of the Agreement executed by officers of the Civil Veterinary Department runs as follows:—

"3. That the party of the first part will devote his whole time to the duties of the Service, and will not engage, directly or indirectly, in any trade, business or occupation on his own account, and that he will not (except in case of accident or sickness certified by competent medical authority) absent himself from his said duties without having first obtained permission from the Government or its authorised officers."

1. The Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam instituted enquiries in the year 1909 as to whether Veterinary Superintendents were allowed in other Provinces to practise privately, and ascertained that there was no uniformity in this respect. Mr. Harris, Superintendent of the Civil Veterinary Department in Eastern Bengal and Assam, ascertained from the Inspector-General of his Department that he had no objection to him (Mr. Harris) being allowed private practice, provided that his work as a Government servant was not interfered with. The Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam therefore enquired of the Government of India whether, in view of Clause 3 of the Agreement, Mr. Harris could be allowed to undertake private practice. It was suggested that in places where there was a Veterinary Hospital, owners would be required to send their animals there, and the hospital fee only would be charged. In cases where the superintendent was required to visit the owner's house to give advice or to examine animals for soundness, a fee of Rs. 10 to Rs. 15 would be charged, and for operations a charge from Rs. 15 to Rs. 30 would be made. Private practice was to be undertaken only on condition that it did not interfere with departmental work.

2. The Government of India observed that when it was first decided to recruit civilians for the Civil Veterinary Department, it was definitely settled that they should be debarred from engaging in private practice. A rule to this effect was accordingly embodied in the conditions for appointment to the Department and the scale of pay offered to the candidates was fixed with reference to the restriction. They considered that this rule should be adhered to. Administrative officers of the Department, such as superintendents, were usually in charge of very large areas and of a number of veterinary assistants whose work required close inspection. It was essential that they should spend a considerable portion of their time in touring through their charges, and it was thought inadvisable to allow them to build up private practices at their headquarters or to engage in private work which might interfere with their duties. For these reasons the Government of India were not in favour of any relaxation of the ordinary rule of the Service in the case of Mr. Harris. It was added that if this officer were permitted to engage in private practice, a precedent would be established which might prove embarassing.

3. I have considered the matter very carefully, and am of opinion that in a Province like Assam, containing a large number of Europeans, who mostly possess valuable horses, some concession should be made. I learn that the Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, is continually being asked when on tour to attend to valuable animals. Heretofore he has done this, as far as practicable, without remuneration, in order to popularise his department. Two alternatives are possible. The Superintendent must either refuse to attend to all calls of this nature, or he must be allowed to charge a moderately high fee, which would have the desirable effect of restricting the number of cases which he was asked to attend. In view of the large number of valuable animals which there are in the Province, and the absence of any other veterinary practitioners, with the exception of the veterinary assistants, whose skill is not of a very high order, the adoption of the first alternative would involve serious inconvenience to the public.

For these reasons I think that the question should be reconsidered, at any rate, as regards Assam, and that the local administration should be given discretion in the matter.

APPENDIX VIII.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Civil Veterinary Department in Burma.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.—Superior Staff.*—The original system of recruitment was to appoint officers with not less than 18 months' service in the Army Veterinary Department. This was discontinued in 1901, and the system of direct appointment by the Secretary of State from the English Veterinary Colleges was introduced. Candidates were required to be over 26 years of age and to possess a diploma from the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons; they were to be on probation for five years. Rules for the officers of the Army Veterinary Department who elect for permanent employment in the Civil Veterinary Department were first published also in 1901, and have since been twice revised.

The Regulations governing admssion into the Department are generally satisfactory subject to the following remarks:—

(i) The possession of a diploma in Tropical Medicine and practical experience of contagious diseases should, other things being equal, be considered as entitling a candidate to preference,

(ii) The present period of probation (five years) might be reduced to three in view of the fact that most officers join the service at the age of 26 or 27.

(iii) A thorough acquaintance with the Vernacular of the Province is a *sine qua non* for success in this Department, and it should be made an express condition of employment that no officer will be confirmed in his appointment until he has passed in the Vernacular by the Higher Standard.

Inspecting Staff.—The rules and regulations affecting this Staff are satisfactory.

The wishes of the Government of India in respect of appointing a staff of Provincial Deputy Superintendents and Inspectors were laid down in a Circular of 1904 and the Local Government's scheme which was formulated on these lines provided for the recruitment of Deputy Superintendents from the ranks of Inspectors and for the recruitment of Inspectors from:—

(i) Selected students who have passed the University Entrance examination and who would be given scholarships to enable them to undergo a training at the Lahore Veterinary College.

(ii) Selected men from the staff of Veterinary Assistants who have passed the seventh standard examination (Vernacular).

Of these only the first were to be eligible for promotion to Deputy Superintendentships. The Government of India in accepting these proposals laid down the full three years' course of training and the College diploma as conditions of permanent appointment as Deputy Superintendents and Inspectors. Under this scheme three students were sent to the Bengal Veterinary College in 1907 with scholarships of Rs. 40—10—60 per mensem while seven Inspectors were appointed from among the Senior Assistants at once. Only the former Instructor at the Insein School has so far been appointed as a Deputy Superintendent.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The information required under this heading for the Superior and Inspecting Staffs is given in the attached statement.

Superior Staff.—A special allowance of Rs. 150 a month should be given to the officer in administrative charge of the department in each province, whatever his seniority.

Inspecting Staff.—The scale of pay provided for the officers of the Inspecting Staff is satisfactory.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—The number of posts in each grade is shown in the statement mentioned above. There are five leave reserve posts in the cadre of the Superior Staff, which may be drawn upon if local arrangement cannot be made. Officers from the Inspecting Staff may be appointed to fill short leave vacancies. No provision for leave and training exists in the cadre of the Inspecting Staff.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—None.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.—The Superior Staff* consists of three officers only. If it were doubled the increased number of officers would be fully employed, and the resulting diminution of cattle mortality and the improvement in the stock of the Province generally would amply compensate for the increased cost.

Inspecting Staff.—With one exception the existing sanctioned posts in the Inspecting Staff have not yet been filled.

Statement showing the Cadre of the Superior and Inspecting Staffs of the Civil Veterinary Department, Burma, in the years 1890, 1900 *and* 1913.

1890.			1900.			1913.		
No.	Designation.	Pay per mensem.	No.	Designation.	Pay per mensem.	No.	Designation.	Pay per mensem.
		Rs.			Rs.		*Imperial.*	Rs.
1	Veterinary Surgeon (Mr. Evans)	450 Military pay + 250 Civil allowance	1	Veterinary Superintendent	1,100	1	Superintendent (Colonel Evans, C.I.E.)	1,220 Military pay. 500 Civil allowance 100 additional allowance.
1	Assistant Veterinary Instructor (Mr. Batlivala, a Graduate of the Bombay University).	250	1	Assistant Veterinary Instructor	250+ 30 house allowance	2	Superintendents (Messrs. Rennie and Cameron)	500 — 40 — 1,100 Rs. 1,200 after 21st year + Burma allowance Rs. 100.
							Provincial.	
							Deputy Superintendents—	
						1	1st grade ...	500
						1	2nd " ...	400
						2	3rd " ...	300
						2	4th " ...	200
							Inspectors—	
						3	1st grade ...	150
						4	2nd " ...	125
						6	3rd " ...	100

APPENDIX IX.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Civil Veterinary Department.

History of the department up to the date of formation of the Civil Veterinary Department. — The Civil Veterinary Department was created only in 1892. Prior to this, Veterinary Surgeons were obtained from the Military Department from time to time to undertake remedial measures for dealing with outbreaks of cattle disease. In 1864-65, such a Veterinary Surgeon was engaged for the first time in connection with an outbreak of cattle disease in Kurnool and the Nilgiris. The success attained on this and subsequent occasions, with the help of the Army Veterinary Officers, was so encouraging that the Government contemplated the employment of a Surgeon with the designation of Inspector of Cattle Diseases, to be in charge of operations for the prevention of cattle diseases, but the attempt to secure the services of an officer suitable for this purpose failed, and the matter remained in abeyance till 1881. In this year the Government resolved, in view of the extreme importance of dealing with cattle diseases on a more permanent footing, to obtain a Veterinary Officer with Indian experience as teacher of Veterinary Science in the School of Agriculture at Saidapet, who might also officiate as Inspector of Cattle Diseases. The Board of Revenue was asked to advertise in the Indian papers for an officer. Subsequently, it was decided to keep the post of Teacher of Veterinary Science distinct from that of Inspector of Cattle Diseases, and a Mr. Shunker was appointed as Inspector, while the duties of the Veterinary Instructor at the College were left in the hands of a Military Veterinary Surgeon.

2. The next holder of that post, who was also borrowed from the Army, was, however, entrusted with the dual duties of Veterinary Lecturer and Inspector of Cattle Diseases, the designation of the post held by Mr. Shunker being at the same time changed into "Deputy Inspector of Cattle Diseases." These officers were assisted by a subordinate staff of Stock Inspectors, each of whom was in charge of a district and under the immediate control of the District Collectors.

3. The organisation of the Veterinary Staff came under review of the Committee appointed by Government in 1888 to inquire into the constitution and operations of the Agricultural Department. The Committee found that the system of providing a single Inspector per district was of little or no use, and recommended an immediate and large increase in the number of Inspectors, but Government, in view of the apathy of the ryots and the cost of the operations, directed that the work of attempting to combat disease directly should be given up, and that the post of Inspector of Cattle Diseases should be abolished, the services of the Stock Inspectors, being at the same time dispensed with.

4. On a perusal of the Proceedings of this Government, the Government of India, however, urged the need for the retention of the staff of the Cattle Disease Department under the direction of the Agricultural Department, with a subordinate staff of an executive character; the Government of Madras thereupon accepted this recommendation and modified their former order.

5. In 1892, at the time of the organisation of the Civil Veterinary Department by the Government of India, there were on the staff of the department in Madras one Inspector of Cattle Diseases, one Deputy Inspector of Cattle Diseases, a few Stock Inspectors in the subordinate staff (corresponding to Veterinary Assistants of the present day).

6. *Formation of the Civil Veterinary Department.*— The question of the creation of a separate Civil Veterinary Department for the whole of India had been mooted as early as 1882, but was kept in abeyance till 1891, on financial considerations. The Government of India again took up the matter in 1891, and addressed the Secretary of State in their Despatch No. 82, dated 21st October, 1891, on the expediency of constituting a Civil Veterinary Department for the whole country. The Secretary of State sanctioned the proposal in his Despatch No. 18, dated 18th February, 1892. The superior staff of the department, as then sanctioned, consisted of 18 officers, including an Inspector-General, at their head. The staff was to be recruited from the Army Veterinary Department, and the officers were to receive the Indian pay and allowance of their military rank and a civil allowance on the scale laid down in paragraphs 18 and 19 of the Government of India Despatch No. 82 of 1891. The whole staff was to be borne on the Imperial list, but the officers were to carry out their duties under the orders of the respective local governments.

7. As already noted, there was one Army officer in Madras at the time of the constitution of the department, and he became the first Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, Madras. The Deputy Inspector of Cattle Diseases was thereafter designated "Deputy Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department."

8. In 1901, a change was effected in the system of recruitment of the superior staff by obtaining officers for Civil employment from Army Veterinary Department, and the Government of India then decided that the candidates should in future be appointed by the Secretary of State direct from the English Veterinary Colleges, and rules for the recruitment of such candidates were also published. Officers of the Army Veterinary Department who elected to continue in the Civil Department do not come under these rules.

9. The Government of India, in 1905, took up the question of the general reorganisation of the department, and addressed the Secretary of State for sanction to increase the number of officers (25) on the Imperial staff of the department, in order to provide additional European officers for some of the more advanced Provinces. The scheme was accepted by the Secretary of State and the number of officers was then increased to 32 (at present 34). The increased cadre did not, however, provide for any additional officer in this Presidency. But the need of a second European Veterinary Officer was strongly felt, and, as a result of repeated requests, the Government of India sanctioned in 1909 the appointment of a second Superintendent to this Presidency. This second officer was posted as Principal of the Madras Veterinary College, under the control of the Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department. In order, however, to avoid confusion of functions between the two officers, the Government subsequently defined the duties and responsibilities of each, and made the Principal of the College independent of the Superintendent. One is in charge of the executive branch and the other the educational branch of the department. The two officers work directly under the control of the Commissioner of Revenue Settlement, Land Records and Agriculture.

10. *Proposals of the Royal Commission on Decentralisation.*—The Royal Commission on Decentralisation suggested in paragraph 327 of their report the provincialisation of the superior officers of the Department serving in the Provinces. They stated:—

"Having regard to the local character of the "Civil Veterinary work, and to the circumstance "that in each Province it is under the general ad- "ministrative control of the Provincial Director "of Agriculture, we think it desirable that the "superior Veterinary Officers serving in the Pro- "vinces should be paid by and recruited on ac- "count of the local governments, as Provincial "Agricultural experts now are. This provincialis- "ing of the staff would eliminate a number of "references which now have to be made to the "Government of India, and would enable the "Veterinary Inspector-General to become in such

"matters the Advising Officer of the Provincial "Governments instead of being the head of a cen- "tralised controlling staff."

This suggestion was referred by the Government of India to the local governments for opinion. The Government of Madras in replying to their reference observed as follows:—

"So far as this Presidency is concerned no "difficulty has up till now arisen from the fact that "the two superior officers of the Civil Veterinary "Department in this Presidency . . . . are "borne on a single Imperial list and are paid "from Imperial revenues. This Government are "of opinion that, unless the staff of the Civil "Veterinary Department is materially increased, "a system of direct recruitment for Provincial "appointments is undesirable . . . . As re- "gards the question of pay of these officers, His "Excellency the Governor in Council is of opinion "that, so long as the Government of India control "the recruitment and posting of officers of the "Civil Veterinary Department, it is desirable, as "the Government of India recognise, that the cost "should continue to be debited to Imperial "revenues."

The Government of India, after ascertaining the views of the local governments, decided not to disturb the existing arrangements under which the superior offices were borne on the Imperial list and were paid from Imperial revenues. The question of provincialising the pay of the veterinary officers is again engaging the attention of the Government of India.

11. *Recruitment.*—When the Civil Veterinary Department was constituted in 1892, the Government of India laid down that as a rule the superior grades of the Department should be filled by European officers who should supervise and control the subordinate native agency employed on the bulk of the work of the Department. The Government of India also expressed the opinion that the European element in the service was indispensable, but that the possible expansion, in the number of European officers which, with the growth of responsibilities, may be demanded by Local Governments, might be confined within the narrowest limits by the employment of the educated natives of the country to relieve the labours of the European staff. The Government of India again reiterated the same policy in 1904 in the following terms:—

"While we desire to confine the European staff within the narrowest limits consistent with securing the efficient working of the Department and to employ the assistants trained in our Veterinary Colleges as far as is possible in the circumstances of each Province, we feel no doubt that for the present and for a good many years to come the superior supervising staff must as a rule be European."

12. *General remarks.*—The rules regarding pay, allowances, etc., applicable to Army Veterinary officers of the Civil Veterinary Department are different from those applicable to Civilian officers of the Department.

13. The salary* of Army Department officers consists of the Indian Military pay and allowances of rank and the staff or civil allowances according to a prescribed scale. Travelling allowances are granted under the Civil Service Regulations. Leave and leave allowances are regulated by the rules in the Civil Service Regulations applicable to Military officers subject to the Civil Leave rules with certain special conditions. Military officers may retire at 20 years' service. The rules in the Civil Service Regulations relating to the compulsory retirements of Military officers in Civil employ upon attaining the age of 55 years apply to Army officers in Civil Veterinary Department. Officers in the Civil Veterinary Department are debarred from private practice without the permission of the Local Government under which they serve.

14. The Civilian officers of the Department are debarred from private professional practice. The pay of these officers is fixed at Rs. 500 per mensem on arrival in India, rising by Rs. 40 each year to Rs. 1,100 a month, which rate will continue from the beginning of the sixteenth to the end of the twentieth year of service; after the beginning of the twenty-first year, Rs. 1,200 per mensem. All officers, Military and Civil, get exchange compensation allowance. Appointments of Civilian officers are made on probation for five years and subject to such rules as the Government of India may lay down in regard to qualification in the vernaculars. Officers who, after satisfactory completion of the probationary period, remain in the service of the Government of India will become entitled to the benefit of the leave and pension rules for European officers contained in the Indian Civil Service Regulations and will reckon service for leave and pension from the date of arrival in India on first appointment. Retirement is obligatory at 55 years of age.

15. The study leave rules for scientific departments are also applicable to officers of the Civil Veterinary Department. Every officer of the Civil Veterinary Department is required to pass an examination in the vernacular of the province in which he is serving within two years of the date on which he is posted to the province. Officers serving in Madras are required to pass in either Tamil, Telugu or Hindustani as the Government may decide; failure to pass entails loss of appointment.

16. The Principal of the College is allowed in addition to his pay a local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem and a house-rent allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem debitable to Provincial revenues until he is provided with free quarters. The Superintendent is also granted a house-rent allowance of Rs. 50 per mensem. The Imperial officers of the Department are liable to transfer from one province to another. All questions affecting their appointment, promotion, leave for more than six months (for less than six months also if a substitute is required), transfer and retirement are dealt with by the Government of India in the Department of Revenue and Agriculture.

PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

17. A scheme for the organisation of a staff of local Cattle Disease Inspectors was formulated in 1878, but allowed to remain in abeyance until 1882, when the subordinate staff was first recruited. This staff comprised nine Inspectors to start with and was employed under the Inspector and Deputy Inspector of Cattle Diseases.

18. The Provincial supervising staff consisted of only one Deputy Inspector of Cattle Diseases until 1887. In that year a proposal was made to combine the functions of the superior officers of both the Veterinary and Agricultural branches of the Agricultural Department, so as to allow of better results being obtained with the small staff then available; but the only change effected was the appointment of a Sub-Assistant Director of Agriculture who was practically an Assistant to the Inspector of Cattle Diseases, but was also available for agricultural work on special occasions. The same staff continued until 1892 when the Civil Veterinary Department was constituted, and even then no actual change was effected except that the designation of the Deputy Inspector was changed to that of "Deputy Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department."

19. After the constitution of the Civil Veterinary Department the Government of India themselves took up the question of subordinate veterinary establishment required to help the European Veterinary officers appointed to each province. They formulated schemes, one in 1893 and another in 1895, both of which were, in the opinion of the Madras Government, not suited to the circumstances of this Presidency. On a further reference from the Government of India in 1899, it was finally decided to retain the appointment of Deputy Superintendent and to add two Senior Veterinary Assistants (afterwards called Inspectors). The Government of India agreed to this arrangement. But

* The scale of pay is as follows:—

	Indian pay and allowances.	Civil allowance.
Major—	Rs.	Rs.
After 15 years' total service ...	750 ...	350
After 17½ years' total service ...	750 ...	400
After 5 years' service as such ...	800 ...	500
Lieutenant-Colonel	1,120 ...	500
Colonel	1,220 ...	500

The post of the Deputy Superintendent was allowed to remain vacant from 1901 owing to the paucity of trained hands competent to fill it. In 1904 the question of the development of the Civil Veterinary Department engaged the attention of this Government with reference to certain suggestions of the Supreme Government, and proposals were submitted in 1905 to the Government of India for the reorganisation of the Department. The scheme provided for the appointment of—

3 Deputy Superintendents			
15 Veterinary Inspectors	In-	6 in the first grade 9 in the second grade	Provincial service.
132 Veterinary Assistants	As-	13 in the first grade 40 in the second grade 79 in the third grade	Subordinate service.

This scheme was sanctioned by the Secretary of State in his despatch No. 57 (Revenue), dated 26th April, 1907.

20. *Recruitment and training.*—Up to 1895 there was no recognised system followed by Government; but there was no bar to the appointment of Indians. In 1895 the Government of India proposed that a complete scheme of Senior Veterinary Assistants should be organised in each Province. This was not, however, adopted. In 1904 the Government of India suggested, with a view to afford relief to the Imperial officers, the employment of indigenous agency, and observed as follows:—

"The Secretary of State has recently urged upon the Government of India the desirability of employing as far as possible the cheaper agency of native Veterinary Graduates. . . . . It appears to the Government of India, therefore, that the system on which the Veterinary Department should in future be developed is that each Province should have one, or in the case of larger Provinces, two European Superintendents drawn from the Imperial staff, and that this staff should be supplemented by the appointment of Native Assistants as 'Deputy Superintendents.' The men would be specially selected Veterinary Graduates with a thorough knowledge of English and good educational qualifications. They would be capable of filling the important subordinate appointments at the Veterinary Colleges." The Madras Veterinary College was established in 1903, and a diploma awarded to students after a three years' course at the College is a necessary preliminary to appointment to the rank of Inspector. Appointments to Inspectors' grade are made mainly by promotion from the subordinate service, while Deputy Superintendent's posts are intended to be filled either by direct recruitment or by promotion from among the Inspectors. One of the three sanctioned posts of Deputy Superintendents is now held by an Indian—a graduate of the Bombay Veterinary College—who was promoted from the grade of a Veterinary Inspector. There are an Assistant Principal and three lecturers at the College. The Assistant Principalship is a gazetted appointment. The Assistant Principal is placed on the same status as Deputy Superintendents. The present incumbent is a student of the Bombay Veterinary College. He was previously employed as Veterinary Overseer in the Remount Department, United Provinces of Agra and Oudh.

Organisation.—The Deputy Superintendents, the Inspectors, and teaching assistants at the College are all paid from Provincial funds. The executive staff is under the direct control of the Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, and the teaching staff under the Principal.

Numbers and pay.—The strength of the Department on 1st April, 1887, was—

One European Inspector of Cattle Diseases on Rs. 800 (no longer on the Provincial List).

One European Deputy Inspector of Cattle Diseases on Rs. 300.

Twenty-three Local Cattle Disease Inspectors (on pay* ranging between Rs. 50 and Rs. 100).

The present strength is—

Staff contemplated.		*Staff on 1st April, 1913.*
Three Deputy Superintendents (200-25-400).		One Deputy Superintendent.
Fifteen Inspectors	Six in the first grade. Rs. 100-4-120; nine in the second grade, Rs. 85-3-100.	Seven Inspectors.

The staff employed on teaching in the college is as under:—

One Assistant Principal on Rs. 200—25—400.
First Lecturer on Rs. 120—8—200.
Second ,, on ,, 100—5—150.
Third ,, on ,, 80—4—120.

The posts of Deputy Superintendents, Inspectors and Teaching Assistants are held by Indians.

Leave and pension rules.—The ordinary Indian Service leave and pension rules of the Civil Service Regulations apply to the Provincial Service.

II.

[*Additional statement called for in the Joint Secretary's letter dated 1st August*, 1913.]

INDIAN CIVIL VETERINARY DEPARTMENT.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training, and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—(*a*) The present system of recruitment is satisfactory.

(*b*) In the past there has been difficulty in arranging for an officer to become familiar with the actual conditions of the country and to acquire some knowledge of general administration, owing to the fact that by reason of the paucity of the leave reserve he is very often drafted into executive posts soon after his arrival. It would be advantageous if this could be remedied.

(*c*) The present period of probation may be reduced to three years.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—

1890.

One Inspector of cattle diseases, Rs. 550 (now Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department), house rent allowance, Rs. 50 per mensem.

1900.

One Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, Rs. 650 with exchange compensation allowance (Rs. 450 per annum) and house rent allowance, Rs. 50 per mensem.

1913.

Rs. 500—40—1,100; after the beginning of the twenty-first year, Rs. 1,200 a month; also draws exchange compensation allowance. (This rate applies to Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, and Principal, Veterinary College.) Principal gets Rs. 100 local allowance, and Rs. 50 house rent allowance. The Superintendent gets only Rs. 50 house rent allowance.

The allowances are satisfactory.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—There are no grades. The Superintendent and the Principal are the only two officers serving in this Province. Leave and training are arranged for by the Government of India.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by Officers of the Service.*—No appointments are so held.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—A second Superintendent may be required as soon as the operations of the Department expand.

PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

(i) The need for recruitment of Deputy Superintendents is beginning to be felt. It is

* Aggregate pay Rs. 17,260.

under contemplation to institute a post-graduate course at the Veterinary College for the purpose. Until the results of the experiment are known, it seems premature to consider the matter. The same remark applies to the training and probation of Deputy Superintendents.

(ii)—

1890.

One Deputy Inspector, Rs. 300.

1900.

One Deputy Superintendent, Rs. 150—10—200.

1913.

(1) Deputy Superintendent, Rs. 200—25—400.

(2) Assistant Principal, Madras Veterinary College, Rs. 200—25—400.

(3) Veterinary Inspectors, first grade, Rs. 100—4—120. Second grade, Rs. 85—3—100.

The rates of pay would seem to be sufficient.

(iii)—

	Sanctioned cadre.	Number now employed.
Deputy Superintendents ...	3	1
Assistant Principal graded with Deputy Superintendents ...	1	1
Veterinary Inspectors—		
First grade	6	2
Second ,, ...	9	5

No provision exists in the cadre of Deputy Superintendents and Inspectors for leave and training. The Inspectors are, however, recruited from among the Veterinary Assistants, in which class 22 posts have been created as reserve for leave and other contingencies.

(iv) There is an appointment of Special Veterinary Inspector in the Forest Department to which the Assistants and Inspectors of the Civil Veterinary Department can aspire. It is at present held by an Inspector of the Civil Veterinary Department.

(v) No additions are at present necessary.

APPENDIX X.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bombay relating to the Civil Veterinary Department.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation.—(a) Rules for the officers of the Army Veterinary Department in the Civil Veterinary Department.—1.* The selection of officers for particular appointments will be made by the Government of India.

2. An officer who accepts permanent appointment in the Civil Veterinary Department elects for continuous Civil employment in India.

3. Officers of the Civil Veterinary Department will be liable to transfer from one appointment to another or from one province to another. They will be under the control of the Local Government under which they are serving for the time being.

Rules for the civilian members of the Indian Civil Veterinary Department.—1. The officers of the Indian Civil Veterinary Department perform or supervise all official veterinary work in India, other than that of the Army, and are debarred from private professional practice in India. Their duties may be divided into three classes under the following heads:—

(*a*) Educational work in Veterinary Colleges;

(*b*) Horse and mule breeding;

(*c*) Cattle disease and cattle breeding.

2. Appointments to this Department are made by the Secretary of State for India, and applications regarding them should be addressed to the Revenue Secretary, India Office, London, S.W.

3. Candidates must not (except on special grounds to be approved by the Secretary of State) be over 26 years of age and must possess a diploma from the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons. Evidence of a knowledge of bacteriology and of capacity for carrying out original research will be specially taken into account in estimating the claims of candidates. Good health, a sound constitution, and active habits are essential, and candidates must be certified by the Medical Board of the India Office to be physically fit for service in India.

4. Appointments will be made on probation for five years. Officers may be required from time to time to qualify in the vernacular language of the province within two years from the date of arrival in India, and in the event of transfer from one province to another, within two years from date of transfer.

(*b*) *Rules for the examination of officers of the Civil Veterinary Department in the Vernacular language.—1.* An officer of the Civil Veterinary Department must pass an examination by the Lower Standard in the vernacular of the province in which he is serving within 18 months of the date of his final election for Civil employ, or of the date on which he is posted to the province, whichever is later. Within three years of this date he must also pass a further examination in the vernacular of his province by the Higher Standard, unless he joined the Civil Veterinary Department before July, 1895. Failure to pass within the prescribed period will, in the absence of special orders to the contrary, entail loss of Civil allowances. But the Local Government may extend the period for passing.

2. The Lower and Higher Standards in vernacular shall ordinarily mean the Lower and Higher Standards in Hindustani prescribed by Army Regulations, India, Volume II. The Higher Standard examination shall include ability to transliterate from Persian into Nagri and *vice versâ*.

(*c*) As at present advised, Government consider that the regulations as to recruitment, training, and probation for the Civil Veterinary Department are satisfactory.

2. *The rates of pay and allowances in force* in 1890 *and* 1900 *and on 1st April,* 1913, *respectively.—(a)* These dates are not suitable for the Civil Veterinary Department. The Department commenced in 1892-93; new terms were issued in 1901 both for Military men and Civilians, and the terms for Military men were revised in 1908. It has been considered advisable to alter the dates to 1892, 1901, and 1st April, 1913.

(*b*) (*1*) In 1892 the following rates were in force for Military officers. These terms were issued for general information in 1895, but the rates of pay and allowances were in force from 1892:—

	Indian Military pay and allowances.	Civil allowances.	Total.
Veterinary Lieutenant—	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Under five years' service	400	150	550
After five years' service	450	200	650
After ten years' service	500	250	750
Veterinary Captain—	600	300	900
After five years' service in that class	650	350	1,000
Veterinary Major—			
After ten years' service as Veterinary Captain	750	400	1,150

The salary and rank of the Inspector-General of the Civil Veterinary Department corresponded with those of the Principal Veterinary Officer in India, his total emoluments being Rs. 1,620 a month irrespective of rank in the Army (*vide* rules for the Civil Veterinary Department published in Govern-

ment of India Resolution No. 10—59-5, dated 28th June, 1895).

At that time Lieutenants became Captains after 10 years; Captains became Majors after 20 years (*vide* Classified List of Officers of the Civil Veterinary Department, dated 1st January, 1899).

(*2*) The following was the scale of pay for Military Officers of the Civil Veterinary Department sanctioned in 1901 (*vide* Government Resolution, Revenue Department, No. 6194, dated 3rd September, 1901, and its accompaniments):—

	Indian Military pay and allowances.	Civil allowances.	Total.
Veterinary Lieutenant—	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Under five years' service	400	150	550
After five years' service	450	200	650
After ten years' service	500	250	750
Veterinary Captain—	600	300	900
After five years' service as such.	650	350	1,000
Veterinary Major—			
After ten years' service as Veterinary Captain.	750	400	1,150
After five years' service as Veterinary Major.	750	500	1,250
Veterinary Lieut.-Colonel	1,020	500	1,520

The pay of the Inspector-General of the Civil Veterinary Department was fixed at Rs. 1,800 a month irrespective of rank.

At that time Lieutenants became Captains after 10 years' service, and Majors after 20 years' service (*vide* Classified List of 1st July, 1902).

(*3*) The following is the scale of pay sanctioned by the Secretary of State in 1908, superseding a similar scale which was sanctioned in 1905, which in its turn superseded the scale of 1901 (*vide* Government Resolution, Revenue Department, No. 3419, dated 1st April, 1908). This scale was in force on 1st April, 1913, except that the Inspector-General's appointment had been abolished:—

	Indian Military pay and allowances.	Civil allowances.	Total.
Lieutenant—	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Under five years' service	480	150	630
Captain—			
After five years' total service.	570	200	770
After seven and a half years' total service.	570	300	870
After ten years' total service.	650	300	950
After twelve and a half years' total service.	650	350	1,000
Major —			
After fifteen years' total service.	750	350	1,100
After seventeen and a half years' total service.	750	400	1,150
After five years' service as such.	800	500	1,300
Lieut.-Colonel	1,120	500	1,620
Colonel	1,220	500	1,720

The pay of the Inspector-General, Civil Veterinary Department, was fixed at Rs. 2,000 a month irrespective of rank.

At present all the Majors in the Department have obtained their majority at 15 years' service and all Lieutenant-Colonels at 25 years' service or under.

(*c*) In 1892 there were no Civilians in the Department. The scale of pay for Civilians in 1901 was:—

Rs. 500—40—1,100 for the first 15 years.

After twentieth year—Rs. 1,200.

The scale laid down in 1901 was still in force on 1st April, 1913, except that the Inspector-General's appointment was abolished.

(*d*) Government reserve their opinion on the question whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—(*1*) Among the Military men the pay is according to rank, and the numbers in each grade are governed by paragraph 3 of the rules for the officers of the Army Veterinary Department who were elected for permanent appointment in the Civil Veterinary Department (*vide* accompaniments to Government Resolution, Revenue Department, No. 3419, dated 1st April, 1908). It is laid down that not more than three officers, excluding the Inspector-General, will hold the rank of Colonel and Lieutenant-Colonel at the same time. The number in the rank of Major is unlimited.

(*2*) There are no grades for Civilian members of the Department.

(*3*) The number of appointments is as below:—

2 Superintendents (Military).

1 Principal (Civilian).

1 Assistant Principal (Civilian).

(*4*) The provision for leave reserve is five as sanctioned by the Secretary of State (*vide* Government Resolution, Revenue Department, No. 5720, dated 12th June, 1906, and its accompaniments).

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held temporarily or otherwise by officers of the various services?*—Nil.

(*b*) THE SUBORDINATE CIVIL VETERINARY SERVICE.

1. Deputy Superintendents are, as a rule, appointed by Government from the ranks of the Veterinary Inspectors. These officers are permitted to rejoin the Veterinary College for further studies. No period of probation is fixed.

2. These appointments were not in existence in 1890 and 1900. On 1st April, 1913, the rates of pay were as follows:—

	Rs.
First Grade	400
Second Grade	350
Third Grade	275
Fourth Grade	200

3. The number of posts in each grade is as below:—

		Rs.
3	Deputy Superintendents, fourth grade ...	200
2	do. third grade ...	275
2	do. second grade...	350
1	Deputy Superintendent, first grade ...	400

Three posts—one in the first grade, one in the second grade and one in the fourth grade—are vacant. The cadre provides for four appointments at the Veterinary College and four appointments for district work. No provision is made in the cadre for leave and training.

4. No appointments are held outside the authorised cadre by officers of this department.

5. Government consider that no addition is required to the cadre of the Civil Veterinary Department, so far as can be seen at present.

APPENDIX XI.

Memorandum prepared by the Administration of the Central Provinces and Berar relating to the Veterinary Department.

1. *Recruitment, training, and probation.*—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—Appointments are made by the Secretary of State from the members of the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons under regulations which apply to all the Provinces of India alike. The conditions of service are given in the Government of India Revenue and Agriculture Department's Memorandum on this Department.

Appointments were, until 1901, made entirely from the ranks of the Army Veterinary Department.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—This consists of Deputy Superintendents and Veterinary Inspectors. The scheme to be worked up to, and already sanctioned, contemplates a Deputy Superintendent for each Revenue Division and one at the Superintendent's headquarters, and one Inspector in each district. No definite rules have been drawn up for their recruitment, training, or probation. It is expected that most of the posts of Veterinary Inspectors will be filled sooner or later by recruitment from the staff of Veterinary Assistants of the Subordinate Service. For Deputy Superintendents, recruitment may be direct or from the ranks of Inspectors.

The Veterinary Assistants are trained at the Veterinary Colleges of Bombay, Calcutta, or Lahore, and a limited number of scholarships are granted each year to enable men to undergo the necessary training.

(*c*) *Remarks.*—The present arrangements for the recruitment, training, and probation of officers of the Imperial and Provincial Services are satisfactory, and Mr. Crump has no suggestions to make for their improvement.

2. *Pay and allowances.*—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—These are detailed in the Government of India's Memorandum on this Service referred to above.

The pay of officers is—

	Rs.
From the 1st to the 15th year of service	500—40—1,100
From the 16th to the 20th year	1,100
From the 21st year	1,200

The service of officers drawn from the Army Veterinary Department to form the Indian Civil Veterinary Department was not finally organised till 1895. The rates of pay and allowances of these officers in Civil employ are given as in force in the year 1900, at page 29, and for the present day at page 45 of the Blue Book of Papers on the Civil Veterinary Department published by the Government of India.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—The Provincial Branch of the Service was completely reorganised, with a greatly increased cadre, and improved pay, in 1913. The sanctioned rates of pay are as follows:—

Deputy Superintendents.

Rs. 150—10—250, and then
Rs. 250—20—400.

It is open to the Administration to declare that any person whom it sees fit to appoint as a Deputy Superintendent shall draw on his first appointment such sum, within these limits of pay, as it may consider desirable to offer. This will enable the Chief Commissioner to appoint from outside the Provinces men of some seniority who will be useful at once.

Veterinary Inspectors.

Rs. 100—10—150.

Until 1913 the sanctioned rate of pay for Inspectors was Rs. 80—10—150.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision for leave and training.*—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—There is only one officer permanently posted to the Provinces, namely, the Superintendent of the Department, but occasionally, as at present, there is an additional Superintendent.

The leave reserve required is too small to be maintained separately for each Province, and is, therefore, managed by the Government of India.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—There are no grades, and pay, as above indicated, is on a time scale.

There are at present two Deputy Superintendents appointed out of the cadre of six which has been sanctioned. There is no leave or training reserve.

There are eight Veterinary Inspectors, and 22 such posts have been sanctioned.

4. *Appointments outside the authorised cadre.*—Nil.

5. *Additions to the cadre.*—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—In no Department, perhaps, has work increased so rapidly as in the Veterinary Department. The Government of India have several times posted a second Superintendent to the Provinces, and at the present time there are two Superintendents. It is, however, a matter of the greatest urgency that there should be two Superintendents permanently posted to the Provinces, and the Government of India have more than once been asked to sanction this measure. The Chief Commissioner thinks that in the near future a staff of three superior officers will be the minimum that can meet the needs of the Provinces.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—The cadre sanctioned in 1913 provides for 6 Deputy Superintendents and 22 Inspectors. It is not intended that the whole of this staff shall be entertained at once; neither the men nor the funds are available. No further additions to the sanctioned cadre are needed at present.

APPENDIX XII.

Statement of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 *a Month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the* 1*st April,* 1913, *in the Civil Veterinary Department* (*Appointments under the Government of India*).

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.														
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).											
	Total	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
300—400	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
400—500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
500—600	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	8	7	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

APPENDIX XIII.

Statement (with details by Provinces) of the Provincial Establishment of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a Month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Civil Veterinary Department.

TOTAL STATEMENT.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.														
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).											
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshattryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	12	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	1	3	—	3	6	5	1	—
300—400	2	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—
400—500	2	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	—
500—600	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	11	11	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	44	28	2	—	1	—	—	1	1	3	—	4	7	6	1	—

DETAILS BY PROVINCES.

I.—*Madras.*

Rs.																
200—300	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
300—400	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	4	2	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	1	—	—	—

II.—*Bombay.*

Rs.																
200—300	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	3	3	1	1	—
300—400	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—
800—900	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	9	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	3	3	2	1	—

III.—*Bengal.*

Rs.																
200—300	2	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
400—500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
500—600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	5	3	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	2	—	—	2	—	—	—

APPENDIX XIII. (*continued*).

IV.—*Bihar and Orissa.*

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).										Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatriyas.	Kayasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).			
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

V.—*The United Provinces of Agra and Oudh.*

Rs.																
200—300	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	3	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—

VI.—*Punjab.*

Rs.																
200—300	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	3	—	—
500—600	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	5	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	14	10	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	3	—	—

VII.—*Burma.*

Rs.																
400—500	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	—
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	4	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	—

VIII.—*The Central Provinces.*

Rs.																
500—600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

IX.—*Assam.*

Rs.																
700—800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—

APPENDIX XIV.

Regulations for appointment to the Indian Civil Veterinary Department.

1. The officers of the Indian Civil Veterinary Department perform or supervise all official veterinary work in India other than that of the Army, and are debarred from private professional practice in India. Their duties may be divided into three classes, under the following heads:—

(*a*) Educational work in veterinary colleges.
(*b*) Horse and mule breeding.
(*c*) Cattle disease and cattle breeding.

2. Appointments to this Department are made, as vacancies occur, by the Secretary of State for India, and applications regarding them should be addressed to the Revenue Secretary, India Office, London, S.W.

3. Candidates must not (except on special grounds to be approved by the Secretary of State) be over 26 years of age, and must possess a diploma from the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons. Evidence of a knowledge of bacteriology, and of capacity for carrying out original research, will be specially taken into account in estimating the claims of candidates. Good health, a sound constitution, and active habits are essential, and candidates must be certified by the Medical Board of the India Office to be physically fit for service in India.

4. Pay will be as follows:—On arrival in India Rs. 500 a month, rising by Rs. 40 each year to Rs. 1,100, which rate will continue from the beginning of the 16th to the end of the 20th year of service; after the beginning of the 21st year Rs. 1,200 a month.

Extra allowances of Rs. 100 to Rs. 200 a month are attached to certain appointments, and house rent is allowed in certain cases.

5. Appointments will be made on probation for five years. Officers may be required from time to time to qualify in the vernacular language of the province within two years from the date of arrival in India, or, in the event of transfer from one Province to another within two years from date of transfer.

6. On appointment a free first-class passage to India will be granted, subject to the condition that its cost shall be refunded in the event of an officer resigning the Service, on grounds other than certified ill-health, within five years from the date of his arrival in India. If on the expiry of the five years of probation the officer's Service is determined, or if he is compelled by certified ill-health to resign the Service before such expiry, he will be provided with a free first-class passage back to England.

7. Officers who, after satisfactory completion of the period of probation, remain in the service of the Government of India, will become entitled to the benefit of the Leave and Pension Rules for European officers contained in the Indian Civil Service Regulations (regarding which information can be obtained from the Revenue Secretary, India Office, London, S.W.), and will reckon service for leave and pension from the date of arrival in India on first appointment. Retirement is obligatory at 55 years of age.

8. Officers will be required to make provision for their families by subscribing to a Provident Fund under such regulations as Government may from time to time lay down.

9. Each officer will be required, before leaving this country, to enter into an agreement with the Secretary of State for India embodying the conditions of his appointment.

India Office, June, 1912.

APPENDIX XV.

Officials and non-officials who furnished written Evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their enquiry into the Civil Veterinary Department but who were not orally examined.

1. C W. Willson, Esq., Offg. Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, United Provinces.
2. Lieut.-Col. G. H. Evans, Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, Burma.
3. W. Harris, Esq., M.R.C.V.S., Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, Assam.
4. D. Quinlan, Esq., Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, Bihar and Orissa.
5. The Chief Justice of Madras and 22 other gentlemen.
6. F. Ware, Esq., Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, Madras.
7. Major F. S. H. Baldrey, F.R.C.V.S., D.V.H., Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, Central Provinces.
8. N. D. Dhakmarwala, Esq. (1st Professor), V. E. Vakhara, Esq. (2nd Professor), and P. Miranda, Esq. (Assistant Professor), Bombay Veterinary College.
9. Major W. O. Dawson, Superintendent, Civil Veterinary Department, Central Provinces.

INDEX.

(The numbers refer to paragraphs.)

Civil Veterinary Department.

A

Administration:
- should be Co-equal with Agricultural Department, etc., and co-ordination and supreme control be in hands of a Commissioner, *Hewlett* 69399
- Control by Board of Revenue and approval of, *Aitchison*, 69340, 69350; *D'Silva*, 69361.
- Control by Board of Revenue preferable, *Hewlett* 69399
- Control by Department of Revenue and Agriculture ... ... p. 335
- under Control of Director of Agriculture or similar official usually, but in Madras under Board of Revenue, *Hewlett* 69399
- Division into Imperial and Provincial satisfactory, *Smith* 69286
- Division of work, *Queripel* 69423
- Organisation on Provincial basis, objection to idea, *Pease* 69260
- Proposals of Royal Commission on Decentralisation *re* provincialisation of superior officers, and result ... ... p. 334–5
- a Provincial department to all intents and purposes except in name, *Aitchison* ... 69351
- Status reduced, and department to all intents and purposes a Provincial Service, *Hewlett* p. 317

Adviser (*see* Veterinary Adviser).

Agriculture, proposed formation of Bureau of, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69252

Aitchison, D. A. D., evidence of ... 69333–69356

Allowances (*see under* Leave *and* Pay).

Army Veterinary Service, comparison of popularity with, *Queripel* 69438

Assam:
- Memorandum by Administration ... p. 331–2
- no Posts held outside authorised cadre p. 331, p. 332
- Provincial Service:
  - Increase may be required in future ... p. 332
  - Pay, present and proposed rates, p. 331; *Earle*, p. 332.
  - Three posts of inspectors ... ... p. 331
- no Provision for leave and training... ... p. 331
- Private practice, question should be reconsidered, and local administration be given discretion *re*, *Earle* ... ... p. 332
- Superintendent, one only, second may be required ... ... p. 331
- Veterinary assistants' pay and allowances, *Earle* p. 332

Assistant Principalships, reservation for Provincial Service or special pay, suggestion, *Brand* 69316

Assistants (*see* Veterinary Assistants).

B

Bengal:
- Civilian officers only to be recruited in future p. 329
- Department undermanned, *Smith* 69288, 69297–9, 69304
- Memorandum by Government ... p. 329–30
- no Posts held outside authorised cadre ... p. 330
- Provincial Service:
  - Cadre sufficient for the present, but will have to be raised gradually ... ... p. 330
  - Constitution, *Brand* 69310
  - Deputy Superintendents, number and duties, *Brand* 69322
- no Provision for leave or training ... ... p. 330
- Staff and duties, *Brand* 69316

Bengal—*continued.*
- Veterinary College:
  - Assistant Principal a Provincial officer, whereas an Imperial officer in Bombay, *Brand* 69316, 69322
  - Entrance test would be approved, *Smith* 69305
  - Examiners' remarks, 1904-5—1911-12, *Brand* 69319
  - Extracts from Inspector-General's administration reports, 1897-8—1910-11, *Brand* ... 69319
  - Extracts from resolutions on the annual reports, 1898-9—1911-12, *Brand* 69319
  - Four years' course not necessary, but five years' course suggested for superior grades, *Smith* 69305
  - Men failing, allowed to go up subsequently, *Brand* 69332
  - Number of students, number taking diplomas every year, etc., *Smith*, 69305; *Brand*, 69326.

(see also under subject headings.)

Bihar and Orissa:
- Increase of cadre, question of ... ... p. 331
- Proposal under consideration for establishment of joint veterinary College at Cawnpore, with United Provinces ... ... p. 331
- Memorandum by Government ... p. 330–1
- no Posts held outside authorised cadre ... p. 331
- Provincial Service:
  - Difficulty in filling posts ... ... p. 331
  - Staff and pay ... ... p. 331
- Provision for leave and training an Imperial arrangement ... ... p. 331
- Superintendent, one appointment only ... p. 331

Bombay:
- Civilian officers, number of appointments p. 338
- need for thorough revision of Department in, *Buxy* 69374
- two Imperial officers necessary, with small laboratory each, *Buxy* 69374
- Leave reserve ... ... p. 338
- Memorandum by Government ... p. 337–8
- Military officers, numbers in grades ... p. 338
- Pay:
  - Civilian officers, 1901, 1913 ... ... p. 338
  - Military officers, 1892, 1901, 1913 ... p. 337–8
- no Posts held outside authorised cadre ... p. 338
- little Private practice, and reasons, *Buxy* 69378, 69384–5
- Provincial Service:
  - no Addition to cadre required ... ... p. 338
  - Brahmans in majority, *Buxy* 69374
  - Qualification of present members, *Buxy*... 69375
  - Rates of pay and numbers in grades, 1913 p. 338
- Subordinate Civil Veterinary Department, name should be changed to Bombay Civil Veterinary Service, and Veterinary Assistants be called Veterinary Assistant Surgeons, *Buxy* 69374
- Veterinary College:
  - After-careers of students, *Buxy* 69378
  - Fees, *Buxy* 69391
  - Guaranteed posts to two or three top men from, would improve recruitment, *Buxy* 69379
  - Higher course of studies and strengthening of staff desirable, and scheme *Buxy* ... 69371 69371
  - Men not of sufficiently good class, and better prospects needed, *Buxy* 69374, 69376
  - Scholarships, *Buxy* 69371
  - all Students being trained with idea of entering Government service, *Buxy* ... 69371

(see also under subject headings.)

Brand, E. H., evidence of 69310-69332
Bureau of Agriculture, proposed formation, and scheme, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69252
Burma:
Leave reserve in superior staff ... ... p. 333
Memorandum by Government ... ... p. 333
Pay, rates of, and allowances and number in each grade, 1890, 1900, 1910 ... ... p. 333
no Posts held outside authorised cadre ... p. 333
PROVINCIAL SERVICE:
all Posts not yet filled ... ... p. 333
no Provision for leave and training ... p. 333
Recruitment and training, system ... p. 333
Superior staff, number and advantage to be derived from increase ... ... p. 333
Buxy, J. D., evidence of 69371-69391

C

Cadre (*see under names of provinces*).
Central College (*see under* Veterinary Colleges).
Central Provinces and Berar:
Imperial Service, one permanent officer only p. 339
Inspectors, pay ... ... p. 339
Leave reserve managed by Government of India p. 339
Memorandum by Administration ... p. 338-9
Pay, rates ... ... p. 339
no Posts held outside authorised cadre ... p. 339
PROVINCIAL SERVICE:
Cadre, no additions needed at present... p. 339
Number of posts and method of recruitment and training, no alteration proposed ... p. 339
Superintendents, increase needed ... p. 339
Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 339-41
Colleges (*see under* Lahore, Royal, *and* Veterinary Colleges).
Colonies, comparison of popularity of department with, *Queripel* 69348
Commissioner of Rural Development (*see* Rural Commissioner).
Conditions of Service:
Changes since 1901, *Hewlett* 69394, 69400
Civilian officers ... ... p. 335
Improvement of Prospects necessary ... p. 329
Military officers ... ... p. 335
Provincial Service, particulars, *Brand* ... 69312
Work of, *Pease* 69262
(*see also* Leave, Pay, *etc.*)

D

Deputy Superintendents:
Creation of ... ... p. 336
Number of posts in each grade, Bengal ... p. 330
PAY:
Rates in Bengal, improvement advocated, *Brand* ... ... 69313, 69321; p. 330
proposed Scale, *Buxy*... 69372
Varies in different Provinces, and proposed scale, *Pease* 69264
RECRUITMENT:
Direct, not favoured as a whole, but rule should not be abolished, *Hewlett* ... 69418
Method, *Pease* ... ... 69270; p. 330
by Promotion from Subordinate Department preferred to direct recruitment, *Pease*... 69270
Scheme, *Brand* 69310-1, 69325
Selection from most able men, irrespective of seniority, advocated, *Buxy* 69372
(*see also under names of provinces.*)
Director of Agriculture:
APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER OF AGRICULTURAL DEPARTMENT AS:
would not be Approved, *Pease* and *Farmer*, 69252; *Pease*, 69265-6, 69268-9, *Aitchison*, 69350.
would be Unpopular with Veterinary Department, direct representation with Revenue member desired, *Smith*, 69307; *Hewlett*, 69399.
Director of Agriculture—*continued.*
System of head of department being, has worked fairly well, and selection of head from Civil Veterinary Department desirable, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69252
Drake, F. C., attention called to evidence of 69461
D'Silva, G. T., evidence of 69357-69370

E

Earle, Sir Archdale, notes by ... ... p. 332

F

Farmer, Lieutenant-Colonel J., evidence of 69244-69279
Furlough (*see under* Leave).

H

Hewlett, K., evidence of 69392-69421
Horsebreeding, transfer to Army Remount Department:
Department practically destroyed as Imperial, and hardship of 69394, p. 317-8, 69407
Less necessity for post of Inspector-General since, *Aitchison* 69345
Recruitment not greatly affected by, *Queripel* 69442

I

Imperial College, no justification for, at present, *Pease* 69271-2, 69277
Imperial Service:
Dissatisfaction among members, and causes, *Hewlett* 69400
no Grades ... ... p. 330, p. 336
High class of men recruited, but attractions not sufficient to keep them in Service, and increased pay necessary, *Queripel* ... 69431
RECRUITMENT OF INDIANS:
Advantages, *Queripel* 69436
no Applications received, *Queripel* ... 69428
Best class of recruit men who had been to England of their own accord and selected by Secretary of State, but promotion of certain number of officers from Provincial Service after training in England approved, *Hewlett* 69402
Diploma course in England advocated, *Queripel* 69444
Direct recruitment with English qualification would be best means, *Smith* 69290
English qualification should be insisted on, for officers recruited direct, but not necessary for promoted officers, *Hewlett* 69402
by Going through post-graduate course in England, inpracticability, *Queripel* 69428-9
Indians of sufficient training not likely to be forthcoming, veterinary work unpopular p. 329
Men having gone to England of own accord preferred, *Hewlett* 69419-21
Promotion from Provincial Service preferable to sending selected Indians to England, *Hewlett* 69419-26
Scheme for, in a few years' time, *Brand* 69311
Selection from Provincial Service preferable to direct recruitment, *Pease* 69258
Sending of selected Indian graduates to England, and recruitment to Imperial Service if qualified would be an advantage, but adoption of scheme not recommended, *Pease* 69277
after Training in England, as a rule, looked forward to, *Aitchison* 69342-69363
Relations with other services satisfactory, *Smith* 69287
Indians:
Best class would be attracted to veterinary profession only in exceptional cases, *Aitchison* 69349
Increased employment of, question of possibility, *Pease* 69256
no Limitations on employment of, *Smith*, 69286; *Brand*, 69316; *Aitchison*, 69339; *D'Silva*, 69360; *Hewlett*, 69398.

Indians—*continued.*
None on register of Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons, *Queripel* 69428
None at Royal Veterinary College at present, but one or two generally, no diploma obtained by, for past ten years, *M'Fadyean* 69454
None in service at present with English qualification of R.C.V.S., *Smith* 69291
Policy of Government of India *re* ... ... p. 335
no Religious objection to department, *Aitchison* 69353
Reservation of two or three posts of Superintendents for, suggestion, *Buxy* 69374, 69382
Staffing of department largely by, in future, looked forward to, *Hewlett* 69402
TRAINING IN ENGLAND:
Diploma course, appointments could not be guaranteed, but different openings for, *Queripel* 69444
Facilities to enable sons to go to England to obtain diploma of R.C.V.S., question of, *Pease* 69257
Post-graduate courses at Royal Veterinary College, difficulties, *M'Fadyean* 69455, 69456, 69459–60
State aid to exceptional students, proposal approved, *Buxy* 69380
Training in India, impossibility unless professors brought from England, *Queripel*... ... 69436

Inspector-General:
ABOLITION OF POST:
Appointment of senior superintendent as veterinary officer to Government would surmount difficulty of lack of technical head, *Aitchison* 69345, 69350
Diminution in number of candidates since, *Queripel* 69439
certain Disadvantages as result ... ... p. 329
Disadvantages of, *Pease* and *Farmer*, 69247; *Smith*, 69282, 69285, 69293–5, 60303, 69309; *Aitchison*, 69335; *Hewlett*, 69400; *Queripel*, 69441; p. 331.
Functions, *Hewlett* ... ... p. 317
Less necessity for, since Imperial horse-breeding handed over to Remount Department, *Aitchison* 69345
Post was an inducement to men to joint department, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69247
REVIVAL OF POST:
Argument that Inspector-General enabled one Department to know what was going on in another Province not agreed with, *Aitchison* 69352
Demand for, *Pease* 69259
not Necessary or desirable, *Hewlett* 69399, 69404

Inspectors:
Duties, *Brand* 69316
Number of posts in each grade, Bengal ... p. 330
PAY:
Rates and improvement advocated, Bengal, *Brand* ... ... 69313, 69321; p. 330
proposed Scale, *Buxy* 69372
RECRUITMENT:
Method ... ... p. 330
Scheme, *Brand* 69310–1, 69325
Selection from most able men, irrespective of seniority advocated, *Buxy* 69372

L

Lahore Veterinary College:
Course of study, and increase in standard, 1900, *Pease* 69244, 69255
Establishment, 1882, by Military Department, and object of, *Pease* and *Farmer*... 69244, 69255
History of, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69244
Increase of educational standard for entry desirable and increase in period of training, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69257
Indians, employment of, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69251
Pay, rates of, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69248
PROVINCIAL OFFICERS' PAY:
Initial, *Pease* 69276
Rates of, scale not satisfactory, *Pease* and *Farmer* ... ... 69248, p. 328
Provincial staff and method of recruitment, and post-graduate training considered necessary p. 328

Lahore Veterinary College—*continued.*
Staff satisfactory, but better qualified specialists would be needed if standard raised to that in England, *Pease* 69267

Leave, Imperial Service:
Conditions of, of civilian members governed by European services leave rules and satisfactory on the whole, *Hewlett* 69396
Full amount due not always obtained, *Pease* 69265
FURLOUGH:
Allowances, increase advocated, *Hewlett* 69396
Pay at minimum rate of £500 per annum advocated, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69249
Reserve, no adequate arrangements *re* furlough, and need for, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69249
on Half pay, shorter period on full pay desirable, *Aitchison* 69337
RESERVE:
Inadequate, *Smith* 69284, 69299
Provision for ... ... p. 330
Recommendation *re*, *Hewlett* 69396
STUDY:
Advocated for selected junior officers, and suggestions, *M'Fadyean* 69448, 69452, 69456
Important, and reduction of study leave allowances for military officers, cause of dissatisfaction, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69249
Reduction of allowances, discouraging effect, *Pease* 69278
System ... ... p. 335

Leave, Provincial Service:
under Civil Service regulations ... ... p. 336
Rules should be on same lines as in Provincial Civil Service, *Buxy* 69373
Recommendations, *Brand* 69314
STUDY:
to Europe, should be given to Deputy Superintendents, but more benefit would be obtained from post-graduate course in India, *Pease* 69278
on Full pay:
Advocated, *Brand* 69314, 69328
Claim would not be pressed if pay increased, *Brand* 69331

M

M'Fadyean, Sir John, evidence of ... 69448–69460

Madras:
Agreement system should be discontinued, *D'Silva* 69358, 69364
DEPUTY SUPERINTENDENTS:
Need for recruitment of, becoming felt p. 336–7
Posts in cadre of, unfilled as no competent men available, *D'Silva* 69369
History of department up to date of formation of ... ... p. 334
Leave and training arranged for by Government of India ... ... p. 336
Memorandum by Government ... p. 334–7
Numbers and pay, 1887—1913 ... ... p. 336
Pay, educational branch should be placed on same footing as in other provinces, *D'Silva* 69359, 69366
no Posts held outside authorised cadre ... p. 336
Proposals of Royal Commission on decentralisation *re* provincialisation of superior officers and reply by Government ... p. 334–5
PROVINCIAL SERVICE:
no Additions necessary at present ... p. 337
History of ... ... p. 335–6
Rule that officers not allowed to practise, disadvantage to public, *Aitchison* ... 69339, 69346
Special Veterinary Inspector in Forest Department, open to assistants and inspectors p. 337
second Superintendent may be required when operations expand ... ... p. 336
Under-staffed, and Imperial Department should be increased, *Aitchison* 69344
VETERINARY COLLEGE:
Cattle and dog practice done free at, *Aitchison* 69347
Course, etc. ... ... p. 336
Grade pay, revision suggested in future, *Aitchison* 69348

Madras—*continud.*
VETERINARY COLLEGE—*continued.*
Nominal tuition fee should be prescribed and no agreement be entered into, *D'Silva* 69358, 69364
Post-graduate course:
under Contemplation ... ... p. 336-7
None, but could be arranged, *D'Silva* 69370
Salaries of staff, *Aitchison* 69348
Scholarship system, no fees, *D'Silva* ... 69368
Staff and organisation, *Aitchison*, 69342; p. 336
Students, number, and length of course, *Aitchison* 69348

O

Organisation of department, *Hewlett* ... 69399

P

Pay, Imperial Service:
Allowances considered satisfactory by Madras Government ... ... p. 336
CIVILIAN OFFICERS:
Comparison with pay of military members, *Hewlett* ... ... p. 318-9
Conditions unsatisfactory and revision needed, *Pease* and *Farmer*, 69248; *Hewlett*, 69395, p. 318
Maximum, grievance *re*, and improvement advocated, *Pease*, 69263; *Smith*, 69283, 69300; *Aitchison*, 69334-5; p. 331.
Rates not considered satisfactory by Punjab Government ... ... p. 328
Scale, *Hewlett* ... ... 69395, p. 328, p. 335
Local and house rent allowances ... ... p. 335
MILITARY OFFICERS:
Civil allowances of Lieutenant-Colonels and Colonels should be increased 69248
not Considered satisfactory by Punjab Government ... ... p. 328
Increase advocated, *Pease* and *Farmer* ... 69248
Rates of, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69248; p. 328, p. 335
Time scale advocated, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69248
Rates, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69248, p. 229-30, p. 331, p. 336
Rates believed to be suitable by Bengal Government ... ... p. 330
Scale should be equal or slightly superior to Army Service, *M'Fadyean* ... 69448, 69450
Special allowance of Rs. 150 a month to officer in administrative charge of department advocated ... ... p. 333
Special grade limited to 10 per cent. of service on Rs. 1,400, promotion to, being by selection after 23 years' service, proposed by Government of Bihar and Orissa ... ... p. 331

Pay, Provincial Service:
Dissatisfaction with, in Punjab, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69248
Improvement, need for, *Buxy* 69374
of Officers promoted to Imperial Service less than Europeans from England suggested, and reasonable, *Brand* 69311, 69327
Rates, 1890, 1900, 1913, Madras ... ... p. 337
Satisfactory ... ... p. 333
Scale, present and proposed, *Buxy*, 69372; *D'Silva*, 69359, p. 331; *Earle*, p. 332.
Pease, Colonel H. T., evidence of ... 69244-69278

Pensions, Imperial Service:
under Civil Service regulations, *Hewlett* 69397, p. 336
CIVILIAN OFFICERS:
Additional pension advocated, *Pease* and *Farmer*, 69250; *Smith*, 69285.
Comparison with military officers, *Hewlett* p. 319
proposed Scale, *Hewlett* ... p. 318, p. 319
Family, on lines of Indian Civil Service, some demand for, *Hewlett* 69397
Increase advocated, *Aitchison* 69338
Military officers, consolidated pension of £700 after 30 years' service advocated, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69250
Rules unsatisfactory, *Hewlett* 69397
Scale should be equal or slightly superior to Army Service, *M'Fadyean* ... 69448, 69450

Pensions, Provincial Service, rules should be on same lines as in Provincial Civil Service, *Buxy* 69373

Popularity of Department, decline of, reasons, *Pease*, 69263; *Buxy*, 69374; *Hewlett*, 69400; p. 329

Principalships, Assistant, *Brand* 69316

Private Practice:
should be Allowed, *Aitchison*, 69339, 69346, 69356; *D'Silva*, 69358, 69365; *Hewlett*, 69400 (*c*), 69406, 69413.
Attitude of Government of India *re*, *Earle*... p. 332
Average income made by veterinary surgeon in England, *Hewlett* 69410
no great Objection seen personally, but objection of Government to, *Pease* 69259
PRIVATE PRACTITIONERS:
Question of, *Aitchison* 69343, 69346
Rise of, *Smith* 69306
Question should be reconsidered, at any rate as regards Assam, and local administration be given discretion, *re*, *Earle* ... ... p. 332

Probation and Training, Imperial Service:
Confirmation in appointment, passing in vernacular by higher standard should be express condition of ... ... p. 333
Difficulty in arranging for officers to become familiar with actual conditions of country, etc. ... ... p. 336
Diploma obtained after four years study of no great value, *Pease* 69268
Five years period of probation might be reduced to three, *Aitchison*, 69334, 69355; *Hewlett*, 60393, p. 330, p. 333, p. 336.
Increase in number of officers advocated to enable adequate training of younger officers, *M'Fadyean* 69448
Local training, certain advantages of higher standard possible, *Smith* 69302
Method approved, *D'Silva* 69357
POST-GRADUATE COURSE:
for Every man going to India, advocated, *Queripel* 69423
Hardships of present system, and suggestions, *Queripel* 69425
Rules for examination of officers in vernacular language ... ... p. 337
Study leave (*see under* Leave).
System, *Hewlett* 69393
System in Punjab, and suggestions, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69246
System satisfactory ... ... p. 339
Training not satisfactory in practice, *Hewlett* 69393
Two years' training desirable, and suggestion *re*, *Smith*, 69281; *Aitchison*, 69334; *Hewlett*, 69393; *M'Fadyean*, 69448, 69452, 69456.
Two months' course at Royal Veterinary College, five years' work in India and then further training in England advocated, *Queripel* 69425
(*see also under* Indians.)

Probation and Training, Provincial Service:
Men trained in India not equal to those trained at home, *Aitchison* 69354
Regulations considered satisfactory ... p. 331
Scheme, *Brand*, 69311; *Buxy*, 69371.
Suggestions *re*, in Punjab, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69246

Promotion:
should Depend first on professional capabilities, not educational, *D'Silva* 69358, 69363
of Junior officers over heads of senior officers from other provinces, and dissatisfaction caused by, *Pease* 69260
Policy *re* appointments complained of, 69247; *Pease*, 69259.

Provincial Service:
Appointment of officers to higher posts, suggestions, *Brand* 69318
Certain members of, should be deputed to England for study and might later be taken into Imperial Service, *Hewlett* 69398
no Direct relations with other services, but may be compared with other Provincial Services, *Brand* 69317

Provincial Service—*continued.*
History of ... ... p. 335–6
no Provision for leave or training, Bengal... p. 330
no Provision for leave and training in cadre of Deputy Superintendents and Inspectors, Madras, but leave, etc., reserve among Veterinary Assistants ... ... p. 337
Unpopularity of, *Brand* 69318
(*see also* Conditions of Service, etc., *and* Deputy Superintendents *and* Inspectors, *and under names of provinces.*)

Publication of Professional Papers, restriction on, and desire for modification of, *Hewlett* p. 320, 69409, 69414

Punjab:
Camel specialist, temporary appointment held by member of Indian Civil Veterinary Department ... ... p. 328
Civil officers, posts required ... ... p. 328
Conditions of service of provincial staff, insecurity of, and dissatisfaction caused, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69247
History and constitution, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69244
Deputy Superintendents, increased number required ... ... p. 328
Indians:
more Higher appointments cannot be given, until better prospects offered and standard of education improved, *Pease* 69251, 69255–6
Increase in employment of Deputy Superintendents, possibility of, *Pease* ... 69251, 69256
Leave reserve, adequate, *Pease* 69261
Leave, two reserve officers required in addition to those under training 69249
Letter from Chief Secretary, October, 1910 p. 328
Memorandum of officers 69244–69252
Military Officers:
no Increase needed ... ... p. 328
no More being recruited, *Pease* and *Farmer* 69245; p. 328
Number, *Pease* ... ... 69253, p. 328
no Posts held outside cadre ... ... p. 328
Professor of Surgery, post held temporarily by Provincial Service officer ... ... p. 328
Provincial Service:
Memorandum not representative of views of entire service, *Pease* 69275
Number of posts in grade ... ... p. 328
no Provision for leave or training ... ... p. 328
Second vernacular college for northern India desirable 69246
Work almost entirely devoted to cattle at present, *Pease* 69254
Staff sufficient, *Pease* 69261
Veterinary College (*see* Lahore Veterinary College).
(*see also under subject headings.*)

Q

Queripel, Lieutenant-Colonel A. E., evidence of 69422–69447

R

Recruitment, Imperial Service:
Age of arrival, younger men desirable, *Pease* 69254
Competitive examination would be no advantage, *Queripel* 69443
Course in England should be essential condition, *Buxy* 69380
Decrease in number of suitable candidates owing to reduction in popularity and competition of other services, *M'Fadyean* 69448, 69450–1
Difficulties might be experienced if many men required, *Queripel* 69426
to Higher appointments from outside, no objection to, but promotion preferable, *Buxy* 69377
of Indians (*see under* Imperial Service).
Memorandum on appointments by Secretary of State to certain branches of Government service, attention called to, *Drake* 69461
Method approved, *Smith*, 69280; *Aitchison*; 69333; *D'Silva*, 69357; *Hewlett*, 69392; p. 329; p. 333; p. 336; p. 339.

Recruitment, Imperial Service—*continued.*
Need for best of recent graduates in point of intelligence and education in, *M'Fadyean* 69448, 69451
Number of officers appointed by Secretary of State, 1904—1914, *Drake* 69461
Numbers recruited each year, 1902—1913, *Queripel* 69426, 69437
Policy of Government of India *re* recruitment of Europeans and Indians ... ... p. 335
Promotion of Provincial Officers:
of Exceptional merit would be agreed to, *Smith* 69292
Number of higher posts might be thrown open to Provincial Service at two-thirds salary in course of a few years, *Brand* 69311, 69323
after Post-graduate course in England, suggestion, unless central college instituted, *Brand* 69324
Qualifications:
Advocated, *Pease*, 69254; *Queripel*, 69428, 69441
Diploma in tropical medicines and practical experience of contagious diseases should entitle candidate to preference ... ... p. 333
Laid down, *Queripel* 69424
Regulations *re* appointments ... ... p. 337, p. 342
Regulations considered by Bengal Government to be working satisfactorily ... ... p. 329
Regulations satisfactory subject to certain amendments (*Burma Government*) ... p. 333
Remarks of Chief Commissioner, Assam, on Agricultural Department, applicable to p. 331
Selection:
Board would not be less liable to outside pressure than single individual, *Queripel* 69430
Committee:
Constitution, *Queripel* 69422
Member of service on, objection to, and not advocated, *Queripel* ... 69427, 69434
Member in touch with recent developments in India not advocated, *Queripel*... 69447
Method, *Pease* 69254; *Queripel*, 69427, 69433.
Preferred, *Pease* 69257
System considered satisfactory, *Queripel* 69245, p. 328
Vacancies generally made known at once, but many unexpected vacancies, *Queripel*... 69426

Recruitment, Provincial Service:
Direct, and small proportion by promotion from Subordinate Service, suggestion and scheme, *Brand* 69310, 69325
Improvement of system, need for, Bombay, and scheme, *Buxy* 69371
Method, *Brand*, 69310; p. 331; p. 338; *Buxy*, 69371
no Special rules, and existing methods satisfactory ... ... p. 330
System and regulations considered satisfactory 69245, p. 331

Research and Original Work:
Facilities for, at present, and central institution desirable, *Buxy* 69387
Officer in every Province advocated, *Queripel* 69423
Original work difficult to obtain in England before going out to India, but some men specially trained, *Queripel* 69423

Retirement, Imperial Service, reduction of period of service advocated, *Hewlett* p. 318, p. 319, 69408

Retirement, Provincial Service, reduction of period of service advocated, *Pease*, 69274; *Brand*, 69315, 69329.

Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons:
Number having qualified as veterinary surgeons by taking diploma of, *Queripel* 69435
Standard for admission, *M'Fadyean* ... 69458

Rural Commissioner:
Appointment of, to co-ordinate agricultural and veterinary work, suggested, *Hewlett* 69399, 69405
would be of great Assistance in the Province, but not outside, *Smith* 69296
Guarantee that Indian Civil Service man appointed as, should have taken general interest in agricultural problems, etc., necessary, *Hewlett* 69417

S

Smith, Major A., evidence of 69280–69309
Study Leave (*see under* Leave).
Subordinate Service, improvement of pay and prospects, suggestion, *Brand* 69311
Surgeons (*see* Veterinary Surgeons).

T

Training (*see* Probation and Training).
Transfers, liability of Imperial officers to ... p. 335

U

United Provinces of Agra and Oudh:
Industries Department, letter, September, 1913 p. 329
Proposal under consideration for establishment with Bihar and Orissa of joint veterinary college at Cawnpore ... ... p. 331
Universities, no degrees granted in veterinary science, but possibility of, *Buxy* ... 69388–9

V

Veterinary Adviser to Government of India:
Civilian Director of Agriculture preferred, *Pease* 69268–9
Need for, and suggestion *re* creation, *Hewlett* 69399, 69404, 69415–6
Senior Veterinary Officer as, would be suitable system in some Provinces, *Smith* ... 69308
Veterinary Assistants:
Conditions of service 69248
Pay, proposed scale, *Farmer* 69279
Veterinary Colleges:
CENTRAL:
would be Beneficial, *Buxy* 69383
English training preferable to establishment of, *Aitchison* 69343
Suggestion not approved, *Hewlett* ... 69403
in Colonies, *Queripel*, 69446; *M'Fadyean*, 69455.
Veterinary Colleges—*continued.*
IN ENGLAND:
Post-graduate course:
Diploma of Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons the only recognised qualification, *Queripel* 69445–6
Diploma of Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons not an essential qualification, *M'Fadyean* 69457
Proposal that men having taken degree in arts at university should be allowed to take three instead of four years course, *Queripel* 69432
in Great Britain, *Queripel*, 69445; *M'Fadyean*, 69453.
IN INDIA:
Comparison with English colleges, *Pease* 69258, 69267
Excellent supply of candidates for vernacular colleges and fair supply for English colleges, *Pease* 69257
Government appointments obtained by most students, or men go to foreign countries or native states, *Pease* 69257
Principals, allowances granted to, considered necessary and justifiable, *Pease*... ... 69273
Qualified men from England as professors, preferable at present to sending Indians to England, *Buxy* 69386
Scholarships, *Pease* 69257
Training in, deficient, and raising of standard desired, and suggestion, *Buxy* 69371, 69383, 69386, 69388
Training not as good as in England, and impossibility of, for some years, *Hewlett* 69403
Training sufficient for agricultural requirements of the present day, *Hewlett* ... 69411
Two vernacular (Burma and Punjab), rest English, *Pease* 69267
(*see also under names of provinces.*)
Veterinary Officers, little contact with Agricultural officers, *Pease* 69262
Veterinary Profession, difficulties in way of raising standard of training in India, *Smith* 69301
Veterinary Surgeons, increased number of official appointments in England, *Queripel* ... 69440

APPENDIX

TO THE

REPORT

OF

THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XV.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

RELATING TO THE

SURVEY OF INDIA DEPARTMENT,

Taken at Delhi and Calcutta,

WITH

APPENDICES.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	353
Minutes of Evidence	354
Appendices	393
Index	399

LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION.

	PAGE
At DELHI, Monday, 10th November, 1913.	
Lieutenant-Colonel C. P. Lenox-Conyngham, R.E., Superintendent of the Trigonometrical Survey, Dehra Dun	354
Captain A. H. Gwyn, I. A., Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India Department	359
A. Ewing, Esq., Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India Department	360
Khan Bahadur Syed Aulad Hossein, Officiating Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India Department	362
At CALCUTTA, Thursday, 22nd January, 1914.	
H. W. Biggie, Esq., Officiating Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India Department	365
At CALCUTTA, Friday, 23rd January, 1914.	
Colonel S. G. Burrard, C.S.I., R.E., F.R.S., Surveyor-General, Survey of India Department ...	371
J. O. Grieff, Esq., Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India Department	378

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

SURVEY OF INDIA DEPARTMENT,

At Delhi, Monday, 10th November, 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, ESQ., C.I.E.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, ESQ., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, ESQ., C.S.I.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

COLONEL C. T. F. B. RENNY-TAILYOUR, C.S.I., R.E., Superintendent, Southern Circle, Survey of India Department.

R. R. SCOTT, ESQ. (*Joint Secretary*).

LIEUTENANT-COLONEL G. P. LENOX-CONYNGHAM, R.E., Superintendent of the Trigonometrical Survey, Dehra Dun.

Written Statement relating to the Survey of India Department.

70044. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—Officers are recruited from the Royal Engineers and the Indian Army in the proportion of three of the former to one of the latter. There is also one special officer designated "The Mathematical Adviser," who is appointed by the Secretary of State from time to time. The system of recruitment is satisfactory.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—Before entering upon any question concerning the Provincial Service it is necessary to point out that that of the Survey of India differs largely from the Provincial Service of the Public Works Department, with which it is often compared, and from some others. In those departments the Provincial Service has been formed in order to give to Indians and the domiciled European community, who are unable to send their sons to Europe, an opening into the more important branches of Government Service. Their Provincial Officers perform duties of the same kind as the Imperial Officers; their numbers are restricted to some moderate proportion of the whole; and the service does not form a link in the chain of organisation.

In the Survey of India the state of things is quite different. The Provincial Officers outnumber the Imperial Officers in the proportion of about three to one; the service constitutes a link in the chain of organisation intermediate between the Imperial Officers and the Surveyors; and in consequence, its duties are to a large extent of a different and less responsible nature than those of the Imperial Service. Moreover, the designation Provincial is quite inappropriate. All officers of the Survey of India (with the exception of the Mathematical Adviser) are liable for service in any part of India or Burma; they have no special connection with any particular locality.

The idea of creating Provincial Services originated, I believe, with the Public Service Commission of 1886, and it seems that in a desire for uniformity of nomenclature in all departments they recommended that what had till then been known as the "Junior Branch" of the Survey of India should receive the new designation.

The effect of this has been unsatisfactory. The change of designation naturally had no effect on the duties which the officers have to perform, but it has had the effect of gradually causing the officers to resent the fact that they are not on an equality in status and responsibility with similarly styled officers in the Public Works and some other departments, while they ignore the great difference between the qualifications demanded of them and of candidates for the Public Works Department.

In the latter candidates for the Provincial Service have to spend three or four years at an Engineering College at their own expense, and after that to take their chance of obtaining an appointment.

Candidates for the Provincial Service of the Survey of India are only required to produce a certificate of having passed the First Arts, or Final School Examination and are then admitted to an elementary competitive examination managed by the department itself. The successful candidates after joining the department are placed under instruction for about a year during which time they receive a salary of Rs. 100 per mensem.

In 1909 a New Provincial Service, with higher pay than the old one, was created, and it was hoped that a more highly educated class of candidate could be attracted. The attempt was not successful, and in consequence of the great and not unnatural discontent aroused in members of the old service by seeing men in no way their superiors given much better terms, it has been found necessary to raise the pay of the old up to that of the new, with the result that the majority of the officers of the old service are now in the enjoyment of very much higher emoluments than they could look forward to when they joined, and it is undeniable that for the pay and prospects now offered Government would have a right to ask for a higher standard of education.

But it is questionable whether it is advisable to take any steps in this direction. At present the Department contains four different classes of officers, namely, Imperial, Provincial, Upper Subordinate, and Lower Subordinate. But there is scarcely room for more than three, namely, Controlling Officers, Supervising Officers and Surveyors. Before 1895 there were only three classes, the Senior Branch, the Junior Branch and the Surveyors; after that there were the Imperial Service, the Provincial Service and the Surveyors: but in 1909 it was decided that the Provincial Service was too expensive an agency for supervising duties, and it was ordered that its numbers should be reduced by degrees from 134 to 87 and that an Upper Subordinate Service should be formed which would in part replace it. The device does not promise to be successful. There is no dividing line between the duties of the two Services. It would be better to have one Service only, modelled on the Upper Subordinate Service of the Public Works Department, which would include a good proportion of non-commissioned officers of the Royal Engineers and other corps, who have been through a course of training at the Thomason Engineering College at Rurki.

I have already mentioned that it was ordered in 1909 that the strength of the Provincial Service should be reduced from 134 to 87. By a more recent order recruiting has been stopped.

The best policy to pursue would seem to be to allow the present Provincial Service to die out and replace it by such a Service as I have mentioned above. This would involve no hardship or injustice to existing members of the Provincial Service, and would provide a body of men who would, I believe, be particularly well adapted to the work of the Survey. Men of this class have proved very useful in the Public Works Department and Military Works Service, and their training and qualities would render them even more suitable for employment in the Survey, in which there is a considerable and increasing number of soldier surveyors recruited from Native regiments. For work in connection with Military operations a survey party consisting of trained soldier surveyors, supervised by non-commissioned officers who had received a technical education at Roorkee, and controlled by an Imperial Officer, would appear to be extremely suitable. I do not mean that the new Upper Subordinate Service should be wholly military; it would probably be advantageous to have a good proportion of Indians and of domiciled Europeans, but for such the education test should be made tolerably stiff, it being recognised that those who had not the advantage of Military training should be possessed of some other valuable quality.

70045. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—Officers of the Royal Engineers receive a good training at the School of Military Engineering, and all that they require is some instruction in the methods that have been found best for this country and in the use of instruments of high precision.

Officers of the Indian Army require a good deal more teaching. After a period of instruction they are required to pass an examination and to serve on probation for a time before they are finally admitted to the Department. No change in the present arrangements seems necessary.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—These officers receive a year's training when they join and are on probation for two years after that.

No change in the system seems necessary.

70046. **(III) and (IV) Conditions of Service and Salary.**—No remarks.

70047. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—The amount of leave is adequate, but the grant of it is hedged about by some restrictions which do not seem to me to be useful and which are sometimes vexatious; also the rules are so complicated as often to be difficult to interpret. I think greater simplicity should be aimed at. At present 11 months of duty earn one month of leave on full pay, and four years of duty earn one year on half pay. Retaining these amounts, if leave were treated like money, and an account like a banking account were kept, showing the amounts earned and the amounts taken, I do not think any restrictions would have to be made except that there would be a limit to the amount of leave to be taken at one time (sickness excepted) and that no leave could be given unless the exigencies of the Service permitted it, which would impose a limit on the number of officers on leave simultaneously. The rule that an officer cannot have furlough until he has done eight years' service is frequently a source of hardship and is of little if any benefit to the State.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—The leave rule applying to this Service might also be simplified with advantage.

There is one other remark to make on this subject. Officers appointed by the Secretary of State to such appointments as those of Manager or Assistant Manager in the technical offices of the Survey of India, find themselves under the Indian Leave Rules. This is a hardship. These rules are framed to meet the case of men who are either natives of or domiciled in this country and to whom a visit to Europe is an exceptional thing. When applied to men who are wholly English they are unsuitable as they do not allow them sufficient opportunities for going home. If such men can manage to afford to go home from time to time both they and the Service benefit, and it is both unwise and ungenerous to place obstacles in their way.

70048. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—No remarks.

70049. **(VII$_A$) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans.**—(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—This is a Military Service, and the question does not arise.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—So far as I am aware, there are no limitations to the employment of non-Europeans.

70050. **(VII$_B$) The working of the existing system of divisions of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—As I have explained above, the term Provincial Service is unsuitable to the conditions of the Survey of India. The old term of "Junior Branch" was more appropriate, indicating as it does that the officers of that Branch had less responsible duties than those of the Imperial Service, or as it was then called the Senior Branch.

There is no need for any Provincial Service in the Survey of India, but there is a need of a body of men to undertake the more difficult parts of a Survey, and to be intermediaries between the

Imperial Officers and the Surveyors, to check the field-work, allot tasks and generally supervise detail. As I have stated under the head of recruitment I believe that such a Service could be formed by the enlistment of Non-Commissioned Officers of Royal Engineers and other corps supplemented by suitably educated Indians and domiciled Europeans.

70051. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The relations between the Survey of India and other Services have generally been good and satisfactory.

Lieutenant-Colonel G. P. Lenox-Conyngham called and examined.

70052. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he had occupied his present position for 13 months. He had served in the Survey Department from July, 1889. There were three classes of officers in the Imperial Branch of the Service, Superintendents, Deputy Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents. The Superintendents were in charge of circles. Each circle was composed of four parties doing topographical survey, each party being in charge of a Deputy Superintendent. One Assistant Superintendent should be with each topographical party, but at the present time there was not a sufficient number to provide for one being with each party. The duty of an Extra Assistant in the Provincial Service was normally to take charge of a camp, or of a sub-division of a party. The Assistants in the two branches of the Service were not ordinarily employed on the same kind of work. An Assistant in the Imperial Service acted as adjutant to the officer in charge of the party, whereas the Extra Assistant of the Provincial Service would be in charge of a camp, supervising the surveyors and checking their actual work on the ground. The assistant in the Imperial Service would either act in lieu of the officer in charge of the party, or take over his duties, or assist him in carrying out the duty of control, while the Extra Assistant in the Provincial Service would simply supervise the work of the surveyor. Under a very recent re-organisation, seven major charges had been made over to the Provincial Service, and Provincial Officers holding such posts were doing practically the work of the officers in the Imperial Service, the only difference being in the status and pay.

70053. Dealing with the suggestion contained in the written statements which had been put before the Committee, that recruitment in the Imperial Service should be confined to Royal Engineer officers, or alternatively, that posts now reserved for Indian Army Officers should be open to other branches of the Military Service, witness said he should be in favour of the former proposal, because a Royal Engineer was better trained for the purpose. He received a good training at Woolwich and Chatham, and came to India already equipped for the work of a surveyor. Then, there was no prejudice against a Royal Engineer taking up such an appointment. In the Indian Army there was a distinct tendency to prevent the best men from leaving their regiments; Commanding Officers did not like their best men leaving to fill a departmental appointment. Again, the disparity between an officer of the Indian Army and the pick of the Royal Engineers was considerable. Also, apart from the fact of that disparity, an officer from the Indian Army entered the Service quite untrained. There was not a large field of selection for officers from the Indian Army. It was extremely difficult to discover whether such officers had special capacity for the work of surveying. The present method of selection was a recommendation by the Commanding Officer, which came before the Surveyor-General, who had to find out what he could about the men, and this was not a very easy task; there was no intrinsic qualification to go upon. With regard to the suggestion that a system might be devised for sending an Indian Army Officer for a year's training in the survey, the object being to provide a nucleus from which permanent appointments could be made, witness said he would not care to give an opinion without consideration. Some organisation would have to be made for such officers' training, which was not at present in existence.

70054. The present system of training was as follows: Men were generally sent to the Trigonometrical Survey Office, where they obtained some training in the scientific and mathematical branches of the subject from the mathematical adviser. They were attached to a field party, and picked up such information as they could. There was no very good organisation. Appointments were so few that the Department had to manage in that way. A more complete organisation and training could not be undertaken unless there were more men to train. At present the proportion was three engineers to one Indian Army Officer. An appointment from the Indian Army was only made once in two or three years. It would not be fair to say that a man's training during his probationary period was somewhat of a perfunctory character. The training was carried out with some little difficulty and inconvenience to other people, but he thought an officer obtained a satisfactory training. Full attention was paid to him. He did not think it necessary that Royal Engineer Officers should pass an entrance examination for admission to the survey of India. They had been through a good many examinations in England, which he thought were quite sufficient. He should be inclined to think that a longer period of training for an officer in the Indian Army would be of benefit, and he suggested three years. At the end of the present two years' probation, there was still a disparity in an Indian Army officer's knowledge as compared with that of a Royal Engineer's.

70055. With regard to the question whether the rules for admission to the Provincial Service had proved on the whole satisfactory, the witness said it was difficult to say whether the Department had obtained as good men as it might have done by some other system. Of the three methods of entrance into the Service put forward in 1909, the system of competitive examination was practically the only one to which effect had been given. Very few promotions from the Subordinate Service had been made in the past, and none recently. On the average the promotions from the Subordinate Service had proved satisfactory, but there was not a great number of such cases on which to base an average. Personally, he could think of only two. Under the rules for admission to the Provincial Service it had been ordered that at least one-fourth should be Indians, and it was understood that in the Upper Subordinate Service it was the intention to give at least half the vacancies to Indians. In practice, no applications had been received except from Indians.

70056. He had not a very good knowledge of how Survey Officers were recruited in other countries, but he thought in all cases, with the exception of the United States, the Survey Department was under a Military organisation. It was necessary to have a reserve of Royal Engineer officers in India and these officers were employed in times of peace on such work as the Survey. He did not know of any Civilian Survey Officers who had been employed on Military expeditions.

70057. He thought the Provincial Service was "a fifth wheel in the coach," and should therefore be abolished. The duties of the Department should be divided under three heads—controlling, supervising and actual surveying, with the surveyors supervised by a superior service, and directed by the Imperial Service. The three classes should be entirely separate. Prior to 1895 the Service was divided into senior and junior, and when the designation of "Provincial" was adopted, the duties did not change in any degree. The Service was an all-India Service, and therefore he thought "Provincial Service" was a misapplication of terms; it did not in the least express the nature of the Service. The Imperial Service, as he would like to see it, would be confined to officers

in charge of parties, and their assistants in training under them. The Upper Subordinate Service would be composed of officers employed in definitely inferior work. If the Provincial Service was abolished and the Upper Subordinate Service took its place, the designations of officers would doubtless be somewhat different.

70058. He thought Circle Superintendents were really necessary to act as a link between the Surveyor-General and the field parties. It would be bad organisation for the Surveyor-General to try and keep in touch with the whole 18 or 20 parties. A Circle Superintendent had five parties under him, and his duty was to be in constant touch with them. The Deputy Superintendents in charge of parties communicated with the Surveyor-General through the Circle Superintendent. He thought that after one year's training a Royal Engineer Officer would be quite competent to take charge of a camp, and that after four years' experience he could be entrusted with charge of a party. He would suggest a longer period in the case of an officer from the Indian Army, but he would be adverse to laying down any hard-and-fast rule, because men differed. He thought the period of probation in the Provincial Service was sufficient. They did in practice go through a three years' probation. With regard to the complaint that officers, particularly Provincial officers, did not obtain a sufficiently varied training during their first year's course, the witness said that when the Department was up to its full strength and less pressed with urgent work, it could arrange to give men a sufficient experience; but in the past the Department had been shorthanded, and a man had to be put to the work which he could do. He thought, however, that nearly all officers were agreed that, so far as possible, a man's experience should be varied during the first years of his service. That very largely depended upon the sufficiency of officers. There was an insufficiency at the present time when any sudden emergency arose. For instance, last year there was an expedition to the extreme north-east frontier, on which nine officers were engaged, and this made a considerable difference to a Department composed of 54 officers. He thought an increased reserve would be a good thing.

70059. With regard to salary, he considered the present system of pay an extremely inconvenient one. It led to a good deal of administrative trouble. He would prefer to see the time scale so adjusted as to include the charge allowance.

70060. Dealing with the representation that the pay of Provincial officers was much less than two-thirds of the pay granted to Imperial officers, and that it should approximate more nearly to the rates authorised for Provincial officers in other services, the witness replied that a Provincial Service which was created in order to give to the people of India an opportunity of obtaining some of the higher appointments under Government was organised on different lines from the Provincial Service of the Survey Department, which was distinctly intended to be a link in a chain of organisation, and was not intended to be on a par with the Imperial Service. When the Provincial Service was created, the duties allotted to officers were not changed in any way; it was still the Service which was originally called the Subordinate Service. It was re-named the Junior Branch, and then the Provincial Service, but the duties remained precisely the same. He did not think the two-thirds scale of pay applied at all. The Provincial Service of the Survey Department outnumbered the Imperial Service by about two and a half to one, so the suggested increase in pay would be a formidable item. With regard to the suggestion that for the Provincial Service an annual increment of Rs. 20 should be substituted for the present triennial increment of Rs. 50, the witness replied it was a question of what the Government desired to give.

70061. With regard to leave, the witness said he had heard in conversation that there was a considerable consensus of opinion in favour of an officer being allowed to accumulate privilege leave for more than three months. Sometimes a man had accumulated his three months' privilege leave, which took him 33 months, and then it was found that he could not be spared. Then from the moment he had 33 months' service to his credit, he ceased to be able to accumulate more privilege leave. The witness thought that perhaps it would be advisable only to allow the privilege leave to exceed three months in cases where the officer was unable, owing to the exigencies of the Service, to obtain it when it was due to him. He did not see any special advantage in granting officers leave to study the methods of the Survey Department in other countries. The methods which had been adopted in a country like England were so different from those adopted in India that he did not think officers would learn anything of value. It would be an advantage for a certain number of officers to be allowed to study the scientific branches of survey, such as gravity observations, magnetic observations, and so on. He thought it would repay the Government of India to encourage officers to study those branches during leave.

70062. With regard to pension he thought the present period of 30 years' qualifying service might be reduced. The life of a Survey officer was a very hard one. He thought that it would be a good thing to allow officers to join the General Provident Fund, and he should say that a concession of this nature would be acceptable.

70063. Replying to a question whether, if the scheme he had suggested of only having two divisions, the Imperial and the Upper and Lower Subordinate ranks, was adopted, he would give opportunities to the qualified and more efficient officers in the Upper Subordinate Service to be promoted into the Imperial Service, witness said he did not think there should be an absolute bar, and yet he did not think it was a plan which would work well, except in very exceptional cases. He did not think promotion should be given as a mere reward for long and meritorious service, but that exceptional ability should be taken into account. Of the two alternatives, promotion of a qualified officer from the Upper Subordinate Service, assuming that the qualification for appointment to the Service was higher than it was at present, or of direct recruitment with a proper training for an Indian, he would favour direct recruitment with a proper training, which he thought should certainly include a certain time spent in England, but he would prefer to see neither scheme adopted. He might remark that it was not very easy to get a proper topographical training in England. The only satisfactory school of training that he knew of was the School of Military Engineering at Chatham, to which Civilians were not admitted.

70064. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness said he did not think the Provincial Service in the Survey Department was the same as the Provincial Service elsewhere. He thought the term "Provincial" as applied to the Department was a misnomer. He had not considered the question of the starting salary for the Upper Subordinate Service, supposing his scheme for the abolition of the Provincial Service was adopted, but he should say it would be very similar to the starting salary of the Upper Subordinate Service of the Public Works and Military Works Department. It would be true, therefore, to say, that if the Survey Provincial Department was replaced by an Upper Subordinate Service, there would be a considerable saving effected. He thought a satisfactory class of men for Survey Work would be obtained on that grade of salary, taking into account the experience of the Public Works and Military Works Department. He would withdraw from the Provincial Service the seven Executive charges which had been transferred to it, and he would also have in his proposed Upper Subordinate Service a considerable proportion of non-commissioned officers. The proportion he had in mind was two-thirds. It would be the case that if his scheme was adopted, the entire Provincial Service with its higher emoluments would be lost to Indians and domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians. He agreed that he was not improving the Survey Department from the standpoint of domiciled Europeans, Anglo-Indians and

Indians by his proposed scheme. He was simply looking at the matter from the point of view of efficiency, and that the outturn of the Department should bear a satisfactory proportion to its cost. The reason why the cadre of the Imperial Service had risen from 40 in 1895 to 55 in 1910 was on account of the recommendations of the Committee which sat in 1904-05. At that time the whole of India had been surveyed after a fashion, but many of the maps were old and inaccurate and the Committee recommended that a systematic re-survey should be undertaken. The estimate of how long the present survey would take was put at 25 years, but he thought that estimate was optimistic. He did not think after the present survey had been finished it would lead to a contraction of the staff of the Surveying Department, if one judged by the experience of other countries. Larger scales and more detailed surveys were constantly being called for as civilisation advanced.

70065. (*Mr. Sly.*) Witness said he did not believe the Indian Army Officers in the Survey Department formed a portion of the War Reserve. They were not required to pass a military examination for promotion, as was the case with Royal Engineer Officers. The duties of the Survey Department in time of war would be to take over all matters connected with the producing of maps for the use of the troops, but doubtless there would be some officers of the Survey Department who would return to their normal Military employment, and become field engineers with the troops. Apart from the War Reserve, however, the survey party, as such, would be furnished by the Survey Department, and employed in time of war as a survey party.

70066. It was not a fact that of the seven charges which had been transferred to the Provincial Service, three had been definitely allocated as office charges. The total number of charges in the Survey Department had, he believed, in the past exceeded 20, but he could not answer that question definitely until he had seen the records.

70067. With regard to opening the Provident Fund for Imperial Officers in the Survey Department, he did not think that preferential treatment should be accorded to any particular department in this respect, but he had not considered the question thoroughly. At the present time no Army Officer in any Department, either Military or Civil, was entitled to subscribe to a Provident Fund, but members of the Provincial Service of the Survey Department did subscribe to a General Provident Fund.

70068. (*Mr. Madge.*) When a qualified Provincial Officer was promoted, his normal duty was to take charge of a camp. If he was selected for an executive charge, he had charge of a party. He did not think a Provincial Officer could rise to the charge of a circle, but he pointed out that the circles had only been in existence for about three years. Referring to the recent order providing for the promotion of Provincial Officers to higher positions, he agreed that this was only a restoration of a privilege previously enjoyed by Provincial Officers, of which they had been deprived by an intermediate committee. But the circumstances were somewhat different. Before the intermediate committee sat, there were no charge allowances, and anybody could be put in charge of a party if he was conveniently placed at the moment the post fell vacant. As far as the pay was concerned, no special sanction was required. No doubt personal qualifications would be taken into account in such cases, as well as considerations of temporary convenience.

70069. Only the Superintendents of Circles were administrative officers. Officers in charge of parties were certainly Executive Officers, but Provincial Officers in charge of camps merely had to check the actual work on the ground, and to do the actual measurements. That was not done, except occasionally, by the officer in charge of the party. There had been two officers known as Deputy Surveyor Generals with administrative duties. Such a post had been held by an uncovenanted man, Mr. Hennessy, who had taken a very high degree at Cambridge. How he had been recruited, and what his career was the witness did not know. He supposed an Assistant Surveyor General would be in administrative charge, and he knew of one case of such a post being filled by a man who had been educated entirely in India.

70070. With regard to study leave, there was no great difference between the training obtainable in India and that obtainable in England. The practice of surveying was different in India, but the principles were the same the world over.

70071. He did not see why there should be any barrier to the promotion of any man in any service for any post, provided he possessed the practical experience and the necessary qualifications. His whole object in making the suggestion with regard to recruitment of non-commissioned officers, was to arrange for an organisation, which, in his opinion, would work easily and efficiently. He thought trained non-commissioned officers, especially from the Royal Engineers, would go to form an efficient, well disciplined department. He agreed that men recruited in India might come from a higher social rank and be better educated men than privates in the Army.

70072. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The witness said he did not join the Department direct from Chatham. The normal employment of a Royal Engineer was in the Military Works Service. He was in that Service for about 18 months when he was appointed to the Survey Department. That was the general method of recruitment for the Survey Department. He agreed that there was no corps in the Indian Army which was analogous to the Royal Engineers, so that, regarding the survey work as essentially military work, the only source of recruitment was the corps of Royal Engineers, and the only training obtainable was through Woolwich and Chatham. The competitive examination for the Provincial Survey Service in India consisted of four mathematical papers, Arithmetic, Algebra, Geometry, and Trigonometry, some geometrical drawing, and some freehand drawing. At various times the syllabus had included an English essay, but latterly this subject of examination had been abolished. He thought he would have been able to pass such an examination two years before he left school, when he was about 14 or 15 years old. The examination did not reach anything like the standard of the Entrance examination for Woolwich. His opinion was that Provincial officers who were promoted to hold major executive charges did not really possess the qualifications which, in his opinion, they should possess.

70073. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) Some of the Provincial Service men were graduates of Indian Universities, and he thought if good graduates of Indian Universities competed the standard of education of the Provincial officer would be satisfactory. It seemed to be very difficult, however, to obtain good graduates from Indian Universities to compete for entrance to a Provincial Service, in which the starting salary was Rs. 250. He did not think the life of a surveyor was attractive to the well-educated Indian. He was not prepared to say that Indians, even with high educational qualifications, would be in every respect as efficient and satisfactory as the Imperial officer, who had had his Military training and possessed other qualifications.

70074. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) No scientific degree of an Indian University would correspond, or be a substitute for the particular training obtained at Woolwich and Chatham. A training similar to that given at Chatham could, he thought, be supplied by the Department itself if a man had a sufficient educational foundation.

70075. (*Chairman.*) He would prefer to send a man to an institution in England to receive the training, rather than that the Department should give it, as the instruction in the Department had to be given rather informally.

70076. (*Colonel Renny-Tailyour.*) The witness said that a training in survey work was given at Sandhurst as well as at Chatham and Woolwich.

(The witness withdrew.)

CAPTAIN A. H. GWYN, I.A., Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India Department.

Written Statement relating to the Survey of India Department.

70077. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The system of recruitment of Indian Army Officers might be modified. At present these officers are, I believe, chosen by the Surveyor General from a very small list of applicants. The Surveyor General can generally have only a rather scanty acquaintance with these applicants, who, moreover, on joining the Department, must be trained for a considerable time before they are of much use.

The Surveyor General could now begin to build up, in order to choose from as vacancies occur, a small body of Indian Army officers in military employ who would all have worked in a Topographical Party, and of whom the Survey would have first-hand knowledge.

At the same time the Army in India would benefit by having a number of officers really well grounded in Topographical surveying, because the great majority of them would remain in military employ, only a very small number being appropriated by the Survey of India. I would suggest an arrangement something like the following:—Each year the Commander-in-Chief and the Surveyor General together to choose from the Indian Army two young officers of about 2½ years' service. These men would remain in military employ, but would come to us for training for about a year. Joining in the autumn, they would plane-table throughout the field season with a topographical party, work in the party office for half of the following recess, and then revert to their ordinary military duty, without any claim to future employment in the Survey of India, or to any particular grading in that department if subsequently admitted. I think good men would come on their military pay (Rs. 400 almost exactly at 2—4 years' service), and on military allowances of some sort which would approximate to those of a junior Imperial Assistant Superintendent; because of the inducement that (as things are at present) one man in about eight so trained would at some future time be appointed to the Survey.

The pay and allowances of each man for, say, six months in the field and three months in recess, would be about Rs. 5,000; say for two men Rs. 10,000 annually; the Army ought to pay for them, as most of the training imparted by us would go to the Army again, and never return to us.

The Surveyor-General to retain his power of nomination, and not to be tied by the five-years-service rule.

I think two is the lowest useful number we could take annually; if we are to have a good number of *umedwars* to pick from.

A nine months' course of training is the least, I think, that would suffice both to give us a proper knowledge of the comparative values of the officers, most of whom would come to us knowing little, and to make them useful to the Army. On joining as an Assistant Superintendent in the Survey of India, of course, a man's survey training would have to be completed.

70078. **(II) System of Training on Probation.**—As I personally remember the Dehra Dun topographical training, it seems to me to be too free from difficulties, and that it would be as well for a young officer to receive it in the field with a topo. party, of which, besides, he should soon become a useful member. I also think that part of the training period should be spent in Calcutta, looking through the accounts system and the drawing and reproduction offices; Dehra Dun would still have to deal with a man's mathematics and all field surveying except topography.

70079. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—Indian Army officers might be given facilities for undergoing military tests for promotion, and be more often sent on field service as survey officers.

70080. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—I personally would like to be able to take less than six months' combined leave. Three months' privilege leave is perhaps enough short leave for anyone going to England, but it is a scramble to make it cover leave in Canada.

70081. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The ordinary Indian Army pension of £700 after 32 years' service ought, I think, to be augmented by £100 for Survey of India Officers; they spend less of their service on leave, and their work is more laborious and better paid than that of officers in Military employ. At the least, an officer should be allowed the choice between the Military pension allowable and that to which a "half average salary" rule would give him.

7082. **(IX) Any other points not covered by preceding heads.**—I think the Imperial Assistant Superintendent at Headquarters ought to get Rs. 100 local allowance to cover the great expense of living in Calcutta. If married, he gets nothing extra, whereas the Imperial Deputy Superintendents get Rs. 100 local allowance on top of these Rs. 200 charge allowance (though not for expensive living I admit).

CAPTAIN A. H. GWYN called and examined.

70083. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he had had about five years' service in the Department and had served about six years in the Army before joining the Survey Department. He had spent the whole of the 11 years in India. He was not satisfied with the method of selection for the officers of the Indian Army, and thought the list of applicants was a small one. Officers in regiments of the Indian Army were not aware that the Survey Department was open to them. About one-fourth of the officers now in the Department were officers of the Indian Army. He would like to see two young officers, chosen from the Indian Army, of about two and a half years' service enter the Survey Department on probation. They should have no claim to enter the Survey at the end of that time, but should return to their regiments with the opportunity of being subsequently recruited to the Service. His particular object in putting forward such a scheme was that there was a dearth of officers in India with surveying knowledge. Another object of his scheme was to give the Survey Department a list of people to choose from. The Indian Army authorities could, he thought, easily spare two officers annually for such a purpose.

70084. He thought the present period of probation sufficient He considered the Dehra Dun course was too easy, in that there was not enough supervision; students were allowed to go their own way. The usual course there was supposed to be for a year. He did not know whether it still continued. With regard to his remark in the written statement that Indian Army officers might be given facilities for undergoing Military tests for promotion, and be more often sent out on field service with survey officers, the witness said it had got to be the custom in the Survey Department to look upon an Indian Army man as not a Military man at all. He thought Indian Army officers would be glad to pass the promotion examination. An Indian officer felt himself under a disability as compared to the officers of the Royal Engineers, and he would like to see the same opportunities extended to the Indian Army officer.

70085. He did not mean by his recommendation for an additional pension of £100 that the present conditions of the Service in regard to pension were

not sufficiently favourable to attract suitable officers. It would be an added attraction. Those officers of the Indian Army who had heard of the Survey Department looked upon it as a well paid Service.

70086. (*Mr. Madge.*) He knew of no special method by which regiments in the Indian Army could be apprised of the fact that the Survey Department was open to them, except that stated in the first paragraph of his written statement.

70087. (*Mr. Sly.*) He considered it necessary to maintain recruitment from the Indian Army, because the Indian Army was an Indian Service and belonged to India; the Indian Army provided a wide field of selection; an Indian Army man who had served three or four years in his native regiment would know more intimately the workings of the mind of an ordinary Surveyor; and Indian Army Commissioners are nowadays taken by those cadets who pass highest out of Sandhurst.

70088. He thought the Imperial Assistant Superintendent at headquarters in Calcutta ought to get a local allowance.

(The witness withdrew.)

A. Ewing, Esq., Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India Department.

Written Statement relating to the Survey of India Department.

70089. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—Since the Resolution of the 27th March, 1895, separating the Survey of India Department (then comprising a Senior and a Junior Division) into an Imperial and a Provincial Service, the Imperial Service has been recruited chiefly from officers of the Royal Engineer Corps, who are appointed to the Survey Department by the Government of India on the recommendations of the Surveyor General of India.

Members of the Provincial Service are appointed to the Department after passing a competitive examination among candidates who are nominated by the Surveyor General of India.

These methods of recruitment I consider satisfactory, but would like the standard of the physical fitness of the Provincial Service to be raised, as survey work in India is done under very trying climatic conditions.

70090. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The candidate for the Provincial Service on passing the competitive examination is appointed to the Department on probation for three years, during which he is liable to be discharged at any time should his conduct or progress in survey work be unsatisfactory. During his first year of probation he attends a survey training class and is taught the theory and practice of surveying and map drawing, and the use of the various surveying and drawing instruments. A portion of this year is spent in the field. During the next two years he is attached to a survey party for further practical training in surveying and map-drawing. On the termination of his period of probation a report is submitted by the officer in charge of the party under whom the probationer has worked, and if the report is satisfactory he is confirmed in the Department by the Surveyor General.

In my opinion, this period of training is quite insufficient to make a Provincial Officer thoroughly qualified to undertake the responsibilities in training Indian Surveyors and in supervising their work, and that greater facilities should be offered to the members of the Provincial Service who may wish to improve themselves, and I therefore respectfully suggest that:—

(*i*) A small amount be deducted every month from the salary of each Provincial Officer, and after eight or ten years the accumulated sum with the usual interest be spent on his passage to Europe or America to enable the Provincial Officer to study the methods of surveying and map-drawing of other nations, the Government of India granting each individual three or six months' study leave on full pay, and, if necessary, small advances recoverable by easy instalments. The small extra expenditure on the part of the Government of India in granting every year two or three of their servants full pay instead of half pay would be more than counterbalanced in their having a highly trained and efficient Provincial Service.

(*ii*) Provincial Officers, when young, be transferred more frequently from one party to another and also from one circle to another, so as to gain the required experience which is essential in the Survey Department.

70091. **(III) Conditions of Service.** — Every member of the Provincial Service on appointment to the Survey Department has to sign an agreement that he is willing to serve Government in any part of India or Burma, and that if he resigns before three years he has to refund the total amount drawn as salary. These conditions should be maintained.

70092. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The salaries of the members of the Provincial Service, with the exception of the probationers, who are paid while being trained, I do not consider adequate for the duties performed. The Public Service Commission of 1886-87 laid down a general principle that the Provincial Services should be paid at a reduction of one-third in the scale of pay of the Imperial Service. This principle has been departed from in the Survey Department, and also the time-scale as recently sanctioned by the Secretary of State is not so favourable as granted to other Provincial Services.

Owing to the enhanced cost of living in India, the married members of the Provincial Service in the lower grades can just exist on their salaries after taxes and subscriptions to funds have been deducted. It is true that the first 10 members of the Provincial Service are paid from Rs. 650 to Rs. 800, with Rs. 100 and Rs. 200 for allowances. But few can hope to be promoted to these grades and to draw these salaries for any length of time. I do not consider that the salaries in the higher grades sufficiently compensate a Provincial Officer for over 25 years of hard work in the Survey Department. I therefore respectfully suggest that the first 15 members of the Provincial Service be paid from Rs. 700 to 1,250.

70093. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The amount of leave granted by the Government of India to the Provincial Service I consider liberal, but I would suggest the addition of a year's study leave, for the reasons given under No. 2 system of training and probation.

70094. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The present maximum pension of Rs. 416-10-8 per mensem is, I think, liberal; but as every member of the Provincial Service cannot hope, under the present condition of pay and promotion, to reach the higher grades of the service within three years of his being superannuated, and so be eligible for the maximum pension, I consider that the salaries and the number of appointments in the higher grades should be raised, to ensure that Provincial Officers after 30 years' service may be able to retire on a pension of Rs. 416-10-8.

70095. **(VII) The working of the existing system of the Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—The formation of an Imperial Service for the administration of the Survey Department and to provide a reserve of Royal Engineers in case of war is sound policy. But, the number—viz., 55—in that service is not only out of all proportion to the requirements of the Department, but it also has an injurious effect on the other services of the Department. Previous to the Resolution of 5th April, 1910, on the recommendation of the Survey Committee of 1904-5 the number in the Imperial Service was fixed at 42. Since then, although the

number and strength of parties have been reduced, the Service has been increased by 13. The Department, at present, is over-officered and undermanned, and this unnecessary increase has been made at the cost of out-turn of work. I therefore consider that the Imperial Service should be gradually reduced to 40 and the lower subordinate service and menials be increased in number and their pay and prospects bettered from the savings thus effected.

Mr. A. Ewing called and examined.

70096. (*Chairman.*) Witness said he had seen 32 years' service. He was recruited to the old junior branch. He obtained entry to the Service by passing a qualifying examination, which was equivalent to the Indian First Arts. When he joined there was a junior and a senior division, so that when the Provincial Service was established, he found himself graded as a Provincial Officer. His duty as a Deputy Superintendent was to be in charge of a party. He did exactly the same work as that discharged by an officer in charge of a party in the Imperial Service. There were 12 parties in the Survey Department doing topographical work, and their duties did not vary a great deal in regard to difficulty and responsibility. Of those twelve parties, four were under the charge of Provincial officers, and were each, in their own way, major positions. He suggested that the number of Imperial officers should be reduced to 40, as at present there were too many Imperial officers for the requirements of the Service. At present there were about 26 higher appointments for which there were 55 Imperial officers. In his opinion there should not be more than one Imperial officer to each party. The second Imperial officer at present attached to a party did practically the work of a Provincial officer. He agreed that such an officer was being trained for the higher positions, but after three or four years no further training was required. Asked how would he provide for an adequate supply of young officers in training for the higher positions if the Imperial Service was reduced to the extent he suggested, the witness replied there would always be seven or eight men under training and this would be quite sufficient for the requirements of the Department. He was only dealing with the requirements of the Department, and not with the reserve which was required for war purposes.

70097. He thought officers should be removed from one circle to another during their early service for two or three years. He did not think this would dislocate the work. Officers arriving in a new district would probably fall into the new régime in a few months.

70098. With regard to the training of a Provincial officer, he did not think that a period of three years' training was sufficient, and he would like to see facilities for study leave in Europe. He suggested that a certain sum should be deducted every month from the salary of a Provincial officer, so that at the end of his eighth or ninth year, he could make the journey to England. By such means he would gain a varied knowledge, and probably pick up new ideas and become better qualified. He thought that after such a training, a man would be qualified to take charge of a party. He would like to see a fixed number of Provincial officers promoted to major charges. He would not favour any proposal for the abolition of the Provincial Service in the Survey Department, but would prefer to see the Service retained in its present position. In his judgment it was the only practical way of carrying on the work.

70099. With regard to salary, he recommended that the first 15 members of the Provincial Service should be on a scale rising to Rs. 1,250. His justification for that suggestion was that there was a very slight prospect of men getting to the higher grades, and there was therefore no inducement for a man to work hard. He did not think there was any difficulty in obtaining a good class of Provincial officers. Although the Survey Department was not so popular as other Departments there was no dearth of well qualified men.

70100. The system of entrance to the Provincial Service was as follows. A certain number of candidates were nominated. They then had to pass a competitive examination. There was a certain amount of selection amongst those who were nominated. A native of India who had passed high in the list obtained one of the appointments, but if there were more natives of India at the top of the list than were required to fill one-fourth of the vacancies, successful Indian candidates would be shut out. He should say that such a system would cause dissatisfaction, but he had not come across any. His recommendation that salaries should be so adjusted as to ensure that officers would get a pension of Rs. 5,000 after 30 years' service meant in effect increasing the maximum of the present time-scale from Rs. 600 to Rs. 850.

70101. With regard to his suggestion that the Service was over-officered and undermanned, he did not mean to say that topographical survey work was inefficiently performed owing to the party being undermanned; he simply meant that it was undermanned in proportion to the officers in the party. He thought there should be one Imperial officer where at present there were two.

70102. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) His proposal that the number of Imperial officers should be reduced would allow for the withdrawal of the nine Imperial officers who were attached last year to work on the North-East frontier. For temporary purposes the Provincial men could take charge of a party.

70103. (*Mr. Madge.*) The reason why there were two Imperial officers in charge of a party was that if one should be disabled, the other could take his place. Consequently, if an officer was not disabled, there was a superfluous hanger-on. Before the re-organisation took place, Provincial officers did the work which the second officer now performed. When he said there should be more subordinates, his idea was that a larger proportion of the work could be undertaken at a cheaper rate and in a shorter time. He thought a larger number of transfers of officers from one Province to another would secure greater efficiency.

70104. (*Mr. Sly.*) It was only in the class of Assistant Superintendents in the Imperial Service cadre that he would like to see a reduction. He considered that the 17 posts of Assistant Superintendent in the Imperial Service were provided partly for officers under training in order to become fitted to hold charge of a party, and partly for officers acting as Assistants to the Imperial officer in charge of a party, and he thought there were too many of such posts. He considered that seven officers under training were quite sufficient, and that no Assistant was required for the Imperial officer in charge of a party. He also recommended that the size of a party should be increased. It was not the case that the size of a party had in recent years been substantially increased. In the past there were as many as 40 to 60 in a party. There had been an actual reduction in the average size of a topographical survey party. A party was divided into three or four sections, under the control of Provincial Service officers. Therefore, if the size of each section was increased, not much extra work would be thrown on the officer in charge. The extra responsibility and hard work would fall on the Provincial man. He agreed that the Provincial officers had to be supervised by the officer in charge of the party, and this meant, to a slight extent, extra work and responsibility for the Imperial officers.

70105. Replying to a question as to whether the amalgamation carried out some years ago had not effected a very considerable improvement in the pay and prospects of the old Provincial Service officers, the witness replied that he joined the old junior division with the prospects of rising to the senior division and a salary of Rs. 1,000 or

Rs. 1,300. He would have been better off if those conditions had been maintained than he was under the present system. The maximum pay of the old Provincial Service was Rs. 1,000 with the personal allowances. He was getting Rs. 1,000 at the present time, which was the highest he could rise to.

70106. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) In the 21 parties in the Survey Department, there were 38 Imperial Officers. He thought if that number were reduced to 21 the requirements of the Service would be satisfactorily met. Prior to 1910, when the reorganisation was effected, 40 Imperial Officers performed the work of the Department, even although there were demands for military purposes from time to time in connection with frontier expeditions. Therefore, there was no reason why the number at the present time should be 55, unless there was more work to be done. He was of the opinion that the original number of 40 would suffice for present-day needs. Of the seven Provincial Officers, four were in charge of parties, and three were in charge of Drawing Offices. He thought such officers, on the whole, were doing their work satisfactorily.

70107. The salary of an Imperial Officer in the same position as he held in the Service would be Rs. 1,700 if he got to the top of his grade. His proposal, therefore, that there should be a maximum of Rs. 1,250 for the Provincial Service, was not very extravagant.

70108. (*Colonel Renny-Tailyour.*) The witness admitted that an Imperial officer in charge of a party might be drawing less than Rs. 1,000. It was also true that only a limited number of officers in the old Provincial Service could rise to Rs. 1,000. With regard to superfluous officers, witness said he could produce a list showing that a second officer was always with a party. It was true that some Provincial Officers did complain that Imperial Officers were sent out too young. He thought that an Imperial Officer should have at least three years in the Survey before he took charge of a party.

70109. (*Chairman.*) Witness said he could not specifically say to what extent the Imperial Service of the Survey Department was over-recruited, but if the Provincial Service was allowed to hold temporary charges of parties, Imperial Officers could be spared for frontier work.

(The witness withdrew.)

KHAN BAHADUR SYED AULAD HOSSEIN, Officiating Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India Department.

Written Statement relating to the Survey of India Department.

70110. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The existing rules for the recruitment of the new Provincial Service of the Survey of India as contained in enclosure No. 1 of letter No. 687—84-1, dated 19th June, 1909, from the Government of India, Department of Revenue and Agriculture, are suitable. In paragraph 4 of these rules the qualifications required for nomination for the competitive examination may be more clearly defined by inserting the words "for the Assistant Engineer Class" after the words "entrance examination" and before "of the Thomason Civil Engineering College," as there are several classes in that college for which various degrees of educational qualifications are required. It may be added that candidates who have passed at least the First Arts or Intermediate examination of an Indian University can also be admitted to the competitive examination.

The other methods of recruitment, namely (*1*) by direct appointment of candidates possessing high educational qualifications detailed in the above rules, and (*2*) by transfer of deserving officers from the Upper Subordinate Service, should be held good.

70111. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—Under the existing arrangements a Provincial Service Officer on first appointment, is attached to the Survey Training School where he is generally kept for one year, after which he is posted to a field party according to the requirements of the Service and may be kept in the same branch of the work for a number of years. I would suggest that after passing out of the Survey Training School an officer may be posted to the Topographical branch for the first two or three years and then to the Trigonometrical branch for a similar period. He should then be attached to the Headquarters Offices of the Survey of India for one or two years in order to get a thorough insight into the work carried out in the drawing and other sections of those offices, including accounts and correspondence This would complete the training of an officer, after which he may be posted to any branch permanently.

The period of probation for a Provincial Officer is at present fixed as three years. This appears to be too long. Under the old rules which were in force prior to 1909, a candidate after passing the competitive examination was generally confirmed in his appointment after one year's probation, if he proved his fitness for the Service. I would, therefore, respectfully suggest that the maximum period of probation may be reduced from three to two years; that the probationers who have given satisfactory proof of their fitness for the work of the Department in the first year of their training in the school may be confirmed without any further delay, and that only in exceptional cases a probationer may be tried for another year, after which, if he fails to prove his fitness for retention in the Service, he may be got rid of.

70112. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—The conditions of Service in the Survey of India are probably harder than those in any other Department. A Survey Officer is bound by agreement to serve in any part of India or Burma: he has to work in the field for at least six months every year, generally under most trying conditions, being exposed to the extreme rigours of the weather and often put to great personal discomforts and hardships: he has during the field season to remain away from his family and has thus to keep two establishments and incur extra expenditure in many other ways. While in the field he has generally to work at a considerable distance from his headquarters and in the course of his duties he has to mix with the local Civil, Public Works Department. Railway, and other officers. This makes it necessary for him to keep up his appearances and live up to a style befitting his position, sometimes beyond his means. His journeys are generally long and transfers are frequent. If he is a man with a family and children, the half-yearly moves from recess to field and *vice versâ* drain off a good portion of his income.

A Provincial Officer in the Survey getting less than Rs. 500 is treated as a second-class officer for the purpose of travelling allowance, which entitles him to Rs. 3 per day in the field and to double second class fare by rail. This is hardly sufficient to recoup him for all the expenditure incurred by the nature of his field work. The restriction of being allowed only second-class fare by rail is looked upon by the Provincial Survey Officers concerned as a great hardship, considering that their contemporaries in the Public Works Department, Postal, Telegraph and some other Departments drawing less than Rs. 500 are allowed to travel first-class by rail, although their journeys perhaps are not quite so long as those of the Survey Officers. This has the effect of lowering the status and the prestige of the Survey Officers in the eyes of the officers of other Departments with whom they come into contact in connection with their duties. It is highly desirable both in the interests of the officers concerned and in the interests of the Government work that all Provincial Officers of the Survey of India may in future be treated as first-

class officers for the purpose of travelling allowance.

The present designation of the "Provincial Service" of the Survey of India appears to be a misnomer, because the members of the Survey of India are not confined to any one Province but are liable to be employed in any part of the Indian Empire. Perhaps a more appropriate designation of the Service would be the "Indian Service," meaning the Service recruited in India against the "Imperial Service" recruited in England.

70113. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The conditions of salary of the Provincial Service have been considerably improved recently by the kind and generous grant of the time-scale pay to all the officers.

While thankfully acknowledging this concession the Provincial Officers feel compelled to bring to the favourable notice of the Government of India one point on which they find that they have still a ground of complaint.

They are granted triennial increments of Rs. 50, while their more fortunate contemporaries in the Public Works Department, Telegraphs and Forests, who have also been placed on time-scale pay lately, have all been granted annual increments varying from Rs. 25 to Rs. 35. The Provincial Officers of the Survey of India would, therefore, beg that the present triennial increments of Rs. 50 may be graciously converted into annual increments of, say, Rs. 20.

70114. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—A Survey Officer, owing to the urgent and pressing nature of his work, cannot ordinarily avail himself of privilege leave during the field season, which generally lasts for at least six months every year. The period during which he can have a chance of getting the leave is, therefore, restricted to less than half a year. He is, therefore, placed at a disadvantage in respect of privilege leave as compared with his contemporaries in other Departments who may be able to get the leave at any time of the year. During the recess season the Survey Officers are employed at certain selected stations which, in the majority of cases are at considerable distances from their homes, so that, ordinarily, Survey Officers cannot generally afford to take privilege leave for short periods and run up to their homes.

Under the existing rules privilege leave is not allowed to accumulate for more than three months. This tells very heavily on the Survey Officers under the peculiar circumstances explained above, for they are prevented from availing themselves of the leave more frequently, firstly, owing to the restricted time at their disposal, secondly, owing to the exigencies of the Service, and thirdly, owing to their homes being at considerable distances from their stations of employment. They would, therefore, look upon it as a great boon if Government sees its way to allowing the privilege leave to accumulate up to six months. The present restriction of six months of duty between any two periods of privilege leave may be relaxed in cases of illness or urgent necessity, the genuineness of which may be proved to the satisfaction of the authority granting the leave.

The amount of furlough on half pay may be extended from two to three years, which may be granted as follows:—

After 8 years' service 1 year's furlough.
" 16 " " 2 " "
" 24 " " 3 " "

The whole period of furlough qualifying as service for pension.

70115. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—In consideration of the exceptionally hard and arduous nature of the work that Survey Officers have to perform and the great physical trials to which their constitutions are generally exposed, they may be granted the option of retiring on pension on completing 25 years' qualifying service, without producing a medical invaliding certificate.

2. The amount of pension may be calculated on the basis of average emoluments for the last year's service instead of the last three years as at present.

3. The maximum amount of pension admissible, viz., Rs. 5,000 per annum, was fixed at a time when the purchasing value of the rupee was much greater than it is now. While the amounts of salaries in most cases have since been revised and increased the maximum amount of pension has as yet remained the same as originally fixed. It is, therefore, prayed that the maximum amount of pension admissible may be raised from Rs. 5,000 to Rs. 6,000 per annum.

4. All pensions may be exempted from income tax.

70116. **(VII) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans.**—The Provincial Service of the Survey of India, or the Junior Division as it was then called, was prior to 1886 almost exclusively recruited from among the Europeans or Eurasians. It was in 1884 that the Government of India decided to reserve 25 per cent. of the vacancies in that Service for Indians This was probably only a tentative measure, as no Indians of any high educational qualifications had till then been employed in the higher grades of the Survey, the subordinate Indian establishment having been generally recruited from classes possessing but little educational qualifications.

From 1891 Indian candidates began to enter the Provincial Service by competitive examination. With the very limited number of vacancies available for the Indians the Service did not readily become popular or even generally known to the educated classes of the Indians and thus in a measure it failed to attract the best qualified Indian candidates whose ambitions naturally carried them to other more popular Departments such as Civil, Judicial, Public Works Department, etc., in which they could eventually hope to attain far higher and more dignified positions.

The Government of India in Revenue and Agriculture Department letter No. 687—84-1, dated 19th June, 1909, has materially improved the proportion of Indians to be admitted to the Service by ordering that *at least* one appointment should be given to an Indian candidate for every three Europeans or Eurasians appointed. With the gradual increase of the number of Indian officers in the Service some of whom are now getting in the higher grades, and the better prospects recently sanctioned by Government, the Provincial Service of the Survey of India is now becoming more popular among the educated classes of the Indians, and it is believed that Indian candidates possessing high educational qualifications will always be available in sufficient numbers whenever there are vacancies in the Service to be filled up. The time has, therefore, now arrived that Indians should be allotted a much larger share in the Service in future than has been the case in former years.

70117. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The Provincial Service of the Survey of India has no direct relations with any other Service. The Survey Officers, generally during the field season, have to come into contact with the Civil and other local officers of the districts in which they have to carry out their operations and the success of their work, to some extent, depends upon the help and co-operation of the latter. The improved positions recently conferred by Government on the Provincial Survey Officers will, it is hoped, materially help them in getting better regard and respect from the District Officers in future.

KHAN BAHADUR SYED AULAD HOSSEIN called and examined.

70118. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he had been 23 years in the Service. He passed the competitive examination, coming out first, obtaining 815 marks in Mathematics out of 1,000. At present he was in sole charge of a trigonometrical party. There were seven of such parties, two of which were held by Provincial officers and five by Imperial officers. He and three other Officiating Deputy Superintendents of the Provincial Service were in charge of parties. He thought the

number of Indians in the Provincial Service should be increased, and that the proportion of one-fourth was too small. He suggested the proportion should be one-half, but open competition would be even better.

70119. He regarded the title of "Provincial Service" as inappropriate, and suggested the title of "Indian Service," *i.e.*, the Service recruited in India against the "Imperial Service" recruited in England. He favoured the re-introduction of the old system when Survey Service was divided into "Senior and Junior Services," because in previous days many junior service officers were eligible for promotion to the senior division by selection, and every year the number of junior service officers in the senior service ranged from 13 to 15, the pay being between Rs. 1,000 and Rs. 1,600. At present the pay of the Provincial Officer was limited to Rs. 1,000, including charge allowances. Under the old system there were no charge allowances.

70120. With regard to training and probation, he was satisfied that it would ordinarily be possible to find out definitely in two years whether a Provincial Service recruit was fit for confirmation. If his scheme were carried into effect, and the Service was divided into senior and junior, as before he thought a First Arts or L.C.E. examination would be a necessary qualification for an officer recruited in future before being promoted from the junior into the senior service. He would not make the test for entry to the Service higher than it was at present. He thought the present competitive examination was sufficient.

70121. He did not think it necessary for a junior officer before being promoted to the senior rank to go to Europe for any further training. He thought a man could learn all that was necessary to qualify him for the higher charge and responsibility in India.

70122. With regard to the present scale of salary, he would like to see annual increments of Rs. 20 as in the Forest, Telegraph and Public Works Departments, instead of triennial increments of Rs. 50.

70123. He thought if the present period of furlough was extended to three years, Provincial Officers would take advantage of the concession.

70124. He suggested raising the maximum pension to Rs. 6,000 a year. Such a proposal would benefit officers in the Provincial Service. The present pension was Rs. 5,000 a year, and it ought to be raised to Rs. 6,000 a year.

70125. He would like to see a single cadre in which Civilian Officers when on the same standing as military officers would be paid at rates equal to three-quarters of those payable to military officers. He did not consider that a Royal Engineer officer, with his superior training, was qualified for an unreasonable higher rate of salary. He would prefer to see all placed on the same basis except that the pay be in proportion as stated above. The professional qualification was the same for the Imperial and the Provincial Service. There might be only this difference that the Imperial Officers were superior in educational qualifications, but the Departmental qualifications were the same. The former was of some advantage in Scientific Departments. He thought the experience gained in the Service was as valuable as the high training of an officer prior to entering the Service.

70126. There was a widespread desire on the part of Anglo-Indians for service in the Survey Department. There were about three or four vacancies every year, for which from 18 up to 60 Anglo-Indians and Indians presented themselves. The number of Indians was generally greater than the number of Anglo-Indians.

70127. He considered the Imperial branch of the Service was over-recruited. Prior to 1904 the number of Imperial Officers was 38 and the number of Provincial Officers 142. The Survey Committee of 1904-05, composed entirely of Imperial Officers and in which the interests of the Provincial Officers were not represented, recommended that the number of Imperial Officers should be increased, and the number of Provincial Officers decreased. They fixed the number of the former officers at 55, and the number of the latter at 87. The Departmental Committee of 1910 presided over by Colonel Burrard, and composed of both Imperial and Provincial Officers, decided that the members of the Survey Committee were wrong in saying that Provincial Officers were unfit to hold charge of parties, and that each party ought to have two Imperial Officers; and they established the fact that Provincial Officers were as capable of holding charge of parties as Imperial Officers.

70128. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) Officers of the Provincial Service holding executive charges, were doing their work quite as well as the Imperial Service Officers. Many Provincial Officers had done splendid work on the frontiers with military expeditions, and also on geographical explorations. All the actual Survey work of such expeditions was done by Provincial Officers under the nominal supervision of Imperial Officers. Their work had been recognised by Government, and if asked to do so, he could put in a statement giving names and references. He himself, before having charge of a party, taught Imperial, Provincial and Upper Subordinate Officers, astronomical observations and computations and he had prepared a book on astronomical computations, which had been examined and appreciated by Colonel Burrard. It would not be true to say that it was difficult to obtain Indians with suitable physique and capable of sanding the rough life of a Survey Officer. He thought a sufficient number of Indians would be forthcoming, especially as the new Provincial Service Regulations had improved prospects. Indians could manage parties and detachments as well as Imperial officers. There was no difference between Indians and Anglo-Indians in that respect. It was possible to make arrangements at Dehra Dun to give the higher education which Imperial Officers started with. If that were done it would be possible to recruit Indians direct into the Imperial branch.

70129. (*Mr. Sly.*) Provincial Service Officers had been placed in charge of trigonometrical parties as well as in charge of topographical parties.

70130. The majority of Provincial Service Survey Officers did not subscribe to the Provident Fund. He could not say what the reason was.

70131. (*Mr. Madge.*) His proposals with regard to increased rates of travelling allowance applied only to Provincial Officers drawing pay from Rs. 250 to Rs. 800. He thought if the prospects were improved the Provincial Service would attract a better class of officers.

70132. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He admitted that the Survey Service was not large enough to justify Government in undertaking the expense which would be entailed by the creation of an educational establishment in India on the same lines as those in England. The desired training could be easily provided at any of the existing Colleges at Sibpur, Rurki, etc.

70133. (*Colonel Renny-Tailyour.*) With reference to his statement that Colonel Burrard's Committee had laid it down that Provincial Officers were as fitted to take charge of parties as Imperial Officers, witness admitted that he had not seen the Report of the Committee. His ground for making such an assertion was that the Committee would not have been in favour of amalgamating both services if they had thought otherwise, and there was also the fact that seven major charges had been given to the Provincial Service which was considered unfit by the Survey Committee of 1904-05 and which did not enjoy this privilege for a few years before. He did not admit that Colonel Burrard's Committee of 1910 thought the old Service had a grievance, and that it was in order to redress this grievance that it gave them to a certain extent some of the terms of the new Service.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Calcutta, Thursday, 22nd January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.
R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

H. W. BIGGIE, Esq., Officiating Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India Department.

Written Statement relating to the Survey of India Department.*

70134. *Preface.*—The views I desire respectfully to place before the Public Service Commission represent not only my own personal convictions but those of the Anglo-Indian Association by which I have been unanimously elected as its representative spokesman. It remains for the Commission ultimately to estimate the true value of the suggestions I make. I would, however, beg that tribunal to believe that these have been reached only after anxious thought, are widely and strongly held, and are submitted with the knowledge that the principles they enforce are of far-reaching consequence to a large and loyal body of men whose past services, present position, and future prospects are not merely a matter of private but of Imperial concern. I and those behind me feel that the very existence of the Provincial Department of the Survey of India is at stake. That great executive and administrative branch of the Government of this country has since its inception in 1763 afforded an honourable avenue of livelihood, and preferment to the Domiciled Community. Its records attest the capacity and competency of that Community to deal effectively with the serious trust committed to its care. To-day it is painfully obvious that those in charge of the destinies of this country are bent on depriving it of one of its important sources of employment and sustenance. I venture respectfully to submit that such an encroachment and limitation upon the wage-earning resources of the Domiciled Community would constitute not merely a grave injustice to a body of men capable, from every point of view, of faithful and efficient work, but would amount to a reversal of the policy of Statesmen who have striven to foster and stimulate local loyalty, and to increase and broaden the avenues of remunerative employment. It assuredly would be regarded as a serious infringement of the principles of the Queen's Charter of 1858 which promised an equal treatment of all men alike irrespective of colour, caste or creed. I do not presume to dictate any line of policy. But I do venture, very humbly, yet very earnestly, to suggest that any proposal to disfranchise a portion of the King's subjects or to extinguish any line of economic advance justifies a strong and united, if temperately voiced, remonstrance from the prospective sufferers. The discontinuance of the Opium Department is a loss which falls heavily on the shoulders of the Anglo-Indian. That was, however an inevitable outcome of the policy which on large moral grounds forbade the cultivation of the poppy. No similar reason exists for the threatened absorption of yet another great branch of a local and thriving organisation.

1. The Commission is already so familiar in the Memoranda of various officers with the details of our grievances under the specified nine heads that I shrink from wearying them with further minutiæ. I am content to accept and endorse in the main the views put forth by Mr. Greiff and Mr. Petters and Mr. Byrne. I would prefer to confine myself to questions of principle, and to the emphasising of a few of the minor but important heads.

2. The revised constitution of 1895 was the first blow administered to the men recruited in India. The last and final blow is the suggestion that the Survey Department is to be militarised, and henceforth to be closed to the legitimate ambitions of the Domiciled Community. Previous to 1895 the Survey was divided into a "Senior" and a "Junior" Service. Promotion was open to all alike, merit being the test. When effect came to be given in 1895 to the recommendations of the Public Service Commission of 1886, we saw retrogression substituted for advance. The reorganisation into an "Imperial" and a "Provincial" Service shut the door on preferment, unnecessarily accentuated the social differences between the two, placed an unmerited slur upon the ability and trustworthiness of the local recruits and, drawing, continued an invidious distinction between men who in the main rendered similar services under similar conditions but on different scales of pay, and in differing social and official environments. Enquiry into Survey grievances has not always been a matter of unmixed comfort. We have seen the larger field anterior to 1886 contracted into dimensions which squeezed our countrymen out of promotion, and we are threatened to-day with a further reorganisation which will "improve" us altogether out of existence.

3. In our view the difference between the Imperial and Provincial Services should be abolished. Both Services are superior Services. Differentiation between the two is impossible without room for offensive if unearned comparisons. The work which a Provincial Officer does is no more Provincial than is the work of an Imperial Officer, nor is it less Imperial than the work of his higher-classed colleague. Their duties summon both alike into endless varieties of climate, locality and difficulty. The Survey Committee of 1904-05 [Report, Part I. page 58, para. 101] recognised and enforced this.

4. There should be but one list on which all officers should be placed. Conceding the necessity for making provision for a certain proportion of the Military element and for the reservation of a few of the higher posts to a particular class, we contest the position that there is no room for the further employment of Civil officers. We deny altogether that we are less fit morally, intellectually or socially than the non-commissioned officers with whom it is proposed to replace us, and we appeal to the Roll Call of our Service since its formation to testify to the zeal, efficiency and integrity with which our kith and kin have met and discharged their duties. We are as capable of enforcing and of rendering obedience as are Military Officers, and we are not prepared to admit that the work of the Survey Department would, from any standpoint, be improved by the introduction of a military precision of dress and manner to which we are foreigners. If at times during a survey military exigencies necessitate a closer touch with delicate situations, a greater caution and a severer reticence, we submit we are as quick to attornment on a point of honour or to loyalty to a trust as is the most upright soldier who ever donned the King's uniform. We have proved our capacity and we feel that to immolate us for such reasons would be to insult us in that on which we rightly profess ourselves to be tender.

5. A scrutiny into the result of the various reorganisations of my Department is not conducive to much self-congratulation. The effect of the changes of 1895 was to alter our status from one of equality to one of subordination. It further

* This statement embodies also the opinion of the Anglo-Indian Association, Calcutta, which was represented by Mr. **Biggie.**

deprived us of a long existing and long exerted right to promotion by barring us from entering into the Imperial Service, the substitute of the old Senior Division. This was the less defensible that the Senior Division, consisting of 50 officers, at that time contained no fewer than 13, or about one-fourth, who had risen from the Junior Division. Again, previous to 1895, 13 out of the 50 appointments in the Senior Division were held by officers promoted from the Junior Division. In 1895 ten of these appointments were transferred from the Senior to the Junior Division to form the Provincial Service. These ten appointments represented in salary a monthly total of Rs. 7,850. But in the progress of the transfer a curious mutilation took place. When the appointments reached the Provincial Service the Rs. 7,850 had been attenuated to Rs. 5,700, a loss roughly of over 25 per cent. (Report of Survey Committee, 1904-05, Part I, p. 23.) The nett result, therefore, of the 1895 reorganisation was to inflict a three-fold injury. The Provincial Service was barred from its former promotion; its so-called compensation for the loss got whittled away in the course of its transfer; and the bar created a loss in status and prestige from which it has never recovered.

6. In 1904-05 a Committee assembled to enquire into the working of the Indian Survey Department. Its members consisted of the Hon. Mr. Miller, I.C.S., Col. Sir John Farquharson, R.E., an expert on English Survey questions, Col. Longe, R.E., Surveyor General of India, and Colonel Kelly. Of these the Chairman and Colonel Kelly possessed no Survey qualifications, Col. Farquharson possessed no knowledge of India, and to Col. Longe, R.E., the Provincial Service was not quite an idol. Once more a re-organisation took place in 1909-10. This time a New Provincial Service was created consisting of ten superior appointments ranging from Rs. 600 to Rs. 1,000, and 77 others, ranging from Rs. 250 to Rs. 600. Only men who had joined the Provincial Service after 1905 were eligible by nomination of the Surveyor-General to the new Provincial Service. All the other members of the Provincial Service were barred. The Surveyor-General nominated nine officers to the lowest grade from the Old Provincial Service to form the New Provincial Service. This latest creation lasted, under protest, two and a half years, when it was amalgamated on the 1st March, 1912, after a storm of discontent which called into being a Departmental Committee in 1910, with the old Provincial Service.

7. The New Provincial Service started life as I have shown with ten Superior appointments which were never filled ranging from Rs. 650 to Rs. 1,000 and 77 others ranging from Rs. 250 to Rs. 600. When it died on the amalgamation the maximum pay of the ten superior appointments was reduced from Rs. 1,000 to Rs. 800, while the emoluments of certain posts, including the two highest, were reduced so as to inflict a nett loss of Rs. 800 a month to the old Provincial Service.

8. On the amalgamation in 1912 a Time Scale was introduced for the first time for the Provincial Service. But the Imperial Service had had the benefit of this scale in 1910. The method of application of the Time Scale to the Provincial Service was remarkable. While officers drawing less than Rs. 300 a month were rightly placed upon a true Time Scale as from the date of their entrance into the Department, all officers drawing from Rs. 300 to Rs. 500 were wrongly placed upon an arbitrary Time Scale as from the date of the amalgamation, the 1st March, 1912. Officers drawing over Rs. 500 got nothing. No reason was vouchsafed for this difference in treatment. It cannot be supported on principle. Its effect has been to place in some instances officers of equal service on unequal pay, in others officers of unequal service on equal pay, and in very many cases to deprive officers of that augmentation in pay which they would have secured had the principle of the true Time Scale been throughout enforced.

9. The contrast in treatment of the Imperial Service intensifies the grievance. We do not grudge them their prizes. We deplore merely our own loss. These officers were granted a Time Scale which dated not from the date of their entrance into the Department but from the date of their first commissions in the Army. I take an illustration. A Royal Engineer Officer draws Rs. 370 from the date of his Commission. Five years after he joins the Survey of India. He starts on Rs. 370 plus Rs. 250, that is Rs. 620. Under the old scheme prior to 1910 he would have started on Rs. 500. Under the 1910 Scheme he starts with Rs. 70 a month more. This Rs. 70 is unearned increment. After 19 years' service the same officer ordinarily draws Rs. 1,500 plus Rs. 200 charge allowance or Rs. 1,700 in all. The Provincial Officer draws after 20 years' service Rs. 550. The increase under their reorganisation scheme for the Imperial Officers amounts on an average to an increase of over 30 per cent. On the other hand, the increase under the reorganisation scheme for the Provincial Officers amounts on an average to an increase of little less than 12 per cent. No reasons have ever been given by the Government of which we are aware for these liberal, if invidious, increases granted to one branch of the Department. Whatever circumstances justified these measures would apply with equal force to the Provincial branch of the Service. I do not think I am unduly pressing the point if I submit that the Government is morally bound to give the Provincial Officer a Time Scale of pay with retrospective effect either from the date that that scale was sanctioned for Imperial Officers or from the date when the new Provincial Service was constituted, the 1st August, 1909. As things stand, some of he officers (in number nine), who joined the Provincial Service in 1905 and after, date the benefit of their Time Scale as from 1909, while others who joined at the same time date their benefit as from 1912, or three years later. I submit this difference in treatment is unjustifiable.

10. Once more, in other Government Departments, for instance the Forests, the Provincial Officer draws two-thirds of the pay of the Imperial recruit in the higher grades. In the Survey of India, however, the Provincial Officer draws on an average in the higher appointments only a third of the pay of his Imperial colleague. The average of all the appointments in both Services contrasted shows that the Provincial only draws a fourth of the pay of the Imperial recruit.

11. In some measure the anomalies referred to can be fairly traced to the fact that the views and grievances of the Provincial Department were very imperfectly voiced, if at all, either at the Public Service Commission of 1886 or on the Survey Committee of 1904. At the latter enquiry Sir John Farquharson made this contribution to the value to be attached to the pronouncement of his committee on the Provincial question: "Being still ignorant as to what functions they (the Provincial Officers) are supposed to discharge, what their qualifications are, and how they perform their duties, I must for the present pass by this branch of the subject." This admission of the ignorance of all members of the Committee who were not members of the Survey of India (of whom there was only one representative, Col. Longe) is generous and complete. By its light the following comment in the Report of the Committee, signed by all the members including Sir John Farquharson, does not appear to possess much intrinsic worth. Yet it probably carried great weight with the Government, and no one can now tell what part it played in the final overthrow of the unfortunate Department against the members of which it was aimed without evidence: "The accounts we have received of the general capacity of members of the Provincial Service to undertake independent and responsible charges are not satisfactory, but it does not appear that there has been much opportunity of trying them in such posts since the Service was reconstituted, and under existing arrangements such officers, by the time they reach the higher grades of the Service, are well advanced in years, and cannot be expected in all cases to retain the energy required for the efficient direction of topographical operations."

12. This we submit is criticism based on no foundation, and therefore, without justification. That portion of it which purports to be apologetic of the alleged shortcomings of Provincial Officers stands clearly self-condemned. If officers have not been afforded occasion for the display of stated qualities the blame lies with the system not with the officers. The system should be amended, not the officers erased. One point stands out clear and distinct. Not one single instance of proved incapacity among Provincial Officers has been cited. On the contrary, in a note of dissent in the Report of the Survey Committee, the Chairman, the Hon. Mr. Miller, wrote thus: "The intention of that measure (the transfer of 10 appointments to the Provincial Service) was that the superior posts should be held by Provincial Officers and until it is conclusively shown by actual experience that the latter are unequal to the responsibilities of such posts, I cannot recommend any change of policy." We are thankful for the fairness of that view, which is the just view. On the other hand, I would beg leave to mention as instances, among many others, of proved fitness for high office among the Provincial Officers the names of Mr. T. Shaw, late Superintendent, Provincial Surveys. Assam, a post now held by an Imperial Officer, Mr. R. B. Smart, who, after retirement, has been specially placed in charge of the Calcutta Town Survey, having held charge of a Revenue Survey party prior to retirement: Mr. A. W. Smart, who, prior to pension, also held charge of a Revenue party; Mr. T. E. M. Claudius, who distinguished himself on the Frontier, and was rewarded with the charge of a topographical party, who received a medal and clasp for the siege of Shepur, who crossed the Frontier in disguise and mapped the whole of the Tirah and Afridi countries, and who ran several important series of triangulation in Baluchistan and the trans-Indus country; Mr. H. Todd, who held similar charge and whose work was specially commended by the Board of Revenue, Madras; Mr. G P. Tate, who did service in Afghanistan, Baluchistan, on the frontiers of Persia, and was placed under Sir Robert Sandeman in Political and Administrative charge of the Kej and Tanjgar Districts, in Kalat, on the borders of Afghanistan; who held independent charge of the Aden Surveys, conducted a reconnaissance in the Aden Hinterland and was given independent charge of the Riverain Survey in Sind, who in 1895 was appointed to the independent charge of the Surveys in connection with the Baluch-Afghan Boundary Commission where he replaced an officer of the Royal Engineers, who in 1899 served with the Mission to the Persian Frontier and carried the secondary triangulation up to the Kuh-i-Malik Shah and into Sistan, of whom the Agent to the Governor-General in Baluchistan thus addressed the Foreign Depart- in 1899: "His duties were to hold charge of the country (Kej and Tanjgar) on behalf of the Kalat State, to administer the Revenues as well as generally to carry on those political duties which were connected with that administration," of whom Sir Robert Sandeman wrote in 1892: "The Government of India will I venture to hope agree with me that Mr. Tate's services have been of an exceptional character both professionally and politically. Should the opportunity present itself I shall be glad if some special mark of approval can be accorded to him," who in 1902 took charge as Chief Survey Officer to the Sistan Boundary Commission, and who for two years was daily associated with Sir A. H. McMahon, the Commissioner. Of officers still in active employ I would cite the names of Mr. H. G. Shaw, J. O. Grieff, Awlad Hossein Khan Bahadur, who are all at present in charge of survey parties. The posts of Chief Draftsman and Head Draftsman of the Calcutta Drawing Office, and three posts of officers in charge of Circle Drawing Offices and the charge of the Cantonment Surveys are all committed to Provincial Officers. Mr. W. Newland is now in charge of the Bombay Town Survey. Of officers promoted from the junior to the senior division prior to the reorganisation of 1895, I would mention illustratively, Mr. G. B. Scott, on whom Government this year have bestowed a C.I.E. for distinguished services rendered during the Black Mountain Expedition (for which he received a medal and clasp) and for purely Civil employment; who holds a war record unsurpassed by that of any Military Officer in the Department, and who, among other distinctions elsewhere, won a sword "for gallantry" in repulsing a night attack by the Allahiwal; who was mentioned in despatches for conspicuous gallantry in the Michni country and who was the first European to ascend the Safed-Ko; who for his services in that expedition received a medal and clasp; who was recommended by the Viceroy and Commander-in-Chief for a direct Captaincy in the Staff Corps, which was never bestowed, and who thrice received the thanks of Government; Mr J. B. Henessey, M.A., F.R.S., who held the post of Superintendent, Trigonometrical Survey; Mr. J. O. N. James, who was Assistant Surveyor-General when he retired; Mr. J. C. Clancy, F.R.G.S., who closed his career as Assistant Director, Land Records, Burma; Mr. McCarthy, F.R.G.S., at one time Director of Imperial Surveys, Siam. The list is by no means exhaustive. But I trust I have advanced sufficient evidence, beyond the reach of cavil or criticism, to justify the claim that the Provincial Service contains splendid material upon which England can draw with confidence for men on whom to rely in their ordinary avocations, and on whom she can count in moments of exceptional stress and trial.

13. If the list be not longer of those who have passed with credit and emerged with distinction from tests sufficiently severe to place a strain upon the strongest constitutions among the Imperial Officers, the explanation lies in the admission of the Survey Committee that the opportunities afforded the Provincial Officers have been few and far between. We feel confident that our Service is equal to every emergency and has vindicated itself by living example against the cruel and unmerited reproach that its members are unequal to the tasks of facing danger, of guarding a trust or of assuming responsibility. With such a record behind it, with such modern contributions to its present vitality and with the assured promise, based upon proved performance, that its future will not be less brilliant than its past, I may be permitted to protest with all earnest strength and sincerity against the proposal that the Provincial Service should cease to exist.

14. All recommendations for change in the Survey Department have hitherto proceeded upon the ostensible basis of economy. If this were correct, it is difficult to see why the salaries of the Imperial Officers of the Survey have been increased to a point in excess of the salaries drawn by similar officers in the Public Works and Military Works Departments for which their past training particularly fits them. Let me illustrate. In the Military Works Department a Captain over 15 years' service receives Rs. 783 a month; in the Public Works Department an Executive Engineer in the 15th year of his service receives Rs. 1,000 a month; in the Survey of India an Imperial Officer in the 15th year of his service receives in all Rs. 1,450 a month. A Provincial Officer of the Survey of India draws in his 16th year only Rs. 450. No greater intellectual fitness is needed in the Imperial branch of the Survey Department than in the Departments quoted for their contrast. Yet the pay is enhanced without any equivalent consideration. I abstain from all imputation of motives. But it is very difficult to resist the inference that the Imperial Survey Officer has, for some unknown reason, become the special object of official protection and advancement not merely at the cost of his brother officer in the Provincial branch, but out of all proportion to the salaries of officers doing not less strenuous work in other departments of the administration.

15. While we may be forgiven for objecting to a system of economy enforced at our pecuniary expense, we would also pray forgiveness for hinting that if our Imperial brethren were to be paid at the same rate as their colleagues in other

branches of the administration there would be freed for distribution among the Provincial Officers a large sum of money available for a very appreciable betterment of their condition. There is no satisfactory defence to be found for the system of charge allowances to officers drawing Rs. 1,000 and over per month. No such allowance is granted in any other Department. The salaries there bestowed are held adequate to the services rendered. They should so be held in the Survey Department. The Public Service Commission of 1886 held out the promise that all Provincial Services should be treated alike as regards "conditions and prospects" which has always been read as a promise to equalise in all Provincial Services the furlough, pay, pension and status of their respective officers. (Report of Survey Committee, Part I., paragraph 101, p. 59: Part I, paragraph 40, p. 22.) The promise has not been kept. The starting pay in the Provincial Telegraph Department is Rs. 250 per mensem; in the Provincial Public Works Department it is the same; in the Provincial Forests Department it is Rs. 270 per mensem; in the Provincial Survey Department it is Rs. 100 per mensem. Let me contrast a later stage. In the 20th year of his service in the Provincial Telegraph Department an officer draws Rs. 850 per mensem; in the Public Works Department he draws the same; in the Forests Rs. 700 per mensem; in the Survey Rs. 500 per mensem. The Survey Committee of 1904-5 commented on this inadequacy of the starting pay of our Service. Yet nothing has been done to abolish or mitigate the anomaly.

16. In other Provincial Departments all officers receive travelling allowance at first class rates. The routes these officers traverse are mainly confined to beaten tracks such as roads, rivers and railways. Our officers are called upon frequently to traverse unbeaten tracks where the nature of the country forbids the possibility of easy or speedy travel. Other Provincial Officers are provided with rest-houses, crockery and furniture. We are not. We are compelled to carry our own and at our own expense. Yet our officers receive only second class rates until they attain a salary of Rs. 500 a month. Under Article 1002 of the Civil Service Regulations first-class rates of Travelling Allowance are admissible to all officers in a grade the maximum pay of which is not less than Rs. 500. Under our old system we were graded, and those grades the maximum pay of which did not reach Rs. 500 were classed as second class for the purposes of travelling allowance. Under the reorganisation of 1909 the intermediate grades between Rs. 250 and Rs. 600 were abolished. Hence the entire grade of Extra Assistant Superintendent as now constituted would be entitled to travelling allowance on first class rates. But the Government interfered and passed a special order (No. 539, dated 18th January, 1910) whereby they disrated all Provincial Survey Officers drawing less than Rs. 500 a month from first class travelling allowance. Not only is the position of the Provincial Officer worse now than before the first reorganisation as to promotion and status, but he is deprived of pecuniary advantages, to which after reorganisation he would have been entitled, by a special and adverse interposition of a Government professedly anxious to better his position. Once more. In the Subordinate Service of other Departments if an officer of admittedly subordinate rank holds honorary rank in the Provincial Service of his Department, irrespective of the quantum of his salary, he at once draws first class travelling allowance (Appendix 18 Civil Service Regulations). In our Service, although it is not a Subordinate Service, no officer can draw such rates unless his salary amounts to at least Rs. 500 a month. Against all these invidious and, as we submit, indefensible distinctions I beg respectfully to protest.

17. Allied with the difference in treatment as to travelling allowance is the question of the social discourtesies to which many of us who draw only second-class rates are subjected. I regret the reference, but the discourtesy exists as a fact and is often intolerable. It can to an appreciable extent be rectified or at least assuaged by an equality of treatment of the members of all the Services. It is bad enough to be deprived of a privilege to which we are entitled. It is bad enough to see other Services enjoy a privilege out of which our exclusion was legislated by a special order of the Government. But this becomes worse when in addition to a deprivation which we submit is unjustifiable we are laid open, through no fault of our own, to social indignities which always touch and sometimes trespass over the borderland of impertinences. The Departmental Committee of 1910 collected many complaints upon this unhappy and unpleasant condition of affairs. Lastly our travelling allowance at second class rates does not nearly cover our actual expenses, and though we do not desire to make a profit out of such allowances we protest against that which amounts to a compulsory loss.

18. I would shortly summarise my grounds of complaint so far. Successive reorganisations have left the Provincial Service wounded and weakened at each stage. The old system of unrestricted ambitions and advances has given place to a system of bars-sinister blocking promotion to the higher appointments in spite of proved merit entitled as of right, not favour, to unqualified preferment. Our pay has upon the average been reduced, our number diminished though the Survey Committee called for an increase, our status financially and socially wrecked. Distinctions unrecognised in sister services are enforced with us for no reason assigned or assignable. Travelling rates are forbidden to us which are favoured elsewhere. If one of our officers serving on Rs. 450 a month be sent on a campaign, he ranks as an Assistant Commissary. His brother in the Postal Department drawing Rs. 250 a month as Superintendent sent on the same campaign ranks as a Major or Captain. A distinguished officer of our Provincial Service ranking therein as Extra Assistant Superintendent on Rs. 500 is detailed for the Sistan Boundary Commission and is ranked as a second lieutenant of two years standing. An officer of the Public Works Department detailed on the same journey and of about the same length of service, ranks as Colonel. The Survey Officer mapped out the boundaries, the Public Works Officer built the pillars. Colonel Longe refused the former a recommendation by Sir Henry McMahon which would have removed the glaring inequality of treatment, and the Public Works Officer received the C.I.E. while the Survey Officer got nothing, not even justice. Labouring long but loyally under grievous disadvantages pecuniary, social and sentimental, the Provincial Survey Officer has never failed to discharge his duty with jealous and competent devotion. His reward is to be found in the hostility of those who to-day threaten his existence with the suggestion that he should make way for a system of Military despotism tempered by inflated cost. He is naturally both indignant and alarmed.

19. There is but one remedy for all this. Remembering always our great debt of gratitude to our present Surveyor-General, an exceptional scientist of exceptional humanity, endowed with rare capacity for sympathy and gift for understanding, it lies in demilitarising the existing service, in placing its chief control in the hands of a civilian, in reverting to the old order of unlimited promotion, in abolishing the opprobrious misnomers of "Extra" and "Provincial," in restoring to our Provincial Service social and pecuniary privileges existing in sister branches, in obliterating the charge allowance for all officers drawing Rs. 1,000 a month and over, and in guaranteeing to us under such a reorganisation the resurrection of that harmony in work and cordiality in intercourse, once extant, long buried and forgotten, which will alone give us back our former pride of self and raise our service in the estimation of its officers and in its treatment by authority to a service *primus inter pares* with the other great auxiliary Departments of Indian administration and control.

We have never faltered in our fidelity to our responsibilities. We have always been and still are—shorn, battered, defaced though it be—proud of the work that our Service has done, is doing,

and still has to do. We merely claim the removal of those impediments which unfairly handicap us in our struggle for life and in that struggle place us undeservedly below sister organisations not more important, more devoted, or more effective than our own. To us it is no valid objection that ours is an "unremunerative" Service. The answer is that ours is the parent and the pilot Service. The Public Works could not build their roads nor the railways their bridges, the Forests could not work their reserves, the post and telegraphs could not lay their lines or erect their stations without our maps. The revenue earned for the Government by its various Departments is earned because of the facilities which our Service supplies. The great spending department, the Army, leans upon us for their maps. We make special charts when a Viceroy moves, we prepare them when a new capital is summoned into existence from the ashes of a dead centre. The Executive Officers of the Covenanted Civil Service depend upon our sheets to enable them to assess the ryot and administer the country. As the Evidence Act is the essential handmaid to all branches of Substantive Law, so are we the necessary handmaid to all Departments of Government in this country. We, however, take higher ground. Remunerative or not, ours is a system necessary to the effective control and development of England's possessions. So long as it exists, so long should it be officered by men who, as servants of the King, have the right to claim equality of treatment alike upon large and broad considerations of policy as under statutory declarations embodied in a solemn and well-loved charter. Into that view no question of earnings can, or ought to be allowed to enter.

20. We agree that economy should be strictly enforced in the creation and continuance of our Department. That is a maxim of general applicability, not limited to one branch of any one service. We deny that economy is enforced either wisely or fairly in our Service. The Imperial staff, as at present constituted, is far in excess of the requirements of the work, it has to perform. Its reduction to 20 officers would meet its necessities and set free a large sum of money available either wholly or in part for the betterment of the work in the Department, and of the prospects of its other officers. If at times 20 were found insufficient for Military needs, Colonel Farquharson's suggestion would meet the situation, namely, that Military Officers should be detailed for a tour of duty in the survey of India on their Military pay plus a survey allowance of Rs. 200 a month, the Military and Survey Departments halving the cost. The scheme is equitable. For the first three years the work of these officers would not perceptibly advance the outturn of the Survey Department, whereas much time would necessarily be devoted to their training by the survey, which time would be substracted from survey needs. On reverting to their own Military duties these officers would, thanks to their survey training, be all the more useful and accomplished adjuncts to the King's Army. Such was Colonel Farquharson's opinion.

The Imperial Officer at a higher salary is technically trained at his start by his provincial colleague on a lower scale of salary. There is no reason why the cheaper tutor should not replace his more expense pupil.

What economy is visible in the appointment of an Imperial Officer on Rs. 1,700 a month to take charge of one party when a junior officer of the same branch takes charge of another and a similar party, performing similar functions, on a salary of Rs. 800?

What justification can be pleaded for the extravagance of the charge allowance in the higher ranks?

The Upper Subordinate Service is expensive and useless. It consists neither of subordinates nor of officers. During its existence of four years it has done nothing which distinguishes its work from that of the purely subordinate service. Its abolition would achieve a considerable saving.

The contemplated importation of non-commissioned officers from Southampton is justified by nothing in past history. Of the two examples formerly brought to India both were imported as expert draftsmen and the work of both was proved to be inferior to that executed by men trained locally on far smaller salaries. There is nothing that such officers can do which cannot be done—certainly as well, probably better—by indigenous officers. We insist with out expert knowledge that they can contribute nothing in the shape of skilled labour equal to the work of our Surveyors whether in the field or in recess.

Our Provincial Service is admittedly understaffed [Report Survey Committee, 1904-5, Part I, page 5]. Its necessary and legitimate expansion could be ensured without additional cost from the economies adumbrated here.

21. Against the introduction and extension of the Indian community in our Department we raise no objection. On the contrary we would cordially open our doors to their inclusion provided their initial selection were made from the right materials of which our experience teaches us there is a plentiful, if scattered and somewhat recondite, supply in India.

22. The preparation of this memorandum has been accompanied by many difficulties which I fear may rob it of much of the value it might have claimed had it been the outcome of considerations culled from a meeting of the members of our Service. We have had no opportunity for union and debate. Ours are disjointed suggestions prepared by men who have been compelled to commit their thoughts to paper while they themselves have been occupied in the field dissevered, unorganised, alone. The Postal Department enjoyed the advantage of careful debate presided over by officers specially deputed to watch, to help and to check. We have had no such advantages. And it is in a spirit of apology therefore for imperfections not altogether attributable to my own shortcomings that I submit this paper for the consideration of the Commissioners.

23. I hold no brief for any class. Our Provincial Service has always been open, and I maintain rightly open, both to the Englishman and the Anglo-Indian as contradistinguished from the Englishman, theoretically at least without fear or favour. That is as it should be. Lord Ripon, in 1884, opened the door still wider to the Indian. Of that catholicity of recruitment we approve. But while I write for no class, I ask leave to say a word in especial favour of the Anglo-Indian born and bred in this country. Many of this category have elisted in our Department, many have won distinction and many have rendered services as faithful and effective as the officers of any other category. Without any wish or intention to be considered or to be invidious I would refer to the following names of purely Anglo-Indian officers who have proved beyond contest the fitness of their class for positions of hard physical work and for positions also demanding tact and efficient control of subordinates. I refer to Mr. J. O. N. James, already referred to in paragraph 12, to Mr. A. DeSouza, who rendered valuable service in Burma as Deputy Superintendent, to Mr. C. Wood, who achieved similar distinction also in Burma. These officers rose from the old "Junior" to the old "Senior" Division. After the re-organisation of 1886, I would allude to Mr. T. E. M. Claudius, already referred to paragraph 12, and to Mr. W. Stotesbury, who received the Chin-Lushai medal and clasp and who was in charge of Settlement Surveys in Africa. These two officers retired as Extra Deputy Superintendents of the Provincial Service. In existing times there are, among many others, Mr. M. Gastaud and Mr. P. J. Barrington, now holding office as Deputy Superintendents in the Provincial Service. The exclusion of such officers from the higher rungs of the professional ladder can not be based upon any objection less unworthy than the accidental bar of their local birth and breeding. I challenge any critic to advance and prove from practice and experience one single disqualifying element which in the view of a righteous and unprejudiced tribunal would or

ought to debar them from legitimate preferment. It was, I think, Sir Bamfylde Fuller, who in a public speech said that the Provincial Services were the backbone of the Indian Administration. The paucity of such generous recognition cannot alter facts. And the fact is that the approbation was deserved and is still true. While of late years successive waves of political advance have lifted the Indians to a position of which their own organisations had no conception and of which they did not dream a short decade ago, the Anglo-Indian, manfully striving to improve his social and economic status, finds himself combating currents of antagonism and bias which retard his progress and now threaten to deprive him of a source of employment in which he has proved himself not unequal to his surroundings. Against such measures I ask to be allowed, on my own behalf and on behalf of those I have been elected to represent, to register our considered and solemn protest. It rests not only on our inveterate antipathy to all projects involving class distinction as unjust to the individual, but on our deep conviction that such measures will weaken and impair the solid loyalty of a large community, itself based on the thankful and inspiriting recognition that the mission of England here, at least, and where the influence of the Crown must for long years to come remain paramount, is to enforce an unswerving impartiality of treatment to all her subjects in the view that it is "Righteousness alone that exalteth a nation."

Mr. H. W. Biggie called and examined.

70135. (*Chairman.*) The witness was an officer in the Provincial Survey Department. The Anglo-Indian Association was composed of members of the domiciled community in India, its object being to watch their interests apart from political motives. There were about 30 members of the Provincial Survey Department, out of a total of 130, who were members of the Association.

70136. One reason why, in his judgment, the Survey organisation should be drawn from sources other than that of the Army, was precedent. The Survey Service used to consist of Civil Assistants, and men recruited from the Army, and, formerly, a certain number of appointments in the old senior division was open to members of the junior division. Those divisions represented at one time the Imperial and Provincial branches of the Department. Promotions to the Imperial Service had ceased on the introduction of the division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial. The Civil element were confined to the Provincial branch of the Department, and the Military occupied exclusively the posts in the Imperial branch, the mathematical expert on salary by special agreement being the only exception.

70137. He would specify spherical trigonometry, conic sections and co-ordinate geometry as additional subjects in the syllabus of examination for admission to the Department. If those subjects were added there might be a danger of the Indian candidate being more successful than the Anglo-Indian candidate, but he would have a limit of selection as between the two classes. Hitherto, the rule had been one Indian in four vacancies. He was perfectly sure, however, that the Anglo-Indian would be quite ready to qualify in the more severe test he had laid down. Why he suggested the limitation as between the Anglo-Indian and the Indian was that Anglo-Indians would like a fair share of the appointments.

70138. He drew attention to the great disparity which existed between the salary of a Provincial Officer and an Imperial Officer. It was less, on an average, than two-thirds of the pay of the Imperial Officer. He would not admit that the work of a Provincial Service Officer was not of the same value and responsibility as the work of an Imperial Officer in the same position. He recognised, however, that an officer appointed from Europe should be paid on a higher basis than the officer recruited locally.

70139 The proposal he made for promoting a certain number of Provincial Officers to the Imperial Service would necessitate a decrease in the number of Royal Engineer Officers. In order to overcome the difficulty of a war reserve, he would suggest that Military Officers should join the Department on tours of five or ten years' service at a time. That was the recommendation of Sir John Farquharson in 1905. He agreed that that was a matter which would have to be determined by the Military authorities. He did not agree with the suggestion that the best organisation for the Survey Department would be to provide for a directing staff consisting wholly of Royal Engineers, of an upper subordinate staff consisting, in the higher ranks, of officers in charge of camps, and, in the lower ranks, of officers employed in the less important triangulation work, and finally of a lower subordinate Service.

70140. There were seven executive posts allotted to the Provincial Service, three of which were drawing office posts, which had not the same responsibility as the charge of field parties. Those posts had always been held by the Provincial Service; it was merely the designation that was changed. They were never executive posts, but when the Government allotted seven executive posts to the Provincial Service, three drawing offices were brought in to make up the seven. His Service would like from about one-fourth to one-third of the number of executive posts as against the present proportion of one-seventh. He agreed that the final allocation would have to depend on the exigencies of the Military organisation, but urged that the just claims of the Provincial Service should also be considered.

70141. He maintained that the Survey Service had always been a Civil Department, and was in no sense a Military Department.

70142. (*Mr. Madge.*) The training given to men after they joined the Survey Department was the same for both branches of the Service.

70143. He had given in the written statement the names of men who would now be called Provincial but who did as important work as had ever been done in any branch of the Department. There was no reason to suppose that the efficiency of the uncovenanted men was lower now that it was formerly.

70144. He thought that the salaries of the Imperial Service were excessive; certainly the initial salary of the recruit was excessive. The pay of the Provincial Service was not equitable. Even a two-thirds scale of salary for the Provincial Service would be excessive, because it would be based on the present excessive salaries paid to the Imperial branch.

70145. Until 1st March, 1913, officers of the Provincial Service were not employed on executive duties in the way they used to be. That privilege had to some extent been restored.

70146. To his knowledge there had never been any question of a war reserve from the Survey Department, nor was the question of a war reserve mentioned anywhere, either in the constitution of the Department, in its history, or in any single annual report.

70147. With regard to the proposal to recruit the subordinate Service from privates in the ranks, he represented that about 30 or 40 years ago a few Military men were brought into the Provincial branch of the Department, and within the last five or six years two non-commissioned officers had been imported from Southampton. After spending about three years in the Department, they reverted to their work in England. In his opinion the general education of soldiers was not above the level of the education of the men who entered the Survey Department.

70148. At present there were about 21 field parties, about 17 of which were under the executive control of military officers, and the remainder under Provincial Officers. There were generally

two military officers in each party. Colonel Longe's object was that in case the controlling senior officer went on leave, the officiating charge thereby falling vacant would be filled by the assistant military officer. Cases had occurred where uncovenanted officers had taken charge of parties for short periods. He did not know of any case where such a man had been reported on for inefficiency.

70149. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He did not consider the three years' probation too long.

70150. There were at present members of the Provincial Service in the Department who were qualified to fill one-fourth, and more, of the Imperial posts. He had had himself to undertake important work without the supervision of an Imperial Officer of the Survey of India. He was on important work in Burma as Superintendent of Land Records. That post gave him great scope for initiative. He was under the Deputy Commissioner for Land Records, and under the Settlement Officer for Settlement Records, but not under an officer of his own Department.

70151. (*Mr. Sly.*) Royal Engineer Officers in the Survey of India Department did form a portion of the war reserve.

70152. With regard to the standard of education amongst soldiers, he had only met two non-commissioned officers of the Royal Engineers.

70153. He admitted that at present Provincial Officers of the Service held seven charges out of 28. The objection to that was that three of the charges were drawing office appointments, which he did not look upon as executive posts. He desired seven executive posts in addition to those three.

70154. In the days when the Service was divided into senior and junior divisions, the maximum salary of the junior division was Rs. 500, whereas the present maximum salary was Rs. 800, with charge allowance of Rs. 200. He could not say what was the largest number of men at any one time who had been promoted to the senior division. He pointed out that in former days the Provincial Service occupied 12 out of the 50 senior appointments in the Imperial Service and had a better status. The division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial involved a distinct lowering of status.

70155. He was of opinion that the surveying which the Royal Engineer learnt before he joined the Department did not fit him for employment in the Survey of India. He was not prepared to say that the surveying standard at Rurki was as high as the surveying standard at Chatham.

70156. At present, admission into the Service was by a competitive test, and a European wishing to enter the Service must have passed his high school examination. If the educational test was raised by the inclusion of the three subjects he had mentioned, he was perfectly willing to concede half the appointments to Indians. He was only following the policy of the Government in that respect. He also justified the policy on grounds of physique. He thought Anglo-Indians were more adapted to work in the Survey of India than the native of India. Even if Indians came up to the physical test, he would still limit them to one-half the number of appointments.

70157. (*Chairman.*) He would not admit that all three Drawing Office posts carried the pay of executive posts. It was very hard to answer the question whether the pay attached to those posts was sufficient. The survey question was bristling with difficulties. There were three men doing the same work on three different rates of pay. This was due to their having rendered different periods of service. The posts were quasi-executive; their powers and duties were capable of enlargement. If that were done the highest-paid man might remain where he was and the salaries of the other two might then be increased. He thought the highest-paid man was certainly drawing too much for the work at present in a drawing office. The work should go to a junior man, and the man at present holding the post should be advanced to a more responsible position, for instance, a field party. The second man was drawing a salary about commensurate with his duties; and he would say the same of the third man.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Calcutta, Friday, 23rd January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.
R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

COLONEL S. G. BURRARD, C.S.I., R.E., F.R.S., Surveyor-General, Survey of India Department.

Written Statement relating to the Survey of India Department.

70158. *INTRODUCTION.*—The organisation of a Survey Department must depend upon the work in front of it.

The main work of a Survey Department may be broadly divided into two classes (i) Topographical Surveys (small scale), (ii) Property and Engineering Surveys (large scale).

The Triangulation and Levelling upon which the Topographical maps are based are included in the first class.

The primary object of a Topographical map is Military. Topography is a Military Art, and owes its origin and progress to Military requirements. It is for these reasons that the Topographical Departments of all the nations of Europe are controlled by Military Officers.

The large scale Surveys (property) are those required for Revenue and Engineering purposes, for the demarcation of properties, for the use of City Corporations, Cantonment Magistrates and Forest Officers.

The reason that property Surveys have come to be controlled in England by Military Officers is that Military Officers were required for the Topographical Surveys and it has been considered advisable to have all Surveys executed by one Department.

The difficulty confronting Survey policy in India has been that the (small scale) Topographical Maps have been an Imperial work paid for by the Supreme Government and the (large scale) property maps have been paid for by the Local Governments.

The Government that pays for a work wishes to control it and to appoint the Supervising Officers.

Many attempts have been made during the last fifty years to bring the Topographical and Property Surveys together and to avoid duplication of work, but no successful system has been devised. Survey policy has in consequence undergone repeated changes. If the number of Officers employed on Survey work in India is required to be ascertained, it will be necessary to include not only officers of the Imperial Survey Department, but all those recruited by the several Local Governments.

Mr. Petters in paragraph 9 of his memorandum* gives figures to show that the number of Provincial Officers has been reduced between 1886 and 1909 from 135 to 87, and that the Domiciled Community has suffered in consequence. But I cannot accept his conclusions.

In 1886 considerable large scale surveys were being carried out by the Survey of India Department. Subsequently these Surveys together with the Provincial Officers supervising them were transferred to Local Governments; no comparison is therefore fair unless account is taken of Provincial Officers serving under Local Governments.

Even now in 1913 there are still 160 Provincial Officers on the List of the Survey of India Department, and if to these be added the Provincial Survey Officers recently recruited by the Burma Government and the survey supervisors recently recruited by the Bengal, Bihar and Assam Governments it will be found that the alleged reduction from 135 to 87 has not taken place.

Until a satisfactory scheme has been devised it is impossible to take a comprehensive view of Indian Survey work as a whole. In considering the organisation of the Survey Department I have to assume that the work before the Department is merely what it is at present, namely the Topographical programme.

I have to assume that Local Governments will continue to have their own little Survey Departments.

If property continues to increase in value as it is doing at present, there will have to be in the future many new large scale surveys in all parts of India; and according to the present system these will be carried out under Local Governments and not by the Survey Department. Personally I think that the limitation of the Survey Department to Topographical surveys will prove a mistake. An Imperial Survey Department ought not to be divorced from property surveys, but as the policy of limitation has only recently been adopted, I have to accept it as the basis of this memorandum.

70159. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—*Imperial Service.*—As the work of the Survey Department is limited to Topographical Surveys, I consider that it should be mainly controlled by Military Officers, who understand the strategical and tactical purposes for which maps are required.

The best training schools for Topography in the British Empire are the Military Colleges of Chatham, Woolwich and Sandhurst. Military Officers employed in the Survey Department form part of a reserve for the Army in war, a reserve that is usefully employed during peace.

India has large transfrontier areas unsurveyed, and its army when crossing the border needs many trained Survey officers. The Survey Department is a training school for war.

Whilst it is advantageous to keep the bulk of the Imperial service Military, I think the old plan of promoting 7 to 10 selected Provincial Officers into the Imperial Service was a sound one. This plan was abandoned in 1891, and I should like to see it re-introduced. Officers so promoted should be allowed to rise to salaries above Rs. 1,000.

The Mathematical Experts of the Imperial Service have never been Military officers.

Provincial Service.—Having regard to the work for which the Provincial Service is required, I think that the present system of recruitment by Departmental Entrance Examination is satisfacory.

The main work of the Provincial Service is the charge of "Sections" of Parties, and the majority of Provincial Officers perform this duty satisfactorily. Doubtless the examination allows a few inefficients to enter, whilst on the other hand we obtain a few exceptionally competent men.

Whilst it is desirable to recruit the bulk of the Provincial Service by means of our Entrance Examination, I think the old plan of promoting a few selected Subordinates from the Service below was a good one.

Many Provincial Officers object to the promotion of selected Subordinates into the Provincial Service, but I think an exceptional man in any Service should have the opportunity of rising into the Service above.

When I consider the excellent services rendered by such Provincial Officers (who were promoted from the Subordinate Service) as the late Khan Bahadur Yusuf Shareef and Rai Bahadur Hira Singh, I think it would be a mistake to close the door against promotions from the Subordinate Service to the Provincial Service. If we are to judge of the success of a system from the individual cases of promoted officers, then the promotion of Officers from the Subordinate Service to the Provincial Service has certainly been as justified as promotion from the Provincial Service to the Imperial Service.

70160. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—*Imperial Service.*—The Royal Engineer Officer is so well grounded at Chatham, both in the theory and practice of Geodesy, Topography and Field Astronomy, that when he joins the Survey of India Department he is not so much in want of technical education as experience of Indian ways and methods.

The school authorities at Chatham keep the Indian Survey informed of the names of young Royal Engineer Officers who show the greatest aptitude during the Surveying Courses.

The Indian Army Officer passes one year at Sandhurst (or two at Woolwich) and is thus not so trained a Topographer as his Royal Engineer colleague, but the Survey of India Department recruits so few of its officers from the Indian Army (only one in four) that it would be superfluous to create a training school for them. No Indian Army appointment to the Survey of India has been made during the last three years.

I consider that the present system of training and probation for the Imperial Service is satisfactory.

Provincial Service.—The training of Provincial Officers must depend upon the work for which the Provincial Service is required. Hitherto their training has been satisfactorily carried out at the Survey School at Dehra Dun.

To make all officers pass through lengthy and varied courses with all Survey Parties, as has been proposed by some Provincial Officers, would dislocate the work of the Department and would convert the Department into a big training school.

This miscellaneous technical training would be no groundwork of education and would be actually detrimental to the formation of character.

The object of Government in creating a Provincial Service is to get certain work done and not to train officers for other work.

70161. **(III) and (IV) Conditions of Service and Salary.**—*Imperial Service.*—This Service has only recently been reorganised, upon the recommendations of the Survey Committee of 1905. The grant of time scale salaries has removed the block in promotion.

Provincial Officers draw attention to the fact that the pay of the Imperial Service is so much greater than their own.

The pay of the two Services has been fixed independently of each other. The pay of the Imperial Service has been fixed so as to attract men of a certain educational standard, and the pay of the Provincial Service has been fixed so as to attract men of a different educational standard. The pay of the Provincial Service is ten times as great as the pay of the Subordinate Surveyors, who carry out the actual surveying in the field. This disparity appears at first sight very great; but the pay of these Services has been fixed independently of one another, as men of different educational standards have been required.

* Not reprinted.

In 1907 the Secretary of State recruited a Cambridge Wrangler on special terms, decided upon in England by the India Office, and those terms are much the same as the time scale pay granted to the Military Members of the Survey of India.

Provincial Service.—Anyone reading the Provincial Officers' notes might think that the Provincial Service was discontented to the core, but this is not the case. Retired Officers are most anxious to obtain appointments in it for their sons.

In 1908 I went into the whole Provincial question with a Provincial Committee. In 1910 the Provincial Officers memorailized the Government and a Committee was appointed which took exhaustive evidence. Neither in 1908 nor in 1910, neither in the memorials nor in the evidence was any proposal made, such as has now been put forward, to transfer all Provincial Officers to the Imperial List.

The foundation of any Department is the work to be done. The Provincial Service was created to do certain work for Government; the nature of that work is now for the first time made a grievance.

When grievances concern promotion, pay, or leave, they can be remedied; but when a service objects to the nature of the work for which it was created, there is no remedy.

If the memorials submitted and the evidence taken in 1910 are examined, it will be seen that most of the Provincial Service grievances have been fairly redressed.

The recent reorganisation has granted an extra lakh of rupees per annum to the Provincial Service.

In 1910 there were two principal grievances:—

(i.) The omission to give them a time scale salary.

(ii.) The denial to them of executive charges.

In their memorials of 1910 they asked Government to grant them a time scale and to allot to them five executive charges.

In 1912 Government granted these requests, giving seven charges instead of the five asked for; in addition to these concessions horse transport and free tents have been allowed, and the prospects of pensions have been greatly improved.

I consider that seven executive charges for the Provincial Service should now be sufficient. When these new executive posts were first filled up, several officers had to be passed over as unqualified, although the tests were not very severe.

I have however to acknowledge that the regulations, by which the time scale salaries were granted, fixed the dates of increase in such a way that some officers benefitted less than others. Men are greatly influenced by comparisons, and I should like to see all officers get their time scale from date of appointment.

During the hot weather, Survey Officers reside in hill stations, the expenses of which are put forward as a grievance.

Although house rent is expensive in hill stations, yet a man does save money there, in not having to send away his family during the hot weather and in having schools handy. Many Provincial Officers, when they retire, settle from choice at hill stations, and I feel certain that if survey recess quarters were to be transferred to the plains there would be much lamentation.

It is difficult to obtain a fair comparison between the pay and prospects of two different Departments; on page 5 of his note Mr. Greiff compares the prospects of the Survey with those of the Public Works and Forest Departments.

In the Public Works Department and in the Forest Department students spend some years at a College, before they receive their initial pay of Rs. 250. During the periods at College they receive no pay at all.

The survey recruit does not pass through any College; he is appointed direct to the Survey Department but kept for 3 years "on probation": during this probationary period he receives a salary of Rs. 100 to Rs. 150, and at the close of it he starts on Rs. 250.

I should have thought that in any comparison the probationary period of the Survey ought to have been set off against the College period of the other two Departments and in favour of the former; but Mr. Greiff argues that the Public Works Department recruit begins on a salary of Rs. 250, whereas the Survey recruit begins on Rs. 100.

In my opinion the comparison should be thus:—

	P.W.D.	Forest.	Survey.
College and Training period	No pay.	No pay.	Rs. 100-150
1st year	Rs. 250	Rs. 250	Rs. 250
10th year	„ 475	„ 450	„ 400
16th year	„ 675	„ 550	„ 500
Maximum pay attainable by time scale	Rs. 850	Rs. 550	Rs. 600
Maximum pay attainable by selection to higher appointments	Rs. 2,000 (?)	Rs. 850	Rs. 1,000

The Public Works Department is on a different level of education to the Forest and Survey Departments.

In some respects the terms of the Forest Department may be better than those of the Survey Department, but in other respects they are less favourable.

I doubt if in my table above the advantages of the Survey Department have even now been sufficiently demonstrated; for the probationary periods on low pay in the Public Works Department and in the Forest Department have been omitted; but I have said enough to show that Mr. Grieff's comparison is not a fair one.

70162. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—*Imperial Service.*—The leave rules are sufficiently liberal, but owing to constant modifications have become too complicated.

Provincial Service.—Provincial Officers are statutory natives of India, and therefore come under the Indian leave rules;—these rules do not allow the same amounts of long leave to be taken as the European leave rules.

Although Provincial Officers do not often take long leave, several of them think that the European and Indian leave rules should be the same.

The difference between the European and Indian rules was originally introduced on the grounds that the European had to go to Europe to visit his home and his relations, whereas the statutory native has his home and his relatives in India and consequently long leave is no more necessary to him than it is to an English Officer serving in England. When a man wishes to enter the Provincial Service, he is willing to accept the position of a statutory native, because as a European he would be debarred. When he is in the service he claims the leave privileges of the European. In this connection difficult cases occasionally arise; as I stated above, the Provincial Officer with his family is supposed to be domiciled in India, and his salary and his leave have been based upon this supposition. But in certain cases the Provinical Officer nobly strives to advance his children's interests; at great personal sacrifices he sends them to England for education: and he thus practically ceases to be a statutory native. He has in fact accepted leave rules which are no longer applicable to his changed condition. Such cases evoke admiration and sympathy. At the same time I cannot agree with Mr. Petter's suggestion that all Provincial Officers should be allowed long furlough on full pay.

To offer the same pay for furlough as for duty will be an inducement to men to take all leave whether they want it or not.

I think that three years' furlough during a man's service might be allowed, and that privilege leave should be allowed to accumulate up to six months.

I think that cases of sickness, which are obviously due to survey work in unhealthy localities, require very generous treatment under the leave rules.

To officers drawing less than Rs. 500 a month the Surveyor-General should be empowered to grant special medical leave on full pay up to three months when he is convinced that the sickness is due to the work and the work alone.

70163. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—*Imperial Service.*—The pensions are governed by the military regulations.

Provincial Service.—Provincial Officers should be given the option of retiring on full pension after completing 25 years service without medical certificate.

70164. **(VIIA) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans.**—The efficiency of the Survey Department has not suffered by the appointment of Indians to the Provincial Service.

Nothing however will be gained by attempting to make comparisons of the respective merits of the Europeans and Indians of our Provincial Service. It is the individual that counts, not his class. The individual counts more than the class.

So many instances of courage and endurance on the part of both Europeans and Indians have occurred in trans-border work of the Survey Department that no Surveyor-General will be willing to seek out and emphasise their relative defects.

70165. **(VIIB) The working of the existing system of the division of the Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—The different Departments of the Indian Government have been developed on different lines, and it was, I think, a mistake in 1895 to attempt to give the same organisation to all. One defect of the existing system is that the term "Provincial" is applied in different Departments to men of different educational qualifications.

In the early days of the Survey Department the supervision of field work was carried out by military officers, whilst the actual surveying was done by a subordinate Service recruited from the domiciled community. After this system had lasted for many years, the necessity of reducing expenses led to a third Service of Indians being recruited.

The Military Service (now the "Imperial") became the controlling staff; the Subordinate Civilian Service (now the "Provincial") became the supervising staff; and the third Service became the working staff. The main purpose for which a Military ("Imperial") Officer is now recruited is to hold charge of a Survey "Party"; in the earlier years of his career he is gaining experience as an Assistant and in his latter years he may be a Superintendent, but the principal work of his life is to hold executive charge of a "Party."

The Civilian Officer, formerly called Subordinate (now Provincial). is recruited to hold charge of a "Section" of a party; that is the work for which he is wanted.

In the latter part of his career he may rise to hold charge of a party.

Owing to the dislike of the Provincial Officers to the term "Subordinate Service," which was their original designation, the latter was altered in 1885 to "Junior Division." But no change in duties was introduced; the "Senior Division" (Imperial) remained the superior Service and the "Junior Division" remained subordinate as before.

On the recommendation of the Royal Commission of 1887 the name "Senior Division" was changed into "Imperial Service" and the name "Junior Division" was changed into "Provincial Service." Again no change was made in their relative duties, the Provincial Service remained subordinate.

Of recent years complaints have been made by Provincial Officers that they are occasionally called "subordinates," and these complaints are justified; according to official designation the Provincial Service is not now a subordinate Service, although it is still recruited for subordinate duties. By the accidental use, however, of the term "subordinate" no slight has been intended; the term is merely a relic of the time where the Service was officially designated "subordinate"; in the present handbook of the Government of India Orders, Provincial Officers are termed "subordinates," and as late as 1891 the Secretary of State referred to them as such.

When in 1895 the names "Imperial" and "Provincial" were introduced the former was intended to include all officers educated in England and the latter those educated in India. The plan has not been satisfactory, because the relative responsibilities allotted to "Provincial" Services have varied in different Departments.

In the Public Works Department the Imperial and Provincial Officers are employed on identical duties. In the Civil Service and in the Survey Department the Provincial Officers are recruited for subordinate duties. This is, of course, the reason why the Survey Department has always been allowed such a very large number of Provincial Officers; in the Public Works Department the number of Provincials is only one-fourth of the number of Imperial Officers; in the Survey Department the number of Provincials is three times as great as the number of Imperials.

Because of their designation "Provincial" some of the Provincial Officers of the Survey Department have argued that they should be treated like Provincial Officers of the Public Works Department; but the work of the Department does not admit of this claim being conceded, and if education is to be recognised as a standard, or if the expenses of education are taken into account, then the Provincial Officers of the Survey have no claim to equality with those of the Public Works Department. To grant them equality would be unfair to the Rurki students, both to those who have passed into the Public Works Department and to those who have failed; it would mean that education is not to be the test of qualification in India.

Survey appointments to the Provincial Service are gained by competition in a small Departmental examination, the subjects being elementary mathematics and elementary drawing. The examination is in no way comparable with those at Roorkee. The Survey examiner has been continually instructed by the Surveyor-General to make the papers easier.

The Survey Department has been founded upon a Military basis for particular Military reasons; no secret has been made of this, and applicants and their parents are quite aware that the Department is organised differently from the Public Works Department.

In interviews with parents of candidates I have sometimes said, "our Provincial Officers complain that their status is inferior to that in the Public Works Department. Why don't you send your son into the Public Works Department?" the following replies have been given to me:—

(i.) "I am afraid my son would not pass for the Public Works Department."

(ii.) "I cannot afford to pay Rs. 4,000 for my son's course at Rurki."

(iii.) "If my son passes the Survey entrance examination he is sure of an appointment; whereas, after three years at Rurki he is not even sure of any appointment in the Public Works Department."

If the Public Works Department standard of education had been insisted on for the Survey Department, very few indeed of our present Provincial Officers would have been able to gain admission.

It has been argued that the name "Provincial" in the Survey is a misnomer, and that as the Survey Provincial Officers are liable for service in any Province they should be called "Imperial." But if this claim is correct, then the lower subordinates of the Survey have also a right to be called Imperial; for every member of the Survey Department whether Imperial, Provincial, subordinate or menial is liable for transfer from Province to Province.

Objections have also been taken to the word "extra" in the designation "Extra Assistant Superintendent," and Provincial Officers have argued from the dictionary meaning of the word

"extra" that it is not applicable. But the dictionary meaning is not the point at issue. The designation "extra" denotes that a Provincial Officer has not qualified at Rurki, that he is "extra" or outside the Rurki List. Discussions of the dictionary meanings of the words "Provincial" and "extra" are irrelevant, for the real question at issue is whether the Provincial Officer of the Survey possesses sufficient education to justify him being granted equality with the Public Works Department and with the Imperial Service. I do not argue in favour of retaining the exact words "Provincial" and "extra"; better dictionary substitutes may possibly be found for them, but no substitutes will satisfy those Provincial Officers who are claiming equality with the Imperial Service. Equality is not a matter of nomenclature; it is a matter of education.

Mr. Petters has stated in his note (para. 13), that on entering the Survey Department the Royal Engineer and the Provincial Officer are on a par.

The Royal Engineer is selected as follows:—

Senior boys of the public schools of England compete for admission into Woolwich; about 50 candidates are successful, and these (even when they enter Woolwich) have an education very superior to that of the Provincial Officer. At Woolwich they undergo two years of hard study; there is then a final examination and out of the original 50 successful candidates only 15 are appointed to the Royal Engineers. These 15 are then sent for two years to one of the best schools in the world, the School of Military Engineering at Chatham. According to Mr. Petters the schools of India are able to turn out boys (aged 19) who are as well educated as those (aged 24) who have been at the head of English Public Schools, and who have subsequently passed four years at Woolwich and Chatham. Mr. Petters' comparison obliges me to say that in my opinion the education of the Provincial Officer is altogether inferior.

Mr. Petters states that on joining the Survey Department no Royal Engineer Officer can do topography, triangulation or traversing. Every Royal Engineer Officer has studied these subjects for four years at Woolwich and Chatham and every Royal Engineer Officer first joining in India is competent to carry out any ordinary Survey work. The Commandant of the Chatham School may be asked his opinion on the subject. It must be remembered that India is not the only country that is being surveyed by Military Officers from Chatham. Large areas of Africa have been recently surveyed by Royal Engineer Officers who have never been trained in the Indian Survey.

A few Imperial Officers of the Survey are recruited from the Indian Army; some of these have passed into the Royal Artillery through Woolwich, other into the Infantry through Sandhurst. The entrance examination to Sandhurst is a more severe test than the entrance examination of our Provincial Service; it embraces such additional subjects as geography, history, modern languages and science.

In my opinion the Indian Army Officer joining the Survey is very superior to the Provincial Officer in education.

Even the Anglo-Indian Association admits that if Provincial Officers are to be placed on the Imperial List their educational qualifications will have to be "considerably raised" (*see* Association's Memorandum).

An article published in "Indian Engineering," 5th April, 1913, which has been quoted by Provincial Officers and which presses the claims of the Survey Provincial Service to equality with the Imperial, ends with the remark, "To attain this equality of status Indian men must consent to acquire a higher 'hall mark.'"

The proposals to transfer 160 Provincial Officers to the Imperial List and to double their pay all round are not based on any considered scheme of reorganisation.

Provincial Officers are mainly employed in charge of "sections" (the seniors being in charge of "Parties" or employed in Drawing Offices or Headquarters). Mr. Petters thinks that charge of a section is a subordinate duty and so he proposes to educate 160 Provincial Officers at Government expense, paying them their full salaries during their course of 11 years training in order to make them fit for charges of Parties which do not exist. Mr. Petters says that new parties ought to be created, but parties can only be created to do work that is required; we cannot create posts and parties in order to provide higher salaries. We cannot create posts for Cadastral and Forest Survey expansions before those expansions have taken place.

Mr. Greiff starts from the Provincial Officers for whom he wishes to find more highly paid posts, instead of starting from the work to be done for Government. Whilst Mr. Greiff is proposing to transfer 160 Officers into a small Imperial Service he does not face the questions:—

(i) How can 50 Imperials and 160 Provincials be organised for the charge of 28 Parties.

(ii) Who are to replace the numerous Officers now in charge of sections?

I doubt if Mr. Greiff's proposals are even in the interests of the Domiciled Community. The old Provincial Service has hitherto been a valuable monopoly (three-quarters of its posts being reserved) for that section of the Domiciled Community who have been unable to afford the higher Roorkee education.

It is this service that Mr. Greiff is now proposing to destroy. Mr. Newland sees the logical conclusion and says that the Provincial Service will have to be allowed to die out. If a Service objects to performing the work for which it was created, it must inevitably be replaced by some other Service.

The argument has been pressed that when Provincial Officers have been promoted to the Imperial Service a few have held their own with Imperial Officers; stress for example has been laid upon the case of Mr. Hennessey, who rose to be Deputy Surveyor-General in 1884.

There is, however, an important fact about Mr. Hennessey which has not been mentioned; namely, Mr. Hennessey when quite a young man took three years' furlough, partly on no pay, and underwent the whole course of mathematics at Cambridge University. He is the only Provincial Officer who has done this. The conclusion to be drawn from his case is, that if a young, hard-working, Anglo-Indian is educated at Cambridge University he may become a useful Imperial Officer. The conclusion commonly drawn from this case is that as one Provincial Office rose to be Deputy Surveyor-General all others are equally qualified. Exceptional Officers exist in all services, but we must not generalize from them. Several Provincial Officers selected for important charges have completely failed; to condemn the whole service from such instances would be unfair, but it would be equally unfair to appraise them all at the value of Mr. Hennessey.

I think that the charge of a few Survey Parties, if the latter are in good working order, and have a normal programme, may be entrusted to selected Provincial Officers; and although heart-burnings in the Provincial Service are created by supersessions and selections, I think that the reservation of some charges for the best men of the Provincial Service will have a good effect. The Government has recently granted seven executive charges, and five non-executive charges to the Provincial Service. The scheme is on its trial and in my opinion no further step in this direction is justified.

A University can give a few honorary degrees in recognition of approved service; but if it is unduly generous in conferring its ordinary degrees, it will only depreciate their value.

Promotions to the Imperial list of selected seniors can be given as prizes for approved service, but wholesale promotions should only be given to mark a certain educational standard.

In the Survey numerous cases arise for which an Imperial Officer is indispensable. The Department has only just started a topographical survey of the Deccan on half the normal scale; if this experiment proves successful, a large sum of money may be saved. But initial control by an Imperial Officer is

desirable in any such departure from normal routine.

Following America and Russia we are trying a new system for measuring base lines; the apparatus is now being tested. No Provincial Officer could do this work, none has the knowledge of physics; although when once a satisfactory method has been worked out, Provincial Officers will probably be able to take the routine observations, as they can now do in magnetic work.

When a special survey and map of the Delhi country was required last year by Government at three weeks' notice, so much push and initiative were necessary that the nomination of a Royal Engineer Officer to the charge was imperative. In such an emergency a sense of proportion is wanted and a power of rising above the ordinary technical methods.

When last year a new map of Persia became necessary the work had to be given to an Imperial Officer. This map will have to face the criticisms of geographers and diplomatists in Europe. It had to be compiled partly from the maps of foreign explorers whose reports were written in foreign languages. I know of no Provincial Officer who possesses such a knowledge of German and French as would enable him to reconcile and adjust the contradictory results of different travellers.

Last year I was asked to depute "an Imperial Officer" to demarcate the boundary of Nepal; the demarcation had been previously done by a Provincial Officer who had failed to realise the importance of the work. On this occasion I was particularly asked to send "an Imperial Officer," and I have to say that the demand was justified.

When last year the City of Bombay pressed me to send them "an Imperial Officer," I offered to select for them one of the best Provincial Officers in the Service. The city had had recent experience of the work of a Provincial Officer and it now specially asked for a Royal Engineer Officer. Although I do not think that an *average* Provincial Officer could be entrusted with the survey of a great city, I think that a Provincial Officer might be specially selected who would be competent to undertake it.

The business routine, the accounts and the correspondence of the Survey Headquarters are managed by a young Royal Engineer Officer; this Officer could be replaced by other Imperial Officers, but I know of no Provincial Officer who could take up his work.

Further instances might be given, but I think I have said enough to show that the proposal to transfer the whole Provincial Service of 160 Officers to our small Imperial List and to double their pay is not one that can be accepted.

When I think of the cordial relations generally existing amongst all ranks of the Department, and of the excellent and loyal work of many Provincial Officers, I deeply regret that the extravagant demands of a few should have compelled me to enter into these invidious comparisons.

70166. **(VIII) Relations with other Services.**—The relations with the Indian Civil Service and other Services have been good.

COLONEL S. G. BURRARD called and examined.

70167. (*Chairman.*) The witness had been in the Survey of India Department for 30 years. He was satisfied with the arrangement under which one-fourth of the vacancies in the Imperial branch were allotted to Indian Army Officers. The war reserve of Royal Engineers for the Army of India was very much larger than any number of officers whom the Survey Department could employ. The Government desired to employ just as many Royal Engineer Officers as they could on useful work in peace time. The Survey Department employed 37 to 38 Royal Engineer Officers in that way. Royal Engineer Survey Officers acted as military engineers as well as Survey Officers in time of war. The cadre required for survey purposes in the event of war was governed by the magnitude of the campaign, and that was a matter for the Military authorities.

70168. There were some 50 Imperial Officers at present in the Survey Department. Six Imperial Officers were filling the higher administrative posts and 21 were executive officers holding major charges. Ten was the allowance for furlough; there were therefore only 14 assistants for 21 executive charges. In 1912, 9 military officers were on trans-frontier military service, and there were only 5 assistants for 21 charges. This year 2 officers were surveying the Persian frontier, 1 was with the Indian expedition in Turkistan, and there were only 11 assistants. Provincial Officers were not available for the Persian or Italian expeditions, as a knowledge of French was required. In 1905 the Director-General of the Ordnance Survey of England, who had been called in to advise the Government of India, represented that the service required 70 military officers for survey purposes in time of peace, and Sir John Miller who was on the Committee, said he thought 64 military officers would be sufficient, and that five charges should go to the Provincial Service. The Government of India cut the number down to 55, and had now further reduced it to 51. He was of opinion that further reduction was impossible.

70169. It was not necessary to have an assistant to every charge, but there must be young officers always coming on, gaining experience of India, and of survey work. He justified the position of the assistant in that he was gaining experience to qualify him for employment as an executive officer. The existing number of assistants was not in excess of the number required for training. An Imperial Officer should normally serve six years before becoming qualified to take charge of a party. This applied equally to the Royal Engineer and to the Indian Army Officer.

70170. The reason why the Survey Department in India differed in its constitution from Survey Departments in other parts of the world was simply policy. If he only thought of efficiency he would recommend that the controlling staff should be a purely Military service.

70171. It was very difficult to express an opinion on the suggestion that the upper subordinate service, if carefully recruited and trained, might be found competent in due time to replace a large portion of the Provincial Service. The upper subordinate service was quite in an experimental stage, and the salaries offered were not sufficient to attract the class of men required. If there was only one intermediate service between the military and the subordinate, it would have to approximate in pay and education to the present Provincial Service. He did not see how it was practicable to get rid of the Provincial Service; there must be an intermediate service. He did not endorse the view that the Provincial Service as now constituted was a fifth wheel on the coach. He would rather say the upper subordinate service was the fifth wheel on the coach.

70172. He would not agree to the suggestion that the present number of executive charges allotted to the Provincial Service should be increased to 11. Seven should be the maximum number. Nor did he agree with the opinion that of the seven allotted posts, the three drawing office appointments were inferior. He should be very glad to see three Imperial Officers in charge of those particular appointments. The work attached to them was just as important as that attached to other Imperial posts. He thought the only reason which could be offered for such a suggestion was that it provided an excuse for asking for three more charges.

70173. He had always been in favour of promoting a few officers of the Provincial Service into the Imperial Service, as used to be the case. He believed in promoting men from the Provincial Service straight into the Imperial Service. He

did not like the system under which the two services overlapped. The old system was quite a good one. A man got to the top of the Provincial Service, and then, if he was fit, was promoted to the Imperial list and entered at the bottom. When the old system first came into force, the method of promoting men was to choose young officers of 24 and 25 from the Provincial Service, and promote them into the Imperial, with the result that those young men had the opportunity of rising very high. That system, however, created such discontent in the Provincial Service that it had to be abandoned. It was pointed out that if a young officer was promoted, no one but the promoted officer got any advantage, whereas if a senior officer got promotion, it meant an increase of pay all round. On the whole, if men were to be promoted to the Imperial Service from the Provincial Service, he would prefer to promote the fully qualified long service officer at the top of the Provincial Service. He did not think that the promoted officer would find himself in an invidious position through being ranked for seniority below a junior officer of the Imperial Service. That was a pure matter of administration. The two officers should be kept apart so that there could be no question of one of them giving orders to the other.

70174. The present system, which provided for charge allowances, and a continuous time-scale for Superintendents, Deputy Superintendents and Assistants, was inconvenient and led to a great deal of trouble. What was wanted was an incremental scale of pay for the Deputy Superintendents, and another scale for the Assistant Superintendents, with promotion by selection from the Assistant class to the Deputy class. There was no need to abolish the system of charge allowances in the case of the Superintendents, as there were so few of them.

70175. He recommended that Provincial Officers should be allowed optional retirement after 25 years of service, because of the rigorous nature of the department. Most men in the service when they reached 45 were too old for field work, and there was not enough room for them in the Drawing offices. He did not think that many officers would take advantage of the option.

70176. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) With regard to the statement that Indian Army Officers never heard of the Survey Department his opinion was that the Indian Army Officer knew of all the departments for which he was eligible. The real point was that his Commanding Officer did not like him to apply for such appointments.

70177. The number of officers in the Survey Department who would be required in the event of mobilisation would depend not only on the extent of the campaign, but on the character and conditions of the country in which the campaign would be carried out.

70178. (*Mr. Sly.*) He was not in favour of the proposal that recruitment from the Indian Army to the Survey Department should be wholly abolished, and that recruitment should be restricted to Royal Engineers. It was a good thing to have officers of different classes and different training in the department. The Indian Army man had experience of Indians, of the sepoys and the language of the country. Indian Army Officers did not form part of the war reserve.

70179. The salaries of Royal Engineers employed in the Survey Department were on a substantially higher level than the salaries of Royal Engineers employed in the Public Works Department. He could not say why the salaries of the Royal Engineers in the Public Works Department had been reduced. The salary of the Royal Engineer officer in the Survey Department had not been altered. His average pay in 1890 was Rs. 1,262, and it stood at that figure at the present time. The pay of a Royal Engineer in the Survey Department had been fixed so as to attract the best mathematical men and draughtsmen from Chatham.

70180. It was the case formerly that in one year there might be more Deputy Superintendents' charges than in another year, but since the reorganisation in 1909 the number had been definitely fixed at 21.

70181. If any rigid rule was prescribed for fixing the proportion of Assistants to executive officers, Government ought to be liberal in the case of a department which had to send men across the frontier. There should be a percentage of assistants allowed for deputation.

70182. The size of topographical parties employed in India had increased within the last 10 or 15 years.

70183. There had been a raising of the status of the three Drawing office posts in the department in 1913. These three offices were first created in 1909; in 1910 the Provincial Service asked that these three offices should be made into executive charges; and in 1913 the Government acceded to this request.

70184. Admission to the Provincial Service was by competitive test. The rule was also laid down that three-quarters of the vacancies should go to the domiciled community, and one quarter to Indians. There was one examination for all candidates, and if more than three-quarters of the men at the top of the list were Anglo-Indians, one of them had to be knocked out. Supposing there were four vacancies, the first three Anglo-Indians were selected and the first Indian. If the rule were abolished, it would lead to a large increase in the number of Indians recruited. One or two Indians had almost always to be knocked out. The three-quarters rule was not justified on the score of efficiency, but by other reasons. It had to be remembered that the Survey Department had to work from Baluchistan to Siam, and required men who were willing to go anywhere. The Indian had a fixed home, he married early and had strong family ties, and preferred to serve in his own Province, whereas the Anglo-Indian had no home, and was willing to go anywhere.

70185. He was not in favour of the proposal that a substantial number of non-commissioned officers from the Royal Engineers should be employed in lieu of officers of the Provincial Service.

70186. (*Mr. Fisher.*) It might be urged as an objection against the present rule under which three-quarters of the appointments went to Anglo-Indians, that the present discontent in the Provincial branch of the Survey of India Department was due to Anglo-Indians. The discontent took the form of envy of the Imperial Officer, and it was undermining the efficiency of the Provincial Service.

70187. The Survey Examiner had been frequently instructed by the Surveyor-General to make the papers easier in order to give the Anglo-Indians a chance. At present an officer in the Service was merely given such technical education as was sufficient for the work he had to do. The stage at which an officer required a higher standard of education was when he came to be eligible for charge of a party.

70188. The present Provincial Service was quite efficient for its work.

70189. Personally, he did not see how the amount of the charge allowances could be varied according to the importance of the charge.

70190. In former days, when railways and communications were defective, the Civilian got his chance of War Service. That happened in every undeveloped country, but nowadays Government could draw on Military Officers, and if a war broke out it would be absurd to ask Civilians to volunteer for War Service.

70191. (*Mr. Madge.*) He did not agree with the statement that no more original survey work remained to be done in India, and that in future all survey work would be merely revisional.

70192. The employment of local Survey Departments under the different Local Governments was likely to prove very uneconomical.

70193. When serving on the Departmental Committee in 1910, he was advised that if the Provincial Service were given the terms which they

were subsequently given, dissatisfaction would cease. As far as he knew opportunity was given to all sections of the Provincial Service to appear before that Committee.

70194. Under the old system a Provincial officer promoted to the bottom of the Imperial list received about the same pay as that of the Junior Imperial Officer.

70195. He was of opinion that the best training schools for topography were the Military Colleges at Chatham and Sandhurst. He did not think any serious exception could be taken to Colonel Longe's opinion, that neither the military man nor the civilian was useful to the Department until he had undergone the special survey training required for Indian conditions. Colonel Longe did not intend to deny the valuable technical survey training given at Chatham. What Colonel Longe was probably referring to when he spoke of Indian conditions was not the actual topographical work, but the knowledge which officers had to acquire of Indian communities, customs, languages and methods.

70196. He thought in a great national emergency the work of the Survey of India Department ought to be suspended. In a great national emergency the requirements of war came first, and the peace work of the Survey Department must suffer for the time being.

70197. He had always regarded the three Drawing Office appointments as important charges. The appointments carried a charge allowance and the Officers holding them simply draw the allowance in addition to their substantive pay. The Drawing Office appointments were normal executive charges, and rightly so. The Senior Provincial Officer at Mussoorie had been offered charge of a field party, but he had refused it, and begged to be allowed to remain in charge of his Drawing Office.

70198. (*Chairman.*) When the Government of India gave orders that recruitment to the Provincial Service should be stopped, there was no intention of abolishing the Service. The idea was simply to stop recruitment until the number of officers was reduced to 87.

70199. He would put in a statement* regarding the recent reorganisation.

* *Vide* Appendix I.

(The witness withdrew.)

J. O. GREIFF, Esq., Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India Department.

Written Statement relating to the Survey of India Department.

70200. *1.* Before being examined on the evidence already submitted by my Service last April, I crave the indulgence of being permitted to put before the Commission the statement I have now drawn up on behalf of the Service I represent. My reasons for begging this indulgence are—

(*i*) That the officers selected by the head of the Department on March 9th, 1913, to prepare memoranda of evidence were directed to do so individually, and were obliged to submit it by April 15th, 1913. At this time of the year officers of the Survey are scattered all over India on field duties, and it was therefore not possible to convene a meeting and submit corporate evidence.

(*ii*) That the want of a co-opted member has placed us at rather a disadvantage, and that therefore it is necessary to submit a more detailed memoranda of evidence. We were not aware that in our memoranda we should have asked for the privileges of a co-opted representative. We understood that orders for the selection of a co-opted member and representative witnesses to be examined by the Commission would issue later.

(*iii*) That the evidence now submitted for the favourable consideration of the Commission embodies the views of members of my Service as a whole, and I am directed by them to ask, that I be fully examined on all statements concerning my Service.

2. In its infancy the Survey Department consisted of Military Officers and Civil Assistants, both holding gazetted rank, and with the same possibilities of promotion to the higher appointments. Later the Department was reorganised, and divided into "senior" and "junior" divisions, with a recognised proportion of appointments in the former belonging to the latter. In 1895, a further reorganisation took place in order to carry out the general principles of the Public Service Commission of 1886-88. The leading feature of this change was that promotion from the junior to the senior division was stopped, but to compensate the former division (thenceforward to be termed the Provincial Service) for this loss, 10 posts carrying a salary of Rs. 400 to Rs. 1,000 were transferred from the Imperial to the Provincial Service. This was by no means an adequate compensation for the loss the Provincial Service suffered, in being deprived of the promotion to the Imperial Service, both as regards emoluments and status. Under the old rules, junior division officers promoted to the senior division could expect to rise to Rs. 2,000 or at least Rs. 1,600 as the accompanying list of the officers so promoted will show. The highest pay allotted to the Provincial Service was only Rs. 800. Their status was irretrievably lowered, as they were gradually reduced to a position of inferiority and subordination and deprived of executive and independent charges, which they enjoyed equally with the senior division officers prior to 1895.

3. So badly and with such short-sightedness had this scheme been evolved, and so little had its effects on the members of the Service been gauged, that hardly was it launched when memorials poured in against it, the justness of which had to be recognised, and expedients in the form of personal allowances were granted to members who joined prior to 1884.

4. The total strength of the Senior Division on 1st January, 1895, was 50, as follows:—

Administrative Officers		...	...	2
Other	,,	...	...	48
Military	,,	...	...	37
Civilian	,,	...	...	13

The steps taken gradually to reduce the Imperial Service from 50 to 40 were consistently followed until we find that in 1905 the strength of the Imperial Service was reduced to 42 (*vide* List of Survey Officers on 1st January, 1905), eight out of the 10 posts having been transferred to the Provincial Service. There were then only two more posts remaining to be transferred to the Provincial Service to reduce the strength of the Imperial Service to 40 as laid down in 1895.

5. Ever since the constitution of the Imperial and Provincial Services in 1895, the policy of the Department regarding the allotment of the administrative and executive charges unreservedly among the Military and Civilian officers promoted from the junior to the senior division, was changed into one of monopolising all the administrative and executive charges for the Military officers, and reducing the Provincial officers to subordinate positions. No such change was probably intended by the Public Service Commission of 1886-87, when they recommended that the Service should be divided into Imperial and Provincial Services. In 1895, immediately before the creation of the Imperial and Provincial Services, there were no less than seven officers promoted from the junior to the senior division holding executive and responsible charges. As these officers retired the corresponding executive charges were not given to the Provincial Service.

6. In 1904-5 a Survey Committee was appointed by Government, and this Committee, among other things, investigated the organisation of the Imperial and Provincial Services. The Military

officers who appeared before this Committee made unfavourable reports regarding the qualifications of the Provincial officers. The interests of the latter were not represented on the Committee, and they were not given an opportunity of defending themselves. In fact the Provincial officers were not even aware of the statements that were being made to the Committee, and realised the true state of things only on the publication of the Committee's Report. It is evident also from the same report, Vol. I, page 57 (President's dissent) and page 59, that in spite of the *ex parte* hearing, the charges were unsubstantiated, and appeared to be based on inconclusive statements. The Government, however, took the view that the Provincial Service as a body were inefficient, and its members unfit for independent responsible posts. It would be interesting to know how the Provincial Service (late junior division) the members of which were promoted to the Imperial Service (late senior division) up to 1895, and were holding responsible posts till then, could have undergone within ten years so rapid a deterioration. If true, there certainly would appear to be something "rotten in the State of Denmark." To show that the officers of the junior division were recognised as capable and efficient in 1895, I quote from the Government of India Resolution No. 6—46, dated 27th March, 1895: "The Government of India believe that these concessions will remove the legitimate grievances of the Provincial Service of the Survey Department, and in granting them they desire to endorse the opinion of the Surveyor-General as to the excellent work done by these officers in positions of considerable responsibility, and often under circumstances of great difficulty."

7. Notwithstanding the pronounced views held and given utterance to by Sir John Miller, President of the Committee, the Provincial Service was deliberately and coldbloodedly left out of the reorganisation affecting every branch of the Department and of which the Imperial branch derived the most substantial benefit; and this on the top of a written statement made by Col. Longe, Surveyor-General, to Provincial officers, whom he bound down to silence, that no branch of the Service was going to derive any pecuniary benefit. The Provincial Service was ear-marked as inefficient and left to die out by the efflux of time. The strength of the Imperial Service was increased from 40 to 55, and that of the new Provincial Service reduced to 87, Government of India Order No. 544, dated 5th April, 1910.

8. To meet the heavy increased cost of the Imperial branch the Provincial branch was sacrificed. It was not possible, without heavy expenditure, to improve the emoluments of the Indian recruited branch, and at the same time deal so generously with the Imperial branch, and it would appear that the new Provincial Service was introduced merely to give the reorganisation the semblance of equitable treatment. It would have taken over 30 years to complete the cadre of such a Service, during which time the revision survey of India would have been completed.

9. There also can absolutely be no doubt that the underlying principle in increasing the strength of the Imperial Service was that there should be at least two Military officers in each party or office, so that the Provincial officer would never have even a temporary or officiating executive charge, and be reduced to a position of absolute inferiority and subordination. That this was so, I shall quote a statement made by Colonel Longe, Surveyor-General, on 17th February, 1906, at "The Palms," Dehra, to a senior Provincial officer: "It is intended that never in future will it be possible for a Provincial officer to hold charge of a party. Nor ever again to have charge of survey operations on political missions, such as Mr. Tate has carried out. In future there will always be in every party two Imperial officers, so that there will always be an Imperial officer to spare." The statement speaks for itself.

10. The officers of the old Provincial Service in a body protested against the new scheme, and memorialised Government for a redress of their grievances. The result was the appointment of the Departmental Committee of Enquiry in 1910, presided over by Colonel Burrard. The findings of this Committee negatived the misleading statements made during the enquiries of 1904-05, and on the strength of its report the Government of India were pleased to forward another despatch to the Secretary of State practically cancelling the previous one of 1908 as far as the Provincial Service was concerned, and thereby acknowledging the injustice which had been perpetrated.

11. The results of the reorganisation of 1st March, 1912, were the amalgamation of the old and new Provincial Services, and the creation of seven additional executive charges as follows:—Three chief draftsmen of the Circle Officers to be called Executive Officers in charge Drawing Offices (this is a change merely in designation as the officers do not enjoy the privileges or exercise the functions of Executive Officers), one Cantonment Party, one Base Line Party, Simla Drawing Office, and Dehra Dun Drawing Office to be executive charges.

12. The change of designation of officers drawing Rs. 650 and over from Extra Deputy Superintendents to that of Deputy Superintendents, and the 12 senior officers drawing Rs. 600 to be styled Assistant Superintendents. The four senior officers holding executive charge to draw Rs. 200 charge allowance, and the three junior Rs. 100. The creation of a system of artificial relative ranking which has not yet been given effect to.

13. For these concessions the Service is indebted to Colonel Burrard, Surveyor-General, who recognised the justness of the grievances of the Service, and endeavoured to remedy them in the most practical way. The improved conditions, while removing some of the grievances under which the Service has been suffering for years, leave untouched the more pronounced disabilities.

14. The points I am therefore desired to lay before the Commission are these:—

(*i*) That the Imperial or Superior branch of the Service be thrown open to the Provincial branch as was the custom prior to 1895. That part of its strength be recruited at "Home" or from Military Royal Engineer Officers and part in India, from the selected officers, both European and Indian, of the Provincial branch.

ii. That there is no necessity for the large highly paid controlling staff at present in the Service, when a large portion of their duties could be discharged by officers on smaller salaries. The strength and cost of the existing Imperial Staff is out of all proportion to the needs of the Department, and its total expenditure. Even Military considerations do not necessitate the continuous service in the Department of a large number of highly paid Military officers.

iii. That suggestions put forward for the abolition of the Provincial Service are the outcome of a desire to reserve as a Military monopoly a highly paid Civil Department of the Government of India, and to secure its higher branch against recruitment from Indian sources, which would naturally lead to a reduction in its Military strength and in emoluments. Any change of this kind would be an injustice to the European and Indian communities of India, and would be a further source of discontent in the country, and require to be minutely and carefully examined by a representative Committee. Even if it be possible to adopt so unjust and drastic a change, then in place of the Provincial branch, the Imperial or superior branch be opened to recruitment in this country to the extent of two-thirds of its appointments in equal proportion between Europeans and Indians.

(*iv*) That all officers of the existing Provincial branch be classed as first class officers for purposes of travelling allowances.

(*v*) Conditions of leave.

(*vi*) That the designation "Provincial" and the prefix "Extra" are misnomers and be excised.

15. Dealing with them seriatim :—

The reasons for claiming admission to the superior branch are based on the grounds that it existed before, that it worked more harmoniously and produced good fellowship, that no such artificial bar to merit exists in the other sister Services, and that it leaves no occasion for invidious distinctions in status, official precedence and treatment.

The existing system is not liked in the Survey, and was objected to by the Surveyor-General Sir Henry Thuillier in his evidence before the last Commission. He advocated the promotion of "Junior" officers to the "Senior" branch. Colonel Burrard, the present Surveyor-General, President of the Departmental Committee of Enquiry of 1910, reported to Government in that report, as follows :—"As the question of promotion to the Imperial Service concerns many departments the Committee cannot presume to make recommendations, but they wish to point out, that in the old days of promotion to the Imperial Service both the Imperial and Provincial Officers liked the system. It necessitated stricter selection, and it promoted good feeling between the services. In the evidence before the Public Service Commission, the Surveyor-General and other senior officers of the Department, who had long experience of the system expressed a wish for its continuance. Certain advantages would ensue if the higher posts of the Provincial Service were retransferred to the Imperial, and filled by officers of the Provincial Service." With the spread of education and efficient technical training available in India, there is no just reason why this branch of the Service should be closed to the Indian branch. In the Public Works Department and the Telegraph, no such artificial bar exists. The officers are all on one cadre and the highest appointments are open to them.

"It must be obvious to unprejudiced minds that such a division does and must introduce the virtual relationship of "subordinate" to the "officer" and in no Department could it have been so emphatically introduced as in the Survey. It is one of the fundamental principles of the Liberal Government of the day, and one of the soundest guarantees of efficiency, zeal, emulation and progress in any service, that there should be no artificial bar to merit. This is in effect what has been done and is being done to the Provincial Officer to-day. To remove this bar would be to remove in the words of the Prime Minister, in his memorable speech at Birmingham, "the domination of an unjust monopoly, and to open everywhere the gate to intelligence to merit, and to energy."

It is owing to this system that it has been possible for prejudiced administrative heads to place Extra Deputy Superintendents of the Provincial branch of over 20 years' service in positions subordinate to the most junior inexperienced Imperial officer, to treat them without consideration for their rank and experience, and to regard them officially and socially as inferiors.

The introduction of any artificial system of relative ranking between officers of the two services holding similar posts will not adjust the anomalies of the existing system. Till quite recently the Provincial officer held no official relative rank alongside the Imperial officer. By Government of India Order No. 611, dated 15th February, 1913, some sort of artificial compromise has been arrived at, which is not regarded with much favour by Provincial Officers. The order has not been given effect to in the Department. The ridiculousness of the artificial rank conferred by it, has further been enhanced by the issue of Government of India Order No. 617, dated 30th June, 1913. The one contravenes the other, and adds only further indignities. To illustrate the indignities of a position created by orders of the above nature, I will narrate the case of Mr. G. P. Tate of our service.

In 1902 he was Chief Survey Officer with the Seistan Boundary Commission, and by the existence of orders of the above nature, he ranked as a second lieutenant of two years' standing—Mr. Tate was about 45 years old—although holding one of the most important posts in the Commission. The consequence was, that he was subjected to no end of indignities at the hands of the Military officers. He represented matters to Sir Henry MacMahon, who recommended to the Foreign Department, that he should rank as an attache. The matter was put up to Colonel Longe, the Surveyor-General, an officer unfavourably disposed to the Indian branch of the Department, and he opposed the recommendation. The consequence was, that Mr. Tate had to endure his subordinate position, which was made more galling, when it is known that his Public Works Department confrére ranked as a Colonel. The Public Works Department man was given a C.I.E. Mr. Tate got nothing but a small personal allowance, and retired without being given even an executive charge. He is an officer with a splendid record of frontier and transfrontier service, surpassed by few Imperial Officers of to-day, and is an author and authority on transfrontier and border history. To show that Mr. Tate was an officer not unworthy of distinction, I will quote only one of the reports on him by an officer outside the influence of survey prejudice. Major (now Sir) Henry MacMahon reporting on Mr. Tate, says :—"The moderate nature of Mr. Tate's report does not adequately describe the difficulties under which much of his work was done. It was always willingly and cheerfully done, and, as always found in the case of members of the Survey Department, carried out with an enthusiastic devotion to work. Mr. Tate gave me much valuable assistance in every way, and I cannot speak too highly of his work." Recognition of good work done by European and Anglo-Indian Provincial Officers has heretofore deserved no titles or distinctions. The work done is even slurred over in annual reports and the credit given entirely to Imperial officers. The Department must acknowledge with gratitude the great honour recently conferred on Mr. G. B. Scott, but this is the first honour so conferred, and it has come to Mr. Scott many years after his retirement. The existing division also lends itself to misrepresentations as regards the duties, efficiency, and ability of the Indian branch, and also to the want of official courtesy, sympathy and support on the part of Imperial officers. In this connection I would recommend for the consideration of the Committee the evidence taken by the Committee of 1910.

The exclusion from this branch on grounds of inefficiency is untenable. It is the argument which has been constantly and persistently advanced since the inauguration of the policy of 1895. It is the outcome of constituting one branch of the Department as an exclusive reserve for Imperial Officers, and it has been fostered by the policy of excluding wholesale, men born and bred in India from higher appointments, on inaccurately alleged grounds of defects in education and character. But the records of the Department in the past, and the actual work done by provincials now, are ample and complete refutation of these misleading statements, I attach a list showing the officers of the old "junior" branch who creditably discharged the duties of their position. The records of the Department attest to the efficiency, zeal and devotion with which their duties were carried out under far more difficult conditions than now exist.

To state that the Provincial Officer is only employed on subordinate duties is equally incorrect. The statements I have attached giving the composition of a "field division" in Southampton, and of one in India, fully explain the duties of the Provincial Officer, and show that there are no higher or more responsible technical and professional duties that can be undertaken by Imperial officers attached to parties.

Give a Provincial Officer an opening in his line of work in other departments, and under foreign Governments, and he invariably returns with a splendid record of service generously recognised and admitted. This has been the case in the past, and is so now. Mr. Newland, in 1899, at the early age of 23, undertook for the Hongkong Government, all classes of survey work, and returned with the highest approval of his work by that Government. Mr. Glass, after five or six years' service in

this Department, left and joined the Public Works Department. He has just been selected for work in Siam, on a salary of Rs. 1,200 a month, and is regarded as an expert in Public Works Department surveys for irrigation plans. Mr. Veale, of our Department, is Professor of Survey and Drawing at Roorkee, he replaced a Royal Engineer, and has proved himself a decided success. Can any one contend that there are not men of equal ability at the present moment in our service? There is no branch of the professional work of the Department in which the Provincial Officer has not his share, and as a personal workman, he outclasses his Imperial colleague. There is absolutely no difference, and there can be no difference in the duties discharged in topographical parties between Imperial and Provincial Officers. To quote from Colonel Burrard's report of 1910:—"The Committee are of opinion that as a body the Provincial officers are efficient, hard-working, and quite capable of performing their duties; and that after the necessary training and experience several of them would prove efficient executive officers. Although the education obtainable in schools in England is superior to that at present available in India, the Committee do not consider the initial advantage conferred upon Imperial Officers to be so paramount as to justify the extreme view that every Imperial Officer is qualified to hold charge of a party and that no Provincial Officer is qualified."

List of Survey Officers promoted from the "Junior Division."

Name.	Pay.	Reference to published list of Survey Officers.
	Rs.	
J. B. N. Hennessey*	2,000	1884
E. C. Barrett	1,600	1898
E. J. Jackson	1,600	1898
J. O. N. James†	1,300	1884
R. B. Smart	1,300	1881
G. H. Cooke	1,300	1894
G. B. Scott	1,300	1898
W. H. Reynolds	1,300	1897
H. Horst	1,000	1888
E. T. S. Johnson	1,000	1883
J. Campbell	1,000	1883
H. B. Talbot	1,000	1884
W. H. Patterson	1,000	1893
F. W. Kelly	1,000	1890
A. D'Souza	1,000	1892
E. F. Litchfield	850	1897
J. McGill	850	1883
C. Wood	850	1892
J. S. Pemberton	800	1898
F. Grant	800	1892
F. W. E. Atkinson	750	1898
W. G. Beverley	600	1892
J. Ogle‡...	600	1894
H. R. Littlewood‡		

* It has now become necessary to announce that the same rules have also required the retirement of a highly distinguished officer, Mr. J. B. N. Hennessey, M.A., F.R.S., selected early for his special talents, which he has since developed by study and perseverance during his service in India, and who has made a name for himself not confined to India, but known to the world of science in Europe and America, and he has, after passing through all the grades of the Department, attained the highest place but one, in which he has employed his unique experience and knowledge of scientific matters. The Department, and especially the Civil branch, may justly be proud of him.

† The Department has been deprived of the services of a very well known and respected officer, Mr. J. O. N. James, for many years the very energetic, efficient, and experienced Assistant Surveyor-General in charge of the headquarters Engraving and Drawing Offices. He has retired carrying with him the good wishes of all his brother officers of every grade.

‡ Died in Service.

16. (ii) A controlling staff of 55 highly-paid Imperial Officers is out of all proportion to the requirements of the Department, and is an unnecessary drain on the resources of the country and the Department. I doubt whether in any other service the incidence of control is so high. This unnecessary increase of officers was clearly foreseen by Sir John Farquharson, member of the Committee of 1904-05 (vol. ii, pages 42, 43). In discussing recruitment for the Imperial Branch, he said: "It would seem inevitable that, unless there is an abnormal number of casualties or retirements, there must be a larger proportion of senior men employed under a system of continuous service than are actually required." It was for this reason he advocated that Military Officers should be appointed for tours of five to seven years' service with the Department, and then be reverted. Continuing he said:—"The system of continuous service would appear of necessity to mean an excessive number of officers being employed in the senior ranks, whereas by being relieved at the end of a five years' tour the Surveyor-General would be enabled to select later on only that very limited number which would be all that he would require for carrying on the very superior and higher administrative duties of the survey." Sir John Farquharson was a Royal Engineer, for some time Director-General of Surveys in the United Kingdom an officer who throughout the enquiries of the Committee of 1904-05, exhibited an intelligence and grasp of the actual requirements of the Indian Survey Department equal to if not superior to that shown by our own officers. His proposals were also supported by Colonel Kelly, Assistant Adjutant-General, nominated by the Commander-in-Chief to watch the interests of Military requirements. The scale of pay suggested by Colonel Kelly was as follows:—

Lieutenants of 7 years' service, Rs. 515-12-0, against Rs. 570 to 720 now drawn.

Lieutenants over 7 years' service, Rs. 615-12-0, against Rs. 720 to 1,070 now drawn.

Captains under 15 years' service, Rs. 833-10-10, against Rs. 1,120 to 1,220 now drawn.

Captains over 15 years' service, Rs. 833-10-10 against Rs. 1,220 to 1,400 now drawn. In this connection I would also invite the attention of the Commission to the recommendations of the Committee of 1904-05 in Vol. I, pages 57, 58, para. 100.

Why these proposals were not adopted by the Government of India, I am unable to say. The advantages of the proposals made by Sir John Farquharson in facilitating expansion and contraction of this branch of the Service are obvious. I am not sufficiently expert to give an opinion on the feasibility of the recommendations, but anyone possessing a knowledge of the facilities that exist in the machinery of the Government of India for transferring officers without injury to the work of the department to which they belong, or detriment to their prospects, for periods of five years' duty and more with foreign Departments, could work out a scheme, and Government cannot fail to realise the practicability of it. There can be no doubt that the Committee as a body of experts were aware also of its workability. Knowing the sentiments that actuated the Surveyor-General of the time, it is impossible to advance any other reasons for the adoption of the existing system other than class interests, and the fixed intent to eliminate for ever, the members of the Indian recruited branch, from executive charges. Prior to 1904-05 there were only three administrative posts, viz., Surveyor-General, Deputy Surveyor-General and Superintendent, Trigonometrical Surveys. There was also a Superintendent of Forest Surveys, but this officer held executive charge of a field party, in addition to his duties as a Superintendent. There are now six administrative posts, viz., Surveyor-General, Superintendent, Trigonometrical Survey, three Superintendents, Topographical Surveys, and one Superintedent, Map Publication Offices. The jump from three to six in administration is abnormal. The emoluments attached to the posts of Superintendents are also high. The pay of the Surveyor-General is Rs. 3,000 and is the same as before. The salaries of the other administrative officers are as follows:—

2 Superintendents' pay Rs. 1,500 + charge allowance Rs. 750 = Rs. 2,250.

3 Superintendents' pay Rs. 1,500 + charge allowance Rs. 500 = Rs. 2,000.

In addition to the above, the Superintendent, Trigonometrical Surveys, draws an additional allowance of Rs. 100, *vide* Government of India Order No. 545, dated 5th April, 1910. Formerly the Deputy Surveyor-General's pay was Rs. 2,200, and the Superintendent, Trigonometrical Surveys, used to get an allowance of Rs. 200 in addition to the pay of his grade. If he was a Superintendent, 1st grade (old organisation), his pay as Superintendent, Trigonometrical Surveys, could not exceed Rs. 1,600 + Rs. 200 = Rs. 1,800. The difference between these salaries and those drawn now is obvious. The duties of the Superintendent, Trigonometrical Surveys, cannot be said to be more onerous now than they were before. Those of the other four Superintendents are considerably less than those of the old Deputy Surveyor-General, who used to supervise nearly half the number of the Topographical parties in the Department.

There are also 21 executive charges, each with a charge allowance of Rs. 200. The introduction of the system of charge allowances is quite a novel innovation, and peculiar to this Department only. The *raison d'etre* of an officer is to hold charge, and to give him a special allowance for doing so, seems to say the least of it, anomalous.

Under Resolution No. 63—82E., dated Calcutta, 18th January, 1911, it has been ruled that all future Royal Engineer entrants into the Public Works Department after 11th December, 1910, " shall draw pay under the Civil scale in accordance with the rules laid down in the Public Works Department Resolution No. 675-694E., dated 24th April, 1908." The old practice of paying the Royal Engineer officer Military Staff pay in addition to Departmental pay has been abolished, and he gets the same pay as the Civilian Officer that is in the Public Works Department. The Royal Engineer Officer no longer enjoys any superior advantages in the matter of pay, and as an Executive Engineer of 20 years' service he cannot draw more than Rs. 1,250 a month, as against Rs. 1,500 plus charge allowances in the Survey of India. There appears to be no valid reason why the Royal Engineer officer joining the Survey of India should have better prospects than on joining the Public Works Department. Again, the Royal Engineer officer entering the Survey of India, say, in his fifth year, starts with an initial salary of Rs. 370, plus increments of Rs. 50, counting from date of first commission, that is, he would receive Rs. 620. In the Public Works Department first year of service is reckoned to commence $2\frac{1}{2}$ years from date of first commission with increments of Rs. 40, so that an officer with five years' commissioned service to his credit would start with increments of Rs. 40 on a salary of about Rs. 500; in his 11th year as Executive Engineer he draws Rs. 800, in his 15th year Rs. 1,000, and in his 20th year Rs. 1,250. The comparison speaks for itself.

I append two statements showing the strength of this branch of the Service since 1887, and the cost prior to 1904-05, and the cost in 1912. Two points stand out prominently in these tables—one the increase in strength, the other in cost. It will be observed also, that while the total number of administrative and executive posts were as high as 27 and 29, the Military strength did not exceed 37 officers, and no one can contend that in the present day there is a greater demand for officers for military expeditions, etc., in fact, there may be said to be hardly any, compared with past years, and judging by events and the reconnaissance on the north-east frontier there will be less in the future. In the Headquarters Drawing Offices in Calcutta prior to 1905, one officer, styled an Assistant Surveyor-General on Rs. 1,482-100 a month, carried out practically the same duties discharged by two officers now, amounting to Rs. 3,470 a month.

I attach also a list showing the distribution of officers on 1st July, 1913. There are so many in the Department now that it is difficult to find means of employing them, and expedients of attaching two and three to a party have to be resorted to. Last year there were three Imperial Officers in this party at a cost of Rs. 2,500 a month. At present we have an Imperial Officer on Rs. 970 a month instructing half a dozen Upper Subordinates. I believe he is to get a charge allowance as well. There is a training school at Bangalore sanctioned by Government with an allowance of Rs. 100 towards the Instructor's salary. The officer in charge is a most efficient officer on Rs. 500 a month with years of experience, so that we are now spending Rs. 1,500 a month on instruction, to say nothing of extras. When the training school was in Dehra a Provincial Officer on Rs. 400—500 a month was in charge of the school, and in this school all officers, Imperial and Provincial, and lower subordinates, went through their training. On the recommendations of the Committee of 1904-05, three training schools were started, one at each Circle headquarters, and were in charge of Provincial Officers, each drawing a charge allowance of Rs. 100. The Government of India in their orders on the reorganisation of the Provincial Service in 1913, directed that two of these schools should be closed as further recruitment for the Provincial Service had stopped, and one of them retained, in which all Upper Subordinates and Lower Subordinates should be trained, so that there is no necessity for the present innovation and expenditure, and if the necessity had arisen the billet should have gone to the Provincial Service. The present arrangement shows that the Imperial Service is in excess.

Statement showing strength of Department from 1887-1913.

	Administrative posts.	Ex. charges of field parties.	Ex. charges of offices.	Total.	*Senior Division or Imperial Service.*		Junior Division or Provincial Service.
					Military.	Civil.	
In 1887	(*a*) 3	21	3	27	37	12	133
Just before creation of Imperial and Provincial Services in 1895 ...	(*b*) 4	20	3	27	37	13	132
At the time of the Committee of 1904-05	(*c*) 3	23	3	29	37	5	157
1st July, 1913	(*d*) 6	20	8	34	55	...	139

(*a*) 1 Surveyor-General.
1 Deputy Surveyor-General, Topo.
1 ,, ,, ,, Revenue

(*b*) 1 Surveyor-General.
1 Deputy Surveyor-General, Topo.
1 ,, ,, ,, Trigonometrical.
(Who was also administrative officer for a certain number of topographical parties).
1 Director, Bengal Surveys.

(*c*) 1 Surveyor-General.
1 Deputy Surveyor-General, Topo.
1 Superintendent, Trigonometrical Surveys.

(*d*) 1 Surveyor-General.
1 Superintendent, Trigonometrical Surveys.
1 ,, *Map Publication Offices.*
3 ,, *Topographical (four parties each).*

Note.—Seven of the executive charges are reserved for Provincial officers. Three of these are charges in name only. These seven have been created since 1st March, 1913, so that the increase in administrative posts was made for a strength of 21 executive charges against 27 and 29 previously.

Statement showing cost of Imperial Staff.

In 1905.			In 1912.		
	Rs. A. P.			Rs. A. P.
1 Surveyor-General	3,000 0 0		1 Surveyor-General	3,000 0 0
1 Deputy Surveyor-General	2,200 0 0		1 Senior Superintendent	2,250 0 0
1 Superintendent Trigonometrical ...	1,800 0 0		1 „ „ Trigonometrical	2,350 0 0
3 Superintendents, 1st grade @ Rs. 1,600	4,800 0 0		3 Topographical Superintendents ...	6,000 0 0
6 „ 2nd „ „ 1,300	7,800 0 0		21 Deputy „ ...	30,510 0 0
7 Deputy Supdts. 1st „ „ 1,000	7,000 0 0		28 Assistant „ ...	22,360 0 0
7 „ „ 2nd „ „ 850	5,950 0 0			
7 Assistant „ 1st „ „ 600	4,200 0 0			
8 „ „ 2nd „ „ 500	4,000 0 0			
Total ...	40,750 0 0			
Add military pay ...	3,600 0 0		Total ...	66,470 0 0
Officiating allowances ...	2,400 0 0		1 Mathematical adviser	1,000 0 0
Total ...	46,750 0 0		Total ...	67,470 0 0
Total cost per year ...	5,61,000 0 0		Total cost per year ...	8,09,640 0 0

Note.—The incumbents of the above appointments are entitled to Rs. 50 annual increment, so the cost of this branch of the Service must continue to show a progressive increase of about Rs. 20,000 a year.

Disposition list of the 55 Imperial Officers of 1st July, 1913.

Surveyor-General	1
Administrative Superintendents	5
Incharge, Topographical Parties	11
„ Trigonometrical „	5
„ Drawing Offices	3
„ Calcutta Headquarters Offices ...	2
Attached Topographical Parties and Offices	6
„ Trig. Parties	1
„ Calcutta Offices	1
Abor Expedition	3
Under training	2
On leave	12
Vacancies	3
Total ...	55

The argument that such a large and well-paid controlling staff is necessary, owing to the inability of the Provincial officer to discharge higher and more responsible duties, is untenable. A list of officers of the Indian branch, who discharged executive duties under far more trying circumstances than attend present-day surveys has been submitted. The Committee of 1904-05, in spite of its being a one-sided one, clearly stated in its report, Vol. I., pages 57, 59, that sufficient opportunities had not been given for holding such posts to the Provincial Service officers, and that their inefficiency had not been proved. The Departmental Committee of 1910 has also upheld the view that selected officers would be quite fit for such duties. Only four officers have been in independent executive charge since 1st March, 1913; one of them for some time prior to this date. There is no reason to say their work is inefficient. The statement before the Commission, that from reports their work was not as good as Imperial Officers is incorrect, and I must question the accuracy and veracity of the reports made. I am one of the executive officers myself. The work done by my party is in no way inferior to that done by the others. When the work of this party was examined on the 26th August, 1913, by the Surveyor-General, Colonel Renny-Tailyour, he expressed himself greatly pleased, and congratulated me on the quality of the work of the party. This opinion was endorsed by Major Robertson, Officiating Superintendent. It has been the rule for Surveyors-General at their annual inspection of parties to submit officially a report on the result of their inspections. Why this was not done this year I cannot say. The other officers, Mr. Ewing, Mr. Shaw and Khan Bahadur Aulad Husain are thoroughly efficient. It is not difficult to see that the eligibility of Provincial officers to executive charges does not find favour with the bulk of Imperial officers. And it is perhaps not wrong to state, that if Colonel Burrard were not returning to duty, efforts would be made to subvert his policy, and to pronounce the Provincial officer a failure as an executive officer. The Provincial officer cannot by any means flatter himself that his position is made easy for him. On the contrary it is just the other way, and his is no easy task, placed as he is, in a branch of the Service which has come to be regarded as inferior, and the interests and aspirations of which conflict with the superior, and make him feel that his executive position is merely being tolerated by officers who would wish it otherwise. During the months I have been in charge of this party, I have lived in a state of constant concern and anxiety, knowing the feelings that exist against my Service. Is not such a position most difficult? And is this not a severe handicap?

I am therefore desired to put up for the consideration of the Commission the following proposals for the composition of the Department. Accepting the existing number of administrative and executive posts to be necessary for the efficiency of the Service, viz., six Administrative and 28 Executive, it is proposed:—

(i) That five Administrative posts and 18 Executive be allotted to Imperial officers, and one Administrative post, and ten Executive to the Indian recruited branch.

(ii) That the salaries for the Imperial branch be recast on the following lines:—

	Rs.
Surveyor-General	3,000
Superintendent, Trigonometrical Surveys ...	2,000
Senior Superintendent	1,800
Two Junior Superintendents	1,750

One Superintendent, Provincial Service, Rs. 1,500.

Twenty-eight Executive posts to be divided between Imperial officers and qualified selected officers transferred from the Provincial Service. The pay of the former to be limited to Rs. 1,500, the pay of the latter to Rs. 1,250. The two classes of officers to be on the same cadre, and to rise by annual increments of Rs. 50. All charge allowances to be abolished. The first term of Service with the Department of all Military officers to be limited to a tour of from five to seven years. During this tour his salary to be regulated according to the scale proposed by Colonel Kelly and already given on page 292, and on his being permanently appointed to the Department to receive the scale of pay in force. His pay for purposes of increment being calculated from the date of his first term of service with the Department. The Junior Service to rise by annual increments of Rs. 20 for the first 10 years and Rs. 25 thereafter to Rs. 700. Officers of this Division to be eligible for transfer to the Senior Division after 15 years' service, that is, when in receipt of pay between Rs. 550 and Rs. 700. Officers so promoted to carry forward all but eight

years' service, to count for position in the Senior Division. Confirmed Deputy Superintendents of the present Provincial Service to rank next to the 21st Deputy Superintendent in the Imperial Service.

When a party officer of the Senior Division, if he is one who has been promoted from the Junior Division, goes on leave, an officer of the Junior Division should officiate for him. The officer so officiating to draw an officiating allowance of Rs. 100 a month, in addition to the emoluments he may be in receipt of when taking up the officiating appointment.

The existing non-executive responsible posts in the Provincial Service to be retained for the benefit of the Junior Division. That is, the Chief Draftsman, headquarters, with an allowance of Rs. 150; the Head Draftsman, with an allowance of Rs. 120; the Chief Draftsman, Forest Map Office, Bengal Drawing Office, and Instructor, Training School, each to receive an allowance of Rs. 100, all these allowances to count towards leave and pension. The designation of Chief Draftsman, Headquarters Office, to be changed to Personal Assistant to the Superintendent, Map Publication Office, and the Head Draftsman to be called the Chief Draftsman.

All officers of the Senior Division from whatever source recruited to be under European rules for leave and pension.

I and all the other officers of the Service strongly advocate the institution of a Pension Fund for the widows and children of Indian recruited services, similar to that for Civilians and Army Officers.

The institution of such a Fund would be an immense boon to the officers of this country. The idea might be recommended to the Finance Department and details worked out by them. Any officer willing to pay into the Fund by monthly instalments, the sum, or certain proportion of the sum, he would have paid from first year of service or from date of marriage, should be considered eligible to the benefits of the Fund. It should be confined to the superior Indian recruited services. Such a Fund would be a great advance on the Provident Fund lately started. Accumulations in the Provident Fund can be drawn on certain conditions, and is really not a certain and sure provision against the accident of death.

That the cadre of the Junior Division be increased, and the Upper Subordinate Service be abolished. There is absolutely no necessity for this branch of the department, and it is an unnecessary expense. The arguments originally advanced in support of the introduction of this branch were to reduce the amount of supervision required by increasing the efficiency of the men employed on actual work, and so lead to economy. It was argued that the employment of a higher class of Surveyor would enable a considerable reduction to be made in the number of subordinates and attendants employed, and that the upper subordinate would be employed on tertiary triangulation, minor levelling, and the more difficult classes of topographical work. The present policy of the Department would appear to be in direct contradiction to the above statements. As far as my experience of this class of officer goes, he will be neither one thing nor the other.

What is essentially required in the Department is a better class of Surveyor, intelligent, with some education, especially in drawing, and a working knowledge of English. This is badly and sadly needed in the department instead of expensive and unnecessary innovations. The pay of this branch should be from Rs. 30 to Rs. 250 by increments of Rs. 5 and 10. At present we engage men on Rs. 10 who do not even know how to hold a pen. They take years of training, get to a certain degree of skill, then drop off and show no further improvement. It is after all a short-sighted policy, for the better class of man would be equal to two or three of the kind entertained at present. The Art schools of India can provide ample good material, but of course they will not come for the salaries offered, and the department, on account of its expensive controlling staff, cannot afford to be lavish.

For a service constituted on the above lines the number of Military officers required would be—

Administrative posts	5
Executive charges	18
Under training from Military Works Service	5
Leave reserve (under training)	6
Total ...	34

All the above to be Royal Engineers, those doing their first tour with the Department to be junior captains and senior and junior lieutenants.

At the same time there does not appear to be a necessity for so many administrative posts in a small department like the Survey. The number and the emoluments attached to these appear to be excessive.

In the Public Works Department the Superintending Engineer class has three grades of Rs. 1,500, Rs. 1,750 and Rs. 2,000, and the Superintendents in the Survey of India are graded from Rs. 2,000 to Rs. 2,350, and it has, moreover, to be remembered that most of the survey work now in hand is revision survey, and there is little new survey to be done. Survey work, if anything, is comparatively easier now than in years past, when ground was being broken for the first time, the means of communication few, and arrangements on a large scale necessary.

The number of administrative posts that would appear to be essential to the Department without impairing efficiency is four—one Surveyor-General, one Superintendent, Trigonometrical Survey, one Superintendent, Topographical, one Superintendent, Map Publication.

Sir John Farquharson, in his evidence before the Committee of 1904-5, strongly and ably opposed the formation of any such division of India into circles for Survey work, Vol. I. page 129, Vol. II., page 46, paragraphs 32, 33, 34.

The number of Executive charges could also be reduced. The work of the Base Line party which has just been created could be well conducted by the Executive officer of the Triangulation party. It has always been part of his work. This officer does no triangulation personally now, all the triangulation being done by Provincial officers. The Pendulum and Astronomical parties consist of an Imperial officer and an Assistant each. Each officer draws Rs. 200 charge allowance. These parties could be combined. With such changes, and constituted on the lines proposed, the cost of the Department could be considerably reduced.

Whatever be the final recommendations of the Commission, I am desired to ask, that in fairness to officers recruited in India, a fair proportion of the appointments in the Imperial branch be allotted to them as was the case prior to 1895. That with a view to the introduction of such a policy, further recruitment from Military sources be stopped, and the existing Executive appointments in the Provincial branch be transferred to the Imperial cadre. All Deputy Superintendents, Provincial, ranking above Assistant Superintendents, Imperial.

Another reason advanced for so large a Military staff is the necessity for having a Military reserve for Military expeditions. The argument does not bear analysis. The system of recruitment proposed by Sir John Farquharson would have secured, in an ample measure, the required reserve, and the country saved the expense of maintaining in continuous service 28 Assistant Superintendents on exorbitant salaries. Are not Provincial Officers also available for Military expeditions? Have they not been on Military expeditions before in Afghanistan, Tirah, Waziristan, Baluchistan, Burma, Lushai, and distinguished themselves. I need only quote such names as Johnson, Scott, McNair, Claudius, Wainright, Stotesbury, Tate, Kennedy, among others. It is an injustice that this door to distinction should be closed to the Indian recruited branch as has now been done.

I attach a list of officers of the Junior branch, who, prior to 1905, were on Military duty and on Political Missions.

Statement showing brief history of war and trans-frontier services rendered by the members of the Provincial Service (old Junior Division) of the Survey of India.

War and Trans-frontier Services.

1. W. H. Patterson—
Mutiny, 1857-58, served against Murree Rebels—Medal.

2. E. C. Ryall—
Mutiny, 1857-58, served against Murree Rebels—Medal.

3. E. C. Barrett—
Lushai Expeditionary Force, 1871-72—Medal and Clasp and thanks of Government.

4. G. H. Cooke—
Lushai Expeditionary Force, 1871-72—Medal and Clasp and thanks of Government.

5. W. H. Reynolds—
1863, Umbeyla Expedition—Medal and two Clasps.

6. G. B. Scott—
1867-68, Black Mountain Expedition, Medal and Clasp and presented with a sword for gallantry.
1869, Reconnoitered independent tracts of Chilas and Kohistan.
1870, Reconnoitered country round Peshawar fired by Hassan Khel.
1871, Reconnoitered Bhutan Hills.
1877, Jowaki-Afridi Expedition—Thanks of Commander-in-Chief.
1878-79, Khyber column, Afghanistan—Medal and Clasp. Granted personal allowance of Rs. 100 and special grant of Rs. 1,000. Recommended for direct Captaincy by Government which was disallowed by War Office.
1879-80, Second Afghan campaign and thanks of Government.
1884, Zhob Valley Expedition—Thanks of Government.

7. M. J. Ogle—
1871-72, Lushai Expeditionary Force—Medal and Clasp and thanks of Government.
1874-75, Dafla Field Force.
1879-80, Second Afghan Campaign—Medal.
1883-84, Akha Hills Field Force.
1886-87, Kubbo Valley and Upper Burma Field Force—Clasp.
1888-89, Mogoung Field Force.
1889, Presented by Royal Geographical Society with the Gill Memoriai.

8. W. MacNair—
1879-80, Afghan War.
1883, Explorations in Kafiristan in disguise—Awarded Murchison grant by R. G. Society.

9. Yusuf Sharif, K.B.—
1881-82, Jowaki-Afridi country survey—Thanks of Government.
1883, Takht-i-Suleman Expedition and Gomal and Khajuri Kach Pass—Special thanks.
1884, Zhob Valley Expedition—Mentioned in despatches.
1884-85, Gomal to Ekbai. Special Survey through Isot Khosa, Mizir Bozdar and Musakhel tribes.
1887-88, Russo-Afghan Boundary Commission. Title of K. B. and Khilat of Rs. 3,000. Explored and mapped Bakhtiari country in Persia. Thanks of Government Triangulated and mapped 68,000 square miles in Persia, awarded Murchison grant of R. G. Society. For special work in military interests received a reward of Rs. 500 by Lord Roberts, Commander-in-Chief.

10. Ahmad Ali Khan, K.B.—
1878-79, Afghan War to 1879-80.
1884-85, Kishanganga Valley and Gilgit Survey.
1885-86, Exploration from Nushki to Afghanistan.
1888-89, Exploration, Kharan to Ladis, Persian Baluchistan.
1889-90, Gilgit Mission Frontier Survey.
1890-91, Exploration, Panjgir to Sistan in Persia.
Exploration, Persian Sistan to Kharan.
1892-93, Exploration from Gwadar to Bampur (Persian Baluchistan) and North of Persian Gulf.
1895-96, Perso-Baluch Boundary Commission, —Title of K. B. and special reward of Rs. 500 from Commander-in-Chief.
1897, Tirah Expeditionary Force.

11. Iman Sharif, K.B.—
1880, Afghan Campaign, Siege of Kandahar —Medal.
1884-86, Russo-Afghan Boundary Commission—Title of K.B. and reward of Rs. 500.
1888, Hazara Field Force—Mentioned in despatches.
1890-91, Explored Bakhtiari country and Kurmi river in Persia—Thanks and reward of Rs. 500.
1892, Anglo-German Boundary Commission in Africa—Reward of Rs. 950 from Secretary of State. Barometer from R. G. Society and Gold Medal.
Kankabai-Durri from Sultan of Zanzibar.
1893-94, Exploration in Arabia in interest of R. G. Society.
1897, Deputed for Survey of Zanzibar.
1898, Employed on demarcation of boundary in East Africa.

12. Hira Singh, K.B.—
1879, Afghan Campaign.
1881, Waziri Survey Expedition.
1883, Takht-i-Suliman Survey Expedition.
1889-90, Survey operations during Zhob and Gomal Expeditions.
1892, Khajuri Kach Field Force.
1895, Waziri Field Force.
1895, Chitral Relief Field Force.
1897, Tirah Expeditionary Force.

13. G. P. Tate—
1893-94, In charge Aden Survey detachment; favourably noticed by Government.
1895, Baluch.-Afghan Boundary Commission.
1899, In charge, Hong-Kong Survey.
1902, In charge, Siestan Mission Survey detachment; twice rewarded with honoraria of Rs. 500 and Rs. 1,000 respectively, for special literary works on transfrontier.

14. J. M. Kennedy—
1886-87, Expedition to Ruby mines.
1887-88, Yaw Expedition.
1889-90, First Chin Expedition.
1890-91, In charge, Survey, Kaington-Cheinganai Mission.
1891-92, Hukong Valley Expedition.
1892-93, Assisted in suppressing rising in N. Shan States—Received Burma Medal and Gold watch and chain.

15. T. E. M. Claudius—
1879, Siege of Sherpur—Medal and Clasp.
Survey from Gandomak to Chardeh Valley.
1880, Mapped the whole of Afridi-Tirah in disguise.
1887, Triangulated 1st class series from N. of Kalat to Gandpahar.
1891, Triangulated through Mekran on to the Persian border.

16. R. Waller-Senior—
1879, Southern Afghan Field Force.
1893, Awarded Murchison grant by R. G. Society for Explorations and Surveys in Glacier regions of Kulu and Lahaul.

17. C. George—
1889-92, Upper Burma and Clasp.
1891, Defence of Kawlin (Upper Burma) and was awarded medal for "Distinguished conduct in the Field."
1895, Chitral Relief Force—Medal and Clasp.

18. Ikbal-un-din, K.S.—
1897-99, Served as Survey officer with Burma-China Boundary Commission.
1900, Served as Survey officer with China Expedition Force—Title of K.S.

19. Abdur Rahim, K.B.—
1889-90, Anglo-Siamese Boundary Commission.
1890-91, Kengtung-Chungonai Mission.
1892-93, Siam Boundary Delimitation.
1894-95, Anglo-French Mekong Boundary Commission.
1900-01, China Expeditionary Force—Medal and title of K. B.

20. W. Stotesbury—
1889-90, Chin-Lushai Expedition—Medal and Clasp.

21. E. A. Wainright—
Triangulated 40,000 square miles in S.E. Persia.
1897, Survey officer with Tirah Expeditionary Force—Medal and Clasp.

22. Asmatulla Khan, K.S.—
1895-96, Pilla Boundary Commission.
1897-98, Malakand Field Force—Medal and Clasp.

23. P. J. Doran—
1892, Anglo-Siamese Boundary Commission.

24. W. M. Kelly—
1892, Anglo-Siamese Boundary Commission.

25. H. G. Shaw—
1892, Anglo-Siamese Boundary Commission.

---

17. (iii) The proposal that a cheaper and more efficient agency for the duties of the Provincial officer could be had in the non-commissioned officer, has its origin in the fact of the latter being employed at Southampton, and chiefly in the reasons already given under this head in the beginning of my memoranda. I submit two statements giving the duties of the Superintendents and Examiners in Southampton, who are usually non-commissioned officers, and those discharged by Provincial officers in Topographical and Trigonometrical parties and Drawing offices of the Survey of India.

Ordnance Survey.

Composition of a "Field Division" taken from Vol. II., pages 44-45, Committee's Report, 1904-05.

One Royal Engineer who is Division or Executive officer.

One Division Sergeant, in charge of accounts, correspondence and office generally.

Four Superintendents with 28 chain Surveyors.

Four Superintendents with 15 Field Examiners.

One Superintendent with 18 Plotters or Tracers.

One Superintendent with 15 Draftsmen.

Thirty-two chainmen.

The surveys done by such a Division are Cadastral (such as are carried out by Revenue parties and now by Local Governments under the executive control of Provincial Officers as Division Officers and entirely Indian agency).

The Division officer receives from the Trigonometrical branch the length of the sides of the triangles as computed, together with a chart showing the positions of the trigonometrical stations. These are sent out to the Superintendents in charge of seven chainmen each. On the stations being identified the posts are restored, and the chain surveyors rechain the sides of the triangles and have to continue to do so until the measurements come within two links in 1,000 of the calculated distance. (It is evident that these triangles must be extremely small and correspond to the size of triangles and squares laid out by Patwaries in this country for settlement surveys.) They similarly measure all interior lines within the triangle which must be made to fit into the triangle according to calculated dimensions. The chain surveyors then take offsets (measurements) entering them in their field-books, to all fences, streams, roads, houses, etc., that fall within the triangle. The field-books are then sent into the party office where the details are plotted on to a plan. When the plan, two feet by three feet, has been filled up by the various triangles, it is divided into six sections, and all detail in each traced in colours. These traces are then sent out to the superintendents in charge of four field examiners each. They check all the details, classify the roads, and collect local information. The completed traces are then sent into the office where the draftsmen pen in ink all details shown on to the plotted plans. The stampers and typers stamp all trees, etc., and type in the names. The Executive or Division Officer then takes the finished plan to the ground and checks it thoroughly. The plan is then signed and sent on to the levelling officer, who, after inserting the levels, sends the plan on to Southampton for reproduction.

Composition of No. 3 Topographical party, Survey of India, employed on Revision Survey.

One Executive Officer—Provincial in this case.

Two Clerks (Indians—one correspondence, the other accounts).

Seven Provincial Officers—one under training.

Two Upper Subordinates under training.

50 Plane-table Surveyors, including nine soldier Surveyors under training, three quite new to the work, and ten 3rd class pupil Surveyors under training.

Two Draftsmen and plotters.

Eight Traversers or Chain and Theodolite Surveyors.

Two Computers.

450 Labourers.

The programme of work for this party to be surveyed in six months, embraces 768 square miles in the Simla district, difficult hilly country, full of detail varying in elevation from 2,000 feet to 9,000 feet; 1,536 square miles in the Dehra Dún district, most difficult and intricate ground, consisting of the Siwaliks covered with heavy forest, the Dún valley, and the hill Sanitarium of Mussoorie. Elevation 2,000 feet to 7,000 feet; 3,840 square miles in the districts of Saharanpur, Muzaffarnagar and Meerut, flat, with average of detail; and if possible 1,536 square miles in Bijnor district, also 1,500 square miles of traversing in advance for next season's work.

To carry out this programme it is evident that the Executive officer, who is responsible for all correspondence and accounts as well, can only direct, control and exercise a general supervision over the whole work, checking personally, only as much as time will permit of, and he is entirely dependent on his assistants for the efficiency and accuracy of the survey.

For the completion of this work the party has been divided into five topographical camps and one traverse camp. The area allotted to each topographical camp is approximately 1,280 square miles, with a staff of ten surveyors.

Each camp officer, after receiving detailed orders from the Executive Officer concerning the execution of the work, is entirely responsible for the management of his section. He apportions the work amongst his staff, and collects all available data, projects and plots these on to his field plan boards, and transfers all existing material from the old maps, and generally completes the plan. He then takes over the instruments, stores, camp equipment and money advances required for himself and his staff, and moves out into his ground, leaving the older hands to begin by themselves; he takes in hand the pupils and novices who require instruction and training. By the time he finishes with these, the others require looking up, and ever after he is constantly moving among his men, examining their work, instructing, surveying difficult bits of ground himself, and checking the delineation of the features shown by the surveyor. He is directly responsible for the accurate survey of the area allotted him. The collection of local information, the correct spelling of all names on the field plan. He has also to attend to the

monthly bills and returns of the section, correspondence, arrangements for conveyance and provisions. In short he is an Executive officer on a small scale.

In Recess the Provincial Officers, under the direction of the Executive Officer, supervise and control the mapping of the country surveyed during the field season, and are directly responsible for its accuracy and correct drawing, and they finally examine the work in detail against the field sheets.

The officer in charge of the traverse camp is responsible for the control and supervision of the work of his chain surveyors and its mathematical calculations. All officers must also be conversant with all the mathematical calculations in use in a Topographical party. The above constitute the chief duties of an assistant attached to a Topographical party, whether he be Imperial or Provincial, employed on the frontier or in India, and there are no other higher or more responsible duties he can be employed on.

Trigonometrical parties, No. 5 Triangulation.

Executive Officer—Royal Engineer.
Assistant—Royal Engineer.
Eight Provincial Officers.

Lieutenants Mason, R.E., Mr. Collins, and Mr. McInnes, on the triangulation connecting the Indian work with the Russian in the Pamirs. Forty trigonometrical stations were fixed, of these nine were observed at by Lieut. Mason and 31 by the Provincial Officers, whose work was as good, if not better, and who were responsible for almost all the reconnaissance connected with the laying out of the triangulation. Mr. Tresham is senior Provincial Officer on Principal Triangulation. This is the most important work in the survey, as on it all other calculations depend. This work was formerly done by Imperial Officers. Mr. Tresham draws Rs. 300 a month, his results surpass all others. Below is shown a comparative statement. The other Provincial Officers are employed on secondary and minor triangulation.

Comparative Statement of principal Triangulation.

Observer.	*Number of Stations.* Observed at	Newly fixed.	Built.	Number of Astronomical Azimuth observed.	Length of Series in miles.	Area in square miles.	Triangular error.	Number of triangles.
							Seconds	
Imperial Officer ...	10	6	7	2	107	2,375	0·35	13
Ditto ...	8	6	11	1	100	3,500	0·41	9
Ditto ...	7	4	Nil	1	50	1,900	0·60	7
Provincial Officer ...	17	15	5	3	261	6.580	0·303	24
Imperial Officer ...	9	4	Nil	1	112	2,900	0·381	8
Ditto ...	8	4	5	1	80	1,760	0·875	10
Ditto ...	5	4	6	1	74	2,200	0·753	9
Provinical Officer ...	17	15	17	2	167	5,014	0·185	22

No. 17 party—Levelling.

Entirely Provincial, both control and working staff.

This is precise levelling and constitutes the basis for trigonometrical heights.

Tidal party—entirely Provincial.

In the Magnetic party all the observations, with the exception of some repeat stations, are taken by Provincial Officers, who also ably assist the Imperial Officer in the mathematical calculations. Two of the Indian Officers being particularly good.

In the Drawing offices, the compilation of Degree sheets, 1,000,000th sheets, and other small scale maps that the Department produces is done by Provincial Officers, under the direction of the Executive Officer, and they also directly supervise the fair mapping of all these. It will be seen from the above that the Provincial Officer is by no means employed on subordinate duties, and has great responsibility, and that his duties are not below those discharged by the Imperial Officer. If the above duties are considered subordinate, those of the Imperial assistant are also subordinate, for there are no other duties he can be employed on until he becomes an Executive Officer, when he has greater responsibilities, and is responsible for the direction of the work of the party and its general efficiency. Of course, the purely scientific work is quite apart from the duties connected with topographical survey work, and needs the direction of a specialist like Colonel Burrard. But all Royal Engineers are not scientists, they are specially trained in the Department for such work, and their scientific attainments are acquired after joining the service. The more abstruse calculations connected with such work being under the direction of the mathematical expert.

Is it right, that men carrying out such useful duties as those of the Provincial Officer in the Department, and whose services can be even better and further utilised, should be sacrificed or penalised, because of their aspirations and ambitions, so as to justify the maintenance of a highly paid controlling staff.

It is evidence of prejudice to contend that the employment of non-commissioned officers would secure greater efficiency. Sir John Farquharson, giving evidence before the Committee of 1904-05, clearly stated, that the men of the Companies of Royal Engineers, and the civilians were of the artisan classes, and were trained for their duties, which, from the statement given, will be seen to be purely mechanical and nothing like the duties discharged by the Provincial Officer. Two men of this class were imported in 1909, one was drawing at Southampton, 26 shillings a week, and the other, a Corporal of Royal Engineers, something more. They were supposed to be two of the best, we paid them respectively Rs. 400 and 450 a month. One was a typer, another an outliner. They introduced the methods of typing and outlining in use at Southampton. It is strange that this could not have been introduced by any of the many Royal Engineers in the service, who are constantly on leave, and have the run of the offices at Southampton. The imported hands had no educational qualifications, nor had they any artistic talent. They had just specialised in these two classes of work. Their standard of typing and outlining is equalled, if not surpassed, by Indian draughtsmen in Calcutta on Rs. 60 a month. One of them typed a sheet in the Northern Circle, which, when sent to the Headquarters Office, was found to be so bad that two Indian draughtsmen were employed to touch it up before it could be sent to press.

Cadastral work of the kind done at Southampton is carried out entirely by Provincial Officers. The off-set and chain measurement work is done by Indian agency at small cost. Capt. Gwyn has just been appointed Assistant Director of such surveys in Assam on Rs. 1,300 a month. He has five years' service, of which two have been spent on cadastral work. Can it be honestly said that he is qualified? He will have a good efficient staff

of Provincial Officers under him, who will make his task easy. This post, previous to its being abolished, was held by Mr. Shaw, a most efficient officer, who received Rs. 800 a month. Mr. Shaw, after retirement, has been re-employed as personal assistant to the Director, Bengal Surveys. These posts, assistant directors, under Local Governments, should rightly be held by Provincial Officers transferred to Local Governments.

The true and real reason for wishing to abolish the Provincial branch is that already given. Once the department is thoroughly militarised, military discipline will bar the way to the superior grade, and at once constitute it a reserve for a particular class. That the suggestion is actuated by no other interests than those for greater efficiency can hardly be accepted as correct.

The Commission of 1904-05, reported that for the duties required of a Provincial Officer it was necessary to recruit men of even higher educational qualifications than those (said to be) possessed by the officers in the department. The Government of India, on these misrepresentations, in their Despatch to the Secretary of State, excluded the existing incumbents from the benefits of the reorganisation, justifying the exclusion on the report

The Committee recommended that the educational standard should be the examination for entrance into the Roorkee Engineering College. It is certain no non-commissioned officer could pass this test. This test was never adopted, and the private departmental test continued. The fact is, that now that executive appointments are open to Provincial Officers, and it is evident that, given a fair chance and cordial support, they will succeed, the question must naturally arise, from the point of view of economy, if of no other, whether the Government would be justified in retaining men on Rs. 1,000—1,700 a month, for duties that can be discharged by others on Rs. 700—1,250. From a financial and a business point of view it is right and just that an employer should obtain his labour in the cheapest market, and if a high class of technical labour can be obtained in a cheap market, it is but right that this course should be adopted. That the Survey parties can be run efficiently at a less cost is obvious, especially now, when the work is chiefly, if not wholly, revision, and is done on no more scientific lines than formerly.

It would be an injustice, therefore, on the grounds alleged to abolish the superior Indian recruited branch of this service. When there are men in the country capable of discharging the duties of the department on smaller salaries, it would be unfair to sacrifice them, and maintain the higher branch of the service as a closed reserve. For nearly a century the domiciled, and latterly the Indian communities have enjoyed the honour and privilege of being connected with the department. Their fathers and forefathers having left behind them a glorious record of work carried out under most trying and difficult circumstances, with a zeal and devotion to duty unsurpassed in the present day, and now these communities are to be wiped off the records of the department for a class that has no connection with it, or claims on a civil department, and to suit the convenience of a particular class. If such a drastic contingency is contemplated, then it would be only fair to open the Imperial branch to recruitment in this country, the same as the Finance, Accounts, Traffic and Postal. A civil department paid for from civil funds should not exist for the benefit of the Military officer. Such a measure would be against the professed policy of the British Government, and endorsed by the last commission, that is, that the Government of India should keep in view the policy of training in India men qualified to take charge of the higher appointments, so as to avoid as far as possible the necessity for expanding the Imperial cadre. If there is to be no Provincial branch then two-thirds of the strength of this branch of the Department should be recruited in India in equal proportion between Europeans and Indians. The Survey is a Civil Department, are there is really little or no justification for the large military element in it. Even the argument "military considerations" do not justify it, for these can always be amply provided for by the system of tours of service of military officers proposed by Sir John Farquharson, and recommended by the Committee of 1904-05. There is no reason why the Department should not be entirely Civil. The Universities of Europe and India provide steadily men of high scientific attainments for the scientific branches of the Department, why should not the covenanted controlling staff be recruited from men of this class? They would not be as costly as the military staff either who have their own profession. Can it be argued that Mr. de Graffe Hunter is in any way inferior to the military officer in the qualifications required for the Survey Department. His pay is limited to Rs. 1,600, while a military officer with the most ordinary qualifications, because he happens to be military, can rise to Rs. 2,250. There appears to be no justification for such distinctions. A well constituted Civil Department could efficiently meet all the requirements of the Government, both Civil and Military, and could be run far more economically. It is incorrect to say, that only at Chatham can the necessary training be obtained. All Royal Engineers have had to undergo training in the Department and in the Survey Training School. The course at Chatham does not pretend to equip a man for scientific survey practice as done in India. No one contends or disputes the fact, that the general education of the Royal Engineer is superior. That of the three classes of officers—Royal Engineer, Indian Army, and Provincial—he is certainly, on entering the Service, the most qualified, but this does not justify the contention that the other officers are unqualified, and that after they have had the necessary training they are not efficient and have not the technical and professional knowledge required for the work of the Department, and cannot make good Survey Officers.

Colonel C. Strahan, R.E., Surveyor-General of India, at a Conference held at Karachi on the 16th and 17th August, 1895, in the presence of Sir C. Oliphant, K.C.I.E., I.C.S., emphatically stated that no matter whether an officer joined the Survey Department from Chatham, a University, or Indian Army, or Provincial Officer recruited in India, not one of them could be regarded as in any way possessing any knowledge of survey practice as done by the Survey Department unless trained, and he had actually worked in the field and in recess, for at least four years. Admitting that the Royal Engineer has the necessary qualifications, what claim has the Indian Army officer to appointments in the superior Service? He has absolutely no claim whatever, and possesses no special qualifications superior to the Indian recruited Service. The educational and professional tests passed by him are not superior to those passed and possessed by the Provincial Officer. Why should he be eligible for the superior branch and be considered fit, and the Provincial Officer, because recruited in India, be debarred and be considered unfit? A high standard of educational and technical training can be had in India. The surveying and drawing course now given at the Rurki College is of a high standard educationally and technically. It could, if necessary, be further developed.

The training being specialised must though take place in the Department. An efficient training school should be maintained in charge of a thoroughly efficient officer. The mathematical course being in the hands of the expert in the Department.

The educational test for admission into the Department should be the entrance examination for admission into Roorkee, candidates prior to sitting for the examination to be nominated by a Board of officers of the Department, the appointments being distributed equally between Europeans and Indians.

(*18*) *iv* It is unjust that the officers of this Service should be regarded as second class officers in the matter of travelling allowance. This has been a sore grievance as far back as 47 years ago, and its

repeal has been petitioned for at every opportunity. It is to be realised that the Provincial Officer is not a localised District Officer with all conveniences at his disposal that such an officer has at his disposal. His work carries him into all localities, and in these he is an outsider and a traveller, and is put to greater expense than would otherwise be the case. Yearly he is subjected to two journeys of great distances, and for six months of the year is obliged to keep up two establishments. This all entails heavy expenditure which is not covered by second class rates. In the sister Services officers are given first class rates from the day they join or are made permanent.

This year all the officers in my party have been obliged to take advances to enable them to purchase ponies. At the close of the field season they are obliged to dispose of these animals as they cannot afford to keep then in recess, and are so forced to sell at a dead loss. This happens annually. It is absolutely necessary for them to keep ponies if they are to do their work efficiently. First class rates were also recommended by the Surveyor-General in 1895, Government of India Resolution No. 6-46, dated 27th March, but the Government of India refused the concession on grounds that do not hold good from experience.

The Service is a non-graded one, first class rates are admissible under Article 1002 of the Civil Service Regulations, and I think I am right in saying that they would have been sanctioned by Government had the claim been supported by Colonel Longe.

Colonel Longe was an officer who was not favourably disposed to the Indian recruited branch of the Department, and he opposed it. I feel certain that I am correct in saying that it has been opposed chiefly because it would give the officers a better status, and bring them more in line with the Imperial branch. It was a small concession, which would have been a great boon, and saved the officers the annual recurring loss sustained. The Civil Service Regulations say that travelling allowance is given to protect an officer against the extra expenditure incurred when travelling and on tour in the field in the discharge of his duties, and it is not to be considered a source of profit. In the case of the Survey Officer the rates allowed operate the other way, and leave him out of pocket yearly. The Upper subordinate lately introduced in the Department is eligible for second class rates. The Provincial Officer is his superior officer, and should be more favourably treated. It cannot be said that the former on his second class rates is not far more advantageously off, compared to the Provincial Officer of twenty years' service, with family expenses to meet, and larger European wants to supply. This concession would be a great boon in more ways than one. Its bestowal has been opposed chiefly on account of the status it confers, and so its real and pressing need finds no sympathy.

(*19*) v. *CONDITIONS OF LEAVE.—Provincial.*—The leave rules for Indian recruited Services should be improved. As the Indian Service leave rules at present stand very few officers, especially if married, can afford to take long leave. All long leave is on half salary, calculated on the average salary drawn during the past three years. Furlough can be taken at intervals of ten years and eight years, or two years combined after 18 years.

Medical leave is most difficult and troublesome to get in India, and officers, as a rule, are backward in availing themselves of medical leave for fear it should militate against their fitness for duty. The maximum amount of medical leave available is three years, but not more than two years can be taken at a time, the first fifteen months on about three-quarter pay and the balance on quarter pay, and no officer can have leave on medical certificate out of India more than twice.

Leave on private affairs can be had at intervals of every six years, but does not count towards furlough or service.

Privilege leave can accumulate up to three months and can be combined with other leave, but the total period of leave must be for not less than six months.

Officers of the Indian recruited Services are on small salaries and cannot afford to be on long periods of leave on half pay. It is sometimes stated that a man of the Indian Service has not the go and energy of the imported Service man. But when it is remembered that the latter, owing to his better rate of pay, can live better, and at the same time can afford to put by to enable him to go for a change and rest whenever his system needs it, and returns to duty a new man, there is nothing in the statement that is astonishing. Any leave statement will show the small amount of leave taken by officers of the Provincial Service, in fact it is a wonder that the man of this country can hang out as long as he does. If he is not as energetic, he knows that he has to husband his energy and vigour to the end of his career, dreading a breakdown and consequent leave on small pay.

I would recommend that privilege leave be allowed to accumulate up to six months. If not, that furlough up to an aggregate of five years be allowed at intervals of from three to six years, and that a commutation of furlough due for half the amount be allowed up to a total of nine months. That is, if an officer has, say, twelve months' furlough due to him on half-pay, he may be allowed to commute it to six months on full pay. This would be a great boon, and would tend to greater energy and efficiency, and would also enable an officer to give his family a change. Other leave to stand as at present, but the total aggregate leave, whether on furlough or medical certificate, not to exceed eight years.

(20) vi. The application of the term "Provincial" to the Indian recruited branch of the department is a misnomer. It is not recruited for work in any particular "Province," but is liable for duty in any part of India and Burma and across the frontier. Its cost is an Imperial charge, and not Provincial. It is part of an Imperial department and should never have been classified as Provincial. My service attaches great importance to the necessity for exercising this nomenclature, and also the prefix "extra." We are not "extra" or waiting officers outside the requirements of the department. We are in essence part of the service and of its active strength. The term too is useless and meaningless, and has come to be associated only with ideas of inferiority and subordination. The old designations "senior" and "junior" are preferable. The officers of the "junior" division being designated Assistant Superintendents, and those in the "senior," Deputy Superintendents.

The Provincial branch of this department has been represented as a discontented service. The grievances and disabilities under which this branch of the service has been suffering, without any hope of redress, has been more than enough to cause discontent. There is a feeling in the service that its advancement and ambitions have no sympathy or support from the Imperial branch, and are even resented. The deliberate exclusion of the Provincial officers from legitimate appointments, the misleading statements made before the Committee of 1904-05, on which there was no Provincial representative, the exclusion of the service from the benefits of the reorganisation, on inaccurately alleged statements of inefficiency and ability, the reflection cast on the members by the creation of a new Provincial service, the humiliating conditions under which senior officers of years of experience and training found themselves placed in subordination to the most junior inexperienced Imperial, and the attitude of "the officer to the subordinate" experienced in all relations with the Imperial officers, the discourteous improper treatment received at the hands of some of them, the constant discrediting of the service, the want of sympathy, kindly feeling and fairness have all been enough to try endurance and patience to breaking-point. When, year after year, Provincial officers realised that similar services were being improved, and that these services had the support of their superior officers, and that only humiliations and discredit was their lot, it was only natural for them to grow restive under the conditions and

to seek measures for the redress of grievances. I believe in no other department is the feeling between Imperial and Provincial officers so strained as in the Survey, and it is not possible for such sentiments to exist without cause. The relations are not cordial; there are no exchange of courtesies. Throughout, one realises that the dominating idea is one of aloofness and exclusiveness. The military officer, trained in the Army, seems to have but one idea pervading his relations with the Provincial officer—that of "officer" and "rank and file," and the want of recognition on his part of the status of Civil officers recruited in India and holding recognised positions. In other Civil departments there is no exclusive military controlling staff, and in those in which there is a mixed staff the military element is in the minority, and so there is not this extreme aloofness, and this idea of "subordinates." It is for these reasons that the suggestion has been put forward that the department should be divided into Civil and Military. The Military Survey Department could form a branch of the Military Works Service, could be taken over entirely by the military department, and controlled by them, its strength being regulated by their needs. The Civil department would be entrusted with all surveys within India, topographical, cadastral, and large scale for towns, and be constituted on the lines of P.W.D. Its staff would be entirely civil, recruited one-third in England and two thirds in India. The cost of such a service would not work out to be as expensive as the present one. It would relieve local Governments of all Settlement Surveys, and provide for their requirements maps based on scientific survey, and so supply for the whole of India a complete set of accurate serviceable records.

The existing department could be split up on the above lines and allotted to local Governments according to requirements. Each local Government would have a Director of Surveys who would be a Civil servant, and an Assistant Director promoted from the officers recruited in India, the large majority of whom would be the executive officers in actual charge of survey operations.

The headquarters of a department constituted on the above lines would be at Delhi, and the administrative head, a Secretary to the Government of India in the Revenue and Agricultural Department. All orders for the direction and control of the work on uniform lines, its mapping and reproduction, the head office would be responsible for. The directors would meet in conference once a year to discuss all matters connected with the direction of survey work.

Such a Department would be responsible for all surveys within the internal borders of India. Those across the frontier being delegated to the Military branch.

If a Department on the above lines is not approved of by the Commission, I am directed to ask that whatever be the final constitution of the Department the administrative head should be a civilian. It would be paying too high a tribute to the altruism of human nature to expect Military Officers to rise superior to bias and prejudice in favour of their own class in the administration of the Department. At present the Department has at its head a most able officer, and one in whom all branches of the Service have the utmost confidence combined with great regard and esteem. The present administrative head has endeavoured to the best of his power to deal fairly with the Provincial branch of the Department and to remedy, under difficult conditions, some of the most pressing grievances and disabilities introduced by the prejudiced administration of past years. But what hope or guarantee is there that his successors will follow in his lines? In fact, the fear is that on his retirement the old order of things will be introduced, or at least an endeavour made to do so, and the Indian recruited branch reduced to a subordinate position. The Provincial branch of the Service has much to be thankful for to Colonel Burrard, and had the Government of India sanctioned the scheme of redress recommended by the Departmental Commission of Enquiry of 1910 there would have been fewer grounds for discontent with the recent reorganisation. But the Government of India, while admitting that in justice to this branch of the Service the time scale of pay should be applied from first year of service, allowing three years for probation, fixed an arbitrary date, 1st March, 1912, for its application, and hereby penalised in emoluments a large number of officers. It has to be borne in mind, moreover, that had the Service not been barred from the benefits of the reorganisation in 1909 they would mechanically have come under the time scale of pay in that year, so that the introduction of an arbitrary date some years hence could not be regarded as a measure of just and fair redress. The plea advanced by Government for this policy was economy, which can hardly be accepted as being reasonable and valid when one considers the lavish and generous manner in which the Imperial branch has been treated. Whenever it is necessary to exercise economy in the Department it is usually the branches recruited in India that undergo the clipping.

It is to measures of the above nature that all the discontent is attributable, and to the distinctions introduced in 1895. The change seriously affected the junior division (present Provincial). It was left worse off by about quarter of a lakh of rupees, and its status irretrievably lowered. In the past junior officers who have risen to the senior division by merit could not be regarded or spoken of as inferiors and subordinates. They belonged to the same Service as the Imperial Officer, and were officially and socially his equal, and were secured against invidious distinctions in treatment. In those days it was not considered degrading for a junior Imperial Officer to serve under an officer of the junior division who had been promoted to the senior, nor was it possible to place officers holding posts equivalent to Extra Deputy Superintendents with years of service and experience in subordination to the most junior Imperial Officers. It is this state of things, and the desire to keep down the ambitions and aspirations of the Indian recruited branch, that is responsible for all the discontent in the Department. All we desire is fair play, just impartial administration and proper treatment.

MR. J. O. GREIFF called and examined.

70201. (*Chairman.*) The witness had been in the Service 22 years. He was at present Deputy Superintendent in the charge of No. 3 party.

70202. The scheme put forward in the written statement was based on the assumption that there was a superfluity of Military Officers in the Department. The actual reason for the increase of the Imperial branch from 40 to 55 was due to the report of 1904-05, which condemned Provincial Officers as incapable of discharging responsible duties, and therefore necessitated two and three Imperial Officers being attached to a party. The unfavourable statements in the report had been discredited. He agreed that if it were found impossible to reduce on military grounds the military element his scheme would have to undergo modification, but he urged that military considerations had always in the past regulated the military element, and the necessity for so large a number had not been felt, part of the cadre always being civil—*vide* Table 1 in written statement. Even should there be at any time an abnormal demand for Survey Officers for Military requirements, Provincial Officers were available, they had proved their ability for duty with expeditions and political missions—*vide* list given in the written statement. They considered it a grievance that this avenue to distinction should now be closed to them.

70203. He was aware of the fact that in all

European countries survey work was directed by Military Officers. One reason why survey work in India should be treated in a different way was precedent. Civilians had been connected with the Department in India for nearly a century, and the records of the Department proved their aptitude and fitness for the work. The Survey Departments in the Colonies were not entirely Military, and the United States Survey Department was entirely civil.

70204. He maintained that the pay and prospects of the officer in the Provincial Service should be brought up to something similar to those of Provincial Officers of the Public Works Department. He agreed that whereas an Assistant Engineer in the Public Works Department rose to a maximum salary of Rs. 535 he was proposing a maximum salary of Rs. 700 for the officer of corresponding rank in the Survey Department, but he urged that the prospects had to be sufficient to attract men of the proper class as every Provincial officer of the Survey Department, however efficient, could not hope to get one of the selected appointments.

70205. The standard of examination for entrance had been lowered within recent years, and the right class of man was not being attracted to the service; notwithstanding the fact that the prospects of the service had been materially improved, still they had not been brought into line with other similar services. The remedy was to raise the qualification for entry and make the prospects more attractive. Selfishly speaking he would naturally like to reserve all the appointments in the department for the domiciled community, but in fairness the half proportion between Anglo-Indians and Indians had been agreed to to satisfy the claims of the latter, depending of course on the methods of recruitment for the future. If competitive examination was to be the sole test for all public services, his service would of course come under the same category. He thought survey life being an outdoor strenuous one appealed more to his community than it did to the Indian. Capacity to pass a competitive test of a high standard was not all that was required of an officer in the Survey Department. What a man required was a good general education, a certain amount of practical knowledge, and a great deal of grit, character and physical endurance. The Anglo-Indian community had those qualities. Out of the Indians who had joined, about one-fourth had either resigned, or had been forced to leave on account of physical breakdown.

70206. Indians had been admitted to the Department since 1891, and there had not been sufficient opportunity to test them on work demanding any considerable measure of responsibility.

70207. He did not think there would be a very heavy increase of expenditure on account of the enlargement of the Provincial Service which he had recommended from 87 officers to about 120, if the upper subordinate service were abolished, and the department constituted somewhat on the lines he had proposed.

70208. The dissatisfaction* in the department arose out of the report of the committee of 1904 and 1905. The Provincial Service was not represented on that committee, and statements were made to the committee which were unfavourable to the Provincial branch, and which the Provincial branch had no means of refuting. Those statements had become public, and had prejudiced the reputation of the community. Further dissatisfaction had been caused by the loss of back pay and the unequal treatment meted out to Provincial Officers at the more recent reorganisation of 1913. The reorganisation was given effect to from 1st March, 1912, instead of from 1st August, 1909, and in the application of the time scale for pay, the principle of the system had been violated, service for increment being reckoned from 1st March, 1912, instead of from date of first appointment. He gave as an example his own case. Had the reorganisation been sanctioned with retrospective effect from 1909, and time scale applied from date of first appointment, he would have drawn pay at Rs. 500 from 1st November, 1909, and Rs. 550 from 1st November, 1912; by the reorganisation, he drew Rs. 500 from 1st March, 1912, and would draw Rs. 550 from 1st March, 1915. All officers drawing Rs. 300 pay and upwards on 1st March, 1912, with a few exceptions, and some even below Rs. 300, had been more or less similarly affected. Lastly, it was felt that the major charges allotted to the Provincial Service should be incorporated in the Imperial service.

70209. (*Mr. Madge.*) One of the reasons for suggesting the transfer of the Survey of India Department to the Home Department, with a Civilian head, was that under such conditions the interests of the members of the service recruited in India would probably receive more favourable consideration. Personally, however, he did not hold that view.

70210. A number of Provincial Service officers in former days rose to very high distinction and important offices in the department. That kind of career had not been by the recent reorganisation entirely closed to the Provincial Service, but their grievance was that the executive appointments allotted to Provincial Officers were regarded as part of the Provincial cadre, whereas under the old system they would have been regarded as belonging to the Imperial cadre.

70211. Relative ranking had not been given effect to insomuch, that in the departmental official lists of officers the position of Provincial Officers, who held relative rank with the Imperials, had not been defined as had been done in the case of the "mathematical adviser," who was outside the Imperial cadre, but against whose name it was stated that for official purposes he ranked below officer so and so.

70212. (*Mr. Fisher.*) If certain selected Provincial

* The witness afterwards asked to have the following note added on this point:—

"I intended to say that the discontent was due to the time scale of pay not having been applied from the first year of service, and with retrospective effect from the 1st August, 1909, the year of the inauguration of the new Service, whereby the Service has suffered a considerable loss of back pay. The point really is that when the future of the Department was under discussion by the Departmental Committee in 1910, the reorganisation of the Public Works, Forest and Telegraph Departments had just been effected, and many of the officers who gave evidence before the Committee urged the adoption of some such scheme as would have brought the Provincial Survey Service into line with these sister Services, but abandoned these schemes when they were given to understand by the committee that it would be possible to afford immediate relief by the exercise of Clause 13 of the Government of India Order No. 527, dated 24th July, 1909, which provided for the transfer of officers from the old to the new Service. The Government of India, however, ruled that it was not possible to exercise this rule in so wholesale a manner, and that the recommendations of the committee would, in any case, require the sanction of the Secretary of State. This caused considerable delay, and the scheme was only sanctioned in 1913 with retrospective effect, not from 1909, but from the 1st March, 1912, and even then not on the true principle of a time scale pay, whereby the Service has lost considerably in emoluments.

"The dissatisfaction I referred to is also due to matters of treatment. This concerns chiefly the more junior officers of the Service, and may be attributed to want of experience and to a want of a knowledge of the different conditions that prevail in a Civil Department as compared with a Military. As an instance in point, just before leaving Saharanpore I received the following information. A junior Imperial Assistant in one of the parties passed an order, without consulting the officer in charge, to the effect that when he came into a room all Provincial officers should stand up, and that they must do so whenever addressed, and that all their work and papers should pass through his hands. The Provincial officers protested and appealed to the executive officer, who cancelled the order. Imagine the mischief that might have been caused by such an order had it been upheld. A similar incident occurred when I was an assistant in No. 18 Party many years ago. The senior officers generally are much more reasonable."

Officers were brought into the Imperial Service at the bottom of the list at an early period of their career, the change of system would be gratefully accepted by the members of his service, at the same time he would not debar the senior officers at the top of the Provincial Service from this preferment, if they were qualified.

70213. It was a grievance with his colleagues that Imperial officers of five or eight years' service and even of less years' service were entrusted with the charge of topographical parties, when senior Provincial officers, who had a right to these posts, were available, because they considered that Provincial Officers of 20 odd years' service were quite capable of undertaking such duties.

70214. (*Mr. Sly.*) The demand made before the Committee in 1910 by the Provincial Service was for ten executive charges, and not five.*

70215. He agreed that a Provincial Officer promoted to an executive charge could not be transferred to the Imperial Service at the initial Imperial rate of pay if he were already in receipt of a higher salary.

70216-743. He did not think the suggestion that the Provincial Service should be abolished, and that there should be an Imperial Service and an upper subordinate service, would make for the good of the Department, because an upper subordinate service would not be sufficiently qualified for the duties of supervision. The upper subordinate and lower subordinate services were also too proximate to entrust the control of one to the other.

(The witness withdrew.)

* The witness afterwards wrote as follows:—"Ten posts were transferred from the Imperial Service to the Provincial by the policy of the Commission of 1886, this number being one-fifth of the cadre, and this number was demanded by the Provincial Service before the Committee of 1910. A very important point to note in this connection is that the number of 'Senior' posts allotted to the 'Junior' division by the old system was *never* regulated by the number of executive charges in the Department, but by the total strength of the 'Senior' division, approximating to about one-fifth of the total number. So if 55 officers be strength of the Imperial cadre, 11 of these posts would, according to the old system, belong to the 'Junior' division. This is the number asked for in my written statement."

LIST OF APPENDICES.

PAGE.

I.—Supplementary Statement put in by Colonel S. G. Burrard, C.S.I., R.E., F.R.S., relating to the reorganisation of the Survey of India Department 394

II.—Statement of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Survey of India Department 396

III.—Officials and non-officials who furnished written evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their enquiry into the Survey of India Department, but who were not orally examined 396

IV.—Rules for the appointment of Military Officers to the Imperial Service of the Survey of India 397

V.—Rules for the appointment of Officers to the Provincial Service of the Survey of India ... 397

APPENDIX I.

SUPPLEMENTARY STATEMENT PUT IN BY COLONEL S. G. BURRARD, C.S.I., R.E., F.R.S., RELATING TO THE REORGANISATION OF THE SURVEY OF INDIA DEPARTMENT.

(Referred to in Paragraph 70199.)

The effects of the recent reorganisation (1913) upon the pay and prospects of Provincial Officers of the Survey of India are illustrated in the following tables:—

(*1*) Effect of introduction of incremental time-scale salaries for Extra Assistant Superintendents.

(*2*) Effect of increasing the number of Extra Deputy Superintendents from five to ten and of creating seven charge allowances.

(*3*) Effect upon pensions of increasing the salaries of Provincial Officers.

(*4*) Effect upon travelling allowances of the recent reorganisation.

(*1*) *Effect of introduction of time-scale salaries for Extra Assistant Superintendents.*

(*i*) Table showing the average age of Provincial Officers drawing different salaries in different years, showing the improved prospects due to the reorganisation.

Salary.	1901.	1913.	1928.
Rs.	Age.	Age.	Age.
350	47	31	29
400	50	35	32
450	52	39	35
500	53	42	38

(*ii*) Table showing numbers of Provincial Officers who as Extra Assistant Superintendents draw salaries of Rs. 500, 550, and 600

Salary.	Before the Reorganisation (1892-1912).	After the Reorganisation.			
		1913.	1915.	1920.	1925.
Rs.					
600	None	2	6	5	22
550	3	6	9	13	19
500	6	9	14	18	37

The cases of a few individual officers will now be considered. I will firstly take the case of Mr. P. A. T. Kenny (aged 35), as he is the officer who has complained in the strongest terms of the inadequacy of the benefits conferred upon him by the reorganisation of 1913.

(*iii*) Statement showing the effect of the 1913 reorganisation in Mr. P. A. T. Kenny's case:—

Pay.	Year in which Pay is reached.	
	Under Old Scheme.	Under New Reorganisation.
Rs.		
350	1912	—
400	1921	1912
450	1926	1915
500	1928	1918
550	1930	1921
600	—	1924
650	1931	1929
800	1932	—
1000	—	1932
Approximate Pension	344	398 Retires 8th April, 1933.

In 1912 his pay has been increased 14 per cent.
,, 1915 ,, ,, ,, 28 ,,
,, 1921 ,, ,, ,, 37½ ,,
,, 1924 ,, ,, ,, 50 ,,

I will now take the cases of Mr. C. E. C. French (aged 38), Mr. E. B. West (aged 34), and Mr. F. H. Grant (aged 28), as these officers were put forward in 1910 as typical instances.

(*iv*) Statement showing the effect of the 1913 reorganisation in Mr. C. E. C. French's case:—

Pay.	Year in which Pay is reached.	
	Under Old Scheme.	Under New Reorganisation.
Rs.		
400	1912	—
450	1921	1912
500	1925	1915
550	1927	1918
600	—	1921
650	1928	1926
800	1929	—
1000	—	1929
Approximate Pension	340	393 Retires 16th Mar., 1930.

In 1912 his pay has been increased 12½ per cent.
,, 1915 ,, ,, ,, 25 ,,
,, 1921 ,, ,, ,, 33 ,,
,, 1924 ,, ,, ,, 33 ,,

(*v*) Statement showing the effect of the 1913 reorganisation in Mr. E. B. West's case:—

Pay.	Year in which Pay is reached.	
	Under Old Scheme.	Under New Reorganisation.
Rs.		
300	1912	—
350	1919	1912
400	1925	1915
450	1929	1918
500	1932	1921
550	—	1924
600	—	1927
650	—	1933
Approximate Pension	247	313 Retires 23rd July, 1934.

In 1912 his pay has been increased 17 per cent.
,, 1915 ,, ,, ,, 33 ,,
,, 1921 ,, ,, ,, 43 ,,
,, 1924 ,, ,, ,, 57 ,,

(*vi*) Statement showing the effect of the 1913 reorganisation in Mr. F. H. Grant's case:—

Pay.	Year in which Pay is reached.	
	Under Old Scheme.	Under New Reorganisation.
Rs.		
200-10-250 drawing 210	1912	—
300	1921	1912
350	1928	1915
400	1933	1918
450	1936	1921
500	1937	1924
550	1939	1927
600	—	1930
650	—	1939
Approximate Pension	263	313 Retires 10th August, 1940.

In 1912 his pay has been increased 43 per cent.
,, 1915 ,, ,, ,, 46 ,,
,, 1921 ,, ,, ,, 50 ,,
,, 1924 ,, ,, ,, 67 ,,

(2) Effects of increasing the number of Extra Deputy Superintendents from five to ten and of creating seven charge allowances.

The following table shows the pay of the posts of Extra Deputy Superintendents to which all officers of the Provincial Service recruited subsequent to 1888 were and are eligible by selection:

	Before the Reorganisation.	1913 and henceforth.
Rs.		
1000	None.	2
850	None.	2
800	2	None.
750	None.	3
650	3	3

In place of five posts with salaries averaging Rs. 710 there are now ten posts with salaries averaging Rs. 790 for which officers recruited since 1888 are eligible.

(3) Effect upon pensions of increasing the salaries of Provincial Officers.

An officer's pension is half the average salary he has received during the last three years of his service.

The number of officers drawing salaries of and above Rs. 500 has been largely increased by the recent reorganisation, and will now be continually increased as years pass. The augmentation of pensions by the recent reorganisation may be illustrated by the following table.

Maximum salaries open to Provincial officers who have been recruited since 1888:—

	Before the recent Reorganisation.	1913.	1915.	1920.	1925.
Rs.					
1000	None.	2	2	2	2
700 to 900	2	5	5	5	5
600 to 700	3	5	9	8	25
550	3	6	9	13	19
500	6	9	14	18	37

Under the recent reorganisations of the Survey of India Department the average pay and pension of an average Imperial officer have not been altered, but the average pay and pension of an average Provincial officer have been considerably increased.

(4) Effect upon travelling allowances.

Number of Provincial officers who are allowed first-class travelling expenses by rail and steamer, and who are allowed to draw a daily allowance of Rs. 4s. or more when on tour:—

Before the recent Reorganisation.	1913.	1915.	1920.	1925.
14	27	39	46	88

In addition to the above increase in travelling allowances, Government tents are now being issued for the use of officers, whereas formerly officers had to purchase their own tents.

Formerly, moreover, officers had to pay for the conveyance of their horses by rail and steamer; now rail and steamer fares for the conveyance of horses are being granted.

In the statements of grievances put forward in 1908 and 1910, the grievances concerning tents and conveyance of horses were emphasised. These grievances have been entirely removed.

The three Circle Drawing Offices.

With reference to the three Circle Drawing Offices which Mr. Biggie thought were not proper charges and which I considered were important posts, I ought to explain that these three Circle Drawing Offices are recent creations and have not always existed. The facts concerning them are as follows:—

In 1909 three Circle Drawing Offices were created for the first time, and charge allowances attached to them.

In August, 1910, the Provincial Service petitioned that these three Drawing Offices should be made into executive charges to rank with the charge of parties.

In November, 1910, a Departmental Committee of which two leading Provincial Officers were members recommended that these three Circle Drawing Offices should be made into executive charges to rank with the charge of parties.

In 1913 the Government acceded to the request of the Provincial Service and converted these three Circle Drawing Offices into executive charges.

In 1913-14 I have heard this step invariably spoken of with approval. I have never heard any objection raised to it except that of Mr. Biggie in his evidence before the Royal Commission.

With reference to the question put to me as to why the salary of the Survey Officer should be greater than that of the Public Works Department Officer I have the honour to invite attention to para. 5 of Despatch 272, of 1909, dated the 25th November, 1909, from which the following extract is made:—"5. Your Lordship has drawn our attention to the fact that the average cost of the appointments of Imperial Service Officers under our original proposals amounted to Rs. 1,268 a month, being slightly in excess of the existing scale of Rs. 1,253, and considerably in excess of the scale applicable to officers of the Royal Engineers employed in the Public Works Department and in the Military Works Services. We are not aware what figures have been placed before your Lordship as representing the average pay of officers of the two latter Services. The emoluments of officers of the Military Works Services are based to a large extent on their regimental pay, and it is difficult to make an accurate comparison between the average pay drawn in those Services and the average pay of a Service under a time scale, such as that proposed for the Survey of India. It must be remembered also that an officer of the Survey of India loses the chances of obtaining high army rank, which are open to officers of the Military Works Services. Moreover, in connection with the reorganisation of the Military Works Services, which was effected in 1905, it was recognised that it was necessary to keep the pay in the junior ranks below that which officers would obtain in the corresponding grades of the Public Works Department, so that Royal Engineer Officers might be induced to volunteer readily for service in that Department. The average pay of the Public Works Department calculated on the same principles as those adopted in the case of the Survey of India is about Rs. 1,219 a month. It is, however, impossible to estimate the relative attractions of the two Services, solely by reference to the arithmetical averages. It appears from some detailed calculations, which have been made, that while the pay proposed for officers of the Survey of India is on the whole higher than that of officers of the Public Works Department for the first 20 years of their service in the Department, the average pay drawn by officers of the Public Works Department during the later years of their service is considerably higher than that of officers of the Survey of India of the same standing. The inferiority of the Survey of India during the later years of service is due to a fact which is of material importance in comparing the conditions of the two Services as a whole, namely, that the Survey of India contains only one prize post, that of Surveyor-General, and it will under our proposals contain only three posts on pay exceeding Rs. 2,000 a month. In the Public Works Department, on the other hand, there are a number of valuable posts open to senior officers, such as those of Chief Engineers, Secretaries to Government, Managers of Railways, and so on. Moreover, it is often possible for distinguished officers of the Public Works Department to obtain further employment on retirement, while the work and training of an officer of the Survey of India, who

is compelled to retire at the age of 55, are such as to render it very difficult, if not impossible, for him to obtain employment after leaving our Service. For the scientific work of the Survey of India, the best Royal Engineer Officers available are required, and the ordinary work of the Department is carried on for a great part of the year in circumstances involving greater isolation and hardship than falls to the lot of most officers of the Public Works Department. For these reasons, we consider that in order to attract the same class of officers, it is necessary that the scale of pay of the Survey of India should be rather higher than that of the Public Works Department during the earlier years of service, and that a slight excess in the average pay of the Survey of India over that of the Public Works Department is justifiable, as it merely represents a slight superiority in the position of the junior ranks to compensate for a decided inferiority in the prospects open to senior officers."

APPENDIX II.

Statement of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a Month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Survey of India Department.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).												
	Total.	European.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs, and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	13	—	10	1	1	—	—	—	—	2	—	—	2	1	—	—
300—400	59	—	43	2	1	4	3	—	—	10	—	1	11	5	—	—
400—500	33	—	25	—	1	5	1	—	—	7	—	—	7	1	—	—
500—600	17	1	15	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—
600—700	9	4	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	5	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	6	4	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	12	12	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	6	6	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	5	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	15	15	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
3,000—3,500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	181	53	100	3	3	9	4	—	—	19	—	1	20	8	—	—

APPENDIX III.

Officials and Non-officials who furnished written Evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their enquiry into the Survey of India Department but who were not orally examined.

1. Colonel T. F. B. Renny-Tailyour, C.S.I., R.E., Superintendent, Southern Circle, Survey of India.
2. M. C. Petters, Esq., Extra Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India.
3. Lieutenant A. A. Chase, R.E., Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India.
4. W. J. Newland, Esq., Extra Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India (with the views of other officers incorporated).
5. Major C. L. Robertson, R.E., Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India.
6. W. C. Price, Esq., Retired Extra-Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India.
7. Major F. C. Hirst, I.A., Director of Surveys, Bengal and Assam.
8. E. C. O'Sullivan, Esq., Extra Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India.
9. Major W. M. Coldstream, R.E., Superintendent, Map Publication, Survey of India.
10. W. Stotesberry, Esq., Late Extra Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India.
11. C. C. Byrne, Esq., Extra Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India.
12. The Provincial Service Survey of India Officers serving in Bengal and Assam Surveys.
13. Major H. M. Cowie, R.E., Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India.
14. Captain C. M. Browne, D.S.O., R.E., Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India.
15. P. A. T. Kenny, Esq., Extra Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India.
16. J. H. Williams, Esq., Extra Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India.
17. R. P. Ray, Esq., Extra Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India.
18. C. West, Esq., Extra Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India.
19. Major E. A. Tandy, R.E., Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India.
20. Major C. H. D. Ryder, D.S.O., R.E., Officiating Superintendent, Northern Circle, Survey of India.
21. J. A. Freeman, Esq., Extra Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India.
22. C. Litchfield, Esq., Assistant Superintendent, Survey of India.
23. J. Smith, Esq., Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India.
24. B. R. Hughes, Esq., Deputy Superintendent, Survey of India.
25. Major F. W. Pirrie, I.A., Officiating Superintendent, Survey of India.
26. L. J. Pocock, Esq., Extra Deputy Superintendent (Retired).

APPENDIX IV.

Rules for the appointment of military officers to the Imperial Service of the Survey of India.

1. Officers of the Royal Engineers on the Indian Establishment and of the Indian Army are eligible for appointment on probation to the Survey of India provided they have not more than six years' Army service. Officers will be confirmed or reverted to military duty, on the recommendation of the Surveyor-General, at any time within two years of their appointment on probation. They may revert at their own request at any time before they are confirmed.

2. The ordinary proportion of appointments for the two services will be three Royal Engineer Officers to one Indian Army Officer.

3. Applications for appointments to the Survey of India will be forwarded to the Surveyor-General through the Military Secretary to the Commander-in-Chief. The Surveyor-General will maintain two lists of candidates, one for officers of the Royal Engineers and the other for officers of the Indian Army. The Surveyor-General will make such enquiries as he thinks necessary regarding applicants for appointment, and will enter in the lists the names of such officers only as he considers suitable for employment in the Survey of India. On the occurrence of a vacancy in the Department, the Surveyor-General will nominate an officer from the lists with due regard to the provisions of Rule 2. The appointment will be made by the Government of India, who reserve to themselves the right to modify the Surveyor-General's proposals as they think fit.

4. Officers of both services, after confirmation in the Department, will be graded on one list in accordance with the date of their first commissions.

5. These rules are subject to alteration from time to time at the discretion of the Government of India.

APPENDIX V.

Rules for the appointment of officers to the Provincial Service of the Survey of India.

1. The Provincial Service of the Survey of India is open only to persons who are natives of India, as defined in the Statute 33 Vict., Cap. 3, Section 6.

2. There will be four methods of admission to the Service :—

(1) By competitive examination of candidates nominated by the Surveyor-General (Rules 3-6);

(2) By direct appointment of persons possessing certain educational qualifications (Rules 7-8);

(3) By promotion from the Upper Subordinate Service (Rule 10);

(4) By transfer from the existing service (Rules 12-13).

3. The Surveyor-General will, about the beginning of April in each year, publish a notice specifying the number of vacancies offered for competition.

4. Only candidates who have been nominated by the Surveyor-General will be permitted to appear at a competitive examination, for admission to the Service. For the present no candidate will be nominated for the competitive examination who does not possess the qualifications required for admission to the entrance examination of the Thomason Civil Engineering College or equivalent qualifications in Provinces other than the United Provinces or the Punjab. Persons desirous of appearing at the competitive examination must apply to the Surveyor-General, Calcutta, when a form of application will be supplied. On receipt of the form duly filled in and after such further enquiries and examination as he may consider necessary, the Surveyor-General will, if he thinks the applicant suitable for service in the Survey of India, give him a nomination which will entitle him to appear at a competitive examinaton to be held under the following rule.

5. The Surveyor-General may arrange to have the competitive examination conducted by the authorities of such College or Colleges as he may select, or a special examination of nominated candidates may be held by the Survey Department. If only one examination is held in a year those candidates who obtain the greatest number of marks will be appointed in order of passing up to the number of probationary appointments offered for competition. If more than one examination is held in the same year, the Surveyor-General will allot the number of appointments to be given at each examination, and the candidates who stand highest on the list of passed candidates at each examination will be selected up to the number of vacancies allotted to the examination for which they appear.

6. Candidates selected after examination under the foregoing rules will be on probation for three years, and will receive salary at the rate of Rs. 100 per mensem for the first year, Rs. 125 per mensem for the second year, and Rs. 150 per mensem for the third year.

7. The Surveyor-General may, subject to the approval of the Government of India, appoint on probation a candidate who has graduated, taking mathematics as a subject for his degree, or who has passed as a Bachelor of Engineering or possesses the Roorkee Engineering College certificate or other equivalent qualification. Such a candidate must be under 24 years of age.

8. Candidates appointed under Rule 7 will be on probation for two years and will receive a salary of Rs. 100 per mensem for the first year, and Rs. 150 per mensem for the second year.

9. A candidate appointed on probation may be discharged by the Surveyor-General at any time during the period of probation, and no probationer will be permanently appointed to the Provincial Service until he has completed his period of probation and has satisfied the Surveyor-General that he is duly qualified and that his health is good. The term of probation may be prolonged by the Surveyor-General to the extent of any period or periods of leave passed on medical certificate. Probationary service, if followed by a permanent appointment, will count for leave and pension.

10. The Surveyor-General may, subject to the approval of the Government of India, promote specially deserving officers from the Upper Subordinate Service to the Provincial Service; ordinarily no such promotion will be given to any officer after he has attained the age of 40 years.

11. On being permanently appointed to the new Provincial Service after completion of the periods of probation prescribed in Rules 6 and 8, or on promotion from the Upper Subordinate Service under Rule 10, an officer will be designated Extra Assistant Superintendent and will receive pay at the rate of Rs. 250 per mensem, rising by triennial increments of Rs. 50 to Rs. 600, subject to the condition that the Surveyor-General shall have power to stop any increment for unsatisfactory work or conduct. The Service will also include a number

of posts of Extra Deputy Superintendents, promotion to which will ordinarily be made by selection from among the Extra Assistant Superintendents on Rs. 600. The Government of India, however, reserve the right to select any Extra Assistant Superintendent for promotion to the rank of Extra Deputy Superintendent.

At present the following posts of Extra Deputy Superintendents have been sanctioned :—

			Rs.		
4	posts	on	650	per	mensem.
2	,,	on	700	,,	,,
2	,,	on	800	,,	,,
2	,,	on	1,000	,,	,,

12. Members of the existing Provincial Service appointed after 1st May, 1905, may at the discretion of the Surveyor-General be transferred, subject to such tests (if any) as the Surveyor-General may prescribe, to the new Provincial Service, and on such transfer will receive their present rates of pay (including such increments as they may earn under the existing scheme) until they have completed three years from the date of their present appointment to the existing service, and thereafter will receive pay at the rate of Rs. 250 subject to the increase provided by Rule 11 above.

13. The Government of India may at any time transfer any number of the old Provincial Service to the new Provincial Service under such conditions as they think fit.

INDEX.

(The numbers refer to paragraphs.)

Survey of India Department.

A

Administrative Posts:
Nature of, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70069
Number and pay excessive, and decrease advocated, *Grieff* 70200 (16)

Anglo-Indian Association:
Membership, and object, *Biggie* 70135
Views of (*see evidence of* Biggie, H. W., 70134–57).

Anglo-Indians:
Civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 396
Claims of, and example of capacities, *Biggie* 70134 (12) (23)
Comparison with Indians, *Greiff* ... 70205–6
Widespread desire for service in department, *Aulad Hossein* 70126

Army (*see* Indian Army Officers).

Assistant Superintendents:
Duties, and comparison with those of Extra Assistants in Provincial Service, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70052
Imperial, at headquarters, local allowance advocated, *Gwyn* 70082, 70088
Inadequate number, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70052
Assistants, fixed proportion of, to executive officers, percentage should be allowed for deputation, *Burrard* 70181

Aulad Hossein, Khan Bahadur Syed, evidence of 70110–70133

B

Baniyas and Vaisyas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 396

Biggie, H. W., evidence of 70134–70157

Brahmans (including Shenvis), civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 396

Burrard, Colonel S. G., C.S.I., R.E., F.R.S.:
Committee of, referred to, *Aulad Hossein* 70127–8, 70133
Evidence of 70158–70199
Statement *re* reorganisation of department, 1913 p. 394–6

C

Charge Allowances (*see under* Pay, Imperial Service).

Charges:
Assistants, justification for, *Burrard* ... 70169
Executive, reduction of number advocated, *Greiff* 70200 (16)
Provincial Service officers in (*see under* Provincial Service).

Circle Superintendents, need for, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70058

Circles, division of India into, opposed by Sir John Farquharson, *Greiff* 70200 (16)

Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, on 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 396

Cost of Living, increase, *Ewing* 70092

D

Dehra Dun, training at (*see under* Probation and Training, Provincial Service).

Deputy Superintendents:
Charges, number definitely fixed at 21 since 1909, *Burrard* 70180
when in charge of party Work the same as that of Imperial officer in charge of party, *Ewing* 70096

Division of Service into Imperial and Provincial, abolition advocated, *Biggie* 70134 (2) (3) (19), 70154

E

Europeans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 396

Ewing, A., evidence of 70089–70109

Extra Assistant Superintendents, Provincial Service:
Designation "Extra" a misnomer, and should be excised, *Greiff*... ... 70200 (14) (20)
Duties, and comparison with those of Assistant in Imperial Service, *Lenox-Conyngham*... 70052
Effect of introduction of time-scale salaries for, *Burrard* ... ... p. 394
Reply to complaint *re* designation, *Burrard* 70165

Extra Deputy Superintendents, effect of increasing number, *Burrard* ... ... p. 395

F

Family Pension Fund, establishment for Indian recruited services advocated, and scheme, *Greiff* 70200 (16)

Furlough (*see under* Leave).

G

General Provident Fund:
Insufficiency of provision, *Greiff* ... 70200 (16)
Permission to officers to join, would be appreciated, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70062, 70067
not Subscribed to by majority of Provincial Service officers, *Aulad Hossein* 70130
Subscribed to by members of Provincial Service, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70067

Greiff, J. O., evidence of 70200–70216

Gwyn, Captain A. H., I.A., evidence of 70077–70088

H

Hindus, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 396

I

Imperial Service:
Allotment of one-fourth vacancies to Indian Army officers approved, *Burrard* ... 70167
Distribution of officers, 1st July, 1913, *Greiff* 70200 (16); p. 383
Division of service into Provincial and (*see under* Division of Service, *etc.*).
Form part of war reserve, *Burrard* ... 70159, 70167
Formation of, approved, but number of officers excessive, *Ewing* ... 70095, 70101, 70108, 70109
Increase in Cadre:
1895–1910, reason, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70064
Underlying principle of, that no Provincial officer should have even temporary charge, *Greiff* 70200 (9) (16), 70202
alleged Need for military officers owing to need for military reserve for military expeditions, reply to, *Greiff* 70200 (16)

Imperial Service—*continued.*
Number of Assistant Superintendents in, should be gradually reduced, and number in lower services be increased, *Ewing* 70095, 70096, 70101-3, 70104, 70106
Number excessive, and reduction advocated, *Aulad Hossein*, 70127; *Biggie*, 70134 (20), *Greiff*, 70200 (16).
Posts held by officers, *Burrard* 70168
Reasons for employment of military officers, *Burrard* ... 70158, 70159, 70165, 70170, 70190
Recruitment (*see that title*).
Should be thrown open to Provincial Service, part be recruited in England and part in India from selected Provincial Service officers, *Greiff* 70200 (14) (15)
Strength and cost excessive, *Greiff* ... 70200 (14)
(*see also* Leave, Pay, *etc.*)

Indian Army Officers:
no Claim to appointment in superior service, *Greiff* 70200 (17)
might be given Facilities for undergoing military tests for promotion and be more often sent on field service as survey officers, *Gwyn* 70079, 70084
Know of all departments for which eligible, but Commanding Officer objects to men applying, *Burrard* 70176
not Part of war reserve, *Burrard* 70178
Superiority to Provincial officers, *Burrard*... 70165

Indians:
Comparison with Imperial officers, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70073
Introduction and extension of, in department, not objected to, if selected from right materials, *Biggie* 70134 (21) (22)
Limitations on employment in Imperial Service, question does not arise, as service a military one, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70049
no Limitations on employment of, in Provincial Service, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70049
Provincial Service becoming more popular among educated classes, *Aulad Hossein* 70116

Recruitment to Imperial Service, Direct:
would be Possible if standard of training at Dehra Dun raised, *Aulad Hossein* ... 70128
with Proper training, including time in England, preferred to promotion, but neither scheme advocated, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70063

Recruitment to Provincial Service:
Applications, more from, generally than from Anglo-Indians, *Aulad Hossein* 70126
Efficiency of department not injured by, *Burrard* 70164
History of, *Aulad Hossein* 70116
Larger proportion of posts should be allotted, *Aulad Hossein* 70116, 70118
Open competition would be preferred, and not reservation of definite proportion of posts, *Aulad Hossein* 70118

J

Junior Branch:
List of officers of, on military duty and political missions, *Greiff* ... ... p. 385-6
List of survey officers recruited from, *Greiff* 70200 (15)

K

Kaiyasthas (including Parbhus), civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 396

Kshatryas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 396

L

Leave, Imperial Service:
Amount adequate, but many restrictions and rules complicated, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70047
Ledger account suggested, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70047
Privilege, accumulation for more than three months, recommendation *re*, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70061
Rules sufficiently liberal, but too complicated, *Burrard* 70162

Leave, Imperial Service—*continued.*
Study:
no Advantage seen, with certain exceptions, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70061
Training obtainable in England and India not very different, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70070
Suggestions, *Gwyn* 70080

Leave, Provincial Service:
Amount liberal, *Ewing* 70093
Conditions, *Burrard* 70162
Furlough:
Recommendations *re* amount and periods, *Aulad Hossein* 70114, 70123
Three years', should be allowed during service, *Burrard* 70162
Improvement of rules, need for, *Greiff* 70200 (19)
Long furlough on full pay to all officers, claim to, not agreed with, *Burrard* 70162
Officers appointed by Secretary of State to appointments as Managers and Assistant Managers in technical offices under Indian Leave Rules, and hardship, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70047
Medical, recommendation, *Burrard* 70162
Privilege:
Accumulation up to six months should be allowed, *Aulad Hossein*, 70114; *Burrard*, 70162; *Greiff*, 70200 (19).
Restriction of period for, and hardship, *Aulad Hossein* 70114
Restriction of six months of duty between periods, relaxation in certain cases advocated, *Aulad Hossein* 70144
Recommendations, *Greiff* 70200 (19)
Rules:
Difference from European rules, reason, but hardship in some cases admitted, *Burrard* 70162
might be Simplified, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70047
Small amount taken, *Greiff* 70200 (19)
Study, scheme, *Ewing* 70090, 70093, 70098

Lenox-Conyngham, Lieutenant-Colonel G. P., R.E., evidence of 70044-70076

M

Military Officers:
Detailing of, for tour of duty in Survey Department on military pay plus survey allowance, Military and Survey Departments halving cost, Colonel Farquharson's suggestion approved, *Biggie* 70139, 70134 (20)
Scheme, and advantages of, *Greiff* ... 70200 (16)
(*see also* Imperial Service.)

Muhammadans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 396

N

Non-commissioned Officers, scheme for recruitment of (*see under* Upper Subordinate Service).

O

Organisation:
Administrative head should be a civilian, *Greiff* 70200 (20), 70209
Civil Department, no reasons against, and advocated, *Greiff* 70200 (17), 70203
had always been a Civil Department, not military, *Biggie* 70136, 70141
Classes of officers and organisation, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70044, 70052
proposed Composition, *Greiff*... ... 70200 (16)
Demilitarising of, advocated, and placing chief control in hands of civilian, *Biggie* 70134 (19), 70135
Division into Civil and Military, proposal and scheme, *Greiff* 70200 (20)
Number of officers in, required in event of mobilisation, question of, *Burrard* ... 70177
Old Senior Division, numbers of Junior Division men in, *Biggie* 70134 (5)
proposed Organisation not agreed with, *Biggie* 70139
Possible time present survey will take, but contraction of staff would not follow after, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70064
Reintroduction of old system of division into "Senior and Junior Services" favoured, and scheme, *Aulad Hossein*. 700119-21; *Greiff*, 70200 (16).

Organisation—*continued.*
Reorganisation of 1913, effects, *Burrard* p. 394–5
Reorganisations, and hardships to Provincial Service entailed by, *Biggie*, 70134; *Greiff*, 70200, 70208.
Strength and cost, 1887–1913, and increase, *Greiff* 70200 (16), p. 382, p. 383
War reserve from, no question of, heard, *Biggie* 70146

P

Parsis, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 396

Parties:
Acting appointments to officer of junior division, recommendation, *Greiff* 70200 (16)
Number and charge, *Biggie* 70148
Number, and number held by Provincial and Imperial officers, *Aulad Hossein* ... 70118
Period required before Imperial officer qualified to take charge of, *Burrard* 70169
SIZE:
Increase in, *Burrard* 70182
should be Increased, *Ewing* 70104

Pay:
Junior Service, scheme, *Greiff* ... 70200 (16)
Single cadre in which civilian officers on same standing as military would be paid at rates equal to three-quarters those paid to military officers, advocated, *Aulad Hossein* ... 70125

Pay, Imperial Service:
Adjustment of time-scale so as to include charge allowance desired, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70059
CHARGE ALLOWANCES:
Abolition:
Advocated, *Greiff*... ... ... 70200 (16)
Advocated in case of officers drawing Rs. 1,000 and over per month, *Biggie* 70134 (15) (19) (20)
not Necessary, *Burrard*... 70174
Varying of amount according to importance of charge, doubt as to possibility, *Burrard* 70189
Comparison with Public Works, and justification, *Burrard* ... ... p. 395–6
in Excess of that of similar officers in Public Works and Military Works Departments, and considered too high, *Biggie* 70134 (14) (15), 70144
Particulars *re*, and allowances, and rates considered excessive, *Greiff* 70200 (16)
proposed Rates, *Greiff* 70200 (16)
of Royal Engineers higher than in Public Works Department, and method of fixing, *Burrard* 70179
Service considered well paid by Indian Army officers, *Gwyn* 70085

Pay, Provincial Service:
Comparison with Public Works and Forest Departments, probationary period of survey should be set off against college periods, in favour of former, *Burrard* 70161
Complaint *re* difference from pay in Imperial Service, *Lenox-Conyngham*, 70060; *Biggie*, 70138
Effects of 1913 reorganisation on, *Burrard* p. 394
Inadequate, with exception of probationers, and proposed scale, *Ewing* 70092
Initial, comparison with other services, and hardship, *Biggie* 70134 (15)
Pay and prospects should be somewhat similar to those in Public Works Department, *Greiff* 70204
Proportion to that in Imperial Service, and grievance, *Biggie* ... 70134 (10), 70138, 70144
proposed Scale, *Ewing* 70098, 70107–8
TIME-SCALE:
Concession welcomed, *Aulad Hossein* ... 70113
Grievances, *Biggie*, 70134 (8) (9); *Greiff*, 70200 (20), 70208.
One for Deputy Superintendents and one for Assistants, with promotion by selection favoured, *Burrard* 70174
System, comparison with Imperial Service, and hardship, *Biggie* 70134 (9)
Triennial increments, conversion into annual, requested, *Aulad Hossein* 70113, 70122

Pay, Provincial Service—*continued.*
TRAVELLING ALLOWANCE:
Claim to treatment of certain officers as first-class officers for, *Aulad Hossein* ... 70112, 70131
Comparison with other services, and grievances, *Biggie* 70134 (7) (16)
Effects of 1913 reorganisation on, *Burrard* p. 395
Grievance, and claim to first-class rates, *Greiff* 70200 (14) (18)
TWO-THIRDS SCALE:
not Applicable, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70060
Principle departed from, *Ewing* 70092

Pensions, Imperial Service:
Conditions governed by military regulations, *Burrard* 70163
ordinary Indian Army pension of £700 after 32 years' service should be augmented by £100 for Survey of India officers, *Gwyn* ... 70081, 70085
Maximum, increase advocated, *Aulad Hossein* 70115, 70124
Officers should be allowed choice between military pension allowable and that which "half average salary" rule would give, *Gwyn* 70081

Pensions, Provincial Service:
Amount should be calculated on basis of average emoluments for last year's service, *Aulad Hossein* 70115
Effect on, of increase of salaries, *Burrard*... p. 395
Exemption from income tax advocated, *Aulad Hossein* 70115
Maximum liberal, but salaries and numbers of appointments in higher grades should be raised to ensure officers receiving after 30 years' service, *Ewing* 70094, 70100

Probation and Training, Imperial Service:
Chatham and Sandhurst the best training schools, but special survey training required for Indian conditions necessary, *Burrard* ... 70195
in Department necessary as well as at Chatham, *Greiff* 70200 (17)
IN ENGLAND:
for Civilians, difficulty of obtaining, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70063
would be Preferred to training by department, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70075
in Indian university would not be substitute for training at Woolwich and Chatham, but similar training could be supplied by department if man had sufficient educational foundation, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70074
of Indian Army officers, three years suggested, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70054, 70058
after Joining department same for both Imperial and Provincial branches, *Biggie* 70142
Royal Engineers, period required, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70058
at Sandhurst as well as at Chatham and Woolwich, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70076
Scheme, *Gwyn* 70078
System, and no change necessary, *Lenox-Conyngham*, 70045; *Burrard*, 70160.
Three years' probation not too long, *Biggie* 70149
Three years in Survey before taking charge of party advocated, *Ewing* 70108

Probation and Training, Provincial Service:
Complaint that training not sufficiently varied during first year, reply to, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70058
AT DEHRA DUN:
Arrangement could be made to give higher education, *Aulad Hossein* 70128
Satisfactory, *Burrard* 70160
must Depend on work for which service required, and proposed lengthy and varied courses with survey parties not approved, *Burrard* 70160, 70187
Establishment in India of institution on same lines as in England would not be justified, but desired training could be provided at existing colleges, *Aulad Hossein* 70132
Insufficiency of, and scheme, *Ewing* ... 70090, 70098
Period sufficient, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70058
Period sufficient, but Dehra Dun course too easy, *Gwyn* 70078, 70084
Scheme, *Aulad Hossein* 70111
System, *Ewing*, 70090; *Aulad Hossein*, 70111.
System, and no change necessary, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70045, 70054

Probation and Training, Provincial Service—*continued.*
Three years' probation considered too long, and reduction to two years, except in exceptional cases, advocated, *Aulad Hossein*... 70111, 70120

Promotion:
of Junior officer to senior rank, training in Europe not necessary before, *Aulad Hossein* 70121
no Barrier needed if officer possessed necessary experience and qualifications, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70071
(*see also under* Provincial Service.)

Provident Fund (*see* General Provident Fund).

Provincial Service:
ABOLITION OF:
not Advocated, and question of possibility of Upper Subordinate Service taking place of, *Burrard* 70171
not Desired, *Ewing*, 70098; *Greiff*, 70216.
and Formation of one department modelled on Upper Subordinate Service of Public Works Department advocated, and scheme, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70044, 70057, 70064
Imperial branch should be opened to recruitment in India, *Greiff* 70200 (17)
Objection to, *Greiff* 70200 (14) (17)
All sections believed to be given opportunity to appear before Departmental Committee, 1910, *Burrard* 70193
Amalgamation of services, and result, *Ewing*, 70105; *Greiff*, 70200 (11).
Capacity of, to undertake all work of department, *Biggie*, 70134 (3) (4) (12) (13) (20), 70150; *Greiff*, 70200 (15) (16,, 70202, 70213.
CHARGE OF PARTIES, ETC.:
Capacity for holding, *Aulad Hossein* 70127–8, 70129, 70133
in Some cases, *Biggie* 70148
Temporarily, Imperial officers could be spared for frontier work, *Ewing* 70109
Work satisfactorily done on the whole, *Ewing* 70106
Claim to equality with Provincial Service of Public Works Department, no justification, *Burrard* 70165
Concessions, *Greiff* 70200 (10) (12)
DESIGNATION:
Argument that title a misnomer, and claim to title "Imperial," reply to, *Burrard* ... 70165
a Misnomer, disadvantage of, and suggestion, *Lenox-Conyngham*, 70044, 70050, 70057, 70064; *Aulad Hossein*, 70112, 70119; *Greiff*, 70200 (14).
no Difficulty in obtaining good class of men though department not so popular as others, *Ewing* 70099
Difficulty of obtaining good graduates to compete for, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70073
Difficulty of position, *Greiff* 70200 (16)
DISCONTENT IN:
Cause, *Burrard*, 70186; *Greiff*, 70208.
Extent of, *Burrard* 70161
Reasons and justification, *Greiff* ... 70200 (20)
Division of service into Imperial and (*see under* Division of Service, *etc.*).
Efficient for work, *Burrard* 70188
EXECUTIVE CHARGES:
Drawing office appointments:
not really Executive posts, *Biggie* 70153, 70157
History of posts, *Burrard* ... ... p. 395
considered Important charges, *Burrard* 70197
not Inferior, *Burrard* 70172
Rise of status, 1913, *Burrard* 70183
Salaries, opinion *re*, *Biggie* 70157
Effect, *Burrard* ... ... p. 395
Grievance that posts regarded as part of Provincial cadre, *Greiff* 70216
and Increased proportion:
Advocated, *Biggie* 70140, 70153
not Advocated, *Burrard* ... 70165, 70172
Number desired, *Greiff* 70214
Particulars, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70052, 70066
should be Sufficient, *Burrard* 70161
Transfer to Imperial cadre advocated, *Greiff* 70200 (16)
Fitness of officers for high office, examples, *Biggie*, 70134 (12) (23), 70143; *Greiff*, 70200 (15).

Provincial Service—*continued.*
Fitness of, for Imperial Service in exceptional cases only, *Burrard* 70165
Formation of new service, 1909, and result, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70044
Good work done by officers not recognised, *Greiff* 70200 (15)
some Graduates of Indian universities in, and qualifications of, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70073
GRIEVANCES:
Redress of, *Burrard* 70161
Reply to, *Burrard* 70161
Summary, *Biggie* 70134 (18)
Importance of, to Anglo-Indian community, and protest against proposed abolition, *Biggie* 70134
proposed Increase, no heavy expenditure anticipated as result if Upper Subordinate Service abolished, *Greiff* 70207
New, creation of, consequent discontent, and amalgamation with old service, *Biggie* 70134 (6–8)
Officers sent on campaign, complaints of different treatment from other services, *Biggie* 70134 (18)
Position of, *Lenox-Conyngham*, 70044; *Burrard*, 70165.
Privilege of employment on executive duties somewhat restored since March, 1913, *Biggie* 70145
PROMOTION:
to Charge of circle not anticipated, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70068
Duties on, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70068
to Hold major executive charges, qualifications not sufficient, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70072
of Fixed number to major charges desired, *Ewing* 70098
to Imperial Service:
Advantages, *Greiff* 70200 (15)
to Bottom of list in old system, pay about same as that of junior Imperial officer, *Burrard* 70194
Scheme, *Greiff* 70200 (16), 70212
of Selected seniors for approved service approved, *Burrard* ... 70159, 70165, 70173
of Young officer, discontent was caused by, *Burrard* 70173
Proposal to transfer officers to Imperial list, and impossibility of, *Burrard* 70165
alleged Reduction, 1886 to 1909, denied, and explanation, *Burrard* 70158
Reduction of numbers, 1909, and formation of Upper Subordinate Service, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70044
Relations with Civil and other local officers of districts, *Aulad Hossein* 70117
Relative ranking between officers of Imperial Service and, grievance and example, *Greiff* 70200 (15), 70211
Report of Survey Committee of 1904, and valuelessness of, *Biggie*, 70134 (11)–(12); *Greiff*, 70200 (6).
Residence in hill stations during hot weather, reply to grievance, *Burrard* 70161
Social discourtesies to, complained of, *Biggie*, 70134 (17), *Greiff*, 70200 (15)–(20).
Understaffed, *Biggie* 70134 (20)
Work of, *Burrard* 70165
Work, equally responsible, etc., with that of Imperial officers, *Greiff* 70200 (15)
(*see also* Leave, *etc.*)

Provincial Services, relative responsibilities allotted to, vary in different departments, *Burrard* 70165

R

Recruitment, Imperial Service:
CONFINING OF, TO ROYAL ENGINEER OFFICERS:
Advocated, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70053, 70072
not Advocated, advantages of Indian Army officers, *Burrard* 70178
Entrance examination not necessary for Royal Engineers, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70054
Examination, additional subjects proposed, *Biggie* 70136, 70156

Recruitment, Imperial Service—*continued.*
OF INDIAN ARMY OFFICERS:
Dissatisfaction with present procedure, *Gwyn* 70077, 70083
Sending of officers for period of training in survey work to form nucleus for recruitment:
Question of, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70053
Scheme, *Gwyn* 70077, 70083, 70086
Reasons for maintaining, *Gwyn* 70087
of Indians (*see under* Indians).
Method in other countries, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70056
from Military sources should be stopped, *Greiff* 70200 (16)
from Provincial Service (*see under* Provincial Service).
Rules for the appointment of military officers p. 397
System, and approval of, *Lenox-Conyngham*, 70044; *Ewing*, 70089.

Recruitment, Provincial Service:
Applications only received from Indians, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70055
Best method, question of, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70055
Cessation of, abolition of service not intended, *Burrard* 70198
Competitive examination, subjects, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70072
not Continuing, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70044
by Departmental entrance examination, system satisfactory, *Burrard* 70159
Educational test should be entrance examination for admission into Rurki, and scheme, *Grieff* 70200 (17)
Limit of selection between Indians and Anglo-Indians advocated, *Biggie* ... 70137, 70156
Method, and proportion of Anglo-Indians and Indians, and proposal, *Burrard*, 70184; *Greiff*, 70205.
Papers made easier to give Anglo-Indians a chance, *Burrard* 70187
from Privates, objection to proposal, *Biggie* 70147
Promotion of few selected men from Subordinate Service advocated, *Burrard* 70159
QUALIFICATIONS:
Amendment of wording of rules suggested, *Aulad Hossein* 70110
should be Raised, *Greiff* 70205
Rules for the appointment of officers p. 397-8
System, *Lenox-Conyngham*, 70044; *Ewing*, 70100.
System approved, *Aulad Hossein* 70110
System, and approval of, but standard of physical fitness should be raised, *Ewing* ... 70089

Relations with other Services, satisfactory, *Lenox-Conyngham*, 70051; *Burrard*, 70166.

Retirement, Imperial Service, reduction of period of service advocated, *Lenox-Conyngham* ... 70062

Retirement, Provincial Service, reduction of period of service advocated, *Aulad Hossein*, 70114; *Burrard*, 70163, 70175.

Royal Engineers:
Comparison with Indian Army and Provincial officers, *Greiff* 70200 (17)
Pay, comparison with Public Works Department, *Greiff* 70200 (16)
a Portion of war reserve, *Biggie* 70151
Surveying learnt before joining department not considered to fit officer for employment in survey of India, *Biggie* 70155

Rurki, Thomason Engineering College, recruitment of men having trained at, suggestion, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70044

S

Superintendents:
Assistant (*see* Assistant Superintendents).
Deputy (*see* Deputy Superintendents).

Survey Departments under Local Governments, employment likely to prove uneconomical, *Burrard* 70192

Surveyors, better class required, and proposed pay, *Grieff* 70200 (16)

T

Time-Scale (*see under* Pay).

Training (*see* Probation and Training).

Training Schools:
History of, *Greiff* 70200 (16)
Imperial officers in charge of, unnecessary, *Greiff* 70200 (16)

Transfers, Provincial Service, more frequent transfers of young officers advocated, *Ewing* 70090, 70097, 70103

Travelling Allowance (*see under* Pay).

U

Upper Subordinate Service:
Abolition advocated, *Biggie*, 70134 (20), *Greiff*, 70200 (16).
Formation, 1909, partly to replace Provincial Service, but one service only preferable, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70044
FORMATION OF, BY ENLISTMENT OF NON-COMMISSIONED OFFICERS AND SUITABLY EDUCATED INDIANS AND DOMICILED EUROPEANS:
Scheme, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70044, 70050, 70057, 70064, 70771
no Justification for, and objection, *Biggie* 70134 (4) (20), 70147, 70152
Promotion to Imperial Service should be for exceptional ability only, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70063
Proposal not agreed with, *Burrard* ... 70185
Starting salary, question of, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70064
Statement of duties of Superintendents and Examiners at Southampton and those of Provincial officers in Survey of India, *Greiff* 70200 (17)

W

Work:
Arduous nature of, *Aulad Hossein* 70112
Classes of, and division between Imperial and local governments, *Burrard* 70158
Dependence of other departments on, *Biggie* 70134 (19)
In time of war, *Lenox-Conyngham* 70065
Limitation of, to topographical surveys considered a mistake, *Burrard* 70158
Statement that no more original work remained to be done not agreed with, *Burrard* 70191
should be Suspended in great national emergency, *Burrard* 70196

APPENDIX

TO THE

REPORT

OF

THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XV.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

RELATING TO THE

MADRAS SURVEY DEPARTMENT,

Taken at Madras,

WITH

APPENDICES.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	407
Minutes of Evidence	408
Appendices	419
Index	424

LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION.

At MADRAS, Monday, 26th January, 1914.

	PAGE
G. D. Hatchell, Esq., Director of Revenue Survey, Madras	408
W. A. Hasted, Esq., Deputy Director, Madras Survey Department	416
M.R.Ry. D. Seshacharlu Garu, Assistant Director, Madras Survey Department	417

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

MADRAS SURVEY DEPARTMENT,

At Madras, Monday, 26th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

L. E. BUCKLEY, Esq., I.C.S., Commissioner of Revenue Settlement, Madras.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

D. G. HATCHELL, Esq., Director of Revenue Survey, Madras.

Written Statement relating to the Madras Survey Department.*

PART I.—GENERAL OPINIONS OF EUROPEAN OFFICERS.

70744. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—The present method of recruitment† is to appoint an European and an Indian Officer in alternate vacancies. It has been recognised by Government‡ that a proportion of Europeans is indispensable for the Department, and the system of recruiting such Europeans in India is not, I submit, satisfactory in the present day. Formerly, it was the custom of young men with an English public school training and Indian traditions to come to this country to obtain appointments in the Public Works, Forests, Police and Survey Departments. The Department of Public Works, Forests and Police now recruit their European staff in England and no one with the qualifications required for the Survey Department dreams of coming to Madras from England on the chance of getting a Government appointment.

There has been for some time a vacancy on the European cadre unfilled for want of a suitable man. An officer was appointed on probation some time back, but was unable to pass the examinations required and has been discharged. Appointments of Europeans should be made in England from public school boys who had undergone training in survey at the Ordnance Survey Office, Southampton; physique and eyesight should be good and the age limits 19—23. The conditions of service in the Department are exacting and an officer must be of active habits and fond of an open-air life.

It is casting no slur on educated Indians to say that these qualities are uncommon among them, and generally speaking an Officer in charge of a Survey Party should be a European. It would, however, be unwise to close the gazetted grades of the Department to Indians by whom the subordinate ranks must be filled, and such a course would certainly be detrimental to obtaining educated Indians to fill the upper subordinate grades. The direct appointment of Indians to the gazetted grades is considered inadvisable, as the possession of the qualities referred to above must first be proved and they cannot be proved except by service in field in the upper subordinate grades. The cadre proposed for the Department is seventeen officers, exclusive of the Director, and five of these appointments should be reserved for Indians who had proved their fitness by service.

70745. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The present system of training and probation of officers appointed direct to the gazetted grades is given in Annexure V. Should

* This statement was submitted by Mr. W. A. Hasted, Acting Director of Survey.

† Government Order No. 315, dated 22nd March, 1887, paragraph 8, sub-paragraph 2—Annexure I.

‡ Resolution of the Government of India, dated Simla, 31st May, 1897, No. 2422-Ex., paragraph 8 (2)—Annexure II.

Paragraph 84 of Mr. Carr's report, pre-penultimate sentence—Annexure III.

appointments be made in England, the period of survey training might be limited to six months; the settlement period of training also might be reduced to six months for both Europeans and Indians.

70746. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—Work in the Survey Department, particularly as constituted in this Presidency, is arduous. Not only has the Madras Survey Officer to stand exposure to sun and rain, from year's end to year's end, but he has to control a large staff of men, many of whom have little education and are borne mostly on the temporary establishment. With such a staff he has to achieve the year's stiff programme of work successfully and the drain on his energy is thus heavy. I would therefore recommend that, in compensation of this strain, his burden of service be lightened by making him eligible for voluntary retirement on completion of 25 years' service instead of 30 years' service as required by the present rules. Three European officers, out of a staff of 12, of between 40 and 50 years of age have died during the last few years, and an Indian officer who retired in 1909 survived only three years to enjoy his pension.

70747. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The present scale of pay in the Department is much less than that in force thirty years ago, though expenses of living have increased considerably and salaries in the kindred scientific departments of Public Works and Forests have been raised. There are six appointments on Rs. 300 out of a total of 15 appointments and 10 years may elapse between the appointment of an officer and his first promotion. The reduction in the scale of pay referred to above took place between 1898 and 1905 and was due to the belief, now accepted as erroneous, that the work of the department was practically at an end.

The Revenue surveys of this Presidency are unequalled in India and probably in the world. Their excellence from a professional standard has been recognised by the Surveyor-General of India (Annexure IV.), and their minuteness and accuracy are undisputed. Such surveys are necessitated by the revenue system of Madras and are, of course, costly. It is false economy to employ any but the best material to carry them out, and the department should be placed on a scale of pay similar to that in the Forests and Public Works departments (the other scientific departments of the Presidency) so far as the executive grades of the European appointments are concerned, *i.e.*, incremental from Rs. 380 (after confirmation) to Rs. 700 by annual increments of Rs. 40 and from Rs. 700—Rs. 1,250 by annual increments of Rs. 50. The scale of pay for Indian officers should be Rs. 300—900 by annual increments of Rs. 40. The incremental period for Indians to attain the maximum executive salary is suggested as 15 against 20 years in the European cadre, as it is proposed that Indian officers should be appointed by promotion of upper subordinates—*vide* reply to head I. The difference in the scales of pay suggested is considered to represent the difference between the expenses of European and Indian officers; for the same reason a sterling pension has been proposed for the former.

70748. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—The first seven officers now in the Department are granted leave under the European Service Leave rules and the other European officers will obtain these rules on reaching the grade of Assistant Director, second class. The European Service Leave rules may be extended to all European officers from the date of their entertainment. In the case of Indian officers, service for eligibility for first furlough may be reduced from ten to eight years and the intervals between subsequent furloughs from eight to five years; otherwise the Indian Service Leave rules are considered satisfactory. The minimum absentee allowance of an officer in Europe, £200, is generally regarded as too low, and it may be fixed at £350 for an officer of under ten years' service and at £500 for an officer of over ten years' service, the maximum being £800. It is impossible now for a married officer to live at home on his furlough pay, and he generally returns to India in debt, conditions which prevent his holiday being as beneficial as it should have been. The furlough pay of officers in India may also for the same reason be raised to two-thirds the average salary drawn in the three years of service preceding the furlough. It is also suggested that privilege leave in both European and Indian cadres be allowed to accumulate up to six months and that furlough should be commutable into privilege leave in the ratio of 2:1 up to a maximum absence at one time of nine months on full pay.

70749. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Consequent on the proposals under (III) Conditions of service, it is recommended that a Survey officer be rendered eligible for an invalid pension of half average emoluments after twenty years of completed service and to a retiring pension of the same on completion of 25 years' service. The maximum pension admissible for ordinary service should be £500 a year and Rs. 5,000 for Europeans and Indians, respectively, an additional pension of Rs. 100 being given to Indians for each year's service after 25. The pension to an officer who had served for three years as Director, either acting, sub *pro-tem.*, or substantive, should be £600 a year to Europeans and Rs. 6,000 to Indians. In column 1 of article 408, Civil Service Regulations, the figures 10, 15, 20, 25 and 30 years may be substituted for 15, 20, 25, 30 and 35 years' service.

70750. **(VII) Limitation of employment of non-Europeans, etc.**—See reply to head I. It is there suggested that the department be divided into two services, European and Indian.

70751. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The junior officers of the department have now to serve for a time as Land Records Superintendents. The work to be done is not professional, and it is desirable that the early and impressionable years of a survey officer should be spent in fitting him to control a survey party. The posts of Land Records Superintendents could be filled by Deputy Collectors with a six months' training in survey and the officers of the two departments should be separate.

70752. **(IX) Other points.**—The officers of the Madras Survey have to provide their own tents, though other officers are supplied with them, and it is suggested that the recommendation of the Board of Revenue (Board's Reference No. 2415, dated 6th October, 1910) that tentage should be allowed at the rate of Rs. 50 per mensem to Director and at Rs. 35 to other officers may be now given effect to. The recommendation was not approved by Government.

The Presidency allowance granted to the officer in charge of the Central office is Rs. 60 only, but the difference in the necessary expenses of life between Madras and mofussil is at least Rs. 250. The allowance may be raised to Rs. 200, the same as given to the Assistant Inspector-General of Police.

The question of the re-organisation of the survey gazetted staff is now engaging the attention of Government, as also that of the Land Records Department. The continuance of the latter appears neither necessary nor economical. Periodical resurveys or revision surveys will, in the long run, prove more economical and effectual. The Revenue department ought not to feel any appreciable difficulty in administration in the interval between one settlement and the next. The karnam's opportunities for oppressing the ryots are growing fewer, and with the advance in primary education they are bound to grow fewer still. The Land Records staff must, therefore, disappear, and at once. In that event there should be six survey parties on a permanent footing. At two officers for each party, and three for the Central Survey office, 16 officers, including the Director, will be needed for the department. Two more officers will be required as reserve, to take the place of officers on leave, so that the department may be self-contained.

PART II.—OPINIONS OF INDIAN OFFICERS.

70753. They agree in all particulars with those of the European officers of the department with the exception of the following.

70754. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The proportion of European to Indian officers in the department should be equal, *i.e.*, 50 per cent. in each case. In the case of Indian officers, appointments should be made partly by recruitment and partly by promotion from the upper subordinate grade. (One of the Indian officers consulted is in favour of promotion only.)

Since a survey officer, European or Indian, has similar duties to perform, there should be no differentiation in the matter of selection of an officer for the charge of a party. It should go by seniority, and, as in the incremental system of pay proposed under head IV. (conditions of salary), increments can be stopped for inefficiency, there will be no chance of an officer not up to the mark holding charge of a party.

70755. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—There should be no distinction in the salaries of officers, European or Indian; such a distinction has hitherto not been made in the Madras Survey Department. The minimum salary should be Rs. 380.

70756. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—No distinction seems necessary in the case of officers other than the Director. The limit of maximum pension may in their case be fixed at Rs. 6,000.

70757. **(VII) Limitation of employment of non-Europeans.**—Please see note under head I.

* * * * *

ANNEXURE I.

Extract from paragraph 8 *of G.O. No.* 315, *dated* 22*nd March*, 1887, *communicated in Board's Proceedings* (*Settlement*) *No.* 82, *dated* 20*th May*, 1887.

* * * * *

2. His Excellency the Governor in Council is of opinion that, unless some unforeseen contingency occurs, such as the death or retirement of more than the usual annual proportion of officers, it will not be necessary to make further appointments to the Survey Department; in the event of this contingency arising, he will be prepared to appoint a native of India to every alternate vacancy.

ANNEXURE II.

Extract from the Resolution of the Government of India, dated 31*st May*, 1897, *No.* 2422-*Ex.*, *printed in G.O. No.* 491, *Financial, dated* 24*th June*, 1897.

* * * * *

B.—Services and departments in which a proportion of Europeans is held by the Government of India to be indispensable.

8. The only services and departments which have as yet been admitted within this category are those referred to in the orders of 1879 regarding appointment and promotion of Europeans. They are—

(1) The Account Departments, Civil, Public Works and Military and the Forest Department, so far as these are filled by appointment, after examination; and

(2) the Education Department in the case of persons appointed by the Secretary of State.

The following departments—Opium, Salt, Customs, Survey, Mint, Public Works and Police.

These orders do not refer to appointments of which the pay is less than Rs. 200.

ANNEXURE III.

Extract from paragraph 84 *of report of Mr. R. C. C. Carr, Officer on Special Duty, dated* 12*th February*, 1903, *to the Secretary to Government, Revenue Department, in connection with the creation of the Land Records Department and the re-organisation of the Survey Department.*

* * * * *

The European element is indispensable, and will always be required for the post of Superindendent.

ANNEXURE IV.

Extract letter from the Superintendent, Southern Circle, Survey of India, Bangalore, to the Director of Survey, Madras, No. 979, *dated the* 7*th July*, 1911.

* * * * *

The results of this year's survey of the former sheet go to show that the reductions are accurate and suitable for utilisation as a basis for our one inch surveys.

* * * * *

ANNEXURE V.

Training of Probationary Assistant Directors of Survey.

1. Before appointment as Probationary Assistant Directors, candidates will be required to pass an examination in mathematics. The papers will be on the following subjects:—

Arithmetic.
Algebra—Quadratics, including the Binomial theorem.
Euclid—First four books.
Mensuration.
Trigonometry—Solution of plane triangles.

2. If successful, the probationer will be attached to a Survey Party for one month, to a Settlement Party for 12 months, to a Survey Party again for six months, and to the Central Survey Office for three months.

3. When fully qualified to perform all the duties of an Assistant Director of Survey, he will, if he has passed satisfactorily the examination in Survey and Settlement and the prescribed examination in a native language, be recommended for confirmation on Rs. 300.

COURSE OF INSTRUCTION.

(I) *Survey Party—One month.*

4. Elements of survey and use of the following instruments:—Chain, offset pole, cross staff, prismatic compass, plane table, protractor, plotting and offset scales, area square and computing scale.

(II) *Settlement Party—Twelve months.*

After the probationer has undergone the course of one month's training as prescribed above, he will be attached to a Settlement Party for 12 months, to acquaint himself with the general principles of Land Revenue Administration and Settlement. He should study the following subjects in which he will be examined at the end of the Settlement course:—

(1) Madras Administration Report for 1901-2—Chapter 1, 122—214 inclusive.
(2) Standing Orders of the Board of Revenue—Chapters I, I-A, IV, VII, VIII, XIII and XIX, Orders 201, 202 and 202A.
(3) Revenue Acts and Regulations—
Madras Regulations XXV and XXVI of 1802.
Madras, Act II. of 1864.
Do. Act. III. of 1869.
Do. Act VIII. of 1869.
Do Act I. of 1876.
Do. Act V. of 1882.
Do. Act II. of 1894.
Do. Act III. of 1895.
Do. Act IV. of 1897.
Do. Act I of 1908.
(4) Manuals of Village and Taluk Accounts.
(5) Settlement Manual.

(III) *A Survey Party—Six months.*

(1) The survey and demarcation of a 300-acre block—all the records for the block should be prepared by the probationers themselves—one and a half months.

(2) Instruction in the use and adjustments of the theodolite and in observation and computation of azimuths. At least three observations should be taken, and the correct bearings of three lines computed. Traverse computation and plotting by Gales' system—one and a half months.

(3) The traverse survey of 40 linear miles of village or khandam boundaries—one month.

(4) The survey with theodolite of four square miles by triangulation and the topographical survey of this area. The topographical survey should show the limits of wet and dry cultivation, village boundaries and topographical details, but not the boundaries of fields. The connection of the two great trigonometrical stations in the above area and the recording and computation of results in the forms prescribed—one month.

(5) Charge of a Sub-Assistant's section performing all the duties required of a Sub-Assistant—one month.

(IV) *Central Survey Office—Three months.*

(1) The probationer should work the means and synopses of the observations for triangulation referred to in section 4 above, compute the sides of triangles and the spherical excess of the angles and find out the latitudes and longitudes and azimuths of the stations.

(2) He should prepare a traverse chart on the 4-inch scale entering in it the observed angles and measured distances in black ink and the computed angles and distances in red ink. He should then prepare the following records:—

(i) Main and minor traverse and all other computation records for one great trigonometrical triangle.

(ii) Pantagraph reductions to the 1-inch scale of the 16-inch maps of two or three villages, total area not less than 10 square miles.

(3) He should be instructed in the following branches of work:—

(*a*) Final examination of village maps.

(*b*) Projection of taluk and district maps.

(*c*) Stellar observations for time, azimuth and latitude.

(*d*) Construction and adjustment of the theodolite and other surveying instruments.

5. *Examination in Survey.*—The probationer should study the following text-books in which a departmental examination will be held on completion of his course of instruction in survey:—

(1) Karnam's Survey Manual.

(2) Madras Survey Manual of Departmental Rules.

(3) Rurki Survey Manual, Chapters 1 to X, XIV and XV.

(4) Clancey's Aid to Land Surveying.

(5) Text-book of topographical and geographical surveying by Major C. F. Close, C.M.G.

(6) Chamber's Mathematical Tables, Introduction, explanation and use of the following tables:—

(i) Common logarithms.

(ii) Logarithmic sines, tangents and secants.

(iii) Natural sines, cosines, chords, etc.

(iv) Natural tangents and secants.

(7) The auxiliary tables of the Survey of India, introduction, explanation and use of the tables X, XI, XII, XVI, and XVII.

6. *Examination in Vernacular.*—The examination to be passed in a native language is that prescribed in G.O. No. 508, Public, dated 24th June, 1891. It consists of:—

(1) Reading fairly and translating with accuracy an original letter or report of moderate length and difficulty in the language of the district.

(2) Dictating an order.

(3) Rendering into English a vernacular report read out.

(4) Conversing with the examiner or with natives of India on subjects likely to occur in the performance of professional duty, in the transaction of ordinary business or in the course of everyday life. If the candidate proves his ability to comprehend readily all that is said to him and to make himself fairly intelligible, more should not be required of him.

Supplementary Written Statement relating to the Madras Survey Department.*

70758. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—I would confine recruitment of the European cadre to graduates of the English, Scotch or Irish Universities who have taken an honours degree in Mathematics. It is from this class that the Forest Department and to a certain extent the superior Revenue Establishment of Indian State Railways, and, if I am not mistaken, the Egyptian Survey Department are now recruited, and I believe the supply is greatly in excess of the demand. The choice of candidates I would leave to a Selection Committee appointed by the Secretary of State in Council. The standard of physical fitness should be as high as that of the Forest Department. I would confine recruitment of the appointments reserved for Indians to Upper Subordinates (Sub-Assistants) of the Department. There is no gainsaying the fact that an out-of-door life is not congenial to the average Indian graduate, and that the Indian is sooner rendered unfit for hard work in the field than the European through his ageing more rapidly. The Indian is in his element in an office and generally renders excellent service. A degree in Engineering would be wasted on a Survey Officer, and no degree is any criterion of an Indian's value as a Survey Officer. This can be gauged only by his conduct of his duties in the Upper Subordinate grades of the Department.

70759. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—I am in full agreement with Mr. Hasted in considering that the present system of training is faulty. Ten months' training in Survey is insufficient to make the average Probationer an efficient Assistant to the Officer in charge of a Survey Party, but owing to the exigencies of the Service he has more than once been required to hold charge of a Survey Party! If in future, recruitment for the European cadre is confined to graduates, I would require the selected candidates to undergo a course of Survey at the Ordnance Survey Office, Southampton. I doubt they would be able to satisfy the Surveyor-General of the Ordnance Survey as to their general knowledge of Survey in less than a year. As a rule, it takes a student at the Royal Geographical Society's headquarters longer than this to obtain the Society's diploma, but few of them, I believe, have had the advantage of a Varsity education.

70760. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—There is no exaggeration whatever in Mr. Hasted's description of the very bad conditions now prevailing in the Department. They could hardly be worse! The impossibility of the task imposed on Survey Officers is not only destructive of their peace of mind, but of economy also. This I have repeatedly urged since I took charge of my office 13 years ago, but to no effect. It is generally recognised that to get the best out of the low-paid Indian employee, Civil or Military, adequate European supervision is a *sine qua non*. There is a greater efficiency, greater desire to please, and a general spirit of *esprit de corps* amongst the rank and file when they know their European Officers and realise that they are known to them. In the Survey Department, as at present constituted, it is impossible for the European Officer in charge of a Survey Party, comprising 200 to 300 low-paid subordinates in office and field, unaided by an assistant, to know his men as he should and to exercise the supervision they require. He has in consequence to leave much undone that should be done and to rely on the reports of his upper subordinates, some of whom are not free from bias, and create disaffection. The system of Survey adopted in this Presidency and necessitated by its Revenue Administration is much more complicated than that of any other Province. A high standard of accuracy is insisted upon, but at the

* This statement was put in by Mr. Hatchell subsequent to his oral examination. In forwarding it he wrote that he agreed in the main with the preceding written statement, to which this is supplementary.

same time exception is taken to the cost of the survey. This is dependent to some extent on the individual efforts of the surveyors. While idlers and inaccurate workers are put under stoppages of pay, the progress of the survey is delayed and its rateable cost increased as the supervisory charges are irreducible. The only way in my opinion to effect these desiderata is to give the Officer in charge of each Party an Assistant.

70761. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The conditions of salary ruling in the Department are clearly indicated in the accompanying tabulated statement* in which the rate of promotion at present obtaining in the Survey and three other Departments is compared. The six Survey Officers, whose service in each grade is averaged are, excepting myself, all that remain of those who joined the Department prior to the changes effected in the cadre in 1891 and 1905. I have excluded myself, as my fortune has been so good that it would be destructive of the presentation of the real prevailing conditions under which the other six officers are labouring to include in the averages the figures that pertain to me. It has not been possible to calculate what additional amounts officers have received on account of acting or sub *pro tem.* promotions, but this I believe will not affect to any appreciable extent the relative differences in the average salary of an officer of each of the four Services. The figures from which were calculated the average service of a Survey and a Police Officer on promotion to each grade, as also of officers of the other two Services in the grades on Rs. 1,500 and upwards, were obtained from the Madras Quarterly Civil List corrected up to 1st October, 1913, and from the classified list of the State Railway Establishment corrected up to 31st December, 1912. It will be seen that though Police Officers have fared badly as compared with the Officers of the Forest, and Traffic Department of State Railways, the lot of the Survey Officers has been infinitely worse, *e.g.*, one of the six officers with upwards of 21 years' service is still on Rs. 550 only, two with upwards of 26 and 20 years' service on Rs. 750, and two with upwards of 29 and 28 years' service on Rs. 900, and one only with close on 30 years' service on Rs. 1,100. In the event of his seniors remaining in service, until they reach the age of 55 years, Mr. Lushington cannot get Rs. 900 until 17th November, 1917, the date on which Mr. MacHutchin must retire, and even then he will not be able, as he will reach the age of 55 on 14th July, 1920, to put in three years' service in that grade to entitle him to full pension in spite of the 33 years' service—all but three weeks—which he will then have to his credit. It is clear, therefore, that the graded system of pay has worked much hardship in the Survey Department. If any further evidence of this is required, it is to be found in the last column of the statement which shows that the average annual emolument of a Survey Officer during the first 20 years of his service was £325 per annum, as against an average of £589 in the other three Services, or 45 per cent. less. Further calculations on the same basis show that the average emoluments in 20 years of the same six Survey Officers were less by Rs. 35,417 or £2,361 than that received by all the nine retired, or deceased, Civilian Officers, who served in the Department since its creation in 1858, with the exception of the late Mr. G. P. Greene, who is excluded for the reason that he, like me, was exceptionally fortunate in rising to the head of the Department some years before he had completed 20 years' service. The necessity and equity of an incremental system of pay has been recognised by the Secretary of State and adopted in all the uncovenanted Services except the Survey and the Police, which the tabulation statement clearly shows are in urgent need of it too.

The incremental scale of pay recommended by Mr. Hasted is much the same as that adopted for the Forest and Public Works Departments and is calculated to give the Survey Officer a salary of Rs. 1,250 per mensem when he reaches his twentieth year of service. Thereafter his chance of further promotion is less than that of the Forest or Public Works Departments Officer, who have five and nine appointments rising to Rs. 1,900 and 2,750 respectively to look forward to, as against his one appointment on Rs. 1,800, since reduced to Rs. 1,400 for future incumbents. This reduction of salary is quite unjustifiable as the difference of Rs. 300 between the pay of the Deputy Director 1st class and the future maximum pay of the Director is not only not commensurate with the heavier work and responsibilities of the latter officer, but does not cover the additional cost of residence at the Presidency town. Nothing less favourable than the incremental scale recommended by Mr. Hasted can in justice be granted to the six Survey Officers whose lot as compared with that of their contemporaries in the Police who were recruited in the same way and from the same class, or with that of officers of the other two Services or even with past officers of their own Service, has been so hard. It is the only fair scale for European Officers for whom conditions of life in India are gradually getting harder, and I feel sure it will attract men of the best 'Varsity education. It is possible that in their ignorance of conditions of life in India, they would accept a lower scale of salary, but it would be impolitic to offer it, as in the course of time it would be the cause of complaint or dissatisfaction. The scale of pay recommended by Mr. Hasted for Indian Officers is slightly higher than that now obtaining in the Public Works and Forest Departments. Though I see no reason why it should be so, I am quite averse to any less favourable scale than that now obtaining or that may hereafter be adopted in the other two Services. Though the liability of the European and Indian Survey Officer to injury to his health through frequent attacks of malaria may be less than that of his confrère in the Forest Department, he has to undergo just as much exposure to the elements and must necessarily have more office work owing to the much larger establishment he has to control and to the closer scrutiny of details which his work demands. I would, however, strongly recommend a higher rate of increment, *i.e.*, Rs. 80, as a special concession to Mr. T. A. Sundaram Ayyar in consideration of the fact that he has been acting in the gazetted grades almost continuously since 1904, and could not be confirmed for want of a permanent vacancy until 20th October, 1911, when he had reached the 48th year of his age. He has rendered exceptionally good service and it would be distinctly hard that he should suffer a large reduction in his pension as he will do, if not given the higher incremental rate of Rs. 80 from the date of his confirmation until the 30th November, 1918, when he will reach the age of 55. I quite agree with Mr. Hasted that the Land Records Superintendents should not be included in the Survey cadre. Those of them who are ex-Tahsildars and have undergone only six months' training in Survey are quite unfit to hold the appointment of an officer in the Survey Department.

70762. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—I am in full agreement with all that Mr. Hasted has said on this subject. Sanction to accumulate privilege leave up to six months and to commute furlough into privilege leave in the ratio of 2:1 up to a maximum absence at one time of nine months on full pay would be a great boon to many a married European Officer who is debarred from taking furlough, of which he may be in urgent need, owing to his inability to maintain himself and his family in Europe on half pay. It would also be very beneficial to all grades of Indian employees who are generally precluded from taking long leave, of which they are in need, for the same reason.

70763. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—Under Chapter XIX, Article 474, C.S.R., a Survey Officer cannot obtain any pension at all until he has completed 30 years' service whereas officers of the Public Works, Forest, and Telegraph, are eligible not only for a proportionate pension of £350 after 20 years' service but to full pension of £437 10s. after 25 years. It is generally understood

* *Vide* page 414.

that the Commission which in 1902-03 enquired into the conditions of service in the Police were strongly of opinion that 30 years' service was much too long and even went to the extent of recommending compulsory retirement of the whole force —officers and men—after 25 years' service.

There is no need to make retirement compulsory after 25 years' service in the Survey, but it should certainly be optional as in the Public Works Department and Forest Services. Few will avail themselves of the concession but the feeling that they are not tied down to 30 years of service in India will give to their outlooks towards the future a more roseate hue. It is better for the Service that the few who elect to retire on completion of 25 years' service should not be compulsorily detained for a further five years as they are likely to feel they are working more for their pension than for Government. The invalid pension after 20 years' service should certainly be increased from one-third to one-half of the average emoluments of the last three years of service rendered. I altogether disagree with Mr. Hasted that the maximum pension for Europeans and Indians should be £500 and Rs. 5,000. It should be £600 and Rs. 6,000 in consideration of the fact that the scale of pension was fixed as long ago as 1855 when £500 was the equivalent of Rs. 5,000. The present pension of £437 10s. at the rate of 1s. 9d. per rupee is therefore £62 10s. less than it was 59 years ago! In consideration of the totally different conditions of service and the high cost of living now prevailing the equity of an addition to the pension of £100 in Europe or Rs. 1,000 in India cannot be disputed. The appointment of Director of Survey is not one of those enumerated in Article 475 of Chapter XIX of the C.S.R., and it certainly should be added. The distinction made thereby between the Director of Survey and a Deputy Inspector-General of Police and Conservator of Forests is invidious. In any case, my salary for the past eight years has been more than that of five of the eight officers of the Police and Forests now eligible for the additional pension of Rs. 1,000 a year. As pointed out *supra* under "conditions of salary" the reduction of the pay of the Director of Survey from Rs. 1,500-1,800 to Rs. 1,200-1,400 was quite uncalled for, as there has been no diminution in his duties and responsibilities, but rather an undoubted increase which is bound to continue.

Though I failed to touch on Mr. Hasted's remark in para. IV *supra*, *re* the relative expenses of European and Indian Officers, and since I have recommended a maximum pension of Rs. 6,000 for the Indian officer which the existing code method of calculating pensions on the basis of the salary drawn during the last three years of service will not allow of if the highest salary allowed to the Indian is fixed at Rs. 900, I must explain the discrepant figures. There is no doubt that the increase in the expenses of the Indian Survey Officer, through the rise in the cost of house rent and food stuffs, etc., is, as in the case of the European officer, out of all proportion to any increase of salary he has received in the past. The Indian, though his standard of living is less expensive than that of the European, is burdened with many social and family liabilities, *e.g.*, the marriage of all his daughters and the provision of a dowry for each of them, and the housing and feeding of sometimes a host of needy distant relatives, who from the European point of view have really no claim on him. In course of time the Indian no doubt will shake himself free of these encumbrances and should then be much better off on Rs. 900 per mensem than the European on Rs. 1,250. He cannot legitimately claim the same pay, at any rate, if recruited in India, as every man who leaves his native land for foreign parts expects to be well remunerated for so doing. I am of opinion that a maximum pension of Rs. 500 per mensem is none too high, though about Rs. 84 more than he is entitled to according to the present code rules for an Indian who has served for three years in the highest grade on Rs. 900 per mensem.

70764. **(VII) Limitation in the employment of non-Europeans.**—The ideal Survey Officer is one who is more in his element out of doors than at his office table. For this reason and because the average Indian ages more rapidly, I agree with Mr. Hasted that the number of Indian officers should be limited to one-third, and I would employ the majority of them in office.

70765. I quite agree with Mr. Hasted's remarks in paragraph 70751 and consider the reasonableness of his claim in paragraph 70752 indisputable.

Average service of an officer on promotion to each grade (referred to in paragraph 70761).

Department.	Rs. 300.	Rs. 400.	Rs. 425.	Rs. 450.	Rs. 500.	Rs. 550.	Rs. 700.	Rs. 750.	Rs. 800.	Rs. 900.	Rs. 1000.	Rs. 1100.	Rs. 1200.	Rs. 1250.	Rs. 1500.	Rs. 1700.	Rs. 1800.	Rs. 1900.	Rs. 2000.	Approximate average emoluments received by an officer during the first 20 years of his service calculated on substantive pay, and not excluding periods spent on furlough and medical leave.
	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	Years	
Police ... ... (67 Officers)	...	1·8 (14 officers)	...	...	4·7 (14 officers)	...	8·3 (9 officers)	...	10·8 (7 officers)	15·7 (11 officers)	20·9 (5 officers)	...	24·5 (2 officers)	...	21·6 (3 officers)	...	28·8 (2 officers)	...	...	Rs. 1,56,492 or £522 per annum.
Survey ... ... (6 Officers)	4 (5 officers) §	...	6·75 (6 officers)	...	...	15 (6 officers)	...	18·5 (5 officers) *	...	21·5 (2 officers) †	...	22·6 (1 officer) ‡	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	Rs. 97,492 or £325 per annum.
Forests ‖ ... (31 Officers)	...	1·5	2·1	...	3	5·3	8·4	9·4	10·4	12·4	14·4	16·4	18·4	19	23 approximate (1 officer)	26·2 (2 officers)	...	29·3 (1 officer)	...	Rs. 1,94,640 or £649 per annum.
Traffic Dept. State Ry. ¶ ... (80 Officers) excluding 10 administrative officers on Rs. 1250 to 2000, and about a dozen Probationers on Rs. 200 to 300.	...	2	...	4	...	6	8	...	10	12	14	16	...	...	26·1 (3 officers)	...	...	...	28·1 (2 officers)	Rs. 1,78,800 or £596 per annum.

N.B.—Those Officers of the Police, Forests and Traffic Departments who have risen from the ranks and whose service is therefore abnormal are excluded.

* Mr. Bateman, whose service to date is 21 years 2 months and 11 days, is still on Rs. 550.
† Messrs. Lushington and Gompertz, whose services to date are 26 years 5 months and 23 days and 20 years 9 months and 20 days respectively, are still on Rs. 750.
‡ Messrs. Hasted and Mullins, with services to date of 29 years 2 months and 7 days and 28 years 2 months and 16 days respectively, are still on Rs. 900.
§ Mr. MacHutchin excluded, as the grade on Rs. 300 was created after he was promoted to Rs. 425.
‖ Promotions from Rs. 380 to Rs. 1250 automatically by increments of Rs. 40 or 50 annually; thereafter by vacancies and selections. The averages therefore are not actuals, but approximate, and are shown for comparative purposes only.
¶ Two classes (comprising 8 grades from Rs. 400 to 1100) of District Officers and one class (3 grades from Rs. 1250 to 2000) of administrative Officers. Promotions from class to class is by vacancy and selection, but from grade to grade automatically every two years. Royal Engineer Officers are excluded.

Mr. D. G. Hatchell called and examined.

70766. (*Chairman.*) The work of the Madras Survey Department was not topographical, but purely cadastral.

70767. The 15 gazetted officers in the Department had been recruited in India, but all the European officers had had an English school education.

70768. The present and future requirements of the Service would depend on the work the Government required it to do. At present it was engaged principally on revisional survey work. The surveys of a few estates also were in progress.

70769. He did not contemplate that at an early date the staff would be able to be reduced to the number suggested by the Government of India and the Madras Government in 1905. There was 20 years' work still to be done, if account was taken of the survey of the zamindari tracts. He agreed with the European officers' statement that a Land Records Department was neither necessary nor economical, and that six survey parties should be maintained on a permanent footing. It would be probably found much cheaper to have a resurvey or revision survey every 30 years than to employ a maintenance staff during that period. If it was decided that the Presidency should be resurveyed every 30 years, the survey parties would have to be employed permanently. In England the Ordnance survey had found it necessary to resurvey each county every 15 years; and in the Madras Presidency resettlements were made every 30 years.

70770. The present method of recruitment was to appoint a European officer and an Indian officer in alternate vacancies. Since the issue in 1908 of a Government order that there was no longer any reason for the continuance of the rule, one European, one Anglo-Indian and two Indians had been recruited to the Service, so that hitherto the rule had still been observed in practice.

70771. He differed from the proposal put forward in the written statement that, for the future, European officers should be recruited in England after a year in the Ordnance Survey. He was of the opinion that appointments should be made from amongst graduates of the English Universities who had taken honours, especially in mathematics. That was a much better scheme than an examination scheme. Under his system officers would come out to India about 23 or 24. The present age of recruitment was under 24, and this was satisfactory.

70772. Assuming that the work became more and more connected with the maintenance of land records, and less and less with surveying, he would still say that it was necessary to recruit from England. If Europeans were to be recruited at all, they should be recruited from England. For revenue survey work suitable European officers could not be obtained in India.

70773. In the Bengal Revenue Survey all the officers were of the Indian Army; he did not think there were any uncovenanted civilians. He was not aware that there were a good many provincial survey officers doing survey work in India and holding major charges.

70774. He objected to seconding provincial officers in the Survey of India because the system in Madras was absolutely different from that adopted elsewhere in India. In the Survey of India they had a 16-inch map. Every holding was treated as a separate field, and surveyed and plotted on the map. Whereas in the Madras Survey, in addition to a 16-inch map, holdings to a maximum number of 10 were clubbed to form survey fields of four and eight acres in wet and dry lands, for each of which a large scale plan on the 40 or 80-inch scale was prepared. Asked why that work could not be done by highly-trained officers locally recruited, the witness said that locally-recruited officers had been tried and some had failed. For instance, an ex-officer of a British regiment was put on probation for some time and had failed hopelessly in mathematics.

70775. Of the 15 appointments in the Service nine were held by Europeans, four by Indians and one by an Anglo-Indian. The remaining appointment was held, sub. *pro tem.*, by an Indian now attached to the Lands Records Department. The vacancy appertained to the European cadre. Two of the Indian officers were employed in the Central office, one was on furlough on medical certificate, and the other was on other duty as a Deputy Collector. Europeans were in charge of all the parties.

70776. He suggested that Indian officers should not be appointed by direct recruitment, but by promotion from the subordinate ranks. Promoted officers should generally be graduates, but he would not debar a good man from being promoted merely on the ground that he was not a graduate. He objected to direct recruitment, because it was absolutely impossible to tell whether a man would turn out well or not. The mere fact that he was a graduate was no criterion of his value as a Survey officer. One stronger reason which he had for not desiring direct recruitment was that survey work was uncongenial to an educated Indian.

70777. He had proposed a time-scale for all the officers in the Department, with the exception of the Director, but, on further consideration, he would be in favour of a charge bar between the Rs. 300 grade and the Rs. 900 grade.

70778. (*Mr. Madge.*) There was no comparison between the natural aptitude for survey work of the Madrasi and the North-West Frontier Province man. Most of the men who had distinguished themselves in the Survey of India Department were Muhammadans, who took to field work more keenly than Hindus.

70779. When men with excellent qualifications were available in such large numbers in England, it would be false economy to take on a cheaper locally-recruited man with lower qualifications. He was not aware of the fact that both domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians now held not only executive, but administrative posts in the Survey of India Department. It was the case in years gone by, but the conditions of service nowadays were totally different from what they were 30 or 40 years ago. Even as regards revisional work, the quality had altered in the last few years. The work was done now in much greater detail.

70780. The scale of pay in the Department was much less at the present time than it was 30 years ago. The existing six officers, excluding himself, had drawn during the first 20 years of their service about Rs. 35,000 less on an average than the nine retired, or deceased, uncovenanted civilian officers who had served in the Department from its inception in 1858 with the exception of the late Mr. G. P. Greene who was exceptionally fortunate in rising to the head of the Department some years before he had completed 20 years' service. In 1896 one appointment of Rs. 1,100 had been abolished, and another two posts worth Rs. 1,500 a month were later abolished in order to allow comparatively junior officers to retire. An agitation was started, and Government replaced two posts worth Rs. 1,800 a month. That meant three appointments worth Rs. 2,600 had been done away with, and two posts at Rs. 1,800 had been given back.

70781. (*Mr. Fisher.*) In Madras the survey was made in greater detail than in Bengal. For this reason a larger supervisory establishment was needed. But for many years past it had not been possible to attach an Assistant to each survey party.

70782. (*Mr. Sly.*) He did not know whether the Madras system of survey was exactly the same as the Bombay system. At the present time the Bombay Government had no Survey Department; they had abolished it altogether, and had instituted a Land Records Department.

70783 Every officer in the Madras Survey had learnt the technical work within the department. They had received no special training elsewhere. He himself, however, had done a course of field astronomy at the Royal Geographical Society's headquarters when in England on furlough some

years ago, and had introduced the subject in the curriculum for Probationary Assistant Directors.

70784. He had absolutely no objection to an Indian graduate being employed as a Survey officer, provided he proved his fitness for the post in the upper subordinate ranks of the department. It was impossible to decide beforehand whether an Indian would make a good Survey officer or not.

70785. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He did not set up a higher standard for officers employed in the Madras Department than was found to be sufficient for officers employed in the Survey of India. Some excellent work had been done by Indians and Anglo-Indians in the Madras Survey, but his contention was that they must go in through the upper subordinate ranks. The work in the Madras Survey was very hard physically, and in this respect the Indian was handicapped more in the Madras Presidency than he was in the northern parts of India, as he seldom was a good man on a horse, and fatigued himself and wasted his time in camp by walking or travelling in slow-moving country carts.

70786. Asked whether he thought it was sound policy to exclude altogether a class which played an important part in the country, the witness replied he desired to get the best men.*

70787. (*Mr. Buckley.*) On two previous occasions it had been contemplated that the Madras Survey Department should come to an end and its place taken by a lands record and maintenance department. Those hopes had not been fulfilled, and unless an improved system of maintenance could be devised, it would be necessary to retain the Department on its present footing for a considerable time to come.

70788. With regard to his experience of the employment of graduates, there had been some who had been quite satisfactory in the upper subordinate grades, and some who had been the reverse. At present he had eight B.A.'s on probation, two of whom would have to be discharged for dishonest work. Most of the subordinate staff were temporary men, and therefore more supervision was required: there should be two officers with each party. If there were two officers to each party, the officers in the lower grade, on the Rs. 300 and Rs. 425 scale, would presumably be assistants and would not have the same responsibility as the officer in charge of a party.

(The witness withdrew.)

W. A. Hasted, Esq.,† Deputy Director, Madras Survey Department, called and examined.

70789. (*Chairman.*) The witness represented all the European gazetted officers of the Madras Survey Department. He occupied the position of Deputy Director of the second class and had completed twenty-nine years' service. He was recruited to the Service by nomination, and learnt the work in India.

70790. Appointments of Europeans should be made in England from schoolboys who had undergone training in survey at the Ordnance Survey Office, Southampton, for about one year, but if the policy of converting the department into a Land Records and Maintenance Office was persisted in, he would not then consider it necessary that officers should be appointed from England.

70791. In other provinces of India, land records duties were performed by officers locally recruited, and, as regards survey work, it was the case that such work was entrusted largely to provincial officers, but their work was not so arduous nor did they control the same number of men.

70792. The Service was exacting, and required great physical strength, and it was exceedingly difficult to obtain the right stamp of man in India to fulfil these conditions. During his tenure of office as acting Director he had tried to get such men, and had failed. He had received applications from eight or nine men, but they were certainly not of the class required, either as regards educational qualifications or as regards physique.

70793. He had suggested that a certain number of appointments should be filled by the direct recruitment of Indians, *i.e.*, direct recruitment of graduates in engineering, but since he made that suggestion he had altered his opinion, his reason being that while he was Acting Director he had entertained seven graduates in mathematics for the upper appointments in the upper subordinate service, and two of them had done very badly indeed since they were appointed. He would, however, reserve one-third of the gazetted posts for Indians and Anglo-Indian leaving discretion as to the method of selection. He would mainly draw his gazetted men by promotion from the subordinate ranks. He did not think any high qualifications were necessary for a Survey Officer who was ultimately to attain a position in the gazetted ranks; he would only require to possess a sound knowledge of mathematics. A man who had passed any matriculation examination ought to be fitted for the post of gazetted officer if of good moral character and physically fit.

70794. He suggested for European recruited officers, the same scale of salaries as was now paid to Executive and Assistant Engineers in the Public Works Department. He did not think that was asking for rather a high salary taking into consideration the conditions under which survey officers lived. Moreover, expenses of living had increased enormously. Under his scheme the European Survey Officer would have had no professional training prior to his entering the Service; he would simply go through a course of training in England at the Ordnance Office. He agreed that this would not be comparable to the training received by an officer of the Public Works Department. Those facts would have to be taken into consideration.

70795. He considered that the pay of the Madras Survey Officer should be higher on the average than that of the Provincial Officer in the Survey of India Department, because the latter was, to all intents and purposes, an inhabitant of his

---

* The witness afterwards wrote as follows:—"As this paragraph shows, I have no wish to *exclude* Indians or Anglo-Indians from their *share of* the appointments in the gazetted grades of the Department if fitted to fill them. What I tried to impress on the members of the Commission was that for vacancies in the European cadre the very best men—*i.e.*, graduates of the English universities, who had taken an honours degree in mathematics, should be recruited. As stated in my memorandum, men with these high qualifications are now being recruited for the Forest Department, the Traffic Branch of Indian State Railways, and, I believe, for the Egyptian Survey Department. The argument of one of the members of the Commission that less highly educated men have efficiently performed the duties of a survey officer in the past, and that there is no reason why they should not do so in the future is applicable to the above-mentioned departments; but, fortunately for those services, it was realised that when the best-educated men are available in large numbers, and at a moderate cost, it is false economy to employ any but them. Even though appointments in State railways are non-pensionable, but have a provident fund only, and an officer's services may be dispensed with at any time, there is, I believe, no difficulty in recruiting graduates of English universities."

† This witness was examined upon the written statement put in by Mr. Hatchell—*vide* paragraphs 70744–57.

own country, whereas a European was a foreigner and also because the latter did not control so many men and had a limited field season.

70796. All the officers in charge of survey parties in Madras, below the Director, were engaged on the same kind of duties. The term "Assistant" was a misnomer as the Survey Department was at present constituted. Every Assistant and every Deputy was in charge of a party, and there was no sense in the two titles except in so far as these officers were assistants to the director.

70797. He considered the Survey Department should be maintained on a permanent footing, because in his opinion maintenance of records was nothing but patchwork, and not very good patchwork at that. The results from the maintenance would not be anything like so good as the results to be obtained from revisional surveys. He did not think many of the old surveys were maintainable; a great deal of the country would have to be re-surveyed. The old maps were useless because the work had not been well done. He agreed that when the survey had been completed on efficient lines, it would then be merely a question of maintenance, and of showing changes on the map and this practically amounted to maintenance and land record work.

70798. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He was doubtful whether the Bombay Government were satisfied with the work which had been done in the past. In fact the Land Records Director from Madras was deputed a short time ago to go to Bombay in order to enquire into their system of maintenance, and to see if a similar scheme could be adopted to Madras, but his report was unfavourable.

70799. (*Mr. Sly.*) He had no special technical training in survey work before coming to India. His educational qualifications when he joined were those of a sixth form school boy.

70800. The Service required another seven officers. Of the officers now in the Service three were in the Land Records Department, one being an Anglo-Indian and two Indians.

70801. For six parties twelve officers were required, and in the Central Survey Office, besides the Director, three additional officers were wanted. Fifteen officers in all were required to run the Survey Department. The Land Records Department should be kept quite separate.

70802. (*Mr. Fisher.*) On an average it took a recruit in the Department from 18 months to 2 years to learn his business, including a knowledge of the vernacular. He was then quite competent to do whatever work was required of him, under supervision.

70803. (*Mr. Madge.*) He recommended an ordnance survey training for European recruits as the one best suited to produce good officers. The educational qualification he would propose for Anglo-Indians would be the school-leaving certificate, the Matriculation examination, or a degree in Arts, and he would insist on good physique. A test of character, however, was a far better test in India than the passing of any examination.

70804. It was quite true that the revenue surveys of the Madras Presidency were unequalled in India, and probably in the world. They were most intricate, and the officers of the Service had been complimented on their work by the Surveyor-General of India, who recognised the excellence of the work from a professional standard. The Director of Surveys in Bengal, who came to Madras last year, also said he had never seen anything like it, and was suprised at the accuracy of the work, and the amount done.

70805. (*Chairman.*) With reference to his statement that the work of the Madras Survey had been judged as very accurate and specially intricate, it was true that there were portions of the Presidency where the work had been inaccurately done, but that work had been done in former years.

70806. (*Mr. Buckley.*) One reason of the inferior work which had been done in the Survey Department was that an attempt had been made to utilise village officers in the survey work.

(The witness withdrew.)

M.R.Ry D. Seshacharlu Garu,* Assistant Director, Madras Survey Department, called and examined.

70807. (*Chairman.*) He held the position of Assistant Director of Surveys in the last grade of the gazetted rank. He had 24 years' service. He passed his B.A. and B.C.E. degrees in the Madras University and entered the upper subordinate service as sub-assistant. He served 11 years as sub-assistant before being promoted to be acting Assistant Superintendent, and served six more years before being confirmed in the last grade.

70808. He would like to see 50 per cent. of the staff recruited from Europeans and 50 per cent. from statutory natives of India. In the case of the latter two-thirds should be recruited direct and one-third by promotion. His main reason for desiring to see a larger proportion recruited direct into the Service was that officers were not promoted to gazetted rank until late in life. An Indian officer obtained his degree at about age 21 or 22, when he was nearly in the prime of his life. Therefore if he started in the Department straight-away as a gazetted officer, Government would have the full benefit of his energies both in the field and in the office until he was about 45. After 45 the Indian aged more rapidly than his European colleague. If an Indian started as a sub-assistant on Rs. 150 it would be at least ten years before he could rise to the Rs. 300 grade, and he would then be 32 years of age. Then if he had ten years' service after that as an officer he would not be so efficient as a European officer of the same age. Again, if an Indian attained gazetted rank late in life he would not stand any chance of getting charge of a party.

70809. Looking to the interests of the Service he would suggest that in order to obtain the most efficient officers, the period of probation should not be less than two years.

70810. There might be advantages in a scheme which laid down that an officer should enter the subordinate ranks with a good University qualification and should then be selected, if qualified. for promotion after five or six years' service. He was afraid, however, that the best material would not be attracted to the service under such conditions. There was the possibility of a man not proving a success, and he would not like to be declared a failure after six years of service; he would sooner go into a Department where his future was assured than into one where it was doubtful.

70811. He agreed that European recruits should be brought out from England.

70812. Asked whether an officer recruited from abroad should be paid a higher salary than a locally-recruited man, he said that an Indian who could command Rs. 200 in Madras would be perfectly willing to perform similar duties in Burma or other distant places for 50 per cent. more salary. But if an officer who could command £500 or £600 per annum in England was willing to come to India at £900 per annum, witness did not see where the question of any further allowance came

---

* This witness was examined upon the written statement put in by Mr. Hatchell—*vide* paragraphs 70744–57.

in. It could be inferred, however, from his first statement that he agreed with the principle of a foreign service allowance.

70813. (*Mr. Madge.*) He did not consider that a mere examination success was a better test either of character or of mental equipment than actual service. That was why he suggested that the period of probation should be extended to at least two years. He preferred, however, direct recruitment to promotion from the inferior service. Not a very high degree of mental equipment was required for the Service; it was more a matter of physique. He would not agree that that was all the more reason why men should be promoted instead of directly recruited. Other matters had to be taken into consideration.

70814. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He would be inclined to insist upon a B.A. degree as a qualification for entrance to the Department, because University life gave a man a much wider outlook.

70815-71043. (*Mr. Buckley.*) He would prefer a time-scale to the present graded scale.

(The witness withdrew.)

LIST OF APPENDICES.

PAGE

I.—Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Survey Department ... 420

II.—Statement of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Madras Survey Department 423

III.—Officials and non-officials who furnished written evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their Enquiry into the Madras Survey Department but who were not orally examined 423

APPENDIX I.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Survey Department.

I

1. SURVEY DEPARTMENT.

Gazetted Staff.

At the time of the last Public Service Commission, the gazetted staff of the Survey Department consisted of 18 officers distributed among five Survey Parties and the Central office at Madras. All the appointments were held by non-domiciled Europeans in accordance with the policy pursued till then. It was expected at the time that the survey of the Presidency would probably be completed soon and the Department abolished in a few years. In his despatch No. 17, dated 19th December, 1889, the Secretary of State suggested that in view of the contingency of survey operations coming to a close soon, the question of disposing of the Survey Staff would have to be considered, and he also desired to know if the village maps and records were maintained in this Presidency and corrected with sufficient care year by year so as to obviate the necessity for a resurvey at the expiration of the Land Revenue Settlement current. *Pari passu* with the question of reduction of Survey staff, the question of maintenance of Survey records engaged the attention of Government, and schemes framed from time to time were under consideration and discussion for several years. On the hypothesis that the ordinary professional work of the Survey Department would be completed first by 1895 and then by 1897, reductions were made in the Survey Department. It was first proposed to remodel the Department with the object of making maintenance of Survey and Survey records its principal duty. To this end the districts of the Presidency were divided into six Survey divisions, each of which was placed in charge of a gazetted Survey Officer. This scheme proved a failure for more than one reason and at the same time it was clear that the professional work of the Survey Department was by no means at an end. It was found that a separate staff was required for land records work and that the retention and strengthening of the professional Survey staff was imperative. The subject was under consideration and correspondence with the Government of India until, in 1902, Mr. R. C. C. Carr was placed on special duty to work out proposals after a full investigation of the actual condition of the Survey records in each taluk of the Presidency. After careful consideration of Mr. Carr's report, the Government submitted in 1903 to the Government of India a scheme for the reorganisation of the Survey Department and the formation of a Land Records Department. From 1903 the Survey Department was placed under the direct control and orders of the Board of Revenue in order to secure continuity of policy in the work of the Department. The scheme received the sanction of the Secretary of State in 1905. Its essential features were the reorganisation of the superior staff of the Survey Department with the two-fold object (1) of reducing its strength to the minimum number required to carry out the Survey operations and thereafter to maintain the Survey record, and (2) of improving the prospects of the Survey Officers in the Department at the time who had suffered from slow promotion, and the creation and maintenance of a Land Records agency throughout the Presidency. The forecast of Survey operations framed in 1903 proved too sanguine and it has been found necessary to retain the existing six Survey parties longer than was anticipated. Need has also been felt for strengthening the gazetted supervision of the parties and the Central office by providing two officers for each party, and three officers for the Central office instead of two as at present. A revised scheme of Survey operations with proposals to strengthen the gazetted staff and the party establishments was submitted to the Government of India in June, 1911. Before passing orders on these proposals, the Government of India asked this Government to consider the question of reducing the cost of Madras Surveys, and at their instance the services of Lieutenant-Colonel Crichton of the Bengal Surveys were obtained to examine the system of Surveys in this Presidency. His suggestions have been considered by Government, and the Government of India have been informed that it is found impossible to make any reduction in the cost of Survey parties, and that it will be necessary to retain the Department for several years to come and to strengthen the staff as proposed in the letter of 20th June, 1911.

2. *Number and pay.*—The Survey Department in 1887 consisted of eighteen appointments as follows (distributed among five parties and the Central office)—

	Rate of pay. Rs.	Monthly total. Rs.
One Superintendent of Survey	1,500	1,500
Two Deputy Superintendents, first class	1,100	2,200
Four Deputy Superintendents, second class	* 750	3,450
Three Assistant Superintendents, first class	550	1,650
Five Assistant Superintendents, second class	425	2,125
Three Probationary Assistant Superintendents	200	600
Total per mensem ...		11,525
Total per annum ...		1,38,300

* One was drawing pay at Rs. 1,200, being a military officer.

The above number was reduced by two in 1887—
One Assistant Superintendent, first class.
One Assistant Superintendent, second class.

In 1891 the pay of the Superintendent of Survey was raised to Rs. 1,500—60—1,800. Instead of three Probationary Assistant Superintendents, six appointments of Assistant Superintendents, third class, on a salary of Rs. 200 a month rising to 300 when the incumbents are fully qualified were created. In 1897 two appointments of Deputy Superintendents, second class, and in 1898 one appointment of Deputy Superintendent, first class, were abolished, so that prior to the reorganisation of 1905 the gazetted staff was as follows (distributed among six parties and the Central office):—

	Rs.
One Superintendent ...	1,500—60—1,800
One Deputy Superintendent, first class ...	1,100
Two Deputy Superintendents, second class ...	750
Two Assistant Superintendents, first class ...	550
Four Assistant Superintendents, second class	425
Six Assistant Superintendents, third class ...	300
Total per mensem ...	8,900
Total per annum ...	1,06,800

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

In 1905 the following cadre including five appointments of Land Records Superintendents was sanctioned:—

Scale for new appointments and ultimate scale.

	Rs.
One Deputy Director ...	1,200—40—1,400
Two Assistant Directors, first class	900
Two Assistant Directors, second class	700
Two Assistant Directors, third class	550
Two Assistant Directors, fourth class	425
Three Assistant Directors, fifth class (during period of probation, Rs. 200)	300
	Total Rs. 7,383⅓ per men.
	Or Rs. 88,600 per ann.

The probationers have to be appointed as settlement probationers, there being no provision for such probationers in the Survey Department. The

Special scale for the Officers in the Department at the time of reorganisation.

	Rs.
One Superintendent ...	1,500—60—1,800†
One Deputy Superintendent, first class ...	1,100
Two Deputy Superintendents, second class ...	900
Two Assistant Superintendents, first class ...	750
Two Assistant Superintendents, second class	550
Two Assistant Superintendents, third class ...	425
Five Assistant Directors, fifth class (during period of probation, Rs. 200)	300
	9,550 per men.
	Or Rs. 1,14,600 per ann.

† Mr. D. Hatchell, the present permanent director, is alone permitted to draw this scale of pay.

In 1907 the designation of the Superintendent, viz., "Deputy Director of Survey" was changed to "Director of Survey."

The proposals submitted to the Government of India in June, 1911, provide for the following cadre:—

Number proposed for the next few years.

	Rs.
One Director of Survey ...	1,200—40—1,400
Two Assistant Directors of Survey, first class	900
Two Assistant Directors of Survey, second class ...	700
Two Assistant Directors of Survey, third class ...	550
Two Assistant Directors of Survey, fourth class ...	425
Twelve Assistant Directors of Survey, fifth class ...	300
Two probationers on Rs. 200 each.	

Government have recently proposed the addition of two appointments of probationers on Rs. 200 per mensem to the Survey Department cadre.

Lieut.-Colonel Crichton has in his note on Madras surveys laid great stress on the need for additional European supervision in the interests of

Ultimate scale.

	Rs.
One Director of Survey ...	1,200—40—1,400
Two Assistant Directors, first class	900
Two Assistant Directors second class	700
Two Assistant Directors, third class	550
Two Assistant Directors fourth class	425
Five Assistant Directors, fifth class	300
Total ...	7,983⅓ per mensem.
Two probationers on Rs. 200 each.	

3. *Recruitment and training.*—When the Department was originally created appointments to the gazetted staff were made by nomination. Subsequently competition was introduced open to all classes of British subjects. The competitive system, was, however, subsequently abandoned and either Military officers or Uncovenanted Civilians were appointed on the nomination of the Governor. There was only one Military officer in the Department in 1887. In years just previous to 1887 it has been customary to appoint as probationers young men, principally the sons of Civil or Military Officers, who had been at good schools in England.

In 1887 all the appointments were held by non-domiciled persons in accordance with the policy pursued up to that time. A change in the policy was affected in 1887 at the instance of the Finance Committee on the revision of Provincial contracts. But Indians were promoted to the gazetted grade for the first time in 1892.

The practice for some years thereafter was to appoint to vacancies in the gazetted staff a European and an Indian alternately.

It was decided by Government in 1908 that it was not desirable to lay down any hard and fast rules either that Land Records Superintendents should invariably be Europeans or as to the number of appointments which should be held by Europeans and Indians and that there was no longer any reason for the continuation of the system of alternate appointment of Europeans and Indians. The Government also decided that candidates for appointment as gazetted Survey Officers should have a year's preliminary training in Land Revenue administration.

economy and is against Indian supervision which in his experience has proved untrustworthy in the field.

Till 1905 probationers appointed to the Survey Department were required to go through a course of training extending to two years in surveying and departmental duties and to pass an examination in mathematics and in a vernacular language. The course of training and syllabus of instruction were revised in 1910 and Assistant Directors appointed to the Department for the first time have to pass an entrance examination in mathematics and then to undergo training for 22 months in a survey party, the Central Survey Office, and a settlement party, at the end of which period and before they are confirmed they must pass an examination in survey and in a vernacular.

Of the 15 appointments in the gazetted staff nine are at present held by Europeans, one by an Anglo-Indian and five by Indians.

4. *Leave, pension, etc., rules.*—For the purpose of calculation of acting allowances, the gazetted appointments in the Survey Department are classed with appointments which are open to and may, in practice, be held by a member of the Indian Civil Service or a Military Officer.

The European service leave rules are applicable to officers of not lower rank than Deputy Directors of Survey, second class, in the special scale or Assistant Director of Survey, second class, in the permanent scale. No exchange compensation allowance is allowed to officers appointed to the Survey Department since 1905. Any officer of the Department whose pay is less than Rs. 700 a month when placed in independent charge of a full survey party draws a charge allowance of Rs. 100 a month,

subject to a maximum emolument of Rs. 700. Assistant Directors of Survey below the rank of second-class (new scale) and Deputy Directors of Survey below the rank of third-class (old scale) permanent or officiating who may be employed at the Presidency town and who may be declared by the local Government to be holding permanently or temporarily an appointment not less important than the independent charge of a party, are entitled to a charge allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem. Assistant Directors of Survey, first and second class (new scale), and Deputy Directors of the first three classes (old scale) stationed at Madras, are entitled to a Presidency allowance of Rs. 60 a month and Assistant Directors of lower grades of Rs. 100 a month.

Assistant Directors of Survey, fourth and fifth class, and Probationary Assistant Directors of Survey are rated as officers of the first class for travelling allowance purposes. The Director of Survey draws a special daily allowance of Rs. 7-8-0, and the Assistant Directors of Survey who draw Rs. 500 and above a special rate of daily allowance of Rs. 5 and the others an allowance of Rs. 4. Officers of the Madras Survey Department are allowed to draw mileage in lieu of daily allowance or actual expenses in special cases. They are not supplied with tents by Government nor do they draw tentage, but the tents they provide at their own expense are carried at Government cost. The ordinary pension rules in the Civil Service Regulations are applicable to the officers of the Survey Department.

2. LAND RECORDS DEPARTMENT.

5. The Land Records Department, in its present form, had no existence at the time of the last Public Service Commission. The question of maintenance of boundary marks and survey records engaged the attention of the authorities from 1864. The subject, however, came into prominence on the receipt of the Secretary of State's Despatch No. 17, dated 19th December, 1889, referred to above. It was at first contemplated that all survey work whether in the direction of keeping up the existing demarcation and recording fresh changes or in the direction of making original surveys of special tracts left unsurveyed by the Survey Department at its abolition would be done by karnams and Revenue Inspectors assisted, if necessary, by temporary surveyors. To train and assist karnams there was to be a district surveyor taken from the Survey Department on about Rs. 100 per mensem in each district. To supervise the work there was to be a Survey Officer taken from the Survey Department for every four or five districts to be styled Assistant Commissioner—there were to be six in all—and at the head there was to be a Deputy Commissioner on Rs. 1,200—1,400 to whose office was to be attached a photo-zincographic office. The scheme was not approved by the Government of India. Meanwhile the system was tried as part of the Survey Department and failed and was eventually abandoned in 1900.

In 1903 a scheme of land records maintenance was first brought into force. Under this scheme the districts of the Presidency are divided into five groups, each group being in the charge of a Superintendent of Land Records. To each district a Land Records Tahsildar and to each taluk a Land Records Inspector is allotted and the Land Records Tahsildar is assisted by a Deputy Surveyor and a Draftsman. The Land Records Superintendents are under the control of the Director of Land Records, while the Land Records Tahsildars and the Land Records Inspectors are under the control of the collectors of districts.

6. *Director of Land Records.*—In 1891 an appointment of a Civilian Deputy Director of Land Records was created at the instance of the Government of India to supervise the work of subordinate Land Revenue officials in connection with the maintenance of land records. This appointment was, however, in abeyance from 1894 and the duties were discharged by the Deputy Director of Agriculture till 1903 when the appointment was revived as part of the scheme of land records maintenance. The designation of the appointment was subsequently changed into "Director of Land Records." The Director is the adviser to the Board in Land Record matters. The appointment is at present included in the first grade of Sub-Collectors and carries with it a local allowance of Rs. 250 a month. Further, the Director of Land Records may, if he would otherwise be acting as Collector, draw the salary of an acting Collector subject to a total emolument of Rs. 1,800 per mensem.

7. The system of recruitment and training and leave, etc., rules of the Survey gazetted staff apply also to the Land Records Superintendents.

II.

[*Additional particulars required in paragraph 1 of the Joint Secretary's letter dated 1st August*, 1913.]

1. *Present regulations as to Recruitment, Training and Probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The present system of recruitment has not proved satisfactory. The Government have come to the conclusion that the Survey Department must be kept on for a considerable number of years, and they consider that some better system of recruitment will have to be devised. Possibly by suitable alterations in the present scale of pay of the Department, candidates who are on the waiting list for Colonial Survey appointments or candidates selected under a similar system could be obtained. Present rates of initial pay in Madras are lower than those prevailing in Colonial Survey Departments.

2. *The rates of Pay and Allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*

1890.	1900.	1913.*
One Superintendent, Revenue Survey (Rs. 1,500).	One Superintendent (Rs. 1,500—60—1,800).	One Director (Rs. 1,200—40—1,600).
Two Deputy Superintendents, first class (Rs. 1,100).	One Deputy Superintendent, first class (Rs. 1,100).	Two Assistant Directors, first class (Rs. 900).
Four Deputy Superintendents, second class (Rs. 750).	Two Deputy Superintendents, second class (Rs. 750).	Two Assistant Directors, second class (Rs. 700).
Two Assistant Superintendents, first class (Rs. 550).	Two Assistant Superintendents, first class (Rs. 550).	Two Assistant Directors, third class (Rs. 550).
Four Assistant Superintendents, second class (Rs. 425).	Four Assistant Superintendents, second class (Rs. 425).	Two Assistant Directors, fourth class (Rs. 425).
Three Probationary Assistant Superintendents (Rs. 200).	Six Assistant Superintendents, third class (Rs. 300),	Six Assistant Directors, fifth class (Rs. 300).
		Personal allowance to present Director (Rs. 400).
House-rent allowance for a Deputy Superintendent, Rs. 60 per mensem.	Seven (exchange compensation allowance).	One (Presidency Allowance), Rs. 100.
	Presidency allowance for an Assistant Superintendent, Rs. 100 per mensem.	One (Presidency Allowance), Rs. 60.
		Six (exchange compensation allowance.

* *Special scale.*

	Rs.		Rs.
One Deputy Director (first class) ...	1,100	Two Deputy Directors (third class) ...	750
Two Deputy Directors (second class)	900	One Deputy Director (fourth class) ...	550

No exchange compensation allowance to entrants since 1905.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—Present appointments are divided into classes as follows:—

	Rs.
One Director of Survey - -	1,200—10—1,600
Two Assistant Directors, first class	900
„ second class	700
„ third class	550
„ fourth class	425
Six Assistant Directors, fifth class,	Rs. 300 (Rs. 200 while under training).

[Special scale contains Deputy Directorships in four classes as shown under item (*ii.*) *supra.*]

There is one leave reserve at present, but it has been proposed in connection with the proposed reorganisation of the Department that this reserve should be abolished. No provision exists for training in the cadre, but some provision is considered necessary and it has been proposed that two probationerships should be created.

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held by Officers of the two Services.*—Temporary appointments connected with boundary disputes and special surveys are held occasionally by officers of the Survey Department.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—Additions to the cadre are required. In letter No. 1887, dated 20th June, 1911, to the Government of India, six additional appointments have been proposed.

APPENDIX II.

Statement of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 *a Month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the* 1*st April,* 1913, *in the Madras Survey Department.*

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).												
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs, and Parsis (*c* is, 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	5	—	1	2	—	—	—	—	—	2	—	—	2	—	2	—
300—400	5	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
400—500	2	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
500—600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	16	9	1	4	—	—	—	—	—	4	—	—	4	—	2	—

APPENDIX III.

Officials and Non-officials who furnished written Evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their Enquiry into the Madras Survey Department but who were not orally examined.

I.—M.R.Ry. P. R. Narayana Iyer, Deputy Director of Survey (Retired) and Vice President, District Board, Saidapet.

INDEX.

(The numbers refer to paragraphs.)

Madras Survey Department.

A

Anglo-Indians (*see* Indians and Anglo-Indians).

B

Bengal Revenue Survey, personnel drawn from Indian Army, *Hatchell* 70773

Bombay Survey Department, doubt as to satisfactoriness of work done in the past, *Hasted* 70798

Brahmans (including Shenvis), civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 423

C

Cadre:
- Addition to, required ... ... p. 423
- Appointments outside, held by officers ... p. 423
- Number of officers since 1887 ... ... p. 420–1
- Proposed strength of, *Hasted*, 70744, 70800–1, 70806; *Hatchell*, 70760, 70788.
- Reduction of staff to number suggested in 1905, not contemplated as possible at present, *Hatchell* 70769

Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 423

Conditions of Services:
- Unsatisfactoriness of, *Hatchell* ... ... 70760 (*see also* Leave, Pay, *etc.*)

Cost of Living, increase, *Hasted*, 70747, 70794; *Hatchell*, 70763.

D

Director of Land Records, history of appointment, etc. ... ... p. 422

Director of Survey:
- Pension after three years' service, recommendation *re*, *Hasted* 70749
- Reduction of pay uncalled for, *Hatchell* ... 70763

E

Europeans:
- Civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 423
- Number of appointments held by, *Hatchell*, 70775; p. 421.
- Proportion of, necessary, *Hatchell*, 70744, 70760; *Hasted*, p. 410.
- Resolution of Government of India *re* Services and Departments in which proportion of, held to be indispensable, *Hasted* ... ... p. 410

F

Furlough (*see under* Leave).

H

Hasted, W. A.:
- Evidence of 70789–70806
- Statement of 70744–70757

Hatchell, D. G., evidence of 70744–70788

Hindus, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 113 ... ... p. 423

I

Indian Christians, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 423

Indians and Anglo-Indians:
- Civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 423
- Educational qualifications advocated for, *Hasted* 70803
- Fifty per cent. of staff should be, *Seshacharlu Garu* 70808
- Good work done by, in Survey, but men must pass through upper subordinate ranks *Hatchell* 70785
- GRADUATES:
  - Employment as Survey officers not objected to, if fitness proved in upper subordinate ranks, *Hatchell* 70784–5
  - Experience of, *Hatchell*, 70788; *Hasted*, 70793.
- Number employed at present, and work of, *Hatchell*, 70775; p. 421.
- Officer in charge of survey party should generally be a European, but gazetted grades should not be closed to, *Hasted* 70744
- Pay, proposed scale, *Hasted* 70747
- RECRUITMENT TO GAZETTED GRADES:
  - Attitude of Government, *Hasted*, p. 410; p. 421.
  - should be Confined to Sub-Assistants, *Hatchell* 70758
  - Direct:
    - Objection to, *Hasted*, 70744; *Hatchell*, 70776.
    - Preferred to promotion, *Seshacharlu Garu* 70813
  - Exclusion from, not desired if fitted, *Hatchell* 70786 *note*
  - Five appointments should be reserved for, *Hasted* 70744
  - Majority should be employed in office, *Hatchell* 70764
  - Opinions of Indian officers *re* methods, *Hasted* 70754
  - by Promotion:
    - Advocated, and scheme, *Hatchell* ... 70776
    - from Subordinate ranks chiefly advocated. *Hasted* 70793
  - Proportion in, opinions *re*, *Hasted*, 70754, 70793; *Hatchell*, 70764.
  - Two-thirds direct and one-third by promotion advocated, *Seshacharlu Garu* 70808

L

Land Records Department:
- proposed Abolition, *Hasted*, 70752; *Hatchell*, 70769
- History of ... ... p. 422
- should be Kept separate from Survey Department, *Hasted* 70801
- Question of amalgamation of Survey Department with, *Hatchell*... ... ... 70787, 70797

Land Records Superintendents:
- should not be Included in Survey cadre, *Hatchell* 70761
- Serving of junior survey officers as, but posts could be filled by Deputy Collectors, *Hasted*, 70751; *Hatchell*, 70765.

Leave:
- Conditions, *Hasted* ... ... 70740; p. 421
- European Service rules should be extended to all European officers from date of appointment, *Hasted* 70748
- FURLOUGH:
  - Allowances, proposed increase, *Hasted*... 70748
  - Commutation into privilege leave, proposal, *Hasted*, 70748; *Hatchell*, 70762.
  - Indians, proposal, *Hasted*, 70748.

Leave—*continued.*
Privilege, accumulation, proposal, *Hasted*, 70748; *Hatchell*, 70762.
Reserve, one at present, but abolition proposed in connection with re-organisation ... p. 423

M

Madras Government, memorandum by p. 420–3
Madrasi, no comparison between aptitude of, for survey work and North-West Frontier man, *Hatchell* 70778
Madras Survey, system, and difference from that adopted elsewhere, *Hatchell* 70774, 70781–2
Muhammadans, take more keenly to field work than Hindus, *Hatchell* 70778

P

Pay:
Acting allowances, method of calculating... p. 421
Acting service of an officer on promotion to each grade, and comparison with Police, Forests, and Traffic (State Railway) Departments, *Hatchell* ... ... 70761, p. 414
Charge allowances ... ... p. 421–2
Daily allowances and mileage ... ... p. 422
Decrease in scale, *Hatchell* 70780
of European recruited officers, proposed scale, *Hasted* 70794–5
no Exchange compensation allowance allowed to officers appointed since 1905 ... ... p. 421
Foreign service allowance, principle approved, *Seshacharlu Garu* 70812
HIGHER TO EUROPEANS THAN TO INDIANS:
no Distinction should be made in opinion of Indian officers, *Hasted* 70755
Justification, *Hatchell* 70763
Initial, lower than in Colonial Departments, and better candidates might be obtained if improved ... ... p. 422
Number of posts in each grade ... ... p. 423
Presidency allowance to officer in charge of central office, increase advocated, *Hasted*, 70752; *Hatchell*, 70765.
Prospects, poorness of, comparison with other services, *Hatchell* 70761
Rates, since 1887... ... ... p. 420–1
Rates of pay and allowances, 1890, 1900, 1913 p. 422
Reduction in scale, 1898-1905, *Hasted* ... 70747
proposed Scales for Europeans and Indians, *Hasted* 70747
Tentage, recommendation *re*, *Hasted*, 70752; *Hatchell*, 70765.
TIME-SCALE:
Charge bar between Rs. 300 and Rs. 900 grades advocated, *Hatchell* 70777
Claim to, and opinion *re* scale, *Hatchell* ... 70761
would be Preferred, *Seshacharlu Garu* ... 70815
Travelling allowances ... ... p. 422
Probation and Training:
Course at Ordnance Survey Office, Southampton, suggestion, *Hatchell* 70759
Details of courses and examination, *Hasted* p. 410–1
Inadequacy of present training, *Hatchell* ... 70759
Period required to learn business, *Hasted*... 70802
Proposal, if appointments made in England, *Hasted* 70745
no Provision for, but creation of two probationerships proposed ... ... p. 423
System ... ... p. 421
Two years should be minimum period of probation, *Seshacharlu Garu* 70809, 70813
Pensions:
no Distinction between Indians and Europeans considered necessary by Indian officers with exception of Director, *Hasted* 70756
proposed Rate for Europeans and Indians, *Hasted*, 70749; *Hatchell*, 70763.
Rules in Civil Service regulations applicable p. 422

Pensions—*continued.*
(*see also* Retirement.)
Provincial Survey Officers, doing survey work and holding major charges not known of, *Hatchell* 70773

R

Recruitment:
Age, under 24, satisfactory, *Hatchell* ... 70771
B.A. degree should be insisted on, *Seshacharlu Garu* 70812
IN ENGLAND:
of Europeans, advocated *Seshacharlu Garu* 70811
from Graduates of English universities who had taken honours, especially in mathematics, advocated, *Hatchell* ... 70758, 70771, 70786 *note*
not Necessary if policy of conversion of department into Land Records and Maintenance Department persisted in, *Hasted* ... 70790
Qualifications, etc., advocated, *Hasted* 70744, 70758
from Schoolboys having undergone training at Ordnance Survey Department, Southampton, advocated, *Hasted* ... 70790, 70794, 70803
by Selection Committee, suggestion, *Hatchell* 70758
of European and Indian alternately, *Hasted*, 70744; *Hatchell*, 70770; p. 421.
OF EUROPEANS:
in England (*see* in England *above*).
in India, unsatisfactory, and appointment in England advocated, *Hasted*, 70744; *Hatchell*, 70772, 70774.
Fifty per cent. Europeans and 50 per cent. Indians advocated, *Seshacharlu Garu* ... 70808
Gazetted officers all recruited in India, but Europeans had had English school education, *Hatchell* 70767
in India, difficulty of obtaining suitable men, *Hasted* 70792
Locally, false economy when suitable men available in England, *Hatchell* ... 70779, 70786 *note*
Promotion from subordinate ranks of officer with good University qualification after five or six years' service, question of, *Seshacharlu Garu* 70810
Qualifications of present officers, *Hatchell*... 70783
Seconding of Provincial officers, reason for objecting to, *Hatchell* 70774
former Systems ... ... p. 421
present System not considered satisfactory by Government, and question of better system p. 422
(*see also under* Indians and Anglo-Indians.)
Reorganisation, proposed, *Hasted*, 70744, 70752; *Hatchell*, 70769; p. 421.
Retirement. reduction of period of service advocated, *Hasted*, 70746, 70749; *Hatchell*, 70763.

S

Seshacharlu Garu, evidence of ... 70807–70815
Sundaram Ayyar, T. A., higher rate of increment recommended for, as special concession, *Hatchell* 70761
Survey Work, entrusted to locally recruited officers in other Provinces, but work less arduous, *Hasted* 70791

T

Time-Scale (*see under* Pay).
Training (*see* Probation and Training).

W

Work of:
Arduous nature and value of, *Hasted*, 70746–7, 70804–6, p. 410; *Hatchell*, 70766, 70768.
Officers in charge of parties all on same kind of duties, *Hasted* 70796

APPENDIX

TO THE

REPORT

OF

THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XV.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

RELATING TO THE

BURMA LAND RECORDS DEPARTMENT,

Taken at Calcutta,

WITH

APPENDICES.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	429
Minutes of Evidence	430
Appendices	434
Index	439

LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION.

At CALCUTTA, Thursday, 22nd January, 1914.

	PAGE
J. Haddock, Esq., Superintendent of Land Records, Insein	430
Maung Pe Maung, K.S.M., Superintendent of Lands Records, Amherst	430

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

BURMA LAND RECORDS DEPARTMENT,

At Calcutta, Thursday, 22nd January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. (*in the Chair*).

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. (*Joint Secretary*).

J. HADDOCK, Esq., Superintendent of Land Records, Insein, and

MAUNG PE MAUNG, K.S.M., Superintendent of Land Records, Amherst.

These Officers were examined together on the following Written Statement relating to the Burma Land Records Department, being the corporate opinions of the Officers of the Department.*

71044. **(I) Method of Recruitment.**—The rules at present in force, as contained in Part E, Chapter II, of the Burma Land Records Manual, are quite suitable.

71045. **(II) System of Training and Probation.**—The existing systems are described in Parts E and F, Chapter II, of the Burma Land Records Manual, and work satisfactorily.

71046. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—(*a*) Matrimony for Assistant Superintendents should be absolutely forbidden; the present rule merely applies to the two and a half years of training, and is insufficient protection of the interests of the Department; marriage impairs a young officer's efficiency.

(*b*) Officiating appointments should, provided the grade system is retained, be permitted in the Superintendents' grades; at present it is only allowed for classes, *e.g.*, from Assistant Superintendent to Superintendent or Superintendent to Assistant Director.

(*c*) House Allowance should be given to Land Records Officers, where drawn by other Departments, as in Rangoon; at present it is only given to officers classed as "Imperial," though those classed as "Provincial" would have the greater need for the allowance. It should also be given in Districts where Government Quarters are not provided for Superintendents.

(*d*) Exchange Compensation Allowance should be abolished in all services; if not, the Land Records Department should also be given it. Exchange affects all officers alike.

(*e*) Burma Allowance should be granted to Land Records Officers if given to those of any other Department (*e.g.*, Forest, Survey, Public Works, Medical, Postal, Telegraph, etc.), whether or not specially recruited for the Province; all are equally affected by the high cost of living in Burma.

(*f*) Local Allowance should be given in all cases to Land Records Officers for Special Charges involving increased responsibility or embracing exceptional conditions *e.g.*, Map Section, Town Registration, Special Survey Party, etc. At present an allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem is allowed only to the Officers in charge of the Map Section of the Government Press at Rangoon, and to the Registrar of Town Lands in Rangoon. The Superintendent in charge of Special Surveys, Burma, whose headquarters are Rangoon, is not in receipt of any Local Allowance; many years ago a former Superintendent who had a similar charge was given a Local Allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem. The Assistant Superintendent of Stamps, the Registrar of the Chief Court, the Assistant Collector of the

* This written statement was drawn up at a Conference of Land Records Officers held at Rangoon on the 11th May, 1913, and represents the views of the members of the Land Records Department. The Committee was composed of Mr. J. C. Clancey, I.S.O., president, and the following members, Messrs. L. E. Palmer, F.R.G.S., W. E. Johnson and W. J. Baker, Maung pe Maung, K.S.M., and Messrs. N. W. Purchase, E. M. Korper, C. S. McKertich, F. A. de Souza, C. F. Cooper, H. A. Hardless, C.E., W. E. S. Swiney, and R. V. Littlewood.

Rangoon Town District, the Secretary and the Assistant Secretary to the Financial Commissioner and the Deputy Director of Land Records at Rangoon each receives a Local Allowance of Rs. 200 per mensem, and the Additional Judge of the Small Cause Court at Rangoon gets an allowance of Rs. 150 per mensem.

(*g*) All officers of the Department, who are Gazetted Officers, should be classed as Class I for the purposes of Travelling Allowance; at present those on pay of Rs. 500 and under are only entitled to travel, as their Clerks, Class II by rail. Daily and mileage rates should be granted as follows, viz., (i) Assistant Superintendents at Rs. 4-8 per day and at As. 6 per mile; (ii) Superintendents on Rs. 400 to Rs. 500 pay at Rs. 6 per day and at As. 9 per mile; Superintendents on over Rs. 500 pay at Rs. 7-8 per day and at As. 12 per mile, as now in force.

(*h*) One appointment of Settlement Officer and two of Assistant Settlement Officers should be open to Superintendents, as for Extra Assistant Commissioners; formerly a Superintendent of Land Records worked with great credit for years as Settlement Officer. A Land Records Officer should also be eligible for the post of Deputy Director of Land Records. There are 47 appointments, including six Assistant Superintendents, in the Land Records Department against 145 in the Provincial Civil Service, or in the proportion of 1:3. Yet only one high post of Assistant Director on a pay of Rs. 1,000 is open to Land Records Officers whereas Extra Assistant Commissioners are given two appointments of District Judge, two of Deputy Commissioner and one of Settlement Officer; the first two classes of appointment have a sliding scale of pay of Rs. 1,000, Rs. 1,200 and Rs. 1,600, and the last of the three classes has a fixed pay of Rs. 1,000.

(*i*) The number of extra appointments to fill leave vacancies is 14 per cent. of the District and Special Charges plus the Assistant Director, and for casualties 2½ per cent. These have proved to be inadequate. The percentages should be respectively raised to 20 and 5. In the Burma Commission. In the Burma Commission 27 per cent. is allowed for absentees.

(*j*) The Officers of the Land Records Department and Extra Assistant Commissioners are both on the same social and official footing, and any future advantages in respect to pay and allowances, and the like, extended to the latter should *pari passu* be made equally applicable to the former.

71047. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The general trend in most Departments now is towards a time-scale pay in supersession of the fixed pay system. A time-scale of pay which exists in the Forest, Accounts, Public Works and other Departments, is desirable for Land Records Officers also. Assistant Superintendents should get Rs. 200 to Rs. 300 by annual increments of Rs. 20. Superintendents should begin on Rs. 400 rising to Rs. 1,000. From Rs. 400 to 600 the annual increments should be Rs. 25, from Rs. 600 to Rs. 800 the increments should be Rs. 33⅓, and from Rs. 800 to Rs. 1,000 they should be Rs. 40; but advancement above the Rs. 600 grade should only be given to those possessing good ability and with a good record of work. The Assistant Director's salary should be Rs. 1,200 to Rs. 1,500 by annual increments of Rs. 50, and appointment should be by selection from among the Superintendents; the position demands special knowledge and experience and carries with it enhanced responsibilities and expense, and whereas the other Assistant to the Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records, designated the Deputy Director, enjoys the privileges of a Local Allowance, Officiating Allowance, House Allowance, Burma Allowance, and Exchange Compensation Allowance, the Assistant Director is ineligible for any of these.

71048. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—(*a*) Furlough should be granted after the first eight years of active service, and thereafter after every seven years of similar service. It should not be limited to an aggregate of two years, as now, in an officer's entire service; it was not so in years gone by.

(*b*) Long leave, which is usually given on half-pay, might be allowed to be commuted, if desired, to a shorter period with a higher allowance; thus, if two years' leave at Rs. 200 per mensem is due, one year might be taken instead at Rs. 400 per mensem, or one and a half years at Rs. 266⅔ per mensem; the balance of the leave being forfeited.

(*c*) On return from furlough an officer of the Provincial Services may not take the next furlough, though earned, till eight years have elapsed since his return. The period might be altered to four years; that for the Imperial Services is three years.

(*d*) Privilege leave should be allowed to accumulate to the extent of six months, limited to twice in an officer's service, as officers with small salary cannot generally afford to go on long leave on half pay.

(*e*) All leave with allowances taken in India should count as service, as in the case of such leave taken out of India.

71049. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—(*a*) Service for pension should be allowed to count from 18 years of age, the age at which recruitment in the Department is allowed, and pension should be given after 25 years' pensionable service.

(*b*) Retirement should be compulsory at the age of 55 years. The work necessitates a strenuous out-door life, subject to much exposure and hardship; and consequently officers beyond that age are not generally able to do much field work.

(*c*) The Assistant Director should be eligible for the extra pension of Rs. 1,000 per annum after three years' tenure of the appointment.

(*d*) Pensions drawn out of India should be made payable at the rate of two shillings to the Rupee. At the time the maximum pension of Rs. 5,000 was fixed the exchange was at this rate, and the intention then was that this should represent a payment of £500 per annum.

71050. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—(*a*) The Department should be open, as now, to (i) Domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians and (ii) Burmans of good family; but limited in the latter class, to a maximum of one-fourth of the total number of appointments, as in the Survey of India Department from which a number of the older Land Records Officers were originally obtained; at present Burmans form about one-sixth of the whole.

(*b*) The distinction between Imperial and Provincial Services should be abolished; it is the source of much bitterness, and is even worse than the former distinction between "Covenanted" and "Uncovenanted."

71051. **(VIII) Relation of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—(*a*) The Administrative Staff of the Department consists of (i) a Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records; (ii) a Deputy Director of Land Records, and (iii) an Assistant Director of Land Records. The first named appontment is held by a senior officer of the Burma Commission; the second by a junior officer of the Burma Commission; and the third by an officer chosen from among the Superintendents. The pay of the Commissioner is Rs. 2,750; that of the Deputy Director of Land Records carries with it a local allowance of Rs. 200 per mensem, subject to a maximum of Rs. 1,600 that of the Assistant Director of Land Records is Rs. 1,000 fixed. The officer who holds the post of Deputy Director of Land Records usually retains it for a couple of years only, as the appointment forms a training ground for eventual higher positions of Revenue Secretary, Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records and Financial Commissioner.

(*b*) It should be clearly understood, as laid down by Government, that both Assistants are directly subordinate to the Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records alone; otherwise the position of the second assistant would be intolerable. The designation of the Deputy Director of Land Records should be changed to that of first Assistant Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records, and of the Assistant Director to that of second

Assistant Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records, in the manner of the two Financial Commissioners of the Punjab. The reason for the proposed change is that the Head of the Department is styled the "Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records," and no longer as "Director," and friction between the Assistants will also, thus, be altogether avoided. At present both assistants are precluded from engaging in the work of the settlement section of the office, whereas formerly, when there was only a single assistant—the Assistant Director—such work was done, as well as the work of the agricultural section which was also then under the direction of the Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records. In future both assistants might well be required to take part in the work of all the sections of the office, viz., Settlement, Land Records, Inland Trade, Agricultural Advances, Scarcity and Famine, Agricultural Statistics, Crop Forecasts and Reports, Survey Schools, Special Surveys, etc. The different separate duties would be assigned, wholly or in part, to the Assistants at the discretion of the Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records. In this way, too, the Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records would receive considerable relief which is both urgent and necessary.

(c) Generally speaking, the relations between the District Officers (Deputy Commissioners) and their Superintendents of Land Records have been cordial; but often the latter, who are gazetted officers and supposed to have and maintain a position, are not treated with the courtesy and consideration that they are entitled to.

Mr. J. Haddock and Maung Pe Maung called and examined.

71052. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) Both witnesses agreed with the views put forward in the written statement, with some slight modifications on the part of Mr. Haddock.

71053. Mr. Haddock said the department contained a Commissioner and a Deputy Director, drawn from the Burma Commission. In the department proper there was an Assistant Director, 41 Superintendents, and 6 Assistant Superintendents, on salaries ranging from Rs. 150 to Rs. 800 a month, the Assistant Director receiving Rs. 1,000.

71054. The Survey of India Department made the original surveys, and prepared maps for each district on a scale of 16 inches to the mile. The maps represented every field plot, and each plot was numbered. The Survey Department also made an area statement. Those two documents were supplied to the Settlement Department, and with their aid the settlement staff commenced their operations. The Settlement Department then inquired into boundaries, titles, etc., prepared a record of rights, and divided the country into soil tracts and classes, and proposed rates. Those records were then handed over to the Land Records Department, which kept the records up to date, attending to all changes in survey, alterations of boundaries, classification of soils, and new expansions, and applying the rates sanctioned by the Government. In fact his department kept up to date the original records made by the Settlement Department.

71055. The age of 18 was too young for recruitment. The age limits should be from 20 to 25. Maung Pe Maung preferred an age limit of from 21 to 25.

71056. Mr. Haddock said a scheme for training the officers at Dehra Dun fell through, and a local scheme had been devised for a local survey party, in charge of a Land Records Superintendent, for the training of all probationers. They should have a survey training of 21 months, and a land records training of 9 months, or 30 months in all. That length of training was very necessary. There were two grades of Assistant Superintendents, the second grade being probationers undergoing training, who were paid at a rate of from Rs. 150 to Rs. 200. That pay was insufficient.

71057. There were, including the latest recruits, eleven Burmans now in the service. The department should be open to Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Burmans alike. He was not in favour of laying down any rough proportion of Burmans, but a certain number of Europeans were required for a stiffening effect, and the Burman cultivator preferred to have a European, though the Burman made an excellent officer. Maung Pe Maung pointed out that when the department was first formed there were not many Burmans who had the necessary training to join, but there was quite a number of them now, and every opportunity was given to them to enter the department. He was satisfied with the present system.

71058. Both witnesses favoured a time-scale of pay.

71059. Mr. Haddock would make it compulsory to retire at 55 years of age, even if a time-scale was adopted, because a land-record officer, who did his duty, was absolutely unfit for work after 55, when he had spent so many years tramping through paddy fields under the sun in all weathers. Maung Pe Maung agreed.

71060. Mr. Haddock said that, if a time-scale was adopted, officiating allowances as between grades would not be required.

71061. With regard to the Burma allowance, he thought the views of the officers had not been clearly expressed in the written statement. They did not so much want a Burma allowance as extra pay to meet the cost of living in Burma, which was very much higher than it used to be. The whole of the Service was recruited in Burma for work in Burma, and it was more satisfactory to lay down a scale of pay which was suitable for Burma.

71062. The Burma Land Record Department was essentially a Provincial Service, but there were Imperial Services working in Burma, and possessing privileges which Provincial Service men had not, and consequently there was an invidious distinction, and that distinction was felt both in social and official life. The officers of the department desired to have the same privileges as were accorded to the European recruited services, both with regard to leave and allowances. If it was considered necessary for Europeans recruited in Europe to go to England in order to recuperate from the effects of the climate, it was also necessary for Europeans, Anglo-Indians and Burmans born and recruited in Burma, who practically started with the handicap of having been in the country before joining the service. He himself had always drawn such small pay that it had been practically impossible for him to take long leave until after 24 years' service. He considered that there should be one set of leave rules for all services in India.

71063. The officers also wished to be allowed to commute a portion of their furlough on full pay. The cadre required strengthening if men were to take proper leave. It was in the interests of the department that men should be able to take short leave, and if they received full pay they would do so.

71064. A pension after twenty-five years' service would enable an officer to retire between the ages of 46 and 50, assuming he had joined between 20 and 25. Forty-five was rather a young age, but the nature of the service was such that, if an officer wished to retire he should be allowed to do so. Maung Pe Maung was of the same opinion.

71065. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Mr. Haddock said that when he spoke of the Imperial Services he referred to the Police, Forest, etc. What was desired was not really longer furlough, but furlough at more frequent intervals.

71066. At present it was not compulsory for an officer to join the Provident Fund.

71067. Men were not taken into the department from the Provincial Service, but were recruited on a standard educational qualification.

71068. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) With regard to the possibility of interchangeability between the Land Records Department, the Settlement Department and the Revenue Department, Mr. Haddock said the Land Records officers were excluded from joining the Settlement Department, but some officers had gone into the Provincial Service as Extra Assistant Commissioners, and Provincial Service men had gone into settlement work. The work of the Lands Records officer gave him better qualifications for settlement work than the Provincial officer. A Provincial officer, before coming into the Land Records Department, would have to undergo a training. Land Records officers were also Revenue officers, but an officer of the Provincial Service—that is, an Extra Assistant Commissioner—was not eligible for the Land Records Department, as he was not a surveyor. Such officers had only to put in three months on survey work, which was not a sufficient course for the Land Records Department.

71069. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) With reference to the rule that all candidates for the department should be unmarried and undertake not to marry before the expiry of their period of probation, Maung Pe Maung said that Burmans, as a rule, married between 25 and 26, but the conditions did not press hardly upon them. There was no reason for such a rule with regard to a Burman officer, because when a man had undergone his training and was considered efficient, and had been confirmed in his appointment, his efficiency as an officer would not be impaired if he married. However, he approved of the present rule, which did not operate hardly on the officers.

71070. M. Haddock said that if the officers were placed on a time-scale, both Burmans and English should come under a rule that an officer should not marry within the first five years. Maung Pe Maung did not agree.

71071. Mr. Haddock said there was no special difficulty in recruiting on the present scale of salaries. No advertisements of vacancies were issued, but there was a register of men who had made applications for appointments, and the register at present contained about 40 names. There were only three vacancies last year. Maung Pe Maung thought there would be no vacancy for the next two years.

71072. Mr. Haddock said he had been asked by the superintendents to emphasise one or two matters before the Commission. One was a house allowance, which was badly wanted in Rangoon, as was proved by the fact that Imperial and other officers received the allowance. By the grant of allowances to certain officers landlords had been encouraged to increase the rents in Rangoon, and those who did not receive allowances had to pay the same rents as those who did.

71073. The next matter was that of exchange compensation. The standard of living of both Imperial and Provincial Officers was practically the same, and compensation allowance should be given to both. If that allowance was abolished for all services, naturally the Department would not expect to have it.

71074. Again three married Superintendents had written to him very forcibly on the subject of medical attendance, as they had suffered a great deal from outrageous charges for attendance on their families. They asked the Commission to consider whether the civil surgeon should not be directed to treat the families of officers free of charge as in the case of military officers or at a charge proportionate to income.

(The witnesses withdrew.)

71075-143. Mr. Haddock subsequently wrote as follows:—

In looking after the interests of my Superintendents I omitted to mention to the Members of the Royal Commission two matters which affect myself as Assistant Director of Land Records. The points are—

(i) In paragraph 71047 it is noted that the Assistant Director of Land Records should wait six years for the maximum pay suggested. Three years in my opinion should be ample. He is an officer whose worth is, or at least should be, beyond question.

(ii) I find that the minutes of the conference (paragraphs 71044-51) do not discuss the European Service Leave rules. I feel I have asked far too much in wanting such rules to apply to the whole of our officers, and Maung Pe Maung agrees with this view. We suggest instead the admission by the Government of India to the benefit of the European Service rules of officers of our department drawing pay not less than Rs. 800, in the same way as officers of the Accounts Department (Civil), Postal Department (Accounts), Customs Department, etc. (*vide* article 297, Civil Service Regulations)

(*2*) Maung Pe Maung has further reminded me that nothing was said about throwing open two Assistant Superintendentships to our Burman Inspectors of Land Records. We consider that our department suffers from incapable Inspectors, and to induce better men to join we desire to throw open two Assistant Superintendentships to these officers. This would mean better pay and better pension for them and need not be given till they are about 40 years old.

LIST OF APPENDICES.

PAGE.

I.—Memorandum dated the 30th June, 1913, prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Burma Land Records Department 435

II.—Supplementary Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Land Records Department 437

III.—Statement of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Burma Land Records Department 438

IV.—Officials who furnished written evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their Enquiry into the Burma Land Records Department, but who were not orally examined 438

APPENDIX I.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Burma Land Records Department, dated the 30th June, 1913.

(I) HISTORY AND GROWTH OF THE DEPARTMENT.

The duties of the Land Records Department are to keep up to date the large scale maps and the record of rights prepared by the Survey and Settlement Departments. It prepares the Land Revenue assessment rolls of the cadastrally surveyed area for each assessment season, thereby determining the assessment of each individual cultivator. In Upper Burma the land assessment is a fluctuating demand varying with the matured crop on the area cultivated by the individual assessees; in Lower Burma it varies with the cultivated area of the year. The Department also prepares crop forecasts and collects much statistical matter regarding rents, produce prices, etc., for use from year to year and for the information of the Settlement Officer when the time comes for revision of the current rates of assessment.

2. Supplementary Survey in Burma was introduced experimentally in 1880 in the more accessible parts of the Hanthawaddy and Bassein Districts. By the end of 1883, five districts had been brought under Supplementary Survey under the charge of three Superintendents, one from the Survey of India Department, one from the Provincial Settlement Department and one from the Subordinate Executive Service. Proposals for a gradual increase in the number of Superintendents as fresh districts came under Survey were approved by the Government of India in December of that year, but owing to a lack of funds the sanctioned totals were never worked up to, and by June, 1891, only eight districts in Lower Burma and one in Upper Burma with a total staff of eight superintendents had been brought under Survey. In view however, of the rapid extension of Survey which was expected in the future sanction was obtained in 1892 to an increase of the number of Superintendents to 20 (8 in Upper Burma) and to the appointment of three probationers. The intention was that gradually and as actual requirements necessitated, each district should be provided with a separate Superintendent who would work under the control of the Deputy Commissioner, and subject to inspection by a Director of Land Records. Six grades of Superintendents were to be formed on pay ranging from Rs. 200 to Rs. 800 a month. Owing to the special and technical character of the work demanded the appointments were to be distinct from the Subordinate Executive Service. The Department was to be open both to the Subordinate Executive Service of Burma and to the officers of the Junior Division of the Survey of India Department.

3. *The reorganisation of* 1899.—By 1897 the scheme sanctioned in 1892 had almost been worked up to, and it was found that with the growth of cultivation in Lower Burma several additional appointments were required to secure efficient administration. Proposals to this end were put forward and in 1898 the sanction of the Secretary of State was received to the appointment of six new Superintendents on pay ranging from Rs. 150 to Rs. 450.

4. *The reorganisation of* 1900.—Even before the above increase, which had been proposed chiefly with reference to Lower Burma, had been sanctioned, it had become clear that revenue would be lost in Upper Burma and that the cadastral surveys already carried out would be largely wasted unless the Land Records staff there was strengthened. Accordingly in 1900 the staff of Superintendents was raised to 31, and two additional posts of Probationers, making five in all, were created, while an Assistant Director on Rs. 1,000 was appointed to help the Director in supervision and inspection.

5. *The reorganisation of* 1905.—On the formation of the Pyapon District an additional appointment was sanctioned in the lowest grade of Superintendents and one of the Probationerships was abolished. In 1904 the cadre consisted therefore of 32 Superintendents and four Probationers (including the Rangoon Town appointment). In view of the spread of cultivation, the increase in the Land Revenue and the growing responsibilities devolving on the Department proposals were made to raise the number of Probationers to five and to increase the cadre of Superintendents by two appointments, one to provide a superintendent for the charge of Revision and Extension Surveys and the other for the new post of Registrar, Rangoon Town. Further, owing to the fewness of the well-paid appointments, the slowness of promotion, and the fact that officers who had been transferred to the Department from the Survey of India were suffering a considerable pecuniary loss, a revision of the cadre was recommended. All these proposals were sanctioned, and as a result the superior establishment in 1905 consisted of the following appointments:—

Grade.	Pay. Rs.	No.
First	700	1
Second	600	2
Third	500	4
Fourth	400	5
Fifth	300	7
Sixth	250	7
Seventh	150—200	8
Probationers ...	100	5

6. *The reorganisation of* 1908.—The last reorganisation, which was undertaken in order to provide for leave vacancies and to ensure that the Department should continue to attract a suitable class of officers, took place in 1908 and is still in force.

(II) PRESENT CONSTITUTION.

7. The present constitution of the Department is given below:—

(*a*) *Composition of Establishment.*—The administrative officers in charge of the Department are a Commissioner assisted by a Deputy Director and Assistant Director. The Commissioner besides being in charge of the Land Records Department also controls the Settlement Department. This appointment ranks as a Divisional Commissionership and is reserved for an officer of the Burma Commission, who draws the pay of his rank plus an allowance of Rs. 500 provided his total emoluments do not exceed those of a Divisional Commissioner. The Deputy Director's duties are confined to the Land Records Department. The appointment is reserved for an officer of the Burma Commission. The Deputy Director is usually an Assistant Commissioner of some eight years' service, who draws the pay of his rank in the Commission plus an allowance of Rs. 200.

The Assistant Director is an officer of the Provincial Land Records Service. The pay of the appointment is Rs. 1,000.

The cadre of the Provincial Service includes the following posts in addition to the Assistant Directorship:—

No. of posts.	Grades.	Pay.
		Rs.
1	1st grade Superintendent	800
2	2nd grade Superintendents	700
3	3rd grade Superintendents	600
10	4th grade Superintendents	500
12	5th grade Superintendents	400
13	6th grade Superintendents	300
41		
3	1st grade Assistant Superintendents	250
3	2nd grade Assistant Superintendents	150—200
6		

This cadre provides one Superintendent for each of the thirty-four districts under Supplementary Survey, one for the charge of Special Survey

Operations and one for the charge of the Map Section of the Government Press.

The following special allowances are drawn in addition to their substantive pay by the officers holding certain posts:—

The Superintendent attached to the Government Press, local allowance ...	100
The Superintendent in charge of Rangoon Town Lands, local allowance	100
The Superintendent holding the office of the Registrar, Mandalay Town Lots, conveyance allowance	50
The Superintendent in charge of Rangoon Town Lands, conveyance allowance	60

(*b*) *Method of recruitment.*—The method of recruiting the administrative officers in charge of the Department has been given above. Up to 1893 Superintendents were recruited almost entirely from the Survey of India and these posts were in consequence filled by officers possessing a high degree of professional capacity. Since 1893 occasional vacancies have been filled by appointment from the Survey of India Department, but for the most part recruitment has been local. Young men are selected by the Local Government from a list of nominees submitted by the Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records, proficiency in mathematics being considered in making nominations. No candidate for nomination is ordinarily registered in the office of the Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records unless he has passed the I.A. or I.Sc. of an Indian Univerity, with mathematics as one of the subjects, or the European High School Pass examination (provided that the higher mathematics comprising algebra, geometry, trigonometry and logarithms are included in the subjects passed) or such other examination as may be declared to be equivalent. Besides possessing these educational qualifications, applicants for registration must:—

(i) Be natives of India as defined in article 37 of the Civil Service Regulations.

(ii) Be above the age of 18 years and not more than 25 years.

(iii) Produce a medical certificate of physical fitness signed by a Commissioned Officer of the Indian Medical Service.

(iv) Possess certificates of good moral character from responsible persons.

(v) Be unmarried and undertake not to marry before the expiry of the period of probation.

The nominees selected by the Local Government are gazetted as Assistant Superintendents on probation.

(*c*) *System of training and probation.*—The rules for the selection and training of Assistant Superintendents provide for a year's training in Cadastral and Traverse Surveying at the Survey of India Training School at Dehra Dun, to be followed by a year's training in field and office work with a Survey of India Topographical Party in Burma. On the completion of these two years' training the selected candidate is posted to duty under a Superintendent of Land Records to be trained for six months in the general work of the Department, at the end of which period, if the reports on his work are satisfactory, he is confirmed in his appointment in the Department.

(*d*) *Conditions of the Service in regard to* (*1*) *Salary.*—In the matter of pay the Land Records Department offers much the same inducements as the Provincial Executive and Excise Services. Superintendents of Land Records, Superintendents of Excise and Extra Assistant Commissioners are alike distributed in six grades, the salaries attached to which range in arithmetical progression between the extremes of Rs. 300 and Rs. 800. Each service throws open superior administrative appointments to members of the Department, there being one such opening in the Land Records and Excise Services, and five, though with a more numerous cadre, in the Provincial Executive Service. As compared with the Assistant Superintendents of the Excise Deparment the Land Records Assistant Superintendents are at some disadvantage, the former all drawing Rs. 250 on completion of training and Rs. 200 during the period of training; whereas 3 out of 6 of the latter draw pay at the rate of only Rs. 150—200.

(*2*) *Leave.*—The reorganisation of 1908 provided a leave reserve of 5 Superintendents or roughly 14 per cent. of the existing strength without drawing on Assistant Superintendents. The Indian Service Leave Rules, Chapter XIV of the Civil Service Regulations, apply to Superintendents.

(*3*) *Pension.*—The ordinary rules in Part IV, Civil Service Regulations, govern the pensions of Superintendents.

(*e*) *The employment of Burmans as Superintendents.*—Of 15 Superintendents and Probationers appointed by 1893, five were Burmans. In 1899, when the first reorganisation was sanctioned, out of 17 appointments 6 were held by Burmans. Since the reorganisation of 1908, 3 direct appointments to the ranks of Superintendents have been made by transfer from the Survey of India Department. All 3 of these officers were Anglo-Indians, as there were no Burman officers in the Survey of India Department. These direct appointments had to be made as the Department was undermanned and trained Survey officers were immediately required. Twelve appointments of Assistant Superintendents have also been made under the rules quoted in the previous paragraph. Of these 12 recruits, 2 are Burmans and a third is a Chino-Burman, the remaining 9 recruits being all Anglo-Indians, *i.e.*, Eurasians or Europeans domiciled in the country. Including this Chino-Burman there are at present 8 Burmans in the Service, their distribution being as follows:—

	Rs.
1 3rd grade Superintendent on... ...	600
2 4th grade Superintendents on... ...	500
1 5th grade Superintendent on	400
1 6th grade Superintendent on... ...	300
3 2nd grade Assistant Superintendents on	150—200
8 Total	

All appointments in the Provincial Service are open to Burmans, and in making promotions there is no discrimination between Burman officers and officers of other races. Appointments given to Burmans in recent years would probably have been more numerous but for the fact that it is not easy to get suitable Burman recruits with the requisite educational qualifications.

8. *The Subordinate Staff.*—The Subordinate staff consists of Inspectors and Revenue Surveyors.

Inspectors.—When the Department was constituted in 1892, there was in existence a staff of 36 Inspectors who assisted the officers seconded from the Survey of India Department in the supervision of the annual supplementary survey in Lower Burma. In 1892 sanction was accorded to the entertainment, gradually and as necessity arose, of 65 Inspectors in Lower Burma in five grades on pay ranging from Rs. 50 to Rs. 100. In 1899 the number in Lower Burma was raised to 73. In 1900 sanction was accorded by the Secretary of State to the appointment of 70 Inspectors in Upper Burma, in four grades with pay ranging from Rs. 50 to Rs. 80, and to the creation of additional posts, as occasion should require, in any part of the Province subject to a fixed limit of expenditure. New posts have been made under these Orders from time to time and in June, 1912, the number of Inspectors in the Province totalled 195. All of these are natives of Burma.

Revenue Surveyors.—Up to 1892 the responsibility for the upkeep of supplementary survey lay in Lower Burma with the *thugyis* (headmen) of the revenue circles into which each district was divided. They either did the work of survey themselves or employed trained assistants at their own expense. In 1892 the system of revenue collection by village headmen was initiated. This involved the gradual abolition of the circle *thugyis*—there are now only 103 left—and the transfer of their trained survey assistants to Government service. In Upper Burma revenue surveyors have always been the direct servants of Government. The number of surveyors employed by Government and

thugyis throughout the Province before 1902 is not now known; in that year the number who were Government servants was 1,058. In June, 1912, the number was 1,762 and in addition there were still 122 surveyors employed by the surveying circle *thugyis*. All alike are natives of Burma, as are the temporary chainmen who are engaged to assist them in the open season. There are various grades of surveyors on pay ranging from Rs. 20 to Rs. 45. Chainmen are paid Rs. 10 to Rs. 12.

APPENDIX II.

Supplementary Memorandum on the Land Records Department prepared by the Government of Burma.

1. *The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The present regulations are stated in paragraph 7 of the General Memorandum of the 30th June, 1913. The regulations as to recruitment and probation have been found satisfactory, but the survey training scheme as originally devised has broken down. The Dehra Dun School is no longer available for the theoretical and practical preliminary training of the first year and the Survey of India Parties employed in Burma are not working under conditions suitable for the second year's training. In the circumstances the greater part of the survey training will have to be done by the department itself.

2. (*a*) *The rates of pay and allowances in force in* 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time.*—The information required under this heading is given in the following statement:—

2. (*b*) *Whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The pay and allowances drawn by Assistant Superintendents after their period of probation are satisfactory as are also the rules regulating the travelling allowance of Superintendents. But there is not a sufficient number of appointments in the higher grades of Superintendents to allow of a satisfactory flow of promotion. If it is decided to adopt a time-scale of pay for other departments a time-scale of Rs. 300—25—800 would be suitable for the Land Records Department.

3. *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—The number of posts in each grade is set out in paragraph 7 of the General Memorandum. The total of 41 Superintendents includes a provision of five for leave and training.

Rates of Pay and allowances of Officers of the Land Records Department, Burma, in force in 1890 *and* 1900 *and at the present time.*

(1)	1890. Pay. (2)	1900. Pay. (3)	1913. Pay. (4)	Remarks. (5)
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Assistant Director of Land Records -	...	800—1,000	1,000	The Superintendent attached to the Government Press and the Superintendent in charge of Rangoon Town Lands each get Rs. 100 a month local allowance, while the latter is in receipt of a conveyance allowance of Rs. 60 per mensem in addition. The Superintendent holding the office of Registrar, Mandalay Town Lots, is in receipt of a conveyance allowance Rs. 50 per mensem.
Superintendents, 1st grade - -	600	700	800	
,, 2nd grade - -	500	600	700	
,, 3rd ,, - -	400	450	600	
,, 4th ,, - -	300	300	500	
,, 5th ,, - -	250	200	400	
,, 6th ,, - -	...	150	300	
Assistant Superintendents, 1st grade	...	100	250	
Assistant Superintendents, 2nd grade	...	...	150—200	

4. *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various Services.*—No appointments outside the authorised cadre are at present held, temporarily or otherwise, by any officers of the department. It is suggested that the listed post of Settlement Officer on Rs. 1,000 per mensem at present open only to members of the Provincial Civil Service should be given alternately to a Superintendent of Land Records and to a member of the Provincial Civil Service. The work in the Department is a good training for settlement work.

5. *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—If the proposal that the listed post of Settlement Officer should be thrown open to the Department is accepted it will be necessary to add one appointment to the cadre as there would be practically continuous seconding of one Land Records Officer first under training as Assistant Settlement Officer and then as Settlement Officer.

APPENDIX III.

Statement of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a Month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, on the 1st April, 1913, in the Burma Land Record Department.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.														
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).											
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans including Shenvis.	Kshatryas.	Kayasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs, and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	12	—	10	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	2
300—400	7	—	7	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1
400—500	10	—	9	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	2
500—600	9	—	7	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1
600—700	3	—	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	2	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	45	1	38	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	6

APPENDIX IV.

Officials who furnished written evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their Enquiry into the Burma Land Records Department but who were not orally examined.

I.—Précis of the opinions of the Officers of the Land Records Department of Burma, viz:—

A. P. P. L'Estrange, Esq., B.A., Superintendent of Land Records, Myingyan, and 30 other Officers of the Department.

INDEX.

(The numbers refer to paragraphs.)

Burma Land Records Department.

A

Administrative Staff, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71051, 71053

Age Limits (*see under* Recruitment).

Allowances (*see* Pay).

Anglo-Indians, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913... p. 438

Assistant Director of Land Records:
Appointment by selection from superintendents advocated, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* ... 71047
Chosen from superintendents, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71051
should be Eligible for extra pension after three years, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71049
Ineligible for special allowances received by Deputy-Director, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71047
PAY:
1890, 1900, 1913 ... ... p. 437
Rates, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* ... 71051, 71053
proposed Scale, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71047, 71075
should be Required to take part in work of all sections of office, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71051
Title should be changed to Second Assistant Commissioner, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung*... 71051

Assistant Superintendents:
Marriage should be forbidden, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71046
Pay, proposed scale, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71047
Probation grade, pay and inadequacy of, *Haddock* 71056

B

Buddhists, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 438

Burma Allowance (*see under* Pay).

Burmans:
Employment as superintendents ... ... p. 436
Number in service and laying down of proportion not advocated, *Haddock* 71057
One-sixth of appointments held by, and one-fourth advocated, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71050
every Opportunity to enter department, and system approved, *Pe Maung* 71057

C

Cadre, no appointments outside authorised, held by officers of department ... ... p. 437

Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 438

Commissioner of Settlements and Land Records:
Pay 71051
Post held by senior officer of Burma Commission 71051

Constitution, history and growth of department p. 435–6

D

Deputy Director of Land Records:
Land Records officer should be eligible, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71046
Local Allowance, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* ... 71051

Deputy Director of Land Records—*continued.*
Post held by junior officer of Burma Commission, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71051
Post usually retained for two years only, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71051
should be Required to take part in work of all sections of office, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71051
Title should be changed to First Assistant Commissioner, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* ... 71051

E

Europeans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 438

Exchange Compensation Allowance (*see under* Pay).

F

Furlough (*see under* Leave).

G

Government of Burma, memorandum p. 435–7

H

Haddock, J., evidence of 71044–71075

House Allowance (*see under* Pay).

I

Imperial Service, distinction between Provincial Service and, abolition advocated 71050

Inspectors of Land Records:
Burmans, two Assistant Superintendentships should be thrown open to, to induce better men to join, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* ... 71075
Position of, etc. ... ... p. 436

L

Leave:
with Allowances, taken in India, should count as service, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* ... 71048
Conditions ... ... p. 436
FURLOUGH:
Commutation of portion on full pay desired, *Haddock* 71063
Commutation to shorter period with higher allowance should be allowed, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71048
after First eight years, and thereafter after every seven years advocated, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71048
at more Frequent intervals desired, *Haddock* 71065
Provincial Services, period between furloughs should be four years, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71048
Privilege, suggestion *re* accumulation, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71048
Reserve, inadequate, and increase advocated, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71046
RULES:
Admission to benefit of European Service rules of officers drawing not less than Rs. 800 requested, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71075
One set for all services in India advocated, *Haddock* 71062

M

Marriage:
PROHIBITION WITHIN FIRST FIVE YEARS, IF TIME-SCALE ESTABLISHED:
Advocated, *Haddock* 71070
not Advocated, *Pe Maung* 71070
Rule that candidates should be unmarried and not marry during probation, no reason for, as regards Burmans, but not objected to, *Pe Maung* 71069

Maung Pe Maung, K.S.M., evidence of 71044–71075

Medical Attendance, free, or reduced, to families of officers, suggestion, *Haddock* 71047

P

Pay:
BURMA ALLOWANCE:
Grant to Land Records officer if given to officers of any other department whether or not specially recruited for Provinces advocated, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71046
not so much Wanted by officers as extra pay to meet high cost of living, *Haddock* ... 71061
Conditions ... ... p. 436
Exchange Compensation Allowance, abolition in all services, or grant to Land Records Department advocated, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71046, 71073
HOUSE ALLOWANCE:
Advocated to officers where drawn by other Departments, not only to those classed as "Imperial," *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* ... 71046
Need for, *Haddock* 71072
Local Allowance, recommendation *re* extended grant of, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* ... 71046
Officers on same footing as Extra Assistant Commissioners, and advantages as to pay, etc., extended to latter should apply to, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71046
Officiating allowances between grades would not be required if time-scale adopted, *Haddock* 71060
Rates of pay and allowances, 1890, 1900, 1913 p. 437
Scale, *Haddock* 71053
Travelling allowance, all Gazetted officers should be classed as Class I. for, and Rates proposed, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71046

Pension:
Conditions ... ... p. 436
Exchange, two shillings to rupee advocated, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71049
Service for, should count from 18, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71049
(*see also* Retirement.)

Probation and Training:
Scheme, *Haddock* 71056
Survey training scheme, breakdown of, as originally devised ... ... p. 437
System ... ... p. 436
System satisfactory, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71045

Promotion:
Small number of high posts open to Land Records officers compared with Civil Service, and recommendation, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71046

TIME-SCALE:
Advocated, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* ... 71058
Scheme, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71047

Provident Fund, joining of, not compulsory, *Haddock* 71066

R

Recruitment;
AGE LIMITS:
20–25 advocated, *Haddock* 71055
21–25 advocated, *Pe Maung* 71055
Candidates, register kept, no advertisements issued, *Haddock* 71071
no special Difficulty, *Haddock* 71071
should be Open to domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians and Burmans of good family as now, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* ... 71050, 71057
Regulations considered satisfactory by Government ... ... p. 437
Rules suitable, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* ... 71044
on Standard educational qualification, *Haddock* 71067
System ... ... p. 436
Vacancies, three, only, last year, *Haddock* ... 71071
no Vacancy probably for two years, *Pe Maung* 71071

Reorganisations of Department ... ... p. 435

Retirement:
Compulsory, at 55 advocated, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71049, 71059
after 25 years' service should be allowed, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71049, 71064

Revenue:
position of Surveyor, etc. ... ... p. 436–7
work of Department, interchangeability of officers, *Haddock* 71068

S

Settlement Department, work of, interchangeability of officers, *Haddock* 71054, 71068

Settlement Officers:
Assistant, two appointments should be open to Superintendents, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71046
Listed post, giving of, alternately to Superintendent of Land Records and member of Provincial Civil Service suggested ... ... p. 437
One appointment should be open to Superintendents, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71046

Superintendents:
Assistant (*see that title*).
Officiating appointments should be permitted if grade system retained, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71046
PAY AND ALLOWANCES:
1890, 1900, 1913 ... ... p. 437
proposed Scale, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71047
Relations with District Officers, *Haddock* and *Pe Maung* 71051

Survey Department, work of, *Haddock* ... 71054

T

Training (*see* Probation and Training).

Travelling Allowance (*see under* Pay).

W

Work of Officers of Department, their competency for certain duties, *Haddock* 71054, 71068

ROYAL COMMISSION ON THE PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA.

APPENDIX

TO THE

REPORT

OF

THE COMMISSIONERS.

Volume XVI.

OF THE BOMBAY BRANCH OF THE ROYAL ASIATIC SOCIETY

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

RELATING TO THE

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

Taken at Delhi, Calcutta, Madras, Bombay, and London,

WITH

APPENDICES.

Presented to both Houses of Parliament by Command of His Majesty.

Cx 1.45

LONDON:
PRINTED UNDER THE AUTHORITY OF HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE
By DARLING AND SON, LIMITED, BACON STREET, E.

To be purchased, either directly or through any Bookseller, from
WYMAN AND SONS, LIMITED, 29, BREAMS BUILDINGS, FETTER LANE, E.C.,
28, ABINGDON STREET, S.W., and 54, ST. MARY STREET, CARDIFF; or
H.M. STATIONERY OFFICE (SCOTTISH BRANCH), 23, FORTH STREET, EDINBURGH; or
E. PONSONBY, LIMITED, 116, GRAFTON STREET, DUBLIN;
or from the Agencies in the British Colonies and Dependencies,
the United States of America and other Foreign Countries of
T. FISHER UNWIN, LONDON, W.C.

1915.

[Cd. 7904.] *Price* 2*s.* 4*d.*

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION	2
MINUTES OF EVIDENCE	3
APPENDICES	219
INDEX	277

LIST OF WITNESSES EXAMINED BEFORE THE ROYAL COMMISSION.

At DELHI, Friday, 14th November, 1913.

	PAGE
W. M. GRIFFITH, Esq., Executive Engineer, United Provinces	3

At DELHI, Monday, 17th November, 1913.

R. P. RUSSELL, Esq., Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department	6
H. J. HOPE, Esq., Executive Engineer, United Provinces	16
F. R. BAGLEY, Esq., M.Inst.C.E., Chief Engineer, Southern Punjab Railway	21
RAJ NARAYAN, Esq., Executive Engineer, United Provinces...	28

At DELHI, Tuesday, 18th November, 1913.

M. NETHERSOLE, Esq., Inspector-General of Irrigation, Public Works Department	32
F. C ROSE, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Punjab	38
RAI BAHADUR GANGA RAM, C.I.E., M.V.O., late of the Public Works Department, Punjab	46
LALA WAZIR CHAND CHOPRA, Executive Engineer, Punjab...	48

At DELHI, Wednesday, 19th November, 1913.

Lieutenant-Colonel E. H. de V. ATKINSON, R.E., Principal, Thomason College, Rurki	52
Captain H. de L. POLLARD-LOWSLEY, C.I.E., R.E., Under Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces, in the Public Works Department	56
F. M. PURVES, Esq., Temporary Engineer (Irrigation), Punjab	64
RAI BAHADUR LALA BAIJ NATH, Executive Engineer (Irrigation), Punjab	70
LALA RADHIKA NARAYAN, Executive Engineer (Irrigation), Punjab	82

At CALCUTTA, Saturday, 20th December, 1913.

B. K. FINNIMORE Esq., Chief Engineer, Bengal	92
F. A. A. COWLEY, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Bengal	97
SHAILENDRA NATH BANARJI, Esq., Under-Secretary to the Government of Bengal in the Irrigation and Railway Branches	102

At CALCUTTA, Tuesday, 6th January, 1914.

RAI BAHADUR ANNADA PRASAD SARKAR, Superintending Engineer, Bengal (retired)...	108
Sir RAJENDRA NATH MOOKERJEE, K.C.I.E. (of Messrs. Martin & Co., Calcutta)	112
B. HEATON, Esq., Principal, Civil Engineering College, Sibpur	115
O. H. DESENNE, Esq., Executive Engineer, Assam	119
F. H. HODGKINS, Esq., District Engineer, Assam	122

At CALCUTTA, Wednesday, 7th January, 1914.

L. W. LEWIS, Esq., Executive Engineer, Burma	125
J. CRAIG, Esq., Executive Engineer, Burma	131
R. C. EDGE, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Bihar and Orissa	136
BABU JNANANJAN SAHA, Executive Engineer, Bihar and Orissa	139
W. S. DORMAN, Esq., Executive Engineer, Punjab	141

At MADRAS, Wednesday, 28th January, 1914.

Colonel W. M ELLIS, R.E., Chief Engineer, Madras	150
W. J. J. HOWLEY, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Madras	157
M. R. Ry. R. A. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR Avargal, Executive Engineer, Madras	160
M. R. Ry. N. SWAMINATHA AYYAR Avargal, Executive Engineer, Madras	164
W. H. JAMES, Esq., B.Sc., Principal, College of Engineering, Madras	167

At BOMBAY, Saturday, 21st February, 1914.

H. F. BEALE, Esq., Chief Engineer and Secretary to Government in the Public Works Department, Bombay	169
V. T. AGASHE, Esq., late Sanitary Engineer to the Government of Bombay	179
K. S. FRAMJI, Esq., Executive Engineer and Professor of Engineering, College of Engineering, Poona ...	181
H. N. ALLEN, Esq., Principal, College of Engineering, Poona	189

At BOMBAY, Monday, 23rd February, 1914.

H. B. LEAROYD, Esq., Executive Engineer, Central Provinces	190
J. H. SHARPE, Esq., Executive Engineer, Central Provinces	195
C. S. C. HARRISON, Esq., Executive Engineer, Pravara Canals District, Bombay	200

At LONDON, Monday, 4th May, 1914.

H. A. HAINES, Esq., Secretary, Public Works Department, India Office	208

At LONDON, Wednesday, 6th May, 1914.

Colonel Sir JOHN W. OTTLEY, K.C.I.E., late R.E., M.Inst.C.E.	213

ROYAL COMMISSION ON THE PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

At Delhi, Friday, 14th November, 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, ESQ., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, ESQ.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, ESQ., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, ESQ., C.S.I.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, ESQ., M.P.

R. R. SCOTT, ESQ. (*Joint Secretary*).

W. M. GRIFFITH, ESQ., Executive Engineer, United Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,244. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—Of the numerous Engineers recruited by the Secretary of State under covenant to the Public Works Department there are, it is believed, only 5 men, named below, now remaining in the Public Works Service, who have not been placed on the Imperial cadre, and it is on behalf of these men that this representation is made. Their names and dates of appointment are as follows:—

Name.	Degrees, &c.	Appointed in	Service as		Total service about	Present Province.
			Covenanted Engineer from	Temporary Engineer from		
					Years.	
Griffith, W. M.	A.M.I.C.E.	Nov. 1902.	Jan. 1903.	Feb. 1908.	11	United Provinces.
Milner, H. W.	B.Sc., A.M.I.C.E.	Do.	1903	1908	11	Madras.
O'Reilly, J. J.	B.A., B.E.	Do.	1903	1908	11	,,
Dixon, T. I.	B.E., M.I.C.E.	Nov. 1903.	Jan. 1904.	Jan. 1909	10	Punjab.
Colyer, C. A.	A.M.I.C.E.	Do.	Do.	Do.	10	,,

All these 5 Engineers were recruited by the Secretary of State (under a 5 years' covenant to the Public Works Department) prior to the abolition of the Royal Indian College of Engineering and the commencement of direct recruitment to the Imperial cadre by the Secretary of State in 1905, and so, at that time, could not be appointed by the Secretary of State direct to the Imperial cadre. They were recruited by advertisement in the open market and selection by interview as are the present recruits to the Imperial cadre, but the qualifications required in their case were rather more exacting than those of the present recruits to the Imperial cadre, as they were required to have in addition to a college training 2 years' experience in practical work. The age-limit was in consequence 28 years instead of as at present 24 years (*i.e.*, 4 years higher) and the pay of the appointments was proportionately greater.

At the time of their recruitment hopes were held out to them by senior officials at the India Office, Whitehall, that if their services were approved they could be given appointments in the Imperial cadre, and these Engineers have since forfeited their return passages to England and remained as temporary Engineers in India in the hopes of these prospects being fulfilled.

All these Engineers have now approximately 10 or 11 years' approved service in the Public Works Department, and it is believed that *all* have been recommended by the Local Government under whom they are serving for places on the Imperial cadre.

71,245. **(III.) Conditions of Service and (V.) Conditions of Leave.**—The present conditions of service of these Engineers as Temporary Engineers are quite unsuitable for men recruited in England by the Secretary of State who are not natives of India or men domiciled in India and their present position is an impossible one because—

(*a*) They are not under the European leave rules, and are not entitled to furlough to enable them to proceed to England to recruit their healths, and see their relations after a period of service in India.

(*b*) They are not entitled to a pension.

(*c*) They are debarred from the higher appointments, in fact Mr. W. B. Gordon, the late Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Depart-

(779—3.) Wt. L3490/12. 2300. 6/15. D & S.

ment, in an interview at Simla in August 1911 personally informed Mr. Griffith who will give evidence before you that it was the intention of the Government of India gradually to reduce the temporary Engineers to Sub-Divisional (*i.e.*, the most Junior Assistants) charges as sufficient Engineers of the permanent establishment were recruited, to fill the executive appointments.

(*d*) They are liable to have their appointments terminated at a month's notice.

71,246. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—(*a*) Their pay is inferior to the pay and allowances of the Imperial Engineers who were recruited by the Secretary of State after they were, though these Imperial Engineers are at least 4 or 5 years younger (being recruited under a 4 years' lower age limit) and are no better qualified.

(*b*) Their pay is inferior to the pay and allowances of numerous covenant Engineers recruited in the same years and under the same conditions as themselves who have been transferred to the Imperial cadre.

(*c*) Their pay is even inferior to the pay and allowances of covenant Engineers recruited several years after they were who have been transferred to the Imperial cadre although they have been holding more senior positions for longer periods than these Engineers or than the Imperial Engineers above referred to in sub-paragraph (*a*).

As example take the case of Mr. Griffith who in his 11th year of service is only drawing the same pay (*i.e.*, R700) as he was in his 5th year of service, although for the last 5 years he has held charge as Executive Engineer of one of the more important irrigation divisions of the United Provinces, and his work in that Division has for several years been favourably mentioned in the Annual Administration Reports of the United Provinces Irrigation Branch His pay is in fact less than the most junior grade of the Imperial Executive Engineers

71,247. *General.*—The grievances of these Engineers is that—

(1) The Supreme Government, although having already created a precedent by appointing a number of covenant Engineers to the Imperial cadre, refused the recommendations of their Local Governments to appoint these Engineers to the Imperial cadre although these recommendations were believed to be as strong as others, and in one case (Mr. Griffith) to have been submitted 3 times by the Local Government.

(2) That whilst refusing these recommendations of their Local Governments the Supreme Government accepted those of a further 12 covenant Engineers who have since (in 1911) been transferred to the Imperial cadre though these 12 men were (*a*) all junior in service, (*b*) In some cases not so well qualified, and (*c*) In some cases not so well recommended.

The refusal of the Supreme Government to accept the recommendation of the Local Governments on behalf of these Engineers has placed them in a very serious position because they are all well qualified Engineers who 10 or 11 years ago gave up good prospects in England to serve in India. Had they not done so they might by now have reasonably expected to have established good positions in England for themselves. As now situated their 10 or 11 years' service (the most important years in their professional careers) as Irrigation Engineers will be of no value to them professionally in England where no similar work exists and further they have by now *lost all their professional connections in England.*

These Engineers find themselves in this serious position through no fault of their own, because:—

(1) They are fully qualified for the Imperial cadre.

(2) Their services have been fully approved as shown by their being recommended by the Local Government for the Imperial cadre.

(3) They were initially misled at the time of their recruitment in England by having hopes of the Permanent cadre held out to them.

(4) They were misled by the precedent created by the Government of India in transferring a number of covenant Engineers to the Imperial cadre.

(5) In one case, namely Mr. Griffith, it is admitted in writing by Mr. N. F. McLeod the then Chief Engineer and Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch, United Provinces, that he led Mr. Griffith to believe he would assuredly receive a permanent appointment.

It is suggested that the placing of these 5 ex-covenant Engineers in the Imperial cadre could easily be arranged by regulating recruitment, and it is further suggested that the placing of these men in the Imperial cadre in places which their age and length of service would entitle them, would improve this cadre, by making it more regular and strengthening it in places where it requires strengthening.

It is hoped that this Royal Commission after due consideration of these facts will recommend His Majesty's Government to place these 5 Engineers in similar positions in the Imperial cadre to those already given to other ex-covenant Engineers, recruited at the same time and under the same conditions as themselves, and so save the threatened ruin of their professional careers.

Mr. W. M. GRIFFITH called and examined.

71,248. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he held the post of temporary Executive Engineer, and appeared on behalf of five engineers who came out originally to India under covenant before the present system of appointment by selection was instituted. He arrived in India on the 1st January 1903. Twelve engineers of his year came out to India under similar conditions, and he appeared before the Committee on behalf of three of them. Of the remainder, two had been made permanent in Madras, one had been made permanent in Bombay, and the others he had not traced, but probably they had all been made permanent.

71,249. He could not state the reason why he and his colleagues had not been absorbed into the Service; that had been a problem he had been trying to solve for the last six years. Of those who had been incorporated in the Service, some were of the same year as himself, some were senior and some were junior. When the last junior men were incorporated, the Government of India refused the recommendation made on his behalf, on the ground that he did not belong to that year, but one man had been made permanent whose covenant had expired in the same year as his own.

71,250. At the time of his appointment, hopes were held out to him of being absorbed in the permanent staff. There was nothing in writing, but on enquiry being made at the India Office as to what were the prospects, he was given to understand that he would probably be taken into the permanent cadre if his services proved satisfactory. He believed it had been admitted by the Government of India that there were some grounds for that belief. In the case of one man it was pointed out that it was a practical certainty he would be made permanent, and the question of his probable pension was officially looked into at the India Office.

71,251. Just prior to the lapse of witness's covenant, he went to see the Secretary to the Government of India, Sir Lionel Jacob, when he learnt that he was not to be taken into the permanent cadre in Madras. In that respect it was quite possible that, as there were five covenanted engineers in his year in Madras, Government did not see its way at that time to take all five in. He therefore left Madras, and accepted an appointment in the United Provinces on the understanding from the Secretary of the Local Government that, if his services were approved, he would in all probability be made permanent. At a later period he understood from the Secretary of the Local Government that he was to be made permanent and he then married. He had, however, not been made permanent and Mr. McLeod had kindly written a letter, which he desired to read to the Committee, because Mr. McLeod felt the very awkward position in which he had placed him. The letter was dated 13th October, and was as follows: "My dear Griffith: In February 1907 you came to see me at Lucknow, seeking for an appointment in the Irrigation Branch in these Provinces. You asked what prospects there were of permanent employment in the Imperial

Engineer Service in the event of your being offered, and accepting, an appointment as temporary Engineer. You informed me at the same time that you had seen Mr. (now Sir) Lionel Jacob, at Calcutta, and understood from him that there were prospects of your obtaining permanent employ in the Public Works Department, but that such permanent appointment would depend on the recommendations of the Local Government under whom you might take service. I told you that I personally considered that there appeared to be a good chance of your obtaining a permanent appointment in the Imperial Service in the Irrigation Branch in these Provinces, provided that you gave satisfaction and that your service was fully approved in the temporary appointment we were at that time able to offer you. Your work in this Province has been fully approved, and I personally always considered that in view of your service here, and your previous approved service as an Engineer under covenant in Madras, your prospects of obtaining permanent employ were better than those of the other officers recommended, and that you would assuredly be appointed to the Imperial Engineer Service. The orders of the Government of India, rejecting the recommendations of the Local Government on your behalf, have caused me extreme regret, the more so that they have so completely vitiated the personal assurance I had, and the belief I doubtless conveyed to you, of an assured permanent apointment in the Irrigation Branch in these Provinces." He had obtained a recommendation from the Madras Government, and his three colleagues also received recommendation for good services from their Local Governments.

71,252. He had first filled the post of Sub-divisional officer, and for the last five years he had been Executive Engineer, Divisional officer, but he had not been receiving for the latter period the pay of an Executive Engineer of the Imperial cadre. His salary was Rs. 100 less than that paid to the most junior executive officer of the Imperial cadre.

71,253. He was not on a scale of salary. The maximum he could look to under present circumstances was Rs. 700 a month. When first entering the service he began at Rs. 500, and finished at Rs. 700.*

71,254. He desired, with his colleagues, to be incorporated in the Imperial Service, but he would not be prepared to enter at the bottom of the list. He was not aware that the absorption of a certain number of engineers similar to himself had caused a good deal of dissatisfaction in the service. The scale was an incremental scale, and he did not see how it could affect anybody.

71,255. The grounds on which he claimed to be admitted into the service were, first the promise that at the end of his covenant he might be admitted; second that his service had been equal in every way to those engineers recruited at the same time as himself, and who had been taken into the Imperial cadre; third, that unless he was admitted his career was wrecked, because he was too old to begin again in another branch of the profession. If he were admitted to the Imperial Service he considered the whole of his temporary service should count for pension. He asked for equal treatment to those who were recruited at the same time and under the same conditions as himself.

71,256. He had not been able to afford to subscribe to the General Provident Fund. He had the opportunity of doing so, and about three months ago had been compelled to do so.

71,257. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) He was quite sure his two colleagues, Mr. Milner and Mr. Riley, had not been confirmed. He did not know what pay they were drawing. They were still in the executive establishment of the Madras Public Works.

71,258. *He did not know at the time he made his application in England that it was the case with regard to other Departments of the Public Service that men were brought out under five years' agreements and then generally confirmed and put into the Service.*

71,259. (*Mr. Madge.*) *It would have been much wiser for him to have obtained some written statement at the time of his application instead of merely a verbal one.*

71,260. With regard to his objection to going in at the bottom of the list if made permanent he would point out that the pay of the lowest Imperial officer was Rs. 380 a month, against his present salary of Rs. 700.

71,261. His statement that junior Imperial engineers were no better qualified than the five temporary engineers he represented, was based on the qualifications of his five colleagues. Three of them were Bachelors of Science, and the other two were Associate Members of the Institution of Civil Engineers, which, as a theoretical qualification, was the standard of the Imperial Engineers recruitment. Also they had had at least two years' experience of works in England. Such a training had been insisted upon in their case, but it was not insisted upon in the case of the present Imperial engineers.

71,262. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) It would be in the power of the Secretary of State to transfer him to the Imperial cadre. The Government of India recommended, and the Secretary of State approved, and then the Government of India undertook the transfer. No representation had yet been made by him to the Secretary of State. He knew nothing of what his colleagues had done in the matter. He memorialised the Government on the 1st July 1912, and received an answer on the 13th May 1913 to the effect: "it is now found that this question is one which is beset with serious difficulties, especially in the case of the Imperial Service, in which the actual number of officers is already in excess of the existing strength, and any increase in the latter is very unlikely." He would like to mention that since that letter was written, 22 further Imperial engineers had been appointed, and in a recent copy of the *Statesman* it was stated that the Government of India had decided as a provisional arrangement to recruit 30 probationary engineers for the Imperial Public Works next year.

71,263. The Secretary of State would have the power to put him at once in the cadre on a salary of Rs. 700.

71,264. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) If he were put into the cadre on this salary, he did not see how that would damage† the prospects of the Assistant En-

* Mr. Griffith afterwards wrote that he had received an intimation that his rate of pay from the 1st January 1914 was to be Rs. 800 *per mensem*, *i.e.*, an increase of Rs. 100.

† Mr. Griffith afterwards submitted an addendum in support of his opinion that putting himself and his colleagues into upper places in the cadre would not damage the prospects of junior men by creating a block. He wrote as follows:—

"(1) In the last 10 or 15 years the Public Works Department has considerably expanded and the expansion is believed to be *permanent* and likely to continue still further.

"(2) This expansion has resulted in the formation of a number of New Divisions and in additional higher administrative appointments.

"(3) The present cadre is badly under strength and the shortage is in the *senior* and not in the junior years.

"(4) The placing of men of corresponding age in these senior years is the only way in which the cadre can now be brought to its proper strength without resulting in subsequent irregularities and blocks.

"(5) The placing of senior men in the senior years of shortage would not create a block as they being older would retire sooner than junior men recruited now at the bottom.

"(6) The existence of the shortage is proved by the recent sanction of an increase of 42 Engineers to the strength of the cadre and by Mr. Russell's statement before the Commission that a further 10 per cent. on the cadre (say 80 men) was required.

"(7) The Imperial recruitment having been based on a calculation of *giving each recruit Divisional charge after 9 years*, it is clear these new Divisional charges *should* have been allowed for in recruitment 9 years before they were created. *It* follows therefore that the shortage must exist in *all* the senior years which were recruited before these new charges were created or thought of and *not* in the junior years.

"(8) To recruit this shortage, 42 + 80 = 122 men, entirely from the bottom, even if recruitment were spread over 10 years, would require an additional recruitment of 12·2 men above the normal, *i.e.*, an over recruitment of over 30 per cent. for 10 *consecutive* years. The effect of this would obviously be to create a *very serious block*.

"(9) To maintain the cadre correctly the rate of *retirement* needs as careful regulation as recruitment which could only be assured if these new recruits in the senior years were neither *older* nor *younger* than the men of the years in which they were placed."

gineers below him, whereas, it would mean ruin* to him if he were not transferred on equal terms with other men of his year recruited under the same conditions as himself, who had already been transferred to the Imperial cadre. If the Government advanced the argument that a certain number of engineers were brought out on covenant, the best of whom they would make permanent and reject the others, he agreed that although some of the officiating engineers, under whom the latter men had directly served, might not agree with that view, the final decision rested with the Government of India, but he submitted that he and his colleagues were not inferior, and that their qualifications were in many cases superior.

71,265. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness believed the twelve covenanted engineers who were junior to him, but who were incorporated in the permanent cadre, had just completed their covenant when they were incorporated and were drawing Rs. 600 a month. They came into the incremental scale at about the same rate.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Delhi, Monday, 17th November 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, ESQ., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, ESQ.
GOPAL KRISHNA GOKHALE, ESQ., C.I.E.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, ESQ., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, ESQ., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, ESQ.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, ESQ., M.P.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

W. P. HOUSDEN, ESQ., Superintending Engineer, United Provinces.
E. W. CLARKE, ESQ., Executive Engineer, United Provinces.
D. W. AIKMAN, ESQ., Superintending Engineer, Punjab.
J. W. B. LOUGHRAN, ESQ., Executive Engineer, Punjab.

R. R. SCOTT, ESQ. (*Joint Secretary*).

R. P. RUSSELL, ESQ., Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

N.B.—*The opinions expressed in this memorandum are purely personal and are in no way those of the Government of India.*

71,266. **General.**—(1) *Organization of Department.*—For purposes of organization, each Province is split up into Circles, Divisions, and Sub-Divisions; in some Provinces these are called Divisions, Districts and Sub-Divisions:—

(i) *Administrative charges*:—

(*a*) All Public Works in a Province are in the charge of a Chief Engineer; in some Provinces there are separate Chief Engineers for the Buildings and Roads and Irrigation Branches.

(*b*) Circles of Superintendence—
These are in charge of Superintending Engineers. A Circle usually contains 3 or more Divisions.

(ii) *Executive charges*:—

(*a*) Divisional charges—
These are in charge of Executive Engineers and occasionally in charge of Temporary Engineers. A Division usually contains 3 or more Sub-Divisions.

(*b*) Sub-Divisional charges—
These are in charge of Assistant Engineers, Temporary Engineers, and Upper Subordinates.

(2) *Engineer Establishment.*—The Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department is composed of—

(*i*) An *Imperial* Establishment consisting of—

(*a*) Civil Engineers appointed by the Secretary of State in England.

(*b*) A limited number of Royal Engineer Officers.

---

* Mr. Griffith afterwards submitted the following explanation. He wrote:—

"My reasons for claiming that failure to transfer me on equal terms would mean ruin are:—

"(1) *Financial.*—My present pay *is not* and for the past 5 years in which I have held Executive charge *has not been* sufficient to maintain *that position.* The actual pay I have drawn throughout my service and the positions held are given below.

Year.	Pay per mensem in Rs.	Positions held.	REMARKS.
1903	500	Sub-Divisional Office ..	Under 5 years Covenant in Madras.
1904	500	Ditto ..	
1905	550	Ditto ..	
1906	600	Ditto ..	
1907	700	Ditto ..	
1908	600	Sub-Divisional Officer to October then Executive.	Temporary Engineer, United Provinces.
1909	600	Executive Engineer in Divisional charge.	
1910	600	Ditto ..	
1911	600	Ditto ..	
1912	700	Ditto ..	
1913	700	Ditto ..	

In consequence instead of contributing to a provident fund I have actually been drawing out those small savings which in my earlier service I was able to accumulate, and am in consequence now without resources.

I have placed myself in this position in the belief: (*a*) That eventually justice would be done by the Government of India, when I hoped this loss would be adjusted. (*b*) In the confidence of my ability to eventually prove my worth. (*c*) In the knowledge of the repeated representations which were being made on my behalf by the Government of the United Provinces.

In justification I submit this belief has been shared by others in high authority better able than I to judge such matters.

Also to the fact that for the past 4 *consecutive* years my name has received special mention in the published Annual Irrigation Administrative Reports of the United Provinces as a result of the effect of my administration of the Rohilkhand canals.

(2) *Professional.*—Placing an officer in the Public Works Department cadre below the position of men of his *age* would mean that not only throughout his service would he draw inferior pay to his brother officers, but forcible retirement at 55 years would prevent the possibility of his rising to the higher administrative appointments. To an ambitious officer this would mean professional ruin.

(*ii*) A *Provincial* Establishment consisting of—

(*a*) Civil Engineers appointed from the Indian Engineering Colleges.

(*b*) Promoted Upper Subordinates.

Although the Engineer Establishment of the Department mainly consists of an Imperial and Provincial Service as above, for reasons which are explained in paragraphs 7-11, there exists—

(*iii*) An Establishment of Temporary Engineers recruited locally in India who belong to neither (*i*) nor (*ii*).

(3) *Strength of Establishment how determined.*—The strength of the Department (Imperial and Provincial Service) is based upon the number of constituted *superior posts, viz.*, Administrative and Divisional charges. The number of officers required to fill the total number of superior posts is determined from actuarial tables drawn up with reference to the conditions of service. The rate of annual recruitment to maintain the total strength is similarly calculated. The cadre number and rate of annual recruitment is so determined as to ensure as far as possible that an Assistant Engineer will rise to Executive rank and be in charge of a Division after ten years' service.

At present the question of fixing the cadre strength of the entire Department is before the Secretary of State. The cadre proposed by the Government of India has been based upon a total number of 440 *superior posts, viz.*:—

Public Works Department	344
State Railways	96
Total	440

The 344 superior posts in the Public Works Department are made up of:—

Imperial Service posts	241
Provincial Service posts	103
Total	344

The 96 superior posts in the State Railways Department are made up of:—

Imperial Service posts	66
Provincial Service posts	30
Total	96

The number of men required to man 241 *Imperial* posts in the Public Works Department and 66 in the Railway Department is 509 and 139 respectively, or a total of 648. The number of men required to man 103 *Provincial* posts in the Public Works Department and 30 in the Railway Department is 219 and 61 respectively, or a total of 280. The total cadre of the Public Works Department including the Railway Branch is therefore 928. The proportion of Imperial posts is therefore nearly seven-tenths and of Provincial posts is nearly three-tenths of the total.

In addition to the strength of 928 officers a provision has been made of 60 officers to enable the Government of India to comply with requests from Foreign employers and Railway Companies for the services of Government Engineers.

The number of Provincial Service Engineers has been fixed by the Secretary of State at present at 280.

(4) *Actual strength compared with cadre.*—The actual strength of the Department on October 1st, 1913, including officers on deputation was as under:—

Imperial Service.

—	Public Works Department.	Railways.	Total.
(*a*) Civil Engineers	559	118	677
(*b*) Royal Engineers	30	40	70
Total	589	158	747
Provincial Service.			
Civil Engineers...	183	26	209
Grand Total	772	184	956

(5) *Majority of Sub-Divisional charges must devolve upon Upper Subordinates.*—The general result of calculating the cadre strength in the manner described is of importance. If the number of officers required to fill the administrative appointments is deducted, the balance consists of Executive Engineers, Assistant Engineers in practically equal proportions, after excluding the leave reserve, that is to say, the number of officers theoretically on duty of not more than 10 years' service is approximately equal to the number of officers theoretically on duty of more than 10 years' service excluding those holding administrative charges. It has already been pointed out that an average Division contains about 3 Sub-Divisions. A Division is the charge of an Executive Engineer; as the number of Assistant Engineers, that is, officers of not more than 10 years' service is supposed to be equal approximately to the number of Executive Engineers, it follows that in theory there is only one Assistant Engineer available for sub-divisional charge in each division. In practice, however, the number of Assistant Engineers available to hold charge of Sub-Divisions will not admit of even one sub-division in every division being held by officers of this rank. The bulk of the Sub-Divisional charges must therefore be held by Upper Subordinates.

(6) *The Sub-Divisional Officer.*—The Sub-Divisional Officer, is the officer primarily responsible for the actual carrying out of work through the medium of his subordinates. He is the officer who is primarily responsible for making all the arrangements, supervising and passing work, arranging contracts, settling rates, measuring up work, preparing bills for payment, and to a very large extent paying for work done. He has a drawing account and prepares all initial accounts. He is the officer who is primarily responsible for the expenditure of a very large amount of public funds. Although the accounts of the Sub-Divisional Officer are subject to strict scrutiny and, after compilation in the Executive Engineer's Office, to audit, and although the work of the Sub-Divisional Officer is inspected by the Executive Engineer, nevertheless upon the capability and integrity of the Sub-Divisional Officer to a very large extent depends the return for expenditure incurred. In a large number of cases, the work of a Sub-Divisional Officer employed upon *maintenance* does not call for any high engineering skill, but it is mostly in such cases where the responsibility of obtaining a fair return for outlay is the most difficult and the least susceptible of any check or control. Slackness and want of efficient control over subordinates, contractors, or Departmental labour, means waste of public funds.

(7) *Reluctance to employ Upper Subordinates as Sub-Divisional Officers cause of employing Temporary Engineers.*—For long past, there has been a great reluctance on the part of the officers responsible for the administration to place any but senior, qualified and selected Upper Subordinates in charge of these responsible positions of trust, particularly in the case of Canal Sub-Divisions. As the number of such selected Upper Subordinates has been found insufficient to man the number of Sub-Divisions recourse has been had to the employment of Temporary Engineers. Temporary Engineers are for the most part Engineers who have received an Engineering education at an Indian College, but who failed to obtain a guaranteed appointment. There are among them Europeans domiciled in India, Eurasians, Indians, and a few men originally appointed in England by the Secretary of State on covenant, who took up appointments on the expiry of their covenants.

(8) *Temporary Engineers. Conditions of service.*—Temporary Engineers are on the footing of monthly paid servants; they are appointed by local Governments for periods of a year; their services are renewed annually if required; their services can be terminated on a month's notice on either side; their pay is governed by no rules; they usually receive increases of salary every second year if recommended; they are non-pensionable; they are entitled to the ordinary rules regarding privilege leave; they are not entitled to furlough or sick leave, except as an act of grace; their pay usually varies from Rs. 250

per mensem to Rs. 750 per mensem; as a rule, an officer on the latter rate of pay will have had 20 or more years' service in the Department, or be from 40 to 45 years of age. Temporary Engineers with but few exceptions are employed as Sub-Divisional Officers and have very little prospect of ever being employed in a higher capacity. In consequence of their having been relegated to this position for so long many of the present Temporary Engineers are unlikely to be fitted for more responsible positions.

(9) *Temporary Engineers to large extent permanently employed.*—It should be clearly understood that in those Provinces in which they are most largely employed Temporary Engineers are engaged not so much with the object of forming an elastic element to meet the fluctuating operations of the Department, as for the purpose of eking out the permanent establishment, because the Department, as organised, requires a greater number of qualified Upper Subordinates for positions of trust than can be obtained from the Upper Subordinate Establishment as it exists. The necessity for this extra establishment of Temporary Engineers sandwiched between the Upper Subordinate and the permanent staff of Engineers would to a large extent disappear if the Upper Subordinate Establishment were sufficiently attractive to induce a greater number of men of better class, family and position to enter it.

(10) *Difficulties of dispensing with services of Temporary Engineers.*—As now constituted, it is impossible to increase the proportion of Assistant Engineers to the Executive Engineers without blocking the former for Divisional charges. On the other hand, it is increasingly difficult to obtain good qualified Temporary Engineers to serve under existing conditions. The longer a Temporary Engineer serves, the more difficult does it become to dispense with his services and to cast him adrift with, in most cases, but little prospect of other employment, owing to his having become stale, less active and efficient than he was, by reason of having been relegated to a position from which he has little chance of being promoted. Moreover, the work of maintaining canals, regulating the supply of water and looking after its distribution, of attending to the record of irrigation and to duties generally falling under the category of up-keep and maintenance, though of the first importance, does not need the possession of qualities and experience that are in any demand outside Government service.

(11) *Growth of size of Divisional charges.*—The necessity for the creation of the present service of Temporary Engineers has, apart from that already given, been accentuated by another cause, *viz.*, that the number of the Divisonal charges has by no means kept pace with the growth of operations of the Department. In many cases the Divisional charge has become unwieldy, the Sub-Divisions have increased in number, size and importance; as the number of Assistant Engineers is directly based upon the number of Divisions there are less Assistant Engineers now available for Sub-Divisional charges: on the other hand the Sub-Divisional charge being larger and more important is less suitable as a Subordinate's charge.

Twenty years ago the Engineer cadre of the Public Works Department (excluding Railways) consisted of 581 officers; the outlay per annum was about 4½ crores. In 1911-12 the cadre stood at 705 officers and the outlay had increased to 11½ crores; thus while expenditure has increased by 150 per cent., the Establishment has only increased by 21 per cent. Twenty years ago there were in the United Provinces 24 Divisional charges with an annual outlay of about 58 lakhs. At the present time there are 36 Divisional charges to cope with an annual expenditure of 130 lakhs; thus while expenditure has increased to 2¼ times what it was the Divisional charges have only increased 50 per cent. In the Irrigation Branch, Punjab, 20 years ago there were 18 Divisions and an annual expenditure of 64 lakhs. In 1912-13, there were including the North-West Frontier Province 41 Divisions to cope with an outlay of 258 lakhs; while expenditure has been quadrupled, the number of Divisional charges has only been slightly more than doubled. In the Buildings and Roads Branch of the same Province while the expenditure has risen from 31 lakhs per annum to 70, the number of Divisions has in the same time only been increased from 10 to 13.

(12) *Divisional Officer's control over initial expenditure.*—The work that devolves upon the Divisional Officer by this increase of work leaves him less free to move about his charge and pay that personal attention to initial outlay which is so important when so large an expenditure of public funds is initially entrusted to officers of the Subordinate class. No system of audit, check, or paper control on the part of the Executive Engineer can take the place of personal supervision. An increase in the number of Divisions and a reduction in their size will automatically provide more Assistant Engineers for Sub-Divisional charge and is a move which, in my opinion, is urgently called for. Nevertheless the only true solution of the present difficulty appears to me to lie in the direction of improving the conditions of the Upper Subordinate Establishment or the method of recruitment so as to secure more men of the better class to enter it to man these important Sub-Divisional charges. An improvement in pay and conditions will not, I am afraid, alone effect this object without introducing some system of nomination as well, at any rate for some time to come. If a sufficiency of capable and thoroughly trustworthy Upper Subordinates could be obtained, the necessity for the employment of Temporary Engineers would largely disappear.

(13) *Suggested improvements in conditions of service of Temporary Engineers.*—Until such time as more men qualified in every way for Sub-Divisional charge can be obtained from the Upper Subordinate establishment, the continued entertainment of a body of Temporary Engineers seems to be unavoidable, and, this being so, these Engineers should be placed on a better footing. It is practically certain that a number of Temporary Engineers who have considerable service, 20 years and more, as Sub-Divisional Officers, cannot continue to be efficient Sub-Divisional Officers much longer, the activity and keenness required of youth cannot be expected from men of advancing age, it is equally certain that appointments as Divisional Officers cannot be provided for them except at the expense of the claims of men in the Permanent Service. It has also to be considered that the salary of a Temporary Engineer might reasonbly expect to receive on the basis of length of service if efficient is more than is warranted to an officer in Sub-Divisional charge. To improve the service I would suggest that Temporary Engineers might be engaged on short agreements of 3 or 5 years on stated terms as to pay after an initial period of probation, that they come under the Indian Service rules as regards furlough and that on being discharged they receive a bonus equal to one month's salary for each year of completed service. I would suggest some such rules being made applicable to Temporary Engineers now in employ.

(14) *Inadequate provision of staff for works under construction, and necessity for considering future demands in advance.*—The establishment of the Public Works Department is subject to much more violent fluctuations than the establishments in other departments. The completion of any large Canal Project for example necessitates the employment of a large staff to work it. The Secretary of State has laid down the principle that the permanent staff should be regulated by the ascertained requirements of the service for the discharge of the duties which may certainly be reckoned upon as recurrent year by year, irrespective of any new large undertakings provision for which should be made when necessary by the employment of temporary establishment. This principle has generally been held to preclude the taking into consideration of posts which, although not immediately necessary, can with certainty be foreseen as being permanently required a few years hence. Any increase to a cadre by the normal method of recruitment can only be obtained very slowly and I think it would be advantageous to commence recruitment for future certain requirements as soon as they become manifest. For example, the Secretary of State sanctions a new Canal Project which is estimated to take 10 years to complete. The construction may involve the creation of 12 or more "superior posts" which as long as construction is in hand are deemed

temporary appointments and as such are excluded from the superior posts on which the cadre is calculated. From the moment of commencement it can be foreseen with sufficient accuracy that within 10 years the new work will involve say 8 permanently required "superior posts": for the purposes of recruitment these posts should be taken into consideration as tending towards obtaining the establishment required by the time it is wanted and lessening the necessity of departing from normal recruitment to make up for deficiencies which usually tends to interfere with an even flow of promotion. In order to ensure that the establishment is maintained at a strength which is sufficient to meet actual requirements of work the cadre should be examined and revised if necessary more frequently than it is at present.

The present system is altogether too rigid to meet the requirements of a Department liable to the sudden fluctuations caused by sanctions to large Projects absorbing a large number of officers. A new Canal Project may readily require for many years 30, 40 or more officers for construction purposes. In order to provide this establishment the practice is to withdraw a number of selected permanent Executive and Assistant Engineers from their regular charges and to employ Temporary Engineers to the extent necessary to make up the full number of men required, the places of the permanent officers so withdrawn being taken by Temporary Engineers, Permanent Upper Subordinates (frequently of a grade too low for their charges) and Temporary Upper Subordinates.

In view of the large amount of constructional work always going on and likely to continue for many years, it would probably be safe to augment the superior posts on which the cadre is based by 10 per cent. to provide for the constructional programme. On the Triple Canal Project in the Punjab there are at the present time 56 officers employed, viz., 31 belonging to the Permanent Establishment and 25 Temporary, the former to a large extent abstracted from works in operation.

Briefly put, the construction of new works, under the existing conditions, is carried out largely at the expense of the efficiency of the arrangements required to administer works already constructed, and is thoroughly uneconomical. The apparent saving in Permanent Establishment which is susceptible of some calculation is far more than counterbalanced by the waste that cannot be calculated but which is known to occur and cannot but occur by the employment of an establishment to a large extent inefficient and unreliable on the upkeep of works. It cannot be too strongly insisted upon that the opportunities for scamping work, waste or fraud on construction work, carried out on estimates which can generally be prepared with close accuracy are almost negligible, compared with the work of lesser importance perhaps from a purely engineering aspect, but involving in the aggregate far greater outlay which is dependent for economical results very largely upon the capability and integrity of the officers employed in immediate charge.

71,267. (I.) **Methods of Recruitment.**—*Imperial Service.*—The number of recruits required annually is determined with reference to the sanctioned strength and is based, as already stated, upon actuarial calculations. The normal rate of recruitment is occasionally modified to make up for abnormal deficiences. Intimation is given to the Secretary of State of the number of recruits required each year. This intimation is given by the Government of India annually in November. The Secretary of State is supplied in May of the following year with a detail of the distribution by Provinces. The distribution of the annual number of recruits among the various Provinces is roughly determined *pro rata* according to the existing deficiences in each.

Generally the present method of recruitment, which has been adopted by the Secretary of State since the abolition of the Royal Indian Engineering College at Cooper's Hill, has been satisfactory as far as technical qualifications are concerned. Under the existing system some very excellent men have been sent out, many of them in no way inferior in technical knowledge to the best of the Cooper's Hill Engineers. The selection Committee have not, however, always paid quite as much attention as is desirable in selecting candidates with the requisite social status for service in India where this important consideration should not be ignored. The Indian is quite capable of detecting any marked inferiority in social status in the officer under whom he is serving, and where such exists his respect diminishes. The general standard of education as apart from technical education is probably not as high now as it was in the days of Cooper's Hill when most of the men entering that institution came from the Public Schools. I consider that the Selection Comittee should be represented by at least 50 per cent. of senior officers in the Department on the active or retired lists, in the latter case by men who have not been severed from the Department too long. These are the men who know the requirements best.

While recognising the arguments that can be brought forward in favour of the abolition of the Royal Engineering College at Cooper's Hill, there is a widespread feeling that the *esprit de corps* which the training at that College fostered and the spirit and qualities that it engendered throughout the service—which under present arrangements must largely disappear—involves the loss of an asset both to the Department and to the State of great value.

The Provincial Service is recruited from the students of the Indian Engineering Colleges, and by the promotion of selected Upper Subordinates. The present rate of recruitment to maintain a strength of 280 is 14 annually, viz., 9 and 10 students and 5 and 4 Upper Subordinates in alternate years. The distribution of the appointments is laid down in the Public Works Department Code, Volume 1, paragraph 149. The system of appointing the qualified students from the Thomason College at Rurki to the lists directly under the Government of India is detailed in paragraph 151 of the same Volume.

The training afforded at the Indian Colleges is directed to the requirements of India and is generally satisfactory. The average Indian College recruit is less highly trained than the average recruit appointed from England; on the other hand his knowledge of the language, people, and methods adopted in India render him more useful for his first year or two. The institution of the Provincial Service does not attract to the Indian Colleges the class of men that formerly went to them. The fact that Engineer officers and subordinates are trained together at the same institution is not very satisfactory, it would be preferable if the training of the two classes could be entirely separated and provided for by separate institutions.

71,268. (II.) **System of Training and Probation.**—*Imperial Service.*—The recruits appointed to the service by the Secretary of State have undergone as a rule at least a year's practical training on works in England. I do not consider any further training or probationary period in India is necessary. The Selection Committee have had ample opportunity of seeing and finding out all about a candidate before they recommend him to the Secretary of State for appointment. If a candidate were liable after spending two years' probationary period in India to be discharged as unsuitable and sent home again, this insecurity of appointment would, in my opinion, operate as a bar to the best men coming forward. I am not aware of any Imperial Service where appointments are made under such conditions.

A further objection to my mind consists in the difficulty of giving practical effect to a probationary period of service having any very real value. The exigencies of the service render it most difficult to secure that a probationer shall serve even for one year under one officer and that period is too short. The number of officers of sufficient standing who would be likely to take any real interest in a probationer, or whose verdict could be relied upon, or who would have the opportunity of keeping him under his eye is very few. As a rule the utmost that would result would be that the probationer would be attached to some Assistant Engineer in charge of a Subdivision and the report would be submitted by the Executive Engineer upon mostly second-hand information. Few Executive Engineers would have any opportunity of usefully employing a probationer immediately under them. Many would not have the time to pay very much attention to them. A probationer sent home after two years as unsuited for

the Indian Service would find it difficult to secure an opening at a critical age in his career. In every Government service there must be some bad bargains and no system of probation which is practicable will obviate this. The present system under which the recruit is usually employed at Headquarters for a time and then attached to a Sub-divisional Officer to pick up the language and ways of the country until he is capable of managing a Sub-divisional charge of his own answers well enough; it is not as a rule in the first two years that a man's worth makes itself apparent amidst surroundings entirely new to him.

Provincial Service.—Passed Engineer students from Rurki College are required to undergo a year's training on works which is at the same time a probationary period as an Apprentice. (The recruit for the Imperial Service has already gone through a period of training before he has been selected.) It is desirable that this period of probation should be retained. Indian students have less facility for applying the theory they have learned to practice than Europeans, and before being appointed as Assistant Engineers, it is desirable that Government should have an opportunity of judging how they are likely to turn out.

71,269. (III.) **Conditions of Service.**—*Imperial and Provincial Services.*—The rule requiring the retirement of an officer from the service on attaining the age of 55 years should be made absolute. The suspension of this rule for a period of 5 years has caused the gravest discontent throughout the entire service. Although the number of officers actually granted extensions of service was relatively small, the number of officers whose prospects and emoluments were seriously effected was large—the result was seriously to reduce the pensions of certain officers below what they had every prospect of receiving had the operation of the rule not been suspended. No officer affected in this way received any compensation. It would be difficult, if not impossible, to calculate the monetary loss sustained by loss in promotion sustained by five officers at least for every extension of service granted, but I think that the officers whose pensions have been affected could be determined and that the loss should be made good to them.

The rule which provides for the compulsory retirement of an officer who on attaining the age of 50 years has not been recommended for advancement to administrative rank should be more rigidly enforced.

Owing to the comparatively small number of higher appointments in the Department I think that the system of selection as opposed to mere seniority should play a greater part in making promotions to the administrative grades. The principle is already laid down in the Public Works Department Code, Volume I, paragraph 80, but is usually only very partially carried out.

71,270. (IV.) **Conditions of Salary.**—*Imperial Service.*—The scale was last revised in 1908 when an incremental system instead of a graded scale was introduced: the benefit of the new scale was, however, discounted by the fact that exchange compensation was at the same time abolished. Even under the improved conditions it is doubtful if the improvement in salaries has been commensurate with the increased cost of living in India. Under the reorganization scheme of 1908 an officer who is qualified to hold charge of a Division cannot draw a salary of more than Rs. 800 per month, viz., that due to him on completion of 10 years' service unless he is actually holding such a charge. I consider that this restriction should be removed as it is through no fault of his own, if through errors in recruiting, or paucity of Divisional charges, that an officer cannot be provided with a suitable charge after 10 years' service.

There are at present two grades of Chief Engineer. Chief Engineers who are Secretaries to local Governments or local Administrations are entitled to a local allowance of Rs. 250, and 150 respectively. The salaries of Chief Engineers are:—Chief Engineer 2nd class Rs. 2,500, Chief Engineer 1st class Rs. 2,750. The anomaly frequently arises that a Chief Engineer in a local Administration receives less emoluments than a Chief Engineer junior to him under a local Government. Owing to the fact that all Chief Engineers do practically the same work, and have the same responsibilities, and that the total number of Chief Engineers in the whole of India is small I consider that the separation of the Chief Engineers into two classes should be abolished. Under present conditions the majority of Chief Engineers are unable to reach the 1st class until immediately before they have to retire and a large number are unable to reach that class at all. To remove these anomalies and objections I consider that there should only be one class of Chief Engineer and all should be paid the same, viz., Rs. 3,000 per-mensem and that the local allowances should be abolished; considering the fact that Chief Engineers are invariably selected men of not usually less than 28 to 30 years' service this salary is not too high. In this connection I may point out that Commissioners of Divisions are not divided into grades; in each Province there are a number ,of Commissioners whereas there are only about 16 Chief Engineers in the Public Works Department all over India.

The present salary of the Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department is Rs. 3,500. I consider that the duties and responsibilities attaching to the appointment warrant it being placed on the same footing as the Secretaryships to the Government of India in the Home, Finance, and Commerce and Industry Departments. A Secretary in the Public Works Department is always an officer of from 6 to 10 years' longer service than any other Secretary. Unlike other Secretaries who are generally drawn from a grade lower than that of a Commissioner of a Division, the Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department is invariably drawn from the highest grade in his own Department. Having regard to the additional cost of living in Simla, the additional emoluments of only Rs. 500 per mensem more than those drawn by a Chief Engineer, 1st class, are insufficient to render the Secretary financially better off than a Chief Engineer of a Province. In all the cases cited the additional emoluments are far greater. For these reasons I think the salary of the appointment might reasonably be raised to Rs. 4,000 as in the case of the appointments referred to.

Provincial Service.—It has been contended that because officers of the Provincial and Imperial Service of the same standing perform approximately the same duties they should be treated similarly in all respects as regards salary. I entirely dissent from that view. The Provincial Service has been created to provide an opening for Indians desirous of entering the Department of Public Works; the salary, conditions of leave, pension, &c., have therefore to be framed to suit the conditions of Indians or others whose domicile is India, and bear no relation to the Imperial Service which provides for an establishment whose domicile is for the most part England. The conditions regarding salary, leave, pension, &c., require to be fixed so in each case as to attract the class of person required, upon entirely independent grounds. The present salaries in the Provincial Service—subject to the removal of the restriction which prevents an officer from rising to more than Rs. 535 per mensem unless in charge of a Division—seem to be suitable enough.

71,271. (V.) **Conditions of Leave.**—*Privilege Leave*—Under existing rules, privilege leave allowances are contingent upon a return to duty—Civil Service Regulations, Article 264. In the case of combined leave the privilege leave allowances are not contingent upon a return to duty; an officer on combined leave at the end of his service can therefore without penalty retire at the end of it. I am of opinion that, in so much as privilege leave is leave already earned, the restriction contained in the Civil Service Regulations referred to above should be relaxed.

Under existing rules an officer can only accumulate 3 months' privilege leave; it occasionally happens that when an officer has accumulated 3 months' privilege leave, the exigencies of the public service render it impossible to grant the leave applied for; in such cases I think that, although the existing limit of 3 months' privilege leave at one time as maximum should be adhered to, the balance of the privilege leave earned should be placed at the credit of the officer concerned, seeing that he was debarred from taking it through no fault of his own.

Study leave.—As a general rule an officer in the Public Works Department desirous of improving his knowledge by visiting works out of India to study the more up-to-date methods of construction or design can only do so during his leave and if recommended by his local Government. Such an officer is required to furnish a report to the Secretary of State and is allowed his actual travelling allowance by rail. This allowance is insufficient to recoup an officer for his incidental expenses in connection with his tour of inspection when on furlough pay. I consider that an officer in such cases should be treated more liberally by being placed *on deputation*.

Furlough.—There is a wide-spread feeling throughout the entire department that the rules regarding furlough pay are so inadequate as to preclude many officers from taking furlough earned; in cases of sickness even, a rest from work or ordinary furlough can only be taken at the expense of running into debt. The present rules provide for furlough being taken on half pay with no minimum (except as provided in Article 320 of the Civil Service Regulations), and with a maximum of £200 per quarter. In the case of officers of the Indian Civil Service and of Military officers subject to the Civil leave rules, the furlough allowances paid at the Home Treasury are subject to a minimum of £500 per annum or last salary drawn, whichever is less. A Civil Engineer of the Imperial Service who takes furlough after completing 8 years' service receives as furlough pay, £279 per annum as a maximum. Even after 18 years' service his furlough pay falls short of that which a Military Officer subject to the Civil leave rules can draw after 8 years' service. It is not in the interests of Government that its servants should be compelled to forego furlough because they cannot afford to take it, or that they should become embarrassed if they are forced to take it. Numbers of instances can be cited of officers in the Public Works Department who have been unable to take furlough on this account. It is presumed that in fixing a minimum of £500 per annum or last salary drawn for furlough allowances, Government had in view the cost to an officer of maintaining himself in England in the state of comfort he was entitled to expect during a period of rest, and if so there wauld appear to be no valid reason why one Imperial Service should be accorded treatment so much less favourable than another. I consider that the furlough rates of pay should be so fixed as to render it possible for an officer to take furlough without financial embarrassment; and this at present junior officers cannot do. The propriety of extending to the Public Works Department the rules regulating furlough allowances in the case of members of the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers in Civil employ is suggested for the consideration of the Commission, both as regards the maximum and minimum.

It has been suggested that the rule which precludes an officer from taking ordinary furlough for a period of 3 years since return from last furlongh exceeding three months' duration, might be modified so as to allow of an officer taking furlough if due to him at any time when his services can be spared. It frequently happens that an officer wishes to take ordinary furlough and can be spared, but is prevented from doing so by the rule quoted (Civil Service Regulations, Article 308).

71,272. **(VI.) Conditions of Pensions.** — *Retiring pensions.*—The inadequacy of the retiring pensions has been a standing grievance in the Department for the last 30 years. The history of the case appears to indicate without any doubt that when the retiring pension was originally fixed at Rs. 5,000 after completion of 25 years' service, it was assumed that this amount should be, as in fact it was, the equivalent of £500. In the earlier prospectuses of the Royal Indian Engineering College the pension was by a footnote so equated. Owing to the great fall in exchange when the rupee fell to little more than a shilling, the rate of exchange for pension was minimised in 1890 to 1*s.* 9*d.* The present ordinary pension converted at 1*s.* 9*d.* per rupee is equivalent to £437 10*s.* 0*d.* It has for years been contended that owing to the increased cost of living this pension fixed more than half a century ago is entirely inadequate to enable an officer to live in England with any approach to the standard of comfort to which he has been accustomed or which his social standing entitles him to expect to be able to provide for himself and his family in his old age. Many memorials in which practically the whole department have participated, have been addressed to the Secretary of State on this subject during the last 6 years, but no reply has been received to them, except to the effect that, as the question will come within the scope of the Commission's enquiry, no action can be taken pending their recommendations. It is therefore to the Royal Commission that the department looks for a full enquiry into this standing grievance. Owing to the fact that for one reason or another neither the Government of India nor the Secretary of State has been able to give any reply to the large number of memorials that have been submitted since 1907-08, it is considered that in equity any amelioration that it may be decided to make should be held to apply to those officers who in the meantime have been compelled to retire.

The rules governing the pensions of Imperial Service Engineers are contained in Civil Service Regulations, Chapter XXX. These rules were introduced to improve the pensions which were formerly governed by Chapter XIX and although the proportion of average emoluments constituting the pension was raised very considerably for service up to 20 years, the effect has been to reduce the actual amount of pension in nearly all cases by reason of the lowering of the maximum amount of the pensions. The fact that the salaries have been raised considerably since these rules were introduced, it is believed in 1884,. renders the maximum pensions that can be claimed still more disproportionate to average emoluments than formerly. Under present rules the maximum ordinary pension is only sixteen-sixtieths of average emoluments after a service of 22 years, and about ten-sixtieths of average emoluments after a service of 30 years. In other services the maximum pension much more closely approaches the half of average emoluments.

It is considered that the maximum pensions ordinarily obtainable by Imperial Service Engineers should not be less than that of officers of the Indian Army, Indian Medical Service, and Military officers in Civil employ, *viz.*, £700 after 30 years' service, and that the following scale of pensions might reasonably be conceded, *viz.*, (*a*) after 25 years' service £500 if paid in England or Rs. 5,000 if paid in India; and (*b*) after 30 years' service £700 if paid in England or Rs. 7,000 if paid in India.

Special pensions:—

(*a*) After 3 years' approved service as a Superintending Engineer £100 if paid in England or Rs. 1,000 if paid in India.

(*b*) After 3 years' approved service as a Chief Engineer £100 if paid in England, or Rs. 1,000 if paid in India; that a proportionate amount of (*a*) and (*b*) be granted for service of less than 3 years. The number of administrative appointments in the Public Works Department is small and it seems equitable that if an officer through no fault of his own should be unable to serve for the full period of 3 years as a Superintending Engineer or a Chief Engineer he should be entitled to a proportionate share of the additional pension according to the service rendered.

Invalid pensions.—In 1884 a new scale of Invalid Pensions was introduced under which officers of the Imperial Service of the Public Works Department, although entitled to a much higher percentage of average emoluments as an invalid pension, actually received less by reason of the maximum permissible being reduced. For example, an officer under the old rules (Article 474, C.S.R.) after 12 years' service was entitled to twelve-sixtieths of average emoluments which has been calculated to be Rs. 1,920 subject to a maximum of Rs. 2,400. Under the new rule (Article 641, C.S.R.) the same officer is entitled to twenty-two-sixtieths calculated to be Rs. 3,520 subject to a maximum of Rs. 1,800. Similarly an officer after 19 years' service under the old rules was entitled to nineteen-sixtieths with a maximum limit of Rs. 3,800. Under the new rules the same officer although entitled to twenty-nine-sixtieths is limited to a maximum of Rs. 3,000 only.

As the increase in the percentages introduced by the rules of 1884, Article 641, C.S.R., can have no other meaning but that the new rules were intended to improve the conditions, it is considered that the maximum limits should be increased to what they were before and which still govern all other services coming under the operation of Article 474.

71,273. (VII.) **Such Limitations as may exist in the Employment of Non-Europeans and the Working of the Existing Division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—In paragraph 71266 (2) it has already been shown that the present strength of the Provincial Engineer Establishment, which is in the process of being worked up to, is based upon 133 superior posts out of a total number in the Public Works Department including Railways of 440—or a ratio of seven-tenths Imperial and three-tenths Provincial. I am of opinion that, although there are doubtless many exceptions, as a rule Indian Engineers are more wanting in originality, less capable of applying book knowledge to practice, less reliable where forethought has to be exercised, have less initiative and are less suited for the positions of responsibility calling for prompt action than Europeans: in the control of Subordinate Establishments they are generally weaker and are apt to be swayed by considerations of caste and creed. The Indian Engineer usually does better under European direction than when left to himself, especially where confronted with difficulties. As a general rule he is far better at construction than design, but in construction he is apt to leave the dealing with difficulties too much to subordinates and contractors. Further, unless fully instructed in every detail, his want of attention to minor details and want of taste results in a lower standard of finish. On the other hand his knowledge of the country, the people and the language, often render him less dependable than the European upon his subordinates in making arrangements for carrying out work. In many cases he can carry out work under conditions that would be very difficult for a European. I am doubtful if it would be wise to increase the relative proportions of Provincial Service Engineers to Imperial for some time to come or to increase the existing limit of 10 per cent. in the case of Indians appointed to the Imperial Service by the Secretary of State. The increase should come in time but the process must be gradual and dependent upon the exhibition of those qualities in which, as compared with the European, the Indian Engineer as a rule is at present lacking.

71,274. (VIII.) **Relations with other Services.**—I have no remarks to enter under this head: the relations of the Public Works Department with other Services are satisfactory on the whole.

Mr. R. P. Russell called and examined.

71,275. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he had occupied his present position as Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department for about eight months.

71,276. With reference to the question of recruitment from Royal Engineer Officers, the witness explained that the Department had to employ a number of these officers as a war reserve, but he advocated the employment of Royal Engineers both on Railways and Public Works, provided that they were in an equality with the Imperial Service Officers and started at the bottom of the list. If a Royal Engineer of fourteen years' service was suddenly transferred to the Public Works Department he interfered with promotion and this caused a good deal of natural discontent. Royal Engineers were posted to a Province and there was no rule by which certain of them were employed on Irrigation and others on buildings and roads. Generally they preferred buildings and roads, and if it could be so arranged they were given employment in that branch. Their number was limited to 70, of whom 40 went to Railways and 30 to Public Works.

71,277. With reference to recruitment in England, the witness considered that social status was requisite in the Public Works Officer but not more so than in any other officer. If a system of open competition was introduced followed by a course of training in a College on the Cooper's Hill model, he thought it would tend to rub off the angles and to raise the men of humbler social status to an equality with the others. Competition combined with nomination would be the best system if it could be worked; and although he did not think it would be easy he thought it could be worked. He valued an English training very highly indeed, as the training an Engineer received in England and the opportunities afforded to him for seeing works were considerably more valuable than they were in India. This applied more to Railway work than to Irrigation, as Irrigation was not practised in England and the practical part of the work had to be learnt in India. The training, however, which a man required in order to deal with hydraulic problems was of a higher order as a rule than the training for other branches of Engineering, and even in the case of an Irrigation Officer English Engineering practice stood a man in better stead. The foundation teaching was better in England than could be obtained in Indian colleges.

71,278. The witness was against the Indian Engineer going to England and being appointed by the Secretary of State to the Imperial Service. He should be encouraged to go to England to get a better training, but in the Imperial Service as now constituted salary and leave and furlough rules were based on the assumption that the service would be manned by Engineers whose domicile was England, and he did not see why a man who was domiciled in India should come in under the same conditions. He advocated something in the nature of a foreign service allowance for the European Officer, as it was necessary, in order to attract a European, to offer considerably higher terms than were offered to Indians, whose cost of living was not comparable with that of Europeans.

71,279. He would like to see Indian Officers recruited and trained in India, and if that were done and the Europeans recruited in England had a standard of salary higher than that of the indigenous community he thought the Service would be contented and satisfied, but not as it at present existed. He did not think the argument of the Provincial Service that they were not paid the same as the Imperial Service was an argument that should be listened to; it was a natural claim and it was foreseen from the outset that the time would come when men would ask for equal pay for doing the same duties. He was prepared to lay down the principle that a European, in consideration of an English domicile and loss of amenities, must be paid at a higher rate than the domiciled officer.

71,280. The witness said he had asked many Indians whether their grievance was non-equality of pay and he had met no Indian yet who admitted that that was the grievance. The average Indian appeared to recognise that it was reasonable to pay a European Officer recruited in England a different rate of salary from the Indian living in his own country.

71,281. The witness was of opinion that the Engineering Courses at the Colleges in India were satisfactory, but he did not like the system under which Provincial Officers and Subordinates were trained in the same college. Candidates for the superior Service should be sent to Rurki and those for the subordinate Service to the other Colleges. The concentration in one College of all the Provincial Service classes would probably result in the best training available. He added, however, that the prospects in the Public Works Department did not attract the higher classes of Indians to the same extent as they were attracted to the Provincial Civil Service.

71,282. In the period of ten years from 1903 to 1913 the recruitment figures were as follows: From Cooper's Hill 98, including 3 Indians (none since 1907); by Nomination of Secretary of State 257, including 5 Indians; Royal Engineers 35; Temporary Engineers 15 (none since 1909); Covenanted Engineers 32 (none since 1911).

71,283. With regard to the present proportion of vacancies reserved for promoted officers from the

subordinate Service, the witness said that personally he considered too many Upper Subordinates were now promoted into the Provincial Service, and he would rather see an increase in the number of officers trained in Rurki for the Provincial Service and a reduction in the number of promoted subordinates. It was desirable to reward the particularly good and able subordinate, but it was only the exceptional upper subordinate who made a good officer.

71,284. As to maintaining the distinction between the Imperial and Provincial Branches, the witness said that in practice there were no Imperial and Provincial Divisions. Provincial Engineers were eligible for so many Divisions, but a Division which was of no importance to-day might be a very important one three years hence. There was no earmarking of Divisions for Provincial and Imperial officers they were all on one list, doing the same work. He would prefer to retain the existing titles Imperial and Provincial, although the responsibilities and prospects were the same in both branches. The general character of the Department would be lowered if the promoted Upper Subordinate was called a Civil Engineer with the same status as an Imperial Engineer. The main ground for retaining the Provincial Service was that an Upper Subordinate was from time to time promoted into it, and therefore the service should not rank with the Imeperial.

71,285. With reference to the statement that had been made to the commission that the proportion of Indian trained Engineers, who had risen to Executive rank was larger than the proportion of trained English Engineers, the witness said possibly that was so, but the statement applied to the Imperial Rurki trained men who had entered the department before the creation of the Provincial Service, and it would not apply to the Provincial Service officers. The men who were attracted to Rurki when recruitment was direct to the Imperial Service were better than the men who now entered the Provincial Service. He admitted that this was hardly an argument in favour of retaining the Provincial title.*

71,286. The witness suggested an increase of cadre to the extent of 10 per cent. to meet the requirements of construction, the 10 per cent. being over and above the figures given in his written statement. The present cadre made no allowance, except in a very indirect way, for the officers who were required for the constructional programme. The recent proposals for increasing the cadre had been put forward mainly with the object of obtaining the Secretary of State's sanction to a new method of calculating the cadre, and the increase asked for was almost entirely due to the readjustment of Provinces, the splitting up of Bihar and Orissa and Bengal; the net increase was very small. The Government of India had already agreed to an increase of 5%, and they were merely awaiting the sanction of the Secretary of State.

71,287. The main reason for employing Temporary Engineers was the difficulty of finding a sufficient number of upper subordinates qualified for permanent posts; there was an actual deficiency of permanent men. He realized the great difficulty of employing Temporary Engineers on a *quasi*-permanent basis. He was inclined to think it would be better if upper subordinates could be obtained of the class required for sub-divisional charges. As to how such a class could be obtained, the witness said the only system he could suggest was nomination. The subordinate Civil Service was recruited mainly by nomination of men of good family, and the Public Works Department would require to have something of the same kind. For the higher sub-divisional work a certain education was necessary. He suggested the officers selected for this higher work should be sent to Rurki with the prospect of getting sub-divisional charges if they qualified. It should not be left to competition. If the method he suggested was carried out, Temporary Engineers could be restricted to temporary jobs. Even with an addition of 10 per cent. for construction purposes there would always be a margin because the additional 10 per cent. or 90 officers would not suffice to carry out all the construction programme. The number of administrative posts would have to be increased in order to provide for the increased numbers of Assistant Engineers. When construction works were undertaken there would be usually an increase in administrative appointments even if only on a temporary basis. It would be necessary, of course, to guard against a block, but he did not think there would be any real danger of a block.

71,288. The witness said he should like to remove the charge bar at Rs. 800 in all cases where an officer had qualified for appointment to the executive grades. He thought it would militate against recruitment to have two incremental scales, one for Assistants and one for Executive Engineers, with promotion from one to the other by selection. Under existing rules a man did not necessarily obtain a division after he had completed his career as an Assistant Engineer; he had to be qualified. That power of excluding the unfit was a form of selection; but a man had to be very bad before he was prevented from rising to executive rank. It would be reasonable, the witness considered, to pay a Temporary Engineer more than an officer of corresponding rank in the Provincial or Imperial service in consideration of the fact that he was employed on a non-pensionable basis.

71,289. The reserves for leave and training were adequate. Many officers often failed to take the long leave to which they were entitled because they could not offord to take it on the authorised rate of leave allowance. The present dissatisfaction in regard to leave allowances might be met to some extent by allowing officers to commute a certain proportion of their furlough into full pay leave, but a concession of this character would hardly be in accordance with the spirit of the furlough rules, and he would not like to commit himself to a definite opinion off-hand.

71,290. As to retirement after twenty or twenty-five years' service, the witness said there had been very few retirements after twenty years' service, but no difficulty was put in the way of anyone who desired to go. If better terms were offered in the way of pension he would favour the abolition of optional retirements after twenty years' service. In his judgment twenty years was rather too short a term of service to qualify an officer for retirement.

71,291. As to the complaint that officers were freely given extensions beyond fifty-five years of age, the witness said there had been a demand on the part of officers to remain in the service after that age but it had been definitely decided that no extensions were to be given. For five years the rule as to retirement at 55 had been in abeyance with the result that a limited number of men were benefited at the expense of a very large number.

71,292. The witness was in favour of the establishment of a Family Pension Fund for the Public Works Department and he thought there was a general desire for it. It should be in lieu of the Provident Fund, as he did not think the average man could afford to join both. The average proportion of salary contributed to the General Provident Fund by officers might be taken as 10 per cent., but it was possible to subscribe 12½ per cent. He was in favour of permitting Temporary Engineers to subscribe to the Provident Fund and he was under the impression that they were allowed to do so now.

71,293. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness said his experience of other parts of India was not sufficient to enable him to decide whether there were objections to making Rurki an All-India College for the Provincial Service. The men who now came into the Provincial Service from Rurki were not so good as the men who formerly entered the Imperial Service, and he thought that was due chiefly to the fact that the openings in the Public Works Department were not as good as they now were in other services. It was the European chiefly who went to Rurki in former days when officers from Rurki were appointed to the Imperial Service, but even then there were some Indians and a considerable number of Anglo-Indians. Europeans did not go to Rurki now. The demand for entrance into the Public Works Department might be gauged by the demand for entrance to Rurki. He was not prepared to say there was

* A note on this point was afterwards put in by the witness and has been printed as Appendix I.

not a keen demand on the part of Indians to gain admission to Rurki; and he did not say that the standard of Indians had fallen off; in his opinion as good Indians got into the service now as formerly. What he did contend was that Anglo-Indian and domiciled European candidates were not so good now as they used to be; and the reason for this was that they were not contented with the Provincial Service. Assuming that the Provincial Service was intended to provide a career for Indians, he did not think it necessary to improve the conditions of the service so as to attract Anglo-Indians of the class which formerly entered the Imperial Service. The Anglo-Indian and domiciled European who wished for something better than the Provincial Service could go to England. He suggested that young Indian graduates from Rurki might be nominated for the upper subordinate service of the Public Works Department as that would give the Service more upper subordinates of the kind required. His proposal was to improve the pay of the upper subordinate Service in order to attract a better class of Indians, but he thought that in any case there should be some form of nomination. He thought it would be possible appreciably to improve the pay of the upper subordinate Service without raising the pay of the Provincial Service. Although the starting pay of the Provincial Service would be less, officers in that Service could rise to the rank of Chief Engineer, whilst the upper subordinate officer would not rise beyond the rank of a sub-divisional officer.

71,294. It was difficult to get temporary Engineers under existing conditions of pay, but if the temporary Engineer establishment was improved or placed on a more permanent footing he was not sure that enough temporary Engineers would not be obtained in India. A large number of Indians were employed as temporary Engineers, about 170 in all, and Local Governments found an increasing difficulty in getting temporary Engineers of as good quality as used formerly to be obtainable.

71,295. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The witness was of opinion that the prospects now held out to men passing out of Rurki had discouraged Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans, and this would have been regrettable if the College had been established for Anglo-Indians or domiciled Europeans; but he understood that Rurki was established to provide for Indians only. In the early days, when officers in India could obtain for their sons a very much cheaper education at Rurki than in England, with good prospects of an appointment in the Imperial Service, young men were sent there, but they were not attracted by the Provincial Service. He throught the average Indian now obtained from Rurki was as good as he used to be.

71,296. The witness said the theoretical training in irrigation in England was better than could be obtained in India, but practical work was best carried out in India. All matters connected with hydraulics demanded a higher training than other branches of engineering. He thought the training in India on irrigation works was even better than could be obtained in Egypt or America, or at least as good, with the exception perhaps of one or two important works in those countries. It would be a good thing, he thought, for a man to visit works in other countries but he was not keen on giving the men a year's practical training on such works. He was in favour of giving engineering officers facilities later in their career to visit foreign countries on deputation.

71,297. (*Mr. Rahim.*) The witness said he was satisfied with the class of Indians now going to Rurki and had no suggestions to make for securing a better class. By class he meant social standing, not necessarily caste, though no doubt social status depended to some extent on caste. Not every Rurki officer proved successful, but the Rurki men were satisfactory on the average. Any improvement that could be made in the social status, whether of Europeans or Indians, would be of benefit to any Service. He did not complain of the average Indian trained engineer; his intellectual capacity was very good. Even if there was a keener desire on the part of Indians to qualify as Engineers in the Public Works Service he did not think the proportion should be increased, because it was necessary to retain for a considerable time a large proportion of the administrative and higher appointments in the hands of Europeans, both on administrative and on technical grounds. In his opinion Europeans were more efficient administrators. Some Indian Engineers had an exceedingly good technical knowledge but were less able than the Europeans to put it into practice. He could not say how many Indians had risen to administrative rank, as the Provincial Service had not been long enough established and Provincial Service Engineers would only be just reaching the stage of promotion to the rank of Superintending Engineer. Many of the old Rurki Engineers, Indians, Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans, had risen to administrative rank. If it were not feasible to have a Central College in India, it would be a good thing to co-ordinate the work of the various Colleges.

71,298. (*Mr. Madge.*) There had always been Anglo-Indians and members of the domiciled community at Rurki, but he understood that the primary reason for establishing Rurki was to provide for Indians in India, just as Cooper's Hill was established to supply Europeans in England. Domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians wishing to rise beyond the level of the Provincial Service could go to England for their training, though he admitted there might be men who had not the means to do so. To assist such people to get into the Imperial Service he did not see why a system of scholarships should not be established for statutory Natives of India.

71,299. With regard to temporary Engineers, the witness said the temporary Engineering establishment was organised on a quasi-permanent basis and was intended to eke out the deficiencies of the permanent establishment. The cadre was based on the number of superior appointments, and as the cadre was now constituted, the numbers of Executive and Assistant Engineers were almost equal. But every divisional appointment carried on an average from 2½ to 3 sub-divisions and consequently there was not a sufficient number of Assistant Engineers to man more than one out of every three. The upper subordinate establishment was intended to man the remaining sub-divisions, but in practice it was found impossible to get a sufficient number of qualified upper subordinates, and temporary Engineers were therefore employed in many of these permanent posts. As the cadre was now calculated it was intended that Assistant Engineers should reach Executive rank after ten years' service. If there were sufficient Assistant Engineers to hold all the sub-divisions, many of them would take much longer than ten years to get a divisional charge. Even as it was, there was a block in promotion. On the other hand an increase of divisional charges would allow of an increase being made in the number of Assistants, and this would tend to reduce the number of sub-divisional charges held by temporary Engineers. The forty-two extra appointments that had been sanctioned would go a very little way to meet the difficulty and a still further increase would be required.

71,300. With regard to training, there was no reason why the training in India should not be raised to the highest possible standard, and he advocated that it should be so raised in the interests of the country. He thought Rurki did provide a sufficiently good training now, but England provided a better.

71,301. One Central Institution to cater for the Department would no doubt be a good thing, but he believed the divisions in India necessitated having more than one Central College. The Provincial Government of Madras might prefer to retain its own Institution. At present the Government of India made no appointments in Madras.

71,302. The witness considered that Anglo-Indians were fairly good at their work and generally discharged their duties with satisfaction.

71,303. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness said that in advocating an increase of the cadre he had not considered the possibility of substantially diminishing the work now being done, building work for instance, in Provincial towns, and of handing this work over to ordinary private agencies. He did not think the number of Engineers in India in private practice was very considerable. No doubt the fact that the work was done by the Public Works Depart-

ment tended to diminish the number of Engineers in private practice.

71,304. As a rule the Department framed an estimate of the cost of a work and called for tenders. Work was occasionally carried out by departmental labour, but, as a general rule, tenders were called for all work of magnitude. If a hospital had to be built in England the medical authorities would lay down their requirements and the Public Works Department would have nothing to do with the matter. In India the Public Works Department would be responsible for designing the hospital and for supervising the carrying out of the work. As Government money was spent on the hospital it was necessary to have a Government Officer in the position of Clerk of Works. The supervision of building work formed but a small fraction of an officer's duties; he had besides to construct and maintain roads, bridges, etc. There might be cases in which the building under construction was large enough to employ the whole time of Public Works Department officials and he admitted that in a case of that kind there might be a saving if the work was entrusted entirely to private agency. He doubted very much whether the appointment of temporary Engineers as Clerks of Works for twelve or six months would materially reduce the staff of the Department. In some cases this was just what happened now. For instance, if the construction of a large canal was sanctioned, thirty or forty Engineers would be employed on it, and when the work was over they would be discharged. The difficulty of late years had been to get temporary Engineers. The witness said his proposal for an increased cadre was put forward with the idea of getting a larger percentage of the men employed in permanent posts. He did not think it would be possible to carry out large works in accordance with the system adopted in England. The employment of a temporary Clerk of Works on a building might reduce the establishment by a few men but it would be a very small saving.

71,305. With regard to conditions of salary, the witness said he assumed that a man recruited to the Department had a right under his terms of recruitment to obtain a divisional charge in his eleventh year. That was part of the obligation which the State was under and the cadre was based on that. It was probably not a legal contract with the individual, but it was a moral contract. If a man did not get the charge he ought to get the pay of the charge. When the pay of the various grades was fixed every care was taken to recruit the establishment in such a way as to ensure a normal flow of promotion. Possibly a man has no grievance at law if he were not promoted. In the old days an Engineer did not rise to a divisional charge until after fifteen years' service, and that caused a good deal of discontent. He himself was blocked for nine years. It was true the Secretary of State had laid down specifically that unless a man had charge of a district he was not to rise above R800 a month, and everybody now knew the conditions.

71,306. With regard to privilege leave, the witness said it was the desire of the Service that leave should be allowed to accumulate beyond three months. At present a man accumulating three months' privilege leave did so at his own risk, Government only guaranteeing one month per annum which might or might not be accumulated for three months. An extension beyond the three months to four or six was possibly not in accordance with the fundamental intention of privilege leave, which was meant to provide a short rest once a year. The general idea of the Service was that if a man earned four months' privilege leave there should be no arbitrary restriction against his taking it. It was within his power to take a month each year, but if an officer chose to have no leave for five years and to take five months in the sixth year he did not see why he should be prevented.

71,307. (*Mr. Fisher.*) With reference to the paragraph in the written statement that "construction may involve the creation of twelve or more superior posts, which as long as construction is in hand are deemed temporary appointments and as such are excluded from the superior posts on which the cadre is calculated," the witness said that what he had in mind was a scheme such as the Triple Canal project which required a certain number of officers for its upkeep after it had been constructed. Work of that sort might require fifty or sixty officers during the construction period and when the work was completed it would provide for a considerable number of permanent charges.

71,308. With regard to the advantage of Engineering training in India and in England, the witness pointed out that the training of an Engineer was both theoretical and practical, and the theoretical work could be better done in an English University than at Rurki. He based that opinion simply on observation. The newly recruited Indian College Engineer when asked to do a simple calculation, such as calculating the size of a beam to carry a certain weight or making an elementary stress design, frequently did not know how to set about it, but the average man from England had learned how to do calculations of this kind though he had not had occasion to apply his knowledge. For the first two or three years the Rurki Engineer was a better man owing to the fact that he had received practical training in work more closely akin to the work he would have to do afterwards; he knew the conditions of the country and the language how bricks were made in India, and various other things which the man appointed from home did not know. As a matter of fact, the man appointed from home probably had to unlearn a great deal. Many branches of Indian Engineering work such as Irrigation could not be practised at home. In many respects practical work in India was carried out differently from the way in which it was done in England, and the Rurki man was acquainted with the methods of Indian Engineering practice. If the same educational facilities could be obtained in India as now existed in England, it would be more useful to have an Engineer College for Englishmen in India.

71,309. (*Mr. Sly.*) The present idea was to select men in England not only on technical qualifications but with regard to social status, and he himself attached considerable importance to a man being of the right social status. It might be feasible to have open competition in technical engineering subjects as between the students of different Engineering Colleges in England, and he thought the position a student took in the Honours School of an Engineering College in England depended solely on the results of the final examination and not on the record of the student during his Course. He did not see that there would be any difficulty in marking students who had specialised in different branches of engineering, and he saw no practical difficulties in the way of holding an open competition in Engineering subjects.

71,310. The witness said he saw no reason why an Engineer should be forced to go at the age of 55 as long as the rule was made applicable to future entrants and was applied to other Services.

71,311. With regard to pay, there had been a very substantial improvement in the pay of Chief Engineers in 1905. The pay formerly authorized was Rs. 2,500 for first class Chief Engineers, Rs. 2,000 for the second class, and Rs. 1,800 for the third class. The latter class was abolished and the pay of the other two increased by Rs. 500, but he did not consider that sufficient. He thought it would be better to have only one class of Chief Engineer because they all did the same work. The Secretaryship to the Government of India was raised from Rs. 3,000 to Rs. 3,500 in 1905, and he recommended it should be now raised to Rs. 4,000 on the ground of the importance of the work.

71,312. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness's statement that the Provincial Service had not attracted to the Indian Colleges the same class of men as formerly went to them applied only to Rurki as he had no personal knowledge of other Colleges. If, instead of creating the Provincial Service, the Government, in 1895, had passed orders to the effect that recruitment in India was to be increased and recruitment in England diminished, he thought the Service would have suffered in time, in spite of the fact that the proportion of Indian recruited men who rose to high administrative charges was greater than the proportion of men

recruited in England. Without testing it witness could not accept this statement as a fact. The fact that for a certain period a number of Rurki trained Engineers rose to administrative ranks did not necessarily indicate that the Public Works Department could do without a leavening of European Officers. The appointments to the administrative grades were really made by seniority unless a man was absolutely useless. The number of men who were declared to be unfitted for promotion to Superintendent Engineers was not great. In witness's opinion the average man appointed by the Secretary of State was a more capable administrator, but he did not think he could establish that view by tracing the official careers of individual officers. In his judgment no political considerations were involved in making appointments to the Department, and therefore the men who had the best education in Engineering should be employed whether they were found in England or in India.

71,313. With regard to the training at Rurki and other Colleges, the witness said the training at Rurki was good but he did not know anything about the other three Colleges; he had always understood they were not so well equipped as Rurki. He believed the Government was doing all that it was possible to do to raise the Indian Colleges to the highest state of efficiency. He did not hold the view that a larger proportion of men should be recruited in England for the higher offices simply because the Public Works offered a good career for young Englishmen. He put it forward in the interests of Engineering work in India. He had no doubt, if a private meeting of the Commission was held, he would be able to substantiate his remarks as to relative efficiency by tracing the careers of individuals, or at least be able to specify a number of men who were relatively inefficient and among whom there would be a greater proportion of Indians than Europeans.

71,314. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness said he would have no objection to an experiment in competitive examination among students of all the Engineering institutions of Great Britain. No instances of defects in the present system of selection had ever come to his knowledge. Under the system in force at Rurki it was possible for a man who had come out first at the end of the three years' course to be superseded by a man who had come only tenth on the examination list at the end of the first year's apprenticeship. Ultimate selection depended on the reports received from different officers. Men who were number 1 and number 9 on the examination list might be sent to Burma and Burma would select between the two and No. 9 might be selected in preference to No. 1. The report received about No. 1 from Burma might be much better than the report received with regard to Nos. 3 and 5 who had gone to the United Provinces, and yet No. 1 might be rejected. Rejected apprentices might get appointments as Temporary Engineers. For some years the number of students at Cooper's Hill had exactly corresponded to the number of appointments to be filled in India four years later.

71,315. On the subject of training, he thought the Indian trained at Rurki was less able to apply his theory to practice, and it was therefore desirable that he should be given an opportunity of practical work to show how he was likely to turn out.

71,316. With reference to the proposed increase of salary for Chief Engineers, the witness said that his suggestion was put forward partly on the ground that all Chief Engineers should receive the same pay and partly in order to avoid the anomaly of a senior officer in one Province drawing less emoluments than a junior officer in another Province. He was not prepared to apply the same principle to the grades of Executive and Assistant Engineers, if it meant paying an Indian Assistant Engineer the same emoluments as a European Assistant Engineer. He would not advocate that even in the case of Chief Engineers. He did not see how it was possible to avoid a higher paid officer working occasionally under a lower paid officer.

71,317. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The witness said that before becoming Secretary to the Government of India he was Chief Engineer in Burma. As an Executive Officer he served twenty-five years on the Punjab Irrigation and in Burma he was employed on buildings and roads.

71,318. With reference to the question of recruiting Indians with an English training, the witness said they would have to be appointed to the Provincial Service by the Secretary of State. He thought that the discontent and heart-burning in the Service were somewhat less aggravated than might be gathered from the written statements that had been submitted to the Commission. He could quite understand the arguments for putting everybody on an equality, and probably there was some legitimate cause of discontent, but he did not think it was acute. His own view was that the question of salary was not the chief cause of discontent, at least, among Indians.

71,319. Asked whether it would be possible so to organise the Service so as to ensure that Officers were graded according to the class of work they had to perform, the witness said that in practice they endeavoured to do that now. The Provincial Executive Engineer was given what was considered to be a suitable charge, usually a division where the work did not require high technical skill, but at any time the division might become an important one, so that it was impossible to earmark charge. It would be difficult to keep a Provincial man always in charges that were ranked as Provincial for the time being. When a Provincial man reached divisional rank it was usually arranged that he should be given a suitable charge. It was possible that a classification better than the present one would be an Imperial Service with a Provincial Service with a position corresponding to that of the Provincial Civil Service, and in that case Indians would be recruited into the Imperial Service in England.

(The witness withdrew.)

H. J. Hope, Esq., Executive Engineer, United Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department, being a Memorandum by the United Provinces Local Secretary to the Civil Engineers' Association, representing the views of the Imperial Service Engineers of the Public Works Department of the United Provinces.

71,320. (I.) **Method of Recruitment.**—(1) The present system of recruitment by selection is generally considered satisfactory, but should be limited to candidates who have resided for at least seven years in Europe. There is a disadvantage in recruiting Indians in England, as it is not always the most suitable candidates who are willing and can afford to go to England. Moreover it tends to lower the standing of Indian Engineering Colleges, and causes discontent among his confrères for a fellow to be ever afterwards classed as an imported Engineer merely on the strength of a short education in Europe. It is too late in life for a youth of eighteen to acquire the British spirit from three years' residence in England, and European engineering methods could be better studied later on under the Study Leave Rules.

(2) One year's practical experience on works in Europe, and some knowledge of accounts should be insisted on.

(3) Every candidate should have been at a recognized Engineering College for at least three years, where he would have rubbed shoulders with other fellows of his own standing, and, at the end of his course of study, have obtained a diploma or other degree which is accepted by the Institute of Civil Engineers as qualifying for their associate membership. The A.M.I.C.E. Examination in itself is not considered a sufficient qualification.

(4) The selection Committee should consist of:—

(1) A retired Lieutenant-Governor or Chief Commissioner as president.

(2) An eminent Engineer with considerable experience in England, preferably a past President of the Institute of Civil Engineers.

(3) An eminent Principal or Professor of an Engineering College of high standing in England.

(4) A recently retired Engineer of the Indian Public Works Department.

(5) An Indian Public Works Department Engineer actually in service, selected from the men who are at home on leave each year.

(5) The most suitable age for recruits to come out to India is between 22 and 24 years.

(6) There is great resentment in the Department at the appointment of Royal Engineers and Temporary Engineers to the permanent scale above the heads of men already in the Department. They should come on to the permanent scale only at the bottom of the list. The Royal Engineer anxious to enter the Public Works Department should make up his mind early in his career, and enter with his contemporaries. This rule should admit of no exception.

(7) For recruitment in India, the Colleges for Engineers should be separate from those for subordinates. It is not desirable that members of the superior service should live on intimate and familiar terms with subordinates, yet this undoubtedly happens, and it is encouraged by the two classes being educated together at the same College. Entrance to the Colleges should be by selection, combined with a qualifying examination.

(8) The present system of deputing two Indian College students for one appointment, *vide* P.W.D. Code, Vol. I., para. 151, and placing them for practical training under different officers is objectionable and dangerous. The qualified candidates should be appointed as Probationary Assistant Engineers and allowed to qualify by practical training for confirmation. The age for confirmation should be the same as for Engineers appointed from England.

71,321. (II.) **System of Training and Probation.**—It is felt that the present system of Departmental examinations is sufficient, and that Engineers appointed in England attain to an adequate proficiency in the Indian languages. The Examination in reading Native accounts might well be dispensed with, as the figures can be learned in a short lesson, and are afterwards soon forgotten.

71,322. (III.) **Conditions of Service.**—(1) It is desirable that the Engineers of the Department be constituted into a service under some such name as the "Indian Service of Engineers" (I.S.E.). The term Public Works Department is used by both subordinates and clerks, and consequently cannot be held to distinguish an Engineer Officer. This would only be following the lead set by other Departments, such as the Educational, Medical and Forest Services. It is felt that the table of precedence should be revised, so as to give Engineer Officers an official status more in keeping with their importance to the prosperity of India.

(2) All Officers should be compelled to retire on attaining the age of 55 years, without exception. The relaxation of this rule in recent cases has led to a large amount of discontent.

(3) The rule which lays down that a Chief Engineer should not be allowed to hold the same post for more than five years should allow of no exceptions.

(4) It is desirable that Government should weed out members of the Department, who are reported on as unsuitable or inefficient. A man, who has been reported on unfavourably for two consecutive years, should be warned that if he does not prove himself efficient, his services will be dispensed with. If, after another two years, he is still found unsuitable, then he should be compulsorily retired under the ordinary gratuity or pension rule allowed for men who are compulsorily retired as invalids. Of these four unfavourable annual reports, at least three should be by different Superintending Engineers.

(5) The employment of Temporary Engineers should be reduced to a minimum, as in many cases they hold Divisional charges, in which qualified Assistant Engineers would otherwise be officiating. Moreover, it creates a discontended class of men, who have a very real grievance, in that whilst doing the same work as permanent Engineers, they draw no extra pay, and have very precarious prospects.

(6) In order to ensure a regular flow of promotion, recruitment should be regulated so as always to make up the number of Assistant Engineers of less than eleven years' service, as nearly as possible to the number required to give a proportion of five Assistant Engineers to each four Divisional charges in the Province. This proportion should be the same for both Engineers appointed in England and in India. The remaining sub-divisional charges should be held by Sub-Engineers and experienced and senior Upper Subordinates.

(7) An Officer transferred from one station to another should be reimbursed the whole of his actual expenses incurred in transporting himself and his family, servants and belongings. Under the present rules, men with families are often severely crippled by the heavy expenses of a transfer.

71,323. (IV.) **Conditions of Salary.**—(1) The system of annual increments in salary meets with general approval.

(2) The present scale of annual increments in salary as far as it goes is generally considered sufficient for an Officer's immediate needs, but it does not permit of an officer saving as much to eke out his totally inadequate pension, as he had every reason to expect from the conditions existing when he joined the Department.

(3) The rule introduced in the Government of India's resolution of the 15th May 1912 by which an officer cannot draw more than Rs. 800 a month under the system of annual increments till he is appointed to a Divisional charge, will bear very hardly on some officers, and should certainly be rescinded in the case of those officers who are reported on as fit for a Divisional charge. It is not right that the annual increments of an efficient officer, who is reported on as fully qualified for a Divisional charge, should be stopped, not on account of any fault of his own, but solely due to erratic recruitment. Similarly, an Indian Engineer, who is reported on as fully qualified for a Divisional charge, should be allowed to draw increased salaries beyond Rs. 535 a month, according to the scale of annual increments, without consideration of whether he is actually in charge of a Division or not. Similarly, many Executive Engineers, reported on as fully qualified for administrative rank, will be unduly held back at Rs. 1,250 a month, merely because of errors in recruitment. There is a strong feeling that Executive Engineers, who are certified as fit for Administrative posts, should have their pay increased beyond Rs. 1,250 a month by annual increments of Rs. 50 a month up to a maximum of Rs. 1,500, which they would thus attain after a minimum of twenty-four years' approved service. Similarly, Indian Executive Engineers, who are certified as fit for Administrative rank, should have their pay increased beyond Rs. 850 a month by annual increments of Rs. 35 a month up to a maximum of Rs. 1,025, which they would thus attain after a minimum of twenty-four years' approved service.

(4) Promotion to Chief Engineer, 1st Class, becomes so badly blocked at present, that many specially deserving officers never obtain a chance of promotion to the higher rate of pay. It is felt there should be only two classes of Superintending Engineers, and one class of Chief Engineer, as for Commissioners of a Division in the Indian Civil Service. The rates of pay of Administrative ranks should be:—

	Engineers appointed in England. Rs.	Indian Engineers. Rs.
Superintending Engineer, 2nd Class	1,750	1,500
Superintending Engineer, 1st Class	2,000	2,000
Chief Engineer	2,750	2,750

And a Secretary to a Local Government or Administration should get a local allowance of Rs. 250 in addition, as at present. The number of Superintending Engineers in the 1st Class should be the same as in the 2nd Class. The extension of the system of annual increments to the Administrative ranks would be a mistake.

71,324. (V.) **Conditions of Leave.**—(1) The amount of leave allowed under the existing rules is generally considered sufficient, but it is sorely felt that it is impossible to take as much forlough as is desirable for proper health, owing to the smallness of the furlough allowances. The present allowance is barely a subsistence allowance for a junior officer, and leaves no margin for expenditure in attending professional lectures or visiting Engineering Works. An officer,

who is keen on improving his professional qualifications and bringing his knowledge up to date in European practice, is thus discouraged. At present the most junior Royal Engineer officer in the Department gets a leave allowance, which a Civil Engineer can only hope to reach after eighteen years' service. It is unanimously urged that the leave allowances should be revised so that an officer on furlough or special leave will draw half his substantive salary subject to the minimum of £500 a year, which is at present laid down for the Indian Civilian and Military Officer subject to the Civil Leave Rules.

(2) The opinion is also strongly expressed that it should be open to every officer to take all the privilege leave which he has earned at any time during his service, when he can be spared. It is unjustifiable that an officer should be penalised because he cannot be spared, or because, in his keenness for his work, he may prefer to see his job through instead of applying for leave when three months happen to be due to him. Privilege leave once earned is as much due as an officer's pay, and the rules should be framed in such a manner that it can never be lost to him.

(3) Furlough cannot be taken till an interval of not less than eighteen months has elapsed since last return from privilege leave of over six weeks' duration. This rule should be relaxed, as it discourages an officer from taking privilege leave in India, when it may be very necessary for his proper health.

(4) A proposal which is unanimously urged is that an officer on furlough should be allowed to draw double furlough allowances for half the period of furlough which is due to him. For instance, that an officer with twenty months' furlough due to him, should be allowed to take ten months' furlough on double the ordinary furlough allowances, and end up with no balance of furlough due to him; or to take any less period, say six months, on double the ordinary furlough allowances, and end up with a balance of eight months (twenty months' less twice six months) still to his credit.

(5) The principles laid down in the foregoing sub-paragraphs concerning leave have already been recommended by the Decentralization Commission, and might well be adopted. They amount to the opening of a ledger for each officer showing on the credit side the amount of leave earned, against which he can draw at any time and in such a manner as suits Government and his own interests. It is felt that no useful purpose is served by the rule which lays down that an officer must have rendered eight years' active service before he can be granted furlough. It would be in the interests of the service to give a junior officer an opportunity of recruiting his health, or of renewing his acquaintance with the progress of his profession, by allowing him to take furlough after four years' active service. Similarly, it is felt that private employment during furlough should not be prohibited, as it would give a keen officer an opportunity of gaining experience to the interests of the Service.

(6) Opinion is unanimous that the rules for the grant of study leavee to officers of Scientific and Technical Departments should be extended to officers of the Public Works Department. Engineering is a progressive science, and it would be to the advantage of Government if officers were allowed periods of study in order to keep abreast of modern developments.

(7) The Indian Service leave rules should be abolished, and there should be the same leave rules for all officers of the Department.

71,325. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—(1) The greatest grievance of the Department, and one which is sorely felt, is the totally inadequate pension to which officers become entitled on retirement under existing rules. The present pensions are actually less than they were forty years ago, and when the higher qualifications now required from men joining the service, and the general rise in the cost of living are taken into consideration, they compare still more unfavourably than the actual figures indicate. It is strongly urged that the Memorials on this subject recently submitted by a large majority of the officers of the Imperial Service, should receive early and favourable consideration. Numerous Memorials on this subject have been submitted during the last six years, and the delay in the issue of first orders on the case has given rise to a considerable amount of discontent. The Engineer appointed in England is expected to live in the same style as the Royal Engineer and the Doctor, and there is no reason why he should be able on retirement to arrange his home menage on a more economical scale than they. He claims equal treatment from Government in the way of pension.

(2) Article 4 of the Civil Service Regulations lays down that an Officer's claim to pension is regulated by the rules in force when he retires. In view of the delay in the issue of final orders on the Memorials already submitted, it is urged that this rule should be held in abeyance in the case of those men who are compulsorily retired before final orders are issued.

(3) The scale of invalid Pensions is meaningless at present owing to the absurdly low maxima limits prescribed, and opinion is unanimous that the maxima limits, as laid down in Article 641, should be revised to agree with those shown in Article 474 of the Civil Service Regulations.

(4) A large majority of the Engineers appointed in England consider that a family pension scheme should be started, and that Government should bear a portion the cost. Pension has been officially laid down to be deferred remuneration, and consequently it is clearly the duty of Government to reimburse this deferred remuneration to his family in all cases when an officer dies before he has drawn it all in the shape of pension. The majority of men are willing to contribute 6¼ per cent. of their salaries towards a Family Pension Fund, and it is felt that Government should also contribute an equal amount. With this datum, the amount of family pensions, payable in the event of an officer dying, should be worked out on an actuarial basis, allowing five per cent. per annum compound interest. Bachelors would subscribe at the same rate as married officers with families, and as a set off they might be allowed to make voluntary subscriptions to a Provident Fund, and receive five per cent. compound interest thereon.

71,326. **(VII.) Division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—(1) It is undesirable to lay down definitely that certain fixed Divisional charges, or even a fixed proportion of Divisional charges should be reserved for Provincial Engineers, as laid down in the Government of India Resolution of the 24th of April 1908. Provincial Service Engineers being borne on the same list as Imperial Service Engineers, the appointments to Divisional charges should be by selection only.

(2) It is felt that, in the interests of efficiency, the proportion of imported Engineers in the Service should be for the present not less than sixty-six per cent.

(3) It is agreed that Engineers of the Imperial and Provincial Services should be borne on the same list, but it is felt that the principle laid down in Article 85 of the Civil Service Regulations is fair and equitable, *i.e.*, that an officer serving in his Native land should get only two-thirds of the pay he would draw while working outside his Native land. It is an economic fact that imported labour has invariably to be paid more highly than home labour, and there is no reason why India should pay the same for her Native-born Engineers, as the Secretary of State has to offer to the pick of English Engineers in order to induce them to serve in a foreign and distant clime. The Englishman serving in India is not working under the same conditions as the Indian, inasmuch as he cannot live so cheaply, and is exposed to adverse climatic conditions. He has also to bear the expense of long and expensive journeys home periodically for himself and his family. Education for his family in England costs considerably more than education in India. The case is complicated by the presence of a small body of the domiciled community in the ranks of the Provincial Service. These men have English habits, and undoubtedly labour under hardship and discontent, but no reasonable remedy has been suggested. Having made their domicile in India, they must throw in their lot with His Majesty's Indian subjects. The scale of pay laid down for the Provincial Service is undoubtedly sufficient for the pure Indian, and certainly attracts Indians of high attain-

ments. A great deal of the discontent in the Provincial Service is due to certain men, after failing to get an appointment to the Provincial Service, having subsequently obtained an appointment to the Imperial Service. It is felt that a recurrence of this discontent could be avoided by limiting recruitment in England to candidates who have resided for at least seven years in Europe.

Mr. H. J. Hope, called and examined.

71,327. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he was Executive Engineer of the Cawnpore division of the Lower Ganges Canal, and he represented the views of the Imperial Engineers in the United Provinces. He also acted as Local Secretary to the Civil Engineers' Association in the United Provinces.

71,328. The witness said the chief points in his written statement related to leave allowances, pensions, and the desirability of establishing a Family Pension Fund.

71,329. With regard to recruitment, instead of the present policy of recruiting about 30 per cent. of the superior Service in India and reserving 10 per cent. of the remainder for selection by the Secretary of State in England, he would abandon recruitment of Indians in England and substitute in its place recruitment in India from the Indian Colleges. Under his scheme recruits in India would be appointed to one-third of the vacancies in the department. He meant no retrograde step, as this proportion of Natives of India was about the same as existed in the United Provinces at present, and he meant it to be the same. As to recruitment in England, he insisted on a seven years' domicile with a view to discouraging the Indian from going to England, as he believed the recruitment of Indians in England was in part responsible for the discontent that now existed. He thought it would be better for all Indians to be recruited direct in India, and it would assist the Indian Colleges if this principle were enforced.

71,330. The witness did not consider the present qualification of the A.M.I.C.E. examination was sufficient in the absence of a residential course in a College for the formation of character. He thought the majority of officers now in the Service had gone through a residental course of three years and a year's practical training, and he wanted to insist upon that for everyone. At present there was no probation for Imperial Engineers. The senior men were in favour of such probation but the junior men were not, as they considered the terms of service were not good enough to attract candidates into the department as probationers. They were under the belief that a probationary period would adversely affect recruitment, but the witness agreed that a good man would not be deterred from coming into the service by any consideration of that kind.

71,331. With reference to recruitment in India, the witness said he would substitute for the present competition for entrance to the Indian Colleges, a system of nomination followed by a qualifying examination. Nomination would ensure physical fitness and respectability, and the due representation of the various castes. He thought it necessary to prevent an undesirable predominance of any caste in the Service. He did not think a qualifying examination would result in their obtaining students of lower intellectual calibre. He would abandon the present system of appointing two apprentices in each Provincial Service vacancy. He would appoint only one man in each vacancy, and if any of the probationers failed to qualify for confirmation, the deficiency in staff would have to be made good in the following year. The present system produced very great anomalies.

71,332. With reference to salary, his proposal was that an officer who was reported to be efficient should be allowed to advance by annual increments to Rs. 1,500, but if not thoroughly fitted for an administrative post, he should stop at Rs. 1,250, and if not fully qualified for the charge of a Division, he should not rise above Rs. 800. His proposal went on the assumption that an officer believed that at a certain period of his career he would be in possession of a charge, but he admitted that the Government had not given any pledge of that kind. An officer, however, when he entered the service certainly expected to get a division in ten years. It was important that the idea should not get about that Government was benefiting by its own mistakes in recruitment.

71,333. The witness said that the number of administrative and Executive posts asked for by the Local Government in the revised cadre, after allowing for expansion, was 63. Recruits appointed in 1913 would not get charge of divisions till after seventeen years' service. Unless the rule was changed, they would be blocked at Rs. 800 for about seven years.

71,334. The witness thought it would be a mistake to extend the system of annual increments to officers in the administrative ranks. It was necessary to make promotions to the administrative grades by selection.

71,335. Royal Engineer officers, witness considered, should enter the cadre at the bottom of the list and should not be put over the heads of Civil Engineers. There were some instances of Royal Engineers being placed over the heads of Civil Engineers, and many officers were discontented in consequence.

71,336. The retention of officers after the age of fifty-five resulted in a block of promotion, and this had caused a great deal of discontent. He thought it was to the benefit of the public that there should be an even flow of promotion and that blocks should be prevented.

71,337. With reference to the suggestion in his written statement that the Indian Service leave rules should be abolished, the witness admitted that there were certain conditions which might be taken into account in deciding whether the same leave rules should apply to Indians and Europeans, but he recommended that they should not be taken into account. He desired to help the Indian to go to England at a later stage of his career in order to make himself acquainted with work there, and he would be encouraged to do so if there were uniform rules as to furlough. The only difference he would make would be in the case of a man who spent his furlough in India instead of in England.

71,338. In connection with the proposal for a Family Pensions' Fund, the witness said pension was considered to be deferred pay, and if an officer died, the pension he had earned by service was lost. Government forced officers to subscribe to the Provident Fund and therefore recognised that it was a man's duty to make some provision for his wife and family. He and his colleagues would welcome the establishment of a Family Pension Fund even if Government made no contribution to it. His own idea was that the Family Pension Fund should be in substitution for the General Provident Fund. It was essential that every Imperial Engineer should subscribe a percentage of his salary to the proposed fund from the day he joined the service.

71,339. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness was of opinion that lately a few officers had been recruited to the Department from England who had received a training inferior to that obtained at Rurki. He did not think the best teaching possible in India was equal to the best teaching obtainable in England. An Indian educated in England should be appointed to the Provincial Service, because he did not think an Indian would obtain sufficient benefit from a three years' course in England to entitle him to join the Imperial Service. For that it was necessary that he should have been educated in an English Public School.

71,340. With reference to his statement that Engineers recruited in India did not possess the British spirit in the same degree as Imperial Engineers, the witness quoted the following extract from Sir Valentine Chirol's book on *Indian Unrest*: "Until quite recently the educated classes have held almost entirely aloof from any but the liberal professions. Science in any form has been rarely taken up by University students, and for every B.Sc., the honours lists have shown probably a hundred B.A.'s. The Indian National Congress itself, as it represented mainly these classes, naturally displayed the same tendencies, and for a long time it devoted its energies

to so-called political problems rather than to practical economic questions. Hence the almost complete failure of the Western educated Indian to achieve any marked success in commercial and industrial undertakings." He also quoted the following from the *Pioneer*: "The men who have entered the profession have not shown themselves conspicuous either in technical knowledge or in those essentials of character and sense of responsibility in emergencies and business and administrative ability, without which technical skill alone is of little avail." Those views were accepted by the Officers in the Public Works Department, and he put them forward as representing their ideas on the subject. What he implied by British spirit was grit, character, a sense of responsibility in emergencies, and business and administrative ability, and he claimed that men recruited in India were inferior in those qualities. Whilst he urged that nowhere in the world was home labour paid at the same rate as imported labour, he admitted that the application of that principle might entitle the Indian to insist on the further principle that as far as possible home labour only should be employed and imported labour employed only in exceptional instances. He thought however that 33 per cent. of the posts in the cadre was the utmost that could be conceded to Indians at present. He did not agree that before 1895 the men recruited in India, judged by the numbers promoted to administrative rank, were found to be as good as the men imported from England. It was economical as far as possible to officer the Public Works Department by men imported from England, but he would take in locally recruited men also as there were political reasons for encouraging Indians.

71,341. The four officers who subscribed to the original report were elected by the whole body of Engineers in the Province. He himself had been elected first, but had been unable to attend the conference. He had been nominated by Government as the representative witness.

71,342. (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness said the question of private practice for Engineers during service in India was not discussed by his colleagues but only the question of permitting private practice during periods of leave on furlough. He did not think that officers on furlough would in any case go in for private practice to any extent as their time would be chiefly taken up by recreation. If private practice during furlough were allowed he thought officers would become more efficient owing to the fact that they would get a wider knowledge of Engineering practice than they could possibly obtain in India. He did not think, however, it was an important point, and the demand would probably disappear when the officers became more contented with their prospects.

71,343. (*Mr. Fisher.*) With reference to his recommendation that there should be no exception to the rule which prescribed that a Chief Engineer should not be allowed to hold the same post for more than five years, the witness said his idea was that someone else should be given a chance and that the flow of promotion should not be blocked. In making the suggestion they were not thinking of the requirements of the Public Service except in so far as it was in the interests of the service to give regular promotion.

71,344. The witness said he received his own Engineering training at Cooper's Hill. He was not acquainted with the education given at Rurki and could not therefore make a comparison between Rurki and Cooper's Hill.

71,345. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) He had gone into the various minutes and despatches governing the scale of pay of the Department and had read the Minute of 1893. He was not able to say whether there was anything in that Minute which justified the statement that the Government had been recruiting with the idea that a Divisional charge should be given to an officer after ten years' service, but in the old days officers went up the scale whether they were in charge of a division or not. He agreed that the Minute of 1908 did not justify him in saying that Government had been recruiting on the basis of promotion after ten years, but Mr. Russell had just now said they were. The Government gave no guarantee. He had not seen the advertisement of 1913 giving the scales of pay, and was not aware that it contained a foot-note that "Officers of the Assistant class will ordinarily pass into the Executive class at the eleventh year of Service, but no Imperial Engineer may draw more than Rs. 9,600 per annum unless he holds charge of a division or a charge of equal importance." He thought, however, that the word "ordinarily" was quite sufficient to make each man expect promotion after ten years, if he worked well. At any rate it would be owing to a mistake if there was not a division for him then, and Government should pay for its own mistakes.

71,346. (*Mr. Madge.*) The urgency for increasing the staff of Imperial and Provincial Engineers was due to the class of men now in charge of sub-divisions. He thought the work performed by Imperial and Provincial Engineers was on an equality. The education in Rurki he believed to be sufficient on the intellectual side, but he did not think it trained men for practical work as they could be trained in English Colleges. It was a general belief amongst Imperial Officers that the work of Provincial Officers who had been promoted to Executive rank was inferior.

71,347. There would be no objection to the employment of temporary Engineers on a purely temporary basis and provided they were not given charge of divisions.

71,348. The cadre should be so increased as to obviate a block in promotion to executive rank, as he did not think the number of divisions should be increased.

71,349. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The witness said he understood that the ordinary work of Sub-divisional officers employed on the roads and buildings was to make designs and prepare estimates, but unfortunately such a bad class of men was being obtained that this work had to be done by the Executive Engineers themselves. During the whole of the hot weather the witness had under him a sub-overseer an Rs. 70 a month and an overseer on Rs. 100 a month as his Sub-Divisional Officers. He had not been able to get his leave, because there had been nobody to do his work.

71,350. A large portion of the staff in the Irrigation and Roads and Buildings Departments was employed on maintenance work, and the sub-divisional officers were generally upper subordinates. It was not frequently the practice for an Assistant Engineer posted to a sub-division to obtain the assistance of an upper subordinate officer; generally he had no assistance at all.

71,351. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) There was no arrangement in the United Provinces for providing a technical section at headquarters to undertake the larger designs and estimates. Every estimate was made in the divisions.

71,352. (*Mr. Housden.*) The witness desired that there should be the same leave rules for Imperial and Provincial officers; he desired to encourage the Indian to go to England on leave after having had some experience in India. On the Imperial list there were some Indian college Engineers who were under Indian Service rules for leave and pension. This caused a great deal of discontent, and the witness thought that such men should be put on to the same leave and pension rules as other Imperial officers.

71,353. When he said he did not think the number of divisions should be increased, he only meant to say that the proportion of sub-divisions to each division should not be decreased. The proportion was about 2½ sub-divisions to one division, and this was approximately right for the United Provinces.

71,354. He knew that Imperial Engineers had sent in memorials to Government asking for better pensions for Superintending Engineers and Chief Engineers. The present rule was that Superintending Engineers obtained an extra pension of Rs. 1,000 for three years' approved service but got nothing more unless they were subsequently appointed as Chief Engineers, and then only if they had been recruited before 1898. Witness asked that no dif-

ference should be made between the pension of the Superintending Engineer and that of the Chief Engineer. If a man was blocked for promotion to Chief Engineer through no fault of his own it would affect his immediate pay, but it ought not to affect his pension. He thought the request that an increase in pension of £40 a year should be granted for each year of service in the administrative grades was a reasonable one.

71,355. (*Mr. Clarke.*) The witness maintained that a man serving in a country which was not his native land ought to be paid more than if he were serving in his native land. If a Provincial Engineer was deputed to Europe he would only obtain under Article 85 of the Civil Service Regulations two-thirds of the salary he was drawing in India, but the witness recommended that, as a ative of India, he should get more.

(The witness withdrew.)

F. R. Bagley, Esq., M.Inst.C.E., Chief Engineer, Southern Punjab Railway.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,356. *Services of witness in brief.*—I joined the Public Works Department in 1871 with an Assistant Engineer's certificate from the Thomason College, Rurki, and worked as an Assistant Engineer in the Central Provinces, and on famine works during the Bihar famine of 1874, till, in July 1875, I was transferred to the Burma (State) Railways. For 23 years after, till July 1898, I worked on the Burma (State) Railways as Assistant Engineer, Executive Engineer, and finally, after 1891 as Engineer-in-Chief. From 1896 to 1898 I was lent to the Burma Railways Company as Chief Engineer. I returned to Government service in July 1898 as Engineer-in-Chief, and in January 1901 was appointed Chief Engineer of the North-Western State Railway (some 4,000 miles in length), which post I held till I retired on the maximum Chief Engineer's pension in September 1907. In 1908 I came out again as Chief Engineer of Construction for the Southern Punjab Railway Company and am still engaged in that capacity building railways in the Punjab.

My total service on works in India comes to over 40 years, during about 20 years of which I have held administrative posts as Chief Engineer. During that time I have come into close contact with nearly 500 Engineers, employed on the same works, or so near me as to give me a thorough knowledge of their qualifications and efficiency, and of this number some 200 have been directly under my orders as Superintending, Executive, or Assistant Engineers. They have been men of all ranks and recruited from all sources and I have good reason to believe that I am considered to have treated all with strict impartiality and to have been a good judge of character and efficiency and able to get out of each man the best work of which he was capable. References may be made on these points to the Government of India records.

I have given these details to show that my experience has been extensive enough to give me presumably a thorough knowledge of the qualifications and efficiency of the various types of Engineer officers in the Department. I take a deep interest in the welfare of the great Department in which I have spent a strenuous lifetime, and I offer to give evidence chiefly because I believe that in the present treatment of the "Provincial Service Engineers" and the "Temporary Engineers" there have been very serious mistakes made which will lead, unless soon corrected, to nothing short of disaster to the good name and efficiency of the service.

I shall take in order the "heads" under which remarks are called for, but to avoid confusion will deal separately with each of the three services into which the Public Works Engineering service is divided—

A.—The Imperial Engineering Service (to which appointments are made from England, or from the Royal Engineers in India).

B.—The Provincial Service (manned by passed students from the Indian Engineering Colleges, chiefly Rurki).

C.—The Temporary Engineer Service (appointments made in India on terms of one month's notice).

(A) *THE IMPERIAL ENGINEERING SERVICE.*

71,357. (I.) **Methods of Recruitment.**—I consider it a great pity that Coopers Hill College was abolished, but the present system of selection in England from qualified candidates is the best possible, and has worked so far with excellent results. Under present circumstances of supply of the likely material in India I think it is desirable that at least half the appointments should be made from England now and for some time to come. It will be possible to make a larger proportion of the appointments in India when the terms are made good enough to tempt the best class of domiciled European and Anglo-Indians, and of the Indians (a small class) to whom thi kind of service is attractive. I shall explain later on, in dealing with the Provincial Service, my reasons for this opinion.

71,358. (II.) **System of Training and Probation.**—There is at present no systematic training and the probation is nominal. The so-called "practical" experience in England is generally a farce, and in no case of much use for Indian works. At the same time this matter of training in India is of essential importance to the usefulness and success of every officer. I have known several men with the makings of good officers in them ruined for life by their first service being on unsuitable work, or under careless or tactless superior officers, who have not troubled about teaching them the details of work, or the spirit in which it should be done, and in which native employes and labourers should be dealt with. At the best it takes something like 2 years for a man fresh from England who comes out, ignorant of the language and of Indian methods, to become really useful, and it is an urgent matter that during this time of training he should be on practical work where he will get experience in details under a sympathetic officer who, by example and influence, will interest him in his duties and teach him how they should be carried out. I have always made it a point, as far as it has been in any way possible, to put every new arrival on to a year or two of Survey and Estimating work, and then for two years on construction work, under the right kind of officer, and with very successful results, and this should always be done systematically.

71 359. (III.) **Conditions of Service** are satisfactory on the whole.

71,360. (IV.) **Conditions of Salary.**—The Imperial Service Engineers have lately been put on a time scale of salary effecting a considerable improvement and appear to be sufficient to attract the right type of man.

71,361. (V.) **Conditions of Leave** are satisfactory on on the whole.

71,362. (VI.) **Conditions of Pension.**—Considering the importance of the work done by the Senior officers as acknowledged by the high rates of pay of the Chief Engineer and Superintending Engineer classes, there is no doubt that an improved scale of pension is called for. As a matter of fact, while the scale of pay has been recently increased, the maximum pension has been actually cut down to £525 a year, which is palpably out of proportion for a Chief Engineer drawing Rs. 2,500 to Rs. 2,750 per mensem. There should certainly be an approximation to the pensions laid down for services paying similar salaries, and the least increase that would be reasonable and satisfactory would be £700 a year for a Chief Engineer of 3 years' service in that rank and £600 a year for a Superintending Engineer of 3 years' administrative service. Considering that many deserving officers cannot be found vacancies in administrative appointments before they are superannuated a rule seems reasonable that men who would have received such appointments if vacant, and have always been recommended as fit for them, should get an extra pension of, say, £500 per annum. With these improvements

it might fairly be said that the Imperial P.W.D. service would have every reason to be happy and contented.

71,363. (VIIA.) **Limitations in the Employment of Non-Europeans.**—The necessity under existing rules of non-Europeans having to go to England for appointment to the Imperial Service is certainly a limitation, as few can afford the expense, but while as at present a large proportion of appointments must be made from England it is unavoidable, and the advantages of Eurocan education (apart from mere technical training) are so great that it is worth while retaining.

71,364. (VIIB.) **Division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—This division has been a most unfortunate and lamentable mistake, and it is chiefly to represent the urgency of its early abolition that I am proposing to give evidence. It will be more convenient to go into the subject in detail later, when considering the general case of the Provincial Service.

71,365. (VIII.) **Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—In all the Provinces in which I have worked these are satisfactory. There was some friction I believe in the Upper Provinces and Bengal before District Board Engineers were instituted.

71,366. (IX.) **Other Points.**—I have no Special remarks to make on the Imperial Service beyond those given above.

(*B.*) *THE PROVINCIAL SERVICE.*

71,367. When I joined the P.W.D. in 1871 and for many years afterwards till 1889, the men appointed in India including those trained at Rurki and the other Engineering Colleges received after training and probation, practically the same rates of pay as all the other Civilian Engineers. The Military men from the Staff Corps and Royal Engineers then a larger proportion than now, received certain extra Staff and other allowances which was a legitimate grievance to the Coopers Hill and other Civilian Engineers, and a "Civil Engineers Association" was got up with the special object of removing this anomaly. It was joined by many of the Indian appointed men and the main text on which it preached for years was the "same work, same pay." No man who joined that Association can consistently do anything but acknowledge the injustice of a Provincial Service, in which the Indian appointed men while doing exactly the same work and on the same lists for promotion, receive only two-thirds of the pay ,while so far as the Europeans and Anglo-Indians are concerned, they have to live on the same scale of expenditure. The Indian College Engineers' Association is now making an able representation on the history of the Provincial Service in which its genesis and the misapprehensions on which its institution was founded, and the alleged broken promises and injustice done, are fully described. I do not propose therefore to go into such details but to confine myself to the refutation of the fundamental error which led to the Government of India taking action in the matter.

(2) The Provincial Service in the Public Works Department was instituted on the recommendation of the Public Services Commission of 1885, which having laid down very good reasons for such a service in various other Departments, did not realise that in this case the circumstances were entirely dissimilar. They founded their recommendation on the ground of the "superior scientific education" of the men appointed from England: and show by their arguments, what I am obliged to call "the most unfathomable ignorance" of an Engineer's real duties, and of what the "scientific education" of a young Engineer, whether in Europe or India, really amounts to. I am aware of the objections to using too strong language, and of its detrimental effect on impartial judges if it is proved to be exaggerated and unreasonable, but I believe in this instance it can be shown beyond doubt that no terms can be too strong to characterise the gross misapprehension on which a Commission of able men made their recommendation, and it is still more amazing that the Government of India with more knowledge and the best intentions should have agreed to and acted on it. It is almost incredible that it should have been so, but so it was as I shall proceed to show.

(3) On referring to paragraph 119 of the Commission's report it will be seen that it is mentioned as a terrible thing that a Coopers Hill man should be condemned to labour on works "within the capability of men of an inferior standard of education" and be kept for 15 years "*making bricks and lime and putting them together*"! To anyone who knows anything of an Engineer's duties that is a terse and comprehensive description of Engineering work everywhere. Similarly, the Commission say with perhaps some truth that "some of the operations of the Department require the highest skill and training obtainable in England, and for control of a great department, qualifications are wanted which are not at present attainable in this country" and *then they proceed to argue that the men "from Chatham and Coopers Hill receiving a higher standard of professional education than the best Indian Colleges are capable of affording,"* are capable of carrying out the aforesaid operations requiring the highest skill and training obtainable in England, while the Indian trained men are only good enough for "the ordinary work of the Department." Now could anything show more extraordinary ignorance of what a young Engineer's professional education really means and amounts to. The fact that "some of the operations of the Department require the highest skill and training obtainable in England" may be a very good reason for importing competent experts in such operations, but that the skill and training acquired at Chatham or Coopers Hill should make any difference for such purposes from that acquired at Rurki or elsewhere, is obviously a statement that proves a complete ignorance of the subject. In either case, the Coopers Hill man or the Rurki man or any young Engineer starting in life, however highly educated professionally, can only have a theoretical knowledge of the first principles of Engineering. One may be slightly better in higher mathematics, and another have a more thorough knowledge of surveying, but both are *beginning their professioanl education* by training in practical work. Neither will be fit for "operations requiring the highest skill" or the "control of a great Department" till after many years of experience, and there is not the smallest reason why one should then be more fit for these than the other if they are men of equal intelligence and practical ability.

(4) Now as a matter of fact I, who have had hundreds of young engineers passing through my hands from all sources, can certify that while the average Rurki man was not perhaps so good in higher mathematics or applied mechanics, he knew quite enough of these subjects to do such work as he would be caled on to carry out in practice, and on the other hand he was a much more thoroughly trained Surveyor, and his knowledge of the language and of Indian men and methods gave him an actual initial advantage. By the time the Rurki man rose to be an Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade, he had had some 2½ to 3 years practical experience and was a long way ahead in usefulness of the newly arrived Coopers Hill man who joined in that grade and on the same pay. These are facts that no experienced and impartial Engineer in India can deny, and that the Rurki man became as fit for operations requiring high skill, and control of a Department as anybody else is abundantly proved by the actual performances of the Rurki men who joined the Department in my time and for some years after, until the institution of the Provincial Service made it no longer attractive to the best men educated in India.

(5) I have made out very carefully a list of all the Engineers with whom I have during my 40 years' service come into sufficiently close contact to enable me to form a judgment as to their efficiency as Engineers. These number in all more than 450 men of all ranks and from all sources made up as follows:—

(*a*)	Royal Engineers	59
(*b*)	Staff Corps	12
(*c*)	Engineers under covenant (5 years)	17
(*d*)	Stanley Engineers	32
(*e*)	Miscellaneous appointments in India	30
(*f*)	Rurki men	117
(*g*)	Coopers Hill, and since	142
(*h*)	Temporary Engineers	50
	Total ...	459

All these are men with, or near, whom, I have worked and I give my personal opinion founded on actual experience. The figures showing that the number of Rurki men who actually rose to administrative rank was as large a proportion as in any other service, will be available no doubt from other sources, but as they might be considered the exceptions. I have gone carefully through all the men I have known well enough to judge, and divided them into three classes —above average, average, and under average, with the following results:—

—	Above average per cent.	Average per cent.	Under average per cent.
(*a*) Royal Engineers	53	42	5
(*b*) Staff Corps	17	50	33
(*c*) Engineers under 5 years covenant.	58	29	13
(*d*) Stanley Engineers... ...	25	55	20
(*e*) Miscellaneous appointments in India.	27	47	26
(*f*) Rurki and Indian College men.	34	54	12
(*g*) Coopers Hill, and since ...	33	57	10
(*h*) Temporary Engineers ...	8	84	8

(6) It is not pretended that these figures are exactly accurate, and such are not possible, but they have been got out with an earnest endeavour at absolute impartiality. I am willing to admit all kinds of qualifications, which might affect the percentages to a certain extent, but I believe there can be no doubt that the Rurki Engineers who joined the Public Works Department while the service was considered worth entering, were as good for all practical purposes as the man from any other source, and had an equal proportion of men above the average fit for administrative, or exceptionally difficult executive posts. I think I have shown good grounds at any rate for my contention that the institution of the Provincial Service in the Public Works Department was founded on a complete misapprehension by the Public Service Commission of what an Engineer's duties are and what his education really means, also that as a matter of fact the men turned out from Rurki in the years before 1889 and for some years after were as competent, and deserving of the same pay, as those recruited from any other source.

(7) I have now to urge the strong reasons that exist for my opinion that the present state of things is in the interests of the Government intolerable and disastrous, and calls for very early and drastic reforms. The Public Service Commission in making their recommendations had the excellent intention of appeasing the discontent that existed amongst the Indian appointed men, who complained that, though doing the same work and drawing the same pay, they were at a great disadvantage in the matter of leave and pension rules. *This discontent they proposed to allay by the very topsy turvy expedient of reducing the pay also* while they continued to do the same work. In practice, as might have been foreseen, there has been since twenty times the amount of discontent that existed previously, and on very solid grounds. There was an idea at the time that the Provincial men could be kept, by themselves in certain unimportant divisions comprising "ordinary works" not requiring the "highest skill," but as any practical man could have foretold this was found to be quite unworkable. In practice, for important works the competent men must be selected whatever their origin, and in any large service any attempt to restrict the freedom of selection for vacancies that occur, would lead to a disorganisation of staff from frequent transfers that would be fatal to efficient management. No attempt is now made therefore to separate the sheep from the goats. They work together indiscriminately, with the result of anomalies of all kinds which make a contented Provincial Service man an impossibility. Very often a Provincial Executive Engineer has Assistant Engineers under his orders drawing much higher pay (I have known a case where the Assistant Engineer drew nearly twice the pay of his superior officer), and even when working together as Assistant or Executive Engineers the man drawing the smaller pay for exactly the same work (while obliged to live on exactly the same scale of expenses) cannot be expected to do the contented and willing service which can alone be efficient service. It is argued that he entered the service with open eyes as to the conditions and ought to have known what to expect, but it is a weak argument. Youngsters of the age at which most men join do not think of such matters, cannot realise what the distinction will mean in practice, and find themselves in positions in which no man with self-respect can be satisfied.

(8) There is another argument, perhaps the most powerful of all, against the existence of the present system of a superior service on subordinates' pay. It is said by critics of the Indian appointed men that they have deteriorated in class of late years from the men who used to go to Rurki some years ago. I am not aware that there has so far been any very marked deterioration, though no doubt the most brilliant of the Indian educated boys are not sent there as they used to be, but with the prospects as bad as they are now it cannot be questioned that such deterioration is in time inevitable, and that there is grave danger of coming down sooner or later to men of inferior type with moral standards that unfit them for positions of trust. It is a delicate matter, but needs putting quite plainly. The Public Works is a spending Department, the officers of which control in every detail an enormous cash expenditure, and it is a necessity that they should be above suspicion as to their absolute honesty. This has been ensured on the whole so far, but what will happen when badly paid and discontented men coming from an inferior class find themselves in such positions exposed to the strongest temptations, anybody conversant with Indian standards knows quite well, and it is not necessary to go into further detail.

(9) No stronger reason can exist than those given above for an immediate reform of the present system of appointment in India to the higher ranks of the Public Works Department but there are farther strong considerations of policy against barring the doors of the higher service against indigenous talent of the right kind. There are, it is true, comparatively few educated Indians at present to whom a service presents itself as attractive in which many hardships and physical discomforts have to be encountered daily and much patient drudgery called for in the lower grades. The Indian Engineers of the future, and very brilliant ones, will be found amongst the artificer castes, trained to such work for generations, but there are yet few of these sufficiently advanced in English education to be successful in College competitions. The members of the large domiciled community however, showed themselves, while appointments worth having were available, to be particularly adapted for this profession and successful in its practice, and as an outlet for their best men it will be in every way an advantage to the State to restore the conditions under which the Indian Colleges sent out so many brilliant Engineers in the seventies and eighties. In this connection the subject is acknowledged to present certain difficulties which will be considered later under the head of "*conditions of recruitment.*" I hope I have shown conclusively above, the evils of the Provincial system for the Public Works Department as at present existing, and its inevitable result if continued on the same lines, in an inefficient and untrustworthy service. Radical alterations are urgently necessary and I will proceed to indicate briefly what I suggest as advisable. But before proceeding farther I should like to explain that I have not forgotten that the Commission mentioned as reasons for the distinctions they recommended, not only the illusory "higher scientific education" obtainable in Europe but the advantages of "general English education and training," which I am quite ready to admit as most valuable in forming energetic and strong characters. I have therefore in my remarks above on what is now called the Imperial Service, proposed that half the recruitment should continue to be from England under present conditions. I am also willing to admit that there is something in the argument that the Indian trained Engineer gets his education so much more cheaply, that a difference in the rate of pay has some appear-

ance of plausibility, but it is also clear I think that this difference should apply only to the initial pay for the first two or three years, by which time the man who has served his probation and practical training successfully has surely washed out the score. My recommendations for reform are therefore as follows:—*First.*—The name of the service should be altered; "Provincial Service" is in other Departments the description of a strictly subordinate service in which *all the members join and work as subordinates* under a superior class of officers, but it is not applicable to Public Works Engineers who join as officers and work as such with all the duties and responsibilities of other officers of the Department. *Secondly.*—My recommendation is in short, that we should return to the state of things substantially, that existed in 1871 when I joined the Department.

(10) The Indian appointed Engineer would join on Rs. 250 instead of the Rs. 350 drawn to start with by the English trained men. The nominal "apprenticeship" of the Rurki man would be abolished as meaningless and generally ignored in practice, and no more necessary in his case than in that of the English trained man, probably less necessary owing to his knowledge of the language and of Indian ways and methods. After probation and training on works for say two years, as described above under paragraph 71,358, both men would be put on the same footing and the same pay. At any rate it is absolutely necessary that after Executive Engineer's rank is reached there should be no distinction whatever in emoluments. We should then get rid of the anomalies that at present exist and cause heart-burnings and humiliations fatal to efficient service.

71,368. (I.) **Method of Recruitment.**—The only really satisfactory system, apart from a Training College like Coopers Hill is that adopted lately for the "Imperial" P.W.D. service, of careful selection from men who have passed a qualifying examination, and there is no doubt that selection by competitive examination is the worst possible system, and more so especially in India, where the classes that shine most in the schools are those least fitted for hard outdoor work, which needs specially energy and perseverance and practical ability. If any workable system could be devised of nomination from schools and colleges for a qualifying examination, and a farther selection after personal interview by a competent and impartial Board of Examiners, it would be an ideal arrangement; but I am aware that in India there are almost insuperable difficulties in the way of any such arrangement. However, absolutely impartial the selectors might be in fact, there would be bitter complaints of unfairness to certain races, or religions, or castes, leading to constant appeals, and I am afraid some system of competitive examination as at present is unavoidable. It is, however, possible to limit to some extent the entrance into the Service of the more unfit, by insisting on a searching medical examination with particular attention to physical activity and hardiness before applicants are allowed to go for the entrance examinations of the Indian Engineering Colleges, and to give marks in the passing out examinations, for riding and proficiency in gymnastics, and games which tend to activity of mind and body and a sound physique.

71,369. (II.) **Probation and Training** would be as proposed above for the Imperial Service.

71,370. (IV.) **Conditions of Salary.**—It has been explained above that the pay must be the same as for corresponding grades of the present "Imperial Service," at any rate after the rank of Executive engineers has been attained. I am quite willing to admit that for Natives of India *living on the Indian scale* the European scale of pay is high, if we compare the respective necessary living expenses, but in this Department at any rate we have to remember that a large proportion of the officers are domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians who do, and to preserve their position *must*, live on the European scale, and it is also desirable that educated Indians should be encouraged to adopt European manners and habits of life. A perfectly fair arrangement theoretically would be to have two scales of pay, one for all Indian appointed officers who live on the European scale and a lower one for those who live in native style, and it would have excellent results in bringing about an approximation to a common scale of the habits of life, which is necessary to allow of free social intercourse and friendship between the Europeans and non-Europeans, without which it will be impossible to quite remove racial feelings and jealousies.

I do not think, however, that under present circumstances any such differentiation is possible, and the only fair solution is to give all officers doing the same work the same rates of pay.

71,371. (V.) **Conditions of Leave and (VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—The appointments made in India are meant for Indians and members of the domiciled community, and it will be no grievance to any of them if they have the same rules as the "Uncovenanted Service" generally, though they should of course have a right to any extra pensions paid to Superintending and Chief Engineers.

71,372. (VII.) **Limitation in the Employment of Non-Europeans.**—For appointments made in India there can be no limitation of non-Europeans, but it is arguable that there should be limitations, perhaps, excluding Europeans not members of the domiciled community, as there would be otherwise a danger of men educated in Europe coming out specially to compete in the entrance examinations, when the service after the improvements proposed is made tempting enough to attract them. (This actually happened in 1871-72). Amongst Indians, and domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians, who are fairly eligible for admission to the Indian Engineering Colleges, it is not I am afraid possible to lay down any proportions as to the numbers in which the races and castes are to be admitted respectively. The better educated members of the domiciled community have proved themselves specially suited for such work, and it is also true that Engineering as a profession does not attract or suit the class of Indians who are at present the most highly educated, and most likely to be successful in competitive examinations. It would therefore certainly tend to the efficiency of the service if at least half the appointments were reserved for the domiciled community, and stated proportions also reserved for Mahomedans and the Artificer classes generally, who are the best practical men though at present backward in English education, but it is not possible in practice to make such reservations and all will have to take their chance equally at the competitive examinations.

In closing my remarks on the Provincial Service I beg to be excused for repeating that I have made no mention of the various other strong arguments against it that may be drawn from its history, of broken pledges, and alleged injustice and harsh treatment, &c., &c., but have been constrained by my deep interest in the Public Works Department to give my reasons founded on long personal experience for believing that reforms on the lines I have recommended are urgently called for in the interests of the State, as a mere matter of expediency.

TEMPORARY ENGINEERS.

71,373. The Commission will know all about this service and it is not necessary for me to go into great detail. The Temporary Engineers are men with sufficient professional training, or knowledge obtained from practical experience, to carry out Engineering works. They are engaged as non-pensionable officers subject to dismissal at a month's notice, but engagements are generally for a year at a time. Towards the end of this year every temporary man is in a state of very uncomfortable suspense as to whether his services will be retained or not. There is no regular system of promotion and temporary men have at present little or no prospect of attaining any rank or pay, above that of Assistant Engineer on Rs. 600 a month. As a rule, so far as is possible under these conditions, temporary men are treated with a certain amount of consideration and have had a tolerably contented existence and a fair prospect of continuous employment so long as their work is satisfactory, but they are entirely at the mercy of superior officers who are sometimes prejudiced and inconsiderate, and many have suffered from very unjustifiable treatment. In a recent case, on one State Railway, thirteen Temporary Engineers were suddenly served with a

month's notice for no fault, but because this number of permanent men was supposed to be coming to it, and room had to be made for them. In the end, as might have been foreseen, nearly all of the Temporary Engineers were either retained or re-appointed, but the disturbance of the work of the Railway, while half the staff was on transfer and retransfer was indescribable, and the shock to the men of the sudden dismissal and anxiety about their future, was such as no men who are doing very responsible work, and supposed to have some self-respect, can be subjected to without deplorable results.

The Temporary Engineers' service is as a matter of fact, if reasonably dealt with, a very valuable and useful part of the Department. The number of officers required from time to time varies so much that to appoint a sufficient number of permanent pensionable men for busy years leads to a surplus in slacker times of a very expensive staff for whom suitable employment cannot be provided. The existence of a staff of competent non-pensionable men, whose numbers can be adapted to requirements gives a most useful amount of flexibility in the Establishment arrangements, and coupled with the fact that every temporary man is necessarily a competent man (as his services would not otherwise be retained) has led, especially in the Irrigation and Railway Departments, to the employment of a large number of very useful men, with satisfactory results in efficiency of work and economy in establishment charges. It is obvious that such a valuable body of men should be cherished and encouraged in every way, but there are hardships and disabilities in the service, as briefly referred to above, which need to be put right if there is not to be the deterioration in quality described in my remarks on the Provincial Service. No men with self-respect will stay in it, and we shall get a lower class of men who cannot be trusted.

The points that require attention are:—

(*a*) The scale of pay.

(*b*) Eligibility of promotion to higher rank than Assistant Engineer.

(*c*) Less uncertainty of tenure of appointment.

(*d*) Better leave rules.

(*e*) A provident fund.

On these my proposals are as follows:—

(*a*) *Scale of pay.*—Considering that the service is non-pensionable, the scale of pay should be at least that of the permanent service. The starting pay should be Rs. 250 per mensem for the first year and Rs. 350 after that for young men beginning work. For older and experienced Engineers the pay should be in accordance with qualifications and experience at the time of appointment. There should be a recognized scale for increase of pay of competent men of, say, Rs. 100 every three years till Rs. 600 is reached.

(*b*) *Elegibility for promotion* to higher rank than Assistant Engineer. This should be allowed in the case of thoroughly efficient men, and there should be possibility of promotion in exceptional cases to the permanent service. Such promotions have been made in the past with excellent results. They were stopped as a grievance to the Provincial Service, but will be so no longer when that Service is put on a better footing. The restriction at present existing to the maximum pay of an Assistant Engineer is fatal to obtaining or retaining the services of the best men.

(*c*) *Greater security of tenure.*—To preserve the flexibility, which is the *raison d'etre* of the Temporary Service there must be a retention of the right to reduce the numbers on due notice, but this can easily be arranged systematically without causing undue anxiety or sudden surprises. The employment at one month's notice should be retained for the first year's service which will be on probation, but after that where service is approved the terms should be six months' notice at least, to allow a man time to look for another job, and it should be understood that reductions will be made from the latest joined men, and that these will have the first claim to re-appointment when numbers are again increased.

(*d*) *Leave rules* should be in accordance with the uncovenanted service rules generally, for men of the same pay in the permanent service, including a right to furlough when due.

(*e*) The Civil Engineers' or Railway Provident Funds should be open to Temporary Engineers in all cases.

During my service as Engineer-in-Chief in Burma and on the North-Western Railway, I was able to work the Temporary Engineer Establishment much on these lines, with, I believe, great success in getting good work done by a willing and zealous staff, and I see no reason why it should not be done throughout the Public Works Department. There is, I believe, no alternative between improving the Temporary Engineer rules on the lines indicated above, or abolishing altogether a service which must become under its recent treatment a mere refuge for the destitute.

I shall be glad to give any further information that may be called for, or to appear before the Commission when the subject is taken up and answer any questions that may be asked.

Supplementary Written Statement.

71,374.—(1) When drawing up the written statement submitted to the Royal Public Service Commission I had not seen the statement sent in by the Civil Engineers' Association.*

(2) After reading that very able, and in most respects, moderate representation, I wish to make the following supplementary remarks.

(3) In my memorandum I find that I underrated the increase in the rates of pension that would be justifiable in the case of the Imperial Engineer Service, and agree that something more nearly approaching what is asked for of the Association is called for to put the Public Works Department men on an equal footing with other departments manned by imported officials.

(4) Also I forgot that the leave rules demand a similar improvement.

(5) I consider that the advantages of *technical training in Europe* (as apart from *education*) have been very much exaggerated, and as far as practical work is concerned (excepting Specialist subjects) I believe too much experience under English conditions is a positive disadvantage. The duties of Engineers in England and India are fundamentally different, and so are the circumstances under which the work is carried out. I do not therefore believe in the necessity for Indian appointed men being sent to Europe for practical training. For the work they have to do, training on large works in India is much more suitable.

(6) I do not admit that the technical training at the Indian Colleges is very inferior as has been made out by some people. It is no doubt capable of improvement, but *just as good for practical purposes as the European training* at Cooper's Hill or elsewhere.

(7) Also I do not admit that European standards of work are very much superior to those in vogue in good practice in India, which are as good, as a rule, as possible under the circumstances. I have made very interesting inspections of works in Europe but gathered very little, if anything, that has been of practical use in this country.

(8) The question of a "foreign service allowance" being due to imported officers in addition to salaries paid to locally appointed men has been raised. It is undoubtedly a fair and reasonable claim, and can be met adequately by improved leave and pension rules, without any differentiation in actual salaries while on duty.

(9) *A period of probation for imported* men is a very important matter under the new system of selection without the knowledge of character given by three years' residence in a College. One year however is quite a sufficient period in which to judge of a man's qualifications for service in India. In practice, whatever the theory, no man would be sent away for anything but faults of temperament and conduct which entirely unfit him for employment in India and these become evident in a very short time.

* *Vide* paragraphs 72,155–63.

Mr. F. R. Bagley called and examined.

71,375. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he was a retired Chief Engineer of the Public Works Department, and now occupied the position of Chief Engineer of Construction with the Southern Punjab Railway. He entered Government Service in the year 1871 from Rurki College. Railway Engineering demanded no higher theoretical training than was needed for work on buildings, roads and irrigation. It required, however, certain qualities of promptness, and readiness of resource.

71,376. His written statement was entirely directed to a general criticism of the present policy in regard to the Provincial Service, and the employment of temporary Engineers. He recommended the abolition of the Provincial Service as it at present existed, and the establishment of a superior Engineering Service. He thought on the whole the supply of suitable material in India would be sufficient to furnish 50 per cent. of the superior Service. He would not suggest such an increase immediately, but he would spread it over three or four years.

71,377. He considered there were positive advantages in recruiting a definite proportion of men who had been educated in England as distinguished from men who had been educated in India. It was a matter of character. Under his scheme openings for the subordinate Service would be the same as at present; the best men of the subordinate Service should be promoted into the superior Service, and ought to get some allowance for the fact that they would under these circumstances enter very much later in life than their colleagues. He would give a man, so promoted, four or five years seniority, which had been the practice in regard to the Royal Engineers, who obtained 2½ years seniority. He admitted that such a practice had been a source of dissatisfaction, but he did not think that dissatisfaction counted for very much. He agreed, however, that this proposal would rather accentuate that feeling of dissatisfaction.

71,378. He was not aware that there was any very great difference in the quality of candidates now available in the Indian Engineering colleges as compared to what it used to be, but he believed from what he had seen and heard in the last few days that the former good class of men were not attracted by the Provincial Service terms, and if there was a difference, that was the reason for it. He thought if better terms were offered, a better class of men would be obtained.

71,379. Technical education, as distinguished on the one hand from general education, and, on the other, from practical experience, counted in his opinion for comparatively little. It was necessary to have a certain amount of technical education as a foundation, but having got that it was entirely a matter of practical experience and of character.

71,380. The training which was at present being given in Rurki included he thought, a sufficient amount of practical experience in surveying, but when he was at Rurki the training, apart from that subject, was practically all theoretical. The year's practical training after passing out of Rurki, was, in his time, an absolute farce. The way to give a man the best practical training was to put him in charge of work. In the old days students from Rurki were at once made Sub-Divisional officers, and that had been the practice up to quite recently. The attention given to such men varied a great deal according to the officer they were under; in other words, the practical training depended almost entirely on the officer.

71,381. He would not alter the present method of recruitment in England. He desired to say that he thought the idea of having another college like Cooper's Hill was quite illusory. Such a college would not produce a better social class; it would produce exactly the same men as at the present time were being produced. He thought three years in a college was a tremendous advantage to a man, but whether it was worth while starting a college for that sole purpose was, he thought, open to doubt. He was acquainted with one or two engineering colleges in Great Britain.

71,382. He would like to reserve a certain proportion of vacancies for the different classes in India, but he was afraid that was quite impracticable.

71,383. With regard to the question as to the proportion of vacancies to be allotted to each of the Indian engineering colleges, the witness thought the best method would be to give a certain number of appointments in proportion to the Public Works Establishments of the particular Provinces.

71,384. It would be in some respects better to have a central college, but he did not think such was called for at the present moment. He thought the technical education given in all the Indian engineering colleges was about on an equality He did not think there was any necessity for concentrating the course of training for the superior posts in one central college. For present purposes the colleges as they existed now were, he thought, quite satisfactory.

71,385. To a certain extent he favoured the continuance of recruitments from the Royal Engineers, but he thought such recruitment had been rather overdone. If a war suddenly broke out, and the Royal Engineer officers were all called away, it would upset the whole Department. Looked at from the point of view of a reserve, it was very important that Royal Engineers should be selected to the service.

71,386. With reference to temporary engineers, he urged that such officers should enjoy better terms than they enjoyed at the present time. He thought a scheme to restrict temporary engineers to speecific constructional work would be very difficult to carry out. There was a tremendous fluctuation in the demand for constructional work. He considered temporary engineers should be eligible for promotion to the higher ranks but he agreed, if they were, there would be a certain legitimate grievance on the part of the Service. That, however, was one of the difficulties which could not be helped; the men would have to grin and bear it. He could see no other way out of the difficulty. He considered that as the Service of temporary engineers was a non-pensionable one, the scale of pay should be rather more than that of the permanent service. He also suggested that all officers of the superior service should get the same scale of pay, certainly after the grade of Executive engineer had been reached, and preferably after the end of two years' probation. He recognised the necessity of regarding the European in India as entitled to a higher scale of pay, but he proposed to mark the difference in the leave and pension rules. All the present discontent arose on account of different pay being given to men who were doing the same work. He would leave the pension rules and leave rules as they were for the Indian Service generally, and would allow the European in India to have preferential treatment in these two respects. He did not think the Service would regard such an arrangement as being quite satisfactory, but there was no serious objection to it. Anyhow the lesser of the two evils was to give a preference in leave and pension rather than to give it in pay.

71,387. Engineers on the Southern Punjab Railway were recruited chiefly in India. When he could do so, he borrowed permanent engineers from the Government. He desired to say that the duties of an engineer in England and the duties of an engineer in India were quite different, and that a man who had had a long experience in England was almost unfitted for duty in India. In England an engineer laid out the work and supervised it, but it was the contractor who was responsible for making the whole of the arrangements; whereas in India there were no such contractors. The Indian contractor was simply a labour agent, and the engineer had to do everything in connection with the work. He thought two or three years' experience of Indian railway consruction would benefit a man to a considerably greater extent than any experience on English railways. The suggestion, that the permanent cadre of the State Railways should be fixed in accordance with the normal rather than the minimum requirements, and that in lean years there would be no difficulty in lending out temporary engineers to companies, was an entirely illusory one, as the relief obtained thereby

could be only occasional and accidental. The work of the companies fluctuated just as much as the work of the Government. Then again, the Companies' work had to be done, and the Government could not lend a man to a Company and then take him away whenever they wanted. If, however, such a scheme was adopted, it would be necessary to lay down a certain programme for the Companies from which the number of Government men could be calculated. That would simply mean an addition to cadre with its usual difficulties and be no relief at all for temporary blocks.

71,388. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) If 50 per cent. of the recruitment to the Imperial Service was allowed to Indian colleges, the witness would suggest the discontinuance of the rule under which 10 per cent. of the vacancies filled in England were reserved to Indians. If half the vacancies were filled in India he thought the Anglo-Indian and domiciled European would re-establish himself in the Indian colleges, and obtain as many appointments in the Service as he used to do.

71,389. Why, he said, the so-called practical experience in England was generally a farce, was that a man who went in for such a course could either learn or not, as he chose. If a man went to a railway, or some Engineering Works to obtain the practical training, it was nobody's business to look after him. If a man chose to learn, he could learn a great deal, but if he did not, he need not learn anything. The witness did not agree with the statement which had been made at the last Educational Congress of Engineers held in England some years ago, that the men who came from colleges were absolutely useless without a long course of practical experience in shops. His remarks applied only to Civil Engineering, and had no reference to mechanical engineering. He did not agree that a man in an Engineering Works learned to do the work as the workman did it, and was therefore very superior to the man who came direct from college to the Indian railway. All the circumstances in England were so entirely different—the workmen, the materials and the climate and methods of work.

71,390. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The reason why he suggested that the 50 per cent. recruitment in India should be worked up to gradually, was because it would take time for men to change their system of education. The men who were not going to Rurki at present and who wanted to become Doctors or Lawyers, would have to change their plans. They would not be all got in at once. In the witness's time, the system was entrance by competitive examination, and appointments were given on the results of competitive examination. He believed at the present time they entered 20 Engineer students in every year by competition. The first six obtained appointments, and the remainder who qualified were given diplomas.

71,391. He thought in India it was impracticable to have anything but a system of competitive examination. He would much rather have a selection of qualified persons, but he was afraid there would be so many complaints with regard to the selection. There would be accusations of favouritism being shewn to one race or religion or another. He thought on the whole the selection in England was the right plan. His experience of men selected there had been satisfactory.

71,392. (*Mr. Madge.*) The rule that incompetent Temporary Engineers would be discharged with a month's notice had been fairly strictly carried out, and therefore the majority of the remaining Temporary Engineers were fairly good men.

71,393. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He did not think there would be room for an intermediate service between the Subordinate Service and the Imperial Service. It has been often proposed and found impracticable.

71,394. (*Mr. Sly.*) There was nothing in the character of Railway Engineering which made it necessary to adopt a different method of recruitment from that by which Civil Engineers were obtained for other branches of the Public Works Department. He thought if better terms were given, a better class of men would be obtained in India.

71,395. The proposals that officers recruited in England should receive the same pay as the Imperial Staff, but that there should be some difference in the leave and pension rules was in effect a proposal to revert to the position which existed before 1887, and which was described by the last Public Services Commission as being very faulty and causing friction and jealousy; but the witness thought the proposal had been wrongly condemned, and that friction and jealousy only existed to a comparatively slight extent. He admitted, however, that there was very serious friction at the present time, but that was, he considered, on account of the differences in pay.

71,396. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness thought the training at present being given in the Indian colleges was quite sufficient. He was not aware of any very serious defects; he thought the men turned out by such colleges were good enough for all practical purposes. He was of the opinion that his figure of 50 per cent. of Indians to be recruited to the Service could be increased to 70 per cent. at some time in the future many years hence, but he considered there was such a difference in the efficiency of men recruited in England and the men recruited in India as made it necessary that there should always be 30 per cent. of Eurropean officers as a minimum.

71,397. He thought that on the whole it would reduce to a minimum the present sense of unfair and unequal treatment if the only differences made were in regard to leave and pension.

71,398. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) It was true that every railway had large workshops attached to it, which would be capable of affording training.

71,399. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) If the witness's standard of 70 per cent. recruited from the India was worked up to, he would suggest the Imperial scale of pay, so long as any men were brought out from England. He agreed that the present scale of salaries would be such as would be considered very good in England, but he thought under present circumstances men recruited in India must be paid more than it was necessary to pay men in England. He did not say it was a method he would approve of, but it was unavoidable because there could not be two rates of pay. He considered Government would be repaid in efficiency; and that it would get a better class of men all down the list. When the percentage did reach 70, the question of the salary might be reconsidered; he did not think it would be too late then.

71,400. He agreed there had been a considerable change in social habits; Anglo-Indians sent their children to England to a greater extent than they used to, but that was largely on account of there being no openings in India. He was sure Anglo-Indians would send their children to Rurki if the conditions of service were improved. He did not think they would be beaten in the qualifying examination by Indians, nor did he agree with the suggestion that the educational standard of Indians had risen enormously of late years, and that that of the Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans had very much deteriorated.

71,401. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) There were 14 superior engineers on one line of the Southern Punjab Railway, and 12 on another. On the first line there was only one sub-divisional officer an Indian; three of the rest were Englishmen trained and educated in England; and the remainder were Anglo-Indians who had been also educated in England, or partly in England and partly in India. On the second line there were three first class Asiatic Indian officers, the rest being Europeans.

71,402. (*Mr. Aikman.*) He did not think that the relatively large number of Rurki men who had risen to administrative rank was due to Rurki College having been started very much sooner than Cooper's Hill. He thought if the percentage was taken from the same date as the Cooper's Hill men came out, it would be found just as good.

(The witness withdrew.)

Raj Narayan, Esq., Executive Engineer, United Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,403. (I.) **Methods of Recruitment.**—The superior posts in the Department are recruited in 5 ways:—

(*a*) by the appointment of Civil Engineers obtained from England,

(*b*) by the appointment of Royal Engineers,

(*c*) by the appointment of successful candidates obtained from the Indian Engineering Colleges,

(*d*) by the appointment to the permanent establishment of Temporary Engineers, howsoever secured, and

(*e*) by the promotion of the Upper Subordinates.

Recruits from England are appointed by a Selection Committee at the India Office without *competition*. The annual recruitment from this source during recent years has averaged 30. It was 15 (from the Cooper's Hill) in 1887. The annual recruitment in India from the Indian Engineering Colleges is only 9. It was also 9 in 1887. This shows that during the last quarter-century the recruitment in India has remained absolutely unchanged, while the English recruitment has *doubled*, in spite of the recommendation of the Public Service Commission of 1886-87, to increase the Indian recruitment. The Commission recommended promotion of Upper Subordinates in *exceptional* cases only, but they are being *regularly* promoted in the ration of 5 to 9 of the directly recruited Indian College Engineers, and claim 36 per cent. of the total Indian recruitment.

The number of Engineer officers in these provinces is 123. It was 126 in 1887. The present number consists of 80 English recruits against only 63 in 1887, and of 43 Indian recruits against as many as 63 in 1887. This is the reverse of what was recommended by the Commission. The number of Royal Engineer officers in this period has practically stood stationary.

The annual recruitment in these provinces is about 3 to 4 from England, and only *one* from Rurki. During this year 5 of the former have been recruited against *one* of the latter. This is not as it should be. In fact it should be the reverse. If this is not possible at present, there should be at least 50 per cent. recruitment from the Indian Colleges. There are special points of qualification, due to place of recruitment, in both, and a service consisting of more than 50 per cent. of the Indian recruitment, cannot but produce not only safe but better results, and will be acceptable to all, for some time to come.

The present method of selection for recruitment in England is faulty and should be discarded for a system of *open* and *unrestricted* competition in which there should be *no racial limit* whatsoever. The Indian Engineering Colleges which are at present *needlessly* closed to Europeans non-resident in India —for no European was ever likely to come to study here, *only to get less pay, leave and pension*—should now be freely thrown open to them, to ensure equal chances to all, and to stimulate further competition, when the Imperial service is again thrown open to students of these colleges.

The subjects of the competitive examination for recruitment in England should at least include all vernacular dialects which should be compulsory for all. The other subjects should be the text books of Indian Civil Engineering, *e.g.*, Irrigation, Architecture, &c., which have been specially compiled in India for Indian standards and practices. The existing system of open competition for admission into the Rurki College, and for admission from the college into the service, is excellent. Those who win the guaranteed appointments after 3 years' hard labour in the college and the 4th year of training on Indian Works, are the pick of Indian intellect, representing all classes of His Majesty's loyal subjects.

Temporary Engineers should not be taken permanently in the same service in which the pick of the Indian and European Colleges are appointed by competition.

Upper Subordinates should not be promoted into this service. They should form a new Provincial service with better status and prospects than they have at present and there might be "listed" or "prize" posts in the cadre of the Indian Engineer service, which may be offered to the most deserving of them.

The number of Engineers, recruited in India up till now, totals about 200, of which half are Indians and half are Anglo-Indians, residing in India. With the abolition of the present Provincial service, the number of both Europeans and Anglo-Indians will probably increase, as many of them will be able to come to India and learn the profession in the country in which it has to be practised, and those who have now to go to England to quality for entering the Imperial service will doubtless remain here. There will thus be no danger of the department being swamped with Indians.

71,404. (II.) **Systems of Training and Probation.**—(A) *Training.*—India, like every other country in the world, has distinctive climatic peculiarities and engineering requirements of its own; *e.g.*, the rainfall here being so precarious, the Irrigation Branch of Engineering has received special attention. The magnitude of our Public works and their success in operation are recognized throughout the world, and the degree of proficiency to which Irrigation Science has been brought in India is not surpassed in any other country. M. Chikoff, a Russian Chief Engineer, is now touring through India to study its canal systems with a view to introduce them in Russian territories. It was from India that several Canal Engineers were sent to Egypt to train rivers and introduce canal irrigation there. It was from India again that only the other day a band of canal Engineers have been sent to the Siam Government to introduce canal systems there. Similar remarks apply to the Architecture, Railways and Waterworks in India. Mr. C. S. R. Palmor, who is a Rurki Engineer, went to Australia where he rose to the Chief Engineer's rank, and was awarded Telford Medal, the blue ribbon, and the Telford Premium for writing papers on Water scheme and Harbour works.

Theory of Engineering in general and its practice in India are two distinct things. The former can be learnt anywhere but the latter must be learnt in India itself. The English recruits, on their arrival in India, are quite new to the country and know nothing about its peoples, languages, ways, and resources. The practice of Indian Engineering still remains to be learnt by them, before they are able to discharge their important duties *efficiently* and *independently*. Their practical training begins on the day of their landing, and most of them take several years to overcome these shortcomings. The average period thus required may be roughly put down at about 5 years. Theoretically in service, they are practically in the school of Indian Works for these years, drawing high scholarships in the form of pay.

The case of the Indian recruits is, however, different. They learn the two subjects side by side, both inside and outside of the class rooms, while for 3 years at the college, and again on works in progress, while undergoing the course of one year's practical training, before appointment to the Department. Specially selected books which refer to the science of Indian Engineering are also prescribed in the course of studies in these colleges, in addition to works on general Engineering. The Indian recruit is thus better fitted for his work immediately on appointment. The system of training in India is very satisfactory, and does not require any change for some time to come. But the system of training for Indian Engineering in England is very inadequate and should be wholly directed to ensure the efficient performance of duties required of an Engineer in India.

The competition in England for appointments in India must be real, the appointments offered in any year not being more than one-third of the number of candidates competing in that year.

(B) *Probation.*—The English recruits should be appointed on one year's probation. Any plea that this is unfair or will deter candidates from England, by reason of the risk of rejection, may be met by the provision of free return passages to rejected proba-

tioners. The Indian recruits should also be appointed on one year's probation. The present rule of sending two successful students,—one from those who win guaranteed appointments, and one from those who do not—to undergo practical training under two different officers, and to select the former if both prove fit, and the latter, only if the former proves unfit and the latter proves fit, is *extremely* unjust. Illustration—The guaranteed number of appointments in 1903, for the Rurki College—*Vide* Calendar for 1912, page 221—was five for the Civil Engineer class. Mr. Wazir Sahai stood 6th, out of a total number of 10 successful candidates of the year. One of the first five proved unfit in the year of training and was rejected. The vacancy thus caused was filled up by the appointment of one who was junior on the list to Mr. Wazir Sahai, simply because the latter did not happen to be posted to the same province to which his junior was fortunate to go. Mr. Wazir Sahai who was senior had equally proved his fitness, but his unjust exclusion was due to the existence of the above rule. His work is, however, so good that he has been kept as a Temporary Engineer for the last 10 years.

The pay during the probationary year for both the English and the Indian recruits should be equal and should equally count towards increments, leave and pension.

If unfavourable reports are received on the first year's work, a second year's trial should be given under a different officer before finally rejecting the probationer, and, in case of an imported Engineer before sending him back at State expense.

71,405. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—The conditions of service should be the same for officers recruited in India and obtained from England, for the Indian Engineer Service. This will remove the present discontent and increase the efficiency of the Department.

The present practice of rarely posting English recruits under Indian-trained Engineers should be discontinued. The former can *learn* better under the latter and more rapidly, if he cares to do so. A hollow sense of superiority should not be allowed to take root by this exclusion.

No officer should have his promotions or prospects in service affected by any report or series of reports, which have not been openly, and *in more important cases* judicially, enquired into. The rules lately published in this connection about His Majesty's Army officers, apply with equal, if not greater force, in the case of the Indian Engineer Service.

Temporary Engineers should be rarely employed, and if ever employed should not be given charge of Divisions, in which qualified Assistant Engineers would otherwise be officiating. Those who have already been employed for many years past should either be taken permanently in the service—on a separate list—or discharged.

The proposals, frequently made, for getting reports on seniors by juniors who may be working under them, or for giving Divisional charges by *selection* are calculated to be unfair to Indian-trained Engineers and should by no means be entertained, as the actual carrying out of the recommendations of the Commission is likely to gravitate, as in the past, in favour of Imported Engineers.

The table of precedence should be revised, so as to give Engineers a better official status.

The cadre of permanent Engineers should be revised more frequently than in the past.

The Indian Engineers should be distinguished from other services by the reserved and officially recognized use of the letters "I. E. S." This is already allowed in some departments, *e.g.*, I. C. S. for Indian Civil Service, I. M. S. for Indian Medical Service, and followed in Gazette Notifications.

The importance of this service to the prosperity of India should be more fully recognized by conferring more honours on its deserving members, than has been allowed in the past. Some time back, the Indians held ex-officio honours, viz., Khan Bahadur or Rai Bahadur for Executive Engineers and Khan Sahib or Rai Sahib for Assistant Engineers. This should be restored and a more equitable share of honours as compared with members of the Civil Service should be given to Engineers.

71,406. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—There is a difference in pay between the officers recruited in England and in India for doing the *same* work and bearing the *same* responsibilities, although both remain on the *same* list and are promoted *side by side* in order of seniority. The excess earned by the former, with compound interest at 4 per cent. per annum, under *normal* conditions amounts to as much as Rs. 1,69,748. Distinction is also made in Local allowances which are meant only for specific purposes, that is, as compensation for local disabilities, which exist equally for both classes of officers. The total excess, thus paid to officers obtained from England, *approximately* amounts to two hundred thousand rupees. This produces great resentment among the Indian-trained Engineers. To pay them less for no other reason than that they are Indians is against the highest principles of liberal statesmanship, and tends to demoralize them by intensifying the sense of subjection and reducing the sentiment of a common citizenship. The distinction should, therefore, be obliterated. On page 39 of the Historical Memorandum of the Engineer service of the Public Works Department supplied to me by the Chief Engineer, United Provinces, it is stated that "it is agreed that Engineers of the Imperial and Provincial services should be borne on the same list; but it is felt that the principle laid down in Article 85 of the Civil Service Regulations, is fair and equitable. There is no reason why India should pay the same for the native-born Engineers as the Secretary of State has to offer for selected English Engineers in order to induce them to serve in foreign and distant countries." This is a gross perversion of the meaning of Article 85, Civil Service Regulations. The rule is meant to apply to *both* Europeans and *Indians* alike and aims at preventing officers, specially Europeans, of the Indian Government from spending more time outside India than is absolutely necessary. Any Government can justly make a similar rule in its own country to save wasteful expenditure by its officers in getting detained abroad longer than necessary. If it is *literally* applied, an *Indian* deputed to or detained in Europe on special duty cannot get more than two-thirds of the salary which he would draw, were he on duty in India. This can, therefore, mean that one who serves outside his native land should not get more than two-thirds of what he gets in his native land. If applied to Europeans and Indians serving in India, it can mean that Europeans should get less if they are to serve in India, and Indians serving in India should get more. The Article requires a careful examination in the light of these remarks, before it can be taken as an authority for lesser pay in the case of Indian recruitment. The most important point to remember in this connection is, that the British Empire includes India within its large circle, *exactly* in the same way, as India includes its provinces within its boundaries, or Delhi its streets within its walls, or a family its children within its building, and no argument which tends to differentiate between wages of the subjects of the same King-Emperor for doing the *same* work *within* His Majesty's vast Empire, can be accepted as valid. Correctly speaking there can be no "Imported" or "Exported" officers serving under the same King, if they are His own subjects. If Indians or Englishmen are sent to serve under a foreign Government, Turkey for instance, they can certainly dictate terms, but not otherwise.

The new rule introduced in the reorganisation scheme of 1912, by which an officer cannot draw more than the minimum pay of an Executive Engineer, unless he holds charge of a Division or an equally important charge, will bear very hardly on some officers who may not, for the time being, be under the good grace of any Chief or Superintending Engineer and should be rescinded, except in the case of those officers who have been declared unfit for such charges, on account of faults proved by adequate enquiry. Executive Engineers who cannot be selected for promotion to administrative post for want of vacancy in the latter, should, if otherwise reported on as fully qualified, get special increments counting for pension to compensate them for error in recruitment.

The officers belonging to the Buildings and Roads Branch and the Irrigation Branch are borne on the same gradation list, but it is very difficult for Irrigation officers to get a transfer to the Buildings and Roads Branch, as none from the latter are found willing to exchange with the former, where, admittedly, the climate is malarious, society wanting and expenses on establishment double. As a compensation for this difference, a special allowance should be given to the Irrigation officers, on the following scale:—

Assistant Engineers ... Rs. 100 per mensem.
Executive Engineers ... Rs. 150 per mensem.

The scale of pay of the Indian Engineer service—consisting of both the European and the Indian recruits on equal pay—should be increased proportionately with other important services in India.

71,407. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—The conditions of leave of the Indian-trained Engineers should be the same as those of the English recruits. The existing distinction is invidious and should be removed. Great stress is laid on the importance of visiting works in foreign countries, and if equal chances, viz., equal pay and equal leave are refused to the Indian-trained Engineers, they are handicapped in competing with their European contemporaries in this respect, *which is not fair.*

It should be open to every officer to take all the privilege leave, which he has earned, at any time during his service. The existing rule that no privilege leave can be due in excess of three months at a time is unjustifiable, for once earned it is as much due as the officer's pay.

71,408. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—The conditions of pension of the Indian-trained and European-trained Engineers should be the same for both. Under the existing conditions an Indian-trained Chief Engineer will draw *equal* pay to, but *less* pension than, his European-trained confreres. He will further draw *less pension than his own subordinates recruited in England.* It is submitted that it is a universally established principle, that pensions are retiring provisions for specific services rendered to the State, and it is therefore unjust to create or maintain any distinction between persons who have rendered exactly the same services, nor is it expedient to give any cause of dissatisfaction to retired respectable Engineers, in the interests of promoting goodwill for the Government amongst the Indian people and classes generally.

71,409. **(VIIA.) Limitations in the Employment of Non Europeans.**—It is believed that the term "Non-Europeans" *in this head* excludes the Domiciled community in India. Unless expressly stated otherwise, the term has *so far* been used, in this memorandum, to *include* this community. Although the liberal policy *declared* emphatically and repeatedly by Government in the past, has been wholly directed to the further employment of Indians in the *higher* ranks of the service, the *actual practice* has been anything but satisfactory. The *advisers* of Government have always considered that the European element must largely preponderate and have arranged matters in such a way that the Indians have not been given a *fair trial* in the *administrative* grades. No limitations are allowed *in theory*, but Indians are excluded *in practice.* Not a single Indian has yet been tried as a Chief Engineer in these provinces, and an Indian *Christian* has only recently been given an *officiating* chance for the first time as a Superintending Engineer. Similar remarks apply to other provinces also. Rai Bahadurs Ganga Ram and Kanhya Lal, although admittedly superior to many European contemporaries were excluded from the highest rank, simply because they were Indians. Times are, however, changing, and evidently under *instruction* from higher authorities, Indians are now being a little better treated than before. Ten years back there were only a few Indian Executive Engineers in charge of Divisions, but now they are holding such charges more extensively, and *very satisfactorily*, although not as much as is due to them as their fair share. One-fourth of the total number of Divisions in the Buildings and Roads Branch, and one-third in the Irrigation Branch in these provinces are now in charge of Indians. The Chief Engineer of Behar and Orissa is an Indian, the Engineer-in-Chief on the E.B.S. Railway is an Indian, and there are some other Indian Superintending Engineers in other provinces of India. If this policy of justice and fair play continues with increased vigour, Indians will certainly justify the trust which is now being reposed in them.

The number of Engineers in India in 1887 was 1,015, of which only 86 were Indians. The total figures for the whole India have not been available to me. The Railway Branches, as a rule, are very conservative in this respect. On the N.W.R. there are only 10 Indians out of 204 officers in the Traffic, Loco., Engineer, and Accounts Branches, and only 5 Indian Engineers out of 73 Engineers. Excluding the Indian Railways, the figures by provinces are as follows:—

No.	Provinces.	Administrative Ranks.		Executive Engineers.		Assistant Engineers.		Total.
		Europeans.	Indians.	Europeans.	Indians.	Europeans.	Indians.	
1	Bengal	6	1	10	7	16	7	47
2	Bombay	8	1	26	17	39	12	103
3	Madras	9	—	36	11	25	12	93
4	Assam	2	—	8	1	11	1	23
5	Bihar and Orissa ...	7	—	8	8	14	9	46
6	Burma	10	1	39	—	38	—	88
7	Central Provinces ...	5	1	16	7	14	8	51
8	N. W. F. P.	2	—	28	—	7	—	37
9	Punjab	22	—	59	18	46	19	164
10	United Provinces ...	11	—	37	13	46	16	123
	Total	82	4	267	82	256	84	775

Total of Europeans = 605, of Indians = 170.
Indians = 22·5 per cent.

[Note:—If Railways are included, this percentage will fall considerably.]

This statement shows that the percentage of Indians is still very low and especially so in the administrative ranks. A greater pressure from higher authorities is evidently necessary to ensure their being tried on these posts. Considering that Indians have already proved successful in the Accounts, *e.g.*, Mr. Wagle, late Accountant-General, United Provinces; in the Postal, *e.g.*, Mr. Badshah, late Postmaster-General, United Provinces; and in the Public Works, *e.g.*, Rai Annanda Prasad, Sarkar Bahadur, B.C.E., Chief Engineer, Bihar and Orissa, it is no longer necessary or just to assume inferiority in other Indians and to condemn them without giving them a fair trial. Indians in other departments have even been given the highest ranks, such as High Court Judges and Members of Executive Councils, and have amply justified their appointment.

71,410. **(VIIB.) Working of the Existing System of Division of the Service into Imperial and Provincial.**—The Provincial service scheme has entirely failed and it should be abolished with the least possible delay. The alumni of the Indian Colleges should be restored to the superior service, to which they originally belonged, under the name of Indian Engineer Service.

71,411. **(VIII.) Relations of Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—There is a tendency among the Revenue officers to bring the Public Works officers under their control. This should be discouraged. The general qualifications of the two are nearly on a par and there will be loss of efficiency if the later are in the least subordinated to the former.

There is a great resentment in the department about putting its officers under the Accountant General in drawing salaries and travelling allowances. Up till last year, the Public Works officers used to disburse them direct by means of cheques drawn on treasuries, but now they have to go to the treasury for receiving payment. They draw cheques for payment to contractors, but they cannot draw cheques for paying themselves. This system does not hold in the Punjab. A case has recently occurred in which

the Accountant General deducted Rs. 100 from *an overseer's* salary for an item referring to some very old transaction, of which no details were given to him. The officer had great difficulty in maintaining himself. Delays of months and in some cases even of years and constant worry in getting obvious claims admitted have become a rule, with no useful purpose to the Government. This system should be discontinued. The Accounts Department should continue to do the audit work of the Public Works Department but should not be allowed to bring officers of the Public Works Department under its control in *other* respects.

An amalgamation scheme of the Public Works and Civil accounts has recently been introduced in these provinces, but not in the Punjab. It is felt that the previous system was more efficient for audit of Public Works Accounts, as the Public Works Examiner knew the working of this Department fully. The Accountant General cannot get time for this Department, and there is a tendency to ignore the details of accounts, which is extremely undesirable from considerations of economy.

71,412. (IX.) **Other Points.**—The revenues from this department alone have increased enormously during the last 20 years, but the expenditure on establishment averages 17½ per cent. only, whereas it should not be less than 21½ per cent. The saving of 4 per cent can advantageously be diverted to raising the pay of the Indian College Engineers. The consequent increase in efficiency will far more enhance the revenues and tend to considerable further economy.

Mr. Raj Narayan, called and examined.

71,413. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he was an Executive Engineer employed on the Ganges Canal in the United Provinces. He had been in the service for ten years, having been recruited from Rurki College. The views put forward in the written statement represented the general opinion of the Provincial officers in the United Provinces. He desired to abolish the distinction between Imperial and Provincial branches, and recruit the superior service with uniform conditions of pay, leave and pension. He suggested that 50 per cent. of the officers should be recruited in England and 50 per cent. in India. If such a proposal was carried out, he thought it would be acceptable to all. By "all" he meant all the Indians and Europeans domiciled in India. The Europeans would not be able to say that they had not a British element in the service, and the Indians would not be able to say they were not adequately represented. He would like to see his proposal take effect in the immediate future, and not to be carried out by gradual means. In addition to the recruitment of 50 per cent. in India to the Service, he would allow Indians to compete in England as well, just as he would allow Europeans to compete in India. He would like to include the vernaculars in the subjects for the competitive examinations in England. He did not think if vernaculars were included it would be giving preferential treatment to Indian candidates in the examination. There would be some English subjects also, which would equalise matters. It was true his scheme might involve more than 50 per cent. of Indians, assuming Indians were successful in England, and 50 per cent. were recruited from colleges in India, but Europeans would come to India as soon as they found they could be admitted there into the Imperial Service. If Government found there was an excess of one class over the other, the further recruitment of that particular class could be stopped at 50 per cent. It was a fact that Indian students learnt theoretical and practical engineering side by side. There were big works going on in the Rurki buildings, and a big canal was running near Rurki, and out of college hours, students took notes of such works. During the vacations it was also insisted upon that they must travel throughout India and see works in progress, and take notes of such works. 200 marks were allotted for notes on works in progress. Practical experience went on throughout the course.

71,414. He was of opinion that Indian trained engineers should get Imperial rates of pay, on the ground that officers doing the same work should be paid the same salary. He did not think any consideration should be given to an officer coming from Europe and serving in this country. He did not think the different conditions which might be supposed to obtain in India were any justification for a higher rate of pay. Indians were not employed in England in the Public Works Department, and Europeans were employed in India, evidently for the purpose of keeping up the British element. It was true he suggested in his written statement that an Irrigation officer should get an allowance of Rs. 100 and Rs. 150. He did so on the ground that such an officer was suffering from less happy conditions than his colleagues in the Buildings and Roads branch. He thought that statement was quite consistent with what he had just said with regard to Europeans. The two branches were quite distinct, although they had the same list. Promotions in the Irrigation branch to the administrative rank were made from among the Irrigation officers only. The witness's contention was that just as there was a differentiation between the Public Works and the Civil Service and the Medical Service, similarly there could also be a differentiation between the conditions holding in the Irrigation branch, and those holding in the Buildings and Roads branch.

71,415. He would employ in charges, which could not be filled by Assistants in the Imperial Service, upper subordinate officers, to whom he would give the titles of Deputy Engineers. There might be some difference in the work given to those officers as compared with that given to the Assistants. The Assistants might have charge of important sub-divisions, or remain on special construction, and under subordinates could hold ordinary sub-divisions. He would not suggest that the latter officers should rise beyond charge of sub-divisions except on listed posts; there must be superior officers over them, such as Executive Engineers. They could not do exactly the same work as Assistants. If there were any important charges, the Assistants could be sent to take charge of them, and officers of the newly promoted upper subordinate service could hold ordinary charges. Selections for sub-divisional charges would have to be at the discretion of the officer in charge of the Department.

71,416. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) Indians recruited direct would have been trained at the various Indian Engineering Colleges, or, it might be, at European Colleges. There would be no objection to the admission of Temporary Engineers in the proposed new service, because it would not be Imperial. He thought the proportion of directly recruited men as compared with the promoted men in this new service should be left to the discretion of the local Governments. Upper subordinate officers with the new status could, he thought, be trusted. Their education was far superior to that of most of the Deputy Collectors. The salary of the upper subordinates recruited in India started at Rs. 100 and rose to Rs. 500. He did not think there was any difficulty in the upper subordinate officers being trained in the same institution as the officers of the Imperial Service.

71,417. (*Mr. Gokhale.*) The witness thought the ideal arrangement would be to have no Europeans in the Service at all; and that if experts were required on any special occasion their pay should be charged to the work concerned.

71,418. Although Indians were as efficient as English officers, he thought it would be wise to have a certain European element in the Service on account of political considerations. Questioned as to what those political considerations were, the witness said that if a Service in which there had been a predominant European element, was suddenly bereft of that element, it would not look nice to the public, as being rather unfair to Europeans. He agreed there would be no danger to British rule by having the Service composed solely of Indians.

71,419. If the bulk of the appointments did go to Indians, he would still object to the scale of the salaries being lowered for the Imperial officers. The

public considered the status of a Department and of its officers according to the scale of pay. If the pay in the Engineering Department was Rs. 500, and in other Departments, because there were Europeans in them, it was Rs. 1,500, the former Department would be considered of very low class. He considered the pay should not be reduced.

71,420. (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness thought that highly educated Indians were attracted more to engineering than to the Provincial Civil Service (even although the latter started at Rs. 250 rising to Rs. 800, and the former from Rs. 100 to Rs. 500), because it was free from evil practices of nomination.

71,421. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The subjects of examination mentioned in the written statement were compulsory for all the students at Rurki. The mathematics which the witness himself had undertaken at Rurki included the Differential Calculus and the Integral Calculus. He did not think there was anything in the argument that the English trained engineer possessed a better mathematical foundation than the Indian trained engineer. He thought the Indian colleges trained to the same standard as English colleges. He had Indian friends who had had an education in some of the Engish Universities, and he thought they were well trained, but Indians trained in India were not inferior to them.

71,422. (*Mr. Madge.*) The witness said he was of opinion that the training at Rurki did not require to be improved at all at present. He was against any scheme for the institution of a single central college for all India, because it would involve a waste of public funds. A great deal of money had already been spent in establishing the four existing colleges. If a central college was established in one particular place it would be difficult for men in the other Provinces to come to it. He thought all the Indian colleges were up to the standard of Rurki, but said he had no personal knowledge of the former.

71,423. Temporary Engineers who had been appointed by Government without any educational qualifications, knew nothing of their work, but there were some valuable Temporary Engineers in the service. It depended upon the method of appointment. Speaking of his own Province, the witness thought those Temporary Engineers who had passed out from Rurki College would be quite fit for admittance into the new Provincial Service which he proposed.

71,424. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) He did not think it probable that even if the commercial development of India depended largely upon the introduction of foreign capital, the confidence of capitalists would be shaken if any sudden change were made in the control of the Engineering Department. Capitalists had in view the security of the whole of India and not any single Department, and therefore would not mind whether any particular Department was manned by Indians or by Europeans.

71,425. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) His argument in favour of paying the same salary to Europeans and Indians was based on the fact that they were all equally employed in the British Empire. He was not aware that the British Government paid a foreign service allowance to British officers in other services when they were sent on duty outside the British Islands, but so far as he knew no such allowance was paid anywhere within the British Empire.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Delhi, Tuesday, 18th November, 1913.

Present:

The Rt. Hon. the LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

The Earl of Ronaldshay, M.P.
Sir Murray Hammick, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
Sir Theodore Morison, K.C.I.E.
Sir Valentine Chirol.
Mahadev Bhaskar Chaubal, Esq., C.S.I.
Abdur Rahim, Esq.
Walter Culley Madge, Esq., C.I.E.
Frank George Sly, Esq., C.S.I.
Herbert Albert Laurens Fisher, Esq.
James Ramsay Macdonald, Esq., M.P.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

D. W. Aikman, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Punjab.
J. W. B. Loughran, Esq., Executive Engineer, Punjab.

R. R. Scott, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

M. Nethersole, Esq., Inspector-General of Irrigation, Public Works Department.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71426. (I.) **Methods of Recruitment.**—(*a*) *Imperial Service* (1) Speaking generally, the present method of recruitment is satisfactory, but I consider that the Institutions which have the privilege of nominating candidates for appointment by the Selection Committee should be such as ensure a College training as distinct from lecture training and whose degree is recognised by the Institute of Civil Engineers as equivalent to the Institute Examination for entrance to that body. My reason for this proposal is that I consider character and social qualifications as essential for satisfactory service by Europeans in India, and apart from the training in these qualifications which College-life affords, it is only in such Institutions that the Principals have adequate opportunities of making satisfactory selections with reference to these as apart from purely professional qualifications.

(2) I consider that an honours degree, as distinct from a pass degree, at such Institutions, should be an obligatory professional qualification.

(3) In addition, the candidate should be required to have at least one year's practical training on Works in Europe.

(4) I consider it desirable that retired officers of the Indian Service should form a majority of the Selection Committee.

(*b*) *Provincial Service.*—The present methods of recruitment through the Indian Engineering Colleges appear to me to be suitable. But there should be a constant effort to raise the standard of qualification.

71,427. (II.) **System of training and probation.**—Apart from the one year's practical experience which I have specified for the Imperial Engineers under paragraph 71,426 (3), I think that it would lead to efficiency and satisfaction if all engineers appointed from England were appointed in the first instance for two years on probation on the understanding that Government would pay for their return passage to England in the event of either party wishing to terminate the engagement at the end of this period, and, that such termination would be free from any implied slur on their professional qualifications. My reason for this suggestion is that it sometimes

happens that a young man on coming to India develops physical or other weakness which to some extent impair his efficiency for service in India: or he finds that he does not like the country. So short a period as two years would not be a serious break in the professional career of a man who might either elect to, or be required to, so terminate his service in India; while it would afford both parties an opportunity of determining whether the engagement might be made permanent with mutual satisfaction.

I would extend the period of probation for Provincial Engineers to two years on works in India and then give each man one year on works at Home with suitable allowances to cover his expenses.

71,428. (III.) **Conditions of service.**—These are generally satisfactory as provided for by the existing Code Rules subject to the remarks I have to make under other heads. I think it is very desirable to make the incremental salary dependent on good work, and not lapse into a mere matter of course. Full opportunity for explanation should be given any officer who is badly reported on by his immediate superior before the increment is withheld.

The rules as to retirement in the case of officers who are shown to be unfitted for further advancement should be strictly enforced, but on the other hand I think, personal allowances should be given to officers whose promotion is stopped by irregularities in past recruitment. I believe this principle has recently been admitted and given effect to in the case of the Indian Civil Service in the Punjab.

71,429. (IV.) **Conditions of salary.**—I consider that the scale of salaries is fair at present both for the Provincial and Imperial branches of the Department.

71,430. (V.) **Conditions of leave.**—I consider either that the limiting maxima of furlough pay should be raised to such amounts as may reasonably be expected to cover an officer's expenses on leave; or that an officer should be given the option of taking half the amount of furlough due to him on full pay with no maxima limits; or that the present restriction of privilege leave accumulation to three months should be extended to six months. My reasons for making these alternative suggestions may best be illustrated by my personal experience. I was obliged to take furlough under very strong medical advice in my eleventh year of service, although I could not afford it. I was married and had a small family. My furlough pay at Home amounted to only £56 a quarter and I returned to India at the end of my furlough £500 in debt. Owing to the financial difficulties in which this first furlough involved me I was unable to take furlough again for another 19 years. During this second period of furlough *i.e.*, in my 30th year of service I was unfortunate enough to incur unexpected expenses owing to the ill-health of my family, which compelled me to curtail the furlough, and once again I returned to India in debt from which I am not yet clear. I have no extravagant habits, and I consider that this actual experience of a European officer serving in India is one which requires very serious consideration as showing that the present facilities for taking necessary long leave are inadequate. It is true that the recent revision of the scales of pay will tend to make it easier, than it was for me, for younger men now in the Service to take long leave; but the limiting maxima from which I suffered still obtain, and I think it entirely in the interest of Government, apart from that of the Service, that the rules should be very carefully revised with a view to making the intention of the Furlough Rules a practical possibility.

71,431. (VI.) **Conditions of Pension.**—These compare unfavourably with the other professional services on a similar footing as to education and social qualifications. The members of the Public Works Department have for many years past been striving to obtain a sympathetic hearing from the Government of India, and the Secretary of State, with a view to being placed on an equal footing in this respect with other sister Services. They have been recently informed by the Government of India, and the Secretary of State, in the House of Parliament, has also stated, that this matter is under reference to the Public Services Commission. I most sincerely hope that the Commission will give it their sympathetic consideration as I am sure that in view of these official announcements any recommendations from them on this subject will carry great weight.

71,432. (VII.) **Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing division of service into the Provincial and Imperial.**—The remarks I have to make on this point apply equally to all Services as they are based on equitable principles which I consider should be strictly adhered to in regulating the recruitment for all services in India. The scale of pay for all the superior Services in India was fixed originally in consideration of the fact that the Services were at the time manned entirely by Europeans. Thus the scale of pay was fixed not for Indians serving in their own country but for Europeans serving in a foreign country. Consequently, if the scale of salaries as fixed for the superior Services in India be compared with the scale of salaries in any other country in which the Public Services are indigenous, they will be found to be comparatvely high. No native of any country will leave his own country to serve in a foreign country on the same rate of pay which would content him and be adequate remuneration if employed in his own country. This is a general principle which has only to be stated to be admitted as essentially logical. The avowed aim of the British Administration in India is gradually to educate and train Indians to take their proper place in the Public Services and the general administration of the country. But I consider that it is not only unnecessary but essentially wrong to admit Indians to the scale of salary which was fixed with reference not to the requirements of an Indian serving in his native country but to those of a European serving in a foreign country. India is not a rich country and cannot afford to pay its indigenous Service at the same rate of pay as it has had to pay its foreign Service. I consider for these reasons that it was an administrative error ever to admit Indians to the rates of pay for service in India which were fixed for Europeans. I believe that if this principle were enunciated authoritatively and observed rigorously it would be accepted as reasonable by all Indians. I believe that the difference of pay in the past has never been objected to except in so far as it has been regarded as an implied slur or mark of inferiority. My opinion as to this has been supported by many conversations which I have had on the subject with Indian gentlemen. For example, when the Public Works Department was divided into the Provincial and Imperial Branches the difference established was not only that of pay but also of the period of service required to qualify for promotion to the higher grades. I believe it was this implied slur or stigma of general inferiority, rather than the difference of pay, which caused the heart-burning and discontent which the matter evoked. This has now been put right so far as the Public Works Service is concerned, and the only difference now obtaining is the difference in pay. This I consider should be the case with all services; namely, one list for all men in the same Service, with Indians on a scale of pay fixed in consideration of the fact that they are serving in their own country, and Europeans on a higher scale of pay fixed in consideration of the fact that they are foreigners serving in a foreign country. It will perhaps be not out of place if I here indicate what apears to me a convenient and simple method of perpetuating this principle and rendering automatic any future revision of salaries such as may occasionally be necessary owing to the rise of prices and general standard of living. It will be remembered that when European salaries were fixed, the value of the rupee was two shillings, but there has been a serious depreciation in the intrinsic value of the salaries owing to the depreciation of silver, and general rise of prices during the last 30 years. The exchange value of the rupee is at present fixed by legislation as to minting at 1*s.* 4*d.* If all salaries both for Indian and European Branches of the same Service were the same in rupees and Europeans were paid in gold at the rate of two shillings to the rupee (which, it should be remembered, was the intention

at the time the scale of their salaries was fixed) the whole matter would be simplified and the European element in the Service would receive their allowance for foreign service in a form which would remove any suggestion of slur on the Indian element in the same Service. As to the numerical proportions to be fixed between the two classes, so far as the Public Works Department is concerned, it may be remarked that the proportion of Indians to Europeans in the Public Works Department was originally *nil*, as no Indians were qualified Engineers, but it has been steadily increasing. I consider it desirable in the interests of the country that for some time to come the European element in the Public Works Department should preponderate, but I do not suggest that the proportion should be definitely fixed for any long period. The British Government are pledged to increase the proportion of the indigenous element as it develops in all Services. Without questioning the wisdom and right of this policy, with which I entirely concur, I am very strongly of opinion that progress in this direction to be safe and healthy must be gradual.

71,433. **(VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—This is a somewhat delicate subject which I approach with diffidence. If officers of all branches of the Public Service in India would remember always that they are members of a body corporate and act always with a single eye to the public interest and with due regard to the prestige of the general administration, relations as between the different Services would be ideal. I think it may be said that the majority of officers in India have this point of view and that their conduct throughout their service tends to keep official relations cordial and efficient; but it cannot be denied that there are some officers in all Services whose point of view and conduct in their official relations with other Services do not conduce to this end. While recognising that the complete ideal I have indicated is probably unobtainable, it is nevertheless desirable. An important factor in striving to attain such an ideal consists in mutual encouragement and support on the part of all officers in their dealings with other Services in maintaining that sense of public responsibility and *esprit de corps* in all branches of the Public Services alike, which is essential to a high standard of duty and efficiency in the administration as a whole. I think it would tend to raise the status of officers of the Public Works Department and the general esteem in which they are held by officers in other Services if they were recognised as a Service and not as a department. A member of the Public Works Department may be either a Chief Engineer or a Works Foreman, the letters "P. W. D." do not necessarily indicate a defined and recognised position of public responsibility as do, for example, the letters "I. C. S.," "I. M. S." or "I. F. S." I think that the superior officers of the department should be recognised as belonging to a service which following the precedent set at the time the Royal Indian Engineering College was established might fitly be designated the Royal Indian Engineering Service. Another matter which I think indicates a lapse from the ideal I have referred to and improvement in which would assist towards the attainment of that ideal is the unequal distribution of honours bestowed in recognition of public service as demonstrated by the Honours Lists. This was recently referred to at some length in the Public Press and it is a matter which in my opinion might be put right by a revision of the procedure under which recommendation for such honours is now made.

71,434. **(IX.) Other points.** — I consider it very essential that the Public Works Cadre should be more frequently revised to meet the regularly expanding requirements of works. The shortage of permanent cadre in the past has led to a considerable influx of Temporary Engineers whose services, though temporary in name, have in fact been extended for very long periods. This can only lead to discontent and there is no obvious object to be gained by it, if temporary men are fairly paid, they cost no less than permanent men, and in all interests it is desirable that the permanent staff should be kept up to the numerical standard necessary to deal with permanent works and with the administration of an expanding department. There are a certain number of Temporary Engineers brought out on covenant for 5 years whose services are still retained. Many of them have the qualifications required in the case of Permanent Engineers and ripe Indian experience. I consider that both justice and efficiency would be met if such of these men who have been recommended for permanent employ are brought on to the cadre, fresh recruitment being regulated to admit of this. The present cadre is so ragged as to seniority owing to irregular recruitment in the past that this suggestion would also have the effect of evening it up and I very strongly recommend the case of these men to the notice of the Commission.

Mr. M. NETHERSOLE called and examined.

71,435. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he had occupied the position of Inspector-General of Irrigation since 1912. He was more or less a Consulting Engineer to Government for all Irrigation engineering construction and had very little to do with questions of establishment which were all dealt with by the Secretary.

71,436. The witness considered that the present method of recruitment in England was satisfactory, subject to the qualification that only collegiate institutions should have the privilege of nominating candidates for appointment by a selection committee, and he had in mind colleges where a residential training was possible. He admitted his suggestion might exclude very good colleges, but he was not sure that it would exclude the best. He laid great stress on the value of having men of character and social position in India, as great value was placed on these qualifications by the Indian themselves, a native very often saying that so and so was a *pucca* sahib while so and so was not. He would hardly carry his suggestion so far as to exclude such non-residential colleges as Glasgow, Manchester, and London.

71,437. The witness said he did not know the present process by which names came before the selection committee, but he believed certain Colleges were asked to nominate men who had the necessary professional qualifications and the men appeared before the selection committee. He considered that an Honours Degree as distinct from a Pass Degree should be an essential qualification. There were some Honours men now in the service. His point of view was that the very best men were required, and something higher than the average should be aimed at. He considered that candidates should have at least one year's practical training, and he believed Western practice was of great value for Eastern conditions, especially in the knowledge of Engineering plant, such as excavators, steam navvies, pumping plant, &c., of which there was a good deal in England.

71,438. With regard to selection, the witness considered that it was necessary to have on the selection committee a man who knew Indian conditions and for that purpose retired officers of the Indian Service would be available. He would give the recruits a two years' probation in India, and he did not think that would have any deterrent effect upon recruitment, because a man who had a proper sense of his own importance and some self-respect would not be afraid to come, and may good men would be induced to come knowing that they could go back within a short time without any damage to their ties at home if they found the country did not suit them. He thought the only alternative to the present system was open competition after nomination, as in the Navy; but he considered the present system was quite good if properly carried out.

71,439. The witness did not object to the reservation to Indians of 10 per cent. of the vacancies filled by the Secretary of State, as he thought it was wise to encourage Indians to go to England for the purpose of obtaining technical education. They came out to India with broader minds and were likely to make more useful officers. He would not, however, give them the same pay as the Europeans when they returned.

71,440. The witness said he had had a good deal of experience in examining Engineering candidates in India and in every case he had found it necessary to mark them up. Having given the marks which he considered the papers deserved he found himself "spinning" probably 80 per cent. of the candidates. In England he had never had to make that liberal allowance. The students did not fail in mathematics and technique, but in the practical application of them. He had nothing to complain about with regard to the syllabus of instruction at Rurki College except that on the whole perhaps it was a little too wide; he did not think that for general engineering such a wide range of subjects was required. In the questions set for the examination he would concentrate more on practical knowledge.

71,441. With regard to the division of the service into Imperial and Provincial Branches, the witness pointed out that in the old days, when Rurki was first started, there was no Indian who desired to become an Engineer, the early recruitment to Rurki being entirely from Europeans and especially from among the sons of Army Officers who had inducements held out to them. Of recent years Rurki had ceased to be a European College in any sense of the word and now consisted almost entirely of Indians. It was quite necessary in the old days to give the Europeans from Rurki the same pay and emoluments as were given to other Engineers in the service. Rurki now did not attract the same class of Europeans. He was of opinion that it was possible to break down the distinction between the two branches and still maintain the differences of pay. So far as the superior grades of the Engineering service were concerned there was no necessity for any distinction whatsoever except in the matter of pay.

71,442. The witness did not think it was suitable to train candidates for the Provincial and Subordinate branches in the same classes at college. He thought it would be impracticable to have only one College, possibly Rurki, as a training College for the Superior Service, and he did not think there was any necessity for it. A Southern Indian would much prefer a College in his own Province. If the standard of all the Colleges was raised he did not see why it should be more expensive than concentrating in a single College. The best means of raising the standard was to improve the teaching staff, and that would only be a small item of expenditure.

71,443. The witness was in favour of sending the Indian recruited officers to works in England for a year in much the same way as the Cooper's Hill men used to be sent to works for practical training after they had left the College. A man who had had a training in India and two years' experience of works in India would be able to go to England and assimilate much useful information in connection with plant and mechanical appliances, which information he could afterwards apply in India. From the social point of view he thought it would do no harm, and by the time the man had had a certain amount of practical training in India he would be in a position to make his own way; he would have had a great deal of intercourse with English people before he went and would know how to get along with them.

71,444. The witness did not think it was possible entirely to stop the employment of temporary Engineers. His great objection to the present system was that it had been carried too far in the past. A more frequent revision of the permanent cadre would tend to reduce the number of temporary Engineers. He was acquainted with one or two men with seventeen or eighteen continuous years' service as temporary Engineers and he believed that was a mistake. He would fill such positions by increasing the permanent cadre and as far as possible reserve the temporary Engineer for specific work. There were of course difficulties in the way, as in a large country like India it was impossible exactly to forecast the programme of works. A famine, for instance, would upset the calculations altogether.

71,445. The witness did not agree that there was work in the Service which was rather more important than that performed by the subordinate Service, but of less importance than that performed by the trained Assistant; neither did he agree that a class of Deputy Engineers might be created for such work. He thought the temporary Engineer ought to be paid something in excess of the pay of permanent men or given a bonus at the termination of his service. If a man was only engaged for three years he did not think six months' notice would be necessary.

71,446. It was possible that a certain number of ex-Covenanted Civil Engineers might be absorbed into the permanent list; he knew two such officers who were quite qualified for it. They came in under a belief that they were going to be taken on permanently and one of them was definitely promised an appointment. It would be unfair to put them in at the bottom of the list with regard to pay and seniority, but they would naturally come a little below men of similar age on the permanent list.

71,447. With reference to his scheme for paying the Imperial Officer in sterling at an exchange value of 2*s.* per rupee, the witness explained that the effect of his scheme would be to give the officer from Europe a rate of pay 50 per cent. higher than that of the indigenous officer, and he thought that was about what ought to be paid. It had been more or less already recognised in the code rules as being a fair proportion. There should be no distinction of status as between men employed on the same work, but there should be a definite distinction in the shape of a foreign service allowance to those officers who came from Europe. He thought that would meet with reasonable approval. The only discontent had arisen from the fact that the principle had not been observed. Once the principle was adhered to he thought the whole of India would accept it as reasonable.

71,448. With regard to leave, the witness believed the present grievances might be met by allowing commutation of furlough into full pay subject to some restriction as to the amount to be commuted, and he believed a concession of this kind would be gladly accepted by the Services generally.

71,449. As to pension, the witness considered that retirement after twenty years' service was rather premature. The rule on this point was only introduced to correct an artificial block in promotion, and was intended to be simply a temporary specific.

71,450 (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness said he wished to see the present rule as to candidates having at least one year's practical training on works in England made compulsory.

71,451. With reference to probation, he did not think there would be any slur on a man who was discharged, if the intention were made quite clear in the original agreement.

71,452. The witness thought it would be a good thing on the whole to retain the opportunities now offered to Indians being recruited in England. If a Native of India wished to go to England to get an Engineering education he would give him the chance of doing so and of getting an appointment. He thought, however, it was a mistake to have a prescribed percentage. The present rule was mandatory, and if the number of qualified men was not sufficient, it was necessary to take in inferior men to make up the 10 per cent.

71,453. On the subject of the training of Indians, he was of opinion that each man should be given one year's training on works in England, he did not think that engineering firms would refuse to take Indians as apprentices if they were paid for doing so. When men left Cooper's Hill they were able to get into engineering works he believed with the payment of a premium by the India Office, and he was under the impression that the Engineers in charge of works were glad to get the men because they were a source of pocket money to them.

71,454. Under the present system a large number of temporary Engineers were required to take charge of sub-divisions. If the number of temporary Engineers was reduced and the permanent cadre increased he was not certain that it would be necessary to make the division much smaller than it was at present and to reduce the proportion of sub-divisions to divisions in order to prevent a block in promotion. He would make the number of Assistant Engineers

larger than the number of Executive Engineers, and would correct any tendency to block by raising the qualifying limit for advancement to the grade of Executive Engineer. At present the period was ten or eleven years. He would rather have a permanent servant filling a sub-division than a temporary servant as it was more satisfactory to the Government and to the Service. He would allow the Assistant Engineer to rise to higher pay and ask him to serve longer as an Assistant Engineer than he did now.

71,455. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) With regard to his proposal to confine recruitment to residential Universities, the witness said he did not want to cut out the modern Universities at all, and if his suggestion tended in that direction he should modify it. He had always understood that both Cambridge and Oxford were asked to nominate two men and Dublin and other Colleges asked to nominate one man, and that from those nominations appointments were made; but it was quite possible he had been misinformed as to the process.

71,456. With reference to the ex-covenanted Engineers, the witness said the Local Governments were asked by the Government of India to nominate men for transfer to the permanent cadre and the Government of India received rather more nominations than they could conveniently deal with and an arbitrary selection was made. The Government cut out some of the senior men because to bring them in it would be necessary to split up a year lower down. There was no ground for saying there was selection on merit. One man was recommended over and over again by the officers under whom he had worked but he was not taken in.

71,457. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness agreed as a matter of principle that if possible the burden on Indian Revenues should be lessened by trying to get efficient work done by an indigenous agency, and he said he would like to see this result brought about. He thought the efforts of Government to turn out efficient Engineers from local Engineering Institutions had to a certain extent succeeded and the outcome of these efforts was to be seen in the proportion of Indians now in the service. Progress had been very rapid indeed. The Indians began with nothing and had now reached very nearly 30 per cent. Under the new rules only a certain number of places were reserved for men trained in Indian Colleges, and he considered it desirable in the interests of the country for some time to come that the European element in the Public Works Department should preponderate. He did not suggest that the proportions should be definitely fixed for any long period, and there ought to be a gradual increasing proportion of Indians in the Service.

71,458. That up to the present Indians had not attained to the grade of Superintending Engineers and chief grades of Superintending Engineer and Chief Engineer was due to the fact that in the Punjab there had not yet been sufficient time. There were Indian Superintending Engineers in Bengal and Madras, and he thought the proportion was good considering the number of Indians who had qualified by service for promotion to these posts. It was impossible to say what percentage of Indians employed in the Department rose to be Superintending Engineers and Chief Engineers. A man had to serve about twenty-three years before reaching administrative rank and there were very few Indians of that standing yet. They would rise ultimately.

71,459. With regard to the pay of Assistant Engineers and Executive Engineers, he thought it was extremely liberal comparing it with what an Engineer working in England received. The witness agreed that an Indian had certain expenses which did not fall upon the European, as for instance in connection with marriage ceremonies and family affairs, and the fact that when he entered the Service he was generally a married man. But even taking those things into consideration he still thought the salary paid to a Provincial Engineer was quite liberal; he did not, however, regard the Engineering Service as one which could be in any sense regarded as leading to wealth.

71,460. As to pensions, the witness agreed that the manner in which a retired European lived in England did not much concern the Indian public, but the Indian public would judge the status of an Indian in the Service by the scale on which he lived after retirement.

77,461. The witness thought the expression "*pucca* sahib" used by Indians generally was synonymous with the word "gentleman," and he was of opinion that residence at an Engineering College was of great value in giving a man that position. He could not say if there was much difference socially between the men who used to go to Cooper's Hill College and the men who now attended such Universities as Glasgow and Manchester.

71,462. The witness said he acted as Examiner at Rurki College from 1901 to 1903 but he was not cognizant of present developments at Rurki.

71,463. (*Mr. Sly.*) With regard to the suggestion that pay should be fixed according to the market value of the candidate whom it was desired to attract to the Service, the witness said it was impossible to recruit the Public Services on a basis of market values. The market value of an Engineer varied enormously. He thought an Indian ought to be obtained for Service in India on a lower rate af pay than a European and by basing the difference of pay on the value of the rupee he thought any suggestion of a slur on the Indian would be avoided. The witness did not attach great importance to the suggestion that had been made to the Commission that the two classes of Chief Engineer should be amalgamated and that there should be one consolidated rate of pay without allowances for all Chief Engineers. He pointed out, however, that there were not two grades of Commissioners in the Indian Civil Service and when an officer reached that standing in the Service one rate of pay should be fixed.

71,464. With reference to pensions, the witness said the comparison he made between the Public Works Department and other Departments had reference chiefly to the Medical Service and the Royal Engineers, the pensions in the Public Works Department not being so good as in those two Services. He knew of no special reason why the rate as to compulsory retirement at fifty-five should be retained, and he did not think the Department would object to the age limit being raised to fifty-eight if it was adhered to. The rule was introduced as a temporary expedient to remedy a block in promotion and had been kept in force ever since.

71,465. The witness was not in favour of a study leave, believing that the present rules were quite sufficient to enable a man to study while on ordinary leave. The leave rules of the Provincial Engineers were loss liberal than those of the Imperial Service, and he would be inclined to extend the period of leave in order that Provincial Engineers might go to England.

71,466. He would not consider study leave as a satisfactory substitute for a year's practical work in England for Provincial Engineers. He would rather give a man an insight into European practice early in his service. After a man had had two years' practical work in India he would be quite capable of assimilating anything likely to be of use to him that he might see in Europe. Afterwards, if he desired to continue his investigations into any special subject, opportunities might be granted to him.

71,467. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The witness was satisfied with the men who were coming out under the present system and saw no reason to consider them inferior to the men who came out under the old system. It was, however, necessary to qualify that by saying that when it was known in England that the prospects of the Department were very bad there was a considerable falling-off in the class of men entering Cooper's Hill in the latter stages of its existence. He thought that if the revision of salaries had been brought in before Cooper's Hill was closed there would have been no falling-off. He thought present rates of pay were attracting quite as good a class of men as would have been obtained at Cooper's Hill. Under the present system a great number of very good Engineering Colleges were drawn upon, but personally he attached considerable value to a collegiate training.

71,468. The witness considered that the employment of a great number of Temporary Engineers constituted an evil and led to discontent. From the point of view of the Public Service it did not make for economy, because a discontented man was apt to be careless and there was a loss of efficiency. There was a distinct difference in the level of efficiency as between the temporary Engineer and the permanent Engineer. A number of temporary Engineers were employed simply because no one else could be obtained, though there were some good men amongst them whom he would like to keep. It was quite obvious that if necessity existed for keeping on a temporary man for seventeen or twenty years it was better that he should have definite prospects.

71,469. The witness explained that estimates for new work were prepared by an Executive Engineer, or in the case of an important work, by a special survey and estimating division, and were usually checked by a Superintending Engineer; they were sent to the Chief Engineer, who looked into them with the aid of his personal Assistant. Men were often hauled over the coals for exceeding estimates, but personally he thought it was a good rather than a bad sign because it showed that the estimates were pretty tight in the beginning, and given careful estimating economy of execution was entirely a matter for the man in charge of the work and the officer supervising him. A good Assistant Engineer would make his maintenance grant go twice as far as a careless one. Although it was not so apparent, he believed efficiency in the Department would show much more as economy in maintenance than in construction. If an officer was economical in the carrying out of works this would be taken into consideration in the matter of promotion, and to that extent there was an incentive to economy, though perhaps not quite so much as there should be. If a man was always spending his repairs grant up to the hilt and his division was in a slipshod order he would be reported upon, and the fact that another man was saving 25 per cent. of his repairs grant and had his division in good order would always be mentioned in the reports.

71,470. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) With regard to his proposals for terminating a man's service at the end of his probationary period, the witness said he did not think that if his proposal were put in force the percentage of rejections would be high. It was very advisable to get rid of unsuitable men early in their career, even if the number so rejected amounted to 5 per cent., and he thought the percentage might well be as high as 5 per cent. having regard to the fact that the retirement would be from two causes, a man not liking India and India not liking a man.

71,471. With regard to the pay of Indian-recruited members of the Service, the witness did not agree that the European staff had set a standard of living which every member of the Service was expected to reach. In the matter of travelling expenses a European would require four bullock carts to carry his belongings about and he had a large number of servants and horses. The Indian would perhaps only have half that number of bullock carts, as his establishment was altogether on a different scale, and he would have a smaller number of servants and horses. Many Indians had taken to living according to European customs but even they could always live cheaper than a European. The witness was not surprised that in the evidence before the Commission so much emphasis was laid upon differences of pay, but he thought if it was once and for all made known to Indian Officers that they were not going to get the same pay as Europeans there would be no discontent on that score. He did not think such discontent would survive a recommendation on the part of the Commission not to put them on equal pay with Europeans.

71,472. The witness said that if the cadre was increased as suggested he would not continue to draw Temporary Engineers from the same sources as they had been drawn from hitherto. At present the Department was often obliged to engage and to keep on a Temporary Engineer who was not quite up to standard, because no other man could be found. A certain number of men were taken each year from Rurki for the Provincial appointments, and from among the unsuccessful students were drawn some of the temporary Engineers, the other going into private employment or posts under district boards. If the cadre was enlarged the best of the temporary Engineers would naturally be absorbed in it, and subsequently the annual recruitment from Rurki and England would be increased. That would mean that certain men would be obtained from Rurki who now went into district and private Engineering. The larger recruitment from India would necessarily mean a lower average for a little time to come. The witness agreed that in the course of a year or two a man who passed out fifth from Rurki might probably be as good as the man who had passed out first. Supposing it was necessary to recruit five or six more Indians every year he was inclined to think that the average efficiency of the Service would be lowered.

71,473. The witness said that opportunity for private practice was now occasionally given. Should a Municipality want Engineering advice in connection with any municipal business and an Engineer obtained permission from the Head of his Department to do the work he was granted a small honorarium, but that only applied to public work. He did not think there was much scope for private work of that character. He considered the present rules met all requirements. He would not encourage outside work because if it became more common men would be looking after private work to the detriment of their official work.

71,474. (*Mr. Madge.*) With regard to the opportunities for seeing Engineering work in England and India respectively, he thought that Mr. Bagley had rather overlooked the mechanical side of Engineering which had developed to a very much greater extent in England than in India, and for that branch of Engineering it was easier to get a training in England. It was, however, a fact that an English Engineer coming out to India was of little use until he had learned the ways of the country, the method of obtaining material, and the power of handling workmen. There was no possibility of giving practical training except by employment on works, and he thought the training at Rurki included visits to Engineering works in India. Generally speaking he though the staff at Rurki was a bit weak for all the subjects that had to be covered, but the appliances at the College were up to date and he had no suggestions to offer for improvement.

71,475. He was glad to hear that hostels were being organised in connection with the Scottish Colleges as it showed that the authorities of the Colleges were of his opinion as to the value of residence. He would not exclude any good Engineering College. His suggestion was that the supervision which was possible in a residential college was of great use and advantage to men in their later career.

71,476. With regard to pay, what he proposed was in effect to give all officers doing the same work the same pay and in addition to pay an exile allowance to Europeans, the allowance being assessed on the basis of a gold standard instead of a silver standard.

71,477. With regard to furlough, the witness considered that furlough depended on considerations of climate. The European was given more furlough than the Indian because, serving in a foreign country, he was supposed to require more change on medical grounds. It was, however, no use giving the European Engineer more leave when he could not afford to take the leave now due to him. The furlough allowance was absolutely inadequate: he himself had never been able to take anything like the furlough he required. The furlough pay should be made adequate to cover the expenses of living in England. He would willingly serve in England on two-thirds of the pay he was drawing in India.

71,478. The witness did not think that the standard of efficiency would be raised by concentrating all the resource and effort in a Central College. A big country like India required to be treated provincially. The establishment of a Central College for the whole of India would not be looked upon with favour by Madras or Burma and he believed Bengal also would object. With reference to the question of preventing blocks in promotion, the witness was of opinion that any increase in the cadre without raising the age limit for the promotion of Assistants would undoubtedly lead to a block, but if the age limit was

raised the cadre could be increased from below without accentuating the chances of a block.

71,479. (*Mr. Arthur Rahim.*) The witness did not agree that it was more or less natural that men should feel a grievance because they were being paid less than some of the men with whom they were working. He thought it was a generally accepted fact that imported labour was always paid more than indigenous labour, and he believed Japan paid the men from England more than they paid their own people in connection with the development of their Navy and other matters. It was hardly likely, for instance, that Mr. Bose, the Chemist, would go from Calcutta to Japan on the same pay as satisfied him in Calcutta. It was true, that illustration related to an expert, but so far as India was concerned the Engineering profession must be regarded as a profession of experts.

71,480. The witness agreed that the standard of living had been rising very rapidly amongst Indians and particularly amongst those who had received an education in England.

71,481. He thought the recruitment of 10 per cent. of Indians in England was illogical but he could not admit that it was illogical that the other 90 per cent. should be British subjects of European descent. What he thought was illogical was that the Secretary of State was bound to recruit 10 per cent. of Indians even though there were not sufficient qualified men to make up the number.

71,482. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) Members of the Public Works Department had considerable responsibility in matters of expenditure and supervision of contracts and naturally might be subjected to considerable temptations. Temporary Engineers, not being permanently connected with the Service, might show a tendency to succumb to temptations more than those on the permanent staff, and there had been practical examples of it. With regard to the standard of honesty in the Service, it might be taken as being common in a great measure to both Indians and British members of the Service, but he thought there was a large difference in character which had not yet been eradicated. He did not think India was yet up to the same level of moral character as was shown by the European Service. He would not put the matter only on the ground of honesty, as he thought it was also a matter of temperament or national genius. The European was a practical man; the Indian was more or less metaphysical. A few years ago there was not such a thing as an engineer in India, and he did not think Indians could point to any Engineering Works which had been carried out except under Western guidance. The old Indian Irrigation Works were extremely inefficient.

71,483. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) With regard to the possibility of having an open competition in Engineering subjects, the witness said the range was wider in an Engineering examination than in the examination for the Indian Civil Service, but he thought it was quite possible to have a fair examination in Engineering. It was true that some men would be better qualified in Electricity and others better qualified in Hydraulics, but he did not think that would be an objection. At Rurki and Cooper's Hill in the old days the final examination depended to a considerable extent on the marks accumulated during the College course.

71,484. With reference to the suggestion that Public Works Officers got into trouble by having a large balance of money at the end of the year, the witness stated that as a rule a sub-division was a fairly large charge and it was impossible to keep payments right up to date. A man knew that if he did not spend his money within the year it would lapse and that he might have to pay for work already done from the next year's grant. That led either to sub-divisional officers making hasty payments or to Executive Engineers asking why money was spent. He did not know why the Government should object to money lapsing into the common fund except that it rather upset the estimated opening balance. A knowledge of that tendency placed the District Engineers to some extent in the hands of contractors, and subordinates would very often keep back bills, and that all tended to a want of economy. The objections to any practical solution of the difficulty had generally come from the financial side.

71,485. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Desiring to ask questions upon the evidence given by the witness in regard to the moral character of Indians, the Chairman ruled that the further evidence of the witness should be taken *in camera*.

The following evidence was taken in Camera.

71,486. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) With regard to a question whether Indian Engineers in the Service had a lower standard of honesty than English Engineers, the witness said it was rather a difficult question to answer, but it might be said that speaking generally the old principle of *dasturi* in India was a national and general custom. All salaries under Native administrations were very low and inadequate and a large part of a man's remuneration was obtained by what might be called irregular means. The system of taking a percentage from contractors was extremely common right through the subordinate Service, and as many of the Engineers had come from the same class as the subordinates he considered they had a greater tendency to continue the system of taking percentages on their payments than English Engineers. That was not a hypothetical statement as it was made on the strength of more than thirty years' actual knowledge and experience of Native officers, superior as well as subordinate. He had caught two men in the position of Assistant Engineers and they had been punished. He thought in both cases the men had risen from the subordinate ranks and they were both in sub-divisional charges. He had had no cases amongst those who had been appointed direct to the Provincial Service. He was not speaking of men appointed direct from Rurki. Both the cases he had mentioned were of men officiating in the Provincial Service after having risen from the ranks. He had said nothing about the general reputation of Indians in the Public Works Service but referred only to general character .

71,487. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness said that it had never come to his knowledge that a commission had been charged on plant or machinery ordered from England. In fact it was quite impossible so far as the Indian Service was concerned because the ordering was always done by the Director General of Stores in the Secretary of State's office. There was no such thing as an Indian Engineer or a Public Works Engineer ordering direct from England and communicating direct with the manufacturer.

(The witness withdrew).

F. C. ROSE, ESQ., Superintending Engineer, Punjab.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department (being a Report proposed by a Committee representing the Imperial Engineers of the Public Works Department, Punjab, which was held at Lahore on 31st March and 1st April,* 1913).

The opinions and recommendations of the Committee are recorded below:—

71,488. (I.) **Method of Recruitment.** — Recruits from the Public Works Department should in future be appointed from England and India. The majority of the Committee considered that the proportion between the two classes should be 70 per cent. from England and 30 per cent. from India, the latter to include recruits from all sources in India. A small minority considered that no proportion should be fixed.

The majority of the Committee agreed that there should be a Central Training College for men to be recruited from England. If this be impossible, the

* The Committee consisted of the following members:—Mr. W. E. T. Bennett, C.S.I., Chief Engineer. Colonel R. S. Maclagan, C.B., C.S.I., Chief Engineer. Messrs. D. W. Aikman, C.I.E.; A. E. Orr, F. C. Rose, W. F. Holms, L. F. Robertson, F. W. Carne, A. S. Montgomery, A. J. Wadley C. J. Floyd, C. B. Williams, F. T. Bates, and H. E. Pellereau, Superintending Engineers, and Mr. R. C. Wilson, Executive Engineer (for Mr. R. C. Laurie, Superintending Engineer. Mr. Bennett and Colonel Maclagan did not vote. The opinions and recommendations recorded in this report are those of the other members of Committee. Mr. Bennett's and Colonel Maclagan's opinion will be found in another report.

present system of selection should be continued, but there should be men with recent Indian experience on the Selection Board.

Men appointed in India should be taken from Indian Engineering Colleges, but candidates should be nominated for Government appointments by a Selection Board prior to entrance into the College.

The permanent cadre should be revised to actual requirements, and the number of temporary Engineers employed should be reduced to a minimum.

Royal Engineers of more than five years' service should not as a rule be appointed to the Department, and on entering should be placed with due regard to seniority.

Specially selected temporary Engineers and Upper Subordinates may be appointed to the Engineering Provincial Establishment in exceptional cases.

The majority of the Committee was of opinion that, of the men appointed in India, 25 per cent. of the appointments should be reserved for statutory natives of India. A minority was of opinion that there should be no fixed percentage. In cases of exceptional merit men may be transferred from the Provincial to the Imperial Service.

71,489. (II.) **System of Training and Probation.**—The Committee was of opinion that after appointment, whether in England or in India, the men should be kept on probation in India for a certain period. As to the length of this probationary period opinions varied from one to five years. Some members were of opinion that if a Central Training College could be established in England, no probationary period would be necessary.

71,490. (III.) **Conditions of Service.**—The Committee was unanimous in considering that the present rules limiting the salary of officers to Rs. 800 in the case of an Imperial and to Rs. 535 in that of a Provincial Engineer, unless in executive charge, should be abolished, and considered that if an officer be reported as fitted for executive charge, he should continue to draw his annual increments. The Committee also considered that executive officers who are recommended as fit for administrative charge, but whose promotion to such rank is blocked by want of vacancies in the cadre, should continue to draw annual increments at the present scale up to a limit of Rs. 1,500 or Rs. 1,000 for the Imperial and Provincial Services, respectively.

The Committee was unanimous in considering that the 55 years' rule should be rigidly enforced, and that in view of the increased cost of living and transport, the travelling allowance rules should be revised and a more liberal scale introduced.

71,491. (IV.) **Conditions of Salary.**—The Committee was of opinion that, owing to the increased cost of living in India, the present salaries do not attract a sufficiently good class of men, and also recorded its opinion that as the money expended in salaries is small in comparison with the total expenditure on works, the recruitment of the very best class of men obtainable would, notwithstanding a small increase in salaries, result in a substantial saving to the State.

It was also of opinion that there should be only two classes of Superintending Engineers on Rs. 1,750 and Rs. 2,000, respectively, and one of Chief Engineer on Rs. 3,000, as those officers are promoted by rigid selection.

The Committee was also of opinion that the proportion at present fixed between the salaries of the Provincial and Imperial Services is correct.

71,492. (V.) **Conditions of Leave.**—The Committee was of opinion:—(*a*) that the restrictions in articles 232 to 236, Civil Service Regulations, on the combination of different kinds of leave should be removed;

(*b*) That the restrictions under article 308, Civil Service Regulations, on the grant (otherwise than on medical certificate) of furlough earned by an officer should also be removed;

(*c*) That a leave ledger system is desirable under which all leave earned by an officer in accordance with the general rules would be entered to his credit, and he would be allowed to draw upon such credit at any time Government could conveniently spare his services;

(*d*) That the restrictions in article 251, Civil Service Regulations, limiting the period of privilege leave to three months should be removed;

(*e*) That the rule laid down in article 299, Civil Service Regulations limiting the amount of furlough and special leave with allowances to six years should be abolished;

(*f*) That periods of furlough which are usually on half-pay should be commutable to shorter leave of absence on a proportionately higher leave allowance;

(*g*) That the first furlough may be taken after six instead of eight years' service;

(*h*) That article 826, Civil Service Regulations, should be abrogated and an officer about to retire should be permitted to take any privilege leave due to him immediately or at any time prior to the date of his retirement;

(*i*) That the leave allowances sanctioned for officers of the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers subject to the Civil Leave Rules should be extended to the Public Works Department Engineer; and

(*j*) That the above recommendations should apply in their entirety to both the Provincial and Imperial Services.

71,493. (VI.) **Conditions of Pension.**—The Committee was unanimously of opinion that the scale of pensions asked for in the memorials repeatedly submitted during late years by the Imperial Service of the Public Works Department is the minimum which should in equity be granted them, and wished to prominently record its opinion that the enormous increase in the cost of living both in this country and at home since the present scale was fixed renders it incumbent on Government to consider without loss of time the very reasonable requests which have been made.

A copy of the most recent memorial is attached* and the attention of the Royal Commission is earnestly invited thereto, as well as to a letter received from the Government of India, a copy of which accompanies, and which clearly shows that the question of pension will be considered on the report of the Royal Commission.

The Committee also desired to invite attention to the fact that the material wealth and prosperity which India now enjoys has been largely built up by the labours of the Public Works Department Engineer who has so far received no adequate recompense, and who is still compelled to retire on a pension which has, through the increased cost of living, now become a mere subsistence allowance.

71,494. (VII.) **Such limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans and working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—Under this head the Committee merely wish to add to what has already been recorded in paragraph 71,488 (*Method of Recruitment*). It suggested that of the men appointed in England 10 per cent. should be Indians and of the men appointed in India 75 per cent. should be of the same nationality. This is exhibited in the table below:—

Total appointments 100—

(A.) Appointed in England	... ...	70
(B.) Appointed in India	... ...	30

Out of (A) 7 appointments to be reserved for Indians and the balance for non-Indians. Out of (B) 23 appointments to be reserved for Indians and the balance, *viz.*, 7 for statutory Natives of India.

71,495. (VIII.) **Relations of the service with Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The Committee was unanimously of opinion that no officer of the Public Works Department should, under any circumstances whatever, be called upon to serve under the orders of any Divisional or District Civil Officer who is not a professional engineer and that no one, not an Engineer by profession, should ever be appointed to the posts of Chief Engineer or Secretary, Public Works Department.

71,496. (IX.) **Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—The Committee was of opinion—

(*a*) That the Public Works Department should be designated a "Service."

* Appendix XIII. (Memorial of 1912).

(*b*) That study leave should be more freely granted as in the case of the Indian Medical Service.

(*c*) Permission to accept fees for outside professional work should be given more freely.

(*d*) That the Government should seriously consider the instituting of a Widow and Orphans Fund, and

(*e*) That the question of invalid pensions should be reconsidered with a view to improvement.

Minority Note by Messrs. D. W. Aikman, W. F. Holms, F. Bates, R. E. Purves, and C. J. Floyd.

71,497. (1) While agreeing generally with the corporate opinion of the majority of the Superintering Engineers (see paragraphs 71,488–17,496) which sat in Lahore in conference on 31st March 1913 and following dates, a small minority consisting of the undersigned felt so strongly that a mistake would be made if the present division of the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial was maintained, that they desire to record briefly a Note of Dissent with their reasons.

(2) To this minority it seemed that, while recognizing that possibly Government might be able to secure the services of recruits of the same class as now fill the ranks of the Provincial Service at a smaller rate of salary than recruits of the stamp which come from England, the benefits of having the officers of an important professional service treated alike in every respect as to pay, pension and leave were so great that the small direct extra cost to the tax-payer would be more than recouped indirectly by the increased efficiency of the Department.

(3) Among other causes of the present want of efficiency are great and natural discontent among the Provincial Engineers, which sometimes manifests itself in ill-feeling towards their better-paid Imperial brethren, and a complete absence of departmental *esprit de corps* and cordiality among all ranks. It is thought that these and other factors, all tending to inefficiency, will have less force if the department is not divided into two main classes of permanent men as now, and all invidious distinctions be removed with a view to making all its officers equally satisfied with the conditions they serve under and proud of the service to which they belong.

(4) Lest objections be raised to the small direct extra cost of the suggested amalgamation, it may not be out of place to emphasize the fact, well known to every experienced engineer in the world, that a capable man can save his employers his salary and often many times his salary throughout his service. This is equally true of men who are largely engaged on revenue work in addition to their professional duties as are many of the Punjab Irrigation Engineers.

(5) Bearing in mind then the great importance, both financialy and politically, of aiming at an extremely high standard of efficiency, it is suggested that a sufficiently long period of probation to test thoroughly the qualities of the recruit, from whatever source he comes, be imposed before he is finally accepted as a permanent engineer. But if during his probation it be clear that the candidate is unsuitable, his services should be immediately and without hesitation dispensed with, alike in his own and Government interest.

(6) Final selection or rejection should be preferably made by a board rather than by an individual.

(7) The Provincial Service, if retained, should be filled only by promoted Upper Subordinates, who being admittedly, socially and educationally inferior could have no possible grievance at being put to a lower scale of pay.

**Written Statement of the Views of the Provincial Service Engineers.*

71,498. The Provincial Engineers agree generally with the Written Statement put in by the Imperial Engineers† except in so far as their opinion affects the principle that there should be one service only. The Provincial Engineers are unanimous that there should be only one service with no distinction of pay, leave rules, pension or allowances between the men appointed in England and India. The Provincial Service Scheme has been a failure, as it has created much discontent and has destroyed the *esprit de corps* that should exist in the service and without which true efficiency cannot be assured. The scheme was introduced as an experimental measure for seven years (*vide* resolution No. 2523 G., dated 28th September 1893, paragraph 10, page 5), and should have been abandoned long ago. The principle in the Public Works Department should be that men doing the same work should get the same pay according to length of approved service. The present possible condition that a Provincial, Executive or Administrative Officer may get a smaller salary than men working under him is an impossible one and can only lead to discontent and misconception.

71,499. (I.) **Method of Recruitment.**—Recruitment should be 50 per cent. in England and 50 per cent. in India, and there should be no distinction in either country in nationality, creed or colour. There should be open competition in England, three candidates being nominated to compete for each appointment. In India there should be selection prior to admission to the Indian Engineering Colleges for Government appointments. The same proportion of three candidates for each appointment should be maintained.

71,500. (II.) **System of Training and Probation.**—They agree entirely with the opinon expressed in the Imperial Engineers' statement.

71,501. (III.) **Conditions of Service.**—The Provincial Engineers agree to the principle that increments should be continued, but there should be no distinction in pay.

71,502. (IV.) **Conditions of Salary.**—Agree, except that there should be only one service and one scale of salaries for all.

71,503. (V.)–(VI) **Conditions of Leave and Pension.**—Agree.

71,504. (VII.) **Such Limitations as may Exist in the Employment of Non-Europeans, and the Working of the Existing Division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—There should be only one service and no fixed proportion of appointments of different nationalities.

71,505. (VIII.) **Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and Other Services, and (IX.) Other Points.**—Agree.

Note by the Chief Engineers, Buildings and Roads and Irrigation Branches, Public Works Department, Punjab, on the Corporate Report of the Departmental Committee held in Lahore on the 31st March and 1st April* 1913†.

71,506. (I.) **Methods of Recruitment.**—The present sources of recruitment to the Indian Public Works Department are the following:—

(*i*) selection by the Secretary of State from the open market in England;

(*ii*) from Engineering Colleges in India;

(*iii*) from the Royal Engineer Corps;

(*iv*) from the Upper Subordinate Establishment of the Public Works Department in India;

(*v*) from the open market in India;

and the Chief Engineers accept all the recommendations made under this head by the Committee, subject to their further remarks under head VII.

71,507. (II.) **System of Training and Probation.**—The Chief Engineers agree with the Committee that a period of probation for all recruits to the Department would be desirable and advantageous to the best interests of the service.

71,508. (III.)–(VI.) **Conditions of Service, Salary, Leave, and Pension, (VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services,**

* This statement was signed by Messrs. Baij Nath, M. S. Dhody, and J. W. B. Loughran.

† This is included as paragraphs 71,488-96 *ante*.

* This note was signed by Messrs. W. E. T. Bennett and F. E. Guzther, and Col. R. S. Maclagan.

† The Report is included as paragraphs 71,488-96 *ante*.

(IX.) **Other Points.**—The Chief Engineers see no reason to differ from the conclusions arrived at by the Committee under each of the above heads, and, if it is decided to maintain the Provincial Service, accept them.

71,509. (VII.) **Such Limitations as may Exist in the Employment of Non-Europeans, and the Working of the Existing System of Division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—The Chief Engineers agree with the opinion of the majority that recruitment, as between Europeans and Indians should be fixed by a definite scale, and concur in the proposal that 70 per cent. of the total strength of the Department be recruited from England, and 30 per cent. from India.

They also accept the recommendation that of the recruits selected annually in England, not more than 10 per cent. should be Indians.

As regards recruitment in India, the Chief Engineers are unanimously of opinion that 60 per cent. of the annual recruits from this source should be reserved for Indians, and 40 per cent. for statutory natives of India.

Recruitment to the Department would thus amount to—

—	From England.	From India.	Total.
Of Europeans ...	63	12	75
Of Indians	7	18	25

And this is the proportion which, in the opinion of the Chief Engineers, is essential to the efficiency of the Department and which should be aimed at in recruiting Indians for the service.

With regard to the second reference under this head, the Chief Engineers favour the Minority Report, attached to that of the Committee, and entirely agree with it: they are of opinion that if the existing division of the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial Services is maintained, the efficiency of the Department as a whole will be impaired.

Written statement relating to the Public Works Department, being a Memorandum by Mr. F. C. Rose.

71,510. (I.) **Methods of Recruitment.**—There is a strong wish among most of the members of the Imperial Service that a residential College, on the lines of the late Royal Indian Engineering College, Coopers Hill, should be established in England, from which Imperial Engineers for the Public Works and Railway Departments would be recruited. They consider that the training which such a College would afford would foster an *esprit-de-corps* which is not to be anticipated among men recruited in the open market, and that this spirit and the qualities which it engenders are of the utmost value to the individual, to the Department and to Government. Students would then be kept under close observation for a considerable period, and there would be less likelihood of men unsuited to the needs of India being appointed than if recruitment is made in the open market.

Assuming then that recruitment by selection, in accordance with the present method, must necessarily be maintained, they urge that at least 50 per cent. of the members forming the Selection Committee should be senior officers of the Public Works and Railway Departments, either on the active or retired lists, as it is felt that the intimate knowledge of these Departments and their requirements possessed by such officers would be of much value in assisting the Committee in their selection of the right class of man.

71,511. (II.) **Training and Probation.**—*Training.*—It is suggested that it should be made a condition of appointment, that recruits should have had at least one year's practical experience on Engineering Works in the British Isles, in addition to an adequate theoretical training.

Probation.—Opinions differ as to the necessity of a probationary period of service in India. While some members of the Imperial Service consider that an officer should be permanently appointed to the Department from the commencement of his service, others consider that it would tend to make the service more efficient if a probationary period of three years for both Imperial and Provincial services were insisted on. At the end of the period of probation if an officer were considered unsuitable, it is suggested that his services be dispensed with and if recruited in England his return passage paid. Officers considered suitable would be permanently appointed and would count their service for pay, pension, &c., from the commencement of the probationary period. The usual annual increment would be paid to officers on probation until their suitability or otherwise was determined. The period of probation appears to be the more necessary if the conditions of present recruitment are continued. The Selection Committee have only a short interview in which to judge the candidates' personal character and traits, and it is possible that recruits may be admitted whose temperament is totally unfitted for their work in this country, and it is unfair to Government and the Service that such men should be permanently kept on.

71,512. (III.) **Conditions of Service.**—It is urged that the cadre of the permanent Engineers should be more frequently revised than has been the case in the past. It is advisable that the number of Permanent Engineers should more closely accord with the number of permanent appointments, and that less reliance be placed upon making up deficiencies by the employment of Temporary Engineers. In support of this suggestion attention is invited to the following extract from the Report of the Irrigation Commission of 1901, which, although recorded in connection with the Irrigation Branch, applies equally to all Branches. "*Paragraph* 306.—We trust, therefore, that the great importance of providing an adequate staff of Engineers for the maintenance and management of the larger irrigation works may be steadily borne in mind whenever the revision of the establishment scale is under consideration, and that it may not be supposed that temporary establishments only are required, which can be discharged or reduced when works are brought to completion. Canal management is as important a part of the duties of the Public Works Department as canal construction, and we may add that success in the design and construction of new works depends to a great extent on the management of those which have been completed."

The conditions under which Royal Engineers are drafted into the Public Works Department have affected adversely the position and prospects of a large number of Civil Engineers. Royal Engineers brought in are usually credited with extra departmental service to such an extent as to give them departmental seniority over Civil Engineers who are senior to them in age, and of many years' standing in the Department. The effect on a Civil Engineer thus superseded is utterly disheartening; if senior, his promotion to administrative rank is retarded, or he may even be prevented from ever reaching administrative rank, and, if junior, it may result in delaying him from being placed in a Divisional charge. Whatever form it may take, the result is to subject him at one time or another to a heavy pecuniary penalty. It is recognised that it is necessary in the interest of Government that employment should be found for Royal Engineers in the Department, but it is strongly urged that in justice the appointments should be made in such a manner as not to impair the prospects of Civil Engineers of the same age already serving in the Departments. It is suggested that Royal Engineers should, like Civil Engineers, join the Department before attaining 25 years of age and that the present system, whereby senior Royal Engineers are appointed to the Department, thus superseding Civil Engineers, who by length of service have acquired a certain right to their position on the list, should be abandoned.

Similarly it is urged that if Government transfer any Temporary Engineers now serving in the Department to the permanent scale it should be done in such a way as to safeguard the prospects of officers already on that scale. Future appointments of Temporary Engineers should only be made on the specific understanding that the holders of the same will not under any circumstances be brought on to the permanent scale.

Article 649 of the Civil Service Regulations which provides for the compulsory retirement of Civil

Engineers, who on attaining the age of fifty years have not been promoted to the rank of Superintending Engineer, should, it is considered, be more rigidly enforced in the case of officers, who on reaching that age are reported as not qualified for promotion to the rank of Superintending Engineer.

In paragraph 80, Volume 1, of the Public Works Department Code, the principle is laid down, that promotion to the administrative ranks should be by a system of selection as opposed to that of seniority. This principle should be more closely followed than at present.

It is urged that no extension of service should be given to any officer beyond the limit laid down in the Civil Service Regulations, and that it ought to be a recognized principle that Government should observe its own regulations as strictly as its own officers are expected to observe them. Recent extensions of service to certain officers beyond the age of fifty-five did seriously affect the pay, position and general prospects of a number of officers of the Department, besides creating a feeling of distrust between junior and senior officers.

71,513. (IV.) **Conditions of Salary.**—In 1908 the scale of pay of the Public Works Department was reorganized and placed on an incremental basis, but at the same time the exchange compensation formerly given to officers was withdrawn. The nett increase in actual emoluments was not commensurate with the increased cost of living in India, which has been so marked a feature of the last decade, and it is felt that the question of pay requires further consideration, and that the pay of the Department should be such as to secure the recruitment of the very best class of men available. The increase in salaries would thereby result in a substantial saving to the State by more efficient service. There is probably no other service in India where inefficiency is so expensive as in the Public Works Department, and it is strongly urged that by the recruitment of the very best material economy in the design and execution of work is secured. It will be readily admitted that an engineer with powers of organization, initiation and invention will save his employers yearly sums which would many times cover his salary.

The following cases of individual hardship which may arise owing to irregularity of recruitment are brought to notice, and suggestions put forward for their mitigation:—

i. Under the reorganization scheme of 1908 it is ruled that an officer may not draw more pay than Rs. 800 per month unless he is in charge of a division, or in a charge which in the opinion of the Local Government is of equal importance. This is unjust to an officer who, though fully qualified, does not obtain a divisional charge simply because there is no vacancy for him. It is strongly urged that the rule should be amended to the effect that an officer of the Imperial Service reported as fit to hold a divisional charge, should continue to receive the ordinary increments laid down in the scale, irrespective of his being in actual divisional charge.

ii. Under the reorganization scheme, Executive Engineers attain their maximum pay of Rs. 1,250 per mensem after 19 years' service. It is urged that an Executive Engineer, if considered qualified for promotion to Superintending Engineer's rank, should continue to draw further annual increments until such time as he is promoted to administrative rank up to a limit of Rs. 1,400.

It is also considered that there should be only two classes of Superintending Engineers on Rs. 1,750 and on Rs. 2,000, respectively, as these officers are promoted by rigid selection.

The present division of the rank of Chief Engineer into two classes, and the variation of local allowances as Secretary to a Local Government, gives rise to the anomaly that a Chief Engineer may be drawing less emoluments than a Chief Engineer junior to him in service in another province, although the work and responsibilities attached to all such posts are exactly similar. The pay of a first class Chief Engineer is generally equal to that of a Commissioner of a division, and whereas the area, over which the latter exercises control, constitutes only a small portion of a Province, the responsibility of the former extends over a whole Province. The number of Chief Engineerships throughout the whole of India is small, and with the exception of the post of Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department and that of Inspector-General of Irrigation they are the only highly paid posts to which an officer of the Public Works Department can hope to attain. On the other hand, there are a number of Commissionerships in each Province in addition to many other high offices, both with Local Governments and with the Government of India, which fall to the lot of officers of the Indian Civil Service. Having regard to these facts it is not considered too much to urge, that there should be only one class of Chief Engineer, and that the salary attached to the appointment should be Rs. 3,000 per mensem irrespective of whether a Secretaryship to a Local Government goes with the appointment or not. In this event the local allowance of Rs. 250 or Rs. 150 a month, according to whether a Chief Engineer is a Secretary to a Local Government or Local Administration, might be withdrawn.

For similar reasons as in the foregoing, it is considered that the duties and responsibilities ataching to the post of Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department, which appointment is invariably held by an officer specially selected from among Chief Engineers and usually of much longer service than any other Secretary to the Government of India, warrant the appointment being paid at the same rate as Secretaries in the Home, Finance, and Commerce and Industry Departments, *viz.*, Rs. 4,000 per mensem.

71,514. (V). **Conditions of Leave.**—*Furlough.*—The amount of furlough, which Imperial Officers of the Public Works Department appointed in England can earn is generally considered sufficient. The rules governing the grant of furlough are practically identical with those which apply to the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers subject to Civil leave rules, except in the most important particular of leave allowances. In the case of officers of the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers under Civil leave rules, furlough allowances are subject, if paid at the Home Treasury, to a minimum limit of £500 per annum, or the salary last drawn, whichever is less, and to a maximum limit of £1,000 per annum, whereas for Civil Engineer Officers of the Public Works Department there is no minimum limit and the maximum has been fixed at £800 per annum. The present furlough allowances permissible to Imperial Civil Engineers are as follows:—

Years of Completed Service.	Maximum Furlough Pay.	Years of Completed Service.	Maximum Furlough Pay.
	£		£
8	279	17	472½
9	297	18	495
10	316½	19	517½
11	327½	20	540
12	360	21	555
13	382½	22	562½
14	405	3 years as Superintending Engineer, 3rd grade.	675
15	427½	3 years as Superintending Engineer, 2nd grade.	787½
16	450	Thereafter	800

As long ago as 1870, in Despatch No. 43 P.W., dated 28th March, the Government of India said—"Section 16. With reference to paragraph 4 of your Grace's despatch under reply, we may remark that we have already recommended the equalization of the pay of the Military Branches of the Department, and we are gratified to find this proof that Her Majesty's Government are likely to receive that proposal favourably. On this point we only add that we shall be glad to see some plan adopted by which the furlough allowances of Civil Engineers shall be equalized with those of Military Officers in the Public Works Department and, so far as practicable, the advantages of pension also." This hope has been reiterated many times by the Government of India and by different Secretaries of State since the date of that despatch.

It is, however, a hope that remains unrealized up to the present day, since a Royal Engineer in the Public Works Department, with 8 years' service to his credit, is entitled to almost double the furlough allowances of a Civil Engineer Officer doing exactly the same class of work and having the same service in the Department. A Civil Engineer is obliged to complete 18 years' service before he can claim an allowance approaching that which a Royal Engineer is entitled to after 8 years' service.

The present allowances are so inadequate that a large majority of officers cannot avail themselves of the furlough due to them, even though the state of their health urgently demands that they should do so. That such is the case is assuredly not in the best interests of the general administration. The question of leave allowances is raised in the last paragraph of the Memorials recently submitted by officers of these Departments; copies of which are attached to this Memorandum as Appendices 1 and 2.* The reply given to the Memorialists by the Government of India was that—" .....Pensions and leave are subjects of reference to the Public Services Commission, and as no doubt the Commission will inquire into these matters and submit recommendations, the Government of India consider that no useful purpose will be served by considering the prayers of the memorialists at this stage."†

In these circumstances it is confidently hoped that the Royal Commission will be able to recommend that the leave allowances sanctioned for officers of the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers subject to civil leave rules, may be made applicable to Imperial Civil Engineer Officers of the Public Works. There is no valid reason why they should receive less favourable treatment than the other officers named. It is pointed out that feeling on this question is very strong, and that there is great discontent regarding the inadequacy of leave allowances.

It is urged that where the allowances are drawn in India they should be paid in the equivalent in rupees, at fifteen rupees to the pound sterling.

Grant of Furlough.—Furlough earned by an officer should be granted at any time after the completion of eight years' service, subject to the exigencies of the service, unless the applicant has returned within eighteen months from privilege leave covering a period of three months.

Special Leave.—The existing rules regarding the grant of special leave require no alterations, but the allowances should be the same as in the case of furlough.

Privilege Leave.—Under the present rules an officer can earn privilege leave to the extent of one calendar month for every eleven complete calendar months of duty, and such leave is cumulative up to a period of three months only. In the case of officers who have accumulated the full period it frequently happens that the exigencies of the public service prevent their being granted privilege leave when they desire it, and this leads to the leave lapsing through no fault of their own. It would in a measure mitigate against this loss of leave on full pay which an officer has fairly earned, if the cumulative period were extended from three to six months.

An officer should be allowed to avail himself of all privilege leave due to him immediately prior to retirement, and be permitted to retire from the service at the end of his leave, without having to return to duty as he is now obliged to do. This concession has already been made where privilege leave is combined with other leave, and its extension to privilege leave, alone, besides removing a legitimate grievance among officers of the Department, would lead to much less administrative inconvenience than is now the case.

Study Leave.—Modern Civil Engineering is a highly specialized profession and progress in the methods of construction is very rapid. In view of the vast undertakings of the Government of India in the Public Works Department, it is essential for efficiency and economy, that the Engineering Staff of the Department should keep themselves abreast of modern engineering practice. Engineers can only accomplish this by visiting and studying works of special interest in progress in different parts of the world. That the importance of this is recognised by other nationalities is instanced by the number of engineers who are commissioned by their respective Governments or private employers, to visit works in India, in order to study Indian methods. The majority of Civil Engineers serving in the Department who wish to visit works in the British Isles and other countries, have to do so as private individuals, and entirely at their own expense unless they are placed on deputation, or are specially permitted to visit certain works while on leave, permission in this case usually being given only when Government require special information regarding a particular aspect of a project. In the latter case certain travelling and other expenses are allowed, but the time spent in the visits counts against the officer's period of leave. It is suggested that officers of the Public Works Department should be encouraged to visit works outside India, and that they should be provided with every facility for doing so. Either new rules should be introduced to admit of these facilities being granted, or there should be a much more liberal interpretation of the existing rules regarding the placing of an officer on deputation. The following instance of study leave obtaining in another professional service is cited:—In the Indian Medical Service study leave is granted in England up to one year out of total service in addition to furlough, for the purpose of allowing an officer to study any particular aspect of his profession which he may desire. During this period he receives furlough pay and lodging allowance amounting from four to eight shillings per day.

71,515. **(VI.) Conditions of Pensions.**—The greatest grievance of Civil Engineer officers of the Public Works Departments and one which is most sorely felt is the totally inadequate retiring pension to which they become entitled under the existing rules. Many efforts have been made, spread over a period of forty years or more, to obtain amelioration in this respect. Both the Government of India and different Secretaries of State have long recognized that all was not well, and new rules and conditions have been introduced to improve matters, but the net result has been that the present pensions are actually less than they were 40 years ago, when the qualifications demanded from men joining the service were not as high as they are now and when the cost of living was considerably less. A short history of the Public Works Department pension rules is attached to this note*. Numerous memorials on this subject have been submitted to the Government of India and H.M. Secretary of State during the last 6 years by officers of the Department. Copies of the most recent are attached.† The first memorials were submitted in 1907, but the petitioners were favoured with no reply up to August 1912 when they were informed by the Government of India in their letter No. 942-E., dated 30th August 1912, that no decision could be arrived at pending the receipt of the report of the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India. It is to the Royal Commission therefore that the Civil Engineer Officers now look for redress of this long standing grievance and it is strongly and respectfully urged that the scale of pensions prayed for in the memorials of 1912-13†, is the least which can in equity be recommended.

Further, that as this grievance was brought prominently to the notice of the Government of India, in the memorials of 1907-08 to which they vouchsafed no reply, and as in the meantime a number of officers affected have been placed on the retired list and many more will probably be called upon to retire before a decision is arrived at, any improvements made in the scale of pensions should have retrospective effect, at least from the year 1908.

Prior to 1884, invalid pensions granted to Civil Engineer Officers of the Public Works Department on the Imperial List were governed by Article 474 of the Civil Service Regulations; this Article also governed the pensions of all officers belonging to the Un-

* These appear in Appendix XIII.

† Government of India's letter P. W. D. 1399—1408 E., dated July 23rd, 1913—not reprinted.

* A copy is given as Annexure V to the evidence of Mr. W. S. Dorman (*vide* page 146).

† These are printed in Appendix XIII.

covenanted Services as then termed. In Lord Kimberley's Despatch of 1838* a new scale was introduced for Imperial Engineers and Telegraph Officers, with a view to ameliorating their conditions of service; this scale is covered by Article 641 of the Civil Service Regulations. Under this Article the scale has been increased from $\frac{10}{60}$ths of average salary for 10 years' completed service, $\frac{11}{60}$ths for 11 years, and so on, to $\frac{20}{60}$ths for ten years, $\frac{21}{60}$ths for 11 years and so on, but at the same time the maxima limits have been reduced from those allowed by Article 474. How this rule brought in with the object of improving conditions in certain Services adversely affects officers at the present time, and how much better off an invalided engineer would have been under Civil Service Regulations, Article 474, is clearly shown from a comparison of the columns in the table below:—

Years of completed service.	Civil Service Regulations, Article 641.		Civil Service Regulations, Article 474.	
	Amount calculated on a percentage basis.	Fixed maximum.	Amount calculated on a percentage basis.	Fixed maximum.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
10	20/60 2,813	1,000	10/60 1,406	2,000
11	21/60 3,150	1,400	11/60 1,650	2,200
12	22/60 3,520	1,800	12/60 1,920	2,400
13	23/60 3,910	2,200	13/60 2,210	2,600
14	24/60 4,320	2,600	14/60 2,520	2,800
15	25/60 4,750	3,000	15/60 2,850	3,000
16	26/60 5,200	3,000	16/60 3,200	3,200
17	27/60 5,670	3,000	17/60 3,570	3,400
18	28/60 6,160	3,000	18/60 3,960	3,600
19	29/60 6,670	3,000	19/60 4,370	3,800
20	30/60 7,200	4,000	20/60 4,800	4,000

It is a decided anomaly that officers of other services coming under Civil Service Regulations, Article 474, and drawing the same pay as an Engineer, should, if invalided, be entitled to a higher pension after 10, 11, 12, 13, 16, 17, 18 and 19 years' completed service and to a less pension after 14 or 15 years' service. It is urged, therefore, that to remove the anomalies pointed out, and to make Article 641 of real benefit to Civil Engineer Officers now serving in the Department, that the maxima limits should be at least the same as those fixed according to Article 474.

There is a strong wish among the Imperial Engineers that there should be one set of leave and pension rules for all Civil Engineer Officers on the Imperial List, irrespective of the source from which they were recruited. Such differentiations as still exist should, it is considered, be abolished.

Family Pension Fund.—Unlike the Indian Civil Service and the Military Services in India, there is no official Family Pension Fund for the Public Works Department. The emoluments of officers in this Department are not sufficient to admit of their making adequate provision for their families should they die in harness. The knowledge that they are unable to make such provision is a constant source of anxiety to many officers who are entirely dependent on their salary, and whose duties constantly take them into situations, which are prejudicial to health. They also have the additional anxiety of knowing that their pensions are purely personal and cease with their death. There is a strong desire, therefore, that means may be found whereby an officer may be aided in making suitable provision against the event of his death for the members of his family dependent upon him. Pension has been officially defined as deferred remuneration, which means that a certain portion of the salary which would have been paid to an officer, had there been no pension attached to his appointment, is kept back to provide for a pension on retirement. This view is corroborated by the fact that when an officer is transferred on Foreign Service he is made to contribute towards the cost of his pension at the rate of one-sixth of the pay he would have received had he remained in the service of the Government of India. It may be presumed, therefore, that an officer only receives six-sevenths of the pay he would have received had there been no pension to provide for, and that one-seventh is kept back by Government as the officer's contribution towards his pension fund. If the officer had the option of investing with a private Insurance Company the amount assumed to be retained by Government to provide for an annuity, he could probably so arrange the terms that a portion of his annuity would be assured to his widow or other member of his family dependent upon him, should his death take place within a certain number of years from the date his annuity fell due, with the additional security that his family would be covered against the risk of his death, should it take place during the time he was subscribing to his annuity, in the guarantee of a considerable sum of money. Could some such scheme be worked out by Government on an actuarial basis a large number of officers, not only in the Public Works Department but in other Services similarly unprotected, would be glad to avail themselves of it and to subscribe towards the extra cost.

71,516. **(VII.) Such Limitations as may Exist in the Employment of Non-Europeans and Working of the Existing System of Division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—The question raised under this head is one which the Engineers in the Imperial Service have fully and sympathetically considered. As regards the division of Services into Imperial and Provincial it seems necessary in the interests of Government itself that this should remain. It is an economic fact that imported labour has invariably to be paid more highly than home labour, and Government has the right to expect that native-born officers should serve in India on less pay than has to be given to the imported officers. The Englishman serving in India is not working under the same conditions as the Indian. He cannot live so cheaply and has necessarily to bear periodically the expense of long and expensive journeys home for himself and his family, the necessity of which is more often than not due to living under trying climatic conditions. Education for his family in England cost considerably more than education in India and almost without exception during the course of his service each officer has to bear the expenses of two establishments, one in England and one in India. It is considered, however, that officers in both Services should be borne on the same lists for purposes of seniority and promotion. The case is complicated by the presence of a small body of the domiciled community in the ranks of the Provincial Service. These men undoubtedly labour under some hardships, but no reasonable remedy has been suggested.

As regards the proportion of Imperial and Provincial Engineers it is considered that in the interests of efficiency the proportion of imported Engineers should for the present be not less than 70 per cent. In process of time this proportion could be reduced, as increased general efficiency in the Provincial Service is apparent. It is felt that the present system of recruitment is capable of improvement and that before candidates are allowed to enter Rurki or other training colleges a system of selection should be adopted. It is an undoubted fact that at the present many men recruited from Indian Colleges lack energy, power of organization, initiative, resource, ability to control, fairness in dealing with subordinates and other qualities essential for the efficient discharge of work in the Public Works Department and it is felt that the main object to aim at is to build up a Provincial

* Not reprinted.

Service which, in general conduct and qualifications, can compare favourably with the Imperial Service. Care in recruiting and in addition the rejection of men found unsuitable after a term of probation will undoubtedly help to this end, which, when gained, would in itself be the best argument for increasing the proportion of Indian Engineers.

It is suggested that Provincial Service officers selected for both the rank of Superintending Engineer and Chief Engineer should receive the same salary as officers of the Imperial Service.

Finally it is strongly urged that in considering any changes in organisation the efficiency of the Department should be kept in view. The prospects offered to men entering the Department should be such as to attract the very best material procurable. Careful selection combined with rejection of men subsequently found unsuitable will best secure the interests of the Government. In a large spending Department, like the Public Works Department, certain qualities of character are essential and if the qualifications and integrity of superior officers are not of the highest, it can only result in inefficiency, causing thereby serious loss of revenue to Government and waste of public money.

71,517. **(VIII.) Relations with the Indian Civil and other Services.**—It is considered that the relationship as existing between the Public Works Department and other Services in India is at present on the whole satisfactory and should remain unaltered.

71,518. **(IX.) Any other Points within the Terms of Reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—*Travelling allowances.*—It is thought that the question of travelling allowances requires consideration. The rates of travelling allowance on tour are the same as they were 25 or 30 years ago although the hire of means of conveyance has certainly increased more than 50 per cent., while the price of horses necessary to most officers for their work has increased by at least 100 per cent. The consequence is that officers, who have much district work, are actually out of pocket, in travelling expenses.

Travelling Allowance on transfer.—The inadequacy of travelling allowance in the case of transfers is glaring. The question is common to other Departments. While admitting that transfers in the interests of the Public Service must inevitably involve some expense to the officers transferred, and the practical impossibility of framing any rules suitable to all cases that will obviate it, it is considered that the actual out-of-pocket expenses, especially in the case of long transfers, are frequently more than an officer should be called upon to incur, and often amount to a distinct hardship. It is believed that the question was under the consideration of the Government of India some six or seven years ago and it is suggested that the question be again considered with a view to the present rules, which contain several anomalies, being made more liberal.

Mr. F. C. Rose, called and examined.

71,519. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he represented the Imperial Engineers of the Public Works Department in the Punjab. The Superintending Engineers whose names were on the written statement were asked to obtain opinions of Executive Engineers, and they met and discussed the views and endeavoured to draft something which was more or less agreeable to everyone. There were no Executive Engineers represented on the Committee, but the papers sent in by those officers were before the Committee in drafting the statement. They all agreed generally, the main point of divergence of those who signed a minority report being on the question of whether the Imperial and Provincial Services should remain as at present. The witness himself was of opinion that the division into two branches should continue in the interests of Government, and he held that opinion purely on economical grounds. He did not think any objection would be taken to having both services on one list and even to their being called by the same name. His objection was to the Indian recruited officer being paid on the same basis as the European recruited officer. He desired to emphasise the point that imported labour should be paid at a higher rate. As to whether salaries should be the same for all with something in the nature of a foreign allowance for the European officer his view would depend largely on the amount of the allowance. He did not mind by what name it was called so long as the difference existed. The witness pointed out that if he returned to England for duty his pay would at once be reduced to two-thirds according to the Civil Service Regulations. He thought the rule was a fair one and was now more or less established in India. It was difficult to gauge what the difference should be, but the general rule appeared to be that a man should expect two-thirds pay in his own country, and he advocated the maintenance of the two-thirds rule on the main ground that the Government had the right to expect to obtain indigenous labour cheaper than imported labour.

71,520. The witness supported the proposal by which all officers in the administrative grades should receive the same rate of pay, and admitted that in that respect the principle he put forward broke down. It was, however, always necessary to pay a good man. The best Engineers in England were very highly paid, but there was a great difference indeed between the rank and file and the man at the top. A man selected for the administrative grades had to be a very good man. Precautions were taken to promote really efficient officers and for the administrative grades a real selection should be made of the very best officers in the Department Men selected for Chief Engineers had the same pay whether they were recruited in India or in England, and he was in favour of extending this to Superintending Engineers. The cost of living was much greater for an officer coming out to India from England than for an officer living in the country.

71,521. The witness suggested a system of nomination and competition for Rurki instead of open competition as he thought on the whole it would give a better stamp of man if they were selected first. An efficient Nomination Board could be appointed consisting of men who knew what the requirements were.

71,522. The witness did not think that the cadre could be increased so as to absord all the temporary Engineers or such of them as were in effect doing permanent work. He would fix the cadre in accordance with ordinary normal requirements, that is to say, at such a strength that it would never be likely to be less than would be fully employed. The cadre was certainly not recruited to that standard at present. In the Punjab there were 63 temporary men and 145 permanent men. Even if all the construction works were closed down he did not suppose it would result in a decrease of four divisions. Taking four men to a division that would mean a decrease of 16 men, a number which he thought would fairly well represent what ought to be the strength of the temporary establishment. Forty or more officers were practically doing permanent work and he should like to see the cadre correspondingly increased. The witness said that in the Punjab Irrigation at present the divisions were too big and should be reduced in size. This would at once tend to prevent a block in promotion. He would increase the number of Executive posts in the divisions in the Punjab Irrigation, and he believed there was a proposal now before Government for doing that. Another method would be to do away with the charge bar at Rs. 800. It was difficult to say where the charge bar should come, but probably the thirteenth year of service would be the right time. The selection from Assistant to Executive rank ought to be stiffer than it was at present as there was not now a sufficient amount of selection for Executive posts. If a man was not fitted for an Executive post he should not be promoted. It was true that his scheme would not be of much value to those who were left behind, but they were left behind by their own fault.

71,523. He thought it would be quite reasonable to have a rigid selection within the grades, provided that the charge bar was raised from Rs. 800 to Rs. 1,000.

71,524. On the subject of the employment of Royal Engineers, the witness said Royal Engineer officers did not care for the Irrigation Branch, but he believed in the Buildings and Roads Branch instances had occurred of Royal Engineers being placed on the permanent cadre to the detriment of the civilians. At present some Royal Engineers came into the Department with from ten to fourteen years' service, when they were over thirty years of age, and they were placed above men who had been in the Department for some time. The ordinary recruit came out at about twenty-three or twenty-four, while the Royal Engineers obtained their commissions about nineteen. He did not think anybody had a word to say against the efficiency of the Royal Engineers. If the age was reduced to twenty-five it would have no injurious effect on the service and the officers would enter somewhere about the bottom of the list and the grievance would be removed.

71,525. The witness was of opinion that under no circumstances should an officer be retained beyond a certain age, but whether the age for superannuation should be 55, 57 or 58 was not a matter of great importance. The important point was to have a rigid rule and to stick to it. To keep on men after the age of retirement created great discontent in the Department. At present there was a definite rule of Government that a man should retire at 55 and all the officers asked that that rule should be strictly adhered to. Regarding the argument that it might be injurious to the Public Service to lose a valuable officer the witness said there were as good fish in the sea as ever came out of it.

71,526. With reference to Widow and Orphan pensions, witness stated he did not wish to argue the question as it was a very intricate subject and officers were not all agreed upon it.

71,527. As regards the question of general increase to the present scale of pensions witness desired to emphasize the fact that there was genuine discontent at present and all officers attached a great deal of importance to this matter.

71,528. (*Mr. Madge.*) The witness said that if the best of the temporary Engineers were brought on to the permanent cadre and the number of charges were correspondingly increased it would in a great measure remove the present difficulty. The temporary men were taken on for temporary schemes, and as fewer men were required for maintenance, there was supposed to be a reduction in their number after the work on new construction was completed, but, as a matter of fact, as soon as one scheme was finished another scheme was started and the temporary men were kept on. He thought it was necessary to have a certain proportion of temporary men.

71,529. The witness said he had had men of the domiciled community working under him and could say with perfect honesty that one of the very best men he had had under him was a domiciled "Native." This remark must, however, not be held to apply to all. Good men were to be found among the domiciled community, but there were some very indifferent men as well.

71,530. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness thought that the difference between the class of men now recruited in India, and the class recruited formerly might to a slight extent be due to the division of the service into Imperial and Provincial, but he spoke on the subject with all reservation. In his view the difference was owing in great measure to a change of nationality, as the men who were recruited formerly came in many instances from England to Rurki.

71,531. (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness said the figures he had given of the permanent and temporary staff referred to the whole of the Punjab, Roads, Buildings and Irrigation.

71,532. It was claimed by the Public Works officers that there should be no difference in pay or pension between Civilians and the Royal Engineers. He admitted Royal Engineers had obligations which did not fall on the Civilians, but considered that it must also be admitted that many of them were never called upon to carry out those obligations. Personally he would be prepared to take the same obligations upon himself, if asked to.

71,533. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness would not admit that if England turned out as many Engineers as at present and there were no openings for them in India the law of supply and demand would come in and the remuneration in England fall. There was no profession in England of any kind which found employment altogether in England; England supplied Engineers to all the world. He did not think that throwing on the market twenty-two men a year would make any difference.

71,534. (*Mr. Aikman.*) With regard to the statement that the proportion of Indian recruited officers reaching administrative rank up to 1892 was higher than the similar proportion of officers recruited in England, the witness said the average number of years of service before an officer obtained administrative rank was twenty-two or twenty-three. Coeper's Hill was started in 1870, and the course being three years, the first batch of men came out in 1873, so that by 1892 they would have only had nineteen years' service. He could not say how many Cooper's Hill men were recruited up to 1892, but recruitment began at the rate of about 50 a year and by 1892 must have fallen to about 30, so that probably between 300 and 400 Coopers' Hill men were recruited during the period in question. Up to 1892 the men who qualified for administrative rank were men who had been educated at Rurki. The only men recruited from England before 1870 were the Stanley Engineers, a body of 40 men, and they were the only English-trained men that were qualified for promotion to rank of Superintending Engineer.

(The witness withdrew.)

Rai Bahadur Ganga Ram, c.i.e., m.v.o., late of the Public Works Department, Punjab. (Retired.)

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,535. (I.) **Methods of Recruitment.**—The present method of recruitment to the Imperial Service of the Public Works Department is in my opinion exceedingly faulty. There is no searching examination to test the candidate's capabilities in such subjects as are likely to be of use in India. Mere qualification of A.M.I.C.E., or a diploma of any engineering college in England, regardless of subjects, entitles a candidate to apply for the appointment, and there being no subsequent examination before or after the selection, there is absolutely no criterion of the candidate's capability or relative merits. In such circumstances, and in the absence of any special institution like the old Cooper's Hall College, the training of the Indian colleges must necessarily turn out superior men for the Indian Public Works Department, to those recruited in England.

Remedy.—(*a*) For recruitment in England there should be first nomination and then competition. The present selection committee should be converted into a nomination committee, and should be composed of one member of the Secretary of State's Council to act as president, and the other two members should be nominated annually by the Secretary of State from amongst retired engineers, shortly before the date of nomination.

(*b*) There should be at least three nominees for each vacancy, and the result should be decided by open competition without any regard to the candidate's nationality.

(*c*) Candidates must be graduates in B.Sc. in engineering or A.M.I.C.E.'s, or passed engineers from any of the Indian Engineering Colleges.

(*d*) The subjects of competition should include a thorough knowledge of the great works constructed in India, in roads, buildings, canals, railways, waterworks, and drainage works.

(*e*) Practical training in England should be confined to sanitary engineering only.

(*f*) Hindustani should be one of the subjects.

Fifty per cent. of vacancies should be given to recruitments in England, and 50 per cent. to recruitments in India.

71,536. (III.) **Conditions of Service.**—All recruitments for permanent vacancies, whether made in

England or in India, should be classed as Imperial. The distinction of Imperial and Provincial should be abolished, and the conditions of recruitment and service should be the same for Europeans and Indians, except in regard to pay and leave, which I have explained later on.

71,537. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—The salary of permanent men doing similar work should be the same for Europeans as for Indians, but it is only fair that a European, as versus Indians and domiciled Europeans, should get an extra allowance because of the fact of his having to educate his children in Europe, and the expenses he has to incur in his family moving between Europe and India. This allowance should be given to non-domiciled Europeans, irrespective of the place of recruitment, under some such rules as used to be in vogue during the days of exchange compensation allowance. This allowance which I now recommend may be called "foreign service allowance," and should be equal to 15 per cent. of salary.

71,538. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—The present conditions of leave are quite good, but they require one modification, namely, that the conditions of leave should vary as to whether leave is spent in Europe or India, and not with any reference to nationality or place of recruitment. To make my meaning clear, if an Indian wishes to spend his furlough in Europe he should get the favourable leave rules, but if he spends it in India, the present rules ought to be sufficient for him.

71,539. **(VII.)** (*a*) **Limitations in the employment of Non-Europeans.**—There should be absolutely no limitation; open competition must be the rule, and no race distinction.

(*b*) **Working of the existing system of division of services in the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial.**—The existing system has led to nothing but discontent and hostility, and the word Provincial has become a sort of slur to one who happens to belong to this service. I quite recognise the necessity of having another service with lesser responsibilities and consequently inferior pay. This necessity is now met partly by Provincial service and partly by the recruitment of temporary men, whose lot is extremely deplorable, as they can be discharged at a month's notice, at any time, and whose method of recruitment is extremely unsatisfactory. To meet this want, as well as to meet another want which is very serious, namely, the engineers required for municipal and local boards, I propose the creation of another service, to be called Extra Engineering Service, whose salary should be graded, and should be 66 per cent. of the Imperial men. This service should carry no pension, but a provident fund system. This service should be recruited in England as well as in India, half and half, from those who fail to get into the Imperial. Out of the Imperial vacancies one or two vacancies may, every year, be given to men of extraordinary merit of the Extra Engineering Service, as a sort of encouragement. Thus the existing *Provincial* and *Temporary* services be abolished altogether. If any men are still required for temporary jobs, they should be called clerks of works, and should be charged direct to works.

RAI BAHADUR GANGA RAM called and examined.

71,540. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he retired from the Service as an Executive Engineer, first grade, permanent, in 1903, after serving 30 years in the Public Works Department in the Punjab. He was trained at Rurki and entered the Service in October 1873. When he passed out of the College twelve Europeans and six Indians passed out at the same time. There was only a two years' course then and he did not remember the number of students in the College.

71,541. The witness was in favour of the abolition of the Provincial Service as it now existed and the creation of an Imperial Service half recruited in England and half in India, and he thought that a sufficient number of Indians were now qualified to fill half the total number of vacancies. He favoured limited competition amongst nominated candidates in England and an examination which would require experience of Indian subjects. He did not think that would give preference to Indians, because English Colleges would put the subjects in the curriculum if they knew that a certain number of their students were going in for the competition. It did not follow that by this scheme fifty per cent. of Indians would enter the Service, because the Indian recruitment of fifty per cent. would also include Europeans and Anglo-Indians.

71,542. With reference to the employment of Royal Engineers, the witness was of opinion that such officers did not care to enter the Public Works Department, but he had not considered the question sufficiently to offer any definite opinion.

71,543. With regard to training, the witness considered there would be an advantage in allowing officers recruited in India to have a period of probation in England. He would not make it compulsory on all students because all of them could not afford to go. If, however, they were sent on full pay they should all be asked to go. He thought the best time to send them would be after four or five years' service. He himself went to England after ten years' service and found it very useful. In England he specially qualified himself in Sanitary Engineering, Water Works and Drainage Works and on his return designed and constructed many such works.

71,544. With reference to his proposal for the creation of a new grade of Temporary Engineer, the witness said he would prefer to call them Extra Assistant Engineers. The Civil Service had Extra Assistant Commissioners who practically did the same work with a little less responsibility, and economy to Government resulted. He would therefore create an Extra Assistant Engineer Service which would include all the temporary men of the Department and also the men now employed by District Boards and Municipalities. The Temporary Engineers transferred to the Extra class would be more or less permanent on the Provident Fund system, carrying no pension, and would have a much better standing. He would recruit them from among the unsuccessful candidates of Rurki and English Institutions, taking 50 per cent. from India and 50 per cent. from England, men who were qualified for but unable to get appointments in the superior service. He would have promotion from the upper subordinates but they would be promoted to the extra service and not to the permanent service. He did not consider the upper subordinates were qualified to enter the superior service, and he did not think their tone was as good as that of officers in the superior service.

71,545. The witness said there was work in the Department which in his opinion was somewhat more responsible than that discharged by officers in the upper subordinate service but somewhat less responsible than that of the Assistants who were doing regular work. He instanced the work of Engineers of District Boards and in the employment of smaller Municipalities. Larger municipalities would require highly trained Engineers, but 80 per cent. of the Municipalities would only require ordinary men whose work would lie mainly in the construction of small buildings, such as schools, and the maintenance of roads. He desired to bring such men under one category, as at present recruitment was not based on any fixed principle. If a man was engaged by a small Municipality at Rs. 200 a month he had no prospects at all, but when he came on the extra list he might be moved from one place to another and would have a wider field for promotion. At present if a man was in a difficulty with a Municipality he was dismissed straight away and had no chance of being sent to another Municipality. He thought the pay of such a Branch should be from half to two-thirds of the Imperial pay, starting at Rs. 200 and rising to Rs. 600 or perhaps in rare cases to Rs. 800. He did not think his proposal would cause any discontent; there had been none in connection with the Extra Assistant Commissioners in the Civil Service.

71,546. With regard to salary, the witness said there was justice in recognising that an officer from Europe should receive something more than an officer recruited in India. For the last four or five years he had spent every summer in England and had had many conversations with Englishmen, and when asked by them the reason of the gulf between Indians and Europeans, he had replied that the Indians generally felt they did not get men of high class who were sympathetic with the Indian people; and he was told that to get better men from England the pay must be high. It was for that reason that he advocated extra pay. He had calculated that there were forty appointments every year and he believed that if twenty of the appointments went to India and twenty to England there would be no objection to giving the Europeans extra pay and thus ensuring the employment of men of very high class. He was not prepared to say whether such a scheme of pay would be received with general acceptance by Members in the service.

71,547. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness was of opinion that an Indian would be in a better position to benefit from study in Europe after he had had some years of practical service in his own country than by going to England as a student.

71,548. With regard to leave, his suggestion was that the conditions of leave should be governed not by the nationality of a man but by the country in which the leave was taken. An officer would have to elect at the outset where he was going to take his leave.

71,549. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The witness said his proposal was to provincialise the Provincial District Engineers and all the temporary Engineers now employed by the Department. There was a considerable quantity of work which was midway between superior work and subordinate work, as for instance sub-divisions in which very little Engineering was required. For example, when a canal was being worked there were revenue sub-divisions whose chief duty it was to distribute water to the zemindars and collect water rate, and those things could be well done by temporary engineers. He thought the maintenance of railways might be classed in the same manner though his experience of railways was not very great.

71,550. With regard to foreign service allowance, the witness considered that 15 per cent. would be in a way sufficient to tempt a man to leave his own country, as it would just meet the extra expense incurred by the moving of a family.

71,551. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness said that after thirty years' service his permanent salary was Rs. 1,100 but he received in addition an allowance of Rs. 150, whilst employed on the Delhi Durbar of 1903. When the last Public Service Commission's recommendations were put forward Indian Engineers previously in the Service were not affected by the changes that were introduced; they remained on under the old rules. He had never risen to Superintending Engineer's grade and no Indians had risen to that grade in the Punjab. He was never superseded.

71,552. With reference to his scheme for Extra Assistant Engineers, the witness said that the Engineers of Municipalities and District Boards were now paid out of Municipal funds, but under his scheme the pay would be debited to the Municipality by the Government, who would make the appointments. He saw no difficulty in having in a Government Department a number of officers working under different Municipalities and District Boards. If a Municipality was only able to pay an Engineer Rs. 100 it could have a subordinate; if it could afford to pay Rs. 200 it could take the lowest class Engineer; more than half the Municipalities and District Boards in the Punjab were employing Engineers drawing more than Rs. 200.

71,553. The witness did not agree with the statement that Indian Engineers were generally lacking in energy, power of organisation, initiative, resource, ability to control, and fairness in dealing with subordinates. He was not in favour of a separate scale of salaries for a Provincial Service as he wanted to have only one Service. He should continue the present Imperial pay subject to increases he had recommended and the Foreign Service allowance for pure Englishmen should be 15 per cent. above that. His idea was to amalgamate the present Provincial Service with the Imperial and to have an Extra Service, the highest pay in the new Service being Rs. 800.

71,554. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The witness considered that the Public Works Department obtained the pick of the Indian trained Engineers, the second best going to the temporary establishment of the Public Works Department, and the third best going to Municipalities. He considered Municipal Engineers would be glad to be taken into the Public Works Department. He did not propose they should be pensionable but that they should have a Provident Fund.

71,555. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) With reference to his proposal that students in England should be examined on Indian subjects, the witness said the knowledge would only be that acquired from text-books and would be on a par with that which was obtained in Cooper's Hill. Hindustani would be valuable all over India from Madras to the Khyber. Should a man ultimately not succeed in entering the Indian Service he did not think it would have done him any harm to have studied Hindustani.

71,556. (*Mr. Madge.*) The witness was of opinion that Sanitary Engineering was the only subject that could be studied better in England than in India.

71,557. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The witness said his experience led him to believe that if a large number of Indians were introduced in the Public Works Department the Service would not suffer in efficiency. They had already been employed on Buildings, Roads, Irrigation, and other work, and had shown no lack of ability in doing it. They had also been employed in the Punjab up to the grade of Executive Engineers on the construction of canals. The reason why the witness did not serve his full time in the Service was because he received a grant of land after finishing work in connection with the Coronation, and as he could not obtain the grant until he retired he preferred to retire rather than to wait.

71,558. (*Mr. Aikman.*) The witness said he thought the class of Engineer at present employed by Municipalities like Lahore, Amritsar and Delhi, would accept the pay and status of the Extra Assistant Engineer class he proposed. At present higher salaries were paid because there was no source of recruitment except from outside. The witness recommended the present Imperial scale for Indians and an extra 15 per cent. above that scale for pure Englishmen, provided the percentage of Englishmen was not more than 25.

71,559. (*Mr. Laughran.*) The witness said he had not stated that the work of a sub-division in the Irrigation Department was inferior but that the Revenue Sub-Division did not require much Engineering skill.

(The witness withdrew.)

LALA WAZIR CHAND CHOPRA, Executive Engineer, Punjab.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.*

71,560. (I.) **Methods of Recruitment.**—This head naturally sub-divides itself in two sub-heads, namely: (*i*) Sources of Recruitment, and (*ii*) System of Recruitment.

(*i*) *Sources of Recruitment.*—The two principal sources of recruitment at present are:—

(*a*) Appointments in England by the Secretary of State, under the advice of a Selection Committee;

(*b*) Appointments given to more successful students of Indian Engineering Colleges.

When the last Public Service Commission sat, annual recruitment on the average was 21 men from source (*a*) and 9 men from source (*b*), *i.e.*, 70 to 30 per

* See also the "Views of the Provincial Service Engineers" appended to the Report of the Imperial Engineers—paragraphs 71498-505.

cent. The Commission then was of opinion that the proportion of recruiting from Indian colleges was inadequate and that this proportion should be gradually raised. On the contrary we find that the proportion of recruitment from Indian colleges has actually decreased. Thus at present the average recruitment from the two sources is, 30 from source (*a*) and 9 from source (*b*), *i.e.*, in the ratio of 77 to 23 per cent. If the recommendations of the Commission had been given effect to, the proportion of recruitments would have by this time been more than half for men from Indian colleges.

It is recommended, therefore, that proportion of recruitment should for the present be made half to half, and as time advances this proportion should rise in favour of the *alumni* of Indian colleges. Engineers have, in the design and execution of Public Works of all descriptions, to deal with local conditions. The Engineering practice, standards, and problems of a large country like India are peculiar to that country. Hence the Engineers who have received their professional education and training in the country itself, suit that country best. At present India possesses first-rate Civil Engineering Colleges, one of which is over 60 years old. It is very necessary, therefore, that the bulk of recruitment should be from Indian colleges; and rather than get recruits from outside in large numbers, the proper policy would be to keep the standard of the Indian colleges abreast of the times, *i.e.*, up to the highest standard of Engineering practice and theory in the world.

(*ii*) *System of Recruitment.*—At present the recruitment in India is by competition, and in England by selection from amongst men trained in the colleges there. The proper system would be by competition in both countries. For the competition to be real and searching the number of appointments in any year should not exceed one-third of the number of candidates in that year.

There is one point, which it is necessary to bring to the notice of the Royal Commission specially. *At present the outside age limit for Rurki Admission* Examination is 21 years, and the candidate is required to be a graduate. *In the Indian Universities the age limit for marticulation examination is 15* or 16 years. Hence a student can not become a graduate until after he is over 19 or 20 years of age. The Rurki College Admission Examination takes place before the results of the Degree Examinations of the *Punjab University are out. Hence the candidate at best has one chance only for appearing in the Admission Examination if 15 years be the rule for marticulation, and none at all if 16 years be the rule. This anomaly* must be removed and the simplest remedy is to lower the University standard for admission to Rurki Engineer Class from B. A. to Intermediate in Arts, as was the case some years back.

71,561 (II.) **System of Training and Probation.**—The system of training in vogue in Indian colleges is as it should be. The training is wholly directed to the requirements of the country, in colleges maintained by the State for the purpose. By the competitive system prevalent in these colleges, the best men available are chosen. The training in England is not wholly directed to the requirements of India. To remove this defect the competition examination in England should include in its curriculum—(1) One Indian Language, (2) Indian Irrigation, and (3) Indian geography, Physical and Political.

The training received by the *alumni* of Indian Engineering Colleges, is further supplemented by a period of probation for one year in the Department, which is not the case with recruits obtained from England. This probationary period in the Department in India is absolutely necessary, and should be insisted upon as an indispensable condition. It should be a probationary period in the true sense, involving selection and possibility of rejection at the end of it. Any plea that this is unfair, or will deter candidates from England by reason of the attached risk, may be met by the provision of free return passages to rejected candidates. Such a system of rejection prevails at present for recruits from the Indian colleges. But the present system at Rurki College of posting two apprentices for each vacancy and selecting one of them at the end of the preliminary period of one year should be done away with, and the system of sending out one apprentice for each vacancy that prevailed up to 1899, should be restored.

71,562. (III.) **Conditions of Service.**—The conditions of service as at present prevalent for the Imperial Engineers are quite satisfactory. Prior to the adoption of the recommendations of the last Public Service Commission, practically the same conditions applied to recruits from Indian colleges,—in fact they entered the Imperial Service and no Provincial Service existed. For reasons explained under head VII (*a*) (paragraph 71,566) *infra*, all distinctions as regards conditions of service between recruits from England and those from Indian colleges should be completely removed, and equality of treatment restored.

71,563. (IV.) **Conditions of Salary.**—The pay of the Indian recruited element is approximately two-thirds of that granted to officers recruited in England. This is utterly unfair and unsuitable. The resulting anomalies and defects are startling and are as follows:—

(*i*) The minimum pay of Indian trained Executive Engineers is much less than the maximum pay of Imperial Assistant Engineers who might be working under them.

(*ii*) The minimum pay of Indian trained Superintending Engineers is less than the maximum pay of Imperial Executive Engineers who might be holding divisional charges under them.

(*iii*) Anomalies existing in connection with local allowances as stated below.

(*iv*) In addition to the above, the pay granted to the Indian trained element is inadequate and is not commensurate with their work and responsibilities, which are exactly the same as those of the Imperial Engineers. That the Indian trained engineers should, under the conditions now prevailing, receive less pay *than their own juniors and subordinates is simply preposterous and untenable.*

It is pointed out that emoluments should depend solely on services rendered, and that all distinctions between two classes of officers who do the same work and bear the same responsibilities should be obliterated.

Local allowances.—Indian trained Engineers receive two-thirds of the local allowances granted to Engineers *obtained from England.* This difference is unfair, *for the said allowances are always given for a specific purpose, viz., as compensation for local disabilities which equally affect both classes of officers.*

Probationary period.—Not only have Indian trained officers, as already explained, to undergo a probationary period and incur the consequent risk of rejection, but even after completing such probation the period so spent is not counted for increment and promotion. This causes great inequality between the two classes of officers.

It is urged that there should be absolutely no distinction in the matter of emoluments of whatever nature, between the two classes of officers, as they do the same work.

71,564. (V.) **Conditions of Leave.**—There should be no difference in the matter of leave between officers recruited in England and those recruited in India. Although it is necessary that the best preliminary training ground for an engineer is his own country, there is no doubt that he is always in necessity of enlarging his horizon of experience by visiting important engineering works in other countries. This will keep him abreast of the times in his technical knowledge. This object can only be attained if leave rules are liberal. Again, the conditions under which engineers have to work are such that, unless allowed long periods of rest, their health is likely to break down. It is recommended, therefore, that the leave rules for all engineers whether recruited in England or India should be the same.

78,565. (VI.) **Conditions of Pension.**—As in the case of salary so in the case of pension, there should be no distinction whatever between engineers recruited in England and those recruited in India. Pensions are really deferred salaries, and it is but fair that they should depend on specific services rendered and

not on place of recruitment. The scale of pension recommended for all Engineer officers is as follows:—

Years of completed Service.	Scale of Pension (Proportion of average emoluments).	Maximum amount to be allowed.
		Rs.
10	20/60	2,000
11	21/60	2,200
12	22/60	2,400
13	23/60	2,600
14	24/60	2,800
15	25/60	3,000
16	26/60	3,450
17	27/60	3,900
18	28/60	4,350
19	29/60	4,800
20		5,250
21		5,700
22		7,150
23		6,600
24		7,050
25	30/60	7,500
26		8,100
27		8,700
28		9,300
29		9,900
30		10,500

An officer may be allowed to retire at any time after completing 20 years' service.

71,566. (VII.) (*a*) **Such limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans.**—As urged above the department should be recruited half from England and half in India for the present. The recruitment in England should be open to all British subjects equally, irrespective of domicile, colour, caste or creed. Latterly, during the existence of Cooper's Hill College, only two Indians were eligible for appointment even after competition, and at present the number of Indians eligible for appointment in England is limited to only ten per cent. of the total annual recruitment. Limitations of this nature should be removed.

(*b*) **Working of the existing system of division of services in the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial.**—The division of the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial Services has been a great mistake and has not been and can never be a success. This division took place on the recommendations of the last Public Service Commission. The grounds on which the Commission based its recommendations and remarks on them, are given below:—

(*i*) The Commission was of opinion that the considerations which, in respect of Judicial and Revenue Branches of the Administration led it to recommend the formation of Imperial and Provincial Services with distinct conditions of service, applied with equal force to the Department of Public Works. Now prior to the introduction of the Provincial Service in 1895, the recruits from Indian Colleges were admitted unreservedly into the Imperial Service. This vested right was interfered with by the Commission, which was really appointed to devise measures for the employment of Indians on a larger scale in the higher grades of service in all departments, and thus in a way raise the status of Indians in the services. In the case of the Public Works Department, the recommendation for the introduction of a Provincial Service was a retrograde measure, and thus the Commission evidently went contrary to its terms of references in this case. But apart from the above, there is really no analogy between provincial branches of other services and Indian trained engineers. Engineers recruited in India belong to a Superior Service, and do the same work and bear the same responsibilities as engineers recruited in England; while this is not the case with members of other Provincial Services. In the case of Engineers, those recruited in India have been borne on the same list with those recruited from England and promoted side by side with them; while in other departments the lists have always been separate. This want of analogy was virtually admitted by the Government of India, when giving effect to the recommendations of the Commission.

(*ii*) The Commission was of opinion, that important charges, especially of Direction and Control, should be held by men recruited from England, while inferior charges should be held by men recruited from India. This assumes the existence of superior and inferior charges, while the fact of the matter is that such distinctions in charges, excepting very rare cases, do not exist. All Executive and Administrative charges during the quarter of the century that has elapsed between the last Public Service Commission and the present one, have been held promiscuously by men recruited from India and England. For the execution of the famous Triple Canal Project in the Punjab, for instance, the charges on the whole have been held much longer by Rurki Engineers than by those recruited from England, the ratio of total periods on the three canals during which charges have been held by Rurki and England trained men respectively being about 1½ to 1 in the case of Executive Engineers, and about two to 1 in the case of Superintending Engineers. The recommendations of the Commission in this respect, as implied by their opinion, were not followed, because they were really impracticable. Even in the Roads and Buildings Branch, the idea of employing men of inferior status could not be given effect to—Imperial Engineers are still in charge of Roads and Buildings Divisions.

(*iii*) The Commission was of opinion that Colleges in India were not capable of affording such a high standard of education as was obtainable in Colleges in England such as Woolwich, Chatham, and Cooper's Hill. Experience has proved that this notion of the Commission was not correct. Some of the *alumni* of Rurki College have risen to great eminence—the names of Sir W. Wilcocks, Sir W. Garstin, and Rai Bahadur Ganga Ram may be instanced in this connection. Leaving alone exceptonally good men like the above, it will be noticed that the proportion in administrative ranks of Indian trained Engineers to England trained Engineers is better than the proportion of their respective original recruitments. Now as promotion to administrative ranks is by selection only, it follows that the Indian College Engineer has proved himself on the whole as better and fitter than his English confrère in the race of official life. A close examinatoin of classified lists over a series of years will bear this statement out. Again, some of the best authorities in the land have borne testimony to the Rurki College being equal to any similar institution in Europe, to the excellence of the Institution, and to the great ability of its *alumni*. It is claimed therefore that there is no difference between the profesional education imparted in Rurki College and that received by the average engineer recruited in England.

All the above leads to the conclusion that the introduction of the Provincial Service in the Public Works Department was really a mistake. Other considerations bearing on the subject are:—

(*a*) Considering the previous history and qualifications of Indian College Engineers, they should be treated just as Indian recruited officers of some other superior Services like Accounts, Traffic (Railways), Finance, etc. (in which by the way the educational qualities required are inferior to those of the Indian College Engineer) are treated. These Services are also partially recruited in India, but all officers, whether recruited in India or England, are classed as Imperial.

(*b*) A number of temporary engineers, at Rurki men, long after the introduction of the Provincial Service, were made permanent and placed not in the Provincial but in the Imperial Service. They did not get guaranteed appointments, and the majority of them had failed even to secure the necessary percentage of marks required to qualify for Government appointment. If out-classed people from Rurki College, who in addition were only eligible for the Provincial Service are held to be fitted for the Imperial Service, the pick of the Indian Colleges certainly should be.

(*c*) There have been cases where men who could not either pass tests in, or secure Government appointments from, Indian colleges have proceeded to England and after undergoing a very meagre training

for a short period at places like Crystal Palace, have been appointed by the Secretary of State to the Imperial Service. How, then, in the name of fairness can the pick of the Indian Colleges be barred from the Imperial Service?

(*d*) The institution of the Provincial Service for Indian College Engineers was in direct opposition to a definite pledge given to them in a speech delivered by Sir William Muir, Lieutenant Governor of the North-Western Provinces at Rurki on the 28th November, 1873, of which the follow is an extract. ". . . But apart from personal associations, there is a reason which renders the present moment one of public interest; the establishment in England of an Engineering College for India has unsettled the minds of the public here as to the prospect of this institution and the continuance to it of the patronage of Government. It has been a subject of much anxiety to myself, and of correspondence with the Government of India. It is, therefore, with sincere satisfaction that I am able to announce to you and through you to those without who are interested in the Thomason College, that the institution at Cooper's Hill will in no degree affect the relations of the Government of India with the college, nor the employment which has been hitherto guaranteed to its more successful students. Between the two seminaries there will be no opposition or antagonism. The requirements of this great country are ample for both. I am sure that you will all with me be thankful to the Governor General in Council for the justice which has thus been rendered to Rurki College."

This pledge was given shortly after the institution of Cooper's Hill College, at a time when the public in India were naturally apprehensive that the position of the *alumni* of the Indian Engineering Colleges in the Public Works Department would be injuriously affected, and it will be observed that it was given with the full authority of the Government of India, and possibly also of the Secretary of State. It will be noticed that the Government pledged that the institution of Cooper's Hill would in no degree affect its relations with Rurki College, nor the appointments "*hitherto guaranteed*" to its successful students. The appointments "*hitherto guaranteed*" were in the Imperial Service. Yet notwithstanding this pledge the Provincial Engineer Service, creating a great distinction between Engineers recruited in England and India, was introduced 20 years later and was based to a great extent on a mistaken comparison of the respective merits of Cooper's Hill and Indian trained Engineers. Again, it must be noted that this pledge, which is recorded in the Rurki College Calendar of 1872-73, formed one of the strongest inducements to candidates to enter Rurki College, for these men naturally believed (and it was a legitimate belief for them to nourish) that the distinction created was merely a tentative measure, and that when the organization of the Engineer Establishment came to be reconsidered, in accordance with paragraph 10 of the resolution No. 2523 G. of 1893, the said distinction would be abolished.

Public Works Department.—Thus from all considerations it is evident, that the existence of the Provincial Service in the Public Works Department stands self-condemned. It was introduced as a tentative measure for 7 years, and ever since the expiration of this specified period in 1902, a strong and persistent agitation has been going on for its abolition. The changes made in 1908, far from removing the prevalent discontent caused great resentment. Further improvements made in 1912 are considered as restoring the Provincial Service to the status it had before 1908. But the real cause of discontent still remains, and it will be removed only when the Provincial Service is abolished.

The pay and conditions of service should be commensurate with services rendered, and when Engineers from Indian Colleges have been and are doing the same work as those recruited from England, there is no reason why their place of recruitment should bar the former from the advantages of the Imperial Service.

It is strongly urged, therefore, that the Provincial Service in the Public Works Department should be abolished without loss of time.

71,567. (IX.) **Other Points.**—The question of cost, if the Provincial Service were abolished, may be briefly considered. The total monthly salary in the department at present amounts to Rs. 7½ lakhs in round numbers. If all the Provincial Officers were made Imperial, the extra cost would be half a lakh of rupees per month, the increase will be only 6·3 per cent. During the last quarter of a century (1885–6 to 1910–11) the general revenues of the country have risen from 7,446 to 12,102 lakhs and those of the Public Works Department alone from 743 to 2,653 lakhs. It will be seen that the proportional increase of Public Works Department revenues is about 4 times that of the general increase of revenue, and it is a sound business policy, that the employees of the department should have a share in this increase of revenue. An increase of 6 lakhs of rupees per annum on establishment due to the abolition of the Provincial Service would be infinitesimal as compared with the increase of Public Works revenue. It may also be pointed out that according to the Public Works Department Code, the theoretical percentage for Establishment on works was 23 till lately, and 21½ now, but in practice this percentage works out to from 16 to 19—or 17½ on the average. Thus there is a saving of 4 to 6 per cent. of the cost on works, in the matter of Establishment. This saving alone can very nearly meet the extra cost of 6 lakhs of rupees per annum mentioned above. Thus, on the score of cost also, the Provincial Engineer Service can be safely abolished.

LALA WAZIR CHAND CHOPRA called and examined.

71,568. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he was an Executive Engineer in the Provincial Service, Public Works Department, and represented the officers in that Department. He believed the views expressed in the written statement were generally agreed to by the officers.

71,569. The witness was of opinion that Indian Colleges turned out men better fitted for the Public Works Department in India than English Engineering institutions, the education in the Indian Colleges being directed more to the requirements of India. His reason for suggesting that 50 per cent. should be recruited from English institutions was in order that the change might be gradual. He desired to see competition among selected candidates in England for about half the vacancies and that Natives of India should be eligible for examination in England as well. *The examination should include an Indian language, Indian Irrigation and Indian geography. This would ensure that English officers on arriving in India would know at least one Indian language and have a text-book knowledge of Indian irrigation, and an idea of the geographical and climatic conditions of the country.* He did not think that would give an undue preference to the Indian. The subject of Indian irrigation would be theoretical for both classes of students and the language standard would be only colloquial.

71,570. He had facts and figures to show that the proportion of Indian-trained Engineers to English-trained Engineers, who had reached administrative rank was greater than the proportion of their respective original recruitments, and he would place those facts and figures before the Commission.*

71,571. The witness declared that at present the period spent by Indian-trained Engineers on probation did not count for increment and promotion, and he wanted that altered so as to equalise the conditions with those of the Imperial Engineers, who had no period of probation in the Department. The Imperial Engineer came from England and had no probation while an Indian recruit had to undergo a year's probation and was liable to be rejected. If he was not rejected it was only fair that the period should count towards increment and promotion, and the salary should be the minimum pay of an Assistant Engineer.

71,572. The witness desired to assimilate pension conditions for all officers of the superior service and

* *Vide* Appendix No. II.

therefore would ask for the privilege of optional retirement after twenty years' service. He himself would wish to retire after twenty years and he did not know what harm retirement at that time would do to the Service.

71,573. If the whole of the Provincial Service were absorbed into the Imperial Service and all were paid alike the witness considered the saving in Statement charges of four to six per cent. on the cost of works as explained in the written memorandum would nearly meet the whole charge. He had figures of actual expenditure on Irrigation Works in the whole of India extending over ten years, and they showed that if the four to six per cent. were applied, it would amount to about six lakhs, so that the extra cost would be met from this saving alone. His authority for quoting the theoretical percentage of Establishment charges, was the P. W. D. Code.

71,574. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) With regard to leave the witness desired that all officers, Indians and Europeans, should receive the same, and he should like officers to go to foreign countries as well as to England. It was not likely that officers on leave would spend long periods in India, as they would have to do so on half salary. He did not think it was necessary to have any condition that the more favourable rules should apply only in case men went to England, because the percentage of people who would take long furlough and not go out of India would be very small, and therefore it would not be advisable to have any invidious distinction on paper.

71,575. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The witness said the age for matriculation in the Punjab was fifteen and men could graduate at the age of nineteen. In the United Provinces the age limit for matriculation was sixteen and for graduation twenty. He himself entered the Provincial Service at the age of twenty-two as an apprentice Engineer. He believed the maximum age for permanent pensionable appointments was twenty-five, and that gave a man ample time to earn his full pension. He believed Imperial recruits came out below the age of twenty-five. If instead of reducing the standard to the Intermediate, the age for admission to Rurki was raised to twenty-two it might solve the difficulty to a certain extent. The lowering of the standard of qualifying examination for admission to Rurki, was one remedy that suggested itself to him; he was not keen ont it.

71,576. (*Mr. Madge.*) The witness said he would not object to introducing the High School standard for Rurki as an alternative to reducing the B.A. to the Intermediate.

71,577. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness explained that the arguments put forward in the written statement were in favour of increasing the Provincial pay, and not in favour of reducing the Imperial pay, as the present salaries were very inadequate. With regard to the possibility of the Provincial Service pay in India being better than the pay of Engineers doing similar work for large municipalities in England, the witness said he could offer no opinion upon that without out a knowledge of the conditions that obtained in England. For reasons best known to the statesmen of the country the Indian Services were the best paid in the world and he did not see any reason why Engineers should be less highly paid; and he, because he was an Indian.

71,578. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The witness said he laid stress on the question of the age of entrants owing to the fact that candidates were required to be graduates. A school-leaving examination would be of no value in the Punjab as that did not obtain in that Province. He was not aware that a boy could get into Rurki under the present rules at the age of seventeen, by passing the school final examination, and if the grievance was only peculiar to the Punjab and not applicable to the majority of provinces then the grievance was very much mitigated.

71,579. (*Mr. Aikman.*) The witness said that it had been the practice of large municipalities such as Lahore, Amritsar and Delhi to obtain English-trained men as Municipal Engineers, mainly for the reason that sanitary engineering was better developed in England and the duties of a Municipal Engineer were mostly sanitary.

71,580. With reference to the question of teaching an Indian language to students, the witness said the method adopted for the Indian Civil Service might be adopted for the Public Works Department.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Delhi, Wednesday, 19th November, 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman.*)

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, ESQ., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, Esq.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

D. W. AIKMAN, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Punjab.
J. W. B. LOUGHRAN, Esq., Executive Engineer, Punjab.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq., (*Joint Secretary*).

LIEUTENANT-COLONEL E. H. DEV. ATKINSON, Principal, Thomason College, Rurki.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,581. *Notes on a scheme for training of recruits in India for the Public Works Department:—*

(1) All recruits for the Imperial service of whatever race or creed should be paid the same and have the same rules for leave, promotion and pension.

(2) A single open competitive examination is not a suitable test for selecting candidates for the Public Works Department. For the Civil Engineering profession many qualifications other than the successful passing of examinations are necessary. Men who pass theoretical examinations with facility may turn out most unsuited for the executive grades where character, initiative power of commanding work, high ideals, &c., are required. The best method, therefore, is to recruit by competition from Colleges where the result is only attained after a course of several years during which practical work is taken as much into consideration as theoretical.

(3) For economy, efficiency, and *esprit de corps*, there should be one Imperial College in India for training. The Thomason College, Rurki, by virtue

of its past history, its buildings, climate and equipment and the fact that in the opinion of a great many responsible judges, it now gives an Engineering education equal to any in England is obviously fitted to be the Imperial College. The other existing Engineering Colleges would undertake the training of the subordinate grades for their Provinces and a special College for the purpose could be built for the United Provinces. These subordinate grades might be termed the Provincial Service, but the successful output of the Imperial College would form the Imperial Service.

(4) Before the formation of the existing Provincial Service confined the Thomason College to statutory natives of India, it was open to everyone and it was the alumni of that period which have produced so many distinguished engineers, a proportion of whom actually came out from England. The present system of appointing Indians to the Imperial Service from England is the worst possible. The choice is limited to the few who can afford to go to England, and these have to undergo the temptations of life in a strange country at an irresponsible age. The climate of India and the conditions of engineering work are often so considerably different to those existing in England, especially in Irrigation and Sanitary work that, though a good sound general engineering education must be the basis, and English experience after training valuable, it is suggested that all recruits both English and Indian should be trained at the Imperial College in India.

(5) Having fixed the proportion of recruitment for the Imperial service from England and in India, an open competitive examination for entrance should be held in England and in India, not necessarily simultaneous but of the same standard. This examination should be a test of general education, chiefly in those subjects necessary for the successful completion of engineering courses. Students in England would be nominated for admission to the entrance examination, and 5 per cent. over and above the number of appointments available would be admitted to the College to allow for wastage.

(6) As regards Indians, the difficulty now arises regarding the various races in India. Some of these are comparatively unfitted for the profession, and perhaps, being proficient in passing examinations would swamp the Entrance examination. Further, most Indians strongly object to serving in distant Provinces. The number of vacancies available in each province yearly should therefore govern the number of men admitted yearly from that province. The question of Railways would have to be settled by the Railway Board. To allow of there being a sufficient number of trained statutory natives for private work, Municipalities, District boards, &c., it is suggested that for each Province 30 per cent. more men should be admitted over and above the number of guaranteed appointments. All Indians competing for the entrance examinations in India would have to obtain nominations, by Boards consisting of the Civil Officer and Indian gentlemen of their districts to ensure they were fit to take up the positions they aspired to. In a great spending department like the Public Works Department this is a very important point.

(7) All students who duly qualified at the end of their course should be given a year's practical apprenticeship on works in India. It is doubtful if the guaranteed appointments should be given on the completion of the College course or at the end of the apprenticeship. The former is the most popular and probably practically the best method while the latter theoretically the best as it permits a man's character, energy and fitness for hard work, &c., to be judged on practical works.

(8) The final climax to the training would be to send all successful candidates to England during their first five years of service for a year's practical training. They would, by that time, have thoroughly grasped the conditions of their Indian work. They would be responsible men with a purpose in life and much less likely to be led away into idleness and dissipation. Further, each man would have specialised into his own line, Irrigation, Railway, Sanitation, Architecture, &c., and could take up his speciality. The training in England would have to be under duly constituted leadership. As the men would go home on Assistant Engineer's pay they would not necessarily be a heavy charge to the State.

LIEUTENANT-COLONEL ATKINSON called and examined.

71,582. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he had occupied his present position for about 12 years. He came out to India in 1887, and had served continuously in the Military Works Department, with the exception of about four years, which he spent on duty in England.

71,583. The engineer class at Rurki was a three years' course, to which 20 students were admitted yearly. There ought therefore to be 60 students, but usually a certain number failed every year, and the average was about 55. The upper subordinate class was a two years' course, to which 40 were admitted yearly, making about 80 students; and the lower subordinate class was a two years' course, to which 60 were admitted yearly. The latter number during the present year had been reduced to 40 yearly, so there would be in the future 80 students in that class instead of 120. This reduction was made because of the opening of an Engineering School at Rasul in the Punjab. All three classes were kept quite distinct within the college, with regard both to their training and to residence. They had also different teachers, in so far as they had each their own staff, but they were superintended by the professors in charge of each Department. The same workshops and laboratories were used.

71,584. The classes were drawn from the domiciled community and from pure Indians. A certain number of students in the upper subordinate class were European soldiers who were being trained for the Military Works Department. With regard to Indians of Asiatic descent, the students were limited to the Provinces of Upper India. Bengal, Madras, and Bombay were excluded. Men from the latter Provinces were only eligible for admission to their own local colleges. The reason for such limitation was, firstly, that each Province had its own college, and, secondly, that if Rurki was thrown open to free competition, it would be very much swamped by certain races who were better at examination work than others.

71,585. With regard to qualifications for entry to the College, under the present regulations, candidates had to possess either the B.A. or the B.Sc. degree, or a school-leaving certificate, with certain optional subjects added. There was very great disparity between the school-leaving certificate and the B.A. and B.Sc. degree. The school-leaving certificate had only been introduced within the last few years, the idea being to carry out the policy of the United Provinces Government which was intended to force men going into an industrial or commercial career to specialise at once instead of going up for the Matriculation and the usual University career. The B.A. and B.Sc. degree had only been left in because the Punjab, for instance, did not have a school-leaving certificate. He would not be in favour of the Bachelor of Science degree being made an essential qualification. He thought the present system was the best.

71,586. The College provided a training in Civil Engineering, Survey, Drawing, Mathematics, Physics, Electrical Engineering, Chemistry, and Mechanical Engineering, which meant the workshops. Each of those subjects might be termed a group. There was also a group which was called the Physique group, in which marks were given for athletic sports and games, and also for moral fitness. The courses practically comprised all the subjects he had just mentioned in various degrees of standard for the three classes, and combined about half as much practical work as theoretical.

71,587. With regard to practical work apart from laboratory work, Survey was done entirely outside the building. The Engineer Class went for three weeks into camp for triangulation purposes. The climax of the Civil Engineer's course in his last year was a Project, which was an independent piece of work, for

which a student was given three months. A Project was set of such dimensions that the student would be able to complete it in the time, and it was of the same nature and standard as an actual piece of work which he would have to do when he joined his profession. That also was dealt with under about five heads—Survey, Drawing, Engineering, Mathematics and Applied Mechanics, and was marked by five independent examiners. The marks were finally all collected so as to form a real practical test for the whole course which the student had gone through during his three years.

71,588. The witness was satisfied that Rurki gave as good a practical training as could be obtained anywhere. There were no improvements which he could suggest which would make the College still more efficient as a training centre for the superior posts in the Works Department. If there were, he would have introduced them. The training was always improving from year to year. He thought at the present time Rurki had as good a staff as could be desired. He had visited some of the colleges in England. On the last occasion when he was in England eight years ago, he made an inspection of all the technical institutions, and wrote a report on them, having in mind a comparison with Rurki.

71,589. He would not care to give a definite answer as to whether the educative value of the Rurki training was as high as that of, say, the Engineering Tripos at Cambridge, because he was not placed in touch with the officers in the Service, and he could only give an opinion from mere hearsay.

71,590. As to his own scheme for training in India, the witness explained that first of all that there would be nomination from Provinces, and then a competitive examination for admission to Rurki. There would not be a competitive examination at the end of the course. The whole three years' course at Rurki was a continual competitive examination. Marking was carried on from year to year, and every man had to qualify at the end of every year, or he had to leave the College. The witness had to remove men in the course of their three years. When he first went to Rurki he found the standard was the same as at the present time, but that every year in the engineering class, six or seven men failed to qualify, were permitted to return, failed to qualify again, and were permitted to return again. Cases had occurred of men who went through their whole course without having once qualified. He protested against such a system, and the whole question was investigated by a Committee, who reported that the standard was not only a very fair one, but was practically the same as was used all over the world in colleges of the same description, and that it ought to be adhered to. Thereupon Government gave orders that in future they would not interfere with the witness's discretion in the matter The result was that instead of having six or seven failures a year, there was now very rarely more than one.

71,591. With regard to recruitment, the witness's idea was that Rurki should be the sole channel of admission to the Imperial Service, and that the Indian colleges should devote their energies to training of the upper and lower subordinates. He suggested along with that proposal that there should be a period of training of one year in England during the first five years of an officer's service. He would not like to say whether as a result of that scheme a sufficient number of good candidates would be obtained from England, but he would regard that as a very important element, mixed up with many difficulties which he had not noted. He thought if men were brought out to India for their training it would be a very great advantage, in so far as they would learn the language, get accustomed to the conditions of the country, and probably get salted to the climate. At the same time it would be a very great responsibility to look after such men, and arrangements would have to be made for medical treatment and probably sanitoria, which would mean a very large amount of trouble and responsibility. In making his proposal the witness was rather looking at the efficacy which he considered would result from having all officers trained together in the country in which they were subsequently going to work. He had had a great admiration for Coopers Hill College and for the spirit which it engendered, and it was, to his mind, the same sort of *esprit de corps* that was required in the Service to get work done in the best way. He thought such a spirit could only be inculcated in a Service like the Public Works Department if all men felt that they were working with brothers who had come from the same place, and that, given one Alma Mater, it should be possible to inculcate the same spirit into one's Indian brothers as it had been undoubtedly inculcated in our own countrymen. He admitted that the result of his scheme would be to sacrifice the opportunities which were now afforded by well equipped colleges and institutions in England for highly trained men to enter the service from that country. He saw very many arguments against his scheme as well as many for it. Probably it would best meet the circumstances to throw the Rurki examination open to the world, though not forcing Europeans to come out. From the point of view of economy, he agreed that the European trained in a college in England at his own expense cost the State less than a European trained in India at the State's expense.

71,592. Asked whether he did not think that *esprit de corps* might to a substantial extent be engendered by the breaking up of the division into Imperial and Provincial branches, the witness said he had always found in the various Departments that there was a great deal of feeling because one man was a Cooper's Hill man, another was a Royal Engineer, another was a Stanley Engineer, and so on. There always seemed to be a certain amount of underlying friction on account of those distinctions, and he thought the same remark would apply in the future with regard to Rurki men and other men. He would not regard that as a sign of healthy rivalry.

71,593. He regarded the year's training in England as of importance. He did not think there would be any difficulty in getting young Indians into suitable institutions or railways in England.

71,594. Speaking from his experience of the students now turned out from Rurki, the witness did not consider he would be justified in suggesting any increase in the proportion of Natives of India in the Service, because he considered that although at Rurki they could be given the best technical education which could be obtained, Rurki was not getting probably the best material to work upon. He had in view an improvement of that material when he made his proposals with regard to entry. The present proportion was 30 per cent. apart from the 10 per cent. in England, and he would be contented with that, until the material which was being received into the College improved and the results were shewn.

71,595. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) He held the view that all recruits for the Imperial Service of whatever race or creed should be paid the same and have the same rules for leave, promotion and pension, because the fact of two men doing the same work and drawing different rates of pay produced so much friction as to make it worth while to face the extra expense. He did not agree with Mr. Nethersole that Indian feeling would be satisfied if the difference of emoluments were extended in the form of a foreign allowance.

71,596. With regard to his proposal to make Rurki a central college for the whole of India, the witness saw no reason to anticipate any difficulty from differences of language and habits. There was at the College at the present time the same difficulty in a minor degree, in that there were Indian students and European students, who lived separately, and worked and played together.

71,597. The witness did not think his remark in the written statement that "most Indians strongly objected to serving in distant Provinces" would apply to an Indian in the South of Madras being sent to a college in the north of the United Provinces, judging from the number of applications he received from Madras and Bombay to enter Rurki; but he did find that when sending a man to actual employment, he experienced tremendous difficulty in getting an Indian to go to the Central Provinces or to Burma, because the man thought he had to settle in that province for the rest of his life.

71,598. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) Out of the 40 upper subordinates who passed out every year, 16 or 17

obtained guaranteed appointments. Such men went out as apprentice overseers for a year on works. They had instructors who were paid by the college, and they had to send in monthly notes of their work; so that they really obtained a good practical training. The remaining 23 all obtained employment somewhere. With regard to the lower subordinate class, the 60 students (now reduced to 40) had no guaranteed appointments to look to, and as a rule it took probably a year to find work for the whole of them. If they did not prefer to wait for permanent Government employment, work of a temporary character could be found for them much sooner. One matter which the witness always complained of was that the sub-overseer, who was a man who required his practical training after his college course even more than his overseer, did not obtain it. It was only the man who went into a Government appointment who received that training. The witness had repeatedly said that every man on passing out from an Indian college should be given a year's practical training by Government. If Government would give such a training, the witness thought the value of those men would be increased, and Government would be repaid a hundredfold. He had not noticed that there had been any increase in the demand from private Indian firms for members of the subordinate classes.

71,599. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Students who did not want any guaranteed appointments did not come to Rurki; their one aim apparently seemed to be to obtain Government work of some description.

71,600. With regard to his remark that the college was not obtaining the best material, what he had more definitely in mind was that for positions in a big Department such as the Engineering service, men were wanted of a certain mental distinction. He was of the opinion that at the present time there were too many men who were the sons of Public Works Department subordinates, apothecaries and so on. It would be better to have a system of nomination by Indian gentlemen, to ensure that the men coming in were from the right class.

71,601. The difference between a man who had taken his degree of Bachelor of Science, and a man who came only with a school leaving certificate, was purely in the subjects of Physics and Chemistry, and to a certain extent in Higher Mathematics. He could not at the moment make any comparison between such men.

71,602. The witness's desire was to have students of a higher social status than the present class. He could give no reason why students of the former class were not at present attracted to Rurki. He was of the opinion, both from the point of view of efficiency and economy, that his scheme for a central college was a better one than a proposal which provided for the development of local colleges.

71,603. The present demands from students in Bengal and Madras and other parts of India for admission to Rurki could be met by strengthening the staff, and there would be no objection to their admission, provided that the number of students from each Province was definitely fixed.

71,604. (*Mr. Madge.*) Rurki possessed most excellent educational workshops. The authorities had, as regards mechanical engineering, an exceedingly difficult problem to face. The college turned out a class known as the mechanical apprentice class, which was recruited from what the witness might term educationally a very low grade man. That class was doing very well. Then there was a class called the technical class, which was supposed to be composed of higher grade men. On the recommendation of the Naini Tal Conference that class was abolished, and a still higher class was started for the relatives of capitalists and manufacturers with the idea of turning out men who might ultimately manage businesses and factories. That went on for four years, but nobody entered it. The conditions were then made easier, and at the present time, in what was called the higher division of the Department of Technology, there were about three men, very far from the class of men Government aimed at, because that class of men would not go in for industrial or mechanical engineering.

71,605. The witness had had domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians under him, and both classes had turned out excellent men, and each had had its failures. The good men had been as efficient as the good Indians. He had had some practical experience of the domiciled Anglo-Indian and the man imported from home, and he should say the imported man was far the better of the two.

71,606. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) Rurki was not maintained at all from Imperial funds; ever since the witness had known it, it had been entirely supported by Provincial funds. In that respect it was on the same footing as the other engineering colleges of India.

71,607. The marking for moral fitness was done in a negative way, in so far as there were no punishments at Rurki, except expulsion. A man who generally had been slack, unpunctual, and who had been misbehaving himself, would find at the end of his career that he had been fined a very considerable number of marks, which appreciably affected his position on the list.

71,608. Privately managed railways did not utilise Rurki to any extent for the supply of engineers and mechanics. Two apprentice overseers and one apprentice engineer were sent every year to railways and the railways assisted very much in the training of the mechanical apprentice class. He had entered into a lengthly correspondence regarding the training of permanent-way inspectors, but nothing had come of it. He had never differentiated much between privately managed and State managed railways.

71,609. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The witness thought the standard at Rurki was as good as that at Woolwich in certain subjects.

71,610. Comparing the mechanical laboratory of the University of Sheffield with that at Rurki, the witness said as far as he could judge from glancing through the copy of the Sheffield calendar on the table everything which was at Sheffield was at Rurki, except the Parson's steam Turbine. In the Electrical Department, he should say Rurki had a good deal more equipment than Sheffield. There was a steel testing laboratory at Rurki. With regard to the metallurgical appliances, there was practically the same equipment at Rurki as at Sheffield. He assumed that all students coming to Rurki would have passed an elementary examination similar to that insisted on at Sheffield.

71,611. Of the Indian students a very large proportion, and of the Anglo-Indians, a very small proportion were capable of undertaking Higher Mathematics.

71,612. (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness could not say on what basis the distribution of appointments was made between the different colleges in India.

71,613. He was conversant with the difficulty, that the present rules for admission to Rurki to a certain extent debarred graduates from entering the course owing to the limits of age; and he was shortly going to bring the matter before the Committee of Management. It would be considered whether it would not be well to raise the minimum age from 17 to 18, and the maximum from 21 to 22.

71,614. The average number of students who came up for the examination in the Civil Engineering class was 60, of whom 20 were admitted. No distinction was made between the different communities in India. The first 20 on the list, no matter of whatever race, passed into the college. The proportion of the domiciled community in the Civil Engineering class was 12 out of 60; and among the Indian students 95 per cent. were Hindus and 5 per cent. were Muhammadans.

71,615. The marks of the students were carried on from year to year, and it was not the case that there was a final competitive examination which alone determined the places of the students obtaining the appointments.

71,616. A medical test was enforced for admission into the college. Marks were given in the final examination for sports and games. Not only had a man to submit a medical certificate signed by a

commissioned officer on entrance, but he was marked for games, gymnastics, athletics, sports and volunteering, and also for physical fitness. Before he left the college he underwent another examination by the Civil Surgeon, who gave him a certificate that he was fit for the Public Service. Such marks affected the position of the candidate in the final list.

71,617. The system of appointing two apprentices for one Government appointment was introduced about 14 years ago. He had not made up his mind whether it was a suitable system or not. Theoretically it was the best system, because in his apprenticeship a man's character and ability to push on work and take responsibility could be tested. On the other hand, it seemed very hard that a man who had worked well at college and passed out top, should perhaps eventually lose his guaranteed appointment to a man who had passed out sixth. On the whole, he would be in favour of abolishing the system.

71,618. With regard to the witness's scheme for recruitment to the Imperial Service, he would have a certain number of appointments allocated to England, to which he would add 5 per cent., and a certain number of appointments allocated to India, to which he would add 30 per cent. All candidates would go through a three years' course of training at Rurki. Both sets of students would work together, as Indian and European students did at the present moment. He did not think his scheme in practice would result in inferior men out of one section obtaining appointments in preference to superior men out of another, because that would be fixed beforehand. If actual examination results did not tally with the approved distribution of appointments as between Indians and Europeans, he would give up the method of publishing marks and would pass students out in classes. The authorities of the college were very anxious to give up publishing marks.

71,619. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) He did not consider the Madras, Bombay and Sibpur Colleges, were quite as well equipped as Rurki, although they could be equally well equipped if Government chose. There was not at present the same restriction for admission into the colleges of other Provinces as there was at Rurki. So far as Madras and Bombay were concerned, it was true that only one appointment in the Imperial Service was given to each of those colleges. He agreed that supposing the Rurki standard of training was introduced into the other colleges, there might be amongst the first five or ten men who entered for the examination a few who were as good as, or better than, the five or six whom Rurki sent into the Imperial Service every year. The reason that Madras and Bombay were given only one place was because the natural characteristics of those races were not particularly adapted for the Civil Engineering profession.

71,620. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) He thought the fee at Rurki for the Engineering class was Rs. 20 a month. The college issued a memorandum of expenses, and it could be taken that the cost for a European was Rs. 120 a month, and for an Indian about Rs. 70. The cost of living had risen in India, and the students had told him they had great difficulty in keeping within those limits, and that probably it would mean another Rs. 10 or Rs. 15 at the present time.

71,621. There were no means by which students who did not obtain Government appointments could get apprenticed or pupilled at other works. The same was true with regard to the upper subordinate officer. The only reason against such a system of apprenticeship was expense. It would cost the Government a good deal to pay such people an allowance during their apprenticeship. It would be absurd to suppose that such men would pay the Government for an apprenticeship. They would not think of doing so for a moment. He did not propose to give men who had been selected in England but trained at Rurki any allowance during the time they were at Rurki. If such a system was put into force, it would mean giving everything free to everybody.

71,622. The only college which he inspected when he was in England eight years ago was Cambridge; he did not go to Glasgow.

71,623. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) It was true that according to the memorandum of expenses published by the authorities of the college, it cost a European two-thirds more than it cost a native to get his training at Rurki. He could not say whether that represented the relative cost of living generally throughout India, but the probability was that it reflected general conditions.

71,624. The reason why he suggested that an Indian student should have a year's practical training in Europe was because he thought it would do the man an enormous amount of good to see the way work was done in England, and that he would be able to get some use out of it, probably more after he had seen work in India for two or three years. He strongly took the view that an Indian would benefit very much more by visiting Europe after serving some years in his own country than he would if he went to Europe merely as a student.

(The witness withdrew.)

Captain H. deL. POLLARD-LOWSLEY, C.I.E., R.E., Under-Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Central Provinces, in the Public Works Department.

71,625. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—The number of Royal Engineer officers permitted to be employed in the Public Works Department (excluding Railways) as sanctioned for five years, from the 1st April, 1905, is thirty and this number is at present employed in the Department. These officers leave the School of Military Engineering, Chatham, after 2 years' service and generally join the Department shortly after arrival in India. They therefore usually join the Department between the age of 21 and 22 and about 2½ years after first commission. Occasionally officers with more, and in some cases considerably more, than 2½ years' service are transferred to the Public Works Department. In paragraph 2 of Public Works Department Resolution No. 154-73-E., dated the 11th February, 1910, it is stated that for purposes of calculating the pay to which an officer is entitled, the first year of service will be reckoned to commence 2½ years from date of first commission, and the manner in which the pay of an officer, whose position on first appointment was especially fixed, shall be calculated is laid down. In paragraph 2 of Public Works Department Resolution No. 6882-E., dated the 18th January, 1911, it is stated that the manner in which the rate of pay admissible to a Royal Engineer officer who entered the Department after the 11th February, 1910, shall be the same as in the Resolution dated the 11th February, 1910. In neither of these Resolutions is the question of the *seniority* of officers of the Royal Engineers entering the Department considered, nor is any reference made to Public Works Department Code, Volume I, paragraph 143, under which an officer entering the Department before he has completed 2½ years' service counts his service from the date on which he enters the Department. It is also laid down in that paragraph (143) that no officer shall add more than one year to his actual service in the Department, but presumably this ruling is cancelled by paragraph 2 of the Resolution dated the 11th February, 1910.

Proposals.—(i) Officers entering the Department before they have completed 2½ years' service shall reckon their service from the date of appointment to the Department both for seniority and pay. In the case of officers who are appointed direct to the Department the date of appointment should be the date of landing in India.

(ii) Officers entering the Department after the completion of 2½ years' service and before completing 7 years' service shall reckon their service in the Department to commence two and a half years from the date of first commission both for seniority and pay.

(iii) Officers entering the Department after having completed 7 years' service or more shall reckon their

service in the Department to commence 2½ years from the date of first commission for pay and 3½ years from the date of first commission for seniority. In the case of officers who are transferred from the Military Works Service to the Public Works Department Service service in the Military Works Service shall count as service in the Public Works Department in fixing their seniority.

The above rules when they are to the advantage of officers already in the Department should have effect from the date of their introduction, but in the case of officers who may be adversely affected by them they should not be applied. In the case of officers whose promotion has been retarded in the past the rule contained in paragraph 2 of the Resolution dated the 11th February, 1910, may continue to apply.

71,626. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—The present system of training at the Royal Military Academy, Woolwich, and the School of Military Engineering, Chatham, produces officers who are in every way capable of undertaking the duties of an officer in the Public Works Department. No period of probation is ordinarily necessary for Royal Engineer officers appointed to the Department and no such period of probation is laid down except in the case of an officer whom it is considered desirable to appoint to a grade higher than that of an Assistant Engineer, 1st grade (*vide* Public Works Department Code, Volume I, paragraph 144). In such cases (*vide* paragraph 145) a period of probation of six months is laid down. It would appear that the conditions of service and pay laid down in paragraph 145 should have been modified in accordance with the Resolution dated the 11th February, 1910, and the 18th January, 1911. It should be possible for the Government of India to decide from a consideration of an officer's previous records of service and reports whether he is likely to be fit for appointment to the Department or not. If, however, this period of probation is considered to be necessary, an officer should, during this period, draw the rate of pay he would be entitled to if appointed permanently to the Department and should not be placed on the pay of an Assistant Engineer.

71,627. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—Now that officers of the Royal Engineers may no longer elect for continuous service* in India, they are liable to compulsory retirement for age under the British Service Regulations. Thus if an officer has not reached the rank of Lieut.-Colonel by the age of 50, he is required to retire from the Army and to vacate his Civil appointment under A.R.I., paragraph 1002. The rules enforcing retirement from the Army require no alteration, but retirement on account of age—under 55—should not entail the vacation of an appointment in the Public Works Department and an officer's pay and pension in the Department should not be affected by his compulsory retirement from the Army. It is true that an officer so retired may be re-appointed by the Government of India, but should there be a block in the Department such re-appointments might not be made and officers of the Royal Engineers are thus placed at a disadvantage.

The existing rates of travelling allowance particularly in the case of transfer are inadequate. There is no doubt that transfers in the interests of the Public Service must involve some expense to the officers transferred, and it is practically impossible to frame rules suitable to all cases. It is, however, suggested that the present rules should be revised and that travelling allowances should be fixed on a more liberal scale and that special rules should be framed to cover transfers.

71,628. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—(1) Royal Engineers on joining the Public Works Department prior to 1906 were given the option of two scales of pay intended to be approximately equal:—

(*a*) Regimental pay *plus* staff pay according to their position in the Department.

(*b*) Consolidated pay depending only on departmental rank *plus* net military pay.

The two scales differed but slightly. Generally speaking there was practically no difference in the Assistant and Executive grades, if anything (*b*) was the better, and (*a*) was the better in the Administrative grades.

(2) Public Works Department Resolution No. 170, published in the *Gazette of India* of the 26th August, 1905, deals with the question of the improvement in the pay of Administrative Officers of the Public Works Department, and in the preamble it is recognized that the pay of Superintending Engineers, 2nd and 3rd Class, then current, was insufficient. The reasons given for the necessity for an immediate increase were (i) to maintain the highest standard of efficiency, and (ii) to retain in the service for the full term of their career officers of the highest professional attainments and ripe experience.

In Standing Order No. 228 of the Public Works Department Code, Volume I, 8th Edition of 1907, the new Civil scale was detailed and with it the scale for Royal Engineer officers on the staff scale pay. To the Standing Order were added certain notes detailing the rules laid down for Royal Engineer officers on the staff scale of pay and the conditions with which they must comply on reaching Administrative rank. From this it will be seen that such officers can only elect the improved Civil scale of pay, while from Standing Order No. 242, dated the 29th August, 1907, it will be seen that Royal Engineer officers on the old consolidated (new Civil) scale draw their Military pay proper in addition, independent of the maximum of the Department. The result of this is that of Royal Engineer officers in the Administrative ranks those on the staff scale who have drawn about the same or somewhat less pay in the Assistant and Executive grades are again, under these orders, much worse off in the Administrative ranks than those who elected the consolidated scale of pay. The difference is considerable, being Rs. 182 in the case of a Major and Rs. 304 in the case of a Lieutenant-Colonel or Colonel. By the publication of a single despatch the parity of the two scales has been entirely destroyed, and yet officers who were adversely affected are allowed no further choice in view of the entirely novel set of conditions thus introduced.

(3) Under Public Works Department Notification No. 675-694-E., dated the 24th April, 1908, an incremental scale of pay was introduced for Civil Engineers in the Public Works Department who had not yet reached the Administrative grades, as it was recognised that in the altered circumstances of the country the existing rates of pay are insufficient to ensure the recruitment of Engineers with the requisite qualifications either in England or in India, or to maintain the standard of efficiency which is requisite to the proper maintenance and control of the great system of public works on which the advance to prosperity of the country so largely depends. The result of the introduction of the new scale of pay was to increase the pay of Civil Engineers by about 16 per cent. and raise the pay of the Civil Engineers nearly to that of the Royal Engineers in the Department, *vide* columns 4 and 9 of Statement I. The pay of the Royal Engineers remained unaltered. *This in the case of Royal Engineer officers on the consolidated Civil scale of pay* plus *net Military pay was contrary to the scale laid down in Public Works Department Code, Volume I of 1907, paragraph 10, where it is stated that "The consolidated scale of pay for Royal Engineers is the Civil scale for the time being."* A further result was that Royal Engineer Assistant Engineers had to serve 11 years before promotion to Executive Engineer against 8 years in the case of a Civilian. It was evidently recognised that the above orders involved an injustice to Royal Engineer officers, as the orders were modified with back effect by Public Works Department Notification No. 154-73-E., dated the 11th February, 1910, which introduced an incremental scale of pay for Royal Engineer officers in the Public Works Department. The scale of pay gives Royal Engineer officers an average of rather less than Rs. 80 per mensem more than Civil Engineers of the same standing, *vide* columns 4 and 10 of Statement I*. The increase of pay in the case of officers of the Royal Engineers was, however, only about 7 per cent. in the case of officers of the Royal Engineers as compared with 15 per cent. in the case of Civil Engineers. Prior to the introduction of this new scale the pay of the Royal Engineer officer was about 19 per cent. more than that of the Civil Engineer. After the alteration the Royal Engineer scale was only about 9 per cent. in excess of the Civil scale.

* *Vide Gazette of India*, dated the 2nd January, 1904.

* *Vide* page 60.

The Government of India, however, again changed their attitude and in Public Works Department Notification No. 63–82–E., dated the 18th January 1911, introduced a new incremental scale of pay for Royal Engineer officers who entered the Department after the 11th February 1910. This new scale of pay was the same as that laid down for Civil Engineers in Public Works Department Notification No. 675-694-E., dated the 24th April 1908. The result of this was that Royal Engineer officers entering the Department after the 11th February 1910, will draw about 2 per cent. less pay than that laid down in paragraph 10 of Public Works Department Code, Volume I (1907), and about 9 per cent. less than Royal Engineer officers who entered the Department prior to the 11th February 1910, and this in face of the reasons already quoted for issuing the Notification dated the 24th April 1908. Further, the arbitrary fixing of the above dated (11th February 1910) has resulted in Royal Engineer officers drawing less pay than brother officers junior to them in the Corps who happened to join the Department before the 11th February 1910.

(4) In thus equalising the scales of pay of Royal Engineer officers and Civil Engineers, the Government of India appear to have overlooked the grounds on which Royal Engineer officers have hitherto been considered as entitled to the net Military pay in addition to the Civil scale of the grade for the time being. These are as follows:—

(1) Royal Engineer officers are liable to be detached for active service in time of war, and while in active service are exposed to war risks to which the Civil Engineer is not exposed unless he volunteers for active service.

(2) They are liable in the interests of the Public Service to be transferred to Military Service at any time.

(3) They have greater liabilities and expenses to meet than Civil Engineers, such as (*a*) Upkeep of uniform; (*b*) Contribution to Mess and Band Funds; (*c*) Enhanced rates for insurance. (In addition to this they are not allowed even to contribute to the General Provident Fund as Civil Engineers do.)

(4) They have to pass Military as well as Civil examinations for promotion—the former up to the rank of Lieut.-Colonel.

(5) Civil Engineers belonging to the Royal Engineer Special Reserve who take up an appointment in the Public Works Department are given (*a*) in the first instance £40 to obtain their uniform though they only require service kit and no full dress, and (*b*) a higher rate of pay than the regular Royal Engineer officers of the same rank while performing Military duty in England.

It is submitted that in no other Department in recent years has there been a reduction in the scale of pay. On the contrary it has generally been recognised that the increased cost of living has justified an increase in the scales of pay, yet in the face of this almost general increase the result of the Government of India Notification dated the 10th January 1911 has been actually to reduce the pay of Royal Engineer officers employed in the Public Works Department by approximately 9 per cent. below that of those who joined prior to the 11th February 1910 and 2 per cent. below that in force prior to 1907.

(5) Taking into consideration the fact that the Royal Engineer officer has liabilities which the Civil Engineer has not, it is proposed that the scale of pay of all Royal Engineer officers in the Public Works Department in the Administrative, Executive and Assistant grades should be fixed with back effect from the 8th March 1908, on the basis laid down in Public Works Department Code, Volume I (1907), paragraph 10, *i.e.*, consolidated pay equal to the scale of pay for Civil Engineers of the same standing *plus* the net Military pay of rank subject to no limitation. If this be done the pay of the Royal Engineer officers in the Executive and Assistant grades will be about 15 per cent. prior to the introduction of the revised scales, while in the administrative ranks the difference and rates of pay will be exactly the same as were permissible for officers who had elected the consolidated scale of pay prior to the issue of Standing Order No. 228 of the Public Works Department Code, Volume I (1907), referred to in paragraph 2 above.

(6) Under paragraph 4 of Public Works Department Resolution No. 154–73–E., dated the 11th February 1910, the pay of an officer of Royal Engineers may not exceed Rs. 900 a month unless he holds a Divisional charge or a charge which, in the opinion of the Local Government or Administration, is of equal importance. Under Public Works Department Resolution No. 63–82–E., dated the 18th January 1911, the limit for officers entering the Department after the 11th February 1910 is Rs. 800. This ruling should not apply in the case of an officer who is reported on as fit to hold the charge of a Division but for whom no Divisional charge is available.

(7) The present division of the rank of Chief Engineer into two classes and the variation of local allowance as Secretary to a Local Government gives rise to the anomaly that the Chief Engineer may be drawing less emoluments than a Chief Engineer junior to him in service in another Province although the work and responsibilities of such posts are exactly similar. It is suggested that there should be only one class of Chief Engineer and that the salary attached to the appointment should be Rs. 3,000 irrespective of whether a Secretaryship to a Local Government goes with the appointment or not. The local allowance of Rs. 250 or 150 might in this event be withdrawn.

(8) It is suggested that the duties and responsibilities attaching to the post of Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department, which appointment is invariably held by an officer specially selected from among Chief Engineers and usually of much longer service than any other Secretary to the Government of India, warrant the appointment being paid at the same rate as Secretaries in the Home, Finance and Commerce and Industry Departments, *viz.*, Rs. 4,000 per mensem.

71,629. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—*Privilege leave.*—Under existing rules, which limit the period of privilege leave which may be taken at one time to three months, it is not infrequently impossible for an officer to avail himself of all the privilege leave which he has earned. This rule operates hardly on the officer who cannot easily be spared, or who is keen to complete the work on which he is employed. It is suggested that the rules should be framed so as to permit an officer, who, for good reasons, is unable to take privilege leave due to him within 33 months, to accumulate such leave up to a maximum of 6 months. The rule which requires an officer taking privilege leave immediately before retirement to return to duty before he retires should be abolished.

Furlough.—The rule prohibiting an officer from taking furlough till an interval of not less than 18 months has elapsed since his return from privilege leave of over six weeks' duration should be abolished. This rule sometimes prevents an officer from taking privilege leave which it may be desirable he should take in the interests of his health.

Under present conditions it is not always possible for an officer to avail himself of all the furlough which he has earned. It would be to the advantage of officers if they were permitted to commute part of their furlough on half pay into half the period on full pay. A limit might be laid down—say, the commutation of 2 years' furlough on half pay into one year on full pay. In order to prevent this concession from acting hardly in the case of an officer who, owing to his having commuted his furlough early in his service, has no furlough available towards the end of his service, when he may require it, it should be provided that an officer may recommute furlough previously taken on full pay into furlough on half pay on making good the extra furlough allowances received by him when the furlough on full pay was taken.

Study leave.—It is understood that a proposal has been made to abolish the Chatham course. If this is done the rules for the grant of study leave to officers of Scientific and Technical Departments should be made applicable to Royal Engineer officers and indeed all officers in the Public Works Department. It is, however, urged that it is most undesirable that this course be abolished. Royal Engineer officers serving in the Public Works Department are

almost entirely out of touch with the Corps, and this course gives them an opportunity to meet many of their brother officers at Chatham, and to bring up to date their knowledge of professional subjects on which they may not have been employed in India.

71,630. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—(1) The maximum pension which can be earned by an officer of the Royal Engineers in the Public Works Department is £700 per annum after 32 years' service from date of first commission. This compares most unfavourably with the pensions admissible to officers of the Indian Medical Service who can earn the following higher pensions:—

	Rs.	
Colonel of the Indian Medical Service after 30 years' service, of which 3 years' active service is in the rank of Colonel	825	Army Regulations, India, Volume I, paras. 726 and 728
Colonel of the Indian Medical Service after 30 years' service, of which 5 years' active service is in the rank of Colonel	950	
Surgeon-General of the Indian Medical Service after 30 years' service, of which 3 years' active service is in the rank of Surgeon-General	1,050	

(2) Civil Engineers who joined the Public Works Department not later than 1898 can qualify for extra pensions as follows:—

Rs. 1,000 (£87–10) per annum for 3 years' service as Superintending Engineer

Rs. 1,000 (£87–10) per annum for 3 years' service as Chief Engineer.

The above extra pensions have been modified in Article 643 for officers entering the Department after 1898, and, in the case of such officers only one extra pension may be drawn. No such extra pensions are permissible for officers of the Royal Engineers.

(3) The pension of an officer of the Royal Engineers who enters the Department after the 31st December, 1904 and who completes not less than 20 years' Indian service for pension is that admissible under the Royal Warrant *plus* such portion of the difference between the retired pay of the Royal Engineers generally and the Indian Army pension belonging to his total length of service as is represented by the proportion his Indian pension service bears to the minimum total service that would have qualified him for the beforementioned Indian Army pension.

(4) An officer who comes to India immediately after leaving the School of Military Engineering, Chatham, can earn his full pension of £700 a year, provided he serves continuously in India at the age of 51 or 52, after completing 32 years' service from the date of first commission. At this time an officer would ordinarily be a Chief Engineer unless he is considered unfit for advancement to that rank, but though he he may serve for a further period of three years and, say, hold the appointment of Secretary to the Government of India or Inspector-General of Irrigation he is entitled to no extra pension on this account. It is considered that an officer of the Royal Engineers, who is promoted to the rank of Chief Engineer, should receive an additional pension of £40 per annum, for each year's service as Chief Engineer up to 3 years, and that a further addition of £40 per annum should be made to the pension of an officer for each year's effective service as Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department or Inspector-General of Irrigation up to three years. An officer who obtains a pension as Secretary to the Government of India or Inspector-General of Irrigation would of course draw the full pension of a Chief Engineer of three years' service in addition to the pension as Secretary or Inspector-General of Irrigation. Under these proposals the ordinary pension of an officer of the Royal Engineers in the Public Works Department will remain at £700 per annum and the maximum wil be £940 per annum, which is less than that of a Colonel of the Indian Medical Service, who has done 30 years' service, of which 5 years has been in the rank of Colonel.

71,631. **(IX.) Other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—There appears to be no good reason why officers of the Royal Engineers should be excluded from the benefits of the General Provident Fund. It is suggested that this should be open to them to subscribe to it.

I.—*Statement showing comparison of different scales of pay of Imperial Civil Engineers and Royal Engineer Officers as revised from time to time.*

(*Referred to in paragraph* 71,628.)

Year of service.	Imperial Civil Engineers. Rank.	Pay (old) including exchange compensation allowance.	Revised scale of pay.	Difference between columns 3 and 4. Plus.	Minus.	Year of Service.	Royal Engineers. Rank.	Staff scale of pay. Pay (old) including exchange compensation allowance.	Revised scale of pay for officers in service prior to 11th February, 1910.	Revised scale of pay for officers entering the service on 11th February, 1910.	Difference between columns 9 and 10. Plus.	Minus.	Difference between columns 9 and 11. Plus.	Minus.	Difference between columns 10 and 11. Plus.	Minus.
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17
1st	Assistant Engineer, 3rd grade.	372	380	8	...	1st ...	Lieutenant and Assistant Engineer, 3rd grade.	494	460	380	...	34	...	114	...	80
2nd	Do. do. ...	372	420	48	...	2nd ...	Do. do. ...	494	500	420	6	...	...	74	...	80
3rd	Do. do. ...	372	460	88	...	3rd ...	Do. do. ...	494	340	460	46	...	...	34	...	80
4th	Do. 2nd grade...	478	500	22	...	4th ...	Do. 2nd grade ...	548	580	500	32	..	...	48	...	80
5th	Do. do. ...	478	540	62	...	5th ...	Do. do. ...	548	620	540	72	...	...	8	...	80
6th	Do. do. ...	478	580	102	...	6th ...	Do. do. ...	548	660	580	112	...	32	...	...	80
						6½th ...	Do. do. ...	548 } 574	...	...	112	...	32	...	...	80
7th	Do. 1st grade...	584	620	36	...	7th ...	Do. 1st grade ...	600 }	700	620	100	...	20	...	...	80
8th	Do. do. ...	584	660	76	...	8th ...	Do. do. ...	600	750	660	150	...	60	...	...	90
9th	Do. do. ...	584	(a) E. E. 700	116	...	9th ...	Captain and do. ...	780	(a) E. E. 800	(a) E. E. 700	20	...	...	80	...	100
10th	Do. do. ...	584	750	166	...	10th ...	Do. do. ...	780	850	750	70	..	...	30	...	100
11th	Executive Engineer, 3rd grade.	743	800	57	...	11th ...	Captain and Executive Engineer, 3rd grade.	885	900	800	15	...	...	85	...	100
12th	Do. do. ...	743	850	107	...	12th ...	Do. do. ...	885	950	850	65	...	..	35	...	100
13th	Do. do. ...	743	900	157	...	13th ...	Do. do. ...	885	1,300	900	115	...	15	...	...	100
14th	Do. do. ...	743	950	207	...	14th ...	Do. do. ...	885	1,050	950	165	...	65	...	...	100
						14½th ...	Do. do. ...	885 } 938	..	...	165	...	65	...	...	100
15th	Do. 2nd grade...	903	1,000	97	...	15th ...	Do. 2nd grade ...	991 }	1,100	1,000	109	...	9	...	...	100
16th	Do. do. ...	903	1,050	147	...	16th ...	Do. do. ...	991	1,150	1,050	159	...	59	...	...	100
17th	Do. do. ...	903	1,100	197	...	17th ...	Do. do. ...	991	1,200	1,100	209	..	109	...	...	100
18th	Do. do. ...	903	1,150	247	...	18th ...	Major and do. ...	1,143	1,250	1,150	107	...	7	...	...	100
19th	Do. 1st grade...	1,062	1,200	138	...	19th ...	Major and Executive Engineer, 1st grade.	1,318	1,250	1,200	...	68	...	118	...	50
20th	Do. do. ...	1,062	1,250	188	...	20th ...	Do. do. ...	1,318	1,250	1,250	...	68	...	68	...	...
21st	Do. do. ...	1,062	1,250	188	...	21st ...	Do. do. ...	1,318	1,250	1,250	...	68	...	68	...	...
22nd	Do. do. ...	1,062	1,250	188	...	22nd ...	Do. do. ...	1,318	1,250	1,250	...	68	...	68	...	...
	Total ...	15,718	18,360	2,642	...		Total ...	18,735	20,060	18,360	...	...	...	...	...	...

Column 4 exceeds Column 3 by 16 per cent.

(a) Officers already in service on the 15th May, 1912, are entitled to Executive rank in their ninth year of service, but future entrants will obtain this rank in the 11th year of service, *vide* paragraph 2 of Government of India Resolution No. 439–458–E., dated the 15th May, 1912.

[*Continued.*

Captain POLLARD-LOWSLEY called and examined.

71,632. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he joined the Department when he was 22 years of age, and had been 14 years in the service. There were 30 officers of the Royal Engineers in the Department, and the views expressed in the written statement were those of his colleagues. Royal Engineer officers in the Public Works Department and the Railway Department considered that instead of being allowed the ordinary civil rates of pay, they should receive the ordinary civil rates of pay *plus* the net military pay of their rank.

71,633. The past history in regard to pay given to Royal Engineers in the Department was somewhat complicated. Before 1906 a Royal Engineer officer could choose between one of two classes of pay: (1) civil rates *plus* net military pay, and (2) regimental pay *plus* staff pay. The effect of the 1907 rules was to abolish (1) for all officers entering the Department after 15th October 1906; to increase the emoluments of Royal Engineer officers already in the Department, and drawing pay under (1) on reaching the administrative ranks, in that such officers were allowed to draw the new civil rates of pay *plus* net military pay; and to give officers already in the department and drawing pay under (2) the option of continuing on that scale in the administrative ranks or drawing the improved civil rates of pay in those ranks *without* net military pay.

71,634. In 1908 the rates of pay of Civil Engineers in the Executive and Assistant grades were increased. The increase was 16 per. cent. and raised the pay of Civil Engineers in these ranks to very nearly the same as that of Royal Engineer officers already in the Department, who continued to draw pay as follows:—

(i) *Consolidated.*—The *previous* Civil rates of pay *plus* net military pay.

(ii) *Staff.*—Staff pay *plus* military pay and allowance of rank.

71,635. In 1910 a new scale was introduced for Royal Engineer officers already in the Department to take effect from 8th March 1908. This scale gave Royal Engineer officers pay in the Executive and Assistant grades in excess of that drawn by Civil officers by about 9 per cent. Under this scale no military pay could be drawn by Royal Engineer officers.

71,636. In 1911 the Government of India decided that in the case of new entrants only civil pay should be allowed, and no military pay.

71,637. Asked how far the 9 per cent. referred to corresponded to the amount of net military pay, the witness explained that net military pay varied with rank. A subaltern's net military pay was Rs. 70, and the average pay of an Assistant Engineer in the Civil Department under the 1910 rules was about Rs. 500, so that the percentage would be about 14; that was to say, civil pay *plus* net military pay would have given an additional 14 per cent. instead of the additional 9 per cent. which subalterns obtained under the 1910 Resolution. A Captain's net military pay was Rs. 140, and an Executive Engineer drew on an average about Rs. 1,000, and here the result was the same as it was in the case of the subaltern. The percentage was difficult to ascertain in the case of a Major. A Major was paid Rs. 180 net military pay, and probably he would be a Superintending Engineer drawing Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 1,750. Taking an average of Rs. 1,600, the percentage would still be the same—about 14.

71,638. The witness based his complaint on the following grounds; it was laid down that the consolidated scale of pay for Royal Engineers should be the civil scale for the time being. Under that ruling, Royal Engineer officers should get the ordinary scale of pay of the Civil Engineers *plus* net military pay. Actually their pay had been reduced below that. That was to say they were not getting what was laid down as their correct scale of pay prior to 1906. The order seemed to have become a dead-letter. His complaint referred both to officers who had entered prior to 1910 and to officers who had entered since, but he agreed that those who had entered in the last two or three years had entered under definite conditions. He could not say whether there had been any falling off of recruits to the Department of late years.

71,639. The witness suggested that Royal Engineer officers should receive higher pay than Civil officers in the Public Works Department, because Royal Engineer officers had certain additional expenses, and were also liable for military service. He thought such reasons would justify Government in paying more than the civil rate. There were a good many Civil Engineers now in the special war reserve, but they were not getting any additional concessions over their colleagues.

71,640. The witness admitted, with regard to his argument for higher pay, that the whole conditions of service would have to be taken into consideration in order to arrive at a fair estimation. The conditions of pension of the Royal Engineers were considerably better than those of Civil Engineers. The Royal Engineer got a pension of £700 a year and provision was also made for his widow and children. There was no such provision for the family of the Civil Engineer. The witness did not admit, however, that that was a factor which should be taken into consideration. Royal Engineers came under the same pension rules as the Indian Army. Although they came out to India under military conditions, they actually served in civil employ. It was only in abnormal circumstances that Royal Engineers would revert to military employ.

71,641. The witness could not at the moment produce figures to shew how the civil rates of the Public Works Department compared with the pay a Royal Engineer officer would receive in his regiment, but he would send them to the Commission.*

71,642. It was true that Royal Engineers were allowed to reckon their first year of service in the Department as commencing 2½ years from the date of first commission, but that did not give them any advantage. Taking the top 15 Majors, and the top 15 Captains in the Sappers, their average age, 2½ years after commission, was 21 years and 10 months; that was to say, if they were joining the Public Works Department, they would count their service from the age of 21 years and 10 months. Taking the 30 Coopers Hill men employed in the United Provinces, it would be found that their average age on joining was 21 years and 11 months. The rule had been interpreted as meaning that an officer of the Royal Engineers who joined the Public Works Department before he had completed 2½ years' service did not count his service from the time he joined. Although he was in the Department, an officer was not allowed to count his service until he had completed his 2½ years' service from date of first commission, the witness did not think the rule was originally intended to mean that.

71,643. He could not say what was the average age at which a Royal Engineer officer joined the Department. A man generally joined before he had finished three to four years' actual service, but there were men who came in later. It was impossible to estimate the age of those men. There were not many cases of Royal Engineer officers entering the service at ages between 25 and 33. The witness desired to point out that any officer who came in late not only superseded Public Works Department officers, but Royal Engineer officers who were in the same Province. He himself had been superseded by three, but he had not considered it a matter for complaint. The men were wanted to bring up the establishment to the cadre, and had to be brought in, and they could not be obtained from anywhere else. He had suggested in his written statement that men who came in when they had had more than seven years' service should lose one year for seniority, at the same time receiving the pay which they would have got if they had joined 2½ years from the date of commission.

71,644. It might be inconvenient to Government to impose an age limit for the recruitment of Royal Engineer officers to the Public Works Department because Government might desire to bring certain

* *Vide* paragraph 71,662.

men in, especially as the Public Works Department was so very shorthanded. If the rule which he had just suggested was adopted, he did not think it would be necessary to fix an age limit, because it might deter officers of the Military Works Service, or other Branches of the Royal Engineers, from entering the Public Works Department late in life.

71,645. The witness could not possibly agree with the suggestion that Royal Engineers coming into the Public Works Department should be placed at the bottom of the list.

71,646. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) It was the practice for a Royal Engineer to count his first year of service in the Department as commencing 2½ years after his commission, or from the date of his entering the Department, whichever was earliest, but the latest rules had gone entirely against that; he meant that paragraph 143 of Volume I of the Public Works Department still stood, but it was not observed.

71,647. The witness did suggest that in the case of an officer entering the Department after seven years' service, his first year of service should count from 3½ years after his commission, instead of 2½. The witness had no reason for suggesting the figure of 3½ years, except that he wanted to lay down something which might deter officers entering late in their service. He had taken the figure of seven years in order to give an officer a reasonable chance of putting in some service in England, and then coming out to India to join the Department if he so desired to do so.

71,648. The witness could find no rules regulating seniority. Apparently, although an officer counted his first year for pay as commencing 2½ years after commission in the Army, he did not necessarily count his seniority from the same point.

71,649. A Royal Engineer would have to retire from the Army, if he was not a Lieutenant-Colonel, by the age of 50. A Royal Engineer when he retired from the Army also had to retire from the Public Works Department, unless the Government of India re-appointed him, and the particular request which the witness and his colleagues made was that retirement from the Army under Army Regulations should not necessarily compel an officer to retire from the Public Works Department. In other words, so far as service in the Public Works Department was concerned, he should be under the civil rules for retirement.

71,650. He believed that the contributions made by Royal Engineer officers to mess and band funds were obligatory.

71,651. The Chatham course referred to in the written statement was generally known as a refreshing course. Officers went to Chatham for six months, passed through various courses in various subjects and got more or less in touch with the corps. A man had to complete 10 years' Indian Service before he could take such a course. The witness would be very sorry to see it abolished.

71,652. When serving in the Public Works Department, Royal Engineers came under the civil leave rules.

71,653. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The witness was not absolutely sure whether a sapper who was in the Civil Engineering branch, could revert to military employment. He could revert to duty in England, so the witness took it that he could revert to military employ in India.

71,654. There was not so much discontent with the 1910 rate of pay as there was with the 1911 rate of pay. He thought future entrants would enter the Survey Department in preference to any other.

71,655. (*Mr. Sly.*) The reason why the witness suggested that Military Works service should count as service in the Public Works Department, was because the Military Works and Public Works Departments were doing the same kind of work. He thought a man who had been serving all his time in Military Works should be entirely fitted for the Public Works, and he did not see any reason why such a man should lose anything as compared to the civil officer.

71,656. It was very difficult to assess at a definite figure the actual expense of a Royal Engineer as compared with those of a Civil Engineer, but he thought £40 a year would cover all the items. A Royal Engineer did not reap any advantages from the special payments he had to make; he did not have a chance of wearing his uniform, and hardly ever saw the Chatham mess. Royal Engineers in civil employ would not welcome a suggestion that such payments should be abolished; they still took much interest in the corps.

71,657. With regard to the suggestion that the witness's scheme for pensions of the Royal Engineers would involve a consideration of the pensions of the whole of the Indian Army, the witness pointed out that the Indian Army had the same scale of pay as the Department. The officers of the Army rose to Rs. 700, and considerably higher if they became Generals or Lieutenant-Generals; whereas the Royal Engineers had no such prospects and had to stop at the Rs. 700 grade, and also retire at 55.

71,658. The witness thought the privilege of being allowed to subscribe to the General Provident Fund could be extended to Royal Engineers in civil employ without it being given to Royal Engineers in other employ.

71,659. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The reason why Royal Engineers were in the Public Works Department was because a certain reserve of Royal Engineer officers had to be kept up in India, and there was not enough work in the Military Works Department to employ all the sappers required to be kept in India. The witness did not think it would be logical to draw the conclusion from this that when Royal Engineers had come to an end of their military employment, they must also come to an end of their civil employment. The only case in which an officer would come to the end of his military employment before arriving at the termination of his civil employment was where an officer had the bad fortune to be too old to pass his promotion examination.

71,660. With regard to the additional expenses of the Royal Engineer officer in civil employ he quite agreed that, being military charges, it seemed unreasonable to impose them upon the Public Works Department; he thought the Military Department ought to pay them.

71,661. (*Mr. Madge.*) The witness thought that although Royal Engineers were admitted into the Civil Department as a Military Reserve, the Civil Department obtained a considerable advantage by the introduction of Army officers.

(The witness withdrew.)

71,662. Captain Pollard-Lowsley subsequently put in the following Note comparing the pay drawn by officers of the Royal Engineers with Military Works Services in the Public Works Department under the Rules of 1911. (Government of India Resolution No. 63/82/E of 18th January, 1911):—

The attached Statement A compares the pay drawn by officers of the Royal Engineers in the Military Works Services and the Public Works Department from 2½ years to 35½ years after first Commission. An officer ordinarily arrives in India after completing 2 to 2½ years' service at about the age of 22 years, and will usually have reached the age of 55 after 35½ years total service, when he will—if in the Public Works Department—be required to retire. No allowance has been made for periods spent on leave, as it is extremely difficult to make such allowance with any accuracy, but the matter is considered generally below. Also no allowance is made on account of officiating appointments in either service.

(2) Statements B and C show that in the Military Works Services an officer would ordinarily draw Rs. 4,09,008, while in the Public Works Department he would ordinarily draw Rs. 4,69,320. The difference

between these figures (Rs. 60,312) does not, however, represent correctly the difference between the emoluments of the two Services for the following reasons:—

(i) In the Military Works Services an officer receives free medical attendance for himself, his wife, and children. In the Public Works Department free medical attendance is given only to the officer himself. It is permissible for an officer to compound with the Civil Surgeon for attendance on his family for one week's pay a year. If it be assumed that an officer is married by the time he reaches the rank of Captain, the deduction to be made on this account is Rs. $\frac{4,69,320 - 54,182}{52}$ = Rs. 7,983. Usually, Royal Engineer officers in the Public Works Department marry before they reach the rank of Captain, and it may be taken that this figure makes some allowance for periods spent on leave.

(ii) In the Military Works Services it is permissible for an officer to obtain two months' privilege leave a year, while in the Public Works Department only one month is allowed. It is true that in both services the leave is frequently unobtainable but for purposes of this comparison it must be assumed that the leave ordinarily is obtainable, and that the Military Works officer is paid for 10 months' duty and the Public Works Department officer for 11 months. If only one month leave were permissible in the Military Works Services, it would be reasonable to increase the pay of an officer in that service by Rs. $\frac{4,09,008 + 2\frac{3}{4}}{27\frac{1}{2}}$ = Rs. 40,900.

(iii) In the Public Works Department an officer of the Royal Engineers while on furlough receives pay at the rate of £500 a year, or half the last salary, whichever is least. In the Military Works Services an officer does not receive £500 a year on furlough until he has completed 24 years' service. It would be reasonable to allow, as the advantage secured by the officer in the Public Works Department on this account, a sum of £400 or Rs. 6,000.

(3) If the above be taken into account, the emoluments of the two services compare as follows:—

Military Works Services—Rs. 4,09,008 + 40,900 − 6,000 = Rs. 4,43,908.

Public Works Department—Rs. 4,69,320 − 7,983 = Rs. 4,61,337.

The difference between the emoluments of the services is, then, Rs. 17,429 in favour of the Public Works Department.

(4) Against this advantage in the shape of pay, the officer in the Military Works Services has the following advantages which it is not possible to assess:—

(*a*) He can continue in the service after the age of 55 and is eligible for promotion to the rank of General Officer, while an officer in the Public Works Department is obliged to retire at the age of 55. General officers are entitled to the following pensions:—

	£
Major-General	800 (per annum)
Lieutenant-General	900 ,, ,,
General (after three years from date of promotion to Lieutenant-General) ...	1,000 ,, ,,

In the Public Works Department an officer of the Royal Engineers cannot obtain a pension in excess of £700 per annum.

(*b*) As an unmarried officer, he is often able to live in a mess at a cheaper rate than an officer in the Public Works Department can live in his own bungalow.

(*c*) As a junior officer, he draws travelling allowance at Rs. 5 a day, while in the Public Works Department an Assistant Engineer draws Rs. 4 a day when his salary is less than Rs. 500.

(*d*) Stations in the Military Works Services are generally better than in the Public Works Department.

(5) The above notes show that while the pay of a Royal Engineer officer in the Public Works Department is, roughly, only about Rs. 17,429 better than that of an officer in the Military Works Services, the prospects and amenities of the Military Works Services are a good deal better than those of an officer in the Public Works Department.

STATEMENT A.

Comparing Rates of Pay of Royal Engineer Officers in the Military Works, Services, and Public Works Department.

Year of Service after 1st Commission.	Rank.	Pay. Military Works Services.	Pay. Public Works Department.
		Rs. a. p.	Rs.
2½	2nd Lieutenant	332 14 0	380
3	Lieutenant	441 12 0	380
3½	Do.	441 12 0	420
4½	Do.	441 12 0	460
5½	Do	441 12 0	500
6½	Do.	441 12 0	540
7	Do.	533 11 8	540
7½	Do.	533 11 8	580
8½	Do.	533 11 8	620
9½	Do.	533 11 8	660
10½	Do.	533 11 8	700
11	Captain	759 3 5	700
11½	Do.	759 3 5	750
12½	Do.	759 3 5	800
13½	Do.	759 3 5	850
14½	Do.	759 3 5	900
15	Do.	810 15 4	900
15½	Do.	810 15 4	950
16½	Do.	810 15 4	1,000
17½	Do.	810 15 4	1,050
18½	Do.	810 15 4	1,100
19½	Do.	810 15 4	1,150
20	Major	1,177 13 2†	1,150
20½	Do.	1,177 13 2†	1,200
21½	Do.	1,177 13 2†	1,250
22	Do.	1,177 13 2†	1,250
23	Do.	1,177 13 2†	1,250
24	Do.	1,177 13 2†	1,250
25	A.C.R.E.	1,259 9 1	1,500‡
26	Do.	1,259 9 1	1,500‡
27	Do.	1,259 9 1	1,500‡
28	Do.	1,259 9 1	1,750§
29	Lt.-Col. and A.C.R.E. ...	1,681 1 11	1,750§
30	Do. ..	1,681 1 11	1,750§
31	Do. ...	1,681 1 11	2,000††
32	Do. ...	1,681 1 11	2,000††
33	Col. and Divn. C.R.E. ...	2,106 5 11	2,500¶
34	Do. ...	2,106 5 11	2,500¶
35	Do. ...	2,106 5 11	2,750‖
35½	Do. ...	2,106 5 11	2,750‖

* Includes Exchange Compensation Allowance.
† Includes Rs. 30 per mensem House Allowance.
‡ Superintending Engineer, Class III.
§ Superintending Engineer, Class II.
†† Superintending Engineer, Class I.
¶ Chief Engineer, Class II.
‖ Chief Engineer, Class I.

STATEMENT B.

Showing the total pay drawn by an officer in the Military Works Services (excluding all periods of leave except privilege leave).

		per mensem. Rs. a. p.		Rs. a. p.
6	months at	332 14 0	... ...	1,997 4 0
4	years ,,	441 12 0	... ...	21,204 0 0
4	,, ,,	533 11 8	... ...	25,619 0 0
4	,, ,,	759 3 5	... ...	36,422 4 0
5	,, ,,	810 15 4	... ...	48,657 8 0
5	,, ,,	1,177 13 2	... ...	70,744 6 0
4	,, ,,	1,259 9 1	... ...	60,459 4 0
4	,, ,,	1,681 1 11	... ...	80,693 12 0
2½	,, ,,	2,106 5 11	... ...	63,191 1 6
			Total ...	409,008 7 6

STATEMENT C.

Showing the pay drawn by an officer of Royal Engineers in the Public Works Department under the rules of 1911 *(exclusive of all periods of leave except privilege leave).*

	Rs. per mensem.		Rs.
1 year at	380	... ...	4,560
,, ,,	420	... ...	5,040
,, ,,	460	... ...	5,520
,, ,,	500	... ...	6,000
,, ,,	540	... ...	6,480
,, ,,	580	... ...	6,960
,, ,,	620	... ...	7,440
,, ,,	660	... ...	7,920
,, ,,	700	... ...	8,400
,, ,,	750	... ...	9,000
,, ,,	800	... ...	9,600
,, ,,	850	... ...	10,200
,, ,,	900	... ...	10,800
,, ,,	950	... ...	11,400
,, ,,	1,000	... ...	12,000
,, ,,	1,050	... ...	12,600
,, ,,	1,100	... ...	13,200
,, ,,	1,150	... ...	13,800
,, ,,	1,200	... ...	14,400
3½ years ,,	1,250	... ...	52,500
3 ,, ,,	1,500	... ...	54,000
3 ,, ,,	1,750	... ...	63,000
2 ,, ,,	2,000	... ...	48,000
2 ,, ,,	2,500	... ...	60,000
½ ,, ,,	2,750	... ...	16,500
		Total	Rs. 469,320

F. M. PURVES, ESQ., Temporary Engineer (Irrigation), Punjab.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,663. [*Note.*—The first intimation received by Temporary Engineers that their Service would have to submit a Written Statement was received by wire No. 02253 E. addressed to Mr. F. Marshall Purves on the 6th October 1913. The time at disposal for the submission of a Statement, on a subject fraught with issues so momentous to a large body of Professional men, has been quite insufficient to admit of completeness. This Statement can only, therefore, deal with the general conditions of the Temporary Engineer Service, and it is earnestly requested that the various Provincial witnesses, who, it is hoped, will be summoned, be given opportunity to explain the special considerations affecting the conditions of Service, which vary in matters of detail in each Province.

The Non-controversial Written Statement prepared under the orders of the Government of India on the Public Works Department, makes no mention of Temporary Service, presumably because even now after over twenty years of regular employment, the Temporary Engineer has been allotted no recognised niche in the economy of State Service. It, therefore, becomes imperative that this one deals more fully with the Temporary Engineer Service than might, otherwise have been necessary.

The Provincial Service, which includes a somewhat smaller number of men than those in Temporary Service, has been allotted two Co-opted members and suitable representation by witnesses; but the latter Service has only to be represented by one general witness, which is quite inadequate, and it is, therefore, feared that the importance of the Temporary Engineer Service will not receive its just recognition.

This Written Statement does not deal with Temporary Engineers in the Railway Branch.]

71,664. The Public Works Department is composed of several Services, the members of which, though recruited on a differentiating scale, carry out the same duties in the various branches. The Services are distinguished as—

(1) Imperial Engineers, with certain favourable Rules; Imperial Engineers with less favourable Rules; and Royal Engineers.

(2) Provincial Engineers, with extremely unfavourable Rules.

(3) Temporary Engineers, with no fixed Rules, beyond those applicable to purely Temporary Service; a few Engineers, covenanted in England for fixed terms, are included.

The Department suffers greatly in efficiency from such a composition as that described above, and the general opinion of all India-recruited Engineers, which include a large proportion of Imperial Engineers, would seem to be that all Engineers should be on an equality in respect of all matters touching salaries, leave and Pension Rules, and general conditions of Service.

Many and various are the arguments in favour of, and against, the salaries of Provincial Engineers being on a lower scale than those of Engineers recruited in England. Justification for such differentiation would only exist if the Engineers imported were specialists. But there is no evidence to show that they are specialists in any higher degree than men trained in India.

It is not intended to further comment on the Permanent Services in this Memorandum, for, no doubt, full consideration has been given in their Memoranda to all questions of salary, service, etc. But it will be necessary to introduce the conditions of Permanent Service, for purposes of comparison. Without such comparison the disadvantages, which dog the Temporary Engineer in respect to pay, position and prospects cannot be placed in their correct perspective.

71,665. *TEMPORARY ENGINEERS.—Definiton.*—Temporary Service is one carrying a definite rate of pay sanctioned for a limited period (Article 77, Civil Service Regulations) and this kind of service has always been in vogue; but the present day Temporary Engineer is practically permanent and is in reality only temporary in name. 'This will be elucidated in the course of this Statement.

71,666. **Method of Recruitment:** *WITH BRIEF HISTORY.*—Hitherto there has been no special method of recruitment and men considered suitable have been, from time to time, added. So that the Service now includes:—

(1) Men with Diplomas from Indian and English Engineering Colleges,

(2) Men with experience gained elsewhere, and

(3) Men without Diplomas, who have been nominated and trained from the beginning, by the Government.

Over twenty years ago there was a great block in the Public Works Department and many members of the Department were, of necessity, kept in Sub-Divisional charge for periods extending to fourteen and fifteen years as Assistant Engineers. Government then appear to have adopted the principle of recruiting Temporary Engineers, *seemingly* to fill the lower posts for the purpose of facilitating promotion in the permanent ranks, without any consideration of the effect on the position and prospects of the Temporary Engineers, so employed, and without declaring such intention to those most nearly interested. Had this intention been made known few, if any, of the men of the class now in the service would have accepted so invidious a position, except from direst necessity. Synchronously with this form of recruitment special retirement rules were introduced, and recruitment to the permanent ranks was reduced to a very large extent, while the recruitment of Temporary Engineers continued with unabated vigour. The result of these measures was to largely deplete the Department of Permanent Engineers, and it became obvious that the Temporary Engineer must be employed permanently to keep up the strength of the Department, whose activities, in all directions, have increased enormously. In the earlier days attempts were made to recruit suitable men, on purely temporary work; but this proved to have been a failure, and it was seen that it would be most advantageous for Government to recruit young Temporary Engineers, train

them and employ them continuously without incurring any liability in respect of pensions. This latter procedure was specially necessary in the case of Irrigation Officers; for Irrigation is a specialised branch of Engineering, and whatever a man's Engineering knowledge, a sound training in his special work is essential in the case of an Irrigation Officer.

Though it was clearly understood several years ago that the Temporary Engineer had come to stay, and was in all respects, except pensions, practically permanent, no special rules with reference to recruitment, salary, leave, and general conditions of service were promulgated. As it was in the beginning so it is down to this time, that men—trained professional men— have to work on under conditions, which would not be tolerated in private concerns. That Temporary Engineers have borne patiently their burdens, has seemingly been assumed as a sign of contentment; but it does not appear to have been conceived as possible, that a sense of dignity would enable a Temporary Engineer Officer to suffer in silence, and a sense of duty support him to do his best under all conditions. It has generally been accepted that the employment of Temporary Engineers for long periods on general work *without special rules*, has been a serious mistake; but no one in authority has considered it either his duty to his Government, or to his neighbour to remedy, by some worthy scheme, the unhappy state of affairs. But one attempt alone has been made to face the situation, and that was by a former Secretary to Government, in January 1913, who suggested, that subordinates should replace Temporary Engineers, who in turn were to be cast adrift, because "Temporary Engineers become discontented and inefficient"—a comment as unhappy as unfortunate.

It cannot be wondered at that Temporary Engineers are discontented, but it comes as a surprise that, therefore, they are considered inefficient. If discontent spells inefficiency, then there are many others, besides Temporary Engineers, who might be classed as "inefficient." The scheme, however, since it offers no material advantages but the great disadvantages of increased expenditure with decreased efficiency, is not likely to be carried out to the bitter end. Thus the only attempt to do something—*anything*—to remedy a state of affairs which is becoming daily, both to the Government and to men concerned, more and more untenable, still leaves the Irrigation Temporary Engineer at least, where he was — neither wiped off the face of the troubled waters, nor impressed. Further on, proposals will be put forward which will possibly be found to be of equal advantage to Government and to Temporary Engineers generally. Unless the Service is vastly improved, false economy is bound to bring its own retribution, in the introduction of an inferior class of men, who, besides being less efficient, will not possess that high code of honour which has hitherto obtained and without which an important Department cannot be efficiently officered.

71,667. **Conditions of service.**—The appointment of every Temporary Engineer is sanctioned for 12 months at a time, for each calendar year, and every man is liable to discharge with one month's notice.* This is in accordance with what is known as purely Temporary Service. Temporary Engineers are employed ostensibly, as put forth in the Public Works Code to allow of the expansion and contraction of the Permanent Engineer Establishment, according to needs, and have no special rights and privileges. In actual practice, however, Temporary Engineers have really been employed as part of the regular permanent establishment, without one single right or privilege accorded to the Pensionable Permanent Establishment. That they are practically permanent is proved by the facts that:—

(1) They have to pass all Departmental Examinations and Tests under pain of loss of increment.

(2) They are forced to subscribe to a General Provident Fund.

(3) It has lately been decided by Government that increments shall only be given once every two years, *so that the Temporary Engineers may not rise too rapidly*. This latter clause leads to the obvious conclusion that the Temporary Engineer is to be retained for long periods. For, when a young man starts on 200 rupees per mensem, it will take him 24 years to get to the maximum salary of 800 rupees per mensem, with an increment of 50 rupees given every two years. Can it really be expected that any man will rest contented for several subsequent years before retirement, on a salary of 800 rupees per mensem? There are a very large percentage of Temporary Engineers, ranging from 5 to 42 per cent. of the Permanent Establishment in the various Provinces; and these men have been employed for long periods; so that the contention, hitherto put forward, that Temporary Engineers are employed for flexibility must go by the board; and is, under the circumstances explained, untenable. The enormous extensions taking place all over India to irrigation and other works, accentuates the fact that the Temporary Engineers at present employed, whatever the future may bring forth, must be retained in permanent employ; not only to carry out works but to adequately maintain them. What form that permanency might reasonably take will be discussed later.

The disabilities of the Service, as put forth briefly below, though in themselves serious enough, lead to much friction in detail between Permanent and Temporary Engineers, which ought not to be allowed to exist, as it detracts from general efficiency. It will serve no useful purpose to elaborate this statement by examples; but, when the members of one class of Public Servants carrying out the same work as another and more favoured class are treated as Ishmaelites, there is serious cause of apprehension that Government interests will suffer. The main grievances of most Temporary Engineers may be summed up briefly as follow:—

(*a*) Uncertainty of tenure of office in spite of years of loyal service.

(*b*) Insufficient prospects, with uncertainty and inequality in increase to salaries.

(*c*) Inability with reference to (*a*) and (*b*) to make future provision.

(*d*) The absence of any definite rules to suit the present conditions.

(*e*) The insufficiency of provident provision in lieu of pension.

(*f*) The exclusion of Temporary Engineers from any right to Divisional charge, and their consequent liability to serve under their juniors in the permanent service.

Before proceeding to formulate proposed remedies it would appear to be necessary and appropriate to give some details under the above headings, so as to bring out the fact that the grievances are real, and are the consequences of the existing conditions under which so-called Temporary Engineers are forced to serve.

(*a*) *Insecurity of Tenure.*—Though a man work as ten, and though his service be 5, 10, 15, or even 20 years he is annually reminded that he is less than mortal, in that his existence in the Department may only extend to one year, and that he may besides be discharged with one month's notice, and no question answered. This annual reminder must in time have a most baneful effect. It is seemingly intended as a protection; but a great Government should surely so treat its employés as to ensure that the conditions of the service, would in itself be a guarantee of good faith. Besides, Government still possesses the inestimable advantage secured by the faith of its employés in its eventual justice and fair treatment; however long that justice, as in the case of Temporary Engineers, be delayed.

The fact appears to be that no regular policy has ever been formulated by Government, with reference to Temporary Engineers and the line of least resistance was, in the beginning, eagerly followed. The doctrine of economy with efficiency has appeared such an easy solution, that its limitations have not been foreseen. Men have worked faithfully with always the eternal hope of good work being rewarded by better prospects. Young men, eager to work, have not been too particular to look into conditions of service, always trusting that Government would, of its

* *Vide* Appendix III.

own accord, and in its own interests, improve matters. Men have believed that in course of time they would be put on to the Permanent Service, and this hope has had foundation in the fact that several Temporary Engineers have at various times been given pensionable appointments. At various times men have been brought out from England on fixed covenants. At the end of their respective terms the majority of these men were transferred to the Pensionable Service, while others retired, and a few were brought on to the Temporary List. Temporary Engineers had thus a real grievance in that the men put on to the Pensionable List on the completion of their terms, were so transferred over and above the heads of many Temporary Engineers engaged in India, who were senior to them. The last of such men were transferred as late as September, 1911. The grievance lay entirely in the fact that men, senior to them were not likewise transferred to the pensionable staff. But apparently there has been no system whatever in the selections hitherto made; and it cannot be contended that the men placed on the pensionable staff were exceptional; for, in the Revenue work of Canals, a high average of excellence is the rule, and pre-eminence the exception. There have always been as good men, who are still on the Temporary List, as those made permanent. It was hoped that when the cases of Imperial and Provincial Engineers had received due consideration, the position of Temporary Engineers would also be improved. There is ample proof to show that Temporary Engineers now in service have done excellent work, in spite of the insecurity of their state. And the fact that so many men have outlived the conditions is a splendid proof of good work done, and it is not unnatural to speculate on the question as to how many, better paid pensionable men, would have stood the same test for years.

The fact that a Temporary Engineer can be got rid of with one month's notice, whatever his service, is often, or appears to often be, used as a means to lever him out without any regular enquiry, or without any charge made. The chance of replying to any alleged fault has been arbitrarily withheld; and as this is not done even in the case of permanent men in the lowest grades, who are given every opportunity of defence, it appears specially unfair in the case of officers.

(*b*) *Insufficient prospects, uncertainty and inequality in increase to salaries.* — The prospect held out to Temporary Engineers is gloomy in the extreme, and, as pointed out above, men have forced themselves to accept things in the hope of eventual betterment, and have preferred to hold to such possible chances, rather than become rolling stones. Government has practically the monopoly of all Engineering works in India, and specially in the case of Irrigation; so that once a man has specialised in this latter branch of Engineering, he may expect no appointments outside Government service. But other branches have also to specialise. And since Government has the patronage of practically all appointments open to Civil Engineers, the Government's responsibility, it will be admitted, can scarcely be said to end in the case of men who have served loyally and well for years when the last pay bill has been settled, at the end of the month's notice. But Government does nothing to aid a man to get employment elsewhere, though he be discharged for no fault of his own. It appears incumbent, therefore, that some endeavour should be made to secure the man further employment, considering that Government is in a far better position to ascertain where appointments are vacant, than the private individual.

According to the latest order a Temporary Engineer may not rise to more than Rs. 800 per mensem; except in very exceptional cases when the Local Government may employ men up to a salary of Rs. 2,500 per mensem for a total period of two years. According to the Public Works Department Code originally the maximum salary of a Temporary Engineer was fixed at Rs. 950 per mensem, in 1908 that rule was cancelled, but was only replaced lately, by a decree that Temporary Engineers were to get increments of 50 rupees after every two years of approved service, and would not rise to more than a maximum of. Rs. 700 per mensem. This latter has since been increased to 800 rupees. These orders have formed the subject of a Memorial by the Temporary Engineers, Punjab, copy of which is attached*. A perusal of this Memorial will bring to light, lucidly, the distinctly poor outlook of the Temporary Engineer. There are, however, several men who draw more than Rs. 800 per mensem; but it is presumed that this is because the order restricting salaries has only been lately issued.

In giving increments no special rule appears to have ever been followed. Some men getting annual increments of Rs. 50, with an occasional increment of Rs. 100; while others have received no increments for periods extending from two to five years. An increment is supposed to depend on the recommendation of a Temporary Engineer's immediate superior. One such superior may be satisfied with little, another may want a great deal before he gives his recommendation. Again, a special recommendation may be gained by chance on some special urgent work, or it may be held back because circumstances may have rendered it impossible for a man to show all the progress expected. The immediate superior's recommendations are endorsed or modified by the Superintending Engineer, and either acted on or otherwise by the Chief Engineer. One Superintending Engineer may have one criterion and another a different. Again, in the course of his tour, a Superintending or Chief Engineer might be impressed favourably by some work done by some particular Temporary Engineer. Enough weight does not appear to be given to the conscientious carrying out of "the daily round, the trivial task." This personal element is not allowed to influence the increments of Permanent Engineers and, therefore, should not influence those of Temporary Engineers. From what has been said, it will readily be seen that the want of system in granting increments is unjust to the individual, and is one of the many causes of discontent.

(*c*) *and* (*e*). *Inability with reference to* (*a*) *and* (*b*) *to make adequate provision for the future.*—Insufficiency of Provident provision. The market value of a Civil Engineer in India is fixed by the salaries given by the Government itself to its permanent staff, it is reasonable, therefore, to expect that the Temporary Engineer should at least draw the same salary as his permanent brother. But the fact, that he can hope for no pension, nor any provision in lieu of pension, renders it still more reasonable to maintain that the temporary man should get a higher salary. Pension is accepted as "deferred pay" and apparently is calculated at 25 to 33 per cent. of a man's salary. It might not, therefore, be unjustifiable for a temporary man to expect a higher salary, than the permanent men, of 20 per cent., a portion of which might be given in the form of better Provident rules. A Temporary Engineer has, along with his permanent brother to live like an officer and a gentleman, and is expected to maintain his official position in exactly the same degree; and thereby his ability to make provision for the future is considerably crippled, since his salary is uniformly less than that considered necessary for the permanent man of equal service. Upper subordinates, who are on the Temporary List, are usually given higher salaries than permanent men of equal standing, and it, therefore, is unjust that a Temporary Engineer Officer should be treated with less consideration.

It has been lately ruled that all Temporary Engineers must subscribe 9¾ per cent. of their salaries to a Government General Provident Fund, the interest accruing at the rate of 4 per cent. compound. Now it is quite possible, by judicious investment, to obtain a better return in India; so that in the long run the Temporary Engineer may gain very little from this enforced saving. This Provident Fund is, therefore, not entirely satisfactory, but it enables the Government to say at the end of a man's service that he is not quite destitute. Railway Temporary Engineers, however, have special rules, whereby Government adds from 75 to 100 per cent. of what each Engineer deposits. It will thus be clear that the Temporary Engineer has small ability to make adequate provision for the future, owing to increased

* *Vide* Appendix IV.

cost of living, and lower salaries than those considered sufficient for the Permanent Services.

(*d*). *Absence of definite rules.*—There are, as shown before, no satisfactory rules regarding salary and increments, no pension and most inadequate leave rules. Such leave rules as exist compare most unfavourably with those governing the Permanent Establishment, and as the reasons for granting leave to the former ought to be exactly the same as those applicable to the latter, the distinction is neither just nor humane. The leave rules of Temporary Engineers are for those in purely temporary employ, and are governed by the Civil Service Regulations, Articles 242, 336 (rule 1) and 339 (rule 2) and as laid down in Chapter I, para. 3, rule IV, of the Public Works Department Code, Volume I (9th edition). Accordingly, a Temporary Engineer is allowed privilege leave, if no substitute is required (Article 242-A), but as a favour the operation of this Article has not of recent years been put into force. Still the rule exists. But the time of taking such privilege leave is fixed by the consideration that the Temporary Engineer has to work for three months after his return before the termination of his services. That is, he must return from his privilege leave by the 1st October. And, during this period of three months enforced work, he is practically debarred from his right or option of terminating his service by a month's notice.

Furlough has occasionally been allowed as a special favour; but this has been restricted to one year, whatever a man's length of service.

It is hoped that it has been made abundantly clear that such leave rules as exist, having been formulated with reference to purely temporary service, do not, and cannot, satisfy the needs of the service as now existing.

(*f*). Whatever the length of service, no Temporary Engineer has any right to Divisional charge. And since Permanent Engineers, if found fit, have to be put into Divisional charges after ten years' service, and there are several Temporary Engineers with far more experience either under Government or elsewhere, it stands to reason that many such Temporary Engineers are forced to serve under their juniors. It needs no special perspicacity to see that such an arrangement is extremely detrimental to Government interests. The position of a youthful Divisional Engineer, who is supposed to keep in check and issue instructions and orders to a man his senior in service and experience is a very difficult one. He must, if he is wise, allow his Assistant an extremely free hand, or if he try the curb find himself professionally unseated. Again it is an accepted fact that after a certain period of work as an Assistant a man is better fitted for Divisional work and if a Temporary Engineer is kept too long as an Assistant, his work suffers and he is unjustly considered unfit, though he would probably make an excellent Divisional Officer. In any case Government interests must suffer. Further a subordinate raised to the Permanent Service, may in course rise to be the Executive Engineer of the Temporary Engineer, under whom he may have formerly served.

There are at present a few Temporary Engineers holding Divisions; but the tenure of such offices is insecure, for at any moment they may have to revert, to satisfy the demand of the younger permanent men who are attaining the service, after which they will lose salary, if retained as Assistants. In this as in all other matters where the interests of Temporary Engineers clash with those of permanent men, the former must give way, as having no rights or privileges (though many a moral claim) to consideration.

A further and more serious grievance, which affects all Engineers alike, but which has a greater effect on Temporary Engineers, is the method by which the system of Confidential Reports is worked. It is generally felt to amount almost to a scandal. If a man's conduct or work has been unsatisfactory a Confidential Report is the best medium for bringing such to the notice of higher authorities, for it protects the prestige and influence of an officer; but the substance of such reports should be brought to the attention of that officer, with the view of giving him a fair opportunity of explaining himself or of mending his ways; and to check any possible tendency on the part of a reporting officer to personal bias. Unfortunately cases, where men have misused the Confidential Report, are not entirely unknown. It is understood that in former times there was a rule that the purport of an unfavourable report should be communicated to the individual concerned; but this rule has either been cancelled or has fallen into disuse; and it certainly should be re-introduced.

71,668. *FINAL PROPOSALS.*—Memorials* setting forth grievances with prayer for reliefs have been submitted to the Government of India, by the majority of Temporary Engineers in India, who have been referred to the Royal Commissioners. The eventual solution of the questions which weigh so heavily on an important section of the Public Works Department, rests on the recommendations which may be considered necessary by the Royal Commissioners; and it is here earnestly requested and hoped that such recommendations will be made as early as may be consistent with other public interests. Since the improvements made in the Permanent Service in 1908, Temporary Engineers have been hoping for similar improvements in their service, and have thus already waited patiently for five long years, it is therefore hoped that such recommendations as seem fit and proper will not be delayed till the final operations of the Royal Commission are completed. "*Bis dat qui cito dat.*"

It has long been evident that Temporary Engineers form an integral part of the Permanent Establishment, and they perform the same general duties as permanent men, and are not now employed for special works. Nor can it be reasonably asserted that they are employed to give elasticity to the Department, for the majority have served for long periods, and since Engineering works are being extended and enlarged, Temporary Engineers are very likely to be employed for several years to come. In short the men now in service will have to be employed permanently, and even the youngest will, in all likelihood, be employed till he is superannuated at the age of fifty-five. The Civil Service Regulations themselves show that the principle of assuring a permanent tenure of office during good behaviour and efficient service, is generally admitted, and is, indeed, regarded, as of *supreme importance*. Therefore, it seems that all Temporary Engineers having proved themselves to be efficient and of permanent use to the Government should be placed on the Permanent Pensionable Scale. There can be no question, from any point of view, except that of false economy, but that this should be done; but the stumbling blocks hitherto in the way of this desirable solution have been—

(1) That the cadre list, which limits permanent Engineers to 946, is complete.

(2) That the introduction of several Temporary Engineers would interfere with the vested rights of certain Permanent Engineers.

With reference to (1), the increase of the cadre list lies in the hands of the Secretary of State for India, and there is little doubt that sanction to a reasonable increase could be obtained by a clear explanation of the situation, and by showing the necessity. Arguments in favour of such increase can be adduced, not the least being the great importance of having a contented body of men to carry out works of unlimited importance to the welfare of India.

Referring to (2), the Government Resolutions referred to before, have given a time scale of increments to all Permanent Engineers, with the proviso that, unless given Divisional charges after ten years of service, no further increment is possible. Can such a proviso be carried out with any justice? It is believed not, and it must follow that men will continue to get their increments regularly, even if not in Divisional charge. This will dispose of one aspect of the question. Now, the Divisional Officer—called the Executive Engineer—was in former years a true Executive officer; but time has brought many changes, and has increased his work so enormously that his work lies more in the administrative line than in the Executive. The work of Divisional charges has increased so enormously in late years, that it is no exaggeration to say that an Executive Engineer is unable to attend

* *Vide* Appendix IV.

to his work with any satisfaction to himself. It has become gradually most imperative to reduce the sizes of Divisions, so as to enable the Executive Engineer to pay more attention to his proper professional work which often has to be entirely carried out by his Assistant without sufficient checks. Smaller Divisions would enable the Executive Engineer to also give personal attention to schemes which, for want of time at disposal, have to be put off from day to day. Thus, by an increased number of Divisional charges, an absolute necessity as things now stand, the introduction of senior Temporary Engineers would have no malign effect on the existing prospects of the Permanent staff. It is, therefore, proposed that all Temporary Engineers now in service, who have completed four years' service, should be put on to the Permanent Pensionable staff. Temporary men in the Roads and Buildings, being so few in number, could readily be absorbed into the Permanent Service without special arrangements.

There are a certain number of Temporary Engineers with Diplomas from Indian Colleges, which date back to a time anterior to that when Indian College Engineers were relegated to a Provincial Service; there are others with English Diplomas which are accepted by the Secretary of State as sufficient for the Imperial Service; there are still others who were brought out under covenants, with promises of permanency at the end of the covenanted period, who have been placed after completion of their terms on the Temporary List. It is expected, if the proposals set forth are accepted, that these three classes of Temporary Engineers will be placed on the Imperial scale of pay. There are, however, some men, to whom such pensionable service would not appeal, and these would be men who, having served elsewhere, have entered Government service somewhat late in life and would not be eligible for an adequate pension. For these men, and for those under four years' service, a special non-pensionable service should be inaugurated, on the following lines:—

(1) Salaries 10 per cent. above the Permanent scale, with annual increments.

(2) Leave rules in every respect the same as for the Permanent service.

(3) Provident Fund similar to that in force on all the great railways, namely, an equivalent of 10 per cent. of salary contributed six-monthly or annually by the Government.

(4) Men to be eligible for absorption into the pensionable service from time to time, which could be effected by a slight decrease in the recruitment of Permanent Engineers. This latter clause would possibly meet the desires of all the young men. All Provident Fund additions made by Government would, of course, be deducted, as soon as these men were placed on the Pensionable List.

Eventually this Permanent Non-pensionable List would cease to exist, except for the few men who found it more satisfactory not to accept pensionable appointments. The rules governing the regular Permanent Establishment would, of course, be in force for the Permanent Non-pensionable Establishment.

All new entrants needed in the future should be employed for fixed terms, with special leave rules and should, if the requirements of the service demand, be placed at the end of their terms on the Non-pensionable List, or re-engaged on fresh terms. Men could not complain that they did not realize their exact position, till too late.

Mechanical, Electrical, Architectural, and Sanitary Engineers, who are fully qualified and specialized, should be given permanency after a term of approved service; but it lies with the Government to decide whether these men should have a separate list or be brought on to the regular Pensionable Establishment.

If the Non-pensionable List alluded to above cannot be a Permanent List, six months' notice of termination of service on either side should be the minimum; and where work has been satisfactory, a man might be transferred to another Province, without break of service, if there is work to be done. And Government might certainly make some efforts to secure men other employment when services are terminated without fault.

71,669. To sum up briefly, it is proposed—

(1) To increase the Cadre List suitably, so that all Temporary Engineers, now of over four years' service, may be placed on the Pensionable List, with the exception of those to whom it would be of no advantage.

(2) To increase sufficiently the number of Divisions, which urgently need to be reduced in size, in order that Government work might be more efficiently carried out; that Imperial men on high salaries be suitably employed; and that certain permanent men need have no just cause of complaint that their rightful ambitions are curtailed by the introduction of senior Temporary Engineers.

(3) That all Temporary Engineers not so transferred to the Pensionable List be brought on to a Non-pensionable Permanent List, being granted all the rules applicable to the regular Permanent Establishment, with salaries and increments on 10 per cent. higher scale, and with special Provident Fund, and eligibility of transfer to the Pensionable Establishment.

(4) In the event of the Non-pensionable List not being made an additional Permanent List, notice of termination of service should be extended from 1 month to 6 months; men should be transferred from one Province to another, as needed, without break of service; and, if their further services are not needed by Government, some endeavour should be made to secure men employment elsewhere.

(5) That specialised Mechanical, Electrical, Architectural, and Sanitary Engineers should be placed on the regular Permanent Establishment or have proper rules governing salaries, increments, leave, etc.

It is not pretented that the proposals set forth above would be acceptable to all Temporary Engineers, for proposals have not been received from the men of some Provinces who have not had full time. Such proposals will have to be submitted later in the form of Supplementary Memoranda. But it is believed that in a general way the proposals will meet the just expectations of the majority of Temporary Engineers in Upper India, Burma and Central Provinces.

Mr. F. M. Purves called and examined.

71,670. (*Chairman.*) The witness said although it had been impossible for him to consult all his colleagues in India, the written statement comprehensively embraced all the points which Temporary Engineers desired to bring before the Commission. The proposals which he had made might not be acceptable to all Temporary Engineers, but they would be acceptable to the majority. They certainly met with the assent of Temporary Engineers in Upper India.

71,671. There were about 253 Temporary Engineers in the various branches of the Public Works Department. There were 75 employed on railways, about 150 employed in the Irrigation Department, and the remainder were employed on Roads and Buildings.

71,672. With regard to length of service, the witness knew of one Temporary Engineer who had served 23 years. Taking the whole of India he should say that about 15 per cent. of the men had served over 10 years. Very few Temporary Engineers had been discharged. During the last 23 years he could only recollect about five cases in the Punjab Irrigation Works. He did not think the total number could be 10 or 11. On the construction side work was continually going on, and there was no chance of any Temporary Engineers being turned out.

71,673. There were about 20 Temporary Engineers who were at present holding executive charges. Twelve Temporary Engineers were drawing over Rs. 800.

71,674. The witness would recommend increasing the permanent cadre so as to absorb all the Temporary Engineers of four years' service, besides which he would increase the number of divisions, with a view to avoiding injury to junior permanent officers. He would also re-cast the cadre for certain Provinces which had gone far ahead of other Provinces in the way of construction works because the result of not doing that in the past had resulted in men getting charge of divisions far earlier than they ought to have

done, to the detriment both of the Government and of themselves. He advocated increasing the number of divisions, not merely for the sake of absorbing the Temporary Engineers, but because he thought from his practical experience that more divisions were required. He should say that about 10 or 12 extra permanent divisions were wanted in the Punjab.

71,675. With regard to pension, there was a rule in the Civil Service Regulations that any unbroken service of a temporary man put on to the permanent establishment counted towards pension from the date he was first employed as a Temporary Engineer. The witness thought that for certain Temporary Engineers a special non-pensionable form of service might be inaugurated. He also suggested that such officers should have 10 per cent. more than the permanent officers, and at the same time the benefit of a Provident Fund similar to the State Railway Provident Fund.

71,676. The witness thought there was good ground for the complaint that Temporary Engineers did not realise their exact position on entering the Service until it was too late. If the witness had been told at the end of his first year that he could leave, he should have gone and obtained better employment elsewhere; but he was told he would be re-engaged if he cared to stay on, and he did so, seeing there was a chance of permanent employment. After a certain number of years he became a specialist in Irrigation work, and it would have been quite impossible for him then to have left Irrigation, whatever his terms were, to find employment in any other branch of engineering. The Government had him in the hollow of their hands, and it had held him there ever since. He had been stationed on Irrigation works for 23 years, and for all practical purposes he was a permanent Executive Engineer, the only difference being in salary and pension. He stated that during his 23 years' service he had been re-engaged from year to year.

71,677. With regard to his complaint as to the recent decision under which Temporary Engineers had been brought on to the General Provident Fund, he did not think there had been a general demand on the part of Temporary Engineers to be included in that fund, because a very large number of them had not joined on the ground of insufficient salary.

71,678. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) He had been in the temporary service for 25¼ years, beginning work on the Bengal-Nagpur Railway, after which he went into the Irrigation Department. The witness agreed that the Government had never given him to understand that his service was anything but temporary, but he had had hopes of permanancy, because Temporary men had been from time to time drafted into the pensionable establishment. With regard to the suggestion that Temporary Enginers had no better claim than a person who was in the employ of a company or private firm, and who was, under his terms of employment, liable to be discharged at a moment's notice, the witness urged that Government was really the sole employer in India. If there were a sufficient number of private firms in the country, perhaps engineers would not mind so much. They might get employment with private firms, but Irrigation was an absolute monopoly of Government. The witness stated that few young men, eager to work, looked closely into conditions of service at first, and it might have been his own fault that he did not bother much about the conditions when he first joined; but that he considered that he certainly should have been given a better salary and he doesn't bother now as the Government cannot now dismiss him.

71,679. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) When Temporary Engineers were appointed to the permanent cadre, it was not by any means the general rule that they were appointed to the lower grade. It was one of their complaints that there was no fixed rule of any sort to govern the amount of salary payable to a Temporary Engineer.

71,680. If a man was not very useful to the Department he was at once discharged, and the terms under which Temporary Engineers were employed gave a great deal of discretion to the Government as to which men they should keep on. Temporary Engineers are not kept on through favour or influences, but solely on their merits. In short, they are not what is known to Indians as "*parwastis.*"

71,681. (*Mr. Madge.*) With regard to the three sources of recruitment set out in the written statement, the witness thought there was an objection to recruiting for the same service men whose qualifications could not be co-ordinated, but he did not desire to raise a point of that kind, because Government employed its own class of men, and if it chose to expend money in teaching those men, there was no harm done to the witness, at all events.

71,682. The witness thought there would always have to be a certain number of temporary men, but these men should be employed on special terms. He was formulating a scheme as to how the cadre might be worked with the least possible number of Temporary Engineers, and he would be pleased to send it to the Commission in due course. In the majority of cases all the appointments which the temporary Engineers held were really permanent, but partly for reasons of economy temporary men on lower salaries were employed.

71,683. The witness said he made the suggestion that both the cadre and the number of divisional charges should be increased, not only in the interests of the permanent men, but in the interests of the Service generally.

71,684. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness had calculated that the pay of a young Temporary Engineer should be higher than that of a Permanent Engineer by 20 per cent. of which 10 per cent. would be increased salary and 10 per cent. deferred pay. He thought under such an arrangement men of as good a quality as the Permanent Engineers would be obtained. If an equivalent rate of pay was given, he agreed there was no reason why Government should not say they only wanted a certain number of permanent men, and that all the other men they required should be taken on just as though Government were an outside contractor.

71,685. The witness did not agree in the least with the statement put forward by various witnesses that the work of the Temporary Engineer taken as a whole was markedly inferior to the work of the Permanent Engineer. In his 25 years' service witness had worked alongside of Permanent and Temporary Engineers, and also had had both classes of men under him, and certainly did not see *any* difference in work.

71,686. Every year a certain number of men came out of the colleges who might be used as temporary men, so that if the officers in charge of work were dissatisfied with their existing temporary staff, they could discharge the men who were not giving satisfaction and take on new men. The market was always being supplied every year, and consequently if the average standard of Temporary Engineers' work was markedly lower than the average standard of Permanent Engineers' work, the responsibility rested with the superior officers, and not with the Temporary Engineers. Permanent Engineers could be lazier than Temporary Engineers, and the very conditions of the service could *not* make their work superior to that of temporary men.

71,687. (*Mr. Fisher.*) When the witness stated that Government had a monopoly of all the engineering works in India, he had not overlooked the fact that there were engineering works undertaken in the Native States, but the Local Government always employed men of their own State, the better appointments in Native States being monopolized by retired Chief Engineers, and other high officials.

71,688. It was not exactly the case that Irrigation work was so highly specialised that a man who had been a long time at it was, *ipso facto*, disqualified from undertaking engineering work of another kind, but the witness would not have the same chance of getting the same terms on a railway as a man who had been 23 years on railways.

71,689. (*Mr. Sly.*) It was the fact that every Temporary Engineer on joining signed a declaration that

he clearly understood the conditions of his temporary employment and accepted them in the just hopes of better things, and that he also received every year throughout his service a notice with regard to the retention of his services, which also clearly stated that he was employed on exactly the same terms; but the witness contended that such conditions were not understood by a man when he signed them. The witness put forward no legal claim of any sort, but he thought the fact of a man being employed year after year nullified those conditions, in spite of the fact that they were brought to his notice every year, and that Temporary Engineers had a moral claim on the Government of being made permanent, when they served Government so well, year after year, and under equal conditions of service as permanent men.

71,690. He agreed that, if his services were to be retained on uncertain tenure and small prospects, his real grievance against the Government was that they had not dismissed him at a proper age, when he had chances of bettering himself.

71,691. The engineering duties of a Revenue officer in the Irrigation Department were to look after the maintenance of his channels, and to keep them in proper condition, so that the supply of water was properly distributed. He had also to consider a large number of hydraulic engineering questions which were of the utmost importance, such as the designing of outlet and distributory heads, and he had to see that channels were kept up to certain designs, and to change designs if need be.

71,692. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The last occasion on which advertisements were issued for Temporary Engineers for the Punjab Irrigation was in 1890 or 1891. There was still a fair field of men from which Government could select; at the present rate of wages and conditions of employment, Government could obtain as many young men as it required.

(The witness withdrew).

Rai Bahadur Lala Baij Nath, Executive Engineer, Punjab.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,693. *INTRODUCTORY.*—I appear as a Representative of the Association of Indian College Engineers, of which I am the Honorary General Secretary. Nearly 75 per cent. of the Provincial Engineers throughout India and Burma are its active members. The rest have full sympathy with its work and aims but are not actually enrolled.

(2) I passed out of the Thomason Civil Engineering College, Rurki, in 1897, the first batch of the Provincial Service from Rurki having come out in 1895. The Association was started in 1901-02 when the Provincial Service was just in its 7th year; and in accordance with para. 10 of Resolution No. 2523 G. of 1893, it was fully expected that the re-organisation of the Service would be reconsidered and the Provincial Service abolished. Memorials were sent up by all officers then in Service, and ever since then the Association has been strenuously but most respectfully representing, by means of Petitions and Memorials, the claims of Engineers entering the Indian Public Works Department from the Indian Colleges, to the same treatment as accorded to Imperial Engineers, and to a restoration of their position and status in the Department to what it was before the backward step of creating a Provincial Engineer Service was taken by the Government of India in 1892.

(3) The various Memorials and Petitions from the Provincial Engineers, ranging over a period of 6 years (1902 to 1907), instead of having the desired effect, resulted in the least expected Resolution No. 675-694 E., dated 24th April, 1908, which practically aimed at the complete separation of the Imperial and Provincial Engineer Services, and thereby the complete degradation of the latter. Discontent among the Engineers, recruited from the Indian Colleges since 1895, was already keen, but this Resolution made it very much keener. A large majority of the men refused to accept terms of service which departed from the original conditions on which they were induced to enter Service and which aimed at a further degradation of their status. The rest of the constitutional struggle through which the Service has passed is well known, and this Association did its level best to place the case before the authorities in the most respectful and the clearest manner possible. The Government of India Resolution No. 439-458 dated 15th May, 1912, abolished the fresh distinctions and disabilities which were attempted to be created by the 1908 Resolution.

(4) But even by this 1912 Scheme, the case was not finally settled, and on the 15th May, 1912, in reply to certain questions asked in the House of Commons, Mr. Montague, Under-Secretary of State for India, made the following statement in connection with the case of Provincial Engineer Service:—"That it was impossible to state exactly when the decision would be reached in this most difficult and complicated case. The Secretary of State in Council had already sanctioned certain increases in pay, which, he hoped, would satisfy those interested, but had found it necessary to reserve other parts of the Government of India's proposals for further consideration. The matter would be expedited so far as was possible till a final decision was reached on all issues. Lord Crewe was not prepared to consider the laying of papers on the table." The "increases in pay" referred to above are those granted in the 1912 Scheme, which merely gave what had been proposed to be withheld and taken away by the 1908 Scheme.

(5) On the 10th October, 1912, again, in the House of Commons, the following questions were asked to which the Under Secretary of State gave the replies quoted below:—

Questions.

(*1.*) "Whether a final settlement had yet been arrived at in the case of the Provincial Engineers; would he state what were those parts of the Governments of India's proposals which had been reserved by the Secretary of State for further consideration, and when a decision upon them would be taken?"

(*2.*) "Whether it was proposed to restore, either completely or partially, to the Imperial Service, those Provincial Engineers who had received their training at Indian Engineering Colleges?"

(*3.*) "Whether the Secretary of State would arrange that the members to be co-opted on the Public Services Commission, to represent the Provincial Engineer Service, should be taken from those who might be duly elected for the purpose by the Provincial Engineers themselves?"

Replies to above questions.

(*1.*) and (*2.*) "As the Hon'ble Member was informed on May 15th last, orders have been passed sanctioning certain increases of pay to the Provincial Engineers. The subject reserved for future consideration is practically the one mentioned in the Hon'ble Member's second question, *viz.*, whether any change shall be made in the system of recruitment for the Imperial Service, and if so, under what limitations and conditions, so as to allow the appointment or promotion to that Service of Engineers trained in India. This subject is covered by the terms of reference to the recently appointed Royal Commission on the Public Services in India."

(*3.*) "The procedure to be followed in the matter mentioned, has not yet been settled. In any case the selection of co-opted representatives will be for settlement by the Royal Commission itself."

(6) From the above extracts from announcements made in the House of Commons it will thus be seen that the 1912 Resolution was, quite unexpectedly, silent on the question of the restoration of Indian College Engineers to their former status. They now look for redress of this long standing and sore grievance to the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India, and this Association strongly but most respectfully urges that the discontent created by the introduction of the Provincial Engineer Service since 1892, be removed by its abolition, and the former status of the Engineers recruited in India be restored to them. With this representation the Association has submitted already 50 copies of the 2 Memoranda* in which the case is fully set forth.

* *Vide* Annexures I. and II.

(7) Again, the Association knows that every Indian-recruited Engineer who has joined the Department since 1895, most keenly feels and resents the anomalous position in which he is placed, and the case therefore calls for an immediate redress being granted. The whole body of Engineers recruited in India therefore, through their Association, most respectfully beg that an *ad interim* recommendation be made by the Royal Commission in connection with the case of the Provincial Engineer Service, so that no more delay may occur in its final decision.

(8) I will not here repeat the various arguments advanced in those two Memoranda, but will confine myself to give, in brief, the conclusions arrived at by the Association, after full and mature deliberation under the various heads laid down by the Royal Commission.

71,694. **(I.) Method of Recruitment.**—The Association wishes to urge that recruitment both in India and England should be (*i*) by free and open competition, and (*ii*) half in India and half in England for the present, and as time goes on, the proportion of recruitment in India should be gradually increased. The Association also wishes to emphasize that this competition should be real and that at least 3 candidates should compete for each appointment.

71,695. **(II.) Systems of Training and Probation.**—*Training.*—The Association is of opinion that the training in England is not wholly directed to the requirements of this country, while that imparted in the Colleges in India is entirely so directed. The appointments made in England should also be by an open competitive examination in which subjects must be specially chosen and must include one Indian Language so that the training there may be directed to Indian requirements.

Probation.—There must be at least one year's probation *in India* for English recruits also. This is especially necessary as new recruits from England take at least 2 to 3 years to gain sufficient knowledge of Indian conditions and Languages.

71,696. **(III.) Conditions of Service, (IV.) Conditions of Salary, (V.) Conditions of Leave, and (VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—Under these heads the Association emphatically but most respectfully urges that whether an Engineer is recruited in India or in England, his emoluments and other conditions noted above should be precisely the same, and should be determined solely by the work he does and responsibilities he bears, and should have nothing to do with the place of his recruitment. "Same work, same wages" is the only equitable principle in this connection.

71,697. **(VII.a) Limitations in the employment of Non-Europeans.**—In the Public Works Department there should be no limitations based on grounds of color, caste, creed, domicile or place and source of recruitment. There should be an open door for all His Majesty's subjects through unrestricted open competitive examinations both in India and England.

71,698. **(VII.b) Working of the existing System of division of Services in the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial.**—The division of services in the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial has been a failure and has resulted in nothing but discontent and want of harmonious working and *esprit de corps* in the Department. The creation of the Provincial Engineer Service was a mistake. It is high time that this mistake is rectified and this Provincial Service abolished. The various arguments showing:—

(i) that the recommendations of the Public Services Commission of 1886-87, on which the introduction of the Provincial Engineer Service was based, are not sound;

(ii) that it was not justifiable to give effect to those recommendations.

(iii) that the policy advocated by that Commission has not been consistently followed; and

(iv) that it is now eminently desirable to abolish the Provincial Engineer Service,

are fully set forth in the Blue Statement submitted by this Association.*

I particularly draw attention to the speech of Sir William Muir, Lieutenant-Governor of the United Provinces, delivered at the Convocation address at Roorkee in 1873, from which the following extract can bear repetition, and which is looked upon by Roorkee Engineers as a definite assurance and a pledge from the Government of India:—"But apart from personal associations, there is a reason which renders the present moment one of Public interest; the establishment in England of an Engineering College for India has unsettled the minds of the public here as to the prospect of this Institution and the continuance to it of the patronage of Government. It has been a subject of much anxiety to myself, and of correspondence with the Government of India. It is, therefore, with sincere satisfaction that I am able to announce to you and through you to those without, who are interested in the Thomason College, that the Institution at Coopers Hill *will in no degree affect the relations of the Government of India with this College, nor the employment which has been hitherto guaranteed to its more successful students.* Between the two seminaries there will be no opposition or antagonism. The requirements of this great country are ample for both. I am sure that you will all with me be thankful to the Governor-General in Council for the justice which has thus been rendered to Rurki College."

71,699. **(IX.) Other points.**—(1) There is no analogy whatever between the case of Indian-trained Engineers and the Provincial Services of other Departments. Therefore there is also no sound argument against the abolition of the Provincial Engineer Service on the ground that this would entitle other Provincial Services to similar treatment.

(2) The Association is of opinion that the present Temporary Engineer Service is very unsatisfactory, and it is highly desirable that it should be regularized by regarding it as a permanent non-pensionable service on an incremental scale of pay.

(3) The Association understands that it is being hinted in certain quarters that the expenses of Indian Officers of pure Asiatic descent in the Department, are not so high as to warrant their being paid the same emoluments as are paid to Europeans and Anglo-Indians. This impression is altogether erroneous, and this Association, which consists of both Indian and Anglo-Indian Members, is anxious to remove it. The impression seems to have gained ground on account of want of insight into and lack of full knowledge of Indian life and customs. The channels of expenditure of an Indian may be different from those of a European, but they are as varied and numerous as those of the latter. An Indian has to support a family which, unlike that of a European, includes not only his wife and children but also a number of far and near relatives and dependants; and considering the rapid rise in prices, this causes a very heavy drain on his resources. Then he has to meet heavy expenses on the occasion of marriages and other social functions. It is not necessary to enter into the ethics of this question here but facts must be taken as they are. Besides, it must be recognised that educated Indians and especially Engineers have adopted European mode of living which is just as expensive in their case as in that of Europeans. As a matter of fact Indian Engineers have to keep in many cases, a double establishment of servants, horses, carriages, etc., on account of their social customs, which compel their families to stay generally at Head Quarters, while in matters of house rent, camp equipage, dress, etc., they are precisely in the same condition in which European Engineers are. Another point, in this connection, is that there is a great tendency for educated Indians to give their children the best education in India or abroad and this is a very heavy item of expenditure. When all is said and done, however, the principle of "same work, same pay" must be the guiding maxim in fixing emoluments, which should have nothing to do with any private or individual considerations.

(4) *Provincial Engineer Service—a young service.*—It is not out of place to point out that the Provincial Engineer Service is young and none of its members has put in more than 17 years' service nor entered administrative rank in any Province in India. It is

* *Vide* Annexure II.

hoped that the fact of the service being so young will not stand in the way of full weight being attached to its representations.

LIST OF DISTINGUISHED ENGINEERS.

(This list is as far as information has so far reached the Secretary).

(1) *From Thomason Civil Engineering College, Rurki.*

No.	Name.	Year of passing out.	Rank attained.
1	C. C. Anderson... ...	1851	Chief Engineer U.P.
2	Rai Bahadur Kanahaya Lal.	1852	Executive Engineer, Punjab.
3	E. Swetenham (Col.) ...	1853	Superintending Engineer, U.P.
4	H. Garbett	1854	Superintending Engineer, Punjab.
5	R. E. Forrest	1855	Superintending Engineer, U.P.
6	H. E. Whish (Lt.-Col)	1856	Superintending Engineer, U.P.
7	W. D. Brockman ...	1858	Superintending Engineer, U.P.
8	H. F. White	1859	Superintending Engineer, Rajputana and C.I.
9	Capt. W. K. Elles ..	1860	Lt.-Genl. Bengal Command.
10	W.H.Mackesy(Lt.-Col.)	1861	Superintending Engineer, M.W.S.
11	G. D'a. Jackson (Gen.)	1863	Superintending Engineer, Military Works.
12	F. D. M. Brown, V.C. (Lt.-Col.).	1864	Principal Thomason College, Roorkee.
13	W. C. Wright	1864	Chief Engineer, Rampur State.
14	H. L. Monk	1865	Chief Engineer, Railways.
15	A. C. Wither (Lt.-Col.)	1866	Superintending Engineer, Bengal.
16	J. F. Miller (Lt.-Col.)...	1868	Superintending Engineer Punjab.
17	C. G. Palmer, C.I.E. ...	1868	Chief Engineer, U.P.
18	R. E. Nelson	1869	Superintending Engineer, Burma.
19	J. S. Slater	1870	Principal Civil Engineering College, Sibpur.
20	A. R. Lilley	1870	Superintending Engineer, Railways.
21	J. T. Rollo	1870	Superintending Engineer, Burma.
22	B. Baxter	1871	Superintending Engineer, Railways.
23	E. W. P. Foster ...	1871	Egyptian fame.
24	J. R. Bagley	1871	Chief Engineer, Railways.
25	Sir W. Willcocks, K.C.M.G.	1872	Egyptian fame.
26	G. M. R. Field	1872	Chief Engineer, Punjab.
27	Sir W. R. Garstin ..	1872	Egyptian fame.
28	Rai Bahadur, Lala Ganga Ram, C.I.E.	1873	Superintendent of Works, Delhi Coronation Darbar Works, 1903; and Superintending Engineer, Patiala State.
29	G. Humfress	1873	Superintending Engineer, Railways.
30	A. F. Higgins, K.I.H...	1873	Superintending Engineer, Bengal.
31	A. Grant	1873	Superintending Engineer, Hyderabad.
32	J. L. P. Hogan... ...	1873	Chief Engineer, Railways.
33	H. T. Gwyther... ...	1874	Superintending Engineer, Railways.
34	A. E. Rose	1874	Superintending Engineer, Burma.
35	Rai Bahadur, K. C. Bandopadhyay.	1876	Superintending Engineer, Bengal.
36	H. D. Granville ...	1876	Superintending Engineer, Punjab.
37	W. MacDonald... ...	1876	Chief Engineer, E.B. and Assam.
38	C. E. Housden	1876	Superintending Engineer. E.B. and Assam.
39	W. B. Gwyther... ...	1876	Chief Superintending Engineer, E.B. and Assam.
40	J. T. Farrant	1877	Chief Superintending Engineer, E.B. and Punjab.
41	W. A. Bagley	1877	Superintending Engineer, Punjab.
42	E. G. Foy	1877	Superintending Engineer, Burma.
43	C. S. R. Palmer ...	1878	Australian fame.
44	G. T. Oliver	1878	Superintending Engineer, Burma.
45	W. E. T. Bennet, C.S.I.	1878	Chief Engineer, Punjab.
46	G. M. Harriot, C.S.I., C.I.E.	1878	Chief Engineer, C.P.
47	J. Willcocks	1879	Superintending Engineer, Railways.
48	C. E. V. Goument, C.S.I.	1879	Chief Engineer, U.P.
49	J. G. Davis	1879	Superintending Engineer, Punjab.
50	Rai Bahadur, Kanhiya Lal.	1879	Superintending Engineer, B. and R. Punjab.
51	W. P. Housden ...	1881	Superintending Engineer, U.P.
52	F. E. Gwyther	1881	Chief Engineer, Punjab.
53	R. E. Purves	1881	Chief Engineer, Punjab.
54	H. W. James	1881	Superintending Engineer, Burma.
55	F. W. Vyal	1882	Superintending Engineer, Burma.
56	G. T. Anthony	1882	Superintending Engineer, U.P.
57	S. Athim	1882	Superintending Engineer, U.P.
58	J. M. Taylor	1882	Superintending Engineer, U.P.
59	F. O. Oertal	1883	Offg. Superintending Engineer, U.P.
60	Rai Sahib, R. Mittra ...	1883	Offg. Superintending Engineer, C.P.
61	C. Pratt	1883	Offg. Superintending Engineer, Railways.
62	E. J. Mitchell	1883	Superintending Engineer, E.B. and Assam.
63	F. W. Roberts	1884	Superintending Engineer, Railways.
64	R. J. Powell	1884	Superintending Engineer, U.P.
65	E. A. W. Phillips ...	1885	Superintending Engineer, Burma.
66	A. J. Wadley	1885	Superintending Engineer, Punjab.
67	Anad Prasad Sarkar ...	1885	Chief Engineer Bihar and Orissa (Place of recmt.).
68	Rai Bahadur Ralla Ram, I.S.O.	1886	Engineer-in-Chief, Railways.
69	C. H. Wollaston ...	1886	Engineer-in-Chief, Burma.
70	F. W. Schönemann ...	1887	Superintending Engineer, Punjab.
71	B. C. Lall	1887	Superintending Engineer, U.P.
72	P. N. Sen	1888	Superintending Engineer. Burma (place of recmt.).
73	F. T. Bates	1889	Superintending Engineer. Punjab.
74	H. W. M. Ives	1889	Superintending Engineer. Punjab.
75	F. W. Allum	1890	Superintending Engineer, Railways.
76	H. Hughes	1891	Superintending Engineer, Railways.
77	J. N. Taylor	1891	Superintending Engineer Punjab.
78	C. J. Floyd		Superintending Engineer Punjab.

Note 1.—Men who passed out in 1892 to 1894 have not yet reached that stage when they may get Administrative rank.

2. After 1894 the men have been classed as *Provincial Engineers.*

3. Some of the officers in the above list are those who were out-classed at Roorkee and did not get guaranteed appointments but were made Imperial from Tempy. Engineers.

(2) *From Poona College.*

(Prior to 1869 this College turned out only Subordinates and the first Engineer Officer passed out in that year).

1. Mr. Fardunji Kavasji Tarapurwala, B.A., L.C.E., C.I.E., 1876, retired a few years ago as Superintending Engineer 1st Class, Bombay.

2. Mr. M. Vishvesvarayya—1884—became Superintending Engineer 1st Class before he was 50 years of age—Chief Engineer Hyderabad State, Chief Engineer Mysore—now Diwan of Mysore State, not yet 55 years of age.

3. K. B. Mancharji Kavasji Marzban, C.I.E.—Joined the Department as a subordinate before 1869; retired as an Executive Engineer 1st grade; got Khan Bahadur 1877, and C.I.E. on 30th May, 1891—

on retirement joined the Bombay Municipal Service. Is alive, and is now 72 years old.

4. Mr. N. Belvadi—Joined 1891, became Superintending Engineer 1911, at the age of 43 only, and died in March, 1912, at 44 years.

5. Karpur Srinivasarav, B.Sc.; L.C.E., 1891, Superintending Engineer, Mysore.

6. Bangalore Kirishnarao B.A., L.C.E., 1891, Superintending Engineer, Bombay.

7. Vinàyak Trimbak Agáshe, L.C.E., 1892, Superintending Engineer, Bombay, and Sanitary Engineer.

GENERAL SECRETARY,
Assn. of Indian College Engineers.

ANNEXURE I. TO ABOVE.

Memorandum by the Association of Indian College Engineers relating to the Public Works Department.

71,700. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—(1) The superior posts in the Department are recruited in 5 ways:—

(*a*) by the appointment of Civil Engineers obtained from England,

(*b*) by the appointment of Royal Engineers,

(*c*) by the appointment of successful candidates from the Indian Engineering Colleges,

(*d*) by the appointment to the permanent establishment of Temporary Engineers howsoever secured, and

(*e*) by the promotion of selected officers from the subordinate grades of the Public Works Department.

(2) Recruits from England are appointed by a Selection Committee at the India Office without competition. The annual recruitment from this source has varied. The number during a series of years has averaged 30 (*vide* the reply given to a question asked in the House of Commons on the 19th April, 1911). The annual recruitment in India is approximately 14, *viz.*, 9 from the successful candidates of the Indian Colleges and 5 from selected subordinates.

(3) The proportion of recruits from England and from Indian Engineering Institutions, *i.e.*, excluding promoted subordinates, is thus approximately 30 to 9. That is to say, only 20 per cent. of the total annual recruitment is obtained from the Indian Colleges and 70 per cent. from England. The remaining 10 per cent. is obtained by selection from the subordinate grades. In other words 80 per cent. of the total annual recruitment is made by selection, while only 20 per cent. is made by open competition.

(4) This proportion of recruitment from the Indian Colleges, which, be it remembered, are institutions maintained at great cost to the State, is thus very small as compared with that from England. This proportion of recruitment should be contrasted with the position existing at the time of Public Service Commission of 1886-87 and with the recommendations of that Commission. It will be noticed (*vide* page 362 of Appendix O of the Appendices to the Report of that body) that the annual recruitment from England and from the Indian Colleges was, at that time, in the proportion of 21 to 9, that is to say, the Indian Colleges received 30 per cent. of the total annual appointments. It is, therefore, manifest that, notwithstanding the fact that the said Commission recommended a gradual increase in the annual number of appointments to be given to the Indian Colleges by reducing the English recruitment, the reverse has in fact transpired. English recruitment has gradually increased while the recruitment from Indian Engineering Colleges has remained absolutely unchanged.

(5) It is asserted that the legitimate aspirations of the public in India cannot be satisfied unless a greater proportion of the superior appointments in the Public Works Department are reserved for competition in this country. It is suggested, as a suitable remedy, that at least 50 per cent. of the total annual recruitment be made in India at present, and that this proportion should be gradually increased as conditions change.

(6) Again, as regards the system of recruitment in England, the method of selection at present in vogue is decidedly faulty and should be discarded for a system of open and unrestricted competition in which there should be no racial limit whatsoever. This system already prevails in India.

71,701. **(II.) System of training and probation.**—*Training of men recruited from England.*—There is no guarantee that the preliminary training obtained by these recruits is such as to meet the requirements of the Profession in India. The training should undoubtedly be specifically directed to one end, *viz.*, the efficient performance of the duties required of an Engineer in India. This can only be secured by Competitive Examination, in which the subjects must be specially chosen and should include one Indian language. The competition must be real, that is to say, the number of appointments offered must not in any year exceed a fixed proportion of the number of competing candidates. A suitable arrangement would be that the appointments offered in any year should not exceed one-third of the number of candidates in that year. This suggestion is by no means unfair when considered with the conditions frequently prevailing in the Indian Engineering Colleges. For example, it has happened at Rurki College that 18 to 25 candidates have competed for 5 or 6 appointments. Again, at the Poona College it has frequently happened that no less than 40 or 50 candidates have competed for one single appointment.

Training of men recruited from the Indian Engineering Colleges.—The training imparted in these institutions, it is considered, is sound and fairly exhaustive. This fact has, moreover, been publicly admitted by eminent persons, such as Lord Macdonnell, and Sir J. P. Hewett, &c. Again, the training is directed wholly to the requirements in India. It is, therefore, submitted that, from the point of view of Indian requirements, the training received by Indian College Engineers is, in fact, superior to that received, on the average, by Engineers obtained from England. In addition, the Indian College recruit possesses the great and acknowledged advantage of having received his training in the country in which he has to practise his profession.

Probation.—The training received by the alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges is further supplemented by a period of training on probation for one year in the Department which is not the case with recruits obtained from England. This probationary period in the Department in India is absolutely necessary and should be insisted upon as an indispensible condition and it should, in addition, be a probationary period in the strictest sense, involving selection and a possibility of rejection at the end of it. Any plea that this is unfair, or will deter candidates from England, by reason of the attached risk, may be met by the provision of free return passages to rejected probationers. This, except for the free passage, is exactly what prevails at the present moment in the case of recruits from the Indian Colleges.

71,702. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—The conditions of service of recruits appointed in England and India differ very considerably, and this is the sole cause of the great discontent which prevails among the latter class of officers throughout India. Notwithstanding the fact that both classes of officers are recruited for and required to do exactly the same work and bear the same responsibilities the position of officers recruited in England is more favourable, in many respects, as compared with that of officers recruited in India. The policy which has, in fact, prevailed since the date when effect was given to the recommendations of the Public Service Commission of 1886-87 has undoubtedly been a melancholy one, of monopoly and exclusion and consistently adverse to the interests of the Indian trained element. The position, thus created, is absolutely illogical and unjust and cannot, in view of the surrounding circumstances and the past history of the department, be supported. The facts and arguments urging the reversal of the policy now in vogue and the restoration of the alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges to the position they formerly occupied (that is on a full equality with Engineers from England) are fully

set forth in the annexed Memorandum,* which it is requested, may be closely studied.

71,703. **(IV.) Conditions of salary.**—The pay of the Indian recruited element is approximately two-thirds of that granted to officers recruited in England. This is utterly unfair and unsuitable. The resulting anomalies and defects are startling and are as follows:—

(*i*) The minimum pay of Indian trained Executive Engineers is much less than the maximum pay of Imperial Assistant Engineers;

(*ii*) The minimum pay of Indian trained Superintending Engineers is less than the maximum pay of Imperial Executive Engineers.

(*iii*) Anomalies exist in connection with local allowance as stated below.

(*iv*) Generally the pay granted to the Indian trained element is inadequate and is not commensurate with their work and responsibilities.

It is clear that Indian trained Engineers, under conditions now prevailing, will receive less pay than their own subordinates. This position is untenable. It is contented that emoluments should depend solely on services rendered, and that this distinction between two classes of officers who do the same work and bear the same responsibilities should be obliterated.

Local Allowances.—Similarly, Indian trained Engineers receive two-thirds the local allowances granted to officers obtained from England. This difference is unjust, for the said allowances are always given for a specific purpose, that is, as compensation for local disabilities which equally affect both classes of officers.

Probationary Period.—Not only have Indian trained Officers, as already explained, to undergo a probationary period and incur the consequent risk of rejection, but even after completing such probation, the period so spent is not counted for increments and promotion. This causes great inequality between the two classes of officers.

It is contended that there should be absolutely no distinction in the matter of emoluments, of whatever nature, between the two classes of officers.

71,704. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—Here again there is much disparity between the conditions applying to each of these two classes of officers. Great stress has been laid on the advantage to be derived by an Engineer in visiting works in foreign countries and the element recruited in England has received undue credit on this account. Unless the conditions of leave are the same, it becomes impossible for Indian trained men, even if they desire to do so, to secure the same advantages in this direction as English recruited Engineers. Again, the nature of an officer's duties in the Public Works Department involves continued exposure and discomfort for long periods and the health of an Indian trained officer suffers equally with that of imported men. There is, therefore, no reason whatever to perpetuate the present distinction. Indian College Engineers should, therefore, receive exactly the same leave conditions as their contemporaries recruited from England. It is generally recognised that Indian recruited Engineers break down in health, much earlier than men obtained from England, and this is due to insufficient leave. Again, officers recruited in India in certain other services, *e.g.*, the Traffic, Accounts, Opium, Finance, etc., are under more favourable leave rules, and there is no reason why Indian trained Engineers should not be on an equal footing with these other services.

71,705. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—Here again there is a much resented distinction, *vide* art. 636, Civil Service Regulations, which will create invidious and unjust anomalies. For example, an Indian trained Chief Engineer will draw less pension than his own subordinates recruited in England. It is submitted that it is a well and universally established principle, that pensions are granted as retiring provisions for specific services rendered to the State, and it is therefore illogical and unjust to create or maintain any distinction in this direction between persons who have in fact rendered exactly the same services. In other words, pensions ought to be wholly and solely dependent on specific services rendered and not on place of original recruitment, for this does not involve any special merit.

71,706. **(VIIa.) Limitations in the employment of Non-Europeans.**—As urged above the Department should be recruited half from England and half in India for the present. The recruitment in England should be open to all British subjects equally, irrespective of domicile, colour, caste or creed. Latterly, during the existence of Cooper's Hill College, only 2 Indians were iligible for appointment even after competition, and at present the number of Indians eligible for appointment in England is limited to 10 per cent. of the total annual recruitment. Limitations of this nature should be barred.

71,707. **(VIIb.) Working of the existing system of division of services in the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial.**—The division of the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial sections has been anything but a success, and can never be so in view of the surrounding circumstances and the past history of the Department. The distinction created between the two classes of officers, who do exactly the same work and bear exactly the same responsibilities, is intensely resented and will inevitably result in splitting up the whole Public Works Department into two hostile camps, and this must greatly injure efficiency. The interests of the two classes of officers are now widely divergent, and this is conspicuous in their relations. Concerted action has become impossible and the general feeling of *esprit de corps* which formerly prevailed, has ceased to exist. In its place there will assuredly spring up a deep and widespread feeling of suspicion and distrust between the two classes of officers which must wreck harmonious working. So long as the two classes possess, on the average, equal educational and professional attainments, and this is undoubtedly the case, any differentiation between them is unworkable. It is impossible to force a distinction in pay when none exists in attainments, and any attempts to do so must create complications and raise issues which it would be as well to avoid. Again, it is, in fact, true that many Indian trained Engineers possess superior qualifications to some officers recruited in England. It is therefore urged that, the said differentiation, which is illogical and unjust, should be obliterated and extinguished, and that the alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges should be restored to the position they formerly occupied, that is to say, there should be only one service in the Public Works Department.

71,708. **(IX.) Other points.**—(1) *No analogy with other Provincial Services.*—It is widely felt that the resistance offered to the oft-repeated prayer of the alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges to be restored to the position they formerly occupied, that is, on an equality with recruits from England, is due in a great measure to the apprehension that if this is accepted, other Provincial Services will be entitled to similar treatment. It is submitted in reply, that the question of other Provincial Services is foreign to the point at issue. There is no parallel between the case of Engineers recruited in India and other Provincial Services. Engineers recruited in India are not situated in the same relation to Engineers recruited from England, as members of other Provincial Services bear to the Imperial Officers of their Services. But, on the contrary, except as regards pay, leave and pension, there is in all other respects no distinction between the two classes of officers in the Public Works Department. It is, therefore, submitted that any argument, opposing the restoration of the alumni of Indian Engineering Colleges to the position they formerly occupied on the ground that this would entitled other Provincial Services to similar treatment, is unsound and cannot be raised.

(2) *Temporary Engineers.*—The position occupied by these officers in the Department is undoubtedly most unsatisfactory and requires consideration. These officers are at present recruited in an irregular manner, *viz.*:—

(*a*). From Indian trained and duly qualified Engineers who failed to secure guaranteed appointments when competing for them.

* See Annexure II.

(*b*). From Engineers appointed under covenant in England.

(*c*). From unqualified persons appointed in India.

It is submitted that, except in special cases where experts are required, these officers should be recruited from qualified persons who have successfully undergone the prescribed training in any Indian Engineering College and that no other person should be engaged until this source of supply is exhausted. It is contended that this arrangement will be greatly beneficial to the State Colleges in India and will tend to attract suitable candidates. The present conditions under which these officers serve are not such as to secure efficiency. There is practically no security whatever, for these officers are liable to be discharged with very limited notice regardless of the length of their service. It is suggested that such service should be regarded as permanent non-pensionable service, and there should be an incremental scale of pay. The Service may be called the Extra Engineer Service, and may be divided into Extra Assistant and Extra Executive Engineer classes.

Annexure II. to above.

Memorandum by the Indian College Engineers relating to the Provincial Engineer Service.

71,709. (1) The question of the recruitment of the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department is one that has given rise to widespread and lasting discontent. It is generally felt throughout the country that the policy of excluding the Alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges from the Imperial Service (*in which they were formerly included*) is unjust and should be abandoned.

(2) The following points which deal with this question deserve consideration, for they reveal that the situation has not, in fact, been adequately appreciated.

ORIGIN OF THE PROVINCIAL ENGINEER SERVICE.

(3) Prior to the institution of the Provincial Engineer Service by the Government of India Resolution No. 2112-G., dated the 19th July 1892, recruits from the Indian Engineering Colleges (one of which, viz., that at Rurki was established so long ago as 1847), were appointed to the Imperial Service, *i.e.*, on an equal footing with Engineers obtained from England. It has been repeatedly proclaimed [*vide* the Government of India, Resolution No. 2112-G. (mentioned above) and No. 675-694-E., dated the 24th April 1908, &c.] that the Provincial Engineer Service was the outcome of the recommendation of the Public Service Commission of 1886-1887. The issues which naturally present themselves are—

(*i*) Were these recommendations sound in themselves?

(*ii*) Was it justifiable to give effect to them?

(*iii*) Has the policy advocated by the Commission been consistently followed.

The following considerations show that the answer to each of these questions is in the negative and that therefore the institution and retention of the Provincial Engineer Service stands self-condemned.

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF 1886-1887.

(4) The report of that body states that its recommendations were based on two grounds, viz.:—

(*i*) that the considerations which led it to recommend the formation of Imperial and Provincial Services, in respect to the various branches of the Civil Service, with distinct conditions of service applied with equal force to the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department, and

(*ii*) that Engineers recruited from England received a better professional training than that which the Indian Colleges were capable of affording.

(5) *Ground No.* 1.—Here the Commission were distinctly in error because there was absolutely no analogy (and this fact has been admitted) between the case of the various branches of the Civil Service and that of the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department.

The following statement contrasts the facts of the case of the various former branches of Civil Service recruited in India with those of the case of Indian trained Engineers:—

Case of the various branches of the Civil Service.	*Case of Indian trained Engineers.*
(*i*) There had always been a complete distinction between the various branches of the Civil Service recruited in England and India.	This was not the case with the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department, Engineers recruited in England and India were on precisely the same footing.
(*ii*) The Branches of the Civil Service recruited in India (now included in the Provincial Service) were formerly subordinate services and were *not* recruited for and required to do the same work and bear the same responsibilities as officers of the Imperial Civil Service obtained from England. The same remarks apply to most other Provincial Services, *e.g.*, the Survey, Forest, etc.	Engineers recruited in India belonged to a superior service. They were and are still recruited for and required to do the same work and bear the same responsibilities as their English contemporaries.
(*iii*) The Commission recognised that the branches of the Civil Service recruited in India were recruited in an irregular manner which was not conducive to efficiency. The Provincial Service was designed to regularise recruitment and did in fact considerably raise the status and improve the prospects of these services.	Indian trained Engineers were recruited from specially established institutions of long standing, one of which had been in existence for 40 years. Many of them had attained high administrative appointments. The Provincial Service was in the case of these Indian Engineering Colleges a retrograde measure, and greatly lowered the status and prospects offered to their successful students.

Furthermore it was virtually admitted by the Government when actually giving effect to the Commission's recommendations that there was no analogy between the case of Indian trained Engineers and those other services recruited in India, for the Provincial Engineer service, as instituted, was quite dissimilar to other Provincial Services. In short, except as regards pay, leave and pension, there was in all other respects no distinction between Engineers recruited in England and India respectively (*vide* Resolution No. 2112-G. dated the 19th July, 1892).

(6) *Ground No. II.*—This conclusion obviously could only have been arrived at from the evidence before the Commission which, be it mentioned, was not tested by cross-examination of the witnesses produced. A close scrutiny of the evidence will reveal—

(*i*) that it did not establish the inferiority of Indian trained Engineers, for many witnesses, including officers with the widest experience were of opinion that there was little to choose between the best Rurki Engineer and his English rival, and

(*ii*) that much of it was prejudiced for, speaking generally, the excellent records established by many Indian trained Engineers in the past were forgotten, the fact that *natives* of India had only recently begun to appreciate and practice engineering as a profession was not considered, and the fact that many Indian College Engineers were at that time holding high administrative appointments secured by competition with their English contemporaries was completely ignored.

(7) Even admitting, for the moment, that the evidence tended to prove that the Indian Engineering Institutions (which had done well enough in the past) had fallen short of the requirements of the day, the proper remedy lay in raising the standard of professional education imparted in them and not, as advocated, in making a differentiation between recruits from them and Engineers obtained from England.

(8) Again it is a very significant fact that the Commission did not advocate the creation of any such distinction in the cases of the remaining superior services (*e.g.*, the Accounts, Traffic, Entrance, etc.) which were also partially recruited in India, but in which recruitment was by nomination and not by competition open to all.

(9) It is contended, therefore, that the Commission failed to appreciate the true position in connection with the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department recruited in India and that their recommendations which suggested an awkward and glaringly unjust method of remedying an alleged evil (viz., the inferiority of Indian trained Engineers) were wholly unsound.

(10) To pass on to the second issue, viz., whether it was justifiable to give effect to the Commission's recommendations. The answer is most emphatically in the negative for two reasons.

(11) *Reason* (*i*) *The Government of India Act of* 1833 *and the Queen's Proclamation of* 1858.—By clause 87 of the said Act it is provided that "no person by reason of his *birth, creed* or colour shall be disqualified from holding *any* office in our service." In the despatch of the Board of Directors of the Honourable East India Company which accompanied the Act, it was stated—"It is fitting that this important enactment should be understood in order that its full *spirit* and intention may be transfused through our whole system of administration. You will observe that its object is not to ascertain qualification but to remove disqualification.....Fitness is henceforth to be the criterion of eligibility." Again the Queen's Proclamation, which is widely known and which it is therefore unnecessary to quote, was couched in very similar terms. The above statute and proclamation have been widely regarded as a charter removing all bars to any branch of the Public Service and holding out the promise of increased and higher employment of natives of India (which term includes Statutory natives) and the complaint that this promise has not been fulfilled has been widespread and uninterrupted.

When the case of the Indian Engineering Colleges is examined, however, the position becomes worse, because here, by the creation of the Provincial Engineer Service, the public in India entering these institutions were in fact dispossessed of that which they had had for nearly half a century. Whatever may be the construction put on this said Act of 1833 and the Royal Proclamation as to the grant of facilities for admission to the Public Service not already enjoyed it is contended that these pronouncements at any rate barred the institution of the Provincial Engineer Service and the withdrawal from the alumni of Indian Colleges of that which they had possessed for a long period of time, viz., full equality with their contemporaries from England. The introduction of the Provincial Engineer Service reversed the practice of years, thereby disturbing vested rights which had accrued to the public in India, and suddenly established a system by which place of recruitment alone is the criterion of eligibility for the Imperial Branch of the Public Works Department.

It may be argued that the Indian Engineering Colleges were disqualified from receiving appointments in the Imperial Service by reason of the finding of the Public Service Commission that recruits trained in them were inferior to Engineers obtained from England. In reply it is contended that—

(*a*) the findings of the Commission, as argued in paragraph 6 above, cannot be upheld;

(*b*) the Government of India have virtually acknowledged that Indian trained Engineers are qualified for the Imperial Service (*vide* the arguments connected with the case of Temporary Engineers, paragraph 13 below). If out-classed people from Rurki College, who in addition were only eligible for the Provincial Service, are held to be fitted for the Imperial Service, the pick of the Indian Colleges cannot be defeated;

(*c*) even admitting its existence this disqualification based upon the findings of the Public Service Commission was capable of being removed and should have been immediately removed; and

(*d*) in any case it has since been removed, *vide* the public admissions of eminent persons quoted in paragraph 23 (*b*) below. The Indian Engineering Institutions should therefore be restored to the position they occupied before.

(12) *Reason* (*ii*) *Pledge given to Indian Colleges in* 1873.—Again the institution of the Provincial Service for Indian College Engineers was in direct opposition to a definite pledge given to them in a speech delivered by Sir William Muir, Lieutenant-Governor of North-Western Provinces at Rurki on the 28th November 1873, of which the following is an extract—". . . But apart from personal associations, there is a reason which renders the present moment one of public interest; the establishment in England of an Engineering College for India has unsettled the minds of the public here as to the prospects of this Institution and the continuance to it of the patronage of Government. It has been a subject of much anxiety to myself and of correspondence with the Government of India. It is, therefore, with sincere satisfaction that I am able to announce to you and through you to those without who are interested in the Thomason College, that the Institution at Cooper's Hill *will in no degree affect the relations of the Government of India with this College, nor the employment which has been hitherto guaranteed to its more successful* students. Between the two seminaries there will be no opposition or antagonism. The requirements of this great country are ample for both. I am sure that you will all, with me, be thankful to the Governor-General in Council for the justice which has thus been rendered to Rurki College." The pledge was given shortly after the institution of Cooper's Hill College at a time when the public in India were naturally apprehensive that the position of the Alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges in the Public Works Department would be injuriously affected, and it will be observed that it was given with the full authority of the Government of India and possibly also of the Secretary of State. It will further be noticed that the Government pledged that the Institution of Cooper's Hill would in *no degree* affect its relations with Rurki College, nor the appointments "*hitherto guaranteed*" to its successful students. The appointments "*hitherto guaranteed*" were in the Imperial Service. Yet notwithstanding this pledge the Provincial Engineer Service making a great distinction between Engineers recruited in England and India was introduced 20 years later and was based to a great extent on a comparison of the respective merits of Cooper's Hill and Indian trained Engineers. Again, it must be noted that this pledge which is recorded in the Rurki College Calendar of 1872-73 formed one of the strongest inducements to candidates to enter Rurki College, for these men naturaly believed (and it was a legitimate belief for them to nourish) that the distinction created was merely a tentative measure, and that when the organization of the Engineer establishment came to be reconsidered, in accordance to para. 10 of the Resolution No. 2523-G. of 1893, the said distinction would be abolished.

(13) *Case of certain Temporary Engineers.*—It now remains to examine whether the recommendations of the Commission have been consistently followed, and whether the subsequent actions of the Government indicate an unqualified approval and acceptance of those recommendations. Here again the answer is emphatically in the negative. The arguments in this connection refer to the case of 12 Temporary Engineers, all Rurki men, who, many years after the Provincial Engineer Service had been established by the Resolution No. 2112-G. of 1892, were made permanent and placed not in the Provincial but in the Imperial Service. The question is why?

The deep significance of this will be more readily and forcibly recognised when the following facts are digested:—

(i) These officers had, with one single exception, passed out of Rurki College after the Commission had

discovered that this Institution did not afford a training equal to that obtained in England.

(ii) They had failed to secure guaranteed appointments when competing for them and had consequently no claim (except good service rendered, which applies equally to other Indian trained Engineers) to this special treatment.

(iii) The majority of them had failed to secure the necessary percentage of marks (*viz.*, 66 per cent.) required in order to qualify for Government appointment appointments and were therefore not eligible under the rules of the Institution which trained them, for permanent appointments at all. *That is to say they could not, with the percentage of marks obtained by them, have obtained guaranteed appointments even if they had in fact headed the examination lists in their respective years.*

(iv) Three of these officers, *viz.*, Messrs. W. C. Cooper, C. H. A. Muller and E. S. Christe *were specially barred from being appointed to the Imperial Service* under para. 11 *of the Resolution No.* 2112-G. *of* 1892, because they were actually undergoing training in Rurki College on the date of the said Resolution and failed to secure guaranteed appointments allotted by Resolution No. 1443-G. of 1884. In their case therefore the Provincial Engineer Service took effect from the 19th July 1892. That is to say even ignoring the disqualification stated in (iii) above they were only eligible for the Provincial Service.

(v) In one case (the name can be stated if required) the officer failed to qualify absolutely in Rurki College and took up an appointment in the service of the State as a Temporary Sub-overseer on the R.M. Railway. He was subsequently engaged in a subordinate capacity as a Temporary Sub-engineer in the Panjab and later appointed as a Temporary Engineer, from whence he was translated to the Imperial Engineer Service. This is therefore a case where an unqualified person has risen from the lowest rung of the ladder to the Imperial Service, long after the Provincial Engineer Service was established, and this should be contrasted with the treatment accorded to the pick of the Indian Colleges against whom the door to similar advancement is absolutely banged and barred.

(14) It is irresistibly clear that—

(i) the placing of these officers in the Imperial Service was a distinct departure from the policy advocated by the Public Service Commission and in fact amounts to a reversal of that policy;

(ii) it stands revealed that the Government have virtually admitted, that Engineers trained in India even subsequent to the Commission's findings, are not necessarily inferior to men recruited in England, and that they are fully qualified to be placed on an equality with the latter, *i.e.*, in the Imperial Service. If this applies to men who were out-classed in Rurki College it must likewise apply with greater force to others who, as stated above, are the pick of the Indian Colleges, but who are placed in the Provincial Service;

(iii) the action taken in respect to the three officers mentioned above whose appointment to the Imperial Service was barred by virtue of Resolution No. 2112-G. of 1892 must be held to have been due to an authorised relaxation of the rules laid down in the said Resolution, and constitutes in fact an amendment of the said rules and renders other Indian trained Engineers also eligible for the Imperial Service, and it is further contended that jpstice and equity demand that these latter should be similarly treated.

(15) *Other Superior Services*, e.g., *the Accounts, Finance, Traffic and Police (until recently).* The facts in connection with these Services are specially worthy of attention for they serve both to emphasise the injustice of the Provincial Engineer Service and to dispel the erroneous belief "*that it is the general rule that members of the Public Service recruited in India are on a different footing as regards pay, leave and pension rules to officers obtained from England.*" This, be it noted, was the reason, given by the Secretary of State, for not re-opening the Imperial Service to Indian trained Engineers in the House of Commons in reply to a question asked by Mr. T. Hart Davies in May 1908, enquiring whether the subject of re-opening the Imperial Service to Indian College Engineers would be considered. The services are, like the Public Works Department, partially recruited in India, but such Indian recruits are on a full equality with their English contemporaries and secure vastly better terms of service than those granted to the alumni of the Indian Engineering Institutions. The questions which immediately present themselves are (*a*) why were not Provincial Branches introduced for these services also?; and (*b*) why was the Indian recruited element of the Public Works Department alone singled out for degradations?

It is a fact that of all the Branches of the Public Service in which the Indian recruited and Imported elements were on an equal footing the Public Works Department only was disturbed and split up into Imperial and Provincial Services. It is contended that the introduction of this invidious and unjust distinction between British subjects born, domiciled, educated and recruited in India is indefensible. Further, in view of the fact that Indian trained Engineers win their appointments by free and open competition and not by nomination (which is frequently secured by influence) and that they can claim to possess superior educational qualifications to those required of men entering these other services, this state of affairs is significant and startling. For example, the educational test requird for admission into the Accounts and Traffic Departments is on a par with that required *merely to enter* the Indian Engineering Colleges, while the Engineer has a further Superior, General and Professional educational course of 3 to 4 years in College itself, and also a further professional training of one year after completing his College course.

It is manifest therefore—

(*a*) that the above facts reveal that it is not the general rule that members of the Public Services recruited in India are on a different footing to officers of their services obtained from England, but

(*b*) that on the contrary where officers recruited in both countries are recruited for and required to do the same work and have the same responsibilities, as in the case of the above-mentioned services, it is the general rule *that they are on the same footing*, and

(*c*) that of all the Branches of the Public Service in which Indian trained and English recruits were formerly on the same footing, the position of the Alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges has alone been disturbed.

It is therefore contended—

(i) that the *ground, stated in reply to the question asked in the House of Commons*, for not re-opening the Imperial Service to Indian College Engineers disappears; and

(ii) that they should in consequence be restored to their former position.

POSITION OF INDIAN COLLEGE ENGINEERS CONTRASTED WITH THAT OF ENGINEERS FROM ENGLAND.

Position prior to 1908.

(16) The above arguments deal with the policy involved in the creation of the Provincial Engineer Service. It now remains to examine the conditions imposed upon the public seeking admission to the Public Service through the Indian Engineering Colleges and to contrast them with those offered to Engineers obtained from England. Although both these classes were and are still *recruited for and required to do the same work and bear the same responsibilities*, the position occupied by the Alumni of Indian Colleges prior to 1908 was as follows:—

(i) The Indian College Engineer received in 30 years Rs. 116,530 (amounting at 4 per cent. compound interest to Rs. 176,800) less pay than his Imperial contemporary.

(ii) The pay of the Provincial Executive Engineer, 3rd grade, in charge of a Division was actually much less than that granted to an Imperial Assistant Engineer, 1st grade, in charge of a Sub-division involving inferior work and far less responsibility. As a result, instances frequently occurred in which Provincial Engineers received less pay than their own subordinates.

(iii) The position of Provincial Engineers on their attaining the administrative rank of Superintending Engineer was still more glaring. Promotions to these

appointments are, under rule, made by special selection only, so that a Provincial Engineer so promoted would necessarily be selected in preference to other Executive Engineers whether Imperial or Provincial. Undr the scale of pay fixed, a Provincial Engineer on receiving such promotion would not only have received approximately Rs. 67,000 less pay during his former service than other Imperial officers who by the very fact of his selection were confessedly inferior to him but he would even then *qua*-Superintending Engineer receive just half the pay of an Imperial officer holding the same appointment and also less than Imperial officers whom he had superseded and who would be his immediate subordinates.

(iv) In the matter of special allowances, which are given solely on account of extra expense involved in living in some localities, Provincial Engineers were and are still granted only two-thirds of the sum allowed to Imperial officers.

In certain cases moreover (*vide* Appendix 19, P.W. Code) the allowances granted to Provincial officers from Superintending Engineer downwards are less than those granted to Sub-Engineers (subordinates). These glaring and unjust anomalies speak for themselves. They handicapped the Indian College recruit in every possible way.

(17) A general memorial setting forth these grievances and praying for the restoration of the Alumni of Indian Engineering Colleges to the Imperial Service was accordingly submitted to the Viceroy in 1902, that is, when the Provincial Service had been in force 7 years and when the consideration of the organisation of the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department was due in accordance with para. 10 of the Resolution No. 2523 G., dated the 25th September, 1893. The reply given was a direct refusal on the ground that the memorialists accepted employment well knowing "*the terms of service.*" This reply may here be suitably contrasted with the attitude displayed towards the imported elements of the Public Works Department who have met with no resistance in their demands to secure accelerated promotion and increased rate of pay which, be it known, is very greatly in excess of that which they contracted to receive and who are at the present moment clamouring for largely improved pensions to which they are distinctly not entitled under "*the terms of their service.*"

(18) The matter was then appealed to the Secretary of State by means of a general memorial submitted in December, 1906.

Changes of 1908.

(19) The next thing that transpired was the memorable reorganization scheme of 1908 (*vide* Resolution No. 675-694 E., dated 24th April, 1908) which made the position of the Alumni of the Indian Colleges worse. Indian College Engineers were also then informed that the orders of the Secretary of State on their memorial of 1906 were embodied in the said reorganization scheme. It would be no exaggeration to say that the feeling raised by this retrograde measure was one of utter consternation and despair which deepened into bitter and intense resentment on the issue, shortly after, of the Government of India's letter No. 997 E., dated the 6th June, 1908, laying down the treatment to be accorded to Indian College Engineers who declined to accept the new conditions of service.

Briefly the changes introduced in 1908 were—

(i) Provincial Engineers were removed from the same list as Imperial officers, thus making a complete differentiation between the two classes.

(ii) The promotion of Imperial officers was accelerated while that of Provincial Engineers was retarded by several years, thus creating the position by which Indian College men would, through no fault of their own and wholly irrespective of the true relative merits be compelled to serve under Imperial men who were their juniors and who may have been previously their own subordinates.

(iii) Promotion to the administrative grades, *i.e.*, to Superintending Engineers and upwards was made almost *physically* impossible for Indian College Engineers.

(iv) The whole reorganisation was transparently designed to subordinate the Indian recruited element of the Public Works Department to the element obtained from England and to place the former in exactly the same relation to the latter as members of other Provincial services bear to the Imperial Officers of their services.

(v) As compensation for these changes which shattered their position and prospects and ensured the complete domination of the imported staff in the Public Works Department a slight increase of pay was offered to Indian College Engineers. This increase when contrasted with the substantial increase granted to Imperial officers is striking. For example, (i) In the first 8 years of service the increase granted to Provincial Engineers averaged Rs. 3 per mensem while that of Imperial officers averaged Rs. 88 per mensem, and (ii) In the first 15 years of service the average increase for Provincial Engineers was Rs. 29 per mensem while that of Imperial Engineers averaged Rs. 142 per mensem. And this notwithstanding the fact (the point requires and will bear repetition) that *both classes of officers are recruited for and required to do the same work and bear the same responsibilities.*

(20) It is small wonder that this reorganisation scheme was rejected by the vast majority of Indian College Engineers, but they were destined to receive an even greater and more staggering blow, for it was ruled (*vide* the Government of India's letter No. 997 E., dated the 6th June, 1908, cited above) that—

(i) These officers would receive no increase of pay;

(ii) They would continue to be promoted according to the rules previously in force for Imperial and Provincial men alike and which had been abolished for the Imperial service; and

(iii) Their names would also be removed from the same list as their Imperial contemporaries.

These orders were not only unjust in that they withheld an increase of pay which had (*vide* preamble to Resolution No. 675-694 E., dated 24th April, 1908) only one month previously, been publicly admitted to be necessary for the Engineer establishment of the Public Works Department, but they were also in direct opposition to and constituted a withdrawal of the *primary conditions* under which these officers were induced to accept employment (*vide* Resolution No. 2112 G., and No. 2523 G., dated the 19th July and the 25th September, 1893, respectively). Under these said Resolutions Provincial Engineers entered the service on the expressed conditions—

(i) that except as regards amount of pay, leave and pension there would in all other respects be no distinction between them and Imperial officers, and

(ii) that they were to be borne on the same list and promoted side by side with Imperial Engineers.

It is submitted that this disregard of the paramount and indefeasible rights of these officers and this arbitrary imposition of changed conditions which would not have been accepted in the first instance (*i.e.*, when they entered the service) is unparallelled and constitutes a significant departure from the practice hitherto observed by which the inducements offered to men entering the public service have been regarded as permanent and enduring.

Changes of 1912.

(21) The general and sustained agitation produced by the above treatment is well known. After prolonged reconsideration the Government of India were led to the conclusion that the position taken up in 1908 was untenable and the reorganisation scheme of that year has in consequence been recently reversed, *vide* Resolution No. 439-458 E., dated 15th May, 1912. The position now is exactly as it was previous to 1908, with similar anomalies and defects, *viz.*;—

(i) the minimum pay of Provincial Executive Engineers is much less than the maximum pay of Imperial Assistant Engineers;

(ii) the minimum pay of Provincial Superintending Engineers is less than the maximum pay of Imperial Executive Engineers;

(ii) the same anomalies in connection with local allowances still exist, and

(iv) generally the pay granted to the Provincial element is inadequate and is not commensurate with their work and responsibilities.

The redress granted, however, is accepted as partial and tentative as it has been admitted in replies to questions asked in the House of Commons that the case has not been finally settled and that the question of the restoration of the Alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges to the Imperial Service has been deferred for consideration by the Royal Commission.

RECAPITULATION.

(22) Various reasons have been advanced above which it is contended establish—

(1) that the policy advocated by the Public Service Commission of creating a Provincial Engineer Service for Indian recruits was unsound;

(2) that its adoption was barred by the Government of India Act of 1833, and the Royal Proclamation of 1858 for it, in fact, dispossessed the public in India of facilities for admission to the higher ranks of the public service on a complete equality with officers obtained from England which they had enjoyed for nearly half a century. It must also be remembered that these Engineering Colleges formed the only source in India of recruitmnt to the public service, on an equality with officers from England, by free competition open to all;

(3) that the inclusion of the Alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges in the Provincial Engineer Service constituted the breach of a definite pledge and has moreover resulted in the creation of an invidious and unjustifiable distinction between British subjects domiciled, educated and recruited in India as explained in para. 15 above;

(4) that the Government themselves have repeatedly broken away from the policy advocated by the Commission as in the cases of the various Temporary Engineers (*vide* paras. 13 and 14 above);

(5) that the line of action taken in the cases of these Temporary Engineers gives other Indian College Engineers a just and an irresistible claim to like treatment;

(6) that the whole history of the Provincial Engineer Service from its very institution reveals a course of long continued injustice and shows how very little consideration has in fact been bestowed upon it; and

(7) that the only solution of the matter lies in the discontinuance of the present policy and the restoration of the Alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges to the position they formally occupied, that is to *the Imperial Service.*

CONCLUSION.

(23) Finally it is urged that the policy now in vogue should be abandoned and that Indian trained Engineers should be restored to the Imperial Service on the following additional grounds:—

(*a*) Indian College Engineers have established brilliant records in the past and have in numerous instances held, and are still holding, the highest administrative appointments in the Indian Public Works Department with distinction. These facts have been duly admitted by no less a distinguished Indian authority than Lord Macdonnell who, in an address delivered at Rurki College on the 6th November, 1900, alluded in the highest terms to the instances in which the Alumni of this Institution has established not merely Indian but European reputations. Lord Macdonnell specially instanced the names of Sir W. Wilcocks and Sir W. Garstin of Egyptian fame who received their training at Rurki College;

(*b*) Whatever may have been the condition of the Indian Engineering Colleges at the time the Public Service Commission sat (and this as argued above did not justify the withdrawal from the Public in India of that which they possessed for so long a period of time) the standard of education imparted in these Institutions has since been considerably raised. Rurki College is now admitted to be equal to any similar Institution in Europe. The following is the testimony of persons whose opinions must prevail:—

(i) Lord Macdonnell in his address referred to above spoke of Rurki College in the following terms:—"This College is, I am assured by those competent to speak on the point, now in a position to impart instruction, both theoretical and practical, up to the standard of any similar Institution in Europe."

(ii) Sir J. P. Hewett, Lieutenant-Governor of the United Provinces, in a speech delivered at Rurki College on the 27th October 1909, spoke of this Institution and its Alumni in the following terms:—"Your assurance, Major Atkinson that it is the aim of yourself and your colleagues to keep the education given in the Thomason College *abreast of the best technical education available in the Western World is amply vindicated* by the extremely high standard of education to which the students who are trained here attain. I have had the privilege of working in close conjunction with two of the most distinguished Alumni of the College. I refer to Mr. Goument, now Chief Engineer in the Buildings and Roads Branch of these Provinces, but destined to reach a still more distinguished position in the Public Works Department. I have no hesitation in saying that these officers are excelled by none of their brethren in the department for professional skill, for initiative, or for a correct appreciation of the needs of the country. I have had opportunities of observing the same good qualities developing themselves in some of the younger men educated at this College, and I have no doubt that you and your staff will continue, in the future as in the past to turn out a constant stream of trustworthy Engineers. Your college has recently been described by the Secretary of State as an Institution with a large and illustrious history behind it' and you rightly observe that if it is to maintain its *past pre-eminence*, it must keep abreast of the time and that there must be a continuous advance and constant and expensive improvement." The deep significance of this second utterance, by a Lieutenant-Governor in India, will be forcibly realised when it is remembered that it was uttered when the agitation against the changes of 1908, was at its highest and after Indian College Engineers had utilised the previous utterance of Lord Macdonnell and had held it out to the Secretary of State as conclusive proof that Indian-trained recruits were not inferior to their English contemporaries. It is irresistably clear that Sir John Hewett would not have spoken in these unambiguous terms, thereby presenting the Alumni of the Indian Colleges with another lever upon which to work, had he not been inwardly conscious that Rurki College did in fact turn out men of marked ability.

(iii) There is yet another public admission establishing the fact that Rurki College has nothing to fear from a comparison with any similar Institution in Great Britain. The Honourable Mr. Goument, Secretary to the Government of the United Provinces in a speech at Rurki College on the 14th July 1910, stated:—"I think it may safely be said that this College is now in a position to impart an education, both theoretical and practical, up to a standard which compares very favourably with that of similar Institutions in Europe. The following extract from a note recently recorded *by an expert* in your Visitors' Book bears out this statement. 'I have visited nearly every College of importance in India, but among all of them Rurki College alone appears to me to attain to the standard of a first grade Engineering College, the organisation and equipment are admirable and the arrangements for imparting practical training in Mechanical and Civil Engineering are hardly equalled in any Institution in Great Britain'":

(*c*) it is claimed, therefore, and it is impossible to resist this claim that there is no difference between the professional education imparted in this Institution and that received by the average Engineer recruited in England. On the contrary, it is a fact in some cases that qualifications of Indian College Engineers are superior to those possessed by the latter, *e.g.*, where men who have only passed out of the Upper Subordinate Class at Rurki have proceeded to England and after undergoing a very meagre training for a short period in the elements of Engineering (at the Crystal Palace, for instance) have been appointed by the Secretary of State to the Imperial Service. These cases are well known both to the Government of India and to the Secretary of State;

(*d*) the Indian College Engineer also posseses the great and recognised advantage (on which great stress was laid when the institution of a Military Staff

College in India was advocated) of having received his training in the country in which he has to practice his profession;

(e) that the Public Works Department is purely a professional and scientific service and has no share in the political administration of the country and that therefore the restoration of the alumni of the Indian Colleges to their former position, while gratifying the legitimate claims and aspirations of the domiciled European and Indian communities, without impairing efficiency (for the already high standard of the Indian Colleges could, if necessary, be raised still further) and giving a much needed impetus to higher technical education to which so much attention is being rightly devoted, would in no degree imperil British supremacy; and

(*f*) lastly the present policy is one which needlessly and unjustly enforces a distinction between two classes which is strongly and increasingly resented, and is in fact opposed to the highest principles of liberal statesmanship which to use the words of the present Prime Minister in his memorable speech at Birmingham in September 1909, aims at "removing the domination of unjust monopoly and opening everywhere the gate to intelligence, to merit, and to energy."

RAI BAHADUR LALA BAIJ NATH called and examined.

71,710. (*The Chairman.*) The witness said there were 125 active members in his Association, all Provincial Engineers. They were all officers trained in Indian Colleges, and recruited to the Permanent Engineer Establishment of the Public Works and Railway Departments. The written statement contained a series of arguments in favour of the abolition of the present division into Imperial and Provincial Branches, and the creation of a superior service which would be recruited by open competition in England and India. It was suggested that in that Service officers should be employed under uniform conditions, as regards pay, leave and pensions, the argument being that officers at present in the two Services were employed on the same work.

71,711. The witness had had 16 years' experience in the Service, and had occupied the position of Executive Engineer in charge of important divisions since 1905. He had also served two years in Assam, the rest of his service being in the Punjab Irrigation, except for six months spent on the contruction works of the Delhi Durbar of 1903. The witness's recommendation that 50 per cent. of the superior Service should be recruited in India and 50 per cent. in England for the present was put forward with the view of making the change a gradual one. At present the recruitment in India was even less than 30 per cent. and this percentage included a certain number of promoted subordinates. His colleagues believed there was sufficient material available in India to raise the percentage to 50. The witness would not retain the present system under which 10 per cent. of the vacancies filled in England were reserved to Indians, but would have free and open competition for half the posts in both countries. When he said that 50 per cent. of the superior appointments should be recruited in India, he did not mean that 50 per cent. of the recruits should be Indians, but that 50 per cent. of the appointments should go to men trained in India, Europeans being allowed to come to India and compete.

71,712. The witness's Association condemned the present system of appointing two probationers for one guaranteed appointment, and suggested that the posts should be given to the top men on the list as used to be the practice. The witness would like to see the system, under which he was apprenticed, revived, namely, that a man, if he proved himself unsatisfactory by the end of his third year of work, could be discharged. Such a proposal would give Government a free hand to deal with a very bad bargain, and it would do away with the anomaly which at present existed, that a man first on the list should be rejected in favour of the tenth man.

71,713. He did not agree with the view put forward by some witnesses that for recruitment to the Imperial Service from India it was necessary to have one very highly equipped College, and that the recruits to the Imperial Service should be drawn exclusively from Thomason College at Rurki, whilst the other Colleges should provide training for the subordinate Service only. He preferred to keep up all four Colleges, and would apportion appointments to those four Colleges in the ratio of the strength of the cadre in each Province.

71,714. In reply to a question whether economy would result from the inauguration of one Central College in India, the witness said that in order to provide a satisfactory and sufficient training at one Central College, a large sum of money would have to be expended on further equipment, and that that amount could be spent more advantageously in improving the other Colleges, if any improvement was required.

71,715. With regard to the witness's proposal for an open competition he would prefer to have an open competition in which graduates from all four Colleges could be tested. He would allocate a certain number of vacancies to each College in proportion to the particular requirements of the Province. He agreed that that would be a modified form of competition.

71,716. With reference to the upper subordinate Service the witness said he would place no bar in the way of the best men being promoted to the superior service. He thought there were a number of men in the upper subordinate Service who were qualified to occupy superior posts. He agreed with the view expressed by other witnesses that the personnel of the upper subordinate Service stood in need of great improvement. One thing which would bring about that improvement, he thought, would be the raising of the status and pay.

71,717. The witness said he had no objection to Royal Engineer officers entering the Irrigation Branch of the Department, but he thought they should come in at their proper place, and in the early years of their service, so as not to cause any supersessions.

71,718. The witness suggested the creation, alongside the permanent pensionable service, of a permanent non-pensionable service, to deal with the Temporary Engineer problem. He could not evolve any scheme by which the 200 odd Temporary Engineers could be done away with all at once. For all practical purposes Temporary Engineers were permanent officers. He agreed that if Temporary Engineers were employed on permanent work and given different conditions from those of officers alongside of them who were holding similar charges, it might lead to grievances after 10 or 20 years, but the present condition of the Temporary Engineers was very bad, and their position very insecure.

71,719. He did not admit that the expenses of the Indian officer were less than those of the European officer, but even if it be assumed for the sake of argument that it was so, the witness would still contend that there should be no difference in the emoluments. He refuted the argument, which was so often advanced, that because an Indian spent less he should receive less. That was not the sole ground on which the Provincial Engineers said they should receive the same salary; they sought it on the principle of the same work the same pay.

71,720. With regard to the objection in the written statement to the designation of "Provincial," the witness objected to the term because it carried with it the present rate of Provincial pay. The sole cause of the discontent among Provincial officers on that point was that they were paid less than the Imperial officers. If Government hereafter laid down a rule that there should be a foreign allowance for Europeans serving in India as distinguished from the salary of the indigenous community, and applied it to all the Services, the witness considered the discontent might be less. He thought there would still

remain a certain amount of discontent if two men doing the same work received different emoluments.

71,721. With regard to the question, whether it would be recognised that imported labour had a different market value from indigenous labour, the witness said he thought that when imported labour was given higher wages than local labour, local labour resented it, and did not do the same willing work which it did previously. Another important point was that imported labour should have its wages compared to the labour of the particular place from which it was imported, and not to the wages of the place whereto it was imported.

71,722. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness said he had had experience of three or four England-trained men who had served under him as sub-divisional officers, and he could say from personal experience that they generally lacked in knowledge of Indian conditions. That was why he had advocated that in the open competition some Indian subjects should be introduced. He preferred a system of open competition to one of nomination or selection, as the latter might lead to favouritism and other evils.

71,723. With reference to his written statement as to the Government not being justified in creating a Provincial Service because of the Act of 1833, the witness said he meant that a Provincial Service officer was disqualified from holding the offices in the Public Works Department which he held before. A man who passed out of Rurki College went into the Imperial Engineering Service up to the year 1895. He admitted that no Provincial Service officer was theoretically disqualified from holding any office in the Public Works Department, but he considered it practically would come to that when the stage of Chief Engineer or Superintending Engineer would be reached on account of the very large difference in the pay.

71,724. (*Mr. Sly.*) The witness said that Civil Engineers recruited both from Coopers Hill and by the Secretary of State had served under him but he could not choose between the two.

71,725. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness said that he preferred the 50 per cent. to be recruited from England by competitive examination, as selection or nomination sometimes led to a man of inferior attainments getting into the Service and to a man of very superior attainments being rejected. He was not prepared to give any instances but he could mention the case of two Indian boys who had studied in England, one of whom had superior attainments but had been rejected, while a man of comparatively low attainments had been selected.

71,726. With reference to the scale of pay, the witness said the standard of pay for certain work was fixed and no man should be paid on a lower scale. Even if all the scientific and technical departments under Government were manned by none but Indians he would still consider the present pay to be insufficient. He did not feel justified in making any comparison between the pay of the Public Works Department and other Departments, as anything he could say on the subject would be mere surmise.

71,727. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The witness said he was aware that the Secretary of State was unable to nominate a candidate in England for the Public Works Department unless that candidate had satisfied certain preliminary intellectual tests, and those tests were comparatively high, but he did not think that was altogether sufficient to prevent a certain amount of patronage, though he did not say there was any abuse at present.

71,728. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness said the real grievances of the Provincial Service were two, first pay, and secondly the proportion of recruitment in India. When the last Public Service Commission sat the ratio of recruitment in India to that of recruitment in England was 30 to 70, and the Commission recommended that statutory Natives should be encouraged to enter the Department by a reduction of recruitment in England. The reverse, however, had taken place. The rate of recruitment for the last ten years to the Imperial Service, which was of course barred to the Indian-trained Engineer, was 40 a year, whereas only nine Engineers a year were appointed from Indian Colleges. Of late years the Department had expanded greatly and all the additional recruits had come from England. A larger recruitment in India would yield men who were quite as efficient, and he believed the Colleges in India were able to supply the men.

71,729. With reference to pay, the witness said he still maintained that a scale of pay which began at about £200 a year and might rise to £960 a year within a very reasonable period of time was not sufficient for an Engineer in the Public Works Department, because the Engineer officer had to maintain a certain official status. The witness said he had not compared the salaries with the salaries paid in England to men doing similar work and occupying the same status, but he was of opinion that the conditions were quite different in the two countries. If the wages in England for the same work were less, and it was possible to get the very best Engineers, he would still say that the need for high salaries in India was greater than the need for high salaries in England, having regard to the surrounding conditions, because the Indian Services are the best paid in the world.

71,730. (*Mr. Madge.*) With regard to the statement that many Indian trained Engineers possessed better qualifications than some officers recruited in England, the witness said he had had personal experience, but did not wish to quote instances. He had had European, Anglo-Indian, and Indian officers under him and there were not many instances he could quote, though there were some.

71,731. The witness was in favour of increasing the divisional charges not only to provide for men in the Service but also to provide for the expansion of the work. He himself had held a division for six years which he considered should have been divided into two, and he thought there was a number of similar divisions.

71,732. If any of the temporary Engineers were made permanent they could be only made so by adopting the same measures as had been previously adopted. Six or seven years ago a number of them were made permanent and placed on the list according to their relative length of service. That caused a great deal of discontent; but there seemed to be no other way. Some really deserving men had not been made permanent because of the supersessions which resulted and perhaps because the Government of India had ruled that no more men should be taken on the permanent list.

71,733. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The witness said he thought dissatisfaction began as soon as the men who first came in began to understand the conditions. At first it was more or less a case of hoping against hope. The Provincial Service began to be recruited in 1895 and the first Memorial to the Viceroy was sent up to 1902. There was a proviso in the Resolution creating the Service that after seven years the conditions would be reconsidered and the Service would be reorganised. From 1902 to 1906 no Memorial was sent up, because a reply to the 1902 Memorial was awaited, and to a Memorial of 1906 to the Secretary of State no reply was received till after the reorganisation of 1908 and then came the resultant discontent. The 1892 Resolution creating the Service said, in distinct terms, that there would be no distinction except in leave, pension, or pay. There were only 165 Provincial Engineers in the whole of India, including Railways, and he knew the opinion of practically every one of them, and could assert that they were all dissatisfied with the distinction of pay where there was no distinction in work. He himself had taken over the charge of a Division and held it for six years, former incumbents of which had nearly all risen to be Chief Engineers and one of whom was now Secretary to the Government of India.

71,734. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The witness said he was not of opinion that the remuneration of work could be conditioned solely by the nature of the work

done without considering all the circumstances and conditions under which the work was done. The principle he would apply is that the inducement offered to the recruit should be compared with the emoluments in the place from which he was recruited, and not with the emoluments obtaining in the place for which he was recruited. Paying the Indian recruited Engineer the same rate of pay in no way affected recruitment in England. The dissatisfaction was not due to the fact that Indians recruited in England were paid on the same scale as Europeans. An Indian entering the Finance Department in India received the same pay as an officer who came from Great Britain. It was impossible to expect good work from a man who was discontented with his pay and who was looked down upon by his subordinates. He had had under him an assistant getting 50 per cent. more pay than himself. He did not compare the India-recruited men with the Indian recruited in England but with the Service as a whole.

71,735. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) If the conditions in the Public Works Department were applied to other Services, the witness thought the other Services would be similarly discontented. The Services that had no distinction in pay were the Traffic Department of the Railways, which was recruited in India as well as in England, the Finance Department, the Posts and Telegraphs, and the Opium. It was true there was a distinction in pay between the Indian Civil Service, and the Provincial Civil Service, but there was also a distinction in work. A man who gained a listed post had been doing inferior work during his whole service and therefore when he reached the listed post he was quite glad. He thought it was an impracticable thing to pay the Indian recruited man at a different rate from the English recruited man and the difficulty would continue, unless a method could be devised whereby all men in the Department obtained what Imperial men already had, and a new Department was created at a lower scale of pay and given less important work; but he did not think that a scheme of this kind came within the limits of practical politics. Any attempt to lower the pay of the Department in future, even though guarding the rights of the men already in the Department, would tend to lower the standard of work and of efficiency. He believed the Government saved about Rs. 50,000 a month on the pay of Provincial Engineers, who if contented would probably save the Government that amount many times over by doing more willing and therefore better work. The case of the officers recruited in India was so strong that nothing except the raising of pay would remove the grievance. Any differential rate in the higher services, even if made generally applicable to all the Departments in India, would cause great dissatisfaction in the Services all over India, and such dissatisfaction would result in uneconomical work, especially in his own Department, which had the spending of large sums of money in its hand and was a large earning Department. In his own division the Revenue earned was about 15 lakhs of rupees a year.

(The witness withdrew.)

LALA RADHIKA NARAYAN, Executive Engineer (Irrigation), Punjab.

*Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.**

71,736. **(I.) Methods of recruitment.**—Under this head the following points deserve special consideration.

(1) The percentage of recruitment from the Indian Engineering Colleges as compared with that made in England is altogether inadequate, as appears from the following facts and considerations:—

(*a*) At the time of the last Public Service Commission of 1886-87, the Government of India in their Resolution No. $\frac{34}{1573-83}$ dated 4-10-86 declared the object of the appointment of that Commission to be "to devise a scheme which may reasonably be hoped .....to do full justice to the claims of Natives of India to higher and more extensive employment in the Public Service." But the actual result in case of the Public Works Department has been that the percentage of recruitment from the Indian Colleges has decreased from 30† as it was in 1886 to less than 24† as it at present. This retrogade progress made during the last 27 years clearly shows that so far at least as this particular Department is concerned, the above quoted object of the Government of India was not only not fulfilled but it was actually reversed in practice.

(*b*) The Public Service Commission of 1886-87 in formulating their recommendations expressed an opinion that the strength of the Imperial Branch should not be greater than was necessary for purposes of control and direction, and for the execution and repair of works calling for high engineering skill; and that the recruitment from the Coopers Hill Royal Engineering College which appeared excessive at that time, should be regulated accordingly. Now the recruitment from this particular College at that time was 50 per cent. of the whole, the remaining 50 per cent. being composed as follows:—20 per cent. Royal Engineers, and 30 per cent. Indian College Engineers.

If this recommendation of the commission had been acted upon, the recruitment of Civil Engineers in England should have been to-day considerably less than 50 per cent., and that of the Indian College Engineers a good deal more than 30 per cent. Moreover the substantial reduction made in the number of the Royal Engineers transferred to the Public Works Department now-a-days, should have all gone to increase the number of the Indian College Engineers the number of Cooper's Hill men being already excessive. But what has actually happened is exactly the reverse of this. The recruitment of Civil Engineers in England has increased from 50 per cent. to more than 75 per cent., and that of the Indian College Engineers has decreased from 30 per cent. to less than 24 per cent. This means a complete subversion of the recommendation of the last Commission in this connection.

(*c*) The Indian Colleges of Engineering, notably the Rurki College, have during the last quarter of a century or more, made a remarkable and all round progress in improving and bringing up to date their courses of study and their method of training young students in the theory and practice of Civil Engineering. This progress has been so very marked on all sides that the Indian Colleges are now in a position to claim, in the words used in the syllabus of the Rurki College for 1913 that they were able to turn out "Civil Engineers of as high a grade as a College training can produce." In addition to this in these Colleges special attention is naturally paid to "the local conditions of India." The text books give examples with descriptions and other details of the great Engineering works in India, and the whole course of teaching and instruction is designed to make the student familiar with the characteristic features of Indian Engineering. Moreover the Engineers trained in India know and understand the people of the country with whom they have to deal and among whom they have to work much better than the foreigners. Thus it follows that the Indian College Engineers ought to be better fitted for employment in the Public Works Department of this country than those recruited in England, and therefore the percentage of their recruitment should have increased with the increase in the number of qualified Engineers out-

* Mr. Radhika Narayan represented the Engineers' Association, Lahore.

† In arriving at these percentages the number of Upper Subordinates (4 and 5 in alternate years) promoted to the Engineer's grade has not been taken into account. First because this is not recruitment but special promotion in recognition of conspicuously meritorious services rendered by selected subordinates of long standing. Secondly because as a general rule a promoted upper subordinate will rarely, if at all, aspire after rising to a grade higher than that of the Assistant Engineer. Hence this case is altogether different from that of those who are in the very first instance recruited for the Engineer grade. Thirdly because the system of promoting upper subordinates to the grade of Assistant Engineers being of recent origin had not been in vogue in 1886, and for several years after that. Therefore for a correct comparison between the existing state of things with that of 1886 it is necessary to leave them (the promoted upper subordinates) out.

turned from the Indian Engineering Colleges. But actually this has not been the case at all. The percentage of recruitment in India has practically stood where it was in 1886, during the last 27 years, although the number of qualified Engineers outturned by the Rurki College alone has increased by 150 per cent. during the same period.

(*d*) The Cooper's Hill College was abolished in 1907-08, and since then recruitment in England has been made by a Selection Committee from amongst the qualified Civil Engineers outturned by the various Engineering Colleges there. This selection is not based on any competitive examination, and it has been found that several Engineering students who failed to pass the examinations of the Rurki, and in one case of the Poona Engineering College, went to England and after going through a short course of study there, came out successful as Imperial Engineers duly selected by the Secretary of State's Committee of Selection. This clearly shows that the Engineers recruited in England are by no means superior to those recruited in India. Moreover the Government has not been since the abolition of the Cooper's Hill College under any obligation to necessarily recruit any particular percentage of Engineers in England. It was, therefore, naturally expected that the recruitment in India would be substantially increased after the abolition of the Cooper's Hill College. But instead of any such increase a resolution (No. 675-694 E) was issued by the Government of India on the 24th April, 1908, which rendered the prospects of the Indian College Engineers very discouraging and humiliating.

In the light of the above facts and considerations it is, I believe, not too much to say that a very retrograde policy has been followed, up to this time, in the matter of recruiting Indian College Engineers for employment in the Public Works Department of this country, and therefore it can not be too strongly urged that at the present stage the recruitment in India should be increased to 66 per cent. of the total recruitment.

(2) As regards recruitment in England, the present system of appointment by selection is by no means satisfactory. The well recognized method of selection by competition is the best yet devised by man, and there seems to be no reason why it should be abandoned in case of recruitment in England. Another reason why a competitive examination is needed in this case is that the Engineering Colleges of Great Britain can not be expected to train their students specially for Indian Engineering. Therefore the selected passed students of these Colleges are likely to prove deficient in those things which are peculiar to India, and these deficiences can best be removed by selecting the candidates on the basis of a judicious competitive examination in the special features of Indian Engineering and one Indian language. This latter point might be considered by some to be unimportant as the deficiency pointed out above might be considered capable of removal after a short residence in India. But really this view is incorrect, being based on ignorance due to the holders of this view not being in real touch with the Indian people. In fact the deficiency pointed out above is a serious one and is likely to considerably reduce the usefulness of a young Engineer for the first few years of his service.

(3) The next point to be noted in connection with the recruitment of Engineers in England is that no more than 10 per cent. of them can according to the rule in force be Indians. This distinction, based as it is on the race, creed or colour of the candidate, is, I believe, altogether unnecessary and inadvisable. I think it is a wrong policy to accentuate race prejudices by making invidious distinctions of this or any other kind. Both in England and India the door of competition should be equally open to the Indians as well as to the Britishers. No such distinction is made for Indians in case of the Civil Service competition, what is its necessity then in case of Engineers recruited in England? If this necessity lies in the fact that none but the Statutory native of India can compete in the Indian Engineering Colleges, let this restriction also be removed at the same time. There was a time when educated Indians needed special concessions and facilities for taking up the profession of Engineering. Happily that time has long passed away, and the educated Indians are now quite competent to hold their own in a fair competition with all comers. It is indeed in the best interests of the country that the most capable men available should be employed in its public service. If again this necessity is felt on account of an apprehension that Indians, if allowed free access through all doors would swamp the Public Works Department, the following facts and figures taken from a calendar of the Rurki College ought to remove this unfounded apprehension. In the year 1886, five students out of 9 who passed the final examination of the Civil Engineer class were Indians and three of them occupied the first three places. This shows that Indians had by this time begun to take up the Engineering profession in earnest. The Sub-Committee of the last Public Service Commission which was appointed for the Public Works Department had also arrived at this conclusion. Now during the period of nine years that elapsed between 1886 and 1895, the latter being the year in which the provincial service scheme was brought into operation in this Department, both Indians and Europeans joined the Rurki College freely. This was, therefore, a time of fair competition between the two communities, and had Indians been able to greatly outnumber Europeans, this was the period in which they ought to have done so. But in point of fact out of a total number of 101 students who passed out of the Civil Engineer class of the Rurki College during this period, only 40 were Indians and 61 Europeans. When such was the case here in India where the Indian students possessed every facility for fairly competing with their fellow European students, what reasonable apprehension could there possibly be of their swamping the Department if they were allowed to compete on equal terms with the Europeans in far off England.

(4.) As regards recruitment from Indian Colleges the points which deserve consideration are as below:—

(*a*) The new system of sending out two apprentices for every vacancy and selecting only one of the two after a trial of one year for filling that vacancy has been found by experience to be objectionable and unsatisfactory. This system was introduced and enforced in case of the Rurki College only a few years ago. In no other Indian Engineering College this system is in force, and the Rurki College itself had done very well without it for more than 50 years. Therefore the sooner this new system is abolished and the old one restored the better.

(*b*) Prior to 1896 the age limit fixed for entering the Rurki College was 22 years, and no special educational qualifications were required. But in 1896 when the period of training in the Civil Engineer class was extended from two to three years, the age limit was reduced to 21 years; and soon after this came the rule that no *Indian* candidates could be admitted who had not passed the B.A. examination. Now the minimum age limit for passing the Matriculation Examination of the Punjab University is fixed at 15 years, and at least four years are required after this, to pass the B.A. or B.Sc examination. So that even if a student passed the Matriculation examination at the right time, viz., when his age was between 15 and 16, and the B.A. or B.Sc. examination four years later his age by that time would be between 19 and 20. Then he must wait another year before he could go up for the Rurki examination, because the B.A. results are not declared till after this examination is over. In this way he gets only one chance for appearing in and passing the Rurki examination. On the other hand in case of European students desirous of joining the Rurki College the only educational qualification required is the School final or the Matriculation examination of some English school. So that these students can get several chances for appearing in the Rurki entrance examination before they attain the age of 21. In this respect, therefore, the Indian students labour under a great disability; and it is very necessary that this disability which becomes a real hardship in many cases be removed. The easist way to do so would be to lower the educational qualification from B.A. or B.Sc. to F.A. or F.Sc. examination. This was the test prior to 1898 and the undergraduate students who passed out of the

Rurki College before this year have proved to be quite as successful and competent as the graduates who passed before or after 1898.

(c) At present the recruitment of Engineers from the four Indian Engineering Colleges is very unequal. The Rurki College which is the oldest Engineering College in India is the most favoured of all. Engineers trained in this College enjoy the lion's share in recruitment, as 5 or 6 guarantees out of a total of 9 or 10 are reserved for this College in alternate years. The remaining four being distributed among the other three Colleges. If this unequal distribution of the guaranteed appointments among the several Indian Engineering Colleges is due to the fact that the Rurki College is the most advanced and up-to-date of them all, justice requires that these other Colleges should also be brought up to the same standard of efficiency as the Rurki College. Anyhow, this circumstance which is beyond the control of the students entering these Colleges, should not be considered sufficient to deprive them of their proper share of the appointments in the public service of their country. It is therefore recommended that while increasing the percentage of recruitment from the Indian Colleges, the guaranteed posts be divided among them proportionately to their respective shares.

(5.) In addition to the two permanent services whose recruitment has been criticized and commented upon above, there is the Temporary Service which came into existence about the year 1890, and went on increasing in magnitude from year to year, so that at present its strength in India is not less than 165 men which is almost equal to the total number of Provincial Engineers. Of these 165 Temporary Engineers the largest number, 63, belongs to the Punjab, and of these no less than 57 belong to the Irrigation Branch of the Public Works Department, and of these latter no less than 34 have rendered services ranging from five to twenty years. All this clearly shows that these temporary engineers are not and have never been temporary in the proper sense of the word. In fact in actual practice they have been doing the same or similar work side by side with the permanent Engineers. They have held charges of subdivisions and divisions continuously for years, exactly in the same way as the permanent Engineers have done, and the same kind of work and responsibility has been expected from them as from the permanent Engineers. And yet we find that the modes of recruitment of the two services have been entirely different. The power of recruiting the Temporary Engineers has hitherto rested entirely with the Local Government which practically means with the Chief Engineer; and since no definite and clear rules were ever framed for the regulation of this peculiar kind of recruitment, all sorts of anomalies are to be found in it. Persons possessing engineering qualifications of various degrees and kinds, and even persons possessing no engineering qualifications at all at the time of recruitment, have found their way in the Department as Temporary Engineers. This state of things is evidently unsatisfactory. It is, therefore, recommended that either the recruitment of Temporary Engineers be stopped altogether; or if it be found impracticable to do so, it should be placed on some regular and systematic basis. The following suggestions are made in this connection:—

(a) Temporary Engineers should always be recruited from amongst the trained and qualified Engineers or students of some recognized Engineering College. As the number of qualified students coming out of an Engineering College must always be considerably in excess of the students who secure guaranteed appointments, such certificated students or qualified engineers can always be had for employment as temporary engineers. Hence there seems to be no justification at all for employing unqualified persons in this capacity. No one would ever think of employing an uncertificated man as a permanent Engineer. Why then should there be any relaxation of this essential principle in the case of Temporary Engineers, who are always required to perform the same kind of work and to bear the same responsibilities as the permanent Engineers.

(b) The Temporary Engineers should always be employed for some specific work and for some specified period of time not exceeding three years. There seems to be no justification for doing otherwise. A temporary Engineer should not only be temporary in the matter of his pay, prospects and conditions of service, but in actual practice also. We ought to adhere much more to the spirit than to the wording of the regulations on this subject. The spirit of the articles 77, 79 and 80 of the Civil Service Regulations is distinctly against the continuous employment of temporary Engineers for indefinite periods of time, as temporary Engineers.

(c) If the Government finds it in the best interest of the Public Service not to dispense with the services of any temporary engineer after the particular period of time for which he was employed is over, he should be made permanent; and his name placed at the bottom of the list of permanent Engineers already in service, along with the new permanent Engineers recruited during the year from other sources. In fact these temporary Engineers should be recognized as one of the legitimate sources of recruitment for permanent Engineers, and a certain suitable percentage of the total recruitment should be assigned to this source. It often happens that an otherwise capable student fails to distinguish himself in his College career on account of some chance circumstance or of some minor defect or short-coming which could be easily removed or counterbalanced by experience and knowledge of the world. It is clearly very hard for such men to be barred for ever from a permanent place in the public service for such trifling and unimportant disqualifications as the above. In fact a number of temporary Engineers have been made permanent in the past, and the experiment succeeded on the whole. In addition to this, it is not just and fair that the Government should go on retaining the services of the temporary Engineers from year to year for deriving the full benefit of their experience and ability so long as it stands in need of it, and that it should turn them out at a month's notice when their services are no longer required. Such a one-sided system of dealing with this important body of public servants is not only bad for the temporary engineers but is also indirectly harmful to the best interests of the Government. Hence the necessity of making the temporary Engineers permanent, under the circumstances mentioned above.

71,737. **(II.) System of training and probation.**—The following points deserve special consideration under this head:—

(1) Sufficient attention is not, in my opinion, being paid at present to the training of the young engineers whether recruited in England or in India. Those recruited in England do not pass through any probationary period at all for training, after their arrival in India, although they stand in much greater need of practical training than the Indian College Engineers; while those who are recruited in India do not get such training as they ought to get during their one year's period of probation. Sometimes it happens that the young engineers are placed for training under Executive Engineers who have no inclination or time for attending to this difficult piece of work properly. At other times, the conditions under which the young engineers are placed are not the most suited for giving them a good and adequate training. Moreover no definite arrangements exist at present for enabling the probationers to get a thorough grounding in the various kinds of practical work which they would soon be required to do and look after in the proper discharge of their duties as engineers. The result of all this is that the first few years of service of an engineer are not spent as usefully as they ought to be spent, and experience which could be acquired very easily under proper guidance is afterwards gained slowly and after making many unnecessary mistakes. Moreover many erroneous ideas and conceptions about men and things are formed and perpetuated merely through ignorance and want of experience. This is naturally much more the case with the engineers recruited in England than with Indian College Engineers, because the former labour under the great disadvantage of not knowing the language and the people of this country. For remedying this unsatisfactory state of things it is suggested that the

training of all the young Engineers (recruited from whatever source) should be placed on a regular and systematic basis, and that the period of training should be sufficiently long.

(2.) It is further suggested that so far as possible European Engineers should be placed for training under some specially selected experienced and capable Indian Executive Engineer, whilst the Indian Engineers should be placed under some similarly selected European Executive Engineer. This suggestion is quite natural. It provides for the best means of removing and rectifying the characteristic shortcomings and defects of both the Indian and European recruits and is calculated to produce the best results through a combination of the virtues and excellencies of both the races. Moreover this arrangement would be very suitable for enabling the young European engineer to learn the language and to become familiar with the people much more easily than otherwise.

(3.) Lastly too much stress can not be laid on the necessity of making the young engineer learn to sympathise with and know the people among whom he has to live and work, and to be in real touch with them. This is an essential qualification for all Government servants, and it is especially so for the engineer, who is required in the proper performance of his duties, not only to deal efficiently with the forces and materials of nature, but also to negotiate successfully with the various kinds and classes of people with whom he comes in contact. In no other civilized country of this world a public servant can be expected to administer the people under him efficiently and successfully without knowing all about their habits, manners, customs, wants and grievances &c. But here in India there is a tendency to consider this important qualification of a public servant of a minor or secondary importance. This is obviously a mistake. It is, therefore, recommended that the Executive Engineers selected for training the probationers placed under them should be such as are able to inspire the young engineers with a spirit of true and abiding sympathy with the people, and to remove from their minds such prejudices, false notions and antipathies as are generally formed by young and inexperienced engineers (especially Europeans) on the basis of mere hearsay or the garbled versions of interested parties.

(4.) It is a matter of daily experience that unless an officer takes very great care, and tries to find out the truth for himself, he is very much liable to form altogether erroneous ideas and come to very wrong conclusions in judging his subordinates and other people, and in arriving at decisions for and against them. Raw young men in particular, are especially apt to jump to hasty conclusions and to act on the impulse of the moment, and if they are allowed to go on unchecked in this wrong course, the tendency for doing such ill-considered things increases, and the habits and temper of the young Engineer are altogether spoilt. Hence it is of the very first importance that the young recruits should get from the Executive Engineer selected for their training a very sound lesson about this important matter in the very beginning of their career. The account given by Mr. Fielding Hall in his article on "Competition-wallah" in the Fortnightly Review for February, 1913, of a young Civilian and his perverted notions about the Burmans is a case in point, as it very correctly represents the state of things prevailing in the Public Works Department, Punjab. The existence of this evil is fully recognized by the Indian Engineers who are in touch with the people; but most of the European Engineers seem to be unconscious about it probably on account of their necessarily circumscribed vision and more or less one-sided view of things. In any case there can be no doubt that it is of very great importance to provide against the formation and perpetuation of wrong notions of any kind about the people in the minds of the young Engineers, and the best way of ensuring this is to give them a very correct and sound training in this important matter also during their period of probation.

(5.) Another matter in connection with which necessity for sound training in the very beginning of an Engineer's career is essential, is the method of dealing with his subordinates and office establishment both clerical and menial. Owing to various causes and chiefly due to the general-ignorance of the European Engineer of the language of the people and of many other things connected with them a certain class of subordinates has arisen who, being led by the strong attraction of greed of money and power, have taken to the ignoble vocation of systematically imposing upon and deceiving their more or less ignorant and in many case young and inexperienced officers about a good many official matters. This class consists of a body of unscrupulous, designing and clever men who have by long practice become quite expert in their illegal trade, and it is a matter of common knowledge among the Indian people that unless the Engineer in charge of a Subdivision or Division is particularly wide awake and both capable of and willing to look into matters and to find out the truth for himself, any one who wants a grievance redressed or a request granted must needs go to members of this disreputable community and propitiate them as best he can, before he can hope to gain his object. The men of this class are thus not only a great hindrance in the way of dispensing equitable justice to all both high and low, rich and poor, strong and weak; but are also responsible for having contributed very largely towards lowering the reputation of educated Indians in the eyes of their European superiors who are in many cases unable to distinguish the grain from the chaff, and judge all educated Indians indiscriminately from their experience of a few. It is, therefore, of the utmost importance that the young Engineer should be warned against the machinations of this mischievous body of men and be practically trained to distinguish such men from others and to deal with them properly.

71,738. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—(1.) On the basis of the one-sided evidence of many European witnesses the last Public Service Commission of 1886–87 came to the following conclusions bearing upon the conditions of service of the Engineer establishment of the Public Works Department:—"Some of the operations of that (the Public Works) Department require the highest Engineering skill and training obtainable in England, and for the control and direction of a great Department, the annual expenditure of which is reckoned by millions, qualifications are wanted which are not at present readily attainable in this country. On the other hand much of the work falls to the Engineering establishment is such as may be and is performed efficiently by officers who have received their professional education in India . . . Men recruited in India, once in the Department, are paid at the rates considered necessary for men who have received a superior general and professional education in England, and these last find themselves for many years condemned to labour on works within the capacity of men of an inferior standard of education. . . . The evidence before the commission leaves no ground for doubting that the officers recruited in England receive at Woolwich, Chatham, and Cooper's Hill a professional education of a higher kind than that which the best Indian Engineering Colleges are capable of affording, and that their general training and education are superior to any attainable in India, but it is abundantly evident that at least one of the Indian Engineering Colleges can, and does impart such a professional education as is fully adequate for the ordinary work of the Department, and that these Colleges can be made still more efficient for this purpose."

(2.) The views expressed by the Commission in the above quotations clearly show that the reason why the conditions of service and salary &c. were recommended to be different for the Indian College Engineers on the one hand, and the Engineers recruited in England on the other, was that the latter were regarded by the Commission to be decidedly superior to the former in merit and Engineering qualifications. There is no other reason given for this differentiation anywhere in the report of the Commission except of course the general one of analogy with the Provincial service of the Civil Department. This is an important point to note. Now on the basis of the recommendations made by the last Public Ser-

vice Commission the Provincial Engineer service of 1892 was instituted and in Resolution No. 2112 C., dated 19/7/1892, of the Government of India introducing this new service for the first time it is clearly laid down that excepting conditions of pay, leave, and pension, " in all other respects there shall be no distinction between the members of this service, and those of the Imperial Service." This means that although the Government of India adopted the recommendation of the Commission regarding reduction in pay of the Provincial Engineers, who were all to be recruited in India, it took no action on the suggestion of differentiating between the work and responsibilities of the two classes of Engineers, the Imperial and the Provincial, in spite of the fact that the only reason explicitly given by the Commission for reduction in pay was this said differentiation. This was a clear anomaly and it was duly pointed out by the Provincial Engineers in the memorials which they submitted after the trial period of seven years of this new experiment was over. Since reduction made in pay was on the face of it unwarranted, the protests of the Provincial Engineers against it were naturally persistent and emphatic. To begin with little or no attention was paid to the memorials of protest for several years. Then in 1908 a clever scheme was devised seemingly at least with a view to hoodwink the Provincial Engineers. The rate of pay was increased fairly substantially but at the same time the status of the Provincial Engineers was considerably lowered, and in doing this an attempt was apparently made to introduce that differentiaion in the work and responsibilities of the two classes of Engineers which was left out altogether in the reorganisation scheme of 1892. According to this new organisation scheme of 1908 which was enunciated in Resolution No. 675-694 F., dated 24/4/1908, of the Government of India the lists of the Imperial and Provincial Engineers were separated, and the conditions of service of the two services were arranged in such a way as to keep the Provincial Engineers almost always subordinate to the Imperial Engineers. However this new clever scheme did not succeed at all. By far the greater majority of the Provincial Engineers did not accept these new conditions of service in preference to the old ones in spite of the substantial increase in pay, and their protest against the Provincial service itself became much stronger than before. The agitation raised by the Provincial Engineers against the reorganisation scheme of 1908 in particular and the whole Provincial Engineer scheme in general grew stronger and stronger every day, till at last the Government of India recognized the justness of their complaints to a certain extent at least and issued a resolution No. 439-458 E., on the 15th May, 1912, according to which the increase in pay provided in the resolution of 1908 was allowed to stand and at the same time the invidious distinctions introduced in that year in the conditions of service of the Provincial Engineers were all removed, so that at present the conditions of service of both the Imperial and the Provincial Engineers are the same, but differentiation is made in the rates of pay and allowances and in the leave and pension rules. Although this partial concession to the just claims of the Provincial Engineers has been entirely in the right direction, yet since by making the conditions of service the same for both the classes of Engineers it is virtually admitted that both the Imperial and Provincial Engineers are of equal merit and qualifications, the only definite ground on the basis of which a reduction in the pay of the Provincial Engineers was recommended by the last Public Service Commission is entirely taken away, and the present differentiation in pay between the two classes of Engineers remains without any justification at all. This is an anomaly which should, in my opinion, be removed as soon as possible.

(3.) As regards the conditions of service of the Temporary Engineers, they are, in my opinion, very unsatisfactory. As explained in paragraph 71,736 (5) above most of the Temporary Engineers at present in service are, in so far as their work and responsibilities are concerned, virtually in the same position as the Permanent Engineers, but their conditions of service are altogether different. Although many of them have been in service continuously for the last five, ten, fifteen, or even more than fifteen years, yet their appointment is sanctioned only for one year at a time. Thus their services are liable to terminate at any time when the usual yearly sanction is either not applied for or not given. Moreover their services might be dispensed with at any time at a month's notice. During the last three years the services of no less than six Indian Temporary Engineers have been dispensed with whose services extended from 8 years to 16 years, of these at least three Temporary Engineers had rendered continuous approved service and had had generally obtained good recommendations from their Engineers. These are cases of real hardship, and there seems to be no moral justification at all for treating this important body of public servants in such an arbitary and unfair way. It is in my opinion not at all right for the Government to apply the rules which are intended solely for purely temporary service to the present body of Temporary Engineers, who are temporary only in name. Great moral injustice has already been done to a good many temporary engineers whose services have been dispensed with in the past merely on the ground that at the time of appointment they were clearly made to understand that their services were liable to be dispensed with at any time it was considered necessary or advisable to do so, without paying any regard to the length of their service or to the quality and quantity of the work done by them. It is time now that something should be done for preventing the recurrence of similar injustice in future. Since the temporary Engineers are required to do the same work and to bear the same responsibilities as the permanent Engineers, and many of them have rendered not only approved but distinctly meritorious services, there seems to be no good reason why all those who have proved themselves to be as good Engineers as the permanent men be not brought on to the permanent service. I would therefore recommend that a yearly selection be made from amongst the temporary engineers now in service for being made permanent as if this service were one of the regular sources of recruitment for the Engineers, and their position on the list should be fixed just in the same way as was done on the last two occasions when a number of temporary engineers were brought on to the permanent list. It is no doubt true that the permanent Engineers regard it as a grievance that a temporary engineer when made permanent should be placed above their heads and there can be no manner of doubt that this grievance is quite a reasonable one. But this is a case in which the Government must chose between two evils, and in my opinion the injustice done to the temporary Engineers of fairly long standing and approved service by keeping them under the existing unsatisfactory conditions of service is much greater than that done to the permanent Engineers by putting above them in the list capable and experienced temporary Engineers, who are senior to them both in service and years, when they are made permanent.

71,739. **(IV.) Condition of salary.**—The scale of salaries as revised in the reorganization scheme of 1908 is quite adequate and satisfactory for the Imperial Engineers, but the one provided for the Provincial service is unsatisfactory, first because it has been actually felt by the Provincial Engineers now in service that their present salaries are not commensurate with the arduousness of their duties and the magnitude of their responsibilities. Secondly because the Provincial Engineers can not but feel dissatisfied and discontented when they find that the Imperial Engineers who do exactly the same kind of work as they do were drawing one and a half times as much pay as they were doing. Same work same pay is a principle which holds good everywhere. Hence any infringement of this principle is felt keenly by the party concerned.

71,740. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—Hitherto two sets of rules have been in force in the Public Works Department, the Indian service leave rules and the European service leave rules. The latter are much more favourable and liberal than the former. This differentiation has apparently been made on the understanding that Europeans stand in need of leave much more frequently and for a longer period of time

than the Indians. But it does not appear to be a good principle to make distinctions of this kind on the basis of race or creed. Moreover the conditions have all changed now and the requirements of Indians have increased a good deal. Hence it is recommended that the leave rules should now be made the same for all the Engineers in the Public Works Department whether recruited in England or in India. It might be taken for granted that no one would care to take more leave than he actually wants either for his health or for urgent private affairs. Even at present there are people who do not avail of all the leave that is due to them. Hence a liberal provision of leave in the leave rules, for all Engineers is not likely to be in any way disadvantageous to the Government.

71,741. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—The present scale of pensions is certainly inadequate both for the Imperial and the Provincial Engineer services. It should therefore be made more liberal and should be kept the same for all Engineers whether recruited in England or in India. Similarly the other conditions of pension should be the same for all Engineers irrespective of race, creed or colour. Europeans in the Imperial service have been hitherto able to retire after rendering service for 15 years. The same rule should be made applicable to all Engineers.

71,742. **(VIIa) Limitations in the employment of Non-Europeans.**—(1) There ought to be no limitations at all in the employment of non-Europeans (viz., Indians both pure and Statutary) in the Public Works Department. Even the last Public Service Commission of 1886-7 had recognized the principle that "all His Majesty's subjects should receive equal treatment and that 'all invidious distinctions of class or race' should be removed." Hence the real reason why this commission recommended the introduction of a Provincial Engineers Service appears to be the fact that the report of the Sub-Committee appointed to deal with the Public Works Department was distinctly unfavourable about the capacity and aptitude for higher Engineering of the Indians in particular and the Indian College Engineers in general. In this connection the following passages occur in the report of the Sub-Committee:—"...The professional education received there (at Cooper's Hill) is superior to any obtainable in India, the professors being more able and more numerous, the range of study wider and the opportunity for seeing the execution of large Engineering works much greater. . . . The general education of Cooper's Hill men is superior to that of Indian students, and this, as well as their English training gives them greater aptitude for applying their professional theoretical knowledge. Against this it is allowed that for the first three or four years of service Europeans or Eurasian students from Indian Colleges possess a decided advantage over Cooper's Hill men by reason of their knowledge of Indian languages and greater familiarity with the habits of the people, and acquaintance with the resources of the country. It is also stated that they are more amenable to discipline than the younger men who come out from Cooper's Hill." As to Native Engineers, while it is allowed that there are some brilliant execeptions, it is asserted by many witnesses that they are inferior to Europeans in force of character and capacity for dealing with men, that they shrink from responsibility, and are not to be depended on in emergencies calling for presence of mind and resource, and that they are less active, physically and mentally, defects which increase as they advance in years. Their dislike to service far from their home . . . renders them less useful. The aptitude of educated natives for Mechanical Engineering and what may be called higher Engineering is said to be small, and while often very good executive officers on works requiring only the imitative faculty they fail in originality and invention."

(2) This is indeed a heavy indictment and is divided under two heads (1) Against the Indian College Engineers taken as a whole, and (2) Against the Indian Engineers. It is based on the evidence of 52 witnesses of which 21 were Indians and 41 Europeans. It appears, however, that no notice whatever was taken of what the Indian witnesses said in their evidence. They were no doubt in the minority, but this was not their fault. There are always two sides of every question, and if we ignore one side altogether on the ground that it is represented only by a minority we can never come to a correct solution of the question. The evidence given by the Indians (mostly Engineers) before the last Public Service Commission might be summarised as below:—

(*a*) Although the profession of Engineering was a very good training field for the Indians and the object of their ambition, yet they could not afford to study for it, because the guaranteed appointments were so very limited, especially in the Sibpur, Poona, and Madras Colleges, and there was no demand yet for Civil Engineers outside Government Service.

(*b*) The establishment of the Cooper's Hill College was an altogether unnecessary burden on the finances of India and was wholly unjustifiable in veiw of the fact that so many Engineers turned out every year from the Indian Engineering Colleges were left unprovided for and had either to accept inferior posts or turn to other walks of life after wasting a good deal of their valuable time in the pursuit of Engineering.

(*c*) The Indian Engineering Colleges turned out men competent to undertake any work in this country. The courses of instruction in these colleges were sufficient for the requirements of the Department, and the training given both theoretical and practical was not inferior to that given at Cooper's Hill. So far as technical knowledge went, there was no difference between Engineers educated in India and England.

(*d*) Civil Engineers trained in India procured the execution of work by the influence they exercised over the labouring class, whereas those recruited in England, get the work done (equally well no doubt so far as technical knowledge went) but more by compulsion than influence. The reason why Indian Engineers sometimes do not do so well as the Europeans on larger works is that sufficient scope is not given to them.

(*e*) Energy in carrying out works depended on the individual. Indians could undergo greater fatigue and could knock about a good deal more than Europeans, while they showed the same energy in pushing on work. Eurasians and domiciled Europeans could not endure so much hardship as Indians.

(*f*) The Indians had only lately begun to appreciate the Engineering profession.

(*g*) The Indian Engineers were better than Europeans for checking scamping of work and fraud on the part of contractors, while in the efficiency of the work done by the two there was not much difference.

(*h*) The Indian Engineers can work more economically than the Europeans on account of their superior knowledge of the country, people, language, and the resources and labour capacity of the district in which they were employed.

(*i*) The Cooper's Hill Engineers after being in the country for 4 or 5 years looked rather inexperienced, and were put in charge of Sub-divisions too early. They were seldom found to be well-versed in vernaculars, while a good command of the vernacular language was essential for efficiency in work. They generally kept the Indians at a distance.

It is a remarkable fact that the statements of these Indian witnesses as summarised above with but slight modifications hold true even to-day, viz., after the lapse of more than a quarter of a century. On the other hand the statements made by the European witnesses before the last Commission can be easily shown to be for the most part imaginary and inaccurate at the present time at any rate. Thus it was all the more necessary that the almost unanimous evidence of the Indian witnesses about the points noted in the above summary should have been duly taken into account and recommendations by the commission modified and enlarged accordingly. Had this been done the Cooper's Hill College should have been abolished about 13 or 14 years earlier than it was, and the number of guaranteed posts for the Sibpur, Poona and Madras Colleges at least should have been substantially increased. It becomes amply clear that the feeling about these two points was very strong and

the grounds advanced in support of the recommendations made were very sound and reasonable.

(3.) The evidence of one particular witness, Mr. J. R. Upshon, establishment clerk, Public Works Department Secretariate, Madras, which has not been summarised in the report of the Sub-Committee for the Public Works Department is of special value as appears from the following extracts:—"With exception of the one guaranteed appointment the Engineering Establishment in this presidency is entirely closed to Natives of India. So far back as 1871 the evil results of such a monopoly were noticed and a Committee formed to propose some remedial measures. . . . In their report the Committee remarked . . . 'we are satisfied that it is expedient to hold out to the Natives of the country better prospects in the Department than have as yet been open to them. We would remark that Natives . . . have within recent years successfully filled many offices of trust . . . have many advantages in ascertaining correctly the wants of the villagers, and in being able to explain to them to what extent those can be provided for by the Government under the rules in force. We think that a serious mistake has been made in the administration of the Department in not fostering the Native talent and enterprise in a profession for which old hydraulic works of the country show that the Natives of this presidency possess a remarkable degree of Native aptitude.'"

"Before the year 1872 . . . only five European passed students (out of 30 A. C. E.'s who turned out of the Madras College between 1863 and 1872) were appointed to the Department as Assistant Engineers while the Natives and Eurasians who passed earlier and better received only Overseers' posts—the lowest in the Department."

"During the same period (1863-1872) 78 Europeans were appointed to the Department as Engineers. The discouragement shown to Natives led many of them to seek employment under other Governments or to enter other walks of life."

"From the year 1863 to 1886, 78 Natives of India have qualified for the Assistant Engineer grade, and of these only six have been given appointments as Assistant Engineers. In the same period 144 Europeans . . . have been appointed to the Engineers' Establishment of the Madras Public Works Department to the nearly entire exclusion of the children of the soil."

The facts and figures given by the witness clearly showed the necessity of abolishing the Coopers Hill College and of encouraging the Indian Engineering Colleges by giving them a larger number of guaranteed posts; but no such recommendation was made by the Commission. It shows that sufficient attention was not paid, or sufficient attention was not given to evidence of the Indian and Eurasian witnesses, although their number was more than one third of the total number of witnesses examined in this connection.

(4.) If the conclusion drawn above is correct and the report of the Sub-Committee for the Public Works Department was based mainly on the evidence of the European witnesses, without giving due weight to the evidence of the other witnesses the force of the indictment made must be considerably reduced. However, even apart from this consideration it can be shown that this indictment does not at all hold true at the present time. To begin with the first part of this indictment which is directed against the Indian College Engineers as a whole, it appears that up to 1886-1887 when the Commission sat no Indian College Engineer had yet risen to the administrative grade, hence none of the witnesses could have had any experience of their capacity for such work. But since then a large number of Indian College Engineers have attained to the administrative grade, several of them have acquired a world-wide fame, and it has been generally admitted by competent authorities that Indian College Engineers were in no way inferior to those recruited in England. Even if we turn to facts and figures we find that in case of the Punjab the total number of Rurki Permanent Engineers who joined the Public Works Department up to 1895 is 79, while the corresponding number of Engineers recruited in England including the Royal Engineers is 261. Out of the 79 Rurki Engineers 24 have risen to administrative grades and of these 24 men no less than 12 have risen to the grade of Chief Engineers. This gives a percentage of 31 for promotions to the administrative grade and of over 15 for those to the post of Chief Engineer. In case of the Engineers recruited in England, out of a total number of 261, eighty-six were promoted to the administrative grade and 39 to that of Chief Engineer, giving the corresponding percentage of less than 33 and less than 15 respectively. This comparison clearly shows that the Rurki Engineers are in no way inferior to foreigners, and the result of the comparison would have been ever better than this, if the Indian Engineers had not been kept studiously out of the administrative grade in this Province. This is I believe a complete and effective reply to the indictment against the Indian College Engineers.

(5.) As regards the indictment against the Indian Engineers the first point to be noted is that the members of a service do not naturally like the *intrusion* of an alien new-comer among themselves, and the greater the degree of alienation between the new-comer and the existing members of the service, the greater is the intensity of dislike. In the beginning the Public Works Department was entirely manned by Royal and other Engineers recruited in England. Then came the Cooper's Hill men. The Royal Engineers duly resented their regular entry into the Department in large number and for some time the controversy about the inferior merits and capacity of the Cooper's Hill men as compared with the Royal Engineers went on, but ultimately it had to be admitted that the Cooper's Hill men were in no way inferior. Then began the controversy about the inferiority of the Indian College Engineers (even Europeans). This controversy also was settled in favour of the latter when authorities like Lord Macdonnell and Sir John Hewett testified to the high merits and capacity of the Rurki European Engineers. Now then comes the last stage of this controversy and it is now the turn of the purely Indian Engineers to be branded with inferiority as compared with European Engineers, and this time the controversy has taken a more acute form because the distinction of race and nationality is also involved in it.

(6.) Experience of the past controversies ought to have shown to those who have taken up a hostile attitude towards the Indian Engineers that human nature is everywhere the same and that education is a great leveller. Every race and nationality does no doubt possess its own characteristics both good and bod. But this does not mean that any of those characteristics is unchangeable. The power of adaptation to *environments* is very strong in man, and with the help of education he is capable of making astonishing transformation. All the defects and shortcomings of the Indian Engineers, which are contained in the indictment, appear to be based on hasty conclusions derived from insufficient data. Because it appears from the report of the Sub-Committee for Public Works Department that there were no more than 86 Indian Engineers in the whole of India in 1886-87, and the European witnesses who found all sorts of faults with them were as many as 41 coming from all parts of India out of a total number of 929 European Engineers. Hence these witnesses must have had (as some of them frankly admitted) a very meagre personal experience of the Indian Engineers. In spite of this most of them did not refrain from making sweeping assertions about the decided inferiority of Indians to Europeans in almost every respect. This shows the general tendency of Europeans to misjudge Indians, which is as much in evidence now at the present time as it was 27 years ago. The European Engineers do not as a general rule come in real touch with the people of this country and therefore cannot possibly have that intimate and all-sided knowledge of their juniors in service (whether European or Indian) which is essential for forming a correct opinion about the real capacity and character of a man. Hence all their ideas and impressions about them are necessarily incomplete and one-sided. Their European juniors mix with them freely and have every opportunity of putting their good points in the

best light before them. The Indian Engineers on the other hand do not mix much with their European superiors. Their relations with the latter are for the most part formal and official. Hence the knowledge of the European Engineers about their Indian juniors is in most cases superficial and necessarily one-sided. Add to this the fact that it is an inherent tendency of human nature to feel a sort of inward liking and partiality for those who are akin to it, and that there are a number of shibboleths and preconceived notions which many European Engineers entertain about the Indians, and it will become amply clear why a European Engineer generally considers an Indian Engineer essentially inferior to himself.

(7.) Now if we turn to actual facts and figures; it is quite easy to show that the Indian Engineers are in reality quite capable of exercising the highest Engineering skill, and of doing all these things and meeting all those situations successfully which they are considered incapable of doing. The only difficulty in their case has been that sufficient opportunities are not given to them on the *a priori* plea of incapacity.

(*a*) The Delhi Durbar of 1903 was entirely managed by Indian Engineers.

(*b*) The Eastern Bengal Railway is being very ably and successfully managed by an Indian Engineer-in-Chief.

(*c*) From statistics collected specially for this purpose any number of examples are available in which the Indian Engineers have displayed promptness of action and soundness of judgment in cases of emergency, have taken the fullest responsibility in difficult situations and met them successfully, have exhibited great resourcefulness, and presence of mind, have shown a good deal of activity both mental and physical, and have displayed marked aptitude even for Mechanical Engineering.

(*d*) Some of the Indian Engineers have displayed a marked and special aptitude for Engineering, some for administrative work and some have given evidence of other high qualities on the possession of which the Britishers "have prided themselves for centuries." From what has been said above it is, I believe, very clear that the second part of the indictment given above is as unfounded as the first one. Hence there is no reason whatever why any limitation should be imposed on the employment of non-Europeans.

(8.) These limitations are, however, very much in evidence at present. In addition to the non-employment of the Provincial Engineers in the Imperial service, there is the restriction against promoting Indian Engineers to the administrative grade, in as much as the latter do not get these promotions simply through a good and unblemished record of service as Europeans do. Again it is a fact that none of the Indian Temporary Engineers has yet been made permanent, although a number of European Temporary Engineers have been so promoted on more occasions than one. Such limitations and restrictions against the Indian Engineers are all the more keenly felt because these are often made quite arbitrarily and without any known reasonable cause.

71,743. **(VIIb) Working of the existing system of division of service into Imperial and Provincial.**—The whole scheme of the introduction of the Provincial Service was based on the assumption that the Indian College Engineers, especially the Indians, could be employed as, what are called, the clerks of works, in England, "for all work of a lower description and the ordinary construction and repairs in the Buildings and Roads branch," and that the European Engineers could be reserved for Engineering proper. This assumption has in actual practice been proved wrong, and it has not been found practicable to make any such distinction beween the Provincial and Imperial Engineers. On the other hand the Provincial men have shown that they were not only doing the same work and bearing the same responsibilities as the Imperials, but have *on account of their greater and more intimate knowledge of the country and its people, also been able to do their work more satisfactorily and efficiently than the European Imperial Engineers.* It has surely been on the basis of facts like these that the Government of India in their Resolution No. 430-450 E of 1912, have virtually recognized the quality of Provincial and Imperial Engineers by bringing them both on the same list and making the conditions of service the same for both. This being the case there seems to be no good reason why the distinctions in pay and allowances, and leave and pension rules of the two services should not also be removed. This would entail no large or heavy expenditure as the following figures would show. The number of Provincial Engineers in the whole of India at the present time is estimated to be about 165. By rising their pay by one half an expenditure of $165 \times 280/- = $ Rs. 46,200 or say 50,000/- per month will be incurred, against the total expenditure of about Rs. 750,000 on account of the salaries of more than 900 Engineers in the whole Public Works Department of India. This means an increase of about $6\frac{1}{2}$ per cent. only, which is nothing when compared with the annual income and expenditure of the Public Works Department which is as below for the 1910-11:—

Total Income (gross)	Rs. 51,89,68,201
Total Expenditure	Rs. 34,85,90,505
Total Expenditure on Establishment	Rs. 5,82,45,379

71,744. **(VIII.) Relations of the service with other services.**—It is the Irrigation Branch of the Public Works Department which generally comes in contact with the Civil Department through those who irrigate their lands from canals. In some cases in the past misunderstanding and friction have arisen between the two Departments in connection with Irrigation matters. This has generally been the case on those canals only where the Civil Department had a direct or indirect hand in irrigation; and the cause of this misunderstanding has as a rule been the inability of the civil officers to grasp the more or less technical principles of Engineering. The best way of getting rid of this occasional friction between the two Departments is to give to the Engineering Department the entire control of irrigation and to hold them responsible for both the results and the methods of working. The other alternative of taking away the Revenue work of the canals from the Public Works Department and entrusting it to the civil people, which is sometimes proposed by some civil officers, is most inadvisable and harmful, and is calculated to lead not only to complications of various kind, but to want of efficiency and good management also.

71,745. **(IX.) Other points.**—The chief problem of the day is—how to improve the relations between the educated Indians and the Europeans. The urgency and importance of this problem is as keenly felt in the Public Works Department as in any other. That the existing state of things is unsatisfactory is admitted on all hands. But the question of reform is difficult. The fight is between old established convictions and preconceived notions on the one hand, and an evergrowing spirit of freedom and self reliance on the other. There was a time when all or almost all Engineers were Europeans and this time lasted for a long while. At that time the subordinates who were of course almost all Indians looked up to the European Engineers as superior persons who were capable of doing wonderful things and taught them how to do them. They admired them and praised them and thereby acquired a good deal of power and influence over their countrymen. The European Engineers, on the other hand, felt duly proud and conceited at the importance attached to their person, and always looked upon their subordinates with a patronizing eye. They used to be particularly pleased with the old fashioned vernacular speaking sweet-tongued and long robed Indian gentlemen who, in the capacity of their Head Munshi or Zilladar, had nothing but praises for their superior master. It was this kind of Indian etiquette which they appreciated most. At the same time they carefully noted all the faults and shortcomings exhibited by their subordinates, and attributed them to their belonging to an inferior race of men, who had acquired certain unchangeable characteristics on account of having passed through centuries of corruption and misrule. It was evidently during this period that the European Engineers must have formed a good many of their preconceived notions and prejudices against the Indians. These

were in course of time matured in traditions which were handed down by one batch of Engineers to another, till they have come down to the present time.

Now, however, the conditions have changed entirely. The long robed sweet tongued gentleman of old is fast disappearing. Well-educated Indian Engineers possessing the same qualifications and the same capacity for work as the European Engineer are daily increasing in number, and taking the places which were occupied by Europeans, and so far as opportunities are afforded they have proved themselves to be fully equal to all situations however difficult they might be. These new conditions are evidently not to the taste of the European Engineer whose deep-rooted idea of the essential superiority of Europeans over Indians is difficult to change. Hence he must find reasons in support of his idea, and must discredit the Indian Engineer wholesale, whenever he shows any failing or shortcoming. It is I believe, partly on account of this feeling and partly due to want of sufficient knowledge of the country and its people that Indian Engineers are often misjudged by their European superiors especially when the comparison lies between an Indian and European.

LALA RADHIKA NARAYAN called and examined.

71,746. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he represented the Engineers' Association of Lahore, an organisation consisting for the most part of Indian Engineers belonging to the Punjab Public Works Department and the North-Western Railway. It consisted of 55 members, and the opinions expressed in the written statement were generally agreed to by the Association. The main points of the recommendations were the abolition of the division into Provincial and Imperial and the creation of an Imperial Service to be recruited by open competition and under uniform conditions. That proposal was made because Imperial and Provincial Officers were now employed on the same work and had the same responsibility, and also because the Indian College recruits were as good as the recruits obtained from England. That opinion was based on statistics he had collected from other Engineers more than 30 in number and on his own experience. He had had both European and Indian officers under him and the Indian officer had been as efficient as the European officer.

71,747. With regard to the proposal that Rurki should be the main college for training the superior staff, the witness thought in such a large country as India one college would not be enough, and his opinion was that the four existing colleges should be raised to the same standard as Rurki.

71,748. With regard to recruitment, the witness considered that for the present at any rate it would be necessary to recruit about one-third of the superior Service in England, the other two-thirds being recruited in India. It was quite true that as good men could be obtained in India as in England, but he thought the change from English recruiting to Indian recruiting should be brought about gradually.

71,749. The witness considered that specially selected officers in the subordinate Service were sufficiently well qualified on the average to be allowed opportunities of promotion to the superior Service. The subordinate Service might be improved if its members were given better opportunities of promotion and if care was taken to ensure that the men promoted were of high character. They should receive promotion on the results of their work but great stress should be laid on character.

71,750. With regard to the employment of Royal Engineers, the witness said they should not be employed as a rule because they superseded men who were already in the Service. If arrangements could be made to obviate that, he would have no objection to their employment.

71,751. On the subject of recruitment in India the witness did not recommend an all-India examination, because he thought it was unnecessary and would entail hardship on students coming from remote parts of the country. He was *therefore in favour of having* different centres.

71,752. The witness saw no difficulty in the way of bringing the present temporary Engineers into the permanent cadre. The temporary Engineers should be considered as a source of recruitment and a certain percentage of temporary Engineers should be recruited every year. Administrative difficulties could be easily prevented by promoting upper subordinates and giving them the charge of sub-divisions. In the Punjab Irrigation there were at present 37 sub-divisions in charge of upper subordinates and the number could be easily increased. It was not necessary for the prevention of blocks in promotion to increase the number of divisions. There would be no increase in the junior posts, as the surplus sub-divisions would be given to upper subordinates. In the Punjab Irrigation there were 129 sub-divisions and 43 divisions, and if the sub-divisions were kept 10 per cent. in excess of the number of divisions in charge of the permanent Engineers there would be no block. Now the number of sub-divisions was so great that if manned entirely by permanent Engineers there would be a block, but if the number of sub-divisions in charge of Engineers was reduced there would be no difficulty. The sub-divisions allocated to Assistant Engineers might be reduced to 59 or 54 or some other suitable number, and the others given to upper subordinates. At present 37 of the sub-divisions were in charge of upper subordinates, 45 in charge of temporary Engineers, and the rest in charge of permanent men. He did not suggest that the temporary Engineers should be made permanent at once; a certain percentage of them should be taken every year. For example, forty men being required every year, five would be taken from temporary Engineers and the recruitment from other sources decreased accordingly. The senior men would be taken first. Everything would remain as before except that recruitment from other sources would be reduced.

71,753. With reference to training, the witness said he would favour sending an officer to England for a European training after he had been some years in the Department.

71,754. In the matter of pay, the witness wished to see the establishment of uniform conditions. Assuming it was decided that the market values of Europeans and Indians were different and that one required a higher salary than the other, and assuming also that a uniform scheme on those lines were instituted, the witness did not think that discontent would be less than it is at present. Race distinctions were always resented by the race which was considered inferior, and he objected to any distinctions in pay which were based on race. An Indian drawing less pay was certain to be looked down upon by a European receiving higher pay. Also, the witness said, he would not accept a scheme for one superior service with a foreign service allowance to Europeans. He thought both schemes were equally bad, and if his scheme of equal pay was not accepted he would not prefer the foreign allowance scheme to the existing state of things.

71,755. With regard to the age of retirement, as optional retirement was allowed to Europeans after twenty years' service he wanted the same privilege for the Indian officers also. He did not think twenty years was too early for optional retirement because he believed only those men would retire who needed to retire at that early age. He could not say that a man of 42 or 43 was too old to do any useful work.

71,756. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness said he *was born in Delhi and entered the service before the Provincial Service was introduced, and he was drawing the same pay as officers in the Imperial Branch* and had no personal interest in the recommendations made in his written statement. He had been in the service twenty-three years, had nver been to England, and was now an Executive Engineer, first class, drawing Rs. 1,250. He did not think pay on the present Imperial scale would be excessive for the whole of the Provincial Engineers' service. No really good Indian Engineers would willingly join the Public Works Department on rates of pay lower than were given to the Imperial Service.

71,757. The witness said he looked forward to the time when English recruitment would be quite unnecessary for the Public Works Department. He did not think the men now entering the Provincial Service were of a different class from those that entered

the Imperial Service. It was only owing to their straitened circumstances that they were compelled to enter the Provincial. The reason why men now went to Rurki and passed a stiff examination to get into the Provincial Service was not that the attractions of the Service were sufficient but because there was no other open door to Government employment for men who had not sufficient money to go to England for training. There was very little private employment for Engineers in India, and the only service which could compare with the Public Works Department was the Civil Service which they could not enter without going to England. The Provincial Civil Service he did not think was better than the Provincial Service of the Public Works Department. He did not believe the Provincial Service of the Public Works Department was more attractive than other branches of Government service, such as the Police or Postal Departments. He could not agree that it would be extravagant to pay the whole of the Provincial Engineers' Service recruited in India at Imperial rates of pay, even though they are at present doing the same work at two-thirds that pay. They were in a way obliged to enter the Provincial Engineers' Service because their circumstances did not allow them to train themselves for any other service. Hence it could not surely be called a proper service.

71,758. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The witness admitted that the market price of work all the world over was determined by the force of circumstances; but pointed out that whilst in other civilized countries only the natural circumstances operated, in India artificial circumstances which could be easily removed compelled many capable Indians to join inferior services.

71,759. (*Mr. Madge.*) The difference between the Association of Indian College Engineers and the Indian Engineers' Association was that the latter contained Temporary Engineers as well as Imperial and Provincial Engineers, while the former consisted only of Provincial men. There was no bar to Europeans and Anglo-Indians joining the Engineers' Association, but at present the members were all Indians.

71,760. With reference to the statement that Engineering work in India differed from that in England, the witness said there were very large differences. For instance, India had specialised in Irrigation work which was not to be found in England, and the Railways in India were different owing to the number of wide rivers that had to be bridged, and also there was a different style of architecture in India from that obtaining in England. The fundamental principles of Engineering were always the same, but the specialities in India required special study.

71,761. The witness said that in his opinion the experiment of the Provincial Service had failed. On the basis of his own personal experience and of the evidence he had collected he thought it was true to say that as a rule the European Imperial Engineers were not in real touch with the people of the country.

71,762. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness said he was acquainted with the criticisms on the cost of Government in India made by the Indian people, and he admitted that the argument had been commonly used that England had staffed the Public Service of India with men who were greatly overpaid. He did not dissociate himself from that argument, though in case of the Public Works Department he looked at it from quite a different standpoint. He was of opinion that the administration of an Indian was much cheaper than that of a European, as he could manage things much more economically than a European. Considering that the Engineer's post was of very great responsibility and trust he did not think that the salaries paid to Europeans were much too high in the case of the Public Works Department. For the same reason he was of opinion that the European officer in that Department had never been overpaid. If the Service was composed entirely of Indians he could not favour a reduction of pay, though the next revision in an upward direction could in this case be delayed much longer than otherwise.

71,763. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The witness said that in taking up that position with regard to pay he was considering the question also from the point of view of the taxpayer. If the circumstances of the country changed so much that men employed in the Service were not content with their pay it was necessary that the pay should be revised; otherwise the taxpayer would lose much more on account of the evergrowing discontent of the officer than he would gain by the curtailment of his pay. The witness would not accept his suggestion that his philosophy of progress was that the Public Service of India should show an increasing measure of discontent with their pay every year; his view was that when men found they could not subsist on their pay, and that higher pay was to be obtained elsewhere, they would naturally endeavour to get an increase.

71,764. (*Mr. Sly.*) With reference to the statistics in the written statement, comparing the proportion of Rurki-trained Engineers with Engineers recruited in England, the witness said that out of 79 Rurki Engineers 18 were Indians and 61 Europeans. The figures were taken up to the year 1895. The Coopers Hill men came out in 1873, so that up to 1895 very few Coopers Hill men could have been promoted to administrative rank. Therefore so far as Coopers Hill was concerned the comparison had very little value. Of the total number of 261 Europeans recruited in England up to 1895, 61 were Royal Engineers.*

71,765. (*Mr. Aikman.*) The witness said he did not think it was correct to say that at present the Civil Engineers appointed in England, including 10 per cent. of Indians, amounted to 20; that number applied only to one year and did not represent the average, which was not less than that given in his written statement. The witness admitted that the proportions now given by the Government of India, 48·6 of English Engineers, 43·3 of Indian Engineers and Indian College Engineers, and 8·1 of Royal Engineers, were very different from the proportions given in his own written statement, but he thought it was an unfair comparison, first because the upper subordinates should not be included, as they generally did not rise above a Sub-Divisional Officer's post; secondly because the number 20 mentioned above was altogether incorrect.

71,766. With regard to the question of supplying Engineers to smaller District Boards, the witness suggested that upper subordinates might well be employed as they were quite qualified for such positions.

71,767. With regard to training, the witness said he had known of Engineers from England being appointed direct to sub-divisions, but as a rule they were put under an Executive Engineer for training.

71,768. With reference to the question of higher rates of pay for imported labour, the witness said higher wages were paid to imported coolies such as Pathans, not because they were imported, but because they were capable of doing more work than the local labourer.

71,769. The witness did not admit that the fact that Indians were sending their children to England for education was an admission that Indian education in Civil Engineering left a good deal to be desired, but he admitted that in case of Electrical and Mechanical Engineering, education in India was backward.

71,770. With reference to the statement that not a single Indian in the Punjab was allowed to enter the administrative grades, the witness said he did not think that was because the men were not fit for such grades, as he knew of at least one case of an Indian Engineer who was quite competent to fill an administrative post.

* The witness afterwards pointed out in a written note that the admission about comparison with Coopers Hill being of little value was due to an oversight. The figures were taken up to 1895 so far only as recruitment was concerned. The figures for promotion to administrative grade were, however, up to date. Hence all the Coopers Hill men who joined the Punjab and had risen up to the administrative grade were included in the comparison, which was in consequence fully applicable to the Coopers Hill Engineers as well.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Calcutta, Saturday, 20th December, 1913.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman.*)

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.

SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.

ABDUR RAHIM, ESQ.

WALTER CULLEY MADGE, ESQ., C.I.E.

FRANK GEORGE SLY, ESQ., C.S.I.

HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, ESQ.

JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, ESQ., M.P.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

H. H. GREEN, ESQ., Superintending Engineer, Bengal.

SHASHI BHUSHAN MAZUMDAR, Executive Engineer, Bengal.

R. R. SCOTT, ESQ. (*Joint Secretary*).

B. K. FINNIMORE, ESQ., Chief Engineer, Bengal.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,771. **(I.) Method of Recruitment.**—*Imperial Service.*—All Imperial Engineers are now recruited in England. They are selected from candidates who answer advertisements of the requirements of the Department. The selection is made by a Selection Committee appointed by the Secretary of State. Formerly recruitment was made by competition among students of the Royal Engineering College, Cooper's Hill.

So far I found the Engineers appointed to Bengal under the present system are in no way inferior socially, or so far as their engineering knowledge goes, to those recruited formerly from Cooper's Hill. I do, however, consider that there is not the same *esprit de corps*, or discipline that there was formerly among the Cooper's Hill students. These qualities I consider of as much importance as superior engineering attainments. There are many appointments in the Public Works Department for which administrative ability, honesty of purpose and independence of character are even more essential than engineering training. I consider that the Cooper's Hill training was specially good for the production of such qualities, and I rather fear that the Department may suffer in future from the want of them. If it is not possible to re-establish such a College as Cooper's Hill was in England, I would suggest that the Selection Committee should consider these points in selecting candidates. I think it very desirable that one or even two members of this Committee should be either Engineers of the Department on leave or who have recently retired. Such men would know the better stamp of men required for work in the Department than men who were not serving, or have not recently served themselves, in it.

I consider that if Indian candidates of requisite qualifications can be found among those applying for these appointments there is no reason why the present limit of 10 per cent. should not be increased. Whether the candidates are Europeans or Indians, the best men should be appointed. What we want are men of independent character, active habits and good health, who are likely to form independent judgment, act on it, and not mind being sent anywhere, where the exigencies of the service might require them. It is very probable that for some time to come the proportion of Indians with such qualifications will not come up to the 10 per cent. limit now allowed.

Provincial Service.—The recruitment for the Provincial Service in Bengal is entirely from the Sibpur Engineering College and the large majority of Bengalis. During the last 20 years the nationality of the successful students has been Bengalis 17, Eurasians 4. Bengalis do not, as a rule, care for Engineering as a profession, their special qualifications fitting them much better for the Legal and Medical professions, and therefore we do not get the best of them for Engineers. Bengal cannot be considered on the same lines as the Punjab or the United Provinces, who obtain their recruits for the Provincial Service from the Rurki College. A more efficient Provincial Service would probably result if a Central College for the higher training of Engineers for all India were established, where the Bengalis would come in contact with the more robust races of Northern India.

At present at the Sibpur Engineering College there are many more students than there are Engineer appointments, and all Engineering students who fail to get appointments as Engineers, *i.e.*, in the Superior Service of the Public Works Department, readily accept appointments as Overseers on Rs. 80 to 100 a month in the Upper Subordinate service, which, under present regulations, is mainly recruited in this way. Such men are, as a rule, the men who go to Sibpur in order to obtain some employment, which will give them a living, not because they desire to be Engineers. They are, as a rule, not practical men, and at the same time they feel dissatisfaction that a man who perhaps has simply gained a few more marks than they have in an examination should obtain an appointment in the Superior Service of the Public Works Department commencing on a salary of Rs. 250 a month with a prospect perhaps of becoming a Superintending or a Chief Engineer, while they themselves are relegated to the Subordinate Service for the whole of their lives.

I advocate that the Provincial Engineering Colleges should confine their attention to the training of subordinates, and that a Central College for the whole of

India on the lines of the Royal Engineering College, Cooper's Hill, should be established, and that from this College the Provincial Engineer services should be recruited.

I do not consider that so far the average Indian-trained Engineer is equal to the average English-trained Engineer. By an Indian-trained Engineer I mean the Indian-trained Engineer that we deal with in Bengal—that is, the Sibpur-trained Engineer. We have recently reported to the Government of India that to fill the Engineer appointments in Bengal we require 60 per cent. English-trained Engineers. This is in regard to the fact that we consider we require men superior to the average men we have hitherto obtained from Sibpur for 60 per cent. of the appointments. This indicates the necessity under present conditions for recruitment of a large proportion of our superior establishment in England. To provide for the proper use of the better men among the Indian-trained Engineers, I propose that if properly qualified men could be found they should, after five or six years' service in the Provincial branch, be transferred to the Imperial branch. For the present I would limit such recruitment of the Imperial branch to 10 per cent. If satisfactory men up to this number are found, and it is in the future felt that there are more men qualified for such promotion than this limit would satisfy, the limit may be raised.

71,772. **(II.) Systems of Training and Probation.**—Regarding "Training," as indicated in paragraph 71,771, I consider the best training for the Department would be an Engineering College on the lines of the Royal Engineering College, Cooper's Hill, for Imperial officers in England, and a similar College for the training of Provincial officers in India, with a year's practical training in each case.

Regarding "Probation," I do not consider it necessary that the Imperial Service Engineer should be on probation. It is very desirable, when he first comes to the country, that he should be given a specific independent charge and placed in charge of a section or subdivision to learn his work under a good Subdivisional Officer or Executive Engineer. I consider it desirable that the Provincial Service Engineer should as at present be on probation for one year. He should as a general rule be placed where he can get continuous help and instruction. He should be placed in charge of some definite work after six months' satisfactory probationary service. I differentiate between the Imperial Service Engineer and the Provincial Service Engineer, because as a rule the Imperial Service Engineer has selected engineering as his profession because he wishes to be an Engineer, whereas the Provincial Service Engineer, with whom I have come in contact, often selects engineering as a means of livelihood, and not because he wishes to be an Engineer.

A sugestion has been made that before appointment to the Department Indian-trained Engineers should be given a year's practical training in England. I do not think that at that stage of their career it could be of practical use. It would, I think, be far better if selected officers were allowed to go to England for such training after five or six years' service.

71,773. **(VIIb) The working of the existing system of division into Imperial and Provincial.**—The division of the Department into "Imperial" and "Provincial" is, I consider, essential so long as it is necessary to import Engineers from Europe to fill a proportion of the appointments. Europeans imported must have many expenses, which Indians living in their native country do not have to face. It is not only fair, but necessary that they should be paid more highly.

71,774. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—I consider the present rate of salaries sufficient, but considering that the cost of living in India has increased so much of late years, I would advocate improvement in the Provident Fund, *i.e.*, that Government should add at least 50 per cent. on to the amount subscribed by each officer. At present all that the officers get is 4 per cent. on deductions from their pay. It is very hard for married men to save on their present pay, and it is, in my opinion, far better that Government should improve the Provident Fund rather than increase salaries: it might only induce habits of extravagance among younger men and while they are bachelors. I advocate very strongly that special allowances should be given to European officers stationed in Calcutta. The Bengal Government have repeatedly urged this on the Government of India, but so far with no result. Officers stationed in Calcutta have very responsible work, and are specially selected. The cost of living in Calcutta is far heavier than in the mufassal. It is very unfair that because an officer is good at his work he should be practically fined by being brought to Calcutta. I know for a fact that all European officers stationed in Calcutta, unless they have private means, have a struggle for existence. From the moment they come here they desire to get away. This makes it increasingly difficult to fill the Calcutta appointments satisfactorily. For the efficient working of the Department it is essential that a portion of the Calcutta appointments should be filled by Europeans. The Bengal Government have recommended special allowances of Rs. 250 a month for Superintending and Executive Engineers, and Rs. 150 a month to Assistant Engineers. This is not necessary in the case of Indian officers, as they readily come to Calcutta; in fact they are continually applying for transfer there.

71,775. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.** — *Imperial Engineers.*—I consider the present leave rules suitable, except that there should be no limit in the accumulation of privilege leave. Leave should be granted when officers can be spared and the present restrictions as to period of service between leave be removed, also after eight years' service a minimum leave allowance, while on furlough or special leave, of £500 should be allowed; if a man be invalided before eight years' service, £350. There should be no maximum limit as at present of £800.

Provincial Service.—I consider that the proportion of furlough should be one-fifth of the service to enable the full amount of 5 years' leave being enjoyed in the service of 30 years.

Study leave to Europe, Egypt and America might be allowed to Indians on favourable terms to encourage them to visit engineering works in those countries. Such leave to be on three-fourth pay subject to a maximum of £40 a month and a minimum of £25 a month. It might extend to four months at a time of intervals of not less than six years. Two such periods of leave might be allowed to an officer in his total service. A report of works visited to be made to Government.

71,776. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—*Imperial Service.*—I think that the pension of the Imperial Engineers recruited in Europe should be improved, that is to say, it should be £500 after 25 years' service and £700 after 30 years' service, with extra pensions for approved service in the administrative grades. Considering the increased cost of living in India, it is extremely hard for officers to save any considerable amount during their service, and as a rule all they have to live on on their retirement is little more than their pension, which at Rs. 5,000 a year as fixed at present is quite inadequate to meet their needs specially if they have children to educate, which must often be the case owing to the fact that their present pay does not enable them to marry until somewhat late in their service.

Provincial Service.—The present pension conditions are, I consider, satisfactory.

71,777. **(VIIa) Limitations in the Employment of Non-Europeans.**—I see no reason why the permissible limit of 10 per cent. in the appointment of Indians should not be raised, provided suitable men can be obtained.

The rule should not be that "10 per cent. must be employed," but that "10 per cent. may be employed." This limit to be raised when it is found that the supply of suitable men exceeds this.

71,778. **(VIII.) Relations of the Service with Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—These are quite satisfactory.

Mr. B. K. Finnimore called and examined.

71,779. (*Chairman.*) The witness stated that he was appointed to the Public Works Department in 1881, after being trained at Cooper's Hill, and became Chief Engineer and Secretary to the Government of Bengal in January 1911. Some four months ago he was appointed to the Chairmanship of the Calcutta Improvement Trust.

71,780. On the question of recruitment the witness gave it as his opinion that the men who were formerly recruited from Cooper's Hill came as a rule from a better class than the recruits appointed by the Secretary of State. There was no friction at present between officers belonging to the two classes of the Imperial Service.

71,781. The witness was in favour of the maintenance of the Provincial Service on grounds of economy. It was only fair that European officers should be paid higher rates of salary than locally recruited officers. He would, however, make an exception in favour of specially well qualified Provincial officers by promoting them to the Imperial branch on Imperial rates of pay. The general principle should be laid down that the Provincial Engineer should get lower rates of pay than the non-domiciled European Engineer, but he would waive the principle in the case of exceptionally well qualified officers. He laid more emphasis, however, on the maintenance of the general principle than on the exception he proposed to make to it. If he could not get both the principle and the exception, he would prefer to have the principle alone. In any case the removal of the term "Provincial" would probably go some way towards removing the present feeling of grievance.

71,782. Under his scheme he would recruit 60 per cent. of the superior staff from among English-trained Engineers, and in that proportion there would be an indeterminate number of Indians. If a central college could be established in India, he hoped it might in time be possible to recruit in Indian more than the 40 per cent., which he considered was possible under present conditions.

71,783. He explained that the candidates for the Provincial and Subordinate services were trained in the same classes at the Sibpur College, but his idea was to have a central Engineering College for the whole of India, with a higher standard of teaching. He did not anticipate any difficulty in getting recruits for this college from the different provinces. Even if the course at Sibpur was modified to the extent of having distinct Provincial Service classes, there would still be the difficulty of not having the same standard of teachers. Also a good many more men would be produced than would be required for some little time to come, and consequently there would be a number of discontented men who could not find employment.

71,784. With regard to pay, a subordinate entering the service began at either Rs. 80 or Rs. 100 and became eligible for a subdivisional charge, according to the exigencies of the service, in from two to five years. Occasionally temporary subdivisions had to be formed to which junior men were appointed.

71,785. There was no difficulty with regard to the few temporary Engineers in Bengal, who had been only kept on for a year or two. No temporary man was now doing ordinary divisional work, but there was one in Sikkim, and another was supervising Government estates. They were liable to be dismissed at a month's notice.

71,786. One Royal Engineer had been appointed to the Bengal establishment, but had not yet joined. The employment of Royal Engineers was being extended, and he believed they would be useful in the service. No instance had arisen in Bengal of Royal Engineers coming into the service over the heads of civilians.

71,787. He considered a year's practical training in England necessary for Imperial recruits. The Selection Committee should satisfy themselves either that a man had already been trained on works or that he got such training before he came to India. Provincial Service Engineers might go to England for training after they had been in the service for five or six years.

71,788. There were no facilities for study leave at present, and any officer visiting works at home had to pay his own expenses. He thought officers in the service would be satisfied if they had the same allowances as the Indian Medical Service, but he suggested three-fourths pay.

71,789. Salaries were adequate, but he suggested an improved provident fund with a 50 per cent. contribution on the part of the Government. He did not approve of two time-scales, one for Assistant Engineers and the other for Executive Engineers, with promotion from one class to the other by selection, as it would spoil the prospects of the service. At present promotion was by seniority. If a man was not fit for a division he would not get it, though that was an exceptional case. If a man was not in a divisional charge from no fault of his own, but owing to a block in the service, his incremental pay should continue.

71,790. On the subject of a family pension fund, the witness said there was a general desire in the service for the establishment of a fund on much the same basis as the provident fund which he had mentioned.

71,791. With regard to retirement, a qualifying service of 20 years might be rather short from the Government point of view, but very few men took advantage to retire after only 20 years' service. If any improvement was made in the scale of pensions, it would no doubt be reasonable that the time of service should be lengthened.

71,792. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) At present in Bengal very junior men were holding charge of divisions. Promotion was good in Bengal at present, and he hoped it would be so for some years to come. All the officers had a division before they reached the Rs. 800 grade. If they had not done so, they would not be entitled to advance beyond Rs. 800.

71,793. With reference to the suggestion that before appointment to the department Indian-trained Engineers should be given a year's practical training in England, his view was that at that stage of their career it would not be of practical use. After men had done a certain amount of work in the department their powers of observation would be better trained and they would have a greater appreciation of the class of work which was being carried out in England. If they went to England at first they would not appreciate the work so much or be so interested in their profession as to observe the differences between work in England and work in India.

71,794. He was not prepared to say that the pay of the Indian-trained Engineer was insufficient to attract a good class of candidate, but it was a fact that the Indian-trained Engineer was not equal to the English-trained Engineer. By recruiting a certain proportion of the Imperial men by promotion from the Provincial Service a better class of man might be induced to come in, but he very much doubted whether that would be so. By promotion he meant simply altering the pay, as officers in the Imperial and Provincial Service were already on one list. There was a feeling at present among some Provincial Engineers that they were as good as men in the Imperial Services and that they should receive the same pay. He was afraid that the scheme he proposed involved the admission that the higher pay given to the European was not given merely because he was serving in a foreign country, but because he was a man of superior qualifications to the Indian, and he agreed that this in a way undermined the whole theory of a foreign-service allowance.

71,795. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) According to the rules an Engineer could not rise by the time-scale above Rs. 800 unless he was actually in charge of a division, but everybody got promotion to executive rank unless he was particularly bad. A man in the ordinary course went on from Assistant Engineer to Executive Engineer; there was no choice of the best assistants for executive charges. As long as their reports were good the promotion to Executive Engineer was purely by seniority.

71,796. The witness did not propose to give a foreign-service allowance to Indians recruited in England, but if an Indian was selected who had spent many years of his life in England, and had received an expensive education there, it might be necessary to do so. He had had very little experience of Indians trained in British institutions, but from what he had seen of them he should say the result was not superior to the training they received in Indian institutions.

71,797. On the subject of limitations in the employment of non-Europeans, the witness said if more than 10 per cent. of Indians were found suitable they might be appointed; good men should be appointed whether they were English or Indians. Practically, he would revise the two rules with regard to nationality.

71,798. (*Mr. Sly.*) With regard to the bar at Rs. 800, it was true that the unfit were rejected, but that could hardly be called selection, as a man had to be particularly bad not to be put in charge of a division. The rule had been interpreted in Bengal in such a way as to give nearly every man a chance. He did not propose that the bar should be removed. If a man was passed over through his own fault, his pay should be limited to Rs. 800; but if promotion became so bad that it was not possible to give him a division, he should go on to the higher pay. It would be hard luck for a man to have his promotion stopped as a result of irregularities in recruitment. Men should be given to understand that they would rise to the top rank if their work proved satisfactory, since without that understanding the class of man who would come forward would be distinctly inferior. The Government made certain promises and, if those promises attracted good men, the Government must adhere to them.

71,799. As a rule when a man reached 55, he had served about long enough. He thought it would cause a great deal of dissatisfaction to alter the 55-year rule now, and it was not desirable in the interests of the department that men should stop on longer. He would give Government no discretion in that matter; it would be better as a matter of fact for the rule to be extended to all the departments of Government service.

71,800. On the subject of the proposal to establish a provident fund with a 50 per cent. contribution from Government, the witness said he understood the State Railways received a Government contribution amounting to as much as 75 per cent. On the other hand, the State Railway officers had no pensions. He did not propose that the pension scheme for the Public Works Department should be given up. The 50 per cent. contribution from Government would mean about Rs. 33,000 per man. He favoured a provident fund rather than a family pension fund.

71,801. With regard to house allowances, the witness stated that a married man only received a house allowance in Calcutta when he had his wife with him; when the wife was not there the allowance ceased. Even a man with Rs. 1,000 a month found it extremely hard to live in Calcutta, where the cost of living was 50 per cent. more than formerly, and it was essential that a substantial allowance should be given. He recommended a special allowance in addition to the house allowance. There was no necessity to give it to Indian officers, because they were anxious to live in Calcutta.

71,802. On the subject of officers being allowed to take private work during active service, the witness thought that should be strictly limited. He agreed with the present system under which men were occasionally asked for a professional opinion outside their ordinary working hours, but he would not encourage them to go in for private practice *per se*. The fees for such work had to be sanctioned by Government. He saw no objection to men taking up private work when on furlough in England, but he would not encourage them to take furlough in India for the purpose of doing private work. It was rather desirable that they should gain experience by doing such work in England. The great point about furlough was not that it was a holiday, but that it gave a man a change of climate.

71,803. With reference to the recruitment of 60 per cent. of the superior cadre in England, the witness said in Bengal that was the exact proportion at present, because 8 of the Imperial men were trained at Sibpur under the old conditions. At present 70 per cent. was recruited in England and 30 per cent. in India, and his suggestion was that the 70 per cent. should be reduced to 60 per cent. As far as Bengal was concerned, he thought that 60 per cent. was the minimum proportion. The promoted subordinates amounted to 10 per cent., and he thought the promotion of subordinates was satisfactory, as several good practical men had been obtained in that way. He was in favour of such men being allowed to rise above the Assistant Engineer's grade.

71,804. (*Mr. Fisher.*) It would be a good thing for engineering knowledge in India that a certain number of engineering colleges should be definitely marked as inferior. In training subordinates it was a mistake to give them too much theoretical training, because when they came into the department or joined a firm where subordinate work had to be done they felt they were doing work below their attainments. He would have a superior college for Engineers only, and he would not recruit subordinates from that college. The entrance test should be a high one. At present men who went to Sibpur had not sufficient general education to understand what they were taught. They went through a course which on paper should make them very well-trained Engineers, but as a matter of fact a large number of them simply committed a great deal of it to memory. Very few of the examination papers showed that the students understood what they were talking about. He thought in some ways Rurki men had been superior to Sibpur men and had been more ready to rough it, but he could not speak very definitely on the subject. He agreed that the three arguments which had previously been put before the Commission in favour of the establishment of a central college were equally good: that it would enable the Bengali to mix with the natives of the north; that it was inexpedient to mix up the subordinate with the superior classes; and that by concentrating resources on a central college a more efficient college would be produced.

71,805. On the subject of recruitment in England the witness favoured a return to the Cooper's Hill system, because he was slightly disappointed with recent recruits. He was thinking, however, of the early days of Cooper's Hill when there was competition for entrance and an assured appointment and a man had to work hard to qualify.

71,806. There were one or two men in the service from the Cambridge Engineering School, and there were men from Dublin University and the Central Technical College, and King's College.

71,807. On the Board of Selection there should be at least one, if not two, Engineers who were either now in, or had recently retired from, the service. He had generally found the impression he formed of boys was fairly correct, and therefore believed that if he had been on the Selection Board he might have been able to select more suitable boys than had been selected

71,808. He favoured the plan of sending Indians to England after they had had some expereince of engineering work in India. Any arrangement made with firms to take them would have to be carefully considered. It would be desirable to place the officers with firms of contractors.

71,809. (*Mr. Madge*). The witness thought a central college would turn out first-class Engineers who would be of value to India. There was a proposal

now to transfer the Civil Engineering College of Sibpur altogether to Dacca, and that would rather be against the strengthening of Rurki. He was in favour of strengthening Rurki rather than establishing another college at Dacca.

71,810. He desired to qualify his suggestion that officers might be promoted to the Imperial Service by saying that they should be *transferred* from the Provincial to the Imperial branch, not promoted. He would place no limit to the promotion of Indians or Anglo-Indians already in the Imperial Service. When it came to a question of promoting a man from Executive Engineer to Superintending Engineer, he would promote the best man available whether he was an Englishman or an Indian, and he thought that was the general feeling of the service in Bengal. The tendency rather was to promote an Indian if he was fit. He did not agree that promotion should fall short of administrative rank.

71,811. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) On the subject of the proportion of Indian-trained Engineers who had attained administrative rank, the witness thought the figures for the last 20 years would show a very surprising change. Up to 1895 the Cooper's Hill Engineer had not been long enough in the country to rise to administrative rank, the men at that time being the old staff college men trained at Rurki and the Stanley men. A very fair proportion of Indian-trained Engineers had attained to very high rank in the service, but they were recruited from rather a different class of men from the present recruits. In saying that the average India-trained Engineer was not equal to the England-trained Engineer he had referred chiefly to the men he had had experience of—natives of Bengal-trained at Sibpur. Three or four Indian-trained Engineers had reached the position of Superintending Engineers in Bengal. If a man was at all likely to be a success he was promoted, but it did not follow that he was as good as the officer trained in England.

71,812. The proportion of Indian-trained Engineers to English-trained Engineers in Bengal was 40 to 60; for the whole of India he believed it to be 30 to 70.

71,813. The training at the Sibpur College was not so good as it was at Rurki, and there was some idea of improving the training when the college went to Dacca. The reason for removing from Sibpur to Dacca was that Sibpur was unhealthy.

71,814. He desired to see boys entering the college with the same standard of general education as those who went to Cooper's Hill. That would do more than anything that could be done inside the college itself. The training was not defective, but the students were unable to assimilate it.

71,815. On the question of allowances, the witness thought Indians had compensating advantages; it was rather a saving to them to come to Calcutta, whereas it was an expense to Europeans. The only object of the allowance was to keep Europeans contented in Calcutta. Nearly every Indian was anxious to be transferred to Calcutta, and they never referred to the necessity of an extra allowance.

71,816. He would like to have the 10 per cent. rule governing the appointment of Indians to the Imperial Service made permissive and not mandatory, because under the present mandatory rule inferior men might be appointed. It was true there were more qualified men than were needed to fill 10 per cent. of the vacancies, but really good men were required, not simply qualified men. A mere examination was not a sufficient test of qualification He would have no limitation either way, English or Indian, provided the best men were obtained. He preferred selection as at present, but thought the best system would be the Cooper's Hill system, though that was beyond the dreams of probability now. He did not think English boys would be favoured by the Selection Board. He did not object to a competitive examination of selected candidates, but believed it would involve the necessity of raising the pay in order to attract candidates.

71,817. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness said that if a central college for India were established, he would still make appointments to the service on a Provincial basis, keeping a certain number for Bengal to be competed for by Bengalis, and so on.

71,818. He wished to correct the statement that men should be brought into the Imperial Service after an experience of five or six years, and he would make it ten years, by which time a man would be qualified to become an Executive Engineer and would have reached a stage at which it could be fairly decided whether he was likely to be a good Executive Engineer or not. In Bengal a certain number of Imperial Officers were wanted, because there were charges which were more important than others and which could be only properly looked after by men with an English training. Men promoted from the Provincial Service to the Imperial Service would be given a trial in one or other of those charges. There were also a certain number of heavy divisions and a certain number of light divisions, for which he would generally choose an Imperial officer or the very best of the Provincial Engineers. He had employed an Indian as Under-Secretary for some time and this officer would now be put in charge of an important division. He thought the system proposed would make for the contentment of the service.

71,819. His proposal for a provident fund was put forward as an alternative to his proposal for increased pay. If a provident fund was established, the pay of the Public Works Department was sufficient. Considering the increase in the cost of living, it would be necessary in order to make the pay the same as it was 20 years ago to raise it by 20 per cent.

71,820. (*Mr. Green.*) The witness said he was not aware that retirement at 55 was the rule in the Pilot Service owing to the work being so arduous. The work in the Public Works Department was arduous also.

71,821. There would be very great difficulty in appointing European officers to Calcutta unless special allowances were paid.

71,822. (*Shashi Bhushan Mazumdar.*) It was quite possible for the Selection Committee to judge a recruit by seeing him and considering his record. No recruit from England was trained in Indian engineering and Indian languages, and he did not think it was necessary they should be tested by an examination in such subjects. For the first year or two an officer from England was probably not as useful as a man recruited in India, but he did not agree that on that account an English recruit should be kept on probation for a year or two. That would probably keep good men from joining. He could not recall any instance in Bengal when the officer appointed from England had not been likely to prove efficient.

71,823. It was quite probable that the prospects offered to students of the Sibpur College were not such as would attract the best intellect of India. He did not think the Provincial Service had a bad name. He provided for the promotion of really good men to the Imperial Service, and as better men came forward the proportion would be increased; and he thought that was a fair response to the aspiration of the Indians. Many of the graduates from Sibpur who accepted posts in the service afterwards became District Engineers.

71,824. He proposed that the central college should give a really good engineering training. He was not aware that the Rurki Engineering College had been pronounced by experts to be as good as any in the world.

71,825. With regard to his proposal to promote selected Provincial Engineers after ten years' service, he merely proposed that the very best of the men should be transferred to the Imperial Service. As a rule the English-trained Engineer took up engineering owing to a liking for the work, but the average Indian who went to Sibpur did so not because he wished to be an Engineer, but because he desired employment.

71,826. With reference to the payment of house allowances to Europeans in Calcutta, the witness said he was not aware that the Indian had heavier expenses in connection with his family. He would not differentiate between married and single men or between men with small and large families.

71,827. He recommended that Imperial officers should be allowed more furlough than Provincial officers, because he did not think the Indian-trained Engineer in his own country required as much change as a man recruited from Europe. For the purpose of visiting engineering works the Provincial Service should be given study leave. He did not agree that the same work and service should entitle everyone to the same leave and pension irrespective of the conditions of recruitment.

(The witness withdrew.)

F. A. A. COWLEY, ESQ., Superintending Engineer, Bengal.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,828. **(I.) Method of Recruitment.**—*Imperial Service.*—Having regard to the many institutions in the British Isles which give a training in Engineering Science adequate to the needs of the Public Works Department, the establishment of a college on the lines of the late Royal Indian Engineering College, Cooper's Hill, may now be considered impracticable and selection from the open market must be accepted as an established fact.

(2) The present system of recruitment is generally considered satisfactory, but in my opinion should be limited to candidates who have resided at least five years in Europe. There is a disadvantage in recruiting Indians in England, as it is not always the most suitable candidates who are willing and can afford to go to England.

(3) Only degrees which are recognised by the Institute of Civil Engineers as qualifying for their associate membership should be accepted, or preferably each candidate for admission to the Public Works Department must be an Associate Member of the Institute of Civil Engineers (England).

(4) Assuming that recruitment by selection is maintained, 40 per cent. of the Selection Committee should at least be senior officers of the Public Works and Railway Departments either on the active or retired lists.

(5) The most suitable age for recruits to come out to India is between the ages of 21 and 24 years.

(6) There is strong resentment in the department at the appointment of Royal Engineer officers or Temporary Engineers to the permanent scale above the heads of men already in the department. They should enter the department early in their career and enter with their contemporaries. This rule should permit of no relaxation.

(7) Candidates appointed to the Imperial Service should not be appointed on probation—(*vide* also section 11)—but a year's practical training on works in Europe should be insisted upon and they should be required to pass within three years of their arrival in India the examination known as the departmental examination. Failure to pass this examination should entail loss of increment in salary and seniority.

(8) *Provincial Service.*—For recruitment in India, the Colleges for Engineers should be separate from those for subordinates. It is not desirable that members of the superior service should live on intimate and familiar terms with subordinates as now happens, and is encouraged by the two classes being educated together at the same college. There should be one central college for recruitment in India to the Provincial Service.

(9) Entrance to the college should be—

(*a*) by selection, to be followed by

(*b*) a competitive examination.

(10) Candidates should be between the ages of 22 and 26 on recruitment.

(11) Candidates admitted to the department should be appointed as Assistant Engineers on probation and required to qualify by training for confirmation; they should also be required to pass the same examination as Imperial Engineers.

71,829. **(II.) Training and Probation.**—It should be made a condition of appointment to the Imperial Service that every candidate shall have had one year's practical experience on Engineering works in the British Isles preferably.

(2) Candidates should not be appointed on probation to the Imperial Service, but failure to pass the departmental examination in Accounts and Engineering after appointment should entail loss of increment and seniority.

(3) Candidates appointed to the Provincial Service should be required to qualify for confirmation—the period for qualifying should be one year—and this limit should in no case be exceeded by more than two years in all. After appointment officers should be required to pass the same departmental examination as Imperial Service officers.

(4) Any officer before being given charge of an Irrigation or Embankment Division should also be required to pass the examination in Law as now required under present rules.

(5) Care should be exercised in placing newly joined recruits under sound and sympathetic officers, and they should be placed on suitable works.

(6) Owing to the very extensive use of English throughout Bengal Engineers appointed in England are not required to attain a high degree of efficiency in the Indian languages: the present system of departmental examination is sufficient.

71,830. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—It is desirable that the Engineers of the department should be constituted into a service under some name such as Indian Engineering Service (I. E. S.). The term Public Works Department is used by subordinates as well as clerks and cannot consequently be held to distinguish an Engineer officer.

(2) The cadre of the permanent Engineers should be more frequently revised. The magnitude and extent of the work in charge of the department is continually increasing and the maintenance of these extended works is part of the duty of the officers of the department.

(3) Officers of the Royal Engineers who are now brought into the service are usually credited with extra departmental service to such an extent as to give them departmental seniority over Civil Engineers who are seniors to them in age and standing in the department. It is necessary in the interests of Government that employment should be found for Royal Engineers in the department, but in justice the appointments should be made in such a manner as not to impair the prospects of Civil Engineers of the same age and standing already in the department.

(4) Similarly, if Temporary Engineers are transferred to the permanent list, the same principle should be observed.

(5) Future appointments of Temporary Engineers should only be made on the specific understanding that the holders will not under any circumstances be brought on the permanent scale. It would remain with Government to improve the temporary service if it is considered expedient. Thus the provident fund for temporary employés on State Railways might be extended to all Temporary Engineers in the Public Works Department.

(6) Article 649 of the Civil Service Regulations, which provides for the compulsory retirement of Civil Engineers, who, on attaining the age of fifty years, have not been promoted to the rank of Superintending Engineers, should be more rigidly enforced in the case of officers who, on reaching that age, are reported as not qualified for promotion to the rank of Superintending Engineers. The principle laid down in paragraph 80, Vol. I, Public Works Department Code, that promotion to the administrative ranks should be by selection as opposed to that of seniority, is the principle on which the above compulsory retirements should be enforced.

(7) Recruitment should be regulated so as to ensure a regular flow of promotion.

(8) There should be some ruling under which Government may compulsorily retire officers of the department who are reported on as unsuitable or inefficient. An officer who has been twice unfavourably reported upon in consecutive years should be warned that if he does not prove himself efficient his

services will be dispensed with. If, after another two years, he is still found unsuitable, he should be compulsorily retired under the ordinary pension rules allowed for men who are compulsorily retired as invalids. Of these four unfavourable annual reports, at least three should be by different Superintending Engineers.

71,831. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—In 1908 the scale of pay of the Public Works Department was reorganized and placed on an incremental basis, but at the same time the exchange compensation allowance formerly given to officers was withdrawn. The net increase in emoluments was not commensurate with the increased cost of living in India, which has been so marked a feature of the last decade.

Before proposals are advanced for the improvement of furlough and pension allowances, which will serve to alleviate those hardships which are most severely felt; and believing that these proposals cannot fail to receive favourable consideration, specific suggestions for an improvement in the scale of pay are not advanced. However, if the Royal Commission, on the careful consideration of the question in regard to other services or departments, consider that the increased cost of living deserves an increase in the salary as at present drawn, it is urged that the Public Works Department should participate in any such general improvements as the Commission desire to recommend.

(2) Under the reorganization scheme of 1908 it is ruled that an officer may not draw more pay than Rs. 800 per mensem unless he is in charge of a division, or in a charge which in the opinion of Local Government is of equal importance. This is unjust to an officer who, though fully qualified, does not obtain a divisional charge simply because there is no vacancy for him. It is urged that the rule should be amended to the effect that an officer of the Imperial Service reported as fit to hold a divisional charge should continue to receive the ordinary increments laid down in the scale, irrespective of his being in actual divisional charge. Similarly, a Provincial Engineer, who is reported on as fully qualified for a divisional charge, should be allowed to draw increased salaries beyond Rs. 535 per mensem according to the ordinary increments laid down in the scale.

(3) Similarly, Executive Engineers attain their maximum pay of Rs. 1,250 per mensem after completing 19 years' service. If, on account of there being no vacancy, an Executive Engineer though otherwise qualified is not promoted to Superintending Engineer's rank after completing 22 years' service, he should be given a personal allowance of Rs. 150 per mensem. Similarly, a Provincial Engineer, who is certified as fit for administrative rank, should be given a personal allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem after completion of 22 years' service.

(4) The present division of the rank of Superintending Engineer into three classes gives rise to blocks in promotion, so that it happens that an officer for no fault of his own never attains the first class rank, or the period of time during which he remains in the second and third class ranks is unduly prolonged: there should be two classes of Superintending Engineer only with salaries as follows:—

	Imperial service. Rs.	Provincial service. Rs.
Superintending Engineer, second class	1,700	1,300
Superintending Engineer, first class	2,000	1,600

The number of Superintending Engineers in each class should be the same, and it would be a mistake to extend the system of annual increments to the administrative rank.

(5) The present division of the rank of Chief Engineer into two classes and the variation of local allowances as Secretary to a Local Government give rise to the anomaly that a Chief Engineer may be drawing less emoluments than a Chief Engineer junior to him in service in another Province, although the work and responsibilities attached to such posts are similar. Promotion to Chief Engineer, first class, becomes so badly blocked at present that many deserving officers never obtain a chance of promotion to the higher rate of pay, or if they do so, only for a comparatively short time previous to retirement.

Considering that the numbers of Chief Engineerships throughout India is small and that with the exception of the posts of Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department and of Inspector-General of Irrigation these are the only highly paid posts to which an officer of the Public Works Department can hope to attain, there should be only one class of Chief Engineer, and the salary attached to that appointment should be Rs. 3,000 per mensem.

For similar reasons and because the appointment as Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department is invariably held by an officer specially selected from among Chief Engineers, the pay of that appointment should be Rs. 4,000 per mensem.

(6) A hardship which is peculiarly felt in Calcutta by officers who may be appointed to hold posts with headquarters at Calcutta is that no local allowances are attached to these posts. The Calcutta house allowance scheme only benefits the married man and then only when his wife or child is actually with him. Should his wife be obliged to go to England for reasons of health, the officer loses his allowance at a time when the allowance is actually worth more than if his wife were with him in Calcutta. The cost of living in Calcutta is well known to be very heavy, and an allowance of Rs. 200 per mensem to Executive and Superintending Engineers and of Rs. 150 per mensem to Assistant Engineers who have their headquarters at Calcutta should be granted and the house allowance under existing rules abolished.

71,832. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—*Furlough.*—The amount of leave which Imperial officers of the Public Works Department appointed in England can earn is sufficient. The rules governing the grant of furlough are practically identical with those which apply to the Indian Civil Service and Military officers subject to Civil leave rules, except in the most important particular of leave allowances. In the case of officers of the Indian Civil Service and Military officers subject to civil leave rules, furlough allowances are subject, if paid at the Home Treasury, to a minimum limit of £500 per annum, or the salary last drawn, whichever is less, and to a maximum limit of £1,000 per annum; whereas for Civil Engineer officers of the Public Works Department there is no minimum limit, and the maximum has been fixed at £800 per annum.

As long ago as 1870, in Despatch No. 43 P.W., dated the 28th March, the Government of India said:—"*Section* 16.—With reference to paragraph 4 of Your Grace's Despatch under reply we may remark . . . . . On this point we only add that we shall be glad to see some plan adopted by which the furlough allowances of Civil Engineers shall be equalised with those of Military officers in the Public Works Department and, so far as practicable, the advantage of pension also."

It is however a fact that at the present day a Royal Engineer officer of the Public Works Department, with eight years' service to his credit, is entitled to nearly double the furlough allowances of a Civil Engineer officer doing exactly the same class of work and have the same service in the department.

A Civil Engineer is obliged to complete 18 years' service before he can claim an allowance approaching that which a Royal Engineer is entitled to after 8 years' service.

The present furlough allowances are so inadequate that a large majority of officers cannot avail themselves of the furlough due to them, even though the state of their health urgently demands that they should do so.

The question of leave allowances is raised in the last paragraph of the memorials recently submitted by officers of the Public Works Department. The reply given by Government of India was that "Pensions and leave are subjects of reference to the Public Services Commission; and as no doubt the Commission will enquire into these matters and submit recommendations, the Government of India consider that no useful purpose will be served by considering the prayers of the memorialists at this stage." In

these circumstances it is confidently hoped that the Royal Commission will be able to recommend that the leave allowances sanctioned for officers of the Indian Civil Service and for Military officers subject to the Civil leave rules will be made applicable to Civil Engineer officers of the Public Works Department.

(2) *Grant of furlough.*—The proposals for simplifying the rules in the Civil Service Regulations regarding the combination of various kinds of leave, as well as the leave rules for the European services which the Government of India have had under their consideration and which were sent to the Government of Bengal with Government of India, Finance Department letter No. 538 C.S.R., dated the 18th September 1912, for an expression of opinion, may be given effect to.

(3) *Privilege Leave.*—Under the present rules an officer can earn privilege leave to the extent of one calendar month for every eleven complete calendar months of duty, and such leave is cumulative up to a period of three months. In the case of officers who have accumulated the full period, it frequently happens that the exigencies of the public service prevent them being granted privilege leave when they desire it, and this leads to the leave lapsing through no fault of their own. It would in a measure mitigate against this loss of leave on full pay which an officer has fairly earned, if the cumulative period were extended from three to six months.

An officer should be allowed to avail himself of all privilege leave due to him immediately prior to retirement, and be permitted to retire from the service at the end of his leave, without having to return to duty, as he is now obliged to do. This concession has already been made where privilege leave is combined with other leave.

(4) *Study Leave.*—Modern Civil Engineering is a highly specialized profession and progress in the methods of construction is very rapid. Engineers can only keep themselves abreast of modern engineering practice by visiting and studying works of special interest in progress in different parts of the world. The majority of Civil Engineers serving in the Public Works Department who wish to visit works have to do so as private individuals and entirely at their own expense unless they are placed on deputation, or are specially permitted to visit certain works when on leave. In the latter case certain travelling and other expenses are allowed, but the time spent in the visits counts against the officer's period of leave. It is to the interest of the Government of India to encourage officers to visit such works, and rules should be introduced to admit of facilities being granted or that there should be a much more liberal interpretation of the present rules regarding placing an officer on deputation. In the Indian Medical Service study leave is granted in England up to one year out of total service in addition to furlough, and during this period he receives furlough pay and lodging allowance.

71,833. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—The greatest grievance of Civil Engineer officers of the department and one which is severely felt is the inadequate retiring pension to which they become entitled under existing rules. Many efforts have been made, spread over a period of 40 years or more, to obtain amelioration in this respect, but the net result has been that the present pensions are actually less than they were 40 years ago, when the qualifications demanded from men joining the service were not as high as they are now and when the cost of living was considerably less. Numerous memorials on this subject have been submitted since 1907, and the reply of the Government of India to these memorials is contained in their letter No. 942E, dated 30th August 1912: "That no decision could be arrived at pending the receipt of the report of the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India." It is therefore to the Royal Commission that the Civil Engineer officers now look for redress of this long standing grievance, and it is strongly and respectfully urged that the scale of pensions prayed for in the memorials of 1912-13 be recommended.

(2) This grievance concerning pensions was brought prominently to the notice of the Government of India in the memorials of 1907-08, to which no reply was vouchsafed until August 1912; and as in the meantime a number of officers affected have been placed on the retired list, and many more will probably be required to retire before a decision is arrived at, any improvements made in the scale of pensions should have retrospective effect, at least from 1908.

(3) *Invalid pensions.*—Prior to 1884 invalid pensions granted to Civil Engineer officers on the Imperial list were governed by article 474 of the Civil Service Regulations, which also governs the pensions of all officers of the uncovenanted services as then termed.

In Lord Kimberley's Despatch of 1883 a new scale was introduced for Imperial Engineers and Telegraph officers with a view to ameliorating their conditions of service; this scale is covered by article 641 of the Civil Service Regulations. Under this article the scale has been increased from $\frac{12}{60}$ths of average salary for ten years' completed service, $\frac{13}{60}$ths for eleven years and so on to $\frac{30}{60}$ths for ten years, $\frac{31}{60}$ths for eleven years and so on, but at the same time the maximum limits have been reduced from those allowed by article 474. It is urged that article 641 should be revised so that the maxima limits may agree with those allowed by article 474.

(4) Unlike the Indian Civil Service and the Military Services in India, there is no official Family Pension Fund for the Public Works Department. The emoluments of officers in the department are not sufficient to admit of their making adequate provision for their families should they die in harness; this is a constant source of anxiety to many officers, and they have the additional anxiety of knowing that their pensions are purely personal and cease with their death.

It is strongly urged that a family pension scheme should be started; the majority of men would be willing to contribute a percentage of their salaries towards such a pension fund. Pension has been officially defined as deferred remuneration, which means that a certain portion of the salary which would have been paid to an officer, had there been no pension attached to his appointment, is kept back to provide for a pension on his retirement. This view is corroborated by the fact that when an officer is transferred on foreign service he is made to contribute towards the cost of his pension at the rate of one-sixth of the pay he would have received had he remained in the service of the Government of India. It may be presumed, therefore, that an officer only receives six-sevenths of the pay he would have received had there been no pension to provide for, and that one-seventh is kept back by Government as an officer's contribution towards his pension fund. If the officer had the option of investing this amount to provide for an annuity with a private Insurance Company, he could probably so arrange the terms that a portion of his annuity would be assured to his widow or other members of his family should his death take place within a certain number of years from the date his annuity fell due, with the additional security that his family would be covered against the risk of his death should it take place during the time he was subscribing to his annuity, on the guarantee of a considerable sum of money.

If some such scheme could be worked out by Government on an actuarial basis a large number of officers not only in the Public Works Department but in other services similarly unprotected would be glad to avail themselves of it and to subscribe towards the extra cost.

(5) There should be one set of leave and pension rules for all Civil Engineer officers on the Imperial list recruited under the present regulations.

71,834. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the Employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—It is felt that the European element must largely preponderate to admit of a high standard of efficiency; the number of appointments to the Imperial Service which may at the present time be reserved for Indians is 10 per cent.; this number should, it is considered, not be exceeded at present.

(2) In the interests of efficiency it is felt that the proportion of Imperial Engineers in the service should for the present be not less than 66 per cent.

(3) It is agreed that Engineers of the Imperial and Provincial Services should be borne on the same list, but it is felt that the principle laid down in Article 85 of the Civil Service Regulations is fair and equitable, *i.e.*, that an officer serving in his native land should get only two-thirds of the pay he would draw when working outside his native land. It is an economic fact that imported labour has invariably to be paid more highly than home labour, and there is no reason why India should pay the same for her home-born Engineers as the Secretary of State has to offer to the pick of English Engineers in order to induce them to serve in a foreign and distant clime.

The Englishman serving in India is not working under the same condition as the Indian, inasmuch as he cannot live so cheaply, and is exposed to adverse climatic conditions. He has also to bear the expense of long and expensive journeys home periodically for himself and for his family. Education of his family in England costs considerably more than education in India.

The scale of pay laid down for the Provincial Service is undoubtedly sufficient for the pure Indian, and certainly attracts Indians of high attainments.

71,835. **(VIII.) Relationship to the Indian Civil and other Services.**—The relationship as existing between the Public Works Department and other services in India is satisfactory and should remain unaltered.

71,836. **(IX.) Any other points within the Terms of Reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding Head.**—*Travelling Allowance.*—It is desired to bring to the notice of the Commission the inadequacy of the existing travelling allowance rules in the cases of transfers. It is believed that this question was under the consideration of the Government of India some seven years ago, and would suggest that the question be again considered with a view to the present rules being made more liberal.

General Provident Fund.—The interest on account of a deceased depositor ceases from the date of tender of payment to the person legally entitled to receive the balance at credit of the account. It frequently happens that from inexperience and other causes it is inconvenient to draw the amount immediately on tender of payment being made. It is therefore suggested that it should be permissible for the balance at credit of the account to remain for a reasonable period after tender of payment has been made and to continue to draw interest during that period.

Mr. F. A. A. Cowley called and examined.

71,837. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he was a Superintending Engineer in Bengal, and that this was his 24th year of service. He represented the whole of the European Imperial Engineers in Bengal, and the views in the written statement expressed the opinions of his colleagues.

71,838. The present system of recruitment to the Imperial Service was generally satisfactory, and recruitment should be limited to candidates who had resided at least five years in Europe; but he did not suggest the five years' limitation for the purpose of disqualifying Indians from recruitment in England, because he believed that some Indians who went to England stayed more than five years at the present time. Five years was the lowest period, as the general education would take up one year, three years would be spent at an Engineering College, and one year at practical work. He had no knowledge whether all the Indians now recruited by the Secretary of State had resided in England for five years, but thought the majority of them had not.

71,839. If the present mandatory rule of 10 per cent. for recruitment in England was retained with the limitation he had suggested, he thought in future there would be a chance of obtaining more efficient Indians than were obtained at present. In the course of time more Indians would go to England for their education, and go for longer periods. The Institution of Civil Engineers had laid down a certain minimum which they considered necessary for the technical education of an Engineer, and that minimum was considerably over five years. Three years at a college and one year's practical training were essential. The ordinary Indian's primary education had not been up to the standard of the British school boy, and therefore he required a certain amount of general education before his Engineering College training. He laid importance on candidates possessing degrees recognized by the Institution of Civil Engineers as qualifying for their Associate Membership. At the present time in Bengal there were very few who were A.M.Inst.C.E.'s, and he wanted them all to have the Associate Membership.

71,840. The general idea in the service was that competition would be effective if combined with selection. He was against probation for Imperial Engineers in India, but insisted on a year's practical training in Europe in that branch of engineering which the recruit took an interest in. A man who was fond of mechanical work should go to workshops, one fond of civil engineering should be employed on drainage-works or water-works, and an officer whose bent was building work should be placed under building contractors. He would ask the men to carry out their work in India as they had seen it carried out by contractors at home, subject to the modifications due to local conditions. The year's training should be given to them before selection.

71,841. He favoured a central college in India in order that candidates for the Provincial Service might be trained in this country. They were now trained at Sibpur in the same class as subordinates, and that he regarded as objectionable. For the Provincial Service the candidates should be selected for the college and a qualifying examination should be held. In his written statement he had said that selection should be followed by a competitive examination, but he preferred to substitute for that a qualifying examination. A man would have to satisfy the examiners that he was sufficiently educated to undergo the training given in the college. If there were 50 candidates for 30 appointments the qualifying examination would simply mean that the first 30 men selected would go into the college. It was really competition combined with selection, but he would not make the examination a hard one. Each province would have its own candidates, the college being merely centralised for purposes of economy and efficiency.

71,842. He had no objection to abolishing the titles of Imperial and Provincial, provided the pay of officers was proportionately raised.

71,843. The witness agreed that a foreign service allowance was necessary for Europeans serving in India, but did not admit that this was the only reason for increased pay. A public school education in England followed by a university or college education gave a greater guarantee of obtaining men of character, with administrative integrity and ability and moral courage, than was obtained by the present system of education in India. Therefore the Government obtained a better bargian in the first instance. He would make no distinction whatever between one race and another; if an Indian had had a form of training which produced the necessary qualities he should be eligible for the higher pay. He did not agree with the principle that assuming equality of efficiency the European serving in India should be allowed something of the nature of a foreign allowance on account of the fact that he was serving outside his own country. The pay should be the same for the Imperial Engineer whether Indian or European.

71,844. Some sort of family pension fund should be established which would be acceptable to Government officers. He himself desired to have a family pension fund with a contribution and guarantee from Government in addition to the existing pension fund. He saw no reason why a man should not submit to a compulsory deduction of a percentage of his pay towards the fund. He did not want Government to subsidise the provident fund, which should remain as at present. A man now put so much of his pay into the provident fund and Government gave him 4 per cent.

compound interest on the money. His own proposal was that in addition there should be a family pension fund, such as that in the Indian Civil Service, worked out on an actuarial basis, in order to enable men to make the necessary provision for their wives and families. The provident fund was only a slightly better investment than Government paper.

71,845. Under the present system of salaries and pensions 20 years' service was not too short for optional retirement, and there would be great resentment in the department if the 20 years' rule was abolished. The pension at 25 or 30 years was so low that it was sometimes not worth a man's while to stay on to obtain the small addition to what he would get after 20 years' service. He did not think the 20 years' rule had a tendency to induce the most capable men to leave the service, because men became so wrapped up in their work that often they did not want to leave it. It afforded an opening, however, for a good man to leave, and that no doubt was injurious to the service. He would rather see greater advantages offered to officers to induce them to stay on for the full time.

71,846. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness said he might have applied to become an Associate Member of the Institute of Civil Engineers at the age of 20, when at Coopers Hill, without passing any further examinations.

71,847. With regard to paragraph 71,831 (5) of his statement, the witness said that in Bengal there were two Chief engineers, and he did not see how it was possible to differentiate between their responsibility or their work. The sole difference was that one was a junior man and the other a senior man, and he urged that the number of appointments was so small that the pay should be the same.

71,848. An officer only received at present six-sevenths of the pay he would receive were there no pension to provide for, and Government therefore was retaining one-seventh of his pay. The officers were willing to subscribe any reasonable sum the Government of India asked them to subscribe to a family pension fund. The pension now died with the officer, and therefore Government should contribute something towards the widows and families; and he asked that Government should contribute to the family pension fund as they now contributed towards the Indian Civil Service Fund. He would be perfectly willing to see Government do away with the provident fund and substitute for it a family pension fund, but the retention of the provident fund was not much of a charge on Government. The officers wanted some form of family pension fund whether a contribution was made by Government or not. He would like to see a family pension fund in addition to the present provident fund.

71,849. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) If every candidate for admission to the Imperial Service had passed the examination of the Institute of Civil Engineers or held a diploma carrying the privilege of exemption to that examination, it would prevent influence from outweighing other considerations in selection, and would equalise the provisional qualifications required. It was a fact that some diplomas of the English colleges were much more easily obtained than others.

71,850. High engineering skill was not required to maintain a building or a road, but he was not prepared to admit that there were a good many subdivisional charges in which only that kind of work was performed.

71,851. (*Mr. Madge.*) He saw no objection to placing the key to the door of a public service in the hands of a body like the Institution of Civil Engineers.

71,852. If a temporary Engineer of 35 years of age was brought permanently into the department, he would block promotion and this would create discontent.

71,853. Officers had occasionally asked for permission to visit works, but he did not think any memorial had been placed before Government on the subject of study leave.

71,854. Members of the service would be quite willing to see any deserving officer promoted to any rank for which he was qualified. In Bengal there was no feeling that only European officers of a certain standing should be promoted to high administrative rank.

71,855. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness said that supposing it was decided to dispense with the services of every member of the higher ranks of the engineering staff who was not an Associate of the Institute of Civil Engineers, practically all the Engineers would be affected in Bengal. There was not a single European amongst them who was not qualified at the time of passing out of Coopers Hill to become an Associate Member without further examination, had formal application been made to the Institution. Therefore, the effect of carrying out the proposal would in a great many cases be purely formal.

71,856. Pay in the public services should depend both upon training and upon work. When appointments were originally made, it was impossible to say whether a man was going to turn out an extraordinarily good Engineer or a very bad one; but the English public school and university and college training was such as to give greater guarantees that a man would turn out well, and therefore to some extent the pay ought to depend upon training. On the whole he thought the average English-recruited Engineer was slightly superior to the Indian-recruited Engineer, the technical education in England being on a higher scale. He had not had experience of picked Rurki men, but had had experience of men who had failed to obtain Government appointments.

71,857. (*Mr. Fisher.*) A man who had taken a first-class in the mechanical science tripos at Cambridge would have passed an examination which, though not identical with the examination for the Associate Membership, would be accepted by the Council of Civil Engineers as equivalent, and certainly such a man should be employed in the service. He wanted some assurance that only men were admitted who passed examinations which would be regarded by the Council as equivalent, because his information was that all the degrees referred to in the regulations did not carry with them the privilege of exemption from examination for admission to Associate Membership. The clause at the end of the list of degrees,—"any other degree of a University in the United Kingdom which may hereafter be recognised by the Council of the Institution of Civil Engineers as exempting from passing for Associate Members"—certainly seemed to imply that all the degrees were accepted; but his information was that that was not correct. To become an Associate Member a man must not only have passed the examination for the Associateship, or an examination recognised as equivalent, but must have also had some experience of practical work. In his time that rule did not apply. He admitted that the insistence on the Associate Membership as such might bar the selection of a very brilliant man who has obtained the highest Engineering honours at a university and might also bar a very brilliant young Indian student. He had not said, however, that all officers should be Associate Members but that only degrees recognised by the Institution of Civil Engineers as qualifying for Associate Membership should be accepted.

71,858. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness said that the system of annual increments should not extend to the administrative ranks, because when a man had reached administrative rank he required a certain substantial promotion, as his responsibilities were trebled or quadrupled.

71,859. (*Mr. Green.*) The point he wished to make was that Engineers ought to have a family pension fund which was guaranteed by Government. The Uncovenanted Service Family Pension Fund is not so guaranteed.

71,860. (*Shashi Bhushan Mazumdar.*) The witness did not consider that the fact that practical work in England was carried out by contracting firms by means of labour-saving appliances at all militated against an English training, because labour-saving appliances were being introduced into India at a very rapid rate.

71,861. He did not propose the same responsibilities and the same standard of education for Imperial and Provincial Engineers.

71,862. Privilege leave might be taken without limit, and the same rules should be applicable to Indians and to Europeans.

71,863. The witness said he was fully aware of the heavy expenses entailed upon Indian officers by the family system. He was not aware that Provincial Engineers were frequently earning much less than some of their junior class fellows who entered other departments. His only experience was that of an Executive Engineer and a Collector of a district, and in that case the Executive Engineer was drawing more pay than the Collector. But in this instance the Executive Engineer, although an Indian-trained officer, was an Imperial Engineer.

71,864. There were heavy divisions in Bengal for which European Engineers were more fit, but he did not think it possible to redistribute the divisions so as to make them practically equal. The work to be done in them varied from year to year, one year being light and another year heavy.

71,865. The present scale of travelling allowances on transfer was a crying injustice.

(The witness withdrew.)

Shailendra Nath Banarji, Esq., Under-Secretary to the Government of Bengal in the Irrigation and Railway Branches.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,866. Referring to the statement by the Indian-trained officers of Bengal dated 2nd April 1913, a copy of which is attached hereto (Annexure A, paragraphs 71,874-80), I generally agree with its conclusions. But I would venture to put forward a few personal opinions on the several points raised.

71,867. **(I.) Method of Recruitment.**—The existing method is described in the statement referred to above.

Imperial Service.—I do not consider the present method of recruitment as satisfactory as it used to be before the abolition of the Cooper's Hill College. It is very probable that present recruits from English Colleges get higher training in the mechanical branch of Engineering and are afforded better facilities of seeing extensive engineering works, but the standard of training in Indian Colleges appears to me more suited to what is required of Engineers in the Public Works Department in India. It may be urged that for works requiring special engineering skill, like the construction of the Lower Ganges bridge, the services of specially trained men in English Colleges are required, but it is open to doubt whether for running the formulated routine of the Public Works Department, men with special branches of engineering training are at all indispensable.

I am of opinion that for recruitment from England the present system of selection should be supplemented by a competitive examination between the nominated candidates, this examination being on the lines as suggested later on for the selection of superior engineer officers from India.

Provincial Service.—The present method appears defective for the following reasons:—

(i) Want of open competition from students all over India.

(ii) Want of special training to qualify the candidates for the particular duties they have to discharge in service.

(iii) An uniform method of training to turn out officers and subordinate classes. This is a very serious drawback.

My suggestions for improvement would be as follows:—

(1) Indian Engineering Colleges should have a theoretical and practical course extending over three years to be terminated by a final University examination. The result of this examination will qualify men for the so-called Provincial Service, members of which are proposed to be designated Deputy Engineers (*vide* Annexure A) after one year's practical training.

(2) Out of these passed students a number equivalent to double the number of requirements in the Superior Engineer Service (proposed to be designated "Indian Engineer Service") for the particular year, should be picked up and given a further training of two years in a Central College for all India. The appointment in the Superior Engineer Service should then be made as a result of competition in the final examination of this College. The men so appointed should not require any probationary period, but will have to pass the prescribed Departmental examination within three years of their appointment.

Those who fail to compete in the examination mentioned above should be given preference in appointments in the District Boards, Municipalities and guaranteed Railways.

Regarding the percentage of appointments in the Superior Engineer Service from English and Indian recruits, I would urge that 50 per cent. of the appointments should be from India, and the proportions should gradually increase as conditions change. The Commission of 1886 was appointed to devise a scheme for doing full justice to the claims of natives of India to higher and more extensive employment in the public service. The Government of India have always held that it is necessary to throw open a larger number of appointments to Indians in order to redeem to the utmost extent the pledges of the British Government to employ natives in the several departments in the service of the State. The outcome of the recommendation of the Commission was quite the reverse, and the number, pay and prospects of the higher Engineering appointments were substantially reduced instead of being increased as was anticipated. A retrograde policy like this may be guarded against.

71,868. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—This has already been dealt within paragraph 71,867. I would now like to add the following. One year's probationary period in England to qualify for the superior Engineer Service has been suggested in the memorandum by the Indian-trained Engineers of Bengal. But I am doubtful whether this is indispensable. Although caste prejudices in this country are gradually but very slowly dying away, it would be a considerably long period before the shackles are entirely cast off. And I am sure that the idea of a voyage to England will seriously hamper the progress of a very intelligent section of orthodox Indians in their attempt to achieve an Engineering career in the service of Government, and perhaps the State will lose some very capable Engineers of talent owing to this barrier being put in.

71,869. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—I fully agree with the observations made under this subhead in the memorandum attached (paragraph 71,876).

71,870. **(IV.) and (V.) Conditions of Salary and Leave.**—I have no fresh observations to make except what I said about leave in my memorandum dated 20th February 1913 (Annexure B—paragraph 71,883).

71,871. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—I would add the following. With the reorganisation of pay and prospects of every branch of service, the Exchange Compensation allowances have ceased. But these allowances in case of pensions drawn have not been discontinued in the case of European officers, thus giving them a higher rate of pension than drawn by an Indian officer for the same amount. There ought to be uniformity in this.

I do not agree to any difference being made in the scale of pension drawn as suggested in paragraph 71,879, and would urge that it should be the same for European and Indian.

71,872. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the Employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—I fully concur with the observations made in the memorandum attached. I would, however, add the following. As urged before, the department should be recruited half from England and half from India. In both these cases, the recruitments should be open to all British subjects equally, irrespective of domicile, caste, colour or creed.

The division of the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial sections has been anything but a success, and has created constant heart-burning among the Provincial officers, who do exactly the same work and bear precisely the same responsibilities as their Imperial brothers. This is not at all analogous to the Civil Service, where the Imperial and Provincial people have altogether different duties to perform. This division of services in the Public Works Department has intensely been resented, and has already resulted in splitting up the whole Public Works Department into two hostile camps, and this must greatly injure efficiency.

It is only proper and just that same value has to be paid for the same type of work, and it should be no consideration that a certain class of workmen may have greater individual needs. The remuneration of the Justices of the High Court and Members of the Executive Council of His Excellency the Governor afford excellent examples of the spirit of Government in this matter. Again, there are examples of English-trained Engineers who, article for article, compare unfavourably with the average Indian-trained Engineers in the matter of efficiency. It is, therefore, urged that the differentiation which is illogical and unjust should be obliterated and extinguished and that the Indian Colleges should be restored to the position they formerly occupied when the training imparted in them was as fruitful as to turn out half a dozen of Chief Engineers and several administrative officers.

71,873. **(VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—I am not quite sure whether the relations between the Public Works Department and the Civil Service do not admit of improvements. As an Indian member of the former service I can say this much from personal experience.

It would, I think, not be out of place to mention here that I have had occasion to feel the want of proper recognition by the Civil officers.

ANNEXURE A.

Memorandum dated the 2nd April 1913, by the Indian-trained Engineer Officers of Bengal.

71,874. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—In Bengal the system of recruitment of Indians and Indian-trained Engineers is as below:—

A.—Imperial Engineers.—Indians appointed by the Secretary of State by nomination from England beginning on Rs. 380 and on the same conditions as Europeans except leave and pension rules. The maximum number of Indians so appointed is limited to 10 per cent. of the total number of appointments made by the Secretary of State. The numbers of officers so appointed in Bengal and the three other Provinces of Bihar and Orissa, Assam and Burma, since the rules came into operation five years ago, compared with the total of officers so appointed, are—

	Number of Indians.	Total number of officers appointed.
Bengal	Nil	9
Bihar and Orissa ...	1	7
Assam	1	5
Burma	Nil	19
Total	2	40

The statement shows that only 5 per cent. has been appointed, though the permissible limit, 10 per cent., in itself was small enough. The number of Indians appointed by the Secretary of State was small enough. The number of Indians appointed by the Secretary of State should be increased, and the limitation of 10 per cent. is too small and it should be raised to 50 per cent. The method of selection of candidates by nomination is not considered satisfactory. Selections should be made by an open competitive examination as in the case of the Indian Civil Service.

B.—Provincial Engineers.—(1) One appointment every year from the Sibpur College. This selection is made from Engineering graduates of the Calcutta University. After graduating, the candidate undergoes a year's practical training in the Department and a second year's apprenticeship and is then appointed on Rs. 250.

(2) One in alternate years selected from deserving upper subordinates. The Provincial Service was introduced to throw open a larger number of the less important appointments to Indians as recommended by the Public Service Commission of 1886. The exact way in which this will be effected was not noted, but it appears that it was probable that the intention of the Commission was to introduce a Provincial Engineer Service analogous to the Provincial Civil Service. The Service introduced is quite different. The Provincial Engineers serve side by side with Imperial Engineers with the same responsible duties, except that the pay is less. This system has created great dissatisfaction, particularly at the present time, when the conditions of education in India and in England are equal, the advantage in favour of European education referred to in 1886 having disappeared now. A comparison of the syllabus of study undergone by the Calcutta graduate will show his advantage over the candidates eligible for nomination for the Secretary of State's appointments, except that the after-College training in certain branches in England is superior, the opportunities of studying Engineering works of higher order being greater. The efficiency of the Indian training is also proved by the fact that just at present three of the ablest Chief Engineers are from Indian Colleges. It is, therefore, urged that all appointments to the superior Engineering Service should be on the same pay, whether appointed in England or in India, and the Provincial Service abolished. It has been felt by the existing Provincial Engineers that from the small pay it is difficult for them to maintain their position in society commensurate with their rank. In the Indian Civil Service the pay is high and a Statutary Service $\frac{3}{4}$rd pay was possible, but the pay of Engineers being much smaller, a reduction of $\frac{1}{3}$rd of pay slices off funds for necessities.

Coming next to the question of the number of Indians appointed, it will be seen that in 1886 the cadre of Engineers was—

India	834
Madras	87
Bombay	94
Total	1,015

Barring special appointments, it was then calculated that 30 Engineers' appointments will be necessary. The Government of India decided that these 30 appointments should be alloted to—

Royal Engineers	6
Cooper's Hill Engineers	15
Indian College Engineers	9
Total	30

That is to provide ultimately $\frac{30}{100}$ × 1,015 or 303 Indian-trained Engineers. The cadre has increased since 1886, and the rules for recruitment have been in operation for 27 years, but the number of appointments of Indian Engineers is now only about 250, which shows that in this case also the permissible minimum has not been worked up to. The number of Royal Engineers recruited have been reduced and Cooper's Hill College abolished; at the same time training in India has improved. It is, therefore, very desirable that a larger percentage of appointments be thrown open to Indian-trained Engineers than in the past. The number we propose are based on the following rough figures. The cadre of regular Engineers is now assumed to be 1,050. This number should be reduced to, say, 1,000 by a redistribution of charges which can be effected if all the subdivisions are manned by graduate Engineers (trained in Indian State Colleges) of the Deputy Engineer class which we propose later on. The Executive Engineers will be relieved of going into minute details which they have to do now in case where a less qualified man is in charge, as it is in some cases at present, and their jurisdiction can then be increased. Of the remaining 1,000 appointments, 100 of the less important charges

may be listed for deserving members of the proposed Deputy Engineer class, the balance of 900 to be regular Engineers of the superior service. It would be fair to reserve 50 per cent. of these appointments for Indian-trained Engineers, this being on the basis of redistribution which was the intention of the Government of India, except that the number allotted for Royal Engineers, who are not appointed now, being given to Indian College students, the number being 9+6 or 15 out of a total of 30 annual appointments. This would mean 450 appointments for Indian College men, and for this ultimate number 450 × $\frac{3}{80}$ or 17 appointments will be thrown open to them annually. The number may be distributed as below:—

Bengal (Sibpur College)	4 (Provinces of Bengal, Assam, Bihar and Orissa and Burma.)
Bombay (Poona College)	3 Bombay.
Madras (Madras Engineering College.)	3 Madras.
Punjab (Rurki)... ...	4 (United Provinces, Central Provinces, Punjab and Railways.)

The remaining three will be reserved for promotion from the proposed Deputy Engineer service. These three total service appointments will afford six appointments being made, as officers will only be selected at about the 16th year of their service, when they have proved their exceptional abilities. These six appointments may be distributed as under:—

Bengal	1
Bombay	1
Madras	1
Punjab and United Provinces ...	1
Bihar and Orissa and Assam	1
Burma and Central Provinces ...	1
Total	6

A saving in establishment charges will thus be effected by a reduction of 15 per cent. of the superior appointments, replacing them by Deputy Engineers on a smaller pay. A saving will also be effected by the replacement of a number of Europeans by Indians in the superior service, on account of the comparatively stringent leave and pension rules and allowances of the latter class. The maintenance of a large European element in the Technical Departments (such as Public Works, Railway, Forest, Telegraph, Medical, etc.) is not demanded for political considerations. In the Medical and other services it has been urged that a war reserve is necessary and Europeans cannot be replaced. In the Public Works Department this even is not necessary, and it is therefore the only department in which a large number of Indians may be appointed without loss of efficiency, and we therefore strongly urge that a substantial larger number of appointments be thrown open to Indians than hitherto.

The selection of this number of Indian-trained Engineers may be by a competitive examination, if possible. If not, these appointments will be made from the results of the final College tests.

The name of the service may in future be the "Indian Engineering Service."

Deputy Engineers.—The proposed class of Deputy Engineers should be recruited solely from passed students of the State-maintained Colleges and no promotion be made to this class from any section where the men are not highly qualified.

Overseers.—The recruitment to this proposed class to replace the lower subordinate class should be from candidates who have passed the Overseer examination of the Technical Board as far as available, the balance being taken up from candidates who have passed the Sub-Overseer's examination after they have completed their practical training.

71,875. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—*Engineers.*—The appointments for Indian Colleges will be on probation directly they graduate, candidates being selected in the order of merit in a competitive examination, or if that be not feasible, by the results of the final examination. One year's practical training in England would be desirable and should be insisted on, and this would be in the probationary period. An allowance of £15 per month *plus* passage from and to India to be given to the probationer and he will be appointed as Assistant Engineer on Rs. 380 on production of a certificate of undergoing this practical training as in the case of Engineers appointed by the Secretary of State. No further departmental test should be made, as under the present system, which is undesirable as the higher qualifications are placed at a discount in the hurried test in minor and less important subjects. This is not the real guide to the test of an Engineer of higher qualifications. If necessary, further practical examinations may be introduced in the College course, though the latter, we presume, will not be necessary, as the University Act of 1904 now provides these, and candidates for 1912 onwards have passed through this standard.

The age at which a Sibpur College student now qualifies for service is very advanced. It is desirable to reduce this and we append a note to this memorandum showing what it works up to now and what we propose.

Deputy Engineers.—These officers should be appointed after undergoing a year's approved practical training in India, Public Works Department, after graduating. An allowance of Rs. 100 per month will be given to them during the probationary period, they being confirmed in the 6th grade at the end of this term. No difference in the scale of allowances should be made as at present between Europeans and Indians, as this distinction in the beginning of a young man's career has a very deleterious influence, creating a feeling a diffidence and inferiority. A further care is necessary to secure that they are not huddled up with the non-qualified Overseer passed students as at present. No further departmental test should be made for selection for the same reasons as given for Engineers.

Overseers.—The present system is satisfactory and should be maintained except that they should not be put in practical training together with the graduate students. Deserving senior Overseers will be promoted to the Deputy Engineer class on the supernumerary list with honorary rank.

71,876. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—The superior Engineering service should be the same and no distinction made between Indians and Europeans. The existing Provincial Service should be abolished as already urged above.

For the larger number of highly qualified Engineering graduates turned out from the State Colleges, the introduction of a suitable service is necessary. At present those that fail to secure appointment as an Engineer are appointed as upper subordinates. The nomenclature is unhappy at present as the majority of these men are now graduates who have undergone a very complete and stiff course of study in a scientific subject. The last Public Service Commission recommended a Provincial Engineering service for less important posts. We presume the intention was to introduce a service which would be in its relation to the Engineer Service as the Provincial Civil Service is to the Indian Civil Service. This should be adopted and a Deputy Engineer Service introduced to replace the existing Upper Subordinate Service. The course of study undergone by an Engineering graduate is far more difficult and extends over a longer period than that of a candidate for the Provincial Civil Service. The status and pay of the Deputy Engineer Service should therefore be analogous to those of the Provincial Civil Service officers.

The existing lower subordinate class should be abolished for similar reasons, the course of study now undergone by them having been thoroughly improved. This class should be replaced by "Overseers" as proposed.

71,877. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—For Engineer officers no difference; the pay as at present.

For Deputy Engineers to replace present upper subordinates, the service will be manned by Engineering graduates, who are highly qualified. The present ones have proved to be a very efficient set of officers who have raised the prestige of the service. The

examination of the records of any office will show that the intricate calculations and estimates of important projects are mostly prepared by this section of useful Government servants. Their pay is, *primâ facie*, inadequate and there is naturally a dissatisfaction. This has been recognised by Government, but the remedy proposed by some officers was worse than the disease. It was, that the College which turns out these highly qualified men be abolished. As Government does not and cannot accept this view, the College has to continue. It is necessary, therefore, to increase the pay and prospects of this body a little higher and we propose the following scale. The present rates of pay for this as also of the lower subordinate class was fixed long ago, and though the pay of the superior Engineers has been increased in the meantime, and stagnation of promotion removed, nothing has been done for this needy class:—

	Pay per month.	Percentage of appointments to total cadre.
	Rs.	
1st	500	20
2nd	400	20
3rd	300	15
4th	250	15
5th	200	15
6th	150	15

Of late graduates have not been eager to accept these appointments owing to rise in prices, which precludes anyone entering on the pay now offered, but with the increased pay as proposed they will be induced to do so. With these efficient and reliable officers of higher moral tone in charge of subdivisions, the Executive Engineer will find relief and be able in his turn to hold bigger charges. At present the promotion of upper subordinates is slow, and this has been further retarded by appointments from time to time of outsiders to the higher grades. This should be stopped, save in very exceptional cases.

One hundred listed appointments as Executive Engineers to be reserved for the senior Deputy Engineers, and six appointments made annually to the Indian Engineer Service from Deputy Engineers of proved ability.

Deputy Engineers in charge of subdivisions should be allowed rent-free quarters as in the case of Provincial Civil Service officers in charge of subdivisions.

Overseers.—This service is proposed to replace the present lower subordinate class as already noted above. The standard of education of subordinates employed has risen much higher since the service was introduced. The cost of living has increased in the meantime about 100 per cent. The Government of Bengal have considered the question of raising their pay, and in Bengal Government Resolution No. 1670 E., of the 30th May, 1910, a number of appointments as Overseer, 3rd grade, has been reserved for the students who have passed the Overseership examination of the Joint Technical Board. This has not been found to be a remedy, rather the reverse, as it has only created dissatisfaction amongst graduates with whom they are trained on equal terms and then examined in simple practical tests in minor subjects, simply because the Overseer students are innocent of the higher subjects. The bulk of the passed students has to enter on Rs. 40 and finish their career on Rs. 70 per month. The promotion is very slow. It is not possible to live on this pay at the prevailing high prices for a married subordinate, who has in a transferable service to live away from a cheap joint family, and also to do touring work entailing a double set of servants. It may be possible for a year or two to do so living without one's family with him, in fact leaving them to be maintained by other relatives, but this arrangement cannot continue for long. The result is that the honest and good leave the service, and the undesirables stick on. The temptations to a Public Works subordinate are as manifold as in the Police, and as has been accepted for the latter Department, the pay and prospects of the lower subordinate require an increase, if the moral tone is to be improved to the interests of Government. We would, therefore, propose that the present lower subordinate establishment be replaced by "Overseers" and the pay fixed as below:—

	Proposed pay per month.	Percentage of appointments to total cadre.
	Rs.	
1st	100	10
2nd	85	15
3rd	70	15
4th	60	20
5th	55	20
6th	50	20

Two special increments of Rs. 10 each may be given to deserving men of the 1st grade.

Deserving subordinates of exceptional ability to be promoted to Deputy Engineer grade to the extent of 5 per cent. of the appointments of Deputy Engineers.

Free quarters should be provided to these officers, and where no Government quarters are provided, a suitable house-rent allowance to be given. At present free quarters are provided in many cases, and this proposal will not increase the cost much.

The conveyance allowance of the Upper and Lower Subordinate Services requires revision owing to enormous rise in wages and prices of food stuffs. Rupees 15 monthly for the upkeep of a pony, as now allowed, is insufficient.

The daily allowance of officers of the Engineer Department should be increased by 50 per cent.

71,878. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—For short leave and leave on urgent private affairs, the rules, which are the same in case of Europeans, are fair, but the latter leave may be granted to Indians in instalments. As regards furlough, the proposal now under consideration of the Government of India will suit, except that the proportion of furlough should be one-fifth of service as against one-fourth in case of Europeans to enable the full amount of five years' leave being enjoyed in a service of 30 years.

Study leave to Europe, Egypt and America should be allowed to Indians on favourable terms to encourage them to visit Engineering works in those countries. Such leave to be on three-fourths of pay, subject to a maximum of £40 per month and a minimum of £25 per month. It should preferably extend to four months at a time at intervals of not less than six years. Not more than two such leave should be allowed to an officer in his total service. A report of works visited by him to be furnished to Government.

The Department has been deprived of the privilege of leaving head-quarters on holidays under the Negotiable Instruments Act. This privilege should be allowed to officers of the Public Works Department as far as possible. Even the Magistrates and District Judges are allowed to go away during Christmas and Puja holidays, making temporary arrangements for urgent work, but the Public Works Department is the only Department from which the privilege has been withheld.

71,879. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—Pension of Indian Engineers and subordinates to be on the same graduated scale as for European officers, except that the fraction in the case of Indians to be reduced to $\frac{30}{60}$ths, etc., instead of $\frac{30}{60}$ths, etc., as in the case of Europeans. The maximum limit of pension to be raised from Rs. 5,000 to Rs. 7,000 a year. Our reason for these suggestions are—

(1) The average life of Indians, particularly people of Bengal, is shorter than that of Europeans.

(2) Indian-trained Engineers, specially Sibpur College men, enter service at a more advanced age than Europeans. This is due to the inordinately long course of study which extends to five years after the intermediate Engineering examination.

(3) Indian service leave rules being stringent such officers have to stay on actual duty, foregoing the advantages of recouping their health.

(4) Long leave of Indian officers being usually spent in India, the service counting towards pension is much less than that for Europeans of the same record of service.

(5) Indian officers of the Engineer Service are fast adopting semi-European mode of living. This, com-

bined with the demands of an Indian society, in the way of maintaining a large circle of relatives and to find funds for heavy marriage dowries for their children; these combined with the general higher standard of living, run up the total cost of keeping up appearances of a retired officer very high.

Article 649, Civil Service Regulations, regarding the retiring of an Executive Engineer at the age of 50, if he has not attained the rank of a Superintending Engineer, should be abolished, particularly in case of officers promoted from the Deputy Engineer grade.

71,880. **(VII.) Limitation for Employment of Indians.**—The maximum limit of 10 per cent. of appointments by the Secretary of State should be raised to 50 per cent. The low limit was put as it was anticipated that the Department will be swamped by Indians otherwise. Experience shows now that these apprehensions are groundless. About half the number of officers appointed from Indian Colleges, as shown in the Classified List, are Europeans. If the limit of Indians for Secretary of State's appointment is raised to 50, then there will be 50 per cent. of Indians from England and 50 per cent. in India. The number of Indians in the total list will not be therefore more than 50 per cent.

Indian graduates who have specially qualified in special branches of Engineering, such as Electrical and Mining, should be appointed in the Government departments where non-qualified Europeans are now employed. The Electrical Departments of the Local Governments now employ a good number of such officers.

Europeans, indifferently qualified, are employed on Railways in which Government can force a control as these Railways are guaranteed, and they should not employ non-qualified Europeans on a higher pay in preference to qualified Indians who are less costly. This requires the serious consideration of the Government of India as an army of Engineers may be suitably employed on Railways. Indian Engineers have proved their ability and usefulness in the Eastern Bengal State Railway.

For the Engineering Service, it is necessary that Government should make stringent rules for appointment of all the superior Engineers and subordinates in all District Boards and Municipalities, from qualified students of the State-maintained Colleges. Europeans who have qualified to any degree find ready employment in the guaranteed Railways and private Engineering firms which are now mostly owned by Europeans; it is, therefore, very necessary that qualified Indian students from Indian Colleges should receive preference in any department where Government has any hand in the selection. No Engineer's post on a pay of Rs. 200 or above in Bengal, Burma, Bihar and Orissa and Assam should be filled in unless he is an Engineering graduate of the Calcutta, Bombay, or Madras University or had passed the final Rurki Engineering Examination.

71,881. **(VIII.) Relations with the Civil Service.**—Only lately, with the creation of a Governorship in Bengal, the Engineering portfolio has been put in charge of a member of the Civil Service. The arrangement or disposal of business is not known to members of the Public Works Department, but they would suggest that the position of the professional head of the Department is made clear on the point of dealing with technical matters and works.

71,882. *NOTE REFERRED TO IN ANNEXURE A.*

From the Classified List it will be seen that Europeans were appointed at a much earlier age than those recruited from the Indian Colleges, thus a very valuable portion of the lives of the latter officers is spent in the Colleges as well as in training, which could be much better utilized in the service to the best interests of both the Government and the officers concerned. This is not due to any intellectual deficiency on the part of the Indian students, but to the standard required for admission into the Indian Engineering Colleges, as well as the lengthy periods of College course and practical training. A comparison of the systems that obtained in the late Coopers Hill College in England with that of the Sibpur Engineering College in Bengal will show clearly the vast difference in the two systems. To enter Coopers Hill College a student is required to pass a preliminary test. He is then admitted into the College, and on passing the final examination after three years he is appointed to the Public Works Department, India, as Assistant Engineer on Rs. 380. If the students entered at 18 or 19, they got Government appointment generally at the age of 21 or 22. In Sibpur Engineering College in Bengal the minimum educational qualifications for admission as a regular student are that a candidate shall have passed (*a*) Intermediate Examination in Science or Arts of the Calcutta University in English, Mathematics, Physics or Chemistry and (*b*) pass such special test in drawing as may be prescribed from time to time by the Principal; such a candidate must be under 21 years of age. Under the present University Regulations, the minimum age of a student at the time of his admission into the College will be about 19 years. He enters College in the month of July. The College course is for four years with an intermediate University examination at the end of the second year.

The final B.E. Examination is usually held in July. Then the passed students commence a year's practical training under some Public Works Department Engineers some time in the following October. Then after completion of the year's training another examination is held at Purulia in the month of November, and the successful candidate is appointed as Apprentice Engineer in the Provincial Service, some time in January or February. Thus it will be seen that even a very meritorious student, who successfully passes every examination at the first chance, will take nearly six years from the date of entering the College to get an appointment in the Public Works Department, Bengal, as an Apprentice Engineer on Rs. 100. After the probationary period of one year as Apprentice Engineer he is promoted to the Assistant Engineers' grade on Rs. 250, if he succeeds in obtaining a favourable report from his Executive Engineer. The above will show how handicapped an Indian Engineer is, in his official career, compared with his European brother officer. The result is that an Indian Engineer commencing service at the age of 25 or 26 on the lowest pay of Rs. 100 becomes superannuated before his time comes for the higher administrative posts.

Thus it is clear that the fact that only a few Indian Engineers have been able to rise to the administrative rank during the last 50 years is not, in many cases, due to any fault of the officers, but to that of the system of recruitment. It is also disadvantageous to Government, as they get on an average of about 28 years' service from its Indian College Engineers against about 32 from Europeans. Besides, the Government takes Indian-trained men into its service, when a considerable portion of their energies was used up in passing a number of stiff and unnecessarily rigorous tests and examinations. It is, therefore, very necessary that the system of recruitment should be thoroughly changed and simplified according to that followed in Cooper's Hill for so many years with such good results. It would not be out of place here to mention that the rules framed for the proposed Dacca Engineering College in connection with the Dacca University Scheme will make matters much worse. The minimum educational qualification for admission is that the student must pass the I.Sc. Examination. Then the College course is for four years, and then practical training for three years. So a student will be about 27 before he can expect Government appointment.

We would therefore propose that age-limit for admission may be fixed at 19. The minimum educational qualification required for admission will be the passing of the Matriculation in the First Division. With better prospects for the passed students of the Engineering College, there will be a very large number of applications from very meritorious students for admission into the College and the Principal will be able to pick up the best students from the top of the list prepared according to their marks in Mathematics and half the number they obtained in English. Of course each student should produce a health certificate from the College Surgeon and a certificate of good character from the Head Master of his school.

The College course may advantageously be fixed for four years, during which the students should be given both theoretical and practical training in all the branches. The University examination that will be held at the end of the fourth year should also be both theoretical and practical. On the results of this examination, the appointments to the Public Works Department should be made without any further practical training or practical examination. We may also note that facilities should be afforded to the students while in the College to learn riding and cycling, and certificate from the Principal to the effect that the student can ride and cycle will be required before he is allowed to appear at the final examination at the end of the fourth year. The probationary year of the Indian College Engineers may advantageously be passed in England, where they can see large and important Engineering works. By the proposed system we are sure that the Government will find in these new recruits highly trained men both in theory and practice, full of youthful vigour and energy which, with a few years' experience and mature judgment, will make them very valuable and useful officers. These officers will be able to render useful service for a much longer period than at present.

ANNEXURE B.

71,883. *Note by Mr. S. N. Banarji, Under-Secretary, Irrigation Branch, dated the 20th February* 1913.

(1) I am not sure whether the proposed rules do not require much more simplification. These rules are to be applied by petty offices as well, and unless these are framed in the simplest manner possible, difficulties in application may occur.

(2) I would suggest that the amount of furlough earned be one-fifth of active service in order that the limitation to five years can be taken advantage of in a service of average length. Under the one-sixth proportion rule, an officer whose services will extend over a period of 35 years will be able to earn this. Under the rules for European services where the proportion is fixed at one-fourth and the total leave allowed is six years, an officer will be able to enjoy this maximum in a service of 30 years. To enable officers under Indian rules to avail themselves of the maximum of five years in their case in 30 years, the proportion of furlough would have to be put at one-fifth of active service. This latter proportion, I would venture to submit, would be fair.

To simplify matters still more, I would suggest as an alternative one-sixth of total service (not active service). In case of Indian service rules, the term furlough "due" has not been defined. It is presumed that furlough "due" is furlough earned, deducted by ordinary furlough availed, except furlough on medical certificate under proposed Article 320A. This point may be made clear in the rules, as without this there may be a misapprehension that an officer who had the misfortune to be compelled to take leave on medical certificate at the earlier stage of his service will have to work off the leave taken from the furlough which he will earn from active service. I am confident that the intentions of the Government are not to withdraw former privileges, and have therefore mentioned this point with a view that the point may be made clear by a sub-clause. In India the bulk of the Government servants who draw less than Rs. 500 per month cannot afford to take long leave on half-pay and they avail themselves generally when they are incapacitated through ill-health. The provision of three years' sick leave allowable under the old rules, irrespective of the furlough earned, was necessary, and it is presumed that this privilege will not be withdrawn.

(3) If there is no objection, leave on urgent private affairs may be allowed to officers under Indian service leave rules in instalments instead of six months at a time. In case of European officers, the journey to England and back to Bombay takes up about five weeks and is an expensive one; a minimum of six months at a time is necessary in such a case. In case of Indian officers a shorter time will suffice, but being near at hand the occasions for such leave are more frequent. The privilege of taking the leave under proposed rule 321 in instalments will therefore be a great advantage. At the same time, the interests of the service will also be better protected in such a case, as an Indian officer will take the full period of six months if he knows he will not get the balance at a future period, though he may not usually require more than half of it, thus dislocating the work for a longer period, which will otherwise be avoided. Then, again, he may not avail himself of the balance due at all. In fact, it will be an inducement to officers not to take a larger length of leave on urgent private affairs than is urgently necessary.

Mr. S. N. Banarji called and examined.

71,884. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he occupied the position of Under-Secretary to Government in the Irrigation Branch and represented the Provincial Engineers of the Public Works Department in Bengal, 11 in all. He was recruited to the service nine years ago from the Sibpur College. He differed from his colleagues* with regard to certain points in the written statement.

71,885. He agreed that 50 per cent. of the superior service should be recruited in England and 50 per cent. in India, and he proposed the abolition of the distinction between Imperial and Provincial. The proposed Deputy Engineers should take the place of the present Upper Subordinate Service in the sub-divisions. Officers of the superior service would fill some of the sub-divisions as Assistant Engineers. The number of Assistant Engineers would be fixed in accordance with the number of superior vacancies. There should be sufficient assistants in training for superior posts.

71,886. The witness did not agree with the written statement that the age for the admission of candidates to Engineering Colleges should be 19. He thought 17 would be the proper age for admission into an Engineering College. He was in favour of a central college, but desired to restrict it to men in training for the Imperial Service. For the proposed Deputy Engineer Service he suggested Provincial colleges in various provinces. Under his scheme the course for the new class of Deputy Engineers would be three years and for the superior service five years.

71,887. He differed from the view held by his colleagues, because he was in favour of open competition throughout the country, so that men from all the provinces would have a chance of showing their abilities. In the central college there would be an open examination for all India, with no selection. Those who came out at the top of the list, irrespective of the provinces from which they came, should be given appointments in the various provinces. After the results were published an endeavour might be made to allot successful candidates to their own provinces, but if this was not possible he did not think it would matter very much, and it would not cause dissatisfaction if men of one province were appointed to another province. He was in favour of direct recruitment to the superior service, but would reserve a certain number of posts for promoted officers.

71,888. He did not agree that a year's training in England should be given to candidates recruited in India, as this would deter some people from entering the service. If it was decided that a year's training in England was necessary, he would not make it compulsory, but would arrange for it by means of study leave. For Indian engineering purposes there was not much to be gained by going to England.

71,889. He saw no reason for paying the European something in the nature of a compensation allowance for serving out of his own country, but he had no

* 'Colleagues' here means and includes all the Indian college-trained Engineers of Bengal, in which there are a good many Imperial officers as well. The joint written statement was a result of their combined deliberation.

objection to such an allowance so long as the pay *plus* allowance did not exceed the pay of the Indian recruited in India. A European could only expect a foreign allowance over and above what he would receive in England, but not beyond the average of the standard pay of India. He would not himself be prepared to serve in England for the same salary as he would receive in India, but if he found that the standard pay in the service in England was more than it was in India, he should accept that pay and would not demand any foreign allowance. He quite agreed with the general principle that when an officer served out of his own country he should receive a higher salary, and that principle would be regarded as reasonable by Indians if it was made universal throughout the services.

71,890. He was not prepared to accept the opinion expressed by his colleagues that preferential terms of pension should be given to non-domiciled Europeans. Throughout the service the responsibilities were the same, and the Indian remaining in his own country had to maintain the same social status, even after retirement, while the European could return to England and live on a lower status than maintained in India.

71,891. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He entered the college at the age of 19 and found his work at Sibpur College of value: the examinations at the college were not quite easy. The present course at the college lasted about two years longer than the Rurki course and a higher standard of university training was required for admission to Sibpur, he himself having passed the B.A. By lowering the qualifications for entrance to Sibpur just as good Engineers would be obtained, as the earlier a man started the more energy he had. Had he been admitted earlier to Sibpur he would have gone through the examinations with the same degree of ease.

71,892. (*Mr. Madge.*) The witness considered that the education imparted in England was on different lines from that given in India. In England men were educated in workshops, sea protective works, sewage works, etc., whilst in India they were educated in irrigation, canals, navigation works, and so on, and the colleges in India were more suited to education in those subjects. It would be wise to aim at raising the Indian colleges to the highest standard possible in accordance with Indian requirements and Indian conditions.

71,893. With regard to the remark in the written statement that those who failed to compete in the examination should be given preference in appointments to district boards, municipalities, and guaranteed railways, the witness said his proposal was that if there were five vacancies in the Public Works Department ten men should be nominated and top five of them selected by a competitive examination for the Public Works Department; the other five would be taken by district boards, etc. Local Governments would no doubt be glad to give preference to men who had had a very high engineering training. He did not think the method would interfere with the powers of local self-government.

71,894. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Of late, designs for bridges had been obtained from England in one or two instances. For the Sara Bridge, he understood both designs and materials came from England. The principal work of his department was in connection with roads, buildings, bungalows, etc., but certain irrigation and drainage schemes had to be drawn out. Two new canals had been built in Bengal during the last few years, and he had been employed upon their construction with other Indian-trained Engineers.

71,895. The service would not be satisfied unless it had the same pay, pension, leave, and conditions for men doing the same class of work.

71,896. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness said his knowledge with regard to the designers of bridges was rather limited, as he only knew of two instances. The general supervision of the work and the preparation of the designs were in the hands of Engineers in India.

71,897. He did not believe in the value of European training for Engineers for Indian work. The training at Sibpur was quite sufficient with one or two slight modifications. Although he objected to the present arrangement under which subordinates were trained with men who received Provincial appointments, under the system he proposed for the first three years the subordinates would all be trained with the men intended for the superior Engineer Service, but it would be found there was really a difference of training at the end.

71,898. (*Mr. Green.*) The foreign allowance should be given so as to make the pay for the European in India above what would be received in England, but not above the standard in India. His information was that Europeans would obtain less pay if they remained in England.

71,899. (*Shashi Bhusan Mazumdar.*) He knew of a large number of Bengalis who had taken to engineering as a profession and were managing their own businesses as engineers. Indian engineers after retirement from the service often engaged in active practice, and he had never accepted the statement that the Bengali had not an aptitude for the engineering profession.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Calcutta, Tuesday 6th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, ESQ., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, ESQ.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, ESQ., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, ESQ., C.S.I.

HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, ESQ.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

H. H. GREEN, ESQ., Superintending Engineer, Bengal.
SHASHI BHUSHAN MAZUMDAR, ESQ., Executive Engineer, Bengal.
W. McM. SWEET, ESQ., Chief Engineer, Assam.
H. WATKINS, ESQ., Assistant Engineer, Assam.

R. R. SCOTT, ESQ. (*Joint Secretary*).

RAI BAHADUR ANNADA PRASAD SARKAR, Superintending Engineer, Bengal (retired).

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,900. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—*Imperial Engineers recruited in England.*—The present system of selection by a Committee should be substituted by a competitive examination in England. In my opinion all Engineer Officers from Assistant Enginer and upwards, whether European or Indian, should be Imperial Engineers, and their recruitemnt should be both from England and from the Indian Colleges, as was the case before the introduction of the Provincial Service in 1882. The present Provincial Service

should be remodelled and placed on a footing similar to that of the Provincial Civil and Judicial Services, for reasons enumerated under the item III (conditions of service).

71,901. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—*For Engineers.*—The system of training that now obtains in Bengal seems to be defective and disadvantageous both to Government and the candidates, and the tests and examinations appear to be unnecessarily rigorous. In the Sibpur Engineering College the minimum educational qualifications for admission as a regular student are that a candidate shall have passed (*a*) Intermediate Examination in Science or Arts of the Calcutta University in English, Mathematics, Physics or Chemistry, and (*b*) pass such special test in drawing as may be prescribed from time to time by the Principal; such a candidate must be under 21 years of age. Under the present University Regulations the minimum age of a student at the time of his admission into the College will be about 19 years. He enters the College in the month of July. The College course is for four years, with an intermediate University examination at the end of the second year.

The final B. E. Examination is usually held in July. Then the passed students commence a year's practical training under some Public Works Department Engineers some time in the following October. Then after completion of the year's training another examination is held at Purulia in the month of November, and the successful candidate is appointed as Apprentice Engineer in the Provincial Service some time in January or February. Thus it will be seen that even a very meritorious student, who successfully passes every examination at the first chance, will take nearly six years from the date of entering the College to get an appointment in Public Works Department, Bengal, as an Apprentice Engineer on Rs. 100. After the probationary period of one year as Apprentice Engineer, he is promoted to the Assistant Engineer's grade on Rs. 250 if he succeeds in obtaining a favourable report from his Executive Engineer. The result is that an Indian Engineer commencing service at the age of 25 or 26 on the lowest pay of Rs. 100 becomes superannuated before his time comes for the higher administrative posts.

It is also disadvantageous to Government, as they get on an average of about 28 years' service from its Indian College Engineers, against about 32 from Europeans. Besides, the Government takes Indian-trained men into its service, when a considerable portion of their energies was used up in passing a number of stiff and unnecessarily rigorous tests and examinations. It is, therefore, very necessary that the system of recruitment should be thoroughly changed and simplified. It would not be out of place here to mention that the rules framed for the proposed Dacca Engineering College in connection with the Dacca University Scheme will make matters much worse. The minimum educational qualifications for admission is that the student must pass the I. Sc. Examination. Then the College course is for four years, and then practical training for three years. So a student will be about 27 before he can expect Government appointment.

I would therefore propose that age limit for admission may be fixed at 19. The minimum educational qualifications required for admission will be the passing of the Matriculation in the First Division. With better prospects for the passed students of the Engineering College there will be a very large number of applications from very meritorious students for admission into the College, and the Principal will be able to pick up the best students from the top of the list prepared according to their marks in mathematics and half the number they obtained in English. Of course, each student should produce a health certificate from the College Surgeon and a certificate of good character from the Head Master of his school.

The College course may advantageously be fixed for four years, during which the student should be given both theoretical and practical training in all the branches. The University examination that will be held at the end of the fourth year should also be both theoretical and practical. On the results of this examination the appointments on probation to Public Works Department should be made without any further practical training or practical examination. I may also note that facilities should be afforded to the students while in the College to learn riding and cycling, and certificate from the Principal to the effect that the student can ride and cycle will be required before he is allowed to appear at the final examination at the end of the fourth year. The probationary year of the Indian College engineers may advantageously be passed in England, where they can see large and important engineering works. By the proposed system, I am sure that the Government will find in these new recruits highly trained men, both in theory and practice, full of youthful vigour and energy which, with a few years' experience and mature judgment, will make them very valuable and useful officers. These officers will be able to render useful service for a much longer period than at present.

For Deputy Engineers who should belong to the proposed Provincial Service referred to under item III (conditions of service). These officers should be appointed after undergoing a year's approved practical training in India, Public Works Department, after graduating. An allowance of Rs. 100 per month will be given to them during the probationary period, they being confirmed in the 6th grade at the end of this term. No difference in the scale of allowances should be made as at present between Europeans and Indians, as this distinction in the beginning of a young man's career has a very deleterious influence, creating a feeling of diffidence and inferiority. A further care is necessary to secure that they are not huddled up with the non-qualified Overseer-passed students as at present. No further departmental test should be made for selection for the same reasons as given for Engineers.

71,902. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—The present conditions of service do not appear to be satisfactory. The officers recruited from England, whether Europeans or Indians, are called Imperial, and those appointed from the Indian Colleges are known as Provincial Engineers, with about two-thirds of the salary of the former. This distinction in their status and difference of salary, while they are called on to perform the same onerous duties and hold the same responsible positions, have caused many difficulties in the way of Provincial Engineers. In the Indian Civil Service there are a few listed posts thrown open to Indian officers of the Provincial, Civil and Judicial services. These officers are required to perform the same duties and hold the same responsible positions as the civilians, although their salary is about two-thirds of that of the civilians. But the conditions in this service are quite different from those of the Engineers. The salary of the Indian Civil Service is much larger than that of other services, and two-thirds of that represent a fairly good salary for the officers taken from the Provincial services. Besides, senior officers of the Provincial, Civil and Judicial services are generally appointed to grades of Magistrates and District Judges, and their pay (about Rs. 1,000 and upwards) then becomes much more than, or sometimes double of, their salary on the Provincial Service, and they consider it a great privilege and a good promotion to be so appointed to the listed posts. But in the Public Works Department our Imperial Executive Engineer has to begin with a salary of Rs. 700 only, and two-thirds of that comes to about Rs. 475, which is hardly sufficient in these days for enabling a Provincial officer to maintain his position as an Executive Engineer of a Division—a position corresponding to that of the District Magistrate in the Indian Civil Service.

The cost of living and education of children has increased considerably during the recent years. Owing to this as well as to the occasional heavy expenses on marriages and other ceremonies, which are quite unavoidable for an Indian officer of his standing and position, a Provincial Engineer finds it difficult at times to make the both ends meet. Besides, his small salary renders it rather difficult for him to exercise the required amount of control over, and command respect and obedience from, his subdivisional officers, amongst whom there may be a senior Sub-Engineer drawing nearly the same pay, or an Assistant Engineer of the Imperial Service drawing more salary than he gets. At the present time Mr. Vieyra, Assistant Engineer, Provincial Service, drawing Rs. 375 per month, has

been placed in charge of the 1st Calcutta Division in which there are two Senior Subordinates as subdivisional officers, one of whom, Rai Sahib Priya Krisna Biswas, draws Rs. 450, and the other, Mr. Traise, draws Rs. 400 per mensem, excluding the subdivisional allowances. I am afraid it will be extremely difficult for Mr. Vieyra to exercise the required amount of authority over, and command respect and obedience from, those subdivisional officers.

A very large amount of public funds is annually expended through the subdivisional officers, and it is to the best interests of Government to strengthen the position of its controlling officers (Provincial Engineers) by improving their status as well as by increasing their salary with a view to keep them above want. I may also note that the Provincial Engineer Service is not so popular. As far as my information goes, three senior Anglo-Indian Subordinates were offered promotion to the Provincial Service, but they thought it more advantageous to them to decline the offer, and preferred to remain as subordinates. It would not be out of place here to mention that contentment amongst the members is very essential for the efficiency of the service, but from the repeated representations from the members of the Provincial Service, I am afraid, they are not much satisfied with their present position.

From the above it is, I believe, clear that in the interests of both the members of the Provincial Service and the Government, the abolition of the existing Provincial Service is very necessary, and all officers of the Engineer establishment should have equal emoluments and privileges, excepting leave allowances, which, in my opinion, should be on a more liberal scale in case of Europeans. In the above prayer I am not asking for any unusual concessions or privileges, but proposed change would simply have the effect of restoring the service to the conditions that obtained more than 20 years ago. For nearly 30 years previous to 1892 the Indian and European Engineers, recruited from England or India, enjoyed equal privileges and worked side by side in close union and harmony, and their united hands guided from inception to fruition works of great magnitude and importance in the Public Works Department, and it is very desirable that the same old conditions should now prevail. Our benign Government have introduced in recent years Provincial services in the Civil, Judicial and other departments to improve the status and condition of the subordinate establishments entrusted with subordinate duties in their respective departments. The position of a Deputy Magistrate or a Munsif, who was considered a subordinate, some years ago, has been much improved by the creation of the Provincial Service in the Civil and Judicial Departments, though their duties remain the same as before. But the creation of the Provincial Service in the Public Works Department, instead of improving the status of its subordinates, which is very badly needed, had unfortunately the effect of lowering that of its officers.

Deputy Engineers.—As already said above, the creation of the Provincial services in the Civil and Judicial departments has greatly improved the status and position of the Deputy Magistrates and Munsifs usually entrusted with subordinate duties in those departments. It is now time that something should be done for improving the position and emoluments of the Upper Subordinates of this department. In the olden days candidates with indifferent knowledge in Engineering were appointed as Upper Subordinates, but the conditions are quite changed. Now graduates in Engineering are usually employed as Upper Subordinates. The course of study and training undergone by them is far more difficult, and extends over a longer period than that of a candidate for the Provincial Civil Service. They are now usually entrusted with much more important duties than formerly, and their case deserves favourable consideration. It is believed that the question of improving their position is now engaging the attention of Government. The creation of the Provincial service for these Upper Subordinates appears to me to be the best solution of the problem. The members of this Provincial service may conveniently be called Deputy Engineers. These subordinate officers, generally in charge of subdivisions, directly deal with the expenditure of a large sum of money annually, and the temptations are great. I think it will be to the advantage of Government to improve their status and increase their salary to a slight extent.

71,903. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—*For Engineer Officers.*—The existing scale of salary apears to be sufficient.

For Deputy Engineer of the proposed Provincial service, I would propose six grades ranging from Rs. 150 to Rs. 500, as noted below :—

	Rs.
1st grade	500
2nd ,, ...	400
3rd ,, ...	300
4th ,, ...	250
5th ,, ...	200
6th ,, ...	150

Nowadays Engineer graduates are appointed in the 1st grade Overseer on Rs. 100. They can rise to Sub-Engineer, 1st grade, the maximum pay of which, including two increments, of Rs. 50, is Rs. 500.

From the above it will be seen that the maximum pay (Rs. 500) of the proposed Deputy Engineer is the same as at present. Only the initial pay is recommended to be Rs. 150, in the place of Rs. 100, in the existing scale. Thus the creation of the Provincial service of Deputy Engineers will not involve a very heavy additional expenditure.

71,904. **(V.) Condition of Leave.**—For short leave and leave on urgent private affairs the rules, which are the same in case of Europeans, are fair, but the latter leave may be granted to Indians in instalments. As regards furlough, the proposal now under consideration of the Government will suit.

71,905. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—The maximum limit of ordinary pension should be raised from Rs. 5,000 to Rs. 6,000 per annum.

Special pension for the service of three years as Superintending Engineer should be Rs. 1,500 in place of Rs. 1,000 as at present.

Special pension for service of three years as Chief Engineer should be Rs. 3,000 in place of Rs. 2,000 as at present.

71,906. **(VII.) Limitation in the Employment of Indians.**—The maximum limit of 10 per cent. of appointments by the Secretary of State should be raised. The low limit was put, as it was anticipated that the Department will be swamped by Indians otherwise. Experience shows now that these apprehensions are groundless. Besides a fairly good number of officers appointed from Indian Colleges, as shown in the Classified List, are Anglo-Indians. I believe the maintenance of a large European element in a technical department like the Public Works Department is not demanded for political consideration, and therefore strongly urge that a larger number of appointments may be thrown open to Indians in this Department than hitherto.

If the above proposal be adopted and the prospects of Engineer Service be improved, the best intellect of the country will be attracted to our Engineering Colleges, and, if at the same time the system of training in our colleges be improved and placed on a sound basis, the out-turn cannot but be highly satisfactory. In my opinion expension of Engineering education amongst the people of this country is very necessary for the development of its resources, for advancement of its sanitation, and for improvement of its drainage and water-supply.

71,907. **(VIII.) Relation with the Civil Service.**—The relations with civil officers are cordial.

RAI BAHADUR ANNADA PRASAD SARKAR called and examined.

71,908. (*Chairman.*) The witness had been 28 years and 7 months in the service. Prior to his retirement he had officiated as Chief Engineer in Bengal for four months.

71,909. The maintenance of a large European element in the Public Works Department was not demanded by any political considerations, and therefore he urged that a larger number of appointments

should be thrown open to Indians. He suggested the proportion of those recruited in India and those recruited in England should be half and half, which would mean nearly doubling the present proportion of Indian Engineers.

71,910. He advocated a competitive examination in substitution for the present system of selection, because it was not possible to test the qualifications and capacity of a candidate simply by an interview. He admitted that the selection was based upon a qualification, and was not merely haphazard, but a University degree was not compulsory in all cases. He did not know of any cases of candidates who had been admitted to the service who had not a qualifying degree prior to selection, so that his objection to the present system of selection based upon a qualifying test was a theoretical one. He would insist that competitors should hold some University degree, which would mean that they would have to have some practical as well as theoretical training in the University. He would not say that the officers now entering the service were not properly qualified for their duties, as he had no personal experience of the matter.

71,911. He was not in favour of the suggestion that all Indian candidates for the Provincial Service should be trained at one central college; there was ample room for the present four colleges. In Bengal there were special engineering conditions, such as tidal navigation, channels, waterways, the improvement of drainage, and the reclamation of waste land, all of which were peculiar to Bengal and the theory of which should be studied in a Bengal college. The average number of candidates passed out of Sibpur College every year was seven or eight, only one of whom was admitted to the superior service. In spite of that fact, he could not say it would tend to more efficient education and training if one central college were established, more efficient training would be secured by increasing the number of appointments from the several Provincial colleges.

71,912. He suggested a new service of Deputy Engineers in substitution for the present grades of Sub-Engineers, Supervisors and Overseers. With regard to the training of those officers, at present they were usually graduates of the Sibpur Engineering College, and he would not make any alteration in that. The guaranteed posts would be filled by the best men, and the rest of the men would become Deputy Engineers.

71,913. The statement, that the facilities available in India for practical training were as good as those in England, might be true, but in England men could see all kinds of works and gain considerable benefit by their travelling. English training was no better than Indian training, except in the matter of this additional experience.

71,914. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The system of recruitment in witness's day was by competition. There were two guaranteed posts in the superior service open to candidates from Sibpur in the year he was selected. He was trained alongside all the other students who were eventually to become subordinate officers. In one way that was a good system, in that the present sub-divisional officers were of a very high stamp, and were rendering very useful assistance in the department.

71,915. His object in suggesting the creation of a class of Deputy Engineers was to improve the status of the subordinate service. If that were done, it would be possible to fill all the sub-divisions from the Deputy Engineer class instead of employing temporary engineers, and it would be possible then to confine the temporary Engineer to temporary work, and not put him in permanent charge of sub-divisions.

71,916. (*Mr. Sly.*) The reason why certain subordinates had at one time declined to accept promotion into the Provincial Service was because they were obtaining practically the same pay, or more, in their then positions, and if they had entered the Provincial Service, they would have had to begin at Rs. 250, and to take their chance of promotion according to the term of their service. Probably by remaining in their subordinate position their prospects of promotion were much higher. Time would not have permitted of their being promoted to a much higher salary, if they had entered the Provincial Service.

71,917. There was a fairly good demand for Engineers outside Government service, for instance, in private firms, on District Boards, etc.

71,918. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The salary a man would receive on District Boards immediately after leaving college would be about Rs. 150.

Practical and theoretical teaching should go hand in hand in all the colleges, but under the present system the practical work had to be done after the college course. Some students were taken to important works occasionally, but not to any large extent.

71,919. (*Mr. Madge.*) In India the conditions of engineering work were so different in the different provinces that it was necessary that students should be conversant with the work they would have to perform during their service later on, and in that connection provincial institutions seemed to offer more advantages than a central college. The training obtainable in India was in some cases up to the standard of the training obtainable in England, and in some respects the Sibpur College course was much stiffer than the old Coopers Hill course. He did not approve of the removal of Sibpur to Dacca, as there were hardly any engineering works of importance in the neighbourhood of Dacca and the training of the students would be purely theoretical; it would be analogous to teaching chemistry without a laboratory. If the Sibpur College had to be removed on the ground of the district being unhealthy, he would prefer a large Provincial college in the neighbourhood of Calcutta.

71,920. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The work done by the Engineering Department chiefly related to buildings, canals, waterways and embankments, the buildings including hospitals, schools, colleges, godowns, etc. Of late very few canals had been built, the work now being mostly drainage channels, drainage being the principal work at present in Bengal. Executive Engineers were placed in direct charge of all works, both construction and maintenance.

71,921. The practical training of students in irrigation was not satisfactory at Sibpur; there should be more practical training on the works themselves. Practical training should accompany the theoretical training as at Cooper's Hill. He recommended a four years' course. Students at Sibpur should be taken to different works for practical instruction, and at the end of the course they might at once enter the service. Sibpur College covered Bengal, Bihar, and Orissa, Assam and Burma, but Bihar and Orissa were not now taking officers from the college. At present he believed that in Bengal only one Rurki student was employed.

71,922. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Some students after leaving the college underwent practical training at their own expense, and frequently applied to complete their training on Government works. Many went to railways with scholarships given by the Educational Department, and therefore paid nothing. Those who were not fortunate enough to obtain the Government scholarship had practical training on Government engineering works in Calcutta and the district. One of the conditions of employment by a District Board was that a man should have had some practical experience in the Public Works Department or other recognized institution for five years. Of the students who could not obtain practical training, some entered works in different capacities, others started private work on their own account, and some joined the staff of contractors. A student leaving college generally considered that, having passed his examination, he was entitled to be paid for any work he might do. As a rule students were capable of doing certain forms of work under a sub-divisional officer and usually carried out their duties satisfactorily.

71,923. (*Mr. Green.*) After Coopers Hill men had completed their third year and passed a final examination they were taken into the service and in their first year were either sent out to India for practical training or given that training in England. A further year's probation in connection with particular kinds of work would be useful.

71,924. With regard to the pension paid to Chief Engineers appointed before 1898, it did not consist of Rs. 2,000 in addition to Rs. 1,000, the pension of a Superintending Engineer, but of Rs. 2,000 in all.

71,925. (*Mr. Mazumdar.*) The scale of salary he had proposed for the Deputy Engineers would be a vast improvement on the present rate of salary, and Deputy Engineers would be glad to have some improvement, however small. Later on probably it would be necessary to improve the salary again.

(The witness withdrew.)

SIR RAJENDRA NATH MOOKERJEE, K.C.I.E. (of Messrs. Martin & Co., Calcutta).

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,926. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—For the superior grades of Engineers for the Imperial Service I would suggest that two-thirds be recruited from England and one-third from India by open competition, the examinations in both countries to be of the same standard. It would be desirable to have the examinations identical and held simultaneously, but if this is considered inexpedient the subjects and question forming the examinations should be practically the same.

71,927. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—The successful candidates recruited in England (*i.e.*, two-thirds of the total number required each year) should have one year's practical training and probation service in Europe before coming to India. They should during this probationary period pass a colloquial examination of the language of the province to which they are posted. On the termination of one year, they should pass a further examination testifying the practical experience gained and then be sent to this country. Those recruited in India (*i.e.*, about one-third) should be sent to England to get practical experience *for two years*. Candidates from both countries should receive the same allowance during the probationary period, but no one ought to be confirmed in the service who has not passed the practical test examination.

71,928. **(III.) Conditions of Service.** — Should remain as now in force in the Imperial Service, *i.e.*, as for the Indian Civil Service.

71,929. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—European and Indian members of the Service should receive the same salaries, whether recruited in India or England provided they qualify themselves according to what has been stated above in paragraphs 71,926-7.

71,930. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—Should be the same as in the Indian Civil Service.

71,931. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.** — There should be no distinction, but should be as now exists in the Imperial Service, *i.e.*, European and Indian members alike draw the same pension.

71,932. **General Remarks.**—The number of appointments to be offered to Indians in India should vary according to the number of Indians passed and admitted in England, so that the number of Indians in the Service should not exceed one-half of the total number at least not during the next few years. There should be a separate service called the Provincial Service, the members of which may be styled "Deputy Engineers" or "Assistant Engineers" or some such name. They should be recruited from the Provincial Engineering Colleges by competitive examination. The successful candidates for this service should receive practical training in *India* for two years and during this probationary period receive a salary of Rs. 100 per mensem. On the termination of the two years a further examination on practical experience should be held and those who pass may be confirmed in the service on a salary of Rs. 200 rising to Rs. 600 per mensem with travelling allowance, &c., as at present. As a rule the members of the Provincial Service shall not be appointed to Executive or Administrative appointments. Exception may be made in specially meritorious cases where such promotion may be permitted, but before the promotion is given, the "Deputy" or "Assistant Engineer" should be compelled to spend one year in Europe to obtain practical experience there. They should be allowed study leave or furlough for that period.

There should also be a Subordinate Grade to be recruited by open examination from the Provincial Engineering Colleges. These men should receive practical training for one year during which probationary period they should receive a salary of Rs. 40 per month. When they pass they will be confirmed in the service on Rs. 60 rising to Rs. 150 per mensem. Specially meritorious members may be promoted from the Subordinate Grade to the Provincial Service.

All candidates whether recruited in England or India should be required to produce certificates of character and social status from two people of standing (to the satisfaction of Government) in addition to medical certificate.

My remarks above have been confined to recruiting.

To remove the grievance of those who now hold Executive Engineer's posts I suggest that they be allowed to proceed to England to such study of scientific subjects as will be prescribed by Government, and on their qualifying they be permitted to enter the Imperial Service in the same grade as that in which they were posted before going to England. During their absence from India they will get study leave allowance.

SIR RAJENDRA NATH MOOKERJEE called and examined.

71,933. (*Chairman.*) The witness said his recommendation was that two-thirds of the superior service should be recruited from England and one-third from India by open competition, and he would regulate the recruitment so that not more than 50 per cent. of the vacancies in the service should be filled by Indians. After the English appointments had been settled an endeavour should be made to discover how many vacancies still existed, and so many appointments should be made in India for that year. For instance, supposing the Government required 50 Engineers for a certain year, and 30 or 40 were appointed by competitive examination in England, out of which number 10 or 20 were Indians, competition should be held in India to fill the number of vacancies to which Indians were entitled. The present selection did not give satisfaction or tend to the efficiency of the service, as a certain amount of favouritism could not be avoided. He knew from his experience that the 10 per cent. Indians selected by the Secretary of State were not so good as some of the Indians who were not selected.

71,934. The number of Engineers employed by Messrs. Martin & Co. amounted to about 100, 10 of whom were Europeans, and 90 Indians. The best men obtainable were recruited by selection on a qualifying test, and he regarded that as the best method of obtaining the most efficient men. There was no fixed proportion between Europeans and Indians, an Englishman being brought out when a man of high attainments or qualifications was required for certain work. There was only one Indian in the higher posts of the firm, the responsible charges being held by Europeans. At present there were only two Indians on the staff who had been trained in England. The Indians were recruited from different colleges in India, many of them coming from Sibpur and Rurki, and one or two from Poona. He did not attach much importance to the particular college, having had three or four very good men from Sibpur and one or two from Rurki. The training in colleges was only theoretical and it depended on the man himself after he left college whether he became a good Engineer. The age of recruitment was twenty-one to twenty-five except in the case of Europeans, who often came out between twenty-five and thirty. Young Indians were only taken on as apprentices and given a small allowance for a year or two before being placed as Engineers in any responsible work. A European Engineer had always had experience, either on rail-

ways or waterworks or in architectural work, but the firm themselves preferred to give Indians their practical training, paying a lower salary while doing so.

71,935. Witness favoured the establishment of one well-equipped college for training for the higher posts in the service, each province sending its own men to the college. He advocated a central college purely on the ground of efficiency in training.

71,936. In future Indians recruited to the Imperial Service should be sent for two years' practical experience to England, where they would not only obtain technical engineering experience, but would have their views very much broadened, their general culture improved, and would learn lessons of manliness, courage, etc. On their return they should be posted to work where they would be under supervision, and, if they passed a practical test, should be made officers in the service. Some Assistant Engineers might be recruited in India without going to England. He laid great emphasis on English training, because his experience showed that Engineers who had been to England were much better men than those with only Indian experience; they attained to positions of greater authority and responsibility in the business.

71,937. He regarded it as injurious to the service to lay down the proposition that so many promotions to the superior service should be made every year, and considered it should be left to the discretion of the Government as efficient men were found.

71,938. European and Indian members of the service should receive the same rates of pay whether recruited in India or in England. There was some difference in the market value of imported labour as compared with local labour, but considering the question from the broad point of view it was better that men should have the same pay; discrimination only tended to increase discontent and raise the racial question. Young Europeans coming into India on higher pay for the same work came to the conclusion that they were better than the Indian men. Indians were adopting English modes of living and had as much expense as Englishmen, because they could not discard their own relations and friends. He thought an Indian would be prepared to serve in England for the same salary as he received in India, but in some parts of the world there might be circumstances which necessitated higher pay. If a scheme were devised which generally recognised that imported labour was paid at a higher rate than indigenous labour, he would still insist on no difference being made. Very few Indians would aspire to the higher positions, as the general capacity of European Engineers was greater than that of Indians, and promotion according to merit would lead to very few Indians attaining the administrative grades. A few hundred rupees more paid to Indians would not be a very heavy burden on the Exchequer.

71,939. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) When he said that the best men in England did not get appointments, he was referring to Indians, not to Europeans. If Indians were asked to go to England for two years before the higher posts were available to them, not a very large number would go, and men, who had aspired to the higher posts and became as competent as Europeans, should undoubtedly receive the same pay. It was an injustice to pay an Indian less than a European, if he reached the same standard and performed the same work. When Englishmen would not come to India on the same pay as the Indian then would be the time to consider the question of a higher allowance. The best Indians would not be obtained if they were told that they would have to do the same work as the Englishmen on two-thirds of the pay. It was for that reason that the Engineering Department at present was so badly manned.

71,940. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He was aware that a man who obtained a certain pay in England was often given a foreign allowance when serving in other parts of the Empire, but that did not apply to India. He did not think it was good policy, having regard to the present condition of the country, to give the same rates of pay to Indians and Europeans and supplement the pay of the latter by an Indian service allowance.

71,941. There should be no Public Works Department in the Presidency towns except a supervising establishment to direct work done by private agencies, and the Commission might take into consideration the question whether it was necessary now to recruit on the same scale as in the past. He recommended that the recruitment should be very much less. Work now done by the Public Works Department could be carried out more efficiently and at less cost by private enterprise. As an instance, he mentioned that his firm had been given building work at Dacca, and had completed the work before the time stipulated, and the work had not been inferior to the work done by the department. Very little work was given to his firm, owing to the department desiring to do everything themselves, but wherever opportunities had been given the firm had proved that they were able to do the work better and cheaper than the department itself. Having to maintain a very large establishment the estimates of the Public Works Department were often higher than necessary, but no such large establishment was needed. Whenever the firm had works to carry out which required a larger staff than the normal establishment, temporary assistants were engaged locally, and if exceptional experience was required men were brought out from England.

71,942. The Irrigation Branch of the Public Works Department stood on a somewhat different footing from the other branches, because they had certain administrative functions to perform, such as assessing rents, rates, etc., and he gathered that the Irrigation Service suffered somewhat owing to its being a part of a department in which a great deal of other work was carried on.

71,943. His firm did not always take men with University titles and degrees but men with practical experience who had been apprentices to large firms. In the Public Works Department, however, which was a Public Service, the Government had to pay something towards the training of their Engineers. In engaging their men the firm did not care whether men had University degrees or whether they were over 30; they chose the best men, paid their passage both ways, and gave them good pay. The Government, with their rigid rules, could not do that, and, therefore, it was best to have a competitive examination and train the men afterwards. He was not a believer in academic distinctions for professional work.

71,944. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The Europeans in his firm were recruited at a higher age than those who entered the Public Works Department, and they were given special rates of pay and a certain share in the profits. The pay varied from Rs. 800 to Rs. 2,000. They corresponded to Superintending Engineers in the Public Works. They came out on a five years' agreement, which was generally renewed, and there were men at present who had been 25 years in the firm's service. A pension fund had been established to which the men subscribed, the firm adding an amount equal to the subscriptions. The leave rules were not very rigid. Sometimes if men had worked very hard they were given six months' leave on full pay after three years' service, and their passage out and home was paid by the firm. According to the agreement they were entitled to three months' leave on full pay after three years' service, but they were generally given more.

71,945. Indian Engineers came from the Indian colleges as apprentices on Rs. 100, and if they did good work could rise to Rs. 800, promotion being made not on an incremental scale but according to competence. There were two Anglo-Indians in the service who received the same pay as Indians. The Indian in the highest grade was paid the same rate as the European and was treated as an Englishman in every sense, and every Indian doing the same work as a European would receive the same pay. On all grounds, political and social, he deprecated any distinction in pay and promotion being given by length of service. His own scheme was that Indians on Rs. 200 to Rs. 600 should be employed on most of the work; and that there should be a limited number of European and Indian Engineers on higher pay doing the higher class of work.

71,946. (*Mr. Madge.*) He practically proposed simultaneous examinations for recruitment. The standard of engineering in India was at present not as high as in England, and if a simultaneous examination was adopted, the Indian college course would

have to be altered to agree with the course in England. Indian theoretical training should be levelled up to the British standard. Until that was done it would be necessary to recruit in England for some time. Should the Commission come to the conclusion that the difficulties in the way of simultaneous examinations were so great as to make them impossible, he would be satisfied to have the standard of examination in India made the same as that in England.

71,947. One well-equipped college for the whole of India would be quite sufficient for a number of years to come to train all the engineering students in the country. He would not, however, abolish the Provincial colleges, as there might be technical colleges for the training of men for the posts the pay of which was Rs. 200 to Rs. 800.

71,948. With reference to the appointment of Engineers to his own firm, in the case of Europeans testimonials were sometimes obtained from well-known Engineers with whom the candidates had been working or from managers or railway companies or large engineering firms. In the case of Indians the firms generally noted whether they had any college certificate, though personally he did not attach much value to that. There were many men in the firm who had failed in the examination of the engineering colleges and yet were better men than those who had passed. If a boy who had failed entered the firm he was taken on as an apprentice and in a few years very likely became a useful man. It was practically a system of selection, not a competitive examination. His objection to selection in England was based on the fact that the Public Works Department was a public service and without public competition there would be complaints. The public had no knowledge of what went on in connection with Messrs. Martin & Co. and therefore could not interfere, and there was no newspaper comment upon the appointments. Personally he thought selection would be the best, but he believed the public would not agree with him.

71,949. There were not many domiciled Europeans or Anglo-Indians in the firm, but those who were there were as good as Indians. Unless they had been to England, however, they were not as good as Englishmen.

71,950. He objected to promotion from the Provincial Service to executive and administrative appointments, but admitted that some very good officers had been obtained in that way. On the whole he thought such selections were not wise and believed if Chief Engineers were asked privately they would say the same thing.

71,951. (*Mr. Fisher.*) In each of the Presidency towns there was a sufficient number of efficient and trustworthy firms to undertake work now done by the Public Works Department, and if the department were abolished there would be a very healthy competition not only in Calcutta, Madras and Bombay, but in Allahabad and Lucknow. That would naturally involve the corollary that the Indian Stores Department in England would come to an end or be considerably reduced. The Government could supply itself with what it needed quite well in India. If the Commission would take evidence from all the Engineers in responsible position, confidentially, allowing them to say freely what they thought, they would unanimously say that the Stores Department should be abolished.

71,952. He laid very great stress upon training in England and his views were not modified by the difficulties that might exist in England as to means of training in connection with civil engineering. The men could obtain a good training on railways and on other extensive works, and they would at the same time be acquiring a general culture which was of great importance to them; he laid much stress on the social value of an English training. The fact that it was almost impossible to give men civil engineering work in England did not really effect his conclusion, as it was necessary for civil engineers to obtain some knowledge of mechanical engineering as well, and it was on the mechanical side that Indians were weakest.

71,953. There was a large field of training for civil engineering work in India if arrangements could be made with private firms. Such arrangements could be made if the money were forthcoming, but students objected to serve as apprentices without pay. It was true that, owing to the fact that a good deal of manual work was done by lower caste Indians, Indians of good family would not work side by side with them, but that prejudice was gradually dying out. There were not the same facilities for training in mechanical engineering and electrical engineering in India as existed in England. Indians entering the Public Works Department should be of very good family as they were exposed to great temptations in that department; to some extent his objection to the selection of Indians in England was founded on the fact that this consideration had not been kept in view.

71,954. (*Mr. Sly.*) It was not true that Government works in Presidency towns were already given out on contract; the contract only referred to labour. The department did everything, even to the making of bricks. The labour was contracted for and put under the supervision of Overseers and Sub-Engineers. It was impossible, having regard to the way the work was done, for any self-respecting man to take work under the Public Works Department. The accounts of the department were "cooked" in different ways to show that cheaper work could be done than by private firms. He did not know of any work that had been given out to a contractor by the department. Outside Presidency towns the department at present would have to continue, but if his scheme were adopted, all Engineers would stop hankering after Government service, and in a few years the Public Works Department would only need generally to supervise the scheme to see that the work was being done satisfactorily.

71,955. In his proposal for the creation of a separate college for the whole of India he had considered the difficulties that might be experienced in inducing people from different parts of India to go to one college, but he had come to the conclusion that students who would not go to another part of India were not fit to be Engineers. Rurki would make a very good centre for the College, and it would be quite reasonable to ask Madrasis to be trained at Rurki, as a man who desired to be an Engineer should be prepared to work anywhere at any time. If the number of students were sufficient, the Government could select men to work in their own provinces, but he saw no objection whatever to a Madrasi going to Bengal or a Bengali going to Madras. All Engineers should be Imperial Engineers on definite salaries, and appointments should be made either by the Government of India or the Secretary of State. In distributing the men Government would consider whether they were Muhammadans, Bengalis, or Madrasis, and he did not think the current idea that the Bengali would monopolise everything was correct; Madrasis and others would soon be taking their rightful place.

71,956. When men had passed through the central college they should be sent to England for two years' training. They might put in one or two years' service in India before being sent, but he thought they would benefit most if they went when they were quite young, directly they had left college.

71,957. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness believed there were sufficient facilities in England for Indians to obtain practical training in everything except civil engineering. As a rule, it would only mean that ten Indians would require training in England each year, and he thought that number could be provided for quite easily.

71,958. The Indians who were employed by his own firm in the higher ranks did not rise from the lower ranks but had five years' training in England and were recruited like Europeans. Among the 90 Indians there were none who in the course of time would be capable of doing the same work which the superior Engineers now did. If trained in England it would not be impossible, but to be placed in a position similar to that occupied by Europeans in the firm Indians required to be equal in every respect, both professionally and socially.

71,959. His reason for confining the work of private companies to Presidency towns was that in Calcutta large firms would not go to the mufassal unless the work was worth while. If it became the practice to

entrust mufassal work to private companies more private companies would take up the work, and gradually Engineers from engineering colleges would divert their attention to private practice. There was nothing in the nature of engineering work in the mufassal which made it essential that it should be performed by a Public Works Department. As a matter of fact the work was generally of small extent and required very little engineering skill.

71,960. If a central college were established, before students were admitted they should be tested in drawing, mathematics, etc., and naturally those who came from a Provincial college would have had greater facilities for studying such subjects. A man with a good aptitude for mathematics might enter the college after a year at a Provincial college while other men might take three years. The central college course would occupy three years. He would not make it compulsory for a student to have previously been in a Provincial college; if a student had taken his B.A. from any good college he might quite well enter the central college. It would be quite possible for a man to pass out of the central college at the age of twenty-five.

71,961. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) There was a sufficient number of firms in Calcutta at present to take over the work of the Public Works Department. A large number of Government buildings were built in Bihar and four firms were asked to tender for certain work, and the tender of his own firm was accepted and the firm finished the buildings. He would initiate the policy of entrusting the work to firms in the large towns; there were many firms with sufficient capital and knowledge to undertake it; but he would exclude irrigation and railways and deal only with roads, buildings and bridges.

71,962. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The Indian Engineers employed by his firm were of the same standard as the Indians now going into the Provincial Service, because those who could not get into the Provincial Service came to the firm. The salary paid to Indians was from Rs. 100 to Rs. 800, with bonuses to special men for good work. To obtain higher salaries the men had to go to England and pass certain tests. The higher Engineers were almost exclusively recruited in England. The apparent contradiction in the fact that in the firm's business the higher Engineers were almost exclusively recruited in England while he advocated that for the higher department of the State at least one-third should be recruited in India was based on the idea that the Government had to look at things from points of view which were excluded from the consideration of a business firm. To put it briefly, the Government had to consider the Government of the country, and the distinction was made really on political grounds.

(The witness withdrew.)

B. HEATON, ESQ., Principal, Civil Engineering College, Sibpur.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

71,963. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—(*a*) *In England.*—I have no remarks to offer except that, in my opinion, recruitment in England should be confined to Europeans, and that Indians should be taken from the colleges expressly established in India by Government for the training of Indians for officers' posts in the Public Works Department.

The making of a successful *practical* Engineer depends more upon the experience gained during his apprenticeship to the profession after leaving college, and on his experience in the actual practice of Engineering than on his studies at the college. The facilities available in India for giving suitable practical training are, I believe, greater than in England, and the number of students passing out of Indian Engineering Colleges seeking such apprenticeship is much less than the number passing out of English Colleges who must be provided for in England. Therefore, if we can arrange a thoroughly satisfactory practical training in India, we should produce as good, if not a better Engineer out of an Indian than is likely to be done in England.

In view of the fewer facilities that exist, and of the prior claim of Engineering graduates trained in England, it would be extremely difficult to arrange suitable practical training in England for the graduates of Indian Colleges.

(*b*) *In India.*—Indians for the officer grades of the Public Works Department are trained in India at—

The Thomason College, Rurki.
The Civil Engineering College, Sibpur.
The Civil Engineering College, Poona.
The Civil Engineering College, Madras.

Each of these colleges admits students from a definite area which is laid down by Government.

The sphere of Sibpur embraces the following provinces:—

Bengal.
Bihar and Orissa.
Assam.
Burma.

The area of population within the sphere entrusted to Sibpur compared with the rest of India is one-third nearly in each case as shown in Imperial Gazetteer. A larger proportion than in the case of any of the other Indian Colleges.

Any student, resident within this sphere, who wishes to be trained in India for the officer grades of the Public Works Department must, under Government orders, seek admission to the Sibpur College, and I maintain that the amount of Government partronage offered to the colleges should have some reference to the amount of Civil Engineering enterprise (Public Works Department, Railway, &c.), that is to be found within the sphere entrusted to Sibpur. But this is far from being the case, the allotment of guaranteed Assistant Engineer posts amongst the colleges was till 1913 as follows:—

Rurki	6
Sibpur	1
Poona	1
Madras	1

But since the formation of Bihar and Orissa, the Bihar Government have repudiated the claim that the college possesses (in view of customs) of supplying that Province with Assistant Engineers, and the Bengal Government have informed the Government of India that they can take an *ex*-student each *alternate* year only. This reduction has been sanctioned. So now the guarantee stands at one post every other year which will of course make difficulties in recruiting students for admission in the blank years.

The rules regarding the obtaining of guaranteed Assistant Engineer posts in Assam and Burma by Assamese and Burman students lay down that, in order to obtain such post, the Assam and Burma lad must actually pass the Bachelor of Engineering Examination at the top of the list of merit. Lads of those provinces are never likely to beat the more highly educated Bengali in the Bachelor of Engineering Examination; consequently the officer grades of the Assam and Burman Public Works Department are practically closed to Assamese and Burman students.

Although, however, Sibpur does receive students from Assam and Burma for training, we do not receive any of the patronage of the Public Works Department of those provinces; perhaps they do not wish for Bengali Engineers.

Thirty-two students are admitted yearly to the Engineer classes at Sibpur, the number that pass through and qualify at the end of the four years' course average 11; of these one obtains the guaranteed post and the remainder have to accept what service they can get; this means that (since practically all the Civil Engineering work is in the hands of Government or *quasi*-Government concerns) most of the students have to accept posts in the subordinate services from which it is only few that rise to the officer grades.

One such promotion is guaranteed each alternate year to a Sibpur lad. One or two may become District Engineers after some five or six years. Hence we find that many subordinates possess Assistant Engineer qualifications and consider themselves as

good as their officers. It is not good for discipline, to have so many discontented men.

The struggle for a living and for Government service in Bengal is getting keener every year, and the attraction of even the single guaranteed post offered at Sibpur is such that it has raised the standard of admission. About 25 per cent. of the students now admitted are Bachelors of Science and their actual age about 20. The new age regulations of the Matriculation Examination of the University will affect our Bachelor of Science admissions from and including next year. By these regulations the minimum age on passing the B.Sc. will be 20 on March 1st, and, as our admissions are made on November 1st, the youngest B.Sc. student must be about 21 then and the average older, so that no B.Sc. could pass the B.E. degree (a four-year course) under 25, that is, if he secures promotion each year. The average B.Sc. would be probably 26 or 27, and as he cannot join Government Service until the completion of his year's practical training, he will then be 27 or 28. Students who join the college after passing the I.Sc. Examination would be two years younger, 23 being their possible minimum on joining Government Service. This corresponds, I think, fairly well with English Engineering Colleges.

Bengali students do not appear to be keen on Engineering for its own sake; they are more interested in trying to obtain a Government post. Most of them have applied also for admission to the Medical College and prefer to take admission there, unless they have been awarded a Civil Engineering College Scholarship. They appear to rely largely upon their exceptional powers of memorising, hoping that the chances of mere examination may secure for them a permanent Government post. Hence they would prefer that the guaranteed post should be awarded solely on the results of the B. Examination. They do not want their practical abilities to be judged.

The Bengalis that come to us are practically ignorant of Drawing, and none of them have that popular knowledge of elementary Engineering that is possessed by practically every school boy in England. They are of a more dreamy and philosophical nature, they do not care for work in the workshops and a comparatively small proportion play games. Owing to the unpractical nature of the Bengali, the Public Works Department have been forced to institute a practical examination held at the end of the 12 months of practical training that the students undergo after passing their B.E. Examination.

71,964. **(II.) Systems of Training and Probation.**—This period of training is far shorter than the ordinary apprenticeship a European lad undergoes, and it is far too short to enable the really practical man to show his head above the crowd. It is not every man that passes through an Engineering College in England who ultimately joins the profession, and it is obvious that the proportion of unsuitable Engineering graduates is likely to be higher in India. In England permanent appointments are scarce and, an Engineer, in order to obtain a living, must be a really practical man, so those unsuitable leave the profession at an early stage.

In India (since all Civil Engineering is in the hands of Government or *quasi*-Government concerns) permanent appointments are the rule. Selection for these should not be made until a man has really shown ability as a practical Engineer. It is very probable that one reason why Indian Engineers, in general, have not a good reputation as practical men is, the ease with which unsuitable men are able to obtain and to retain permanent posts.

There is not the same reason for giving a man a permanent post when he is serving in his own country, as in the case of selected Engineers imported from Enrope.

The length of practical training (apprenticeship) should certainly be extended up to three years, increased pay (depending upon satisfactory work) being given in the last two years. Even at the end of this period it is not necessary to offer permanent employment. Selection for the permanent staff should be made on reaching the Executive Engineer rank, Assistant Engineers being employed on temporary terms. This would enable an increased number of Assistant Engineers to be engaged.

Assistant Engineers, not selected for the permanent staff, would have had very sound practical experience, and should be able to obtain ready employment on the Engineering staff of District Boards, Municipalities, &c. Those who have proved unsuitable for the profession would have been discovered at an early stage, they would leave the profession then and would not bring a bad name on the Indian trained Engineer.

If such a method of recruitment be adopted it would give the Indian, who is really an Engineer, a real chance of coming to the front, and would make it easy to select exceptional men for special promotion to the Imperial Service. The knowledge that (as in England) a man's future will depend upon his practical ability as an Engineer, more than on his skill in passing examination tests, will tend to restrict the admissions to the college to lads who have a taste for Engineering, and will tend to keep out the unfit and those more suitable for the medical or other professions.

As noted above, the extremely limited patronage offered by Government to the students of this college has little reference to the sphere entrusted to the college, or to the amount of Civil Engineering construction within that sphere. Increased patronage would attract a larger number of suitable students, and would raise both the prestige of the college and the quality of the output.

Increasing the period of practical training to three years will treble the number of student Engineers under practical training at one time, and may make it difficult to arrange for suitable training.

The Engineers under whom students are placed for training need not be confined to officers serving under Government, but ought to include Engineers serving on railways and with private firms, the Engineer, whether Government or official, being paid a suitable premium for at least the first year's training.

71,965. **(VII.) Employment of Non-Europeans.**—As more suitable training can be provided in India than in Europe for Indians being educated for the Public Works Department, I am of opinion that no Indian should be recruited in England.

In view of the hereditary influences, early environment and unpractical preparatory school training of Indian students, it is not likely that for many years the average Indian will be equivalent to the imported European; therefore I am of opinion that the distinction between Imperial and Provincial Engineers should be retained and that suitable provision should be made for the admission to the Imperial cadre of any Provincial Engineer who may show exceptional merit

71,966. **(VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The Public Works Department (being essentially a professional department) must remain, as at present, independent of the Indian Civil and other services.

Mr. B. Heaton called and examined.

71,967. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he was recruited to the Public Works Department 26 years ago from Cooper's Hill, served four years in the Department and then joined the Civil Engineering College as a Professor. He had been Principal for nearly 10 years.

71,968. There were at present two departments at Simpur, the Engineering Department and the Apprentice Department. In the former there were about 100 students studying for the B.E. degree of the Calcutta University, while in the latter there were about 200 training for the Upper and Lower Subordinate ranks. The students all lived at the college in separate barracks, but did not mix in the college or the workshops. There was a common staff of teachers, but the routine was so arranged that the engineering students had their lectures in the morning and their practical work in the afternoon, while the apprentices had their practical work in the morning and their lectures in the afternoon.

The training of the two classes was not kept as separate as it was at Rurki, and he would like to see a more rigid separation of the students out of class hours so as to obtain a superior class of student.

71,969. It would be to the advantage of the Public Works Department if all who contemplated entering the superior posts were trained at a central college because he did not think Government obtains full value from the four Civil Engineering Colleges now maintained. If civil engineering was to be undertaken by an Imperial department, mechanical engineering, electrical engineering, mining and all higher technical education should be undertaken by the Imperial Government also, even though a central college was not established. The four colleges might be retained, each specialising in a separate subject. He desired to see the Imperial Government undertaking the highest training in all branches of engineering and higher technical training.

71,970. Apart from the students who entered Government service, a certain number became contractors or joined other firms, or went on to District Boards and municipalities, and a large number joined the subordinate ranks of the Public Works Department, some of them becoming, after five years' experience, District Engineers. All the students preferred to obtain Government appointments.

71,971. There was keen competition on the part of students to enter the college. The selection of students was left entirely to himself, and he selected them on their standing in the University examination. It was laid down in the rules that they must have passed the Intermediate examination in Science and have taken both chemistry and physics. An endeavour was also made to ensure that they had some knowledge of drawing. There were about 100 applicants for 40 vacancies.

71,972. His idea was that there should be not one central college but four colleges which he suggested might be devoted one to civil engineering, one to mechanical and electrical engineering, and one to mining, or there might be two colleges for civil engineering if one was not sufficient. The Provincial colleges should retain their present recruitment areas and admit students for a course of about two years. At the end of two years a qualifying examination should be held, conducted by the college authorities and then the students should be allowed to go to one of the special colleges for instruction in one or other particular branch of engineering. Each college would give a grounding in general engineering and would have a special branch of its own. The first two years' training would be of students within the province, but the specialised training would be open to students from all parts of India. It would be a four years' course altogether.

71,973. After the four years' course the students would have to obtain a year's practical training, which could be obtained in India. He did not think it would be possible to arrange for the practical training of students of Indian colleges in England as there were difficulties in the way of getting railways and firms to take them. There was a great deal more civil engineering enterprise going on in India than in England, and consequently a larger number of openings for practical training.

71,974. Students entering the Upper Subordinate Service did not require the same qualification as students going direct into the Provincial Service. The course for subordinates included more practical work in workshops; they were not taken up to the same theoretical standard as the Provincial Service students; the work was essentially practical so that they might be in a position to deal with the workmen they would have to direct. He saw no real objection to such students being trained in the same buildings as the engineering students if separate lectures were provided. In the same building there would be those who were training for the superior posts in their first two years; secondly, those who were specialising in a particular branch, and, thirdly, those who were training for the rank of overseer. It might be advisable to have a separate college for subordinates, but a much more efficient teaching could be obtained by having the students altogether.

71,975. There would be advantages in having the specialised training concentrated in one institution, but that would mean establishing a large technical University for the teaching of civil engineering, mechanical engineering, electrical engineering, mining, etc. Rurki was perhaps not sufficiently equipped for that work; he had not seen Rurki for 5 or 6 years and it might have improved much; but Sibpur might be made into a highly specialised training college if it were better equipped for dealing with larger numbers of students. If the numbers were small it would be almost possible for Sibpur to deal with them now, as the college had the finest workshops of any college in India.

71,976. He was in favour of retaining the division into Imperial and Provincial branches, but would promote exceptional Provincial Engineers to Imperial rates of pay. The education received by the Imperial man in England was in some respects sounder than that obtained in India, as in England a man started with a better educational foundation.

71,977. He proposed that the services of Indian officers in the rank of Assistant Engineers should be temporary and that only officers promoted to executive rank should be placed on the permanent cadre. That would enable the department to be contracted or expanded according to the work that had to be done and he did not think it would give rise to administrative difficulties, though it might raise further invidious distinctions as between Europeans and Indians.

71,978. A proportion of the men recruited to the Overseer grade might, after experience and practical training, be promoted to subdivisional posts.

71,979. He wished to see all Indians recruited in India and would abolish the present system under which 10 per cent. were recruited by the Secretary of State. The Government ought to encourage Indian engineering colleges as much as possible and not cast a slur upon them.

71,980. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) Of the students in the higher class only one received an appointment in the Provincial Service every two years and most of the students had to accept posts in the subordinate service. The Public Works Department received a certain number of students, both engineering and subordinate, for training, and at the end of the period there was a practical examination conducted by the department with the assistance of a Professor from the college, and on the results of that examination appointments were made to the subordinate service. Although the two classes of students were trained differently they were eventually judged by the test of an identical examination. That a large number of B.E.'s sought employment in the subordinate grades was due to the fact that too many students were admitted to the University course. At present 40 were admitted, and he thought the number should be only 20. The evil was aggravated by the fact that neither Burma nor Assam ever offered any appointments in their Provincial Services to the students, probably owing to the fact that they did not desire to be hampered in their recruitment.

71,981. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) He had never had any difficulty in obtaining one year's practical training for his students. There was a sufficient number of scholarships available for those who passed the examination and he arranged for their practical training either with the Bengal Public Works Department, or the Public Works Department of Bihar and Orissa or Assam, or with the Bengal-Nagpur Railway and the Eastern Bengal State Railway. The facilities offered by Government were usually sufficient, and it was only when a larger number of students passed that the railways were asked to take them. Students believed that if they went to railways they had not the same chance of obtaining employment under Government. At present the apprenticeship was only for one year and he wished to see it longer. A man was not an Engineer when he had finished his college course, and it was desirable that the apprenticeship should be for at least three years. That would treble the number of students under training at one time, but there would be no great difficulty in arranging for it. No Government Engineer now took pupils with a

premium, but it would be an advantage if he did so, and the student would be willing to pay if he could not obtain training otherwise.

71,982. A scheme was being drafted for a school of mines and he was confident there would be no difficulty in arranging for practical training in mining, as the miners were anxious to get qualified men and would assist in training such men.

71,983. He saw no objection to all Assistant Engineers being employed on a temporary basis.

71,984. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Rurki although it was allotted six posts provided for a smaller area than the other colleges, Sibpur having the largest recruitment area of any college in India.

71,985. (*Mr. Sly.*) The allocation of posts was made according to the number of vacancies in the Public Works Branch of each province, and probably Bengal had only one appointment, because there was one vacancy on the average every other year. He thought, however, Sibpur should have some consideration on account of its being the college for Burma, Assam and Bihar and Orissa. It was quite possible that some students from Rurki obtained appointments in those provinces.

71,986. Admission to the Sibpur College was limited to Indians and Anglo-Indians from a certain specified area, men from other provinces not being able to obtain admission to the college unless there was a vacancy which could not be filled from the provinces the college represented.

71,987. In Bengal six candidates were sent for one year's probations to the Public Works Department, the first six men on the list having a right to enter for a year's training as part of their college course. For the actual post the final selection was made by the Public Works Department on the result of the practical examination held at the end of the year.

71,988. The qualification for entering the college at present was the Intermediate Science examination. The length of the college course, combined with the increase in the practical training, created an age difficulty, and he wished to be allowed permission to refuse to admit to the college students over a certain age, whether they had read up to the B.Sc. or not, although that might exclude some good students. The educational qualification for admission could not be reduced. Suggestions had been made that the Matriculation should be the educational qualification, but if the standard of a boy passing Matriculation was compared with the standard of a boy entering an engineering college in England, it would be found that the Bengal student would be under very great disabilities, if Matriculation were made an educational standard for admission, because he had had no opportunity in the Bengal schools of specialising towards engineering, *i.e.*, of learning higher mathematics, drawing, science or manual training. The Medical College a short time ago took boys with a Matriculation qualification and lengthened the college course, and in the result Intermediate Science men applied for admission to the Medical College, although the Matriculation examination was the standard, the result being that these lads had to stay a year longer at the Medical College than formerly. The college preferred the Intermediate Science candidate and selected him. The present system of training an Engineer entailed two college courses, the preliminary science course at an Arts or Science college and the final course at the Engineering College, but the standard of the Intermediate Science examination was no higher than the ordinary school leaving standard in England.

71,989. The final examination was conducted by the Calcutta University, which gave no credit for marks awarded at college examinations during the course. There was no physical test and no practical test in workshops, the latter being taken in the Intermediate examination. Of the admitted students about 11 a year passed in the final test. Six competed for Government posts and the remainder the railways were asked to accept. After practical training they had the opportunity of competing for subordinate posts in the Public Works Department, if they wished to take them.

71,990. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The main criticism he had to pass upon the candidates entering the college was their insufficient training in drawing and elementary science. That education could be much better given in Sibpur to students of Matriculation age, but it would necessitate lengthening the course, and the Intermediate Science candidate would be still clamouring to come in for a five years' course, and it would be very difficult to resist the appeal. It was very desirable that a boy, who was being trained for an Engineer, should have a good training in drawing early in life and should be well grounded in science. He would like to catch the students at the Intermediate Science stage.

71,991. The system of combining practical training with theoretical training in a Sandwich system as obtained at some colleges in England was very suitable for mechanical and electrical Engineers, as it was easy to find works where everything was under one roof, but that could not be done with civil engineering. One or two students had gone into private works to study mechanical or electrical engineering during the vacation, but it was very exceptional to do so. The college itself offered a practical training, because there was a very large electrical installation which was maintained entirely by the students.

71,992. He wished to put all the higher technical education under the Government of India, because the outlook of Provincial Governments was limited to the needs of their province. The Bengal Government, for instance, had mining classes, and would develop them in regard to the needs of Bengal only. The present system meant multiplying institutions to such an extent that they would be neither efficient nor economic. There was an advantage in having all the training carried on in one institution, as it widened the outlook of the students, but for this an entirely new technical University for India would be required.

71,993. (*Mr. Madge.*) If the field of practical training was widened at Sibpur and it was possible to get firms such as Sir R. N. Mookerjee's to take some of the pupils for practical training, those pupils would probably obtain as good a practical training as they could get in the Public Works Department or even better. Opportunities existed for training in India, but they were not offered because Indians without exception preferred training under Government.

71,994. At present there were four colleges training Engineers in India, and he suggested that each of them should take up one branch of engineering only in their University classes. That would not mean that before a man could be an all-round Engineer he would have to go the circuit of all the colleges, because it was not necessary that a man should be a good Engineer in all branches of engineering. A student could be given a sufficient amount of general training in the two years he remained in the local college. A similar scheme was in force at Sibpur in connection with apprentices. There were a large number of "feeder" classes in Kurseong, Burdwan, Midnapore, Dacca, Ranchi and many other places, at which students were trained up to a certain stage, and when they reached that particular standard they were offered by the college a choice of civil engineering, mechanical and electrical engineering, and mining, and they could take a special course in either of those branches at the Sibpur College. That system worked very well. The man who went into the Public Works Department took the civil engineering branch, but at the same time he was getting a knowledge of mechanical work in the workshops.

71,995. The ideal would be to have one technical University teaching all branches of engineering, but if that was not possible, the existing colleges might be utilized for specialization in the various branches of engineering. He had put forward his proposal as one which was more likely to be sanctioned as Provincial Governments might not be willing to give up their high grade classes in engineering.

71,996. He did not think any difficulties would arise out of his proposal to employ Assistant Engineers on a temporary basis, as the men would know that after five years or so they would have an opportunity of becoming permanent, and they would do their utmost during the five years to become really efficient. He desired to get away from the principle of guaranteed posts. The system had rather a tendency at Sibpur to make the students study the syllabus with

the object of seeing which were the most mark-getting subjects. They did not come to the college with the idea of becoming efficient Engineers, but with the idea of getting a particular post.

71,997. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The reason why he considered that Indians should not be recruited in England to the Imperial Service was because Government maintained colleges in India for the training of students for Government service, and students should go to those colleges rather than to England. If Indians went to England, they should give up the idea of getting into Government service. If Government maintained colleges and guaranteed to recruit the services from those colleges the guarantee should be adhered to. If the guarantee was abolished and the Bengal Government said they would appoint a Bangali to the Provincial Service, no matter where he was trained, the position would be much sounder, because every boy who came to the college would come to be trained as an Engineer and not for a place under Government. He would be selected for Government service on account of his efficiency as an Engineer, not on account of his facility in passing examinations. An Indian who had been educated in England might be accepted, if qualified, but there should be no guarantee of admission to the service. If he was equally qualified he should have an equal chance with others. In a central Imperial college he thought it would be possible to create a good social and professional atmosphere and to raise the students to the English standard without their going to England. No doubt England offered a better mechanical and electrical training, as methods there were more up-to-date and there were more extensive works.

71,998. With regard to the difficulty connected with the age of admission to the college, the only suggestion he could make was that no one should be admitted after the age of 19. There should be then a four years' course followed by a year of practical training, which would bring the age up to 24 as the maximum if the students passed through without failure.

71,999. About a fourth of the students in the college this year were B.Sc.'s and three-fourths Intermediate Science. Nearly all the students who applied for admission had already applied for admission to the Medical College or some other professional college, so that it could not be said they came to Sibpur with an inherent taste for engineering.

72,000. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The majority of Indians who went to England for training had already failed to obtain admission to one of the engineering colleges of India. The number of admissions to the colleges in India was strictly limited; for instance, Sibpur could only take 40 in an area comprising one hundred million inhabitants. Amongst those who were unable to get into Sibpur there might be very good men. His main point in objecting to English Engineering training for Indians was his desire to encourage education in India.

72,001. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) In England practically every student who went to an engineering college had to go through a four or five years' apprenticeship before he had the opportunity of obtaining work. If the same rule obtained in India, there would not be the same complaint about Indian-trained Engineers. At present a student on passing from the college thought that he knew quite enough to undertake at once well paid work and he did not realise his deficiences. An undue value was placed upon the B.A., B.E., and S.Sc. certificates. Students had a very great objection to paying for their experience and also to accepting posts on low pay, arguing that if they accepted such posts it would be said that that was the market value they placed upon themselves, and that if their market value was that of an Overseer, they could hardly expect to receive larger pay afterwards. There was also a difficulty in connection with the students working in outside workshops where lower caste workmen were employed. This difficulty did not obtain in the college workshops. The inefficiency of the Indian Engineer was due in the main, first, to his objection to going in for a practical course; secondly, to the great difficulty of obtaining a sufficiently good practical course in works, and, thirdly, the unsuitable character of the preliminary training before they joined the engineering college. He did not think there was likely to be any very great improvement in those directions so long as the Matriculation examination of the Universities was the be-all and end-all of a student's school career. If there was an examination for students, who had been trained especially for industries, then he believed satisfactory material would be obtained. The opportunities already existed in India for a real practical training in works after students had left the college, but they did not take advantage of them.

(The witness withdrew.)

O. H. Desenne, Esq., Executive Engineer, Assam.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,002. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—Imperial Engineers should be recruited by competition from a Central College in England and Provincial Engineers from one Central College in India.

72,003. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—Both Imperial and Provincial Engineers should undergo a year's training in India on some large work which is being carried out by departmental agency. The work need not necessarily be in the province to which the Assistant Engineer will be posted.

72,004. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—The following recommendations are made:—

(1) That for the "Public Works Department" be substituted the "Public Works Imperial/Indian Service" and Provincial Engineers who reach administrative grades be absorbed in the Imperial Service.

(2) That free medical attendance be provided for the families of officers.

(3) That the travelling allowance rules be reconsidered, especially as regards (1) travelling by inland steamer, (2) expenses on transfer, (3) travelling allowance of Assistant Engineers.

(4) That administrative appointments be made and controlled by the Goverment of India.

(5) That the interest of Public Works Department officers be safeguarded against supersession by Royal Engineer officers.

(6) That the cost of the site for a residence shall be fixed without reference to its actual cost due to local variations in the price of land or to special circumstances, and shall be a fixed percentage of the cost of the proposed residence.

(7) That Engineers shall obtain a reduction in the fees payable for the education of their sons in the Central Training Colleges if established in England or in India.

(8) Superintending Engineers like Conservators of Forests should be Heads of Departments (except in cases where they are under the orders of a Chief Engineer who is not a Secretary to the Local Government or Administration) as their responsibilities are at least as great. The Chief Engineer's duties would then not be diffentiated from those of a Secretary to the Local Government or Administration.

(9) That temporary Engineers should not be placed in charge of permanent Public Works Division; they should only be employed in accordance with their designation in charge of temporary divisions or as technical experts and their functions should never be administrative.

72,005. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—The pay of Provincial Engineers should be raised to $\frac{3}{4}$ of that of the corresponding ranks in the Imperial Service.

Provincial Engineers promoted to administrative grades should get the same pay as Imperial Engineers. The pay of Imperial Engineers has recently been increased, and a married officer can now only just manage to make both ends meet.

The attached (*vide* Annexure) shows the estimated percentages of expenditure of a married officer in the executive grades who regulates his expenditure

in a rational manner under the existing conditions of service.

72,006. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—Proposed:—

(1) That the period of service qualifying for leave be reduced to 4 years.

(2*a*) That furlough allowance be ½ of the average salary in India.

(2*b*) That furlough allowance be ½ of the average salary out of India with a minimum of £300 for Imperial Engineers.

(3) That there should be the option of taking short—six months—leave out of India on full pay after four years of uninterrupted service—three months to be treated as privilege and three months as equivalent to six months' furlough.

(4) That twelve months' study leave in the whole service with the necessary safeguards and allowances be given, in addition to all furlough admissible under the rules.

(5) That privilege leave be assimilated to furlough in the matter of carrying on to an officer's credit leave which he is prevented by the exigencies of the service from taking.

72,007. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—That pensions should be improved on the lines proposed in the petitions recently submitted by Imperial Engineers to the Government of India, but preferably in the case of new recruits pension should be replaced by a provident fund on the lines of the State Railway Provident Fund, officers subscribing a fixed percentage of their pay, to which Government should contribute an equal amount, the accumulations to be the absolute property of the subscribers and their heirs. On retirement an officer should have the option of withdrawing the accumulated amount of his own deposits and draw interest till his death on the balance, when it would be paid to his estate. In this way an officer will be certain of getting his pension or deferred pay and he will be able to make some provision for his family. For officers who are already in the service of Government a widow's pension of £100 a year should be allowed by Government.

72,008. **(VII.) Limitations in the Employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—The number of Provincial officers as at present recruited is, owing to the laws of supply and demand, and market values, a measure of the inefficiency which the Government of India are prepared to condone; and the proportion of such officers must be determined accordingly. The fact that private concerns find it necessary to employ the services of men whose qualifications correspond to those of Imperial Engineers, on a salary higher than that which the local supply of Engineers trained in Indian Colleges would be prepared to accept, proves this point.

The Imperial Service should be filled only by recruits appointed in England, facilities being given if necessary to Indians, in order to enable them to compete on even terms with Europeans.

72,009. **(VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—If this enquiry is directed to conditions of social intercourse—these are eminently satisfactory. The roads and buildings branch is however subjected to unfair criticisms owing to unsatisfactory results and delays which are often due to a course of action being pursued over which this Department is not at present in a position to exercise its veto. This Department is second to no other in its efficiency, but the scope of its functions is not generally understood and its position in relation to some of the other departments and services requires strengthening.

Annexure (*vide* 72,005).

	Per cent.
1. Medical attendance, including midwifery cases and medicines ...	2½
2. General Provident Fund subscription	12½
3. Income tax	2½
4. Life Insurance	10
5. Provision for 9 months' leave (3 months' privilege and 6 months' furlough every six years, including passage)	10
6. House rent	10
7. Household expenses, including servants, food, furniture, clothes ...	40
	87½

This leaves 12½ per cent. for the club bill, education of children, purchase of horses or other means of conveyance, subscription lists and contingencies, and is inadequate.

The above applies to the average salary of the married officer drawing Rs. 1,000 per mensem, and those drawing less or more are comparatively worse or better off, as the percentages of some of the above items 4, 5, 6, and 7 need not necessarily be increased in direct proportion to the larger pay.

Mr. O. H. Desenne called and examined.

72,010. (*Chairman.*) Witness had been in the service for 15½ years. He represented about 17 Engineers, and his views generally represented those of the Imperial engineering service in Assam.

72,011. He proposed that Imperial Engineers should be recruited by competition from a central college in England, not because the present system of nomination by the Secretary of State had given unsatisfactory results; the suggestion was put forward chiefly on the ground of *esprit de corps*. In a department like the Public Works Department *esprit de corps* was a very valuable asset; and there was much apprehension that that spirit was gradually disappearing under the present system of appointments. There was also the question of the training of Indians in England, which seemed to present great difficulties. With the establishment of a central college those difficulties would disappear.

72,012. He suggested that all Indians, who were admitted into the Imperial Service, should be trained in England. He said that partly from the result of experience, and also from the point of view of market value. A Provincial Engineer with an Indian training drew, on an average, less in the open market than the home man with qualifications equal to those of the Imperial Engineer.

72,013. He had come in contact with Indians who had been trained in England, and they made much better Engineers than those trained in India. It was necessary that Indians should go to England to be trained.

72,014. He had but very little experience of Indian colleges, although he had had both Rurki and Sibpur men under him. Personally he preferred the men from Rurki.

72,015. He knew his view as to the inadequacy of training in Indian colleges was very different from that which had been put forward before the Commission by several responsible witnesses.

72,016. Assuming that Indians were to be trained in India, he considered that it would be advisable to have a central college, in preference to colleges in each of the various provinces, because the different races would be more blended together, and the rough corners would be sheared off more readily.

72,017. He recommended a year's training in India for both Imperial and Provincial Engineers, on work which was being done departmentally. There was a great deal of difference between work which the Public Works Department did by contract, and work which it did departmentally, where there were no contractors, and where the department looked into the details, and did the actual work itself. He agreed it was important that young officers should be placed on some big constructional work, and not on ordinary routine work. It was not always the case that big constructional work was put out to contract. The witness himself had carried out fairly big works departmentally. His reason of suggesting a year's training in India was that it gave a young officer the opportunity of coming into contact with men with whom he would have to deal for the rest of his service. It would also enable

him to learn the language and the various conditions of the country.

72,018. The present average age of men coming into the service was 25, which he thought was a little too advanced; 23 would be a very good average age.

72,019. He was strongly of the opinion that the interests of the officers in the department should be safeguarded against supersession by Royal Engineer officers. He thought the latter should come in at the bottom of the list, so as not to supersede those already in the service. At the present time Royal Engineer officers were placed over the heads of several civilian Engineers on the list. The complaint was not so acute as it had been in the past, and his colleagues were not complaining so much against what was happening at present; all they required was a safeguard against any revival of the past system. In Assam there were two Royal Engineer officers.

72,020. With regard to pension, the witness endorsed the proposals which had been put forward in the petitions recently submitted by the Imperial Engineers, but in the case of new recruits he recommended the replacement of pensions by a provident fund, which he thought was more satisfactory. Under the present system many Chief Engineers had died in harness, thereby losing their pensions. He would like to see a system in vogue similar to the State Railway Provident Fund. That, as at present organised, gave larger benefits than the present non-contributory pensions. His chief reason for putting forward the suggestion was that it would ensure some sort of provision for the widow of the officer. He thought for officers who were already in the service, Government should allow a widow's pension of £100 a year, in addition to the increased scale of pensions mentioned in the Imperial Engineers' petition.

72,021. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) He suggested that administrative appointments should be made and controlled by the Government of India, because if promotions were made on one general list for the whole of India and men could be transferred to other provinces, it would minimise blocks in promotion, and neutralise differences in the rates of promotion due to separate sanctioned cadres for each province.

72,022. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) Questions coming within the purview of the Secretary to Government (Public Works Department) were very often dealt with to a certain extent by other departments. It was not a very crying abuse, or a matter of paramount importance, but at the same time it would strengthen the position of the Public Works Department if it was understood that all orders of the local administration regarding Public Works Department matters should be dealt with only by the Public Works Department. He did not agree that it would possibly strengthen the position of the Public Works Department at the expense of the Local Government; the Public Works Department was part and parcel of the Local Goverment; but it might strengthen the Public Works Department Secretary at the expense of other Secretaries.

72,023. (*Mr. Madge.*) He thought the establishment of a central college in India for Provincial Engineers was quite a practicable proposal. He would not abolish the existing Provincial colleges; he would have one central college for higher engineering, and let the local colleges remain for the lower engineering training. He agreed that there were other services, which were recruited otherwise than through a central college, which still retained their *esprit de corps*, but he did not think that spirit was quite so well developed as it would be with a central college.

72,024. In Assam the Public Works Department gave out a lot of work to petty contractors. There were very few large contractors. The department had the supervision of all work done.

72,025. The Secretariat of the Public Works Department was not strong enough. For instance, they were constantly told by the Secretary of State for India that they must not on any account purchase European stores locally. In the face of that, it was found that large quantities of European stores were purchased locally, and the Public Works Department was blamed.

72,026. The reason was there was a rush, the work had to be done, and there was no help for it under the existing system. In many similar instances, very much against the wishes of the Public Works Department, rules had to be broken owing to the Public Works Department not being strong enough, *e.g.*, "sanctioned amounts of schemes and projects being exceeded owing to their scope being widened under the orders of other departments." It was true that the Chief Engineer was Secretary to Government, but he had distinct duties as Chief Engineer, and distinct duties as Secretary. While he was Secretary on the one hand, on the other he was merely head of a department, whereas the other Secretaries were purely Secretaries and nothing else.

72,027. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The proposal that the pay of the Provincial Engineer should be raised from two-thirds to three-quarters of the pay of the Imperial Engineer was simply put forward as a concession to the Provincial Engineers. He did not wish to imply that in the case of the average Provincial Engineer the standard of living had risen in proportion to the increase of pay suggested. He proposed they should be paid something above the market rate, in order to produce more contentment in the service.

72,028. He thought the majority of the Assam Engineers were of the opinion that Englishmen coming out into the service should undergo a period of probation in India. That was not because they had had experience of the evils of the opposite system, of bringing out people and of not submitting them to any period of probation. He did not find that young men who came out from England without any knowledge of India maltreated their native subordinates. As a matter of fact, these officers were always kept under very strict supervision for the first year, simply being given opportunities of getting acquainted with the language and local conditions; they did not have much chance of getting into mischief, even if they were so inclined. He had had some experience of Indians who had been sent out from England, and he should say that they stood on a much higher level than Indians who had simply passed through the Indian colleges.

72,029. (*Mr. Sly.*) Government should have the right to reject an officer at the end of the year's probation, if it was found that his probationary training had not been satisfactory. It was possible that the chances of being thrown out of employment after a period of probation might affect recruitment in England, but he did not think it would interfere with Indian recruitment. If Government were to guarantee a return passage to a rejected candidate, the effect on recruitment in England would be much less. He would not be prepared to go a stage further, and say that all Engineers wishing to enter the Public Works Department should be, in the first place, recruited temporarily under a five or seven years' contract, and should then either go back to England, or be appointed permanently for service in India. It was much better to have a man permanently engaged from the very beginning. He had had experience of two Engineers who had been brought out for a period of years, and they had turned out very good men, but he did not think such a method of recruitment would be suitable for the Public Works Department. The objection to it would be that men would not go in for solid work, but would confine themselves to "eye-wash," and simply do superficial work which would strike the eye. The result would be that the more solid work of the department would suffer. He quite agreed it was the case that practically all engineering service, other than the engineering service of India, was on short-term contracts, but the work of the Public Works Department was quite different. There was a great deal of administrative work to be performed over and above the technical and detailed work. Over and above this there was no difficulty in the case of private firms in getting rid of undesirables, but in Government service a strong case of inefficiency would have to be made out before a short term contract man could be sent back.

72,030. The Assam Provincial Service was not recruited from Sibpur, but from Rurki. There was promotion from the Subordinate into the Provincial Service in Assam. This system worked very satisfactorily. He certainly would not desire to see it abolished.

72,031. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) It was the fact that many men in the Public Works Department did pay as much as 10 per cent. of their salary for life insurance.

72,032. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The proposal made in the report of the conference held at Shillong to the effect "that the rule under which increments are withheld, if an officer does not obtain charge of a division, should be made inapplicable to cases where a divisional charge, or post equivalent to a divisional charge, is not available for an officer who has been reported fit for such a charge" was not included in the subsequent written statement because the witness had heard that the recommendation had practically been given effect to. He would not be prepared to guarantee that that was the fact, but that was the reason why it was not put into the subsequent written statement.

72,033. (*Mr. Sweet.*) He insisted on the year's training in England for Indian-recruited Engineers, chiefly because of the wider outlook which they would obtain in this way. There mere fact of walking in a London street widened the outlook of an Indian.

72,034. (*Mr. Watkins.*) In his experience, an Indian trained in England was quite good enough for the Imperial Service. He agreed that a training at home was not the only requisite, but it certainly was one which was absolutely necessary.

(The witness withdrew.)

F. H. Hodgkins, Esq., District Engineer, Assam.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,035. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.** — The superior grades of the department are recruited in four ways:—

(*a*) By importing recruits from England, including Royal Engineers.

(*b*) By appointment of the successful candidates from the Engineering Colleges in India who secure guaranteed appointments by open competition.

(*c*) By translating temporary Engineers, wheresoever secured, to the permanent list.

(*d*) By the promotion of selected officers from the subordinate grades of the Public Works Department.

Recruits from England are appointed by a Selection Committee at the India Office without competition. The annual recruitment from England has increased. The numbers during a series of years (*vide* the reply given in the House of Commons on the 19th April 1911) are as follows:—

1908	39	Average 30·5.
1909	30	
1910	30	
1911	23	

The annual recruitment in India is approximately 14, viz., 9 for the successful candidates of the Indian Engineering Colleges and 5 for selected upper subordinates.

The proportion of recruits from England and India, respectively, is therefore 2 to 1, or of recruits from England and of the Indian Engineering College men, is as 7 to 2, that is say, only 23 per cent. of the annual recruitment (excluding promoted subordinates) is obtained from the Indian Engineering Colleges. In other words, 77 per cent. of the total annual recruitments is made by selection and only 23 per cent. by open competition. This proportion of recruitment for the Indian Colleges, which, be it remembered are institutions maintained at great cost to the State, is thus very small as compared to that from England.

This proportion of recruitment should be contrasted with that existing at the time of the Public Services Commission of 1886-87, and the recommendation of that Commission. It will be noticed (*vide* page 362 of Appendix O of the appendices to the report of that body) that the annual recruitment from England and the Indian Colleges was at that time in the proportion of 21 to 9, that is to say, the Indian Colleges received 30 per cent. of the annual appointments. It is, therefore, manifest that, notwithstanding the fact that the said Commission recommended a gradual increase in the number of appointments to be given to the Indian Colleges, by reducing the English recruitment, the reverse has been the practice.

It is my opinion that the legitimate aspirations of the public in this country cannot be satisfied unless a greater proportion of the superior appointments in the Public Works Department is reserved for competition in India. I would suggest as a suitable remedy that at least 50 per cent. of the total annual recruitments be made in India for the present, and that this proportion should be gradually increased as conditions change. I think, moreover, that of this 50 per cent., at least 10 men should be promoted by selection from the Upper Subordinate grades.

Again, as regards the system of recruitment in England, the method of selection should be discarded for a system of open competition. This system already prevails in India, and as an alteration I would suggest the creation of an Imperial College in place of the four existing provincial institutions. The advantages of this system are sufficiently obvious and need not be enlarged upon.

72,036. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—*TRAINING.*—(*a*) *Of Men recruited from England.*—There is no guarantee that the preliminary training obtained by these recruits is such as to meet the requirements of India. The training should be specifically directed to one special end, viz., the efficient performance of duties in India, and the curriculum should include one Indian language.

The only remedy is a special Engineering College, in which the desired training shall be given, similar to the Royal Engineering College at Cooper's Hill. But steps must be taken to ensure that the competition between candidates undergoing such training shall be real, that is to say, the appointments offered must not in any year exceed a fixed proportion of the competing candidates. A suitable arrangement would be that the appointments offered should not exceed one-third of the number of candidates.

This suggestion is not an unreasonable one, when considered with the conditions frequently prevailing in the Indian Engineering Colleges. For example, it has happened at Rurki that 18 to 25 candidates have competed for 5 or 6 appointments: again, at the Poona College of Science it has happened that no less than 40 to 50 candidates have competed for one single appointment.

(*b*) *Of Men recruited from Indian Colleges.*—The training imparted in these institutions is, I think, sound and fairly exhaustive. It is directed wholly and solely to the requirements of India, and the Government can, at any time, introduce any changes as may be required, since these institutions are maintained by the State. In addition, the Indian College Engineer has the advantage of receiving his training in the country in which he has to practice his profession.

PROBATION.—The training received by men from the Indian Colleges is further supplemented by a period of training on probation for one year in the Department, which is not the case with recruits obtained from England. This probationary period in the Department is necessary and should be insisted upon as an indispensable condition, and should be a period of probation in the strictest sense, involving selection and the possibility of rejection at the end of it. Any plea that this is unfair or will deter candidates from England, may be met by the provision of free return passages to rejected probationers. This, minus the free passage, is exactly what prevails at the present moment in the case of recruits from Rurki.

72,037. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—The conditions of service between recruits appointed in England and India vary considerably, and this is the

cause of the great discontent which prevails among the latter class of officers. Notwithstanding the fact that both classes of officers are recruited for and required to do the same work, and bear the same responsibilities, the position of officers from England is more favourable in every respect as compared with that of the officers recruited in India. This policy which has prevailed since the date when effect was given to the recommendation of the Public Service Commission of 1886-87 has not, I think, been for the good of the Department.

72,038. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—The pay of the Indian recruited element is approximately two-thirds of that granted to men recruited in England. This I consider is unfair. This distinction should, I think, be abolished and there should be no difference in pay between officers who do exactly the same work and have the same responsibilities.

72,039. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—Here again there is much disparity between the conditions prevailing, as regards both these classes of officers. Great stress has been laid on the advantage to be derived by an Engineer in visiting foreign countries; unless the conditions of leave are the same for both classes of officers, it becomes impossible for Indian trained men even if they desire to do so, to secure the same advantage in this direction as the English trained men.

Again, the nature of an Engineer's duties in the Public Works Department involves continued exposure and bodily discomfort for long periods, and the health of an Indian trained officer suffers equally with that of an imported man. There is, therefore, no reason whatever to perpetuate the present distinction. The Indian College Engineers should, therefore, receive exactly the same leave conditions as their contemporaries recruited from England.

72,040. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—Here again there is an unfair distinction (*vide* Article 636, Civil Service Regulations), which will create invidious and unjust anomalies. For example, an Indian-trained Chief Engineer will draw less pension than his own subordinate recruited from England.

It is a well-known and universally established principle that pensions are granted as a retiring provision for specific services rendered to the State, and it is therefore illogical and unjust to create or maintain any distinction in this direction between persons who have in fact rendered exactly the same service to the State. In other words pensions ought to be wholly and solely dependent on specific services rendered and not on place of original recruitment for this does not involve any special merit.

72,041. **(VII.) Limitations in the Employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—(*a*) As argued above the Department should be recruited half from England and half in India, for the present.

(*b*) The separation of the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial sections is very undesirable when it is remembered that both classes of officers do exactly the same work and bear the same responsibilities.

The ultimate result will, in my opinion, greatly injure efficiency and already causes great discontent. The conditions of work and responsibilities being, as they are, equal in all respects, the confirmation of the differentiation in the matter of pay, &c., would not be fair.

It is therefore urged that Indian College trained men be restored to the position formerly occupied, that is to say, it should be one service, for all the Public Works Department. The proportion of Indians recruited both in India and England should, I think, not be changed.

72,042. **(IX.) Other Points.**—*System of appointing Temporary Engineers.*—This might be improved. At present these appointments are made from various sources, viz.:—

(*a*) Indian trained and qualified Engineers, who fail to secure guaranteed appointments when competing for them.

(*b*) Engineers imported from England under covenant.

(*c*) Unqualified persons appointed in India.

Except where special experts are required, Temporary Engineers' appointments should, I think, be filled solely from the Engineers of the Indian Colleges, and until such time as this source of supply is exhausted no unqualified persons should be entertained. Again there is considerable room for improvement in the conditions of service of Temporary Engineers. These officers are liable to be discharged with very limited notice, irrespective of the length of their service. I would suggest that such service be regarded as permanent non-pensionable, and should have a time-scale of pay, as is the case with Permanent Engineers.

Local allowances.—Indian recruited officers receive two-thirds of the local allowances granted to officers from England. This difference is not fair, for the said local allowances are always given for a specific purpose, that is, as compensation for local disabilities which equally affect both classes of officers.

Probationary period.—Not only have Indian trained officers to undergo a probationary period and thereby incur the consequent risk of rejection after receiving years of special training, which is not the case with imported officers, but even after completing such probation, the period so spent is not counted for promotion in the Department. This is a distinction which I think should be abolished.

Mr. F. H. Hodgkins called and examined.

72,043. (*Chairman.*) Witness had been 20 years in the service. His present position was that of District Engineer at Chittagong. He represented the only three provincial officers in Assam.

72,044. His view was that the division into Imperial and Provincial branches should be broken down, and he suggested that 50 per cent. of the total number of annual entrants to the superior engineering service should be recruited in India. He put that forward on the ground that Indian trained Engineer was as efficient as the European trained Engineer. Fifty per cent. was a sufficient increase on the pr sent proportion. He thought that figure should be gradually increased as conditions changed. He meant by that, that if the 50 per cent. was adopted, and it was found to be a success, and the training in India went on being improved and the necessity for men from England was diminished, recruitment in India might be increased.

72,045. He recommended the establishment of an Imperial College in India in place of the four existing permanent institutions. He did not think a central college would have an adverse effect on recruitment from any of the provinces. He suggested the absolute abolition of the existing institutions, as he thought the Imperial college could efficiently train both for the Imperial and Provincial Services, including the subordinate ranks. It would mean the college staff would have to be very much enlarged, but that the additional staff required could be transferred from the colleges which it was proposed to abolish. He thought it would be a suitable arrangement that all subordinate candidates from the various provinces of India should congregate at one central college. He did not think there was much objection in the fact that they would have to come from one end of India to the other to be trained. He would lay down a rule that candidates for entry to the proposed Imperial college, before competing for admission, should have graduated at the University of Calcutta or Allahabad, and that the subordinates should have passed the Matriculation examination. He would keep subordinates separate from the Imperial candidates.

72,046. With regard to pay, he considered it unfair that the salary of Indian recruited officers should be less than that of officers recruited in England, because the former did similar work, and under-

took the same responsibilities as the latter. He would not say that the market value varied as between the officer who came from a distance and the officer who was recruited in his own country. If the principle were laid down that something in the nature of a foreign service allowance should be granted to all European imported officers, it would be quite a fair arrangement. This foreign allowance should only be sufficient to cover the cost of the voyage to and from England when on leave, and if it were kept quite separate from salary, it would largely remove the present discontent.

72,047. He suggested that service as temporary Engineer should be regarded as permanent non-pensionable service; if temporary Engineers obtained a pension, he thought they would be more satisfied with that than with any other proposal. He agreed that it was better for temporary Engineers to be employed on fairly temporary work, and for strictly limited periods. There were no temporary Engineers in Assam, except when big works were being undertaken.

72,048. In regard to the establishment of a Family Pension Fund, he would like to see some arrangement by which a widow and the family could be provided for, and the pension earned by an Engineer not entirely lost in the event of his death.

72,049. As to leave, and the disparity between the conditions prevailing between the two services, he agreed that his proposal rather pointed towards the grant of greater facilities for study leave. At the same time he maintained that there should be no difference in leave earned by Indian recruited or imported Engineers. If privilege leave was earned and it so happened that a man could not take it, he should be allowed to accumulate it up to six months.

72,050. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The discrepancy between the statement in the written statement, that the annual recruitment from England had increased, and the figures, which showed that as a matter of fact it had decreased, was explained by the fact that he had taken the average for the four years mentioned, and had compared it with the average of another four years, some years ago. Paragraphs 3 and 4 of his written statement should be read in connection with these figures.

72,051. He did not think it would be reasonable to take the foreign service allowance into consideration when a man's pension was being assessed. That was the reason why he thought it should be called an allowance. While he would admit the reasonableness of granting men a foreign service allowance during the period of their service in India, he would only give them the same pension that the Indian recruited officer was entitled to. He did not suggest for a moment that the pay of a man recruited in England should be reduced, but that he should be given a foreign service allowance over and above what he was drawing at the present time.

72,052. (*Mr. Sly.*) He considered the present prospects did not attract sufficiently good men into the Provincial Service, at least as regards Anglo-Indians. Despite the evidence given by the Principals of the colleges, namely, that there was great competition to enter the colleges, and that there was an ample supply of candidates of every kind, he still maintained that the service was getting unpopular.

72,053. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The principal reason of that unpopularity was that a man in the Provincial Service held charge of a division which he had probably taken over from an Imperial man, but was given a lower scale of pay. Moreover, it sometimes happened that an Imperial Assistant Engineer working under a Provincial Executive Engineer drew more pay than the latter. The same applied to Provincial Superintending Engineers and Imperial Executive Engineers.

72,054. The rates of pay offered by District Boards were higher than those enjoyed by the Provincial Service. It was not his view that a good young student from Sibpur or Rurki would prefer to be employed by a District Board than by Government, because in the latter case there was the advantage of a pension, and permanent employment, and to that extent Government service was more attractive than private service. He did not know whether it was the fact that the first man from Sibpur always accepted a Government appointment if he could obtain it.

72,055. (*Mr. Madge.*) Local requirements were very different from requirements in England. The locally trained man had the advantage of being thoroughly acquainted with the language, he could get along with his labour better, and he knew the habits of the Indians much more intimately than a man who had just come out from England. For a year at least, a recruit from England could not be very useful. As far as the qualifications of men recruited in England were concerned, there was nothing to complain about; it was simply that the conditions under which they had to work in India were quite foreign to those to which they had been accustomed in England.

72,056. The members of his service would be willing, he thought, to have their furlough reduced, if they could get six months' privilege leave on full pay.

72,057. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness was recruited to the department from Rurki 21 years ago. He did not know how many other officers were recruited from Rurki in that year.

72,058. (*Mr. Sweet.*) The scale of pay of Provincial Engineers was quite insufficient, and this grievance was aggravated when for the same duties and responsibilities Imperial men received more pay. He did not think his proposal, if acceded to, would eventually saddle the country with an engineering service paid very much in excess of what was really necessary.

72,059. (*Mr. Watkins.*) He passed into the service from the upper subordinate ranks. After a period of work as an upper subordinate, he was promoted, under the existing rules, to the Provincial Service. He was not trained as an Engineer in Rurki.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Calcutta, Wednesday, 7th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, ESQ., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, ESQ.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, ESQ., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, ESQ., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, ESQ.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

H. H. GREEN, ESQ, Superintending Engineer, Bengal.
SHASHI BHUSHAN MAZUMDAR, Executive Engineer, Bengal.
B. M. SAMUELSON, ESQ., Executive Engineer, Burma.

R. R. SCOTT, ESQ. (*Joint Secretary*).

L. W. LEWIS, ESQ., Executive Engineer, Burma.

**Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department, being the corporate opinion of Officers in Imperial Service of the Public Works Department in Burma:—*

(i) *Recruited from the Royal Indian Engineering College, Cooper's Hill and* (ii) *Appointed by the Secretary of State for India.*

72,060. **(I.) Method of Recruitment.**—The present system of selection from qualified applicants should be continued. Candidates for appointment should have taken the Honours Degree or Diploma of some recognised Engineering College and should be required to obtain a nomination from the Head of their College. There would be no limit to the number of these nominations and final selection would be made by a Selection Committee. The present age limit is suitable.

A Special Selection Committee should be appointed annually to deal with applications for appointments to be made that year. At least one-third of the members of this Committee should be senior Officers of the Indian Public Works Department either still on the active list or only recently retired. Candidates rejected should not be eligible for appointment in subsequent years.

Special attention should be given to the general character and social qualifications of the candidates in order to fully maintain the high standard of the Department. Such special qualifications are essential for Officers who will be required to deal extensively with the other departments both Civil and Military and to command the trust and respect of the Natives of the country.

In order to assist the Selection Committee in choosing the candidates most likely to fulfil the special requirements of the Indian Service the Heads of Colleges should be asked to submit to them a confidential report on the general character and special qualifications of each candidate nominated by them.

72,061. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—A period of training on works in England is not of much value and should not be insisted on. The conditions under which work is carried out in India are so entirely different that it is better to give every officer appointed in England one year's training on works in India after appointment so that he can learn Indian conditions and study the vernacular language.

It is not advisable to introduce a period of probation after appointment owing to the practical difficulty of making such a safeguard an effective one, while its introduction would probably have an adverse effect on the recruitment.

The Departmental professional examination provided for by Public Works Department Code, Volume I, paragraphs 167 to 169 should be made a thorough practical test of Departmental efficiency and there should be no hesitation in stopping the increments of an officer who is unable to pass this examination satisfactorily within three years of joining his appointment.

72,062. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—The rule contained in Article 649, Civil Service Regulations, requiring all officers of the Public Works Department to retire on attaining the age of 55 years should be rigidly enforced and extensions of service beyond this age should not be given in appointments against the Cadre as such extensions block the promotion of other deserving officers.

All officers who on reaching the age of 50 years have not attained to the rank of Superintending Engineer should be compulsorily retired under Civil Service Regulations, Article 649, unless they are reported as fully qualified for the post of Superintending Engineer.

No Chief Engineer should be permitted to retain the same appointment for more than five years.

According to the present rules introduced with the incremental scale of pay, an officer of the Imperial Service cannot draw more than Rs. 800 per mensem unless he is in charge of a Division or a charge which in the opinion of the local Government is of equal importance. It seems unjust that the increments of an officer under the incremental scale of pay should be stopped owing to a block in promotion caused by errors of recruitment. The rule should be altered to the effect that an Officer of the Imperial Service cannot draw more than Rs. 800 per mensem unless in charge of a Division or reported on as qualified for the charge of a Division. As the rules now stand it seems that a fully qualified officer of ten years' service for whom no Division was available would not only lose an immediate increment but would also lose service for future increments.

72,063. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—In 1908 the pay of the Public Works Department was re-organised and placed on an incremental scale but at the same time the Exchange Compensation Allowance formerly given to Officers of this Department was withdrawn so that the actual increase then made in the emoluments of the Department was not nearly so large as

* The statement was signed by Mr. F. St. G. Manners-Smith and Mr. G. C. Stawell, for Officers representing Imperial section from Coopers Hill, and by Mr. R. Stanley Baker, for Officers representing Imperial section appointed by Secretary of State.

it appeared to be as is shown in the tabular statement below—

Year of Service.	Old Grade Pay.	Ditto including Exchange Compensation Allowance.	Present Incremental Pay, 1908.	Net increase given by 1908 Scheme.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1	350	372	380	+ 8
2	350	372	420	+ 48
3	350	372	460	+ 88
4	450	478	500	+ 22
5	450	478	540	+ 62
6	450	478	580	+ 102
7	450-550	474-584	620	+ 102+36
8	550	584	660	+ 76
9	550	584	700	+ 116
10	550	584	750	+ 166
11	550	584	800	+ 216
12	700	744	850	+ 106
13	700	744	900	+ 156
14	700	744	950	+ 206
15	700-850	744-903	1,000	+ 256+97
16	850	903	1,050	+ 147
17	850	903	1,100	+ 197
18	850	903	1,150	+ 247
19	850	903	1,200	+ 297
20	1,000	1,062	1,250	+ 188
23	1,050	1,116	1,250	+ 134
27	1,100	1,169	1,250	+ 81
		Administrative Grades.		
S.E., 3rd	1,500	1,594	1,500	— 94
S.E., 2nd	1,750	1,859	1,750	— 109
S.E., 1st	2,000	2,125	2,000	— 125
C.E., 2nd	2,500	2,656	2,500	— 156
C.E., 1st	2,750	2,922	2,750	— 172

The continued rapid increase in the cost of living both in India and in England indicates that it will not be long before a further revision of the scale of pay will be necessary.

Under the old scale of pay Executive Engineers, 1st grade, could be granted two increments of Rs. 50 on completing four and eight years, respectively, in that grade thus raising the maximum pay of an Executive Engineer to Rs. 1,100 obtainable after not less than 27 years' service.

Under the incremental scale of pay introduced in 1908, the increments of an Executive Engineer cease after the 20th year although he is not likely to attain the rank of Superintending Engineer till he has completed at least 25 years' service. Executive Engineers of over 20 years' service should be given biennial increments of Rs. 50 counting from the date of the last increment and subject to the maximum limit of Rs. 1,400 which would be reached after completing 25 years' service. These special increments should be conditional on the officer being reported as qualified for promotion to Superintending Engineer rank, but the grant of the increment would not give the officer any prior claim to such promotion.

In the case of Administrative grades the re-organization scheme of 1908 actually entails an appreciable reduction in the pay and allowances attached to these appointments owing to the withdrawal of Exchange Compensation Allowances. The pay of the Administrative grades in the 1908 scheme are identical with the revised scale of pay for these grades that was introduced in 1905. In Government of India Resolution No. 471 E., dated the 30th April 1906, Exchange Compensation Allowance in the administrative grades was withdrawn from all officers appointed to the Department in and after the year 1907, while Government of India Resolution No. 675-694 E., dated the 24th April 1908, states, "No change is made in the pay of officers of administrative rank, as sanctioned in Resolution No. 1101 E., dated the 25th August, 1905, but Exchange Compensation Allowance will not be admissible on promotion to that rank of officers who, on the 8th March 1908, were below the rank of Executive Engineer, 1st grade. As promotion to Executive Engineer, 1st grade, required at least 19 years' service under the old time scale, this is equivalent to withdrawing Exchange Compensation Allowance in the Administrative grades from all officers appointed to the Department after 1888, without the withdrawal being compensated by any increase in the pay of these grades.

Therefore so far as officers who joined the Department between 1889 and 1907 are concerned, the pay and allowances of all the administrative grades was actually reduced by 6¼ per cent. by the re-organization scheme of 1908.

The policy of gradually eliminating Exchange Compensation Allowance has much to recommend it, but at the same time it is strongly urged that the withdrawal of this allowance should have been arranged so as not to cause any actual reduction in the pay and allowances of these appointments.

It is recommended that in view of the discontinuance of Exchange Compensation Allowance the pay of the administrative grade should be revised to the following amounts:—

Superintending Engineer, 3rd grade, Rs. 1,600 per mensem.

Superintending Engineer, 2nd grade, Rs. 1,900 per mensem.

Superintending Engineer, 1st grade, Rs. 2,200 per mensem.

The duties of first and second grade Chief Engineers are generally identical, and there should, therefore, be only one grade of Chief Engineer on Rs. 3,000 per mensem. The Local Allowances attached to the posts of Secretary to Local Governments under Government of India Resolution No. 1101 E., dated the 25th August, 1905, might then be withdrawn.

The principle is already laid down in paragraph 80, Volume I, Public Works Department Code, that promotion to the Administrative ranks should be by a strict system of selection as opposed to that of seniority and it is recommended that this principle be even more closely followed than it is at present.

72,064. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—The leave rules applicable to officers of the Public Works Department appointed by the Secretary of State are practically identical with those which apply to members of the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers subject to the Civil Leave rules; but this equality does not extend to maximum and minimum leave allowances. In the case of officers of the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers subject to the Civil Leave rules, furlough allowances are subject to a minimum limit of £500 per annum, or the salary last drawn whichever is less and a maximum limit of £1,000 per annum, whereas for Officers of the Public Works Department there is no minimum limit for furlough allowances (except that in the case of furlough on Medical Certificate or on account of ill health there is a minimum limit of £200 a year (under Civil Service Regulations, Article 320) and the maximum furlough allowance is limited to £800 per annum. Under the present rules the amount of furlough pay for an Imperial Officer of the Public Works Department is accordingly limited as follows:—

Years of completed Service.	Maximum furlough pay per annum.
	£
8	254
9	297
10	316⅔
11	337½
12	360
13	382½
14	405
15	427½
16	450
17	472½
18	495
19	517½
20	540
21	555
22	562½
3 years as Superintending Engineer, 3rd grade.	675
3 years as Superintending Engineer, 2nd grade.	787½
3 years as Superintending Engineer, 1st grade.	900*

The furlough pay is at present so low that married officers frequently cannot afford to take the furlough

* Subject to the present maximum limit of £800 per annum.

due to them, although it would generally be to the interest of Government that they should take such leave at fairly frequent intervals. This is covered by the last paragraph of the memorials recently submitted praying for improved Pension and leave allowances and which it is understood have been referred to this Royal Commission, *viz.*—"Thirdly that the leave allowances sanctioned for officers of the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers subject to the Civil Leave Rules may be extended to your petitioners' Service."

There does not appear to be any valid reason why all Imperial Officers in the Public Works Department should receive less favourable leave allowances than those granted to Military Officers serving in the Public Works Department, Police and other Departments. A minimum of £400 per annum or the pay last drawn whichever is less, is the lowest figure at which the minimum furlough allowance for the Imperial Service of the Public Works Department should be fixed in order to remedy the present conditions under which many officers are either unable to take the furlough which they have earned or else run into debt by doing so.

The maximum limit of £800 per annum only comes under operation for senior first grade Superintending Engineers and the cost of increasing this limit to £1,000 would entail very little extra expense and would place these senior Administrative Officers on the same footing as Indian Civilian and Military Officers of similar rank.

The many vexatious restrictions now in force regarding the grant of leave should be removed and the amount of leave due to an officer should be the total amount earned less the amount already taken.

Some proposals to this effect are at present being considered by the Government of India but they do not extend to Privilege Leave. At present the Privilege Leave earned is one-eleventh of the active service subject to the restriction that no further privilege leave can be earned while there is three months such leave due. This restriction should be removed entirely as also the rule that not more than three months' privilege leave can be taken at one time. If all these restrictions were removed the rules would be as follows:—

(i) The amount of privilege leave earned is one-eleventh of the total period spent on active service.

(ii) The amount of privilege due is the total amount earned less the total amount already taken.

(iii) The amount of furlough earned is one-fourth of the total period spent on active service or privilege leave.

(iv) The amount of furlough due is the total amount earned less the total amount already taken.

(v) Subject to the maximum limit of two years, leave due can be combined and taken to any extent at any time that an Officer can be spared provided that not more than 20 per cent. of the total Cadre can be absent on ordinary furlough at the same time.

The proposal at present under consideration to commute part of the furlough earned into half the amount of leave on full pay would be a valuable concession to those Officers who cannot at present afford to take more than a fraction of the furlough due to them, but the alterations and concessions already suggested would considerably reduce the demand for this new form of leave.

Study leave should be admissible for Officers of the Public Works Department on the same lines as the study leave now given to the Indian Medical Service. Engineering is a high scientific profession and it would be to the interests of Government to offer such special facilities to Public Works Officers to enable them to study the latest developments and most up-to-date methods of European practice.

In order to place officers serving in all parts of the Province on a more equal footing as regards leave and to admit of subsidiary leave being abolished, an Officer returning from furlough should be on duty again as soon as he reports himself at the Rangoon Secretariat. He will then be entitled to joining time on full pay and travelling allowances under the ordinary rules to whatever station he may be posted to.

72,065. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—During the last 25 years the pay of the Department has been improved from time to time to meet the altered conditions of the value of the rupee and the cost of living; but although the cost of living in England has also greatly increased the pensions are still subject to limits that were fixed in 1884. The maximum limit of Rs. 5,000 still in force was fixed in 1864 when the sterling equivalent was £500. As pensions are now payable at 1*s.* 9*d.* the maximum pension of Rs. 5,000 is only worth £437 10*s.* per annum. The maximum possible pensions for officers joining the service after 1898 have been still further reduced by the withdrawal of the extra pension of Rs. 2,000 for three years' service as Chief Engineer and the limiting of the extra pension of Rs. 1,000 to three years' service as Superintending Engineer, first grade, or Chief Engineer, while it was formerly open to all grades of Superintending Engineer; and for officers entering the service after 1909 the additional pension is subject to the further condition of 28 years' total qualifying service. In the case of the Forest Department an additional pension of Rs. 1,000 per annum can be earned by three years' service as Conservator without and restriction as to grade.

It is hardly surprising therefore that the Officers in the Department are very dissatisfied with the present inadequate pension and that memorials on this subject have been submitted to the Government.

The scale of pension laid down in Article 641 of the Civil Service Regulations is quite liberal but the scale is rendered entirely inoperative by the low maximum limits that are fixed and which are in many cases even considerably lower than the maximum limts fixed by Civil Service Regulations, Article 474, which applies to Officers in the Provincial Service and others subject to the Indian Service Rules.

The following examples are sufficient to prove this:—

Years of completed Service.	Civil Service Regulations, Article 641.		Civil Service Regulations, Article 474.	
	Scale of Pension, amount.	Maximum limit.	Scale of Pension, amount.	Maximum limit.
(Imperial Service at present scale of pay.)	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
10	2,813	1,000	1,406	2,000
12	3,570	1,800	1,920	2,400
16	5,200	3,000	3,200	3,200
19	6,670	3,000	4,370	3,800
24	7,500 or over	4,000	6,000 or over	4,800
25 to 30	7,500 to 16,500	5,000 —	7,500 to 16,500	5,000 —

Retiring pensions should be granted in sterling at the rates suggested in the latest memorials on the subject, *viz.*:—

Ordinary Pensions.

On completing—	£
20 years' service	350
21 years' service	380
22 years' service	410
23 years' service	440
24 years' service	470
25 years' service	500
26 years' service	540
27 years' service	580
28 years' service	620
29 years' service	660
30 years' service	700

Special Service Pensions.

Secondly, that as in accordance with the orders of the Government of India Officers are appointed to the administrative grades entirely by merit, an additional special service pension of £40 per year of completed service be accorded to Officers in those grades, subject to a maximum total pension of £940 per annum.

Any period spent on practical training in England should count as service for pension up to the limit of

one year. The amount of furlough counted as qualifying service for pension should be as follows:—

Not less than—

15 years' total service, 1 year
20 years' total service, 2 years
25 years' total service, 3½ years
30 years' total service, 5 years

} Furlough to count as service for pension.

Invalid Pensions.—No proposals regarding invalid pensions are made in the memorials submitted from this Province. The following scale of Invalid Pensions should be adopted:

Years of Completed Service.	Scale of Pension as per Civil Service Regulations, Article 641. (Proportion of average emoluments.)	Maximum limit as per Civil Service Regulations, Article 474.
		Rs.
10	20-60ths	2,000 a year.
11	21-60ths	2,200 a year.
12	22-60ths	2,400 a year.
13	23-60ths	2,600 a year.
14	24-60ths	2,800 a year.
15	25-60ths	3,000 a year.
16	26 60ths	3,200 a year.
17	27-60ths	3,400 a year.
18	28-60ths	3,600 a year.
19	29-60ths	3,800 a year.

These pensions being paid in sterling rates at 2*s.* to the rupee as asked for in connection with retiring pensions.

72,066. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the Employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Service into Imperial and Provincial.**—At present the recruitment of Natives of India in England to the Imperial Service of the Public Works Department is understood to be limited to 10 per cent. of the appointments. The time for the increase of this percentage has not yet arrived.

Natives of India do not as a rule possess that personality and strength of character combined with adaptability and ability to take responsibility which is as necessary in the Imperial Service of the Public Works Department as in any other branch of the Public Service. Mere ability to pass examinations is not the only qualification required in recruits for the superior service of the largest spending department of the Government of India.

The Provincial Service.—As regards the Provincial Service it is understood that this service is primarily intended for Natives of India educated in India whose cost of education and subsequent cost of living and general expenses are considerably less than those of an Imperial Officer domiciled in England. There appear to be good reasons for such officers receiving a lower rate of pay than officers appointed in England and the Provincial Service should be continued in practically its present form.

It has been found impossible in practice to keep separate "listed posts," for officers of the Provincial Service and consequently Provincial Engineers are often placed in charges previously or subsequently held by Imperial Officers. The Provincial Service asserts that officers doing the same work should receive the same rate of pay but the same argument might be applied also in the Imperial Service when an Executive Engineer on Rs. 800 has to take charge of a Division formerly held by an officer drawing Rs. 1,250 per mensem! Although Provincial and Imperial Officers do in practice often hold the same charge at different times it does not necessarily follow that the duties are as efficiently discharged by the Provincial Officer as by the Imperial Officer and it is maintained that as a general rule the services of the Imperial Officer are of greater value to Government.

72,067. **(VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—The relations of the Public Works Department with other Departments are at present satisfactory and no change in this respect appears necessary. It is very desirable that the existing independence of the Department should be maintained.

It may be remarked, however, that there is a strong feeling among Executive Officers that the recent amalgamation of the Public Works Accounts Department with the Civil Accounts Department has resulted in a considerable increase of the office work of an Executive Engineer without any corresponding gain in the efficiency of the audit.

The new procedure has not yet passed beyond the transitory stages and it is hoped that means may still be found to reduce rather than increase the time which an Executive Engineer has to devote to accounts work; as all time so spent reduces that left available for the even more important duty of frequent inspection of works, which is the only real safeguard against extravagant and unproductive expenditure.

72,068. **(IX.) Any other points within the Terms of Reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding Heads.**—*Temporary Engineers.*—It may be necessary to resort to the appointment of temporary Engineers, in order to provide for a temporary increase in establishment required for the construction of large new works or other special causes but such temporary Engineers should not be looked upon as a source of recruitment for the permanent service. The appointment of temporary Engineers to the permanent service any where above the bottom of th list appreciably affects the prospects of the officers below them on the list who were recruited in the ordinary way and thus causes discontent.

Burma Allowance.—The recommendation of the Special Committee appointed in 1910 to report on the subject of Burma Allowance should be given effect to. The report referred to proves that the present Burma Allowance is not sufficient to meet the extra cost of living in Burma as compared with India and that Burma Allowance should be paid to all grades of the service.

The old rule (Note 2 (*b*) of Appendix 19, Public Works Department Code) that the aggregate of salary plus the local allowance of Rs. 100 shall not in future exceed Rs. 1,100 was made about 1887 when the pay of a 1st grade Executive Engineer was Rs. 950 and it was apparently intended that the allowance was to be admissible to all Assistant and Executive Engineers but not to officers holding higher rank and therefore the limit should have been increased when the maximum pay of an Executive Engineer was increased to Rs. 1,250 in 1908. In the Forest Department, who are on an identical incremental scale, Burma Allowance is given to all officers below the rank of Conservator. This means that the maximum pay and allowance of a Deputy Conservator of Forests serving in Burma is Rs. 1,250 + 100 = Rs. 1,350 while that of an Executive Engineer is Rs. 1,250 only.

Pending the decision on the general question of Burma Allowances the present allowance should be given to all Assistant and Executive Engineers and the rules should be altered to give effect to this with retrospective effect from 1st April, 1908, the date on which the incremental scale of pay came into force.

This particular grievance of the Senior Executive Engineers was represented to the Government of India in 1908 but no decision in the matter has yet been arrived at. In the mean time an Executive Engineer receives only Rs. 50 Burma Allowance in his sixteenth year of service and then ceases to draw any allowance at all, while officers of the Forest Department in Burma continue to draw the allowance until they are promoted to the rank of Conservator.

House rent and House allowances.—Subdivisional Officers in the Public Works Department stationed elsewhere than at the Headquarters of the Division should receive rent free quarters in the same way as Subdivisional Officers of the Indian Civil Service and Civil Police. The Rangoon House Allowance Scheme is at present restricted to married men, and batchelors receive no compensation for the high house rents in Rangoon. The scheme should be extended so as to include batchelors and married men whose families are not in Rangoon, the allowance admissible being limited to the amount by which the house rent actually paid by them exceeds 10 per cent. of their pay.

Travelling Allowances on Transfer.—The Travelling Allowance admissible under the present rules is quite inadequate in cases of transfer and it is generally recognized that a transfer involves considerable loss to the officer concerned in almost every case. A transfer thus comes to be looked upon as a punishment involving a fine of greater or less amount according to the circumstances of the case. The necessity for special liberal rules to regulate the travelling allowances of gazetted officers transferred in the interests of the public service was brought to the notice of the Government of India in 1906 by the Government of Bengal but the matter appears to be still under consideration. The proposals made by the Government of Bengal in 1906 should be adopted and incorporated in the Civil Service Regulations.

Family Pension Fund.—It is very advisable that there should be some form of Family Pension Fund for the Public Works Department and such a fund on the lines of the Indian Civil Service Family Pension Fund or the Indian Army Family Pension Fund should be introduced. Probably several other Departments such as the Forest, Telegraph and Police, could be included in the same Family Pension Fund Scheme.

General Provident Fund.—This fund should be made more elastic as regards the amount that can be deposited, there does not seem to be any particular reason why the amount that can be subscribed to this fund should be limited to 12½ per cent. of the salary of an officer, or why the percentage which an officer subscribes should not be allowed to be altered from time to time in accordance with the wishes of the subscriber.

Examination in Burmese.—At present Public Works Department Officers have to pass the examination which is primarily set for officers of the Civil Service and Police Departments and no attention is paid to the special requirements of the Public Works Department. To remedy this officers of the Public Works Department appearing for an examination in Burmese should be given a special paper set by an officer of the Department.

Mr. L. W. Lewis called and examined.

72,069. (*Chairman.*) The witness said he was a member of the Imperial branch of the Public Works Department, Burma, and represented the whole of the officers of that branch. The written statement embodied the general feeling of the service.

72,070. He considered the present system of recruitment should be continued, and emphasised the necessity of nomination in order to secure qualities that possibly would not be obtained by open competition. An examination was not very necessary if people had the proper qualifications and were carefully selected. Candidates should have an Honour Degree. The best age for recruitment was twenty-three to twenty-four, but no harm would be done by raising the age limit. A man a little older than twenty-four would still be young enough to assimilate Indian conditions and would come out with a more developed character.

72,071. The officers he represented believed the best field for training was in India, but his personal opinion was that a year in England would be preferable. The year he had spent on works in England after leaving Cooper's Hill was of enormaus value to him. It was important that a recruit should make himself acquainted with Indian conditions, language, and so on, but he did not favour a probationary period in India, as possibly men would not be obtained if they had to undergo a probation in the country.

72,072. From the point of view of the efficiency of the service it would be better to reject an unsuitable man at the earliest possible date, but that might bring the service into disrepute with the colleges in England and might be detrimental to recruitment, because men would not come out with the possibility of being sent back as failures. A possible alternative to probation would be to engage men temporarily on a five years' agreement. It was the general procedure in the engineering profession for men to leave England on term agreements, and if they were satisfactory and their services were still required the agreement was generally extended.

72,073. In Burma there were no officers in the Provincial Service who had reached the top of the list of executive engineers, so that he was not in a position to say whether officers had failed in due course to get promotion to the rank of Superintending Engineer.

72,074. The recommendation in the written statement that no Chief Engineer should be allowed to retain the same appointment for more than five years was based on the rule in the code. A Chief Engineer had to retire at the age of fifty-five and it sometimes happened that he only had a year or a year and a half as Chief Engineer. It was very seldom that officers attained to that rank before the age of fifty.

72,075. The suggestion that after an executive engineer reached Rs. 1,250 he should continue to draw further increments of Rs. 50 up to a maximum of Rs. 1,400 after twenty-five years' service was put forward as a kind of solatium for non-promotion. In the old days when a man had been executive engineer for five years on the same pay he was given an increase, and a further increase after the next five years. The system was designed to compensate for blocks in promotion. It was really a personal allowance over and above the pay he was qualified to receive for the work he was discharging and was only given to men who although qualified for promotion to Superintending Engineers, were unable to obtain promotion.

72,076. Under present conditions officers were frequently unable to take privilege leave or furlough when they had earned it. There was a good deal of difficulty in obtaining privilege leave owing to the smallness of the cadre and the pressure of work; and officers could not afford to take furlough, especially married officers who had their families in England. The furlough pay after eight years was regarded as insufficient. Study leave should be granted under rules similar to those of the Indian Medical Service. At present officers were not taking study leave to any extent. If a man desired to study any particular question he had to be placed on deputation, but regulations should be introduced with the specific object of affording officers opportunity for study and bringing themselves up to date.

72,077. There were a great many officers who intended to take advantage of the twenty years' rule for retirement and some had already done so. From the point of view of the Public Service, possibly twenty years was too short a period of service to qualify for optional retirement, but if a man could obtain work in England it was to his benefit in many cases to retire after twenty years. The officers would like to retain the twenty years rule even though an improvement in pension was granted. The rule was a great inducement to men to join the department.

72,078. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) With regard to bringing men out on terminal agreements, the fact that the best men were kept on in the service would not mean that the others were discharged with any reflection on their capacity. The men would be brought out for a large programme of work and when the work was completed they would not be required any further. It would mean bringing out many more men than could possibly be kept on the service.

72,079. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) If the system of terminal contracts was adopted there might be a considerable reduction in the permanent establishment of the department. In Burma there were not nearly enough men to do the general work; the divisions were much too large and the men had more work given to them than they could look after with efficiency. The department suffered greatly from the want of Assistant Engineers and that could be remedied by a system of terminal contracts. He had not, however, considered the economic aspect of the question. It would be probably necessary to offer the contract men slightly higher pay than that offered

to junior members of the Public Works Department and also fairly good terms in the way of a provident fund. It was possible that some who came out on contract would establish themselves in the country as engineers, if they found an opening.

72,080. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) There was one case of a man who had been thirty years in the service and had only taken three and a half months' privilege leave. He had no figures to show how many men did not take privilege leave or furlough.

72,081. He differed from his colleagues on the subject of training, believing that training in England was of very great use, even for irrigation work. The work he himself had done on railways in England had given him a general idea of how things should be done on irrigation construction when he had to do that work in Burma. For the work of maintenance and running of canals experience in England was practically valueless, but it was of great use for constructional work.

72,082. He had not thought out any programme for study leave. He did not know the rules under which Indian Medical Service officers obtained study leave but believed they were allowed to take a course in a certain branch of work and had to give proof that the time was adequately utilised.

72,083. When a large number of men were required on terminal contracts they would be engaged for the work in hand at the time, and he thought the system would result in economy.

72,084. (*Mr. Madge.*) A thorough professional training would enable a man to adapt himself to engineering work anywhere. The system of terminal contracts would not be in substitution for the departmental service, but would be auxiliary thereto. There were certain drawbacks in a uniform system; it was necessary to recruit so far ahead that the recruitment was carried on without regard to any programme of work. He did not think in Burma it would be advisable to give out work to contractors instead of having it done by the Public Works Department. It would be better in Burma for the Department to carry out work with petty contractors rather than with one big contractor.

72,085. He did not think men would be willing to have their furlough curtailed if they received six months' privilege leave on full pay, but no doubt officers would agree to take half their furlough on full pay.

72,086. As a rule the imported engineer in Burma was better than the indigenous man. Some temporary engineers had been employed in Burma for a short time but there were only two there now. They were taken on from month to month when there was a rush of work, and then their services were dispensed with.

72,087. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The present system of recruitment was satisfactory but did not give so good a type of officer as was obtained from Cooper's Hill. An idea of the work done by the Public Works Department in Burma could be obtained from the administrative reports.

72,088. (*Mr. Sly.*) The Provincial Service officers in Burma came from Rurki, and he knew of no Burman now living who had been appointed from Sibpur.

72,089. He doubted whether enough Indians could be obtained to make the system of short term contracts available for recruits in India, but he had not thoroughly considered the matter from this point of view. His recommendation was limited to recruits from England. The term of the contract might be three of five years, dependent on the programme of work. Recruitment for the department would go on as at present, the temporary recruitment being intended merely to relieve pressure. Rather than have a system of probation in this country he would prefer that engineers recruited in England should come out on a contract term and on the expiration of that term a proportion should be appointed permanently to the department; but apart from probation his preference was for the present system supplemented by engineers on temporary contracts for definite work. It would not be advisable to bring out men on ten year contracts and select executive engineers from men whose contracts were just expiring.

72,090. In Rangoon it would be possible to abolish the small contract system for large works and employ large firms but that would not mean a reduction of the staff of the department. There was a large amount of petty work in Rangoon which large contractors would not take up, and the department would have to be maintained even though particular works were given out to contractors.

72,091. The leave rules of the department were exactly the same as those of other services, except with regard to pay. The proposition that furlough should end when an officer reported at the Rangoon Secretariat was made in order to equalise matters. A man who had to take over a charge of an out-of-the-way-place was on half pay until he reached his charge, while the man who came to Rangoon went on full pay at once. The same disability existed in other Provinces in India and he suggested that they should adopt the same remedy. The concession was not meant to apply to privilege leave, and was made with the idea of doing away with subsidiary leave.

72,092. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) He would rather have the present system of nomination than a system of open competition.

72,093. The observation in the written statement that the time had not arrived for an increase on the 10 per cent. proportion of Indians was the result of experience. As a rule Indians were not a great success in that country. The statement was not based on statistics but on general experience. At present there was only one native of India recruited in Europe in the department. He did not think that the argument put forward by the Provincial service for abolishing the difference in salaries, between the officers of that service and the Imperial service officers on the ground that they were doing identically the same work was analogous to the argument put forward in the written statement to the effect that the duties of first and second grade Chief Engineers were generally identical and there should therefore be only one grade of Rs. 3.000 per month.

72,094. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) With regard to reducing the Public Works Department to a small nucleus of supervising officers and giving out the work to engineering firms, it might be that the construction of a long line of Railway would be a suitable work to give to large contractors, but the general work of the department could not be done in that way. Repairs and general work would always have to be done by petty contractors as at present. He doubted whether it would be any cheaper to employ a large contractor on big works, and a large firm would employ petty contractors exactly as the department did at present. It might possibly be that in time large firms would be established in India who would be able to undertake large contracts. In Burma a very large engineering firm was given some extensive work to do but everybody in the department came to the conclusion that the department could have done it quicker and better itself. There were building contractors now established who would be able to take over a large amount of building work, but the Public Works Department would have to prepare specifications, supply clerks of works, and supervise the whole of the work. The measuring up would undoubtedly have to be done by an engineer as it was necessary to employ a sub-divisional officer in that capacity. It was true a very highly trained engineer was not required for measuring work, but it was necessary to have a man with some qualifications and a good deal of honesty.

72,095. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) At present in the department there were forty-one executive engineers and forty-two assistant engineers. All divisions had not an assistant engineer in charge of a sub-division. In the irrigation circle a larger proportion of assistant engineers were employed than in other circles. There was a certain number of districts in which the sub-divisions were not held by assistant engineers. The sub-divisional charges not only absorbed the whole of the assistant engineers but a large part of the upper subordinate service and part of the lower subordinate service. At times temporary engineers had been placed in sub-divisional charges and there were a few

in such charges now. It was not an ideal state of affairs to have a subordinate officer in sub-divisional charges, but it was the best that could be done at present. It would be a great improvement on the present system to employ a large number of assistant engineers on terminal contracts for the purpose of placing them in sub-divisions; but it would probably be too expensive.

(The witness withdrew.)

J. Craig, Esq., Executive Engineer, Burma.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department, being the corporate opinion of Officers of the Provincial Engineer Service, Burma.*

72,096. (1.) The question of the recruitment of the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department is one that has given rise to widespread and lasting discontent. It is generally felt throughout the country that the policy of extending the alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges from the Imperial Service (*in which they were formerly included*) is unjust and should be abandoned.

(2.) The following points which deal with this question deserve consideration, for they reveal that the situation has not in fact been adequately appreciated.

ORIGIN OF THE PROVINCIAL ENGINEER SERVICE.

(3.) Prior to the institution of the Provincial Engineer Service by the Government of India, Resolution No. 2112 G., dated the 19th July, 1892, recruits from the Indian Engineering Colleges (one of which, viz., that at Rurki, was established so long ago as 1847) were appointed to the Imperial Service, *i.e*, on an equal footing with Engineers obtained from England. It has been repeatedly proclaimed (*vide* the Government of India, Resolution No. 2112 G., mentioned above, and No. 675-694 E., dated the 24th April, 1908, &c.) that the Provincial Engineer Service was the outcome of the recommendations of the Public Service Commission of 1886-87. The issues which naturally present themselves are—

(i) Were these recommendations sound in themselves?

(ii) Was it justifiable to give effect to them?

(iii) Has the policy advocated by the Commission been consistently followed?

The following considerations show that the answer to each of these questions is in the negative and that therefore the institution and retention of the Provincial Engineer Service stands self-condemned.

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF 1886-87.

(4.) The report of that body states that its recommendations were based on two grounds, viz.:—

(i) That the considerations which led it to recommend the formation of Imperial and Provincial Services, in respect to the various branches of the Civil Service, with distinct conditions of service, applied with equal force to the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department, and

(ii) That Engineers recruited from England received a better professional training than that which the Indian Colleges were capable of affording.

(5.) *Ground No.* (i). — Here the Commission were distinctly in error because there was absolutely no analogy (and this fact has been admitted) between the case of the various branches of the Civil Service and that of the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department.

The following statement contrasts the facts of the case of the various former branches of the Civil Service recruited in India with those of the case of Indian trained Engineers:—

Case of the various branches of the Civil Service.	*Case of Indian trained Engineers.*
(i) There had always been a complete distinction between the various branches of the Civil Service recruited in England and India.	This was not the case with the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department. Engineers recruited in England and India were on precisely the same footing.
(ii) The branches of the Civil Service recruited in India (now included in the Provincial Service) were formerly subordinate services and were not recruited for and required to do the same work and bear the same responsibilities as Officers of the Imperial Civil Service obtained from England. The same remarks apply to most other Provincial Services, *e.g.*, the Survey, Forests, &c.	Engineers recruited in India belonged to a superior service. They were and are still recruited for and required to do the same work and bear the same responsibilities as their English contemporaries.
(iii) The Commission recognized that the Branches of the Civil Service recruited in India were recruited in an irregular manner which was not conducive to efficiency. The Provincial Service was designed to regularize recruitment and did in fact considerably raise the status and improve the prospects of these services.	Indian trained Engineers were recruited from specially established institutions of long standing, one of which had been in existence for forty years. Many of them had attained high administrative appointments. The Provincial Service was in the case of these Indian Engineering Colleges a retrograde measure and greatly lowered the status and prospects offered to their successful students.

Furthermore it was virtually admitted by the Government when actually giving effect to the Commission's recommendations that there was no analogy between the case of Indian trained Engineers and those other services recruited in India; for the Provincial Engineer Service, as instituted, was quite dissimilar to other Provincial Services. In short, except as regards pay, leave, and pension, there was in all other respects no distinction between Engineers recruited in England and India respectively (*vide* Resolution No. 2112 G., dated the 19th July, 1892).

(6.) *Ground No.* (ii).—This conclusion obviously could only have been arrived at from the evidence before the Commission which, be it mentioned, was not tested by cross-examination of the witnesses produced.

A close scrutiny of the evidence will reveal—

(i) That it did not establish the inferiority of Indian trained Engineers, for many witnesses, including officers with the widest experience, were of opinion that there was little to choose between the best Rurki Engineer and his English rival, and

(ii) That much of it was prejudiced for, speaking generally, the excellent records established by many Indian trained Engineers in the past were forgotten, the fact that *natives* of India had only recently begun to appreciate and practise engineering as a profession was not considered, and the fact that many Indian College Engineers were at that time holding high administrative appointments secured by competition with their English contemporaries was completely ignored.

(7.) Even admitting for the moment, that the evidence tended to prove that the Indian Engineering Institutions (which had done well enough in the past) had fallen short of the requirements of the day, the proper remedy lay in raising the standard of professional education imparted in them and not, as advocated, in making a differentiation between recruits from them and Engineers obtained from England.

* The statement was signed by Messrs. W. R. Wells and J. Craig, Executive Engineers, and Mr. A. H. Ricketts, Assistant Engineer.

(8.) Again it is a very significant fact that the Commission did not advocate the creation of any such distinction in the cases of the remaining superior services (*e.g.*, the Accounts, Traffic, Finance, &c.), which were also partially recruited in India, but in which recruitment was by nomination and not by competition open to all.

(9.) It is contended, therefore, that the Commission failed to appreciate the true position in connection with the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department recruited in India, and that their recommendations which suggested as an awkward and glaringly unjust method of remedying an alleged evil (*viz.*, the inferiority of Indian trained Engineers) were wholly unsound.

(10.) To pass on the second issue, *viz.*, whether it was justifiable to give effect to the Commission's recommendations. The answer is most emphatically in the negative for two reasons.

(11.) Reason (i)—*The Government of India Act of* 1833 *and the Queen's Proclamation of* 1858.—By Clause 87 of the said Act it is provided that "no person by reason of his *birth, creed or colour* shall be disqualified from holding *any* office in our service." In the despatch of the Board of Directors of the Honourable East India Company which accompanied the Act, it was stated:—"It is fitting that this important enactment should be understood in order that its full *spirit* and intention may be transfused through our whole system of administration. You will observe that its object is not to ascertain qualification but to remove disqualification . . . . . Fitness is henceforth to be the criterion of eligibility." Again the Queen's Proclamation, which is widely known and which it is therefore unnecessary to quote, was couched in very similar terms.

The above statute and proclamation have been widely regarded as a charter removing all bars to any branch of the public service and holding out the promise of increased and higher employments of Natives of India (which term includes statutory natives) and the complaint that this promise has not been fulfilled has been widespread and uninterrupted.

When the case of the Indian Engineering Colleges is examined, however, the position becomes worse, because here, by the creation of the Provincial Engineer Service, the public in India entering these institutions were in fact dispossessed of that which they had had for nearly half a century.

Whatever may be the construction put on the said Act of 1833, and the Royal Proclamation as to the grant of facilities for admission to the Public Service not already enjoyed, it is contended that these pronouncements at any rate barred the institution of the Provincial Engineer Service and the withdrawal from the alumni of Indian Colleges of that which they had possessed for a long period of time, *viz.*, full equality with their contemporaries from England. The introduction of the Provincial Engineer Service reversed the practice of years, thereby disturbing vested rights which had accrued to the public in India, and suddenly established a system by which the place of recruitment alone is the criterion of eligibility for the Imperial Branch of the Public Works Department.

It may be argued that the Indian Engineering Colleges were disqualified from receiving appointments in the Imperial Service by reason of the finding of the Public Service Commission that recruits trained in them were inferior to Engineers obtained from England. In reply it is contended that—

(*a*) the findings of the Commission, as argued in sub-paragraph 6 above, cannot be upheld;

(*b*) the Government of India have virtually acknowledged that Indian trained Engineers are qualified for the Imperial Service (*vide* the arguments connected with the case of Temporary Engineers, paragraph 13 below). If outclassed people from Rurki College, who in addition were only eligible for the Provincial Service are held to be fitted for the Imperial Service, the pick of the Indian Colleges cannot be defeated;

(*c*) even admitting its existence, this disqualification based upon the findings of the Public Service Commission was capable of being removed and should have been immediately removed; and

(*d*) in any case it has since been removed, *vide* the public admissions of eminent persons quoted in sub-paragraph 23 (*b*) below. The Indian Engineering Institutions should therefore be restored to the position they occupied before.

(12.) Reason (ii)—*Pledge given to Indian Colleges in* 1873.—Again the institution of the Provincial Service for Indian College Engineers was in direct opposition to a definite pledge given to them in a speech delivered by Sir William Muir, Lieutenant-Governor of North-Western Provinces at Rurki on the 28th November 1873, of which the following is an extract:—". . . . But apart from personal associations, there is a reason which renders the present moment one of public interest; the establishment in England of an Engineering College for India has unsettled the minds of the public here as to the prospects of this institution and the continuance to it of the patronage of Government. It has been a subject of much anxiety to myself and of correspondence with the Government of India. It is, therefore, with sincere satisfaction that I am able to announce to you and through you to those without who are interested in the Thomason College, that the Institution at Cooper's Hill *will in no degree affect the relations of the Government of India with this College, nor the employment which has been hitherto guaranteed* to its more successful students. Between the two seminaries there will be no opposition or antagonism. The requirements of this great country are ample for both. I am sure that you will all, with me, be thankful to the Governor-General in Council for the justice which has thus been rendered to Rurki College."

The pledge was given shortly after the institution of Cooper's Hill College at a time when the public in India were naturally apprehensive that the position of the alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges in the Public Works Department would be injuriously affected, and it will be observed that it was given with the full authority of the Government of India and possibly also of the Secretary of State.

It will further be noticed that the Government pledged that the Institution of Cooper's Hill would in *no degree* affect its relations with Rurki College, nor the appointments "*hitherto guaranteed*" to its successful students. The appointments "hitherto guaranteed" were in the Imperial Service. Yet notwithstanding this pledge the Provincial Engineer Service making a great distinction between Engineers recruited in England and India was introduced twenty years later and was based to a great extent on a comparison of the respective merits of Cooper's Hill and Indian trained Engineers.

Again, it must be noted that this pledge, which is recorded in the Rurki College Calendar of 1872-73, formed one of the strongest inducements to candidates to enter Rurki College, for these men naturally believed (and it was a legitimate belief for them to nourish), that the distinction created was merely a tentative measure, and that when the organization of the Engineer Establishment came to be reconsidered, in accordance with paragraph 10 of the Resolution No. 2523-G. of 1893, the said distinction would be abolished.

(13.) *Case of certain Temporary Engineers.*—It now remains to examine whether the recommendations of the Commission have been consistently followed, and whether the subsequent actions of the Government indicate an unqualified approval and acceptance of those recommendations. Here again the answer is emphatically in the negative. The arguments in this connection refer to the case of twelve Temporary Engineers, all Rurki men, who, many years after the Provincial Engineer Service had been established by the Resolution No. 2112-G. of 1892, were made permanent and placed, not in the Provincial, but in the Imperial Service.

The question is why?

The deep significance of this will be more readily and forcibly recognised when the following facts are digested:—

(i) These officers had, with one single exception, passed out of Rurki College after the Commission had discovered that this Institution did not afford a training equal to that obtained in England.

(ii) They had failed to secure guaranteed appointments when competing for them and had consequently no claim (except good service rendered, which applies equally to other Indian trained Engineers) to this special treatment.

(iii) The majority of them had failed to secure the necessary percentage of marks (*viz.*, 66 per cent.) required in order to qualify for Government appointments and were therefore not eligible under the rules of the Institution which trained them, for permanent appointments at all. *That is to say they could not, with the percentage of marks obtained by them, have obtained guaranteed appointments even if they had in fact headed the examination lists in their respective years.*

(iv) Three of these Officers, *viz.*, Messrs. W. C. Cooper, C. H. A. Muller and E. S. Christie, *were specially barred from being appointed to the Imperial Service* under paragraph 11 of the Resolution No. 2112-G. of 1892, because they were actually undergoing training at Rurki College on the date of the said Resolution and failed to secure the guarateed appointments allotted by Resolution No. 1443-G. of 1884. In their case therefore the Provincial Engineer Service took effect from the 19th July, 1892. That is to say, even ignoring the disqualification stated in (ii) above, they were only eligible for the Provincial Service.

(v) In one case (the name can be stated if required) the Officer failed to qualify absolutely in Rurki College and took up an appointment in the service of the State as a Temporary Sub-Overseer in the Rajputana-Malwa Railway. He was subsequently engaged in a subordinate capacity as Temporary Sub-Engineer in the Punjab and later appointed as a Temporary Engineer, from whence he was translated to the Imperial Engineer Service. This is therefore a case where an unqualified person has risen from the lowest rung of the ladder to Imperial Service, long after the Provincial Engineer Service was established, and this should be contrasted with the treatment accorded to the pick of the Indian Colleges against whom the door to similar advancement is absolutely banged and barred.

(14.) It is irresistibly clear that—

(i) the placing of these Officers in the Imperial Service was a distinct departure from the policy advocated by the Public Service Commission and in fact amounts to a reversal of that policy.

(ii) It stands revealed that the Government have virtually admitted, that Engineers trained in India even subsequent to the Commission's findings, are not necessarily inferior to men recruited in England, and that they are fully qualified to be placed on an equality with the latter, *i.e.*, in the Imperial Service. If this applies to men who are out-classed in Rurki College it must likewise apply with greater force to others who, as stated above, are the pick of the Indian College, but who are placed in the Provincial Service.

(iii) The action taken in respect to the three Officers mentioned above whose appointment to the Imperial Service was barred by virtue of Resolution No. 2112-G. of 1892 must be held to have been due to an authorised relaxation of the rules laid down in the said Resolution and constitutes in fact an amendment of the said rules and renders other Indian trained Engineers also eligible for the Imperial Service, and it is further contended that justice and equity demand that these latter should be similarly treated.

(15.) *Other Superior Services, e.g., the Accounts, Finance, Traffic and Police (until recently)*—

The facts in connection with these Services are specially worthy of attention for they serve both to emphasise the injustice of the Provincial Service and dispel the erroneous belief "*that it is the general rule that members of the Public Service recruited in India are on a different footing as regards pay, leave and pension rules to Officers obtained from England.*"

This, be it noted, was the reason given by the Secretary of State for not re-opening the Imperial Service to Indian trained Engineers in the House of Commons in reply to a question asked by Mr. T. Hart Davies in May 1908, enquiring whether the subject of re-opening the Imperial Service to Indian College Engineers would be considered.

The service are, like the Public Works Department, partially recruited in India, but such Indian recruits are on a full equality with their English contemporaries and secure vastly better terms of service than those granted to the Alumni of the Indian Engineering Institutions.

The questions which immediately present themselves are—

(*a*) why were not Provincial Branches introduced for these services also? and

(*b*) why was the Indian recruited element of the Public Works Department alone singled out for degradation?

It is a fact that of all the Brancehs of the Public Service in which the Indian recruited and imported elements were on an equal footing, the Public Works Department only was disturbed and split up into Imperial and Provincial services.

It is contended that the introduction of this invidious and unjust distinction between British subjects born, domiciled, educated and recruited in India is indefensible. Further, in view of the fact that Indian trained Engineers win their appointments by free and open competition and not by nomination (which is frequently secured by influence) and that they can claim to possess superior educational qualifications to those required of men entering these other services, this state of affairs is significant and startling. For example, the educational test required for admission into the Accounts and Traffic Departments is on a par with that required *merely to enter* the Indian Engineering Colleges, while the Engineer has a further superior, general and professional educational course of three to four years in College itself, and also a further professional training of one year after completing his College course.

It is manifest therefore—

(*a*) that the above facts reveal that it is not the general rule that members of the public services recruited in India are on a different footing to officers of their services obtained from England, but

(*b*) that on the contrary, where officers recruited in both countries are recruited for and required to do the same work and have the same responsibilities, as in the case of the above-mentioned services, it is the general rule *that they are on the same footing;*

(*c*) that of all the branches of the public service in which Indian trained and English recruits were formerly on the same footing, the position of the Alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges has alone been disturbed.

It is therefore contended that—

(i) *the ground, stated in reply to the question asked in the House of Commons,* for not re-opening the Imperial Service to Indian College Engineers disappears; and

(ii) that they should in consequence be restored to their former position.

POSITION OF INDIAN COLLEGE ENGINEERS CONTRASTED WITH THAT OF ENGINEERS FROM ENGLAND.

I.—Position prior to 1908.

(16.) The above arguments deal with the policy involved in the creation of the Provincial Engineer Service. It now remains to examine the conditions imposed upon the public seeking admission to the public service through the Indian Engineering Colleges and to contrast them with those offered to Engineers obtained from England.

Alhough both these classes were and are still *recruited for and required to do the same work and bear the same responsibilities,* the position occupied by the Alumni of Indian Colleges prior to 1908, was as follows:—

(i) The Indian College Engineer received in thirty years Rs. 1,16,530 (amounting at 4 per cent. compound interest to Rs. 1,76,800) less pay than his Imperial contemporary.

(ii) The pay of the Provincial Executive Engineer, 3rd Grade, in charge of a division, was actually much less than that granted to an Imperial Assistant Engineer, 1st Grade, in charge of a subdivision involving inferior work and far less responsibility. As

a result, instances frequently occurred in which Provincial Engineers received less pay than their own subordinates.

(iii) The position of Provincial Engineers on their attaining the administrative rank of Superintending Engineer was still more glaring. Promotions to these appointments are, under rule, made by special selection only, so that a Provincial Engineer so promoted would necessarily be selected in preference to other Executive Engineers whether Imperial or Provincial. Under the scale of pay fixed, a Provincial Engineer on receiving such promotion would not only have received approximately Rs. 67,000 less pay during his former service than other Imperial Officers, who by the very fact of his selection were confessedly inferior to him, but he would even then *qua* Superintending Engineer receive just half the pay of an Imperial Officer holding the same appointment and also less than Imperial Officers whom he had superseded and who would be his immediate subordinates.

(iv) In the matter of special allowances, which are given solely on account of extra expense involved in living in some localities, Provincial Engineers were and are still granted only two-thirds of the sum allowed to Imperial Officers.

In certain cases, moreover (*vide* Appendix 19, Public Works Code), the allowances granted to Provincial Officers from Superintending Engineer downwards are less than those granted to Sub-engineers (subordinates). These glaring and unjust anomalies speak for themselves. They handicapped the Indian College recruit in every possible way.

(17) A general memorial, setting forth these grievances and praying for the restoration of the Alumni of Indian Engineering Colleges to the Imperial Service, was accordingly submitted to the Viceroy in 1902, that is, when the Provincial Service had been in force seven years and when the consideration of the organisation of the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department was due, in accordance with paragraph 10 of the Resolution No. 2523-G., dated the 25th September 1893. The reply given was a direct refusal on the ground that the memorialists accepted employment well knowing "*the terms of the service.*" This reply may here be suitably contrasted with the attitude displayed towards the imported elements of the Public Works Department, who have met with no resistance in their demands to secure accelerated promotion and increased rate of pay which, be it known, is very greatly in excess of that which they contracted to receive, and who are at the present moment clamouring for largely improved pensions to which they are distinctly not entitled under "*the terms of their service.*"

(18) The matter has then appealed to the Secretary of State by means of a general memorial submitted in December 1906.

II.—Changes of 1908.

(19) The next thing that transpired was the memorable reorganisation scheme of 1908 (*vide* Resolution No. 675-694E., dated 24th April 1908), which made the position of the Alumni of the Indian Colleges worse. Indian College Engineers were also then informed that the orders of the Secretary of State on their memorial of 1906 were embodied in the said reorganisation scheme.

It would be no exaggeration to say that the feeling raised by this retrograde measure was one of utter consternation and despair, which deepened into bitter and intense resentment on the issue, shortly after, of the Government of India's letter No. 997-E., dated 6th June 1908, laying down the treatment to be accorded to Indian College Engineers, who declined to accept the new conditions of service.

Briefly, the changes introduced in 1908 were:—

(i) Provincial Engineers were removed from the same list as Imperial Officers, thus making a complete differentiation between the two classes.

(ii) The promotion of Imperial Officers was accelerated, while that of Provincial Engineers was retarded by several years, thus creating the position by which Indian College men would, through no fault of their own, and wholly irrespective of the true relative merit, be compelled to serve under Imperial men who were their juniors and who may have been previously their own subordinates.

(iii) Promotion to the administrative grade, *i.e.*, to Superintending Engineers and upwards, was made almost *physically* impossible for Indian College Engineers.

(iv) The whole reorganisation was transparently designed to subordinate the Indian recruited element of the Public Works Department to the element obtained from England, and to place the former in exactly the same relation to the latter as members of other Provincial services bear to the Imperial Officers of their services.

(v) As compensation for these changes which shattered their position and prospects and ensured the complete domination of the imported staff in the Public Works Department, a slight increase of pay was offered to Indian College Engineers. This increase when contrasted with the substantial increase granted to Imperial Officers is striking.

For example (i) in the first eight years of service the increase granted to Provincial Engineers averaged Rs. 3 per mensem, while that of Imperial Officers averaged Rs. 88 per mensem.

(ii) In the first fifteen years of service the average increase for Provincial Engineers was Rs. 29 per mensem, while that of Imperial Engineers averaged Rs. 142 per mensem.

And notwithstanding the fact (the point requires and will bear repetition) that *both classes of Officers are recruited for and required to do the same work and bear the same responsibilities.*

(20) It is small wonder that this reorganisation scheme was rejected by the vast majority of Indian College Engineers, but they were destined to receive an even greater and more staggering blow, for it was ruled (*vide* the Government of India's letter No. 997-E., dated the 6th June 1908, cited above) that—

(i) these officers would receive no increase of pay;

(ii) they would continue to be promoted according to the rules previously in force for Imperial and Provincial men alike and which had been abolished for the Imperial Service; and

(iii) their names would also be removed from the same list as their Imperial contemporaries.

These orders were not only unjust in that they withheld an increase of pay which had, only one month previously (*vide* preamble to Resolution No. 675-694-E., dated 24th April 1908), been publicly admitted to be necessary for the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department, but they were also in direct opposition to and constituted a withdrawal of the *primary conditions* under which these Officers were induced to accept employment, *vide* Resolution No. 2112-G. and No. 2523-G., dated the 19th July and 25th September 1893, respectively.

Under these said Resolutions Provincial Engineers entered the service on the express conditions:—

(i) that except as regards amount of pay, leave and pension there would in all other respects be no distinction between them and Imperial Officers; and

(ii) that they were to be borne on the same list and promoted side by side with Imperial Engineers.

It is submitted that this disregard of the paramount and indefeasible rights of these Officers and this arbitrary imposition of changed conditions which would not have been accepted in the first instance (*i.e.*, when they entered the service) is unparalleled, and constitutes a significant departure from the practice hitherto observed by which the inducements offered to men entering the public service have been regarded as permanent and enduring.

III.—Changes of 1912.

(21) The general and sustained agitation produced by the above treatment is well known. After prolonged reconsideration the Government of India were led to the conclusion that the position taken up in 1908 was untenable, and the reorganisation scheme of that year has in consequence been recently reversed, *vide* Resolution No. 439-458-E., dated the 15th May 1912.

The position now is exactly as it was previous to 1908 with similar anomalies and defects, viz.:—

(i) the minimum pay of Provincial Engineers is much less than the maximum pay of Imperial Assistant Engineers;

(ii) The minimum pay of Provincial Superintending Engineers is less than the maximum pay of Imperial Executive Engineers;

(iii) the same anomalies in connection with local allowance still exist; and

(iv) generally the pay granted to the provincial element is inadequte and is not commensurate with their work and responsibilities.

The redress granted, however, is accepted as partial and tentatife as it has been admitted in replies to questions asked in the House of Commons that the case has not been finally settled and that the question of the restoration of the Alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges to the Imperial Service has been deferred for consideration by the Royal Commission.

RECAPITULATION.

(22) Various reasons have been advanced above, which it is contented, establish—

(1) that the policy advocated by the Public Service Commission of creating a Provincial Engineer Service for Indian recruits was unsound;

(2) that its adoption was barred by the Government of India Act of 1833 and the Royal Proclamation of 1858, for it in fact, dispossessed the Public in India of facilities for admission to the higher ranks of the public service on a complete equality with Officers obtained from England which they had enjoyed for nearly half a century. It must also be remembered that these Engineering Colleges formed the only source in India of recruitment to the public service on an equality with Officers from England, by free competition open to all.

(3) that the inclusion of the Alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges in the Provincial Engineer Service constituted the breach of a definite pledge and has moreover resulted in the creation of an invidious and unjustifiable distinction between British subjects domiciled, educated and recruited in India as explained in sub-paragraph 15 above;

(4) That the Government themselves have repeatedly broken away from the policy advocated by the Commission as in the cases of the various temporary Engineers (*vide* sub-paragraphs 13 and 14 above);

(5) that the line of action taken in the cases of these Temporary Engineers gives other Indian College Engineers a just and an irristible claim to like treatment;

(6) that the whole history of the Provincial Engineer Service from its very institution reveals a course of long continued injustice and shows how very little consideration has in fact been bestowed upon it; and

(7) that the only solution of the matter lies in the discontinuance of the present policy and the restoration of the Alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges to the position they formerly occupied, that is *to the Imperial Service.*

CONCLUSION.

(23) Finally it is urged that the policy now in vogue should be abandoned and that Indian trained Engineers should be restored to the Imperial Service on the following additional grounds:—

(*a*) Indian College Engineers have established brilliant records in the past and have in numerous instances held, and are still holding, the highest administrative appointments in the Indian Public Works Department with distinction. These facts have been duly admitted by no less a distinguished Indian authority than Lord Macdonnell who, in an address delivered at Rurki College on the 6th November 1900, alluded in the highest terms to the instances in which the Alumni of this Institution had established not merely Indian but European reputations. Lord Macdonnell specially instanced the names of Sir W. Wilcocks and Sir W. Garstin of Egyptian fame, who received their training at Rurki College;

(*b*) Whatever may have been the condition of the Indian Engineering Colleges at the time the Public Service Commission sat (and this as argued above did not justify the withdrawal from the public in India of that which they had possessed for so long a period of time) the standard of education imparted in these institutions has since been considerably raised. Rurki College is now admitted to be equal to any similar institution in Europe. The following is the testimony of persons whose opinions must prevail:—

(i) Lord Macdonnell in his address referred to above spoke of Rurki College in the following terms:—"This College is, I am assured by those competent to speak on the point now in a position to impart instruction both theoretical and practical, up to the standard of any similar institution in Europe."

(ii) Sir J. P. Hewett, Lieutenant-Governor of the United Provinces, in a speech delivered at Rurki College on the 27th October 1909, spoke of this institution and its Alumni in the following terms:—"Your assurance, Major Atkinson that it is the aim of yourself and your colleagues to keep the education given in Thomason College *abreast of the best technical education available in the Western World is amply vindicated* by the extremely high standard of education to which the students who are trained here attain. I have had the privilege of working in close conjunction with two of the most distinguished Alumni of the College, I refer to Mr. Goument, now Chief Engineer in the Buildings and Roads Branch of these Provinces and to Mr. Harriot, at present Superintending Engineer in the Central Provinces, but destined to reach a still more distinguished position in the Public Works Department. I have no hesitation in saying that these officers are excelled by none of their brethren in the department for professional skill, for initiative, or for a correct appreciation of the needs of the country. I have had opportunities of observing the same good qualities developing themselves in some of the younger men educated at this College, and I have no doubt that you and your staff will continue, in the future as in the past, to turn out a constant stream of trustworthy Engineers. Your College has recently been described by the Secretary of State as an institution with a large and illustrious history behind it and you rightly observe that if it is to maintain its *past pre-eminence*, it must keep abreast of the times and that therefore must be a continuous advance and constant and expensive improvement." The deep significance of this second utterance, by a Lieutenant-Governor in India, will be forcibly realized when it is remembered that it was uttered when the agitation against the changes of 1908, was at its highest and after Indian College Engineers had utilized the previous utterance of Lord Macdonnell and had held it out to the Secretary of State as conclusive proof that Indian trained recruits were not inferior to their English contemporaries. It is irresistibly clear that Sir John Hewett would not have spoken in these unambiguous terms, thereby presenting the Alumni of the Indian Colleges with another lever upon which to work, had he not been inwardly conscious that Rurki College did in fact turn out men of marked ability.

(iii) There is yet another public admission establishing the fact that Rurki College has nothing to fear from a comparison with any similar institution in Great Britain. The Honourable Mr. Goument, Secretary to the Government of the United Provinces, in a speech at Rurki College on the 14th July 1910, stated—"I think it may safely be said that this College is now in a position to impart an education, both theoretical and practical, up to a standard which compares very favourably with that of similar institutions in Europe. The following extract from a note recently recorded *by an expert* in your Visitors' Book bears out this statement. 'I have visited nearly every College of importance in India, but among all of them Rurki College alone appears to me to attain to the standard of a first grade Engineering College, the organisation and equipment are admirable and the arrangements for imparting practical training in Mechanical and Civil Engineering are hardly equalled in any institution in Great Britain.'

(*c*) it is claimed, therefore, and it is impossible to resist this claim that there is no difference between the professional education imparted at this institution and that received by the average Engineer recruited in England. On the contrary, it is a fact

in some cases that qualifications of Indian College Engineers are superior to those possessed by the latter, *e.g.*, where men who have only passed out of the Upper Subordinate Class at Rurki have proceeded to England and after undergoing a very meagre training for a short period in the elements of Engineering (at the Crystal Palace, for instance) have been appointed by the Secretary of State to the Imperial Service. These cases are well known both to the Government of India and to the Secretary of State;

(*d*) the Indian College Engineer also possesses the great and recognised advantage (on which great stress was laid when the institution of a Military Staff College in India was advocated) of having received his training in the country in which he has to practise his profession;

(*e*) that the Public Works Department is purely a professional and scientific service and has no share in the political administration of the country and that therefore the restoration of the alumni of the Indian Colleges to their former position, while gratifying the legitimate claims and aspirations of the domiciled European and Indian communities, without impairing efficiency (for the already high standard of the Indian Colleges could, if necessary, be raised still further) and giving a much needed impetus to higher technical education to which so much attention is being rightly devoted, would in no degree imperil British supremacy; and

(*f*) lastly the present policy is one which needlessly and unjustly enforces a distinction between two classes which is strongly and increasingly resented, and is in fact opposed to the highest principles of liberal statesmanship which to use the words of the present Prime Minister in his memorable speech at Birmingham in September 1909 aims at "Removing the domination of unjust monopoly and opening everywhere the gate to intelligence, to merit, and to energy."

Mr. J. Craig called and examined.

72,097. (*Chairman.*) The witness held the position of Executive Engineer and had been in the service for fourteen years. The bulk of the Provincial Service in Burma consisted of men promoted from the Subordinate Service, only about seven men having been recruited direct. The written statement represented the views of all the members of the Provincial Service.

72,098. The division into Imperial and Provincial branches was inherently unsound as the work done by both was precisely the same. In Burma the Provincial Engineer was given a charge of equal responsibility to that occupied by Imperial officers. For the present it was necessary to have a proportion of European officers in the Service, but he believed ultimately the service could be exclusively recruited from India. He did not think that officers coming from England had any special expenses beyond those incurred by officers recruited in India, as all officers had to keep up the same status. There might, however, be a certain difference in regard to the expenses attaching to the family of a European recruited officer. He would not agree that men recruited from Europe should receive anything in the nature of a foreign service allowance, as that would cause discontent among the men recruited in India.

72,099. For the superior service he would recruit half in England and half in India, and for India open competition between men drawn from the Indian colleges would be the best. He thought Rurki college was as efficient as any college in England but that view was not based on experience of English colleges as he had not visited any English colleges, but it was based on his experience of men recruited from some of those colleges who had served under him.

72,100. There should be a two years' probation both for those recruited in India and those recruited in England.

72,101. He had been present at the examination of the previous witness (Mr. Lewis) but did not agree with Mr. Lewis' scheme for bringing men out on a five years' contract; he did not believe men would come from England on such conditions. It was much more likely that they would come out on a two years' probation than under a five years' contract.

72,102. The creation of a family pension fund was very much desired by the service.

72,103. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The Provincial Service engineer was disqualified from holding any Imperial appointment in the Public Works Department. It was true that he was not disqualified from holding "any office," but he did not receive the same emoluments as the Imperial officer, and he took "any office" to mean any office without any distinction.

72,104. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) No one in the Provincial Service had yet become qualified for the post of Superintending Engineer or Chief Engineer.

72,105. (*Mr. Sly.*) With regard to the complaint that certain temporary engineers, whose college careers were not equal to those of men in the Provincial Service, were promoted to the Imperial Service, it was probably the case that the temporary engineers had had a long period of practical work in the department and that it was owing to their proved capacity that they were promoted. They were however promoted after the Provincial Service was formed, and if they were fit for the Imperial Service, Provincial officers should also have been promoted. It was really a reversal of policy because in any system of examination the top man was always selected. He did not mean to suggest, however, that promotion throughout a man's career should be regulated by his position at college or in the examination list.

72,106. (*Mr. Madge.*) Some of the men who had entered the subordinate service on account of there being no opening in the Provincial Service had worked very efficiently. The training in India was as good as that in England, and in some respects better, and his opinion upon that point was based on the experience he had had of the work of both classes of men. The Indian engineer was much better acquainted with India than the man who came from England and also was in a better position to deal with subordinates and workmen.

72,107. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The statement that temporary engineers had been appointed to the permanent service instead of Provincial Service men referred to India and had nothing to do with Burma.

72,108. He did not approve of promotions from the Subordinate Service to the Provincial Service. The subordinates should have their own graded service and should not look for promotion outside that service. Some men promoted from the subordinate service had made good Provincial officers. He urged that the Provincial Service should be abolished for Indian college engineers and that a Provincial Service should be established which would be entirely manned by men promoted from subordinate grades. The men taken from Rurki and the other engineering colleges should be taken straight into the upper service. He did not so much object to the promotion of men from the subordinate service under present conditions as to the whole system.

(The witness withdrew.)

R. C. Edge, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Bihar and Orissa.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,109. **(I.) Method of Recruitment.**—Since the abolition of the Royal Indian Engineering College, Cooper's Hill, the Imperial Service has been recruited by Engineers selected by a Committee in England.

There is no examinnation, but certain qualifications are required equal to those required for passing the examination for the associateship of the institution of Civil Engineers.

In the absence of a special College for training Engineers for India, this system is probably the most

satisfactory. Members of the service, however, consider that it is desirable that senior officers of the Public Works Department or railways should be more largely represented on the Selection Committee.

72,110. **(II.) Training and Probation.**—Recruits are selected from various Colleges and Institutions in the British Isles. On the whole this training is satisfactory, though it has no special reference to Indian conditions, as was the case with the course at the now defunct Royal Indian Engineering College. At present many of the men, who come out to India, have had little or no practical training in England. It would be an advantage to insist on a year's training on works at home before apointment to the Public Works Department.

There is no probationary period in India at present, and although it would have some advantages, it is not altogether desirable if proper care is taken in the selection of suitable recruits in the first instance.

72,111. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—The number of officers employed should be such that it is always possible for an officer to obtain leave which is due to him. At present it very frequently happens that an officer is refused leave on the ground that there is no one to relieve him, although the number on leave at the moment is less than the proportion—supposed to be allowed for in fixing the cadre. The number of officers required will naturally vary from time to time, and the cadre should therefore be revised more frequently than at present.

Any Royal Engineer officers who may be drafted into the Department should be so placed in the list that they do not become senior in position to men who are senior to them in age.

72,112. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—The pay of the Imperial Engineers was reorganised in 1908 and placed on an incremental basis. This gave improved pay to many, but at the same time exchange compensation, which was formerly drawn by officers domiciled in Europe, was withdrawn. This reduced the advantage in pay considerably, insomuch that it was found necessary in some cases to restore the exchange compensation in order to prevent officers from actually losing by the change. Moreover, the pay of the administrative grades was not altered, though the exchange compensation was withdrawn, with the result that all Superintending Engineers who have been promoted to that rank in the last few years are actually drawing less pay than they would if no change had been made in 1908. On the whole, therefore, it cannot be said that the present rates of pay are altogether satisfactory, having in view the rapidly increasing cost of living. It is fairly certain that very few officers are in a position to save anything from their pay to supplement their meagre pension on retirement.

Promotion to the administrative ranks is not a satisfactory footing. At present all Superintending Engineers in a province are on a provincial list, and promotions to the different classes are made on that list. This is very hard when there are two or more men of about the same seniority in one province, as the number of men in each class is fixed in a certain proportion, and some cannot therefore hope to rise to the 1st class through no fault of their own, though men junior to them are able to do so owing to more favourable circumstances in other provinces.

It has been suggested that this could be remedied by having only one class of Superintending Engineers starting on a salary of Rs. 1,500 (the pay of the present 3rd class), and rising by annual increments of Rs. 100 to Rs. 2,000 (the pay of the present 1st class).

Considerable hardship and pecuniary loss is often caused by the transfer of officers in the administrative grades from one province to another. It is very hard for a man who expects promotion to these grades in the province in which he has served all his service, to have another from outside brought in over his head, to block his promotion for the greater part of the remainder of his service. It should be made a rule that unless in very exceptional circumstances no transfer should be made between provinces unless it can be shown clearly that there is a serious block of promotions in one, or a great want of officers in the other.

72,113. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—The rules governing the grant of furlough are practically the same as those which apply to the Indian Civil Service, except in the most important particulars of leave allowance. In the case of the officers of the Indian Civil Service and Military officers under Civil leave rules, furlough allowances are subject, if paid at the Home Treasury, to a minimum limit of £500 per annum, or the salary last drawn, whichever is less, and to a maximum limit of £1,000 per annum. In the case of Civil Engineer officers of the Public Works Department, there is a minimum limit, and the maximum has been fixed at £800 per annum. This inequality may be realised by taking the case of a Royal Engineer officer in Public Works Department, who after eight years' service is entitled to the minimum furlough allowance of £500, where the Public Works Department officer does not reach this amount till after 18 years' service, his maximum furlough allowance after eight years' service being £279 per annum, which, it must be admitted, is quite insufficient.

These small furlough allowances to Public Works Department officers result in many men being unable to take the leave which is due to them, and which a due regard for health demands. The Government of India recently, in reply to memorials from officers of the Public Works Department, replied that this matter would be enquired into by the Royal Commission, and that no useful purpose would be served by considering the prayers of the memorialists at that stage.

Privilege leave.—Privilege leave can at present be accumulated to the extent of three months and combined with furlough. It frequently happens that owing to short establishment an officer is not able to avail himself of the full period when it becomes due, and hence any additional leave earned collapses through no fault of his own. It would be a great boon if in such cases the period of three months could be extended.

Study leave.—At present when an officer on leave desires to increase his knowledge of his profession and keep abreast of modern Engineering practice, he does so entirely at his own expense and with no help or encouragement whatever from Government.

It would be in the interests of the Government of India to encourage officers to visit works when on furlough, and they should be provided with every facility for doing so.

72,114. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—The pensions which can be earned by officers of the Imperial Branch are briefly—

	£	*s.*	*d.*
After 20 years' service	350	0	0
After 25 years' service	437	10	0

For officers appointed before 1898 there are extra pensions of £87 10*s.* for three years' services as Superintending Engineer, or £175 for three years as Chief Engineer. For officers appointed after 1898 this extra pension has been reduced to £87 10*s.* for three years as Superintending Engineer, 1st class, or Chief Engineer, given at the discretion of the Government of India, and in the cases of officers who joined after 31st December, 1909, subject to the condition that the officer must not retire voluntarily before the completion of a total qualifying service of 28 years.

This scale of pensions compares very unfavourably with those for other scientific services in India. For example, the Indian Medical Service Pensions are far more liberal, and an officer of that service can rise to a pension of £1,050 per annum, against a maximum of £525 for officers now joining the Public Works Department. Again an officer of the Indian Army can obtain a pension of £1,000 per annum, and the scale throughout is far higher than that for the Public Works Department. It is claimed that the Public Works Department should be put on the same footing in the matter of pensions as other Scientific Services.

This matter of pensions is the greatest grievance of Civil Engineer officers of the Public Works Department. The retiring pensions to which they become entitled under the existing rules are totally inadequate for their support after retirement. Moreover, their emoluments during service are not sufficeint to enable them to save or make any adequate provision for their

families should they die in harness, or to supplement their meagre pensions should they live to draw them.

Memorials have been addressed to the Secretary of State in recent years praying for an improvement in this respect, and the answer has been received that the matter comes within the scope of enquiry of the Royal Commission.

The pensions are purely personal, and cease at the death of the officer, and there is no official Family Pension Fund for the Public Works Department as in the case of the Indian Civil Service and Military Services. This inability to make suitable provision for his family is a constant source of anxiety, and it is strongly felt that there should be some means of providing for an officer's family in the event of his death.

Pension has been officially defined as deferred remuneration, *i.e.*, that a part of an officer's salary is kept back to provide his pension. Hence it is hardly just that his family be deprived of any part of this should he die prematurely. Officers of the Public Works Department would heartily welcome a scheme worked out on an actuarial basis by which some provision could be made for their wives and families.

The existing Provident Fund does not meet such cases as it is limited to the amount plus 4 per cent. compound interest which the subscriber has paid into it, and is therefore of little avail in the case of premature decease.

72,115. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the Employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—The number of Indians appointed to the Imperial Service at present is 10 per cent., and there seems no reason to exceed this number at present, as there is the Provincial Service open for them. The Provincial Service is recruited from Engineers trained in Indian Colleges, and as far as the Province of Bihar and Orissa is concerned, they now come entirely from the Sibpur Engineering College.

It cannot be said that as a class they are at present equal to the Imperial Engineer, but, possibly in future and with better training they may improve, in which case it would be desirable to make the Provincial Service entirely subordinate and let all Engineer Officers —both European and Indian—be in one service with the same rates of pay. The present arrangement of having both Imperial and Provincial Engineers on one list is unsatisfactory and leads to many anomalies. An unsatisfactory feature of the present training of Provincial Engineers is that both Engineers and subordinates are trained together; one fortunate man becomes an Engineer officer, and the remainder or such as join the Public Works Department become his subordinates.

72,116. **(VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil and other Services.**—The present relationship is satisfactory, and should not be altered.

72,117. **(IX.) Any other points within the Term of Reference to the Royal Commission.**—Officers of the Public Works Department in common with those of other services feel that the present travelling allowances when on transfer are very inadequate.

While admitting that transfer in the interest of the Public Service must inevitably involve some expense to the officer concerned, it is felt that in many cases these expenses are greater than an officer should be called upon to incur, especially when transfers are long or frequent. In the case of a married man, the actual travelling expenses of his family might well be allowed.

It has also been suggested that the provision of necessary furniture in all official residences would greatly reduce the loss due to constant buying and selling of furniture or the cost of carriage from one place to another. If necessary, some addition could be made to the rent to cover the cost of the furniture.

Mr. R. C. Edge called and examined.

72,118. (*Chairman.*) The witness was an executive engineer of 19¼ years' service and represented the thirty-one officers in the Imperial Branch of the Public Works Department of Bihar and Orissa. The department consisted of twenty-four Europeans and seven Indians, some of the latter having been recruited before the Provincial Service was established and one by the Secretary of State after the abolition of Cooper's Hill.

72,119. An examination coupled with nomination for appointment to the Public Works Department would be an improvement on the present system. The ideal age for recruiting would be twenty-two or twenty-three and it was important that a man should have had a practical experience in England before he came out. He believed that probation in India would have an adverse effect on recruitment. It might be reasonable in the interests of the service that there should be power at the earliest date to reject an officer who proved himself unsuitable. If, after two years, it was found he was unsuitable it would be less harmful to the recruit to reject him then than to reject him at a later period. It very rarely happened that a man was rejected now. From the point of view of the interests of the service rejection during the first two years would be on the whole the best, though it might possibly be hard on the recruit.

72,120. In Bihar and Orissa only one Royal Engineer had been appointed to the Public Works Department and he had not yet joined. He would like to see Royal Engineers put in the same position they would be in if they had joined the Works Department in the ordinary way.

72,121. He had no objection to the 10 per cent. rule with regard to the recruitment of Indians in England, and he thought most of the officers in the Province were of the same view.

72,122. A central college for India would offer much the best means of recruiting Indians to the superior posts of the department.

72,123. There was some discontent amongst Provincial Service officers in regard to the division of the service into two branches, Imperial and Provincial, but he had not noticed that it was very acute. If all invidious distinctions were removed and were higher pay given to the European in the form of a foreign service allowance the discontent would to some extent be removed.

72,124. He agreed with the observation in the memorandum from the Imperial officers of the Province that salaries on the whole were satisfactory provided an adequate pension was given, and he also agreed that the present inequalities in promotion to the grade of Superintending Engineer could be remedied by having only one class of Superintending Engineer on a time-scale running from Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 2,000 a month.

72,125. Considerable hardship and pecuniary loss was caused by the transfer of officers from one Province to another, but he was unable to give statistics to show to what extent such transfers had been made. There had recently been a case in the province where a man had been brought in from outside and had blocked everyone's promotion; he had come from the Central Provinces where promotion was better than it was in Bihar and Orissa. There were a good many instances of that kind in Bengal some years ago. From the point of view of the service there were certain advantages attached to transfers.

72,126. He did not regard the granting of furlough after eight years' service as a serious hardship. It would be to the interest of the service if certain facilities were given for study leave.

72,127. He was in favour of substituting for the present pension scheme a system under which part of the money would be in the form of a pension and part in the form of a capital sum; that would be acceptable to officers as it would enable them to leave something to their families.

72,128. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The most pressing grievance in the Public Works Department at present was the question of pensions. He looked on the establishment of a family pension fund as of considerable importance and desired to see a scheme introduced under which officers would be called upon to make considerable contributions towards the fund. He believed it would be popular in the service.

72,129. A young officer on first coming out probably got into debt in connection with his preliminary

expenses, but his debts were not so serious then as they became later on in his service.

72,130. With regard to transfers, he believed that if Government supplied furnished houses it would reduce the expense of transfers very considerably. It would be quite possible for the Government to lay down a scale entitling an officer after so many years' service to the cost of removal of so many maunds of luggage, so many horses, carriages, etc. Transfers were very frequent in Bihar and Orissa and also very expensive.

72,131. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) He had always understood that pension was deferred pay for the purpose of providing for an officer after retirement. It was only fair that Executive Engineers when they were not promoted to administrative rank through no fault of their own should be given a certain allowance. To some extent pay was regulated by the duties performed, but a man required some compensation for not being promoted owing to the fact that there was not a vacancy.

72,132. (*Mr. Madge.*) Practical training in England was received by a good many officers at present and he thought all officers should have it.

72,133. The paragraph in the written statement that the present training was satisfactory though it had no special reference to Indian conditions as was the case with the course at Cooper's Hill, referred to general professional education, and not to practical training. It was purely a matter of opinion, based on a man's experience, whether he favoured training in England or in India.

72,134. The only remedy he could suggest for the present grievance in connection with the Royal Engineers was to put the Royal Engineer in the place he would have occupied had he joined the service in the ordinary way. A Royal Engineer could be put in at any stage provided due consideration was given to the claims of the men in the service. It was not a question of salary but of position on the list.

72,135. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He had had no personal experience of the Indians who had come out under the 10 per cent. rule, but he had heard that men who had failed for the Provincial Service sometimes got into the Imperial Service in England. He would favour any scheme under which a picked number of Indians would be sent to England for training and then drafted into the Imperial Service, but he would rather have them trained at a really good central college in India and sent to England for a year or two afterwards.

72,136. (*Mr. Sly.*) The system followed by the Public Works Department in connection with work was almost entirely one of petty contracts, except in the case of very large works. In the building of the capital at Bankipur work had been given to large English contractors and such contractors had also been employed on building canals, but not with much success.

72,137. Since the Province had been formed no one had been recruited to the Provincial Service and therefore he could not say what the present system of recruitment was. So far as he knew no orders had been issued with regard to not taking men from Sibpur.

72,138. The junior members of the service agreed that the question of pension was a most important one but they did not feel it so strongly as the more senior men. He had consulted all the members of the association and both young and old agreed that the matter of pension was of the first importance.

72,139. With regard to the eight year rule as to furlough, some of the junior men thought the period should be five years. He had not heard that the eight year rule deterred recruits from coming forward for the service, as they could always go home on special leave before the expiry of that period.

72,140. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness saw no reason for increasing the 10 per cent. of Indians recruited in England so long as the Provincial Service existed. In the old days, when there was no Provincial Service, the percentage might have been thirty, but he saw no reason why it should be so high as that now. The remark in the written statement that as a class the Provincial Engineers were not at present equal to the Imperial Engineers, but that possibly in future with better training they might improve, was based on his experience in Bengal and Bihar and Orissa; confidential reports would show that the Provincial Service officer was not as good in his work as the Imperial officer. He agreed they might also show cases of unsatisfactory work on the part of Imperial Engineers.

72,141. (*Mr. Green.*) He had not suggested that Assistant Engineers after the eleventh year of their service should be given an allowance if there was a block in promotion but he would endorse the suggestion in the case of those who were qualified for the position of Executive Engineer.

(The witness withdrew.)

Babu Jnananjan Saha, Executive Engineer, Bihar and Orissa.

Written statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,142. Under the nine heads referred to in paragraph 3 of letter, dated the 1st August 1913, from the Joint Secretary to the Royal Commission, on the Public Services in India, to the Chief Secretary to the Government of Bihar and Orissa.

Referring to the Memorandum by the Indian trained officers of Bengal, a copy of which is printed in paragraphs 71,874–81, I would say that I generally agree with it, but I would add the following notes under the different heads.

72,143. **(I.) Method of Recruitment.**—Recruitment both in India and in England should be—

(*a*) By free and open competition, and at least three candidates should compete for each appointment which is to be made in order of merit.

(*b*) Half in England and half in India for the present and as time goes on, the proportion of Recruitment in India should be gradually increased.

(2.) At present only one man is appointed annually to the Engineer establishment direct from Sibpur Engineering College for Bengal, Bihar and Orissa. The number should be increased to 50 per cent. of the total number of annual recruits for these provinces from England and India.

In the last five years there were 16 recruits from England and five from Sibpur. Total number being 21, annual number of recruits is nearly four. Therefore number of guaranteed appointments from Sibpur should be increased to two every year if it is to supply the demands of the above provinces only.

(3.) Rurki College does not admit students from Assam and Burma. But successful men from this College are appointed in these provinces. This is unfair—Rurki College should be thrown open to the students from Burma and Assam. If this is not feasible, then the number of guaranteed appointments of Sibpur Engineering College should be still further increased to four every year, to meet the 50 per cent. demand of these provinces, students from which are eligible for admission into this College.

At present about forty students are admitted annually to Sibpur and they compete for a single guaranteed appointment. The number of admission, which is very large, should not be increased though the number of appointments is increased to four to meet the demands of Bengal, Bihar and Orissa, Assam and Burma.

(4.) The number of appointments in the other Engineering Colleges (Rurki, Madras and Poona) of India, should be increased in proportion to the requirements of the different provinces for which, men are trained in the above Colleges.

(5.) Course of training of Sibpur Engineering College extends over five years. After four years of training in the College classes, University examination is held, and out of the successful students a certain number is selected in order of merit for practical training of one year in the Public Works Department. Similarly a certain number of passed students from the Apprentice class of Sibpur College

and from Dacca and Bihar School of Engineering are selected to undergo a course of practical training for one year under Public Works Department. After completion of their training the Engineer students are examined with the other students in some simpler subjects and in riding, to which marks are allotted. Marks obtained by them in workshops during their College and School training are added to the above marks. Of the Engineer students, who head the list in the above subjects obtains the guaranteed appointment and is appointed as Apprentice Engineer in Public Works Department.

This system of recruitment is unsatisfactory. Students of Sibpur Apprentice Class and of Dacca and Bihar Schools of Engineering are better trained in Workshops than the students of Sibpur Engineer class, and it does not infrequently happen that the former stands first in the combined list by virtue of their having obtained higher marks in Workshops during their school training.

Riding is absolutely necessary for the Engineers, but marks obtained in it should not in any way interfere with the position of a student secured by him in the University examination, and this is not done in any other Department. It is quite sufficient if a student can show his proficiency in riding. Similarly, marks obtained by the Engineer students in Workshops in the 1st and 2nd year class examinations, should not decide their position for the appointment. Result of the present system of recruitment is that the Engineer student who was good in Workshops during his College training and who excels in riding usually gets the appointment though he may not be as strong as others in theory and other subjects which they learn during their course of practical training in Public Works Department.

(6.) The course of training is Sibpur College which is four years at present, can be reduced, with advantage, to three years. After passing the B. E. examination the students should undergo a course of practical training for one year in Public Works Department and appointments should be given to the graduates in order of their positions in the University Examination provided he completes his practical training satisfactorily and can show his proficiency in riding.

72,144. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—One year's practical training in the Public Works Department in India is sufficient to qualify the successful students for appointment as Assistant Engineer. At present they are appointed as Apprentice Engineer and remain on probation for one year. This is unnecessary. Graduates after completion of their practical training should be appointed as Assistant Engineers, third grade. But for special branches of Engineering, *e.g.*, electricity, mining, sanitation, etc., practical training may be done with advantage in England and suitable allowance should be given to the probationers for the purpose.

72,145. **(III.) Conditions of Service, (IV.) Conditions of Salary, (V.) Conditions of Leave, and (VI.) Conditions of pension.**—Whether an Engineer is recruited in India or in England his emoluments and other conditions noted above, should be precisely the same and should be determined solely by the work he does and responsibility he bears and should have nothing to do with the place of his recruitment.

72,146. **(VII.) Limitations in the Employment of Non-Europeans and working of the existing system of division of Services in the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial.**—Recruitment both in India and in England should be open to all British subjects equally, irrespective of caste, colour and creed.

Division of the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial sections has been anything but a success and has created constant heart-burning among the Provincial Officers, who do exactly the same work and bear exactly the same responsibility as the Imperial men. It is therefore urged that the said differentiation, which is illogical and unjust, should be abolished, and that the alumini of the Indian Engineering Colleges should be restored to the position they formerly occupied, that is to say, there should be only one service in the superior establishment in the Public Works Department.

BABU JNANANJAN SAHA called and examined.

72,147. (*Chairman.*) The witness represented the Provincial Engineers, thirteen in number, of Bihar and Orissa, and occupied the position of an Executive Engineer. He received his training at Sibpur College and had been in the service for 14½ years. The written statement represented the views of the majority of the Provincial men.

72,148. He recommended the abolition of the division into Imperial and Provincial and the recruitment of a superior service partly in England and partly in India by open competition. He preferred one competitive examination for the whole of India rather than an examination in each Province, but he had no strong view on that point. He agreed that there would be the danger under a system of open competition of officers being drawn from one Province over a series of years. As a rule it was advisable that officers should occupy positions in the Public Works Department of their own Provinces.

72,149. The training of officers was adequate in the Indian colleges but he wished to see the present four years' course at Sibpur College reduced to three years, as four years was too long. One year's practical experience would be quite sufficient and the training should be carried out in India. There should be promotions from the subordinate services to the superior service, the proportion being left to the discretion of Government according to the number of officers qualified.

72,150. Temporary Engineers should be placed on a regular incremental scale, without pension. They should be recruited for a period of five or six years on a commencing salary of Rs. 200 or Rs. 250, with annual increments of Rs. 30 or Rs. 35 and should be placed in a cadre of their own. The work done by the Temporary Engineer would be such as would be done by subdivisional officers. There were only four Temporary Engineers in Bihar and Orissa. Probably it might be a better principle to appoint Temporary Engineers merely for temporary work, as that would not necessitate so long a period as five years except in rare cases.

72,151. The pay of all officers doing the same work should be similar, but a compensation allowance might be given to those coming from England.

72,152. He did not think a family pension fund was necessary.

72,153. (*Mr. Sly.*) The present rule of recruitment to the service was nine from Indian colleges and five from other sources and was fixed on a basis of 30 per cent. recruited in India. Of the 70 per cent. recruited in England, 10 per cent. were Indians. Therefore so far as Indian recruitment was concerned the percentage at present was 37 per cent., as compared with 30 per cent. before the Public Service Commission. The direct recruitment from Indian colleges had been reduced but there had been an increase in the percentge of Indians recruited. The promotion of subordinates was desirable.

72,154. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) There were no Bihari Engineers in the Public Works Department. There were no students from Bihar in Sibpur College during his time, but he did not know whether there were any there at present.

(The witness withdrew.)

W. S. Dorman, Esq., Executive Engineer, Punjab.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department, being a Memorandum of the Civil Engineers' Association.*

72,155. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—There is a strong wish among members of this Assocation that a residential College, on the lines of the late Royal Indian Engineering College, Coopers Hill, should be established in England, from which Imperial Engineers for the Public Works and Railway Departments would be recruited. The Association is practically unanimous in considering that the training which such a College would afford would foster an "*esprit-de-corps*" which is not to be anticipated among men recruited in the open market, and that this spirit and the qualities which it engenders are of the utmost value to the individual, to the Department, and to Government. The Association also considers it to be an advantage, that the students would be kept under close observation for a considerable period, and there would be less likelihood of men unsuited to the needs of India being appointed than where recruitment is made in the open market. The Association, however, realizes, having regard to the many Institutions in the British Isles which give a training in Engineering Science adequate to the needs of the Public Works Department, that the establishment of such a College may now be considered impracticable, and that selection from the open market must be accepted as an established fact.

Assuming then that recruitment by selection is maintained this Association urges that at least 50 per cent. of the members forming the Selection Committee should be senior officers of the Public Works and Railway Departments, either on the active or retired lists, as it is felt that the intimate knowledge of these Departments and their requirements possessed by such officers, would be of much value in assisting the Committee in their selection of the right class of man.

72,156. **(II.) Training and Probation.**—*Training.*—The Association suggests that it should be made a condition of appointment, that recruits should have had at least one year's practical experience on Engineering Works in the British Isles, in addition to an adequate theoretical training.

Probation.—It is considered that circumstances, which render a probationary period possible and desirable in the case of engineers appointed to State Railways, do not exist in the case of the Public Works Department. While the members of the Association in the Public Works Department consider that a probationary period is undesirable in the case of engineers appointed to the Buildings and Roads and Irrigation Branches, the views of Railway engineers are as follows:—"It not infrequently happens that men appointed as engineers on State Railways retire after a few years' service, to enter employment elsewhere. It is unquestionable that service on Indian railways offers a valuable training, and increases rather than diminishes a young engineer's prospects of securing employment on railways outside Great Britain. Railway engineers, who are members of this Association, feel that advantage should be taken of this to introduce a probationary period of service, extending to two, or at most three, years. At the close of this period the probationer would be appointed permanently, if both he and Government desired this, his probationary service counting for pension.

"Under such an arrangement Government would have an opportunity of dispensing with the services of men, who, though technically qualified and innocent of such faults as would merit their dismissal, had not proved themselves entirely suitable for the particular duties which they would be called upon to perform on Indian State Railways. No stigma would, in these circumstances, attach to failure to secure or to accept a permanent appointment, and probationers would ordinarily be in a better position to procure appointments elsewhere, at the close of the probationary period, while Government would undoubtedly profit by the opportunity for closer selection thus afforded. In the case of State Railway Engineers, in fact, Government does not make as good a bargain as it might in view of the valuable training in Railway Engineering which the early years of service offer."

72,157. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—(i) The Association urges that the cadre of the Permanent Engineers should be more frequently revised than has been the case in the past. It is advisable that the number of Permanent Engineers should more closely accord with the number of permanent appointments, and that less reliance be placed upon making up deficiencies by the employment of Temporary Engineers. In support of this suggestion the Association would call attention to the following extract from the Report of the Irrigation Commission of 1901, which, although recorded in connection with the Irrigation Branch, applies equally to all Branches. "Paragraph 306. We trust therefore, that the great importance of providing an adequate staff of Engineers for the maintenance and management of the larger irrigation works may be steadily borne in mind whenever the revision of the establishment scale is under consideration, and that it may not be supposed that temporary establishments only are required, which can be discharged or reduced when works are brought to completion. Canal management is as important a part of the duties of the Public Works Department as canal construction, and we may add that success in the design and construction of new works, depends to a great extent on the management of those which have been completed."

(ii) The conditions under which Royal Engineers are drafted into the Public Works and Railway Departments have affected adversely the position and prospects of a large number of Civil Engineers. Royal Engineers brought in are usually credited with extra departmental service to such an extent as to give them departmental seniority over Civil Engineers who are senior to them in age, and of many years standing in the Departments. The effect on a Civil Engineer thus superseded is utterly disheartening; if senior, his promotion to administrative rank is retarded, or he may even be prevented from ever reaching administrative rank, and, if junior, it may result in delaying him from being placed in a Divisional charge. Whatever form it may take, the frequent result it to subject him at one time or another to a heavy pecuniary penalty. The Association recognises that it is necessary in the interests of Government, that employment should be found for Royal Engineers in the Departments, but it is strongly urged that in justice the appointments should be made in such a manner as not to impair the prospects of Civil Engineers of the same age already serving in the Departments.

(iii) Similarly it is urged that if Government transfer any Temporary Engineers now serving in the Departments to the permanent scale, the same principle should be observed to safeguard the prospects of officers already on that scale, as in the case of Royal Engineers.

(iv) Future appointments of Temporary Engineers should only be made on the specific understanding that the holders of the same will not under any circumstances be brought on to the permanent scale. It remains with Government, if it is considered expedient, to improve the Temporary Service as such. Thus the improved provident fund for temporary employes on State Railways might be extended to all Temporary Engineers in the Public Works Department.

(v) Article 649 of the Civil Service Regulations which provides for the compulsory retirement of Civil Engineers, who on attaining the age of 50 years have not been promoted to the rank of Superintending Engineer, should, the Association thinks, be more rigidly enforced in the case of officers, who on reaching that age are reported as not qualified for promotion to the rank of Superintending Engineer.

* This Written Statement was prepared by a Special Committee of the Civil Engineers' Association consisting of the following Members:—The Hon. Mr. R. P. Russell, Messrs. M. Nethersole, F. E. Gwyther, J. Coates, A. R. Astbury, R. L. Colbourne, and P. C. Young. Mr. C. D. Gee, General Secretary of the Civil Engineers' Association, acted as Secretary.

(vi) In paragraph 80, Volume 1, of the Public Works Department Code the principle is laid down, that promotion to the Administrative Ranks should be by a system of selection as opposed to that of seniority. This Association recommends that this principle be more closely followed than at present.

72,158. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.** — *Present Scale of Pay.*—In 1908 the scale of pay of the Public Works Department was reorganized and placed on an incremental basis, but at the same time the exchange compensation formerly given to officers was withdrawn. The net increase in actual emoluments was not commensurate with the increased cost of living in India, which has been so marked a feature of the last decade.

Below proposals are advanced for the improvement of furlough and pension allowances, which will serve to alleviate those hardships which are most severely felt, and in the belief that these proposals cannot fail to receive favourable consideration the Association refrains from making specific suggestions regarding the improvement of the scale of pay generally. However, if the Royal Commission, on the careful consideration of the question in regard to other departments or services, consider that the increased cost of living deserves an increase in the salary as at present drawn, this Association urges that the Public Works and Railway Departments should participate in any such general improvements as the Commission desire to recommend.

The following cases of individual hardship which may arise owing to irregularity of recruitment are brought to notice, and suggestions put forward for their mitigation.

(i) Under the reorganization scheme of 1908 it is ruled that an officer may not draw more pay than Rs. 800 per month unless he is in charge of a division, or in charge which in the opinion of the Local Government is of equal importance. This is unjust to an officer who, though fully qualified, does not obtain a divisional charge simply because there is no vacancy for him. It is strongly urged that the rule should be amended to the effect that an officer of the Imperial Service reported as fit to hold a divisional charge, should continue to receive the ordinary increments laid down in the scale, irrespective of his being in actual divisional charge.

(ii) Under the reorganization scheme Executive Engineers attain their maximum pay of Rs. 1,250 per mensem after 19 years' service. It is urged that if, on account of there being no vacancy, an Executive Engineer, though otherwise qualified, is not promoted to Superintending Engineer's rank on completing 23 years' service, he should receive a personal allowance of Rs. 150 per mensem, and should continue to draw the same until such time as he is promoted to administrative rank.

Pay of Chief Engineers.—The present division of the rank of Chief Engineer into two classes, and the variation of local allowances as Secretary to a Local Government, gives rise to the anomaly that a Chief Engineer may be drawing less emoluments than a Chief Engineer junior to him in service in another province, although the work and responsibilities attached to all such posts are exactly similar.

The pay of a first class Chief Engineer is generally equal to that of a Commissioner of a division, and whereas the area, over which the latter exercises control, constitutes only a small portion of a Province, the responsibility of the former extends over a whole Province. The number of Chief Engineerships throughout the whole of India is small, and with the exception of the post of Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department and that of Inspector General of Irrigation, they are the only highly paid posts to which an officer of the Public Works Department can hope to attain. On the other hand there are a number of Commissionerships in each Province in addition to many other high offices, both with Local Governments and with the Government of India, which fall to the lot of officers of the Indian Civil Service. Having regard to these facts it is not considered too much to urge, that there should be only one class of Chief Engineer, and that the salary attached to the appointment should be Rs. 3,000 per mensem irrespective of whether a Secretaryship to a Local Government goes with the appointment or not. In this event the local allowance of Rs. 250 or 150 a month, according to whether a Chief Engineer is a Secretary to a Local Government or Local Administration, might be withdrawn.

As regards Chief Engineers in the Railway Department the remarks which have been made as to the responsibilities of Chief Engineers in the Public Works Department "*mutatis mutandis*" apply, while the present pay of the Engineers-in-Chief of State Railways in India compares most unfavourably with that of men in a similar position in different parts of the world.

Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department.—For reasons similar to the foregoing, it is considered that the duties and responsibilities attaching to the post of Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department, which appointment is invariably held by an officer specially selected from among Chief Engineers and usually of much longer service than any other Secretary to the Government of India, warrant the appointment being paid at the same rate as Secretaries in the Home, Finance, and Commerce and Industry Departments, viz.:—Rs. 4,000 per mensem.

72,159. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—*Furlough.*—The amount of furlough, which Imperial Officers of the Public Works and Railway Departments appointed in England can earn is generally considered sufficient. The rules governing the grant of furlough are practically identical with those which apply to the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers subject to Civil leave rules; except in the most important particular of leave allowances. In the case of officers of the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers under Civil leave rules, furlough allowances are subject, if paid at the Home Treasury, to a minimum limit of £500 per annum, or the salary last drawn, whichever is less, and to a maximum limit of £1,000 per annum; whereas for Civil Engineer Officers of the Public Works Department there is no minimum limit and the maximum has been fixed at £800 per annum. The present furlough allowances permissible to Imperial Civil Engineers are as follows:—

Years of completed Service.	Maximum furlough pay. £
8	279
9	297
10	316½
11	337½
12	360
13	382½
14	405
15	427½
16	450
17	472½
18	495
19	517½
20	540
21	555
22	562½
3 years as Superintending Engineer, 3rd grade.	675
3 years as Superintending Engineer, 2nd grade.	787½
Thereafter...	800

As long ago as 1870, in Despatch No. 43 P. W., dated 28th March, the Government of India said:—"Section 16 with reference to paragraph 4 of Your Grace's Despatch under reply, we may remark that we have already recommended the equalization of the pay of the Military Branches of the Department, and we are gratified to find this proof that Her Majesty's Government are likely to receive that proposal favourably. On this point we only add that we shall be glad to see some plan adopted by which the furlough allowances of Civil Engineers shall be equalized with those of Military Officers in the Public Works Department and, so far as practicable, the advantages of pension also." This hope has been reiterated many times by the Government of India and by different Secretaries of State since the date of that Despatch. It is, however, a hope that remains unrealized up to the present day, since a Royal Engineer in the Public Works Department, with 8 years' service to his credit, is entitled to almost double the furlough allowances of a Civil Engineer Officer doing exactly the same class

of work and having the same service in the Department. A Civil Engineer is obliged to complete 18 years' service before he can claim an allowance approaching that which a Royal Engineer is entitled to after 8 years' service.

The present allowances are so inadequate that a large majority of officers cannot avail themselves of the furlough due to them, even though the state of their health urgently demands that they should do so. That such is the case is assuredly not in the best interests of the general Administration. The question of leave allowance is raised in the last paragraph of the Memorials recently submitted by officers of these Departments; copies of which are attached to this Memorandum as Appendices 2 and 3. The reply given to the Memorialists by the Government of India was that:—" .....Pensions and leave are subjects of reference to the Public Services Commission, and as no doubt the Commission will inquire into these matters and submit recommendations, the Government of India consider that no useful purpose will be served by considering the prayers of the memorialists at this stage." (Government of India's letter, Public Works Department, No. 1399-1408 E, dated July 23rd 1913.)

In these circumstances it is confidently hoped that the Royal Commission will be able to recommend that the leave allowances sanctioned for officers of the Indian Civil Service, and Military Officers subject to civil leave rules, may be made applicable to Civil Engineer Officers of the Public Works and Railway Departments on the Imperial list. There is no valid reason why they should receive less favourable treatment than the other officers named. It is pointed out that feeling on this question is very strong, and that communications received from members of this Association show that there is great discontent throughout both Departments regarding the inadequacy of leave allowances.

It is urged that where the allowances are drawn in India they should be paid in the equivalent in rupees, at fifteen rupees to the pound sterling.

Furlough earned by an officer should be granted at any time after the completion of eight years' service, subject to the exigencies of the service, unless the applicant has returned within eighteen months from privilege leave covering a period of three months.

Special Leave.—The existing rules regarding the grant of special leave require no alterations, but the allowances should be the same as in the case of furlough.

Privilege Leave.—(i) Under the present rules an officer can earn privilege leave to the extent of one calendar month for every eleven complete calendar months of duty, and such leave is cumulative up to a period of three months only. In the case of officers who have accumulated the full period it frequently happens that the exigencies of the public service prevent their being granted privilege leave when they desire it, and this leads to the leave lapsing through no fault of their own. It would in a measure mitigate against this loss of leave on full pay which an officer has fairly earned, if the cumulative period were extended from three to six months.

(ii) An officer should be allowed to avail himself of all privilege leave due to him immediately prior to retirement, and be permitted to retire from the service at the end of his leave, without having to return to duty as he is now obliged to do. This concession has already been made where privilege leave is combined with other leave, and its extension to privilege leave alone, besides removing a legitimate grievance among officers of the Departments, would lead to much less administrative inconvenience than is now the case.

Study Leave.—Modern Civil Engineering is a highly specialized profession and progress in the methods of construction is very rapid. In view of the vast undertakings of the Government of India in the Public Works and Railway Departments, it is essential for efficiency and economy, that the Engineering Staffs of these Departments should keep themselves abreast of modern engineering practice. Engineers can only accomplish this by visiting and studying works of special interest in progress in different parts of the world. That the importance of this is recognized by other nationalities is instanced by the number of engineers who are commissioned by their respective Governments or private employers, to visit works in India, in order to study Indian methods. The majority of Civil Engineers serving in these Departments who wish to visit works in the British Isles, and other countries, have to do so as private individuals, and entirely at their own expense unless they are placed on deputation, or are specially permitted to visit certain works while on leave, permission in this case usually being given only when Government require special information regarding a particular aspect of a project. In the latter case certain travelling and other expenses are allowed, but the time spent in the visits counts against the officer's period of leave. This Association recommends that officers of the Public Works and Railway Departments should be encouraged to visit works outside India, and that they should be provided with every facility for doing so. The Association thinks that either new rules should be introduced to admit of these facilities being granted, or that there should be a much more liberal interpretation of the existing rules regarding the placing of an officer on deputation.

The following instance of study leave obtaining in another professional service is cited.—In the Indian Medical Service study leave is granted in England up to one year out of total service in addition to furlough, for the purpose of allowing an officer to study any particular aspect of his profession which he may desire. During this period he receives furlough pay and lodging allowance amounting to four to eight shillings per day.

72,160. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—*Retiring Pension.*—The greatest grievance of Civil Engineer officers of the Public Works and Railway Departments and one which is most sorely felt is the totally inadequate retiring pension to which they become entitled under the existing rules. Many efforts have been made, spread over a period of forty years or more, to obtain amelioration in this respect. Both the Government of India and different Secretaries of State have long recognized that all was not well, and new rules and conditions have been introduced to improve matters, but the net result has been that the present pensions are actually less than they were 40 years ago, when the qualifications demanded from men joining the service were not as high as they are now, and when the cost of living was considerably less. A short history of the Public Works Department pension rules is attached to this Memorandum, Annexure V. Numerous memorials on this subject have been submitted to the Government of India and H.M.'s Secretary of State during the last 6 years by officers of these Departments. Copies of these are given in Annexures I, II, III attached*. The first memorials were submitted in 1907, but the petitioners were favoured with no reply up to August 1912, when they were informed by the Government of India in their letter No. 942-E., dated 30th August 1912, Annexure 4, that no decision could be arrived at pending the receipt of the report of the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India. It is to the Royal Commission, therefore, that the Civil Engineer Officers now look for redress of this long standing grievance, and it is strongly and respectfully urged that the scale of pensions prayed for in the memorials of 1912–13, Annexures 2 and 3, is the least which can in equity be recommended.

Further, that as this grievance was brought prominently to the notice of the Government of India, in the memorials of 1907–08, to which they vouchsafed no reply, and as in the meantime a number of officers affected have been placed on the retired list and many more will probably be called upon to retire before a decision is arrived at, any improvements made in the scale of pensions should have retrospective effect, at least from the year 1908.

Invalid Pensions.—Prior to 1884, invalid pensions granted to Civil Engineer Officers of the Public Works Department on the Imperial List were governed by article 474 of the Civil Service Regulations; this article also governed the pensions of all officers belonging to the Uncovenanted Services as then termed. In Lord Kimberley's Despatch of 1883 referred to on page 4 of this Memorandum, (*vide* Annexure V.

* *Vide* Appendix XIII.

page 147), a new scale was introduced for Imperial Engineers and Telegraph Officers, with a view to ameliorating their conditions of service, this scale is covered by article 641 of the Civil Service Regulations. Under this article the scale has been increased from $\frac{1}{60}$ths of average salary for 10 years completed service, $\frac{11}{10}$ths for 11 years, and so on, to $\frac{20}{60}$ths for ten years, $\frac{21}{60}$ths for 11 years and so on, but at the same time the maxima limits have been reduced from those allowed by article 474. How this rule brought in with the object of improving conditions in certain Services adversely affects officers at the present time, and how much better off an invalided engineer would have been under Civil Service Regulations, Article 474 is clearly shown from a comparison of the columns in the table below.

Years of completed service.	Civil Service Regulations. Art. 641.		Civil Service Regulations, Art. 474.		
	Amount calculated on a percentage basis.	Fixed maximum.	Amount calculated on a percentage basis.		Fixed maximum.
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
		Rs.	Rs.		Rs.	Rs.
10	$\frac{20}{60}$	2,813	1,000	$\frac{10}{60}$	1,406	2,000
11	$\frac{21}{60}$	3,150	1,400	$\frac{11}{60}$	1,650	2,200
12	$\frac{22}{60}$	3,520	1,800	$\frac{12}{60}$	1,920	2,400
13	$\frac{23}{60}$	3,910	2,200	$\frac{13}{60}$	2,210	2,600
14	$\frac{24}{60}$	4,320	2,600	$\frac{14}{60}$	2,520	2,800
15	$\frac{25}{60}$	4,750	3,000	$\frac{15}{60}$	2,850	3,000
16	$\frac{26}{60}$	5,200	3,000	$\frac{16}{60}$	3,200	3,200
17	$\frac{27}{60}$	5,670	3,000	$\frac{17}{60}$	3,570	3,400
18	$\frac{28}{60}$	6,160	3,000	$\frac{18}{60}$	3,960	3,600
19	$\frac{29}{60}$	6,670	3,000	$\frac{19}{60}$	4,370	3,800
20	$\frac{30}{60}$	7,200	4,000	$\frac{20}{60}$	4,800	4,000

It is a decided anomaly that officers of other services coming under Civil Service Regulations Article 474 and drawing the same pay as an Engineer, should, if invalided, be entitled to a higher pension after 10, 11, 12, 13, 16, 17, 18 and 19 years completed service and to a less pension after 14 or 15 years service. It is urged, therefore, that to remove the anomalies pointed out, and to make article 641 of real benefit to Civil Engineer Officers now serving in the Department that the maxima limits should be at least the same as those fixed according to Article 474. Unlike the Indian Civil Service and the Military Services in India, there is no official Family Pension Fund for the Public Works and Railway Departments. The emoluments of officers in these Departments are not sufficient to admit of their making adequate provision for their families should they die in harness. The knowledge that they are unable to make such provision is a constant source of anxiety to many officers who are entirely dependant on their salary, and whose duties constantly take them into situations, which are prejudicial to health. They have also the additional anxiety of knowing that their pensions are purely personal and cease with their death. There is a strong desire, therefore, that means may be found whereby an officer may be aided in making suitable provision against the event of his death for the members of his family dependent upon him. Pension has been officially defined as deferred remuneration, which means that a certain portion of the salary which would have been paid to an officer, had there been no pension attached to his appointment, is kept back to provide for a pension on retirement. This view is corroborated by the fact that when an officer is transferred on Foreign Service he is made to contribute towards the cost of his pension at the rate of one-sixth of the pay he would have received had he remained in the service of the Government of India. It may be presumed, it therefore, that an officer only receives six-sevenths of the pay he would have received had there, been no pension to provide for, and that one-seventh is kept back by Government as the officer's contribution towards his pension fund. If the officer had the option of investing the amount assumed to be retained by Government to provide for an annuity with a private Insurance Company, he could probably so arrange the terms, that a portion of his annuity would be assured to his widow or other member of his family dependent upon him, should his death take place within a certain number of years from the date his annuity fell due, with the additional security that his family would be covered against the risk of his death, should it take place during the time he was subscribing to his annuity, in the guarantee of a considerable sum of maney. Could some such scheme be worked out by Government on an actuarial basis a large number of officers, not only in the Public Works Department but in other services similarly unprotected, would be glad to avail themselves of it and to subscribe towards the extra cost.

There is a strong wish among the members of this Association, that there should be one set of leave and pension rules for all Civil Engineer Officers on the Imperial List, irrespective of the source from which they were recruited. Such differentiations as still exist should the Association considers be abolished.

72,161. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the Employment of Non-Europeans and working of the existing system of division of Services into Imperial and Provincial.**—As regards the employment of Indians in the Imperial Branch of the Public Works and Railway Departments, the majority of the members of this Association consider that the European element must largely preponderate for a good many years to come to admit of the present standard of efficiency being maintained. The number of appointments to the Imperial Service which may at the present time be reserved for Indians is ten per cent., and this number should, it is considered, not be exceeded at present.

The Association does not feel called upon to express any views regarding the division into Imperial and Provincial Services as it is a question outside its scope, neither does the Association consider it within its province to make suggestions regarding the constitution of the Provincial Branch of the Department.

72,162. **(VIII.) Relationship of the Service to the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—It is considered that the relationship as existing between the Public Works and Railway Departments and other Services in India is on the whole satisfactory and should remain unaltered.

72,163. **(IX.) Any other points within the Terms of Reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding Heads.**—*Travelling Allowance on Transfer.*—The Association desires to bring to the notice of the Commission the inadequacy of the existing Travelling Allowance Rules in the case of Transfers. The Association is aware that the question is common to other Departments. While admitting that transfers in the interests of the Public Service must inevitably involve some expense to the officers transferred, and the practical impossibility of framing any rules suitable to all cases that will obviate it, they consider that the actual out-of-pocket expenses, especially in the case of long trans-

fers, are frequently more than an officer should be called upon to incur, and often amount to a distinct hardship. The Association believes that the question was under the consideration of the Government of India some six or seven years ago and would suggest that the question be again considered with a view to the present rules, which contain several anomalies, being made more liberal.

General Provident Fund.—Under the rules of this Fund interest on the account of a deceased depositor ceases from the date of tender of payment to the person legally entitled to receive the balance at credit of the account. It frequently happens that from inexperience in matters of the kind and other causes, it is inconvenient to draw the amount immediately on tender of payment being made. The Association therefore suggests, that it should be permissible for the balance at credit of the account to remain for a reasonable period after tender of payment has been made and to continue to draw interest during that period.

Inadequate recognition in the Honours Lists.—There has been for a very long time a growing dissatisfaction among Engineers in India with the Honours distribution, which has resulted in what is felt to be an implied public slur on the profession. It is felt that the power to confer Honours on the Public Services was entrusted to the General Administration as a means of giving public recognition to individual merit impartially to all public servants deserving such recognition, and that given impartial exercise of this power, the Honours List would be, to some extent, an index of appreciation by the Administration of services rendered by any given branch of the Service. Judged by this standard, a study of the Honours List indicates a marked lack of appreciation of services rendered by the Engineers of the Public Works and Railway Departments which is felt to be unjust. There is, so far as is known, no other country in the world, where a similar system of Public Service Honours obtains, in which the Engineering profession is held in such light esteem, as is evidenced in the Honours List in India, while, certainly in some of its aspects, the work of the Department in India stands out prominently as of a high order of merit, as has frequently been proved by the deputation of Indian Engineers to other countries as experts in their particular profession.

Although it is not definitely known to the Association what system is followed in framing the Honours Lists, it is generally believed that the results, which are the subject of dissatisfaction, are due to the fact that the recommendations are almost exclusively in the hands of the Civil Service, and that this has led to a gradually increasing tendency to restrict Honours unduly to that Branch of the Service.

It is believed that if the matter is considered worthy of notice by the Commission, an expression of opinion by them would carry much weight and lead to rectification of what is a very substantial grievance. The figures given below speak for themselves.

Statement comparing Honours granted in the Indian Civil Service and those granted in the Public Works Department for each Province. Abstracted from the Civil Lists, April 1913.

—	Bengal.	Bombay.	Madras.	Assam.	Bihar.	Burma.	Central Pro.	N.W. F.P.	Punjab.	United Pro.	Totals.
India Civil Service:—											
C. I. E.	11	9	11	3	6	5	6	4	17	12	84
C. S. I.	5	7	7	3	8	9	3	—	9	10	61
Kt.	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	2	4
K. C. I. E.	—	1	1	1	—	1	1	—	4	1	10
K. C. S. I.	1	2	2	—	3	1	2	—	—	2	13
Total Honours	17	19	22	7	17	16	12	4	31	27	172
Cadres	176	180	176	5	111	171	110	39	170	243	1,426
Per cent.	9·7	10·5	12·5	14·0	15·4	9·4	11·0	10·0	18·2	11·1	12·0
Public Works Department:—											
C. I. E.	1	—	1	—	—	1	2	1	2	3	11
C. S. I.	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	2	—	4
Total Honours	2	—	1	—	—	1	3	1	4	3	15
Cadres	46	103	101	24	48	92	51	24	165	116	770
Per cent.	4·4	—	1	—	—	1·1	2·9	4·0	2·4	2·6	2·0

Statement comparing Honours granted to officers serving in various departments in the Government of India Secretariats.

Departments.	Home.	Education.	Legislative.	Foreign.	Revenue.	Commerce.	Finance.	Railways.	Total of all Departments.	P.W.D.
Number of Officers	10	8	2	7	9	15	6	10	75	8
Number of Honours	4	6	2	9	5	5	5	9	45	—
Percentages	40	75	100	130	55	33	83	90	60	—

ANNEXURE I.

Purport of Memorials submitted in 1907-08. (*Vide* Appendix No. XIII.)

ANNEXURE II.

Memorial of 1912. (*Vide* Appendix No. XIII.)

ANNEXURE III.

Memorial of 1913. (*Vide* Appendix No. XIII.)

ANNEXURE NO. IV.

Letter No. 942E. (*Vide* Appendix XIII.)

ANNEXURE NO. V.

Short History of the Public Works Department Pension Rules.

Prior to 1884 the Pension Rules for the Public Works Department were identical with those in force for all other services outside what was known as the Covenanted Service. These rules had their birth in 1831, when the following rules were drawn up for subordinate officers of the Civil Department, excluding sowars, jemadars, &c.

The officers were divided into two classes, *i.e.*,

(1.) Law officers and native judges, with whom were subsequently included educational officers, and

(2.) All others in superior services.

The rules were briefly as follows:—

(1.) No pension could be claimed by any officer unless incapacitated for further service by old age, protracted ill-health, or other infirmity.

(2.) Subject to this proviso a pension not exceeding one third of salary could be claimed by Class 1 after fifteen years service, and by Class 2 after twenty years service. After twenty-two years service, Class 1 could claim an increased pension not exceeding half salary; Class 2 had the same privilege after completing thirty years service.

(3.) At first there was no limit of age from which pensionable service commenced; subsequently the limit was fixed at 16.

The principal points to observe about the above rules are that there was no maximum limit of pension, and these were not retiring pensions, but could only be claimed by persons incapacitated for further service.

The result of no maximum having been fixed was that when uncovenanted officers began to obtain the higher appointments they were able to claim pension much in excess of anything contemplated by the Court of Directors, and consequently in 1855 a rule was introduced limiting the pensions to £500 per annum for uncovenanted officers "hereafter appointed to the service." In some cases the pension sanctioned under the old rules had been as much as £900.

In 1862 the Bombay Government proposed that every officer appointed before 1855 should, on promotion to a salary of Rs. 10,000 per annum or upwards be called upon to renounce his claim to a pension of more than £500 a year. With this however the Government of India did not altogether agree, and in submitting the proposals to the Secretary of State pointed out, that the original rules which had been framed chiefly in reference to natives of India, among whom it is probable that no salary higher than Rs. 500 or Rs. 600 per mensem would have been found, merely fixed a maximum which was not to be exceeded; and that while the Government would be quite justified in framing new pension rules which would be applicable to all classes of appointments, it was a somewhat doubtful proceeding to refuse promotion to a deserving officer unless he would consent to abandon that to which it was assumed he had a right under the existing rules. In reply the Secretary of State considered, that when the rules were framed a larger pension than £500 could never have been contemplated, and laid down that the full pension should not be given as a matter of course, but only awarded in case of extraordinary merit.

This correspondence led up to the Revised rules of 1864, applicable to the whole of the uncovenanted services of India. These may be briefly summarized as follows:—

(1.) An officer, on production of a medical certificate of unfitness for further service in India, could claim—(*a*) If under 15 years service, a gratuity not exceeding 12 months' pay; (*b*) after 15 years' service, one third of salary, subject to maximum of Rs. 3,000 and 2,000 according as the salary was above or below 1,000 a month; and (*c*) after 25 years, one half of salary, subject to a maximum of Rs. 5,000 and Rs. 4,000, according as the salary was above or below Rs. 1,000 a month.

(2.) After 30 years' service a retiring pension (*i.e.* without medical certificate) of one-half of salary subject to the maximum limit of Rs. 5,000 and Rs. 4,000 could be claimed as the reward of 30 years' faithful and efficient service.

The limit of age from which pensionable service counted was raised from 16 to 22 and it was ruled that privilege leave in India was the only leave which could be counted towards pension. At the same time provision was made for the payment of pensions through the Home Treasury.

In 1855 a few English trained Civil Engineers with some practical experience had been sent out for the first time by the Court of Directors, and with reference to these the Hon'ble the President in Council was pleased to resolve that "such of the uncovenanted servants of the Public Works Department as receive above Rs. 10 a month of salary, should be entitled to a superannuation pension under the provision of the Pension Rules of the 4th January 1831, but that in no case should a larger pension that £500 or Rs. 5,000 per annum be granted to uncovenanted servants receiving salaries above Rs. 1,000 per mensem whether the retirement may be from ill-health (after either 20 or 30 years' service), or without a medical certificate after 35 years' service."

The regular appointment of Civil Engineers from home in large numbers was only commenced by Lord Stanley in 1859, after the Mutiny, when the administration of the country had been taken over by the Crown.

The position of these men as regards the general pension rules was defined in Despatch No. 84, dated 31st March 1865, when the Secretary of State ruled that "Civil Engineers who entered into covenants when the old uncovenanted Leave and Pension Rules were in force" might be allowed "the benefit of those rules in regard both to leave of absence and pension, and any covenanted Engineer so situated may have the option of selecting which rules he will abide by, but having once made his selection he is not to be permitted to avail himself of any of the advantages of the other rules."

This concession to Covenanted Civil Engineers and certain Civil Covenanted Officers of the Telegraph Department who entered the service before 1864 was finally summarised in Financial Department Resolution No. 1555,* dated 1st July 1870, where it is stated

---

* (1) Officers entering the service before 1855.
(2) Convenanted Civil Engineers in the Public Works Department and certain Civil Covenanted Officers of the Telegraph Department who entered the service before the promulgation of the new rules, and have elected to abide by the Pension Rules.
(3) Native judges who were in the service on 26th October 1866.

that "limitation prescribed by the Uncovenanted Service Pension Rules of April 1864 in regard to the third and one-half pensions do not apply to the uncovenanted servants of the three cases noted in the margin. Ordinarily the limit of pension for these classes of servants will be £500 per annum.

All Civil Engineers appointed subsequently to 1864 came under the new rules promulgated in that year for the uncovenanted service generally, but in 1869 the disadvantageous position in which they were placed as compared with their Royal Engineer confrères doing exactly the same work in the Department, was recognised by the Government of India; and in Circular No. 84 P. W., dated 6th October 1869, referring to the position of the Civil Engineers it was stated that "the Government of India has lately had before it proposals which it is hoped will take early effect, for improving their position generally, and placing them in respect of their emoluments on precisely the same footing as all other officers employed on the same duties."

The Government of India proposals were more clearly defined in their Despatch of 28th March 1870, to the Secretary of State, an extract from which reads as follows:—

"We may remark that we have already recommended the equalisation of the pay of the Military and Civil branches of the Department, and we are gratified to find this proof that Her Majesty's Government are likely to receive that proposal favourably. On this point we only add, that we shall be glad to see some plan adopted by which the furlough allowances of Civil Engineers shall be equalised with those of Military Officers in the Public Works Department, and so far as practicable their advantages of pension also."

Government machinery moves slowly, and matters seem to have remained at this stage till 1883, when Lord Kimberley, then Secretary of State for India, announced in a despatch that the Public Works Department Officers were no longer to remain under the general uncovenanted service rules, but that a special chapter was to be introduced into the pension code to meet their case. Accordingly in 1884, what are known as the more favourable pension rules came into force and the following privileges were accorded to English trained Engineers and Telegraph Officers:—

(1) The right of claiming a pension up to Rs. 4,000 on completing 20 years' services and up to Rs. 5,000 on the completion of 25 years' service (the pension is reckoned at 1s. 9d. to the rupee).

(2) Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 and 2,000 over the above maximum limit for three years' service as Superintending and Chief Engineer respectively.

(3) The right of counting the following periods of furlough as pensionable service (Civil Service Regulation 408):—

2	years	in	20	years'	service
3	,,	,,	25	,,	,,
4	,,	,,	30	,,	,,
5	,,	,,	35	,,	,,

(4) The right of adding a period not exceeding three years to their pensionable service on account of previous experience in their profession. The regulation regarding the counting of previous professional experience towards pension is no longer in force.

After having been in existence for 14 years, the Chief Engineer and Superintending Engineer special pensions were abolished in 1898. Officers however who have shown special energy and efficiency during an effective service of three years as Chief Engineer, or first grade Superintending Engineer, may, at the discretion of the Government of India, be allowed an additional pension of Rs. 1,000 a year, subject in the case of entrants to Government Service after 31st December 1909, to the condition that the officer must not retire voluntarily before the completion of a total qualifying service of 28 years (Civil Service Regulation 643).

The actual pension earned is still regulated by the maximum fixed in 1864, and compares very unfavourably with what is nominally earned on the percentage basis.

Pension has been officially defined as an officer's deferred remuneration, and hence should bear a definite relation to the amount of salary. It is obviously due either to the officer himself as a provision for his old age on retirement, or else to those dependent on him in the event of his dying in harness. In the case of an officer going on foreign service all contributions made towards that officer's pension are calculated on a percentage of salary basis and consequently the logical way of calculating the pension itself would seem to be on the same basis. At present the great drop of income on superannuation in the case of an officer who has devoted the best years of his life, to the service of India, necessitates on retirement an almost complete severance from his former life, inasmuch as, in order to live on his reduced income he has to set up house in a humbler way among more humble surroundings. This is obviously a hardship, and almost inevitably forces a married officer with children to educate and start in life to again seek employment, either at home or outside the Department in India, at an age when, owing to the unfavourable conditions under which he has worked in India, he is no longer considered by Government as fit for duty. On superannuation under such circumstances an officer is entitled to a sufficient superannuation allowance to enable him to live in honourable retirement in approximately the same state as he has been encouraged to live during his 25 or 30 years in India, and not to be forced, in premature old age, to dispense with any little luxuries to which he may have been accustomed.

Amount of Pension.—The amount of the pension was limited to a maximum of Rs. 5,000 in the 1864 rules and though this has never been specifically declared to be the equivalent of £500, such was obviously the intention at the time, and this was the equivalent paid in England under the rules till the official rate of exchange began to drop in the early seventies. This £500 payable in England was on exactly the same footing as the £1,000 payable to the covenanted service, and it is very evident that this limit was fixed as the moiety of the pension of the covenanted service which the Government at the time undertook to contribute.

In 1870 the Presidency Annuity Funds were abolished, and Government undertook to provide every Civil Servant who had completed 25 years' service, of which 21 had been spent in India, with an annuity of £1,000 payable in England. Towards this the officer was to continue to contribute throughout his service 4 per cent. of his salary.

Previous to 1862, a Civilian, in the event of his subscription falling short of what would cover his own moiety of his annuity, had to pay up the balance in a lump sum, on retirement, but in 1862, the Secretary of State decided that the Government should be assumed to provide £600 as its share, and that at least the balance should be provided by the annuitant from his subscriptions to the fund. This however only benefited those who had not contributed largely to the funds.

It is difficult to say how much a Civilian at the present actually contributes towards his annuity, but actuarial calculations made by the European Civil Service Association in reply to a speech made by Sir J. Gorst in the House of Commons in 1889, brought out the fact that with the rupee at 1s. 4d. a civilian on the average contributes at the rate of 4 per cent. of his salary, only sufficient for an annuity of £300 on retirement, leaving Government to make up the remaining £700.

This is also the amount of the pension ordinarily granted by Government in the case of the Indian Army, the I. M. S. and the R. E. Officer subject to the Civil Rules, and it is on this basis that the Imperial Engineer, with his equally expensive training asserts his right to a £700 pension after 30 years' service.

As matters now stand it would often pay an able man to retire on completing twenty years' service when he would be entitled to a Rs. 4,000 pension. Such a man would be at his prime and would probably not have much difficulty in finding suitable remunerative employment elsewhere. By judiciously investing his pension, in ten years he would have accumulated half a lakh, and this amount at 4 per cent. would

provide an additional income of £175 in perpetuity, while he would be under no obligation of retiring on his fifty-fifth birthday. If the money were invested in an annuity it would supplement the pension to a figure far beyond what the officer would have received on superannuation had he remained in Government Service until compelled to retire under the fifty-five year rule.

MR. W. S. DORMAN called and examined.

72,164. (*Chairman.*) The witness represented the Civil Engineers' Association, which numbered 560 members drawn from all Provinces in India, and which included 48 Indians out of 65 in the Imperial Service. The Association was confined to men in the Imperial branch of the service and those who have retired.

72,165. The members of the Association were practically unanimous in considering that the training should be at a college on the lines of Cooper's Hill as it would be of advantage to the service in fostering *esprit de corps*, but they recognised that there would be difficulties in the way of re-establishing such a college.

72,166. He could not say what the views of the members would be with regard to a competitive examination coupled with nomination in substitution for the present system of selection by the Secretary of State. That was the system in force prior to the formation of Cooper's Hill, and recently he had come across a note recorded by the Institution of Civil Engineers in 1871 in which they pointed out that the system in force prior to the formation of Cooper's Hill was bound to lead to disappointment as it in no way tested any of the qualifications of an engineer except a retentive memory and a certain aptitude for figures, and the Institution appeared to think that competition was bound to fail.

72,167. The present age at which recruits joined the service, was satisfactory; whether they should join earlier was a matter of opinion.

72,168. The best qualifying test for a candidate who submitted himself for selection would be one of the University Degrees recognised by the Institution of Civil Engineers as exempting from their own examination. He thought the approved Universities included all the representative colleges in England as well as the McGill University in Montreal, the University of New Zealand and the Sydney University.

72,169. The balance of opinion in the Association was in favour of a year's practical training in England. If opportunities were offered, however, in the shape of big operations in India there were advantages in a training in India. Personally he believed that some elasticity should be allowed so that when large operations were going on in India a recruit might be sent out at once.

72,170. With reference to the division of the service into Imperial and Provincial branches, the Association had decided that this question was outside their scope and that any opinions upon it might be left to individual members. There was undoubtedly a certain amount of discontent with the present system, and that discontent must naturally react injuriously upon the service. The Association had not considered whether the discontent would be removed by the abolition of the invidious distinctions in regard to service, title, etc., but personally he believed the removal of those distinctions would largely tend to remove the discontent.

72,171. The mandatory rule that 10 per cent. of the vacancies in the Imperial Service should be reserved for Indians ought to be abolished. If the 10 per cent. was retained the field should be made wider so that when an eligible candidate was not to be found in England he could be drawn from India.

72,172. He thought a central college in India would have many advantages but did not know sufficient about the present colleges to offer any useful criticisms.

72,173. Engineers in the Public Works Department were not against a period of probation, but feared that candidates might not come forward if a probationary period was established. There was nothing undesirable about it. Personally he did not think it would be difficult to obtain recruits on probation. In the interests of the service it would be a good thing to be able to get rid of an unsuitable man and it would also be of benefit to the probationer if he were sent away as early as possible in his career.

72,174. With regard to the appointment of Royal Engineers being so made as not to impair the prospects of civil engineers of the same standing, the Association did not mean that when brought in they should be placed at the bottom of the list for purposes of seniority. At present a Royal Engineer coming into the department counted for promotion in the department as though his service began two and a half years after the date of his first commission. That rule was introduced in order to put Royal Engineer Officers on a level with Cooper's Hill men of the same age. Now that men being recruited from the open market were on the average older than the Cooper's Hill men that period of two and a half years might have to be modified in future so as to keep the two classes on an equality. The average age of Cooper's Hill men was about twenty-two, while the average now was twenty-three to twenty-four. If civilians could be recruited at twenty-two, the two and a half years would still be fair to the Royal Engineer. Provided there was equality of age he had no objection to a Royal Engineer being brought into the Department somewhere above the bottom of the list. Hardship occurred at times, however, for instance, in his own Province two men came out from Cooper's Hill in the same year and two Royal Engineers from the same Chatham batch subsequently entered the department, one some time ago, and one recently with the rank of an Executive Engineer; they had gone into the same year as the Cooper's Hill men, but it happened that their seniority counted about a fortnight earlier than the two Cooper's Hill men, and other things being equal the latter would suffer in the long run when it came to promotion to the administrative grades.

72,175. The Association laid the greatest emphasis on improved pension and leave allowance. If an increase were made in the amount of pension the officers would be content with the present scale of salaries. If improvements in the pension were made conditional on the abolition of the twenty years retiring pension the junior men would probably raise an outcry. The concessions of optional retirement after twenty years had not been taken advantage of to a large extent, but men in the department looked forward to the possibility of being able to retire after that length of service. It was only when a serious block was impending that the privilege was likely to be taken advantage of to any great extent. It did not do any harm and Government did not suffer. The officers did not ask for any improvement in the pension paid after twenty years as there was no desire to encourage early retirements but they wanted some improvement in the pension paid for more than twenty years' service. Personally he believed if the pension was improved the abolition of the twenty years' period would be a reasonable condition.

72,176. The service very much desired a family pension fund to be established, guaranteed and subsidised by Government. The officers were quite prepared to contribute and would accept the fund if it had a Government guarantee behind it.

72,177. Officers were deterred from taking leave because they could not afford it. It was practically impossible for a married officer to save anything out of his salary beyond his Provident fund contributions; and the leave allowance of a junior officer was very inadequate.

72,178. There was some feeling in the service with regard to the Honours List, but it was not a point upon which much emphasis was laid.

72,179. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The Crystal Palace School of Engineering was not one of the recognised colleges on the list of the Institution of Civil Engineers. Many Indians went to the school, but personally he had not much confidence in it.

72,180. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) Bringing out trained engineers on a terminal contract for five years would not meet the requirements of the department. The men brought out would be much older than the men who came out on probation and would not be suitable men to bring in at the bottom of the cadre. If

young men were brought out they would have no experience, and the five years' service would practically be a probationary period. He himself had come out at the age of twenty-four on a five years' covenant and was brought on to the permanent cadre at the end of the term with the loss of one year's service in reckoning for seniority in the Department.

72,181. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) He would not fix a maximum of Indians for the Imperial Service but would confine that service to officers recruited in in England.

72,182. The question of paying indigenous labour the same rates as imported labour was an economical one for the Government to consider. The Association had not put forward any suggestions on the subject. Personally he believed that a man working in his own country should not be paid the same as a man who came in from abroad. It was necessary to offer sufficient terms to attract men to India, but whether those terms should be higher than those paid to Indians was a matter for the Government to settle. If a man came out on a certain contract, and understood the terms of the contract, he had no reason to grumble so long as the contract was fulfilled. He did not think the terms offered to Imperial officers at present would continue to attract the right stamp of men in the future. The past history of the department showed that Government had gradually to offer better terms in order to obtain the class of men they wanted. For example in the early history of Cooper's Hill it was found that the terms were not quite so good as they appeared from the college prospectus and on protest being made to the Secretary of State the pay was revised.

72,183. The abolition of the distinction of Imperial and Provincial would go a great way to remove the existing discontent, but the difference of pay was also a grievance. Personally he did not think the local recruit ought to expect the same pay as the recruit from England, but he had not discussed the matter with men in the Provincial Service and the Association had not taken up the question.

72,184. (*Mr. Madge.*) There was no recognised system in England by which men could obtain a practical training; they obtained it where they could. A great deal depended on the place and the officers under whom the candidate was trained and possibly that accounted to a large extent for the difference of opinion as to the value of a training in India or a training in England.

72,185. The general opinion of the men in the Imperial Service was that the Provincial Service men were not up to the same standard as the Imperial Service, but it was difficult to prove anything from actual facts.

72,186. It was felt by the Association that it would be advisable that Royal Engineers should join the department early in their service. The Royal Engineer came into the Public Works Department because he received improved pay, and he did not think it would be fair to the Royal Engineer to bring him in at a time when his pay corresponded to the pay of the lowest grade in the Public Works Department.*

72,187. A five year contract system was not practicable as a recruiting base for the department. Old experienced men would not be amenable to the rules of the department, and would probably cause discontent. Another objection was that the men would come in on higher pay.

72,188. (*Mr. Fisher.*) At present officers could not obtain study leave, but a man of less than 12 years' service could obtain permission when on furlough to inspect definite works, about which he had to submit a note, and if that note was considered satisfactory his railway fare was paid. That was quite inadequate. The Association felt there ought to be something on the lines of the facilities offered to the Indian Medical Service.

72,189. (*Mr. Sly.*) The fifty-five years' rule for retirement was originally introduced to accelerate promotion in the department when there was a block. Now another block seemed inevitable but apart from this there were no special conditions in the Public Works Department which made it necessary that the rule should be retained.

72,190. According to the present prospectus sent to candidates a man had a reasonable expectation of reaching the executive grade after a certain period of service, and if he failed to do so through no fault of his own the fault must lie with erratic recruitment on the part of the Government. It was true there was a specific statement in a footnote that an officer would not rise above Rs. 800, in the ordinary course, but that required to be made much more clear, because read in conjunction with the paragraph in the prospectus itself the meaning was open to doubt.

72,191. The Association felt that the expense of living of a Public Works officer was just as heavy as that of an Indian Civil Service officer, and also that the Public Works officer's education was equally expensive. The better pay of the Indian Civil Service and the plums in that service were necessary to attract the best brains to the premier service and to enable the officers to keep up their position in India but taking everything into consideration officers of the Public Works Department were entitled on retirement to an equal pension in so far as this was contributed by Government.

72,192. The claims put forward in the written statement in regard to privilege leave involved an alteration of the principle on which privilege leave was granted, but at the same time there was the question of whether a man who had earned his privilege leave was not entitled to it. He himself at present was entitled to three months' privilege leave but saw no chance of getting it. The suggestion put forward by the Association provided an economical remedy as against the more logical method of an increased cadre. The claim for the allowance of privilege leave prior to retirement was also, he admitted, opposed to the principle on which privilege leave was granted.

72,193. If a family pension fund was established there would not be the same need for the provident fund as at present.

72,194. The question of private practice on the part of officers had never come prominently before the Association, but it was felt that during leave it would be advantageous to allow an officer to take private practice, not with the idea of his making any considerable profit, but with the idea of his obtaining experience in English methods. Private practice during service in India was negligible.

72,195. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) 75 per cent. of the Indians in the Imperial Service were members of the Association, and presumably the memorandum had been seen by them, as a copy was supposed to have been sent to every member. He could not say whether it had been approved by the Indian members, but it had been given to him as the official memorandum of the Association. The memorandum was drawn up by a committee formed of officers stationed in Simla but no Indian member was on the committee. No general meeting was called, as it was impossible to have a meeting of such a large number of members from all over India.

72,196. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) He did not think there had been any reduction of maximum invalid

* The witness afterwards wrote: "I find my reply was not quite accurate and the following comparative table which has been prepared by Captain Holme, R.E., Under Secretary, Buildings and Roads, Punjab, may be of use.

The last column gives the pay (including exchange compensation allowance) of a Royal Engineer officer in the Military Works Service, while the previous column gives the corresponding pay in the Public Works Department.

The starting pay shewn for the Military Works Service is the pay drawn 2½ years after the date of first commission. The pay is shewn in rupees per mensum:—

Service in P. W. D.	P. W. D.	M. W. S.
1st year	384	442
2nd „	420	442
3rd „	460	442
4th „	500	442
5th „	540	$\frac{442 + 548}{2} = 495$
6th „	580	548
7th „	620	548
8th „	660	548
9th „	700	$\frac{548 + 780}{2} = 662$
10th „	750	780
11th „	800	780"

pension and the statements in the memorandum on this point required some modification. His own impression was that subsequent to the introduction of the chapter in the pension code to which Civil Service Regulations 641 now corresponded the paragraph (now Civil Service Regulation 474) regarding the allowances of the other uncovenanted services had been revised. The relative figures given in the memorandum were, however, correct. The complaint really was that the regulation fixing the maximum pensions of the uncovenanted services had been revised (*vide* Finance Department order No. 414, dated 25th January, 1888), and no corresponding revision had been made at the same time in the invalid pension rules of the Imperial Engineers, though it had been ruled that the latter were entitled to special treatment, and better pension rules than those governing the services formerly classed as uncovenanted.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Madras, Wednesday, 28th January, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, ESQ., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, ESQ.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, ESQ., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, ESQ., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, ESQ.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

S. D. PEARS, ESQ., Acting Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, Madras.
S. BHASKARA AYYAR, ESQ., Executive Engineer, Madras.

R. R. SCOTT, ESQ. (*Joint Secretary*).

COLONEL W. M. ELLIS, R.E., Chief Engineer, Madras.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,197. **(I.) Methods of recruitment.**

IMPERIAL SERVICE.

Present Regulations.—This service is recruited from selected candidates appointed in England by the Secretary of State for India in Council. The selection of candidates in England is made on the advice of a Selection Committee including at least one eminent representative of the Engineering profession. Natives of India who are British subjects are eligible for appointments to this service and are selected to the extent of 10 per cent. of the total number of Assistant Engineers thus recruited, if otherwise duly qualified, viz., by age, examination, &c.

Remarks. — Generally the method of selecting the Imperial Engineers is satisfactory. It is considered that one member of the committee should be an Engineer who has served in India as a Chief Engineer in the Public Works Department.

One member of the committee should be a retired member of the Indian Civil Service.

It is also considered that the 10 per cent. proportion of Indians who are now selected in England by the committee should be selected in India by the Local Government and that the field of selection should include all qualified men up to the age of 30 years and embrace men already serving in the Provincial or Subordinate establishment. It is believed that by such a system more efficient Engineers could be secured.

In regard to the matter of appointment of Indian Engineers it is believed that the locally-bred and trained men are likely to be more efficient than men belonging to other provinces or trained in England. Generally speaking, local men are likely to be professionally and administratively the equals of Indians appointed in England, while they have the advantages of being in close touch with the language, customs and mode of life of the local Indian population. This is frequently not the case with the Indian appointed in England. I am of opinion, speaking generally and as regards average, that the Indian Engineer is inferior to English Engineers, i.e., in ability to apply in practice his theoretical knowledge and training and in practical self-reliance and resource and energy.

If a local man, he, however, possesses the advantage of closer touch and knowledge of the people and this is frequently a considerable asset. In the case of the Indian appointed in England, this advantage is frequently lost, while the disadvantages remain. I am of opinion that the best method of appointing Indians to the Imperial Service is by the selection periodically from among the Provincial Service Engineers for transfer to the more highly-paid service, and not by direct appointment either in England or in India.

PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

Present Regulations.—This service is recruited—
(1) From the students of the College of Engineering, Madras, being natives of India as defined in the Statute 33 Vict., Chapter 3, Section 6, at the rate of one every year, and

(2) From the Upper Subordinates of the Department at the rate of one in alternate years. The recruitment for the College is made annually by the Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, in consultation with the Principal of the College and the appointment is conferred on the student, either Civil or Mechanical Engineer, judged most suitable on the results of the examination and the promises shown by him and his general behaviour during the College course.

Remarks.—It would be an advantage if the selection of an Engineer direct from the College of Engineering, Madras, for appointment to the Public Works Department could be improved on. It is by no means a foregone conclusion that the man who is top of the year will prove the most efficient practical Engineer.

It is considered reasonable to guarantee the number of appointments to Indian Engineering graduates, but the selection under existing conditions in practice is confined to two—the first Civil and first Mechanical Engineer student in order of passing out from the College. It has been suggested that selection from among the passed Engineers after two years' service in the Department as Section and Sub-Division Officer would result in getting the best men with much more certainty than the present method. Such a system is, however, open to the objection that it entails employment of several inexperienced men in positions of responsibility with a view of seeing which was best suited for such a position. From this both Government work and the interest of the unsuccessful men are likely to suffer. This objection is so grave a one as to render the suggested reform of doubtful value. In the interests of Government more efficient men would be obtained by giving the yearly post now given yearly to a selected passed Engineer student from the College to any passed Engineer graduate of the Madras College under the age of, say, 30 years. This would secure a wider field for selection among proved and tried men, but would naturally be unpopular with College students.

The system of recruitment of the Provincial Service from Upper Subordinates of the Department is quite satisfactory.

72,198. **(II.) Systems of training and probation.**

Imperial Service.

Present Regulations.—Candidates who had passed through a College course and obtained one of the degrees prescribed should have had at least one year's practical experience in Civil Engineering under a qualified Civil Engineer at the time when they appear before a Selection Committee. Those who have taken no College course should have had a full three years of such practical experience. In the event of any candidate being selected who has not, in the opinion of the Selection Committee, had sufficient practical experience, he may be required to undergo, after arrival in India, a year's probation in charge of works and his final appointment is made dependent upon the result of such probation.

Remarks.—It is considered that both Imperial Engineers appointed in England and Provincial Engineers appointed direct from the Madras College of Engineering should be on probation for a period of two years after appointment. The apprentice period of one year for Provincial Engineers to be in addition to this. This may be considered as taking the place of the practical training required of English-appointed men before appointment. In cases of doubt, extension of the period of probation by not more than one year should be permissible. At the end of the period of probation the engagement should be terminable by either party. The termination of either party of the engagement should, in the case of Engineers appointed in England, carry with it title to a free passage to England.

Provincial Service.

Present Regulations.—Students recruited from the College of Engineering, Madras, are appointed by the Local Government as apprentices on Rs. 100 a month. They are promoted to Rs. 150 after six months' period, provided they have given satisfaction during that period and to Assistant Engineer on Rs. 250, Provincial Service, after a year provided they are then considered to be in all respects competent to hold charge of a sub-division. In the case of an apprentice who at the end of the first year's service is not considered qualified for confirmation in the department, the Local Government may decide whether he is to be given a further trial or be removed from the Department; and ordinarily one who is not within three years from date of appointment as apprentice Engineer recommended for promotion to Assistant Engineer will be so removed.

72,199. **(III.) Conditions of service.**

Present Regulations.—Under Article 649, Civil Service Regulations, any Civil Engineer of the Public Works Department who, on reaching the age of 50 years, has not attained the rank of Superintending Engineer will be liable to be called upon to retire.

Under Article 650 of the Civil Service Regulations, all Civil Engineers of the Public Works Department are required to retire on attaining the age of 55 years.

The same rules apply to Military officers also—*vide* Articles 615 and 616, Civil Service Regulations.

This heading is too vague to give any more information on the subject.

Remarks.—The alteration suggested in the way of extended probationary period on first appointment has already been made. It is, however, too much to expect that such an extended period of probation will have the effect of excluding inefficients from the department and under the existing conditions of service the matter of getting rid of an inefficient officer either Imperial or Provincial is one involving great difficulties.

This is especially so when the period served is such as not to entitle the officer to a pension. In every department there are a few inefficients in the position of superior officers and the Public Works Department is no exception. There are Assistant Engineers who are considered unfit for executive charges of divisions and who it may be added are bad Sub-Division Officers as well.

It is open to Government to reduce such servants or refuse to promote them, but this does not meet the case—reduction or non-promotion will not produce efficient work and is indeed likely to result in still more inefficient performance of duties on the part of a man who has lost all prospect of advancement. It is obviously in the interests of Government to dispense with the services of men who prove unprofitable public servants, while in the case of the junior men, in such a case, it is probably also in the interests of the men themselves. Under existing circumstances, in the absence of gross misconduct or default, there is no regular method of getting rid of an inefficient. It is essential that an officer of the Public Works Department who is considered unfit for charge of an executive division after sufficient service as Assistant Engineer in charge of sub-divisions (say six years) should be got rid of.

It is desirable that Government should treat with generosity men whose services are dispensed with for general inefficiency; in some cases the fault does not lie with want of effort on the part of men themselves, and indeed while the most deserving, these are the most hopeless cases of all. It is to be considered that in unwittingly appointing such men there has been an error of judgment on the part of the appointing authority and such things must be paid for. It is recommended, therefore, that special powers to compulsorily dispense with the services of all officers at suitable notice (say one year) for general inefficiency as shown by their record of service be a part of the "conditions of service" but that officers whose services are so compulsorily terminated be given double gratuities if dispensed with before a pension is earned or in the case of pensions some increase to pension where the services are dispensed with at less service than 20 years.

No increases are to be allowed in the case of an officer whose services are dispensed with on account of specific gross fault.

There may be some difference of opinion as regards the giving special extra gratuities to special inefficient officers, but there can be little doubt as to the desirability of holding the power to get rid of a useless man and the necessity for this is pressed on the attention of the Royal Commission.

72,200. **(IV.) Conditions of salary.**

The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time are:—

Imperial Service.

—	Rates of pay.		At the present time.
	In 1890.	In 1900.	
Chief Engineers—	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
First class... ...	2,500	2,500	2,750
Second „	2,000	2,000	2,500
Third „	1,800	1,800	Abolished.
Superintending Engineers—			
First class... ...	1,600	1,600	2,000
Second „	1,350	1,350	1,750
Third „	1,100	1,100	1,500
Executive Engineers—			
First grade ..	950	1,000	Rs. 800—50—1,250, the increment of Rs. 50 being given annually for approved service.
Second „ ...	800	850	
Third „ ...	700	700	
Fourth „ ...	600	Abolished.	
Assistant Engineers—			Rs. 380—30—700—50—750, the increment of Rs. 40 being given annually for approved service until Rs. 700 is reached, the next increment being Rs. 50 a month.
First grade ...	500	550	
Second „ ...	*350	450	
Third „ ...	250	350	

* Assistant Engineers, second grade, after three years' service in the grade, received Rs. 400 a month if recommended.

Remarks.—While as regards salary generally for both services it is considered that officers are adequately paid, there is as regards Madras an exception in the case of the Chief Engineers' grade and this is especially so when one has regard to the scale of pay of the Superintending and Executive Engineer officers.

The Chief Engineers of the Madras Public Works Department are put to considerable extra expense in moving with the Government and upkeep of houses both at Madras and Ootacamund which the position they occupy entails on them and especially on the officer who is head of the Department considerable unavoidable extra expenditure.

The responsibilities of the posts are great—much greater than those of Superintending Engineers—while the actual work is more arduous and more harassing. This is more specially so as regards the head of the department who has the dealing with all establishment questions in addition to his administrative professional duties. This officer draws Rs. 250 a month more than the second-class Chief Engineer, but his extra responsibilites and work are much more onerous and the difference of salary an altogether inadequate recognition of these.

Provincial Service.

—	Rates of pay.		At the present time.
	In 1890.	In 1900.	
Chief Engineers—		Rs.	Rs.
First class ...		2,500	2,750
Second „ ...	There were not	2,000	2,500
Third „ ...	two separate	1,800	Abolished.
Superintending Engineers—	services—Imperial and Pro-		
First class ...	vincial—in	1,050	1,600
Second „ ...	1890. The En-	900	1,400
Third „ ...	gineers ap-	750	1,200
Executive Engineers—	pointed in England and in India were borne on the same list and were drawing the same rate of pay which is shown under Imperial Service for 1890.		Rs. 535—35—850,* the increment of Rs. 35 a month being granted annually for approved service.
First grade ..		650	
Second „ ...		550	
Third „ ...		475	
Fourth „ ...		Abolished.	
Assistant Engineers—			Rs. 250—25—675, the increment of Rs. 25 a month being granted annually for approved service.
First grade ...		400	
Second „ ...		350	
Third „ ...		250	

* A special increment of Rs. 50 may be granted by the Local Government to a deserving Executive Engineer who after completion of five years' service on the maximum pay of Rs. 850, is not promoted to administrative rank.

Remarks.—The salaries of the Provincial Service are considered adequate and suitable.

72,201. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**

Imperial Service.

Present Regulations.—The following is a summary of the principal regulations to the leave admissible to Engineers appointed to the Imperial Service by the Secretary of State from the United Kingdom:—

Short leave.—Privilege leave may be granted to the extent of one-eleventh part of the time that an officer has been on duty without interruption; and it may be accumulated up to three months, earned by 33 months' duty. During privilege leave the officer retains a lien on his appointment and receives an allowance equal to the salary which he would receive if he were on duty in the appointment on which he has a lien. An interval of six months must elapse between two periods of absence on privilege leave.

Privilege leave may be prefixed to furlough, special leave or extraordinary leave without allowance. The whole period of leave thus taken in combination is known as combined leave. Combined leave cannot be granted for a shorter period than six months, nor, except on medical certificate, may be extended beyond two years.

Extraordinary leave without allowances may be granted in case of necessity and, except in certain specified cases, only when no other kind of leave is by rule admissible. It may be granted in continuation of other leave.

Subsidiary leave in India for a minimum of ten days, usually with half average salary, may be granted to an officer proceeding on or returning from leave out of India or on retirement, to enable him to reach the port of embarkation or to re-join his appointment. It is admissible only at the end and not at the beginning of combined leave.

Short leave is also granted to enable officers to appear at examinations, etc.

Long leave.—Furlough and special leave with allowances are admissible to an aggregate maximum amount of six years during an officer's service. The amount of furlough "earned" is one-quarter of an officer's active service and the amount "due" is that amount *less* any enjoyed.

Furlough without medical certificate can, if due, be generally taken after eight years' active service and again after intervals of not less than three years' continuous service. It is limited to two years at a time. After return from privilege leave of more than six weeks, furlough cannot be taken for 18 months.

Furlough on medical certificate may be granted (*a*) to an officer who has rendered three years' continuous service for not more than two years but capable of extension up to three years and (*b*) to an officer who has not rendered three years' continuous service up to one year in any case, and up to such longer period, if any (but not exceeding two years), as the officer may have furlough due to him.

The *allowances* admissible during furlough are—

(1) During the first two years of furlough without medical certificate and during so much of furlough with medical certificate as may be "due," half average salary subject to certain maximum limits.

(2) After the expiration of the period for which the foregoing allowances are admissible, one-quarter of average salary subject to certain maximum and minimum limits.

Special leave may be granted at any time for not more than six months with intervals of six years' service; allowances calculated as during furlough are given during the first six months only whether taken in one or more instalments.

General rules.—Leave of absence, whether on furlough or on privilege leave, can never be claimed as of right, and is given or refused at the discretion of Government.

After five years' continuous absence from India an officer is considered to be out of the employment of Government.

When leave allowances other than privilege leave pay are paid at the Home Treasury, or in a Colony where the standard of currency is gold, rupees are converted into sterling at the rate of exchange fixed for the time being for the adjustment of financial

transactions between the Imperial and Indian Treasuries unless any other rate has been exceptionally authorized. But for the present the rate of conversion is subject to a minimum of 1*s.* 6*d.* to the rupee. [Privilege leave pay when issued from the Home Treasury (this is only admissible when privilege leave is combined with other leave) is converted at 1*s.* 4*d.* to the rupee.]

Remarks.—It is considered that the leave rules are too complicated and require revision. It appears unnecessary to restrict the amount of privilege leave accumulated to three months, and this specially operates as a hardship in the case of officers whose services cannot, in the interests of the public service, be spared and who continue to serve without leave after they have earned three months' privilege leave.

It is frequently the case that officers, especially married officers, with families to educate in England, cannot afford to take furlough entailing as it does half salary, and it is recommended that officers should be allowed to take furlough on full pay, the same being counted against them as if double the period on half pay. This should be subject to a proviso that not more than two-thirds of the total furlough at credit of an officer should be taken on full pay and further the total period on full pay in any one absence might be limited to one year.

The limit requiring active service for eight years before being eligible for the first furlough should be reduced to five years.

Provincial Service.

Present Regulations.—The *privilege leave* rules are the same as those for Imperial officers.

The *long leave* rules applicable to Provincial officers are those given in Chapter XIV of the Civil Service Regulations. Briefly these are:—

Leave on medical certificate may be granted for three years in all but not for more than two years at one time, and no officer can have leave on medical certificate out of India more than twice.

After six years' service, *leave on private affairs* for six months may be granted to an officer who has not had furlough and reported after intervals of six years:—

(*a*) After ten years' service, furlough for one year or any less period; and thereafter, at intervals of not less than eight years, one year or such other period as together with all periods already spent on furlough may not exceed two years, or

(*b*) After eighteen years' service, furlough for two years or any less period; and thereafter, at intervals of not less than eight years, any such period as together with all periods already spent on furlough may not exceed two years. Provided—

(i) That the service for furlough of an officer who has had leave on private affairs counts only from the date of his last return from such leave;

(ii) That the aggregate amount of furlough or of furlough and leave on private affairs taken together shall not exceed two years;

(iii) That an interval of not less than eighteen months has elapsed between last return from privilege leave of over six weeks' duration, whether taken by itself or combined with leave on medical certificate, and the furlough, or privilege leave, if any, with which the furlough is combined.

Extraordinary leave without allowances may, in case of necessity and when no other leave is by rule admissible, be granted for such time as may be necessary—

(*a*) An officer on leave on medical certificate is entitled to half his average salary for the first fifteen months of each period of such leave but not for more than thirty months in all. For the rest of his leave he is entitled to a quarter of his average salary.

(*b*) An officer on furlough or on leave on private affairs is entitled to half his average salary.

Half average salary and quarter average salary are subject to certain maximum and minimum limits.

Remarks.—The rules should be modified in the same respects as those recommended for Imperial services as regards privilege leave. As regards restrictions on interval between periods of furlough, it is considered the first furlough should be admissible after five years' active service and further furlough subject to an interval of four years. The total furlough admissible should be one-eighth of the active service subject to a maximum of four years in the total service. The privilege of converting furlough for half the period on full pay recommended for Imperial Engineers is recommended only when the furlough is spent in Europe.

72,202. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**

Imperial Service.

Present Regulations.—The following is a summary of the principal pension rules applicable to Engineers appointed to the Imperial Service by the Secretary of State from the United Kingdom:—

An officer is eligible for a pension on voluntary retirement after completing 20 years' qualifying service or attaining the age of 55 years. If at an earlier date he is compelled to retire from the service through ill-health not occasioned by irregular or intemperate habits, he becomes eligible for an invalid pension or a gratuity according to the length of his service.

The amount of pension or gratuity is regulated as follows:—

After a service of less than ten years, an invalid gratuity not exceeding one month's emoluments for each completed year of service.

After a service of not less than ten years an invalid pension not exceeding the following amounts:—

Scale of pension.

Years of completed service.	Sixtieths of average emoluments.	Maximum limit of pension.
10	20	Rs. 1,000 a year or Rs. 83⅓ a month.
11	21	Rs. 1,400 a year or Rs. 116⅔ a month.
12	22	Rs. 1,800 a year or Rs. 150 a month.
13	23	Rs. 2,200 a year or Rs. 183⅓ a month.
14	24	Rs. 2,600 a year or Rs. 216⅔ a month.
15	25	Rs. 3,000 a year or Rs. 250 a month.
16	26	
17	27	
18	28	
19	29	

After a service of not less than twenty years, a retiring pension not exceeding the following amounts:—

Scale of pension.

Years of completed service.	Sixtieths of average emoluments.	Maximum limit of pension.
20 to 24	30	Rs. 4,000 a year or Rs. 333⅓ a month.
25 and above	30	Rs. 5,000 a year or Rs. 416⅔ a month.

Officers who have shown special energy and efficiency during an effective service of three years in certain appointments may, at the discretion of the Government of India, be allowed an additional pension of Rs. 1,000 a year, subject to the condition that the officer must not retire voluntarily before the completion of a total qualifying service of 28 years.

Subject to certain prescribed conditions, rupee pensions are now issued at the rate of exchange of 1*s.* 9*d.* the rupee to pensioners residing in countries in which the Indian Government rupee is not legal tender.

Remarks.—I consider the rates of pay now allowed to Imperial Engineers adequate, but some improvement in the pension is urgently called for.

The standard of living and the cost of necessaries both in England and in India has greatly increased in the past 30 years and this has been recognized and suitable increases of salary have been given.

In the matter of pension, actual reduction owing to the fall of the exchange value of the rupee has been sustained. I consider that pensions should be raised to a standard approaching those given to Military officers of the Indian Army and Royal Engineers who have served continuously in India. It is considered that the ordinary pensions of officers should be raised to £300 sterling after 20 years' service and to £600 after 30 years.

Extra pensions of £100 a year should be given for approved service as a Superintending Engineer for three years and an additional £30 for each year's service as a Chief Engineer subject to a maximum of £150.

Provincial Service.

Present Regulations.—An officer is eligible for a pension on voluntary retirement after completing thirty years' qualifying service or on attaining the age of 55 years—*vide* articles 464 and 465, Civil Service Regulations. If at an earlier date he is compelled to retire from the service through ill-health not occasioned by irregular or intemperate habits, he becomes eligible for an invalid pension or a gratuity according to the length of his service.

The amount of pension or gratuity is regulated as follows:—

(*a*) After a service of less than ten years a gratuity not exceeding (except in special cases and under the orders of the Government of India) one month's emoluments for such completed year of service. If the emoluments of the officer have been reduced during the last three years of his service, otherwise than as a penalty, average emoluments may, at the discretion of the local Government, be substituted for emoluments.

(*b*) After a service of not less than ten years, a pension not exceeding the following amounts:—

Years of completed service.	Scale of pension (60th of average emoluments) of last three years.	Maximum limit of pension a year.
		Rs.
10	10	2,000
11	11	2,200
12	12	2,400
13	13	2,600
14	14	2,800
15	15	3,000
16	16	3,200
17	17	3,400
18	18	3,600
19	19	3,800
20	20	4,000
21	21	4,200
22	22	4,400
23	23	4,600
24	24	4,800
25 and above	30	5,000

Remarks.—It is considered that the period of service to qualify for voluntary retirement on pension should be reduced to twenty-five years.

The maximum limit of pension should be as at present up to twenty-five years' service, but should be raised at the rate of Rs. 200 per year up to thirty years. The final maximum will then stand at Rs. 6,000.

72,203. **(VII.) Limitations on the employment of non-Europeans and the working of existing system of division of services.**

Present Regulations.—The employment of non-Europeans (Statutory Natives of India) is restricted to the appointments made in India and 10 *per cent.* of those made in England.

The working of the existing system has not caused any difficulty.

Remarks.—It is considered that the appointment of Indians in England is inadvisable for the reasons already given above under the heading (I).

Appointments in England should be limited to Europeans.

The existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial is a logical one and has worked well.

72,204. **(VIII.) The relations of the Public Works Department with the Indian Civil Service and other departments.**—The relations with the Indian Civil Service and other services are good. There is generally little friction and it is not considered that alterations are called for in this respect.

72,205. **(IX.) Other points within the terms of reference not covered by the above heads.**—*Travelling allowances.*—These have not been raised for very many years and are frequently inadequate to cover out of pocket expenses. Generally it may be said an officer is out of pocket when travelling by road for every day on which he moves. Those officers who move slowly halting several days at each camp, recoup their losses on the move by gains on the halting allowances. Officers whose duties require constant moving in camp receive inadequate allowances. When it is considered that the cost of carts and forage has risen over 50 *per cent.* since the allowances were fixed, it is not surprising that such a result ensues. The daily allowances for the days when an officer moves his camp should be increased. The rules further require some revision to suit the more modern mode of travelling—the bicycle, the motor car, etc.

Officers in this Presidency in the Public Works Department generally feel they are unjustly treated in the matter of carrying horses and camp equipment by rail on Government service.

The readings of the rules on this subject (Civil Service Regulations, article 1000) are generally opposed to considerations of justice or common sense and on plea of protecting the public purse—the grossest injustice is occasionally done to officers.

Cases of hardship in regard to conveyance of horses, etc., most frequently occur in connection with transfers, but I have known also cases of intolerable injustice in causing officers to carry their horses by rail when taking them about in the execution of their ordinary duties.

It is considered that officers on transfer should be allowed actual expenses incurred up to some fixed limit for each grade.

For District officers on tour the provisions of Civil Service Regulations, article 1062, may be made to apply. This gives the option of claiming actual expenses for the first journey out of and back to headquarters.

Inspection of engineering works in Europe.—Greater facilities for seeing works in Europe by officers on leave should be given. The suggestion that a party tour should be organized each summer by the India Office for Engineer officers on leave to visit engineering works in progress in England is supported. Adequate allowances for personal expenses on such tours should be given to officers accompanying them. The time spent on tour should generally count as part of the furlough.

Colonel W. M. Ellis, called and examined.

72,206. (*Chairman.*) He held the post of Chief Engineer for Irrigation and joined the Public Works Department in 1888. Previously to joining the department he spent four years in Burma.

72,207. The present method of selection in England was satisfactory and the recruits coming out from the different engineering colleges compared favourably with those who came out in the old days from Cooper's Hill. He objected to recruitment by competition amongst selected candidates. The present qualifications of the recruits were adequate.

72,208. Imperial engineers should be on probation in India for a period of two years, not so much with a view to training as with a view to enabling the local officers to judge of their suitability. It was desirable that a man should have some practical experience of works, but it did not make much difference whether that experience was gained in

England or in India; in fact if works were available at the time there would be certain advantages in India.

72,209. He favoured the existing system of division into Imperial and Provincial but would do away with the present rule under which 10 per cent. of Indians were recruited in England. Recruitment in India would give a better selection of men who were in touch with prevailing conditions. He would leave it to the discretion of the local governments to select men from the provincial or subordinate services, but there would be no objection to leaving the posts open to the whole profession whether in Government or any other service. He had sent in the written statement under the impression that it was his business to put forward views which would be acceptable to Government but discovered later that it was his own personal views which the Commission required. His own opinion was that there was no necessity for the 10 per cent. and that Government could get better value for their money by appointing the English engineer in England and the Indian engineer in India.

72,210. There appeared to be a certain amount of dissatisfaction amongst provincial officers with the designation provincial and he would favour the removal of any form of nomenclature which might create invidious distinctions. Officers doing the same work should be in the same service, but he held to the principle that a European recruited officer should have a compensation allowance over and above the ordinary pay of the service.

72,211. He was the only Royal Engineer in the service at the present time and none were being recruited to the department.

72,212. He had not considered the question of a central college but saw no great objection to it. The engineering training at the Madras college was adequate. He did not lay much stress upon the actual detail of the courses at engineering schools; if a man was going to make a good engineer he would benefit by the course at any engineering college provided it attained a fair standard. The difference between two men of equal capacity after ten years would not be very great if one went to a rather inferior school and the other to a somewhat superior school. He agreed, however, that the better the school the better a man was likely to be, and he desired to see the Indian given an opportunity of a standard equal to that of the engineering colleges in England.

72,213. A recruit joining the upper subordinate service was given a year's practical training when he came out of the college and did not get an appointment till some time after that. The upper subordinate officer was working satisfactorily.

72,214. Temporary Engineers had been working in the service for the last seven or eight years, and some of them were doing permanent work in connection with irrigation, roads and buildings. All kinds of work were included in the duties of an executive engineer, the only officer allocated to a separate branch being the Chief Engineer for Irrigation. It did not pay where works were scattered to have officers for different classes of work. The subordinate officer had to take any work that might occur within his charge. For buildings and roads, he took his orders from the officer in charge of buildings and roads, and for irrigation from the irrigation officer. Temporary engineers at present were in a very poor position in regard to prospects and he had a great deal of sympathy with them. Those who had been on permanent work for some years might be taken into the cadre of the service. In doing so age and standing would have to be considered and also due regard paid to the position of the officers in the service. A Temporary Engineer could not be put at the bottom of the list if he had any experience or length of service; on the other hand if he was brought on to the cadre at some point up the scale it would rouse a grievance amongst the officers.

72,215. It was very important that inefficient officers should be compulsorily retired. If Government now possessed that power it did not appear to use it. A man could be reduced but that did not meet the case as in his reduced capacity he continued to do still more inferior work. A man retired for inefficiency should be treated generously; up to ten years he might be given a double gratuity and between ten and twenty some increase of pension. That was open to the objection that it would be treating him more generously than an invalided officer, and perhaps the proposal was not a good one; in any case Government should have the option of giving compensation. It was possible that a man might wish to leave the service and with malice aforethought might perform his work inefficiently, and therefore it was necessary that Government should have discretionary power.

72,216. Increased salary was necessary for officers in the grade of Chief Engineer. The difference between his pay and that of the Superintending Engineer was not commensurate with the extra responsibility of the post. The Chief Engineer now received Rs. 2,750 and Rs. 250 as Secretary to Government, and he should receive at least Rs. 500 more than the man below him. The Chief Engineer for Irrigation received Rs. 2,500 and Rs. 250 as Secretary to Government, so that the difference between the officers was Rs. 250, whereas the responsibility of the higher post was worth a great deal more than Rs. 250. The present salary of Rs. 3,000 could not be called a bad salary.

72,217. It would be an advantage to the service to separate the Assistant Engineer and Executive Engineer and have two time-scales, with selection from one grade to the other. A man's qualifications were always carefully considered before he was given charge of a division and if a man was not considered fit he was passed over. At present an officer had occasionally to wait in the Rs. 800 grade before he received executive rank, on account of there being no vacancy. If he had to wait for two years before being promoted he should take up his position in the time-scale allowing for the two years he had waited. It would be rather hard on an officer not to compensate him for being kept back through no fault of his own.

72,218. Very few officers took advantage of the privilege of optional retirement at twenty years, but the concession was very much valued. From the point of view of the service twenty years was rather short. If they had to chose between a larger pension and the retention of optional retirement after twenty years the majority would prefer a longer term of service and a larger pension.

72,219. He did not think that private contractors could do the work so cheaply as the Public Works Department. There were a few large engineering firms who were prepared to make designs and to act as engineering contractors, but the majority of contractors were only collectors of labour and practically looked for supervision to the engineering staff. The rates of tender of large firms for miscellaneous works were very much higher than the rates of the Public Works Department. In any case a certain number of engineers would have to be maintained by the department.

72,220. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) He was not aware that the Government had the power of retiring inefficient officers but did not exercise the power because they had no discretion to award pensions to officers so retired.

72,221. There should be nothing derogatory to a locally recruited service, which performed the same work and was on the same list for promotion as the service recruited from England. An officer recruited in India would draw less pay and would be under different rules with regard to leave and pension. The only alterations he proposed were, first, to change the name of provincial service and secondly to stop recruitment of Indians in England.

72,222. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The periods of leave now allowed were liberal. An officer should, however, be allowed to commute his furlough into shorter periods on full pay within certain limits.

72,223. A pension of £600 should be payable to an Executive Engineer on retirement after a full period of service, and Superintending Engineers should be eligible for a pension of £700 and Chief Engineers for a pension running up to £850. That proposal was put forward in order to bring the pensions of Public Works Department officers into line with those

of Royal Engineer officers, who received £700 no matter what their rank.

72,224. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) He was against any form of competition and preferred the present method of selection. Any firm engaging an Engineer would do so by selection. It was true there was some difference between a system of recruitment for a recognized service and the occasional employment of an Engineer by a private firm, but the men obtained would be pretty much the same. Men might be brilliant in an examination and yet be inefficient, but the chances of obtaining such men were reduced by selection. It might be more satisfactory to the public to know that a man was being chosen on his merits by an examination, but his proposal was made rather with a view to efficiency than with the object of satisfying public feeling. He knew of instances in which candidates successful in examinations had proved failures, and had also known of failures amongst selected candidates, but the failures were fewer amongst the latter.

72,225. An Indian selected by the Secretary of State had generally lived in England about three or four years, and three years' absence at such a time of life rather put him out of close touch with the languages, customs, and mode of life of his own people. An Indian who was appointed in England might belong to the Punjab or the United Provinces and be posted to Madras, where he would be as much a stranger as a young Englishman. An Englishman had certain general advantages over an Indian and an Indian had certain general advantages over an Englishman. The Englishman was generally able to apply his theoretical knowledge in a more practical way, while the Indian was more in touch with the labour of the country, but by going to England he lost some touch with his own province, though no doubt he was more acquainted with it than the Englishman. It could not be said that an Englishman who served in India for twenty years lost touch with the manners and customs of the English people as he lived amongst his own people in India and spoke the same language. It might be of advantage to an Indian to be trained in the better institutions of England, and to live and move about for some years in western society, but the field of selection of such men would be extremely limited.

72,226. If a European officer received the pay that he would receive in his own country, *plus* 50 per cent. as a compensation allowance for serving in India he ought to be satisfied, but the question arose as to whether men could be obtained on such terms.

72,227. (*Mr. Sly.*) Important works were carried out generally by a system of petty contracts. As a rule large contractors were not forthcoming at reasonable rates. Large works had not been constructed in Madras for a great many years. In Madras town a single building as a rule would be taken up by a single contractor, but there was one in the town who was prepared to work on a large scale.

72,228. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The Indian Assistant Engineers generally received their engineering education in the presidency, their appointments being all made from the Madras college. Temporary Engineers might come from anywhere, and most of those now employed were educated outside the presidency. The facilities at the Government college were not sufficient to meet the demand for engineers. The output of subordinates was much below what was required and practically the department had to take anybody it could get. There had been a great increase in the demand for engineers and subordinates, especially the latter, by district boards and municipalities. Therefore a considerable extension was needed in the Madras college.

72,229. (*Mr. Madge.*) The period of probation he had recommended would practically mean that a man came out on an engagement and that at the end of that period was either kept on permanently or his engagement terminated. There was a good deal of difference of opinion as to whether such uncertainty of tenure would present the better class of engineers coming forward, but personally he believed that a man who had confidence in himself and who had a guarantee that a certain percentage of the men who came out would receive a permanent appointment would generally think he would be one of the permanent men. There should be power of dismissal at any period of a man's career. Cases were by no means rare of a man who was quite good in his youth but became worthless later in life, and when a man was useless he should be got rid of whatever might be the cause. That might prejudice recruitment and that was why he had said that inefficient officers should be treated with great generosity and not be thrown on the world without provision.

72,230. He did not know whether promotions of Anglo-Indians had been made from the upper subordinate grades, but there had been several such promotions from the domiciled community. There were very few Anglo-Indians in the subordinate ranks of the department. On the average their work was much the same as that of other officers in the department. There was only one promotion by selection every two years.

72,231. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Indian trained officers were employed on construction to a very considerable extent, but no very large work had been done since the Periyar and Rushikulya works many years ago, neither of which was in charge of provincial engineers, though provincial engineers and upper subordinates were employed on the works. Some of the Indian college trained men had done very excellent work indeed. The two works he had mentioned were built twenty years ago when there were fewer Indians in the service than there were now.

72,232. There had been a great deal of investigation work going on but that was quite different from the actual execution of works. Investigation work consisted in surveying and considering the lines on which projects ought to be drawn up and in making designs for large works, and he agreed with a statement made by a witness that in the investigation of some of the big projects in the Madras Presidency the Indian trained element was greatly in requisition and had to bear a very considerable share of the burden and responsibilities of the work. He also agreed that whatever was possible should be done to foster Indian engineering talent, but personally he did not think it would be to the advantage of the Government service that Indian college trained engineers should be employed in larger numbers in the Public Works Department. Whether it would be a matter of policy was another matter. Excluding the exceptional men, of which there were several brilliant examples in the department, the Indian did not make as good an engineer as the Englishman; he excelled in book work, but was not quite so good in the practical application of his learning. The best brains of the presidency went in for law where there were a great deal more openings than there were in engineering.

72,233. He was not prepared to say that the probationary training was everything it might be, in the case either of the European or of the Indian officer. They were sent to a division to learn their work, but the Executive Engineer as a rule had very heavy duties of his own and could not give a great deal of time to the training. He denied, however, that a difference was made as between European and Indian probationers. As a rule the probationers were not taken round with the Executive Engineer when he was on his tour. The training might be capable of improvement if officers were appointed to go about with the probationers and give them the teaching which the Executive Engineer had no time to give.

72,234. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He would be prepared to admit a claim for higher pay by Indians serving in a different province from their own, as an Indian would not go to another province unless he did receive more pay. He agreed with a previous witness that a Bengali serving in Madras would be as much a foreigner in a foreign country as a European serving in Madras; but at the same time he would far rather have a Madrassi serving in Madras than a Bengali.

72,235. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Diaries of the probationers did not go to the Superintending Engineer through the Executive Engineers, but probationers as a rule were reported on quarterly or half-yearly to the Superintending Engineer who would send the reports on to the Chief Engineer, and if the Superintending Engineer was not satisfied with the training he would make a note on the reports accordingly.

72,236. (*Mr. Pears.*) He would not insist on students passing out of the college serving as upper subordinates in the Public Works Department in the

interval between their passing out of the college and the occurrence of a vacancy.

72,237. In saying that the time scale was adequate he assumed that the condition of pension and leave would be improved. At present the salaries were not adequate to make up for deficiencies in pension.

72,238. He could not see any object in the restrictions now placed on the taking of privilege leave immediately before retirement. The rule involved Government in a certain amount of inconvenience, as it was rather apt to lead a man within a year of retiring to take any leave due to him in order not to lose it. If he was allowed to take it at the time he retired he would probably take it just before retiring and there would be no break in his service. There was also a certain amount of administrative inconvenience arising from the fact that a man on returning from privilege leave had sometimes to occupy a post for three months before he retired.

72,239. He objected to the rate of exchange for the rupee being 1*s.* 9*d.* for a man retiring in England and 1*s.* 4*d.* for a man living after retirement in India. When a man was paid out of Indian revenues he should not be penalized for settling down in the country.

72,240. The question whether a Temporary Engineer placed in a permanent post would cause a grievance amongst the permanent men superseded would depend on the place in which the officer was put. It he was put in somewhat below coevals he was not likely prejudicially to affect the men below him until it came to selection for administrative ranks.

72,241. There was not a great deal to choose between departmental work and contract work in regard to quality. Quality depended on the efficiency of the supervision of the engineer in charge.

72,242. He could not recall any instance in the presidency where an engineer had been kept waiting for a division owing to there being no vacancies.

72,243. Investigation of a project would involve a good deal of local inquiry from ryots as to rainfall, flood level, value of land, etc., and for such enquiries an Indian engineer would be specially suitable, but the advantage of the Indian officer would not be so great when it came to the execution of the project. For the execution of minor projects in Madras Indian engineers had been employed in certain cases.

72,244. (*Mr. Bhaskara Ayyar.*) Where projects had been worked out by Indian engineers he had no reason to doubt they had performed their work thoroughly well, but as he had only assumed charge of his present office recently he was not in a position to give an opinion. He was not prepared to say that Indian engineers had not shown energy and resourcefulness in their work.

72,245. If Indians were given the same charges as European engineers and were as efficient he had no objection to giving them any amount of pay, but he did not think it was necessary from the point of view of Government to pay a man above the reasonable market rate, and the market rate of an engineer in his own country was different from the market rate of the imported engineer. If there were men in the country able to do the work he did not object to their being largely employed, on the understanding that they were as efficient in every respect.

72,246. He would not exclude a member of the subordinate establishment from being appointed to the Imperial service if he was considered a good man. He would appoint the best available man in each vacancy as it occurred but would bar any man over thirty years of age.

(The witness withdrew.)

W. J. J. Howley, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Madras.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,247. **(I.) Methods of recruitment.**—The present method of selection of Imperial Engineers by a Selection Committee in England is satisfactory, but it is suggested that at least 50 per cent. of the Selection Committee should be senior officers of the Public Works Department, either on the active or the retired lists.

72,248. **(II.) Systems of training and probation.**—*Probation.*—It is considered that there should be no period of probation after appointment. The opinion is that a period of probation after appointment would act as a deterrent preventing the best men from offering themselves; and, moreover, that it would be of very little use unless unduly prolonged. The Selection Committee should be in quite as good a position to decide as to a man's fitness for permanent appointment as his superior officers in India would be after a probation of say one year

Training.—It is suggested that a recruit after appointment should have a year's practical experience on engineering works in the British Isles, instead of this being required as a condition of appointment. It should be ascertained to what Presidency and to what branch the new assistant would be posted, so that he might be sent to works where he would gain experience likely to be useful to him on joining his appointment. During this period of training the Assistant Engineer would be required to prove himself a competent horseman and to study the vernacular of his province (or such one of them as might be prescribed). His knowledge of the vernacular should be tested by examination during this practical course: the standard required need not be high.

72,249. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—It is suggested that the cadre of Permanent Engineers should be more frequently revised, and less dependence placed upon the employment of Temporary Engineers.

Much dissatisfaction has occasionally been caused by the transfer of Temporary Engineers to the permanent scale. It is suggested that future appointments of Temporary Engineers should be on the distinct understanding that no man so appointed shall under any circumstances be brought on to the permanent scale. With regard to Temporary Engineers already serving, it is considered that the interests of men permanently appointed in the usual way should be fully safeguarded for promotion to administrative rank.

72,250. **(IV.) Conditions of salary.**—Although the scale of pay of the Public Works Department was revised and placed on an incremental basis in 1908, the Exchange Compensation Allowance formerly given was withdrawn and the net increase in actual emoluments is not commensurate with the greatly increased cost of living during the past decade.

Under the re-organisation scheme of 1908 it is ruled that an officer may not draw more than Rs. 800 per month unless he is in charge of a Division, or in a charge which the Local Government consider to be of equal importance. This rule is a hardship to an Officer who, though fully qualified, does not obtain a divisional charge simply because there is no vacancy for him. It is therefore suggested that an officer of the Imperial Service reported as fit for divisional charge should continue to receive the ordinary increments, irrespective of his being in actual divisional charge.

Under the reorganisation scheme of 1908, Executive Engineers attain their maximum pay of Rs. 1,250 per mensem after 19 years' service. It is urged that if an Executive Engineer, though otherwise qualified, is not promoted to a Circle charge after 20 years' service, he should continue to draw annual increments of Rs. 50 per mensem, subject to a maximum of Rs. 1,400 per mensem.

72,251. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—The rules governing the grant of furlough to Imperial officers of the Public Works Department appointed in England are practically identical with those which apply to the Indian Civil Service and to Military Officers in Civil Employment; *except* as regards the amount of allowances. In the case of the two classes of officers just mentioned, furlough allowances are subject, if paid at the Home Treasury, to a *minimum* limit of £500 per annum, or the full amount of salary last drawn, whichever is less; and to a *maximum* limit of £1,000 per anum. On the other hand, for Civil Engineer officers of the Public Works Department, there is *no minimum* limit, while the maximum has

been fixed at only £800 per annum. The following table shows the *maximum* furlough allowances permissible to Imperial Civil Engineers under the present rules:—

Years of completed service.	Maximum furlough pay. £
8	279
9	297
10	316½
11	337½
12	360
13	382½
14	405
15	427½
16	450
17	472½
18	495
19	517½
20	540
21	555
22	562½
After 3 years as Superintending Engineer, 3rd Grade	675
After 3 years as Superintending Engineer, 2nd Grade	787½
Thereafter	800

It is urged that Civil Engineer Officers on the Imperial list should not be subject to *maximum and minimum limits* of leave allowances different from those applicable to officers of the Indian Civil Service and to Military Officers subject to civil leave rules. A Royal Engineer in the Public Works Department, with 8 years' service to his credit, is entitled to *almost double* the furlough allowances of a Civil Engineer officer doing exactly the same class of work and having the same service in the Department. It is not till a Civil Engineer officer has completed 18 years' service that he can draw an allowance approaching that of a Royal Engineer officer after only 8 years' service. There is no valid reason why Civil Engineer officers should be so very much less favourably treated than their brother officers in the Royal Engineers. It is, however, not merely on the ground that other classes of Officers doing the same work draw much higher leave allowances that a claim is made for an increase in these allowances, but because the present furlough allowances are so inadequate that a large number of Civil Engineer officers cannot avail themselves of the furlough due to them, and which the state of their health demands that they should take. This question of improved leave allowances has already been raised in Memorials submitted by Civil Engineer officers to His Majesty's Secretary of State for India in 1912 and 1913.

Special leave.—It is suggested that the allowances paid during special leave should be the same as in the case of furlough.

Privilege leave.—Under the present rules privilege leave can be accumulated up to a period of three months only. It is a frequent occurrence that when an officer has accumulated the full period of privilege leave admissible (three months), the exigencies of the public service do not permit of his being allowed to take the leave, and in consequence his service ceases, for the time, to count for privilege leave. It is suggested that in order to avoid this loss of valuable leave on full pay, the period up to which it may be accumulated should be increased from three to six months.

An officer should be allowed to avail himself of privilege leave due to him immediately before retirement, and to retire from the Service at the end of his leave, instead of having first to return to duty, as is the case under existing rules. This concession would remove a legitimate grievance and would obviously tend to reduce administrative inconvenience.

The concession has already been applied to privilege leave when combined with any other form of leave and all that is asked for is its extension to privilege leave alone.

Study leave.—It is very desirable that officers of the Public Works Department should be allowed every opportunity of making themselves acquainted with modern developments in Engineering practice at Home and abroad. At present Civil Engineers can visit works in the British Isles and elsewhere only as private individuals and at their own expense, unless placed on deputation or specially permitted to visit certain works while on leave. In the latter case, certain travelling and other expenses are allowed, but the time spent in the visits counts against the officer's period of leave. It is suggested that officers should be allowed greater facilities for inspecting work outside India and should be encouraged to do so. In the Indian Medical Service, for example, an officer is allowed Study Leave in England up to one year out of total service, in addition to furlough. During this period he receives not only furlough pay, but also lodging allowance amounting to four to eight shillings per day.

72,252. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—The question of pensions is the greatest grievance of Civil officers of the Public Works Department. The amount of retiring pension admissible under the existing rules is totally inadequate and has formed the subject of numerous Memorials to the Government of India and to His Majesty's Secretary of State for India. Notwithstanding the great increase in the cost of living and the much higher qualifications now required from officers entering the Service, the present pensions are actually less than they were 40 years ago. Copies of the Memorials submitted by Civil officers of this Department during the past six years are attached as Appendices.* Although the first memorials were submitted in 1907, no reply thereto was furnished till August, 1912, when the petitioners were informed by the Government of India that no decision could be arrived at pending the receipt of the report of the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India. Civil Engineer officers, therefore, now look hopefully to the Royal Commission for redress of this long-standing grievance, and respectfully urge that the scale of pensions prayed for in the Memorials of 1912 and 1913* may be recommended.

In full confidence that the Royal Commission will realise the justice of these claims it is further urged that any improvements made in the scale of pensions should have retrospective effect, at least from the year 1908, seeing that the grievance was brought prominently to the notice of the Government of India in the Memorials of 1907-1908, to which no reply was vouchsafed, and that in the meantime many officers have been placed upon the retired list and many more will probably be retired before any decision is arrived at.

Invalid pensions.—Prior to 1884, invalid pensions granted to all officers belonging to the Uncovenanted Services, with which the Public Works Department was then classed, were governed by Article 474 of the Civil Service Regulations. In Lord Kimberley's Despatch of 1883, however, a new scale of pensions (known as the "more favourable" pension rules) was introduced for English-trained Engineers and Telegraph officers. Under this scale, which is governed by Article 641 of the Civil Service Regulations, the fixed maximum rate of invalid pension has been reduced, although the amount calculated on a percentage basis has been increased. The net result is that a Civil Engineer officer, if invalided after 10, 11, 12, 13, 16, 17, 18 or 19 years, would draw a *less* pension than officers of other Services coming under Civil Service Regulations, Article 474, and drawing the same pay; while if invalided after 14 or 15 years' service he would draw *more pay*. In order to remove this anomaly it is urged that the fixed maximum limits under Article 641 should be increased to at least the same as those fixed under Article 474.

* *Vide* Appendix XIII.

The following comparative table will make clear the difference:—

Years of completed service.	C.S.R. Article 474.		C.S.R. Article 641.		
	Amount calculated on a percentage basis.	Fixed Maximum.	Amount calculated on a percentage basis.		Fixed Maximum.
		Rs.		Rs.	Rs.
10	10/60	1 406	20/60	2,813	1,000
11	11/60	1,650	21/60	3,150	1,400
12	12/60	1,920	22/60	3,520	1,800
13	13/60	2,210	23/60	3,910	2,200
14	14/60	2,520	24/60	4,320	2,600
15	15/60	2,850	25/60	4,750	3,000
16	16/60	3,200	26/60	5,200	3,000
17	17/60	3,570	27/60	5,670	3,000
18	18/60	3,960	28/60	6,160	3,000
19	19/60	4,370	29/60	6,670	3,000
20	20/60	4,800	30/60	7,200	4,000

Family Pension Fund.—Unlike the Indian Civil Service and the Military Services in India, there is no official Family Pension Fund for the Public Works Department. The emoluments of officers are not sufficient to admit of their making adequate provision for their families. Pension has been officially defined as "deferred remuneration," which means that part of an officer's salary is withheld as a contribution towards the cost of his pension. Now if an officer dies while still in the service, or shortly after retirement, the whole, or almost the whole of this "deferred remuneration" is lost and his family may be left utterly destitute. If, however, the officer had the option of investing with an Insurance Company, the amount assumed to have been retained by Government as his contribution towards his pension, he could so arrange that in the case of his death before the date from which the annuity would commence a considerable amount in cash or an annuity would be payable to his widow or other member of his family dependent upon him. There is therefore a desire that some form of Family Pension Fund, applicable perhaps to other Services similarly unprotected as well as to the Public Works Department, should be introduced by Government.

72,253. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—It is considered that if the present standard of efficiency in the Department is to be maintained, the European element must largely preponderate in the Imperial Branch for some considerable time. The number of appointments in the Imperial Service at present reserved for Indians is 10 per cent. and this proportion appears to be suitable for the present.

It is considered that Engineers recruited in England should receive a higher rate of pay than those recruited in India, whether all are included in one Service, as has been proposed, or in two distinct Services (Imperial and Provincial) as at present.

72,254. **(VIII.) Relationship to the Indian Civil and other services.**—The relationship between the Public Works Department and the Indian Civil and other Services in India is considered to be satisfactory.

72,255. **(IX.) Other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—It is considered that some revision of the present Travelling Allowance Rules is necessary, especially with regard to transfers. At present a transfer is frequently a matter of very considerable expense to an officer. It is suggested that actual expenses, subject to reasonable limits, should be paid. It is also considered that Article 1000, Civil Service Regulations, as at present interpreted, imposes undue restrictions, especially in this Presidency, where the charges are very large.

Mr. W. J. J. Howley called and examined.

72,256. (*Chairman.*) The witness represented the European Imperial Engineers of the Public Works Department, Madras. He had been in the service twenty-five years.

72,257. The present method of selection was generally satisfactory. It was considered by the officers he represented that a period of probation, after appointment, would deter the best men from applying for appointment. Personally he thought probation made for efficiency in the service. He did not regard the question, however, as one of special importance.

72,258. The ten per cent. limit of Indians should be maintained, but the question had not been really gone into by his colleagues. There were certain objections to a mandatory rule that ten per cent. should be appointed whether they were available or not, and on the whole it might be better to recruit Indians in India than in England. He agreed with Colonel Ellis's evidence on that point.

72,259. He saw no objection to the abolition of the present division into Imperial and Provincial branches, provided the distinction with regard to salary was maintained. The services should be all on one list with a common designation. Officers recruited from Europe should be granted an additional allowance.

72,260. He had no personal experience of the Madras Engineering College, but judging by results the training appeared to be sufficient. He saw no difference between the technical qualifications of Indians who came out from England and of Indians trained in India.

72,261. He was unaware of the exact conditions under which Temporary Engineers were appointed. They were doing the same maintenance work as permanent men. It would be reasonable to increase the cadre to the extent of the number of Temporary Engineers employed on permanent work.

72,262. With regard to salary, Assistant Engineers who were considered to be qualified for a divisional charge but for whom no divisional charge was available should continue to receive the ordinary annual increments, and there should be no check at Rs. 800. He was not looking at the matter from the point of view of economy but from the point of view of the engineers themselves. The Imperial Engineers whom he represented considered that an officer had a right to expect that, with nothing against him, he would go on getting regular increments of pay.

72,263. With regard to study leave, the Indian Medical Service and the Royal Engineers were granted a certain amount of study leave for which they received pay and allowances, but engineers had to pay their expenses out of their own pockets unless they were put on deputation. Study leave should be given with allowances, to enable men to visit constructional works in other parts of the world.

72,264. The officers he represented laid very great stress on the insufficiency of existing pensions. They did not desire to have a family pension fund in substitution for the present provident fund. They had now the right to subscribe to an insurance company and to draw on their balance in the provident fund for this purpose. They were afraid that if a family pension fund was merely established and administered by Government without the promise of any Government contribution, they would not get as good terms as from leading insurance companies. There was a difference of opinion amongst the officers as to whether just as good or better terms would not be obtained from insurance companies as from Government.

72,265. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) His colleagues were in favour of commutation of pension. There was the risk of an officer using the money up before his death, but it involved too much interference with a man's personal liberty for the Government to say in what manner he should deal with his own money. The officers he represented claimed that they paid largely for their pension annuity, that it was partly deferred pay, and on that ground they looked for liberal assistance from Government in the event of a family pension fund being established. They would not care for a Government family pension fund unless it was

contributed to by Government and based on more favourable terms than the terms of an insurance company. Possibly it was the right of Government to some extent to see that an officer made reasonable provision for his family, and it was on that ground that contribution to a provident fund was compulsory.

72,266. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The Indian engineer who had been to England, although possibly no better theoretically than an Indian trained engineer, had certainly an advantage in that he had visited works and learned how works were carried out by European contractors. He also had some advantage in dealing with his brother officers, as European training was of value in creating an *esprit de corps* in the service. On that ground there was no reason why a small percentage of recruitment in England should not continue.

72,267. (*Mr. Madge.*) No Temporary Engineers, so far as he knew, had been discharged on account of there being no work for them; and there were Temporary Engineers filling posts of a permanent nature. If the cadre was increased by including trained and tried Temporary Engineers it would do no harm until the question of their promotion to the Superintending Engineer grade came up, but their absorption in the cadre would be always looked upon as a grievance by the men below them. If the administrative ranks were also increased there would be no objection. The work in the divisions was so large that they might well be broken up and extra divisions formed.

72,268. Engineering work was increasing in India, but it was not up to the standard of work in Great Britain, and it was more useful for an officer to visit works in that country. He did not suggest that an engineer should specially go to Europe for study, but when at home he should have an opportunity of visiting works, and receive an allowance for doing so.

72,269. (*Mr. Pears.*) It might be sufficient to guarantee the out-of-pocket expenses of officers on study leave and to allow the study leave to be treated as part of an officer's furlough.

72,270. It would be a good arrangement to convert some of the present half pay furlough into a shorter period of furlough on full pay.

72,271. If a man was entitled to draw a pension in England at 1*s.* 9*d.* he should be allowed to draw it at the same rate in any other part of the world; and more especially in India, as it was obviously undesirable to penalise men for spending in India pensions paid from Indian revenues.

72,272. If a family pension fund was introduced it should be as a separate fund and not merely a modification of the present provident fund. If good engineers could be obtained on a much lower pay in India that might be, from an administrative point of view, a sufficient reason for not recruiting them in England.

72,273. (*Mr. Bhaskara Ayyar.*) If the Secretary of State was prepared to increase the 10 per cent. of Indians, he had no objection to offer on the part of the men he represented. He recommended different rates of pay for officers recruited in India and in England on the ground that a European officer was put to a much greater expense owing to his domicile being in England.

72,274. The view of the majority of officers he represented was that probation would deter the best men from applying for appointment.

72,275. It was not easy to learn the vernacular in England, but a certain grounding in Hindustani could be obtained. Although the vernacular was better learned in the place where it was spoken, a student in England might, during his period of probation, utilise part of his time in language study.

72,276. He would apply the proposed concession with regard to pay being continued when an officer had to wait for a vacancy to the Provincial as well as to the Imperial Engineer.

(The witness withdrew.)

M.R.Ry. R. A. Srinivasa Ayyangar Avargal, Executive Engineer, Madras.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,277. **(I.) Method of recruitment.**—The Engineer Officers of the Department are at present recruited in 5 ways.—

(1) By appointment by selection in England, of Civil Engineers by the Secretary of State for India assisted by a committee;

(2) By appointment of Royal Engineers;

(3) By promotion of Temporary Engineers, howsoever recruited in the first instance;

(4) By appointment of passed Engineer Students of the Indian Engineering Colleges; and

(5) By promotion of deserving Upper Subordinates.

The method at present followed for recruitment of Civil Engineers in England is to appoint the men selected by a Committee of Engineers appointed by the Secretary of State for India. There is no competition whatever and as such, there is no guarantee that the best available men have been selected. A system of selection, on the results of a competitive Examination, from candidates nominated by a Committee, is likely to secure far better results and is therefore recommended for adoption. The Examination should be in Engineering and allied subjects with special reference to the requirements of India. There must be at least three candidates selected for every post to be competed for.

There is a restriction placed with regard to selection in England of Natives of India and only 10 per cent. of the appointments made in any year is given to them. This restriction does not seem to be called for and there should be no restriction of race, caste or creed in respect of the appointments made in England, except in respect of the candidates belonging to the Colonies of South Africa and Australia. Inasmuch as the Governments of the Colonies do not treat the Indians with the consideration due to them, their subjects ought not to be admitted to the service of the Government of India in any capacity.

No appointments of Royal Engineer Officers have recently been made, and those that were at one time reserved for them are now being allotted to the Civil Engineers appointed from England.

There have been cases in which men who were appointed Temporary Engineers in the first instance and for whom no hopes of permanent appointment were held out, were subsequently made permanent and promoted over the heads of many of their seniors. This has caused a good deal of dissatisfaction.

With regard to appointments of men from the Indian Engineering Colleges, the practice in Madras was, till recently, to appoint the student who stood *first* in the Engineer class *in the final examination held by an independent Board of Examiners*, provided he successfully passed through the practical course. But recently, the system was changed and the rules provide for a selection by the Principal and the Chief Engineer *from among the students of the Engineer Class who pass at the final examination held by the College staff*. This latter system is likely to lead to undesirable results, and we would recommend the reversion to the older system.

The promotion of deserving Upper Subordinates to the Engineer Establishment, as followed in Madras, has not attracted the best of the available men, as they were always appointed with the starting salary of an Assistant Engineer. The rules are not against giving higher salaries, and a more judicious system of appointing deserving men to any class and on any salary is likely to produce better results.

According to the reply given to a question asked in the House of Commons on 19th April 1911, the number of Civil Engineers recruited in England has averaged 30 for a series of years. The number appointed in India is 14 (9 from the Colleges and 5 by promotion of Upper Subordinates). The correct figures for the last ten years are that 507 Imperial Engineers were appointed by the Secretary of State for India, which gives an average of 40·7 per year,

and 140 Engineers were appointed in India, which gives an average of 14. Thus the annual recruitments have been 74 per cent. from England and 16 per cent. from the Indian Colleges and 10 from the Subordinates. Thus 84 per cent. of the appointments is made by Selection and only 16 per cent. by open competition. The number of Indians appointed from England during this period of 10 years is only 13, which gives an average of 1·3 per year or 24 per cent. of the recruitments. Thus, the proportion of the appointments is 72 per cent. for Europeans and 28 per cent. for Indians (including promotions from the Subordinate grades).

Taking the figures for the last 6 years since the abolition of the Cooper's Hill College, there have been 221 appointments by the Secretary of State, of which 12 are Indians and 84 appointments in India, the percentages being almost the same.

The above figures are for the whole of India. The figures for Madras are as noted below:—

Period.	Recruitments.			Percentages.	
	England.	India.	Total.	England.	India.
1904-1912 ...	26	22	38	70	30
1908-1912 ...	11	8	12	64	36

Comparing the present circumstances with those that existed at the time of the Public Service Commission, it will be found (*vide* page 362 of Appendix O of the Report of that body) that the annual recruitment from England and from the Indian Colleges was, at that time, in the proportion of 21 to 9, against 40·7 to 9 at present. Whereas the Indian Colleges got 30 per cent. of the annual appointments at the time of the Public Service Commission they get only 16 per cent. at present.

Another point that has to be noticed in this connection is that the Public Service Commission found that the recruitment from the Cooper's Hill College was excessive and recommended that 50 per cent. of the Engineers should be recruited from Cooper's Hill, 20 per cent. from the Royal Engineers and 30 per cent. from Indian Colleges. No effect has been given to this recommendation, and the recruitment from India is only to the extent of 26 per cent. of the annual recruitments, of which 10 per cent. is made up of men promoted from the Subordinate grades.

Circumstances have changed since then, the Cooper's Hill College has been abolished and no appointments are made from the Royal Engineers. The places reserved for the Royal Engineers should have been distributed equally between the recruitments in England and in India. Thus 40 per cent. of the annual appointments should have gone to the Indian Colleges.

The evidence taken by the Commission of 1886 leads one to conclude that there is very little to choose between the best Indian Engineer and his English rival. The training imparted in the Indian Colleges is sound and fairly exhaustive. This fact has, moreover, been publicly admitted by such eminent persons as Lord MacDonnell and Sir J. P. Hewett. The training is further directed wholly to the requirements in India. Taking all the above facts into consideration, it will only be reasonable if it is asserted that the legitimate aspirations of the public in India cannot be satisfied unless a greater proportion of the superior appointments is reserved for competition in India. It is suggested as a suitable remedy that at least 50 per cent. of the total annual recruitment may be made in India at present, and that this proportion should be gradually increased as conditions change.

72,278. **(II.) Systems of training and probation.**—As there is no guarantee that the preliminary training given to the recruits from England is such as to meet the requirements of the profession in India, they should be given two years practical training under selected Executive Engineers and where large works are in progress. During this period, they should be trained in Section and Sub-Division work, in the investigation of projects and in designing. Opportunities should also be given to them of becoming acquainted with the agricultural conditions of the province in which they are employed. They should also gain, during this period of probation, sufficient colloquial knowledge of the local vernacular language. If any probationer fails to give satisfaction at the end of this period, his term of probation may, at the discretion of the local Government, be extended by another year, and his services should be dispensed with at the end of three years if he proves a failure. Any plea that this is unfair or will deter candidates from England, by reason of the attached risk, may be met by the provision of free return passages to rejected probationers.

As the Indian recruit is to be appointed only on completion of one year's practical course, according to the system in force now, no further probation is necessary in his case.

Before confirmation, however, every Engineer must pass the Professional Examination prescribed in the Public Works Department Code. The English recruit should also pass an examination in the local vernacular.

72,279. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—The two years spent on probation by the English recruit and one year in practical training by the Indian recruit should count towards qualifying service for promotion to the Executive Engineer class and for leave, pension, &c.

Officers should be compelled to retire when they attain the age of 55 years, and the provision for the retirement at 50 of officers not promoted to the administrative grade may stand. Government should, also, have power to compulsorily retire any officer, at any time, for continued inefficiency. An officer who finds that his claims for promotion have been continuously overlooked should be given the option of retiring voluntarily at any time.

72,280. **(IV.) Conditions of salary.**—The present incremental system of salary has given complete satisfaction and may be continued.

The salary of the English recruit during his probation may be fixed at the initial salary of an Assistant Engineer, and that of the Indian recruit during his practical course at Rs. 250 per mensem. On being made permanent they may draw the salary due to them in the third and second year of service respectively as Assistant Engineer.

The pay of the Indian recruited element is approximately two-thirds of that granted to officers recruited in England. This is unfair and unsuitable, and has caused great discontent. Both classes of officers are recruited for and are required to do exactly the same work and bear the same responsibilities, and emoluments should depend solely on services rendered. The distinction between the two classes of officers who do the same kind of work and bear the same responsibilities should therefore be obliterated.

72,281. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—There is much disparity between the conditions applying to each of these two classes of officers. There is also a difference between the rules applying to the Indian and the European recruited Imperial Engineers. Great stress has been laid on the advantage to be derived by an Engineer in visiting works in foreign countries, and the element recruited in England has received undue credit on this account. Unless the conditions of leave are the same, it becomes impossible for an Indian trained Engineer, even if he desires to do so, to secure the same advantage in this direction as English recruited Engineers.

The maximum furlough admissible to the Indian recruited Engineer under the existing rules is 2 years, the first furlough can only be taken after 10 years of active service and the interval between any two furloughs is eight years. In order to enable the Indian recruit to visit works in foreign countries when he is still young, it should be possible for him to go on furlough after six years of active service. The interval between any two furloughs ought not to be more than three years and the maximum amount of furlough admissible should also be increased to one-sixth of the active service subject to a limit of four years.

It must, also, be stated here that the duties of a Public Works Department officer are very onerous and trying, and he requires more frequent rest for

recruiting his health than any other class of officers. In this respect both Europeans and Indians are alike and there should therefore be no distinction between them.

The allowance during furlough should be half the average emoluments subject to a maximum of Rs. 1,000 per mensem if paid in India and £800 per annum if paid in a foreign country.

Privilege leave. Under the present rules an officer can earn privilege leave to the extent of one calendar month for every eleven complete calendar months of duty, and such leave is cumulative up to a period of three months only. In the case of officers who have accumulated the full period it frequently happens that the exigencies of the public service prevent their being granted privilege leave when they desire it, and this leads to the leave lapsing through no fault of their own. It would, in a measure, mitigate against this loss of leave on full pay which an officer has fully earned if the cumulative period were extended from three to six months.

An officer should be allowed to avail himself of all privilege leave due to him immediately prior to retirement and be permitted to retire from the service at the end of the leave without being obliged to return to duty as he is now obliged to do. This concession has already been made when privilege leave is combined with other leave, and its extension to privilege leave alone, besides removing a legitimate grievance among officers of the Department, would lead to much less administrative inconvenience than is now the case.

Study leave. Modern civil engineering is a highly specialised profession and progress in the methods of construction is very rapid. In view of the vast undertakings of the Government of India in the Public Works and Railway Departments, it is essential for efficiency and economy, that the engineering staff of these Departments should keep themselves abreast of modern engineering practice. This can only be accomplished by visiting and studying works of special interest in progress in different parts of the world. The officers of the Public Works Department should be encouraged to visit large works wherever in progress and should be provided with every facility for doing so. Either new rules should be introduced to admit of these facilities being granted, or there should be a much more liberal interpretation of the existing rules regarding the placing of an officer on deputation.

72,282. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—Here again there is a much resented distinction (Vide Art. 636 Civil Service Regulations) which will create invidious and unjust anomalies. As it is a well and universally established principle that pensions are granted as retiring provisions for specific services rendered to the State, it is illogical and unjust to create or maintain any distinction in this direction between persons who have, in fact, rendered exactly the same services. In other words pensions ought to be wholly and solely dependent on specific services rendered and not on the place of original recruitment, for this does not involve any special merit.

The maximum amount of pension should be raised to Rs. 7,500 per annum as the cost of living has considerably increased since the amount was fixed at Rs. 5,000.

The service required for voluntary retirement is rather long and may be fixed at 25 years.

The period of furlough to be counted as service for pension requires to be increased as noted below:—

After a total service of	15 years ...	1 year.
do.	20 years ...	2 years.
do.	25 years and above	3 years.

The emoluments of officers in the Public Works and Railways Department are not sufficient to admit of their making adequate provision for their families should they die in harness and there is no official family pension fund for these departments. The knowledge that they are unable to make such provision and that their pensions are purely personal and cease with their death is a source of great anxiety to many an officer whose duties take him into places which are prejudicial to health. There is a strong desire, therefore, that means may be found whereby an officer may be aided in making suitable provision against the event of his death for the members of his family dependent on him. As pension has been defined as deferred remuneration it means that a certain portion of the officer's salary is kept back to provide for pension after retirement. As an officer deputed to foreign service has to contribute towards his pension at the rate of one-sixth of the pay he would have received in the British service, it may be presumed that an officer now receives only six-sevenths of the pay he would have received had there been no provision for pension. It is recommended that a portion of this amount which is thus kept back from the salary of an officer may be commuted as an annuity for his widow and children if he happens to die in harness or soon after retirement.

72,283. **(VIIa) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans.**—At present the employment of non-Europeans (Statutory Natives of India) is restricted to the appointments made in India and to 10 per cent. of those made in England. This limitation is uncalled for, as no irreducible minimum of the European element seems necessary in a department which is a purely professional and scientific service and has no share in the political administration of the country and in which the employment of purely Indian element will in no degree imperil the British supremacy.

It has already been suggested under the head Recruitment that 50 per cent. of the appointments may be from England and 50 per cent. from India. The recruitment in England should be open to all British subjects (except to those of the Colonies) irrespective of domicile, caste, creed, or colour.

72,284. **(VIIb) Working of the existing division of service into Imperial and Provincial.**—The division of the Public Works Department into Provincial and Imperial sections has been anything but a success and can never be so, in view of the surrounding circumstances and the past history of the Department. The distinction created between the two classes of officers who do exactly the same work and bear exactly the same responsibilities is intensely resented and will, inevitably, result in splitting up the whole Public Works Department into two hostile camps and this must greatly injure efficiency. The interests of the two classes of officers are now widely divergent and this is conspicuous in their relations. The lower pay that the Provincial receives has branded him as belonging to an inferior service and has lowered him considerably in the estimation of the public.

So long as the two classes possess, on the average, equal educational qualifications and professional attainments—and this is undoubtedly the case—any differentiation between them is unworkable. It is impossible to force a distinction in pay where none exists in attainments and any attempts to do so must create complication and raise issues which it would be as well to avoid.

It has already been stated that the training given in the Indian Colleges compares very favourably with that given on the Continent of Europe and it is a fact that many Indian trained Engineers possess superior qualifications to some officers recruited in England. It is also an admitted fact that in the investigations of some of the big projects in the Madras Presidency the Indian trained element was greatly in requisition and had to bear the greater share of the burden and responsibilities of the work.

It is therefore urged that the differentiation between the two services should be abolished and that the alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges should be restored to the position they formerly occupied; that is to say, there should be only one service in the Public Works Department.

72,285. **(VIII.) Relations of the service with the Indian Civil Service, &c.**—It would be for the good of the country if the relation between the Public Works Department and the Indian Civil Service were more cordial than at present.

72,286. **(IX.) Other points.**—The restriction now imposed on the people of one province (other than those of the domiciled community) disabling them from competing for the guaranteed appointments in other provinces should be removed.

The College of Engineering at Madras does not attract the best available talent in the country, as the prospects of passed students other than those who get the guaranteed appointments are not very encouraging in the Public Works Department, and as the door for entrance to other Departments such as Revenue Survey, Salt and Abkari, Trigonometrical Survey, Railway and Telegraphs, where they can be employed advantageously on account of the special training received by them is now practically closed to them. The passed students should therefore be employed wherever their special training will be beneficial so that the best available talent may be attracted to the College and thereby a still better class of men be had for local recruitment of our requirements and the efficiency of the department be thereby increased.

When I submitted my first Memorandum I dwelt in detail on the subordinate Service. But this service has been since reorganized more or less on the lines indicated by me and the only point that requires consideration is whether the incremental system of salary will be preferable to the present graded system. The concensus of opinion seems to be in favour of the former.

If after all it is decided to have a Provincial Service in the Public Works Department as in the Revenue and Judicial Departments, it is suggested that a few appointments of Executive Engineers may be listed as in those services for the promotion of deserving subordinates. Six such appointments may, for the present, be listed. The Provincial Service should, in such a case, be intended solely for the Subordinates and those promoted to the Executive Engineer grade from the Subordinate service. All those recruited as Assistant Engineers whether in India or in England should belong to one service, i.e. the Imperial. Even this is not liked by the Subordinates. When a Subordinate is considered fit to be promoted to an Engineer's place, he must receive the same remuneration as his brother officers doing the same work.

The scales of travelling allowance given to officers and subordinates were fixed long ago and since then circumstances have changed, the cost of everything, including servants and cart hire, has increased, the allowances are found inadequate to meet the cost of travelling and many officers are obliged to meet a portion of their travelling expenses from their salary. It is therefore reasonable that these allowances should be increased by 50 per cent.

Officers are put to much expense when they are transferred from one place. The expenses of breaking up establishment in one place and of setting it up in a new place and the loss incurred by the sale of furniture, carriages, &c. at one place and buying new ones at the other are in themselves very heavy. Add to this, the cost of moving one's self with family, servants, and the necessary articles of luggage is considerably more than what is paid by Government. The net result is that many an officer is considerably out of pocket by a transfer which is, therefore, regarded as a great punishment. It would be more satisfactory if a liberal set of rules were introduced which would enable an officer to recoup what he actually spent. The Scale recommended by the Madras Government in July, 1912, may be adopted.

M.R.Ry. R. A. Srinivasa Ayyangar called and examined.

72,287. (*Chairman.*) The witness represented the Indian engineers of the Imperial service. He was recruited under the rules by which one guaranteed appointment was given; there were only five such officers now in the service. There were two recruited under the 10 per cent. rule. He was Executive Engineer of the Chingleput district, and had completed nearly twenty-eight years' service.

72,288. The Public Works Department should be recruited both in India and England by competitive examination, and the division into Imperial and Provincial branches should be abolished, as the training given in Indian colleges was as efficient as that given in English colleges.

72,289. Fifty per cent. of the superior posts should be filled by recruitment in England and 50 per cent. by recruitment in India, but Indians should be allowed to compete in either country. The 50 per cent. recruitment in England was only suggested as a temporary measure, as the indigenous element might be introduced in greater proportion as time went on. The 50 per cent. in either country might consist of all Indians or all Europeans according to the results of the examination. The present proportion of officers recruited in India had been laid down by the Government as 30 per cent., but there had not been sufficient time for that percentage to be reached. Since 1886 a relatively smaller number of students had been taken from the colleges. In the early days the bulk of the students came from Rurki and were Europeans. The system of recruitment in India would be on the results of a final examination similar to that at the Madras Engineering College. The competition should also take into account college work, and it might be confined to provinces. He had no objection to a central college if it could be arranged. The superior service might be concentrated in the one college and the provincial colleges might train only for the subordinate services.

72,290. He did not approve of the present system of payment of officers recruited in England and in India. An allowance might be given to the European but that should be based on what he would receive in his own country and not on market values in India. If an Indian served in England it would be reasonable for him to be paid something more tahn he would be paid in India in consideration of the fact that he was serving in a foreign country.

72,291. If the distinctions of title were removed as between Imperial and Provincial, and the pay of officers made the same, it would remove some of the dissatisfaction now existing amongst provincial officers, but the question of the foreign allowance would be a difficult one to deal with. If the pay that a European received in India was a little more than that which he would receive in his own country there appeared to be no necessity for paying any foreign allowance. The grievance might be removed if the European officer received the same salary *plus* a foreign allowance.

72,292. Certain posts in the Executive Engineer grade should be allotted to upper subordinates, if the division into Imperial and Provincial continued, but if there was only one service the proportion of promoted upper subordinates should be left to the discretion of the Government.

72,293. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) He was drawing the same pay as European officers and he only put forward the complaints in his written statement in the interests of his countrymen.

72,294. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) At present the provincial service salaries were not adequate to keep up the status and dignity of an engineer. It was true that men came into the service, but for the present they had no other choice. The engineering college was not popular and only a few students entered it.

72,295. (*Mr. Madge.*) He attached a great deal of importance to the passing of an examination, but did not think mere examination was a sufficient test. Recently the system in the Madras college had been changed. Formerly there was an independent board of examiners but now the examiners were the college staff. He advocated a return to independent examiners.

72,296. There were Anglo-Indians in the subordinate service but none in the provincial. So far as he had seen the work of these subordinates, there had been some good and some bad specimens.

72,297. Any foreign allowance given might also be based upon the difference in the cost of living between the two countries.

72,298. There was a risk that, if men were discharged during the period of probation, recruitment would be affected owing to the uncertainty of appointment, but that could not be helped.

72,299. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) He had known of no Madras College Engineer being employed on the railways.

72,300. The Assistant Commissioners, Inspectors and Assistant Inspectors in the Salt and Abkari Depart-

ment had to do a good deal of constructional work for which a knowledge of engineering was required, and a training in the Madras College would help them considerably. They were given some training now in engineering.

72,301. (*Mr. Pears.*) He had heard of no difficulties in securing recruits in England. With regard to training under an Executive Engineer, it was part of that officer's duty that he should allot time for the work. On the whole the training given by executive engineers was adequate, but it might be improved if the probationers were taken over works. That was possible under the present system, but it was not always done.

72,302. With regard to the system of promoting deserving upper subordinates and its failure to attract the best of the available men owing to their being appointed on the starting salary of Assistant Engineers, that was due to the fact that the highest men in the upper subordinate service were getting more pay than they would get at the bottom of the provincial list. Asked whether the college would not become unpopular if the promotion of the officers were retarded, the witness said that if upper subordinates were promoted to a higher class of the provincial service, the promotion of men who came in direct from the college would be retarded to a certain extent, but generally speaking the men in the upper subordinate grade had also come from the engineering college.

72,303. (*Mr. Bhaskara Ayyar.*) From his personal knowledge of the expenses of provincial officers he was able to affirm that the present scale of salaries for the provincial service was inadequate. The pay the Imperial engineer received was just sufficient to enable him to maintain his position. He would not be content with a scale of pay midway between the present pay of the Imperial and Provincial engineers; it was necessary that the pay should be on the Imperial scale.

(The witness withdrew.)

M.R.Ry. N. Swaminatha Ayyar Avargal, Executive Engineer, Madras.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,304. **(I.) Methods of recruitment.**—The method of recruitment followed in England for the Imperial Service of the Public Works Department has not been the same all along. First there were the Royal Engineers who are not being appointed now and have almost disappeared as a class. Subsequently there was the Royal Indian Engineering College at Coopers Hill from where the men required for Service in the P.W.D. were appointed. The College too has been abolished and the method followed at present is appointment by selection by the Secretary of State for India assisted by a Committee. It is too early yet to say whether this method will prove satisfactory; but it appears fairly certain that it is not likely to secure the best talents suited to the requirements of service in this country. Selection on the results of an unrestricted competitive examination in Engineering and allied subjects fixed with special reference to the needs of service in this country and in one Indian Vernacular, so as to secure only persons of proved educational qualifications will be far more satisfactory than any other system which could be thought of and will not be open to reproach as the other methods of selection pure and simple or selection on the results of a competitive examination of the nominated candidates.

In the case of the Provincial Service the method of recruitment was till recently, to appoint the student of the Engineer class who came out first in the examination held by a Board of Examiners, after his completing satisfactorily one year's apprentice course in the Department. This system has been changed and the rules provide at present for a selection by the Principal and the Chief Engineer from among the students of the Engineer class who passed the examination held by the College staff. This latter system is likely to lead to undesirable results as it places the students under the mercy of the Principal of the College and a reversion to the former system which has worked hitherto with such good results is very necessary. If there are any grounds for complaint, they are due mostly if not entirely to the defects in the constitution and working of the College and the unattractive openings held out to passed men about which more will be said later on.

There is also another source of recruitment to the Provincial service by the promotion of deserving Upper Subordinates already in Service at the rate of one in every alternate year. Considering how the prospects of Sub-Engineers have been improved recently, their promotion to the Engineer Establishment on the initial salary of an Assistant Engineer is not at all attractive and as a result of this the whole class of Sub-Engineers have no stimulus to work well and earn this special promotion. Better results will be secured if promotions are made to any class and grade of Engineer Establishment on any salary.

72,305. **(II.) Systems of training and probation.**—As the practical training had in England is not likely to meet the requirements of service in India, the recruits from England should be given two years' practical training in this country under selected Executive Engineers in all kinds of work they will be called on to do. During this period they should gain sufficient colloquial knowledge of the local vernacular. At present their experience is gained wholly while in active service; this not unfrequently places them at a disadvantage resulting in inefficiency and should not be allowed to continue. If any probationer fails to give satisfaction at the end of the period, his term of probation may, at the discretion of the local Government, be extended by another year. His services should be dispensed with if he proves a failure at the end of 3 years. Any plea that this will deter candidates from England by reason of the attached risk may be met by the provision of free return passages to such rejected probationers.

In the case of men appointed locally the training and probation might be limited to one year; but they should be given proper facilities to learn work. At present they are left severely alone and nobody takes care of them. With their own unaided effort they have to learn what is necessary for doing the work of the Department and it is nothing surprising that it takes a longer time than necessary for them to learn and do their work efficiently. Their inexperience is only too readily mistaken for inefficiency. If they are only taken care of properly and proper opportunities are given them to learn work they will prove very efficient indeed in the space of one year. If any probationer fails to do so, his term of probation may, at the discretion of the local Government be extended by another year.

72,306. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—For one work and same responsibility there should be one service with absolutely no distinction of any kind. All officers required to carry out the ordinary work of the Department should be in one list and treated alike in every respect. The special posts requiring specific qualifications should be filled by special men and these latter should not be asked to do the ordinary work of the Department. Also the men appointed temporarily for carrying out specific works should be employed on those works only and their services terminated as soon as they are completed.

Officers should be retired compulsorily when they attain the age of 55 years and the provision for the retirement at 50 of officers not promoted to Administrative grade may stand. Government should also have the power to compulsorily retire any officer at any time for continued inefficiency. Also an officer who finds that his claims for promotion have been continuously overlooked should be given the option of retiring voluntarily.

72,307. **(IV.) Conditions of salary.**—The present incremental system appears to be quite suitable. But

there should be no difference in the salaries of the men appointed to do the same duties merely because they are recruited differently. Any such difference is felt as a great grievance when both do the same work, and what is worse, brands those receiving less, as being inferior. Very often the treatment given to those receiving less pay is also different and to give only a few instance of the same there are:—

(1) The denial of the grant of Presidency Allowance to Provincial officers, when their Imperial brethren are having it, there being no reason for this anomaly;

(2) The way in which the reorganisation of the services was carried out in 1908 failed to give satisfaction to the Provincials and it proved an uphill task for them to get it modified. Even the one recently sanctioned in 1912, though an improvement on the previous one, does not abolish all distinction between the two services. The one main principle to be recognized is that the pay is for the post and not for the man. No difference can be logically maintained without destroying efficiency.

72,308. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—The duties of a P.W.D. Officer are very onerous and trying and he requires more frequent rest for recruiting his health than any other class of officers. In this respect both Europeans and Indians are alike and there should therefore be no distinction between them. But there is at present much disparity between the conditions applying to each of these two classes of officers.

The maximum amount of furlough admissible at present for Indians is only 2 years and the first furlough can be taken only after 10 years of active service, the interval between any two furloughs being 8 years. It should be possible for an officer to go on furlough after six years active service and the interval between any two furloughs ought not to be more than three years. The maximum amount of furlough admissible should also be increased to $\frac{1}{6}$ of the active service subject to a limit of 4 years.

The allowances during furlough should be half the average emoluments subject to a maximum of Rs. 1,000 per mensem if paid in India and £800 per annum if paid in a foreign country.

Privilege Leave and *Study Leave*.—(The representation under these heads is the same as that in paragraph 72,281 *ante*.)

72,309. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—(The representation under this head is the same as that in paragraph 72,282 *ante*.)

72,310. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—(*a*) At present the employment of non-Europeans is restricted to the appointments made in India and to 10 per cent. of those made in England. This limitation is uncalled for as no irreducible minimum of the European element seems necessary in a Department which is purely a professional and scientific service and has no share in the political administration of the country. The percentage of recruitment made from England for the Madras Presidency during the last 10 years is 70 while that from India is 30 inclusive of those promoted from the subordinate service. Considering the fact that the training imparted in the Indian colleges is sound and fairly exhaustive and is further directed wholly to the requirements of the service in this country and that there is very little to choose between the best Indian Engineer and his English rival, it will be only reasonable to employ local talent to the fullest possible extent without any restriction whatever, by reserving a very great proportion of the appointments for competition in India. The recruitment from England should be limited to

(1) the special posts requiring specific qualifications,

(2) the minimum number of ordinary posts which will enable the filling up of half the number of higher posts in the administrative grade.

This end will, it is believed, be achieved by recruiting from England about one-third the number of men required for the Department exclusive of the special posts, the remaining two-thirds being recruited from the local Colleges. In fact no proportion need be fixed at all regarding the employment of the latter, and what is suggested above is only as a tentative measure.

(*b*) The division of service into Imperial and Provincial which came into force only in 1896 has proved very unsatisfactory and is felt as a great grievance. The lower pay the Provincial draws has lowered him in the estimation of public. Not only this, the Imperials consider themselves superiors, and treat the Provincials as their inferiors. There is thus a distinct line of cleavage between the two, which increases with their service in geometric progression. One of proved merit in the Provincial Service has at present no chance before one of the Imperial Service who is not quite so good. Owing to the unfair treatment accorded to the Provincials and the lack of opportunities to show themselves they come to lose interest in their work and are pronounced as failures. The division of services should cease to exist as soon as possible.

72,311. **(VIII.) Relations of the service with the Indian Civil Service and other services.**—As a result of the division of service into Imperial and Provincial and the consequent differences in pay, treatment, etc., the latter do not command the same respect from the officers of the Indian Civil Service and other services. Consequently they do not move with them as much as they should. An improvement in their relationship is highly desirable and the abolition of the division of service into Imperial and Provincial advocated above will surely hasten it.

72,312. **(IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—The method followed at present in the appointment of Temporary Engineers in the Public Works Department on higher salaries for doing the regular work of the Department is felt as a sore grievance both by the men who have entered service from the way in which their prospects are affected and by those who have passed out of the College, from the way in which their claime have been overlooked for no obvious reason, very often, in favour of others who are not possessed of the same educational qualifications. Too much stress is laid on the value of practical experience and theoretical knowledge which is taken at a great discount in support of the above policy. But its effects are very far-reaching and has resulted in keeping out capable students from entering the College, as their prospects are miserably poor and disappointing, when they fail to come out first.

The recruitment of the Upper Subordinate Establishment employed so largely to assist the officers in carrying out the work of the department deserves to be considered specially in the grade of Sub-Engineers as success is dependent in a large measure on them. The majority of the men who are to do the onerous duties of Sub-Divisional Officers are drawn from this class and it cannot be said at present that they are all able to carry out their duties intelligently and efficiently, as they do not possess the requisite educational qualifications nor do they take pains to improve themselves. It is highly desirable to limit the selection and take in only the promising and deserving men. The deficiency in their number should be made up by appointing the passed Engineer students of the local Engineering College as temporary Engineers and after some years' trial they might either be confirmed as Sub-Divisional officers or done away with. This is not done at present with the result that the capable passed Engineer students first seek employment either in the Local Fund or Native States and those who fail to secure such appointments enter the Public Works Department in a subordinate capacity as temporary Overseers; because there is no scope for employment outside the above services nor can they afford to take up any other line after incurring all the expenditure and trouble in completing this course. Instances are not wanting even among these men leaving the Public Works Department when they are able to secure a place elsewhere. Thus the Public Works Department fails to secure the services of all capable men while it could have the choice and engages only those who are not quite so good and this policy results in the inefficiency of the subordinate service. Government too do not get proper return for the money spent in the education of such students in the Engineering College. If after

securing the capable students as Temporary Engineers, there are still grounds for complaint as regards the quality of men who come out of the college, the proper course will be to alter the constitution and working of the College suitably to meet the requirements of the Public Works Department. In doing so, the requirements of the other allied services, viz., the Local Fund, Municipal and Sanitary, might be considered. For instance a general course might be prescribed to all students entering the Engineer and Subordinate classes for about 2 years or so, and opportunity given in the last year or two to specialize themselves either in Civil, Mechanical, Electrical, Municipal, Sanitary and Road Engineering. There will be then no complaint about the dearth of qualified men for the several services on the one hand and want of scope for the employment of passed men on the other. This latter will in its turn result in attracting capable and intelligent students to enter the College and making the service more efficient. The scope for employing local talent without impairing the efficiency of the services will also be increased.

Travelling allowance.—(The representation under this head is the same as that in paragraph 75,286).

M.R.Ry. N. Swaminatha Ayyar called and examined.

72,313. (*Chairman.*) The witness was an Executive Engineer of twelve years' service, and represented the Provincial Engineers of the Public Works Department. He was trained in the Madras college.

72,314. The present division into Imperial and Provincial branches should be abolished and recruitment in England should be limited to special posts requiring specific qualifications such as Superintendent of Workshops, Electrical Adviser to Government, etc. The remainder of the service should be recruited one-third in England and two-thirds from local colleges. A proportion of the two-thirds recruited in India would come from the subordinate service. Most of the subordinate officers had been educated in the college, and they did not endeavour to improve themselves after entering the service and therefore did not make efficient sub-divisional officers when they attained that rank. They had lower educational qualifications as they had only to pass the school final examination, whereas the qualification for the provincial service was that of graduate. In the college they were trained in separate classes and under separate masters.

72,315. The most successful students in the Engineer class of the Madras Engineering College entered the Public Works Department and the next best went into local services or to Native States. Most of them preferred to go into Native States where they rose to positions of rank and responsibility. If any were left over they entered the Public Works Department in a subordinate capacity.

72,316. He did not agree with the principle that a European serving in India should have an additional allowance in the shape of pay, but he might be given something in the form of first-class passage money to and from England when going on leave or furlough. He would be willing to serve in England himself without any extra allowance provided his passage money was paid. He thought the members of the service would all take that view and would be prepared to serve thousands of miles away from their own home on the same pay they were receiving in India.

72,317. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) His reason for saying that the new system of appointment was not likely to secure the best talent was that the members of the selection board were not likely to know intimately all the merits of the candidates who appeared before them. He knew nothing about the method of selection in England, but thought that the selection board would be able to judge the men properly. When the number of candidates was so large it was impossible for a committee to obtain any intimate knowledge of them. Further, the men were drawn from several institutions no two of which had a common standard.

72,318. With regard to his remarks in the written statement on the subject of selection by the Principal of the College and the Chief Engineer, the difficulty was that the student had a suspicion that if he offended the Principal he might not have the same chance. It might not be a justifiable suspicion but it acted on the student. The Chief Engineer was generally swayed by the recommendation of the Principal and there was a suspicion that intelligence and merit might not obtain their reward. He himself apprehended no unfairness but the suspicion was there.

72,319. At present he was drawing Rs. 630 a month. He did not consider any extra allowance would be necessary if he were appointed to serve in Peshawar.

72,320. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The apprentice in the engineering department was simply attached to a division under the orders of an Executive Engineer. He was allowed to learn what he could by going about the place, and taking notes which he submitted every three months. No remarks or orders were passed thereon. The engineer under whom the apprentice was placed did not give him any instructions. He did not know how the English probationer was treated, but he did not suggest there was any difference in the manner in which the two classes of probationer were trained.

72,321. In his opinion an apprentice should be made to do the work of a sectional officer for some time, to inspect large works, and to take notes of them with the help of the officer who might be in charge. At a later period he should be given the charge of a sub-division.

72,322. The travelling allowance of an apprentice engineer was sufficient; he received Rs. 3 per day and first-class fare.

72,323. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He had never served out of the Madras Presidency. He had never been to Peshawar, but he had friends there. They had not told him what the conditions were. He would not claim any extra allowance merely because he was sent to a foreign district.

72,324. (*Mr. Madge.*) He did not think the British element was at all necessary in the service.

72,325. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) If he served in Peshawar he would take his wife and children with him. When his children were old enough he would send them back to Madras to be educated. That would mean more expense to him than if he was appointed to the Madras Presidency, and he would expect some allowance to be made. This allowance should not have anything to do with pay.

72,326. With regard to travelling expenses, he would expect to receive travelling allowance for himself and his wife and children.

72,327. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) He suggested that an Indian vernacular should be a necessary subject for engineer officers recruited in England in order that such men could show their attitude or otherwise, for learning the vernacular. He admitted it would be rather unfair to an English engineer officer who was not successful in the competitive examination to have been obliged to spend a large part of his time in learning a language which would clearly be of no use to him in his later life, but he pointed out that Indians, who would compete with the English officer, were also under a similar disadvantage in having to learn the English language. At the same time he agreed that a knowledge of English would be of advantage to an Indian engineer even if he failed in his examination. He had not viewed the matter in the light that if a knowledge of the Indian language was insisted upon as one of the subjects for the competitive examination, it would deter English engineers from entering the examination.

72,328. (*Mr. Pears.*) Passed-out engineer students of the Civil Engineering College preferred Native States to local funds.

72,329. (*Mr. Bhaskara Ayyar.*) He did not mean to suggest that the present system of selection was badly exercised. What he meant to say was that, however fair a Principal might wish to be, it was impossible for him to avoid an unconscious prejudice, arising from the circumstances that he had known the students in his college, and had formed some impres-

sion about them. If one scale of pay was made common to all the Provincial and Imperial engineers, and the Imperial engineers were given a foreign allowance, and the recruitment of Indians was increased, the discontent of the Provincial engineers would not be in any way mitigated. There must be absolute equality in pay, and also a larger recruitment in India.

(The witness withdrew.)

W. H. James, Esq., B.Sc., Principal, College of Engineering, Madras.

Written statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,330. [The undersigned is not a Public Works Department Officer and can express no opinion based on actual experience in regard to the conditions of service in the Public Works Department but, as principal for some years past of the institution from which a great majority of men employed in the Department are drawn, is closely concerned with the subject of recruitment.]

ENGINEER OFFICERS.

Recruitment in England.—No information is available as to the considerations that influence the Secretary of State's Advisory Committe in making appointments to the Public Works Department cadre, but I would, in any case, advocate that no engineer should be regarded as eligible for service in India unless he has had at least two years' practical experience in workshops or on Engineering works, in preferably some subordinate position and not as a premium apprentice. The longer this practical training up to a limit of say four years, concomitant with his having pursued a thorough theoretical course, the better fitted I should regard the candidate for employment in this country. There should also be a real and effective period of probation for two or three years before confirmation as a permanent officer.

Recruitment in India.—This is a matter of very great importance, for, India like all other countries, must in this mechanical age come to depend more and more for her progress and development on technical and in particular on Engineering skill, and whatever is possible should be done to foster indigenous talent.

The provision of adequate and up-to-date facilities for preliminary theoretical training is naturally called for in the first place, but the creation of well-qualified and practical class of experts is only possible if those Indians, who take up Engineering work, are encouraged in every way and given full scope for exercising their projession.

It can hardly be denied that, in general, the best brains of the country are at present drawn to seeking careers away from technical work. This, perhaps, is due partly to there having been no tradition in the past leading the higher and more intellectual classes to the study of applied science, but a greater present bar is the limited opporunity afforded in connection with Engineering work, and also the much larger prizes to be won in other walks of life.

For admission to this institution the general educational qualification demanded is of the standard of the Intermediate Examination in Arts of the University of Madras with Mathematics and Physics as the chief subjects. Selection from among the candidates is made by the Principal on the University examination records, and the students after admission pursue a college course extending over four years, followed by one year in workshops or on engineering works. After the first two years, the course bifurcates, and the students elect to qualify either as civil or mechanical engineers.

One appointment as Apprentice Engineer in the Public Works Department is conferred annually by the Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, in consultation with the Principal, College of Engineering, on the student, either civil or mechanical engineer, judged most suitable on the results of the examination and the promise shown by him and his general behaviour during the college course. The Apprentice Engineer is brought on to the permanent establishment of the Public Works Department as an Assistant Engineer at the end of the year of apprenticeship.

So far as Madras students are concerned, this is the only appointment open in the Engineer Establishment of the Department. The Government Order sanctioning the first regular and annual appointment of this kind is dated as long ago as May 14th, 1872, when the number of officers serving in the Public Works Department was naturally smaller than at present, and the question might very well now be considered whether something cannot be done in this direction.

I am myself not particularly in favour of appointment direct from College and would prefer selection should be made from among the three or four best students of the year after a probationary period of say two years in the Department. Selection might still remain with the Chief Engineer in consultation with the Principal of the College, based as at present on the results of the examinations and promise shown during the college course, but together with the further information that would then be available in regard to the aptitude shown by the probationers for practical work.

I would throw open more appointments in the Superior Service to men selected under such conditions, so that they may be afforded ample opportunities to show their worth, but promotion to the higher executive grades should be strictly on merit and not a mere matter of seniority. Men who after some years are regarded as unfit for promotion should be asked to resign and to allow of this being done without a suggestion of hardship, they may be granted some kind of retiring or compensation allowances with liberty to engage in other work.

UPPER SUBORDINATE OFFICERS.

Some appointments to the Engineer Establishment are made from among the Upper Subordinates. The College training of the subordinate is appreciably lower in standard than that of the Engineer student. The educational qualification for entry is the equivalent of Matriculation, and our present system is to admit the student in the first place to what is termed the Probationary Subordinate Class. Selections are made after two years from among the students of this class for promotion to the Upper Subordinate Class for a further course extending over two years, followed by a year of practical training in the Public Works Department. The unselected pass out at the end of the third year as Lower Subordinates. This arrangement, which really constitutes an attempt to improve the type of Upper Subordinate by obtaining men who at least show some promise in elementary engineering studies, was only introduced a few years back, and it will take some time to judge the results with any certainty.

After some service in the department, the more capable of the subordinate officers are offered promotion to the grade of Assistant Engineer, but this should come sufficiently early to make acceptance of some material advantage. I would not be in favour of increasing the number of promotions from that class.

Mr. W. H. James called and examined.

72,331. (*Chairman.*) The witness had occupied his present position for over six years. He had been in the service for twelve and a half years. He was appointed to the professorship of engineering when he first came out in 1901, and remained in that post for about six years.

72,332. The course of training now given at the Madras college was adequate for officers of the superior grades of the service, but it could be made better. Government had now a large scheme under their consideration, and provided that scheme was accepted, and the requisite staff and equipment were

provided, the training at the college would be considerably improved. There were 382 students at the college. There were also other students undergoing practical training, making a total number of 435. One hundred and twenty-five students were in training in the classes of the provincial service standard from which number one was appointed to the higher service every year. Of the remainder, 50 per cent. accepted appointments in the subordinate ranks of the Public Works Department, 25 per cent. went into local funds, 10 per cent. went with the Native States, and the rest took up various appointments. There were very few openings in private firms in Madras.

72,333. The pupils under training for the subordinate service were kept quite separate from those under training for the provincial service. Students who contemplated entering the provincial service underwent a higher course of training than those who contemplated entering the subordinate service.

72,334. There were no residential arrangements at the college. Students had facilities to go to the Victoric hostel with pupils of other colleges.

72,335. The present method of training for the upper and lower subordinate services was to admit pupils to a probationary subordinate class. After two years in that class, selections were made for a further course of three years, to qualify students for the upper subordinate branch. Those who were not selected stayed an additional year, and then entered the service as lower subordinates.

72,336. The students in the engineer class entered the college after having gone through the intermediate course, and naturally the college was able to train these students up to a much higher standard. The qualification for entry for pupils intended for the subordinate service was the matriculation or school final.

72,337. He was not in favour of the suggestion that in view of the very small recruitment to the provincial service each year in the various provinces, it might conduce to efficiency of training and possible economy if all the students entering the provincial service were trained at the same college. In the first place India was much too large a country, both in point of area and of numbers, for a college of that kind to serve the purpose intended. Nine or ten men each year were taken into the provincial service, and for classes of that standard, not more than twenty-five students in a class could be properly dealt with. If there was a central college of the kind suggested it meant there would be a class of twenty or twenty-five students, from which nine each year would be selected and put into the Imperial service. In his opinion Government would not get so good a selection by that method as if the appointments were distributed amongst the existing colleges. A college in each of the major provinces was absolutely essential,—apart from any considerations of recruitment for the provincial service. The training given to students who contemplated entering the subordinate service would not suffice for the 35 per cent. of men who were taken into the local funds and Native States. The latter required the same training as provincial engineers. He would also point out that difficulty might arise in getting the best men from Madras to go to a central college, as they might not desire to leave the presidency.

72,338. He regarded it as very important to give every opportunity to Indians to become thoroughly trained, because he considered that as engineering works developed in India, as much indigenous talent as possible should be employed. Therefore he was anxious to see each of the provincial colleges brought up to the highest possible standard. He would throw open more appointments in the superior service to Indians trained in India. At present the figure was 30 per cent. He would prefer to see the 10 per cent. of Indians now recruited by the Secretary of State in England recruited in India by local governments.

72,339. The course at the Madras college lasted four years, with one year on works. That was a year more than Rurki. Therefore, Madras college naturally thought its curriculum was a little more advanced than that of Rurki. He could not put in a return as to the difference between the two curricula, as Rurki college did not publish their syllabus in the calendar. He thought it was necessary to have a fourth year. From the experience he had obtained of work in India, he had himself advocated the lengthening of the period. The four-year course had only been in vogue two years, and the results of the change were not yet available, but he believed the extra year would effect a great improvement. The reason for the extension was that formerly students in the Madras college were accepted after they had passed the B.A. degree. They came in up to the age limit of twenty-two and he found they were rather old to start engineering. Therefore the qualification had been cut down to the intermediate, and the course lengthened, in order to give the students an additional year of special training. Students at present were taken in up to twenty years of age.

72,340. Although he was not in favour of increasing the number of promotions from the upper subordinate service to the superior service, he certainly would have no objection to promoting an exceptional man.

72,341. He did not suggest any improvement in the training for subordinates.

72,342. At present the Madras college gave a very inadequate workshop course. The surveying work was carried out very satisfactorily, because students were given a month in the field. What was chiefly wanted in the college were workshops and laboratories.

72,343. He would not suggest sending Indian students to England after they had been turned out of college; he would after the period of practical training put them straight into the service.

72,344. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) No Madras college students went into the Telegraph Department. They were given instruction in electrical engineering, but the college had only just started a course in that subject, and their great desire was to increase the laboratory facilities in order to give proper instruction.

72,345. Students who had passed the regular course of the college were as efficient theoretical engineers as students who had passed through a course in an English engineering college.

72,346. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The longer the period of practical training the better, but students who were getting on in years desired to earn money at the earliest possible moment.

72,347. With regard to the opportunities for practical training which were given to pupils who did not get into Government appointments, all the upper subordinate and engineering students who left the Madras college received a year's practical training, during which time they were paid a maintenance allowance. Those who went into Native States also received the same training.

72,348. Although he would like to see recruitment confined to Indian colleges, he would not absolutely exclude those Indians who had been trained in England.

72,349. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) There could not be the same facilities in India for learning electrical engineering as there were in England, but it was quite possible to equip Indian colleges to give a good enough training in that subject. There were at present no facilities in the Madras college for teaching telegraphy.

72,350. (*Mr. Sly.*) Engineering students in the Madras college were charged Rs. 140 a year. That sum was paid by the students themselves. There were for each class division two open Madras Government scholarships, and a third for which Muhammadans, Indian Christians, Eurasians or Europeans had a prior claim and there were a number of students holding scholarships from Native States. The one year's practical training had to be undergone before a student obtained his degree in engineering. The University laid down the condition that the student must have been on works for one year before being admitted to the degree. The Madras college insisted on the student going through a year's practical training under the supervision of Public Works officers of the Madras Government. All the upper subordinates and engineering students were posted to the Public Works Department for one year. The one year's probation which a man had to undergo after leaving the college was in addition to that.

72,351. The student's position on the list at the final examination did not depend on the written test at that examination, but on his work right through the course. There was a separate examination for the University degree. The college course had nothing to

do with the University except that attendance qualified for admission to the University examinations. The college diploma certified a man for employment.

72,352. (*Mr. Madge.*) Apart from maintaining a British element, he was desirous of improving the standard of training in India to such a high degree that recruitment would mainly take place in India. He was pretty familiar with the conditions in England, and he saw no reason whatever why the engineering training in India should not be as good as that in England.

72,353. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Practically none of the Madras college students were employed on railways. He did not know the reason for that. Several efforts had been made in that direction, but they had all been unsuccessful. No specific reason had been given. The training received at the Madras college would fit a student for theoretical railway work, but he would need a little practical training.

72,354. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) There was very little difference of standard between the one man who was fortunate enough to get into the provincial service, and the best of the others who failed. The students highest up on the list who had just missed the provincial service appointment, usually went to local funds or Native States as assistant engineers. Those on the lower half of the list usually obtained employment in the Public Works Department.

72,355. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The men who went into the local fund employ had received the one year's practical training in the Public Works Department. They went into the local fund as assistant local fund engineers, with a prospect of becoming local fund engineers. That was a career which, in Madras, led to something between Rs. 400 and Rs. 900 a month.

72,356. Students who came from the Native States with scholarships usually applied to the Native States for employment, and they were taken on as opportunity offered. The Native States continually applied to the college for men, but for the higher appointments the students themselves usually put in their applications. Last week he had had an application from a Native State for eight engineers, but there were no men available. If the new scheme which was before the Government of Madras was carried out, and the college was enlarged, there would be ample employment for the increased number of students turned out.

72,357. (*Mr. Bhaskara Ayyar.*) The training of the Civil Engineer in India was quite as good as it was in England. It was not possible to obtain experience of irrigation work in England.

72,358. He was not in favour of the direct appointments of passed students from the college to the service; he preferred a period of probation. He did not mean that they should be appointed on probation, but he would select three or four students, make them them undergo a period of probation, and then make a final choice from amongst those three or four. His idea was that they should all serve in turn under the same officers.

72,359. With regard to his statement that after the practical training was over, the Chief Engineer and the Principal should select the candidate to be appointed, he did not say anything about the Principal being able to judge a man's fitness during the practical course except from the reports received, but what he did maintain was that the Principal, having known the student for four years, and carefully watched his career during that time, would be in a favourable position to form some opinion as to his ability and character. A pupil's character was not likely to be altered during the period of practical training.

72,360. He meant exactly what he said, when he stated that owing to there having been no tradition in the past leading the higher and more intellectual classes to the study of applied science, it was not quite popular in India. He admitted that there had been engineering works constructed in olden days.

72,361. (*Chairman.*) His suggestion was that after the completion of the college course the three or four best students should be placed in turn under the same officers in the Public Works Department. He would place each one under an officer, and change them about, so that all four would in turn have been under the same men. The officers would then write reports about each of them, and the Chief Engineer would be able to judge who was the best man. He was not particularly keen about acting as selector with the Chief Engineer, but he would know more about the student than anybody else. The appointment was always in the hands of the Chief Engineer, and not in the hands of the Principal of the college. If two men were equally good, and there was only one vacancy, the claims of the man who was not selected might be considered in the following year.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Bombay, Saturday, 21st February, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
Sir MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
Sir THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
Sir VALENTINE CHIROL.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.
WALTER CULLEY MADGE, Esq., C.I.E.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, Esq., C.S.I.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

R. J. KENT, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Bombay.
J. H. ADVANI, Esq., Executive Engineer, Bombay.

R. R. SCOTT, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

H. F. BEALE, Esq., Chief Engineer and Secretary to Government in the Public Works Department, Bombay.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,362. [NOTE.—When opinions upon controversial matters are expressed in the present memorandum, or preference shown for any particular line of action, it must be understood that I speak for myself, and not as the mouth-piece of Government. I also demonstrate as far as possible the wants of the various sections of our department, and make remarks on them from the point of view of my position in the department.]

72,363. **(I.) Methods of recruitment.**—In common with many other Engineers I regret the abolition of Coopers Hill as the training establishment in England for the Indian Public Works Department. But I think the Selection Committee at home seems to be doing its work very well on the whole, and the men recruited as Imperial Engineers are nearly all talented and well trained. A weak point in this system of selection however—and it hits our department very hard—is that the Committee have no means of gauging the tact and the qualifications of the candidates in the management of men, nor have they any sure method of examining their manners and temper. A man, who has to be in residence at a college for three years, learns, before he goes out into the world, some valuable lessons in the art of forbearance and companionship, and if he has rough corners they are knocked off by raily contact with men of his own age, approaching the period when they must become entirely self-dependent and responsible members of society. The spirit of comradeship survives in the case of most of the college men, throughout their service in India. A man selected by the Committee may have no such experience, and may be absolutely ignorant of the conditions of public life or service. It is important that the right stamp of man should be chosen, as far as the present system allows, and I

think the aid of two or three Public Works Department Engineers, retired or on furlough, would be a very useful addition for the purpose to the Selection Committee.

The Provincial Establishment which was sanctioned in 1892, and came into being in 1896, is recruited from the College of Engineering, Poona, one man in each year, and from the ranks of Upper Subordinates one man in every 2nd year. The ultimate strength of the Provincial Service in the Bombay Presidency is supposed to be 30 men. The recruitment is satisfactory, except that it is now felt that Upper Subordinates should be promoted to the Provincial Service, before they have served very long as subordinates. The Public Works Code directs that men should be selected as a rule from the Sub-Engineer grade and only very exceptionally from among the Supervisors. There are various objections to this:—

(i) It is no pecuniary benefit, and may be a loss to a man to be thus promoted.

(ii) He is too old to rise above junior Executive rank, even if he gets as far.

(iii) He has lived himself into the subordinate groove, self and family, and is like a fish out of water in the new circles to which he is then raised: a trial to the men he has to associate with, and too often in a very uncomfortable position himself.

Whereas early promotion is a rapid reward for energy and brilliance, and the man promoted has the best part of his life before him.

As a reward for the senior subordinates (Sub-Engineers) I suggest that a grade of Deputy Engineer be instituted with a rise of Rs. 100 in pay. At present a Sub-Engineer may get Rs. 500 maximum + Rs. 30 Sub-divisional allowance; the Deputy Engineer should get Rs. 600 + Rs. 30.

A third form of recruitment is the appointment of R. E.s. If they are drafted in at the bottom of the department and rise with their Civilian colleagues, there can be no objection to their appointment. If senior men are drafted in, they should not take precedence of men of their own age; but even then it will be a hardship to the juniors unless an increase in the cadre is sanctioned at the same time.

The same argument applies to taking temporary covenanted men on to the permanent establishment. The Secretary of State decided* that such men (duly selected for their efficiency) should be graded one year below the permanent men they came out with, but still such appointments are felt as a hardship by the permanent men, unless there is an increase in the cadre to absorb them.

The general recommendation, therefore, is not to take temporary men on to the permanent establishment; but it would be wrong and inexpedient to make this a hard and fast rule.

72,364. **(II.) Systems of training and probation.**—At present when a man has had one or two years' practical training in England before selection he is appointed at once as a permanent member of the Department, but if his training has been short he is sent out on probation for a year. I doubt much the value of this probationary period, except perhaps that it makes a man buckle to from the start. A man's character can be gauged during the period, but it is always a difficult and disagreeable task to get rid of an officer (even on probation) unless he is really bad. A stigma must necessarily attach to any such discharge, except on the score of health. The training at home is now principally useful in giving a man an idea of public life and responsibility.

The Provincial Engineer appointed from the College in India is differently placed. He is engaged as an Apprentice for a year, and then confirmed, if good. This year is really a period of training and probation in one, and it cannot be abandoned. Of course men from the subordinate ranks are not put on probation when promoted to the Engineer establishment.

72,365. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—The permanent cadre of the Bombay Public Works Department is insufficient, but an application for increase has been refused by the Government of India (letters attached†). We have 106 permanent and 28 temporary men.

I attach a statement† showing the recruitment year by year from 1880 to 1913. I submit that spasmodic recruitment, as shown periodically therein and particularly in 1907, 1908 and 1909, is essentially wrong, unless the men are appointed in various ranks, so that they may retire in succession. The Government of India have stated* that uneven recruitment will not produce a block, because they are able to correct any redundance of officers in one rank by an annual adjustment of the limiting scale. I regret that I do not know how this is done, but hope it may come into use when the men of 1907—1909 rise to the senior grades. At present they are on the annual increment system, but if Executive Engineer charges are not available for them when they reach that rank their increments will have to be withheld. When they have 20 years' service only a few will be accommodated in the administrative ranks, and our department has very few outside appointments indeed to look to.

What the Bombay Government has asked is that we may be allowed to look ahead and commence recruiting steadily at once for an increased cadre. Meanwhile if we want older men to fill up the increased establishment we can appoint them (without injustice) against the greater cadre to be sanctioned and they will retire leaving places for the younger men to fill.

The staff required for construction is always greater than the maintenance establishment. So it must be perfectly safe to work up to the latter limit the moment any project is sanctioned (or even likely to be sanctioned, because recruitment is always very slow and can if necessary be stopped, if it should happen that a promising project is suddenly rejected).

The balance of men required, over and above the sanctioned cadre of permanent officers, must of course be temporary men, but these should not be more numerous than can be helped. The cadre must be constantly checked and revised. If properly done the revision will always take the form of an increase in numbers; if carelessly done there will be fluctuation, sometimes more, sometimes less.

Article 650 of the Civil Service Regulations provides for the compulsory retirement of all permanent Public Works Department officers at 55 years of age. This is a suitable provision. Article 649 provides for the discharge of officers at 50 years, who are not of administrative rank and are considered unfit for it. But a further provision is necessary. It should be possible, without positive cruelty, to discharge at any time men who are incompetent or lazy, and definitely proved to be so by the successive report of three different officers. I think a bonus should be given to them. This bonus might be, for example, $\frac{1}{3}$ to $\frac{2}{3}$ of a contribution Government might make at the rate of 75 per cent. of the deposits of the officer in the Provident Fund. No definite amount should be fixed. This may apply equally to Imperial, Provincial and Temporary Engineers.

With regard to the last it is thought that for two reasons better terms should be offered than at present because

(i) they will attract better men, and

(ii) Government will have some hold over the men.

The following arrangement might be adopted:—

The terms already offered to some covenanted men should be offered to all temporary engineers. All the new men have been directed to subscribe $9\frac{3}{8}$ per cent. of their salary to the Provident Fund. Government should add to this half yearly 75 per cent. of the subscription, the sums to earn $3\frac{3}{4}$ or 4 per cent. compound interest.

In case of misdemeanour the Government contribution would be withheld and in case of inefficiency, followed by discharge, the Government contribution might (as explained above) be partially withheld.

In no case should a permanent Engineer be allowed to claim any bonus for voluntary retirement before he has earned his first pension, and after he has earned his pension there will no more be any question of bonuses.

The temporary Engineers desire† that the one month's notice on either side should in future be changed to three months' notice. This is a reasonable request.

72,366. **(IV.) Conditions of salary.**—The increment scale of salary, introduced in 1908, and modified

* *Vide* Government of India, Public Works Department, letter No. 842-E., dated 2nd August, 1906 (Annexure 5 on page 174).

† *Vide* Bombay Government Memorandum, Appendix XVI.

* *Vide* Government of India, Public Works Department, letter No. 1463-E., dated 3rd November, 1905 (Annexure 4 on page 174).

† *Vide* Annexure 4.

in 1912 as regards the Provincial* Service, while giving better pay generally, at the same time abolished as usual the exchange compensation allowance.

The cost of living is generally on the rise, and if on this account the pay of other departments is to be increased the Public Works Department should share. That the present scale is by no means high is shown by the fact that Engineers are very much averse from serving in Poona, where they cannot save at all, and in Bombay, where they perforce must run into debt.

There are one or two cases, which require consideration independently of a general increase all round—

(*a*) The two Chief Engineers who are Secretary and Joint Secretary to Government have to migrate with Government and as heads of their department have to do a great deal of entertainment. They are not like other Secretaries comparatively junior men, about half way up the ladder, looking forward to much higher emoluments, but they are the senior men of the department enjoying, as far as may be possible, what looks on paper like high pay, compared with the men next below them. Their responsibility extends over the whole department in the Bombay Presidency including Sind and Aden. The joint Secretary gets a house allowance in Bombay, the Secretary does not. It is suggested that their pay should be—

Rs. 2,500 as Chief Engineer,
+ Rs. 500 as Head of the department in either branch,
+ Rs. 250 for Joint Secretary's duties, without house allowance.
and + Rs. 500 for Secretary's duties, without house allowance.

Thus the senior man would draw Rs. 3,500 (which is not more than the pay of the Commissioner† of a division in Bombay) and the junior man Rs. 3,250.

(*b*) The Government of India have already been addressed‡ upon the necessity of granting a Presidency Allowance to the junior Public Works Department officers in Bombay itself, *viz.*, Rs. 250 for Executive and Rs. 150 for Assistant Engineers. It is hoped they will sanction this now, for the reasons given in the Government letter, as it is a very urgent want.

(*c*) There is an order that an Executive Engineer not holding a district charge should not draw over Rs. 800 (Imperial) or Rs. 535 (Provincial). Unless the officer is unfit for an Executive Engineer's charge this seems an unfair restriction, as the fault is not his that there are no vacancies, and I consider it would be fair to permit him to draw his increments as they become due.

(*d*) There is an order that if a man is reported unfit for Executive Engineer's charge he should draw the pay of an Assistant Engineer only, *i.e.*, Rs. 750 (Imperial) and Rs. 475 (Provincial). I suggest that he should come under the previous rule that Rs. 800 and Rs. 535 should be the limit but that if he continues to be a good sub-divisional officer he should get two increments at 5 year intervals of Rs. 50 each as compensation for not being promoted to the charge of a district. (A Provincial Executive Engineer debarred from administrative rank is compensated, if he is a good Executive, by an increment of Rs. 50, and I think a second Rs. 50 should be added in his case also.)

At present, the rule as it stands is very unfair indeed upon Provincial Engineers promoted from subordinate rank for special ability, if they are not sufficiently expert to hold charge of a district. Such a case actually exists in our department, and the officer in question draws less than he would have, had he refused the honour of promotion to the Engineer establishment. It is a very great hardship for a man who has done excellent service for the State. He is debarred from rising above Rs. 475, and my suggestion is that he should be drawing Rs. 535, *viz.*, only Rs. 5 more than a Sub-Engineer, 1st Grade, and that he should be allowed two increments at 5-year intervals up to a maximum of Rs. 635. The latter figure, it will be noticed, is only Rs. 5 more than the pay I suggest for Deputy Engineers.

In the matter of pay, I have a representation* from the temporary Engineers that, compared with permanent men occupying the same posts, they should be given 10 per cent. more, because of the precarious tenure of their appointment, and the fact that after some years of work in India they are virtually precluded from obtaining work elsewhere. Also, they request that some further addition should be made to compensate them for earning no pension. They suggest that regular increments should be given on the same basis as for the permanent men, and all their allowances.

The whole demand is a natural one, but I doubt if Government would be well advised to accede to these requests. Temporary Engineers are obtained in the open market; there is no fixed scale of pay for them and there is no particular reason why Government should bind themselves down to give increments. Each man has to be treated on his merits. I think, however, it would be right, and wise, too, if Government were to contribute towards their Provident fund, as already explained under III. (paragraph 72,365). This would meet part of their demand.

Certain Engineers who have been given permanent appointments in the Imperial Establishment, ask† for a reconsideration of their position on the seniority list. They were older, when selected by the Secretary of State, than the usual run of men appointed to the Public Works Department, and they came out on a 5-year covenant, they were all graduates in Engineering, and had 2 to 8 years' training at home. They were made permanent at or before the expiration of their covenant, and were then placed a year or 15 months below the permanent men who commenced their Indian career at the same time, and are thus 3 to 7 years' older than the latter. Their request is to be placed in a position more suited to their age and experience, and they contend that because the incremental system has been introduced, and because the promotion to Superintending Engineer rank is done entirely by selection, no permanent man will suffer any hardship by their advancement. I sympathise with these officers, but must explain that the Government of India pointed out (when the matter was under discussion) that it was a great concession to temporary men to make them permanent. Though these officers were more or less obliged by circumstances to take whatever terms were offered, yet they must realise that when first sent out to India they had already passed the age at which they were eligible for the Indian permanent establishment, and they secured entrance only by virtue of coming out on a short covenant. Again though selection is the rule for the administrative ranks, yet among men nearly equal the senior officer must be chosen, and hardships would result.

72,367. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—The leave rules are now being revised by the Government of India, and they will be very much improved. I think no difference should be made between the various Imperial Services; at present there are one or two small differences.

Provincial Engineers come under the Indian Service rules, and these are also being improved.

Temporary Engineers appointed in India may have privilege leave, if no extra expense is incurred thereby. Those who are appointed by the Secretary of State may have privilege leave, and also sick leave up to six months, the latter on half pay, or as a special case, leave as admissible to the Provincial Service.

The temporary Engineers have asked to be brought under European Service rules, and that leave due should be given even after discharge. They also ask for proportional furlough, if discharged before 8 years' employment.

Perhaps some concession may be recommended such as the following:—

For Europe-trained Engineers European leave rules, and for India-trained Engineers Indian leave rules, after three years' continuous service; also privilege leave due up to a limit of three (or six, if the new rule be that) months may be given after discharge, but not furlough.

* For the Imperial Engineers the two periodic increments of Rs. 50 admissible to Executive Engineers, 1st grade, were abolished (Rs. 1,250 maximum), but for Provincial Engineers a special increment of Rs. 50 was sanctioned (850 + 50 = 900) after 5 years if not promoted to administrative rank.

† The pay of Commissioners of Divisions in the Presidency proper is either Rs. 3,000 or Rs. 3,500 per mensem and that of the Commissioner in Sind is Rs. 3,750 per mensem.

‡ *Vide* Bombay Government Memo.—Appendix No. XVI.

* *Vide* Annexure 2, page 173. † *Vide* Annexure 3, page 173.

A most important point is the question of furlough pay. Indian Civil Service and Military Officers in civil employ draw a minimum furlough allowance of £500 or full pay if less, and a maximum of £1,000 a year. The Imperial Engineer begins on about £280, and after 18 years' service is still below £500, while his maximum, viz., £800, is reached in about 30 years.

It is evident, then, that nearly throughout his service he does not draw a living wage while on furlough. The result is that most officers not only absorb their small savings in the short periods of furlough they venture, or are obliged to take (for considerations of health, putting children to school, etc.), but very frequently run into debt. They should be treated like the other Imperial Officers, having like needs.

The Provincial Officers get very much less pay (their furlough allowance is half their salary), and could not be expected to take much home leave, but furlough in India is not expensive. However, they wish naturally in this, as in all other respects, to be placed on a par with the Imperial Engineers.

The Bombay record shows that Indian Officers (both Provincial and Imperial) do not take much furlough as a rule. Of Indian Officers in the Public Works Department twenty have over 10 years' service and eight have over 20 years.

Those who have taken furlough are on the Imperial list; one, with 31 years' service, has had 3½ years' furlough, and four others have had between 1 and 2 years.

Study leave, such as is granted to the Indian Medical Service, would be a useful concession to Public Works Department men. At present they can be put on deputation for a definite purpose, during which they may draw pay at two-thirds of their salary.

72,368. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—The pensions of Engineers are so small that it is difficult to think how retired officers can exist at home. The pension fixed in 1864 was Rs. 5,000, and is still that, but in those days the equivalent was £500, while now, 50 years later, it is £437½.

The pay drawn is too low to permit of appreciable savings, and the small savings are soon eaten up by any furlough that may be taken on the allowances referred to in V. above. At the end of 30 years' service an Engineer without any private means is very badly off, unless he is a bachelor. A married man must make provision for his wife and family, so cannot risk much by insuring for an annuity as an addition to his pension. His Provident Fund, even with 10 per cent. contributions, is at best a comparatively small figure.

In pensions it is the maximum limit imposed which hits the officer. The Civil Service Regulations provide that a man shall get thirty-sixtieths of his pay as pension after 25 years' service or over, but he is limited to Rs. 5,000 as Executive Engineer and Rs. 6,000 as Superintending Engineer. In the first case the calculation would give Rs. 7,500, and in the second Rs. 10,500, so the limits imposed involve a very heavy reduction.

The Imperial Service officers have represented their case to the Government of India and Secretary of State more than once, and only desire to be brought on a par with the other Imperial officers, Civil and Military. For the Provincial Service the pensions are the same as for the Imperial, but it appears that the concession as regards Superintending Engineers' and Chief Engineers' pensions will only be granted under very special condition (Article 636, Civil Service Regulations).

It may be interesting to compare the retirements and casualties between European and Indian officers. Taking the period from 1894 to 1913, 20 years:—

Number of officers who	Europeans.	Indians.
Died while in service	17	8
Retired before 55 years of age	32*	5
Retired on pension at 55 or over ...	20	6

* Includes 7 resignations before earning a pension.

The retirements of the Europeans before reaching the age limit is a contrast to the Indian figure.

72,369. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—The Bombay Establishment consists of:—

—	Imperial Engineers.	Provincial Engineers.	Total.
	81	25	106
Europeans	65	—	65
Indians with English training ...	6	—	6
Indians with Indian training ...	9	22	31
Europeans trained in India ...	1	3	4
Proportion { European	66	3	69
Proportion { Indian	15	22	37

The high proportion of Indians, in the first column, is due to the annual recruitment of 2 men from the College of Science in Poona for some years. A proportion of 10 per cent. Indian Engineers from Europe is sufficient for the present, but should be considered a limit dependent upon thoroughly qualified men being available. This view, however, is not supported by the Imperial Indian members. The point they probably lose sight of is, that in the Provincial Section Government will always have an overwhelming majority of Indians, and when the Provincial Service contains the proposed limit of 30 members, there will still be about 40 Indians in the whole cadre. To claim more than 40 per cent. would be unreasonable, and would involve a serious diminution in the efficiency of our department. I will show separately* how this heavy percentage already handicaps us.

The existing division into Imperial and Provincial seems quite suitable, and now that the men are on the same list for promotion, and the districts are interchangeable, it can in no way be said that the official status of one is lower than the other. In particular I wish to point out that there is no such thing as transfer, much less promotion, from one to the other. The inequality is in training, pay, and conditions of service, but not in status.

The Provincial Service, however, ask for absolute equality in all respects with the Imperial Service. For the same responsibilities and the same duties they want the same pay. They fail to see that the living wage is different for the Indian-born and trained man and for the European whose domicile is not in India. Life (lodging, clothes, food), education, expenditure for leave on account of health, etc., and retirement are all different, and if a definite salary is sufficient for the Indian, it necessarily follows that it is insufficient for the European. This requires no argument or further proof.

The proportion of 2:3 in pay has usually been considered suitable.

If the pay for Provincial establishment is too low, that is, of course, a different question which I do not propose to contest. I think it is too low. The pay of an Assistant Engineer only rises to Rs. 475, which is less than a Sub-Engineer (Rs. 530), and the junior Executive Engineer only gets Rs. 535. I think it should be at least Rs. 635.

72,370. **(VIII.) Relations of the service with the Indian Civil Service and other services.**—The relations between the Public Works Department and other Services are harmonious and satisfactory.

72,371. **(IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—The heavy cost of transfers has been referred to by the Imperial representative particularly. Some relief in this respect is wanted. In recent years there has been a tendency to cut down charges very much, and the result is that travelling is generally a source of loss for officers, and transfers invariably mean a heavy tax on their private purse.

It often occurs that in the interests of Government an officer is transferred several times at comparatively short intervals; the result is very disheartening, as he is bound to lose either by selling his effects or by moving them at greater cost than he can claim from Government.

* *Vide* paragraph 72, 373.

My opinion is that Government would be well advised to err, if at all, on the side of liberality. The removal for example of a vexatious order in connection with return railway fares, has been a move in the right direction, simplifying work and control, and avoiding discouragement.

72,372. *ANNEXURES.*

ANNEXURE 1.

Record of entrants into the permanent Engineer Establishment since 1880.

Year.	Europeans from England.	Indians from England.	Europeans from Indian Colleges.	Indians from Indian Colleges.	Transferred from other Governments, &c.		Promoted from Upper Subordinate establishment.		Total.
					Europeans.	Indians.	Europeans.	Indians.	
1880	7	—	—	1	4	—	—	1	13
1881	8	—	—	1	2	—	—	—	11
1882	7	1	—	—	2	—	—	—	10
1883	3	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	4
1884	1	—	—	1	1	—	—	—	3
1885	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	3
1886	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	4
1887	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	3
1888	1	—	—	2	—	—	—	—	3
1889	1	—	—	2	—	—	—	—	3
1890	—	1	—	2	—	—	—	—	3
1891	3	—	1	1	—	—	—	—	5
1892	2	—	—	1	1	—	—	—	4
1893	2	—	—	1	1	—	—	—	4
1894	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	3
1895	2	—	—	2	—	—	—	—	4
1896	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	3
1897	2	1	—	1	—	—	1	—	5
1898	1	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	2
1899	4	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	6
1900	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	3
1901	2	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	4
1902	3	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	4
1903	3	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	5
1904	4	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	5
1905	6	1	—	1	—	—	1	—	9
1906	3	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	5
1907	9*	1	—	1	—	—	—	1	12
1908	(7+2) 8*	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	9
1909	(6+2) 6†	—	—	1	2	—	—	1	10
1910	(5+1) 4	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	5
1911	1	1	—	1	—	—	—	1	4
1912	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	3
1913	3	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	5

* Two of these are from covenanted temporary engineers.
† One of these is from covenanted temporary engineers.

ANNEXURE 2.

Note by the Committee of Temporary Engineers, Bombay Presidency, dated 5th December, 1913, *on the references contained in Government letter No. E-12052 of November 29th,* 1913.

1. *Methods of Recruitment.*—No special point.

2. *Systems of Training and Probation.*—No special point.

3. *Conditions of Service.*—A. In considering the conditions of service of temporary Engineers it should be borne in mind that temporary service with Government for an extended period limits the field of all Engineers' subsequent employment and practically confines it to India.

B. In view of the difficulty of finding situations in this country and with a view to lessening the feeling of insecurity which makes the work of a temporary Engineer more exacting and arduous than that of a permanent man, three months' notice to be given by either side to terminate employment instead of one month as at present.

C. Vacancies in the permanent cadre should be filled as far as possible by suitable temporary Engineers.

4. *Conditions of Salary.*—(*a*) Owing to the conditions of service and the fact that his employment is temporary and frequently made for emergent necessities of Government, the scale of pay should be on a more generous basis than that of permanent men of similar rank.

It is suggested that a temporary Engineer should receive 10 per cent. more than the salary which would be paid to a permanent man occupying a similar post.

(*b*) The pay of a temporary Engineer during the period of his employment by Government should be incremental on the same basis as that of a permanent officer.

(*c*) As a temporary Engineer is not eligible for pension his salary should be on a still higher basis in addition to paragraph (*a*) to enable him to insure for a pension or contribute to a Provident Fund.

(*d*) Temporary Engineers should draw all allowances sanctioned for permanent men.

5. *Conditions of Leave.*—These should be identical with those of the Imperial permanent service, but having regard to the temporary nature of his service the rules should be modified so that they do not militate against him adversely.

For instance, if his services are dispensed with he should be granted any leave that may be due to him. Further he should be entitled to furlough per year of service in the event of his employment terminating before he has served the full period qualifying him for furlough under the European leave regulation.

6. *Conditions of Pension.*—(*a*) A temporary Engineer cannot earn a pension owing to the nature of his service.

(*b*) It is strongly held that a Provident Fund with a subscription by Government should be instituted for all temporary Engineers on the following lines:—

The monthly subscription to be 12½ per cent. (*e.g.*, 2 annas in the rupee) of the salary and Government to contribute a further 75 per cent. on the amount monthly.

The whole to accumulate at 4 per cent. compound interest calculated monthly.

7. *Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial.*—No special point.

8. *Relations of the service with the Indian Civil Servce and other services.*—No special points.

9. *Any other points.*—It would be greatly to the advantage of Government that temporary Engineers who are specialists should have special consideration in respect of pay and leave on deputation to enable them to keep up-to-date in the advances of their professions.

ANNEXURE 3.

Memorandum from Imperial Engineers serving in the Bombay Public Works Department who were appointed to the Permanent Establishment after serving under covenant for five years on the Temporary Establishment.

(1) Appointment as Temporary Engineers:—

(*a*) These Engineers were appointed in England by the Secretary of State for India as Temporary Engineers on a five years' Covenant after selection by a Committee at the India Office. They were selected on the strength of their Engineering training and on their approved practical experience from a large number of applicants.

(*b*) The ages of these Engineers on appointment varied from 24 to 28 and all hold Engineering degrees.

Their practical experience in Great Britain varied from two years to eight years.

(2) Appointment as Engineers on the Permanent Establishment:—

From the Temporary Engineers so appointed, a certain number were selected and appointed to the Permanent Establishment, before or at the completion of their five years' agreements.

(3) Terms of appointment:—

The terms of the appointment were that their whole service on the Temporary Establishment was to count towards leave and pension but for purposes of promotion and seniority instead of counting full service, from 1 year to 15 months were deducted.

This latter condition meant that these Engineers who, even at the time of their appointment, were

considerably older and more experienced than Engineers appointed at the same date directly to the Permanent Establishment are in the seniority list one year or more below them.

(b) In some cases as much as 18 places are lost by this condition and the result is that they are placed on the seniority list below Engineers 2 to 8 years their junior, which, apart from the pecuniary loss involved, places them in positions which are at times embarrassing and undignified.

(c) In the case of the last appointments which were made shortly before the closing of the R. I. E. College, the deduction of 15 months from their service places them below men appointed to the Permanent Establishment, after the closing of that College.

These Engineers had the same training as those appointed from the Temporary Establishment but they are considerably younger and their practical experience was much less.

(4) It is pointed out that Engineers who leave appointment in Great Britain at ages varying from 24 to 28 and serve for five years in India are placed at a very serious disadvantage when they return home and apply for appointment, as it is between the ages of 25 to 30 that an Engineer, as a rule, becomes settled in his profession. These officers were, therefore, practically compelled to accept any terms which were offered.

(5) Attention is also invited to the fact that all the Engineers, appointed from the Temporary Establishment, are Executive Engineers or will be acting as such very shortly and that therefore if the concessions asked for are granted, it will not be in any way to the detriment of officers appointed direct to the Permanent Establishment, now or later, as it has been clearly laid down that appointment to the Administrative grades shall be by selection.

(6) They request that the Commission will consider their case and recommend that they may be allowed to count at least their full services, as Temporary Engineers, towards seniority and increment and further that due consideration may be given to their ages and previous approved experience at home, when determining their seniority, as has been done in at least one case in another Presidency where for purpose of counting promotion and seniority, at least two years were added to the officer's services on the Temporary Establishment.

ANNEXURE 4.

No. 1463-E.

Government of India. Public Works Department.
Establishments.

From Mr. L. M. Jacob, C.S.I., Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department; to the Secretary to the Government of Bombay, Public Works Department.

Simla, the 3rd November, 1905.

Sir,

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter and telegram noted in the footnote* on the subject of the permanent appointment to the Department of Messrs. R. W. Murphy and C. Johnston, Temporary Engineers under covenant with the Secretary of State.

2. In reply I am to point out that the proposal made in paragraph 2 of your letter under reply that such men on being made permanent should be graded as supernumeraries in the Department is an unusual one. Many Temporary Engineers have been brought on to the permanent establishment in various provinces from time to time, and the invariable rule has been to accord them a position in the regular list which would be fair to them in consideration of their age and length of service, and the Government of India would suggest that the same plan should be followed in the case of these Temporary Engineers in Bombay whom it is desired to bring on to the permanent establishment.

3. I am to explain that under the system of promotion at present in force as governed by the rules in paragraph 62 of the Public Works Department Code, the Government of India are in a position by a proper adjustment of the limiting scale to regulate the rate of promotion in the different cadres to correspond as nearly as possible with the limit of time laid down as reasonable for promotion to the various grades, so that there can at no time be a serious block of promotion in any of the Executive and Assistant grades. This, in fact, they do; the limiting scales being revised each year, and if it is seen that a block in any grade is likely to occur, the limiting scale being adjusted to remove it. This being so the Government if India are of opinion that there is very little hardship, if any, to the permanent staff in bringing in a Temporary Engineer into the permanent Establishment otherwise than at the bottom of the list since the disturbance of the list can be remedied at the next annual revision of the scale. It is true that the introduction in this manner of additional officers into the scale may ultimately result in a slightly larger number of Executive Engineers, 1st Grade, at a given time than would otherwise be the case and so diminish to some extent the chances of promotion to administrative rank, but the retardation of promotion due to this cause would in any case be very slight. I am, therefore, to suggest that the proposal of the Government of Bombay in regard to Messrs. Murphy and Johnston may, with the consent of His Excellency the Governor in Council, be reconsidered in the light of the above remarks.

I have, &c.
(Sd.) E. G. Stanley,
Under Secretary to the Government of India.

Documents Accompanying:—
Nil.

ANNEXURE 5.

No. 842-E.

Government of India. Public Works Department.
Establishments.

From Mr. L. M. Jacob, C.S.I., Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department; to the Secretary to the Government of Bombay, Public Works Department.

Simla, the 2nd August, 1906.

Sir,

With reference to correspondence ending with your letter No. E.—488, dated 23rd February, 1906, I am directed to state that, on the recommendation of the Government of India, the Secretary of State for Inda has been pleased to sanction the appointment of Messrs. R. W. Murphy and C. Johnston, covenanted Temporary Engineers to the permanent Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department in Bombay on the following terms:—

I. They will be granted the Imperial rates of pay.

II. Mr. Murphy will be appointed Assistant Engineer, 2nd Grade, and Mr. Johnston, Assistant Engineer, 3rd Grade.

III. They will come under the leave and pension rules applicable to officers now appointed to the Public Works Department in England.

IV. They will be allowed to count service for purposes of leave and pension from 5th January, 1901 and 12th December, 1902 respectively, the dates on which their services as covenanted Engineers commenced.

V. They will be allowed to count service for purposes of promotion from 5th January, 1902 and 12th December 1903 respectively.

VI. They will be allowed exchange compensation allowance while serving in the Assistant and Executive grades only.

2. I am to request that permanent appointment in the Department on the above terms, may now be offered to Messrs. Murphy and Johnston and on their acceptance being intimated to the Government of India the usual notification appointing them per-

* Letter No. E.—2128, dated 18th August, 1905 } not
Telegram No. 373 T., dated 24th October, 1905 } reprinted.

manently to the Public Works Department will be issued.

3. It will be observed that under item V of the terms Messrs. Murphy and Johnston are to count service for purposes of promotion from 5th January, 1902 and 12th December, 1903 respectively instead of from 5th January, 1901 and 12th December, 1902 as originally proposed. This alteration, I am to say, has been made at the suggestion of the Secretary of State and has been adopted in the case of other convenanted Temporary Engineers recently appointed to the permanent establishment in the Punjab, in order to maintain the seniority of their contemporaries who were appointed permanently to the Department.

I have, &c.,
(Sd.) F. C. Dover,
Offg. Under-Secretary to the Government of India.

72,373. *Supplementary Confidential Written Statement by Mr. H. F. Beale.**

THE VALUE OF THE INDIAN.

The reports from the Department are as follows:—

(*a*) the Europeans report adversely upon the Indian for independent, responsible positions, and favourably for positions where he will be under guidance;

(*b*) the Indians extol the ability of their own men. I may quote Mr. Chitale, a very senior Executive Engineer, who was tried but found unfit for administrative duties. He writes:—"The good points of the Indian Engineers are their continuous hard work, steady habits, general intelligence, close supervision of, and co-operation with, the subordinates under them, which are necessary qualifications for getting the work done cheaply and preventing frauds. They are, however, yet looked upon with suspicion and their good points are not often brought out."

Our effort is to get the best we can for Government out of the department. If we appoint a Superintending Engineer and he submits papers from his Executive Engineers "for disposal," or "agreeing" or making some remarks which any man might do from his chair, we call him a post office. I may instance a recent case in which a Superintending Engineer forwarded "for early orders" suggestions made by a contractor for the foundations of an important work without any comment whatever. All kinds of mistakes will pass an officer of that kind, and one will never look to him for an exhaustive report or for the expression of an opinion of value.

This is rather the type of Indian we have had as Superintending Engineer, but there have been two or three notable exceptions.

As a subordinate and an Assistant Engineer even, the Indian is quite good.

Under a zealous officer he will work well, and having a guide he moves on with confidence.

As an Executive Engineer he has the following advantages:—

(*a*) knowledge of the people, language, and country, excepting Sind;

(*b*) the confidence of the people, if he is a straightforward and friendly man;

and he should be able to make good use of the experience gained as a sub-divisional officer, but he has certain disadvantages, *viz.*:—

(*c*) he lacks prestige, unless his training enables him to hold his own in any society;

(*d*) his independence in public duties is interfered with by family ties;

(*e*) a fear of local unpopularity will affect him very much, while a European would hardly be aware of it;

(*f*) caste prejudices which often make him favour the higher caste men in preference to the lower;

(*g*) he may be subjected to temptation in places where the inborn feeling of the people is that a private remuneration must precede all useful effort, especially in the case of large contracts or special appointments: such temptations are seldom put before Europeans, because of the futility of the offer or of the physical danger involved in the process.

Then in a general way (it must always be understood that there are many exceptions) the Indian is not able to bear exposure better than, and often not as well as, the European, or perhaps it is that the latter spares himself less; the Indian seems less keen about details of work and supervision, and he has a known disinclination or disability for manual work, hence lacks some useful experience.

The Indian may be described as capable of good work, having mental ability and shrewdness and often great keenness for his duties, but as wanting in self-reliance, vigour of effort and of management, and of reliability. He is also apt to be very partisan or excessively lenient in his reports. An unfortunate and very great disadvantage he has (and it is only a few who can get over this) is his social disability. The caste system begins by making him exclusive, so he does not readily learn how to consort with officers of his own and other services. Thus he naturally tends to avoid them, is little known, and not as popular as he would otherwise be.

This feature reduces the level of our Public Works Department very materially. It is easy to mention numerous other Indian gentlemen who are very well received in society, having a good appearance and good address. If all our officers were to cultivate a higher social refinement it would be a very great advantage both to themselves and to the Department as a whole, and mutual intercourse with their fellows of all creeds and castes would help them in their every day life and work.

There is, I believe, too great a tendency for men, who do not consort with their equals in rank, to hob-nob with subordinates, which after all is only natural, as they were probably all brought up together, but it impairs discipline and certainly lowers very much indeed the prestige of the Department.

The objection to Indian Engineers in Sind is most marked. The Zamindars dislike them, and can for some reason or other not feel for them a due respect, even for a good, earnest, and active officer. The Brahmin is absolutely out of his element in Sind, and the other Indian gentlemen recruited in our Department have not the manner which the Sindhi Zamindar admires.

Mr. H. F. Beale, called and examined.

72,374. (*Chairman.*) The witness was Chief Engineer and Secretary to the Government of Bombay, and had held his present post since October, 1912. He joined the service in October, 1882.

72,375. He suggested that certain senior members of the Public Works Department should be added to the committee of selection in England to assist the committee in discovering the class of candidate best suited for India. They might be officers of the service on furlough or men who had just retired from the service.

72,376. Recruitment to the Provincial Service was generally satisfactory, but upper subordinates should be promoted to the Provincial Service at an earlier age. At present the promoted men were nearly always sub-engineers of about fifteen years' service, whereas he would prefer to promote them after eight years' service. The fact that they were placed over the heads of others in the service would not cause friction.

72,377. Recruits from the Royal Engineers were occasionally taken into the department, and two young officers had been appointed within the last two or three years. They took their seniority according to the date on which they entered and came in at the bottom of the list. Provided a Royal Engineer was recruited to the Public Works Department fairly young, there was no hardship to him or to the service. As a rule, a Royal Engineer had two or three years' service before coming into the department.

72,378. The last temporary engineers to be made permanent were two officers in 1911. There were twenty temporary engineers in the department, and ten in special posts. Two or three more appointments

* Mr. Beale was examined upon this written statement *in camera*.

would be made shortly. Although temporary engineers were recruited for certain constructional work, their services were not dispensed with when that work was completed, as constructional work was continually going on. No distinction was made between men employed on constructional work and on maintenance work, and officers might be transferred from one class of work to the other at any time. Probably next year another ten temporary engineers would be entered on account of additional work. The additional men were required in the junior grades, not in the executive grades, but the Government of India would not allow the increase of cadre of permanent men to be brought in when applied for on the ground that if too many men were put in the junior grades the senior men would suffer. Amongst the temporary engineers now in the department there were seven with more than five years' seniority, five with more than ten years, and one with more than fifteen years. He was not in favour of transferring those particular men to the permanent cadre.

72,379. Practical training in England gave men some idea of engineering life after their career as students, bnt was not otherwise of very great value. If a man had less than a year's experience in England he was entered as a probationer in India, but in the case of those who had had several years' experience, probation was dispensed with. The rule as to probation had only been in force for the last two years.

72,380. An increase in the cadre was necessary both for maintenance and construction work. As a rule permanent men were employed on construction work, and temporary men were employed on maintenance work. At present there was a good deal of building construction going on and a large amount of irrigation work; there were two very large projects in irrigation, and a third was about to be sanctioned, and when the Sukkur scheme began a vast increase in the number of engineers would be required.

72,381. If constructional work were carried out by private firms it would mean a reduction of the establishment, and the Government would have great difficulty in finding men to do the work which came within the range of the department. It would be quite possible to have work done by a private contractor, even irrigation work, but it would not pay the State to reduce the permanent establishment of the department. The cost of work by private contract would be probably in excess of the cost of work done by the department. Also there was a large amount of miscellaneous work; an Executive Engineer in charge of a district had to work out all kinds of problems while he was engaged in constructing large buildings. Looking at the question broadly, however, it would be undoubtedly of advantage to the country to have work done by private enterprise if it could be done sufficiently well.

72,382. In describing as unfair the order that an Executive Engineer not holding a district charge should not draw more than Rs. 800 in the Imperial or Rs. 535 in the Provincial Service, he was assuming that an engineer was an efficient engineer, and that for the moment an executive charge was not vacant. It did not seem fair that a man should suffer because the department had been over-recruited, and if a man could not receive an appointment he should receive his increments of salary just the same. The conditions were quite different in respect of temporary engineers, as a temporary engineer could be always on the lookout for other employment. He took work in India for a time and gained his experience, and then he could go to any other part of the world at his own price. There was no reason whatever why he should have a constant increment. In practice he remained in the department, but that was simply because he obtained better terms than he could obtain elsewhere.

72,383. No reply had been received from the Government of India with regard to the proposal to grant presidency allowances. The Superintending Engineer in Bombay should also be granted an allowance, in addition to his present salary, otherwise there was just the possibility of an Executive Engineer getting as much pay as a Superintending Engineer. That in itself, he admitted, was not a very strong argument, but he maintained that the Superintending Engineer, whose headquarters were in Bombay, was worse off than the other Superintending Engineers, and should receive a Presidency allowance.

72,384. He did not object to the 10 per cent. rule for the appointment of Indians in England, as he believed that Indians with sufficient enterprise to go to England to study should have their reward. It was not essential that an Indian Engineer should have an English training so long as the service was divided into Imperial and Provincial branches. He had been told that if the title of Provincial was abolished, and the difference in pay was retained in the shape of a foreign service allowance, the discontent would to a very great extent be allayed. There was a feeling amongst Provincial officers that they were considered of lower rank than Imperial officers, and if that was the construction put upon the term Provincial it should be abolished.

72,385. There was no difficulty in obtaining recruits to the provincial service on the present salaries, but it was said that the salaries were insufficient. A junior Executive Engineer on Rs. 535 was on a very low rate of pay having regard to his responsible position, and the salaries of the Provincial branch of the Public Works Department did not compare favourably with the salaries of other Provincial services.

72,386. It was very important that increased transfer allowances should be granted, as officers now had to spend money out of their own pockets invariably when they were transferred from one district to another.

72,387. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) He did not say that all Royal Engineers would come in at the bottom of the list. Tht two men recently appointed had come in at the bottom. If a senior Royal Engineer were brought into the department he should come in with an increase in the cadre, and then there would be no friction.

72,388. If work was done by private contract it would be still necessary to have an Executive Engineer in charge of every district and subordinates in charge of sub-divisions.

72,389. The pay given to a European engineer was based both on the expense of his training and the conditions of service in a foreign country, and did not necessarily imply that his services were more efficient than a provincial engineer.

72,390. In the Bombay presidency a considerable number of temporary engineers were employed in charge of sub-divisions, chiefly owing to the fact that the subordinate establishment was under-manned. If the subordinate establishment was brought up to a proper strength and the training of the officers was improved, it would be possible to draw the sub-divisional officers from the subordinate establishment and thus to reduce greatly the number of temporary engineers.

72,391. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) In estimating the cost of work the department did not take into account non-effective charges of the establishment, but the effective charges were calculated and added to the cost of the work.

72,392. (*Mr. Sly.*) The system followed in the Bombay presidency for the construction of large works was generally a system of petty contracts and departmental labour, but constructional work was also given to local contractors. Work was done in three different ways: it was given to large contractors, or divided up into petty contracts, or done by departmental labour. There was a large number of reliable contracting firms in Bombay city and a great deal of the construction work in the city was done by them, but he did not think the State would gain if the whole of the work was done by contract. The establishment maintained in Bombay city was large enough to undertake direct construction on a large scale, and if constructional work was put out to contract the establishment would be very largely decreased. It would not be a wise thing to do this as it was always necessary to have something to put up against contractors.

72,393. There were reliable firms of local contractors in the districts who were quite able to take up large jobs of work. The maintenance of works and repairs could not be carried out by contractors and an establishment would have to be maintained for that.

72,394. The Provincial service recruited one candidate every year from the Poona college and one pro-

moted subordinate every other year. As a rule the promoted subordinate was an old man who had been in the subordinate service for over fifteen years and was not a suitable man for the Provincial service. It would be better to select a young man from the subordinate service, as he would be trained in exactly the same manner as the direct recruits coming from the same college and sometimes being only a few marks lower in the examination than the Provincial recruit. The fact that one had four years in the college and the other three made no difference to the class from which they came. The man who spent another year at the college only did so in order to have a better chance of getting the appointment.

72,395. He did not favour a central college for all India for training provincial service men. The college at Poona was very efficient and was being improved year by year and it would be a great pity to reduce its value.

72,396. Admission to the Provincial service was not restricted to statutory natives of India, as any man who entered the college had a right to be appointed to the service. He did not think, however, that a European would come out to India and enter the Poona college with the object of getting into the Provincial service.

72,397. If an officer in the Provincial service was sent to England for one year's training in practical work it would be desirable that he should go after about five years' experience of Engineering work in India.

72,398. Probably it would be true to say that a temporary engineer after having been employed for a certain number of years in India would have little chance of work in England, but he would still be valuable for service in other parts of the world, even for irrigation work. There was a good deal of irrigation work in Canada, for example.

72,399. (*Mr. Madge.*) The men who were selected for the Provincial service came from the same class as those who were in the upper subordinate service, but a man promoted from the subordinate service to the provincial might be out of his element owing to the long time he had spent in the subordinate service.

72,400. The time had not come to make over the whole work of the Public Works Department to private enterprise. He agreed that private enterprise should be encouraged and that local contractors should be employed to a great extent; in fact, they were freely employed and always would be employed.

72,401. If the cadre were increased in the proportion that had been asked for there would be an excess of Assistant Engineers compared with officers in the superior ranks.

72,402. The objection to bringing temporary engineers into the cadre after approved service was that they could only do so to the prejudice of officers belonging to the permanent staff.

72,403. He wanted power to discharge a man for inefficiency at any time and he did not believe that this would be detrimental to recruitment. It would be of great advantage to have the power, and if the discharged man was given a bonus he would not be hardly dealt with. There had been cases in which men had been found to be inefficient long after they had completed their probation.

72,404. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) He did not wish any special inference to be drawn from the figures given in the written statement as to the number of European and Indian officers who died or retired. The figures showed that a large number of Europeans had retired before fifty-five years of age as they had the option to do so. The Indians, however, had no such option and that might explain the difference in the figures. He had not meant to compare Europeans with Indians, but only put the table forward as interesting in connection with the pension question. He had not brought out in the written statement all the facts which might be deducted from the table.

72,405. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) To give out the whole of a contract including both the design and execution of the work, and to leave the department simply to act as clerk of works, would be to alter the whole of the present system. The designing of works was all done in the department,—with the aid of consulting architects and other specialists when necessary. It might be that the works already designed had not been so successful as to justify the claim of the department to a monopoly of design, but he thought if the designing of buildings was left to private contracts the country would in many cases suffer greatly. The duty would then fall upon the Department of criticising the designs, and possibly of making out fresh designs. If the door were opened to large contractors, there would be a number of firms to select from, and the Department was already using local contracts to a large extent. The experience of the Department had been that they could do large works at present more cheaply than English contractors could do them, but he could give no definite figures, as tenders had not been invited for recent large works. It might be advisable gradually to extend the system of putting large works out to contract so as to see whether work could not be more efficiently and more cheaply carried out by private enterprise, and the encouragement given to contractors might be desirable in the interests of the country.

72,406. All Provincial service men were drawn from the College of Engineering in Poona. The first man in the examination received an appointment in the Provincial service and the others went into the upper subordinate service. He did not want to increase the number of subordinates promoted to the Provincial service; at present one man was promoted every second year and that seemed quite sufficient. With a larger number of subordinates in the subordinate service it might be possible to dispense with the recruitment of temporary engineers, but he would not increase the proportion of subordinates promoted to the Provincial service.

72,407. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) A number of officers had retired before attaining the age of fifty-five, but he could not remember a single case where an officer had retired on the completion of twenty years' service.

72,408. The department had never given out large constructional work to a London firm, but probably would do so if it promised to be more economical. Large buildings were given out to local contractors and every bit of the work was supervised by the department. There would be no difficulty whatever in making contracts with private firms. Even if that were done it would not allow the staff of the department to be reduced to any great extent in the districts. On the Sukkur scheme there would be a large number of Executive Engineers, Assistant Engineers and subordinates, and it would be possible to reduce their number by 50 per cent. if the work was given to a large contractor. No consideration had been given to the question of reducing the establishment in that way.

72,409. He had heard it said that Provincial officers were every bit as good as Imperial officers. He knew of certain cases where men had gone to England from the Poona College and after a period of training in England had got into the Imperial service, and obviously these were better trained men than the men who were trained in India only.

72,410. The agreements with temporary engineers appointed in India were renewed every year, so that they knew exactly the terms upon which they were employed, and they could leave at a month's notice. The distinction between an officer who had not reached executive rank and the engineer in private employment was that the latter could go off to another firm, while the former could not leave Government service, and he had that in mind when he said that an Assistant Engineer had a claim for something more than Rs. 800 if he was efficient.

72,411. (*Mr. Kent.*) There were reliable contractors who could undertake construction work but were not able to prepare plans and estimates.

72,412. He attached considerable importance to the *esprit de corps* which life at such an institution as Cooper's Hill fostered.

72,413. It would be quite possible by means of a central institution in England to arrange a curriculum to suit Indian conditions, and a central institution would be preferable to a large number of individual institutions which could not give the necessary special training.

72,414. The system by which an engineer obtained an appointment after a series of examinations spread over a long period was a better test of a man's ability than a single examination.

72,415. The provincial executive engineer was allowed one increment of Rs. 50 after he reached the ordinary maximum, but he thought two increments should be given, and correspondingly two should be given to Imperial engineers who were debarred from becoming Superintending Engineers but were efficient officers.

72,416. Travelling allowances were insufficient and a more suitable arrangement would be to provide a permanent travelling allowance as was done in some other services. He would give the allowance to the Executive Engineer of Bombay although he did not move outside the city. In certain cases stationary men might be given a smaller travelling allowance. Motor cars should be given to officers in places like Bombay and it would be also a sound thing to supply motor cars to men in the mofussil.

72,417. Transfers even in the districts cost more than the allowance given. Officers should be paid their actual expenses in all cases of transfers, but if Government prescribed any limit they should fix a certain allowance of trucks by rail and a certain number of carts by road. An officer suffered loss in every case of transfer, especially if the transfer was to a distant place. One officer who had been transferred from Poona to Nagar had been out of pocket to the extent of Rs. 250. When an officer was transferred during furlough he received no allowance to enable him to join his new appointment, and the witness suggested that the same allowances should be given in such cases as for other transfers.

72,418. No facilities were given to young officers to learn the Vernacular although they had to pass a language examination within two years of their arrival. It was in the interests of Government that all officers should learn the language as soon as possible and for that purpose new arrivals should be sent to Bombay, Poona or Karachi for three months to learn the language under a trained Government teacher, not the ordinary munshi or pundit of the country.

72,419. (*Mr. Advani.*) It was not possible for any selection committee in England to gauge the tact and qualifications of candidates in the management of men or to examine into their manners and temper, but he was not in favour of a probationary period in India on that account It was not easy to get rid of a man merely because he had a bad temper. He believed that an officer who was appointed to the selection committee for the purpose of aiding the committee in selecting the best men for India would not be influenced or biassed in any way by personal feeling.

72,420. The previous Public Services Commission had recommended increased recruitment from India for the Public Works Department, but there had really been a reduction. In those days the College of Science at Poona supplied two recruits a year and it was found that the number of Indian trained engineers was becoming excessive and a request was made that only one engineer should be appointed each year; that was agreed to by the Government of India and the Poona recruitment was reduced from two to one.

72,421. It was probably true that the term provincial had come into disrepute on account of the difference in pay and if the difference in pay was maintained the discontent might still continue.

72,422. The Presidency engineer received extra remuneration as a member of the Improvement Trust to compensate him for his extra work, and not for the higher cost of living in Bombay.

72,423. It was necessary for a district Provincial officer to keep up the same status as an Imperial engineer, but he could not say whether or not he could do so on the present scale of pay. Certainly in the junior ranks of the Provincial service the pay was too low.

The following evidence of this witness was taken in camera.

72,424. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The remark in his confidential written statement that "Europeans report adversely upon the Indian for independent, responsible positions, and favourably for positions where he will be under guidance," was true in almost every case. In order to avoid any misapprehension he wished to point out that this observation and that expressing the Indian opinion quoting Mr. Chitale's remark was preceded by the remark "The reports from the department are as follows:", which meant that questions had been recently put to the officers of the department and that it was their reports he was quoting. The department consisted of a certain number of officers, Europeans and Indians, and each of them had expressed his opinion for the information of the Commission. The reports referred to were not reports taken from the records in the department. Reports were made to the departments from time to time about the work of different officers, but it was not those reports to which he was referring.

72,425. Mr. Chitale was found unfit for administrative duties, and it was open to the Commission to ask for information with regard to European officers who had been passed over or found unsuitable. He had mentioned Mr. Chitale in particular simply because he had quoted his actual words. Elsewhere he had stated that there were some very good Indian officers who were notable exceptions, and by "notable exceptions" he meant notably good officers and not notable exceptions proving the rule with regard to other Indians.

72,426. With regard to the statement that Indians as a rule did not express opinions, he had in mind certain cases and if those cases were asked for by the Commission he would put them forward. It was true there might be similar cases in connection with Europeans, but he was referring to officers who habitually refrained from expressing their views. It was open in such cases for the head of the department to send the file back and ask for an opinion, but that was not done in one of the cases he had in mind. He was quite prepared to establish before the Commission that Indians habitually did not express their opinions.*

72,427. He had not compared the number of European officers who sent up cases without a report with the number of Indians, but he could not recall a single European case. He did not search for such cases; they came before him in the course of his daily work.

72,428. The remark in the written statement as to an officer lacking prestige unless his training enabled him to hold his own in any society referred both to European and educated Indian society. It was very difficult to specify instances without hurting people's feelings, but he could do so in cruder language if the Commission required definite information on the subject.

72,429. The remark that "the Indian officer's independence in public duties is interferred with by his family ties" was based on the known fact that the family ties of a man in India interfered very much with his work. In (g) (of paragraph 72,373) he intended to point out that an Indian officer was very much more likely to be tempted than a European officer, but of course if he withstood the temptation no harm was done. He was not prepared to give any case of a man taking a bribe.

72,430. The Zemindars referred to in the last paragraph of his confidential note were mostly Mohammedans and probably of the same class as the Zamindars in the Punjab.

(The witness withdrew.)

---

* *The witness afterwards wrote:—*

"In explanation of this answer I wish to state that although my service as Chief Engineer and Secretary to Government in Bombay dates from October, 1912 (1 year and 5 months only as remarked by Mr. Rahim) yet I was Chief Engineer in Sind from April 1912, and I have held administrative rank as Superintending Engineer since May 1901, *i.e.*, close on 13 years. It will be conceded therefore that my experience of the classes of men in the department as Executive and Assistants is a long one. I state that the *average* Indian officer (even including those who have been trained at home) is not as good as the *average* European in permanent employ. At the present moment we have on our list three Indians and one European who have been passed over for the rank of Superintending Engineer.

V. T. Agashe, Esq., late Sanitary Engineer to the Government of Bombay.

Written statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,431. *INTRODUCTORY.*—I am a Poona College Engineer with nearly 24 years service, and appear as a representative witness on behalf of Indian Engineers of the Imperial Service in the Bombay Presidency. I shall touch upon those points only wherever the interests of the Indian College Engineers differ from those of the Imperial Engineers recruited from England. In other respects, I may be assumed to subscribe to the Memorandum prepared by Mr. Harrison, who represents the Bombay Imperial Service Engineers recruited from England.

(2) I may mention at the outset that the Indian Imperial Engineers would have one Indian Engineering Service, without any sub-division into Imperial and Provincial, and without any difference in pay, leave and pension rules, since all Engineers in the Public Works Department do the same work, and bear equal responsibilities, whether they are recruited from England or from the Indian Colleges.

(3) Moreover, Indian College Engineers have proved their fitness for the Public Works Department in Bombay, as in other parts of India, and have even risen to administrative rank (there are now two Poona College Engineers working as Superintending Engineers in charge of Divisions in the Bombay Presidency, in addition to an Indian Superintending Engineer from the Cooper's Hill College. A third Indian College Engineer acted in the Superintending Engineer's Grade last year for over 6 months, on the demise of a fourth Indian College Engineer who worked for 2 years as Sanitary Engineer to Government). Two of our Poona College Engineers have reached even greater distinction: one, Mr. Fardunji Kuvarji Tarapurwala, who earned a C.I.E., for his Famine Services, and who retired as Superintending Engineer, First Grade, 7 years ago; and the other, Mr. Vishveshvarayya, who retired as Superintending Engineer from the service of Government, to Mysore, where he was made Chief Engineer, and is now working as Dewan of that First Class State. As Indian Engineers have thus shown that they are as good as their European Colleagues, they claim that recruitment from the Indian Colleges should be doubled, especially as these Indian Colleges are now much better equipped than before, and now approximate to the best of such Institutions in Great Britain, as testified to by the Principals of the Indian Engineering Colleges. I had as Executive Engineer, under me, at different times, European Assistant Engineers, and also Indian College Assistants, and I can say that I did not find the work of the latter in any way inferior to that of the former. Double the present recruitment from the Indian Colleges, would mean the admission of two men instead of one, from each of the Engineering Colleges in the Presidencies of Bombay, Madras and Bengal, and 12 instead of 6 from the Rurki College. The first man out of a class of 20 to 30 is surely the best of his year, but there cannot be any great difference between the first man and the second best of his year. There will thus be no deterioration in the class of recruits to be obtained from these Colleges. It might be mentioned in this connection, that only in the years 1888, 1889, 1890 and 1891 were 2 recruits per year appointed to the Public Works Department, from the Poona Engineering College, and the Indian Superintending Engineer at present in charge of Deccan Irrigation, and the one who acted in that grade for 6½ months last year, were both of them the 2nd best of their respective years, *viz.*, 1889 and 1890.

72,432. **(I.) Methods of recruitment.**—Half the vacancies available each year, should be reserved for recruits from England, and filled by a competitive examination in England (as in the case of the I.M.S.) which should be open to students from the British Universities, and to British subjects from abroad without any distinction of colour or creed.

At present the total annual recruitment for the whole of India is about 37 (*vide* page 3 of Government of India's Memorandum), distributed as below:—

Civil Engineers appointed in England ...	20	23
Royal Engineers	3	
Civil Engineers from the Indian Colleges.	9	14
Civil Engineers by promotion from the subordinate grades.	5	

viz., 23 recruited from England and 14 in India. If as recommended in introductory paragraph 3, the recruitment from the Indian Engineering Colleges be doubled, the figures will be changed as shown below:—

Royal Engineers	3
Civil Engineers appointed in England ...	15
Recruited from Indian Engineering Colleges	18

thus ensuring equal recruitment from England and India.

As for the promotion of deserving Upper Subordinates, a new Deputy Engineer's Grade might be created as proposed by the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, Bombay.

72,433. **(II.) System of training and probation.**—As conditions of working are different in England and India, it would be better if the recruits from England are apprenticed to Executive Engineers in the Public Works Department here, just in the same way, as recruits from Indian Colleges are. In England many of the Engineering operations are carried out by machinery, or mechanical devices, whereas here in India, they have to be carried out by manual labour, so that the practical training obtained in the management of machinery, or complicated mechanical appliances, is of little use, and the recruit has on arrival here, to learn the management of manual labour, as the Indian College apprentice has.

72,434. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—They are the same for both classes of Officers, English and Indian, and there should be no differentiation in name like Imperial Service and Provincial Service.

Under this head it might be mentioned that the promotion of Engineer Officers depends upon the confidential qualification reports sent up by their superiors, and it sometimes happens that an average man is superseded by another, simply because the latter had had opportunities of showing good work, while the former was not fortunate enough to get such opportunities. Such ought not to be the case. Similarly, on the other hand, vaguely worded reports ought not to carry weight, unless specific instances of deficiency are given, but such vague reports are sometimes considered to be sufficient to supersede a man. This is not right, especially when no intimation of an unfavourable report is given to the officer concerned. None should, as a principle, suffer who has not had any positively bad report about him.

72,435. **(V.) Conditions of salary.**—No increase in the rates of salary of the Imperial Service is proposed, but it is recommended that those of the Indian recruited members of what is called the Provincial Service Branch be raised to the level of the other, as both do the same work, and have the same responsibilities and are borne on the same lists. The same work and responsibilities ought surely to carry the same remuneration. As to the allegation of the expenses of English Officers being high, I beg to say that those of the Indian Officers are not less than those of the other. In this connection it has to be remembered that only the *ways* in which the two classes spend their income is different. It is admitted that the personal expenses of English Officers are higher, but as a set off against this should be put the expenses incurred by Indian Officers, on maintaining and educating their near relatives in addition to their family on account of the Hindu joint family system, so that at the end of the service, the two classes of officers on equal pay would be in similar financial circumstances. The difference in the scale of expenses is not moreover taken into account in paying individuals, such as whether the payee is a bachelor or a married man with a large family, and it ought not to effect the question of fixing the pay of any class of officers. In the case of other Departments, the Provincial Service is given less responsible work and so is paid less, but in the Public Works Department, they do exactly the same kind of duties and bear equal responsibilities, so that there is no valid reason why the Indian trained Engineer should be paid less than his European Colleague.

72,436. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—The English Engineers are rightly given great facilities for going home on furlough. The Indian College Engineers ought likewise to have at least four years' furlough instead of two at present allowed, because under the present conditions, this latter has to be reserved to the end of the service, to provide against contingencies. But this want of sufficient rest causes early break down of the health of the Indian Engineer, as it would have done in the case of English Engineers, if they were not allowed furlough at frequent intervals. The interval between two periods of furlough ought also in the case of Indians to be reduced from 8 to 4 years. It would also be a great boon if the privilege leave be allowed to accumulate to at least 4 months, if the exigencies of the public service do not allow of an officer taking privilege leave while 3 months of it is due.

As to allowances while on furlough, the Indian Engineer ought to get the equivalent of the amount that the English Engineers get, *viz.*, £472 to £800, *viz.*, Rs. 7,080 to Rs. 12,000, whereas the present rules allow him Rs. 6,000 only as a maximum.

72,437. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—The pension allowed to Indian Engineers is a maximum of Rs. 5,000 for Executive Engineers and Rs. 6,000 for Superintending Engineers. These amounts were fixed when the pay of the Engineer Grades was 75 per cent. of the present rate of pay. Whatever sterling pensions are allowed to the English Engineers, the equivalent thereof in rupees at the ruling rate of exchange should be allowed to the Indian Engineers, as pension is mere deferred pay, and if the salaries of the two classes are equal, the pensions also must perforce be equal.

2. Indian Engineers should, like their English confreres, be allowed to retire on medical certificate after 20 years' service, and without medical certificate after 25 years' service, because the strain of active service in the Tropics tells as much on the health of the Indian Engineer, as it does on that of the English Engineer.

72,438. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—It is the deliberate opinion of the Indian College Engineers that there should ultimately be no limitations to the employment of Indians in the Public Works Department, as they have proved their fitness therefor, and though at present they agree to have half the places reserved for recruits from England, still as years roll on, the percentage of Indians should continuously be increased. The present proposal of reserving half the vacancies for recruits from England, would mean the present preponderance of Europeans in the Department, because the recruitment of Indians in England is limited to 10 per cent. (though actually even this small percentage is not being worked up to), whereas the recruitment from Indian Colleges and Subordinates includes a considerable percentage of Europeans and Anglo-Indians, as is seen from the Government of India's classified list for June 1912, which shows that the number of these latter was 100, while the Indians numbered 103 only.

The Engineering service has since 1896, been subdivided into Imperial and Provincial, and this has caused great discontent amongst the Indian Engineers, because though the recruits now turned out by the Indian Engineering Colleges are, on account of improvements in their equipment and curricula, much better trained than the product of these Colleges of more than 20 years ago, still they are relegated to an inferior position, *viz.*, put into the Provincial service, while the latter used to be taken up into the Imperial service. And this has produced serious discontent amongst the Indian Engineers, who are now hoping for the abolition of the Provincial service.

It is admitted on all hands that the theoretical training in Indian Colleges is on a level with that in Engineering Institutions in Great Britain, and if practical training of advanced type, suited to the conditions obtaining in the Public Works Department, is to be undergone, the time for imparting to Indian Engineers such training is England is not in the beginning of a recruit's service, when he does not know exactly what is wanted in the Department, but after a service of 5 to 10 years, when he gets to know the wants of the Department, and when, on account of the previous training in the College and in the Department, he will be able to more easily pick up what is wanted from his observations on large works in England. The preliminary training should, in the case of both Indian and English Engineers, be obtained under actual service conditions, under Executive Engineers in charge of large works in India. If there are no suitable works going on in a Province, the apprentices from that Province might be sent to other Provinces where such large works may be going on. For obtaining an English training, study leave up to a year might be allowed to all Indian Engineers of 5 to 10 years' service, on the same conditions as are allowed to I.M.S. Officers.

72,439. **(IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—I entirely concur with Mr. Harrison, the representative witness for the Bombay Imperial Engineers, in what he says with regard to the matters touched upon by him under this head, especially as to the utter inadequacy of travelling allowance at present allowed to Engineers on transfer.

Mr. V. T. AGASHE, called and examined.

72,440. (*Chairman.*) The witness was an Executive Engineer and represented fifteen officers of the Indian Imperial Engineers.

72,441. Officers recruited to the Imperial branch from the Poona College enjoyed all the privileges of Imperial officers and there were no complaints except with regard to pension and leave rules.

72,442. The division into Imperial and Provincial branches should be abolished and there should be one service with uniform conditions of salary, leave, and pension. His proposals were practically on the same lines as those put forward by the Provincial Service. There should be open competition in England with no selection and the present rule under which only ten per cent. of appointments were reserved for Indians should be abolished. It was a fact that the number of Indians in the Public Works Department was increasing (though not so the percentage which is going down) very slowly and that under the present system of selection the candidates were satisfactory, but Indians did not get in in sufficient numbers. He believed the best test for an efficient engineer was an examination, even though the local Government had recognised that better men were obtained by some form of selection.

72,443. Study leave in England should be given to officers with between five and ten years' service. It was well for a man to go to England as it widened his horizon and gave him greater experience.

72,444. The expenses of an Indian officer were as great as the expenses of a European officer, and when *two officers were doing the same work they should receive the same pay. He did agree that in order to attract an Englishman to India it was necessary to offer him a salary above his market value in England.*

72,445. There was keen competition to get into the Provincial branch of the service and the standard of competency amongst recruits was *high; and it was* a fact that the rates of pay in the Provincial branch of the Public Works Department compared favourably with the rates of pay in other Provincial services. At the same time he was of opinion that if the pay was not increased the discontent in the service would continue, because the so-called Provincial service in the Public Works Department was altogether different from the Provincial services in other Departments, in that the latter were subordinate services, whereas the former was superior service equal in status (except as regards pay, leave and pension) to the Imperial Service.

72,446. In his reorganized department he would not have promotion from the upper subordinates grades to the superior cadre because the promoted men would

come in at a late age, thirty-four or thirty-five, and would block the promotion of those in the department.

The officers now recruited to the upper subordinate service had practically the same qualifications as the officers in the Provincial branch and he only denied them the opportunity of entering the superior service because they would get promotion too late. If they were promoted earlier his objection would be removed.

72,447. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He would not favour the reduction of the rates of pay now granted in the Imperial Service, both to Europeans and Indians, to the level of the rates now paid in the Provincial Service, because if that were done men would not come out from England. His suggestion for increased pay was put forward not only in order to obtain good men from Europe, but to satisfy the feelings of the Indians in the service, and for that purpose he was quite prepared to see Indians paid above the market rates of the engineering profession. He was not aware that the pay of the Provincial Engineering Service at present was about the average pay that English engineers received in England, but if it were so, he still desired to raise the standard of the Indian in his own country above that which an Englishman earned in England, because they had to work side by side doing the same duties. From the point of view of the State it might not be right that the Indian taxpayer should be made to pay more than the legitimate market rates, but on the other hand there was no market for an engineer in India. One Executive Engineer of the Provincial Service had resigned his appointment to take up private practice and was earning more than he received in the department. It might be one remedy for the grievance of the Indian engineers in the Provincial Service if they resigned their appointments and trusted to what they could obtain in private employment, but that was not a possible solution.

72,448. (*Mr. Madge.*) He was of opinion that the law of supply and demand should not operate in India in connection with the engineering service.

72,449. (*Mr. Advani.*) At the present time the Indian engineer in the Provincial Service was not being paid the market value of his work, as engineers could earn much more in private practice. It was quite possible that the market value in England, where there was so much competition, might be less than the market value in India, and that an Indian, if his market value was considered, would receive more pay than he was getting at present. It would be very difficult for an officer with twelve or thirteen years' service to leave the service in order to take up private practice.

(The witness withdrew.)

K. S. FRAMJI, Esq., Executive Engineer, and Professor of Engineering, College of Engineering, Poona.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,450. *INTRODUCTORY.*—I appear as a representative witness on behalf of the Provincial Engineers employed under the Government of Bombay. I passed out of the Poona College of Engineering in the year 1896 and was the second man to join the Provincial Service after its rules were brought into operation. I am also a graduate (B.A.) of the Madras University. I took this degree before I joined the Poona College.

I have served in many parts of the Presidency, including Sind, both in Irrigation, and Roads and Building, districts and have varied experience. I have worked under both Europe- and Indian-trained Imperial Engineers and have had under me also both Imperial (Europe-trained) and Provincial (India-trained) Assistant Engineers, for short periods. My services are at present lent to the Educational Department and I am employed as a Professor of Civil Engineering in the Poona College. I have been in the College now for nearly three years. I have also been an examiner in Engineering at all the Engineering examinations of the University of Bombay.

The Poona Engineering College has undergone several improvements and revolutionary changes since the time I was a student at it, both as regards reorganization of course of studies, which is now made of a more practical and comprehensive nature, and in the equipments which now render it possible to impart even a higher standard of training of a practical and experimental nature, which is of such vital importance in developing the powers of initiation and self-reliance of an Engineer. The staff is also considerably augmented.

The large and magnificent scale on which the new Engineering Laboratory of the College is being fitted up will ensure that ample facilities and scope will be afforded for original research work and that practical training, in the testing of materials and in the details of construction and working of modern mechanical appliances (*e.g.*, steam, oil and gas engines, hydraulic machinery, electric motors, etc.), will be imparted to the students on the same high standard as is possible to be obtained in the best Engineering institutions in the United Kingdom.

Recently the Bombay Government have appointed an Advisory Committee for the College. The functions of the Committee are "to advise Government on questions of policy, organization, staff, buildings, equipment, the formation or reconstitution of classes, curriculum," etc.; also "to take the initiative in suggesting improvements and reforms in respect of any of the above matter."

As the Advisory Committee has on its board the Chief Engineer and Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, and other practical Engineers (officials and non-officials), it is obvious that such a Committee would exercise a most salutary control and succeed in ensuring that the training and knowledge imparted in the College, both theoretical and practical, be thoroughly perfect and up-to-date and such as would fully meet the requirements of the Public Works Department.

The course of studies, as laid down by the Bombay University, to which the Poona College of Engineering is affiliated, extends over three years, but while the general body of students present themselves for the final or degree examination in the year succeeding that in which they pass the Second year's examination, such of the students as wish to make their studies as thoroughly complete and perfect as possible, with a view to be better fitted for the keen competition which takes place for the guaranteed appointment, invariably spend an additional year before they appear for the final examination on the results of which the selection for appointment as Apprentice Engineer depends; in other words those who are in the run for the guaranteed appointment find it necessary to devote four years to their course of studies while the University requirements need only three. I make this remark to show that while the students who succeed in obtaining the guaranteed appointments of Apprentice Engineers virtually undergo the same course of studies, side by side, with those who ultimately serve in the Public Works and other departments in subordinate positions, the standard of perfection is greater in the former than in the latter. In the Roorkee and Madras Engineering Colleges the classes and standard of training are entirely different for Engineers and Subordinates, and the same is now being sought to be done in the Poona College, what, in practice, is attained, in a more or less degree, even under existing conditions. Definite proposals are shortly to be placed before the Advisory Committee, referred to above, to the effect that in order to take full advantage of the new Engineering Laboratory, the course of studies should be so revised and supplemented by an advanced experimental course in the Laboratory that the more intelligent and selected students should be made to undergo a thoroughly complete and comprehensive course, both theoretical and practical, extending over a period of four years, while a less elaborate course of three years' duration is proposed for the rest of the students. These proposals would, it is believed, be soon put into effect and the appointment of Apprentice Engineer will be conferred on the best student of the former class.

I have found it necessary to dilate at some length on this subject (which is covered by the 2nd head—Systems of Training and Probation—prescribed by the Royal Commission) in order to refute the hostile evidence sought to be advanced by some to belittle the

work done and the type of men turned out by some of the Indian Colleges where, it is alleged, the Engineers and Subordinates are made to undergo the same kind of training.

72,451. **(I.) Methods of recruitment.**—There are five sources of recruitment in the Department for the superior posts:—

(*a*) by the appointment of Civil Engineers obtained from England;

(*b*) by the appointment of Royal Engineers;

(*c*) by the appointment of candidates who have proved successful in the competitive examinations of the Indian Engineering Colleges;

(*d*) by the appointment of Temporary Engineers, howsoever secured, that is whether from England or in India; and

(*e*) by the promotion of selected officers from the subordinate grades of the Public Works Department.

With regard to (*a*), (*c*) and (*e*) it is desirable that one uniform system of recruitment should be adopted, all through, instead of the present system of selection in England, and part competition and part selection in India. The selection system, though theoretically sound, proves faulty in practice, and is certainly not suited to the conditions existing in India, so that the proposed uniformity in practice cannot be attained by extending to India the method of selection followed in England. The competitive system is working satisfactorily for the Indian Civil Service and it is not clear why it should not give satisfaction in this Department also. It is, therefore, suggested that a system based purely on *real* competition should be introduced both in England and in India for the recruitment of the Imperial Service. The Provincial Service will then disappear as such, and so far as officers of the class (*e*) are concerned, an additional grade of Extra Assistant Engineers may be created in the Upper Subordinate Class carrying a maximum pay of say Rs. 650—700, and the rules for promotion in that class may be so modified as to make it possible for deserving subordinates to rise to that pay in about 25 years' service.

As regards the competitive examination proposed for admission to the Imperial Service, it is recommended that certain Engineering institutions in the United Kingdom and in India should be recognised, and graduates or superior diploma holders from these institutions may be admitted to an open competitive examination both in England and in India. The examinations should be held in London and Delhi. They need not be simultaneous, but the standards of both the examinations must be identical, and they should be held at about the same time. English or Indian graduates, both from English or Indian recognised colleges, should be allowed to compete in these examinations without any restrictions to members of any class. To ensure thorough representation of all communities, the doors of the Indian Engineering Colleges should be thrown open to all subjects of His Majesty, including subjects of Native States, and admissions to the Colleges should be by means of open competitive examinations, as is done in some of the Colleges at present.

The age of the candidates for the competitive examinations in London and Delhi should be between 23 and 25 years. The subjects should be selected solely with regard to the requirements of Indian Public Works Department, *e.g.*, Indian Irrigation, Indian Railways, and Indian Architecture: also one Indian language.

The proportion of recruitment based on the results of the competitive test in London and Delhi should, at present, be one to one, and this proportion should gradually be increased in favour of India as conditions change. Unless a greater proportion of the superior appointments in the Public Works Department are reserved for competition in this country, the legitimate aspirations of the public in India cannot be satisfied. A gradual increase in the number of appointments annually to be given to the Indian Colleges by reducing the English recruitment was one of the recommendations made by the Public Service Commissions of 1886-87.

It must, further, be arranged that the competition is real in both the examinations. This can be secured only by offering a fixed number of appointments in proportion to number of competing candidates. A suitable arrangement would be to offer only one appointment for every three candidates appearing for the examination with a maximum limit of 50 per cent. for each centre. In case sufficient number of candidates are not available at one centre, the deficiency can be made up by offering more appointments at the other centre. The ratio of one to three candidates, suggested above, is not unfair or unreasonable. At the Poona College, for instance, it has frequently happened that no less than 40 or 50 candidates have competed for one single appointment, and in Rurki about 125 candidates for five or six appointments.

There is no likelihood of Indians swamping the Department by this arrangement. A reference to the Government of India classified list corrected up to 30th June, 1912, would show that, notwithstanding the present unfavourable conditions of service, out of 203 Engineers recruited in India, 100 are Europeans, and 103 Indians, and if the Provincial Service is altogether abolished, as is recommended, the number of Europeans recruited in India will be much greater than now, for almost all the members of the Anglo-Indian and domiciled communities, who have now to go to Europe for their Engineering training to get entrance into the Imperial Service, will try to be recruited in India. Besides, it is not improbable that some of the men educated in Europe may come out to India so that they may learn the profession in the country in which it has to be practised, and may compete at the Delhi Examination; an instance of this nature actually happened at the Rurki Entrance in 1871-72, when the conditions and the salaries offered were tempting enough for men to come out from England to compete at Rurki. Furthermore, in addition to the Indian recruitment, there will be the London recruitment, which will always ensure the preponderance of the European element in the service.

It has also to be remembered that the Public Works Department is purely a professional and scientific service, and considerations about the preponderance of European element in it are not so weighty as in the Revenue Service, as this Department has no share whatsoever in the political administration of the country.

In this connection it may be mentioned that, though increased recruitment from Indian Colleges was recommended by the Public Service Commission of 1886-87, still the recruitment from these Colleges has remained absolutely unchanged, while the English recruitment has gone on increasing rapidly as the Department has been expanding. The total number of Engineers recruited from all sources for the Imperial Service during the last 10 years was, according to the figures supplied by the Government of India, 407, of whom only 13 were Indians; during the same period the Indian recruitment for the Provincial Service was only 90 (excluding promoted Subordinates). The proportion of recruitment from Europe and India was thus 407 to 9, as contrasted with the proportion of 21 to 9 at the time of the Public Service enquiry in 1886-87. Considering the figures for Bombay alone, it is seen that during the same period of 10 years, the proportion of Europe-trained Engineers to India-trained (including promoted Subordinates) was 4·7 to 1·6; in other words, the Indian recruitment has been only 25 per cent. of the total recruitment. Some arrangement, therefore, to allow for increased Indian recruitment at the same time as European recruitment in increased for supplying the growing demands of the Department, is obviously necessary so as to keep the proportion between Indian and European recruitment the same. Considering these facts, the recruitment of 50 per cent. in India, as suggested aboev, cannot be deemed excessive, specially when it is remembered that this recruitment will consist of all classes, namely, Anglo-Indians, members of the domiciled communities, and Indians.

In this connection it will not be out of place to enumerate a few of the advantages which Government derive from employing the Indian recruit in the Public Works Department where an engineer has to spend a large amount of public money, and must, therefore, have first-hand information as regards the conditions and rates of local labour, &c.

(1.) The Indian Engineer possesses the great and recognised advantage—a consideration on which great

stress was laid when the institution of a Military Staff College in India was advocated—of having received his training in the country in which he has to practise his profession.

(2.) He knows the customs and habits of the people with whom he comes in contact, and is therefore likely to understand them better than a European Engineer.

(3.) He can understand more efficiently the local conditions of labour, contracts, the requirements of Zamindars, &c., and is therefore in a better position to deal with them.

(4.) He can, more generally, decipher the vernacular records himself, and is in a better position to collect first-hand information instead of obtaining it through his establishment, which may probably be interested in one or other of the parties concerned. For the same reason he is in a better position to impart justice and exercise greater fairness in dealing with subordinates.

(5.) He is useful from the day he joins the service, as is publicly admitted by high officials, while the European takes some years before he is equally useful.

(6.) Because of some of the above advantages he is found more useful on famine work, and has been employed to a greater extent on such works. His preferential employment on such works is an index of his powers of organisation and initiation.

In the event of the Imperial Service being thrown open once again to the India-trained recruit, as recommended, the members of the existing Provincial Service who are already listed with the Imperial Engineers, should be admitted to the same scale of pay as their Imperial confrères.

72,452. **(II.) System of training and probation.**—There is no guarantee that the preliminary training obtained at present by recruits from England will meet the requirements of the profession in India. The training should undoubtedly be specially directed to one end, *viz.*, the efficient performance of the duties required of an Engineer in India, and this can only be achieved by prescribing specially selected subjects, including one Indian language, for the competitive test.

As a matter of fact, the training, including the so-called practical experience in England, received by the present recruits is of no use for Indian works, and they have always to receive a fresh training in India to make them useful officers. While, in the case of the Indian recruit, the preliminary training is solely directed to meet the requirements of the Department, and is considered sound and sufficiently exhaustive. This fact has been publicly admitted by persons fully qualified to speak on the subject even before the Royal Commission.

It is believed that certain Imperial officers hold the opinion, as brought forth in the evidence, that the Provincial Engineer or rather the India-trained Engineer and his work are inferior in certain respects to the average Europe-trained Imperial Engineer and the work turned out by him. Such hostile evidence merely betrays narrow-mindedness and an attempt to maintain the gulf of separation which has been unjustly created between the two services, in point of pay. Evidence of this nature will not stand the test of close and searching scrutiny and can be easily refuted by quoting specific instances in which Indian College Engineers have displayed remarkable ability and efficiency, even in administrative ranks, and proved themselves in specific cases, to be even superior when brought in competition with Imperial Engineers. The high standard of training that they get in India and their natural intelligence and ability have enabled them to attain conspicuous success and to prove themselves equally capable as their Imperial confrères to fill any office in any branch of the department. The weighty testimony of so able and experienced an officer like Mr. F. R. Bagley, retired Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, Railways, who had a brilliant and distinguished career extending over forty years and through whose hands several Imperial and Provincial Engineers had passed, will amply bear out the above remarks. His memorandum and the record of his evidence are before the Royal Commission from which it will be seen that an experienced officer like him is also strongly of opinion that there is no systematic training of Engineers in England at present, while that in India is good and such as turns out a class of men who are qualified to do the work required of them: besides he characterises the so-called practical experience of England as being "generally a farce." Further proof of the high standard of training of India-trained Engineers can be had in the fact that even in the Professional Examinations of Assistant Engineers—which is a test of both theoretical and practical knowledge—India-trained men have generally succeeded in passing them soon and within the prescribed time and in their *first* attempts.

It will be appropriate to refer here to the opinion expressed by so great an authority as Mr. C. E. Mallet, of the Advisory Committee for Indian students, appointed by the Secretary of State, who, in his last annual report, says (as reported in one of the Bombay dailies) that "it is unfortunate that students desiring ultimately to make railways, bridges, and roads, leave India, where opportunities exist, for England, where such opportunities are more rarely found. It would be a great assistance," adds Mr. Mallet, "if the Railways and Public Works Department in India would afford Indian students such facilities as are so difficult to obtain here." If this suggestion is made for private students it would be applicable, with greater force, in the case of Government officers, on probation, who can be given every facility for practical training, on their *own* works, when such opportunities exist in India to a greater extent than in Europe.

From my personal knowledge and experience as Professor of Civil Engineering in the Poona College, and after carefully contrasting the curricula of studies prescribed in the Indian Engineering Colleges and those of the United Kingdom, I am forced to the conclusion that the former are more suited to the requirements of the Department than many of the latter, and are even in some cases, of a more difficult nature. This is supported by the results of certain Poona and other Indian College graduates who having failed to qualify themselves for the guaranteed appointments here, have easily succeeded in obtaining, after a short course of study, the necessary English degrees to qualify themselves for appointments in the Imperial Service and have been so appointed. Further, some graduates have also been able to qualify themselves easily for the Associate Membership of the Institute of Civil Engineers by passing that examination in India—one of the tests prescribed for nomination of recruits to the Imperial Service.

The probationary period, therefore, which is enforced in the case of the alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges should be insisted upon as an indispensable condition in the case of the English recruit as well. This probationary period in the Department in India is absolutely necessary, though instances are not wanting in which some Provincial Engineers have not been given any opportunities for practical training on works during their apprentice periods, but have been placed in charge of important sub-divisions and made to carry out the duties of the ordinary trained officer, which they have successfully preformed. Recently, however, the Bombay Government have issued stringent orders on this subject and have laid down the lines on which the practical training of all Apprentice Engineers should be conducted.

It is further proposed that after the selections of the candidates are made on the results of the competitive tests in London and India, as suggested above, the recruits should be consulted, with a view to specialization, as to the class of work on which they desire to be trained, such as Railways, Irrigation, Roads and Buildings, Sanitary Engineering, &c., and as far as practicable the training might be arranged in accordance with their tastes and inclinations. They should all, whether European or Indian recruits, pass one year's apprenticeships in the countries which can impart the best training in that branch of Engineering. For instance India will be best suited for Irrigation training and possibly Railways, and Europe for Sanitary Engineering, and so on. The Secretary of State should make arrangements for the proper training of apprentices in Europe, and the Government of India for those who are to learn work in India.

All the apprentices should be paid a reasonable salary, and all the expenses of training, such as payment of premia, &c., should be borne by Government. By this system a special training required for special branches will be imparted and this will serve the beneficial effect of keeping the officers of a scientific service up-to-date. The division of the Public Works Department into separate branches such as roads and buildings, irrigation and railways is already carried out in some provinces, and in others it is being carried out gradually. This may be expedited and brought into effect as early as possible.

It may be remarked that the conditions of this probationary period should be observed in the strictest sense, *i.e.*, it should involve selection and a possibility of rejection at the end of it. For candidates from England free return passage for rejected candidates may be provided to meet the plea which may be urged that this condition may deter candidates from England by reason of the attached risk.

72,453. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—The conditions of service for recruits from England and India, who are required to do identically the same work and bear the same responsibilities, differ very much, and this is the principal cause of the great discontent that prevails amongst the Indian recruits.

Ever since the first of the Indian Engineering Colleges was established in the year 1847 and until the year 1895, the Indian Engineers have enjoyed full and equal rights and privileges with engineers recruited in England and have done exactly the same work. They have also done the same work after the Provincial Service was introduced in 1895.

When the Cooper's Hill College was established in 1871 it was feared that its establishment would injuriously affect the position of the Indian Trained Engineers, but to dispel this fear the then Lieutenant-Governor of the North Western Provinces, Sir William Muir, after consulting the Government of India, gave an authorised assurance in a public speech delivered at Rurki in November 1873 that the Cooper's Hill College would in no degree affect the privileges enjoyed by the Indian Colleges or the appointments guaranteed till then, to the Colleges, as the requirements of India were large enough to provide for all the Engineers recruited both in England and India on terms of equal rights and privileges.

Some time later, however, the Provincial Engineering Service came into existence with its pernicious results. It was the outcome of the unjust and unsound recommendations of the Public Service Commission which was appointed in 1886 to "devise a scheme which may reasonably be hoped to do full justice to the claims of the Natives of India to *higher* and *more* extensive employment in the public service." While the Commission did the good expected of it by laying down strong and sound reasons for creating Provincial Service branches in various other Departments they distinctly erred in the case of the Public Works Department in which they evidently failed to realize that the conditions were entirely dissimilar. This Department was one of those in which recruitment used to be made on an equal footing as regards pay, promotion, duties and responsibilities for recruits from Europe and India, and hence in recommending the creation of a Provincial Service for it, on a lower scale of pay, they took a distinctly retrograde step. In most other Departments which resembled the Civil Service more closely than the Public Works, either the Provincial Service scheme was not introduced at all (in which superior posts were open to Indians) or where it was introduced it regularized recruitment and considerably raised the status and dignity of the subordinates and ensured more extensive employment of those Indians who had never before got any better treatment than employment as subordinates. For instance conditions in the Provincial Civil Service (Revenue) were made so attractive and gratifying as to render it possible for selected officers of the Deputy Collector's grade—who unlike the Engineers are men without any special technical training or professional qualifications—to rise to certain listed posts of Collectors on the high salaries of Rs. 1,200 and Rs. 1,600 per mensem.

The situation created by the institution of the Provincial Engineering Service is seen to be all the more unjust when it is remembered that no such differences in pay or prospects were introduced in other Departments like Finance, Accounts, Traffic, Salt, etc., in which, as in the Public Works Department all officers whether recruited in England or India were on a footing of equality. This differentiation in treatment is all the more unendurable when it is realized that in these Departments recruitment in India is made by nomination and the training and educational qualifications of the recruits are not of the same high standard as of the recruits in the Public Works Department, in which recruitment is made by open *competition*.

The Public Service Commission seems to have based its recommendations regarding the Provincial Engineering Service on the ground that Engineers obtained from England received a better professional training than that which the Indian colleges were capable of affording. This conclusion has not been confirmed by what has subsequently transpired, for men trained in Indian colleges have attained the highest ranks in the Department *since* the year 1887 when the said Commission sat. Their high standard of qualifications and professional merits have been admitted by officials of the highest ranks who have come in close contact with all classes of Engineers and have also been recognised by Government by the bestowal of titles such as C.I.E., etc., on India-trained Engineers.

The Government of India, while giving effect to the recommendations of the Public Service Commission, also recognized that the conditions in the Public Works Department were quite different from those in other Departments, by introducing, in the Public Works Department Provincial Service, no further changes from the conditions originally existing except in the matter of pay only, the Provincial Officers still being borne on the same list and required to do the same work and bear the same responsibilities as their Imperial confrères. The policy recommended by the Commission was also not consistently followed by the Government of India in the case of some temporary Indian College Engineers. Certain officers who had failed to secure appointments in Rurki and who had no special claims whatever, were subsequently made permanent and put on the Imperial list, while officers who had secured guaranteed appointments were placed on the Provincial list and still continue to remain on that list because of the absence of any provision in the rules to transfer those men to the Imperial list, however competent they may be.

These facts clearly indicate (1) that the policy advocating the adoption of the Provincial Service Scheme for the Public Works Department as suggested by the Public Service Commission is unsound, (2) that in accepting it the Government were ignoring the pledge given by Sir W. Muir in 1873, and (3) that Government have, themselves, broken away from it and have relaxed or infringed the rules in the case of certain temporary Engineers. Justice and equity would, therefore, demand that the rules of the Provincial Service should be entirely set aside for *all* officers, and that the India-trained Engineers should be reinstated in the position they formerly held, *i.e.*, they should be placed on terms of equality with the Imperial Engineers.

The Provincial officers, subjected to these disabilities and grievances, have been sending memorials to the Government of India and the Secretary of State for the abolition of the Provincial Service since 1902, but have not received any redress as yet. They have been promised full consideration of their case after the investigations of this Commission are completed, as will be seen by the replies (given below) of the Under Secretary of State in the House of Commons. The Provincial Engineers now concentrate their hopes in the Royal Service Commission for a complete redress of their long-standing grievances by recommending the entire abolition of the Public Works Department, Provincial Service. Such an act of justice and grace will give a further impetus to technical education, to which so much attention is being rightly devoted, and will also prove a source of intense gratification not only to the Indian communities but also to the Anglo-Indian and the domiciled European communities, who have proved themselves particularly suited

for this profession, as judged by the history of the careers of the distinguished men turned out by the Rurki College, since its establishment.

The questions and replies referred to above are as follows:—

I. The Under Secretary of State, Mr. Montague, made the following statement on the 15th May 1912, in the House of Commons in reply to certain questions:—"That it was impossible to state exactly when the decision would be reached in this most difficult and complicated case. The Secretary of State in Council had already sanctioned certain increases in pay, which, he hoped, would satisfy those interested, but had found it necessary to reserve other parts of the Governments of India's proposals for further consideration. The matter would be expedited so far as was possible till a final decision was reached on all issues. Lord Crewe was not prepared to consider the laying of papers on the table." The "increases in pay," referred to above, are those granted in the 1912 scheme, which merely gave what had been proposed to be withheld and taken away by the 1908 scheme.

II. In the 10th October 1912, again, the following questions were asked in the House of Commons and the Under Secretary of State gave replies as quoted below:—

Questions.—(1) "Whether a final settlement had yet been arrived at in the case of the Provincial Engineers; would he state what were those parts of the Government of India's proposals which have been reserved by the Secretary of State for further consideration, and when a division upon them would be taken?"

(2) "Whether it was proposed to restore, either completely or partially, to the Imperial Service, those Provincial Engineers who had received their training at Indian Engineering Colleges?"

(3) "Whether the Secretary of State would arrange that the members to be co-opted on the Public Services Commission, to represent the Provincial Engineer Service, should be taken from those who might be duly selected for the purpose by the Provincial Engineers themselves?"

Replies.—(1) and (2) "As the Honourable Member was informed on May 15th last, orders have been passed sanctioning certain increases of pay to the Provincial Engineers. The subject reserved for future consideration is practically the one mentioned in the Honourable Member's second question, *viz.*, whether any change shall be made in the system of recruitment for the Imperial Service, and if so, under what limitations and conditions, so as to allow the appointment or promotion to that service of Engineers trained in India. This subject is covered by the terms of reference to the recently appointed Royal Commission on the Public Services in India."

(3) "The procedure to be followed in the matter mentioned has not yet been settled. In any case the selection of co-opted representatives will be for settlement by the Royal Commission itself."

72,454. **(IV.) Conditions of salary.**—(1) *Salary.*—The Indian recruit draws approximately two-thirds of the Europe-recruited officer. Considering that both have to do the same work, bear the same responsibilities, and maintain the same social position in conformity with their rank in the Department, this practice of paying the two classes of officers at different rates is utterly unfair and unsuitable. It is contended that emoluments should depend on services rendered, and that the distinction between the two classes of officers who do the same work should be obliterated. Such a difference has resulted in the following anomalies and defects:—

(*a*) The minimum pay of India-trained Executive Engineers is much less than the maximum pay of the Imperial Assistant Engineers. Under this arrangement, on several occasions, an Assistant Engineer of the Imperial Service in charge of only a sub-division has been drawing more pay than his immediate superior of the Provincial Service, bearing more than double the responsibility, and having to maintain a much higher social position suited to his rank. The outside public can have no idea of the detrimental effect that such an arrangement has on the discipline amongst the subordinate officers, for in India the position of an officer and the respect due to him are gauged not so much by the rank he holds as by the pay he draws.

(*b*) The minimum pay of an India-trained Superintending Engineer is less than the maximum pay of an Imperial Executive Engineer.

(*c*) Anomalies exist in connection with local allowances as per Appendix 19 of the Public Works Department Code. It will be seen that subordinates of the rank of Sub-Engineers get better allowances (in the form of Presidency and other allowances) than the Assistant and Executive Engineers of the Provincial Service though they have neither to live in the same style nor to maintain the same position. On this account cases have occurred where senior Sub-Engineers have refused promotion to the Offiers' grades.

(*d*) Generally the pay granted to India-trained recruits is inadequate and is not commensurate with their work and responsibilities.

(*e*) The minimum pay of Rs. 535 fixed is so low that it is not even a living wage for an Executive Engineer. From a statement of expenditure furnished by an Executive Engineer (Provincial Service), who is at present drawing a salary of Rs. 535, it is seen that after he has met all his outside expenses such as disbursing payments for house-rent, menial establishment, the education of his children, and after paying contribution to Civil Engineers' fund, he has only a balance of Rs. 55 left for his personal, domestic, and other requirements of life, and for the provision he has to make for extra expenditure consequent on transfers, and on account of ill-health, or visits to his home or other parts of India, &c. The statement in question can be produced if required.

It may be argued that an Indian drawing Rs. 535 need not run into such expenses and that other Indians drawing similar salaries in other departments find them sufficient. This argument may be met by pointing out that Indians belonging to other departments and getting similar salaries are in subordinate positions and are not required either to pay such heavy rents or to live in the style and position of an Executive Engineer, who is the local head of the Department. The latter has to move freely among the District and Divisional Officers, and it is in the highest degree desirable that he should receive adequate pay and emoluments (similar to the Imperial Executive Engineer) so as to be able to maintain his dignity as the principal officer of the Public Works Department in the District, filling a high post of trust and responsibility.

It often happens that a Provincial Officer drawing a low salary succeeds an Imperial Officer on a much higher salary in the same place, and he is required to maintain the same establishment at the same rates of pay, join the same institutions, such as local clubs, &c., and live in the same style. It is, moreover, a popular belief that Government also expects him to mix socially with other District officers in the interests of work, and in one instance, at least, it is said that it was hinted to a Provincial Executive Engineer that even his promotion depended, to some extent, on the nature of his *social* relations with other District officers. Unless, therefore, he is adequately paid, it is not fair to place an officer of Government in such position.

It is in consequence of such a false and incongruous situation which a Provincial Engineer finds himself forced into—a situation which is rendered all the more galling when contrasted with the easy and highly affluent position, unencumbered by any social obligations, which his contemporaries at College, possessing very mediocre and far inferior abilities, are found to be enjoying in the pursuit of independent practice as Architects, Surveyors, &c., in places like Bombay, &c., that some of them have been seriously considering the desirability (a few have actually put the resolution into effect) of giving up their appointments under Government even at the sacrifice of their prospective pensions. This picture is by no means overdrawn, though it may apply only to a few cases.

It may here be mentioned that various flimsy arguments are being advanced by interested parties in favour of differential treatment, as regards salary, being accorded to Indians on the following grounds:—

(1) Imported labour should be paid more than indigenous labour.

(2) The market value of Engineers trained in India is much below that of Europe-trained Engineers.

(3) The mode of life of Engineers recruited in England is more expensive than that of those recruited in India.

(4) Inability of Indians to perform administrative work.

The fallacy of these arguments can be easily demonstrated.

(1) Every Engineer ought to know that it is not possible to get the *same* work done on the same spot by paying *different* wages. If imported labour has to be paid more for a certain kind of work, the wages of local labour have forthwith to be raised to the same scale. Such an argument will not be advanced by Englishmen in Australia, Canada, and other Colonies, because the Colonists will not entertain the same.

If imported labour is dissatisfied with the scale of wages offered, the obvious remedy lies in demanding higher wages than what *it* gets and *not* higher than what another class of labour—local labour—doing exactly the same work, gets.

Arguments of this nature must lose all weight and force if the resentment of imported labour can rest appeased, as appears to be the case, provided the local labour is paid on a *lower scale*.

(2) Whatever the relative values may be of Europe-trained and India-trained Engineer so far as the average type of men is concerned (this is not the point of contention at issue) it cannot, for a moment, be disputed that the *pick* of the Indian Engineering Colleges (who alone get admission to the superior grades of the Public Works Department and whose value is being sought to be depreciated) are as good and efficient as the Europe-trained men in the Imperial Service. This has been admitted, in public utterances as well, by distinguished and eminent persons qualified to speak on the subject. In support of the statement that such officers have the same market value as Europe-trained men, instances can be quoted in which India-trained officers have been employed, on or before retirement, by Municipalities, etc., on posts of the highest rank, on which Europe-trained men have been employed, either previously or subsequently, on the *same salary*.

Besides, no Municipal or any Public Body, or a Native State, etc., would ever think if employing any one class of labour at a higher rate, if it is possible to get the *same kind of work* done as efficiently by another class at a lower rate. Hence, so far as the Public Works Department requirements are concerned, such an argument, as has been advanced, is devoid of practical significance.

(3) As regards the cost of living, it may be pointed out that though the channels of expenditure in the case of Europeans and Indians may be different, they are as many and as varied in the one case as in the other. The Provincial Service does not consist wholly of Hindus or orthodox habits or principles. It includes Anglo-Indians, domiciled Europeans, Christians, Parsis, Mahomedans and unorthodox Hindus, also. Most members of these classes, when occupying high official positions, have been known to adopt the European standard of living, and while they and their wives may mix with Europeans freely, they cannot possibly forsake their Indian friends and relations who may not have advanced so far, so that they are often obliged to keep up a double establishment. Besides, unlike the European, an Indian has very often to support not only his own family, but a large number of dependents closely or distantly related to him.

(4) The argument regarding the inability of the Indians to do administrative work stands self-refuted, for past experience has shown that, in several instances, Indian Officers have, when given the opportunity, displayed conspicuous ability and been eminently successful in administrative work, for which their services have been rewarded by Government, in some cases, by the bestowal of titles as C.I.E.'s, etc.

Some of the highest appointments, in all departments, have been occupied by Indians with distinction, and the Indian Engineer has been no less conspicuous in this respect. Many Indian College Engineers have held administrative appointments and have done credit to themselves, their alma-mater, and their country; one of them is at present holding the highly responsible position of the Diwan of a premier State—an appointment requiring administrative ability of the highest order.

The work and duties of an Executive Engineer involve as much the exercise of administrative ability, especially in the Irrigation Branch, as capacity for the practical execution of work; hence, as almost all Indians are proved and acknowledged to be a success as Executive Engineers, there is no reason to believe that they will fail to display administrative ability in the higher ranks.

Having regard to all these considerations it is contended that emoluments should solely depend on services rendered, and that the distinction between the same classes of officers, who do the same work and bear the same responsibilities should be done away with as early as possible.

(2) *Local allowances.*—Similarly the proportion of two-thirds which has been carried to such an extent as to produce the anomaly of paying more in the form of local allowances to subordinates than the officers under whom they may be working, should be obliterated. This difference in local allowances is specially unjust, as these allowances are always given for a specific purpose, that is, as compensation for local disabilities, which equally affect both classes of officers.

(3) *Travelling allowance rules.* (*a*) *Travelling allowances for ordinary tours.*—The Engineer Officers get their travelling allowance at a daily rate when they are out of headquarters. They have to maintain their permanent conveyance at their own expense during periods of halt at headquarters. It generally happens that most of the Executive Officers have to pass nearly four months at headquarters when it is not possible for them, owing to climatic conditions, to move out, systematically, or for any length of time.

Further, taking into account the periods of absence from the district on short leave or during holidays as also the necessity of spending a few days each month at headquarters for accounts purposes, it will be seen that, roughly speaking, an Engineer Officer generally gets his travelling allowance for about six months only in the year, while he has to maintain at least two horses permanently throughout the year, and also pay for carting, etc., of his kit when he actually travels. It happens, therefore, in a good many cases that he is actually out of pocket as regards travelling allowances earned and expenditure incurred, so that a part of his already limited income has to be spent on travelling expenses, and this is not in keeping with the spirit of the Travelling Allowance Rules.

It is, therefore, suggested that Engineer Officers should either get a fixed travelling allowance like the officers of the Revenue Department, or the scale of their travelling allowances should be raised to provide for the actual travelling expenses. The fixed travelling allowance recommended is Rs. 150 a month for Executive Engineers, in accordance with what is actually given to officers of other departments of similar standing.

(*b*) *Travelling allowances on transfer.*—These have been universally recognized to be inadequate and it is hoped that the rules regarding these will be amended at the earliest opportunity so as to provide, at least, for the actual expenses incurred by officers on transfers, limited to say three times the railway fare or road mileage ordinarily allowed for touring. Liberal allowance should also be made for the carriage of furniture and personal effects.

(*c*) *Travelling allowance for short voyages by sea in coast districts.*—Though few officers are affected by these rules, it would not be fair to ignore the hardships to which they are subjected. All officers travelling by steamers are paid only *single* first-class fares for their voyages however short or long these may be. Allowances granted for journeys by rail prove insufficient to cover an officer's expenses when he is travelling with his family, but the hardships are greatly accentuated in the case of voyages by sea where only single first-class fare is allowed. The unfavourable nature of the rules operates very harshly, the more so in the case of Provincial Engineers with their low scale of pay, and substantial increase in the scale of allowances is urgently called for.

72,455. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—Here again there is much disparity between the conditions applying to each of these two classes of officers.

Great stress has been laid on the advantage to be derived by an Engineer in visiting works in foreign countries, and the element recruited in England has received undue credit on this account. Unless the conditions of leave are the same, it becomes impossible for India-trained men, even if they desire to do so, to secure the same advantages in this direction as English recruited Engineers.

Again, the nature of an officer's duties in the Public Works Department involves continued exposure and discomfort for long periods, and the health of an India-trained officer suffers equally with that of imported men. There is, therefore, no reason whatever to perpetuate the present distinction.

Indian College Engineers should, therefore, receive exactly the same leave conditions as their contemporaries recruited from England. It is generally recognised that India-recruited Engineers break down in health much earlier than men obtained from England, and this is due to insufficient leave. There seems however no reason to apprehend that given equal opportunities the Indians will avail themselves of the leave rules more freely than they have been doing hitherto and that they will thereby put Government to extra expense.

Again, officers recruited in India in certain other services, *e.g.*, the Traffic Accounts, Opium, Finance, etc., are under more favourable leave rules, and there is no reason why India-trained Engineers should not be on an equal footing with these other services.

72,456. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—Here again there is a much resented distinction, *vide* Article 636, C. S. R., which will create invidious and unjust anomalies. For example, an India-trained Chief Engineer will draw less pension than his own subordinate recruited in England.

It is submitted that it is a well and universally established principle, that pensions are granted as retiring provisions for specific services rendered to the State, and it is, therefore, illogical and unjust to create or maintain any distinction in this direction between persons who have in fact rendered exactly the same services. In other words, pensions ought to be wholly and solely dependent on specific services rendered and not on place of original recruitment, for this does not involve any special merit.

72,457. **(VIIa) Limitations in the employment of non-Europeans.**—As urged above the Department should be recruited half from England and half in India for the present. The recruitment in England should be open to all British subjects equally, irrespective of domicile, colour, caste or creed.

Latterly, during the existence of Cooper's Hill College only 2 Indians were eligible for appointment even after competition, and at present the number of Indians eligible for appointment in England is limited to 10 per cent. of the total annual recruitment.

Limitations of this nature should be barred.

72,458. **(VIIb) Working of the existing system of division of services in the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial.**—The division of the Public Works Department into Imperial and Provincial sections has been anything but a success, and can never be so in view of the surrounding circumstances and the past history of the Department. The distinction created between the two classes of officers, who do exactly the same work and bear exactly the same responsibilities is intensely resented and will inevitably result in splitting up the whole Public Works Department into two hostile camps, and this must greatly injure efficiency. The interests of the two classes of officers are now widely divergent, and this is conspicuous in their relations. Concerted action has become impossible, and the general feeling of *esprit de corps* which formerly prevailed, has ceased to exist. In its place there will assuredly spring up a deep and widespread feeling of suspicion and distrust between the two classes of officers which must wreck harmonious working.

So long as the two classes possess, on the average, equal educational and professional attainments, and this is undoubtedly the case, any differentiation between them is unworkable. It is impossible to force a distinction in pay when none exists in attainments, and any attempts to do so must create complications and raise issues which it would be as well to avoid.

Again, it is, in fact true that many India-trained Engineers possess superior qualifications to some officers recruited in England.

It is, therefore, urged that the said differentiation, which is illogical and unjust, should be obliterated and extinguished, and that the alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges should be restored to the position they formerly occupied, that is to say, there should be only one service in the Public Works Department.

72,459. **(IX.) Miscellaneous.**—*No analogy with other Provincial Services.*—It is widely felt that the resistance offered to the oft-repeated prayer of the alumni of the Indian Engineering Colleges to be restored to the position they formerly occupied, that is, on an equality with recruits from England, is due in a great measure to the apprehension that if this is accepted, other Provincial Services will be entitled to similar treatment.

It is submitted in reply, that the question of other Provincial Services is foreign to the point at issue.

There is no parallel between the case of Engineers recruited in India and other Provincial Services. Engineers recruited in India are not situated in the same relation to Engineers recruited from England, as members of other Provincial Services bear to the Imperial Officers of their Services. But, on the contrary, except as regards pay, leave and pension, there is in all other respects no distinction between the two classes of officers in the Public Works Department.

It is, therefore, submitted that any argument, opposing the restoration of the alumni of Indian Engineering Colleges to the position they formerly occupied on the ground that this would entitle other Provincial Services to similar treatment, is unsound and cannot be raised.

Temporary Engineers.—The position occupied by these officers in the Department is undoubtedly most unsatisfactory and requires construction. These Officers are at present recruited in an irregular manner, viz.:—

(*a*) From India-trained and duly qualified Engineers who have failed to secure guaranteed appointments when competing for them.

(*b*) From Engineers appointed under covenant in England.

(*c*) From unqualified persons appointed in India.

It is submitted that, except in special cases where experts are required, these officers should be recruited from qualified persons who have successfully undergone the prescribed training in any Indian Engineer-College, and that no other person should be engaged until this source of supply is exhausted.

It is contended that this arrangement will be greatly beneficial to the State Colleges in India, and will tend to attract suitable candidates.

The present conditions under which these officers serve are not such as to secure efficiency. There is practically no security whatever, for these officers are liable to be discharged with very limited notice regardless of the length of their service.

It is suggested that such service should be regarded as permanent non-pensionable service, and there should be an incremental scale of pay.

Mr. K. S. Framji, called and examined.

72,460. (*Chairman.*) The witness was an Executive Engineer and Professor of Civil Engineering in the Poona College. He represented the Provincial engineers.

72,461. The standard of efficiency amongst Provincial engineers was very high and there was keen competition for entry to the service, but he was not prepared to assume on that account that the salaries paid by Government were adequate. It had been found by experience that they were not adequate and the keen competition was simply due to the fact that the appointments in the service were so few. If the number of vacancies were larger the competition would not be so keen unless the conditions of the service

were improved. There was no sign at present of the competition falling off, but it was just possible it might do so. The great discontent which at present prevailed might prevent men of superior intellectual attainments entering the service.

72,462. Even though no European officers were recruited to the engineering service he would recommend the imperial scale of pay for officers recruited in India. Having regard to the service rendered, the officers were entitled to much higher pay than they received at present. The argument he had used in his written statement, that if imported labour was dissatisfied with the scale of wages offered they should demand higher wages, was put forward to show that Europeans should not ask for lower wages to be paid to Indians but for higher wages to be paid to themselves.

72,463. He did not agree that the abolition of invidious distinctions and the payment of a foreign service allowance to Europeans would mitigate the grievance that was felt, but if the alternative offered was a foreign service allowances or the maintenance of present conditions he would accept the foreign allowance.

72,464. The selection system of recruitment had proved faulty in practice but he could not give any specific instances of where that faultiness had occurred. Men who had been disqualified in India had gone to England and had obtained admission to the Imperial service although they were of an inferior type.

72,465. With regard to his recommendation for a competitive examination in London and Delhi, he thought it would not be impracticable to frame a syllabus for an examination of the kind suggested in the written statement, and such an examination would not be unfair to Europeans except perhaps in regard to the subject of language. He advocated sufficient attention being paid to such subjects as Indian irrigation, Indian railways, and Indian architecture, because he found that in the English university courses sufficient emphasis was not laid upon them. In some they were treated as optional subjects, and in some others they were entirely excluded. More attention was paid to Indian irrigation and hydraulics at Poona and Rurki than was paid in the British engineering colleges.

72,466. All candidates recruited in India or in England should have a year's special training on the class of work in which they desired to be trained, and during that year they should receive about three-fourths of their ordinary salary. That period of probation should be given to all whether they came from Europe or from Indian colleges.

72,467. He would stop the promotion of upper subordinates to the higher services. Most of the men who were now recruited in that way would, probably, under the scheme put forward, be recruited direct, about ten or twelve years earlier than they were now recruited. Most of the men who were recruited to the upper subordinate grade were men who had only fallen short of a guaranteed appointment by a very few marks. He did not intend to shut the door to promotion, as, under his proposal, with increased recruitment, men who now entered the upper subordinate service would stand the chances of being directly recruited to the superior service immediately on passing out instead of waiting, as they did now, for a good many years. Inferior students would go into the upper subordinate service and remain there, but their prospects would be greatly increased by the addition of an extra-assistant grade with a salary of Rs. 650 to Rs. 700, and if listed posts were reserved for them there would be no harm in giving them executive charges in exceptional cases.

72,468. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) It would be practicable to recruit by means of a competitive examination with an Indian language included in the subjects. The language would form a very minor part of the whole syllabus and the time spent in studying it would not be wasted (even if a candidate was not successful in obtaining an appointment) more than what was inevitable in all similar cases.

72,469. (*Mr. Sly.*) The standard of admission to the Poona College of Engineering was the Previous Examination of the Bombay University, but there were applicants who had passed the M.A. and the B.Sc. The graduates entering the college were certainly above the average. Up to recently the first man on the list had the option of a Government appointment, but it was now laid down that the best man should be selected irrespective of his position on the list. He had known no case of refusal of the appointment. The second best man was offered an upper subordinate appointment, but very often he did not accept it, preferring to go into private employment or to go to England to qualify for the higher service. The upper subordinates and Provincial service candidates were all drawn from the same class, but in future they were to be given two entirely different courses of instruction.

72,470. He did not think the proposal to have a separate college for the whole of India for the Provincial service was a very sound one. The provincial colleges had been growing up to the requirements of the services and it would be a pity to relegate them to a lower status.

72,471. The present system of selection in England might possibly lead to cases in which inferior men came into the service and superior men were rejected. It was quite possible that the fact that a man went to England from Poona and took a good course of instruction for three years did not prove anything except that the training at Cooper's Hill, for instance, was better than the training in Poona.

72,472. (*Mr. Madge.*) It would not be possible to do away with the recruitment of Europeans, and the arguments he had put forward in his written statement as to the advantages gained by employing Indian engineers were not put forward as arguments in favour of abolishing the European element but in favour of the employment of Indians.

72,473. The examiniations he asked for would not be simultaneous in the sense that the same sets of questions would be prescribed, but the standard would be practically equal in every respect. To get over the difficulty which might be caused by the number of successful candidates in one year being larger than the number of vacancies extra recruitment might be made by increasing the cadre.

72,474. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The competitive examination held by the University covered a good deal of practical work, as the practical work done in the college had to be tested at the University examinations. The note books in connection with the laboratory and field work of the students were placed before the examiners. There was no real practical work before appointment such as was to be found at Rurki. The same kind of examination could also be adopted for English recruits, as field work and laboratory work, on the same lines, could be arranged for, both in England and in India. The schools would probably have to modify their courses to suit the requirements of the competitive examination.

72,475. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) The grievance with regard to salary would not be removed if the salaries of European engineers were reduced to the salaries of the Provincial service officers because the service was dissatisfied not only with the disparity of salary but with the lowness of pay. There had been instances in which men had been dissatisfied and left the service for other pursuits and had obtained better income.

72,476. (*Mr. Advani.*) In the granting of foreign allowances care should be taken to see that no anomaly occurred. No difference whatever should be made in the pay of the grades above assistant engineers, because the question of social status and dignity as well as the equality in work and in responsibilities came into greater play when a man reached the Executive Engineer's grade. The best form of foreign allowance would be a percentage of pay.

72,477. (*Mr. Kent.*) Indian students had been to Cooper's Hill and obtained appointments in India and he knew of no restrictions which limited the number of admission of Indian students at Cooper's Hill, though he believed there was latterly a limit in the number of appointments given to them..

(The witness withdrew.)

H. N. Allen, Esq., Principal, College of Engineering, Poona.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,478. **(I.) Method of recruitment.**—The present method of recruiting for the Provincial Service in the Bombay Presidency is, as far as I can judge, satisfactory.

Candidates are recommended by the Principal of this College, and are appointed as Apprentice Engineers.

Selection depends, to a large extent, on the place taken in the Bombay University Examination for the degree of Batchelor of Engineering; but other qualifications are to be taken into consideration by the Principal, in making his recommendations. I have no direct knowledge of the methods used in recruiting for the Imperial Service.

72,479. **(II.) System of training and probation.**—Under Government Memorandum No. 379-E. of 6th March 1908, Apprentice Engineers from this College have to send in monthly notes, on the work done by them, to the Executive Engineer under whom they are working. These are forwarded, through the Superintending Engineer, to this office, are examined and criticized by the members of the College staff, and finally returned through the proper channels to the Apprentice Engineer. We have thus an opportunity of seeing that the practical training is being carried out on satisfactory lines, and that the Apprentice Engineer is profiting by the opportunities given him to obtain practical experience on works, and in the office.

72,480. **(III.) and (IV.) Conditions of service and salary.**—The distinction drawn between Imperial and Provincial Engineers causes, I understand, some dissatisfaction among the latter. Although they hold the same offices as the Imperial Engineers they draw lower pay and, though this may be justified in some cases by the fact that they are able to live more comfortably than a European at less expense, there can be no doubt that it causes a soreness.

The difficulty might, perhaps, be got over by extending the period of Apprenticeship, for members of the Provincial Service, and appointing them as Assistant Engineers, third grade, at such a time as would make their total emoluments, before retiring, much the same as at present.

72,481. **(V.) and (VI.) Conditions of leave and pension.**—I have no information as to the working of the leave and pension rules in this department.

72,482. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans.**—Only one Apprentice Engineer is admitted to the Provincial Service, under the Bombay Government, annually. For many years only Indians have been recommended. Europeans and Anglo-Indians, who wish to study Engineering, as a rule go to the Thomason College, Rurki. As there is generally no very great difference in ability, and other qualifications, between the candidates who, in any one year ,obtain the first two or three places at the University Examination, there is little doubt that this College could supply a larger number of satisfactory Apprentice Engineers than at present. This will certainly be the case when improvements in the College course, introducing a much larger amount of practical work, which are now under consideration, have been carried out.

Several past students of this College have proceeded to England for further study, in the hope of being appointed to the Imperial Service. Two of these have received appointments.

Mr. H. N. Allen, called and examined.

72,483. (*Chairman.*) The witness was Principal of the Engineering College, Poona. He had served at the College during the whole of his service of thirteen years, but had been Principal only for the last three years.

72,484. The nominal qualification for admission to the college was the Previous Examination of the Bombay University, but it was possible to make very careful selection and obtain people who had high mathematical attainments or who had done very well in science. It was also possible to make sure that the English of the candidate was good enough to enable him to understand the courses fully. If a man had been a year in an Arts College and had passed a college examination at the end of the year he was qualified to appear for the engineering examinations.

72,485. A candidate could enter the college at about seventeen but men had entered as high as twenty-two or twenty-three. A man with the Previous Examination certificate might come in at eighteen, one with an Intermediate Arts at nineteen, and a B.A. or B.Sc., at twenty-two.

72,486. The course was for three years but students who wished to compete for the Government appointment of apprentice engineer generally stayed on for a fourth year. There was very keen competition for admission. Fifty students were admitted yearly for the Civil Engineering branch out of some two hundred applicants. Recently the course had been made stiffer and men in the B.E. Course were not getting through quite as fast as formerly. When things were in better running order he expected that about forty would pass through every year. The Advisory Committee of the College was now considering the entire reorganization of the college, separating the course into two, one for engineers, and the other for assistants, and in that case only a comparatively small number would be taken for the engineers' course. At present they were altogether in one class. The engineers would be given a four years' course and much more practical work than they had now. It was not proposed to alter the theoretical part very much, but an extra year would be given in the workshops and the new mechanical engineering laboratory, and it was hoped in that way to turn out a good class of men.

72,487. It very often happened that a subordinate officer had practically the same qualifications as a provincial man and had only failed by a few marks. Under the new régime subordinates would not get the same training, as they would only have a three years' course. The training in future would be better for an upper subordinate than it was now because it would be more practical, but there would be a distinction between that training and the higher training given to provincal man. He was of opinion that recruitment to the Provincial Service should be direct.

72,488. He believed there was room for a college for the higher service in the Bombay Presidency as there were many openings now in Bombay and in the Native States surrounding or dependent on it for engineers apart from Government service. The Mysore Government were endeavouring to make a special arrangment with the Bombay Government to take an increased number of men from their State, and Baroda, Hyderabad, and the Central Provinces also sent their men to the college to be qualified as engineers. The country was too large to have one college for all India. There was room for two colleges or two separate courses taught in the same college, one for engineers and the other for overseers in Bombay as there were many openings for good engineers.

72,489. Candidates for the Provincial Service were recommended by him for appointment and he only recommended for each vacancy.

72,490. With regard to the suggestion in his written statement that the difficulty with regard to pay might be overcome by extending the period of apprenticeship of members of the Provincial Service and by appointing them assistant engineers, he wished now to withdraw that remark because on further consideration he did not think it would be found practicable. He had been told there was a strong feeling in the Provincial Service with regard to the differences in pay.

72,491. He would not go so far as to say that in years to come there would be room for a large increase

of Indians in the Imperial Service, but he had been led to think it would be so from conversations with members standing high in the Public Works Department.

72,492. He had not recently visited any English colleges or any of the other colleges of India, but in a general way he believed that the Poona college was well up to the average of the Indian colleges, and he believed the new syllabus would be as good as any on account of the fact that it was going to be practical.

72,493. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) An apprentice was under probation for one year but he had never known of a man being turned out during this period. That was the only practical work men had before entering the service, except what they did in the college.

72,494. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) There were two Muhammadan students in the college this year but very often there were none at all. There were no special scholarships for Muhammadans. The cost of the college course was between Rs. 400 and Rs. 500 a year, including travelling expenses. Candidates were selected according to their general qualifications. He preferred a man who had passed the Intermediate Science, but a great many who had passed the Intermediate Arts were admitted, and also some who had passed the Previous Examination, or had been only a year in the Arts college, if they were suitable men.

72,495. (*Mr. Madge.*) Europeans and Anglo-Indians as a rule went to Rurki because Rurki had been the best college and had laid itself out for Anglo-Indians. Perhaps Poona was not yet quite up to the Rurki standard.

72,496. Of the forty students who passed out of the college, three obtained guaranteed posts as upper subordinates and three or four entered Government service in other ways; the others went into outside employment.

72,497. The course had been divided chiefly from a consideration of the advantages of special training for the upper subordinates and of a better training for engineers. The four years' course was more expensive and it did not seem fair to put the expense on the shoulders of a subordinate.

72,498. (*Mr. Sly.*) He did not think that admission to the college or to the Provincial Engineering Service was restricted to statutory natives of India.

72,499. The selection of the first man on the list depended entirely on the final examination and not on a record of work throughout the course. The final examination was wholly theoretical except for drawing and the record of work done in the field.

72,500. There was no system in Bombay, as in Madras, of sending the students out for one year for practical training with private firms, and that would not be necessary in Bombay as there were larger openings for people to get their practical training after they had finished their college course.

72,501. (*Chairman.*) He did not think it made very much difference whether the marks were given on the final examination or on examinations throughout the general work of the course. As a matter of fact he believed that a very good man was obtained on the results of the final examination.

(The witness withdrew.)

At Bombay, Monday, 23rd February, 1914.

PRESENT:

The Right Hon. the LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

The Earl of Ronaldshay, M.P.
Sir Murray Hammick, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
Sir Theodore Morison, K.C.I.E.
Sir Valentine Chirol.
Mahadev Bhaskar Chaubal, Esq., C.S.I.
Abdur Rahim, Esq.
Walter Culley Madge, Esq., C.I.E.
Frank George Sly, Esq., C.S.I.

Herbert Albert Laurens Fisher, Esq.

and the following Assistant Commissioners:—

C. C. S. Clark, Esq., Secretary, Public Works Department, Central Provinces.
J. M. Vachha, Esq., Executive Engineer, Central Provinces.
R. J. Kent, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Bombay.
J. H. Advani, Esq., Executive Engineer, Bombay.

R. R. Scott, Esq. (*Joint Secretary*).

H. B. Learoyd, Esq., Executive Engineer, Central Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department, being a Memorandum of the views of a Meeting of the Civil Engineers Association held at Nagpur, Central Provinces, on the 27th July* 1913.

72,502. **(I.) Method of recruitment.**—[i] The present system of recruitment in England only is generally considered satisfactory. There is a disadvantage in recruiting Indians in England as it is not always the most suitable candidates who are willing and can afford to go to England. It is not considered that any particular proportion of Indians should be appointed in any one year. Selection should be left entirely to the Committee if composed as in paragraph 4.

[ii] One year's practical experience on works in Europe and some knowledge of accounts should be insisted on.

[iii] Only degrees which are recognised by the Institute of Civil Engineers as qualifying for their Associate Membership should be accepted.

[iv] The Selection Committee should consist of—

(*a*) A retired Lieutenant-Governor or Chief Commissioner as President.

(*b*) An eminent Engineer with considerable experience in England, preferably a past President of the Institute of Civil Engineers.

(*c*) An eminent Principal or Professor of an Engineering College of high standing in England.

(*d*) Two retired Engineers of the Indian Public Works Department, one of these to be a retired Indian Engineer.

(*e*) Two Indian Public Works Department Engineers actually in service, selected from the men who are at home on leave each year.

* Members of the Civil Engineers Association who were present at the meeting:—Messrs. R. H. Tickell, C. C. S. Clark, W. B. Starky, J. D. Thomson, E. A. Lugard, G. A. Phear, E. S. L. Beddy, A. Davison, A. E. Joyce, A. R. Pollard, P. Davies, G. S. Sneyd, and G. H. Forrest.

[v] The maximum age should not exceed 24 years.

[vi] Should the Government of India desire to appoint on the permanent scale any Temporary Engineer in its employ, it would, it is considered, not be unfair to all concerned that he should be brought into the service at such rate of pay as the Government shall deem proper in each case, and that he should receive increments in the same manner as an Engineer who has joined the service in the prescribed manner. Since the incremental scale of pay has been brought in, this would inflict little or no hardship on those already in the Department. The only chance of hardship would be if an officiating appointment were given to a Temporary Engineer, so appointed, to the exclusion of one who was on the permanent scale before he was appointed. Such cases would, however, be vary rare, unless the number of temporary men, so brought in, was unduly high. The employment of Temporary Engineers should be reduced to a minimum, as in many cases they hold Divisional charges, in which qualified Assistant Engineers would otherwise be officiating. Moreover it creates a discontented class of men, who have a very real grievance, in that whilst doing the same work as permanent Engineers, they draw no extra pay, and have very precarious prospects. It is also thought that no temporary man appointed in the manner prescribed above should ordinarily be given administrative rank before those who were in permanent employ before he was appointed, nor until he himself has put in at least 20 years' permanent service; in fact he should not ordinarily be allowed to attain administrative rank at all. This would prevent any feeling of discontent among those who have entered the service in the regular manner.

Royal Engineers should only count their service from the time they join the Department, whatever their military rank.

72,503. **(II.) System of training and probation.**—(i) The most suitable age for a young officer to arrive in India is 21 to 23 years.

(ii) On first arrival, it is desirable that a recruit should be posted to some station of considerable size, where he will have a certain amount of social amenities, and meet men of all ages. He would thus not become narrow-minded or discontented at the outset of his career; would not get an exaggerated idea of his own importance, but get a certain amount of polish.

(iii) It is felt that the present system of Departmental Examination is sufficient, and that Engineers appointed in England attain to an adequate proficiency in the Indian languages. The examination in reading native accounts might well be dispensed with, as the figures can be learned in a short lesson, and are afterwards soon forgotten.

(iv) The opinion of the meeting was strongly against any form of probation. No other department of the Government of India requires recruits appointed by the Secretary of State in England to undergo a period of probation. A proportion of bad bargains in every Department is inevitable. Really bad bargains can be got rid of under code rules if necessary.

72,504. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—(i) It is desirable that the Engineers of the Department be constituted into a service under some such name as "Imperial Engineers" (I.E.). The term Public Works Department is used by both subordinates and clerks, and consequently cannot be held to distinguish an Engineering Officer. This would only be following the lead set by other Departments, such as the Medical and Forest Services. It is felt that the table of precedence should be revised, so as to give Engineer officers an official status more in keeping with their importance to the prosperity of India.

(ii) All officers should be compelled to retire on attaining the age of 55 years without exception. The relaxation of this rule in recent cases has led to a large amount of discontent.

(iii) The rule which lays down that a Chief Engineer should not ordinarily be allowed to hold the same post for more than five years should allow of no exceptions.

(iv) The cadre should be arranged so that everyone can have furlough or privilege leave whenever it is due to him. Local Governments should be asked to frame their cadres 5 years in advance and keep them up to date year by year.

(v) An officer transferred from one station to another should be reimbursed the whole of his actual expenses incurred in transporting himself and his family, servants and belongings. Under the present rules, men with families are often severely crippled by the heavy expenses of a transfer. Some officers consider that this hardship could be best remedied by giving each officer on transfer a breaking-up house allowance equal to half a month's pay, in addition to the ordinary travelling allowances due under existing rules.

The present travelling allowances are far too low. They are based on prices as existing in India 50 years ago, when a cart could be obtained for Rs. 12 per month. They are with difficulty now obtained for Rs. 30 per month and the daily rate is usually Rs. 1-4-0. For road journeys the rate should be raised at least 50 per cent. and mileage should be drawn as soon as the number of miles travelled exceeds the equivalent of the daily allowance. For ordinary journeys by rail the present allowance is sufficient.

72,505. **(IV.) Conditions of salary.**—(i) The system of annual increments in salary meets with general approval.

(ii) Although salaries have recently been increased, it has to be borne in mind that the pay of Engineers is actually less in English money than was the case when Cooper's Hill was founded.

At the time Cooper's Hill was first founded the scale of pay for the rank and file of Imperial Engineers was fixed at—Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade, Rs. 350 up to Executive Engineer, 1st grade, Rs. 900, per mensem.

At that time these sums, respectively, represented £420 and £1,080 per annum. Even in 1883, when the rupee stood at one shilling and eight pence, they represented £350 and £900.

The pay of the newly joined Imperial Assistant is now Rs. 380 and of the Senior Executive Engineer Rs. 1,250 corresponding at the present rate of exchange to £304 and £1,000 per annum. But from these sums there are deductions on account of income-tax, which were not imposed until about 1885. The pay now, after deduction, amounts to only £296 and £974, respectively. Thus the pay given now, when measured by English money, is actually less than was considered fair 40 years ago. And in the case of newly joined Assistants less than they received 30 years ago, although it is admitted on all sides that the cost of living in India has nearly doubled.

Hence it would appear that when the salaries of the Public Works Department were readjusted they should have been raised to a level which would represent in English currency 50 per cent. more than they did when Cooper's Hill College was first founded.

As salaries have been so recently raised (in rupees, not in pounds) it would of course be useless to ask for any further increase now, but the above is pointed out in support of the recent memorials submitted for increased pensions.

(iii) The rule introduced in the Government of India's Resolution of the 15th May 1912 by which an officer cannot draw more than Rs. 800 per month under the system of annual increments till he is appointed to a Divisional charge, will bear very hardly on some officers, and should certainly be rescinded in the case of those officers who are reported on as fit for a Divisional charge. It is not right that the annual increments of an efficient officer, who is reported on as fully qualified for a Divisional charge, should be stopped, not on account of any fault of his own, but solely due to erratic recruitment.

(iv) Similarly, many Executive Engineers, reported on as fully qualified for administrative rank, will be unduly held back at Rs. 1,250 per month, merely because of errors in recruitment. There is a strong feeling that Executive Engineers, who are certified as fit for administrative posts, should have their pay increased beyond Rs. 1,250 per month by annual increments of Rs. 50 per month up to a maximum of Rs. 1,500 which they would thus attain after a minimum of 24 years' approved service.

(v) Promotion to Chief Engineer, 1st Class, becomes so badly blocked at present, that many specially deserving officers never obtain a chance of promotion to the higher rate of pay. It is felt that there should be only two classes of Superintending Engineer and one class of Chief Engineer, as for Commissioners of a Division in the Indian Civil Service.

The rates of pay of administrative ranks should be—

Engineers whether appointed in *England or not*—

	Per month. Rs.
Superintending Engineer, 2nd Class ...	1,750
Do. do. 1st Class ...	2,000
Chief Engineer	3,000

and a Secretary to a Local Government or Administration should get a local allowance of Rs. 250 in addition, as at present. The number of Superintending Engineers in the 1st Class should be the same as in the 2nd Class.

The pay of a Chief Engineer is often compared to that of a Commissioner. This is not a fair comparison as Commissioners can rise to higher posts and Chief Engineers have the charge of a large department.

72,506. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—(i) The amount of leave allowed under the existing rules is generally considered sufficient, but it is sorely felt that it is impossible to take as much furlough as is desirable for proper health, owing to the smallness of the furlough allowances. The present allowance is barely a subsistence allowance for a junior officer, and leaves no margin for expenditure in attending professional lectures or visiting Engineering works. An officer, who is keen on improving his professional qualifications and bringing his knowledge up to date in European practice, is thus discouraged. At present the most junior Royal Engineer Officer in the Department gets a leave allowance, which a Civil Engineer can only hope to reach after eighteen years' service.

It is unanimously urged that the leave allowances should be revised so that an officer on furlough or special leave will draw half his substantive salary, subject to a minimum of £500 a year.

(ii) The opinion is also strongly expressed that it should be open to every officer to take all the privilege leave which he has earned, at any time during his service, when he can be spared. It is unjustifiable that an officer should be penalised because he cannot be spared, or because, in his keenness for his work, he may prefer to see his job through instead of applying for leave when three months' happen to be due to him. Privilege leave once earned is as much due as an officer's pay, and the rules should be framed in such a manner that it can never be lost to him.

(iii) Furlough cannot be taken till an interval of not less than 18 months has elapsed since last return from privilege leave of over six weeks' duration. This rule should be relaxed, as it discourages an officer from taking privilege leave in India, when it may be very necessary for his proper health.

(iv) A proposal which is unanimously urged is that an officer on furlough should be allowed to draw double furlough allowances for half the period of furlough which is due to him. For instance, that an officer with twenty months' furlough due to him should be allowed to take ten months' furlough on double the ordinary furlough allowances, and end up with no balance of furlough due to him, or to take any less period, say, six months, on double the ordinary furlough allowances, and end up with a balance of eight months (twenty months less twice six months) still to his credit.

He should also be allowed to take leave of any kind without restriction whenever he can be spared.

(v) It is felt that no useful purpose is served by the rule which lays down that an officer must have rendered eight years' active service before he can be granted furlough. It would be in the interests of the service to give a junior officer an opportunity of recruiting his health, or of renewing his acquaintance with the progress of his profession, by allowing him to take furlough after four years' active service.

(vi) Similarly, it is felt that private employment during furlough should not be prohibited, as it would give a keen officer an opportunity of gaining experience to the interests of the service.

(vii) Opinion is unanimous that the rules for the grant of study leave to officers of Scientific and Technical Departments should be extended to officers of the Public Works Department. Engineering is a progressive science, and it would be to the advantage of Government if officers were allowed periods of study in order to keep abreast of modern developments.

72,507. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—[i] The greatest grievance of the Department, and one which is sorely felt, is the totally inadequate pension to which officers become entitled on retirement under existing rules. The present pensions are actually less than they were forty years ago, and when the higher qualifications now required from men joining the service, and the general rise in the cost of living are taken into consideration, they compare still more unfavourably than the actual figures indicate. It is strongly urged that the memorials on this subject, recently submitted by a large majority of the officers of the Imperial Service, should receive early and favourable consideration. Numerous memorials on this subject have been submitted during the last six years, and the delay in the issue of final orders on the case has given rise to a considerable amount of discontent.

The Engineer appointed in England is expected to live in the same style as the Royal Engineer and the Doctor, and there is no reason why he should be able, on retirement, to arrange his home menage on a more economical scale than they. He claims equal treatment from Government in the way of pension.

[ii] Article 4 of the Civil Service Regulations lays down that an officer's claim to pension is regulated by the rules in force when he retires. In view of the delay in the issue of final orders on the memorials already submitted, it is urged that this rule should be held in abeyance in the case of those men who are compulsorily retired before final orders are issued.

[iii] The scale of invalid pensions is meaningless at present owing to the absurdly low maxima limits prescribed, and opinion is unanimous that the maxima limits, as laid down in Article 641, should be revised to agree with those shown in Article 474 of the Civil Service Regulations.

[iv] A large majority of the Engineers appointed in England consider that a family pension scheme should be started, and that Government should bear a portion of the cost. Pension has been officially laid down to be deferred remuneration, and consequently it is clearly the duty of Government to reimburse this deferred remuneration to his family in all cases when an officer dies before he has drawn it all in the shape of pension. The majority of men are willing to contribute $6\frac{1}{2}$ per cent. of their salaries towards a Family Pensions Fund, and it is felt that Government should also contribute an equal amount. With this datum, the amount of family pensions, payable in the event of an officer dying, shall be worked out on an actuarial basis, allowing 5 per cent. per annum compound interest. Bachelors would subscribe at the same rate as married officers with families, and as a set-off they might be allowed to make voluntary subscriptions to a Provident Fund, and receive 5 per cent. compound interest thereon. An alternative suggestion is made that Government should start pensions for families on the same lines as those at present in force for the Civil Service.

[v] Other departments might be communicated with to take similar action with regard to pensions.

72,508. **(VII.) Division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—(i) It is undesirable to lay down definitely that certain fixed Divisional charges, or even a fixed proportion of Divisional charges, should be reserved for Provincial Engineers, as laid down in the Government of India Resolution of the 24th April, 1908. Provincial Service Engineers, being borne on the same list as Imperial Service Engineers, the appointments to Divisional charges should be by section only.

(ii) It is felt that, in the interests of efficiency, the proportion of the imported Engineers in the service should be for the present not less than 66 per cent.

(iii) It is considered that the Imperial and Provincial Services should be borne on separate lists as

in practically all other Departments until such time as members of the Provincial Service attain administrative rank, when they will be borne on the Imperial list.

Supplementary Memorandum by Mr. H. B. Learoyd.

72,509. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans.**—Under the present system, the Imperial Service is recruited only in England and the Provincial Service entirely in India. Non-Europeans, practically speaking, can only enter the Provincial Service. As a matter of fact during the 18 months from January, 1911, to June, 1912, 13 European Imperial Engineers were appointed in England and one non-European. As the Provincial Service is open to non-Europeans it does not seem desirable to alter this, especially as it is possible for a non-European to be appointed in England to the Imperial branch. There is no distinction between the Provincial and Imperial Services except in the matter of pay, and it is felt that statutory natives of India employed in their own country and under climatic conditions, to which they have been accustomed from their youth, should not draw the same pay as Englishmen appointed by the Secretary of State who have to work in a foreign land far removed from their relatives and friends, whom they can only visit at rare intervals at great expense, and in a climate notoriously trying to their constitutions.

72,510. **(VIII.) Relations of the service with the Indian Civil Service and other services.**—The relations of the service with the other services are generally satisfactory. It is felt that the Pubic Works should be a service in reality and not a Department. There is perhaps a tendency to rank Subordinate officers of the Department below subordinate officers of other Departments. For instance, an "Upper Subordinate" of the Public Works Department drawing a salary of Rs. 400 a month has neither the standing nor the dignity of an Extra-Assistant Commissioner drawing less pay. The one is a "Subordinate" and the other an "Officer."

MR. H. B. LEAROYD, called and examined.

72,511. (*Chairman.*) The witness, an Executive Engineer of the Jubbulpore Division, represented the Imperial Engineers of the Central Provinces and had been in the service for sixteen and a half years.

72,512. The present system of recruitment was generally considered satisfactory. There was no objection to the ten per cent. of Indians now recruited in England being recruited in India, but unless there was a residential college in India probably the present form of recruitment was the best that could be obtained.

72,513. He was in favour of two distinct branches: Imperial Engineers recruited in England and a Provincial Service recruited in India. The indigenous engineer ought not to be quite on the same lines as the imported engineer. He would not object to the Imperial and Provincial Services being abolished if appointments were made by selection to the higher posts and the difference in pay now obtaining between the services were continued. The European serving in India should be granted something in the shape of a foreign allowance. There was some dissatisfaction in the ranks of the Provincial Service. The Provincial Service officers were doing practically the same work as the Imperial officers, and he would be prepared to extinguish any anomalies that might exist provided there was a differentiation of pay between the foreign recruited officer and the officer recruited in India.

72,514. There were twenty-eight temporary engineers in the Central Provinces, and if any were taken into the permanent cadre they should be brought in at the bottom of the list. The same principle should be applied to the Royal Engineer. At present the Royal Engineer was allowed to count as much as two and a half years of his Royal Engineer Service and this brought him in senior to men of the same age than himself. There were five Royal Engineers at present in the service, but none had been recruited for a long time. Some of the temporary engineers might be regarded as more or less permanent men. Most of them were employed on irrigation works and buildings and roads, both in maintenance and construction.

72,515. A good deal of constructional work on roads in the Central Provinces was done by contract under the supervision of the department, but the department had to prepare all the estimates and measure up the work. The contracts were not the same as contracts in England, and no work was done by contract in that way.

72,516. He objected to a probationary period as it did not give a man security when he first came into the service. If a man proved unworthy there were always means by which he could be got rid of. A probationary period might affect recruitment, as a man would probably object to entering a service and being sent out to India on the understanding that if he was not suitable he would be sent back after a year.

72,517. All officers should be compelled to retire on attaining the age of fifty-five. There should be no exception even in the interests of the service, because extensions pressed very hard on other men. If there was any question as to men being suitable for employment at that age he would rather raise the age of retirement than have an exception to any rule.

72,518. With reference to the suggestion that an officer on furlough should draw half his substantive salary, subject to a minimum of £500 a year, it might very well happen that sometimes an officer would be receiving higher pay on leave than when on duty, but that frequently happened in other services, especially in the I.C.S., where an officer early in his service received more pay on leave than when working. He would not press absolutely for £500 a year, but there should be a minimum, as an officer who was forced to take leave on medical certificate in the first year or two of his service did not receive a living wage. He would not press for the adoption of any principle which enabled an officer to receive more pay on furlough than on duty. A good many officers were in favour of drawing double allowance for half the period of furlough, but personally he was not in favour of it, as it was possible that an officer at the end of twenty years would have taken far more furlough than he ordinarily would and it would count against his pension; it would also result sometimes in an officer on furlough receiving more than an officer on deputation.

72,519. The officers asked for improvements in salary, for a considerable increase in pension, and for a family pension fund to which Government subscribed. They did not press for an increase in pay as Government had given an incremental scale in 1908. What they desired most was an improvement in the pensions.

72,520. Increases in the cadre were required for permanent work. He knew nothing about the irrigation branch, but for work on roads and buildings the department was understaffed. The expenditure on works taken in hand during the last six or seven years was far more than before, and at present Assistants were doing Executive Engineers work and sub-divisions were being held by subordinates. A good deal of work had to be done in connection with estimates, and if contractors were employed a large staff would not be needed; but he did not think it was practical in the Central Provinces to employ contractors, because there were no large firms, and he doubted whether the Bombay and Calcutta firms would take up the construction of bridges or roads in the Central Provinces. Firms would tender for the supply of girders, but would not erect them. If they could be promised works amounting to some lakhs of rupees in some fixed centre they might be prepared to take contracts up, but at present the amount of work was very small and the work itself was very scattered.

72,521. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) If the ten per cent. rule for the recruitment of Indians in England still continued probably Indians so recruited would have to be given the foreign allowance. It would be

awkward to have Indians recruited in England drawing the allowance and doing the same work as Indians recruited in India, but he did not see how it could be avoided.

72,522. He did not think that the payment of passages, to England and back would in any sense be equivalent to the grant of more pay on furlough. It would be much better to have a fixed minimum furlough allowance. The difficulty of an officer using up his furlough might possibly be met by only allowing him to commute up to six months, and it was no doubt better to have a number of short furloughs than a few long ones.

72,523. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) If the State considered it absolutely necessary in the public interest to keep a man on after the age of fifty-five he should be retained as additional to the cadre, but even then he would block promotion by holding a post which another officer ought to have. No doubt the State had full value out of a man by the time he had reached fifty-five.

72,524. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) If a Superintending Engineer was kept on after fifty-five outside the cadre it would mean doubling the establishment.

72,525. There was dissatisfaction among provincial men with regard to the disparity of pay, and he did not see why that dissatisfaction should not be removed by granting the extra pay to the English recruited men in the shape of a foreign allowance. It was simply changing the designation, but he could not see why provincial engineers should object to it. Foreign imported labour was always paid more than indigenous labour. A Civil Engineer, doing exactly the same work as a Royal Engineer, received less than the Royal Engineer, though the difference in the pay was not so great as it was between the Imperial and Provincial Services.

72,526. (*Mr. Madge.*) Recruitment might be affected by a period of probation in India. It might happen that a man on coming out would find he was not fitted for the work and wished to go away, and in that case a period of probation would be of value.

72,527. Local Governments should calculate the recruits they required up to five years ahead and recruit accordingly, and he believed the principle of anticipating vacancies had been urged by the department.

72,528. He did not know very much about the supervision of contracts in England, but the supervision in India on the part of the department was very strict. The department prepared designs and estimates and supervised the work very carefully. He did not think a contract on the basis of an English contract would ever be possible in the Central Provinces.

72,529. The cost of living had increased largely in India and the pay of to-day was less than the pay of forty years ago.

72,530. (*Mr. Fisher.*) Twenty-four was the best age for men coming out to India; by that time students in the Universities in England would have obtained their academic training, though perhaps they would not have had any practical experience. He attached some importance to practical experience on works, which might now be given in India as there were a number of large works in the country. A man would get just as valuable experience on a project like the Sara Bridge as he would in England. He would not lay down any hard and fast rule that a man should have practical experience in England.

72,531. He did not favour a competitive examination for entry to the Imperial Service. There should be certainly some element of selection, but that selection might come before or after the examination.

72,532. The posting of recruits to a station of considerable size would not involve expense as some of the smaller stations were more expensive than the large stations, and a recruit had far more chance of seeing large works in the bigger stations.

72,533. In the Central Provinces most of the work was done by comparatively small contracts. He himself spent about seven lakhs a year on works, but the money was not expended on a given work in a given year; there was one large work going on now the total expenditure on which would be about seven lakhs, but only about two lakhs was being spent in the present year.

72,534. (*Mr. Sly.*) He was afraid he could not say anything that would justify the recommendation that when an Indian became a Superintending Engineer he should have the same pay as the Imperial Engineer.

72,535. While he was in favour of permitting an officer to take up private work during furlough in England he was not in favour of allowing that course when furlough was taken in India. One of the reasons for suggesting private employment in England was that the furlough allowances were so small that a man might be allowed to add to them, and another reason was that in private employment he could obtain some special knowledge that would be of value to his work in India. Study leave would not meet the second point as no allowances were paid beyond bare railway-fares.

72,536. In the Central Provinces direct recruits to the Provincial Service were appointed from Rurki; there had been cases of appointments from the subordinate service but that was not general, and they had been generally appointed towards the end of their service. He preferred the young, direct recruit, as the promoted man was hardly the class of man required. A period of service in the subordinate ranks was not a good form of training for the Provincial Service.

72,537. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The value of selection was that it brought to light qualities that were not discoverable by examination. A man might be an excellent engineer but a very bad executive officer. The qualities which an engineering officer should possess might very well be ascertained by a selecting board before an examination, and he would have no objection to the selection of candidates before the examination.

72,538. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) An Englishman who was serving in a foreign country, far from his friends, his associations, and his home, and had to send his children to England to be educated, naturally deserved something in the shape of foreign allowance. On the supposition that the Commission would recommend that the salaries in the Imperial branch should be raised by 25 per cent. on condition that the Indians in the Provincial Service also received the same pay, naturally the officers would prefer the 25 per cent. rather than remain on the present scale. *Qua* service it did not affect the officers whether the Indians were paid the same or not. The only ground on which it could be advocated that Indians should be paid less was that of the general financial interests of the State, that it was unnecessary to pay them more because they could be obtained for less, but that had nothing to do with the Englishmen in the service. The Imperial officers were not asking for a rise of pay; what they claimed was that if the Provincial pay was raised the Imperial Service should have a rise also.

72,539. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The Englishman in India paid taxes and he therefore had a certain interest in the economical administration of the various Public services.

72,540. A man could take furlough at the end of eight years when he would be drawing Rs. 660 and his furlough allowance would be half the average salary of the past three years, and in a way that was really a minimum furlough allowance. The point really was not that there was not a minimum, but that the minimum was not high enough. There was, however, no minimum for furlough on medical ceritificate, although the furlough counted for pension.

72,541. (*Mr. Clark.*) It was not possible for the class of contractors found in the Central Provinces to prepare estimates and drawings. The chief requirement in the Central Provinces was a permanent engineering staff. The sanctioned cadre was now forty-eight, including three for Central India, and the Central Provinces Government in their memorandum on the Public Works Department stated that sixteen additional officers were required besides a proportionate number of subordinate staff. Applications

had been made to the Government of India for more permanent engineers, but the increase had not been sanctioned. It was very important that the application should receive early attention.

72,542. (*Mr. Vachha.*) He did not know what the proportion of Indians at present in the service was, but he did not think there were too many in the cadre. He desired to recruit the Imperial Service in England because higher educational qualifications could be secured there. If it were possible to get in India public schools run on exactly the same lines as those in England he would be quite prepared to have recruitment in India.

72,543. The fact that European engineers appointed in India held a larger proportion of higher posts than European engineers appointed in England might be explained by the fact that Rurki was opened before Cooper's Hill and more Rurki men were appointed in earlier days.

72,544. Royal Engineers received more pay than Civil Engineers as they started on Rs. 420 as against Rs. 380.

72,545. There was no particular objection to men entering at the age of twenty-five, but twenty-four was a good age and would give a man thirty-one years' service.

(The witness withdrew.)

J. H. Sharpe, Esq., Executive Engineer, Central Provinces.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,546. *INTRODUCTORY.*—"The Provincial Engineer Service," as it is now termed, is a misnomer. It is in reality an integral part of the Imperial Service, with the sole difference that it is recruited in India. It has not come into existence as something new in the same way as the other Provincial Services of India; it has sprung out of an older service which originally constituted the Imperial organisation of the Public Works Service. That Service, indeed, represents Indian training and experience of half a century during which period its members, whether recruited in England or in India, were welded together in close union and their united hands guided from inception to fruition works of magnitude and importance such as were never before chronicled in India or even out of it. The achievements of the products of Indian Colleges of the past have naturally stimulated the efforts and ambitions of the later products of the present day; and to those efforts and ambitions must be attributed the persistent appeal for special treatment with which the Government of India have been approached in recent years.

The speeches of Sir William Muir of November, 1873, and of Sir Antony MacDonnell of November, 1900, extracts from which have figured so largely in the Memorials submitted by the Provincial Service Engineers, have brought into prominence the fact that the Rurki College of India has been recognised as one which imparts instruction, both theoretical and practical, up to the standard of any similar institution in Europe, and that the late Cooper's Hill College was never intended to affect in any degree the relations of the Government of India with the former Seminary. The Government of India Resolution No. 2112-G of 1892, introducing the Provincial Engineer Service, moreover, declared that except in the matter of pay, leave, and pension, "there shall be no distinction between the members of this service and those of the Imperial Service." Its members, unlike the members of the recently created Provincial Services of other Departments, perform the same duties and rise to the same positions as their Imperial confrères; and yet they draw reduced pay and emoluments exactly in the same way as the other Provincial Services.

The main problem before the Public Services Commission is—how to reconstitute the Imperial and Provincial Services of the Public Works Department so as to restore to the Indian recruited Engineers their original status and prestige and at the same time to bring the Provincial Branch of the Public Works Department into line with the Provincial Branches of other Departments. In order to arrive at a proper solution of this problem I would respectfully entreat the Royal Commission to accord full and sympathetic consideration to the methods of recruitment, system of training, and conditions of service suggested in the enclosed Memorandum. The Memorandum gives expression to the unanimous opinions of not only the so-called "Provincial" Engineers, but also the "Imperial" Indian Engineers of these Provinces, whether recruited in England or in India. In order to indicate how widely these views are shared by Indian Engineers I beg leave to give below the names* of the officers who have accepted the Written Statement herewith submitted.

72,547. **(I.) Methods of recruitment.**—It is desirable that all superior services should as far as possible, be modelled on the same lines as regards modes of recruitment, salaries, pensions, &c. (*vide* Main Head VIII). The superior service of the Public Works Department may be divided into two branches:—(A) *Imperial* for the higher executive and administrative appointments corresponding to the Covenanted Civil Service; and (B) *Provincial* for all the other executive appointments corresponding to the Provincial Civil Service.

The method of recruitment should be as described below.

A.—Imperial Service.—(i) The Imperial Engineers will be recruited partly in India and partly in England in the proportion of 2 to 1, that is to say, two-thirds of the number of vacancies in every year will be filled by recruitment in India and one-third in England. From the last Government of India Classified List (corrected up to 30—6—12) it would appear that out of a total of 203 Engineers recruited in India, 100 are Europeans and 103 Indians. There is no likelihood of Indians swamping the Department as the proportion of Indians and Europeans among the local recruits will be about equal and the total European element in the Imperial Service, including European officers drawn from England as well as those drawn from India, will always remain at a very high level.

(ii) The recruitment will be by means of an open competitive examination, which has always been the rule in the Indian Colleges and which was also the rule in the Cooper's Hill College for many years. There should be no nomination or selection in any form. Every candidate must produce certificates to show that he belongs to a respectable family and that he bears a good moral character.

(iii) There should be certain recognised Engineering Colleges and Universities in Great Britain and Ireland and in the Colonies, graduates or superior diploma holders from which (provided they are His Majesty's subjects) may be admitted to an open competitive examination held in London every year. Appointments will be made in the order of merit from the successful candidates to the extent of the number of vacancies during the year.

(iv) Similarly there should be certain recognised Colleges in India, graduates from which (including

* Indian Engineers recruited in England: Mr. A. B. Madappa Executive Engineer, Karun Division. European Engineers recruited in India. Mr. J. H. Sharpe, Executive Engineer, Hoshangabad Division. Indian Engineers recruited in India: (*a*) *Imperial*—Mr. R. Mitra, Superintending Engineer, Second Circle, Central Provinces: Mr. P. C. Lall, Executive Engineer, East Berar Division; Mr. J. M. Vachha Executive Engineer, Eastern Division; Mr. J. M. Ray Executive Engineer, Bhandara Division; Mr. M. Ramaya, Executive Engineer, Chanda Division; Mr. N. N. Mukerjee, Executive Engineer, Mahanaddy Division. (*b*) *Provincial*—Mr. B. C. Dube, Executive Engineer, Akola; Rai Sahib Prayagdas, Assistant Engineer, Balaghat; Mr. H. R. Tandan, Officiating Executive Engineer, Mandla Division; Mr. Sunderlal, Assistant Engineer, Jubbulpore; Rai Sahib Purshottam Razu, Officiating Executive Engineer, Yeotmal; Mr. Kanewarlal Jhanji, Assistant Engineer. (*c*) *Temporary Engineers*—Messrs. M. S. Murzaban, Shivadasani, Chowa Lal Pradhan, G. B. Chandiramani, N. C. Bhattacharya, and Jhandamal and Rai Sahib S. N. Bhaduri.

subjects of Native States) may be admitted to an All-India open competitive examination held in Delhi every year. Appointments will be made from the successful candidates in the order of merit to the extent of the number of vacancies during the year.

(v) The examinations held in London and in Delhi need not be simultaneous; the standards of both the examinations must be identical and they should be held about the same time. This will practically be a revival, in a modified form, of the old system of recruitment from Cooper's Hill and Rurki.

(vi) The age of the candidates should be not below 23 and not above 25. Those recruited in India will be made to serve a probationary period of two years in England and those recruited in England will serve a similar probationary period, partly in England and partly in India. This point is more fully dealt with in paragraph 72,548.

B.—Provincial Service.—(i) Provincial Engineers should be wholly recruited in India. Each Government will recruit direct from the Engineering College within the Province, or, in the absence of a local College, from the Engineering Colleges in the neighbouring Provinces, to which local students may be encouraged to go with a view to compete for the Public Works Services. Appointments should be made in the order of merit from the successful Engineering graduates to the extent of the number of vacancies during the year.

(ii) In order to give an opportunity to the successful candidates of the year to compete in the examination for the Imperial Service, the Provincial recruitment will take place after the results of the former examination are declared.

(iii) The Provincial Engineers will be placed on the same footing as the Provincial officers of other Departments and will be styled Extra-Assistant Engineers, similar to the Extra-Assistant Commissioners and Extra-Assistant Conservators of Forests. The present grades of Sub-Engineers in the Public Works Department will be entirely abolished and will merge into the class of Extra-Assistant Engineers.

General.—Any medical examination or other test which may be deemed necessary in order to ensure the fitness of a candidate for the Public Works Services must be held prior to the competitive examinations, after which there should be no further disqualification.

There will be no promotion from the Provincial Branch to the Imperial Branch; nor is there any necessity of having "Listed Posts" for the Provincial men, as they are not ordinarily intended to hold the higher executive charge of Divisions. In exceptional cases men from the subordinate ranks (Supervisors) may be promoted to Extra-Assistant Engineers, in the same way as exceptionally good Tahsildars are occasionlly promoted to Extra-Assistant Commissioners. Such promotion, however, should be an exception and not the rule.

There should be no class or race representation in the Public Works Services, Imperial or Provincial. If in the view of Government there are any backward classes whose advancement ought to be accelerated, special facilities in the way of scholarships may be given to them at the various stages of their education in order to enable them to qualify themselves for the Public Works Services in due course.

The constitution of the Public Works Services outlined above may be summarised thus:—

A.—*Imperial Service.*

(*a*) Imperial Engineers recruited by open competition in India.

(*b*) Imperial Engineers recruited by open competition in England.

B.—*Provincial Service.*

(*a*) Extra-Assistant Engineers recruited by open competition from the Engineering Colleges.

(*b*) Extra-Assistant Engineers promoted (in exceptional cases) from the subordinate ranks (Supervisors).

Absorption of the members of the present Provincial Service.—In the event of the above scheme being adopted, the officers of the existing Provincial Service should be placed under Class A, as they are already listed with the Imperial Engineers, their pay being two-thirds of the pay of the Imperial Engineers. The distinction in pay should vanish on these officers attaining to the executive ranks. The selection of an officer for the assumption of the higher executive charge of a Division must be regarded as a sure test of his equality with the Imperial officers. An officer so selected has to move freely among the District and Divisional officers and it is in the highest degree desirable in the interests of public service that he should receive the same pay and emoluments as an Imperial Engineer, so as to be able to maintain his dignity as the principal officer of the Public Works Department in the Division filling a high post of trust and responsibility.

Temporary Engineers may be recruited from qualified Engineering graduates, only in exceptional cases when the permanent staff is unable to cope with any sudden rush of work. They should be employed only in positions held by Extra-Assistant Engineers and in no case should they be put in charge of Divisions. In cases of emergency Divisional charges may be temporarily held by Extra-Assistant Engineers, but not by Temporary Engineers. As a rule Temporary Engineers should not be kept in service longer than five years, within which period it should be possible to strengthen the permanent service suitably so as to meet the permanent growth of work, if any, in the Department. Should at the present moment there be any Temporary Engineers who are qualified Engineering graduates or superior diploma holders and have now been working continuously for over ten years, and who in the opinion of Government are fit to be made permanent, they may be brought on the list of Extra-Assistant Engineers before new recruits are admitted.

There should be no limitation upon the employment of Temporary Engineers chargeable to Works, so long as the main provisions of the Public Works Department Code, Vol. I, paragraphs 795 and 796, are fulfilled. This will not add to the Establishment charges, Permanent or Temporary. Any expenditure on this head will be met from Works, and its existence, continuance, growth and cessation will entirely depend upon the works themselves.

72,548. **(II.) System of training and probation.**—As already stated the Imperial Engineers, after appointment, will undergo a course of practical training for two years on some large construction works. Those recruited in India will spend the whole period of their training in England and those recruited in England will spend the first year in England and the second year in India. The training in England will be conducted by a stipendiary Superintendent appointed by the Secretary of State, who will act under the Advisory Board consisting of one of the Indian members of the Indian Council as President and three members (all appointed by, and receiving an honorarium from, the Secretary of State) as follows:—

(1) One member of the Council of the Institution of Civil Engineers.

(2) One retired Engineer officer of the Public Works Department not below the rank of Superintending Engineer, and

(3) One Engineer officer of the Public Works Department of not less than 15 years' service on long leave in England.

The Superintendent will arrange to article each recruit under a professional Engineer, who will afford him every opportunity of training himself on large construction works.

The training in India for the English recruit will be arranged by the Chief Engineer of the Province to which he may be posted. It would be desirable to place him, if possible, in the hands of superior Indian Officers (Superintending Engineer and Senior Executive Engineer) so that he may work amidst Indian surroundings of a high quality, in the same way as the Indian recruit will be trained amidst English surroundings. In every case a report on the recruit's work during the year under training, briefly stating how he was employed and how far he has made use of his opportunities, will be furnished to the Government under which he may be posted. The recruits should be consulted as to the class of work on which they desire to be trained, and as far as practicable the training might be arranged in accordance with their inclinations.

During the period of training each Assistant Engineer may be paid a salary of Rs. 300 per month in the first year and Rs. 340 per month in the second year. A sum of Rs. 1,000 will be paid to each recruit from India to cover his passage and the premia he may have to pay to the Engineers to whom he will be articled and travelling expenses, &c. The recruit from England will be provided with a free passage to India as now, and will draw travelling allowances in India under the ordinary rules. The date of appointment to the Department will be the same for both classes of recruits, a month's time being allowed from that date to join the place of training. Within three years after the period of training is over each Assistant Engineer will be required to pass a Departmental examination in languages and professional subjects as laid down in the Public Works Department Code at present.

72,549. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—The conditions of service, salary, leave and pension will be the same for all Imperial Engineers whether recruited in India or in England. Those for the proposed new Provincial Engineers or Extra-Assistant Engineers will follow the lines laid down for the Provincial Civil Service.

The rule for retirement at 55 years should be rigidly enforced, no exception being made in any case. An officer considered unfit for promotion to Superintending Engineer may be asked to retire at any age between 50 and 55, provided he is given the full pension (*i.e.*, $\frac{30}{55}$ of average emoluments, *vide* Main Head VI).

As regards the rule (*vide* Government of India, P. W. D., Resolution No. 25 of 15th May, 1912) under which no officer can draw more than Rs. 800 a month unless he holds a Divisional charge, it should be made clear that an Executive Engineer already drawing more than Rs. 800 a month will not have his pay reduced under this rule in case there is no Divisional charge to which he can be posted.

The annual recruitment of Imperial Assistant Engineers must not exceed what is necessary to fill the casualties in the higher executive and administrative grades. In this way no more Assistant Engineers ought to be ripe for promotion than there will be room for in the executive ranks. The Sub-Divisional charges will be mainly held by Extra-Assistant Engineers. With a suitable readjustment of charges, both Divisional and Sub-Divisional, and with judicious decentralisation of authority, the bulk of the executive work should be performed by the Provincial Staff, the duties of the Imperial Staff being confined to the higher executive and administrative functions.

72,550. **(IV.) Conditions of salary.**—On the representations submitted by the Public Works Department officers the Secretary of State was pleased to sanction increased salaries on an incremental scale in 1908. For the present that scale appears to be adequate for the Imperial Service. If, however, after reaching the highest salary of the Imperial Service an Executive Engineer who is considered fit for promotion is not raised to Superintending Engineer grades within three years, he should be entitled to an annual increment of Rs. 50 from the fourth year, subject to the condition that the maximum salary thus obtained shall not exceed Rs. 1,400. The scale of salary for the proposed Provincial Engineers or Extra-Assistant Engineers should be made identical with that for the Provincial Civil Service.

The travelling allowance admissible on transfer is universally recognised to be inadequate. Actual expenses should be paid, limited to three times the railway fare or road mileage ordinarily allowed for touring. Actual charges for the carriage of furniture and personal effects should be allowed, subject to a limit of one wagon load by rail and 20 cart loads by road. Trainage of one trap and two ponies should also be made permissible.

72,551. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—The Government of India have under consideration a scheme for the simplification and improvement of the leave rules of both the European and Indian services. They can, however, be still further simplified by having only one set of rules for all the services, Imperial or Provincial. It is recognised that climatic conditions may necessitate more leave in the case of Europeans than in that of Indians. But there seems to be no reason to suppose that, given equal opportunities, the Indians will avail themselves of the leave rules more freely than they have been doing hitherto, and that they will thereby put Government to extra expense. It is only in a real and pressing case of necessity that an Indian officer will take advantage of the better "Long Leave" rules, and the amount of long leave actually taken is not likely to undergo any substantial change. Any differentiation would, therefore, merely create discontent without leading to any corresponding gain to Government.

The leave allowances are altogether inadequate. The maximum was fixed in the old days when the salaries were poorer in comparison with the present scale. The leave allowances on furlough should be equal to half of average salary subject to a maximum of £800 if paid in England and Rs. 12,000 if paid in India for all services.

It is desirable to introduce two modifications in the leave rules which do not at present find place in the scheme under contemplation:—

(*a*) Privilege leave may be allowed to accumulate up to a maximum of 6 months.

(*b*) Furlough up to a maximum of 2 years in the whole service may be allowed on full pay in lieu of 4 years ordinary furlough.

It seems pretty certain that if these concessions are granted, no Indian officer will, save under very exceptional circumstances, take furlough for a longer period than 2 years in all his service

In counting leave towards pension there should be no difference between periods spent in India and out of India, *vide* Civil Service Regulations Article 408.

72,552. **(VI.) Conditions of pensions.**—The pension rules should be uniform for all Imperial Engineers whether recruited in India or in England. Those for the Extra-Assistant Engineers will follow the lines of the Provincial Civil Service.

The following should be the scale of pension for the Imperial Service:—

Ordinary Pension.

Years of completed service.	Scale. (60ths of average emoluments.)	Maximum limit. £	Rs.
10	20	133⅓	or 2,000
11	21	146⅔	or 2,200
12	22	160	or 2,400
13	23	173⅓	or 2,600
14	24	186⅔	or 2,800
15	25	200	or 3,000
16	26	230	or 3,450
17	27	260	or 3,900
18	28	290	or 4,350
19	29	320	or 4,800
20		350	or 5,250
21		380	or 5,700
22		410	or 6,150
23		440	or 6,600
24		470	or 7,050
25	30	500	or 7,500
26		540	or 8,100
27		580	or 8,700
28		620	or 9,300
29		660	or 9,900
30 and above		700	or 10,500

Special Service Pension.—An additional special pension of £40 or Rs. 600 for each year of completed service in the administrative grades.

The rate of conversion from English to Indian currency and *vice versâ* should be taken to be £1 = Rs. 15.

An officer should be allowed to voluntarily retire after 20 years' service.

72,553. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans.**—Under the present system the Indians as well as Europeans who have settled in India are practically shut out from the Imperial Service which is wholly recruited in England. When the admission was by open competitive examination from the Cooper's Hill College without any restrictions, Indian students of merit could go to England with some certainty of success. A few Indians did, indeed, get into the Imperial Service through its doors. But since the days of nomination the uncertainty has been so great that no Indian

student ventures to go to England with the definite idea of seeking an entrance into the Public Works Department. It is true that there is no distinction between the present Provincial Service recruited in India and the Imperial Service recruited in England except in the matter of pay. But there should be no insuperable barrier in the way of the Indian or the European settled in India who may try to secure the same pay and emoluments as the European recruited in England, provided that he proves his fitness in every respect.

The proportion of Europeans and non-Europeans admitted during a period of 18 months, into the Public Works Department, from 1st January 1911 to 30th June 1912, is exhibited in the following table, vide Government of India Classified List (excluding Bombay, Madras and the Railways):—

—	Royal Engineers.	Imperial Engineers.		Provincial Engineers.
		Appointed in India from Covenanted Temporary Establishment.	Appointed in England.	
Europeans ...	3	10	13	6
Non-Europeans	—	—	1	8

Out of a total of 27 Royal and Imperial Engineers appointed during a period of 18 months only one is an Indian, while among the Provincial Engineers the Indians represent only 57 per cent. On the whole, therefore, the position of the Indian Engineers is not such as to satisfy their legitimate aspirations. Europeans and non-Europeans should be freely admitted into the Imperial Service.

The Indian Engineering College of Rurki which is the oldest institution of the kind in India was founded in 1848. Not till about *sixty years afterwards* was an Indian officer recruited from that College given a trial in the administrative grades. Even now the number of Indians in these higher ranks is very few. Greater and more liberal opportunities should be given for entering the higher spheres, and steady and sympathetic effort must be made towards testing efficiency in the actual administration of the Department instead of showing any tendency, real or apparent, to assume unfitness without a fair and unrestricted trial. The soul of grievance lies in the fact that the non-European is not allowed an equal chance with the European, and not in the mere preponderance of the European element in the Department.

72,554. **(VIII.) Relations of the service with the Indian Civil Service and other services.**—All Superior Indian Services should, as far as possible, be modelled on uniform lines as regards modes of recruitment, and conditions of service, salary, leave and pension. A good deal of jealousy and discontent has arisen in the past on account of undue differentiation in this respect. It is recognised that the Indian Civil Service, which is the premier service of India and which supplies Government with officers of the highest ability and attainments for the general administration of the country, should receive exceptional treatment. With this reservation, all services should be constructed and maintained alike.

In all attempts at reorganization either in the Public Works or in any other Department, the process has invariably been one of levelling up and never of levelling down. Officers of one Department naturally aspire to the higher salaries and allowances paid in other Departments and even the dignity visible in other cognate services leads to discontent among the members of the less favoured Department. Witness the case of the "Upper Subordinate" of this Department who is not really drawing very much less pay than officers performing similar functions in the other Departments; yet he is discontented because he always remains a "Subordinate" even though he may be drawing Rs. 500 a month, whereas one drawing even Rs. 200 per month in the Provincial Civil Service and not holding any higher charge is classed as an "Officer"—an Extra-Assistant Commissioner. What the Public Works "Upper Subordinate" wants is not higher pay and emoluments so much as greater dignity and importance in the eyes of the public.

A state of affairs such as this is not calculated to promote either economy from the point of view of Government or contentment and harmony from the standpoint of the services. A serious attempt must therefore be made to equalize the conditions of service in all Departments as far as may be practicable so as to extinguish all feelings of jealousy and to silence discontent.

72,555. **(IX.) Other points.**—(i) *Participation in the new Rules.*—The present generation ought to participate in any improved rules regarding admission into service, pay, pension, etc., that may be recommended by the Royal Commission and it is hoped that an early decision will be reached on those recommendations. As regards pension particularly, it is only fair that officers who have been urging so long for better pension and who have been told to await the result of the deliberations of the Royal Commission should have the benefit of the new rules with retrospective effect even though they may retire by the time these rules are brought into force.

(ii) *Expenses of an Indian Officer.*—It is erroneous to suppose that the expenses of an Indian officer are, generally speaking, less than those of a European officer. The European society and the Indian society are differently organised and the accumulation of centuries has no doubt created dissimilarity of tastes and ideals; yet the channels of expenditure, under the new conditions of life, are as many and as varied in the case of the Indian officer as in the case of the European, even though they may not all flow in the same directions.

The Indian members of the superior services are rapidly adopting the European mode of living. An Indian officer has, indeed, all through his service to keep up a double establishment; for although he and his wife may mix with the European freely, they cannot possibly forsake those of their Indian friends and relations who have not advanced so far.

Unlike the European, an Indian officer has to support his family, not infrequently a large one, from the date he joins the first appointment. The recent rise in prices in India which it is believed is proportionately higher than in England, affects an Indian perhaps more severely than a European in the first years of his service.

Unlike his European confrères, an Indian has to support, besides his own family consisting of parents, wife and children, a large number of collaterals (brothers, widowed sisters, daughters, etc.). These dependants go on increasing as the officer advances in age. It seems unnecessary to enter into the ethics of the question here. Facts must be taken as they are, and it cannot be denied that the Indian officers have, as a rule, to spend on this head of expenditure far more than they are known to spend on their own personal comforts and social obligations and amenities.

Parents in India have begun to realize the importance of giving their children the benefits of English education and travelling abroad. The expenses incurred by Indian officers of the superior services in connection with the up-bringing of their children are thus growing daily and approaching those borne by European officers.

(iii) *Relations between European and Indian Officers.*—Taking the Department as a whole the relations between European and Indian officers are happily not wanting in cordiality. Any detailed inquiry into this subject must be deprecated. At the same time it seems necessary in the interests of good government that the matter may be frankly and firmly yet gently dealt with. To leave his point out of consideration would be to leave the essence of the whole problem before the Royal Commission untouched.

Endeavour must be made to establish, if possible, a more harmonious and sympathetic connection between the two classes of public servants. Time, education and co-operation are slowly but steadily pulling down the barriers and the day is perhaps not far distant when the members of the European and Indian communities whom Providence has in His wise dispensation brought together for the fulfilment of His divine ends will mingle freely in all paths of life, both social and official.

The time has indeed come when Government might consider seriously whether European and Indian officers should not be encouraged in every possible

manner to come more intimately into contact with each other so as to understand each other better, and cultivate closer, healthier and more friendly relationship with each other. Where free social intercourse is not practicable, mutual visits and exchange of ideas on matters of common interest might be systematically fostered. Indifference or lukewarmth in this respect must be viewed with disfavour and any gross act or behaviour leading to a serious breach of cordiality on the part of either the Indian or the European should be regarded as a stumbling block to promotion.

Imagine a young Indian officer full of devotion to the Throne and of zeal for his country joining a district far away from his home and his early associations. He calls on all the European officers, he is received with varying degrees of coldness, and no one returns his call. Other European officers join the district, they call on their European colleagues, but not on him. He meets them as strangers, receives no sympathy and is not treated as their equal. The same story repeats itself in other districts. The young mind is unhinged and embittered and the bitterness clings to him all his life. The unhappy and uncongenial surroundings engender discontent and crush all initiative out of him.

The picture, though imaginary and depicting cases of more or less exceptional occurrence, is not overdrawn. A woeful picture such as this—even a solitary one—should not, if possible, be allowed to hang on the walls surrounding the official life of the Indian youth whose mind is stored with sentiments of profound gratitude and ardent loyalty to the British Throne and whose heart has been stirred to its innermost depths by the gracious message of Hope and Sympathy from his Beloved Sovereign.

Mr. J. H. Sharpe, called and examined.

72,556. (*Chairman.*) The witness was an Executive Engineer at the Central Provinces and represented the Provincial service. He was recruited from Thomason College, Rurki, and was now in his thirteenth year of service.

72,557. His colleagues proposed the abolition of the division into Imperial and Provincial branches and suggested the constitution of a new Imperial service recruited by competition in India and in England, two-thirds being recruited in India and one-third in England. He had statistics to show that if that method was adopted, even after twenty years the proportion of Indians to Europeans would be as one to two. Indian training was quite as good as the training to be obtained in England, but he did not think it was superior. He looked at the matter purely from an engineering point of view and not from the point of view of candidates prior to their entering an engineering college, but probably the earlier education would also have to be taken into consideration. He believed a competitive examination in England would lead to more students coming forward and a better class of students than was obtained at present. The subjects necessary for a competent engineer could very well be tested by a competitive examination. At present many students did not go in for the Public Works Department because they thought they had no chance of being nominated owing to want of influence, though he did not wish to say that any favouritism was shown by the selection board. There should be no form of selection.

72,558. Under the proposed scheme there would be no promotion from the lower branch to the higher. A subordinate after a certain number of years' service would probably make an efficient officer for executive work but not for administrative posts. At present they came in so late that they could not rise to higher than executive positions. The Provincial recruitment should take place after the results of the examination for the Imperial service were made known, so that those who did not succeed in entering the Imperial service would be able to go into the Provincial service. He did not think they would object, as they would have found out they were not as good as the men who had succeeded in getting into the higher service.

72,559. He suggested a two years' training in England for Indians so as to broaden their views. There would be no difficulty in finding works in England where officers could spend their leave if the Secretary of State paid a premium.

72,560. He did not recognize the principle that an officer recruited from Europe should have compensation in the form of foreign allowance when serving out of his own country, and he himself would be prepared to serve in a foreign country provided his pay was the same as the engineers of that country were receiving. Probably the pay in India would not be sufficient for a man in Africa if the man in Africa were getting higher pay.

72,561. He had no details with regard to allowances on transfers. At present officers received double first-class fare, which did not meet one-tenth of the cost.

72,562. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The written statement was agreed to by six members out of fourteen in the Provincial service. A copy was sent to every member but eight did not reply. It was not correct to say, as was said in the written statement, that it was the unanimous opinion of the service, and that paragraph should be deleted. He believed, however, that the other eight officers would agree generally with what was said.

72,563. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The number of men required every year was about forty, which would mean that the recruitment in India would be about twenty-seven under the proposed scheme, and he thought that number could be found, not from Rurki alone but from the other engineering colleges as well. At present the competition to enter service was very keen and there were far more candidates than vacancies.

72,564. The real complaint of the officers was in the smallness of the pay of the Provincial Engineers. An engineer was paid much better by private firms than by the Government. There was no real market rate for an Indian engineer in India. The first man in the list did not always enter the Provincial service. The competition to enter the service was probably due to the hope that after they had entered they would get something better than the present Provincial salary.

72,565. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) He had received no expressions of dissent from any member of the Provincial service to the opinions expressed in the written statement, and he did not think there were any proposals in the statement which prejudicially affected the interest of the officers.

72,566. The fact that there were many applicants for posts in the Provincial service was not a real test of market value. Probably if the present salaries were halved there would be applications just as there were now.

72,567. If a foreign allowance was given to imported engineers it was only logical and in the interest of the State that a larger number of Indian engineers should be employed.

72,568. (*Mr. Sly.*) The written statement was circulated to all the members of the Provincial service including promoted subordinates, but no replies were received from the latter. He did not think promoted subordinates would agree to the proposition that there should be no promotion from the subordinate service.

72,569. He passed out from Rurki in 1901, but as he had no knowledge of the present recruits from that college he was unable to make any comparison of them with the recruits of the past. The reason why the number of Europeans entering Rurki was now smaller than formerly was that the college had been closed for recruitment to the Imperial service. If it were opened again for that service a large number of Europeans would enter. Recruitment from Rurki was made on the basis of a continuous record of marks throughout the whole college career, but he thought an open competitive examination would be a much better system.

72,570. The officers in the lower branch of the proposed new service would hold charge of sub-divisions. The sub-engineering grade would be converted into extra assistant engineers. The new service would

consist of the existing cadre of sub-engineers and some men appointed from the colleges. He did not think there was any objection to the use of the term assistant engineers.

72,571. (*Mr. Fisher.*) He had one Anglo-Indian sub-divisional officer under him who had been trained at the Crystal Palace, but the majority of Provincial engineers were trained at Rurki.

72,572. He thought it would be a wise plan to put English recruits under superior Indian trained officers because they would more quickly understand how to deal with Indian subordinates. An Indian trained officer naturally understood native subordinates better than an officer recruited from England.

72,573. (*Mr. Madge.*) The fact that the written statement had been agreed to by Imperial, Provincial, and temporary engineers gave it greater weight than if it came only from one section.

72,574. The Indian Civil Service, in virtue of the peculiar position it held in the country as the premier service, required certain qualifications in connection with its earlier education which were not needed in purely professional services.

72,575. He proposed to exclude Provincial men from promotion to the higher branch, believing that it would tend to lower the status of the Imperial service, and the men would have already had an opportunity of getting in by sitting for the competitive examination.

72,576. If Government thought that a temporary engineer, after about ten years' service, was qualified for a permanent billet, he could be appointed for the Provincial service.

72,577. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) If the engineering training in India was adequate then recruitment ought to be from India rather than from England; and even if the training in England was superior to that in India he should still take up the same attitude, because an Indian trained engineer would understand his subordinates better than a man from England. It was also necessary for the development of the country that Indian training should be encouraged. If the principle was adopted that because education in England for various departments was superior to that in India and that therefore recruitment must be more largely from England than from India, it would result in recruitment in India never being larger than it was at present.

72,578. It might be necessary for certain reasons to have a preponderating element of Englishmen in the administrative ranks, but it did not follow that it was necessary in the executive ranks. He did not agree, however, that there should be a large element of Europeans in the administrative grades and Indians should have a chance of being promoted if found fit for administrative rank.

72,579. If the bulk of recruitment was from India Indian engineers should be paid according to their market value, and any Englishmen employed should be paid according to the market value of an engineer in England.

72,580. (*Mr. Clark.*) He did not think that if the principle of a foreign allowance was applied generally to all services in India it would be more acceptable to Indian recruited men than the present arrangement.

72,581. (*Mr. Vachha.*) An Indian-recruited officer in the Imperial service should be paid the same as an English-recruited man because he had to keep up the same style of living. Also if the pay was the same a better class of officer would be obtained.

72,582. He did not think the preliminary education of an English school was of much value for service in India and he did not consider English-trained engineers were superior to Indian-trained engineers.

(The witness withdrew.)

C. S. C. HARRISON, Esq., Executive Engineer, Pravara Canals District, Bombay.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,583. **(I.) Methods of recruitment.**—(i) *Establishment of a special Training College.*—The Imperial Engineers as a body consider that a residential College on the lines of the late Royal Indian Engineering College, Coopers Hill, should be established in England from which Imperial Engineers for the Public Works and Railway Departments should be recruited.

There is practically unanimous opinion that the training which such a College would afford would foster an "*esprit de corps*" which cannot possibly be obtained under the existing methods of recruitment. Such a spirit and the qualities it engenders are of the utmost value to the individual, to the Department, and to Government.

(ii) *Constitution of the Selection Committee in England.*—Should it not be deemed possible to establish a residential College there appears no alternative but to adhere to the selections of qualified Engineers from the open market.

Should this course be followed the Imperial Engineers strongly urge that at least 50 per cent. of the members forming the Selection Committee should be Senior Officers of the Public Works and Railway Departments either on the active or retired lists, as it is felt that the intimate knowledge of these Departments and their requirements possessed by such officers would be of much value in assisting the Committee in their selection of the right class of man.

It is considered essential that the possession of the qualities of a gentleman be given particular prominence at the time of selection.

72,584. **(II.) System of training and probation.**—(i) *Training.*—It is suggested that it should be made a condition of appointment that recruits should have had at least one year's practical experience on Engineering Works in the British Isles, in addition to an adequate theoretical training.

This latter training is assured by the present academical requirements as at present laid down by the existing rules of selection, but the question of practical experience requires greater attention.

It is considered that the practical course should be such that the selected candidate will have had the opportunity to study, practically, the difficulties encountered on such works as the construction of dock and harbour works, water-supply to towns, large sanitary schemes, erection of masonry and steel bridges, and railway construction works.

Special mention is made of these classes of works because many candidates put in their practical course with firms who specialize highly. In such cases little valuable general experience can be obtained, whereas such *general* experience is essential to the Indian Engineer who, by the nature of service in India, has to deal with all classes of work.

(ii) *Probation.*—It is considered that if the Selection Committee at Home pay particular attention to the academical qualifications combined with the nature of practical experience undergone by the candidate, a period of probation in India is not necessary.

It is considered that the question of social qualifications should be treated as very important.

High academical distinction is not the sole desideratum for service in India. It is an unquestionable fact that the Native of India will give greater respect to a real gentleman or, as he generally puts it, a "pacca Sahib," than to an officer wholly or practically devoid of those traits that go to make the "English Gentleman."

72,585. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—(i) *Revision of the Permanent Cadre.*—It is urged that the cadre of the Permanent Engineers should be more frequently revised than has been the case in the past. It is advisable that the number of Permanent Engineers should more closely accord with the number of permanent appointments and that less reliance be placed upon making up deficiences by the employment of Temporary Engineers. In support of this suggestion attention is invited to paragraph 306 of the Report of the Irrigation Commission of 1901, which, though recorded in connection with the Irrigation Branch, applies equally to all branches of the Service.

(ii) *Appointment of Royal Engineers to the Department.*—The conditions under which Royal Engineers

are drafted into the Public Works Department have in the past, and are liable to again in the future, affect adversely the position and prospects of Civil Engineers.

Royal Engineers brought in are usually credited with extra departmental service to such an extent as to give them departmental seniority over Civil Engineers who are senior to them in age and of many years standing in the Departments

The effect on a Civil Engineer thus superseded is utterly disheartening; if senior, his promotion to administrative rank is retarded, or he may even be prevented from ever reaching administrative rank, and, if junior, it may result in delaying him from being placed in a Divisional charge.

Whatever form it may take the frequent result is to subject him, at one time or another, to a heavy pecuniary penalty.

It is recognised that it is necessary in the interests of Government, that employment should be found for Royal Engineers in the Departments, but it is strongly urged that in justice the appointments should be made in such a manner as not to impair the prospects of Civil Engineers of the same age already serving in the Departments.

(iii) *Transfer of Temporary Engineers to the permanent scale.*—It is likewise urged that if Government transfer any Temporary Engineer now serving in the Departments to the permanent establishment the same guiding principles should be observed to safeguard the prospects of officers already on that establishment, as in the case of Royal Engineers.

(iv) *Future appointments of Temporary Engineers* should only be made on the specific understanding that the holders of the same will not, under any circumstances, be brought on to the permanent scale. It remains with Government, if it is considered expedient, to improve the Temporary Service as such. Thus the improved provident fund for temporary employés in State Railways might be extended to all Temporary Engineers in the Public Works Department and that, should circumstances so occur that their services will be required for some considerable period, they be allowed to take combined leave up to a period of six months.

(v) *Compulsory retirements.*—Article 649 of the Civil Service Regulations which provides for the compulsory retirement of Civil Engineers who, on attaining the age of 50 years, have not been promoted to the rank of Superintending Engineer should, it is considered, be more rigidly enforced in the case of officers who, on reaching that age, are reported as not qualified for promotion to the rank of Superintending Engineer.

It is also recommended that an officer who is reported on as inefficient during three successive years be compulsorily retired, irrespective of length of service. It is considered that in such a case a suitable bonus, less than what an efficient man might expect to get (but would not get because it would not be offered to efficients) should be given. The actual bonus to be given would require mature consideration but it is suggested that it should take some form of a percentage contribution by Government to the sum contributed to the Provident Fund by the officer.

This suggested bonus would of course only apply to cases where pensions had not, under existing rules, become due. In the case of an officer being compulsorily retired after he has earned a pension Government would consider what proportion of the pension should be given.

(vi) *Observation of the principle laid down in P. W. D. Code, Vol. I, paragraph* 80.—It is recommended that the principle laid down in paragraph 80, Volume I of the Public Works Department Code, namely, that promotion to the Administrative Ranks should be by a system of selection as opposed to that of seniority, be more closely followed than at present.

72,586. **(IV.) Conditions of salary.**—*Present scale of pay.*—In 1908 the scale of pay of the Public Works Department was reorganised and placed on an incremental basis, but at the same time the exchange compensation formerly given to officers was withdrawn. While gratefully acknowledging the small net increase that has accrued from the recent reorganization it is very strongly urged that the Imperial Engineer is still very inadequately paid.

The net increase in emoluments under the new scheme is not commensurate with the increased cost of living in India which has been so marked a feature of the last decade, and greatly increased responsibilities.

In paragraphs to follow, proposals are advanced for the improvement of furlough and pension allowances, which will serve to alleviate some of the hardships which are most severely felt, and in the belief that these proposals cannot fail to receive favourable consideration, no specific suggestions regarding the improvement of the scale of pay generally, are now put forward. If after careful consideration of the question in regard to other Departments or services, the Royal Commission consider that the increased cost of living deserves an increase in the salary as at present drawn, the Imperial Engineers urge that they should participate in any such general improvements as the Commission desire to recommend.

It is also suggested that there should be more liberal treatment of the cases of officers who are subject to individual hardships through the exigencies of the service.

A case in point is the granting of a special allowance to officers who have to serve in isolated places. They are cut off from many of the amenities of life which are enjoyed by others more favourably posted.

This particular hardship generally falls on the more efficient officers for, on account of their efficiency, they are selected for special work which, especially in the case of irrigation schemes, entails their sojourn in lonely places.

The following cases of individual hardship which may arise owing to irregularity of recruitment are brought to notice, and suggestions put forward for their mitigation:—

(i) Under the reorganization scheme of 1908 it is ruled that an officer may not draw more pay than Rs. 800 per month unless he is in charge of a division, or in a charge which, in the opinion of the Local Government, is of equal importance. This is unjust to an officer who, though fully qualified, does not obtain a divisional charge simply because there is no vacancy for him.

It is strongly urged that the rule should be amended to the effect that an officer of the Imperial service reported fit to hold a divisional charge, should continue to receive the ordinary increments laid down in the scale, irrespective of his being in actual divisional charge.

(ii) Under the reorganization scheme Executive Engineers attain their maximum pay of Rs. 1,250 per mensem after 19 years' service. It is urged that if, on account of there being no vacancy, an Executive Engineer, though otherwise qualified, is not promoted to Superintending Engineer's rank on completion of 22 years' service he should receive a personal allowance of Rs. 150 per mensem, until such time as he is promoted to administrative rank.

The existing pay of Chief and Superintending Engineers is deemed wholly inadequate. It is felt that the work and responsibilties of these officers has increased greatly of recent years and out of all proportion to the increase granted in their pay.

The pay of a first class Chief Engineer is less than that of a Commissioner of a division and, whereas the area over which the latter exercises control constitutes only a small portion of a Province, the responsibility of the former extends over a whole Province. The number of Chief Engineerships throughout the whole of India is small and, with the exception of the post of Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department and that of Inspector-General of Irrigation, they are the only highly paid posts to which an officer of the Public Works Department can hope to attain. On the other hand there are a number of Commissionerships in each Province in addition to many other high offices, both with Local Governments and with the Government of India which fall to the lot of officers of the Indian Civil Service.

As regards Superintending Engineers, it may be pointed out that the highest class in that rank draws less than does a Senior Collector.

The above arguments apply equally to the Superintending Engineer ranks and it is strongly urged that an increase of pay in all classes of the Superintending Engineer grade is absolutely necessary.

The proposals put forward are:—

Chief Engineers:

Only one class	...	Pay Rs. 3,000	per mensem.
Allowances ...	...	,, 500	do.

additional for the post of Secretary to Government and Rs. 250 per mensem for the post of Joint Secretary to Government.

Superintending Engineers:—

Class I	... ...	Pay Rs. 2,500	per mensem.
Class II	... ...	,, 2,000	do.
Class III	... ...	,, 1,750	do.

Secretary to Government of India in the Public Works Department.—For similar reasons as in the foregoing, it is considered that the duties and responsibilities attaching to the post of Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department, which appointment is invariably held by an officer specially selected from among Chief Engineers, and usually of much longer service than any other Secretary to the Government of India, warrant the appointment being paid at the same rate as Secretaries in the Home, Finance, and Commerce and Industry Departments, *viz.*, Rs. 4,000 per mensem.

72,587. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—*Furlough.*—The amount of furlough, which Imperial Officers of the Public Works Department appointed in England can earn is generally considered sufficient. The rules governing the grant of furlough are practically identical with those which apply to the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers subject to Civil leave rules, except in the most important particular of leave allowances. In the case of officers of the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers under Civil leave rules, furlough allowances are subject, if paid at the Home Treasury, to a minimum limit of £500 per annum, or the salary last drawn whichever is less, and to a maximum limit of £1,000 per annum; whereas for Civil Engineer Officers of the Public Works Department there is *no* minimum limit and the maximum has been fixed at £800 per annum. The present furlough allowances permissible to Imperial Civil Engineers are as follows:—

Years of completed service.	Maximum furlough pay.	Years of completed service.	Maximum furlough pay.
	£		£
8	279	19	517½
9	297	20	540
10	316½	21	555
11	337½	22	562½
12	360	3 years as Superintending Engineer, 3rd Grade.	675
13	382½		
14	405		
15	427½	3 years as Superintending Engineer, 2nd Grade.	787½
16	450		
17	472½		
18	495	Thereafter ..	800

As long ago as 1870, in Despatch No. 43-P. W., dated 28th March, the Government of India said:—"*Section* 16.—With reference to paragraph 4 of Your Grace's Despatch under reply, we may remark that we have already recommended the equalization of the pay of the Military Branches of the Department, and we are gratified to find this proof that Her Majesty's Government are likely to receive that proposal favourably. On this point we only add that we shall be glad to see some plan adopted by which the furlough allowances of Civil Engineers shall be equalized with those of Military Officers in the Public Works Department and, so far as practicable, the advantages of pension also." This hope has been reiterated many times by the Government of India and by different Secretaries of State since the date of that despatch. It is, however, a hope that remains unrealized up to the present day, since a Royal Engineer in the Public Works Department, with 8 years' service to his credit, is entitled to almost double the furlough allowances of a Civil Engineer officer doing exactly the same class of work and having the same service in the Department. A Civil Engineer is obliged to complete 18 years' service before he can claim an allowance approaching that which a Royal Engineer is entitled to after 8 years' service.

The present allowances are so inadequate that a large majority of officers cannot avail themselves of the furlough due to them, even though the state of their health urgently demands that they should do so. That such is the case is assuredly not in the best interests of the general Administration. The question of leave allowances is raised in the last paragraph of the memorials recently submitted by officers of this Department; copies of which are attached to this Memorandum as Appendices 2 and 3. The reply given to the memorialists by the Government of India was that:—"... Pensions and leave are subjects of reference to the Public Services Commission, and as no doubt the Commission will enquire into these matters and submit recommendations, the Government of India consider that no useful purpose will be served by considering the prayers of the memorialists at this stage.*"

Under the circumstances it is confidently hoped that the Royal Commission will be able to recommend that the leave allowances sanctioned for officers of the Indian Civil Service, and Military Officers subject to Civil leave rules, may be made applicable to Civil Engineer Officers of the Public Works and Railway Departments on the Imperial lists. There is no valid reason why they should receive less favourable treatment than the other officers named. It is pointed out that feeling on this question is very strong, and that communications received from officers of the Department show that there is great discontent throughout the Department regarding the inadequacy of leave allowances.

It is urged that where the allowances are drawn in India they should be paid in the equivalent in rupees at fifteen rupees to the pound sterling.

(ii) Furlough earned by an officer should be granted at any time after the completion of eight years' service, subject to the exigencies of the service, unless the applicant has returned within eighteen months from privilege leave covering a period of three months.

Special leave.—The existing rules regarding the grant of special leave require no alterations, but the allowances should be the same as in the case of furlough.

Privilege leave.—(i) Under the present rules an officer can earn privilege leave to the extent of one calendar month for every eleven complete calendar months of duty, and such leave is cumulative up to a period of three months only. In the case of officers who have accumulated the full period it frequently happens that the exigencies of the public service prevent their being granted privilege leave when they desire it, and this leads to the leave lapsing through no fault of their own. It would in a measure mitigate against this loss of leave on full pay which an officer has fairly earned, if the cumulative period were extended from three to six months.

(ii) An officer should be allowed to avail himself of all privilege leave due to him immediately prior to retirement, and be permitted to retire from the service at the end of his leave, without having to return to duty as he is now obliged to do. This concession has already been made where privilege leave is combined with other leave, and its extension to privilege leave alone, besides removing a legitimate grievance among officers of the Department, would lead to much less administrative inconvenience than is now the case.

Study leave.—Modern Civil Engineering is a highly specialized profession and progress in the methods of construction is very rapid. In view of the vast undertakings of the Government of India in the Public Works and Railway Departments, it is essential, for efficiency and economy, that the Engineering Staffs of these Departments should keep themselves abreast of modern engineering practice. Engineers can only accomplish this by visiting and studying works of special interest in progress in different parts of the world. That the importance of this is recognized by other nationalities is instanced by the number of Engineers who are commissioned by their respective Governments or private employers, to visit works in India, in order to study Indian methods. The majority of Civil Engineers serving in these

* Government of India's letter P. W. D., No. 1399-1408-E. dated July 23rd, 1913—not reprinted.

Departments who wish to visit works in the British Isles and other countries, have to do so as private individuals, and entirely at their own expense unless they are placed on deputation, or are specially permitted to visit certain works while on leave, permission in this case usually being given only when Government require special information regarding a particular aspect of a project. In the latter case certain travelling and other expenses are allowed, but the time spent in the visits counts against the officer's period of leave. It is recommended that officers of the Public Works Department should be encouraged to visit works outside India, and that they should be provided with every facility for doing so. It is urged that either new rules should be introduced to admit of these facilities being granted, or that there should be a much more liberal interpretation of the existing rules regarding the placing of an officer on deputation.

The following instance of study leave obtaining in another professional service is cited. In the Indian Medical Service study leave is granted in England up to one year out of total service in addition to furlough, for the purpose of allowing an officer to study any particular aspect of his profession which he may desire. During this period he receives furlough pay and lodging allowance amounting to four to eight shillings per day.

72,588. **(VI.) Conditions of pensions.**—*Retiring pension.*—The greatest grievance of Civil Engineer Officers of the Public Works Department and one which is most sorely felt is the totally inadequate retiring pension to which they become entitled under the existing rules. Many efforts have been made, spread over a period of forty years or more, to obtain amelioration in this respect. Both the Government of India and different Secretaries of State have long recognized that all was not well, and new rules and conditions have been introduced to improve matters, but the net result has been that the present pensions are actually less than they were 40 years ago, when the qualifications demanded from men joining the service were not as high as they are now and when the cost of living was considerably less. Numerous memorials on this subject have been submitted to the Government of India and H.M. Secretary of State during the last six years by officers of these Departments. The first memorials were submitted in 1907, but the petitioners were favoured with no reply up to August, 1912, when they were informed by the Government of India in their letter No. 942-E., dated 30th August, 1912, that no decision could be arrived at pending the receipt of the report of the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India. It is to the Royal Commission therefore that the Civil Engineer Officers now look for redress of this long standing grievance, and it is strongly and respectfully urged that the scale of pensions prayed for in the memorials of 1912–13, Annexures II and III, is the least which can in equity be recommended.

Further, that as this grievance was brought prominently to the notice of the Government of India, in the memorials of 1907-08 to which they vouchsafed no reply, and as in the meantime a number of officers affected have been placed on the retired list, and many more will probably be called upon to retire before a decision is arrived at, any improvements made in the scale of pensions should have retrospective effect, at least from the year 1908.

Scale of invalid pensions.—Prior to 1884, invalid pensions granted to Civil Engineer Officers of the Public Works Department on the Imperial list were governed by Article 474 of the Civil Service Regulations; this article also governed the pensions of all officers belonging to the Uncovenanted Services, as then termed. In Lord Kimberley's Despatch of 1883 a new scale was introduced for Imperial Engineers and Telegraph Officers, with a view to ameliorating their conditions of service; this scale is covered by Article 641 of the Civil Service Regulations. Under this Article the scale has been increased from ten-sixtieths of average salary for ten years' completed service, eleven-sixtieths for eleven years, and so on to twenty-sixtieths for ten years, twenty-one-sixtieths for eleven years and so on, but at the same time the *maxima limits* have been reduced from those allowed by Article 474. How this rule, brought in with the object of improving conditions in certain Services, adversely affects officers at the present time, and how much better off an invalided engineer would have been under Civil Service Regulations, Article 474, is clearly shown from a comparison of the columns in the table below:—

Years of completed service.	Civil Service Regulations, Article 641.		Civil Service Regulations. Article 474.		
	Amount calculated on a percentage basis.	Fixed maximum.	Amount calculated on a percentage basis.		Fixed maximum.
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
		Rs.	Rs.		Rs.	Rs.
10 ...	20/60	2,813	1,000	10/60	1,406	2,000
11 ...	21/60	3,150	1,400	11/60	1,650	2,200
12 ...	22/60	3,520	1,800	12/60	1,920	2,400
13 ...	23/60	3,910	2,200	13/60	2,210	2,600
14 ...	24/60	4,320	2,600	14/60	2,520	2,800
15 ...	25/60	4,750	3,000	15/60	2,850	3,000
16 ...	26/60	5,200	3,000	16/60	3,200	3,200
17 ...	27/60	5,670	3,000	17/70	3,570	3,400
18 ...	28/60	6,160	3,000	18/60	3,960	3,600
19 ...	29/60	6,670	3,000	19/60	4,370	3,800
20 ...	30/60	7,200	4,000	20/60	4,800	4,000

It is a decided anomaly that officers of other services coming under Civil Service Regulations, Article 474, and drawing the same pay as an Engineer, should, if invalided, be entitled to a higher pension after 10, 11, 12, 13, 16, 17, 18 and 19 years' completed service, and to a less pension after 14 or 15 years' service.

It is urged, therefore, that to remove the anomalies pointed out, and to make Article 641 of real benefit to Civil Engineer Officers now serving in the Department, that the maxima limits should be at least the same as those fixed according to Article 474.

Family Pension Fund.—Unlike the Indian Civil Service and the Military Services in India there is no official Family Pension Fund for the Public Works Department. The emoluments of officers in this Department are not sufficient to admit of their making adequate provision for their families should they die in harness. The knowledge that they are unable to make such provision is a constant source of anxiety to many officers who are entirely dependent on their salary, and whose duties constantly take them into situations which are prejudicial to health. They have also the additional anxiety of knowing that their pensions are purely personal and cease with their death. There is a strong desire therefore, that means may be found whereby an officer may be aided in making suitable provision against the event of his death for the member of his family dependent upon him. Pension has been officially defined as deferred remuneration, which means that a certain portion of the salary which would have been paid to an officer, had there been no pension attached to his

appointment, is kept back to provide for a pension on retirement. This view is corroborated by the fact that when an officer is transferred on Foreign Service he is made to contribute towards the cost of his pension at the rate of one-sixth of the pay he would have received had he remained in the service of the Government of India. It may be presumed, therefore, that an officer only receives six-sevenths of the pay he would have received had there been no pension to provide for, and that one-seventh is kept back by Government as the officer's contribution towards his pension fund. If the officer had the option of investing the amount assumed to be retained by Government to provide for an annuity with a private Insurance Company, he could probably so arrange the terms, that a portion of his annuity would be assured to his widow or other member of his family dependent upon him, should his death take place within a certain number of years from the date his annuity fell due, with the additional security that his family would be covered against the risk of his death, should it take place during the time he was subscribing to his annuity, in the guarantee of a considerable sum of money. Could some such scheme be worked out by Government on an actuarial basis a large number of officers, not only in the Public Works Department but in other services similarly unprotected, would be glad to avail themselves of it and to subscribe towards the extra cost.

One set of leave and pension rules for all Imperial Engineers.—There is a strong wish among Imperial Engineers, that there should be one set of leave and pension rules for all Civil Engineer officers on the Imperial List, irrespective of the source from which they were recruited. Such differentiations as still exist should, it is urged, be abolished.

72,589. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—*Appointment of non-Europeans to the Imperial Service.*—As regards employment of Indians in the Imperial branch of the Public Works Department, it is considered that the European element must, for a good many years to come, largely preponderate to admit of the present standard of efficiency being maintained. The number of appointments to the Imperial Service which may at the present time be reserved for Indians is ten per cent., and this rule should not, it is considered, be exceeded at present. The proportion of Natives of India to Europeans and Anglo-Indians combined at present on the active list of Imperial Engineers of this Presidency is 18½ per cent.

Of the 10 administrative posts in the Department three or 33⅓ per cent. are at present held (permanently or temporarily) by Indians.

Appointment of Natives or Anglo-Indians to the Imperial Service.—It is considered that no Native or Anglo-Indian should be appointed to the Imperial Service unless he has studied for at least three years in the British Isles and obtained a degree from one of the recognised British Universities.

Divisions into Imperial and Provincial Services.—It is considered that the present system of having two branches of the service, *viz.*, the Imperial and Provincial, should be adhered to for it is recognised that the value of a sojourn and training in the British Isles renders an Engineer's work more efficient than if he only obtains his education in India.

Recruitment for the Provincial Service.—It is also considered that the existing system of recruitment for the Provincial Service is satisfactory and that with the gradual improvements that are bound to take place in the Indian Engineering Colleges the general standard of efficiency of Provincial Engineers will be raised.

Differentiation in pay between the Imperial and Provincial Services.—It is considered that the market value of an Indian educated Engineer is considerably less than that of an Engineer with British qualifications. The Indian Engineer serves in the land of his birth and consequently is able to live in the accustomed style of his surroundings. That this is not possible for the European educated Engineer in India is obvious. Very few Indian Engineers would think of taking up an appointment in a foreign country without demanding a greatly increased salary. For this reason and for the reason that an Engineering education in India is cheaper than that in England, it is considered that there should be a marked differentiation in the rates of pay between the Imperial and Provincial Services.

72,590. **(VIII.) Relations of the service with the Indian Civil Service and other services.**—It is considered that the relationship as existing between the Public Works and other Services in India is, on the whole, satisfactory and should remain unaltered.

72,591. **(IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—*Inadequacy of present travelling allowance.*—It is desired to bring to the notice of the Commission the inadequacy of the existing Travelling Allowance Rules in general, and in the case of transfers in particular.

It is urged that the existing rule which fixes the 5 mile radial limit within which, if an officer travels he cannot get the daily allowance, should be altered so as to read:—"Daily allowance cannot be claimed unless an officer travels at least 10 miles, out and back, from his head-quarters."

Travelling allowance on transfer.—It is realized that the inadequacy of the allowance under existing rules to an officer on transfer is common to other Departments and while admitting that transfers in the interests of the Public Service must inevitably involve some expense to the officers transferred and the practical impossibility of framing any rules suitable to all cases that will obviate it, it is very strongly urged that attention be paid to the very great hardships, especially in the case of long transfers, to which an officer is put owing to the inadequacy of the allowance permissible under existing rules.

It is believed that the question of revision of the existing rules to obviate distinct pecuniary (in many cases almost crushing) loss to an officer on transfer was under the consideration of the Government of India some 6 or 7 years ago and it is requested that the question be again considered with a view to the rules, which contain several anomalies, being made more liberal.

This question has, for many years, caused great heart-burnings and is one the remedy for which has received a great deal of careful attention by members of the Service and it is considered that if the following allowances be fixed a cause for considerable complaint will be removed:—

Maximum allowances on transfer.

(*a*) The allowance of double first class fare by railway as at present.

(*b*) The following for transport of kit:—

For Chief and Superintending Engineers:—
Three railway waggons or their equivalent by steamer, 2 horses, 1 motor car and 1 cycle.

For Executive Engineers:—
Two railway waggons or their equivalent by sea, 2 horses, 1 motor car and 1 cycle.

Assistant Engineers:—
One railway waggon or its equivalent by sea, 1 horse, 1 motor car, or motor cycle, and 1 cycle.

It is also urged that the above allowances (as regards kit) be made applicable to an officer who on return from long leave is transferred to another station. In this case the kit allowance would be from the station at which the officer last served prior to going on leave to the station to which he is posted on return from leave, and the usual rail allowance from port of debarkation (within his Province) to his new head-quarters.

Presidency house rent and extra emoluments.—It is felt that there should be some special pecuniary consideration shown to officers posted to the Presidency towns. At present an Engineer officer of this Presidency if posted to Bombay receives no extra pay. He is given a special Presidency house rent allowance if he is a married man, but *nothing* if he is a batchelor.

In the case of a married man, the special allowance for house rent is Rs. 125 a month on the average, but this is subject to the extraordinary condition that his *wife or family must be actually residing with him:* that is to say that supposing a man has children at school in England and his wife goes Home for three months to see them or goes away for the sake of her health, then he does not get this house rent allowance and, from this it is natural to deduce that he is

expected to break up his arrangements, leave his bungalow or flat, and live in a hotel or club, only to again incur the expense of getting a new house and furnishing it at great expense.

It will be realized that it means that, in a city like Bombay, where suitable accommodation for a married man at any but exorbitant rentals, is difficult to get, the unfortunate officer has most probably to pay a heavy rent for his flat during the absence of his wife and yet get no allowance.

This is, it is considered, a most unfair anomaly and it is strongly urged that the Presidency house rent allowance should be extended to all officers whether married or not.

Apart from this grievance the question of extra emoluments to the pay of an officer posted to a Presidency town requires consideration.

In this department officers are not highly paid and, when posted to Presidency towns, they, unless they have a private income, must run into debt if they are to live up to their official position. The ordinary every-day expenses in a Presidency town (Bombay for example) are very great and as junior Executive Engineers are often posted to Presidency towns it will be readily understood that the Rs. 800 salary is almost entirely swallowed up by the bare necessities of life.

To remedy this source of complaint it is suggested that a special allowance of from 25 per cent. to 50 per cent. of the ordinary salary, in addition to that salary, be allowed to all officers appointed to posts in Presidency towns, the lower the pay the higher the percentage increased.

General Provident Fund.—Under the rules of this Fund interest on the account of a deceased depositor ceases from the date of tender of payment to the person legally entitled to receive the balance at credit of the account. It frequently happens that from inexperience in matters of the kind, and other causes, it is not possible to draw the amount immediately on tender of payment being made. It is therefore suggested that it should be permissible for the balance at credit of an account to remain for a reasonable period after tender of payment has been made and to continue to draw interest during that period.

Inadequate recognition of the Engineering Departments in the Honours Lists.—There has been for a very long time a growing dissatisfaction among Engineers in India with the Honours distribution, which has resulted in what is felt to be an implied public slur on the profession.

It is felt that the power to confer Honours on the Public Services was entrusted to the General Administration as a means of giving public recognition to individual merit impartially to all public servants deserving such recognition, and that given impartial exercise of this power, the Honours Lists would be, to some extent, an index of appreciation by the Administration of services rendered by any given branch of the service. Judged by this standard, a study of the Honours List indicates a marked lack of appreciation of services rendered by the Engineers of the Public Works and Railway Departments which is felt to be unjust. There is, so far as is known, no other country in the world, where a similar system of Public Service Honours obtains, in which the Engineering profession is held in such light esteem, as is evidenced in the Honours List in India, while, certainly in some of its aspects, the work of the Department in India stands out prominently as of a high order of merit, as has frequently been proved by the deputation of Indian Engineers to other countries as experts in their particular profession.

Although it is not definitely known to the officers of this Department what system is followed in framing the Honours Lists, it is generally believed that the results, which are the subject of dissatisfaction, are due to the fact that the recommendations are almost exclusively in the hands of the Civil Service, and that this has led to a gradually increasing tendency to restrict Honours unduly to that branch of the Service.

It is believed that if the matter is considered worthy of notice by the Commission, an expression of opinion by them would carry much weight and lead to rectification of what is a very substantial grievance. The figures given below speak for themselves.

Statement comparing Honours granted in the Indian Civil Service and those granted in Public Works Department to each Province. Abstracted from the Civil Lists, April 1913.

—	Bengal.	Bombay.	Madras.	Assam.	Behar.	Burma.	Central Provinces.	N. W. F. Province.	Punjab.	United Provinces.	Totals.
Indian Civil Service:—											
C. I. E.	11	9	11	3	6	5	6	4	17	12	84
C. S. I.	5	7	7	3	8	9	3	—	9	10	61
Kt.	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	2	4
K. C. I. E.	—	1	1	1	—	1	1	—	4	1	10
K. C. S. I.	1	2	2	—	3	1	2	—	—	2	13
Total, Honours	17	19	22	7	17	16	12	4	31	27	172
Cadres	176	180	176	50	111	171	110	39	170	243	1,426
Per cent.	9·7	10·5	12·5	14·0	15·4	9·4	11·0	10·0	18·2	11·1	12·0
Public Works Department:—											
C. I. E.	1	—	1	—	—	1	2	1	2	3	11
C. S. I.	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	2	—	4
Total, Honours	2	—	1	—	—	1	3	1	4	3	15
Cadres	46	103	101	24	48	92	51	24	165	116	770
Per cent.	4·4	—	1·0	—	—	1·1	2·9	4·0	2·4	2·6	2·0

Statement comparing Honours granted to Officers serving in various departments in the Government of India Secretariats.

Departments	Home.	Education.	Legislative.	Foreign.	Revenue.	Commerce.	Finance.	Railways.	Total of all Departments.	Public Works Department.
Number of Officers	10	8	2	7	9	15	6	10	75	8
Number of Honours	4	6	2	9	5	5	5	9	45	—
Percentages	40	75	100	130	55	33	83	90	60	—

ANNEXURE No. I.

Purport of Memorials submitted in 1907-08. (*Vide* Appendix No. XIII.)

ANNEXURE No. II.

Memorial of 1912. (*Vide* Appendix No. XIII.)

ANNEXURE No. III.

Memorial of 1913. (*Vide* Appendix No. XIII.)

ANNEXURE No. IV.

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch. Letter No. 942-*E., dated Simla, the* 30*th August,* 1912. (*Vide* Appendix No. XIII.)

ANNEXURE No. V.

Short History of the Public Works Department Pension Rules. (*Vide* page 146,—evidence of Mr. W. S. Dorman.)

Mr. C. S. C. HARRISON called and examined.

72,592. (*Chairman.*) The witness was an Executive Engineer in the Public Works Department of Bombay and represented the Imperial officers. He had completed eleven and a half years' service.

72,593. The present system of recruitment to the Provincial service was satisfactory, and with gradual improvements in the engineering colleges in India the general standard of efficiency of the service would be raised, and if the standard was raised the proportion of recruitment in India could also be raised provided a sufficient number of Europeans were recruited to maintain British characteristics.

72,594. With regard to the rule for the recruitment of Indians in England, he considered that there should be no increase on the present ten per cent. The majority of the officers believed that nobody should be selected in England who had not had three years at a British Engineering College and taken a degree, but personally he did not hold that view. His own view was that six or seven years at least should be spent in England, so that a man might have had a public school education and the influence of English surroundings before his college course. A college course of three years was not sufficient to make an Indian very much better than a provincial engineer. The written statement expressed the opinion of all the eighty-one officers in the service except five and therefore might be taken to represent the opinion of close on eighty-five per cent. Three years in England would mean that no officer could enter the Imperial service who had been trained in an Indian college, and that was so at the time he was at Cooper's Hill, where there were two Indian students who had passed in India and then gone to England for another three years' course.

72,595. The present system of division into Imperial and Provincial branches should be adhered to because a training in a British college was extremely important. It was true that in the past the Indian colleges had turned out as capable officers as were now to be found in the service, but the conditions of service had changed tremendously and the work now demanded a great deal more of a man than it did in years gone by. The press of work was much greater. Officers had more responsibility now, especially in the administrative grades, than in the days when Rurki men were successful engineers. He did not think the improvement in the Indian colleges had kept pace with the added responsibilities of the officers. The difference might be observed by referring to the administrative reports of thirty or forty years ago.

72,596. It should be a condition of appointment to the Imperial branch that recruits should have had at least one year's practical experience on engineering works in the British Isles. Practically every Junior officer now in the service had had a year's training on some works in England. The consensus of opinion was that if it was considered that an officer had not had sufficient practical experience in England with his one year's practical course he might be put on a practical course in India as well. It was essential that a man should have a year's practical training and it was a very important factor in obtaining men for the public service.

72,597. There were four Royal Engineer officers in the department. The junior officers had come in at the bottom of the list, so that of recent years the difficulty of a Royal Engineer being placed over Civil Engineers of the same standing had not arisen. The Royal Engineers had been recruited in the last few years. For the purposes of seniority Royal Engineers should always come in with the other officers.

72,598. The pay of Superintending Engineers was last raised in 1908. The present salary was from Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 2,000 and he suggested it should be raised to Rs. 1,750 to Rs. 2,500. Considering the responsibilities on a Superintending Engineer he was rather underpaid at present. The break at Rs. 800 should be abolished and officers who were qualified, whether they were holding an executive position or not, should advance to the maximum of the time-scale. The possibilities were greatly against his ever getting to the Rs. 1,250 rate without reaching a higher post.

72,599. Allowances were recommended for those who were out in country districts on account of the lonely life they had to lead, and for those in Presidency towns on account of the expense. A man in the most populous district would collapse under his financial burdens if he were not given an allowance, and therefore of the two the Presidency allowance was the most important. An addition of twenty-five to fifty per cent. on his salary would be a reasonable allowance. An allowance was now given to married officers as long as their wives were actually with them, but if the wife went away for three months the allowance was stopped. The allowance should be payable whether the wife was in the country or not, and it should also be extended to bachelors.

72,600. Further facilities should be given for study leave on the lines adopted in the Indian Medical Service.

72,601. With regard to a family pension fund, he had no specific proposals to put forward and considered that a scheme would have to be worked out on an actuarial basis. He thought officers would be quite prepared to have a family pension fund established without cost to the State if it was established on sound financial lines.

72,602. He emphasised the hardship caused by the present transfer allowance rules. The allowance to an Assistant Engineer on transfer was twenty maunds of luggage and double first class fare. Several general statements had been sent into him by officers and one or two detailed statements and he would put in three cases dealing with transfers between 1910-12.*

72,603. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Slightly more officers were employed on roads and buildings than on irrigation. In the construction of roads and buildings it was necessary to employ English trained men; he did not say Indians were not good enough, but for the general administration it was necessary to maintain a British element. For the work itself local men were quite good enough under British supervision. There was undoubtedly considerable engineering talent in India and the Indian element had largely increased in the service in the last twenty or thirty years, though in Bombay it happened to have gone down.

72,604. With regard to study leave a medical officer who took study leave was not bound to pass an examination but simply followed a definite course of study.

72,605. (*Mr. Madge.*) He did not consider that the suggestion that no one should be appointed to the Imperial service unless he had studied for three years in Great Britain would operate as a serious bar to the recruitment of engineering talent in India. If an

* *Vide* Appendix XV.

Indian had exceptional talent he could rise to administrative rank, and when he got to a high appointment there was little difference between his pay and the pay of the Imperial Engineers. In fact in the administrative grades he would not mind an officer being taken into the Imperial service and therefore he would qualify the remarks in the written statement to the extent of saying that when a Provincial officer reached an administrative post he should be taken into the Imperial service.

72,606. The allowance he claimed for men in isolated places was intended to cover the considerable expense an officer incurred in sending his family to a station which might be many miles away. It cost him a good deal to enjoy the amenities of civilised life. If an officer was in a station where he could meet friends it would be another matter.

72,607. (*Mr. Fisher.*) There were very few posts in the service where a training in mechanical engineering was of much use. His general view was that it was desirable to send an Indian to England not so much in order that he might obtain a superior technical training as in order that his views might get broadened. From the point of view of technical engineering facilities the Indian colleges were very good, though they were not quite so good as an English colleges. He would not send a man to England solely for mechanical engineering.

72,608. (*Mr. Sly.*) The present rule with regard to Royal Engineers was that they entered the department with seniority dating two and a half years after their first commission, and the intention of the rule was to put the Royal Engineer on an equal footing with a Civil Engineer of the same age; but he objected to the Royal Engineer being brought in anywhere except at the bottom of the list. It was one of the conditions of the service that a certain number of Royal Engineers should be employed, but the rule did not mean that they should be put in above men already in the department. The officers desired a guarantee that Royal Engineers should be brought in young.

72,609. His temporary colleagues (*i.e.*, temporary engineers) asked for a provident fund on the lines of the fund for temporary employees on the State railways, to which he believed Government contributed cent. per cent. If an officer was dismissed for any glaring fault Government could withhold its contribution, but if he was discharged in the natural course of events he received the whole of the money to his credit in the fund

72,610. He would only give the Bombay officers one allowance if they were given houses at the ordinary rental of 10 per cent. of their pay. There was considerable difficulty in inducing men to take appointments in Bombay; the only attraction seemed to be Secretariat experience, but that was not sufficient to make service in Bombay popular.

72,611. It was a fact that transfer allowances were not given when the transfer was made to Bombay. The twenty maunds allowed to an Assistant Engineer was supposed to be camp equipment and Government considered that there was no necessity for camp equipment if a man was in Bombay.

72,612. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) He believed there had been some deterioration in the candidates appearing before the selection committee in London, and he was of opinion that if the selection committee was reconstituted as suggested in the written statement the material obtained for the service would be considerably improved. He objected to a competitive examination because it would bring men into the service simply on the throw of one die, but he had no instance to show that where a system of competition amongst qualified candidates had been tried it had failed.

72,613. He did not think recruits realised the conditions of the service until they came into it and therefore there was still many applications on the part of qualified men. By raising the salaries, better material would be obtained and the service would be much more contented. The same proposition might be applied to the Provincial service, as the more the prospects were improved and the salaries raised the better and more contented the service would be. He would not say that because men were coming into the Provincial service on the present salaries no increase in the present salaries should be considered.

72,614. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) A good engineer in England was more or less certain of employment and a really first-class man would probably not take the trouble of going up for the service if he had to go through a competitive examination, unless he was specially keen to come out to India. A competitive examination might deter a great many good men from coming forward.

72,615. (*Mr. Kent.*) In connection with the various provident funds of municipalities and public bodies there was generally a condition that in the event of an officer's service being dispensed with before ten years he would not draw the contribution of the municipality or public body, and that appeared to be a fair condition to attach to a provident fund. If it was an ordinary case of reduction of establishment the contribution should be given to him. He thought a contribution by the State to a provident fund would work well, and probably the wishes of the department would be met by a combination of the pension system and a pension fund for widows and orphans on the lines prescribed for military services.

72,616. Daily allowance could not be claimed unless an officer travelled at least ten miles out and home from headquarters. If an officer did not go beyond a five mile limit he might travel thirty miles but would still get no daily allowance.

72,617. In the old days the Presidency allowance was fixed at Rs. 100 a month and house rent at Rs. 45 a month in the case of all officers, whether single or married, and officers were now worse off than they were under the old rules. There was no reason why a batchelor should be debarred from the allowance.

72,618. In some cases it was desirable that the State should employ experts and he would not bar a man from entering the service because he happened to specialise in one branch of engineering. A man might be required, for instance, who had a good knowledge of reinforced concrete construction, which was a very special thing.

72,619. Ninety-nine per cent. of the officers were of opinion that there should be no extensions beyond fifty-five years of age unless the officer retained was taken right outside the cadre.

72,620. (*Mr. Advani.*) It was only recently that Indians had risen to higher appointments. In administrative appointments they might get along in a sort of mediocre way, but they would not be as efficient as the men who came out from England. There was a great deal of selection for promotion but seniority counted very much. As a rule the best men were selected over the heads of others for administrative appointments, but not quite to the extent that they should be.

72,621. Officers should be encouraged in every way to go to England for part of their furlough, even subordinates; but the three years' training in England should be taken quite young when a man was more impressionable and open to British influences.

72,622. He would be against promoting into the Imperial service even a man of marked ability, because he would not have had an education in England; but he would be prepared to consider the question of providing an opening for Indians of marked ability.

72,623. In the interests of the State the Provincial service officers should be paid according to their market value, which should be fixed by the quality of the men who could be obtained on the terms offered. The probabilities were that up to a certain limit better men would be obtained by the grant of higher pay. At present there was discontent in the Provincial service and that might well affect their efficiency. The present state of pay for Executive Engineers in the Provincial service was low.

72,624. He would not tie a man down to one year's training with any one particular firm, but he would give him three or four months with different firms, and he thought it would be quite possible to make arrangements accordingly.

(The witness withdrew.)

At the India Office, London, Monday, 4th May, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, ESQ., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, ESQ.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, ESQ., C.S.I.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, ESQ., M.P.
M. S. D. BUTLER, ESQ., C.V.O., C.I.E. } (*Joint Secretaries*).
R. R. SCOTT, ESQ.

HERMANN A. HAINES, ESQ., Secretary, Public Works Department, India Office.

Written Statements relating to the Public Works and Railway Departments.

I. Extracts from a Memorandum on appointments made by the Secretary of State for India in Council.

72,625. *Indian Public Works Department and Indian State Railways. (Engineering Branch).*—The present system of recruitment was adopted in 1905 after the closing of the Royal Indian Engineering College, Coopers Hill. The appointments are widely advertised in the Press, and the selection of candidates is made by a Committee of three persons appointed for the purpose each year by the Secretary of State. This Committee has on each occasion consisted of (1) the Member of the Council of India who is Chairman of the Public Works Committee; (2) Colonel Sir John Ottley, K.C.I.E., formerly President of the Royal Indian Engineering College, Coopers Hill; and (3) one member nominated by the Council of the Institution of Civil Engineers. In 1910, 1911, 1912 and 1913, the Committee consisted of (1) Sir Hugh Barnes, K.C.S.I., K.C.V.O.; (2) Colonel Sir John Ottley, K.C.I.E., R.E.; and (3) Sir Alexander Binnie, Kt.

Indian State Railways (Assistant Traffic Superintendents). — For these appointments recruitment is made three-fifths in England and two-fifths in India. The recruitment in England is not undertaken at fixed periods, but on a specific demand from India for a stated number of men. When such a demand is received a Selection Committee (consisting generally of the Member of the Council of India who is Chairman of the Public Works Committee, the Government Director of Indian Railway Companies, and the Secretary of the Public Works Department, India Office) is appointed by the Secretary of State. The Selection Committee consider any applications which may have been made since the last recruitment, and are awaiting the occurrence of further vacancies, and further invite by special letter (*a*) the principal railway companies in the United Kingdom to make known the appointment to any suitable candidate with sufficient railway experience, and (*b*) the Appointments Committees of Oxford and Cambridge and any other University that may apply to be furnished with such notices to suggest suitable University candidates. When all the applications have been received every candidate who is qualified under the regulations and is not *primâ facie* quite unsuitable is invited to an interview with the Committee, who then make their selections. There is no rule as regards the relative proportions of men with railway experience and University men appointed, but the Committee are guided, in the absence of an expressed wish on the part of the Government of India, by the relative suitability of the candidates who present themselves.

(2) Recent Selection Committees have been constituted as follows:—

Sir H. S. Barnes, K.C.S.I., K.C.V.O., Chairman of the Public Works Committee of the Council of India. A Brereton, Esq., C.S.I., Government Director of Indian Railway Companies. H. A. Haines, Esq., Secretary, Public Works Department, India Office.	August 1911 August 1912. January 1913
Sir James Thomson, K.C.S.I., Acting Chairman of Public Works Committee. A. Brereton, Esq., C.S.I. H. A. Haines, Esq.	August 1913.

(3) *Miscellaneous Public Works Appointments.* —The India Office is occasionally called upon to engage other persons for special appointments in Indian Service. These appointments are not made on the advice of a formally constituted Selection Committee. They are comparatively few, the rate of recruitment is low and irregular, and candidates with specialised or technical training are required. Thus within the last five years Consulting Architects have been engaged for the Governments of Bombay, Bengal, Eastern Bengal and Assam, Burma, and the United Provinces. It has been the practice to request the President of the Royal Institute of British Architects to nominate suitable candidates for these appointments. Assistant architects have also been engaged for several of the Local Governments in India, the selection of candidates being, at the request of the India Office, made by the President of the Architectural Association. There are also from time to time requests from India for the engagement of electrical engineers or other engineers with special qualifications. The method of filling such appointments depends on the circumstances of each case and a suggestion as to the method of recruitment not infrequently accompanies the demand. Public advertisement is made when necessary.

(4) Applications for special appointments of this kind are recorded in the Public Works Department of the India Office, and on occurrence of a vacancy for which the applicant is *primâ facie* suitable, care is taken to see that his application is considered along with those of other candidates. Appointments such as electrical inspectors, experts for supervising water-borings, plumbers, mechanics, foremen, electricians are occasionally made. The expert advisers consulted in such cases vary according to the nature of the appointments.

Public Works Department.—II. Supplementary Note by Mr. Haines.

72,626. A memorandum prepared in this Office regarding recruitment for the Public Services in India through the channel of the Public Works Department, India Office, has already been laid before the Royal Commission. I now submit a Supplementary Note with annexures.

(2) The first annexure is a Statement showing the number of appointments made through the Public Works Department of this Office to the superior establishments of the services of the Government of India since 1st January 1911, and the manner in which the selections were made.

(3) In regard to the appointment of Assistant Engineers, the following further observations may be made. The question of the qualifying degrees of candidates has been the subject of prolonged consideration. I attach (Annexure II.) a copy of Appendix I. of the Regulations in the revised form in which it has been approved by the Secretary of State in Council for appointments to be made in 1915.

(4) In paragraph 5 of the Regulations* for appointments of Assistant Engineers, it is laid down that not less than 10 per cent. of the appointments

* *See* Memo above.

will be reserved for Indians. This rule had its origin in the time of Coopers Hill College. The College at that time admitted students to the number of about 50 a year; and about 12 engineering appointments were offered each year to the most successful students at the end of their course. The College was open to Indians as well as Europeans. The following rule was inserted in the College Prospectus for 1901:—

"Natives of India who are British subjects have the exclusive right to enter the Public Works and Telegraph Departments through the Indian Engineering Colleges. They cannot claim, therefore, the right of admission to the Royal Indian Engineering College, which is maintained for the training of Europeans, with a view to compete for the appointments given to its students.

"Nevertheless, when there is spare accommodation, the President has discretionary power to admit natives of India who are British subjects, and two appointments in those services, but not more than two in the aggregate in each year, may be awarded to such students."

(5) When the College was closed in 1906, the provision for the appointment of Indians to the Imperial Service of the Public Works Department was continued, and a rule was inserted in the Regulations to the effect that the total number of natives of India appointed in any year under these Regulations "shall not exceed 10 per cent. of the total number of Assistant Engineers thus recruited." This was changed in 1909, and the rule altered to provide that "Natives of India shall be selected to the extent of 10 per cent. of the total number of Assistant Engineers thus recruited, if duly qualified."

This rule is still in force.

(6) It may be added that the Reports of the Selection Committee show a continuous improvement in the standard of Indian candidates since the present system of selection came into force.

(7) With regard to the appointments of Architects and to most of the other Miscellaneous appointments shown in Annexure I., it may be stated that the appointments are made in the first instance on short agreements for five or three years, but at the end of the first term, the services of the officers are generally retained on fresh conditions involving a higher salary. These fresh conditions are recommended by the Government of India and approved, with or without modifications, by the Secretary of State. There are no regulations on the subject.

ANNEXURE I.

Public Works Department.

Appointments made to the Superior Establishments of the Services of the Government of India since 1st January 1911.

Appointments.	Year.	Number of Appointments made.	Salaries of Appointments.	By whom Candidates were selected.
(i) *Assistant Engineers* (Imperial Service) in the Public Works and State Railway Departments.	1911	23*	Commencing at Rs. 380 a month.	Selection Committee appointed by the Secretary of State, consisting of Sir Hugh Barnes (Chairman of the Public Works Committee of the Council of India), Colonel Sir John Ottley (late President of Coopers Hill College), and Sir Alexander Binnie (representing the Institution of Civil Engineers).
	1912	20	Do.	
	1913	33	Do.	
(ii) *Temporary Engineer* for deep borings for artesian wells, Bombay.	1913	1	Rs. 700–800 a month.	Ingersoll Rand Company.
(iii) *Assistant Electrical Engineer* for Oudh and Rohilkund Railway.	1914	1	—	Selected by Consulting Engineer, but appointment actually made in India, the candidate having in the meantime proceeded to India on his own account.
(iv) *Assistant Signal Engineer* for Indian State Railways.	1912	1	Rs. 350–25–400 a month.	Consulting Engineer to the Secretary of State for India.
(v) *Workshop Accountant* for Indian State Railways.	1913	1	Rs. 600–50–900 a month.	Mr. W. F. O'Donoghue, late Accountant-General and Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department.
(vi) *Assistant Traffic Superintendents*, Indian State Railways.	1911	5	Commencing at Rs. 350 or Rs. 400 a month.	Selection Committee appointed by the Secretary of State, consisting of the Chairman of the Public Works Committee of the Council of India, the Government Director of Indian Railway Companies, and the Secretary in the Public Works Department of the India Office.
	1912	3	Do.	
	1913	8	Do.	
	1914	1	Do.	
(vii) *Assistant Locomotive and Carriage and Wagon Superintendent*, Indian State Railways.	1911	6	Commencing at Rs. 300, 350, or 400 a month.	Consulting Engineer to the Secretary of State for India.
	1912	4	Do.	
	1913	7	Do.	
	1914	4	Do.	
(viii) *Assistant Coal Superintendents*, Indian State Railways.	1913	2	Rs. 450–50–600 a month.	Director-General of Stores in consultation with Consulting Engineer.
	1914	1	Do.	H.M.'s Chief Inspector of Mines, Home Office.
(ix) *Assistant Laboratory Officer*, Indian State Railways.	1913	1	Do.	Director-General of Stores in consultation with Consulting Engineer, and the Director of the National Physical Laboratory.
(x) *Assistant Chemist*, Indian State Railways.	1913	1	Do.	Do. do.

* Made by the Judicial and Public Department.

Appointments.	Year.	Number of Appointments made.	Salaries of Appointments.	By whom Candidates were selected.
(xi) *Electrical Inspectors* for Local Governments in India.	1913	1 (Madras).	Rs. 600 a month.	Director-in-Chief, Indo-European Telegraph Department.
		1 (United Provinces).	Rs. 700 a month.	Director-General of Stores in consultation with Mr. Goument, late Chief Engineer and Secretary to the Government of the United Provinces in the Public Works Department.
(xii) *Architects* :—				
(*a*) Consulting Architects	1911	1 (Burma).	Rs. 800–50–1,000 a month.	President, Royal Institute of British Architects.
	1912	1 (United Provinces).	Do.	Do. do.
	1913	1 (Punjab).	Do.	Do. do.
(*b*) Assistant to Consulting Architect.	1913	1 (India).	Rs. 600–40–800 a month.	Do. do.
(*c*) Assistant Architects.	1912	4	Rs. 340–40–500 a month.	President of the Architectural Association.
	1913	2	Do.	Do. do.
	1914	2	Rs. 540–40–660 a month.	(1) President of the Royal Institute of British Architects, and (1) President of the Architectural Association.
(*d*) Architectural Draughtsman.	1913	1	Rs. 500–50–600 a month.	Mr. E. L. Lutyens, Architect for New Delhi.

ANNEXURE II.

DRAFT OF APPENDIX I. FOR PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT REGULATIONS, 1915.

LISTS OF DEGREES REFERRED TO IN PARAGRAPH 6.

The degrees shown in Lists A and B are accepted without reservation in the case of candidates who matriculated on or before 30th June 1914. The special condition applicable to candidates who matriculated on or after 1st July 1914 are stated in the Notes appended to the two lists.

Candidates who reply on a degree in "Mechanical" or "Electrical" Engineering or in "Naval Architecture" should have had at least one year's practical experience in Civil Engineering.

List A.

Oxford.—B.A. (with Honours in the Engineering Science Final Honours School).
Cambridge.—B.A. (with Honours in Mechanical Science Tripos).
St. Andrews.—B.Sc. in Engineering.
Glasgow.—B.Sc. in Engineering.
Edinburgh.—B.Sc. in Engineering.
Dublin.—B.A.I. with Honours in Engineering.
London.—B.Sc. with Honours in "Civil and Mechanical" or "Electrical" Engineering.
Victoria University (Manchester).—B.Sc. with Honours in Engineering.
Birmingham.—B.Sc., with Honours in "Civil," "Mechanical," or "Electrical" Engineering.
Liverpool.—B.Eng., with Honours in "Civil," "Mechanical," or "Electrical" Engineering, or Naval Architecture.
Leeds.—B.Sc., with Honours in "Civil," "Mechanical," or "Electrical" Engineering.
Sheffield.—B.Eng., with Honours in "Civil," "Mechanical," or "Electrical" Engineering.

Note to List A.—In the case of candidates who matriculate after 30th June 1914 the above degrees will be accepted only if taken after three years' study in the several Universities, but this condition will not apply to Indians who, having taken an Indian degree which exempts them from part of the University course, shall have taken one of the above degrees in less than three years in accordance with the regulations of the University concerned.

List B.

Dublin.—B.A.I.
Durham.—B.Sc. in "Civil," "Mechanical," or "Electrical" Engineering, or in Naval Architecture.
London.—B.Sc. (Engineering).
Victoria University (Manchester).—B.Sc. Tech. in "Mechanical" or "Electrical" Engineering (Honours Division in the Final Examination).
University of Wales.—B.Sc. (in "Civil," "Mechanical," or "Electrical" Engineering).
Birmingham.—B.Sc. (Engineering).
Liverpool.—B.Eng.
Leeds.—B.Sc. in "Civil" or "Mechanical" Engineering.
Sheffield.—B.Eng. (First Class in the Final Examination).
National University of Ireland.—B.E.
Bristol.—B.Sc. in "Civil" or "Mechanical" Engineering.

Note to List B.—In the case of candidates who matriculated after 30th June 1914 the degrees in List B will be accepted only if (1) the matriculation or other entrance examination accepted by the Institution of Civil Engineers to the Engineering course in the University has been passed, and (2) a regular course of study occupying not less than three academical years has been pursued in the University between the passing of such matriculation or other entrance examination and the passing of the final examination for the degree.

But Indians who have taken an Indian degree which exempts them from part of the University course will be regarded as having satisfied condition (1) and will be exempted from condition (2) if their degree has been obtained in less than three years in accordance with the Regulations of the University concerned.

ANNEXURE III.

Note by Sir A. M. Rendel, dated 22nd April 1914, on his Procedure in Getting and Choosing Candidates.

I should premise that I am not concerned with the appointments to the Civil Engineering section of the P.W.D. but, as Mr. Haines says, I am referred to when men are wanted for the locomotive, carriage and wagon, electric, and other mechanical departments of Government railway management; and I, or rather my firm, are applied to by our other Indian clients for all descriptions of railway appointments of the mechanical class, and some others as well.

Our mode of action in obtaining the men indented for is advertisement in the Press. A paper containing questions as to age, nationality, education (general and professional), practical experience, &c., is then sent to all of the applicants who seem to require consideration. These papers and a personal interview with those whose answers promise well, form the basis of the final selection. In no case is there any favouritism in any way, except so far as this, that, *cæteris paribus*, we incline, with the full assent of our clients, to a preference to the sons or near connections of men who have done good service to the Government of India.

The number and quality of the applicants varies greatly, depending a great deal on the activity of railway construction in the world of British enterprise; but I am safe in saying that the higher values attached of late years to the theoretical education noticeable in all occupations is having its full effect on the civil engineer, who is now frequently able to show a diploma or degree—often with honours—from some University or first-class teaching authority, and as a matter of fact we are now able to almost confine our recommendations to men who can produce one. It is not so marked in the other branches of my profession, but it is to a great extent compensated for by a longer and more searching practical training, and by the opportunities offered by the evening schools maintained by many of the great English railway companies, of which many young men fully avail themselves.

ANNEXURE IV.*

(*i*) *Return showing for the year 1911–13 the number of Indian applicants for appointment as Assistant Engineer, &c.*

—	1911.	1912.	1913.	Total.
Number of qualified candidates	10	13	16	—
Number of appointments made	3	3	4	10

(*ii*) *Provinces from which 10 Indians appointed as Assistant Engineers in 1911–12–13 came :—*

—	1911.	1912.	1913.	Total.
Punjab	1	2	4	7
Bombay	1	—	—	1
Burma	1	—	—	1
Hyderabad	—	1	—	1
	3	3	4	10

(*iii*) *Universities at which 10 Indian Assistant Engineers appointed in 1911–12–13 took their course :—*

—	1911.	1912.	1913.	Total.
London	1	1	3	5
Glasgow	—	1	1	2
Edinburgh	1	—	—	1
Manchester	—	1	—	1
No University	1	—	—	1
	3	3	4	10

* This Annexure was put in by Mr. Haines after his oral examination, *vide* paragraph 72,628.

ANNEXURE V.*

Statement showing (a) number of natives of India who have applied for appointment as Assistant Engineers in Indian service and (b) number of natives of India appointed in years 1905–1914

Year.	Number of Indian Applicants.	Number of Indians qualified for appointment.	No. of Indians selected.
1905	No record	No hard and fast line was drawn in these years between "qualified" and "unqualified" candidates.	—
1906	1		—
1907	—		—
1908	8		—
1909	13	7	3
1910	16	7	3
1911	20	10	3
1912	16	13	3
1913	22	16	4
1914	31	21	3

* This annexure was put in by Mr. Haines after his oral Examination, *vide* paragraph 72,628.

ANNEXURE VI.*

Statement showing amount of professional experience possessed at the time of their selection by Assistant Engineers appointed during the years 1905–1914.

Year.	No. of appointments made.	No professional experience.	One year's experience or less.	More than one year's experience.
1905	25†	2	11	12
1906	14†	1	7	6
1907	17	—	6	11
1908	39	—	14	25
1909	30	—	5	25
1910	25	1	7	17
1911	23	—	—	23
1912	20	1	8	11
1913	33	—	13	20
1914‡	30	—	18	12

* This annexure was put in by Mr. Haines after his oral Examination, *vide* paragraph 72,628.
† In addition to appointments made from the Royal Indian Engineering College, Coopers Hill.
‡ No appointments have yet been made in 1914. The figures refer to the candidates selected for appointment and may require revision.

Mr. H. A. Haines called and examined.

72,627. (*Chairman.*) The witness was Secretary of the Public Works Department of the India Office and a member of the Selection Committee for certain traffic appointments.

72,628. He put in a return† showing for the last three years the number of applicants for appointments who were non-Europeans, and he undertook to put in a further return showing the number of candidates selected for the Public Works Department and the Railway Department, and distinguishing those who had had no professional experience from those who had had a year's professional experience or more.†

72,629. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) Under the present rule Indians had to be appointed to the extent of 10 per cent., but it was not meant definitely to limit them to that percentage, though, as a matter of fact, the 10 per cent. had not been exceeded. He was not able to say whether under the rule Indians had been appointed who would not have been appointed if the rule had not been in existence, but he knew, as a matter of fact, that three or four years ago it was felt that some Indian candidates, who were only just up to the standard of qualification, would not have stood a chance unless they had been appointed under the 10 per cent. rule.

† Vide annexures IV, V and VI to written statement.

72,630. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) It was a fact that the first Selection Committee reported that they would not have selected those two or three Indian candidates but for the operation of the 10 per cent. rule, but he understood that Indians were now coming forward with better qualifications. The rules as to qualifications had been recently revised so as to conform with the rules observed by the Institution of Civil Engineers, but a special exception had been made so as to allow Indians possessing an Indian degree to come forward as candidates for the Public Works Department although their qualifications would not be up to the standard prescribed by the Institution of Civil Engineers.

72,631. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The rule in force at Cooper's Hill stipulated that the 10 per cent. should not be exceeded, but the wording of the rule was afterwards altered. He understood that the interpretation of the wording of the regulation as it stood would not prevent the appointment of more than 10 per cent., although more than 10 per cent. had not been appointed in the past. It was, however, an accident that there was not an additional Indian appointed last time. The original wording was, "shall not exceed 10 per cent.," and that was altered to, "be selected to the extent of 10 per cent.," but it had not been understood in the India Office that only 10 per cent. could be selected.

72,632. (*Mr. Sly.*) The number of European candidates in 1911 was 89, and the number of Indian candidates fully qualified 10, so that there were only 99 fully qualified candidates in 1911 for the Indian Public Works and State Railway Department. The figures given in his written statement represented the total number of applicants and not those who were interviewed. All candidates who were fully qualified under the rules were interviewed.

72,633. Sir Alexander Binnie was at one time a member of the Selection Committee, nominated by the Institution of Civil Engineers, but for the present year the Institution had nominated Mr. Elliott Cooper.

72,634. The Selection Committee, appointed by the Secretary of State to advise him in connection with the appointment of Assistant Traffic Superintendents, included the Government Director of Indian Railway Companies, who had fairly recent experience of railway management in India.

72,635. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) Some of the appointments were made on the advice of one individual; for instance, the appointments of Assistant Coal Superintendents were made on the advice of His Majesty's Chief Inspector of Mines. The Chief Inspector recommended and the Secretary of State accepted his nomination. He did not think these appointments were advertised in the papers, but the Chief Inspector circularised the managers of a great number of coal mines. The first appointment, in 1913, of an Electrical Inspector was made on the sole advice of the Director-in-Chief of the Indo-European Telegraph Company, who was in touch to some extent with the Electrical Inspector in the Stores Department. He believed that post was advertised, and the same remark applied to a good many of the positions alluded to in his written statement. The posts of architects were not advertised as the principal architectural institutions, with which all architects were in touch, were approached on the occurrence of a vacancy. There was no rule that certain vacancies carrying a certain salary must be advertised, and he did not think a universal rule would be possible, as some of the appointments were very special; for instance, a person had to be obtained who was experienced in deep boring, and for that purpose the Ingersoll-Rand Company had to be approached, this being practically the only firm which could supply a man with the special training required. He did not think there would be any harm in having a rule by which appointments would all be advertised.

72,636. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) With regard to the Indians who had got in under the 10 per cent. rule, but who otherwise would not have had a chance, he explained that the standard they had reached barely qualified them for appointment. It was quite possible, on the other hand, that the rule excluded some Indians who were really good men. No applications were received from Indians for some of the special appointments mentioned in the written statement. Very few Indians had received a training fitting them for most of those positions. He believed one did apply for the position of Electrical Inspector, but it was the only application received from an Indian. There were some Indians who were training for electrical engineering in Great Britain, but he knew of none who were working in the locomotive and carriage and wagon workshops of British Railways.

72,637. He considered it was almost impossible to have a competitive examination for Assistant Engineers as so much depended on the candidate's practical experience and capability of working. Testimonials were required from engineers under whom they had been employed to show that they were fit for practical work. A competitive examination was possible in India as the candidates had been under observation for a long time and their fitness was known; but if an examination was held in England for public works appointments there would be very little to go upon as to the fitness of the candidates for their work. He did not think anyone would accept a theoretical examination as the best way of obtaining engineers for India.

72,638. In the three years 1911-13, as far as selected candidates were concerned, five Indian engineering students came from the London University, two from Glasgow University, one from Edinburgh, one from Manchester, and one from no university at all.

72,639. The paragraph in his written statement alluding to the reports of the Selection Committee as showing a continuous improvement in the standard of Indian candidates, referred to the year 1910.

72,640. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He had had no experience of India, although he was born there.

72,641. There was no general rule, when an appointment was made on the advice of a single individual, to determine who that individual should be. Very often the Government of India themselves suggested someone, and, as a matter of fact, did suggest the Inspector of the Home Office as a suitable person to advise, but if the suggestion had not come from the Government of India, it was very possible that the India Office would have written to the Home Office asking whom they would recommend. The head of the department would probably make enquiries as to the most suitable manner in which the selection should be made and then submit his proposals to the Secretary of State. When a special recommendation was made by the Government of India, that recommendation was not acted upon automatically but was dealt with on its merits by the Secretary of State in Council. As a matter of fact, in practice a recommendation of that sort from the Government of India would very rarely, if ever, be ignored.

(The witness withdrew.)

At the India Office, London, Wednesday, 6th May, 1914.

PRESENT:

THE RIGHT HON. THE LORD ISLINGTON, G.C.M.G., D.S.O. (*Chairman*).

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P.
SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
SIR VALENTINE CHIROL.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, ESQ., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, ESQ.
FRANK GEORGE SLY, ESQ., C.S.I.
HERBERT ALBERT LAURENS FISHER, ESQ.

JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, ESQ., M.P.

M. S. D. BUTLER, ESQ., C.V.O., C.I.E.
R. R. SCOTT, ESQ. } *Joint Secretaries.*

COLONEL SIR JOHN W. OTTLEY, K.C.I.E., late R.E., M.Inst.C.E.

Written Statement relating to the Public Works Department.

72,642. I gather that the special reason that prompted the suggestion that I should give evidence before the Royal Commission is that for the last 14 years I have had peculiar opportunities—first as President of the Royal Indian Engineering College, Coopers Hill, and then as a member of the Selection Committee—of forming an opinion as to the quality of the assistant engineers appointed during that period. Quite apart from this, there are other

reasons that, I think, qualify me to express an opinion on the subject of the recruitment of the Public Works Department.

72,643. I commenced my professional career as a civil engineer in India as far back as 1858, when I was articled to the chief engineer of the Great Indian Peninsula Railway in Bombay. Consequently my personal acquaintance with India is a fairly lengthy one, whilst I have been connected with it by family ties for nearly a century, my father (an infantry officer in the H.E.I.C.'s service) having acted as an assistant engineer in the Bombay Presidency, where I was born in 1841. As a matter of fact I have been myself more or less closely connected with the Public Works Department for more than 45 years, and during that time have been associated with a great number of engineers drawn from a variety of sources, whilst many Coopers Hill men have served in India under my orders since the College was first established. Lastly, I was employed for some five months in 1894 as a member of the "Lyall Committee" which was constituted to deal with the question of the re-organisation of the Military Works and Public Works Departments, so that 20 years ago I had to make a special study of this question of recruitment.

72,644. From the wording of a communication received from the India Office, in which I am credited with possessing a "unique experience of the *quality* of the candidates who have for many years past obtained appointments in the Railway and Public Works Departments," I am not quite sure whether it is intended that I should institute a comparison between the assistant engineers from Coopers Hill and those obtained under the selection system. But in case this should be the intention, I will endeavour to explain as briefly as possible why it is really not in my power to frame any such comparison as would be of practical value. Indeed, in my judgment, the only persons in a position to form any reliable opinion on this subject must necessarily be those under whom both classes have served on actual work for some considerable length of time. I may add, however, that I take leave to doubt whether any comparison of this sort would now serve any useful purpose. It seems to me that the points of real interest to-day are—(i) how far the existing system gives us the requisite material for India; and (ii) what (if any) changes are desirable to further improve that material and bring it up to the standard required.

72,645. In the first place, it is absolutely essential to arrive at a clear understanding of what is connoted by the word "quality." I should be disposed to say that it includes qualifications under the following three distinct heads:—

(i) The technical education of a civil engineer as tested by a University diploma or equivalent examination;

(ii) The possession of knowledge of many technical matters either peculiar to or especially required in India, for instance, plane table surveying, the methods of taking discharges, the preparation of materials, Indian building construction, the accounts and rules of the Public Works Department, the methods of executing work in India, and some general knowledge of the country, its inhabitants, its geology, &c.; and

(iii) The possession of qualities that cannot be tested by any examination, but which are really far more important than any amount of technical knowledge; I mean, for instance, a high moral standard, commonsense, good temper, a sense of justice, discipline, powers of observation and initiative, and readiness to accept responsibility.

72,646. Now, under the first head I do not think that there is a pin to choose between the *best men* appointed from Coopers Hill and the *best men* obtained under the present system. In either case, however, the term "best men" under this head only covers a comparatively small percentage of the total number of candidates. As regards the balance, I am distinctly of opinion that—*taking this test alone*—the *average* product of the selection system compares favourably with the average Coopers Hill student. This is only what might have been expected as only men up to the diploma standard appear before the Committee.

72,647. Before passing on, I think it desirable to invite attention to a fact which, it seems to me, is often lost sight of, viz.:—that it is quite unnecessary that the whole or even a large proportion of the recruits should hold very high academic distinctions. I think all experience goes to show that it is by no means those who possess the greatest amount of "book learning" who turn out to be the most valuable officers. Of course, it is desirable that a certain number should be thus distinguished, but it should at the same time be borne in mind that the vast mass of the work to be done does not require these qualifications and that to employ a "1st class Honours" man for years together in carrying out the ordinary work of the Public Works Department is very much on a par with using a razor to chop wood blocks with, and very often results in completely spoiling both the instrument and the work. In short, for the ordinary work of the Department, the qualities outlined in head (iii) above are really of far greater importance than any amount of high technical and mathematical knowledge.

72,648. Turning now to the 2nd head (ii above) I would explain that every Coopers Hill student acquired more or less knowledge of these special matters whereas the recruits obtained under the selection system are necessarily almost invariably ignorant of them. It is, of course, quite true that this knowledge can be gradually picked up at a later stage after reaching India, but the broad fact remains that—*under this head*—the assistant engineers appointed from Coopers Hill were better fitted *on joining* to carry out the duties required of them than are the men now being sent out under the selection system.

72,649. It is, however, under the third head, *the possession of qualities that cannot possibly be tested by any form of examination*, that the difficulty of forming any reliable comparison becomes positively insuperable. At Coopers Hill the students were under my close observation both at work and play for three years, and I was, therefore, in a position to frame a fairly accurate estimate of what they really were. During the course I was able to weed out a certain number of undesirables, whilst in many cases the rough diamonds entering the College were cut and polished out of all recognition when they left Coopers Hill. A high moral tone and strict discipline was insisted on and a strong *esprit-de-corps* was fostered, which undoubtedly made for good results subsequently. I felt, therefore, fairly certain that, at any rate, a large proportion of those completing their course would develop into really good officers. Under the selection system, on the other hand, we know little or nothing of the candidates under this head, and the result is consequently very much a matter of chance. It is only possible to form a crude guess at these matters from a perusal of the letters of recommendation sent in and a short ten minutes' interview with each candidate. I have absolutely no doubt whatever that under the new system we have been able to nominate a very fair number of exceedingly good recruits, but I should hesitate to speak with any confidence as to others who may or may not eventually be found to possess the qualities essential to the making of a good and reliable officer.

72,650. So much was I impressed with these facts and also with the want of knowledge of the special technical matters referred to above, that after the closure of Coopers Hill College, but prior to the sale of the property, I suggested to the then Permanent Under Secretary that an ideal system would probably be to select the men as at present and to then send them for a year or two to Coopers Hill for instruction in the matters referred to, thus also affording some opportunity of ascertaining what the men really were as opposed to merely what they knew. It seemed to me that in this way it might also be possible to secure some continuity of the *esprit-de-corps* to which I attached considerable importance, and which I thought it desirable to preserve for the benefit of the service. My proposal was, however, considered to be outside the range of practical politics, and was, therefore, dropped.

72,651. From what has been said above, it will, I hope, have been made clear why it is impossible for me in the circumstances to formulate any comparison

between the products of the two systems with which I have been so long connected.

72,652. I have already said that in my judgment the really important points for present consideration are as to whether the present system affords the requisite material and whether any further change can be recommended. I propose in the following paras. to deal separately with the question of the selection respectively of European and native assistant engineers.

72,653. As regards *European assistant engineers*, I am unable, as matters stand, to suggest any better plan than that which now obtains, except that I should not be disposed to lay much, if any, stress on the supposed necessity for practical training in this country, and would strongly recommend that every man selected should be sent out *on probation* for three years, by which time the authorities in India ought to be able to decide whether he is worth retention or not. It seems to me that no man worth having need fear this test, whilst if any undesirable should be eliminated it would certainly be to the advantage of the service and of India generally. It should, of course, be provided that any man thus sent back at any time during his period of probation should be provided with his passage back, as also his salary to date of landing in England, unless he be dismised for some serious fault beyond mere unsuitability for the service.

72,654. Turning now to the class of *native assistant engineers*, I must record my matured conviction that it is radically wrong to make these appointments in England. I originally formed this opinion at Coopers Hill, where we had quite a number of native students, and the view then formed has been strengthened each succeeding year. It is an opinion, moreover, fully shared by every officer—both of the Public Works Department and the Indian Civil Service—with whom I have discussed the question, and also by natives themselves, both parents and candidates. I hold that it is absolutely wrong on principle to induce young Indians to come to this country on the mere chance of securing a valuable prize. Whilst Coopers Hill lasted, the evils were greatly minimised because, if a candidate failed at the entrance examination, he had at any rate lost comparatively little money or time, whilst if he succeeded in entering the college he had a fair chance of an appointment, and was, moreover, well looked after during his stay in England. Under the selection system on the other hand, the candidate is compelled to reside in this country for some three or four years at an expenditure running into many thousands of rupees, with, in many cases, no one to look after and care for him. At the end of his studies he has about a one in ten chance of being selected, as there are only some two or three appointments annually available for some 20 or 30 applicants. The vast majority must, therefore, return to India without a Government appointment, and with very little hope of obtaining any other employment. Can it therefore be wondered at that all these unfortunates go back to India thoroughly disappointed, disheartened and dissatisfied, and full of resentment at a system which has led to their incurring such heavy losses? It may not be out of place here to point out that some at any rate, and I think an increasing number of these candidates are the sons of subordinates in the Public Works Department, Supervisors and Overseers, drawing comparatively small pay, who can certainly ill afford to risk the loss of so large a sum as, say, £1,000 and who certainly ought not to be tempted to incur that risk.

72,655. I have endeavoured to show above that the system is wholly wrong whether we regard it from the point of view of the parent or the candidate. It is equally unwise from that of Government, as the Committee have absolutely no knowledge of the candidates, and it is far less easy to be sure that the most suitable men are chosen from amongst the native candidates than is the case with the Europeans, and this, as already pointed out, is by no means a simple problem. Quite apart from this, there is the further difficulty that a man so chosen in London is as likely as not to be posted to any province but his own, and in that event will be quite as much a "pardesi" or "foreigner" as any European, having to learn a new language, and being out of touch with everything and everybody. On the one hand he will not have the prestige of the European, nor the support, sympathy, and social amenities of the people of the country. In short, he will be in all probability a veritable Ishmael with every man's hand against him.

72,656. The only possible remedy appears to me to be that native assistant engineers should be appointed in India on the recommendation of local Governments and administrations who should be required to employ the men so recommended in their own territories. In my judgment there is absolutely no necessity for insisting in their case on a course of training in this country; indeed, I am inclined to think that more useful men from the departmental standard could be secured from the Indian colleges.

72,657. So long as native assistant engineers are appointed in this country under the existing system, so long will it be necessary to appoint them on exactly the same pay and conditions as the Europeans appointed at the same time, and it was on the assumption that the Secretary of State might consider it necessary to adhere to these grants that I suggested some 15 months ago that the Government of India should be permitted to allot the small number of appointments thus available as special prizes to the various engineering colleges to be awarded to men of the different provinces in turn. I desire, however, to record my opinion that there is really no justification for offering to natives of India the salaries that are held to be necessary to secure the right stamp of European for the Indian service. I base this opinion solely on the fact, which I do not think anyone would care to deny, that the necessary expenses of a European Engineer in India are vastly greater than those of a native doing precisely the same work, so that the salary on which a European manages to live decently is really a splendid salary to a native, who probably is able to save three-fourths of it. To make this quite clear, I would point out that the salary that our young assistant engineers could hope to draw in England would certainly not be in excess of £100 to £150 a year, whilst many of them would be glad to get £50 a year. In order to induce these young men to take service in India, it is thought proper to offer them a commencing salary of Rs. 4,560, or, say, £300 a year, and we offer the same salary to young natives, some of whose parents, to my knowledge, cannot be drawing half that amount after, perhaps 30 or 40 years' service. I would invite attention to the fact that the present system of paying native assistant engineers recruited in England far higher salaries than those paid to their countrymen appointed from the Indian colleges, who are performing precisely similar work, must necessarily cause great heart-burning, and will, I believe, lead to trouble hereafter. It is also unfair to the finances of India that more pay than is warranted is disbursed to the men in question.

72,658. It appears to me that the justification for the employment of Europeans is the belief that they render more efficient service, whilst their salaries have been fixed on the ground that they cannot be obtained for less money. As soon as it can be shown that the work can be performed equally well by native and therefore cheaper agency, the latter may be expected to replace the European much to the advantage of the finances of the country. It is obvious, however, that nothing is to be gained by unnecessarily levelling-up the salaries of the men of the country.

72,659. It may not, perhaps, be out of place if I add, in conclusion, that no matter how good the system of recruitment may be, full value will never be obtained unless care is taken to see that all promotions are made on the score of merit alone and not on the ground of mere seniority. The man who appears to be best fitted for any special work or post should be selected for that work or post without regard being paid as to how he entered the service, or whether he has or has not followed the regular course of promotion. On the other hand, inefficiency—from whatever cause it may arise—should be dealt with far more drastically than was often the case during my service in India.

Colonel Sir JOHN OTTLEY, called and examined.

72,660. (*Chairman.*) The witness was President of Coopers Hill from 1899 to 1906, and was now a member of the Selection Committee for the Public Works Department and the Engineering branch of the Railway Department.

72,661. The selection of men for engineering appointments was made on a variety of qualifications, but as he had said in his written statement, it was quite unnecessary that the whole or even a large proportion of the recruits should hold very high academic distinctions. Every assistant engineer ought to have a certain amount of technical training, but he should not attach particular importance to First-class Honours. There had been a tendency rather to look upon a man who had taken First-class Honours as necessarily a very much better man than a man who had simply taken a pass degree, but his experience had shown him that in very many cases the honours man was more or less of a bookworm and often not quite so good at practical work. In selecting candidates he accepted any pass degree as a suitable qualification. If a man was undoubtedly better in other respects, he attached a certain amount of importance to an Honours Degree, as it showed that he was a good man all round, but he would not pit an Honours Degree against other qualifications.

72,662. On the whole he thought the Coopers Hill training, all round, was better than anything in existence now. Comparing the present system of selection with pure examination, he thought the system of selection was the better of the two, because a great many men who were good on paper in an examination utterly failed afterwards. Some of the very best men in India had been Stanley men, but some very poor specimens had got in by passing an examination. Therefore, he preferred a system of selection of the kind that was now in force. Fairly accurate information was obtained with regard to character and disposition, but he was not altogether satisfied in this respect. For instance, questions were put such as: "Do you consider that the candidate is likely to be able to work satisfactorily with natives of India?" "Is he suited for the business of the Government of India in this Department?" and these questions went to people who knew nothing whatever about India or Indians or the department, and invariably the reply was "Certainly," and such opinions were absolutely worthless. There seemed to be no remedy for that, but he had recently suggested that the questions might be re-cast. The best remedy he could suggest would be a definite probation of three years, and if a man was good he had nothing to fear. If he was not a good man the sooner he left the Service the better. He did not think such a rule would keep a man out of the Service as there was such enormous competition in England at the present moment in the engineering branch that there would be no difficulty in obtaining men. He regarded probation as essential.

72,663. On the Selection Committee there was no one with any recent experience of India, but the constitution of the Committee was a matter for the decision of the Secretary of State. It would probably assist the Committee in their work if a senior officer of the Service was on it, but it would be necessary to be very careful in selecting the officer.

72,664. Plane table surveying was taught in some of the engineering colleges, but he had had many candidates before him who had never used a plane table and knew nothing at all about river discharges.

72,665. There was one matter which was really very important for India. A young engineer went out to the country and found he had to do everything from the start. If he had to build, he had to find in many cases his brick-earth and had to make bricks, learn to burn lime, and do many things which were quite new to him. In England he would go to a contractor and buy everything ready made, but in India he had the preparation of the materials as well as the building. That was a thing that was taught at Coopers Hill as far as possible, but nothing of the kind was now taught in any of the colleges. At present the training in the colleges was more or less a mathematical training and not a practical training. That training had to be picked up gradually, and could hardly be picked up anywhere else than in India, but students might be given in the course of their training some foundation on which to work.

72,666. He would like to see Indians recruited to the service in India. He objected to sending Indians to England to be trained, because he thought it was a very cruel thing to do. He would have Indian officers in future appointed by selection in India, and even where there was an Indian who had been trained in England—and he did not think any Indian should be trained in England—the Secretary of State should send out particulars to India, and the selection should be made in that country.

72,667. With regard to the observation in the written statement, that at he end of his studies the Indian assistant engineer had about a one in ten chance of being selected, as there were only some two or three appointments annually available for some 20 or 30 applicants, he did not mean that there was a considerable number of Indians in England who were qualified to occupy positions as assistant engineers. They had their diplomas, but he did not think they had the other qualities, and there was no means of testing them. In many cases they were not the right stamp of men for the engineering profession. On the last occasion there were about 30 Indian candidates who had gone through courses in England, costing their parents from Rs. 12,000 to Rs. 15,000, money which might have been borrowed. Yet there could not possibly be more than one in ten who could get an appointment under the present system. He believed that 21 out of the 31 applicants had diplomas. They were all at the colleges, but some had not qualified, and there were only three appointments for the 21 candidates who actually held diplomas.

72,668. A diploma was no test of whether a man was fitted to be an engineer or not. There were points of character infinitely more important than any amount of technical education. On the technical side he did not consider that the diploma represented a sufficient qualification for the ordinary work of the Public Works Department. He would rather insist on practical experience than on technical training if it was necessary to choose between the two. Of course, for certain purposes it was necessary that a man should have high mathematical qualifications, but for the ordinary work of the Department such qualifications were absolutely not required.

72,669. It had been the rule of the selection committee to give preference to men who had had a year or more of practical experience. He was very doubtful about this so-called practical experience, because it was really not practical experience. A man would come forward and say he had been engaged on such-and-such works, and would give a list which would lead one to suppose that he had been actually engaged on the works, but when cross-examined on the subject it would be found that he had simply been to look at them. There were many cases where men had actually been employed and were good enough to be paid for their work, but in a very large number of cases that was not the case, the so-called practical experience simply amounting to the preparation of tracings in the drawing office. The difficulty was that a man who was going out to India paid a premium of 50 to 100 guineas for a year's training, and the people in charge of the works naturally had very little interest in him; they pocketed the premium and did very little in the way of teaching. In the case of Englishmen they often did not charge a premium at all, but took a lot of trouble with them, and during the second or third years they got their money back by making them useful. The men for India were *simply lookers-on.* A man might have been employed for only six months on works, but if his employer had found him valuable enough to pay for his services, that showed that he was useful. Hitherto the idea had been general that unless a man had a year's practical experience he would not be accepted, but he had had very largely to discard that idea, and therefore he was thrown back on the theoretical qualifications, the candidate's recommendations, and the

answers the man himself gave during his 10 minutes interview. It would be a good thing to have more than a 10 minutes interview, but it was quite possible in many cases after that time to say that a man was suitable. The rule guiding him was to put himself into the place of an employer and ask himself whether he would take the man on.

72,670. The material for selection was nothing like so strong as it looked on paper. There were a great many men who could be thrown out almost at sight. He was not opposed to examination after selection. Better practical experience could be obtained by probation in India, and after a man was selected he should go straight out to India to gain that experience, and it would be quite possible to say after three years in India whether the man was fit to be retained or not.

72,671. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) It was possible that, owing to the frequent change of superior officers, it might be difficult in two or three years to tell what the real value of a probationer was. No doubt it would be a difficult thing for a superior officer in the Public Works Department to make a selection in India after a three years' trial, and the chances were that unless the man was very bad he would remain in the Department, but the authorities in India would at any rate have had the opportunity of finding out whether a man was or was not suitable, and this would be an improvement on the present system.

72,672. With regard to the colleges in England to which Indians went for training, it could not be said that there was any special college. Of those that appeared before the Committee this year five came from Edinburgh, four each from University College and the City and Guilds Institute, three from Glasgow and one each from Armstrong College, King's College, Cambridge, Manchester, and Liverpool.

72,673. When he found that the training had been really practical he placed great value upon it; in other cases the value he attached to it was very small.

72,674. (*Sir Valentine Chirol.*) He did not think that there was any need for a redistribution of the work done by members of the Public Works Department when they got out to India. Young engineers, whether assistants or executives, in the majority of cases did not require high mathematical qualifications. What he had in his mind was the fact that a good many men of very high qualifications had proved absolutely useless in practical work. He knew many men of his own time, Royal Engineers, Stanley engineers and Coopers Hill men, who were head and shoulders, from the mathematical point of view, above their compeers and yet were absolutely useless for practical work. That seemed rather to show that much of the work which engineers were put to when they first reached India was not the work on account of which they were recruited; they were chosen to do a very much higher class of work and when they got to India they were put to work of a very different character, and when the time came for them to take on first-class mathematical work they had lost to some extent the power of doing it. He did not think that could be remedied by any redistribution of the work done by the Department in India, because not only high mathematical qualifications in certain instances were required but experience to use those qualifications, and that could be only obtained on work. The young engineer might be used as an assistant to an officer on a big design, but at first he could only carry out the orders of somebody else. He was afraid it was impossible to relieve the engineer of the prolonged burden of so-called inferior work during the first few years, because there were very few higher posts, and they required experience, and in the meantime all the work of the Department had to be done by people who could do it with very much lower qualifications. The ordinary work which had to be done by the Department was very humdrum work indeed, such as road maintenance and construction and survey work.

72,675. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) He was not inclined to say that the education of an engineer in England was higher than it was possible to get in India, and so far as the engineering service was concerned it would be possible to recruit from Indian engineering colleges. He did not see any reason why it was necessary to recruit Indians from England at all. The European could not be recruited in India, and he had never come across an Indian who was the equal of the English engineer on the work. He did not say that the Indian engineer could do the work expected of him; what he said was that the education in the Indian colleges was as good as that in the English, but, as he had said over and over again, the education was a very minor consideration. There was no question of race involved. As soon as Indian engineers could be got to do the work as well as Europeans, then by all means they should be employed. Since 1903 Indian engineers had been sent out, and it was for India to say whether they had done their work to the satisfaction of the authorities in India. He was not in a position to say whether Indian engineers trained in Indian colleges did their work as well as Indian engineers trained in English colleges. The only persons capable of giving an opinion on this point must be those on the spot who could make the comparison.

72,676. With regard to the statement in his memorandum that "in order to induce the young men to take service in India, it is thought proper to offer them a commencing salary of Rs. 4,560, and we offer the same salary to young Indians, some of whose parents, to my knowledge, cannot be drawing half that amount after 30 or 40 years' service," he did not mean by that that the young Indian engineer was not to be paid a salary larger than his father had been getting, but he did not think he was the class of man to be put in a position of control over a large number of people, and, therefore, he was not a man to be an assistant engineer. That was not necessarily because his father had been in a subordinate service. When he wrote that paragraph he had in his mind that it was not a satisfactory thing for a man in the position of a subordinate to spend an enormous amount of money on sending his son home to England merely on the chance of getting double the pay that his father was drawing at the end of 30 or 40 years' service. It was not intended in any way to be an offensive statement.

72,677. There had been no Indian member on the Selection Committee.

72,678. (*Mr. Fisher.*) The number of officers recruited each year varied. In 1912 there were only 19 whilst in 1913 there were 33 vacancies. Some years ago there were as many as 234 applicants for about 30 vacancies, but at present there were about 130 applicants for the same number of vacancies, the number of applicants being on the decline. It was difficult to say what that decrease was due to.*

72,679. The Selection Committee did not make a point of approaching the different engineering schools, and it might be a good plan to send round to each of the colleges in order to get some information about the men on the spot. He did not think it would be practicable to give to each of the principal engineering colleges in England a certain number of places and put the responsibility upon the heads of those colleges to recommend candidates, at the same time asking the colleges to undertake to give instruction in those particular branches of engineering knowledge which were directly applicable to India, such as used to be given at Coopers Hill. One year a large number might come up from one particular college, and in the following year there might not be a single man from that college. The principals were asked to place the men as far as possible in order of merit, but it was very rarely that the Selection Committee took precisely the same view as the principals in regard to the relative merits of candidates.

72,680. If an Indian showed any special bent in any particular direction, it might possibly be useful to bring him over to England for further training. That was reverting to what took place some 40 years ago, when two assistant engineers were sent over for

* The witness subsequently wrote:—It is probably due to the fact that the conditions of selection are now better understood by applicants, because it appeared that of the 234 candidates who applied in 1909 only 103 came before the Committee, the remainder having been ruled out as not fulfilling all the conditions laid down. On the other hand, out of the 136 candidates applying in 1914, no less than 91 came before the Committee. It would, therefore, seem that the number of qualified candidates has not really diminished to any serious extent.

special training. He would not lay down any definite number to be sent over each year, but leave that to be fixed as men were found to be available.

72,681. It was quite true that while the Indian engineering colleges could give a training in civil engineering as good as could be obtained in England, they might be behind English colleges in mechanical engineering and electrical engineering, but he was not dealing with either of those branches, but simply with civil engineering, such engineering as would be taught at Sibpur College and the Thomason College. For all purposes of the Public Works Department, he thought those Indian colleges gave a better education than was given in England, or certainly as good.

72,682. (*Mr. Sly.*) The Selection Committee were responsible for the selection of engineers required for Indian railways as well as for the Public Works Department, and as far as possible every man selected for a railway appointment had at least one year's training on a large railway in England, and he believed that in the present year every man had had considerably more, some having two or three years' experience. It would be a good thing if that was made a definite condition of recruitment to the railway service. It was no use sending a man on to a railway unless constructional work was going on. It was difficult to secure facilities in England for candidates, but it should be made somebody's business to see that it was done.

72,683. The Indian Public Works Department compared very favourably with other openings for young engineers in point of attractiveness. It was largely a question of money. At present the Indian Public Works Department attracted a really good standard of engineering students.

72,684. With regard to the 10 per cent. rule, it was laid down that the committee had to select at least 10 per cent. of Indians, and he knew of no rule which permitted more than 10 per cent. to be selected if qualified candidates were available. The standard of Indian candidates had varied considerably. In the early days the committee had selected three Indians and had reported that had they been Europeans not one of them would have been chosen, but since then the standard had so improved that, so far as technical qualifications were concerned, many men could have been selected had the 10 per cent. rule not been in force and it became increasingly difficult to select the best two or three men. In saying this, he was merely comparing Indians with Indians and not with Europeans. There were certain specific degrees of engineering colleges which were accepted as qualifications, amongst them the qualifications of the Institution of Civil Engineers. Some of the qualifications were very likely to be considerably altered. A Past President of the Institution of Civil Engineers sat on the last Selection Committee and had taken note of several of the cases. In the case for instance of one of the colleges it was said that the degree was accepted with advanced mathematics, but when he came to cross-examine on the matter he found there was no examination in mathematics at all, and that the student had merely attended certain mathematical lectures; whether he had benefited from them at all there was nothing to show.

72,685. He doubted very much whether a great deal of work which formerly used to be done by assistant engineers had now been transferred to the Provincial Service and that assistant engineers had now to discharge much higher duties than used to the case.

72,686-75,143. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The Selection Committee had nothing to do with telegraph engineers. He had been told that mechanical engineering and electrical engineering were better taught in this country than in India, but he had no knowledge on the subject.

(The witness withdrew).

LIST OF APPENDICES.

I. Note by Mr. R. P. Russell, Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department, relating to the percentage of officers appointed to the Public Works Department in England and from the Engineering College at Rurki, who have risen to administrative rank... ... ...

II. Note by Lala Wazir Chand Chopra relating to the percentage of officers appointed to the Public Works Department in England and in India, who have risen to administrative rank ... ...

III. Conditions of Temporary Employment in the Public Works Department with form of Declaration for Temporary Engineers ... ...

IV. Memorials of certain temporary Engineers to the Viceroy and to the Lieutenant Governor of the Punjab; with connected correspondence ... ...

V. Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, No. 1617 (Home-General), dated Lahore, 7th October, 1913 ... ...

VI. Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, No. 1787 (Home-General), dated Lahore, 5th November, 1913 ... ...

VII. Memorandum prepared by the Government of the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh ... ...

VIII. Memorandum prepared by the Bengal Government relating to the Public Works Department ... ...

IX. Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bihar and Orissa relating to the Public Works Department

X. Memorandum prepared by the Assam Administration relating to the Public Works Department ... ...

XI. Note, dated 21st April, 1913, by the Honourable Sir Archdale Earle, K.C.I.E., Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Public Works Department ... ...

XII. Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Public Works Department ...

XIII. Memorials submitted by Engineers of the Public Works Department to the Viceroy and to the Secretary of State for India ... ...

XIV. Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Public Works Department ...

XV. Transfer expenses of Mr. Henry J. M. Cousens... ... ...

XVI. Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bombay relating to the Public Works Department ...

XVII. Memorandum prepared by the Administration of the Central Provinces and Berar relating to the Public Works Department ... ...

XVIII. Statement, with details by Provinces, of the Civil Appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on the 1st April, 1913, in the Public Works Department ... ...

XIX. Indian Public Works Department and Indian State Railways—Regulations as to the Appointment of Assistant Engineers, 1914 ... ...

XX. Officials and non-officials who furnished written evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their enquiry into the Public Works Department, but who were not orally examined ... ...

APPENDIX I.

(Referred to in paragraph 71,285—Mr. R. P. Russell's evidence.)

Note by Mr. R. P. Russell, Secretary to the Government of India in the Public Works Department, relating to the percentage of officers appointed to the Public Works Department in England and from the Engineering College at Rurki, who have risen to Administrative Rank.

1. During my examination on November 17th by the Royal Commission the question was put to me whether it was not a fact that a greater proportion of officers, appointed from the Indian Engineering College, Rurki, had been selected for appointment in the administrative grades, than in the case of officers appointed by the Secretary of State in England—the object of the question I understood was to indicate that the average qualification of officers appointed from the Indian Engineering College was higher than of those appointed in England.

2. I expressed my doubt if an examination of the records would substantiate the assertion.

3. It is obvious that the matter can only be tested by taking the figures for both cases over the same period; it would, for example, lead to a false conclusion if the percentage of all the Engineers from the Engineering College, Rurki, who have risen to administrative rank since, say, 1850, were compared with the percentage of officers who have been appointed in England and have risen to the same rank since 1870.

I attach a statement showing in both cases the number of appointments made from the year 1872 —the year in which the first appointments from Coopers Hill were made—to the year 1893 (no officer appointed later than 1893 has yet reached administrative rank) and the number of men in each case of each year who subsequently rose to administrative rank substantively. The result shows that out of a total of 513 officers appointed in England during the 22 years under consideration, 172 or 33·5 per cent. reached administrative rank. Out of a total of 168 officers appointed from Rurki during the same period 38 or 22·6 per cent. reached administrative rank. The assertion made is therefore incorrect and consequently the deduction from it.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT (including RAILWAYS).

Year.	Appointments from the Cooper's Hill College.		Appointments from the Rurki College.	
	Number appointed each year.	Number of Officers of each year who reached administrative rank.	Number appointed each year.	Number of Officers of each year who reached administrative rank.
1872	1	1	13	1
1873	6	4	16	6
1874	43	19	22	2
1875	42	16	15	—
1876	38	14	8	5
1877	47	13	8	2
1878	41	15	8	3
1879	42	12	7	3
1880	35	15	*	*
1881	34	11	8	4
1882	29	12	8	2
1883	16	6	8	3
1884	13	7	8	1
1885	13	7	5	2
1886	15	5	5	2
1887	15	2	4	1
1888	14	6	4	—
1889	15	2	4	1
1890	15	3	5	—
1891	15	1	4	—
1892	12	—	3	—
1893	12	1	5	—
Total	513	172	168	38
	33·5 %		22·6 %	

* No recruitment from Rurki in 1880.

APPENDIX II.

(Referred to in paragraph 71,570—Lala Wazir Chand Chopra's evidence.)

Note by Lala Wazir Chand Chopra relating to the percentage of officers appointed to the Public Works Department in England and in India who have risen to administrative rank.

Taking the Government of India lists, which deal with the whole of India, except Railways, Bombay, and Madras, for the last 5 years (I have taken those for June each year), we get the following figures in Administrative ranks:—

Year.	Indian College Engineers.			England-trained Engineers including Royal Engineers.			Grand Total.	Total percentage of Indian College men, *i.e.*, percentage of column 4 over column 8.
	Chief Engineers.	Superintending Engineers.	Total.	Chief Engineers.	Superintending Engineers.	Total.		
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
								per cent.
June, 1909 ...	5	18	23	9	41	50	73	32
June, 1910 ...	4	19	23	9	38	47	70	33
June, 1911 ...	4	18	22	8	38	46	68	33
June, 1912 ...	3	19	22	10	41	51	73	30
June, 1913 ...	3	17	20	12	42	54	74	27
Average percentage.								31

The corresponding recruitment can be taken by striking the average of the 3 years 1888-1890. This will give an average difference of 22 years; which is the average length of service for Administrative ranks. The figures are as follows:—

Year.	Men recruited in India.	Men recruited in England including Royal Engineers.	Total.	Percentage of Indian recruits over the total, *i.e.*, of column 2 over column 4.	REMARKS.
1	2	3	4	5	6
				per cent.	
1888	2	9	11	18	The recruitment is taken only in those Branches and Provinces which are at present included in the Government of India list to make the comparison with years 1909–1913 correct.
1889	7	12	19	37	
1890	4	11	15	27	
Average percentage.				27	

Thus although the average percentage of recruitment of Indian College men was about 27, their percentage in Administrative ranks is 31. At the time of the last Public Service Commission the general percentage of Indian recruitment was 30, and 31 is better than that even. The present day percentage of Indian recruitment is still lower, namely, about 20. Since this Administrative rank percentage of 31 is better than all the percentages of recruitment, I draw the inference that the percentage in Administrative ranks of Indian College Engineers is better than the proportion of their respective recruitments.

APPENDIX III.

(Referred to in paragraph 71,667—Mr. F. M. Purves' evidence.)

Conditions of Temporary Employment in the Public Works Department with form of Declaration for Temporary Engineers.

A. *Conditions of Temporary Employment in the Public Works Department.*

(For temporary employés on pay higher than Rs. 250 per mensem engaged for a particular work or for those whose appointments have been sanctioned by the Government of India.)

I.—Persons engaged temporarily will be on the footing of monthly servants, and their employment carries with it absolutely no claim to pension, or to any absentee allowances beyond those conditionally given to temporary employés under Articles 201 (Note), 242 (*a*), 336 (Rule 1) and 339 (Rule 2) of the Civil Service Regulations.

II.—The services of such employés may be dispensed with at any time without notice in case of serious misconduct on their part—and otherwise after one month's notice, or on payment of one month's salary in lieu of notice. Also with or without notice their engagement will cease absolutely on the completion of the work in connection with which their appointments may have been sanctioned by either the Government of India or the Local Government. Should they desire to resign their appointments they wlil be required to give a month's notice of their intention to do so or to forfeit a month's salary in lieu of such notice.

Extract from the Public Works Department Code and from the Civil Service Regulations.

Public Works Department Code (Ninth Edition), Chapter I, para. 111, Rule IV.

Rule IV.—Persons engaged locally will be on the footing of monthly servants, and they must be clearly informed in writing that their employment carries with it absolutely no claim to pension or to any absentee allowances beyond those conditionally given to temporary employés under Article 201 (Note) 242, 336 (Rule 1) and 339 (Rule 2) of the Civil Service Regulations, and they must be required to sign a declaration that this is clearly understood by them. As soon as they have joined their appointments, the fact should be reported to the Government of India, in order that the transaction may be reported to the Secretary of State, *vide* clause (1), Rule III, para. 361. If they are engaged for a special work, their engagement lasts only for the period during which the work lasts. If dismissed otherwise than for serious misconduct before the completion of the work, they will be entitled to a month's notice or pay in lieu of notice; but otherwise, with or without notice, their engagement terminates when the work ends. If they desire to resign their appointments they will be required to give a month's notice of their intention

to do so or forfeit a month's pay in lieu of such notice.

The terms of engagement should be clearly explained to men employed under the circumstances mentioned in this order.

Article 201. *Note.*—[The rules providing for the grant of leave to an officer who has a temporary or officiating appointment only are contained in Articles 242, 336, Rule 1, and 339 of Rule 2.]

Article 242 (*a*).—An officer, who has a temporary or officiating appointment only may be allowed Privilege leave, without losing his lien on such appointment, if no substitute is required, or if his duties can be provided for without additional expense.

Article 336.—Leave on Medical Certificate may be granted for three years in all, but not for more than two years at one time; and no officer can have leave on Medical Certificate out of India more than twice.

1.—An officer who has a temporary or officiating appointment only may be allowed leave under this Article for not more than three months, if no substitute is required, or if his duties can be provided for without additional expense.

Article 339.—Extraordinary leave without allowances, may, in case of necessity, and when no other leave is by Rule admissible, be granted for such time as may be necessary. Time spent on leave under this Article does not count as service for other leave. Subject to the provisions of Article 198, there is no limit to the length or frequency of leave under this Article. It may not be granted in combination with the grant of other leave except as provided in Article 233. But it may be granted in continuation of other leave if circumstances arise which prevent the return by the officer to duty, and which, in the opinion of the Local Government or the authority empowered to grant the leave, are such as to justify the concession. No officer is *entitled* to Extraordinary leave.

* * * * * *

2.—An officer who has a temporary or officiating appointment only may, at the discretion of the Local Government or the head of the officer's office, be allowed leave under this Article for not more than three months.

B. Form of Declaration for Temporary Engineers.—I do hereby declare that I have been made acquainted with the conditions prescribed for temporary employés in the Public Works Department, as laid down in Chapter I, para. 111, Rule IV, of the Public Works Code (Ninth Edition); that these terms are clearly understood by me, and that I am willing to accept employment under them.

APPENDIX IV.

(Referred to in paragraphs 71,667-68—Mr. F. M. Purves' evidence.)

Memorials of certain Temporary Engineers and connected correspondence, as follows:—(I) *To His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab;* (II) *To His Excellency the Viceroy, enclosing Memorial to His Honour the Lieutenant Governor of the Punjab, with reply;* (III) *Connected Correspondence.*

(I) To His Honour
The Honourable Sir Michael Francis O'Dwyer, K.C.S.I., I.C.S.,
Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab and its Dependencies.

The humble Memorial of
Temporary Engineer, Irrigation Branch, Public Works Department, Punjab.

Dated the 1913.

Sheweth

That Your Memorialist is employed as a Temporary Engineer in the Irrigation Branch of the Public Works Department in the Punjab.

That he has served the Government faithfully and to the best of his ability since he was appointed.

2. That up to June 1908 the last sentence of sub-para. 1 of para. III of the Public Works Department Code, Volume I, 1907, fixed the salaries of all Temporary Engineers at a maximum of Rs. 950 per mensem. That in 1908 that paragraph was cancelled, and that such cancellation led to the natural belief that the maximum salary of a Temporary Engineer would not be, in the future, restricted. That there are several Temporary Engineers all over India, with salaries ranging from Rs. 750 to Rs. 1,250 per mensem.

3. That Your Memorialist has only lately been informed of the contents of letter No. 1700 E., dated 20th December, 1911, from Secretary to the Government of India, to Secretary to Government, Punjab. That the above quoted letter limits the increments which may be earned by Temporary Engineers to Rs. 50 per mensem after two years of approved service; and his salary to a maximum of Rs. 700 per mensem.

4. That Your Memorialist most respectfully submits that a decision so momentous to Your Memorialist's future prospects and position, and so much at variance with Your Honour's well known equity, should not, in justice, have been kept from Your Petitioner's knowledge for nearly nineteen months.

5. That Your Memorialist is forced to conclude that such stringent restrictions of Your Petitioner's prospects were ordered, without due consideration of the conditions of Your Memorialist's service, and Your Memorialist's just expectations.

6. That Your Memorialist's conditions of service are briefly as follows:—

(*a*) Liability to dismissal with one month's notice without cause assigned.

(*b*) Absence of all title to pension or gratuity.

(*c*) Dependence of increments to salaries and retention of service entirely on the reports of the immediate superior, appreciation by the recommending authority, and, finally, approval of the same by the Local Government and Government of India.

(*d*) A higher quality of work expected than that demanded of Permanent Engineers in spite of mental strain consequent on disabilities (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*).

7. That by the Re-organisation of 1908 and the subsequent Resolution of Government, the prospects of all classes of Permanent Engineers were enhanced.

8. That when the emoluments of the Permanent Establishment of the Public Works Department were increased, Your Memorialist was filled with great hope that Your Honour's Government would forthwith proceed to enquire into the case of the establishment of Temporary Engineers, and that their disabilities would be ameliorated. That, therefore, Your Memorialist is unable to grasp the reason if any, why Your Memorialist's just expectations of similar treatment have been nullified, and Your Petitioner's prospects thus curtailed.

9. That the attitude of the Government, as indicated by the letter of the Secretary to the Government of India, in the Public Works Department, quoted above, has shattered every hope of advancement. That Your Memorialist, suffering under a sense of uniformly unsympathetic treatment, will be slowly but surely crushed beneath the weight of burdens imposed by the Government, Your Memorialist has served with such ability as has, to Your Memorialist, been given.

10. That, considering all the indications which have from time to time been revealed by the Government of unsympathetic treatment meted out to Temporary Engineers, Your Memorialist may be pardoned in arriving at the conclusion that Your Memorialist's position is gradually becoming more and more untenable. That Your Memorialist may be further pardoned for humbly submitting that such treatment is foreign to the whole tenour of that justice which is the treasured tradition of a Great Government.

11. That Your Memorialist humbly and respectfully prays that Your Honour will be pleased to forward this Memorial to His Excellency the Viceroy, and to recommend the following reliefs, *viz.*:—

(*i*) The withdrawal of the order fixing the maximum pay of *Temporary Engineers* at Rs. 700 per mensem, and increments at fifty rupees every second year, and

(*ii*) Sanction to Your Memorialist remaining eligible for such increases of salary for which Your Memorialist may from time to time be recommended, and this on some recognised basis.

And Your Memorialist will ever pray, &c.

(II) To His Excellency
The Right Honourable CHARLES
BARON HARDINGE OF PENSHURST,
G.M.S.I., G.M.I.E., K.C.B., etc.,
Viceroy and Governor-General of India
in Council.

(Through proper channel).

The humble Memorial of , Temporary Engineer, Irrigation Branch, Public Works Department, Punjab.

Dated the 1913.

Sheweth:—

That Your Memorialist is employed as a Temporary Engineer in the Irrigation Branch of the Public Works Department in the Punjab.

That he has served the Government faithfully and to the best of his ability since he was appointed.

2. That in November, 1912, Your Memorialist submitted a Memorial to His Honour Sir Louis William Dane, then Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab, setting forth his grievances and praying that a recommendation be made to competent authority, for such relief as might seem just and proper in the circumstances.

3. That the reply received from His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor—a copy of which, together with copy of original Memorial, is attached as Appendices (*B*) and (*A*) is so extremely unsympathetic and disappointing, not to say disheartening, that Your Excellency's Memorialist is constrained to appeal to Your Excellency's acknowledged sympathy, for a consideration of Your Memorialist's grievances.

4. That His Honour's reply to paras. (1), (2), and (6) of Your Memorialist's original Memorial does not appear to recognise the fact that the establishment of Temporary Engineers has steadily increased from its inception in 1891; showing that the tenure of office has been accepted by all concerned as practically permanent; and that Temporary Engineers are in no sense of the word the casual employees for which the rules in the Civil Service Regulations were designed, and subject to which they have to work.

That, if it had been the intention of Government merely to employ men to suit requirements, Your Memorialist humbly submits that it would have been fairer to have dispensed with their services after three, four or five years and to have engaged others. That there would then have been no mistake as to the intentions of Government, and it would have become evident that men of the class needed would not have been obtainable at the salaries accepted, in the just hope of good prospects. That by retaining their services for ten, fifteen and twenty years Your Memorialist submits what Your Memoralist ventures to think Your Excellency's justice will allow, that such men have earned a lien on their appointments, and that Government is thereby under a moral obligation to provide for their futures (they being trained specialists and unable to gain suitable employment outside Government service); and to secure them and those dependent on them from penurious want.

That no allusion was made to State Railway Engineers by Your Memorialist, who distinctly referred to "all other non-pensionable public officers employed on State Railways." That there would appear to be no reason why a body of highly specialized officers should be obliged to labour under less favourable conditions than non-pensionable public officers of State Railways.

5. That prayer (6) has received no reply whatever, that being combined with prayers (1) and (3), it has escaped consideration. That Temporary Engineers on all open lines of Railways are admitted to special provident rules, along with all other non-pensionable establishment. And Your Memorialist fails to understand why a Department which yields considerably better results than State Railways should be unable to treat the very employees, who contribute so largely to such results, with equal liberality as the Railway Department.

6. That judging, by His Honour's reply to prayer (2), the purport of Your Memorialist's prayer would seem to have been entirely misunderstood.

That Your Memorialist did not intend to ask for the *frequency* of selection to the permanent establishment to be regulated; but that such transfers might be more frequent than at present, and that *selection* be governed by some recognised principle. *That the Temporary Engineers as a body, in view of their wide experience and services, be constituted one of the sources, if not the main source, of recruitment to the Irrigation Branch of the Public Works Department after a period of approved service.*

7. That His Honour's reply to prayer (4) is the first intimation of any order of the Government of India limiting Your Memorialist's increments to Rs. 50 every second year, and that the omission to inform Your Memorialist of an order, fraught with so much importance to Your Memorialist, is a typical instance of the scant consideration meted out to a body of men, deserving well of the Government. That such an order is exceedingly disheartening to Your Memorialist, who has been led to believe that good work would always be suitably rewarded. That the order is all the more depressing from a consideration of the fact that Permanent Engineers get annual increments of Rs. 35 and 50, respectively, after 8 years' service.

That Your Memorialist begs to submit that Temporary Engineers performing the *same duties*, under far less favourable conditions, with no guarantee of continuous employment, or of provision in the future, in the shape of either pension or adequate provident provision, are entitled to at least an equal, if not better, rate of increment than their permanent confrères.

8. That Your Memorialist has waited patiently for five years since hearing of the improvement in the prospects of the permanent establishment, for some amelioration of the conditions of Your Memorialist's service before appealing to Your Excellency; and humbly submits that this should be accounted unto Your Memorialist for righteousness.

9. That Your Memorialist accordingly humbly and respectfully prays that Your Excellency will be pleased to take this and the earlier Memorial into your favourable consideration and grant the following reliefs, namely:—

(1) That Temporary Engineers of over four years' standing be made permanent, non-pensionable, and be borne on the same cadre as the Permanent Engineers, who are pensionable and promoted side by side with them in due and ordinary course.

(2) That the selection of Temporary Engineers for appointment to the pensionable list may be regulated in such manner as may be just and suitable, and that

such selections may be more frequently made than at present, and on some recognised basis.

(3) That Temporary Engineers be treated in all respects in the same manner as all other non-pensionable public officers employed on the State Railways in India.

(4) That their increments may be made annual and on a more liberal scale than at present, and that such increments may be regulated by fixed rules as in the case of the pensionable staff of Engineers.

(5) That they may be granted the language rewards and allowances granted to their confrères on the pensionable list.

(6) That their Provident Fund be placed on the same basis as those of State Railways; and

(7) That the leave rules applicable to all other Indian services be extended to them.

(8) That Your Memorialist's request for permanency be specially considered.

Or such other or further relief as to Your Excellency may seem just and proper in the circumstances.

And Your Memorialist will ever pray, &c.,

ENCLOSURES IN ABOVE.

(A.) To His Honour
The Honourable Sir LOUIS WILLIAM DANE,
G.C.I.E., C.S.I., I.C.S.,
Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab.

The humble Memorial of
Temporary Engineer, Irrigation Branch, Public Works Department, Punjab.

Dated the 18th November 1912.

Sheweth—

That your Memorialist is employed as a Temporary Engineer in the Irrigation Branch of the Public Works Department in the Punjab.

That he has served the Government faithfully and to the best of his ability since he was appointed.

2. That, while the rules applicable to temporary Engineers debar them from many rights, advantages and privileges which are allowed to the permanent service, whether Imperial or Provincial, your Memorialist believes that it will be generally admitted that they form a useful body of public servants and have, for many years, as a body, rendered valuable services to the State. That, in this view, your Memorialist ventures to approach Your Honour in the hope of obtaining the redress of some of what he humbly ventures to regard as his grievances and, generally, an improvement in his position and prospects.

3. That, in order to make his case clear, your Memorialist begs to explain that Temporary Engineers were first employed, in the Punjab, in 1891, for work on the Lower Chenab Canal and the Sirsa Branch of the Western Jumna Canal: That this became necessary because of the reduction of the staff of Engineers in the Public Works Department, brought about by facilitating retirements in order to relieve a block in the service, with the result that the numbers soon became too low to meet the requirements of the works to be executed: That, in the course of the years 1891-98, a considerable number of Temporary Engineers were engaged and an effort was at first made by the Government to obtain the services of purely Temporary Engineers on a higher rate of salaries than that prevailing in the lower grades of the regular service. That this effort having failed, attention was turned to recruiting Temporary Engineers from amongst young, newly-qualified persons, with the intention of training and specialising them and employing them continuously without involving liabilities in respect of pensions. That officers thus specialising as Canal Engineers can only look to the Government, which has had them trained, for future employment and, if their services are dispensed with, find it impossible to obtain suitable employment elsewhere.

4. That there are now fifty-six Temporary Engineers in the Irrigation Branch of the Public Works Department of the Punjab, of whom—

22 have five years' service or less;
21 have more than five and less than ten years' service;
8 have more than ten and less than fifteen years' service, and
4 have more than fifteen years' service;
1 has more than twenty-one years' service.

—
56

That these officers, some of whom have served for many years, are allowed no rank or grade promotion even when they hold Divisional charges.

That the above Temporary Engineers are, in addition to three covenanted Engineers, employed in the Amritsar Workshops and six Temporary Engineers employed in the Roads and Buildings Branch.

That there are employed in the Irrigation Branch of the Public Works Department of the Punjab, 42 Assistant Engineers on the Imperial List and 14 Assistant Engineers on the Provincial List, so that the body of Temporary Engineers, who are all substantively Assistant Engineers, is more than four times the number of Assistants in the Provincial List, 26 per cent. more than the number of Imperial Assistants, and more than 50 per cent. of all the Assistant Engineers employed in the whole of the Irrigation Branch of the Province. That these facts make it clear that this large body now consists of Engineers practically in permanent employ, but placed on a separate list from the permanent Engineers, the chief distinction between the two lists being that the so-called Temporary Engineers are not entitled to pension.

5. That it is humbly urged that these figures show that the Government policy has long since changed from that which originally led to a few Engineers being temporarily engaged from time to time to meet emergencies and for special works and that the so-called Temporary Engineers now really form a large and integral part of the permanent staff, though engaged on altogether different terms, and are employed regularly on every class of work: That the Engineers so employed now constitute a regular service of Engineers, who, though still called "Temporary Engineers," are engaged on less favourable terms, in almost every respect, than those accorded to the permanent service. That Temporary Engineers discharge precisely the same duties as the latter, and many are compelled to submit to the humiliation of serving under their juniors in age, experience or length of service. That the engagement of Temporary Engineers is renewed annually and they are liable to dismissal after one month's notice, however long they may have served.

6. That it is humbly urged that the list of the so-called Temporary Engineers contains men who are in no way inferior in educational and professional qualifications to the men on the permanent list: That most officers recruited as Temporary Engineers hoped and believed that, if they gave satisfaction, they would, after some period of probation, be placed on the list of the permanent service. That this hope has been encouraged by appointments actually made from time to time to the permanent list:

That the following Temporary Engineers have been so advanced:—

Date of appointment to Permanent Service.	Name.	Present Rank.	Date at first appointment as Temporary Engineer.
1905	C. J. Floyd ..	Officiating Superintending Engineer.	May, 1891.
1898	C. B. Williams	" "	June, 1891.
"	F. T. Bates...	" "	September, 1892.
"	J. N. Taylor	Executive Engineer	May, 1891.
1905	E. H. Purves	" "	January, 1893.
1898	E. R. Foy ...	" "	December, 1894.
1905	C. B. Mellor	" "	May, 1892.
"	A. E. Jeffries	" "	February, 1891.
"	W. C. W. Muller.	" "	May, 1894.
"	R. C. R. Wilson.	" "	September, 1898.
"	C. H. A. Muller.	" "	May, 1895.

That in 1898 there were 32 Temporary Engineers and only 5 were made permanent, and in 1905 there were 50 such Engineers of whom only 7 were made permanent.

That fourteen Engineers were engaged, for fixed terms, in Europe, under covenants. That, of these eight men were, on the expiry of their respective terms, transferred to the Permanent List, while two others remained on the Temporary List. That the others retired at the end of their terms. *That the transfer of these eight Temporary Engineers to the Permanent List over the heads of the Temporary Engineers engaged in India, who were senior to them, was regarded as a grievous hardship.* That there were, on the Temporary List at least thirteen officers of longer service than these eight officers.

7. That the policy of the Government appears to have been to use Temporary Engineers for the purpose of graduating or regulating the flow of promotion in the permanent service, and that their services and interests, and the hardships thus imposed upon them, have been entirely overlooked. That, as a body of useful and hardworking public servants, discharging the same duties as their brethren on the Permanent List, and, in fact, themselves continuously employed, they feel this treatment very acutely indeed.

8. That by retaining so-called Temporary Engineers continuously in the service for many years, and gradually increasing their numbers, until they now form a very important proportion of the entire Engineering Establishment, it is humbly submitted that the Government have broken away from the original principle of engaging such Engineers for purely temporary service, and your Memorialists humbly contends that hopes have thus been raised which ought, in justice, to be fulfilled and urges that the Government should meet the just expectations of the present body of Temporary Engineers, who have done good work for so many years that their prospects are bound up in the Government service. That the discontent which has arisen amongst this useful body of public servants, cannot, it is submitted, be deemed unnatural when the disadvantages under which they (as practically forming a permanent service) labour as compared with their brethren on the Permanent List.

9. That the permanent services of the Public Works Department have recently been re-organized and the position and prospects of the members of those services have been greatly improved, while nothing has been done to mitigate the hardships of the class of Temporary Engineers. That your Memorialists, therefore, humbly and respectfully solicits that the hardships under which his service suffers and the grievances under which he himself labours may be mitigated and relieved.

10. That, in the matter of appointment to the permanent staff, two sets of selections have hitherto been made. That in the first case selecion was made only from those Temporary Engineers who were at the time employed on a single canal: That this told hardly on the general body of Temporary Engineers: That such promotion should, in justice, have been made by seniority tempered by selection from amongst the whole body of such Engineers. That the second set of selections was made from different canals, it is true, but seniority was more or less ignored, even in the case of seniors holding professional and service qualifications equal, if not superior, to some of the juniors who were selected: That, moreover, not a single Indian was selected for appointment to the permanent service although several were senior and equally qualified: That the list given in paragraph six, will make this clear. That it is humbly submitted that the selections have been few in number and have not been made on any recognized and sound principle: That five officers of over fifteen years' service, of acknowledged ability and good conduct, have been left out. That, out of the Temporary Engineers, of between five and ten years' service, there are several who would undoubtedly receive promotion in any other department of the service of Government. That it is impossible to expect officers of unquestioned character and ability, having several years of approved service and a good record behind them, to be contented under the conditions at present applicable to the Temporary Engineers in the Punjab. That it is respectfully urged that it is to the interests of the Government to ameliorate their condition and to render them contented and, therefore, more useful public servants.

11. That it cannot be advantageous to the Government to constitute a class of public servants which is looked upon by the members of another class of such servants, as being of inferior status, and the members of which are treated as having no right to consideration in matters of rank, promotion and the like. That many high officers of the Department have expressed the opinion that the present state of things, under which the same work is done by officers recruited on two different sets of conditions, those recruited on one set being placed on a lower status as regards permanency of employment, promotion and other privileges, and being regarded with supercilious contempt by their confrères who were recruited on another set of conditions giving them a more assured and favourable position, is not satisfactory. That, whatever else may be said, Temporary Engineers, as already shown, now form an integral part, and a large proportion of the Engineering Establishment of the Punjab.

12. That the chief grievances which your Memorialists desires to put forward may be briefly stated as follows:—

(*a*) Uncertainty of tenure of office and consequently mental anxiety.

(*b*) Insufficient prospects and uncertainty and inequality in increase of salary.

(*c*) Inability, with reference to (*a*) and (*b*), to make provision for the future.

(*d*) The withholding of jungle and other allowances.

(*e*) The absence of any definite leave rules.

(*f*) The insufficiency of the Provident provision in lieu of pension.

(*g*) The exclusion of Temporary Engineers from any right to hold Divisional charges and the absence of allowances to Temporary Engineers drawing Rs. 600 or over, when holding such charges.

That, while a large proportion of the officers employed on State Railways are non-pensionable, no such distinctions and disabilities apply to them as apply to the Temporary Engineers.

13. That a reference to the Civil List alone shows that Temporary Engineers are not treated with any consideration, and are herded together in a list appended to the list of the pensionable service without regard to grade, rank or service: That this may seem a small matter but for the fact that it is typical of the attitude taken up towards a large body of professional men.

14. That, as regards insecurity of tenure of appointment, your Memorialist ventures to think that the word "temporary" can no longer be aptly applied to men who, if found to be efficient, are retained in the service as continuously as any other class of public servants, some of whom are also (as in the Railways) non-pensionable: That, at the same time, the retention of this denomination leads to the treatment of Temporary Engineers with less consideration on the supposition that they can be more easily got rid of than any other class of public servants. That every Temporary Engineer is continually made to feel the insecurity of his position, and this, in the course of time, preys upon his mind and affects his nerves and renders him less confident and useful as a public servant, besides embittering his life. That, so long as the door of appointment to the Permanent List is open to Temporary Engineers and they are appointed to it within four or five years of their first appointment, the early period of the service being regarded as probational, no evil effects follow; but, when that door is closed for ten, fifteen, twenty or more years, the effect is highly injurious to the public service. That the Civil Service Regulations themselves show that the principle of assuring a permanent tenure of office, during good behaviour and efficient service, is generally admitted, and is, indeed, regarded as of supreme importance, and this principle is, in fact, applied to all services, superior and inferior alike, except in the case of Temporary Engineers.

15. That at present the fact that a Temporary Engineer *can* be dismissed with a month's notice, without any cause being assigned, is often used as a means of depriving him of the right allowed to all other Government servants of being permitted to reply to any charges of incompetence or misconduct which may

be made against him. That the exclusion of Temporary Engineers from these rights and privileges is not based on any condition of their employment, and is a right possessed by every public servant, whether permanent or temporary. That your Memorialist believes that it has never been the intention of Government to deny this privilege to Temporary Engineers, who belong to a professional class and are discharging the duties of, and are themselves, Gazetted Officers.

16. That your Memorialist ventures to urge that Temporary Engineers, although non-pensionable, are entitled to be placed on the regular cadre, and that this should be recognised and their status re-organised accordingly: That your Memorialist accordingly solicits that after four, or, at most, five years' approved service, a non-pensionable Engineer should be placed on the same cadre as the pensionable staff and be promoted side by side with that staff to Divisional charges, and that all disqualifications, except that of pension, be eliminated: That your Memorialist further solicits that the door of the pensionable service should be more widely opened to deserving members of the temporary establishment according to some recognised and definite rule.

17. That the Temporary Engineers are employed from year to year, subject to one month's notice of dismissal. That notice of their retention is annually served on them and has become almost a mere matter of form, but the existence of the rule and of this annual reminder thereof is extremely disheartening, not to say demoralising, as warning the recipient that his tenure of office is exceedingly insecure, and that, at any moment, he may, with those depending on him, be cast adrift, whatever may be the length of his service. That no employer imposes such a condition on his superior servants as that imposed upon Temporary Engineers, namely, that their services may be dispensed with one month's notice. That persons employed from year to year in the United Kingdom are in all cases entitled to a quarter's or longer notice: That private employers in India usually allow from three to six months' notice to superior employees. That what has been stated above shows the very great insecurity of the position of Temporary Engineers, and the state of mind engendered thereby is more easily imagined than described.

18. That the State Railways freely use the system of employing officers on the principle that the men employed shall not be entitled to pension: That, on Railways, those employed subject to this condition, are all treated as members of the permanent establishment and are graded, promoted and treated in all other respects in exactly the same manner as pensionable officers: That liberal provident provision, specially designed to meet the deprivation of pension, is established throughout every Railway service: That your Memorialist humbly solicits that precisely the same conditions should be applied to the body of Temporary Engineers: That the provision referred to is that the employer contributes to the provident fund, monthly, a sum practically equal to the contribution made by the servant, thus doubling the provision made.

19. That your Memorialist humbly urges that the body of Temporary Engineers suffers severely from the absence of any settled principle or rule regulating the increase of pay by annual increments. That, in this respect, the Temporary Engineer having no chance, as such, of rising to the position of Superintending or Chief Engineer, should be given increments on a somewhat higher scale than that applicable to the permanent Provincial List of Engineers: That, it is humbly urged that for a certain number of years the annual increments might be fixed at Rs. 40 and thereafter at Rs. 50 per mensen, and that salaries might be allowed to rise to a maximum of Rs. 1,050.

20. That there would, it is respectfully urged, seem to be no good reason for depriving Temporary Engineers of the Jungle allowances made to the permanent services, or of Language rewards, and the grant of these is humbly solicited: That the Jungle allowance is presumably made as compensation for long residence in solitary and inhospitable parts of the country, where the expense and hardship of living are accentuated: That Temporary Engineers are necessarily employed for long periods in such out of the way places, because they spend their service as Sub-Divisional Officers.

21. That your Memorialist humbly submits that there seems to be no good reason why the leave rules applicable to the Indian services generally should be denied to Temporary Engineers, and solicits the extension of these rules to them, in their entirety, inasmuch as they undergo the same strain and discharge the same duties as their confrères of the permanent service: That, at present, Temporary Engineers come under the temporary service rules which are intended for persons employed for short periods only. That such rules are hardly adapted to persons continuously employed for long periods: That, as regards privilege leave, the Temporary Engineer may have to pay the charge allowance given to his *locum tenens*, if a subordinate. That, as regards furlough, a Temporary Engineer has no recognised rights, and it has lately been decided by the Government of India that he may not get more than one year's furlough at a time, whatever his service. That, having regard to the present state of the body of Temporary Engineers, these inadequate provisions as to leave demand consideration.

22. That now that the list of Temporary Engineers has become both large and permanent, and contains the names of several men of over ten years' service, your Memorialist respectfully ventures to urge that such Engineers should be given Divisional Charges according to their seniority with reference to the whole body of Engineers both pensionable and temporary: That this boon would not only put new heart into this branch of the service, but would also be advantageous to the public interests, inasmuch as men of long service are more suited to Executive than Sub-divisional work, while their experience would render them an acquisition to this grade.

23. That your Memorialist accordingly humbly and respectfully prays that Your Honour will be pleased to take this Memorial into your favourable consideration, and to recommend to competent authority in the sense desired, the grant of the following reliefs, namely:—

(1) That Temporary Engineers of over four years' standing, be made permanent, though non-pensionable, and be borne on the same cadre as the permanent service Engineers, who are pensionable, and promoted side by side with them in due and ordinary course;

(2) That the selection of Temporary Engineers for appointment to the permanent, pensionable list may be regulated in such manner as may be just and suitable, and that such selections may be more frequently made than at present, and on some recognised basis;

(3) That Temporary Engineers be treated in all respects in the same manner as all other non-pensionable public officers employed on the State Railways in India;

(4) That their increments may be made annual and on a more liberal scale than at present, and that such increments may be regulated by fixed rules, as in the case of the pensionable staff of Engineers;

(5) That they may be granted the Jungle and Language allowances granted to their confrères on the pensionable list;

(6) That their Provident Fund may be placed on the same basis as those of State Railways;

(7) That the leave rules applicable to all other Indian services be extended to them; and

or such other or further relief as to Your Honour may seem just and proper in the circumstances.

And your Memorialist will ever pray, &c.

(*B.*) REPLY TO ABOVE.

Copy of a letter from F. E. Gwyther, Esquire, Secretary to Government, Punjab, Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch.

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of correspondence ending with your letter No. 7493, dated

27th November 1912, submitting memorials from Temporary Engineers praying:—

(1) That Temporary Engineers of over four years' standing be made permanent non-pensionable, and be borne on the same cadre as the permanent service Engineers, who are pensionable and promoted side by side with them in due and ordinary course.

(2) That the selection of temporary Engineers for appointment to the permanent pensionable list may be regulated in such manner as may be just and suitable, and that such selection may be more frequently made than at present and on some recognised basis.

(3) That temporary Engineers be treated in all respects in the same manner as all other non-pensionable public officers employed on State Railways in India.

(4) That their increments may be made annual and on a more liberal scale than at present, and that such increments may be regulated by fixed rules as in the case of the pensionable staff of Engineers.

(5) That they may be granted the Jungle and Language allowances granted to their confrères on the pensionable list.

(6) That their Provident Fund may be placed on the same basis as those of the State Railways; and

(7) That the leave rules applicable to all other Indian Services may be extended to them.

2. In reply, I am to state that the memorials have been laid before His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, and to request that the memorialists may be informed as follows:—

Prayers (1), (3), and (6).—As temporary Engineers are engaged to supplement the permanent establishment in order to meet the demand for extra supervision which may arise from time to time, as well as to insure that the Public Works Establishment be capable of contraction as well as of expansion as the expenditure on works diminishes or increases, His Honour is unable to make any recommendations to the Government of India for the appointment of temporary Engineers to the *cadre* posts as permanent non-pensionable.

It may be pointed out to the memorialists that in the Engineer establishment of State Railways there are but three officers on the permanent non-pensionable establishment.

Prayer (2).—As the selection of temporary Engineers for permanent appointment depends on vacancies caused by the authorized sources of recruitment being unable to supply the demands, the frequency of such selections cannot be regulated.

Prayer (4).—The Government of India have intimated that, unless very special reasons can be advanced, no increment should exceed Rs. 50, and that no increment should be granted except after two years' approved service, and in this His Honour agrees with the Government of India.

Prayer (5).—Language allowances are admissible for Baluchi and Pashtu only, and temporary Engineers are not debarred from drawing these allowances when they fulfil the conditions of the grant.

As regards jungle allowances, the Government of India have been pleased to rule in their Public Works Department letter No. 1436-1449 E., dated the 5th December 1912, that in future local allowances, which are ordinarily admissible to members of the permanent establishment, may be granted, either in whole or in part, to temporary employés under sanction of proper authority and subject to any restrictions which the sanctioning authorities may decide to impose.

Prayer (7).—As temporary Engineers can, with the sanction of the Government of India, be granted leave otherwise than that what is admissible under the Regulations, His Honour is of opinion that no change in the Rules is necessary.

III. CONNECTED CORRESPONDENCE.

(i) *Copy of para 2 of a letter No. 1700 E., dated the 30th September 1911, from Mr. G. H. C. Maistre, Deputy Secretary to the Government of India Public Works Department, to the Secretary to the Government, Punjab, Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch.*

2. In regard to the officers for whom increases of pay are recommended, I am to say that the Government of India are, as a rule, averse to granting an increase of more than Rs. 30, and that only after two years' approved service. It is observed that in some cases increases ranging from Rs. 25 to 50 are proposed after a year's service only and in one case Rs. 100 after two years' service. The Government of India are of opinion that these Temporary Engineers should not, save in very exceptional cases, be given a higher rate of pay than Rs. 700 a month, and that, therefore, it is undesirable to increase their salaries too rapidly. They further consider that unless very special reasons can be advanced no increment should exceed Rs. 50 and that no increment should be granted except after two years' approved service.

This has been superseded by B. (Government of Punjab letter No. 02488 E.I., dated 14th October 1913).

(ii) *Copy of a letter No. 02488 E.I., dated 14th October 1913, from the Secretary to the Government, Punjab, Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch, to the Superintending Engineer, Derajat Circle.*

With reference to correspondence ending with your letter No. 5439, dated 22nd September 1913, submitting certain Memorials addressed to His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, by Temporary Engineers, praying that a recommendation may be made to the Government of India for the withdrawal of the order fixing the maximum salary of Temporary Engineers at Rs. 700 per mensem and increments Rs. 50 every second year, and that they may remain eligible for such increases of salary as they from time to time be recommended for, and this on some recognised basis, I am directed to request that the Memorialists may be informed that in future the remuneration to be given to Temporary Engineers will be considered on the merits of each case with reference to the financial powers conferred on Local Government by the Government of India Finance Department Resolution No. 249 E.A., dated 15th July 1912, under which Provincial Governments can sanction temporary appointments, the cost of which is wholly or partly provincial, for any specified period if the remuneration exceeds Rs. 800 a month, but does not exceed Rs. 2,500 a month. Temporary appointments, the cost of which is wholly Imperial, may be sanctioned by Provincial Governments for any period if the remuneration does not exceed Rs. 250 a month.

This has been superseded by C. (Government of India letter No. 2208-2, dated Simla, the 24th October 1913).

(iii) *Copy of a letter No. 2208-2, dated Simla, the 24th October 1913, from the Assistant Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department, to the Secretary to the Government of Punjab, Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch.*

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter No. 02378 E.I., dated the 10th October 1913, forwarding Memorials submitted by certain Temporary Engineers employed in the Punjab in which they pray for an improvement in the conditions of their employment and for the grant of certain other concessions in the matter of pay allowances, Provident Fund and Leave.

2. In reply, I am to say that, as the Temporary Engineers will have an opportunity of representing their case to the Royal Commission on Public Services, the Government of India do not propose to consider the Memorials forwarded with your letter till they have received any recommendations which the Commission may have to make on behalf of the general body of such Engineers. I am to request that the Memorialists may be informed accordingly.

APPENDIX V.

APPENDIX V.

Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab and its Dependencies, No. 1617 (Home—General), dated Lahore, 7th October, 1913.

With reference to your letter dated the 1st of August 1913, I am directed to forward 20 copies of letter No. 567 E. S., dated the 23rd of September 1913, from the Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, Buildings and Roads Branch, and of its enclosure, giving the information required by the Royal Commission in respect of the Buildings and Roads and Irrigation Branches of the Public Works Department, Punjab.

Enclosure in covering letter from Colonel R. S. Maylagan, C.B., C.S.I., Chief Engineer, Punjab, Public Works Department, Buildings and Roads Branch, No. 567 E. S., dated Simla, 23rd September 1913.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT, PUNJAB, BUILDINGS AND ROADS AND IRRIGATION BRANCHES.

Statement showing information required by the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India in their Joint Secretary's letter dated the 1st August 1913, to the address of the Chief Secretary to Government, Punjab.

(i) *Present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.*—The regulations applicable to India as a whole are applicable to the Engineer Services (Imperial and Provincial) in the Punjab as well, as laid down in Public Works Department Code, Volume I, Chapter II, paragraphs 141 to 160. No supplementary or subsidiary regulations have been framed for this Province. Covenanted temporary Engineers, and temporary Engineers appointed in this country, have been, however, occasionally appointed to the permanent Engineer services by the Secretary of State or the Government of India. This, however, has only happened when the demand for Engineers has been such as could not be readily met by the ordinary methods of recruitment laid down in the Public Works Department Code.

With regard to these regulations being satisfactory or otherwise, reference is invited to Chief Engineers' opinions* forwarded under letter No. 1851 E. I., dated the 21st April 1903, to the Chief Secretary to Government, Punjab.

(ii) *Rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.*—The rates of pay compare as follows:—

Departmental rank.	1890.	1900.		1913.	
		Imperial.	Provincial.	Imperial.	Provincial.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Chief Engineer ... 1st Class ...	2,500	2,500	2,500	2,750	2,750
Chief Engineer ... 2nd „ ...	2,000	2,000	2,000	2,500	2,500
Chief Engineer ... 3rd „ ...	1,800	1,800	1,800	—	—
Superintending Engineer. 1st Class ...	1,600	1,600	1,050	2,000	1,600
Superintending Engineer. 2nd „ ...	1,350	1,350	900	1,750	1,400
Superintending Engineer. 3rd „ ...	1,100	1,100	750	1,500	1,200
Executive Engineer 1st Grade ...	950	1,000	650	Rs. 700 rising by Rs. 50 annual increments on time scale to Rs. 1,250 per mensem.	Rs. 450 rising by Rs. 35 annual increments on time scale to Rs. 850 per mensem.
Executive Engineer 2nd „ ...	800	850	550		
Executive Engineer 3rd „ ...	700	700	475		
Executive Engineer 4th „ ...	600	—	—		
Assistant Engineer 1st Grade ...	500	550	400	Rs. 380 rising by annual increments of Rs. 40, on time scale to Rs. 660 per mensem.	Rs. 250 rising by annual increments of Rs. 25 on time scale to Rs. 425 per mensem.
Assistant Engineer 2nd Grade after three years.	400	—	—		
Assistant Engineer 2nd Grade ...	350	450	350		
Assistant Engineer 3rd „ ...	250	350	250		

Allowances.—(1) *Exchange compensation allowance* was generally admissible to Imperial Engineers in 1900; admissible in 1913 to those Imperial Engineers who rise to the ranks of Superintending Engineer and Chief Engineer, provided they were Executive Engineers, 1st grade, or higher rank on the 8th March 1908.

NOTE.—This allowance has practically been abolished for the executive ranks by the introduction of the time-scale in 1908.

(2) *Local allowance commonly known as jungle allowance.*—This allowance is admissible only to Divisional and Sub-Divisional Officers of the Irrigation Branch under the conditions and at the rates specified in Part III of appendix 19 of Public Works Department Code, Volume III. The allowance was not in existence in 1890. It was admissible in 1900 and is still admissible in 1913.

(3) *Local allowance.*—Chief Engineers who are also Secretaries to Government receive an allowance of Rs. 250. This allowance was not in force in 1890 or 1900, but is in force in 1913. Under-Secretaries to Government also receive as such a local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem. This allowance was in force in 1890-1900 and is still in force in 1913. This allowance is now also granted to the Personal Assistant to the Chief Engineer, Irrigation Branch, but was not granted to that officer in 1890 and 1900.

Leave and Pension allowances. These are laid down in the Civil Service Regulations, Chapter XXX.

With regard to whether the rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory, reference is invited to Chief Engineers' opinions*, forwarded with letter No. 1851 E. I., dated the 21st April 1903, to the Chief Secretary to Government, Punjab.

(iii) *Number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*—The sanctioned Engineer cadre for the Irrigation Branch is for 122 officers including a provision of 20 for leave but none for training. This number is made up as below:—

	Appointments.
Chief Engineer class	2
Superintending Engineer classes ...	10
Executive and Assistant Engineer classes	110
Total ...	122

Executive and Assistant Engineers are on a time scale of pay. Assistant Engineers ordinarily pass into the Executive class in the 9th year of service, provided they are fully qualified for the charge of a Division, but no officer can draw more than Rs. 800 per mensem in the case of Imperial Service or more than Rs. 535 per mensem in the case of the Provincial Service unless he holds a Divisional charge or a charge of equal importance.

In the Buildings and Roads Branch the cadre is as follows:—

Chief Engineer	1
Superintending Engineers including Sanitary Engineer	4
Executive Engineers	18
Assistant Engineers	18
Total ...	41

The sanctioned number for absentees is 6. No provision is made for officers under training.

* *Vide* paragraphs 71,506–509.

* *Vide* paragraphs 71,506–509.

(iv) *What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held temporarily, or otherwise, by officers of the various services.*—There are no appointments in the Irrigation Branch outside the cadre that are held by Imperial or Provincial Service Engineers. There are, however, three posts in the Department in connection with the Central Workshops of the Department at Amritsar, which are held by officers covenanted out from Home and known as Covenanted Temporary Engineers, viz., (1) Superintendent and (2) two Assistant Superintendents. There are at present 54 temporary Engineers in the Irrigation Branch to supplement the strength of the Engineer establishment. These officers are on salaries varying from Rs. 750 to Rs. 200 per mensem, and their services are terminable at a month's notice. Their numbers fluctuate according as the work of the Department expands or contracts. Eleven permanent Engineers of the Irrigation Branch, Punjab, are on deputation,—3 to Siam, 4 to Delhi Province, one each to Baluchistan, Gwalior State, Central Provinces, and Buildings and Roads, Punjab. The posts vacated by the men on deputation have been filled by Temporary Engineers in a few cases, but chiefly by upper subordinates.

In the Buildings and Roads Branch there are 3 officers on deputation,—one to the Simla Municipality as Resident Engineer, and 2 to the Imperial Works at Delhi. One officer is also on deputation to this branch from the Military Works Services as a specialist to take charge of the Simla Hydro-Electric Works. The services of Mr. Gemmel lent by the Irrigation Department have been placed at the disposal of the Education Department as Principal of the Government Engineering College at Rasul.

Seven temporary Engineers are employed on salaries from Rs. 400 to Rs. 600 on same conditions as in the Irrigation Branch.

(v) *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*—The question of addition to the present cadre in the Irrigation Branch is under consideration, and the result will be reported to the Secretary to the Royal Commission later. The Irrigation Branch any cadre is known to be much below requirements.

In the Buildings and Roads Branch no addition is at present contemplated.

APPENDIX VI.

Letter from the Chief Secretary to the Government of the Punjab and its Dependencies, No. 1787 (*Home—General*), *dated Lahore, 5th November*, 1913.

In continuation of my letter No. 1617 (Home—General), dated 7th October 1913, I am directed to forward, herewith, 20 copies of a letter No. 3100 E. I., dated 1st November 1913, from the Chief Engineer, Irrigation Works, Punjab, and of its enclosures, completing the information called for by the Royal Commission in respect of the Buildings and Roads and Irrigation Branches of the Public Works Department, Punjab.

Enclosures in Covering Letter from F. E. Gwyther, Esq., Chief Engineer, Irrigation Works, Punjab, No.* 3100 *E. I., dated Lahore, 1st November* 1913.

I.—NOTE, DATED 4th SEPTEMBER, 1913, BY MR. F. E. GWYTHER, CHIEF ENGINEER, IRRIGATION WORKS, PUNJAB.

The subject of the present discussion on a reinforcement of the Sub-Divisional staff in the Punjab Irrigation Branch was only raised three years ago, and has for its avowed object the replacement of Temporary Engineers now employed in Revenue charges. I understand the Government of India would like to get rid, as soon as possible, of all temporary men, but Mr. Gordon's note of 5th September 1910 apparently contemplated their gradual extinction, for he retained 25 Sub-Divisions for them (*i.e.*, for about half the number of temporary men now in employ).

2. Before proceeding to note on the suggestions made for reinforcement, I would like to touch on this question of Temporary Engineers: apparently Mr. Gordon decided that it was " not considered desirable to place men of this class in permanent charge of Revenue Sub-Divisions," and the Government of India have accepted the principle.

3. If the alternative was the employment of permanent Imperial or Provincial men, I should have no hesitation in accepting it myself. But as a fact the only alternatives presented to us are—

(*a*) the larger employment of Upper Subordinates, or

(*b*) the creation of a new agency or link in the shape of Canal Revenue Assistants, or

(*c*) a reduction in the number of Sub-Divisional Officers by enlarging existing Sub-Divisions.

My own experience is that the bulk of our temporary staff is doing as good work as the Provincial men—better than the average Upper Subordinate. It contains men of talent, who have now considerable experience to back them (and for this reason they are of considerable use to the State) and are more looked up to than the Upper Subordinate class.

4. There are two difficulties in the way of any drastic treatment of our temporary officers on the lines suggested above, and they are:—

(i) The impossibility of chucking out men who have done good work—some with 20 years' continuous service—and who would find it difficult to secure employment elsewhere. In the case of men with approved service this would be a cruel decision to adopt.

(ii) It would also be unnecessary. The Department is an expanding one—it is constantly called on to depute men for special works (*e.g.*, to Native States, Central India, Delhi, Siam): † there is at present no sign in view of its having reached its utmost limit of expansion. On the contrary, the opening of the Beas Project will create a further enlargement of our staff—to mention only one work in view. To reduce our temporary staff now, create a new one in its place, and then re-entertain temporary men two years hence would in my opinion involve injustice and great hardship.

As it is, the Department is undermanned, we have to employ Upper Subordinates in Sub-Divisional charges who are too young, and are not fitted for them.

5. As regards the second alternative, I concur in the conclusion arrived at by the Government of India on the suggestion made to create a new class of Canal Revenue Assistants.

It is not clear why the term " Revenue " should be applied to them; I understand they will be selected men who will have to undergo a two years' Engineering course to fit them for technical work and Sub-Divisional Officer's responsibilities: but it is not explained how they will acquire Revenue experience—presumably while in charge of a Sub-Division. In that case they would in practice be equivalent to Provincial Engineers, with the added advantage of selection, and the immense disadvantage of forming a separate closed service without any prospects.

6. My reasons for objecting to this suggestion are the following:—

(*a*) It contemplates forming a new service to do work which is now being efficiently and ably done by trained Imperial and Provincial Engineers and by Upper Subordinates.

(*b*) If training of its selected officers on the Revenue side is contemplated, it would form something of a hybrid profession—neither Engineer nor Revenue.

* The covering letter states that the views expressed in the notes were the views of the Chief Engineers and not those of the Local Governments.

† The displacement of the trained temporary staff by new men of whatever designation would mean to the Department the distinct loss of the time and money that has gone in training the former.—R. EGERTON PURVES, 21st September, 1913.

APPENDIX VI—*continued.*

(*c*) It would imitate the present temporary staff, in that it would employ men who could secure no "plums" and would have no future prospects. In time it would be a discontented service—claiming as in the case of Provincial and temporary men that they do the same work as other (*e.g.*, Imperial) Sub-Divisional Officers and should be similarly treated. The plea would be difficult to resist and would lead to agitation.

(*d*) Such a staff would, if created now, lack weight and possess no experience—for the next 10 years it would not prove efficient.

(*e*) It provides for a staff which should ordinarily be catered for by Engineering Colleges. Sub-Divisional Officer's work is only partly Revenue, and it will be a bad day for the science of irrigation when the fact is lost sight of that it needs technical and an Engineer's training.

7. The third alternative, presented by the Government of India, involves a reduction of Sub-Divisional Officer's staff by enlarging Sub-Divisional charges—thereby reducing their number. This in my opinion would be a retrograde step, and involves a misconception of hard actual facts. We have for some time past felt that both Divisional and Sub-Divisional charges in the Punjab Irrigation Branch are far too large—it is recognised by all senior officers now that work has increased so greatly, the responsibilities and requirements exacted so large that Sub-Divisional Officers cannot efficiently run such charges: the result is that they are increasingly out of touch with the minutiæ of their work and with the cultivating classes.

8. I attach a statement which compares our Punjab charges with those of other Provinces in India as regards—

(*a*) the annual revenue collected,

(*b*) the annual expenditure incurred,

(*c*) area irrigated and cost of establishment,

in them on the average: it throws into prominence the fact that our charges are generally 2½ times larger and heavier than those found necessary in the United Provinces and Madras (the largest irrigating Provinces approximating to the Punjab).

The fact merely strengthens the general opinion of senior officers (including myself) that both Divisions and Sub-Divisions are as at present constituted in the Punjab much too big, and any enlargement of them would prove to be a serious mistake. It illustrates as well the present difficulty of employing men of the calibre of the average Upper Subordinate Class in such big charges.

9. My objections to the scheme outlined by Government of India may be summarised as follows:—

(i) The introduction of new and additional officials between the Sub-Divisional Officer and the cultivators is unsound in principle; the object we should aim at is rather the reverse of this—to remove such possible obstacles and to encourage by every means possible more intimate relations between the two. That would be in the interests of the State, as well as of the science of irrigation. I think the introduction of two professional and one revenue officials as assistants to the Sub-Divisional Officer would indubitably tend to add more links in the chain connecting the latter with his zamindars; and I am confident that is not a proposal which would find favour with the latter class.

(ii) The additional staff would to a certain extent constitute a fresh burden on the Sub-Divisional Officer; he would have three more men to correspond with, to teach and to supervise.

(iii) It would not in practice relieve him of his existing burdens; the Sub-Divisional Officer would still be the responsible officer whom modern requirements and an increasingly stringent application of rules does not permit of being relieved. Any out-of-doors relief he might secure through this agency would be distinctly undesirable, as tending to loss of touch with important details he should have at his fingers' ends and to the creation of a type of Under-Divisional Officer which we would view with disfavour.

(iv) It would tend to increase the subordinate and Indian staff in a Division, with resultant loss of efficiency.

(v) And it will involve considerable additional expenditure under establishment. The exact amount need not be worked out now, but it will probably amount to 2½ lakhs annually, say Rs. 400 per Division of two Sub-Divisions.

(vi) Additional expenditure will also be involved for touring accommodation—that at present available at rest-houses has been strictly limited to present staff and in some circles is admittedly insufficient even for that.

(vii) It is suggested that the Revenue Assistant would conveniently form a stepping-stone to the Deputy Collector grade; the want of such a link is not at all apparent, and its creation would deprive the existing Zilladar staff of direct promotion by selection from Zilladar, 1st grade, to Deputy Collector, 3rd grade. Even in our large charges no need has yet, I think, been expressed or felt as to the desirability of strengthening our Revenue staff.

(viii) As regards the two Upper Subordinates to be posted as Assistants to the Sub-Divisional Officer, the general feeling is that such work would not prove good training for them, nor tend to qualify such men for holding charge of a Sub-Division in their turn; they will lose the advantages of training in a section, and will tend to degenerate into roving agents in out-of-the-way places on odd jobs for the Sub-Divisional Officer.

(ix) Finally, when making proposals of this kind, we must not lose sight of the possibility of fixed canal assessments replacing our present system, thereby relieving us of some Revenue work and freeing the hands of the Sub-Divisional Officer for greater attention to other minutiæ.

10. That some relief to the present congestion is desirable is generally admitted, but I do not think it will be secured by getting rid of our Temporary Engineers, not because the bulk of them are admittedly inefficient, but merely because they are employed for temporary service. The fact that we have permitted them to gain considerable experience in that class of work (Revenue), without protest, for many years, cannot be ignored.

Nor do I consider the creation of a new special class of Sub-Divisional Officers (Canal Revenue Assistants) with limited prospects and forming a closed service, likely to help us out of our difficulty. Such a staff would be created at the expense of the Provincial Engineer Establishment and of the Upper Subordinates without the distinct advantages of either; there is little doubt in time it would claim those of the former, on the obvious grounds that it does the same work.

11. I do not think we should lose sight of the necessity for keeping up a limiting number of European Officers in the Department; it is now a very important Revenue earning department, and it is entirely to the interest of the State to employ officers who are respected and looked up to. In this respect we must not place the independent Punjabi on the same footing as the people of other Provinces. I mention this merely to indicate the need for caution in creating a new staff, and in employing too many Upper Subordinates as Sub-Divisional Officers (these have not come up to average expectations in Revenue Sub-Divisions and do not command the respect that is desirable).

12. My own proposals as alternatives to these two schemes are the following:—

(A) Increase the number of Divisions in the Irrigation Branch; this is a necessity that must be faced. It need not be done all at once.

(B) Decrease to some small extent the size of present Sub-Divisional charges by increasing their number (this refers to admittedly unwieldy charges).

(C) The extra Divisional Officers required under (A) would be automatically provided by our present cadre, in which in 1914 there will be more officers qualified to hold Divisions than there will be Divisional charges available.

(D) Provide for the additional staff that will be needed by—(*a*) additional recruitment in the Provincial Engineer Service and in the Imperial; (*b*) retaining the best of our temporary officers on a permanent non-pensionable footing; and (*c*) the recruitment of only selected candidates trained as Upper Subordinates at Rurki or Rasul.

APPENDIX VI—*continued*.

Comparative Statement showing average area of irrigation per Division and Sub-Division and Cost of Establishment on same basis for three years ending 1911–12.

Particulars.	United Provinces.			Punjab.		
	1909-10.	1910-11.	1911-12.	1909-10.	1910-11.	1911-12.
	Acres.	Acres.	Acres.	Acres.	Acres.	Acres.
Area irrigated (*a*)	2,513,000	2,269,000	2,442,000	6,481,000	6,705,000	7,728,000
Number of Divisions (*b*)	24	24	24	25	25	25
Average per Division	104,708	94,542	101,750	259,240	268,200	309,120
Number of Sub-Divisions (*b*)	62	62	62	71	71	71
Average per Sub-Division	40,532	36,597	39,387	91,282	94,436	108,845
COST OF ESTABLISHMENT CHARGED TO REVENUE.						
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Revenue Management	13,07,880	12,41,972	13,65,307	26,83,067	26,32,955	27,61,943
Maintenance of Works	5,48,358	5,15,269	5,02,977	8,32,141	7,47,061	8,21,894
Total (*c*)	18,56,238	17,57,241	18,68,284	35,15,208	33,80,016	35,83,837
Number of Divisions	24	24	24	25	25	25
Average per Division	77,343	73,218	77,845	1,40,608	1,35,200	1,43,353
Number of Sub Divisions	62	62	62	71	71	71
Average per Sub-Division	29,939	28,342	30,134	49,510	47,606	50,476
Establishment charges per acre irrigated (*c*)/(*a*) ...	0·74	0·77	0·76	0·54	0·50	0·46

(*a*) Taken from Statistical Statement III E of the Annual Administration Report.
(*b*) Revenue Divisions only; for United Provinces taken from Classified List and Distribution Return of establishment corrected to 30th June, 1912, omitting Bhimgoda Weir Division and Gangao Dam Division.
(*c*) Taken from Statistical Statement I-C of the Annual Administration Report.

SIMLA :
The 4th September, 1913.

F. E. GWYTHER,
Chief Engineer, Irrigation Works, Punjab

Statement showing how the Divisions and Sub-Divisions are held at present.

Circle.	Executive Engineers.		Sub-Divisional Officers.				Remarks.
			Engineers.		Upper Subordinates.		
	Europeans.	Indians.	Europeans.	Indians.	Europeans.	Indians.	
Western Jumna Canal	2	1	4	3	2	2	
Sirhind Canal	1	3	2	4	—	5	
Upper Bari Doab	3	2	4	3	—	5	
Lower Bari Doab	2 *1	1	3	3 *2	—	4	* Sutlej Survey Division.
Derajat	4	—	3	3	1	3	One Sub-Division Vacant
Lower Chenab Canal	5	1	6	2	1	9	
Upper Chenab Canal	1	2	3	3	—	5	
Lower Jhelum Canal	3	—	4	1	—	4	
Upper Jhelum Canal	4	—	10	2	—	4	One Division vacant.
Swat River Canals	4	—	9	1	2	2	
Total	30	10	48	27	6	43	

Northern	Europeans ... 46 Indians ... 34	Upper Subordinates in Sub-Divisions ... 21	Divisions ... 18 Sub-Divisions ... 62
Southern	Europeans ... 38 Indians ... 46	Ditto ... 28	Divisions ... 22 Sub-Divisions ... 62

II.—*NOTE, DATED* 25TH *SEPTEMBER* 1913, *BY MR. R. EGERTON PURVES, CHIEF ENGINEER, IRRIGATION WORKS, PUNJAB.*

I agree with Mr. Gwyther in his note, dated 4th September 1913, in all but the remedy proposed for the present state of affairs, but before offering my own suggestions I should like to emphasise the fact that the work of the Department has been growing faster than the corresponding increase in the number of charges of each kind. For this purpose I have expanded the statement attached to Mr. Gwyther's note (see annexure), so as to include the Triple Project and the North-West Frontier Province (under construction in 1912), but not Baluchistan or the Amritsar Workshops Division. I have also included other items for comparison with the conditions prevailing in the adjacent United Provinces.

2. The resulting statement bears eloquent testimony, if that were wanted, to the far greater volume of work required of the Executive Officers in the Punjab. The figures, however, need some explanation before correct inferences can be drawn therefrom. I propose to deal with the following points:—

(*a*) Irrigated area.
(*b*) Intensity of irrigation.
(*c*) Length of channels to be maintained.
(*d*) Incidence of cost of establishment per acre irrigated.

3. *Irrigated area.*—In the United Provinces there are 24 Divisions and 62 Sub-Divisions for an irrigated area of something like 2½ million acres. In the

APPENDIX VI—*continued.*

Punjab, when fully going in about two years' time, there will be, on the *present basis* of provision, 41 Divisions and 125 Sub-Divisions for 9 millions irrigated. The number of charges based merely on the irrigated area should be more than three times those in the United Provinces. The volume of work is measurable mainly in two ways, *viz.*, (*a*) by the ground to be covered for field work and (*b*) by the number of cultivators who produce office work. The unit of area (the acre) being the same in both cases, the amount of field work to be got through would be practically equal per unit. On the other hand, the number of cultivators, or, in other words, the size of holdings, differ considerably in the two Provinces. In the United Provinces the size of holdings decreases from west to east and increases southward. In the Punjab the size of holdings increases from east to west. On both sides of the river Jamna the size of holdings may be said to be the same. If we allow (and the allowance seems reasonable when measured by the density of the rural population of the Agra Province, 367 per square mile as against 185 in the British territory of the Punjab figures of 1891) that the average volume of work arising from an acre in the United Provinces is *twice* that from an acre in the Punjab, the relative index figures for numbers of charges in the two Provinces would be—

United Provinces to Punjab for field work... 1:3
Ditto ditto for office work... 5:9

and it appears quite fair to estimate that, for the entire volume of work, the proportion is as 1:2.

4. *Intensity of irrigation.*—As this figure takes into account the gross commanded area, it is really a better measure of the volume of work than the irrigated area. We find (see attached statement) that in the United Provinces the intensity is 14 per cent., whereas in the Punjab it is now 40 per cent. and will become 42 per cent. during the next few years. Making the same allowance as before the relative index figures will become:—

United Provinces to Punjab for field work... 1:3
Ditto ditto for office work... 2:3
and the final result will be as 1:2.

5. *Lengths of channels to be maintained.*—In the United Provinces there are 1,812 miles of main canal and 9,379 miles of distributary channels to be maintained, and in the Punjab the same figures will, in the course of 3 or 4 years, be 4,644 and 13,356, respectively. Now the main canal and branches call for far more attention than the distributaries, in the length of ground to be covered. This is one of the reasons why complaint is sometimes heard against Sub-Divisional Officers that the distributaries have been neglected. In such cases, I think, the explanation will be found in the fact that relatively the officer has had too large a proportion of main canal to maintain. In order to arrive at a fair comparison of the relative volume of field work arising out of this item, it seems fair to count each canal mile as equal to 4 distribuary miles. Correcting the mileage figures by this multiplier, the relative figures of the two Provinces will become—

For each Division as 692:861
Ditto Sub-Division as 268:302

On this basis then the Punjab Divisions are larger by 26 per cent. and the Punjab sub-Divisions are larger by 13 per cent. The extra work entailed under this head is in addition to the volume of work arising out of the larger irrigated area. It would also appear that the Punjab Divisions must be reduced in size relatively more than the Sub-Divisions.

6. *Incidence of cost of establishment per acre.*—The figures under this head are not complete for the Punjab as a whole. At present a comparison can only be made between the United Provinces and the open canals in the Punjab. The relative figures are 0·76:0·53 per acre, which shows that the United Provinces work costs 43 per cent. more than the same work in the Punjab. The relative proportions in detail are:—

	United Provinces.		*Punjab.*
Intensity of irrigation (modified)	1	:	2·0
Whole cost	1	:	1·9
Revenue management only ...	1	:	2·0
Maintenance of works only ...	1	:	1·5

From above it will be seen that the cost of revenue management is about the same proportionately as the relative volume of work due to intensity of irrigation, as modified by me, *viz.*, as 1:2. But the cost of establishment employed on the maintenance of works is about 25 per cent. less. This may be compared with the figures of 26 per cent. arrived at differently in paragraph 5 when considering the lengths of channels to be maintained. The coincidence is quite accidental and has not been specially worked up to agree. We may take it then that our superior staff requires to be strengthened by 25 per cent. The cost of this item in the Punjab should be twice that of the United Provinces, and therefore instead of Rs. 8,00,350 it should be Rs. 10,44,200 or thereabouts. An increased expenditure of Rs. 2,40,000 is required to make the Punjab supervision as efficient at least as the United Provinces supervision.

7. I may now summarise the results of this enquiry. In considering the relative irrigated areas and intensity of irrigation, it has been found that the volume of work in the Punjab is twice that in the United Provinces per unit considered: also as regards lengths of channels to be maintained, the Punjab Divisions are 26 per cent. larger and the Sub-Divisions 13 per cent. larger than in the United Provinces: and that when we compare the cost of establishment on maintenance (superior staff), we find that the Punjab is undermanned by 25 per cent. as measured by the United Provinces standard. It is not contended that these deductions are quite accurate or free from objection. The main point, however, which is clear is that viewed in any manner the superior staff is insufficient in the Punjab, and we have gradually allowed ourselves to drift into a condition of overwork with consequent proportionate loss of efficiency. In my opinion we are in defect to 25 per cent. of our superior staff.

If we increase our superior staff by providing Rs. 2,40,000 more under cost of establishment on maintenance of works (see paragraph 6 above), the total cost of establishment would be increased from Rs. 34,93,000 to Rs. 37,33,000 and the incidence of cost per acre would be raised from 0·53 to 0·57, and this would still be less than 0·76 in the United Provinces. I have no doubt that in the course of time when the average of holdings in the Punjab becomes smaller and the volume of work increases, we shall be forced to make a corresponding increase in the staff. We are, however, concerned with the present condition of things. The increase suggested by my note is so modest that I believe no serious objection will be raised, and I also believe that the money so put out will be repaid fully in other ways to Government. It will give our Executive Officers much relief and will also give them the time to study and suggest improvements. We are now coming to a time when forward movements in all directions are desirable and necessary. We must consolidate and improve the immense property in our keeping.

8. I propose in the paragraphs following to consider the manner in which this increase of 25 per cent. of the Executive staff should be carried out to give the best results:—

We have at present—

Divisions	41
Sub-Divisions	125
Total	166

and when the canals now under construction are completed we shall have—

Divisions	37
Sub-Divisions	106
Total	143

based on the same standard which we have found to be insufficient when compared with the United Provinces. To improve this condition of things we ought to have 35 new appointments in the Executive and Assistant charges plus the usual additions for leave vacancies.

9. Our present proportion of Divisions to Sub-Divisions is (or will be in 2 or 3 years) as 37:106 or

as 1:2·89. Congestion in the lower ranks and loss of efficiency is sure to come in the near future, if we continue to maintain this ratio, and our qualified and senior Assistants will not get Divisions as soon as they ought to. Unless the ratio is changed, we shall revert to the congestion which occurred in 1888 to 1895, when men served in Sub-Divisions for periods varying up to 14 years' service. We have only been able to maintain a suitable flow of promotion in the permanent staff by the employment of a large and growing (permanently employed) staff of Temporary Engineers, who bulk almost wholly as Sub-Divisional Officers. It was foreseen almost from the first that the recruitment of the temporary service was a clumsy makeshift which transferred the onus of finding a true solution of the difficulty to posterity. The time has come when we may deal with the question correctly or devise some other makeshift to add to the difficulties of posterity of a later date. It has been accepted that the temporary service, with its difficulties for the employer and its hardships for the employed, must go, and the sooner we can do this with the least amount of hardships to individuals the earlier shall we be out of a difficult position. In order therefore not to cause congestion, it will be necessary to alter the ratio of Divisions to Sub-Divisions, while we are adding to the staff as a whole for other reasons. I make out that our ratio should be reduced from 1:2·89 to 1:2·4, in order to meet all the conditions of the Punjab. From the United Provinces figures (see statement attached) the ratio is 24:62 or as 1:2·5. This higher ratio is, I think, due to the fact that *relatively* more Upper Subordinates are employed habitually in Sub-Divisions. Of 86 appointments, the Upper Subordinates may number 22 or say 25 per cent. We shall need a superior staff of something like 250, and cannot at present find more than 40 suitable Upper Subordinates or only 16 per cent. It is, therefore, clear that as things are in the Punjab the proper ratio of Divisions to Sub-Divisions should not be greater than 1:2·4.

10. It is not only impossible but not desirable to make the Divisions all more or less uniform in extent. Not only does the intensity of work vary, but the necessities differ, and the ability of our officers, by reason of age and experience and other causes, varies. I would therefore propose to create a certain number (to be determined on recasting the charges) of light Executive charges to be placed in charge of the less able or younger Executives. The light Executive charges might, for the purpose of effecting some small savings, be termed independent Sub-Divisions, and they might ordinarily consist of one or two Sub-Divisions in charge of Assistants and a small headquarter section to be under the direct orders of the Executive Engineer. No young Executive Engineer or, for the matter of that, an older and less able officer need take exception to this arrangement. He would have in charge of the direct section a good Upper Subordinate in training for Sub-Divisional charge, and otherwise there would be less work than at present owing to the reduction in size of Divisions.

11. Under the redistribution of charges on the completion of the canals now in progress, the total number of charges is to be (37 + 106) = 143. I would increase these by 30 for the present. There ought to be 35 new appointments as noted at paragraph 8 above, but 30 will meet immediate requirements. We should have then (143 + 30) = 173 charges, which should be arranged in the following manner:—

Divisions	51
Sub-Divisions	122
Total	173

The ratio adopted is 1:2·4. These figures will supersede the total of 166 existing charges or 143, as they might have become, had we reduced the charges, as shown in the statement.

12. We can now estimate our full requirements making provision for leave vacancies:—

Chief and Superintending Engineers, as at present	12
Under-Secretaries and Personal Assistants to Chief Engineers, as at present	3
Executive Engineers of Divisions	51
Sub-Divisional Officers	122
Personal Assistant to Superintending Engineers	5
For surveys and new construction—Sutlej Valley Canal, &c.—including 2 Superintending Engineers for same	32
For Baluchistan	2
For Amritsar Workshops	3
Total	230
Allowance for permanent Engineer absentees (*i.e.*, 20 per cent. 165)	33
GRAND TOTAL	263

This looks a large figure, but it is not one bit too big for the magnificent property to be cared for.

13. I propose to provide for this staff in the following manner:—

Permanent Imperial and Provincial Engineers	198
Temporary Engineers, pure and simple ...	25
Upper Subordinates in *habitual* charge of Sub-Divisions	40
Total as above	263

or omitting Upper Subordinates, we should have 223 Engineer officers against which we have at present—

Permanent Imperial and Provincial Engineers, as per sanctioned cadre	122
Covenanted Engineers	3
Temporary Engineers	53
Total	178

We are therefore 45 men short, which should be made up in the next 3 or 4 years during which time the scheme, if agreed to, could be carried through. The changes could be carried over 3 or 4 years.

14. Now as to recruitment of the permanent staff—

We shall need a permanent staff of	198
Whereas we have at present only	122
We require	76

I would propose engaging at once from 25 to 30 of the very best of the Temporary Engineers, bringing them in on various positions on the list to prevent congestion among themselves and others. I believe we could find suitable men of experience in our temporary staff for recruitment immediately. The remainder of the staff I would recruit from present sources of supply spreading out the additions over four years. Later on in 3 or 4 years it might be possible to give a few of the best Temporary Engineers remaining with us permanent appointments before dispensing with the services of the last.

APPENDIX VI—*continued.*

Statement comparing the United Provinces with the Punjab.

Items of comparison.	United Provinces.	Punjab and North-West Frontier Provinces.							
		Open Canals.	Triple Project.		North-West Frontier Province.		Total.	
			At present	Required for revenue.	At present	Required for revenue.	At present.	Required for revenue.
Gross commanded area	Acres. 17,586,100	Acres. 16,512,632	Acres. 3,987,216		Acres. 724,695		Acres. 21,224,543	
Average annual irrigation, three years ending with 1911-12	2,407,942	6,594,094	—		161,000		9,007,829	
Estimated irrigation	—	—	1,871,235		381,500			
Intensity of irrigation per cent.	14	40	47		75		42	
Miles of channels to be maintained. Canals and branches	Miles. 1,812	Miles. 3,997	Miles. 452		Miles. 195		Miles. 4,644	
Distributaries	9,379	10,661	2,210		485		13,356	
Average cost of establishment. Revenue management	Rs. 13,05,050	Rs. 26,92,650	?		?		?	
Maintenance of works	5,22,200	8,00,350	?		?		?	
Total	18,27,250	34,93,000	—		—		—	
Number of Divisions	24	25	12	9	4	3	41	37
Number of Sub-Divisions	62	71	40	27	14	8	125	106
Average cost of establishment per acre irrigated	Rs. 0·76	Rs. 0·53	Rs. ?		Rs. ?		Rs. ?	
Per Division: Average area irrigated or estimated to be	Acres. 100,331	Acres. 263,964	Acres. 219,026		Acres. 180,833		Acres. 243,440	
Per Division: number of canal miles to be maintained.	Miles. 76	Miles. 160	Miles. 50		Miles. 65		Miles. 125	
Per Division: number of distributary miles to be maintained.	391	426	245		162		361	
Per Sub-Division: Average area irrigated or estimated to be	Acres. 38,838	Acres. 92,875	Acres. 73,008		Acres. 67,812		Acres. 85,000	
Per Sub-Division: number of canal miles to be maintained.	Miles. 30	Miles. 56	Miles. 17		Miles. 24		Miles. 44	
Per Sub-Division: number of distributary miles to be maintained.	152	147	82		61		126	
Assuming canal inspection=4 times distributary inspection, the relative miles for inspection purposes would be:—								
Per Division	692	1,066	445		422		861	
Per Sub-Division	268	375	150		157		302	

APPENDIX VII.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh relating to the Public Works Department.

I.—General.

Division of the Engineering Establishment into Imperial and Provincial.

1. Before any of the other questions which concern the Public Works department are considered, it is first of all necessary to examine the present constitution of the department with reference to its division into Imperial and Provincial Branches.

The constitution of the Provincial service was the outcome of the recommendations of the Public Service Commission of 1888.

The recommendations of this Commission were as follows:—

(1) "The Engineer establishment of the Public Works department should consist of an Imperial Branch and of Provincial branches."

(2) "The Imperial Branch should consist of such a number of Royal Engineers as may be required as a reserve for Military purposes, over and above the officers employed in the Military Works Branch and of Civil Engineers recruited in England."

(3) "The strength of the Imperial Branch should not be greater than is necessary for purposes of control and direction and for the execution and repair of works calling for high Engineering skill, and the recruitment from the Coopers Hill Engineering College which appears excessive should be regulated accordingly."

(4) "The conditions of service in the Imperial Branch should be fixed with a view to secure the necessary qualifications in England, and should, as far as possible, be uniform for all officers employed in it."

(5) "The Provincial Branches should be of a strength adequate for the construction and maintenance in the several provinces of works not ordinarily calling for high Engineering skill."

(6) "The recruitment for the Provincial Branches should be made by the direct appointment to the lowest grades of qualified Engineers from the Indian Engineering Colleges, and in exceptional cases by promotion from the Upper Subordinate grades."

(7) "There should be at least one College in India thoroughly well equipped for providing a high education for Engineers for the Provincial Branches, and such College should be open to all classes of His Majesty's subjects."

(8) "The conditions of service as to pay, furlough and pension should be fixed for the Provincial Branches without reference to those of the Imperial Branch."

(9) and (10) These proposals refer to the Accounts branch only.

The Commission held that the proposals embodied "principles on which the establishment of the Public Works department should be reorganised in the interests alike of economy and of efficiency and as furthering the larger admission of qualified Natives of India to employment in this important department of the Public Service."

2. The history of the reconstitution of the Public Works department Provincial service in accordance with those recommendations and the difficulties which have arisen therefrom are set forth in the appended article* on the Public Works department Provincial service which appeared in the *Pioneer* of August 14, 1912.

The article gives a clear *résumé* of how the service now appears to the ordinary man of business.

The Commission of 1888 recorded that "the distinctions inevitable in a department so constituted and

* Printed as annexure.

recruited give rise to friction and jealousies which must affect the efficiency of its officers. Royal Engineers, Coopers Hill Engineers, and Engineers educated in India all belong to the same service, but, as shown above, the conditions of service of each of these classes differ in regard to leave and pension; and the men appointed in India not unnaturally claim to be placed on an equal footing with their brother officers."

3. The object that the Commission had in view in making their recommendations regarding the formation of Imperial and Provincial services with distinct conditions of service was as follows:—

The Commission considered that "some of the operations of the Department require the highest Engineer skill and training obtainable in England, and for the control and direction of a great Department, the annual expenditure of which is reckoned by millions, qualifications are wanted which are not at present readily attainable in this country," whilst "on the other hand, much of the work which falls on to the Engineering establishment is such as may be and is performed efficiently by officers who have received their professional education in India." To cope with these two grades of work it was recommended that the service of engineers should be divided into two branches, Imperial and Provincial.

4. It has been found impracticable and undesirable to lay down definitely that certain divisional charges or even a fixed proportion of divisional charges should be reserved for Provincial Engineers.

The result is the present anomalous state of affairs in which we have two classes of men in a professional service, some of them educated approximately up to the same standard and performing the same duties, but at the same time under entirely different rules as regards pay, leave and pension. Thus, in spite of the changes made, the same anomalous state of affairs continues on which the Commission specially commented as giving rise to friction and jealousies which were bound to affect the efficiency of its officers. Such a state of affairs does not exist in any other service in India.

The Provincial Service Officers of Civil and Medical services, for instance, are undoubtedly inferior as regards education and training to the officers of the Imperial service, and, moreover, the duties they have to perform are of a lower standard.

The superior Accounts branch of the Public Works department with far less responsibility and need of character and initiative, less study to keep abreast of the times, less exposure and isolation and greater comforts and amenities, is maintained on an Imperial footing, and it is certainly an anomaly that some of the Engineers should be inferior in position to their Auditors.

II.—PROPOSED RECONSTITUTION OF THE DEPARTMENT.

1. The only solution of this difficult question which, in the opinion of the Local Government, is likely to bring contentment to the department and to promote efficiency, is the following:—

(*a*) The abolition of the Provincial service and the placing of all officers in the Imperial service under the same rules as regards pay, leave and pension.

(*b*) The constitution of an improved upper subordinate establishment. This establishment to consist of:—

(*a*) A Sub-Engineer class with pay from Rs. 200 to Rs. 600, and (*b*) an upper subordinate class with pay from Rs. 100 to Rs. 300.

The men for class (*a*) to be recruited from passed Engineer students from Indian Colleges and by promotion of deserving men from class (*b*). Only men in the Sub-Engineer class should, it is considered, be eligible for the charge of sub-divisions. Men of the Sub-Engineer class should not be promoted to the Imperial service, as, in the opinion of the Local Government, there should be a hard and fast line of distinction.

In order, however, to provide opportunities for advancement to specially meritorious Sub-Engineers, such officers, it is suggested, might be made eligible for three or four divisional charges on a special rate of pay, say Rs. 700 to Rs. 800 per mensem.

In the manner briefly indicated above, the Local Government is of opinion that a class of Sub-Engineers would be obtained consisting of well educated men constituting a less highly paid service recruited in India for work not requiring a high degree of scientific attainment, but who would be well qualified to take charge of sub-divisions and whose pay would be sufficiently good to place them beyond the temptation inevitable to men responsible for the expenditure of large sums of Government money.

This reorganization would in fact constitute a Provincial service under another name.

2. The accepted strength of the cadre provides for one Assistant Engineer to each Executive Engineer, so that there is a marked demand for well-trained Sub-Engineers to replace a considerable number of men who have of necessity been placed in charge of sub-divisions, but who, on account of their status and inferior qualifications and character, are quite unfitted for such charges.

On these lines the department would be composed of:—

(*a*) Imperial Engineers recruited in England and in India, highly trained for the more scientific work of the department.

(*b*) A less highly paid service recruited solely in India for other work in the department composed of:—

(1) Sub-Engineers.
(2) Supervisors.
(3) Overseers.
(4) Sub-overseers.

III.—METHOD OF RECRUITMENT OF IMPERIAL ENGINEERS.

1. The magnitude of the Railway and Irrigation works in India, the large sums of money spent and earned by those branches, the varied and difficult work of the general branch, having regard to the increasing demand for works of sanitation and water-supply, all demand a thoroughly efficient Engineering establishment.

This being the case it is clear that an inferior engineer, whatever the economy due to low pay, will be a costly servant to the State and that inefficiency will be not only an extravagance but a positive menace. While it is more than doubtful if the engineers who now receive appointments from the Indian Engineering Colleges are as well educated and trained as the men who are now recruited in England, it is unquestionable that the European is as a rule far superior to the Indian and even to the country-born European educated in India in those essentials of character, business and administrative ability without which technical skill alone is of little avail.

While there are signs of improvement, such improvement is likely to be of slow growth, and it is unquestionable that any reasonably high standard of efficiency must mean the employment of a very large proportion of Europeans for a long time to come, not because they are Europeans, but because the necessary qualifications and aptitude and intense love for the profession have not so far been found in India in any appreciable degree. If this be accepted, it will be necessary to lay down the proportion of men to be recruited in England and in India, a proportion which should be subject to revision from time to time as the Indian recruit justifies his fitness for increased employment.

2. Acording to a reply given in the House of Commons on 19th April, 1911, the number of men recruited in England through the Selection Committee of the India Office without competition has been in recent years as follows:—

1908	39
1909	30
1910	30
1911	28

the average annual recruitment may be taken as 30 of which according to rule 10 per cent. must be Indians. The annual recruitment in India for the Provincial service is 14, distributed in the ratio of 9 to 5 or 10 to 5 in alternate years between Assistant Engineers and Upper subordinates.

The present proportion of Europeans recruited in England to Indians recruited in England and in

APPENDIX VII—*continued.*

India is therefore—27 : 17, that is 38 per cent. of the appointments have in recent years been given to Indians; but it must be remembered that the recruitment from England has at the same time been considerably below what is considered to have been necessary to maintain the Engineer cadre at its proper strength and efficiency.

The Local Government is of opinion that, for the present at any rate, the proportion of Europeans, *i.e.*, including Europeans recruited in India, to Indians in the department might be fixed at 2 to 1.

With say 45 annual appointments therefore 30 would be Europeans and 15 Indians whether recruited in England or in India.

3. *Recruitment in England.* — Every candidate should have been through a three years' University course and obtained one of the University degrees mentioned in Appendix I of the present rules for appointment of Assistant Engineers in England, in order to ensure that he shall have undergone a proper course of study at the best Engineering Colleges in the United Kingdom and that he has qualified up to a high standard.

The A.M.I.C.E. examination alone should not be considered a sufficient qualification.

4. The Selection Committee should consist of—

(1) A retired Lieutenant-Governor or Chief Commissioner as President.

(2) An eminent Engineer with considerable experience in England preferably a past President of the Institution of Civil Engineers.

(3) An eminent Principal or Professor of an Engineering College of high standing in England.

(4) A recently retired Engineer of the Indian Public Works Department.

(5) An engineer of the Indian Public Works Department actually in service, selected from the men who may be at home on leave.

This Committee should select two or three times as many candidates as there are vacancies.

5. The candidates should be from 21 to 24 years of age and selected candidates should be required to undergo a competitive examination, the order of passing determining the seniority of the candidates who receive appointments.

On arrival in India the selected candidates should undergo a course of practical training for one year and should only be confirmed if this has been satisfactory, otherwise, they should, in the case of Europeans, be paid their passage money back to England.

6. The number of Europeans fixed for recruitment in England should include Royal Engineers who may be appointed to the permanent scale of the department, but such officers should only come in at the bottom of the list, otherwise not only is the promotion of Civil Engineers to the administrative appointments prejudicially affected but also the amount of pension they may earn.

Under the present rules additional pensions are granted to Civil Engineers who have served certain terms in the administrative grades, and from this they may be debarred if senior Royal Engineers are brought in over their heads.

7. *Recruitment in India.*—Recruitment in India should preferably be from one Central College for Engineers only.

Entrance to this college should be by selection combined with a qualifying examination; the selection committee to consist of the Principal of the College, the Director of Public Instruction, and one of the Chief Engineers of the province.

Candidates who have passed successfully through a three years' course and after a final competitive examination have been successful in obtaining appointments, should be appointed as probationary Assistant Engineers and should undergo a course of practical training for one year. If this has been satisfactory, they should be confirmed, otherwise their services should be dispensed with.

The age for appointment should be the same as for men recruited in England. The standard of training at this Central College and the standard of the final examination should be the same as fixed for candidates recruited in England.

The most suitable College in His Honour's opinion for the training of Engineers for the Public Works Department is Rurki but emphasis must be laid on the fact that the stamp of recruits from Rurki in recent years has been disappointing and there is reason to fear that it is deteriorating.

The general education of the students who now enter Rurki is as a rule defective. The Anglo-Indian recruits of the present day are much below the class of those who entered thirty years ago and the Indian recruits are decidedly inferior. Not only is this the case but the course of training at Rurki is markedly inferior to the course of training at the Universities which it is recommended that recruits from England should undergo. Until a better class of recruits is obtainable in India and the College is thoroughly reorganised to conform to the standard of training at the Universities in England, it will not, in the opinion of the Local Government, be possible to train Engineers with the same educational qualifications as can be obtained amongst those recruited in England.

It will therefore be necessary to restrict the number of appointments to those only who have approximated very nearly to the standard of the men appointed in England and for several years at least to give a greater proportion of the appointments than the two-thirds suggested to the men recruited in England.

The results of the final examination for the Engineering students at Rurki are known in July and there should be no difficulty in selecting the number of men who have qualified for appointments up to the required standard, subject in the case of Indians, to a maximum of one-third of the total number of recruits required in any year; the balance to make up the full number would then be selected from the candidates in England in the order of merit of passing the final competitive examination.

IV.—SYSTEM OF TRAINING.

1. The present system of departmental examination is considered sufficient. The Local Government would however recommend that greater facilities be given to officers to go to Europe in order to visit and report on works.

Modern Civil Engineering is a highly specialized profession and progress in methods and materials of construction is very rapid. A Civil Engineer, if he is to remain professionally efficient must therefore study up-to-date methods and appliances for executing work. The rules for the grant of study leave to officers of the Royal Army Medical Corps and Indian Medical Service should, it is considered, be extended to officers of the Public Works Department.

V.—CONDITIONS OF SERVICE.

1. It would appear desirable to the Local Government that a distinctive title should be given to the service since the term Public Works Department is used both by subordinates and clerks and hardly distinguishes an Engineer. The title suggested is Imperial Engineer Service corresponding to the title of Imperial Forest Service for the superior officers of that branch.

2. The Local Government is of opinion that the rules in the code I/427—430 relating to inefficient officers should be enforced with greater strictness in order to get rid of such officers.

3. The present post of Secretary to the Government of India is as a rule held by an officer of the Irrigation branch and the Local Government is of opinion that there should be either two Secretaries to the Government of India, *i.e.*, one for each branch, or that the post should be given to either branch in rotation.

4. The Local Government holds strongly the opinion that the number of Temporary Engineers should be reduced to the requirements of work of a purely temporary nature.

The lamentable shortage of Engineers on the permanent strength has necessitated the employment of this class, in many cases for a long term of years, and in some cases in charges which should be held by permanent Engineers. The result is a discontented class of men, mostly of inferior qualifications, who have a very real grievance in that whilst often performing the same duties as permanent Engineers they draw considerably less pay and have very precarious prospects.

VI.—CONDITIONS OF SALARY.

1. The system of annual increment in salary meets with general approval.

2. Promotion to Chief Engineer, 1st class, is so often blocked that many specially deserving officers never obtain a chance of promotion to the higher rate of pay or only do so shortly before they retire.

His Honour considers that there should be only one class of Chief Engineer as for Commissioners of divisions in the civil service, and that the rate of pay of a Chief Engineer should be Rs. 2,750. A Secretary to a Local Government or administration should get in addition a local allowance of Rs. 250 as at present.

VII.—CONDITIONS OF LEAVE.

1. The Local Government considers that the amount of leave allowed under the existing rules is sufficient, but that furlough allowances at present are inadequate in the case of junior officers and debar men from taking as much furlough as is desirable for their health's sake. Under the present rules an Imperial Engineer going on furlough to England is entitled to furlough allowance as follows:—

After 8 years' service	£279
,, 15 ,, ,, ...	£427-10-0

The Local Government would recommend that these allowances be increased to £350 after 8 years' service and to £500 after 15 years' service.

2. The desirability of granting study leave has already been noted on.

3. The Local Government considers that the Indian Service leave rules should be abolished and there should be one set of rules for all Engineer officers.

VIII.—CONDITIONS OF PENSION.

1. His Honour is not prepared to recommend any proposal for increased pensions, other than invalid pensions. The non-effective charges in His Honour's opinion are already too high. His Honour would however recommend greater liberality as regards invalid pension which might be increased in accordance with the following scale:—

Year of completed service.	Invalid pension, Civil Service Regulations, Article 641.		Proposed invalid pension.
	Amount calculated on a percentage basis.	Fixed maximum.	
1	2	3	4	5
10	20/60	Rs. 2,813	Rs. 1,600	Rs. 1,400
11	21/60	3,150	1,400	1,700
12	22/60	3,520	1,800	2,000
13	23/60	3,910	2,200	2,400
14	24/60	4,320	2,600	2,800
15	25/60	4,750	3,000	3,200
16	26/60	5,200	3,000	3,350
17	27/60	5,670	3,000	3,500
18	28/60	6,260	3,000	3,650
19	29/60	6,670	3,000	3,800
20	30/60	7,200	4,000	4,000

IX.—FAMILY PENSION FUND.

1. The advantages of a compulsory Provident Fund are generally recognized, but the resulting provision for the wife and family in the event of the death of the officer during his term of service is wholly inadequate.

His Honour would therefore be glad to see a Family Pension Fund established on a sound actuarial basis and is of opinion that Government might act generously in this matter but whether Government could afford to pay pound for pound into it must, His Honour considers, be left to the Government of India to determine.

X.—GENERAL.

Present constitution and working of the department.—As regards the new system of recruitment from England the Local Government is of opinion that the recruits hitherto received under this system are on the whole satisfactory, but that a still better class of recruits could be obtained on the lines advocated in section III, paragraphs 3, 4 and 5.

2. As regards recruitment in India the Local Government has already expressed its opinion on the recruits who are now received from Rurki and has made suggestions with a view to securing a better stamp of men, *vide* section III, paragraph 7.

3. As regards the comparative merits of Europeans and Indians, the Local Government has already expressed its opinion in section III, paragraph 1.

His Honour holds strongly to the opinion therein expressed that the European recruited in England is much superior to the Indian in all those essentials of character, business and administrative ability without which technical skill is of little avail and is, as a rule, in addition, superior in technical skill. It will therefore, in His Honour's opinion, be necessary if a reasonably high standard of efficiency is to be maintained to employ a very large proportion of Europeans in the service for a long time to come.

The objections to the employment of temporary Engineers to the extent to which they are employed at present and to the placing of subordinates in charges for which they are not qualified have been stated in section III, paragraph 1, section V, paragraph 4.

4. His Honour would lay emphasis on the present inadequacy of the present staff of Engineer officers.

The Irrigation Commission of 1901-1903 made the following remarks on the necessity for an increase in the Engineering staff:—

"In every province which we have visited, wherever we have taken evidence and made or received any proposals for the extension of works, we have been uniformly met with the complaint of the lack of Engineer officers. We have reason to think that this complaint is well-founded. It has been pointed out to us that the scale which has been sanctioned for each province is insufficient for present requirements; that the actual working strength is generally much below that scale; and that matters are getting worse every year, as, owing to irregular and insufficient recruitment in the past, the number of annual vacancies exceeds the number of new recruits. We have been told not only that the size of divisional charges is much larger than formerly, but also that the Executive Engineers are assisted by a less efficient staff: sub-divisions which used to be held by Engineers of English education being now in charge of subordinates or of Engineers temporarily employed."

"The sufficiency of the strength of the Public Works Department for the current duties which it has to discharge, and the adequacy of the present recruiting arrangement are administrative questions with which we have no immediate concern; and we have not therefore considered these complaints very closely. We cannot however but recognize that the successful prosecution of the programme of new irrigation works which it has been our duty to propose, will largely depend on the maintenance of the *personnel* of the Public Works Department at an adequate strength; and that, if even only a portion of that programme meets with the approval of Government, it cannot be completed within a reasonable time unless the staff of Engineers be largely increased and a permanent increase will be required for purposes of

investigation and construction, and also of subsequent maintenance and management. We need not dwell on the fatally wrong policy of spending large sums on new works and grudging the small expenditure necessary for their proper design, supervision, and management."

Although ten years have elapsed since the above opinion was recorded, the number of Engineer officers has not kept pace with the expansion of Public Works such as Irrigation, Sanitation, Water-supply, Roads and Buildings, with the result that the case is even worse now than it was ten years ago and the present staff of Engineers is quite inadequate to cope with the large amount of work it is now required to undertake. As a result of this subordinates have of necessity been placed in the charge of sub-divisions for which they are in very many cases quite unfitted by reason of their status, inferior qualifications and character.

For the same reasons it has been necessary to employ temporary Engineers in charges both divisional and sub-divisional which should be held by permanent men. These temporary men, as a rule, possess poor qualifications and have poor prospects. As a result we now have a considerable body of inferior Engineers, many of whom have been employed for a considerable term of years and who are in consequence not unnaturally discontented.

The great temptations to bribery to which the subordinate staff is open in a large spending department, the inadequacy of the superior supervising staff and the consequent survival of the old bad traditions which our Indian Engineers, with few exceptions, have not shown themselves strong enough to resist, has led to frequent dissatisfaction with the work of the department in recent years and urgently demands an increase in the superior supervising staff.

The Local Government is strongly of opinion that a much stronger and carefully selected proportion of Europeans should be employed in the Public Works Department than is at present the case.

ANNEXURE.

The Public Works Department Provincial Service.

From *Pioneer* of August 14, 1912.

The history of the Provincial service of the Public Works Department ending with its last phase, the resolution of the Government of India of the 15th May, 1912, announcing the sanction of the Secretary of State to the introduction of another revised scheme, is in many respects a curious one. To trace its main features on broad lines, up to the year 1882 the Indian College appointments were open to all comers without any question of domicile in the country or race distinctions; and although there were certain differences in the matter of leave rules and pensions to the disadvantage of those appointed in India all officers of the department drew precisely the same rates of pay. It was free to any candidate to aim at entering the service through the home channel or in India as he might deem it expedient in his own interests. In 1882 the first important change occurred, the Indian College appointments were restricted to Natives of India, that is to Indians and domiciled classes and Europeans were debarred. But not even then was any differentiation in salaries introduced, and all officers, whether Natives of India appointed in the country or Europeans recruited in England, continued to draw salaries on the same scale. Up to 1882 the service attracted not only the cream of European youths educated in India, but also, to some small extent, men from beyond the borders of India, altogether: officers such as Sir William Garstin and Mr. Moylefield were in no sense the products of India or of Indian education and though Englishmen became ineligible in the subsequent two years the department was still replenished by the best European blood that India could supply. In neither period were the best Indians to the fore as the Engineering profession was not in accordance with their inclinations, prejudices or family traditions.

A still greater change came into force in 1892 when the Provincial service was introduced. It was ostensibly the result of the recommendations of the Public Service Commission of 1888; but it seems probable that the Government of India or the Secretary of State had previously some idea of reducing the salaries of men appointed in India on the occurrence of a suitable opportunity, in which case the report of the Commission may have given the opportunity sought and have meant little more than that. It is difficult in any other way to account for the manner in which the Provincial Scheme of 1892 was framed. It ignored what seems to have been the main intentions of the Commission in its report, and not altogether without reasons, for the report, it must be admitted, was a somewhat perfunctory affair. Considering the vast importance of the Public Works Department in the future development of India, and the fact that its officer strength was nearly equal to that of the Civil Service and its subordinate establishment larger, it is remarkable that while the subject of the Civil Service received such careful and exhaustive examination, the department should have been dismissed in such few words. And even those few words were peculiar. "The Commission is informed" it was said by one very competent witness "that at present a Coopers Hill man is sometimes kept for fifteen years manufacturing bricks and lime and putting them together." Whether the Commission imagined that Coopers Hill Engineers loaded and fired limekilns with their own hands, pugged brick earth with their own feet, and subsequently performed the duties of a bricklayer is not clear, but, putting it briefly and in its broad sense the above, as a definition, is not a bad description of an engineer's duties. The engineer usually is a man who is putting things together and bricks and lime together may mean large buildings and bridges and important irrigation works. Ballast and mortar together form concrete—concrete and steel together and there is reinforced concrete; a number of bits of steel together and may be a great railway bridge; but to the members of the Commission it was ridiculous that Coopers Hill men should be so employed and they considered it high time that there should be a second rate class of Engineers to relieve them of drudgery. They would not appear to have realized that, although there are details of an Engineer's work for which high qualifications are not essential the department possessed a large subordinate establishment for such purposes.

But if the scheme of 1892 were intended to be independent of the views of the Commission it was unfortunate that it should have been introduced at that particular time; it was only natural that it should have been ascribed to the Commission's recommendations. And it was particularly unfortunate for another reason. The avowed purposes of the Public Service Commission were to arrive at the best means of improving the prospects of Natives of India by opening the road to more of the higher posts of all services to them. The Civil Service in addition to its covenanted officers, possessed a lower Indian appointed establishment whose prospects, by means of a Provincial service, it was possible to advance. The Public Works Department had no such corresponding establishment: its officers were all Imperial, and consequently any Provincial scheme, not confined to the subordinates of the department, must necessarily have entailed a degradation, instead of improvement, on former conditions. The point was one of vital importance, and without a radical change in the composition of the department, there was no way out of it. Something however had to be done and the result was what is known as Sir Charles Elliott's Provincial Engineer Scheme of 1892. The scheme made no provision for a separate engineer establishment, for the less important work of the department, as was apparently contemplated by the Public Service Commission; in fact it might have been framed on orders which said "Never mind the Commission but reduce the pay of the appointment made in India" as if that, and that only were the aim. It merely created a new superior service on the same list as the Imperial men to work side by side with them, only, except in Chief Engineer class, on two-thirds the salary. Except in the matter of pay, the two services were co-equal; and the attempt to give some justification to the scheme by listing the less important charges as provincial proved impracticable. It is sometimes supposed that the "two-thirds" idea originated with

the Commission, but this is an error. Sir Charles Aitchison and his colleagues never touched on the subject of emoluments in their report. Indeed, by a curious irony of fate, the fraction in question appears to have been derived from the analogy of the statutory Civil Service which the action of the Commission may be said to have abolished. It was only natural that such a scheme should have been received with dismay. By 1892 the home recruited engineers were no longer what they were in the early days of the Coopers Hill system. The freely expressed grievances of the senior Coopers Hill men who had been attracted to the service by a very misleading prospectus, had not stopped this source of recruitment altogether; but the supply was no longer of the same class, and rightly or wrongly the Rurki Engineers believed themselves to be the equal of the officers appointed by the Secretary of State. In that frame of mind they bitterly resented working shoulder to shoulder with men on pay so superior to their own, and though the Imperial officers were not directly affected, the scheme came to them as a reflection on the importance of their service, lowering at a blow its status and efficiency. Efficiency in fact was bound to suffer, not only did the scheme introduce into the department a body of engineers thoroughly discontented with their position, but it was not to be expected that the service would be as popular as it was when Rurki produced such officers as Garstin or Willcocks, Field and Macdonald, and others who established a reputation for themselves in India and Egypt. At the transition stage, in spite of the changed conditions, a number of able men doubtless adhered to their intention of embarking on a profession for which they had been destined from an early age; but the average quality of the recruits had a downward tendency. The best Europeans in the country no longer cared to compete, the lists of successful candidates for the guaranteed appointments became almost exclusively Indian and to Indians of the better class the engineering profession had never been attractive. If they entered it was for the sake of some form of government service and on account of the difficulty or impossibility of obtaining other appointments more to their taste, but not from any aptitude or love for engineering. It is possible that many of them were amply paid for what they were worth; but as time went on their numbers increased and with their number the voicing of grievances. The general weal of the service was plainly suffering. It was not that time disclosed any fresh causes for dissatisfaction. The scheme at the end was just what it was known to be at the beginning, but every year brought an accession to the ranks of the malcontents, and after about a decade the Government apparently felt that the position called for reconsideration.

I believe I am correct in saying that the department, then consulted and taken seriously into confidence for the first time, spoke with no uncertain sound. Its members have never been in favour of a Provincial Service. They were of opinion that there was no room for a service of Proviincial engineers sandwiched, so to speak, between the Imperial officers and the subordinates, and with scarcely a dissentient voice they condemned the scheme in the form it had assumed. They contended that the pecuniary value of the operations of the department was so great that an inferior Engineer, whatever the economy due to low pay, was a costly servant to the State; that inefficiency was not only an extravagance, it was a positive menace, and the menace was accentuated because the Provincial service was discontented to the core. It is believed that the Railway and Irrigation officers in particular asserted that the Provincial system was unlikely to produce recruits of the stamp required for the important work of these branches of the department; and it was obviously impossible to force the whole Provincial establishment on the Buildings and Roads branch, the proportion of Imperial engineers would be so small that the effect would be disastrous. In short the weight of opinion then expressed pointed to the restoration of the department to its former Imperial conditions in some shape or form or a still greater degree of differentiation in the direction of a Provincial subordinate service. There were many reasons why in the circumstances of the department it should be wholly Imperial. The magnitude of the interests of Railway and Irrigation in India, the large sums of money spent and earned by these branches, the varied and difficult work of the general branch of the service all point to the necessity for a thoroughly efficient engineer establishment. Moreover, when the accounts branch of the department—with far less responsibility and need of character and initiative, less study to keep abreast of the times, less exposure and isolation and greater comforts and amenities—was being maintained on an Imperial footing, it was anomalous that the engineers should be consigned to a position so inferior to that of their auditors. But if on the other hand the views of the Public Service Commission were sound and it was felt that there was a genuine demand for a second class engineer agency, it would have been consistent to have given practical effect to the belief and to have divided the services in a more wholesale manner. The subordinate establishment was in need of improvement; nothing had been done for it for years, and the opportunity presented itself. In an organization which provided only one Assistant Engineer to each Executive, there was a marked demand for highly trained sub-engineers for the charge of sub-divisions, from which they might rise to divisional charge, if found so qualified. In fact there might have been combinations of the two main systems in various ways, a certain number of the best men being appointed on an Imperial footing and the rest to a Provincial sub-engineer service on admittedly lower salary and status or all appointed to the sub-engineer service with the prospect of transfer to the full emoluments of the Imperial engineer if found so qualified. The task of framing any satisfactory Public Works Provincial scheme, difficult enough at the start, was however rendered still more difficult by the shape the first scheme had taken and the manner in which it had been announced. The long delay was doubtless owing to this reason and while the years were passing another factor urgently affecting the Imperial establishment came into play. A time-scale had been sanctioned for the Opium department in 1906 and was followed by a similar scale of pay for the Enrolled list. The scale for the latter was cast on such generous lines that it was impossible for other Imperial services to remain as they were. The scheme for the Imperial Forest establishment came into force in January 1907 and the Public Works department grew uneasy. Further delay was clearly out of the question and forced by the pressure of events, the reorganisation scheme of 1908 was launched.

It is unnecessary to refer to the Imperial part of it which merely followed the time-scale sanctioned for the Forest department. In the case of the Provincial service, a sort of middle course was adopted. In many respects the prospects of the Provincial engineers were improved, but they were placed on a separate list; and this action coupled with the substantial improvements in the salaries of the Imperial officers, caused more discontent and disaffection than had ever previously existed. As a matter of fact, if the question be examined dispassionately, the separation of the lists, the main feature of the reorganisation of 1908, was not in itself unreasonable. If the Indian college engineers were as well qualified in technical and administrative skill as the home recruits, they were worthy of the same salary; but if the Provincial service had been introduced on account of a need for a lower paid agency for the less scientific work of the department, the complete separation of the two establishments was not only defensible but was common sense. The 1892 scheme was purely arbitrary, here at any rate was some show of principle; it was nevertheless made the special rock of offence. The Provincial engineers, almost in a body, declined to accept the new conditions, accompanied by, what they considered to be, enhanced social degradation and breach of faith. All their earlier memorials had prayed for reinstatement to the Imperial establishment and their hopes were centred in that direction. They knew that the grievances of the department of the past had been largely directed towards equalization of emoluments for all officers, military and civil, doing the same work. The 1892 scheme, with all its disadvantageous disparity of pay had declared that "in all other respects there shall be no distinction between the two services." The inequality of pay to

two sets of officers with the same duties and responsibilities was so marked that the Provincial men had hopes of rectification in the direction without disadvantages in any other. They had not anticipated the separation which dashed their hopes to the ground and their disappointment was unbounded. They felt that in asking for bread, they had received a stone. The discontent was so pronounced that yielding to importunity, Government faced the situation once more, and the result is shown in the recently announced scheme of 1912. The 1912 reorganization resorts to the general lines of the scheme of 1892 and there is again no distinction between the two services except in the matter of pay. The only underlying principle would appear to be that Europeans with a longer and more expensive course of education, serving in a climate prejudicial to their health in a country which means separation from families, and all the other personal and pecuniary disabilities, should be paid on a higher scale than Indians employed in their own country. Indeed the Honourable Mr. Gokhale proposed in Council to give this principle more definite shape. In urging the more extended employment of Indians he suggested that they should be on the same general scale of pay as the Europeans but that the latter should be granted additional personal allowances as compensation for service in a foreign country. The principle may be plausible enough at first sight, but it is very questionable whether it should be admitted. If the future policy of Government should be one of allowing Indians a greater share in the work of their own country when they show themselves fit for it, there is no reason to pay a European engineer higher solely because he is a European. If as an engineer he is no better than the Indian, there is no reason to import him at all. But it is common knowledge that he is better and for the better article it is sound policy to pay the price. Nearly forty years ago a very distinguished Irrigation officer remarked that in the course of his experience he had not known a single native Assistant Engineer worth his pay. He may have been unfortunate and no doubt some progress has been made since that time, but it was only a short time ago that a disinterested observer, Sir Valentine Chirol, wrote: "Until quite recently the educated classes have held almost entirely aloof from any but the liberal professions. Science in any form has been rarely taken up by University students or for every B.Sc. the honours lists have shown probably a hundred B.A.'s. The Indian National Congress itself as it represented mainly these classes naturally displayed the same tendencies, and for a long time it devoted its energies to so-called political problems rather than to practical economic questions. Hence the almost complete failure of the Western educated Indian to achieve any marked success in commercial and industrial undertakings, and nowhere has that failure been more complete than in Bengal, where it would be difficult to quote more than one really brilliant exception." The one exception Sir Valentine refers to is Sir R. N. Mukerjee of Messrs Martin and Co., an engineer and business man of marked ability, and there have been other exceptions, but being exceptions they prove nothing beyond the rule. The fact is no reflection on the brilliant intellects of India because the best intellects of India have never been devoted to engineering science; and to look the question fairly in the face, the men who have entered the profession have not shown themselves conspicuous either in technical knowledge or in those essentials of character and sense of responsibility in emergencies and business and administrative ability, without which technical skill alone is of little avail. There are signs of progress in the right direction even since Sir Valentine Chirol wrote his work on Indian Unrest, but India is a country which moves slowly, and those who are most intimately acquainted with the working of the Public Works department are well aware that any reasonably high standard of efficiency must mean the employment of a very large proportion of European officers for a long time to come, not because they are Europeans, but because the qualifications and aptitude and intense love for the profession have not so far been found in India in appreciable degree. It would have been well if this had been realized at the time the first Provincial scheme was framed. If this scheme created difficulty the difficulty is intensified by that of 1912, the principle on which both are founded is unsound, and the system, under which ten per cent. of the home appointments are given to Indians, without competition with the Europeans, only adds to the inconsistency of the situation. All that can be said is that both parties appear to be satisfied for the time and discontent has been allayed. The Provincial engineers may congratulate themselves on the substantial improvements granted to them, and the Government, in their freedom from adverse criticism at the moment, may feel themselves in the position of the Provincial Mayor who plumed himself on having "held the balance even between right and wrong."

APPENDIX VIII.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bengal relating to the Public Works Department.

(1) Present Regulations as to Recruitment, Training, and Probation, and whether these Regulations are satisfactory.—The cadre of the Bengal Public Works Department, as at present sanctioned by the Government of India, consists of 49 Engineer officers. This is divided as follows: 34 Imperial and 15 Provincial.

The recruitment for the Imperial Service is in accordance with the Appendix VIII of the memorandum prepared by the Government of India for the Public Services Commission, 1912.

Each year the number of appointments to be made of Assistant Engineers in the Public Works Department is advertised and applications for the same are invited. Selection is then made in accordance with the advice of the Selection Committee appointed by the Secretary of State.

Every candidate, except natives of India, must be a British born subject of European descent, and at the time of his birth his father must have been a British subject either natural born or naturalized in the United Kingdom.

Natives of India, who are British subjects and are not qualified under the above regulation, are eligible for appointment and shall be appointed to the extent of 10 per cent. of the total number of Assistant Engineers thus recruited, if otherwise duly qualified.

Candidates must produce evidence that they have obtained (1) one of the University degrees mentioned below, (2) passed the A.M.I.C.E. Examination or obtained such other diploma or distinction as may, in the opinion of the Selection Committee, be accepted as approximately equivalent to the degrees mentioned below.

It is further laid down that it is advisable that candidates who have been through a college course should have had at least one full year's practical experience of Civil Engineering under a qualified Civil Engineer. Those who have taken no college course should have had a full three years of such practical experience. If a selected candidate has not, in the opinion of the Selection Committee, had sufficient practical experience, he may be required to undergo, after arrival in India, a year's probation.

List of Degrees.

University of Oxford.—B.A. (in the Final Honours School in Engineering Science).
University of London.—B.Sc. (Engineering).
University of Cambridge.—B.A. Honours (Mechanical Sciences Tripos).
University of St. Andrews.—B.Sc. (Engineering).
University of Glasgow.—B.Sc. (Engineering).

APPENDIX VIII—*continued.*

University of Edinburgh.—B.Sc. (Engineering).
Victoria University of Manchester (or Victoria University).—B.Sc. (with Honours in Engineering) and B.Sc. Tech. (Honours Division in the Final Examination).
University of Liverpool.—B. Eng., provided the degree be obtained by passing the examinations of the University.
University of Leeds.—B.Sc. in Civil or Mechanical Engineering.
University of Sheffield.—B.E. (First class in Final Examination).
University of Birmingham.—B.Sc. (Engineering) provided that the Engineering Matriculation Examination shall have been passed before entry upon any course of study which forms part of the degree course; and that a regular course of study, occupying not less than three academical years, shall have been pursued between the passing of such Matriculation Examination and the passing of the Final Examination for the degree.
University of Dublin.—B.A.I.
Royal University of Ireland.—B.E. and M.E.
University of Wales.—B.Sc. (in the Department of Civil, Mechanical or Electrical Engineering).
University of Durham.—B.Sc. in Civil, Mechanical, Electrical Engineering or in Naval Architecture, provided that the Matriculation Examination for Engineering and Naval Architecture shall have been passed before entry upon any course of study which forms part of the degree course.
University of Bristol.—B.Sc. in Civil or Mechanical Engineering.
Other degrees.—Any other degree of a University in the United Kingdom which may hereafter be recognised by the Council of the Institution of Civil Engineers as exempting from passing the examination for Associate Membership.

The recruitment for the Provincial Service is from the Sibpur College of Engineering, and the appointment is made in accordance with the following rules:—

One appointment as Apprentice Engineer will be made every alternate year from the regular students who have completed the full course of study in the Civil Engineering branch of the Engineering Department of the Civil Engineering College and have passed the Final Examination, either University or College, held at the end of this course within not more than six academic years of their first admission in the first year class of that college, and who have qualified in the year's practical training in the Public Works Department.

If the Apprentice Engineer serves his apprenticeship satisfactorily, he will permanently be appointed as Assistant Engineer in the Provincial Service of the Public Works Department.

In every fourth year one Upper Subordinate of the Public Works Department will also be appointed as Assistant Engineer in the same service.

The number of regular students of the Civil Engineering branch of the Engineer Department of the Civil Engineering College, Sibpur, who having passed the final College or University Examination held at the end of the college course training will be received for practical training, will be six.

The practical training will be from 1st November to 31st October of the following year.

The Governor of Bengal will select six students who have in the year obtained the Upper Subordinate or Sub-Engineer certificate of the Joint Technical Examination Board and have been trained in one of the following institutions:—

Apprentice Department, Civil Engineering College, Sibpur	3
Dacca School of Engineering	3

These six candidates will undergo a similar practical training to that of the regular students of the Engineering Department of the Civil Engineering College.

When the practical training is over, a Board of Examiners will be appointed by Government to conduct the practical examination which will be designed to test candidates in those qualities, which, independently of book work and theory, go far to make an efficient officer.

The Board is composed of—

Superintending Engineer of the Public Works Department ...	*President.*
Executive Engineer	*Members.*
A Professor of the Civil Engineering College, Sibpur	*Members.*

The examination is to be essentially a practical one as far as possible conducted orally and in the field. The examination is to be held in the month of November each year.

The following schedules of marks are used at this examination:—

I.—Schedule for competition for guaranteed Assistant Engineer's post.

	Marks.
(1) Handicraft examination	500
(2) For marks gained by the candidates in the Engineering and drawing groups of the Civil Engineering branch of the examination held at the end of course of the Engineer Department of the Civil Engineering College	1,000
(3) Practical levelling	250
(4) Do. Engineering	250
(5) Preparation of materials	250
(6) Knowledge of simple accounts	250
(7) Ability to prepare, use and apply working drawings	250
(8) Estimating	250
(9) Riding	250
Total	3,250

II.—Schedule for competition for posts in Public Works Department subordinate grades.

	Marks.
(1) Handicraft examination	1,000
(2) Practical levelling	250
(3) Do. Engineering	250
(4) Preparation of materials	250
(5) Knowledge of simple accounts	250
(6) Ability to prepare, use and apply working drawings	250
(7) Estimating	250
(8) Riding	250
Total	2,750

NOTE.—The standards of the handicraft examination of both the Graduate and the Overseer courses shall be approved for the purposes of this examination by the Public Works Department.

The local Government in reviewing the results will take into consideration the reports on the character and general fitness of the candidates, which are submitted by the officers under whom they have served during their practical training. They will take the marks as awarded under the above Schedule (No. I) into account in deciding the award of the guaranteed post of Assistant Engineer and will arrange the candidates on the list in order of merit, the first candidate on the list being appointed as Apprentice Engineer to the Bengal Public Works Department Provincial Service in each alternate year.

In deciding the filling of the posts in the subordinate grades, they will prepare a list of merit in a similar way to that described above, making use of the marks awarded in Schedule II.

Those who are *ex*-students of the Engineer Department of the Civil Engineering College will usually be appointed to the first grade of Overseers, while those who hold the Upper Subordinate or Sub-Engineer certificate of the Joint Technical Examination Board will be placed in the second grade, the Bengal Government showing preference to those trained at Bengal Institutions.

Regarding the method of recruitment, the present method of recruitment for the Imperial Service has so far produced satisfactory results. It is, however, desirable that an Imperial officer of the Public Works Department, selected from the men who are each

APPENDIX VIII—*continued.*

year on leave in England or officers who have recently retired, should be added to the Selection Committee.

It is also desirable that it should be provided that Provincial Service Engineers may be selected for transfer to the Imperial Service if found of suitable attainments, subject to the condition that the proportion of officers so promoted to Imperial officers otherwise appointed shall never be greater than one to nine.

It is provided in the regulations that 10 per cent. of the total number of Assistant Engineers appointed to the Imperial Services annually shall be natives of India, if duly qualified, and no limit is imposed as to the number of such natives of India who may be selected in any one year. While His Excellency the Governor in Council does not wish to press for a modification of this rule, he holds the view that discretion should be left to the Selection Committee to pick out the best men available for this service and that it is undesirable that this discretion should be fettered by the obligation to appoint a certain number of natives of India should such Indians be qualified under the rules.

Regarding the present system of recruitment for the Provincial Service, the weak point of the present system is that Engineers and subordinates are educated and brought up together, obviously a very undesirable condition. It would be better in the opinion of this Government if the appointments of the Engineer establishment were made from a college entirely separate from that from which the subordinate establishment is recruited.

The point has been raised for Provincial Engineers that the existing minimum educational qualifications for admission to the Sibpur Engineering College should be lowered so that students may enter the college below the age of 19; this proposal is now being examined by the Bengal Government as there is no doubt that under the present system the Provincial Engineer recruited from Sibpur is placed at a disadvantage when compared with the Imperial recruit as he may enter the department about four years older.

The present system of training and probation appears satisfactory, except that it is desirable that special opportunities should be given to Indian trained Engineers to visit Engineering works outside their country.

(2) The Rates of Pay and Allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present Rates of Pay and Allowances are satisfactory.—The rates of pay and allowances are shown in the statement in Annexure A.

Imperial Service.—The Imperial Engineers have represented that their present salaries are inadequate. Although during the last twenty years the salaries of the Engineers of the Public Works Department have been materially increased, there is ground for the objections still raised that, even with the present rate of salaries, it is extremely hard for an officer in the Imperial Service, if married, to save an amount from his salary sufficient to provide for his wife and family after his retirement or on his death. At present the existing Provident Fund merely gives him 4 per cent. on the deposits made in it, and the Bengal Government is inclined to the view that something might be done by the State in the way of a contribution to this Fund, in order to improve the position of Imperial officers generally. This might prove more effective than a readjustment of salaries which might lead to an increase in the general standard of expenditure. The addition by Government of 50 per cent. of the amount thus saved by each officer, subject to proper limitations, would prove a valuable and not extravagant addition to the attractions of this service.

It is further urged that special allowances should be given to European officers of the Imperial Service stationed in Calcutta. These officers have for some time past felt the hardship of the present conditions, the cost of living for Europeans in Calcutta being at least 50 per cent. higher now that it was 25 years ago. This Government strongly support this proposal and has more than once urged on the Government of India the necessity for such allowances, but so far with no satisfactory result. In the meantime it is increasingly difficult to fill any of the Calcutta appointments in the Public Works Department with European officers, though for the efficient working of the Department it is essential that a portion of these appointments should be so filled.

Provincial Service.—This Government is of opinion that the present rates of pay are satisfactory.

(3) Number of Posts in each Grade and the provision, if any, made in the Cadre for Leave and Training:—

Chief Engineers (one sanctioned temporarily)	2
Superintending Engineers	5
Executive Engineers	18
Assistant Engineers	18
Allowance for absentees	6

(4) Appointment held outside the authorised Cadre:—

(1) Mr. B. K. Finnimore, Chairman, Improvement Trust.

(2) Col. Joly de Lotbiniere, State Engineer, Kashmir.

(3) Mr. A. G. Maflin, Assistant Sanitary Engineer.

(4) Mr. J. C. Stronach, on deputation to Delhi.

(5) Babu Jotindra Nath Mallick, District Engineer, Burdwan.

(5) Whether any addition is required to the present Cadre.—Not at present.

ANNEXURE A.

Scale of pay in 1890.

	Rs.	
Chief Engineer—		There was no Provincial Service in 1890.
1st class ...	2,500	
2nd ,, ...	2,000	
3rd ,, ...	1,800	
Superintending Engineer—		
1st class ...	1,600	
2nd ,, ...	1,350	
3rd ,, ...	1,100	
Executive Engineer—		
1st grade ...	950	
2nd ,, ...	800	
3rd ,, ...	700	
4th ,, ...	600	
Assistant Engineer—		
1st grade ...	500	
2nd ,, (Rs. 350 rising to after three years) ...	400	
3rd grade ...	250	

Scale of pay in 1900.

Imperial.	Rs.	Provincial.	Rs.
Chief Engineer—		Chief Engineer—	
1st class ...	2,500	1st class ...	2,500
2nd ,, ...	2,000	2nd ,, ...	2,000
3rd ,, ...	1,800	3rd ,, ...	1,800

APPENDIX VIII—*continued.*

IMPERIAL.	Rs.	PROVINCIAL.	Rs.
Superintending Engineer—		Superintending Engineer—	
1st class ...	1,600	1st class ...	1,050
2nd ,, ...	1,350	2nd ,, ...	900
3rd ,, ...	1,100	3rd ,, ...	750
Executive Engineer—		Executive Engineer—	
1st grade ...	1,000	1st grade ...	650
2nd ,, ...	850	2nd ,, ...	550
3rd ,, ...	700	3rd ,, ...	475
Assistant Engineer—		Assistant Engineer—	
1st grade ...	550	1st grade ...	400
2nd ,, ...	450	2nd ,, ...	350
3rd ,, ...	350	3rd ,, ...	250

Present scale of pay.

IMPERIAL.	Rs.	PROVINCIAL.	Rs.
Chief Engineer—		Chief Engineer—	
1st class ...	2,750	1st class ...	2,750
2nd ,, ...	2,500	2nd ,, ...	2,500

Local allowance of Rs. 250 is given to Secretaries to Local Government.

IMPERIAL.	Rs.	PROVINCIAL.	Rs.
Superintending Engineer—		Superintending Engineer—	
1st class ...	2,000	1st class ...	1,600
2nd ,, ...	1,750	2nd ,, ...	1,400
3rd ,, ...	1,500	3rd ,, ...	1,200

IMPERIAL.	Rs.	PROVINCIAL.	Rs.
Assistant Engineer—		Assistant Engineer—	
Year of service:		Year of service:	
1st	380	1st	250
2nd	420	2nd	275
3rd	460	3rd	300
4th	500	4th	325
5th	540	5th	350
6th	580	6th	375
7th	620	7th	400
8th	660	8th	425
9th	700	9th	450
10th	750	10th	475
Executive Engineer—		Executive Engineer—	
Year of service:		Year of service:	
11th	800	11th	535
12th	850	12th	570
13th	900	13th	605
14th	950	14th	640
15th	1,000	15th	675
16th	1,050	16th	710
17th	1,100	17th	745
18th	1,150	18th	780
19th	1,200	19th	815
20th, and following years	1,250	20th	850

APPENDIX IX.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bihar and Orissa relating to the Public Works Department.

(1) The present Regulations as to Recruitment, Training, and Probation, and whether these Regulations are considered satisfactory.—There is a separate cadre for the Engineer Establishment of Bihar and Orissa, but recruitment and training are carried out under rules applicable to the establishments of all provinces, and additions to the establishment are arranged by the Government of India.

The Imperial establishment is recruited from selected candidates appointed in England by the Secretary of State with the help of a Selection Committee, and from the Corps of Royal Engineers on the Indian Establishment. The Provincial Service is recruited from passed students of Indian Civil Engineering Colleges and by the promotion of deserving Upper Subordinates. The system of recruitment is fully described in paragraphs 141 to 166 of the Public Works Department Code, Vol. I.

Recruits for the Imperial Service are expected to have had practical experience on works prior to selection by the Selection Committee in England. If the Committee consider the experience gained is insufficient, appointment to the service is made subject to a satisfactory probation in India of one year in charge of works. Recruits from Indian Colleges to the Provincial Service are first appointed as apprentices for one year during which they are trained on works. Their appointment as Assistant Engineers is dependent on their giving satisfaction during their training.

The Local Government have no objection to urge against the present system of recruitment for either service; but they consider that the period of training for one year as "Apprentice," prior to appointment as Assistant Engineer on the Provincial Establishment, should be abolished in Bihar and Orissa in view of the fact that a preliminary training on works for one year is already required at the conclusion of the College Course before competition for the post of Assistant Engineer. The Apprentice Course, in effect, extends the period of practical training to two years and unnecessarily defers appointment to the Assistant Engineer class. If necessary, appointment as Assistant Engineer may be on probation for one year as in the Imperial Service, in certain cases.

(2) The Rates of Pay and Allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present Rates of Pay and Allowances are satisfactory.—A statement is attached showing the pay and allowances in force during the years stated. Although there are separate rates of pay for the Imperial and Provincial Services, all officers are borne on one combined list, receiving their increments annually and rising from the Assistant to the Executive class in the same period, *viz.*, in the 11th year of service. The Local Government do not consider that any alteration is required in the existing rules for either service in the classes of Assistant and Executive Engineer, but they think that the incremental system of pay might be extended to the class of Superintending Engineer, now that Superintending Engineers are borne on separate scales for each province. The numbers on each scale being necessarily small, the separation results in a most unequal system of promotion, taking the class as a whole. A suitable incremental scale, retaining the present minimum and maximum, would perhaps be Rs. 1,500 rising to Rs. 2,000 by annual increments of Rs. 100.

APPENDIX IX—*continued.*

Grades.	Pay.				
	1890.	1900.		1913.	
	Imperial and Provincial.	Imperial.	Provincial.	Imperial.	Provincial.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Assistant Engineer, III	250	350	250	380 rising	250 rising
Ditto II	350—400	450	350	to 750 in	to 475 in
Ditto I	500	550	400	10th year.	10th year.
Executive Engineer, IV	600	— (*b*)	—	800 in 11th (*e*)	535 in 11th (*f*)
Ditto III	700	700	475	year rising	year rising
Ditto II	800	850	550	to 1,250 in	to 850 in
Ditto I	950	1,000	(*a*) 650	20th year.	20th year.
Superintending Engineer, III	1,100	1,250 (*c*)	750	1,500	1,200
Ditto II	1,350	1,400	900	1,750	1,400 (*e*)
Ditto I	1,600	1,600	1,050	2,000 (*d*)	1,600
Chief Engineer, III	1,800	1,800	1,800	—	—
Ditto II	2,000	2,000	2,000	2,500	2,500 (*d*)
Ditto I	2,500	2,500	2,500	2,750	2,750

(*a*) Introduced in 1892. (*b*) Introduced in 1893. (*c*) Introduced in 1899. (*d*) Introduced in 1905.* (*e*) Introduced in 1908. (*f*) Introduced in 1912.

* In this year, a local allowance of Rs. 250 per month was attached to the post of Secretary to a Local Government and Rs. 150 to that of Secretary to a minor administration in addition to the grade pay of the post on the Engineer Establishment.

(3) The number of Posts in each Grade and the provision, if any, made in the Cadre for Leave and Training.—A statement is attached, showing the scale which has been submitted to the Government of India for sanction and the actual number of officers employed against it. The scale is the same as that already provisionally approved by the Government of India with an addition of eight officers (equivalent to 20 *per cent.*) as a reserve to provide for absentees on leave. No separate provision is made for officers under training. The preliminary training on works considered necessary is acquired before recruits join the Department as Assistant Engineers. For Departmental training, it is the practice to post Assistant Engineers on first appointment at the headquarters of a division so as to give them an opportunity of acquiring a knowledge of the general routine of duty and the system of accounts, and of studying the vernacular.

Name of appointments.	Number in each grade.	
	As existing.	As submitted to India for sanction.
Chief Engineer	2	2
Superintending Engineers	5(*a*)	5
Executive Engineers	16	17
Assistant Engineers	24(*b*)	15
Provision of Executive and Assistant Engineers for leave.	—	8
Total	47	47

(*a*) Three officiating.
(*b*) Includes Mr. T. S. Malik and Lieutenant Robson, R.E., who are at the disposal of the Chief Commissioner, Delhi.

(4) What Appointments outside the authorised Cadre are held temporarily or otherwise by Officers of the various Services.—The following are the only Officers who are employed outside the cadre:—

One Government Architect.—This is a special appointment, sanctioned by the Secretary of State, carrying a salary of Rs. 800 rising to Rs. 1,000 in five years. The officer holding the appointment is serving under a special agreement and was selected in England by the Secretary of State. Application has recently been made to the Government of India for two Assistant Government Architects to be recruited in the same manner. These additional officers will be required in connection with the Capital works at Bankipore and a number of other works of magnitude either started or in contemplation.

One Sanitary Engineer.—This is also a special appointment sanctioned by the Secretary of State. The present incumbent was appointed in India on a special agreement which provides for a salary of Rs. 1,200 rising to Rs. 1,400 in five years. It is probable that the development of the Sanitary works of the province will necessitate the employment of one or two Assistant Sanitary Engineers.

Three temporary Engineers.—These officers are appointed in India under the ordinary rules applicable to temporary staff (Public Works Department Code, Vol. I, 109–111). The sanction to their appointment is renewed from year to year as occasion requires. One is serving on Rs. 500, one on Rs. 300 and the other on Rs. 250.

(5) Whether any addition is required to the present Cadre.—The present cadre is considered sufficient for the normal requirements of the province. Additional officers will, however, be required during the period the works connected with the new Capital at Bankipore are in progress. It is possible, when the Capital works develop, that it will be necessary to form an additional Circle of Superintendence under a Superintending Engineer who can devote his whole time to the work. The additional temporary staff that will be required can be obtained locally and appointed under the ordinary rules for the employment of temporary staff.

APPENDIX X.

Memorandum prepared by the Assam Administration relating to the Public Works Department.

(1) The present Regulations as to Recruitment, Training, and Probation, and whether these Regulations are considered satisfactory.—The Permanent Establishment of the Public Works Department is recruited from the following sources:—

(*a*) Officers of the Royal Engineers.

(*b*) Civil Engineers—British subjects trained in England.

(*c*) Students of the Indian Engineering College and the Subordinate service.

(*a*) and (*b*) form the Imperial Engineer Establishment.

(*a*) are appointed direct by the Secretary of State.

(*b*) are appointed by the Secretary of State with the advice of a Selection Committee which includes at least one eminent representative of the Engineering profession.

APPENDIX X—*continued.*

The number to be recruited in each year is notified previous to inviting applications.

The appointments are generally made permanent from the date of landing in India in the case of candidates who have had previous practical training.

In the event of any candidate being selected who has not, in the opinion of the Selection Committee, had sufficient practical experience, he is required to undergo, on arrival in India, a year's probation in charge of works, and his final appointment is dependent upon the result of such probation.

(*c*) form the Provincial Engineering Establishment.

The number of the appointments from the Indian Engineering Colleges is fixed by the Government of India and the appointments of subordinates are made by the Government of India on the recommendation of a Local Government or Local Administration.

The Staff of Engineers for Assam is posted by the Government of India according to the requirements of the province from among those recruited from the above sources.

The present system of recruiting Engineers as judged by its results is satisfactory, but for the existing Provincial Training Colleges from which Provincial Service officers are recruited, a thoroughly equipped central residential training college might with advantage be substituted.

(2) The Rates of Pay and Allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present Rates of Pay and Allowances are satisfactory.—The following comparative table gives the rate of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time. The present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

—	1890.	1900.		—	At present.	
	Imperial.	Imperial.	*Provincial.		Imperial.	*Provincial.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.		Rs.	Rs.
Chief Engineer, 1st class ..	2,500	2,500	2,500	Chief Engineer, 1st class	2,750	2,750
Ditto, 2nd „ ...	2,000	2,000	2,000	Ditto, 2nd „	2,500	2,500
Ditto, 3rd „ ...	1,800	1,800	1,800	Superintending Engineer, 1st class ...	2,000	1,600
Superintending Engineer, 1st class ...	1,600	1,600	1,050	Ditto, 2nd „ ...	1,750	1,400
Ditto, 2nd „ ...	1,350	1,400	900	Ditto, 3rd „ ...	1,500	1,200
Ditto, 3rd „ ...	1,100	1,250	750	Executive Engineer, 20th year of service and following years.	1,250	850
Executive Engineer, 1st grade	950	1,000	650	Executive Engineer, 19th year of service	1,200	815
Ditto, 2nd „	800	850	550	Ditto, 18th ditto	1,150	780
Ditto, 3rd „	700	700	475	Ditto, 17th ditto	1,100	754
Ditto, 4th „	600	—	—	Ditto, 16th ditto	1,050	107
Assistant Engineer, 1st grade	500	550	400	Ditto, 15th ditto	1,000	675
Ditto, 2nd „	350 rising to Rs. 400 after 3 years' service.	450	350	Ditto, 14th ditto	950	640
				Ditto, 13th ditto	909	605
				Ditto, 12th ditto	850	570
				Ditto, 11th ditto	800	535
				Assistant Engineer, 10th ditto	750	475
				Ditto, 9th ditto	700	450
Ditto, 3rd „	250	350	250	Ditto, 8th ditto	660	425
				Ditto, 7th ditto	620	400
				Ditto, 6th ditto	580	375
				Ditto, 5th ditto	540	350
				Ditto, 4th ditto	500	325
				Ditto, 3rd ditto	460	300
				Ditto, 2nd ditto	420	275
				Ditto, 1st ditto	380	250

* NOTE.—A special increment of Rs. 50 may be granted by the Local Government to a deserving Provincial Service Executive Engineer who, after completion of five years' service on the maximum pay of Rs. 850, is not promoted to administrative rank.

Executive Officers serving in Assam, except in the districts of Cachar, Sylhet and Goalpara, draw the following local allowances:—

	Rs. per mensem.
Assistant Engineers and Executive Engineers (Imperial Service) ...	100
Assistant Engineers and Executive Engineers (Provincial Service) ...	65

Subject to the provision that pay and local allowance shall not exceed Rs. 1,000 and Rs. 615, respectively.

The Chief Engineer and Secretary to the Local Administration draws a local allowance of Rs. 150 per mensem and the Under-Secretary to the Local Administration draws a local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem.

(3) The number of Posts in each Grade and the provision, if any, made in the Cadre for Leave and Training.—The number of posts which the Government of India has recommended to the Secretary of State for Assam is 21, comprising 1 Chief Engineer, 1 Superintending Engineer, 10 Executive Engineers, and 9 Assistant Engineers. In this number provision has been made for leave and training.

(4) What Appointments outside the authorised Cadre are held temporarily or otherwise by Officers of the various Services.—The following temporary appointments outside the authorised cadre are held by Temporary Engineers:—One post of Executive Engineer on Rs. 750 with a local allowance of Rs. 100, and two posts of Assistant Engineers on Rs. 250 each with a local allowance of Rs. 65 each.

(5) Whether any addition is required to the present Cadre.—One more Executive Engineer for dealing with sanitary projects is required in addition to the proposed cadre, and this is now under consideration by the Government of India.

APPENDIX XI.

APPENDIX XI.

Note, dated 21st April, 1913, by the Honourable Sir Archdale Earle, K.C.I.E., Chief Commissioner of Assam, on the Public Works Department.

THE IMPERIAL SERVICE.

Recruitment.—The principles which I have advocated in connection with other services are (1) that Indians required to fill important posts should, for the most part, be recruited direct to the superior service along, and on equal terms, with their European *confrères*, and (2) that while the door should be left open for the promotion of exceptional locally-recruited officers, too great reliance should not be placed on this method of recruitment to the superior service. The Public Works Department is peculiarly constituted in that, though it admits of the direct recruitment of 10 per cent. of Indians to the Imperial Service, it also recruits locally for superior posts, but on a lower rate of pay. It shows the latter, locally-recruited (provincial service), officers on the same list as the officers recruited by the Secretary of State, an arrangement which I cordially approve. The Department is peculiar also in that it has a Subordinate Service, which does not quite correspond with other Subordinate Services, inasmuch as the salaries of the higher posts correspond rather with those of members of the provincial services than with those of members of the subordinate services of other departments.

2. Inasmuch as these arrangements were sanctioned quite recently (1912), they may perhaps be left alone for a time. Personally, however, I should much prefer to see all officers required for superior posts recruited on precisely similar terms, it being a condition that officers recruited locally should undergo such a training as would bring them up to the standard of those recruited in England. At present the locally-recruited officer is supposed to be on a par professionally with his *confrère* of the superior service, but I gather that, in fact, he is not. If he were what he is supposed to be, I consider that he should get the same pay. In any case, it seems to me highly anomalous that an officer of such outstanding merit as to be specially selected for an important post like that of Superintending Engineer should, if locally recruited, get less pay than officers recruited direct.

3. *Recruitment of Indians to the Imperial Service.*—The only other remark which I have to make as regards recruitment is that Indians recruited direct should, as far as possible, be residents of the province to which they are posted. As I have stated in connection with the Indian Civil Service, it is for many reasons, administrative, personal and political, desirable that officers should usually be posted to their own province.

4. *Training.*—If, as I have proposed in connection with the Indian Civil Service, a special training institution is established in England for recruits to that service, I trust that the question of providing a training in the same institution for engineers destined to serve in India may be borne in mind. Apart from the great advantage that would accrue from association between European and Indian officers and with recruits for other services in India, the candidates selected for the Public Works Department would be trained specially for work in India, and I consider that such a training would have a very decided advantage over the present system, the general trend of which is towards English practice and results in new recruits being at sea for some time after their arrival in India. Special training in the direction of Indian needs would result in economy.

The training which I advocate above is in respect of recruits selected on their qualifications as at present, the object of the training proposed being directed solely towards Indian needs. This training need not exceed one year. If, in addition, any training in India is considered necessary, this should not be at the expense of the training in England, which I consider most desirable in the general interests of European and Indian officers.

5. *Pensions.*—Imperial Service officers have, I understand, submitted memorials on the subject of their pensions and leave allowances, but I am not in a position to say anything in regard to this matter, as I have not seen the memorials.

THE UPPER SUBORDINATE SERVICE.

1. As noted above, this service corresponds roughly with the Provincial services of other departments. The pay of the service is as shown in the footnote.*

Since these rates were fixed in 1864, not only has the training become more rigorous, but the duties have increased in importance and the responsibilities have become much greater, while the cost of living has advanced very considerably. I would therefore introduce the following combination of grades and time-scale. The lowest grade would be on Rs. 100—$\frac{20}{2}$—200, the second grade on Rs. 200—$\frac{30}{2}$—350, and the highest grade on Rs. 350—$\frac{40}{2}$—550. Following the proportions laid down in rule 62 of the Public Works Department Code, Volume I., three-sixteenths of the total cadre would be in the first grade, five-sixteenths in the second grade, and the remainder in the lowest grade. The usual allowances for holding charge of a sub-division should continue.

2. Experience, however, shows that a considerable percentage of Upper Subordinates prove worthless after a few years, and that others from physical and other causes deteriorate hopelessly at a later stage, and I would, therefore, with the improvements proposed, empower Local Governments to dispense with the services of such men at any period during the first 10 years of their service with a month's pay for each year of completed service, and to retire them compulsorily at a later period on a pension equivalent to that which they would receive if retired on a medical certificate of ill-health.

3. All increments should be subject to stoppage for repeated bad work, and promotions to the Rs. 350—550 grade should be by selection. Officers not promoted to the Rs. 350—550 grade should be eligible for two special quinquennial increments of Rs. 25 for approved service.

4. Upper Subordinates have recently voiced a grievance with regard to their designations, and have asked that their service shall be known as the "Deputy Engineer Establishment," and that they shall be called Deputy Engineers and Assistant Deputy Engineers. I am unable to recommend these requests, as the designations proposed, besides being quite inappropriate in the case of officers performing the functions of an Overseer, would cause confusion by adding to the already long list of names, such as Chief, Superintending, Executive, Assistant and District Engineers. The term Supervisor might, however, be abolished, and the proposed grade of Rs. 100—$\frac{20}{2}$—200 be termed the "Overseer grade," and the two higher grades the "Sub-Engineer grades," while the service might appropriately be designated the "Sub-Engineer and Overseer Establishment."

THE LOWER SUBORDINATE SERVICE.

The standard of education for admission to the colleges is much the same as for Upper Subordinates, but the period of training—theoretical and practical—only lasts two years. The training is of a considerably higher standard than was the case when the present rates of pay were fixed. The service is divided into three grades on Rs. 30—$\frac{5}{5}$—35, Rs. 35—$\frac{5}{5}$—45, Rs. 50—$\frac{10}{5}$—70. Two further special increments of Rs. 10 can be given to officers of approved service in the first grade. These rates are palpably inadequate to secure either honesty or contentment.

* Overseer III ... ... Rs. 60
" II 80
" I 100
Supervisor II 150
" I 200
Sub-Engineer III 250
" II 300
" I 400
with increments of Rs. 50 after 5 and 15 years' approved service in grade I.

al I would raise the pay of the grades to Rs. 45, k. 60, and Rs. 75. Officers rendering approved ser-ce would be eligible for two quinquennial increments of Rs. 5 in each of the two lower grades, and for four quinquennial increments of Rs. 10 in the highest grade. Government should reserve the right of dispensing with the services of inefficient officers on terms similar to those proposed above in the case of the Upper Subordinate Service.

GENERAL.

Obliteration of unnecessary distinctions in nomenclature.—As in the case of the Indian Civil Service, I advocate that there should be a single Public Works Department list, showing by Divisions (1) the officers of the at present so-called Imperial Service, (2) the at present so-called Upper Subordinate Service officers, and (3) the at present so-called Lower Subordinate Service officers.

APPENDIX XII.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Burma relating to the Public Works Department.

(1) The present Regulations as to Recruitment, Training, and Probation, and whether these are considered satisfactory.

RECRUITMENT.

Imperial Engineer Officers.

(*a*) From Royal Engineers.—No appointments made since 1890. No Royal Engineer Officers at present in Burma.

(*b*) From Officers appointed by the Secretary of State from the Royal Indian Engineering College, Cooper's Hill.—Recruitment from this source ceased in 1906.

(*c*) From Officers appointed by the Secretary of State after nomination by the Selection Committee of the India Office.—The first appointments of Assistant Engineers from this source were made in 1902.

(*d*) Officers appointed direct by the Secretary of State.

(*e*) Officers appointed in India who were not admitted into the Department as Statutory Natives of India.

(*f*) Officers appointed in India in and after 1886 who were admitted into the Department as Statutory Natives of India.

European Officers, whether of Indian domicile or not, appointed from Indian Colleges prior to 1885-86, form class (*e*), while officers appointed in 1885-86 and after belong to class (*f*).

In Burma four officers come under this latter class.

Provincial Service Engineer Establishment.

(*a*) From Students of Indian Colleges (Statutory Natives of India).

(*b*) From Upper Subordinates of the Public Works Department.

Upper Subordinates.

(*a*) From the Thomason Civil Engineering College, Rurki. Up to 1895 this was the principal source of recruitment. Now one appointment is made in every alternate year.

(*b*) Rangoon (Insein) School of Engineering.—Opened in 1895. One guaranteed appointment yearly as Overseer, 3rd grade.

(*c*) From the Lower Subordinate Staff.—One appointment yearly. Vacancies remaining after the guaranteed appointments have been made may be filled by the Local Government from any source desired.

Lower Subordinates.

(*a*) From the Thomason Civil Engineering College, Rurki.—Principal source of recruitment till 1895.

(*b*) Rangoon (Insein) School of Engineering.—Five guaranteed appointments yearly since 1895. One Sub-Overseer has risen to the Provincial Engineer Establishment.

(2) *Imperial.*—During the existence of the Royal Indian Engineering College, Cooper's Hill, the number of appointments reserved for Natives of India was limited to two each year. Since 1886-87 only one Indian from this Institution has been appointed to the Public Works Department in Burma. No Natives of India were appointed during the previous 10 years.

After the abolition of Cooper's Hill in 1906 it was ruled that Natives of India who are British subjects are eligible to the extent of 10 per cent. of the total annual number of Assistant Engineer appointments. So far from 25 to 30 Assistant Engineer appointments have been made annually, but, despite the increase in favour of the Natives of India, no Native of India or Burman has been appointed to this Province in the Imperial Branch of the Department.

Provincial.—Is open to Statutory Natives of India and is recruited mainly from the Indian Colleges. Between 1892 and 1912 the percentage of Indians in Burma has been—Burmans 3·45, Natives of India 13·8, total 16·53. Numerically this comes to 1 Burman and 4 Natives of India, total 5; two were promoted from the Upper Subordinate Class and three recruited from Indian Colleges.

Upper Subordinates.—The percentage of Indians recruited since 1886 has been—Burmans 25, Natives of India 42·65, total 67·65.

During the previous 10 years the percentages were—Burmans 3·9, Natives of India 29·4, total 33·3.

Lower Subordinates.—Almost entirely composed of Indians.

(3) *Imperial Service.*—Present regulations are satisfactory, but it is considered necessary that each recruit should have an Honours Degree or Diploma of some recognised Engineering College and be nominated by the Principal of the College, who should submit to the Selection Committee a confidential report on the general character and special qualifications of each candidate nominated by him.

Special attention should be given to the general character and social qualifications of the candidates in order to maintain the high standard of the Department.

At least one-third of the members of the Selection Committee should be senior officers of the Public Works Department either still on the active list or only recently retired.

The number of Natives of India admitted to the Imperial Service should be limited and it is suggested that this be fixed at 10 per cent.

Provincial Service.—If the Provincial Service is to remain as at present constituted the method of recruitment is considered satisfactory, but exception may be taken to the existing system of appointing two apprentices from the Rurki College to a province where only one obtains an appointment. It is often not possible to place the two apprentices under the same officer for the period of probation and consequently it is very difficult to judge between the respective merits of the two apprentices. This system, it is considered, should be abolished and only those students who have gained the guaranteed appointments should be sent out as apprentices.

TRAINING AND PROBATION.

(a) *Imperial Service.*—It is understood that candidates to be eligible for promotion are required to have undergone a year's training on works after passing through their College course, but as the conditions of work in England and India are so very different this training is not of much practical use and should not be insisted on, but, whenever possible, the selected candidates should have a year's training on works

APPENDIX XII—*continued.*

in India in order to pick up the methods of work and accounts, as well as the Vernacular.

It is not considered advisable to introduce a period of probation after appointment owing to the practical difficuly of making such a safeguard an effective one, while its introduction might have an adverse effect on recruitment. In lieu of the period of probation it would be better to have the Professional Examination (Public Works Department Code, Vol. I, para. 167) made more difficult and of a real practical character which should be passed within three years of joining. Any failure to pass within this period to lead to stoppage of increment, permanent supersession, and possibly forfeiture of appointment.

(b) *Provincial Service.*—All recruits have to undergo a year's training on probation which is considered suitable and on appointment to Assistant Engineer are subject to the same rules as the Imperial Service with regard to passing the Professional and Vernacular examinations.

(2) Rates of Pay and Allowances in force in 1890, 1900, and at the present time, and whether the present Rates of Pay and Allowances are satisfactory.

Note.—Figures in *italics* indicate changes made.

1. Imperial Engineer Officers.							2. Provincial Service Engineer Establishment.				
Rank.	1886-87.	1893.	1900.	1905.	8th March 1908.	May 1912.	Rank.	July 1892.	1893.	8th March 1908.	Present.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.			Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Chief Engineer:							Chief Engineer:				
1st class ...	2,500	2,500	2,500	(b)*2,750*	2,750		1st class ...	2,500	2,500	2,750	2,750
2nd class ...	2,000	2,000	2,000	*2,500*	2,500		2nd class ...	2,000	2,000	2,500	2,500
3rd class ...	1,800	1,800	1,800	Abolished	—		3rd class ...	(c)1,800	(c)1,800	—	—
Superintending Engineer:							Superintending Engineer:				
1st class ...	1,600	1,600	1,600	*2,000*	2,000		1st class ..	1,050	1,050	*1,600*	1,600
2nd class ...	1,350	1,350	*1,400*	*1,750*	1,750		2nd class ...	900	900	*1,400*	1,400
3rd class ...	1,100	1,100	*1,250*	*1,500*	1,500		3rd class ...	750	750	*1,200*	1,200
Executive Engineer:							Executive Engineer:				
1st grade ...	950	(a)1,000	(a)1,000	(a)1,000	—		1st grade ...	650	650	—	—
2nd grade...	800	*850*	850	850	—		2nd grade...	550	550	—	—
3rd grade ...	700	700	700	700	—		3rd grade ...	475	475	—	—
4th grade ...	600	—	—	—	—		4th grade ..	400	—	—	—
Assistant Engineer:							Assistant Engineer:				
1st grade ...	500	*550*	550	550	—		1st grade ...	350	*400*	—	—
2nd grade...	350 rising after 3 years' approved service, to 400	*400*	450	450	—		2nd grade...	250	*350*	—	—
							3rd grade ...	—	*250*	—	—
							Engineer Student.	100	100	100	100
							Assistant Engineer:			Max. Pay.	
3rd grade ..	250	*350*	350	850	—		1st year ...	—	—	*250*	250
Apprentice Engineer.	100	100	100	100	100		2nd year ...	—	—	*250*	*275*
Assistant Engineer:					Max. Pay.		3rd year ...	—	—	*300*	300
1st year ...	—	—	—	—	*380*		4th year ...	—	—	*300*	*325*
2nd year ...	—	—	—	—	*420*		5th year ...	—	—	*350*	350
3rd year ...	—	—	—	—	*460*		6th year ...	—	—	*350*	*375*
4th year ...	—	—	—	—	*500*		7th year ...	—	—	*400*	400
5th year ...	—	—	—	—	*540*		8th year ...	—	—	*400*	*425*
6th year ..	—	—	—	—	*580*		9th year ...	—	—	*450*	450
7th year ...	—	—	—	—	*620*		10th year...	—	—	*450*	*475*
8th year ...	—	—	—	—	*660*		11th year...	—	—	*500*	—
Executive Engineer:							12th year...	—	—	*500*	—
9th year ...	—	—	—	—	*700*		13th year...	—	—	*550*	—
10th year...	—	—	—	—	*750*		14th year...	—	—	*550*	—
11th year...	—	—	—	—	*800*	Future entrants not to attain Executive Engineer rank till their 11th year of service.	15th year...	—	—	*550*	—
12th year...	—	—	—	—	*850*		Executive Engineer:				
13th year...	—	—	—	—	*900*		16th year...	—	—	*650*	—
14th year...	—	—	—	—	*950*		17th year...	—	—	*650*	—
15th year...	—	—	—	—	*1,050*		18th year...	—	—	*700*	—
16th year...	—	—	—	—	*1,050*		19th year...	—	—	*700*	—
17th year...	—	—	—	—	*1,100*		20th year ..	—	—	*750*	—
18th year...	—	—	—	—	*1,150*		21st year...	—	—	*750*	—
19th year...	—	—	—	—	*1,200*		22nd year...	—	—	*800*	—
20th year...	—	—	—	—	*1,250*		23rd year...	—	—	*800*	—
					Note.— The 2 periodical increments of Rs. 50 per mensem [see footnote (a)] were withdrawn.		24th year...	—	—	*850*	—
							25th year...	—	—	*850*	—
							26th year...	—	—	*900*	—
							11th year...	—	—	—	*535*
							12th year...	—	—	—	*570*
							13th year...	—	—	—	*605*
							14th year...	—	—	—	*640*
							15th year...	—	—	—	*675*
							16th year...	—	—	—	*710*
							17th year...	—	—	—	*745*
							18th year...	—	—	—	*780*
							19th year.	—	—	—	*815*
							20th year...	—	—	—	(d)*850*

(a) Two periodical increments of Rs. 50 per mensem were allowed at the end of 4 and 8 years, respectively, for approved service.
(b) A local allowance of Rs. 250 per mensem was attached to the post of Secretary or Joint Secretary.
(c) Abolished in 1905.
(d) A special increment of Rs. 50 per mensem may be granted by the Local Government to a deserving Executive Engineer who, after completion of 5 years' service on the maximum pay of Rs. 850, is not promoted to Administrative rank.

APPENDIX XII—*continued.*

3. Upper Subordinates.

Civilians.		Military.
Rank.	Consolidated Salary.	
	Rs.	Military Subordinates were allowed Staff salaries of their grade in addition to the pay and allowance of their Military rank, but it was stipulated that when the Military pay and allowances of a European Military Subordinate, together with his Staff salary, were exceeded by the Civil consolidated pay of the grade he held his staff pay was to be increased by so much as would make his total pay equal to the Civil pay of his grade. The effect of this rule was to place European Members of the Upper Subordinate Staff on consolidated rates of pay. Recently, however, it was ruled that soldiers entering the Public Works Department after the 14th July 1910, were to draw the Civil rate of pay of the grade to which they may be appointed, ordinarily that of Overseer, 1st grade. Soldiers who were undergoing a theoretical course in a Civil Engineering College on the 14th July 1910, would, in the event of their passing their final examination, be permitted to enter the Public Works Department under the rules in force at the time they joined the College.
Sub-Engineer:		
1st grade ...	400 (*a*)	
2nd grade ...	300	
3rd grade ...	250	
Supervisor:		
1st grade ...	200	
2nd grade ...	150	
Overseer:		
1st grade ...	100	
2nd grade ...	80	
3rd grade ...	60	

(*a*) Allowed 2 increments of Rs. 50 per mensum each for long and meritorious service, the 1st after 5 years and the 2nd after 10 years in the grade.

Remarks.—In order to improve the social status of Civil Upper Subordinates the Government of India have permitted Local Governments to confer on Sub-Engineers the Honorary rank of Assistant Engineer. Limited to 6 per cent. of the total Civil Staff of Upper Subordinates in each list, with the addition of 1 for any fraction.

All Civil Sub-Engineers are classed as gazetted officers.

4. Lower Subordinates

Rank.	Minimum.	Maximum.
Sub-Overseer:	Rs	Rs.
1st grade	50	70
2nd grade	35	45
3rd grade	30	35

Remarks.—Lower Subordinates may be permanently appointed or promoted at any time to any rate of pay that may be deemed appropriate so long as the maxima and mimima limits are observed.

Imperial Service.—The present incremental scale of salaries is considered sufficient to attract the kind of officer required and has its advantages over the old system of graded salaries, but has one great disadvantage in that it is laid down that an officer may not draw more than Rs. 800 per month unless he is in charge of a division or in a charge which is considered as of equal importance. This is unjust to an officer who, though fully qualified, does not obtain a division because there happened to be none vacant. It is considered this rule should be amended and an officer who has been recommended as capable of holding charge of a division should draw his increments irrespective of his being in divisional charge.

After the 20th year of service an Executive Engineer draws Rs. 1,250 per month and increments cease. It is suggested that if, on completing 23 years' service, an Executive Engineer is not promoted, though fully qualified, to Superintending Engineer he should be given a personal allowance of Rs. 150 a month and draw the same until promoted to administrative rank. It also appears unnecessary to have two grades of Chief Engineers and it hardly seems fair that a Chief Engineer who is Secretary to a Local Government should draw Rs. 250 a month extra while one who is Secretary to a Local Administration should only draw Rs. 150. The work of Chief Engineers is the same and it is an anomaly that a Chief Engineer in one province should draw more than a man, probably his senior, in another province differently constituted. It is considered that it would be better to have only one class of Chief Engineer on a fixed salary of Rs. 3,000. There were three grades, but these have been reduced to two and may well be reduced to one. Under existing rules Burma allowance of Rs. 100 is not allowed to Executive Engineers drawing a salary of over Rs. 1,000 a month, whereas in the Forest Department all Deputy Conservators draw an allowance of Rs. 100 respective of the amount of their salary, and it is considered the same procedure should apply to the Public Works Department, *i.e.*, all Executive Engineers drawing salaries of Rs. 1,050 to Rs. 1,250 should be granted a Burma allowance of Rs. 100.

Provincial Service.—The Service as now recruited is practically confined to Natives of India and promoted Upper Subordinates, and consequently the present rate of pay is considered ample, but so long as the present College-trained European and Eurasian element, recruited in the past, remains in the Service there is sure to be discontent, and it is considered that this discontent can be removed by promotion of selected officers to the Imperial Service. Also that when an officer is promoted to the administrative grade he should draw the same salary as an Imperial Service Officer, *viz.*, Rs. 1,500, Rs. 1,750 and Rs. 2,000 instead of Rs. 1,200, Rs. 1,400 and Rs. 1,600 in the 3rd, 2nd and 1st Classes of Superintending Engineers.

APPENDIX XII—*continued.*

(3) Number of Posts in each Grade, and provision, if any, made in the Cadre for Leave and Training.

Particulars.	1887.	26th June 1888.	September 1889.	November 1890.	1891.	1st April 1894.	1894 (later)	July 1897.	December 1898.	November 1899.	29th March 1904.	February 1905.	January 1906.	1911.	Present sanctioned Cadre.	Remarks.
Chief Engineer and Secretary.	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	2	2	1 1	Chief Engineer and Secretary. Chief Engineer and Joint Secretary.
Superintending Engineers.	1	3	(*d*)3	3	4	(*f*) 5	5	5	5	5	5	7	7	7	7	Includes the Sanitary Engineer.
Superintendents of Works.	1	...	(*d*)1	1	..	...	...	...	...	...	..	...	...	...	...	
Executive Engineers.	37	52	58	61	82	82	30	26	26	52	52	61	62	62	42	Includes 1 for the Andamans.
Assistant Engineers.							30	25	25						41	
Absentees ...	...	...	...	...	...	...	12	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	...	
Temporary Staff	...	...	...	...	...	...	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	...	
Upper Subordinates.	78	78	78	78	92	(*g*)96	96	96	(*i*) 78	78	(*j*)96	96	97	(*m*)118	97 21	Includes 1 for the Andamans. Supernumeraries.
Lower Subordinates.	(*a*)	(*a*)	(*a*)	(*a*)	(*a*)	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	
Grand Total ...	(*b*)118	(*c*) 134	141	144	(*e*) 179	184	(*h*)184	174	156	157	175	(*k*) 187	(*l*)189	210	210	Exclusive of special officers.*

(*a*) This Establishment is regulated by a money limit. The fluctuations since 1887 are shown below:—

—	1887.	1889.	1898–99.	1904.	1905.	1909.	1910.	Present limit.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Permanent Lower Subordinates	45,000	50,000	80,000	90,000	1,05,000	1,05,000	1,05,000	1,05,000
Temporary Lower Subordinates	34,000	34,000	34,000	10,000	45,000	95,000	1,05,000	1,05,000

(*b*) Prior to April 1887, Public Works in Upper Burma were carried out by Royal Engineer Officers attached to the Field Force, assisted by certain Officers and Subordinates of the Provincial Establishment from Lower Burma.

(*c*) With the abolition of the Field Force on the 1st April 1887, Upper Burma was constituted a separate Public Works charge under a Superintending Engineer and Secretary, with headquarters at Mandalay. This arrangement continued till Upper and Lower Burma were amalgamated on the 26th June 1888, and the combined charge placed under the control of one Chief Engineer and Secretary, with headquarters at Rangoon.

(*d*) Three Circles of Superintendence were found to be insufficient to control the large and scattered operations of the Province; a fourth Circle was therefore added and the Cadre revised.

(*e*) Cadre again increased consequent on the extension of Public Works operations and to a number of Engineer Officers being employed in the preparation of irrigation projects.

(*f*) Irrigation Circle formed.

(*g*) Increased in consequence of Military Works in Mandalay and Rangoon having been taken over by the Public Works Department.

(*h*) Re-adjusted by the Government of India when revising the Cadres of the several Lists of the Engineer Establishment for submission to the Secretary of State.

(*i*) Reduced to compensate for an increase in the number and cost of the Lower Subordinate Establishment, as men of the latter class were much needed.

(*j*) Owing to the large increase in the grant for Public Works, the figure was revised again.

(*k*) Consequent on the appointment of a Second Chief Engineer for the Province, the raising of the appointment of the Sanitary Engineer to a Superintending Engineership and the establishment of the Toungoo Circle of Superintendence the Cadre was increased as shown.

(*l*) Increased by one Engineer and one Upper Subordinate to provide an Officer and an Upper Subordinate for the Andamans.

(*m*) Increase in Upper Subordinates due to the Public Works Department taking over District and District Cess Fund Works.

* SPECIAL OFFICERS.

1. *Assistant Secretary.*—In 1903 sanction was obtained to the temporary appointment of a non-professional Assistant Secretary in the Public Works Department on Rs. 550. Subsequently made permanent, on Rs. 550—40—750, with effect from the 1st January 1904.

2. *Consulting Architect.*—In 1905 sanction was obtained to a special appointment of Superintending Engineer Architect for a period of 3 years, with effect from the 18th October, 1905, in order to expedite the architectural work of the Province. Subsequently extended to the 5th February 1909. In 1911 the appointment of a Consulting Architect to the Government of Burma, a non-pensionable appointment, was sanctioned to replace that of the Superintending Engineer Architect. The pay of this appointment is Rs. 800—50—1,000.

3. *Electrical Inspector.*—In 1905 sanction was also obtained to the appointment of an Electrical Inspector, on Rs. 600 per mensem, for a period of 3 years. This appointment has since been made permanent, non-pensionable on Rs. 600—40—1,000 with a local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem.

It is considered that the proportion of Assistant Engineers to Executive Engineers should be increased so as to allow each division an Assistant Engineer and the more important divisions two or more Assistants. In Bengal, United Provinces, Bihar and Orissa, Assam and Central Provinces the average excess of Assistant over Executive Engineers is nearly 21 per cent. and if 20 per cent. was allowed for Burma it would not be excessive.

Provision for Leave.—At present fifteen absentees are allowed out of ninety-two officers on the cadre, *i.e.*, a percentage of sixteen nearly. This allowance is considered sufficient.

Provision for Training.—No provision is made. Engineer students of the Provincial Service undergoing a year's practical training do not reckon against the sanctioned cadre until promoted to Assistant Engineer. No provision is considered necessary unless the recruits to the Imperial Service are put on to a year's course of practical training after arrival in India.

(4) What Appointments outside the authorised Cadre are held temporarily or otherwise by Officers of the various Services.

Two such appointments are held at present, *viz.*, Mr. C. G. Barnett, Executive Engineer, at Delhi; and Mr. A. P. Morris, Assistant Engineer, as Headmaster, Government School of Engineering, Insein. Mr. C. J. Homer, Sub-Engineer, has been offered the post of

Assistant Engineer in the Provincial Service and if he accepts, his name will have to be included as he is on deputation under the Government of Bombay.

(5) Whether any addition is required to the present Cadre.

The present cadre is undoubtedly not sufficient for the duties to be carried out by the Department. The present numbers are not sufficient for privilege leave vacancies with the consequence that leave has frequently to be refused owing to there being no relieving officer available. Sanitary work is increasing very largely and special assistants are necessary. A division with one Executive Engineer and two Assistant Engineers is shortly to be formed for work on the frontier north of Myitkyina, and another division will probably have to be formed out of the present Mandalay and Meiktila Divisions where work has increased and present charges are reported to be very heavy.

The present cadre of Executive Engineers should therefore be increased by two, making it 44, and allowing 20 per cent. excess. For Assistant Engineers the cadre should be revised and increased to:—

Chief Engineers ...	...	...	2
Superintending Engineers		...	7
Executive Engineers	...	...	44
Assistant Engineers	...	...	53 (44+9).
		Total ...	106

instead of 92 as at present, *i.e.*, an increase of 14.

APPENDIX XIII.

[Referred to in paragraphs 71,493 (Mr. Rose's evidence); 72,160 (Mr. Dorman's evidence); 72,252 (Mr. Howley's evidence); and 72,588 (Mr. Harrison's evidence).]

Memorials submitted by Engineers of the Public Works Department to the Viceroy and to the Secretary of State for India.

Purport of Memorials submitted by Engineers of the Public Works Department in 1907-08.

To His Excellency the Right Honourable THE EARL OF MINTO, P.C., G.M.S.I., G.C.M.G., G.C.I.E., Viceroy and Governor-General of India.

The humble Petition of A.B. . . Engineer, Public Works Department, India.

Showeth,

1*stly*.—That in consequence of the fall in the purchasing value of gold, the pension which your petitioner can earn under the present rules will not enable him to live in England on retirement in that condition of life in which he was brought up, and in which men of his social standing live.

2*ndly*.—That your petitioner is unable to save any considerable sum from his pay owing to the high and constantly increasing cost of living in this country.

3*rdly*.—That the pension which your petitioner can earn compares very unfavourably with the sterling pensions now granted to officers of the other Scientific Services in India, men who are of the same social standing and who have had a similar expensive scientific education.

4*thly*.—That it appears from Article 641 of the Civil Service Regulations that retiring pensions are intended to be half the officer's average emoluments, but actually, owing to the maxima fixed, they are very much less than half, and could only be half if the officer had been stopped all promotion for many years.

5*thly*.—That at present there is no increase in pension for length of service beyond 25 years.

(*For officers appointed since* 1898.)—6*thly*.—That your petitioner is barred from earning the extra pension of Rs. 2,000 given to Chief Engineers or of Rs. 1,000 given to 2nd and 3rd class Superintending Engineers for 3 years' service as such, if those officers were appointed in or before 1898.

Your Petitioner therefore Prays—

That pensions may be granted according to the scale given below, and that they may be paid in England in sterling, at an exchange rate of 10 rupees to the pound sterling.

After 20 years' service, Rs. 4,000 in India or £400 in England.

After 25 years' service, Rs. 5,000 in India or £500 in England.

After 30 years' service, Rs. 6,000 in India or £600 in England.

Additional pension for 3 years' service as Superintending Engineer, Rs. 1,000 in India or £100 in England.

Additional pension for 5 years' service as Superintending Engineer or Chief Engineer combined, Rs. 2,000 in India or £200 in England.

Additional pension for 3 years' service as Chief Engineer, Rs. 2,500 in India or £250 in England.

Memorial of 1912.

To

The Most Hon'ble,
The Marquis of Crewe, K.G.,
His Majesty's Secretary of State for India.

The humble petition of.....Engineer, Public Works Department, India.

Showeth,

That your petitioner is an Engineer of..... year's service in the Imperial Branch of the Public Works Department, and that a few years ago His Excellency the Viceroy and Governor-General of India was approached with a humble petition for an increase in the amount of pension to which an officer in your petitioner's service becomes entitled on retirement, no final reply has been received.

That since this petition was presented, despite the improvement in salary graciously accorded by His Majesty's Government in 1908, the continued increase in cost of living in India, and the steady rise in prices in England, have caused your petitioner grave anxiety as to his future on retirement, and induce him to lay his case before your Lordship.

That the increased cost in living to which your petitioner has alluded, renders it extremely difficult for a married officer to afford his children an education suited to their position in life, and at the same time to save sufficient to enable him to supplement the pension to which he will be entitled on retirement. Your petitioner is convinced that your Lordship cannot consider such a state of affairs satisfactory.

That your petitioner moreover belongs to a highly trained scientific body of men, whose duties involve their spending a very considerable portion of their service under conditions deficient in the ordinary amenities of life, and in a climate that renders such work more than usually arduous. This service is rendered in a Department which is in a marked degree engaged in creating and developing new sources of revenue; and it is largely due to its efforts that the country owes its wealth and prosperity.

That the approximate expenditure on pensions in all services in 1884 and in 1911 compared with the amount of general revenues and of revenues earned by works constructed by the Public Works Department are set forth in the following table in lakhs of rupees:—

——	1884.	1911.	Increase.	
			Total.	Percentage.
General Revenues	6,706	12,240	5,534	83
Revenue from Public Works	977	3,013	2,036	300
Pension—all Services ...	78	162	84	108

That the increase of revenue from Public Works thus amounts to about 53 per cent. of the increase of general revenues and is about 35 times the total increase of pension charges for all services in the same period.

APPENDIX XIII—*continued.*

That while he gratefully acknowledges the benefits derived from the Reorganisation Scheme of 1908, your petitioner ventures to point out that, owing to the withdrawal of Exchange Compensation Allowance, those benefits were in the case of most officers considerably less than would appear at first sight, and compare very unfavourably with the concessions recently granted to the Provincial Branch of the Service, in that the net increase in pay granted to Provincial Engineers during their first 24 years' service has been 25 per cent. as against less than 15 per cent. given to Imperial Engineers for the same period.

That the increased salaries granted to the Imperial and Provincial Services in 1908 doubtless represented what Government after careful consideration at that time deemed absolutely necessary in the relative circumstances of the two services.

That the increase then granted to the Provincial Service has since been proved to be insufficient and your petitioner respectfully submits that this applies equally to the Imperial Service.

That whereas Your Lordship's Government has clearly defined pension as "deferred remuneration," bearing a definite proportion (from 1-3 to 1-2) to salary; yet owing to the fixed maximum, the sliding scale prescribed in Civil Service Regulations Article 641 is practically inoperative; and thus, while the improvement in salary introduced by the recent Reorganisation scheme brought a proportionate increase in pension to the Provincial Engineers, it brought no corresponding increase to the Imperial Engineer.

That while the average scientific training and professional qualifications now demanded are much higher than in the earlier years of the Department, the maximum pension which can ordinarly be earned by an officer in your petitioner's service, and payable in England, has owing to the fall in the exchange value of the rupee, fallen from £500 the figure at which it originally stood and is now fixed at £437-10-0.

That your petitioner believes that his service continues to receive in the matter of pensions and leave allowances the same consideration which is given to the services formerly styled "uncovenanted," and your petitioner submits that this is not in accordance with Secretary of State's despatch No. 18, dated 22nd March 1883, where Lord Kimberley laid down that "under the special rules regarding the pay pension and furlough which have now been provided for them (*i.e.*, Imperial Engineers) they will no longer come under the general Uncovenanted Service Rules, and a special chapter will have to be introduced into the Pension Code to meet their case. The term is therefore no longer applicable to them and should be dropped in India, as it will be here in all official notifications. Moreover as long ago as 1871, the Under Secretary of State for India (Mr. Grant Duff) speaking on the subject of Cooper Hill College and the Indian Engineering Service claimed in the House of Commons that Government had created a new profession on a level with the two great Indian Services—the Civil and the Military."

That your petitioner finds that so far from this equality being observed, the pensions at present granted to his Service compare most unfavourably with those granted to officers of the other scientific Indian Services, certain members of which are employed in your petitioner's own Department doing exactly the same work as your petitioner.

That your petitioner further respectfully submits that there appears to be no reason for this markedly adverse disparity in the pension rules of his own service, and other scientific services. Your petitioner in preparation for his service needed a preliminary education as expensive as that of the Royal Engineer or the Indian Medical Service Officer, and the Civil Engineer is in every way of at least equal importance to the country's life and prosperity. Further that while the pensions granted to those other services mentioned are not greater than the circumstances require, the pensions at present granted to Imperial Engineers are in comparison totally inadequate, and this disparity is emphasised by the want of a suitable Widows and Orphans Fund, the existence of which in the case of the other services renders improbable the chance of their families being left destitute.

That your petitioner when applying for, and accepting his appointment as an Assistant Engineer in the Public Works Department had not formed any correct estimate of the purchasing value of the rupee, and of the cost and conditions of life in India, and he anticipated he would be able to save a material portion of his salary and thus to supplement his pension, but the experience which your petitioner has already gained has proved to him the futility of this hope and has satisfied him that even allowing for the probably lower salary, which he might have drawn to commence with had he sought professional employment otherwise than under the Government of India, the conditions of such employment would in ordinary circumstances have offered him better prospects.

The climatic and other conditions of work in India render retirement at 55 years of age undoubtedly desirable, and at this age your petitioner cannot reasonably hope to obtain other employment with a view to supplementing his small pension.

A man who has worked in better climatic and other conditions is comparatively young at this age, and in ordinary circumstances does not find himself compelled to retire. The conditions of life in India involve the added risk of earlier complsory retirement on account of ill health, in a degree that does not obtain in more favourable surroundings and this risk becomes greater in the later years of service.

That in view of these facts, your petitioner has satisfied himself that the only course open to him in existing conditions, in order to improve his prospects, in the later years of his life, would be to retire at the earliest permissible date, *i.e.*, after 20 years' service, with a view to seeking other employment in which he would be able to continue to work for a longer period. This however constitutes at the best but an uncertain and unsatisfactory alternative to the prospects which your petitioner anticipated when he entered the service.

Your petitioner therefore humbly prays that your Lordship may be graciously pleased to give early and favourable consideration to this your petitioner's humble memorial.

Firstly, that pensions be granted to all Imperial Engineers according to the scale given below, and be paid in sterling:—

Ordinary Pensions.

On completing	20	years'	service	...	£350
,, ,,	21	,,	,,	...	380
,, ,,	22	,,	,,	...	410
,, ,,	23	,,	,,	...	440
,, ,,	24	,,	,,	...	470
,, ,,	25	,,	,,	...	500
,, ,,	26	,,	,,	...	540
,, ,,	27	,,	,,	...	580
,, ,,	28	,,	,,	...	620
,, ,,	29	,,	,,	...	660
,, ,,	30	,,	,,	...	700

Special Service Pensions.

Secondly, that as in accordance with the orders of the Government of India officers are appointed to the administrative grades entirely by merit; an additional special service pension of £40 per year of completed service be accorded to officers in those grades, subject to a maximum total pension of £940 per annum.

Thirdly, that the Leave allowances sanctioned for officers of the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers subject to the Civil Leave Rules may be extended to your petitioner's service.

And your Memorialist, as in duty bound will ever pray.

.....*Engineer,*
.....*Province.*
.....*Public Works Department.*

Memorial of 1913.

To

THE MOST HON'BLE,
THE MARQUIS OF CREWE, K.G.,
His Majesty's Secretary of State for India.

The humble petition of.....
.....Engineer, Public Works Department, India.

SHOWETH,

That your Petitioner has learned with dismay, from a letter issued by the Government of India, that

Government was unable to further consider the Memorials recently submitted, a large number of Imperial Engineers praying for a revised scale of pensions, until the report of the Royal Commission on the Public Service of India is received.

That your Lordship caused to be stated in the House of Commons on the 9th of October, 1912, that the question raised by the Memorialists was then under examination by the Government of India, and that pending the result of this examination no pronouncement could be made, and that the pensions come within the scope of the Public Services enquiry.

That the first of this reply seems to indicate that Your Lordship has not been kept fully informed of how the Government of India is dealing with this important case.

That the Royal Commission has been unable to deal with the Public Works and Railway Departments during their first tour in India.

That the number of Departments and Services, remaining to be dealt with during future tours, is so large that your Petitioner feels that a final decision on these Memorials may possibly be delayed to a date before which he will have been superannuated, and that therefore, under Article 4 of the Civil Service Regulations, which lays down that an officer's claim to pension is regulated by the rules in force when he retires, the practical effect in your Petitioner's case is a direct negative to the Memorials. Your Petitioner humbly submits that this is not consistent with the tenor of Your Lordship's reply in the House of Commons on the 9th of October, 1912.

Your Petitioner therefore humbly prays that your Lordship may be graciously pleased to give immediate consideration to your Petitioner's humble Memorial.

Firstly, that the pensions be granted to all Imperial Engineers according to the scale given below, and be paid in sterling:—

Ordinary Pensions.

On completing	20	years'	service	...	£350
,,	,,	21	,,	,,	...	380
,,	,,	22	,,	,,	...	410
,,	,,	23	,,	,,	...	440
,,	,,	24	,,	,,	...	470
On completing	25	years'	service	...	£500
,,	,,	26	,,	,,	...	540
,,	,,	27	,,	,,	...	580
,,	,,	28	,,	,,	...	620
,,	,,	29	,,	,,	...	660
,,	,,	30	,,	,,	...	700

Special Pensions.

Secondly, that as in accordance with the orders of the Government of India officers are appointed to the administrative grades entirely by merit; an additional special service pension of £40 per year of completed service be accorded to officers in those grades, subject to a maximum total pension of £940 per annum.

Leave Allowances.

Thirdly, that the Leave allowances sanctioned for officers of the Indian Civil Service and Military Officers subject to the Civil Leave Rules may be extended to your Petitioner's service.

And your Memorialist, as in duty bound, will ever pray.

.....*Engineer,*
.....*Province.*
Public Works Department.

Letter No. 942-*E, dated Simla, the* 30*th August* 1912, From Mr. G. H. LEMAISTRE, DEPUTY SECRETARY TO THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA, P.W.D. To THE SECRETARY, TO THE GOVERNMENT OF THE PUNJAB, P.W.D.

I am directed to refer to the correspondence ending with your letter No. 0658-E. I., dated the 6th July 1911, forwarding memorials submitted by certain Engineer officers of the Public Works Department in which they pray for the grant of enhanced rates of pensions and for the payment of pensions in sterling.

2. In reply, I am to say that His Majesty's Government having appointed a Royal Commission on the Public Services in India and pension being one of the subjects of reference to the Commission, the Government of India are unable further to consider the matter until the report of the Commission is received. I am to request that the memorialists may be informed accordingly.

APPENDIX XIV.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Madras relating to the Public Works Department.

IMPERIAL ENGINEER SERVICE.

(i) *Present regulations as to recruitment.*

This service is recruited from selected candidates appointed in England by the Secretary of State for India in Council. The selection of candidates in England is made on the advice of a Selection Committee including at least one eminent representative of the Engineering profession. Natives of India who are British subjects are eligible for appointment to this service and are selected to the extent of 10 *per cent.* of the total number of Assistant Engineers thus recruited, if otherwise duly qualified, viz., by age, examination, etc.—*vide* paragraphs 1 and 5 of the Regulations as to appointment of Assistant Engineers to the Imperial Service.†

Present regulations as to training and probation.

Candidates who have passed through a college course and obtained one of the degrees prescribed should have had at least one year's practical experience of Civil Engineering under a qualified Civil Engineer at the time when they appear before the Selection Committee. Those who have taken no college course should have had a full three years of such practical experience. In the event of any candidate being selected who has not, in the opinion of the Selection Committee, had sufficient practical experience, he may be required to undergo after arrival in India a year's probation in charge of works and his final appointment is dependent upon the result of such probation—*vide* paragraph 7 of the Regulations as to appointment of Assistant Engineers to the Imperial Service.†

† *Vide* Appendix XIX.

Whether the regulations are satisfactory.

His Excellency in Council considers the present method of selection to be satisfactory, but it is suggested that paragraph 5 of the present Regulations as to the appointment of Assistant Engineers should be modified so as to provide that, instead of Natives of India being selected in England to the extent of 10 *per cent.* of the total number of Assistant Engineers recruited, Provincial Engineers should be appointed annually to the Imperial Service to the extent of 10 *per cent.* of the total recruitment in England, the appointment of Natives of India by the Secretary of State being made in exceptional cases only.

PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

Present Regulations as to recruitment.

This service is recruited—

(1) from the students of the College of Engineering, Madras, being Natives of India as defined in the Statute 33 Vict., Chapter 3, Section 6, at the rate of one every year, and

(2) from the Upper Subordinates of the department at the rate of one in alternate years.

The recruitment from the college is made annually by the Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, in consultation with the Principal of the College, and the appointment is conferred on the student, either Civil or Mechanical Engineer, judged most suitable on the results of the examinations and the promise shown by him and his general behaviour during the college course.

APPENDIX XIV—*continued.*

Present Regulations as to training and probation.

Students recruited from the College of Engineering, Madras, are appointed by the Local Government as apprentices on Rs. 100 a month. They are promoted to Rs. 150 after six month's period, provided they have given satisfaction during that period, and to Assistant Engineer on Rs. 250, Provincial Service, after a year, provided they are then considered to be in all respects competent to hold charge of a sub-division. In the case of an apprentice who at the end of the first year's service is not considered qualified for confirmation in the department, the Local Government may decide whether he is to be given a further trial or be removed from the department, and ordinarily one who is not within three years from date of appointment as apprentice Engineer recommended for promotion to Assistant Engineer will be so removed.

Whether the present regulations are satisfactory.

No change in the present method of selection from the college is considered to be necessary.

(ii) *The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time.*

IMPERIAL SERVICE.

—	In 1890.	In 1900.	At the present time.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Chief Engineer—			
First class ...	2,500	2,500	2,750
Second class ...	2,000	2,000	2,500
Third class ...	1,800	1,800	Abolished.
Superintending Engineers—			
First class ...	1,600	1,600	2,000
Second class ...	1,350	1,350	1,750
Third class ...	1,100	1,100	1,500
Executive Engineers—			
First grade ...	950	1,000	Rs. 800—50—1,250, the increment of Rs. 50 being given annually for approved service.
Second grade ...	800	850	
Third grade ...	700	700	
Fourth grade ...	600	Abolished.	
Assistant Engineers—			
First grade ...	500	550	Rs. 380—40—700—50—750, the increment of Rs. 40 being given annually for approved service until Rs. 70 is reached, the next increment being Rs. 50 a month.
Second grade ...	*350	450	
Third grade ...	250	350	

* Assistant Engineers, second grade, after three years' service in the grade received Rs. 400 a month if recommended.

PROVINCIAL SERVICE.

In 1890.		In 1900.	At the present time.
		Rs.	Rs.
Chief Engineers—	There were not two separate services — Imperial and Provincial in 1890. The Engineers appointed in England and in India were borne on the same list and were drawing the same rates of pay which are shown under Imperial service for 1890.		
First class ...		2,500	2,750
Second class		2,000	2,500
Third class...		1,800	Abolished
Superintending Engineers—			
First class ...		1,050	1,600
Second class		900	4,400
Third class...		750	1,200
Executive Engineers—			
First grade		650	Rs. 535–35–850,† the increment of Rs. 35 a month being granted annually for approved service.
Second grade		550	
Third grade		475	
Fourth grade		Abolished.	
Assistant Engineers—			
First grade		400	Rs. 250–25–475, the increment of Rs. 25 a month being granted annually for approved service.
Second grade		350	
Third grade		250	

† A special increment of Rs. 50 may be granted by the Local Government to a deserving Executive Engineer who, after completion of five years' service on the maximum pay of Rs. 850, is not promoted to administrative rank.

Allowances.

(1) From the 1st August, 1905, the two Chief Engineers who are also Secretary and Joint Secretary to Government Public Works Department, draw a local allowance of Rs. 250 a month, each.

(2) From the 19th June, 1899, the two Executive Engineers who are Under Secretaries to Government draw a local allowance of Rs. 100 a month, each.

(3) The officers of both the services draw travelling allowances in accordance with the rules in the Civil Service Regulations.

Whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

Rates of pay.—It is considered that no alteration in the rates of pay of the Engineer services is necessary.

Allowances.—The rates of travelling allowances admissible to Gazetted officers under present rules on transfer from one station to another are altogether inadequate and the following scale of rates is proposed:—

Salary of officer after transfer.	Railway fares for himself and family.	Number of servants whose fares will be paid by Government.	Weight of luggage in manuds for the conveyance of which by goods train or cargo steamer Government will pay.	Number of horses for the conveyance of which Government will pay.
I. Officers on less than Rs. 500.	4	*3	†15	One horse.
II. Officers on Rs. 500 and less than Rs. 1,500.			†30	Two horses.
III. Officers on Rs. 1,500 and above.			†40	

* With one syce and one grass-cutter for each horse if necessary. A servant making a journey ten days on either side of the date of arrival of the officer at his new station may be included in the maximum number of servants for whom fares are recoverable.

† Officers who maintain tents may draw in addition to the cost of the carriage of ordinary luggage, the cost of carriage of tents within the limits already fixed for the purpose of article 1000, Civil Service Regulations.

This scale was recommended to the Government of India in July 1912.

(iii) *The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.*

Number of posts in each grade.

	Ultimate.		Provisional until the Provincial Service cadre reaches its maximum strength.	
Chief Engineer—				
First class	1	2	1	2
Second class	1		1	
Superintending Engineer—				
First class	2	7	2	7
Second class	2		2	
Third class	3		3	
Imperial Service—				
Executive Engineers ...	35		41	
Assistant Engineers ...	19		21	
Provincial Service—				
Executive Engineers ...	8		4	
Assistant Engineers ...	22		18	
	93		93	

The provision made in the *cadre* for leave is 20 *per cent.* of the total strength.

No provision is made in the *cadre* for training.

(iv) *Appointments outside the authorised cadre held temporarily or otherwise by officers of the Imperial or Provincial Engineer Service.*

One of the two posts of Temporary Deputy Sanitary Engineers is held temporarily by Mr. E. W. Lace, an Assistant Engineer of the Imperial Service.

(v) *Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.*

It will be seen from item (iii) above that the present sanctioned number of the Engineer Establishment is—

Chief Engineers	2
Superintending Engineers	7
Executive Engineers	45
Assistant Engineers	39
Total ...	93

In June 1913, the Government of India were asked to obtain the sanction of the Secretary of State to an additional appointment of Superintending Engineer, second class, to provide for an additional circle of superintendence which was created, in the first instance as a temporary measure, for two years and which has been found to be permanently required. The total number of Superintending Engineers will then be raised from 7 to 8.

The strength of the Engineer *cadre* in this Presidency was last fixed by the Government of India in 1908 at 92. This strength was fixed on a basis of eight administrative posts, thirty-three divisional and two special and extra charges. In 1909, the Government of India were requested to increase the *cadre* from 92 to 97 on a basis of nine administrative posts, thirty-three divisional and three special and extra charges. In 1911, the number of administrative posts alone was increased from eight to nine by the inclusion of the post of Sanitary Engineer in the Imperial Engineer *cadre* in the rank of Superintending Engineer, third class. Since the request made in 1909, the number of administrative and divisional posts have been increased, and the Government of India have recently been requested to fix the strength of the Engineer *cadre* on a basis of ten administrative posts, thirty-three divisional and six special and extra charges, or a total of forty-nine charges against forty-three in 1908. It is not known what the additions to the *cadre* will be on account of the increase of six in the number of charges, as the data on which the Government of India calculate the number is not known to this Government.

APPENDIX No. XV.

(Referred to in paragraph 72,602 — Mr. C. S. C. Harrison's evidence.)

Transfer expenses of Mr. Henry J. M. Cousens, Assistant Engineer, Acting Executive Engineer.

(i) *Dhárwàr to Bombay, December* 1912—10*th December* 1912.

(Equal to about 441 miles.)

For self and wife, no family. } +1 servant.

Item.	Actual expenses.			Travelling Allowance received.		
	Rs.	a.	p.	Rs.	a.	p.
Bullock carts for kit to Dhárwár station including coolies (for all kit)—						
10 carts	9	8	0			
Packing expenses — carpenter grass, gunny bags, coolies, &c.	8	0	0			
One wagon kit by goods at wagon rates to Bombay as per Railway receipt Note 15—06180, dated 3rd December 1912.	88	4	0	No allowance given for 20 maunds camp kit and cycles as transfer was to Bombay Secretariat.		
Delivery charges for do. by Cox & Co. in Bombay.	19	0	0			
Delivery charges for passenger train luggage.	3	0	0			
Conveyance by rail from Dhárwár to Bombay—						
Two 1st Class fares	81	6	0			
One 3rd Class fare (Mail) ..	9	0	0			
Rail charge for 1 motor cycle. } As per general Receipt Note No 12 of	12	0	0			
Rail charge for 1 ordinary cycle. } 10th December 1912.	3	0	0			
Passenger train excess luggage (as per General Receipt Note No. 11, dated 10th December 1912).	59	4	0			
Retransfer of kit from station to house.	7	0	0			
Total ...	299	6	0			
Received double 1st Class fare ...		—		81	6	0
1½ miles to Dhárwár Station from Post Office.		—		0	8	0
				81	14	0

The above does not include the usual extra expenses due to transfer such as:—

(1) Loss in sale of furniture at necessarily cheap rates.
(2) New club entrance fees.
(3) Conveyance to and from stations.
(4) Extra cost of meals on trains, etc.
(5) Breakages.

In some cases the transfer expenses would have been higher still, for example—

(1) A motor car might have had to be conveyed and no allowance would have been given because the transfer was to the Secretariat in Bombay.
(2) More servants might have been kept on.
(3) More kit might have been conveyed. In the above transfer the amount of kit could not have been considered large by any means, etc.

(ii) *Sátára to Dhárwár,* 10*th October* 1910

For self, wife and 3 servants. } Sátára to Dhárwár = 244 miles.

Item.	Actual expenses.			Amount claimed in Travelling Allowance bill, as per rules.		
	Rs.	a.	p.	Rs.	a.	p.
Sátára to Sátára Station—						
10 carts, including toll, &c., and filling wagon.	15	0	0			
Tonga to Station—10 miles ...	2	8	0			
(10 miles @ 8 annas a mile)...		—		5	0	0
Packing expenses	7	0	0			
Train fare to Dhárwár—						
Two 1st Class	45	12	0	45	12	0
Three 3rd Class...	8	7	0			
Goods—						
81 maunds as per Receipt No. 14 of 7th January 1910.	44	8	0			
One horse as per Receipt No. 4 of 7th October 1910.	30	8	0	30	8	0
Two cycles (1 motor cycle as per Receipt No. 10 of 10th October 1910).	4	0	0			
(One cycle)		—		2	0	0
Excess luggage in mail train— Mds. srs. Weight 12 31 Free 3 15						
Weight charged 9 16 = Rs. 19 as per Receipt No. 10 of 10th October 1910.	19	0	0			
Camp kit per passenger train 7½ maunds.		—		15	2	6
Do. goods train 12½ ,,		—		6	13	10
20						
Cart hires—						
Lhárwár to bungalow—9 carts at 9 annas each.	5	1	0			
(2 miles from Station at Dhárwár to Post Office at 8 annas per mile).		—		1	0	0
Dumney hire in Dhárwár on arrival—Station to house.	0	8	0			
Cooly hires on stations ...	1	0	0			
Total ...	183	4	0	106	4	4

The above does not include the usual extra expenses due to transfer such as:—

(1) Loss in sale of furniture at necessarily cheap rates.
(2) New club entrance fees (otherwise unnecessary).
(3) Extra cost of meals on trains.
(4) Breakages, etc.

The amount of kit conveyed in the above transfer was very small and included very little furniture indeed.

APPENDIX XV—*continued.*

(iii) *Dhárwár to Hubli, January* 1912, *and Hubli to Dhárwár, March* 1912.

Mileage each way—12.

Item.	Actual expenses.	Amount claimed in Travelling Allowances and allowable as per rules.
	Rs. a. p.	Rs. a. p.
14 bullock carts kit 12 miles at 2 annas per mile each	21 0 0	
Packing expenses, grass, &c., approximate	5 0 0	
Train fare for wife (servants and self by road)	1 4 0	
No conveyance expenses from and to stations as dumney hired in Dhárwár was kept on at Hubli.		
Station coolies	0 4 0	
Total	27 8 0	
Amount admissible as per rules—daily allowance for one day, Rs. 4....	—	4 0 0
Total		4 0 0

The above does not include the usual extra expenses due to transfer such as in this case—
(1) New club entrance fee (otherwise unnecessary).
(2) Breakages, etc.

APPENDIX XVI.

Memorandum prepared by the Government of Bombay relating to the Public Works Department.

1. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.

The Engineer Establishment is recruited from the following sources:—

For the Imperial Service—

(1) Selected candidates appointed in England by the Secretary of State.

(1*a*) Temporary Engineers who have been sent out by the Secretary of State on covenant for a few years.

(2) Officers of the Corps of Royal Engineers on the Indian Establishment.

For the Provincial Service—

(3) Passed students of the Indian Civil Engineering Colleges, and,

(4) Promoted Upper Subordinates.

The candidates of the first-named class were, up till 1907, selected from Coopers Hill College. They are now appointed by the Secretary of State, with the advice of a Committee of Selection, from amongst applicants in possession of certain specified University degrees or other approximately equivalent qualifications. Ten per cent. of the appointments thus made are reserved for duly qualified natives of India, but only one such appointment has as yet been made on the Bombay Establishment. Since Coopers Hill was abolished 4 Indians have been added to Imperial Establishment. Three of them were from amongst those finishing off at Coopers Hill after outsiders were first appointed, *viz.*, Messrs. M. A. Mirza, D. R. Sawhney and S. B. Tyabji, *e.g.*, in 1905, 1906 and 1907. Mr. T. S. Mirchandani came in 1911. A candidate who has not had sufficient practical experience may be required to undergo, after arrival in India, a year's probation in charge of works, his final appointment being made dependent upon the result of such probation. A report is to be submitted to the Government of India on such officers at the end of the year. A copy of the rules is appended.* The usual rate of recruitment from England for Bombay is two per year, though this rate has been increased at times to meet heavy pressure of work. Two Royal Engineer officers were appointed in 1909. Appointments from that Corps are seldom made now-a-days. The rate of recruitment from the Poona College of Engineering is one candidate per year and, from the Upper Subordinate class one every alternate year, or 1½ per year on an average.

2. Up to 1891, two appointments, one as Assistant Engineer, and the other as Apprentice Engineer were allowed for this Presidency from the Poona College. In 1891 the Government of India at the request of the Government of Bombay agreed to take the Apprentice on to their list, and since then only one appointment is made from the Poona College. Three appointments were made by the Government of India in 1892, 1893 and 1894. In 1895 this Government retained the second man.

3. In 1892, the Provincial Engineer service was established and it took effect from the year 1896. Under the rules governing this service, the appointment of one man in each year from the Poona College has been continued but on somewhat less favourable terms, the student eligible being appointed as an Apprentice Engineer in the first instance and promoted to be Assistant Engineer, 3rd Grade, after one year of approved service. This is a year of probation and of training in one, while the Imperial Engineers usually have their year's training at home. Under the previous arrangement, the men appointed as Assistant and Apprentice Engineers were required to have passed the L.C.E. Examination of the Bombay University in the First Class and the first two men were taken; but the present rule is to select the most suitable man from among graduates in the First Class as Apprentice Engineer. The Government order* is as under:—

"Under the guarantee at present in force, *vide* Government Notifications noted in the footnote,† the candidate who passes first in the First Class of the Bombay University Examination for the degree of L.C.E. is appointed to the permanent Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department. But, while educational attainments are necessary, there are other factors such as physique, antecedents, character, manners, etc., which must be taken into consideration in making an appointment of Assistant Engineer. Government, therefore, consider that the

* Appendix XIX.

* Government Notification (Public Works Department), No. E.—580, dated 26th February, 1908.

† Government Notification No. 10, dated 18th, February, 1885.
Government Notification No. 36, dated 20th May, 1891.
Government Notification No. 42, dated 2nd August, 1892.
Government Notification No. 10, dated 31st January, 1893.

existing terms of the guarantee require modification, and they are pleased to direct that in future the guaranteed appointment is to be conferred not necessarily on the candidate who stands first in the order of examination but on the one, from amongst the candidates, in the First Class, who appears best fitted generally for a post in Government service."

Men promoted from the Upper Subordinate class are of course appointed as Assistant Engineers at once.

4. The recruits from England and those from the Poona College are borne on the same list and their positions are determined according to the dates on which they reach the rank of Assistant Engineer. The appointments of the former take effect from 1st October, while the latter enter between February and March. The order of seniority, therefore, of these officers is fixed as follows:—

Recruits from England of say, October 1912, then

Poona College Recruit of March 1912 who undergoes apprentice work until March 1913, which corresponds to the year of practical work required of Imperial Engineers before being appointed, then

Recruit from Upper Subordinate class if appointed later than March 1913, and then

Recruit from England in 1913.

5. The following orders regarding a practical course of training for the recruits from the College of Engineering (Poona) have been issued by the Government of Bombay:—"After a passed student is appointed Apprentice Engineer he must be placed on some large Engineering work to undergo a year's course of practical work under an Executive Engineer. During the period of apprenticeship he will be required to maintain a note-book fully illustrated with neat sketches showing all details connected with the work, including manufacture of materials. He should record, from actual measurement, what quantities of fuel and limestone or kankar are required for 100 cubic feet of lime, and when these vary, try to explain the cause, what quantity of different classes of work a bricklayer or stone-mason can lay in a day, and what assistance he requires, what quantities of lime, sand or surkhi and stone or brick are required per 100 cubic feet of masonry, etc., etc. He should also record the difficulties encountered and how they have been overcome. The note-book should be submitted every month to the Principal, College of Engineering, Poona, through the Executive Engineer and the Superintending Engineer who will pass it on without delay, making such remarks as may be called for. It should be returned by the Principal direct to the Apprentice, his remarks being communicated to the Superintending Engineer. If at any time during the period of apprenticeship, it appears to the Principal that the Apprentice is not receiving sufficient attention or not obtaining sufficiently varied experience he should draw the attention of the Superintending Engineer to the fact and make suggestions. Towards the end of the 12 months the Executive Engineer should report to the Superintending Engineer through the Principal his general opinion on the manner in which the Apprentice Engineer had used his opportunities of acquiring practical knowledge. When passing on the report, the Principal in consideration of the manner in which the note-book has been maintained should report to the Superintending Engineer whether the Apprentice had done creditably. The Superintending Engineer should submit the reports to Government with his own observations."

6. The course for the final examination in Engineering in the Poona College has been made more comprehensive, and the old degree of Licentiate of Civil Engineering has been converted into that of Batchelor of Engineering.

7. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation are considered satisfactory, except that the recruitment should be more regular, and increased as soon as the expectation of an increased cadre is justified.

2. The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

Grades.	Rates of pay in 1890.	Rates of pay in 1900.		Present rates of pay (*viz.*, in April 1913).	
		Imperial.	Provincial.	Imperial.	Provincial.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Chief Engineer, 1st Class	2,500	2,500	2,500	2,750§	2,750
Do. 2nd Class	2,000	2,000	2,000	2,500§	2,500
Do. 3rd Class...	1,800	1,800	1,800	—	—
Superintending Engineer, 1st Class	1,600	1,600	1,050	2,000	1,600
Do. 2nd Class	1,350	1,400	900	1,750	1,400
Do. 3rd Class	1,100	1,250	750	1,500	1,200
Executive Engineer, 1st Grade	*950	*1,000	*650		
Do. 2nd Grade	800	850	550	800—50—1,250	535—35—850‖
Do. 3rd Grade	700	700	475		
Do. 4th Grade	600	—	—		
Assistant Engineer, 1st Grade	500	550	400		
Do. 2nd Grade	†350	450	350	380—40—700	250—25—475
Do. 3rd Grade	250	350 Old 250	250	700—50—750	
Apprentice	100	—	‡ 150 / 100	—	‡ 150 / 100

* Two periodic increments, each to the extent of Rs. 50 per mensem, were granted to Executive Engineers, 1st Grade, under certain circumstances. A minimum of 4 years' approved service in the grade was necessary to qualify for the first increment and a further minimum period of 4 years' approved service for the second.

† Assistant Engineers 2nd Grade, after 3 years' service in the grade received Rs. 50 per mensem more if recommended.

‡ Apprentice Engineers receive Rs. 150 a month after 6 months' satisfactory service.

§ Plus Rs. 250 per mensem for holding the posts of Secretary and Joint Secretary to Government.

‖ A special increment of Rs. 50 per mensem may be granted by the Local Government to a deserving Executive Engineer who after completion of 5 years' service on the maximum pay of Rs. 850 is not promoted to administrative rank.

The Bombay Government have recently represented* that the pay of Public Works Department officers below administrative rank (stationed in Bombay) is insufficient, and they have strongly recommended a presidency allowance of Rs. 250 per mensem for Executive Engineers and of Rs. 150 per mensem for Assistant Engineers.

* *Vide* Annexure E.

APPENDIX XVI—*continued.*

3. The number of posts in each grade and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.

The number of posts in each grade, etc., is as under:—

	Number of posts as per sanctioned cadre.
Chief Engineer, 1st Class	1
Chief Engineer, 2nd Class	2
Superintending Engineer, 1st Class ...	2
Superintending Engineer, 2nd Class...	2
Superintending Engineer, 3rd Class ...	2
Executive Engineers	49
Assistant Engineers	42
Total ...	100
Temporary Superintending Engineer on Rs. 1,500 per mensem for 2 years	1
Total ...	101

The cadre includes provision for absentees on leave at 17 per cent. on total strength. The cadre does not include any provision for training.

4. What appointments outside the authorized cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the various services?

The following appointments outside the authorized cadre are held by officers engaged on short agreements, etc.:—

(1) Consulting Architect to Government.	(Pay Rs. 1,500–50–1,750.)
(2) Assistant to the Consulting Architect to Government.	(Pay Rs. 500–40–660.)
(3) Assistant to the Consulting Architect to Government.	(Pay Rs. 340–40–500.)
(4) Electrical Engineer	(Pay Rs. 1,000–50–1,200.)
(5) Electrical Inspector	(Pay Rs. 650–50–750.)
(6) Mechanical Engineer to Government.	(Pay Rs. 1,100 per mensem for the first three years; Rs. 1,150 per mensem for the fourth year. Thereafter it is to rise by annual increments of Rs. 50 per mensem to Rs. 1,750 per mensem.)
(7) Temporary Engineer for Boring Work.	(Pay Rs. 700 per mensem for the first year and Rs. 800 per mensem for the next 4 years.)
(8) Analyst to the Sanitary Board.	(Pay Rs. 500–20–600.)

2. In addition to the above-mentioned officers there are 20 temporary Engineers under the yearly sanction on the rates of pay shown below:—

Number of Officers.	Rate of pay per mensem Rs.
2	1,200
2	800
1	750
1	620
2	600
1	550
2	500
3	450
2	400
2	300
2	250
Total ... 20	

5. Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.

An increased cadre (100 to be raised to 132 officers) was recommended in letter No. E-4418* of 23rd April 1913. But on the Government of India* pointing out that junior officers may not exceed a certain proportion of the whole, it is necessary to reconsider the request. A modified increase may be asked for, and a request may be made that the normal recruitment be increased so as avoid spasmodic† increases such as have occurred in the last ten years.

* *Vide* Annexures C and D.
† *Vide* Annexure A.

ANNEXURE A.

Statement showing recruitment to the Imperial Branch of the Engineer Establishment of the Bombay Public Works Department from 1894 *to* 1913.

Year.	Number of Recruits.	Whether an increase to the cadre was sanctioned.
1894	3	—
1895	4	—
1896	2	—
1897	3	—
1898	1	—
1899	4	Yes.*
1900	2	—
1901	2	—
1902	3	—
1903	3	Yes.†
1904	4	—
1905	7	Yes.‡
1906	4	—
1907	§10	—
1908	§8	‖
1909	¶6+2**=8	—
1910	4	—
1911	2	—
1912	2	—
1913	3	—

* The cadre was increased from 80 to 81 as the appointment of the Sanitary Engineer to Government was transferred from the General to the Public Works Department.

† The cadre (which was reduced from 81 to 80 in 1901 (was increased from 80 to 82 consequent upon the appointments of the second Secretary and the second Under Secretary to Government, Public Works Department.

‡ The cadre was increased from 82 to 101 to provide for additional executive charges.

§ Of these, two were from covenanted temporary Engineers.

‖ The cadre has been fixed at 100 consequent upon the Reorganization of the Engineer Establishment in 1908.

¶ Of these one was from covenanted temporary Engineers.

** Two transferred from Military Works Services.

ANNEXURE B.

INDIAN PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT AND INDIAN STATE RAILWAYS.

Regulations as to Appointment of Assistant Engineers, 1913. (*Vide* Appendix XIX.)

ANNEXURE C.

No. E. 4418 of 1913.

Public Works Department.

Bombay Castle, 23rd April 1913.

From H. V. R. KEMBALL, ESQ., Secretary to the Government of Bombay; to the SECRETARY to the GOVERNMENT of INDIA, Public Works Department.

Establishments.

SIR,

I am directed to address the Government of India with regard to the urgent necessity for strengthening the staff of the Public Works Department in the Bombay Presidency.

2. The sanctioned cadre of the department is at present fixed at 100 officers. This strength is even now insufficient for the regular work of the department and 105 officers are actually employed. The large construction works in progress necessitate a considerable temporary increase of staff and this is

being met by the employment of Temporary Engineers. Twenty-two Temporary Engineers are employed at present, of whom ten noted in the foot-note* are employed on special work and are not taken into consideration in the calculations of establishment in this letter. The remaining twelve Temporary Engineers are employed on the regular work of the department and are being added to as capable men offer.

3. But considerable difficulty is experienced in obtaining a sufficient number of capable Temporary Engineers. The completion of the large irrigation works now under construction and of those which will most probably be taken in hand and completed within the next twenty-five years will necessitate a considerable increase in the permanent strength of the department for their maintenance. There are strong objections to appointing the extra men in a block when required because the block will cause hardship when the men are ripe for executive charges and for promotion to administrative appointments, while, if the men are appointed gradually, they will be most useful for the construction work. It is, therefore, proposed to determine now the permanent strength that will be required when these works are opened and to regulate at once the annual recruitment so as to provide this strength.

4. There are at present 38 sanctioned permanent executive charges including the two appointments of Under Secretary to Government. From these must be deducted the two additional charges—Provincial or Imperial—which have not been formed, the Survey and Construction District which has been temporarily closed, and one of the Jamrao Canal Districts since the amalgamation of the two districts into one may now be considered permanent. The new Kolaba District sanctioned for two years as an experimental measure must, however, be considered permanent. It may thus be taken that there are 35 permanent Executive charges, of which 20 are Provincial and 15 Imperial. There are also five temporary Executive charges, *viz.*, the Pravara Canals, the Poona Drainage and Water Supply District, and the Lake Whiting, Lonand, and Malsiras Districts of the Nira Canals. These are all construction districts and will be closed when the works are completed.

5. Executive charges will, however, have to be formed for the maintenance of the large irrigation works now under construction or contemplated in the near future. The Godavari Canal construction district has been closed and amalgamated with the Nasik and Ahmednagar Irrigation District. When the Godavari Canal is opened for irrigation, this combined district will be too large for one charge and it is proposed to form a new district to be called the Ahmednagar Irrigation District, which will include the irrigation in the Ahmednagar District and the irrigation under the Pravara Canal when opened. The Nira Canal must be formed into a separate charge for maintenance. It is presumed further that the construction of the Sukkur Barrage and Indus Left Bank Canal, and the Gokak Canals will be completed within 22 years from the present time. The former, with more than 500,000 acres of new irrigation, will require two additional Executive charges and the latter one Executive charge for maintenance. Thus within the next 22 years five new Imperial Executive charges will be required. The rapid extension of Sanitary works in this Presidency makes *it imperative that two new* Executive charges, Northern and Southern, *should* be formed at once, and the Government of India is being spearately addressed on this matter. I am to assume that these two additional charges will be formed at an early date, and that the number of Provincial Executive charges will thus be increased to 22.

6. I am to attach hereto a statement† prepared to show the Engineer staff which will, in the opinion of Government, be required when the Executive charges detailed in the last paragraph are sanctioned, in comparison with the staff as sanctioned, and as it stands at the present time. From this statement it will be seen that the strength when those Executive charges are sanctioned, should be 113 or, adding 17 per cent. for absentees, 132 in all.

7. I am to observe that, pending the completion of the great irrigation works, the establishment during construction must of course be much in excess of the requirements above figured out. The comparison will be somewhat as follows:—

Construction district dealt with.	Executive Engineers.	Assistant Engineers.	Instead of permanent Maintenance district dealt with	Executive Engineers.	Assistant Engineers.
Godavari and Pravara Canals.	1	8	Ahmednagar Irrigation.	1	2
Nira Right Bank Canals 3 districts.	3	6	Nira Canals ...	1	3
Gokak Canal 2 districts.	2	5	Gokak Canal ...	1	1
Rohri Project 4 districts at least.	4	8	2 Districts	2	6
Total	10	27	Total	5	12

The difference will have to be made up by appointing temporary men to the extent required. The strength required, taking into consideration works under construction, will always be in excess of the figure given in the end of the last paragraph, for the Godavari Canal will not be completed for two years from now; the Pravara Canals will take five years to complete; the Nira Canals will require 12 years for completion; the Gokak Canal can be begun in 1915 and will then be completed in 1925; and the Sukkur Barrage and Rohri Canal, if begun in 1915, will probably not be finished before 1930.

8. The above projects are those which have been fully elaborated and submitted to the Government of India for approval. There are several others which will no doubt follow these, but the purpose of the present letter is to deal only with schemes which will in all human probability be brought into existence within the next 10 or 15 years. The proposals may be found later on to be insufficient for the needs of the department, but they will not be in excess of requirements.

9. Investigation shows that the average term of an Engineer's service in the Bombay Public Works Department is 22 years. Taking figures for the last 20 years in the Bombay list, it has been found that 62 men retired or resigned giving an average of 3·1 men per annum with an average service of 25½ years, and 23 men died, giving an average of 1·1 men per annum with an average service of 11·3 years. The average cadre for the period was 89·1 men so that for a cadre of 132 men the loss would be about 6·3 or say 6 men *per annum. This is, therefore, the rate at which recruitment may take place, and in 22 years the cadre will be complete. It is assumed* that the recruitment will be in the proportion of 4 from home, and 10 per cent. of Indians as at present, and two from this country instead of 1½ as at present. I am, therefore, to ask that the Secretary of State may be moved to increase the annual recruitment from home to four officers.

10. I am now to explain the necessity for the additional Superintending Engineer provided in the statement for Irrigation in Deccan. Now that the new Kolaba District has been sanctioned, the Northern Division includes seven Executive Districts, the annual expenditure of which may be taken at Rs. 24 lakhs excluding local fund works. The Southern Division includes seven districts with an expenditure of about Rs. 21 lakhs excluding local fund works. The Central Division includes eight permanent Executive Districts with an annual expenditure of about Rs. 25 lakhs excluding local funds. In addition, this Division has now for some years included two construction districts, *viz.*, the Godavari

* Mr. Wittet, Consulting Architect; Mr. Mercer, Assistant Architect; Mr. Phipps, Assistant Architect; Mr. Stuart-Menteth, Electrical Engineer; Mr. Wilson, Electric Inspector; Mr. Thiselton Dyer, Mechanical Engineer; Mr. Mandy, Sanitary Executive Engineer; Mr. Hubbell, Boring Engineer; Mr. Kirloskar Under Electrical Engineer; Mr. Dooris, Boring Engineer.

† Printed as an accompaniment.

APPENDIX XVI—*continued.*

Canals just closed, and the Pravara Canals. These ten districts have formed a very heavy charge for one Superintending Engineer.

11. When the construction of the enlarged Nira Canal was sanctioned, it was not considered advisable to entrust the three new construction districts to the Superintending Engineer, Southern Division, though this would appear to be numerically a more suitable division of labour. Though the Right Bank Canal lies partly in the Southern Division, Lake Whiting, the Left Bank Canal and the greater part of the Right Bank Canal are in the Central Division, and it was considered advisable to place the whole canal under one Superintending Engineer. The Southern Division is ill-provided with facilities for rapid communication. Ratnágiri and a considerable part of Kánara are shut off by the Western ghats with few roads for communication, mountainous and intersected by creeks running on land nearly to the foot of the ghats, and with no railways. On the other hand, the Central Division lies entirely upon the Deccan plateau, is well provided with railways running through each of the districts, and the headquarters are within easy access to the Nira Canal. It was, therefore, decided to place the three districts as a temporary measure under the Superintending Engineer, Central Division. But it is clear that this arrangement cannot be allowed to continue. Twelve Executive Districts, with an expenditure of more than Rs. 50 lakhs per annum, are too much for one officer to supervise, and the health of the officer and the public interests must suffer.

12. I am to say that the Governor in Council, after careful consideration, is of opinion that it is necessary that a new division of superintendence should be formed at once. This division would be called the Deccan Irrigation Division, and would comprise for the present the following Imperial Districts:—

(i) Násik and Ahmednagar Irrigation.
(ii) Pravara Canals.
(iii) Poona Irrigation.
(iv) Lake Whiting District, } Nira Right
(v) Lonand District } Bank
(vi) Málsiras District } Canal.

The expenditure of this division in 1913-1914 will be over Rs. 40 lakhs for works only, and is not likely to be less than this for the next five years at the least. It appears very probable that this division will be permanently required for the maintenance of the great canals with their complex system of intensive irrigation, but at present I am to ask only that the formation of the new division shall be sanctioned for five years as a temporary measure.

13. The Central Division will then comprise the following Provincial Districts:—

(i) East Khándesh. (iv) Ahmednagar.
(ii) West Khándesh. (v) Sholápur.
(iii) Násik. (vi) Poona.

The expenditure of these six districts is at present about Rs. 23 lakhs, excluding local fund works, and it is improbable that it will ever fall below Rs. 21 lakhs.

14. I am now to recapitulate very briefly the requirements put forward for the approval of the Government of India and the sanction of the Secretary of State:—

(*a*) The increase of the cadre of the Engineer Establishment from 100 to 132 and a recruitment of 6 men every year.

(*b*) The constitution of a new administrative division and appointment of an additional Superintending Engineer, 2nd Class, making a total of 7.

(*c*) As the present Superintending Engineer, Central Division, is much overworked, it is requested that the Secretary of State's sanction to (*b*) may be obtained by cable.

The necessary proposition statement in the prescribed form will be submitted on receipt of the approval of the Government of India to these proposals. It is difficult to calculate correctly the extra cost involved by the proposed increase in the scale as the additional staff is to be employed gradually. The Accountant-General, who was consulted in the matter, is unable to calculate it in the absence of actuarial tables. Roughly speaking, however, and assuming that the scale proposed will be fully worked up to, the extra cost will be about Rs. 7,000 per mensem as under:—

Excess.	Per mensem. Rs.	
1 Superintending Engineer, 2nd Class	1,750	
7 Executive Engineers (5 Imperial at the minimum rate of pay Rs. 800 and 2 Provincial at Rs. 535 per mensem)	4,000	
	1,070	
19 Assistant Engineers (13 at Rs. 380 per mensem and 6 at Rs. 250 per mensem)	4,940	
	1,500	
		13,260
Deduct cost of the 12 temporary Engineers referred to at end of paragraph 2 above:—	Rs.	
Mr. Benson	1,200	
Mr. Weatherdon	700	
Mr. Combi	550	
Mr. Bayliss	750	
Mr. Walker	620	
Mr. Bhandarkar	300	
Mr. Shaik Ebrahim	450	
Mr. Davies	450	
Mr. Bhagvat	500	
Mr. Goodwin	500	
Mr. Lyttle	250	
Mr. Naik	250	
		6,520
Total		6,740

I have the honour to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient servant,
H. V. R. KEMBALL,
Secretary to Government.

Accompaniment to this letter—1 Statement.

ACCOMPANIMENT TO ABOVE.

Statement showing the sanctioned scale of the Engineer Establishment, the actual strength, and the proposed strength necessary to meet normal requirements of the Bombay Public Works Department.

Cadre sanctioned in 1906 and as reduced (from 101 to 100) after the re-organization of 1908.						Actual strength.							Proposed strength.						Remarks.
1	C.E.* 2	S.E.* 3	E.E.* 4	A.E.* 5	Total. 6	7	C.E.* 8	S.E.* 9	E.E.* 10	A.E.* 11	T.E.* 12	Total. 13	14	C.E.* 15	S.E.* 16	E.E.* 17	A.E.* 18	Total. 19	20
Chief Engineer and Secretary to Government.	1	—	—	—	1	Chief Engineer and Secretary to Government.	1	—	—	—	—	1	Chief Engineer and Secretary to Government.	1	—	—	—	1	
Chief Engineer and Joint Secretary to Government.	1	—	—	—	1	Chief Engineer and Joint Secretary to Government.	1	—	—	—	—	1	Chief Engineer and Joint Secretary to Government.	1	—	—	—	1	
Chief Engineer in Sind having charge of the Indus River Commission.	—	1	—	1	2	Chief Engineer in Sind having charge of the Indus River Commission.	1	—	1	1	(2)	3	Chief Engineer in Sind having charge of the Indus River Commission.	1	—	—	3	4	
NORTHERN DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	1	NORTHERN DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	—	1	NORTHERN DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	1	
Provincial.						*Provincial.*							*Provincial.*						
(1) Ahmedabad	—	—	1	1	2	(1) Ahmedabad	—	—	1	1	—	2	(1) Ahmedabad	—	—	1	1	2	
(2) Kaira and Panch Mahals ...	—	—	1	1	2	(2) Kaira and Panch Mahals ...	—	—	1	—	—	1	(2) Kaira and Panch Mahals ...	—	—	1	2	3	
(3) Surat and Broach	—	—	1	1	2	(3) Surat and Broach	—	—	1	1	—	2	(3) Surat and Broach	—	—	1	1	2	
(4) Presidency	—	—	1	1	2	(4) Presidency	—	—	1	1	(1)	2	(4) Presidency	—	—	1	3	4	
(5) Thana	—	—	1	1	2	(5) Thana	—	—	2	—	—	2	(5) Thana	—	—	1	1	2	
						(6) Kolaba	—	—	1	—	—	1	(6) Kolaba	—	—	1	1	2	
Imperial.						*Imperial.*							*Imperial.*						
(6) Gujarat Irrigation	—	—	1	1	2	(7) Gujarat Irrigation	—	—	1	—	(1)	1	(7) Gujarat Irrigation	—	—	1	1	2	
CENTRAL DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	1	CENTRAL DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	—	1	CENTRAL DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	1	
Provincial.						*Provincial.*							*Provincial.*						
(7) East* Khandesh	—	—	1	1	2	(8) East Khandesh...	—	—	1	2	—	3	(8) East Khandesh...	—	—	1	1	2	* Formerly named as Khandesh District.
(8) West† Khandesh	—	—	1	1	2	(9) West Khandesh	—	—	1	—	—	1	(9) West Khandesh	—	—	1	1	2	† Formerly named as Khandesh Irrigation.
(9) Nasik	—	—	1	1	2	(10) Nasik	—	—	—	1	(1)	1	(10) Nasik	—	—	1	1	2	
(10) Ahmednagar	—	—	1	1	2	(11) Ahmednagar	—	—	—	1	(2)	1	(11) Ahmednagar	—	—	1	1	2	
(11) Sholapur...	—	—	1	1	2	(12) Sholapur	—	—	1	1	—	2	(12) Sholapur	—	—	1	2	3	
(12) Poona	—	—	1	1	2	(13) Poona	—	—	—	2	(1)	2	(13) Poona	—	—	1	1	2	
													DECCAN IRRIGATION DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	1	
Imperial.						*Imperial.*							*Imperial.*						
(13) Poona Irrigation	—	—	1	1	2	(14) Poona Irrigation	—	—	—	2	—	2	(14) Poona Irrigation	—	—	1	1	2	
(14) Nasik and Ahmednagar Irrigation.	—	—	1	1	2	(15) Nasik and Ahmednagar Irrigation.	—	—	—	3	—	3	(15) Nasik Irrigation	—	—	1	1	2	
						(16) Pravara Canals	—	—	1	4	(2)	5	(16) Ahmednagar Irrigation ...	—	—	1	2	3	
						(17) Lake Whiting...	—	—	1	1	—	2	(17) Nira Canal	—	—	1	3	4	
						(18) Lonand...	—	—	1	2	—	3							
						(19) Malsiras	—	—	2	2	—	4							

APPENDIX XVI—*continued.*

SOUTHERN DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	1	SOUTHERN DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	—	1	SOUTHERN DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	1							
Provincial.						*Provincial.*							*Provincial.*											
(15) Satara	—	—	1	1	2	(20) Satara	—	—	—	3	—	3	(18) Satara	—	—	1	2	3							
(16) Bijapur	—	—	1	1	2	(21) Bijapur...	—	—	1	—	—	1	(19) Bijapur...	—	—	1	1	2							
(17) Belgaum...	—	—	1	1	2	(22) Belgaum	—	—	1	—	—	1	(20) Belgaum	—	—	1	1	2							
(18) Dharwar...	—	—	1	1	2	(23) Dharwar	—	—	1	1	—	2	(21) Dharwar	—	—	1	1	2							
(19) Ratnagiri and Kolaba... ...	—	—	1	1	2	(24) Ratnagiri	—	—	1	1	—	2	(22) Ratnagiri	—	—	1	1	2							
(20) Kanara	—	—	1	1	2	(25) Kanara	—	—	1	—	—	1	(23) Kanara	—	—	1	1	2							
Imperial.						*Imperial.*							*Imperial.*											
(21) Dharwar Irrigation	—	—	1	1	2	(26) Dharwar Irrigation	—	—	1	1	—	2	(24) Dharwar Irrigation	—	—	1	1	2							
													(25) Gokak Canal	—	—	1	1	2							
INDUS RIGHT BANK DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	1	INDUS RIGHT BANK DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	—	1	INDUS RIGHT BANK DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	1							
Provincial.						*Provincial.*							*Provincial.*											
(22) Karachi Buildings and Roads	—	—	1	1	2	(27) Karachi Buildings	—	—	1	1	(1)	2	(26) Karachi Buildings	—	—	1	3	4							
Imperial.						*Imperial.*							*Imperial.*											
(23) Begari Canal	—	—	1	1	2	(28) Begari Canal	—	—	—	2	—	2	(27) Begari Canal	—	—	1	1	2							
(24) Shikarpur Canal	—	—	1	1	2	(29) Shikarpur Canal	—	—	1	1	—	2	(28) Shikarpur Canal	—	—	1	1	2							
(25) Ghar Canal	—	—	1	1	2	(30) Ghar Canal	—	—	—	1	—	1	(29) Ghar Canal	—	—	1	1	2							
(26) Western Nara	—	—	1	1	2	(31) Western Nara...	—	—	1	—	—	1	(30) Western Nara...	—	—	1	1	2							
(27) Karachi Canal	—	—	1	1	2	(32) Karachi Canal	—	—	—	2	—	2	(31) Karachi Canal	—	—	1	1	2							
(28) Survey and Construction ...	—	—	1	1	2																			
INDUS LEFT BANK DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	1	INDUS LEFT BANK DIVISION.	—	—	1	—	—	1	INDUS LEFT BANK DIVISION.	—	1	—	—	1							
Provincial.						*Provincial.*							*Provincial.*											
Nil	—	—	—	—	—	Nil	—	—	—	—	—	—	Nil	—	—	—	—	—							
Imperial.						*Imperial.*							*Imperial.*											
(29) Northern Hyderabad Canals...	—	—	1	1	2	(33) Northern Hyderabad Canals	—	—	1	—	—	1	(32) Northern Hyderabad Canals	—	—	1	1	2							
(30) Central Hyderabad Canals ...	—	—	1	1	2	(34) Central Hyderabad Canals ...	—	—	—	1	—	1	(33) Central Hyderabad Canals ...	—	—	1	1	2							
(31) Fuleli	—	—	1	1	2	(35) Fuleli	—	—	1	—	—	1	(34) Fuleli Canal	—	—	1	2	3							
(32) Eastern Nara	—	—	1	1	2	(36) Eastern Nara	—	—	1	1	—	2	(35) Eastern Nara	—	—	1	1	2							
(33) Jamrao Canal (Northern Division).	—	—	1	1	2	(37) Jamrao Canal	—	—	—	4	—	4	(36) Jamrao Canal	—	—	1	4	5							
(34) Jamrao Canal (Southern Division).	—	—	1	1	2								(37) Sukkur Barrage and Rohri Canal.	—	—	1	3	4							
													(38) Sukkur Barrage and Rohri Canal.	—	—	1	3	4							
SANITARY ENGINEER.	—	1	—	—	1	SANITARY ENGINEER.*	—	—	—	1	—	1	SANITARY ENGINEER.	—	1	—	—	1	* This appointment is temporarily held by the Temporary Engineer in charge Poona Drainage and Water-supply in addition to his own duties.						
						Provincial.																			
						(38) Poona Drainage and Water-supply.	—	—	—	—	(1)	—													
													Provincial.											
													(39) Northern Sanitary District...	—	—	1	1	2							
													(40) Southern Sanitary District ...	—	—	1	1	2							
Carried forward ...	2	3	14	15	34		3	2	17	25	(10)	47		3	3	17	27	50							

* For note *see* next page.

Statement showing the sanctioned scale of the Engineer Establishment, the actual strength, and the proposed strength necessary to meet normal requirements of the Bombay Public Works Department—continued.

Cadre sanctioned in 1906 and as reduced (from 101 to 100) after the re-organization of 1908.						Actual strength.							Proposed strength.						Remarks.
	C.E.*	S.E.*	E.E.*	A.E.*	Total.		C.E.*	S.E.*	E.E.*	A.E.*	T.E.*	Total.		C.E.*	S.E.*	E.E.*	A.E.*	Total.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20
Brought forward ...	2	3	14	15	34		3	2	17	25	(10)	47		3	3	17	27	50	
SECRETARIAT.						SECRETARIAT.							SECRETARIAT.						
35) Under Secretary to Government.	—	—	1	1	2	(39) Under Secretary	—	—	—	1	—	1	(41) Under Secretary	—	—	1	—	1	
(36) Under Secretary to Government.	—	—	1	1	2	(40) Under Secretary	—	—	—	1	—	1	(42) Under Secretary	—	—	1	—	1	
ADDITIONAL CHARGES.						ADDITIONAL CHARGES.							ADDITIONAL CHARGES.						
(37) and (38)	—	—	2	2	4	Nil	—	—	—	—	—	—	Nil	—	—	—	—	—	
Consulting Architect to Government.	—	—	—	—	—	Consulting Architect to Government.	—	—	—	2	—	2	Consulting Architect to Government.	—	—	—	—	—	
Absentees at 17 per cent.	—	—	8	6	14†	Absentees	—	1	9	3	—	13	Absentees	—	—	8	11	19	† In the sanctioned cadre the number is 15, but the reduction of 1 to bring down the total from 101 to 100 is taken here.
Foreign Service, lent, &c.	—	—	—	—	—	Foreign Service	—	1	4	1	—	6	Foreign Service	—	—	—	—	—	
Total	2	7	46	45	100	Total	3	6	43	53	(12)	105	Total	3	7	50	72	132	

* C.E.=Chief Engineer.
S.E.=Superintending Engineer.
E.E.=Executive Engineer.
A.E.=Assistant Engineer.
T.E.=Temporary Engineer.

ANNEXURE D.

No. 2309-E

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA. PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.
Establishments.

From The Honourable Mr. R. P. RUSSELL, Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department, to The SECRETARY to the GOVERNMENT of BOMBAY, Public Works Department.

Simla, the 31st October 1913.

Sir,

I am directed to refer to your letter No. E.—4418, dated the 23rd April 1913, submitting the proposals mentioned below in connection with the cadre of the Engineer Establishment in the Bombay Presidency:—

(1) that a sixth administrative division be constituted, for a period of five years in the first instance, by splitting up the Central Division, and that an additional appointment of Superintending Engineer, class II, be sanctioned for that period for the charge of the new Division;

(2) that the cadre be increased from 100 to 132 Engineers;

(3) that six Assistant Engineers be recruited annually.

2. The Government of India concur in the conclusion come to by the Government of Bombay that the Central Division as at present constituted is too heavy a charge for a single Superintending Engineer to administer efficiently. They also think it possible that an additional Division will be required for the next five years, as suggested by the local Government; but they consider that pending the fixation of the cadre of the Engineer establishment in the Bombay Presidency—a matter which has already been referred to the Secretary of State—it will be better to create the new division for a period of two years in the first instance. It is for this reason that in their telegram No. 1683-E., dated the 29th August 1913, they sanctioned the creation of an additional Superintending Engineership for that period only. The additional appointment being a temporary one, cannot be added to the 2nd class of Superintending Engineerships, as proposed by the Government of Bombay, but must in accordance with the usual practice in such cases be placed in the lowest class.

3. With regard to the proposals relating to the increase of the cadre, I am to point out that the calculations on which the proposals are based do not follow the principles relating to the calculation of the strength of a cadre with reference to a given number of "superior posts." The increase in the number of inferior appointments proposed by the Government of Bombay is out of all proportion to the number of superior posts available in the Presidency if an equable flow of promotion is to be assured and if blocks are to be avoided. As explained in paragraphs 5 and 6 of Sir Lionel Jacob's letter No. 1220-E., dated the 8th July 1908, the total strength of the Imperial Engineer cadre is determined by the number of superior posts to be filled by Imperial engineers. It was stated in that letter that in order to fill 100 such posts with officers of over seven years' service, and to allow for the filling of leave vacancies, a strength of 178 officers was necessary. Since then the period for which an officer must serve before he becomes eligible for promotion to a superior post has, by the orders contained in the Government of India, Public Works Department, Resolution No. 439—458-E., dated the 15th May 1912, been extended to 10 years, and consequently a larger number of officers will now be required to fill the same number of posts. It has been calculated that under the new conditions of service a total strength of 211 Imperial officers, of whom 125 will be over 10 years' service, is required for every 100 superior posts. The total strength of the Provincial Engineer Service throughout India is at present fixed at 280 officers, of whom, it is calculated, 148 will be officers of over 10 years' service. Of the 280 officers, 30, as explained in paragraph 3 of Sir Lionel Jacob's letter of 8th July, 1908, form the share of the Bombay Presidency, and of the latter 16 will be officers of over 10 years' service. In order to admit of an equable flow of promotion to superior posts, it has been estimated that under the new conditions of service 133 superior posts should be provided for the Provincial Engineer Service. The proportion of superior posts to be filled eventually by the members of that service in the Bombay Presidency is therefore 14.

4. In determining the strength of the cadre the Government of Bombay propose to take into account the probable requirements 25 years hence, when certain large works now in course of construction or in contemplation are expected to be completed. I am, however, to observe that the Secretary of State has laid down the principle that the permanent Engineer staff should be regulated by the ascertained requirements of the service for the discharge of the duties which may certainly be reckoned upon as recurrent year by year, irrespective of any new large undertakings, provision for which should be made when necessary by the employment of temporary Engineers. In accordance with this principle, no provision can at present be made in the cadre of the Engineer establishment in the Bombay Presidency for the permanent establishment which may eventually be required for the maintenance of works the estimates for the construction of which have not yet even been sanctioned, such as the Gokok canal, and the Sukkur Barrage and Rohri canal. Nor is it usual to make provision in the regular cadre for other than existing permanent superior charges. Thus provision can at the present time be made in the cadre only for the new Kolaba district. In regard to the two sanitary districts (northern and southern), the constitution of which has been recommended in your letter No. E.-5372, dated the 20th May 1913, I am to mention that the Government of India are considering these two new charges in connection with the general question of the increase of th Sanitary Engineering establishments throughout India, and their orders on this proposal will be communicated separately to the Government of Bombay.

5. It appears from paragraph 4 of your letter of the 23rd April 1913 that including the Kolaba district there are at present 35 permanent executive charges. Adding to these the two posts for special and extra divisions and the 9 permanent administrative posts (3 Chief Engineerships and 6 Superintending Engineerships), the total number of permanent superior posts in the Presidency amounts to 46. The strength of the cadre based on existing permanent charges should, therefore, in accordance with the principles mentioned in paragraph 4 above, be 98 officers, that is, two less than the number sanctioned in 1908; but in view of the large amount of construction work in the Bombay Presidency, and of the fact that more than one regular division will probably be required when the existing construction work is completed, there is of course no question of effecting any reduction.

6. I am accordingly to remit the case to the Government of Bombay and to request that their proposals may be reconsidered in the light of the foregoing remarks.

7. As regards the question of recruitment raised in paragraph 9 of your letter, I am to say that the number of Imperial Assistant Engineers to be recruited annually is determined with reference to the total strength of the Engineer cadre for the whole of India, and that this number is distributed among the various provinces with reference to the state of the cadre of each. This year three Imperial recruits will be posted to the Bombay Presidency and it is understood that two Provincial Assistant Engineers* have been appointed, making five recruits in all.

I have, &c.,
(Signed) R. P. RUSSELL,
Secretary to the Government of India.

ANNEXURE E.

No. E.—150 OF 1914.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT:
Bombay Castle, 7th January 1914.

From H. F. BEALE, ESQ., M.INST.C.E., Secretary to the Government of Bombay, to the SECRETARY to the GOVERNMENT of INDIA, Public Works Depart-Department.

SIR, *Establishments.*

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of Mr. leMaistre's letter No. E.—1608, dated 15th August 1913, and to reply as follows.

2. The Governor in Council accepts the decision of the Government of India that the charge allowance of Rs. 100 a month given to each of the Under Secretaries cannot as such be increased because it is

* One Indian College recruit confirmed.
One promoted Subordinate.

given only as a remuneration for the arduous and responsible nature of their duties.

3. But I am to state that when the Bombay Government in their Financial Department No. 3659 of the 7th October 1909, accepted the draft rules proposed by the Government of India in their letter, Finance Department, No. 3367-F. O. and A., dated 3rd July 1909, they appear to have not fully appreciated the effect of rule V.

4. In Mr. Deputy Secretary leMaistre's letter now under reply it is practically affirmed that the new house allowance is all that can be granted to an officer to compensate him "for the extra cost of living in Bombay." I am to say that when the Government of Bombay submitted their house allowance scheme they based their figures of compensation entirely upon the calculated difference between what an officer paid as house rent and 10 per cent. of his pay. The grant of a presidency or local allowance on the other hand was given to compensate for the higher cost of living in Bombay, which is quite apart from the incidence of house rent, and is a heavy tax on bachelors as well as on married people. To abolish the latter compensation because the former has been brought up to the bare limit, which makes it serve its own purpose, is, this Government submits, much the same as to give a man a better house and deprive him of the adequate means of living in it.

5. When the Government of Bombay first submitted their proposals (in their Financial Department letter No. 1588, dated 13th April 1909) to the Government of India, they expressed their approval of the Bombay Committee's report and suggestions. In paragraph 5 of the letter a special stipulation was made that certain officers drawing local allowances should continue to draw them, and in paragraph 12 of the report the expression was used "these house allowances should be granted . . . . in lieu of the house rent allowances now drawn by them."

The Government of India in their answering letter No. 3367, Finance Department, already referred to, took no exception to the above, and when the scheme subsequently received the sanction of the Secretary of State, the Government of Bombay, overlooking the effect of rule V, issued their Government Resolution No. 1045, Financial Department, dated 23rd March 1911. Statement II (*a*) on page 19 of that Government Resolution set out clearly the allowances admissible to certain officers, and it was not until May 1912, more than a year later, that any question on the subject arose. The Accountant General, Bombay, then referred to rule V and refused to pass the presidency allowance for the Under Secretary, Public Works Department, in addition to the new house rent allowance. In answer to Mr. Secretary Hill's letter No. E.—6043, dated 3rd July 1912, explaining the case, the Government of India, in their letter No. 1131-E., dated 10th October 1913, supported the Accountant General's view.

6. A reference to the Bombay notes and minutes underlying the whole case shows that this decision was unexpected and in opposition to the original proposals of the Government of Bombay. I am to attach a statement showing in detail how not only the Under Secretaries, Public Works Department, but also the other Public Works Department executive officers stationed in Bombay are affected by the above ruling. The result works out as follows:—

Public Works Department Officer.	Original allowances, married or single.	Present allowances M. = Married S. = single or wife at home.	Loss per annum.
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Under Secretary	2,940	M. 2,700	240
	2,940	S. 1,200	1,740
Executive Engineer, Presidency	1,740	M. 1,500	240
	1,740	S. 0	1,740
Assistant Engineer, Rs. 620 and upwards.	Same as Executive Engineer.		
Assistant Engineer, Rs. 500 to 580.	960	M. 1,500	Gain 540
	960	S. 0	Loss 960
Assistant Engineer, less than Rs. 500.	840	M. 990	Gain 150
	840	S. 0	Loss 840

Thus with two small exceptions these officers on being admitted to the benefits of the new house allowance scheme incur a loss of from Rs. 240 to Rs. 1,740 per annum. Considering that the previous allowances were deemed insufficient and that the new scheme was designed to ameliorate the condition of Government officers living in Bombay, the fact that the Public Works Department officers actually lose more or less heavily by the concession referred to in Rule V is in the opinion of this Government somewhat disappointing.

7. The Governor in Council is convinced that when the Government of India wrote their Finance Department letter No. 638-Ex., dated 31st January 1907, inviting the Government of Bombay to prepare a scheme of house rent allowances for their Presidency town, it was not their intention to reduce the emoluments of men drawing comparatively low pay. In these circumstances I am directed to urge very strongly upon the Government of India the necessity of granting again the presidency and other allowances for the Public Works Department officers referred to, with a view to the removal of a very real and grevious hardship.

8. It appears that the Government of India anticipated the possibility of some modification of the conditions being required, because in their despatch No. 117, Finance Department, dated 26th May 1910, forwarding the scheme to the Secretary of State they wrote:—

"Paragraph 4. We enclose statements of the appointments which, as at present advised, we propose to admit to the scheme. They will be subjected to further scrutiny, particularly in respect of the withdrawal of local allowances sanctioned on account of the high cost of house rents in Bombay and are now sent up merely in order to afford an indication of the cost of the scheme."

In these circumstances I am to express a hope that they will take a favourable view of the present representation.

9. So far I have dealt with the principle of restoring the presidency allowance to the Public Works Department officers for the reasons stated. I am directed now to make a further representation to the effect that Rs. 100 per annum is a totally inadequate figure for the presidency allowance. To prove this I am to attach a copy of letter No. 4946, dated 13th June 1913, from Mr. A. H. Whyte, Executive Engineer, Presidency, a man of simple tastes, who is married and has a small family. His pay till last October was Rs. 850, and as his wife is in India he draws Rs. 125 average house-rent. Deducting income-tax and contribution to the General Provident Fund his net pay amounts to Rs. 847, while his expenses are shown to be Rs. 909 exclusive of doctor's bills and savings for passage home and for additions to furlough pay.

10. It is evident that unless an officer of this standing has a private income he must run into debt in Bombay, and Government cannot consider this a fair condition of service. The Executive Engineer, Presidency, has very onerous duties to perform and he must be specially selected for his capability and energy. The billet, far from being a prize for good officers, may rightly be regarded as an appointment to be shunned in the present circumstances.

11. There can be no doubt that the cost of living in Bombay, quite apart from house rent, has increased considerably in recent years, and the arguments as to dearness of living apply equally to the other Public Works Department officers in Bombay. I am therefore to recommend the following scale of presidency allowances as suitable for the various ranks:

	Pay.	Presidency allowance.
	Rs.	Rs.
Executive Engineer, Presidency	800 to 1,250 per mensem.	250 per mensem.
Under Secretaries who rank as Executive Engineers.	800 (usually)	250
Assistant Engineer	380 to 750	150

APPENDIX XVI—*continued.*

If the allowance be granted, I am to ask that it may be sanctioned with retrospective effect from the date mentioned opposite the name of each of the officers in the footnote.*

12. In conclusion, I am to summarise the proposals put forward by this Government as follows:—

(*a*) The presidency and other allowances previously given, excepting the old house rent allowance, should not be withdrawn from the Public Works Department officers, as the new house rent allowances were not designed to do more than replace the old house rent allowances in Bombay, which had been proved to be inadequate.

(*b*) The presidency or local allowances, which were previously limited to Rs. 100 per mensem, are (like the old house rent allowances) found to be insufficient, and should be raised to Rs. 250 for Executive Engineers and Rs. 150 for Assistant Engineers permanently stationed in Bombay.

I am to express the most earnest hope that the Government of India will be able to treat this case in a sympathetic manner, as the efficiency of the administration and the execution of the many important works in hand and projected in the City of Bombay must suffer, if officers are overwhelmed with private cares and difficulties in their everyday life.

I have the honour to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient Servant,
H. F. BEALE,
Secretary to Government.

Accompaniment to above letter:—

No. 4946 of 1913.

From A. H. Whyte, Esquire, Executive Engineer, Presidency, to the Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, Bombay.

Executive Engineer's Office,
Public Works Department,
Bombay, 13th June 1913.

SIR,

I HAVE the honour to represent the following facts for the favourable consideration of Government.

2. I have now been serving for a period of 10 years in Bombay, first as Assistant Engineer under the Consulting Architect to Government and later as Executive Engineer, Presidency District, to which post I was appointed in March 1912 on a salary of Rs. 800 per mensem.

3. Up till now, the post of Executive Engineer, Presidency, has nearly always been held by an officer considerably senior in rank and consequently drawing a higher salary.

4. In my present position, my expenses are very much more than I would be likely to incur in the districts, and although I receive a House Rent Allowance of Rs. 125 $\frac{(80 + 170)}{2}$ average for the year, I find it quite impossible to live on my salary, as a statement of my average monthly expenses given below† shows; and were it not for the fact that I have a small private income, I should be compelled to run into debt or ask for a transfer.

5. My total emoluments are Rs. 850 + 125, average House Rent, from which Income Tax of Rs. 22 is deducted, also my subscription to the General Provident Fund of Rs. 106, giving a net total of Rs. 847 per mensem. I am thus quite unable to save anything for going home for the benefit of my health, to see my child, or even to send my wife home or to the hills should necessity arise, and for other emergencies, such as Doctors' fees for my wife and family.

6. I do not think it will be denied that the cost of living in Bombay has increased very considerably in the last 10 years, especially house rent.

7. Mr. Hill gave me to understand that one of the reasons why I was chosen for the post was my long experience of Bombay and local conditions; but had I been allowed to remain on in Dhárwár District, I should certainly have been able to live within my pay and probably to have saved something.

8. Further, I should like to mention the case of Assistant Engineers stationed in Bombay. At the present moment, I have only one Assistant Engineer who is drawing House Rent and Local Allowance under the old scheme in addition to his salary; but should he be transferred out of Bombay—no matter for how short a period—he would, on returning to Bombay, be compelled to forego the allowances under the new rules or accept a smaller one in its place, if he be married. This applies to all Assistant Engineers posted to Bombay.

9. Assistant Engineers' expenses are greatly enhanced the moment they arrive in Bombay and unless they are assisted by means of a local allowance, say Rs. 150 per mensem, or by private means they are likely to get into debt.

10. I would respectfully request that Government will be pleased to sanction to all Executive and Assistant Engineers who may be stationed in Bombay, Local Allowances at the rates of Rs. 250 and 150, respectively, and in my own special case with retrospective effect from the date I took over charge of the office.

I have the honour to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient servant,
A. H. WHYTE,
Executive Engineer, Presidency.

†

	Rs.
For house rent	240
For servants	115
For food, coal, electric light, &c....	260
For clothing for self and family and upkeep of household linen	95
For schooling of child in Scotland	75
For conveyance	50
For club bills	25
For insurance premium	49
Total	909

* Mr. A. H. Whyte, Executive Engineer, Presidency District, 13th March 1912; Mr. H. J. M. Cousens, B.Sc. (Eng.), Executive Engineer and Under Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, Roads and Buildings Branch, 11th December 1912; Mr. E. M. Duggan, B.Sc. (Eng.), A.M.I.C.E., Executive Engineer and Under Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, Irrigation and Railways, 17th November 1912; Mr. J. C. Gammon, B.Sc. (Eng.), A.C.G.I., Assistant Engineer under the Consulting Architect to Government, 12th April 1913, with a short break of about a month when he was sent to Sind.

APPENDIX XVII.

Memorandum prepared by the Administration of the Central Provinces and Berar relating to the Public Works Department.

1. The present regulations as to recruitment, training and probation, and whether these regulations are satisfactory.

(*a*) *Imperial Service.*—The Regulations for the appointment of officers to the Imperial Service of the Public Works Department are given as Appendix VIII of the Memorandum on the Department prepared by the Government of India for the Royal Commission.

(*b*) *Royal Engineers.*—Officers are selected from the Corps of Royal Engineers on the Indian Establishment, and are appointed permanently at once in the 3rd or 2nd Grade of Assistant Engineers. Officers whom it is considered desirable to appoint to a higher grade than that of Assistant Engineer, 1st Grade, are posted as supernumeraries for a period of six months, after which a report is made as to their qualifications.

These officers are liable for recall to Military duty and form a War Reserve.

(*c*) *Provincial Service.*—The Regulations for the Provincial Service are contained in Appendix I of the Memorandum referred to above. The probationary period for qualified students is ordinarily one year.

(*d*) *Remarks.*—The system of recruitment, training, and probation at present in force is working satisfactorily on the whole, and the Officiating Chief Commissioner has no suggestions to make for its improvement.

The organisation of the service is, however, not on a satisfactory basis, and the system by which officers on the same list doing the same class of work are divided into Imperial and Provincial according as they are recruited in England or India is unsound.

The distinction between the two branches of the service proposed by the Public Service Commission of 1886, and introduced in 1892, was practically abandoned in the orders contained in Government of India, Public Works Department, Resolution No. 439—458-E., dated the 15th May, 1912, and the retention of the names Imperial and Provincial serves no useful purpose.

2. At the same time the training afforded by the Engineering Colleges in England is still superior to that which can be procured in India and will continue to be so for many years to come. This is due partly to the superior equipment of those Colleges, and so far as this defect is concerned, it would no doubt be possible to provide a remedy by establishing a fully equipped Engineering College in India. Such a College will not, however, succeed in producing Engineers on a large scale equal to those that can be trained in England, for in industrial development India is far behind England, and it is the industrial development of a country with its large demand for trained Engineers and its opportunities for their practical training more than the equipment of the College that secures a highly trained Engineer. Until, therefore, the industries of India have expanded more than they have done at present, it seems improbable that the best of the Indian trained Engineers will be equal to the best of those trained in England, and as the presence of Engineers trained in the best school available is essential to the maintenance of the high efficiency of the service, it is, in Mr. Crump's opinion, desirable to continue to recruit a certain proportion of the higher branch of the Public Works Department from England.

It is also desirable to employ members of the Corps of Royal Engineers in the service as a convenient way of maintaining the War Reserve required for Military purposes.

The balance of the Engineers required to complete the cadre would be recruited direct from the Engineering Colleges in India and in every exceptional cases by promotion from the subordinate ranks.

It appears from page 8 of the Memorandum prepared by the Government of India on the Public Works Department that at present the number of vacancies occurring each year is about 37 and that these are filled as follows:—

20 (including 10 per cent. of Indians) recruited in England.

14 recruited in India, 9–10 in alternate years by direct appointment from Indian Colleges.

3 from Royal Engineers.

These proportions are at present suitable, though when the expansion of industries in India leads to an increased demand for Engineers for private employ in India and an improvement of the supply of locally trained Engineers, it will no doubt be possible to replace a portion of the Engineers recruited in England by men trained at the Indian Colleges.

The question of the rates of pay and allowances and the rules for leave and pension for officers recruited in England and India, depends not on the fact that the majority of the former are English and of the latter Indian, but on the market value of their services. Engineers trained in English Colleges are to be found in every part of the world, and have a far larger field of employment open to them than those trained in Indian Colleges, and are thus able to command a higher price in the market. Many Engineers working in England earn far more than India can afford to pay, and those that are willing to go to Foreign Countries such as South America, or to the Colonies such as Australia or Africa, command a higher wage than their equals who stay in England.

If India, therefore, wishes to obtain any portion of its Engineering staff from England, as it must for many years to come if efficiency of the service is to be maintained, it must be prepared to pay for them, and the rates of pay recently sanctioned for the Imperial Service require no change. It applies equally to all, whether English or Indian. At present the members of the Provincial Service, who are recruited in India, are paid at approximately two-thirds of the rate of pay sanctioned for those recruited in England until they rise to the rank of Chief Engineer. Owing to the absence of any large demand for their services outside Government employ, their present market value is less than that of the Engineers trained in England, and the present rates of pay require no alteration, except that on selection as Superintending Engineer both classes should be paid alike, for such selection shows that their market value has become the same.

2. The rates of pay and allowances in force in 1890 and 1900 and at the present time, and whether the present rates of pay and allowances are satisfactory.

The rates of pay and allowances in 1890, 1900, and at the present time are given below:—

(*a*) *Imperial Service.*

1890.		1900.		1913.	
Rank.	Pay.	Rank.	Pay.	Rank.	Pay.
	Rs.		Rs.		Rs.
Chief Engineer—		Chief Engineer—		Chief Engineer (*a*)—	
1st Class	2,500	1st Class	2,500	1st Class	2,750
2nd ,, ...	2,000	2nd ,, ...	2,500	2nd ,, ...	2,500
3rd ,, ...	1,800	3rd ,, ...	1,800		
Superintending Engineer—		Superintending Engineer—		Superintending Engineer—	
1st Class	1,600	1st Class	1,600	1st Class	2,000
2nd ,, ...	1,350	2nd ,, ...	1,400	2nd ,, ...	1,750
3rd ,, ...	1,100	3rd ,, ...	1,250	3rd ,, ...	1,500
Executive Engineer—		Executive Engineer—		Executive Engineer (*b*)—	
1st Grade	950	1st Grade	1,000	11th to 20th and following years of service.	800—50—1,250
2nd ,, ...	800	2nd ,, ...	850		
3rd ,, ...	700	3rd ,, ...	700		
4th ,, ...	600				
Assistant Engineer—		Assistant Engineer—		Assistant Engineer—	
1st Grade	500	1st Grade	550	1st to 9th year of service...	380—40—700
2nd ,, ...	350	2nd ,, ...	450		
3rd ,, ...	250	3rd ,, ...	350	10th year of service ...	750
		Old 3rd Grade	250		
Apprentice Engineer	100				

(*a*)—1913—Local allowance Rs. 150 per mensem is drawn by a Secretary and Joint Secretary to Local Administration, *vide* paragraph 10 of Public Works Department Code, Volume I.

(*b*)—1913—Local allowance of Rs. 100 per mensem is drawn by Under Secretary to the Chief Commissioner, Public Works Department, Central Provinces.

APPENDIX XVII—*continued.*

(*b*) *Royal Engineers.*—In 1890 and 1900 Royal Engineer Officers in Civil employment in the Public Works Department might receive their net Military pay in addition to the pay of their Civil grade, or their staff salary plus Military pay and allowances. In 1913 Royal Engineer Officers who joined the Public Works Department after the 11th February 1910 draw pay at the rates given above for Imperial Engineers.

(*c*) *Provincial Service.*

1900.		1913.	
Rank.	Pay.	Rank.	Pay.
	Rs.		Rs.
Superintending Engineer—		Superintending Engineer—	
1st Class ...	1,050	1st Class	1,600
2nd „ ...	900	2nd „	1,400
3rd „ ...	750	3rd „	1,200
Executive Engineer—		Executive Engineer—	
1st Grade ...	650	11th year of service to 20th.	535–35–850
2nd „ ...	550		
3rd „ ...	475		
Assistant Engineer—		Assistant Engineer—	
1st Grade ...	400	1st year of service to 10th.	250–25–475
2nd „ ...	350		
3rd „ ...	250		
Apprentices	100	Apprentices	100

* NOTE.—Apprentice Engineers, other than qualified students appointed from the Thomason College, Rurki, may, after 6 months' satisfactory service, receive Rs. 150 per mensem.

A special increment of Rs. 50 may be granted by the Local Administration to a deserving Executive Engineer who, after completion of 5 years on the maximum pay of Rs. 850, is not promoted to Administrative rank.

The Provincial Service was organised in 1892.

For Chief Engineers of the Provincial Service the rates of pay are the same as those of the Imperial Service given above.

(*d*) *Remarks.*—Subject to the proposals made under head I for a reorganisation of the service and the fixing of the pay of officers recruited in India at two-thirds of that of those recruited in England, the present rates of pay are generally suitable. In the case, however, of Superintending and Chief Engineers, the present orders by which these posts are graded do not always work fairly. Superintending Engineers are appointed and promoted by the Local Government, but as an officer is ordinarily promoted to the rank of Superintending Engineer after 20 years' service, the division into classes may result in his never attaining the highest class before the time comes for him to retire. A time-scale would, in Mr. Crump's opinion, work more equitably, and he recommends the abolition of classes for Superintending Engineers, and that the pay of these officers be fixed at Rs. 1,500—100—2,000, with the proviso that no officer under 22 years' service should be eligible for increments even if appointed permanently as a Superintending Engineer.

In the case of Chief Engineers also, Mr. Crump is in favour of the abolition of the second class, and the pay of Chief Engineers being fixed at Rs. 2,750.

3. The number of posts in each grade, and the provision, if any, made in the cadre for leave and training.

The number of sanctioned posts is as follows (which includes a provision of one Superintending Engineer, one Executive Engineer and one Assistant Engineer for Central India):—

Post.	Number.
Chief Engineers (*a*)	2
Superintending Engineers	5
1st Class, 1.	
2nd Class, 2.	
3rd Class, 2 (*b*).	
Executive Engineers (*c*)	18
Assistant Engineers	16

(*a*) Including one Chief Engineer, 2nd Class, sanctioned for two years.

(*b*) Including one Superintending Engineer sanctioned for two years.

(*c*) Including one Executive Engineer sanctioned for the post of second Under Secretary, Public Works Department, for two years.

The sanctioned provision for absentees is 7 posts, or 20 per cent. of 35, which was the former strength of the Department, making a total sanctioned strength of 48, though the actual strength is at present 49.

The following statement shows the present distribution of the 49 posts between Imperial and Provincial:—

Rank.	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Chief Engineer ...	2	—	2
Superintending Engineer	5	—	5
Executive Engineer ...	20	3	23
Assistant Engineer ...	8	11	19
	35	14	49

4. What appointments outside the authorised cadre are held, temporarily or otherwise, by officers of the service.

Outside the number of sanctioned posts detailed under the previous head, there is one post of Sanitary Engineer, Central Provinces, held by an Executive Engineer of the Public Works Department.

Besides the sanctioned cadre, Temporary Engineers, in numbers varying as occasion demands, are employed in the Department on pay ranging from Rs. 150 to Rs. 750 per mensem. At present 28 Temporary Engineers are entertained.

5. Whether any addition is required to the present cadre.

The existing scale of permanent establishment provides for:—

Roads and Buildings Branch—

One Chief Engineer.

Two Superintending Engineers.

Nine Divisional Charges.

One Under Secretary in the Public Works Department.

Irrigation Branch—

One Chief Engineer sanctioned temporarily for two years.

Two Superintending Engineers—one sanctioned temporarily for two years.

Four Divisional Charges.

One Under Secretary in the Public Works Department, sanctioned temporarily for two years.

This cadre, even including the appointments sanctioned temporarily, is not sufficient to carry on the large programme of work which the rapid development of the Province requires, and the necessity of a large increase of permanent establishment has been pressed frequently on the Government of India, and the proposals are only held in abeyance pending the Report of the Royal Commission on the Public Services.

Temporary Engineers should only be employed to carry out the construction of large works with which the permanent staff cannot deal, and all ordinary work and maintenance should be entrusted to the permanent staff, the strength of which should be fixed accordingly.

Taking first the supervising staff, with the large Irrigation works now under construction, such as the Tendula Canal, the Mahanadi Canal and the Weinganga Canal, the maintenance of which will have to be provided for, it is clear that the temporary appointments of a Chief Engineer, a Superintending Engineer and an Under Secretary which have been only sanctioned temporarily for two years, will be needed permanently.

The maintenance of these works and the construction of further Minor and Major Irrigation works of

which the Province stands in need and the maintenance of such works and of those already constructed will also require an addition to the existing four Divisions in the Irrigation Branch, and in 1910 and again in 1912 and in 1913 the Government of India were asked to sanction the creation of three new Irrigation Divisions with a staff of three Executive Engineers and three Assistant Engineers.

In the Roads and Buildings Branch the work of the Nagpur Division has increased so enormously that it has been found necessary to divide it into three Divisions, two with headquarters at Nagpur and one at Chanda. Two of these Divisions are at present only temporary, and in 1910 the necessity of making the Chanda Division permanent was pressed on the Government of India. Since then the pressure has increased, and Mr. Crump considers that with the large area of the Nagpur Division and the importance of its roads and buildings it will be necessary to make the third Division also permanent, if the principle that Temporary Engineers should be employed only as temporary additions to the permanent staff is to be maintained. Two Executive Engineers and two Assistant Engineers are therefore required in the Roads and Buildings Branch.

The permanent additions to the Cadre now needed are:—

Chief Engineer ...	1	At present sanction exists for two years only with effect from the 12th November, 1912.
Superintending Engineer	1	Sanctioned for two years only which will expire in November 1914.
Executive Engineers	6	Including one Executive Engineer sanctioned for Under Secretary's post in the Irrigation Branch for two years from the 13th November, 1912.
Assistant Engineers	5	
Total	13	
Absentees at 20 per cent.	3	
Total Engineer officers required	16	

APPENDIX XVIII.

STATEMENT, with details by PROVINCES, of the CIVIL APPOINTMENTS on Rs. 200 a Month and over held by EUROPEANS, ANGLO-INDIANS, and INDIANS on the 1st April, 1913, in the PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

TOTAL STATEMENT.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.														
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).											
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kayasthas (including Parbhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs, and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian-Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	224	31	27	72	13	16	22	6	9	138	5	2	145	11	7	3
300—400	117	38	13	14	11	7	11	5	6	54	4	1	59	5	2	—
400—500	147	68	18	20	9	6	7	—	5	47	4	3	54	4	2	1
500—600	103	84	3	5	3	1	1	1	—	11	—	1	12	2	2	—
600—700	111	93	1	6	4	—	3	1	2	16	—	—	16	—	1	—
700—800	57	47	3	3	—	2	—	—	1	6	—	1	7	—	—	—
800—900	51	47	1	1	—	—	—	—	1	2	—	—	2	—	1	—
900—1,000	27	25	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	—	1	2	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	60	42	2	7	—	4	2	—	2	15	—	—	15	—	1	—
1,200—1,400	93	66	7	11	—	2	—	—	1	14	—	3	17	—	3	—
1,400—1,600	19	15	3	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	22	21	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	19	15	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	1	—	—
2,500—3,000	16	16	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	1,066	608	80	140	40	40	46	14	27	307	13	12	332	23	19	4

APPENDIX XVIII—*continued.*

DETAILS OF PROVINCES.

I.—*Madras.*

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).										Muhammadans.	Indian-Christians.	Buddhists.
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).			
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	45	8	3	28	—	—	—	3	—	31	—	—	31	—	3	—
300—400	17	4	2	5	—	—	—	4	—	9	—	—	9	—	2	—
400—500	21	8	2	9	—	1	—	—	1	11	—	—	11	—	—	—
500—600	14	10	—	3	—	—	—	1	—	4	—	—	4	—	—	—
600—700	11	9	—	2	—	—	—	—	—	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
700—800	6	5	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
800—900	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	5	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—
1,000—1,200	9	7	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	1	1	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	20	16	—	3	—	—	—	—	—	3	—	—	4	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,500—3,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	161	85	7	52	—	1	—	8	1	62	—	1	63	—	6	—

II.—*Bombay.*

Rs.																
200—300	49	6	2	18	5	3	8	—	2	36	—	2	38	—	3	—
300—400	16	6	—	5	2	—	1	—	1	9	—	1	10	—	—	—
400—500	22	11	2	4	2	—	—	—	—	6	—	3	9	—	—	—
500—600	20	15	—	1	1	—	—	—	—	2	—	1	3	1	1	—
600—700	17	15	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	1	—
700—800	7	5	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	1	2	—	—	—
800—900	10	8	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—
900—1,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	5	2	—	2	—	—	1	—	—	3	—	—	3	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	11	5	—	5	—	—	—	—	1	6	—	—	6	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—
2,000—2,500	3	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,500—3,000	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	168	83	5	36	11	3	10	—	4	64	—	8	72	2	6	—

III.—*Bengal.*

Rs.																
200—300	21	2	3	8	—	5	1	1	1	16	—	—	16	—	—	—
300—400	13	4	2	2	—	3	1	—	1	7	—	—	7	—	—	—
400—500	13	7	2	2	—	1	—	—	1	4	—	—	4	—	—	—
500—600	5	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
700—800	3	2	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
800—900	4	3	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	4	2	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	6	1	3	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	4	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,500—3,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	81	37	10	15	—	11	2	2	4	34	—	—	34	—	—	—

APPENDIX XVIII—*continued.*

IV.—*Bihar and Orissa.*

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.														
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).											
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	15	—	—	9	—	3	1	1	1	15	—	—	15	—	—	—
300—400	9	4	1	—	1	1	1	—	1	4	—	—	4	—	—	—
400—500	10	3	2	1	1	1	—	—	2	5	—	—	5	—	—	—
500—600	6	3	—	1	—	1	—	—	—	2	—	—	2	—	1	—
600—700	9	4	—	1	—	—	2	—	2	5	—	—	5	—	—	—
700—800	2	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
800—900	2	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	6	4	—	1	—	1	—	—	—	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,500—3,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	70	30	4	13	2	8	1	1	7	35	—	—	35	—	1	—

V.—*The United Provinces of Agra and Oudh.*

Rs.																
200—300	43	5	8	4	3	4	8	1	2	22	—	—	22	8	—	—
300—400	25	10	2	—	—	—	6	—	2	8	1	—	9	4	—	—
400—500	29	14	2	1	2	3	4	—	1	11	—	—	11	2	—	—
500—600	19	16	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	1	1	—	—
600—700	16	12	—	3	—	—	—	1	—	4	—	—	4	—	—	—
700—800	11	9	1	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
800—900	7	7	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	8	6	—	—	—	2	—	—	—	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	16	11	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	1	2	—	2	—
1,400—1,600	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	2	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,500—3,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	186	101	16	9	5	10	19	2	5	50	1	1	52	15	2	—

VI.—*Punjab.*

Rs.																
200—300	14	3	1	—	4	—	3	—	—	7	1	—	8	2	—	—
300—400	18	3	—	1	6	2	1	—	1	11	3	—	14	1	—	—
400—500	23	8	—	2	4	—	2	—	—	8	4	—	12	2	1	—
500—600	18	15	1	—	2	—	—	—	—	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
600—700	33	28	1	—	3	—	1	—	—	4	—	—	4	—	—	—
700—800	14	14	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	14	14	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	9	8	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	14	10	2	—	—	—	1	—	1	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	17	15	—	1	—	1	—	—	—	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	5	2	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	6	5	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,500—3,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	191	131	9	4	19	3	8	—	2	36	8	1	45	5	1	—

APPENDIX XVIII—*continued.*

VII.—*Burma.*

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.															
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).												
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Banyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	27	6	8	2	1	—	1	—	—	4	4	—	8	1	1	3
300—400	11	6	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
400—500	16	10	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1
500—600	13	13	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	14	14	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	10	9	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	8	8	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	7	7	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	11	10	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	2	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,500—3,000	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	129	94	20	3	1	—	1	—	—	5	4	—	9	1	1	4

VIII.—*Central Provinces.*

Rs.																
200—300	2	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
300—400	6	—	1	—	2	1	1	1	—	5	—	—	5	—	—	—
400—500	7	5	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	2	—	—	2	—	—	—
500—600	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	4	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
800—900	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
900—1,000	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	6	3	—	3	—	—	—	—	—	3	—	—	3	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	6	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	1	—	1	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	2	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
2,500—3,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	48	32	1	4	2	2	2	1	2	13	—	1	14	—	1	—

IX.—*Assam.*

Rs.																
200—300	8	—	2	3	—	1	—	—	2	6	—	—	6	—	—	—
300—400	2	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
400—500	6	2	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—
500—600	5	4	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
600—700	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
900—1,000	1	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	2	—	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,500—3,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total ...	32	15	8	4	—	2	—	—	2	8	—	—	8	—	1	—

APPENDIX XIX.

Indian Public Works Department and Indian State Railways.

Regulations as to Appointment of Assistant Engineers, 1914.

1. The Secretary of State for India in Council will, in the year 1914, make *about 30* appointments of Assistant Engineers in the Public Works and State Railway Departments of the Government of India.

In making these appointments he will act with the advice of a Selection Committee, including at least one eminent representative of the Engineering profession.

2. Applications for the appointments must be made on a printed form to be obtained from the Secretary, Public Works Department, India Office, Whitehall, London, S.W., and to be returned so as to reach *him not earlier than 1st February 1914,** and not later than *Wednesday the 1st April 1914.*

3. Candidates must have attained the age of 21 and not attained the age of 24 years on the 1st July 1914. To this rule no exception can be made.

[N.B.—*Natives of India must obtain a certificate of age and nationality in the form explained in Annexure II. As the production of this certificate is a necessary condition of appointment, candidates are advised to procure it without delay. The certificate should be forwarded to the India Office together with the candidate's form of application or at the earliest subsequent opportunity.*]

4. Every candidate, except as provided in Regulation 5, must be a British subject of European descent, and at the time of his birth his father must have been a British subject, either natural-born or naturalised in the United Kingdom. The decision of the Secretary of State in Council as to whether a candidate satisfies this condition shall be final. He must also be of good moral character and sound physique.

5. Natives of India who are British subjects, and are not qualified under Regulation 4, are eligible for appointment, and shall be selected to the extent of 10 per cent. of the total number of Assistant Engineers thus recruited, if otherwise duly qualified.

6. Candidates must produce evidence that they have either (1) obtained one of the University degrees mentioned in Annexure I.; or (2) passed the A.M.I.C.E. examination; or (3) obtained such other diploma or distinction in Engineering, as may, in the opinion of the Selection Committee, be accepted as approximately equivalent to the degrees mentioned.

It will be for the Selection Committee to decide in dealing with the applications, whether they will recommend any candidate under head (3).

7. It is preferred that candidates should have taken a college course and obtained one of the degrees mentioned in Annexure I. It is advisable that in addition they should have had at least one full year's practical experience of Civil Engineering under a qualified civil engineer at the time when they appear before the Selection Committee. Those whose qualifying diploma has been obtained without a college course should have had a full three years of such practical experience. In the event of any candidate being selected who has not, in the opinion of the Selection Committee, had sufficient practical experience, he may be required to undergo, after arrival in India, a year's probation in charge of works, and his final appointment will be made dependent upon the result of such probation.

8. Candidates must be prepared, if called upon, to attend at the India Office, at their own expense, for a personal interview with the Selection Committee, which will probably take place at the end of April or early in May 1914.

9. They will further be required, before final appointment by the Secretary of State in Council, to appear, at their own expense, before the Medical Board at the India Office for examination as to their physical fitness for service in India.

The Regulations governing the physical examination of candidates for the Public Works and State Railway Departments of the Government of India are given in Annexure V.

**10. Selected candidates will also be required to satisfy the Secretary of State, in such manner as he may determine, of their ability to ride.*

11. They will on appointment be provided with a free first-class passage to India and they will be expected to proceed thither about the end of September 1914.

Their pay will begin from the date of their landing in India, and, if they so desire, they will be able to obtain an advance of two months' pay, recoverable by monthly instalments of one-third of salary. Of this advance a proportion not exceeding one-half may be received in England, and the balance can be drawn in India.

12. They will enter the Service as Assistant Engineers, on a salary of Rs. 4,560 a year (equivalent to 304*l.* a year, when the rupee is at 1*s.* 4*d.*).

13. The instruments required by Assistant Engineers are supplied to them in India.

14. Particulars as to their prospects of pay, pension, &c., are contained in Annexures III. and IV.

India Office,
December 1913.

NOTE FOR THE INFORMATION AND GUIDANCE OF CANDIDATES.

The Selection Committee of 1906 drew attention to the subjects which were held to be of most importance for the Public Works Service, viz.:—

Pure Mathematics, including a knowledge of the differential and integral calculus.

Applied Mathematics.

Geometrical and Engineering Drawing.

Surveying and Geodesy.

Strength and Materials and Theory of Structures.

Hydraulics.

Heat Engines.

Materials used in Construction.

Building Construction.—Wood and metal work, limes and cements, and building with stone, brick, and concrete.

Knowledge of the principles of road-making, waterworks, sanitary and railway engineering. (Important.)

The Selection Committee were further of opinion that all candidates should have had some workshop training.

---

* Applications from candidates not resident in the United Kingdom may be submitted before this date and since the India Office cannot undertake to correspond with candidates except by letter, such applications should be submitted as early as possible.

* Selected candidates will be examined by the Civil Service Commissioners as to their ability to ride, and will be required to obtain either—

(*a*) a certificate from the Civil Service Commissioners that they are able to ride well and to perform journeys on horseback; or

(*b*) a certificate from the Civil Service Commissioners of minimum proficiency in riding.

In the latter case they will be subjected, on their arrival in India, to such further tests in riding as may be prescribed by their Government.

Candidates are warned that the certificate of minimum proficiency in riding, without which they will not be allowed to proceed to India, is only granted to those who can qualify in a series of tests, which includes jumping.

The chief tests will be saddling and bridling; mounting and dismounting; trotting and cantering; riding at a trot, without stirrups; riding at a trot with stirrups but without reins, jumping a hedge hurdle about 3 feet in height.

Although the examination will, in the main, be confined to these points, the examiner will not be debarred from applying any other tests which may appear desirable.

APPENDIX XIX—*continued.*

The following Announcement regarding the recruitment of the Public Works Department in future years is published for the information of intending candidates:—

The foregoing Regulations apply only to the appointment of Assistant Engineers in the permanent establishment of the Public Works Department in 1914, but it is the intention of the Secretary of State for India in Council, as at present advised, to recruit the permanent establishment of the Department in succeeding years on the same general lines as those already laid down; see, however, Note to Annexure I.

The Secretary of State is unable to give any undertaking that the Regulations will remain unaltered in the future.

ANNEXURES.

ANNEXURE I.

LIST OF DEGREES REFERRED TO IN PARAGRAPH 6.

Note.—Certain modifications of this Annexure to be applicable to students entering on their University course after June 1914, are under consideration.

University of Oxford.—B.A. (with honours in the Engineering Science Final Honours School).

University of London.—B.Sc. (Engineering).

University of Cambridge.—B.A. Honours (Mechanical Science Tripos).

Univ. of St. Andrews.—B.Sc. (Engineering).

University of Glasgow.—B.Sc. (Engineering).

University of Edinburgh.—B.Sc. (Engineering).

Victoria University of Manchester (or Victoria University).—B.Sc. (with honours in Engineering), and B.Sc. Tech. in "Mechanical" or "Electrical" Engineering (Honours Division in the Final Examination).

University of Liverpool.—B.Eng.; provided the degree be obtained by passing the Examination of the University.

University of Leeds.—B.Sc. in Civil or Mechanical Engineering.

University of Sheffield.—B.E. (First Class in the Final Examination).

University of Birmingham.—B.Sc. (Engineering). Provided that the Engineering Matriculation Examination shall have been passed before entry upon any course of study which forms part of the Degree course; and that a regular course of study, occupying not less than three academical years, shall have been pursued between the passing of such Matriculation Examination and the passing of the Final Examination for the degree.

University of Dublin.—B.A.I.

Royal University of Ireland.—B.E. and M.E.

University of Wales.—B.Sc. (in the Department of Civil, Mechanical, or Electrical Engineering).

University of Durham.—B.Sc. in Civil, Mechanical, or Electrical Engineering or in Naval Architecture; provided that the Matriculation Examination for Engineering and Naval Architecture shall have been passed before entry upon any course of study which forms part of the degree course.

University of Bristol.—B.Sc. in Civil or Mechanical Engineering.

Other degrees.—Any other degree of a University or College in the United Kingdom which may hereafter be recognised by the Council of the Institution of Civil Engineers as exempting the holder from passing the examination for Associate Membership.

ANNEXURE II.

PARTICULARS REGARDING THE CERTIFICATE OF AGE AND NATIONALITY TO BE OBTAINED BY CANDIDATES WHO ARE NATIVES OF INDIA.

A.—*Rules for Candidates born within His Majesty's Dominions.*

1. A candidate who is resident in British India must obtain a certificate signed either (*a*) by the Secretary to Government (or his lawful deputy) of the province in which his family resides, or (*b*) by the Commissioner (or his lawful deputy) of the District in which his family resides.

2. A candidate who is resident in a Native State must obtain a certificate signed by the highest Political Officer (or his lawful deputy) accredited to the State in which his family resides.

3. The certificate required must be in the following form—

"I hereby certify that has submitted the proofs of his birth detailed below,* and has satisfactorily shown that he was actually born on or about the date stated, viz., the day of 18 , at , a place within His Majesty's dominions."

*(*Here enter details*).

and the nature of the evidence produced must be such as to satisfy the officer who issues the certificate.

4. The documentary evidence which a candidate may be expected to produce in order to obtain such certificate comprises:—

(*a*) The horoscope.
(*b*) Family books.
(*c*) Tradesmen's account books showing entries relating to the birth.
(*d*) The record of admission in the registers of the school in which the candidate was educated, and the record of the candidate's age at various periodical school examinations.
(*e*) If the candidate is matriculated, a certified copy of his application to the Registrar in Form A.

Oral testimony from persons able to give relevant evidence may also be taken.

5. If a candidate has proceeded to England without obtaining a certificate, the certificate may be granted to his father or guardian on production of the requisite evidence.

B.—*Rules for Candidates not born within His Majesty's Dominions.*

6. The rules are the same as the foregoing except that a candidate not born within His Majesty's dominions must also prove that he is the son or grandson of a person born in those dominions, and in his case the form of certificate must be not as in paragraph 3 above but as follows:

"I hereby certify that has submitted the proofs of his birth detailed below* and has satisfactorily shown that he was actually born on or about the date stated, viz., the day of 18 , and that he was born at a place without His Majesty's dominions, but that he is $\frac{\text{son}}{\text{grandson}}$ of a person born in those dominions."

*(*Here enter details*).

ANNEXURE III.

PARTICULARS REGARDING THE INDIAN PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT (EXECUTIVE BRANCH).

(*The arrangements and salaries hereinafter described are subject to revision according to the requirements of the Service.*)

1. The Engineer Establishment of the Indian Public Works Department consists of a staff of Engineers, military and civil, engaged on the construction and maintenance of the various public works undertaken by the State in India.

2. The permanent establishment of the Department is recruited from the following sources:—

(1) Officers of Royal Engineers.

(2) Persons appointed to the Imperial Service by the Secretary of State by selection from the United Kingdom.

(3) Persons educated at the Government Civil Engineering Colleges in India, and appointed to the Provincial Services by the Government of India.

(4) Occasional admission of other qualified persons.

3. The various ranks of the Department are at present as follows:—

	Salary per Annum (Imperial Service). Rs.
Chief Engineer, First Class	33,000
,, ,, Second Class	30,000
Superintending Engineer, First Class ...	24,000
,, ,, Second Class...	21,000
,, ,, Third Class ...	18,000
Executive Engineer, 20th year of service and following years	15,000
,, ,, 19th year of service	14,000
,, ,, 18th year of service	13,800
,, ,, 17th year of service	13,200
,, ,, 16th year of service	12,600
,, ,, 15th year of service	12,000
,, ,, 14th year of service	11,400
,, ,, 13th year of service	10,800
,, ,, 12th year of service	10,200
,, ,, 11th year of service	9,600
*Assistant Engineer, 10th year of service	9,000
,, ,, 9th year of service	8,400
,, ,, 8th year of service	7,920
,, ,, 7th year of service	7,440
,, ,, 6th year of service	6,960
,, ,, 5th year of service	6,480
,, ,, 4th year of service	6,000
,, ,, 3rd year of service	5,520
,, ,, 2nd year of service	5,040
,, ,, 1st year of service	4,560

4. The increments will be given for approved service only, and in accordance with the rules of the Department.

Exchange compensation allowance will not be granted to future entrants.

5. Promotions above the grade of Executive Engineer are dependent on the occurrence of vacancies in the sanctioned establishment, and are made wholly by selection; mere seniority is considered to confer no claim to promotion.

ANNEXURE IV.

PARTICULARS RELATING TO PENSIONS, PROVIDENT FUND, AND LEAVE.

(Not printed).

ANNEXURE V.

Regulations as to the Physical Examination of Candidates for Appointment to the Public Works Department of the Government of India.

Note.—These Regulations are published for the convenience of candidates and in order to enable them to ascertain the probability of their coming up to the required physical standard. But it must be clearly understood that the Secretary of State reserves to himself an absolute discretion to reject as unfit any candidate whom he may consider, after hearing the opinion of his medical advisers, to be physically disqualified for the public service; and that his discretion is in no respect limited by these Regulations.

It is not the practice to communicate to candidates who may be reported as physically unfit for service in India the reasons for the Medical Board's opinion.

General Physical Requirements.

1. A candidate must be in good mental and bodily health, and free from any physical defect likely to interfere with efficient performance of duty.

2. In the examination of candidates the Medical Board will apply the following table of correlation of age, height, and chest girth:—

Age.	Height without Shoes.	Chest. Girth when expanded.	Chest. Range of Expansion.
	Inches.	Inches.	Inches.
21 and upwards	62½ and under 65 ...	35	2
	65 ,, 68 ...	35½	2
	68 ,, 70 ...	36	2
	70 ,, 72 ...	36½	2½
	72 and upwards ...	37	2½

3. *Measurement of Height.*—The candidate will be placed against the standard with his feet together, and the weight thrown on the heels, and not on the toes or outside of the feet. He will stand erect without rigidity, and with the heels, calves, buttocks, and shoulders touching the standard; the chin will be depressed to bring the vertex of the head level under the horizontal bar, and the height will be noted in parts of an inch to eighths. In the Indian Police Force a maximum height of 5 ft. 4 ins. is required, but in other Departments no fixed limit of height is imposed.

4. *Measurement of Chest.*—The candidate will be made to stand erect with his feet together, and to raise his hands above his head. The tape will be carefully adjusted round the chest, with its posterior upper edge touching the inferior angles of the shoulder blades, and its anterior lower edge the upper part of the nipples. The arms will then be lowered to hang loosely by the side, and care will be taken that the shoulders are not thrown upwards or backwards so as to displace the tape. The candidate will then be directed to empty his chest of air as much as is possible. This is best done by continuous whistling with the lips as long as sound can be produced. The tape is carefully gathered in during the process, and when the minimum measurement is reached it is recorded. The candidate will then be directed to inflate his chest to its utmost capacity. This maximum measurement will likewise be noted. The girth with the chest fully expanded and the range of expansion between the minimum and the maximum will then be recorded.

5. The hearing must be good.

6. The speech without impediment.

7. The teeth in good order, *i.e.*, decayed or broken teeth must be properly stopped or crowned, and deficient teeth replaced by artificial teeth where necessary for effective mastication.

8. The chest must be well formed, the lungs and heart sound.

9. Rupture, hydrocele, varicocele, varicose veins in a severe degree, or other condition likely to cause inefficiency will disqualify a candidate, unless such condition is cured by operation.

10. The limbs, feet, and toes must be well formed and developed, with free and perfect motion of all the joints.

11. A candidate must have no congenital malformation or defect likely to interfere with efficiency.

12. A candidate must not be the subject of chronic skin disease.

13. Evidence of previous acute or chronic disease pointing to an impaired constitution will disqualify.

14. The Regulations as to the standard of vision required are shown separately for each department. In all cases of "colour blindness" a note of the same will be made on the candidate's papers.

* Officers of the Assistant Class will ordinarily pass into the executive class in the 11th year of service, but no Imperial Engineer may draw more than Rs. 9,600 per annum unless he holds charge of a division or a charge of equal importance.

APPENDIX XIX—*continued.*

Candidates may, if they wish it, undergo a preliminary examination by the Medical Board, which meets at the India Office every Tuesday, under the following conditions:—

(*a*) Applications must be addressed to the Under Secretary of State, India Office, Whitehall, London, accompanied by a fee of two guineas, and a statement as to the particular appointment which the candidate desires to obtain.

(*b*) Candidates must pay their travelling expenses.

(*c*) Candidates considered to be unfit by the Medical Board at this preliminary examination are not bound to accept its opinion, but may, *at their own risk*, continue their studies, with the knowledge that they will have to submit themselves for a final medical examination by the Medical Board, prior to the examination, or to their appointment.

(*d*) On the other hand, it must be distinctly understood that the preliminary examination by the Medical Board is held solely for the candidate's information, and that, if after that examination he is reported to be apparently fit, he has not on that account any claim to be accepted as physically fit when he presents himself for the final Medical Examination, upon which alone his acceptance or rejection will depend. Candidates may be considered fit for the Service at the preliminary examination, but may be found at the final examination to be unfit, either on account of some physical defect which did not exist or passed undetected at the preliminary examination, or for other reasons.

Regulations as to the Standard of Vision.

1. If myopia in one or both eyes exists, a candidate may be passed provided the ametropia does not exceed 3·5 D, and if, with correcting glasses not exceeding 3·5 D, the acuteness of vision in one eye equals $\frac{6}{6}$ and in the other $\frac{6}{9}$, there being normal range of accommodation with the glasses.

2. Myopic astigmatism does not disqualify a candidate, provided the lens, or the combined spherical and cylindrical lenses, required to correct the error of refraction, does not exceed 3·5 D; the acuteness of vision in one eye, when corrected, being equal to $\frac{6}{6}$, and in the other $\frac{6}{9}$, together with normal range of accommodation with the correcting glasses, there being no evidence of progressive disease in the choroid or retina.

3. A candidate having total hypermetropia not exceeding 4 D is not disqualified, provided the sight in one eye (when under the influence of atropine) equals $\frac{6}{6}$, and in the other eye equals $\frac{6}{9}$, with + 4 D glasses, or any lower power.

4. Hypermetropic astigmatism does not disqualify, provided the lens or combined lenses required to cover the error of refraction do not exceed 4 D, and that the sight of one eye equals $\frac{6}{6}$, and the other $\frac{6}{9}$, with or without such lens or lenses.

5. A candidate having a defect of vision arising from nebula of the cornea is disqualified if the sight of one eye be less than $\frac{6}{12}$. In such a case the better eye must be emmetropic. Defects of vision arising from pathological or other changes in the deeper structures of either eye, which are not referred to in these rules, may exclude a candidate.

6. Squint or any morbid condition, subject to the risk of aggravation or recurrence, in either eye, may cause the rejection of a candidate. Any imperfection of the colour sense is a disqualification for appointment to the engineering branch of the Railway Department. In other cases the existence of imperfection of colour sense will be noted on the candidate's papers.

FOR ALL APPOINTMENTS UNDER THE INDIAN GOVERNMENT A DECLARATION, AS FOLLOWS, IS REQUIRED FROM CANDIDATES.

1. I.....declare upon honour that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, I am not at present suffering or affected with any form of disease or bodily infirmity, such as—

(*a*) Disease of the heart or lungs.
(*b*) Venereal disease.
(*c*) Fits.
(*d*) Rupture.
(*e*) Varicocele or varicose veins.
(*f*) Hydrocele.
(*g*) Malformation.
(*h*) Congenital defect.
(*i*) Defective sight or hearing.
(*j*) Loss of teeth.
(*k*) Impediment in speech.
(*l*) Gout or rheumatism.

2. That I have not to my knowledge any hereditary tendency or predisposition to mental or constitutional disease, such as—

(*a*) Fits or insanity.
(*b*) Cancer.
(*c*) Consumption or scrofula.

3. That I will fully reveal to the Medical Board all circumstances within my knowledge that concern my health and fitness for the appointment for which I am a candidate.

4. That I have previously been examined by a Medical Board for the public service and was declared on the .

Signature.....
Date.....

N.B.—A wilful mis-statement by a candidate will invalidate any subsequent appointment obtained.

APPENDIX XX.

Officials and non-officials who furnished written evidence to the Royal Commission in connection with their enquiry into the PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT but who were not orally examined.

1. Rai Bahadur Bakhshi Sohan Lal, Member, Legislative Council, Punjab.
2. Rai Bahadur Lala Kanhya Lal, C.E., Retired Offg. Superintending Engineer, Punjab Public Works Department.
3. F. W. Schönemann, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Public Works Department, Punjab.
4. Lala Kashi Ram, Pleader, Chief Court, Punjab.
5. Rai Bahadur Ram Sarn Das, Member, Punjab Legislative Council.
6. Rai Bahadur Lala Sultan Singh, late Member of the Punjab Legislative Council, Reis and Magistrate, Delhi.
7. Lala Lajpat Rai, Pleader, Chief Court, Punjab, Lahore.
8. Chawalal Pradhan Lala, and two other Temporary Engineers.
9. S. Athim, Esq., A.M.I.C.E., Executive Engineer, Ganges Canal, Rurki.
10. Khan Bahadur Nawab Ashadulla Khan, Meerut.
11. J. W. Meares, Esq., M.I.C.E., Electrical Adviser to the Government of India.
12. Gazetted staff of the Thomason Civil Engineering College, Rurki (other than R.E. officers and officers of the Indian Educational Service).
13. Officers of the Public Works Department, Burma, appointed to the Imperial Branch from the Thomason Civil Engineering College.
14. C. A. Duncan, Esq., Assistant Engineer, Ramgarh, Hazaribagh District, Bihar and Orissa.
15. C. A. Marchant, Esq., Honorary Assistant Engineer, Bihar and Orissa.
16. R. E. Carter, Esq., Superintending Engineer, Orissa Circle, and eight other officers of the Public Works Department in Bihar and Orissa.

APPENDIX XX—*continued.*

17. Lala Sukhbir Sinha, Muzaffarnagar.
18. W. J. Finniston, Esq., Executive Engineer, Bassein, Burma.
19. A. E. P. Rae, Esq., Assistant Secretary, Public Works Department, Burma.
20. The Anglo-Indian Association, Calcutta.
21. Babu K. C. Sen, Assistant Engineer, Sambalpur.
22. E. A. W. Phillips, Esq., M.I.C.E., retired Superintending Engineer, Burma.
23. The Indian Society of Civil Engineers.
24. W. R. Wells, Esq., Executive Engineer, Burma.
25. S. D. Pears, Esq., Superintending Engineer.
26. J. M. Lacey, Esq., Executive Engineer.
27. Fardunji C. Daraporvala, Esq.
28. Vasudeo Rajaram Gupta, Esq., and Chuitaman Sakharam Deole, Esq., Honorary Secretaries on behalf of the Deccan Sabha, Poona.
29. The Bombay Public Works Department, Upper Subordinates' Association, Poona City.
30. P. F. Plomer, Esq., A.M.I.C.E.
31. J. H. Sharpe, Esq., Executive Engineer (Supplementary Notes on his Written Statement, *vide* paragraph 8).
32. Lt.-Col. J. P. Blakeway, R.E., Superintending Engineer, 1st Circle, and four other R.E. officers.
33. Keshavlal S. Sanghani, Esq., Assistant Engineer, Bombay.
34. K. R. Godbole, Esq., Civil Engineer, Poona City.
35. Babu Motilal Ghosh, Editor, Amrita Bazar Patrika, Calcutta.
36. W. McM. Sweet, Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, Assam. Memoranda giving (1) views of a majority of Members of the Department belonging to Assam; (2) his own views.
37. Nanabhai Dayabhai Daru, Esq.

INDEX.

The numbers refer to paragraphs.

Public Works Department.

A.

Administrative posts:
- Absorption into Imperial Service of Provincial Engineers who reach, advocated, *Desenne* 72,004
- Appointments to, should be controlled by Government of India, *Desenne* 72,004, 72,021
- Charges, particulars, *Russell*... 71,266
- Maintenance of British element necessary, *Harrison* 72,603
- Number would have to be increased, if construction staff increased to extent of 10 per cent., *Russell* 71,287

PAY:
- Exchange Compensation Allowance withdrawn and reduction in pay and allowances entailed, *Lewis*, 72,063; *Edge*, 72,112.
- Extension of incremental scale undesirable, *Hope*, 71,323, 71,334; *Cowley*, 71,858.
- Indians and Europeans should receive same, *Desenne* ... ... 72,005, p. 248

Pensions, special service, grant advocated, *Lewis*, 72,065; *Sharpe*, 72,552.

PROMOTION TO:
- no Feeling that only Europeans should be promoted, *Cowley* 71,854
- Indians:
  - should have Chance of being promoted if fit, *Sharpe* 72,578
  - not as Efficient as Europeans, *Harrison* 72,620
  - Fit for grade, *Radhika Narayan* ... 71,770
  - no Limitations to employment of, in theory, but excluded in practice, *Raj Narayan* 71,409
  - Proportion, *Bagley*, 71,402; *Nethersole*, 71,458; *Rose*, 71,534; *Wazir Chand*, 71,570, p. 220; *Baij Nath*, 71,699; *Finnimore*, 71,811.
  - Percentage of officers appointed in England and in India ... ... p. 219, p. 220
  - by Selection as opposed to mere seniority advocated, *Russell*, 71,269; *Dorman*, 72,157.
  - Seniority determining factor, *Russell*, 71,312; *Harrison*, 72,620.
- 33⅓ per cent. held by Indians, *Harrison*, 72,589.
- Transfers from one Province to another, considerable hardship and pecuniary loss caused, *Edge* 72,112, 72,125
- (*see also* Chief Engineers *and* Superintending Engineers.)

Agashe, V. T., evidence of 72,431–9

Age limits (*see under* Recruitment).

Allen, H. N., evidence of 72,478–501

Allowances (*see under* Leave *and* Pay).

Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans:
- Civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 268
- Fairly good at work and generally discharge duties satisfactorily, *Russell* 71,302

Annada Prasad Sarkar, Rai Bahadur, evidence of 71,900–25

Assam:
- Administration, memorandum by ... ... p. 243–4

CADRE:
- Additional Executive Engineer required p. 244
- Appointments held outside authorised ... p. 244

Assam—*cont.*

CADRE—*cont.*
- Number of posts in each grade and provision for leave and training ... ... p. 244
- Civil appointments, statement of, on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 271
- Comparison of number of Europeans and Indians, *Raj Narayan* 71,409
- Local allowances drawn ... ... p. 244

(*see also subject headings.*)

Assistant Engineers:
- Allotment of guaranteed posts among colleges, *Heaton* 71,963, 71,985
- Appointment of, in 1911, particulars, *Haines* 72,626, p. 209

EMPLOYMENT ON TEMPORARY TERMS:
- Advocated, *Heaton* 71,964, 71,977, 71,983, 71,996
- not Advocated, *Desenne* 72,029

INDIANS:
- Number of applicants and number appointed, 1905-14, *Haines* ... ... 72,626, p. 212
- Number of qualified candidates and of appointments made, 1911-13, *Haines* ... ... 72,626, p. 211, 72,633
- Provinces from which men came, 1911-13, *Haines* 72,626, p. 211
- Universities in Great Britain at which course taken, 1911-13, *Haines* 72,626, p. 211, 72,638

Larger proportion employed in Irrigation Circle, *Lewis* 72,095

Number, *Lewis* 72,095

Number should be fixed in accordance with number of superior vacancies, *S. N. Banarji* ... 71,885

Professional experience of, at time of selection, 1905-14, *Haines* ... ... 72,626, p. 212

Testimonials required from engineers under whom employed, *Haines* 72,637

Atkinson, Lieutenant-Colonel E. H. de V., evidence of 71,581–624

B.

Bagley, F. R., evidence of 71,356–402

Baij Nath, Rai Bahadur Lala, evidence of 71,693–735

Banarji, Shailendra Nath, evidence of 71,866–99

Baniyas and Vaisyas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by 1st April, 1913 p. 268

Beale, H. F., evidence of 72,362–430

Bengal:

CADRE:
- no Addition required at present ... ... p. 241
- Appointments held outside authorised ... p. 241
- Number of posts in each grade and allowance for absentees ... ... p. 241
- as at Present sanctioned ... ... p. 239

Civil appointments, on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 269

Comparison of number of Europeans and Indians, *Raj Narayan*, 71,409; *Finnimore*, 71,812.

Bengal—*cont.*
DIVISIONS:
very Junior men holding charge, *Finnimore* 71,792
Redistribution to make practically equal, not possible, *Cowley* 71,864
Government, memorandum ... ... p. 239–42
Royal Engineers, employment being extended, *Finnimore* 71,786
Temporary engineers, no difficulty with regard to, *Finnimore* 71,785
(see also subject headings.)

Bihar and Orissa:
CADRE:
Appointments held outside authorised ... p. 243
Number of posts in each grade and allowance for absentees ... ... p. 243
Sufficient for normal requirements ... p. 243
Civil appointments, on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 270
Comparison of number of Europeans and Indians, *Raj Narayan* 71,409
Government, memorandum ... ... p. 242–3
Training, Provincial Engineer's apprentice, period should be abolished ... ... p. 242
(see also subject headings.)

Bombay:
CADRE:
Appointments held outside authorised ... p. 257
Establishment, and proportion of Europeans and Indians, *Beale* 72,369
Number of posts in each grade and provision for leave ... ... p. 257
Permanent, insufficient and application for increase refused by Government of India, *Beale* 72,365, 72,401
Recruitment to Imperial Service, table, and spasmodic increases ... ... p. 257
Urgent necessity for strengthening, and statement showing sanctioned scale, the actual strength, and proposed strength necessary to meet normal requirements ... ... p. 257–63
Civil appointments, on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 269
Comparison of number of Europeans and Indians, *Raj Narayan* 71,409
Government, memorandum ... ... p. 255–65
Method of recruiting Provincial Engineers, *Beale*, 72,394, 72,406; *Allen*, 72,478, 72,499, 72,501.
Presidency, allowance to Executive and Assistant Engineers advocated, *Beale* ... 72,366, 72,383, 72,422, p. 256, 263–5
System followed for construction of large works, *Beale* 72,392
TEMPORARY ENGINEERS:
in Charge of sub-divisions because subordinate establishment undermanned, *Beale* ... 72,390
Particulars, *Beale* 72,378
(see also subject headings.)

Brahmans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 268

Buddhists, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 268

Burma:
ALLOWANCE:
should be Given to all Assistant and Executive Engineers, *Lewis* ... ... 72,068, p. 248
Recommendation of Special Committee of 1910 should be given effect to, *Lewis* ... 72,068

CADRE:
Appointments held outside authorised p. 249–50
Insufficient for duties and should be increased p. 250
Number of posts in each grade and provision for leave ... ... p. 249
Civil appointments, on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 271
Comparison of number of Europeans and Indians, *Raj Narayan* 71,409
Executive Engineers, proportion of Assistant Engineers to, should be increased ... ... p. 249
Government memorandum ... ... p. 246–50
(see also subject headings.)

Burmese, examination, should be special paper set by officer of Public Works Department, *Lewis* 72,068

C.

Cadre:
Actual strength of establishment compared with, *Russell* 71,266
Composition, and Department suffers greatly in efficiency from, *Purves* 71,664, 71,681
more Frequent revision advocated, *Russell*, 71,286, 71,303–4; *Hope*, 71,348; *Raj Narayan*, 71,405; *Nethersole*, 71,434, 71,444, 71,445, 71,454, 71,472; *Rose*, 71,512, 71,522; *Cowley*, 71,830; *Edge*, 72,111; *Dorman*, 72,157; *Howley*, 72,249, 72,261; *Beale*, 72,365, 72,380; *Learoyd*, 72,504, 72,520, 72,527; *Harrison*, 72,585.
Inadequate provision for works under construction, and necessity for considering future demands in advance, *Russell* ... 71,266, 71,307
Only officers promoted to executive rank, should be placed on permanent cadre, *Heaton* 71,977
Reserves for leave and training adequate, *Russell* 71,289
Strength of establishment, method of determining, *Russell* 71,266
Urgency for increasing staff due to class of men now in charge of sub-divisions, *Hope* 71,346
Transfer of Temporary Engineers to *(see under* Temporary Engineers).

Calcutta, special allowances should be given to European officers stationed at, *Finnimore*, 71,774, 71,801, 71,815, 71,821, 71,826; *Cowley*, 71,831, p. 241.

Casualties, comparison between Indian and European officers, *Beale* 72,368, 72,404

Central Provinces and Berar:
Administration, memorandum by ... ... p. 265–8
CADRE:
Appointments held outside authorised ... p. 267
Insufficient and large increase necessary p. 267–8
Number of posts in each grade and provision for leave ... ... p. 267
Civil appointments, on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 271
Comparison of number of Europeans and Indians, *Raj Narayan* 71,409
(see also subject headings.)

Charges:
DIVISIONAL:
Appointments should be by selection only, *Hope* 71,326
Control over initial expenditure by officers, *Russell* 71,266
Growth of size, *Russell* 71,266
Increase in number advocated, *Rose*, 71,528; *Baij Nath*, 71,731.
Laying down definitely that fixed proportion should be reserved for Provincial Engineers undesirable, *Learoyd* 72,508
Proportions of sub-divisions to, should not be decreased, *Hope* 71,353
Grading, according to class of work to be performed endeavoured to be put in practice at present, *Russell* 71,319
Re-adjustment, duties of Imperial Engineers could be confined to higher executive and administrative functions, *Sharpe* 72,549
SUB-DIVISIONAL:
Cases known of engineers from England being appointed direct to, *Radhika Narayan* 71,767
Certain number of districts where not held by Assistant Engineers, *Lewis* 72,095
Functions of officers, &c., *Russell* ... 71,266
Maintenance of buildings and roads only kind of work performed in many, *Cowley* ... 71,850
Majority must devolve on upper subordinates, *Russell*, 71,266; *Hope*, 71,350.
Nomination of upper subordinates of class required for, suggested, *Russell* ... 71,287
Ordinary work of officers, but such inferior classes of men being obtained that work had to be done by Executive Engineers, *Hope* 71,349

Chief Engineers:
ONE CLASS ONLY:
Advocated and proposed rates of pay, *Russell*, 71,270, 71,311, 71,513; *Hope*, 71,323; *Pollard-Lowsley*, 71,628; *Cowley*, 71,831, 71,847; *Lewis*, 72,063; *Dorman*, 72,158; *Ellis*, 72,200, 72,216; *Beale*, 72,366; *Learoyd*, 72,505; *Harrison*, 72,586; pp. 236, 248, 267.
no Importance attached to suggestion, *Nethersole* 71,463
Pay, same whether recruited in India or England, *Rose* 71,520
PENSIONS:
Amount, *Annada Prasad* 71,924
no Difference should be made between pension of Superintending Engineer and, *Hope* 71,354
Special, advocated, *Russell*, 71,272; *Annada Prasad*, 71,905; *Ellis*, 72,202, 72,223.
should not be Permitted to retain same appointment for more than 5 years, *Lewis*, 72,062, 72,074; *Learoyd*, 72,504; *Hope*, 71,322, 71,343.
no Provincial Engineer has yet qualified for post, *Craig* 72,104

Civil Appointments, statement of, on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... p. 268

Conditions of Service, Imperial:
Constitution of engineers into service under name of "Imperial Engineers" advocated, *Hope*, 71,322; *Raj Narayan*, 71,405; *Nethersole*, 71,433; *Cowley*, 71,830; *Desenne*, 72,004; *Learoyd*, 72,504, 72,510, p. 235.
Cost of site for residence should be fixed without reference to actual cost due to local variations in price of land or to special circumstances, *Desenne* 72,004
no Officer should have promotions or prospects in service affected by report or series of reports which have not been openly or judicially inquired into, *Raj Narayan* 71,405
Particulars, *Russell* 71,269
Present regulations and, satisfactory on the whole, *Bagley*, 71,359; *Nethersole*, 71,428; *Wazir Chand*, 71,562; *Ellis*, 72,199.
not Realised by recruits, *Harrison* 72,613
Table of precedence should be revised, *Hope*, 71,322; *Raj Narayan*, 71,405; *Learoyd*, 72,504.
(*see also* Leave, Pay, &c.)

Conditions of Service, Provincial:
no Officer should have promotion or prospects in service affected by report or series of reports which have not been openly or judicially enquired into, *Raj Narayan* 71,405
Particulars and comparison with conditions of English recruits, *Russell*, 71,269; *Baij Nath*, 71,702; *Hodgkins*, 72,037; *Craig*, 72,096, p. 133–5.
Proposal for getting reports on seniors by juniors who may be working under them, unfair to Indian-trained engineer, *Raj Narayan* ... 71,405
Same as engineers recruited in England advocated, *Raj Narayan*, 71,405; *Purves*, 71,664; *Baij Nath*, 71,696, 71,710; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,738; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,876, 71,895; *Mookerjee*, 71,928; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,145; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,306; *Framji*, 72,453; *Allen*, 72,480; *Sharpe*, 72,549.
(*see also* Leave, Pay, &c.)

Confidential Reports, *Raj Narayan*, 71,405; *Agashe*, 72,434.

Contracts by private firms, question of, *Russell*, 71,303–4; *R. N. Mookerjee*, 71,941, 71,951, 71,954, 71,959, 71,967; *Lewis*, 72,094; *Ellis*, 72,219, 72,227, 72,241; *Beale*, 72,381, 72,388, 72,392–3, 72,400, 72,405, 72,408, 72,411; *Learoyd*, 72,515, 72,525, 72,533, 72,541.

Coopers Hill College:
Abolition regretted, *Beale* 72,363, 72,412, 72,419
ESTABLISHMENT OF COLLEGE ON SAME LINES:
Advantages of, purely illusory, *Bagley* ... 71,381
Impracticable, *Cowley* 71,828
Number of students exactly corresponded with number of appointments to be filled in India 4 years later for some years, *Russell* ... 71,314
Practical training to men from, given in first year, *Annada Prasad* 71,923
no Restrictions limiting number of admission of Indian students known of, *Framji* ... 72,477

Cowley, F. A. A., evidence of 71,828–65
Craig, J., evidence of 72,096–108

D.

Departmental examination (*see under* Probation and Training).

Deputy Engineers, abolition of Provincial Service advocated and establishment of new service proposed, and particulars, *S. N. Banarji*, 71,874, 71,875, 71,877, 71,886, 71,887; *Annada Prasad*, 71,912, 71,915; *Mookerjee*, 71,932.

Desenne, O. H., evidence of 72,002–34

District Boards:
Government should make stringent rules for appointment of superior engineers and subordinates from qualified students of State-maintained colleges, *S. N. Banarji* 71,880, 71,893
PAY:
Rates higher than Provincial Service, *Hodgkins* 72,054
Received immediately after leaving college, *Annada Prasad* 71,918

Divisional charges (*see under* Charges).

Division into Imperial and Provincial Services:
Abolition advocated, *Bagley*, 71,364; *Raj Narayan*, 71,413; *Nethersole*, 71,441; *Ganga Ram*, 71,451, 71,536, 71,539, 71,553; *Wazir Chand*, 71,566; *Baij Nath*, 71,698, 71,699, 71,707, 71,709, 71,710, 71,723; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,748, 71,753, 71,757, 71,762; *Cowley*, 71,842; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,867, 71,872, 71,874, 71,876; *Annada Prasad*, 71,902; *Hodgkins*, 72,041, 72,044; *Craig*, 72,098; *Edge*, 72,123; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,146, 72,148; *Dorman*, 72,170, 72,183; *Howley*, 72,259; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,284, 72,288, 72,290–1; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,311, 72,314, 72,329; *Beale*, 72,384; *Agashe*, 72,431, 72,433, 72,442; *Framji*, 72,458; *Sharpe*, 72,546, 72,547, 72,557; *Earle*, p. 246.
Abolition and establishment of proposed new Service advocated, *Bagley*, 71,376, 71,377, 71,393; *Raj Narayan*, 71,403, 71,410; *Ganga Ram*, 71,539, 71,544, 71,549, 71,552, 71,553, 71,554, 71,558, 71,559; *Wazir Chand*, 71,567, 71,573; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,867, 71,874, 71,875, 71,876, 71,877, 71,885, 71,886, 71,887; *Annada Prasad*, 71,912, 71,915; *Mookerjee*, 71,932, p. 234.
Retention desirable, *Rose*, 71,516, 71,519; *Finnimore*, 71,773, 71,781; *Heaton*, 71,965, 71,976; *Desenne*, 72,008; *Lewis*, 72,066; *Ellis*, 72,203, 72,209–10; *Beale*, 72,369; *Learoyd*, 72,508, 72,509, 72,513; *Harrison*, 72,589, 72,595.

Dorman, W. S., evidence of 72,155–96

E.

Earle, Sir Archdale, K.C.I.E., note by ... p. 245–6

Edge, R. C., evidence of 72,109–41

Electrical Engineering, Indian graduates should be appointed where non-qualified Europeans now employed, *S. N. Banarji* 71,880

Electrical Inspectors, Local Governments' appointments, 1913, and methods, *Haines* ... 72,626, p. 210, 72,635

Ellis, Colonel W. M., evidence of ... 72,197–246

Engineers:
Administrative posts (*see that title*).
Assistant (*see that title*).
Chief (*see that title*).
Demand for, outside Government Service, *Annada Prasad* 71,917
Deputy (*see that title*).
Executive (*see that title*).
Imperial (*see that title*).
Provincial (*see that title*).
Royal (*see that title*).
Superintending (*see that title*).
Temporary (*see that title*).

European element:
Necessity for maintenance, *Harrison* ... 72,603
(*see also under* Administrative posts.)

Europeans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 268

Executive Engineers:
Duties, *Ellis* 72,214
Increase in office work by amalgamation of Public Works Accounts Department with Civil Accounts Department, *Lewis* 72,067
Number, *Lewis* 72,095
Particulars regarding ... ... p. 273–4
Pay, special increments should be granted, *Lewis* 72,063, 72,075
Pensions, scale advocated, *Ellis* 72,223
Proportion of Indian-trained engineers having risen to rank of, *Russell* 71,285

F.

Family Pension Fund:
Establishment advocated, *Russell*, 71,292; *Rose*, 71,515; *Hope*, 71,325, 71,338; *Finnimore*, 71,790; *Cowley*, 71,833, 71,844, 71,848, 71,859; *Hodgkins*, 72,048; *Lewis*, 72,068; *Craig*, 72,102; *Edge*, 72,128; *Dorman*, 72,176, 72,193; *Howley*, 72,252, 72,264–5, 72,272; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,282; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,309; *Learoyd*, 72,507, 72,519; *Harrison*, 72,588, 72,601, 72,615, p. 236.
Not considered necessary, *Jnananjan Saha* 72,152

Finnimore, B. K., evidence of... ... 71,771–827

Foreign service allowance (*see under* Pay, Imperial Service).

Framji, J. S., evidence of 72,450–77

Furlough (*see under* Leave).

G.

Ganga Ram, Rai Bahadur, evidence of 71,535–59

General Provident Fund (*see* Provident Fund).

Griffith, W. M., evidence of 71,244–65

Gwyther, F. E., note by ... ... p. 228–30

H.

Haines, Hermann A., evidence of ... 72,625–41

Harrison, C. S. C., evidence of ... 72,583–624

Heaton, E., evidence of 71,963–2,001

Hindus, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 268

Hodgkins, F. H., evidence of 72,035–59

Honours list, inadequate recognition in, *Raj Narayan*, 71,405; *Nethersole*, 71,433; *Dorman*, 72,163, 72,178; *Harrison*, 72,591.

Hope, H. J., evidence of 71,320–55

Howley, W. J. J., evidence of... ... 72,247–76

I.

Imperial Service:
Constitution of Service, *Russell* 71,266
Division of Department into Provincial and (*see under* Division into Imperial and Provincial).
European, not in real touch with people of country, *Radhika Narayan* 71,761
(*see also* Conditions of Service, Leave, Pay, &c.)

Indian Christians, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 p. 268

Indians:
Attracted to Engineering more than to Civil Service because free from evil practices of nomination, *Raj Narayan* 71,420
EDUCATED IN ENGLAND:
should be Appointed to Provincial Service, as three years' training insufficient for Imperial Service, *Hope* 71,339
would have to be Appointed to Provincial Service by Secretary of State, *Russell* ... 71,318
Higher classes of Indians not attracted to Public Works Department to same extent as to Provincial Civil Service, *Russell* 71,281
Improvement of relations between Europeans and, chief problem of day, *Radhika Narayan* 71,745

Indians—*cont.*
LIMITATIONS IN EMPLOYMENT OF:
Abolition advocated, *Raj Narayan*, 71,409, 71,424; *Ganga Ram*, 71,539; *Wazir Chand*, 71,566; *Baij Nath*, 71,697, 71,706; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,742; *Finnimore*, 71,777; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,872; *Annada Prasad*, 71,906; *R. N. Mookerjee*, 71,932; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,146; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,283; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,310; *Agashe*, 72,438; *Framji*, 72,457; *Sharpe*, 72,553.
should be Retained, *Russell*, 71,273; *Bagley*, 71,363, 71,372; *Nethersole*, 71,432; *Rose*, 71,494; *Cowley*, 71,834; *Heaton*, 71,965; *Desenne*, 72,008; *Hodgkins*, 72,041; *Lewis*, 72,066; *Edge*, 72,115; *Dorman*, 72,161; *Ellis*, 72,203; *Howley*, 72,253; *Beale*, 72,369; *Allen*, 72,482; *Learoyd*, 72,509; *Harrison*, 72,589.
RECRUITMENT:
Confined to Provincial Service advocated, *Russell* 71,279
(*see also* Indians *under* Recruitment, Imperial Service, *and* Recruitment, Provincial Service.)
Relations between European officers and, *Sharpe* 72,555
Report on value, *Beale* ... 72,373, 72,424–30

Irrigation Branch:
Large portion of staff employed on maintenance work, *Hope* 71,350
on Somewhat different footing from other branches, and suffered somewhat from being part of department in which great deal of other work carried on, *R. N. Mookerjee* 71,942
Special allowances should be given to, and suggested scale, *Raj Narayan* 71,406, 71,414

J.

James, W. H., evidence of 72,330–61

Jnananjan Saha, Babu, evidence of ... 72,142–54

K.

Kaiyasthas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913... ... p. 268

Kshatryas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 268

L.

Learoyd, H. B., evidence of 72,502–45

Leave, Imperial Service:
ALLOWANCES:
Payment at 15 rupees to pound sterling, when issued in India, advocated, *Rose*, 71,514; *Dorman*, 72,159; *Harrison*, 72,587.
Regulations, *Ellis* 72,201
Scale inadequate and officers cannot avail themselves of furlough due, *Russell*, 71,271, 71,287; *Hope*, 71,324; *Nethersole*, 71,430, 71,477; *Rose*, 71,514; *Cowley*, 71,832; *Desenne*, 72,006; *Lewis*, 72,064, 72,076; *Edge*, 72,113; *Dorman*, 72,159, 72,175, 72,177; *Howley*, 72,251; *Beale*, 72,367; *Learoyd*, 72,506, 72,541; *Sharpe*, 72,551; *Harrison*, 72,587, p. 236.
Extraordinary, regulations *re*, *Ellis* ... 72,201
FURLOUGH:
Amount of, which should count as qualifying service for pension, *Lewis* 72,065
Commutation of full period on half-pay into shorter period on full-pay advocated, *Hope*, 71,324; *Nethersole*, 71,430; 71,448; *Desenne*, 72,006; *Lewis*, 72,064, 72,085; *Ellis*, 72,201, 72,222; *Howley*, 72,270; *Learoyd*, 72,506, 72,518, 72,522; *Sharpe*, 72,551.
Eight years' limit:
should be Granted at any time after completion of eight years' service, *Rose*, 71,514; *Dorman*, 72,159.
Reduction advocated, *Ellis*, 72,201; *Desenne*, 72,006; *Learoyd*, 72,506.
not Regarded as serious hardship, *Edge* 72,126, 72,139
no Useful purpose served by, *Hope* ... 71,324

Leave, Imperial Service—*cont.*

European given more than Indian because serving in foreign country, supposed to require more change on medical grounds, *Nethersole* 71,477
Indian officers do not take much, *Beale*... 72,367
on Medical certificate, regulations, *Ellis* 72,201
without Medical certificate, regulations, *Ellis* 72,201
Private employment during, should not be prohibited, *Learoyd*, 72,506, 72,535; *Hope*, 71,324, 71,342; *Finnimore*, 71,802; *Dorman*, 72,194.
Proportion should be one-fifth of service as against one-fourth, to enable full amount being enjoyed in service of 30 years, *S. N. Banarji* ... 71,878, 71,883
Rule *re* lapse of 18 months since last privilege leave should be relaxed, *Hope*, 71,324; Learoyd, 72,506.
Rule precluding taking of furlough for period of three years since return from last furlough exceeding three months should be modified, *Russell* 71,271
Simplification of rules advocated, *Cowley* 71,832
should be Total amount earned less total amount already taken, *Lewis* 72,064
General rules, *Ellis* 72,201
Long, regulations, *Ellis* 72,201
One set of rules irrespective of source from which recruited advocated, *Atkinson*, 71,581, 71,595; *Cowley*, 71,833; *Dorman*, 72,160; *Harrison*, 72,588; *Beale*, 72,367.
Periods sufficient, *Hope*, 71,324; *Bagley*, 71,361, 71,374; *Rose*, 71,514; *Cowley*, 71,832; *Ellis*, 72,220; p. 236.
Privilege of leaving headquarters on holidays should be allowed as far as possible, *S. N. Banarji* 71,878
PRIVILEGE:
Cumulative period, extension beyond three months advocated, *Russell*, 71,271, 71,306; *Hope*, 71,324; *Raj Narayan*, 71,407; *Nethersole*, 71,430, 71,448; *Rose*, 71,514; *Finnimore*, 71,775; *Cowley*, 71,832, 71,862; *Desenne*, 72,007; *Edge*, 72,113; *Dorman*, 72,159, 72,192; *Ellis*, 72,201; *Howley*, 72,251; *Learoyd*, 72,506; *Sharpe*, 72,551; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,281; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,308; *Harrison*, 72,587.
Permission to officers to avail themselves of, immediately prior to retirement, and to retire at end without return to duty advocated, *Russell*, 71,271; *Rose*, 71,514; *Cowley*, 71,832; *Dorman*, 72,159; *Ellis*, 72,238; *Howley*, 72,251; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,281; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,308; *Harrison*, 72,587.
Regulations, *Ellis* 72,201
should be Total amount earned less total amount already taken, *Lewis* 72,064
Rules same as other Services except as regards allowances, *Lewis*, 72,064, 72,091; *Edge*, 72,113; *Dorman*, 72,159; *Howley*, 72,251; *Harrison*, 72,587.
Rules too complicated and require revision, *Ellis* 72,201
Rules now under revision, *Beale* 72,367
Same as Indian Civil Service advocated, *Mookerjee* 71,930
Short, regulations, *Ellis* 72,201
Special, existing rules require no alteration, but allowances should be same as in case of furlough, *Rose*, 71,514; *Dorman*, 72,159; *Harrison*, 72,587.
STUDY:
Advocated, *Russell*, 71,271; *Hope*, 71,324; *Rose*, 71,514; *Cowley*, 71,832, 71,853; *Mookerjee*, 71,932; *Desenne*, 72,006; *Lewis*, 72,064, 72,082; *Edge*, 72,113, 72,126; *Dorman*, 72,159, 72,188; *Ellis*, 72,205; *Howley*, 72,251, 72,263, 72,268–9; *Beale*, 72,367; *Agashe*, 72,438, 72,443; *Learoyd*, 72,506; *Harrison*, 72,587, 72,600, 72,604, p. 235.
not Advocated, *Nethersole* ... 71,465, 71,466
Subsidiary, regulations, *Ellis*... 72,201
Summary of present regulations, *Ellis* ... 72,201
(see also particular posts.)

Leave, Provincial Service:

ALLOWANCES:
Equivalent of amount of English engineers advocated, *Agashe* 72,436
should be Half average emoluments subject to a maximum, *Swaminatha Ayyar* 72,308
Scale, *Beale* 72,367

Leave, Provincial Service—*cont.*

Extraordinary, regulations, *Ellis* 72,201
FURLOUGH:
Extension to four years advocated, *Agashe* 72,436
Indian officers do not take much, *Beale*... 72,367
Proportion should be one-fifth of service, *Finnimore*, 71,775; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,878, 71,883.
Reduction of interval between two furloughs advocated, *Agashe*, 72,436; *Ellis*, 72,201.
Term furlough "due" should be defined, *S. N. Banarji* 71,883
Indian Service rules, under improvement, *Beale* 72,367
on Medical certificate, regulations, *Ellis* ... 72,201
PRIVILEGE:
Cumulative period, extension beyond three months advocated, *Raj Narayan*, 71,407; *Desenne*, 72,007; *Hodgkins*, 72,056; *Ellis*, 72,201; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,281; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,308; *Agashe*, 72,436.
Permission to officers to avail themselves of, immediately prior to retirement, and to retire at end without return to duty advocated, *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,281; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,308.
Privilege of leaving headquarters on holidays should be allowed as far as possible, *S. N. Banarji* 71,878
Regulations, *Ellis* 72,201
Rules should be left as they are for Indian Service generally, and Europeans in India allowed to have preferential treatment, *Bagley* ... 71,386, 71,395, 71,397
SAME AS FOR ENGINEERS RECRUITED IN ENGLAND:
Advocated, *Hope*, 71,324, 71,337, 71,352; *Raj Narayan*, 71,407, 71,413; *Nethersole*, 71,465; *Ganga Ram*, 71,538, 71,548; *Wazir Chand*, 71,564, 71,574; *Purves*, 71,664; *Baij Nath*, 71,696, 71,704, 71,710; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,740, 71,743; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,895; *Hodgkins*, 72,039, 72,049; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,145; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,281; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,308; *Agashe*, 72,442; *Framji*, 72,455; *Sharpe*, 72,551, p. 236.
not Warranted, *Finnimore* 71,827
Same as uncovenanted service generally, advocated, *Bagley* 71,371
Short, rules fair, *S. N. Banarji* 71,878
Study, advocated, *Finnimore*, 71,775, 71,778, 71,827; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,878; *Mookerjee*, 71,932; *Desenne*, 72,006; *Beale*, 72,367; *Agashe*, 72,438, 72,443.
ON URGENT PRIVATE AFFAIRS:
in Instalments advocated, *S. N. Banarji*, 71,883; *Annada Prasad*, 71,904.
Regulations, and considered fair, *S. N. Banarji*, 71,878; *Ellis*, 72,201.
(see also particular posts.)

Lewis, L. W., evidence of 72,060–95

Listed or Prize posts, to be offered to upper subordinates, suggestion, *Raj Narayan* 71,403

Lower Subordinate Service *(see under* Subordinate Service).

M.

Madras:

CADRE:
Appointments held outside authorised ... p. 253
Increase advocated ... ... p. 254
Number of posts in each grade and provision for leave ... ... p. 253
Civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by Europeans, Ango-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 269
Comparison of number of Europeans and Indians, *Raj Narayan* 71,409
Government, memorandum ... ... p. 252–4
Training and probation, regulations as to... p. 253
(see also subject headings.)

Madras College of Engineering:

one Appointment annually as apprentice engineer, *James* 72,330
Considerable extension needed, *Ellis* ... 72,228
Diploma certifies man for employment, *James* 72,351
Engineering course adequate, but could be improved, *James* 72,330

Madras College of Engineering—*cont.*

ENGINEERING STUDENTS:
Charge to, *James* 72,350
as Efficient theoretical engineers as students having passed through course in English college, *James* 72,345
Length of course, *James* 72,339
Little difference between man fortunate enough to get into Provincial Service and best of others who failed, *James* 72,354
Number of appointments should be increased in proportion to requirements of province, *Jnanan-Saha* 72,143
not Obtaining Government appointments, opportunities for practical training, *James*... 72,347
One year's practical training compulsory before obtaining degree in engineering, *James* 72,350
Position on list at final examination dependent on work right through course and not on written test at examination, *James* 72,351
Practically none employed on railways, *James* 72,353
Scholarships, *James* 72,350
Selection for appointment, improvement desirable, *Ellis* 72,197
Selection from best students after probationary period, and throwing open of more appointments advocated, *James* ... 72,330, 72,358–61
no Facilities for teaching telegraphy, *James* 72,344, 72,349
no Residential arrangements, *James* ... 72,334
Students, number and distribution. *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,312, 72,315, 72,328; *James*, 72,332, 72,355–6.

SUBORDINATE SERVICE STUDENTS:
Kept quite separate from those under training for Provincial Service, *James* 72,333
Method of training, *James*... ... 72,330, 72,335
Qualification for entry, *James* 72,336
Training appreciably lower than Engineer students, *James* 72,330, 72,336
Workshop and laboratory course inadequate, *James* 72,342, 72,344

Martin & Co., Messrs., engineers employed by, particulars *re*, *Mookerjee* 71,934, 71,943, 71,944–5, 71,948–9, 71,958, 71,962

Medical attendance should be provided for families, *Desenne* 72,004

Mining engineering, Indian graduates should be appointed where non-qualified Europeans now employed, *S. N. Banarji* 71,880

Mookerjee, Sir Rajendra Nath, K.C.I.E., evidence of 71,926–62

Muhammadans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913... p. 268

Municipalities, Government should make stringent rules for appointment of superior engineers and subordinates from qualified students of State-maintained colleges, *S. N. Banarji* 71,880, 71,893

N.

Nethersole, M., evidence of 71,426–87

North West Frontier Province, comparison of number of Europeans and Indians, *Raj. Narayan* 71,409

O.

Organisation of department, details of, *Russell* 71,266

Ottley, Colonel Sir John W., K.C.I.E., late R.E., M.Inst.C.E., evidence of 72,642–86

Overseers:
Free quarters or suitable house-rent allowance advocated, *S. N. Banarji* 71,877
Pay, scale advocated, *S. N. Banarji* ... 71,877
PROMOTION:
to Deputy Engineer class on supernumerary list with honorary rank advocated, *S. N. Banarji* 71,875, 71,877
to Sub-divisional posts, suggestion, *Heaton* 71,978

Overseers—*cont.*
Recruitment from candidates having passed Overseers' Examination of Technical Board advocated. *S. N. Banarji*... 71,874
Training, system satisfactory, *S. N. Banarji* 71,875

P.

Parsis, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 268

Pay, Imperial Service:
Bar at Rs. 800 and 1,250, officers reported as fit for promotion but for whom no vacancies exist, should continue to draw increments, *Russell*, 71,270, 71,288, 71,305; *Hope*, 71,323, 71,332, 71,333, 71,345; *Raj Narayan*, 71,406; *Rose*, 71,513; *Finnimore*, 71,795, 71,798; *Cowley*, 71,831; *Lewis*, 72,062; *Edge*, 72,131, 72,141; *Dorman*, 72,158, 72,190; *Ellis*, 72,217; *Howley*, 72,250, 72,262, 72,276; *Beale*, 72,366, 72,382, 72,410; *Learoyd*, 72,505; *Harrison*, 72,586; *Sharpe*, 72,549, 72,550, p. 248.
Basis of market value, impossible, *Nethersole* 71,463
should Depend on training and on work, *Cowley* 71,856
Difference from Provincial rates marked by leave and pension rules advocated, *Bagley* ... 71,370, 71,386, 71,395, 71,397, 71,399
Estimate of expenditure of married officer in executive grades, *Desenne* 72,005, 72,031, p. 120
FOREIGN SERVICE ALLOWANCE:
Anomalies should be guarded against, *Framji* 72,476
Claim can be met adequately by improved leave and pension rules, without any differentiation in actual salaries while on duty, *Bagley* 71,374
should be Given so as to make pay for European in India above what would be received in England, but not above standard in India, *S. N. Banarji* 71,889, 71,898
to Indians recruited in England might be necessary, *Finnimore* 71,796
Question of, difficult to deal with, *Srinivasa Ayyangar* 72,290–1, 72,297
Question whether men could be obtained on terms of receiving pay they would receive in their own country plus compensation allowance for serving in India, *Ellis* 72,226
Higher to Indians recruited in England than to those recruited in India, objection to, *Ottley* 72,657
House rent and allowances, sub-divisional officers stationed elsewhere than at headquarters should receive rent-free quarters, *Lewis* 72,068
Improvements that may be recommended should have retrospective effect, *Sharpe* 72,555
Increment should be made dependent on good work and not lapse into mere matter of course, *Nethersole* 71,428
Incremental scale approved, *Hope*, 71,323; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,280, p. 236.
Leave allowances (*see under* Leave).
Local allowances, Indian-trained engineers receive two-thirds of that granted to officers obtained from England and injustice, *Baij Nath* 71,703
Payment in sterling at exchange value of two shillings per rupee advocated, *Nethersole* 71,432, 71,447, 71,463, 71,471, 71,476, 71,479
Personal allowances should be given to officers whose promotion is stopped by irregularities in past recruitment, *Nethersole* 71,428
Presidency house-rent and extra emoluments, anomalies and remedy suggested, *Harrison* 72,591, 72,599, 72,606, 72,610, 72,617
Rates in 1890, 1900, and present scale ... p. 227, p. 241–2, p. 243, p. 244, p. 247, p. 253, p. 256, p. 266–7.
Reduction of rates to Provincial Service level not advocated, *Raj Narayan*, 71,419; *Agashe*, 72,447; *Framji*, 72,475.
Same for Indian and English recruits advocated, *Atkinson*, 71,581, 71,595; *Cowley*, 71,843; *R. N. Mookerjee*, 71,929, 71,938, 71,939–40; *Sharpe*, 72,581.

Pay, Imperial Service—*cont.*

Scale adequate, *Bagley*, 71,360; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,739; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,877; *Annada Prasad*, 71,903; *Edge*, 72,124; *Ellis*, 72,200, 72,237; *Sharpe*, 72,550.

Scale revised in 1908, and exchange compensation allowance withdrawn; net increase not commensurate with cost of living, *Russell*, 71,270; *Hope*, 71,323; *Cowley*, 71,831; *Lewis*, 72,063; *Edge*, 72,112; *Dorman*, 72,158; *Howley*, 72,250; *Beale*, 72,366; *Learoyd*, 72,505, 72,519, 72,529; *Harrison*, 72,586, p. 227.

Statement showing comparison of different scales of pay of Royal Engineers and, as revised from time to time, *Pollard-Lowsley* ... ... p. 60

TRAVELLING ALLOWANCES:

Inadequate and revision advocated, *Rose*, 71,518; *Desenne*, 72,004; *Ellis*, 72,205; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,286; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,312; *Framji*, 72,454; *Learoyd*, 72,504; *Harrison*, 72,591, 72,616.

on Transfer:

Detailed statements of expenses ... p. 254–5

Inadequate and revision advocated, *Hope*, 71,322; *Rose*, 71,518; *Cowley*, 71,836, 71,865; *Desenne*, 72,004; *Lewis*, 72,068; *Edge*, 72,117, 72,130; *Dorman*, 72,163; *Ellis*, 72,205; *Howley*, 72,255; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,286; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,312; *Beale*, 72,371, 72,386, 72,416–7; *Framji*, 72,454; *Learoyd*, 72,504; *Sharpe*, 72,550, 72,561; *Harrison*, 72,591, 72,602, 72,611, p. 253.

Two incremental scales, one for Assistants and one for Executive Engineers, would militate against recruitment, *Russell* 71,288

(see also particular posts.)

Pay, Provincial Service:

Avoidance of higher paid officer working occasionally under lower paid officer considered impossible, *Russell* 71,316

ON BASIS OF MARKET VALUE:

Advocated, *Harrison* 72,623

Impossible, *Nethersole* 71,463

Bar at Rs. 535, officers reported as fit for promotion but for whom no vacancies exist, should continue to draw increments, *Russell*, 71,270; *Hope*, 71,323; *Raj Narayan*, 71,406; *Cowley*, 71,831; *Beale*, 72,366, 72,382.

Daily allowance, 50 per cent. increase advocated, *S. N. Banarji* 71,877

should Depend on training and on work, *Cowley* 71,856

Discontent might still continue if difference maintained, *Beale* 72,421

Dissatisfaction at distinction from Imperial Service, *Allen* 72,480, 72,490

Grading according to class of work to be performed, endeavoured to be carried out in practice at present, *Russell* 71,319

Higher to Indians serving in different Province from their own, not objected to, *Ellis* 72,234

Inadequate, *Baij Nath*, 71,729; *Hodgkins*, 72,058; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,294, 72,303; *Beale*, 72,369, 72,385, 72,423; *Sharpe*, 72,564, 72,566.

INCREASE:

Proportionately with other important Services in India, *Raj Narayan* 71,406, 71,412

would Result in better and more contented Service, *Harrison* 72,613

To three-quarters of that of corresponding ranks in Imperial Service advocated, *Desenne* 72,005, 72,027

Local allowances, same as officers recruited in England advocated, *Wazir Chand*, 71,563; *Hodgkins*, 72,042; *Framji*, 72,454.

Non-equality of, with Europeans, grievance not admitted by Indians, *Russell* ... 71,280, 71,318

Present scales satisfactory, *Nethersole*, 71,429, 71,459; *Finnimore*, 71,774, 71,789; *Ellis*, 72,200, p. 241.

PROMOTION OF EXCEPTIONAL ENGINEERS TO IMPERIAL RATES:

Advocated, *Heaton* 71,976

Discontent can be removed by ... ... p. 248

Rates in 1900 and present scale, *Ellis* ... 72,200, p. 227, p. 241–2, p. 243, p. 244, p. 247, p. 253, p. 256, p. 267.

Pay, Provincial Service—*cont.*

SAME AS FOR ENGINEERS RECRUITED IN ENGLAND:

Advocated, *Bagley*, 71,367; *Raj Narayan*, 71,406, 71,413, 71,414, 71,425; *Ganga Ram*, 71,537, 71,546, 71,550, 71,553, 71,558; *Wazir Chand*, 71,563, 71,577; *Purves*, 71,664; *Baij Nath*, 71,696, 71,699, 71,703–4, 71,710, 71,719–21, 71,726, 71,734–5; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,738, 71,739, 71,743, 71,754, 71,756, 71,758, 71,762–3, 71,768; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,872, 71,890, 71,875, 71,877, 71,895; *Annada Prasad*, 71,903, 71,925; *Desenne*, 72,005; *Hodgkins*, 72,038, 72,046; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,145, 72,151; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,280, 72,290–1, 72,303; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,307, 72,316, 72,319, 72,323, 72,325, 72,329; *Agashe*, 72,435, 72,442, 72,444, 72,445, 72,447–9; *Framji*, 72,454, 72,451, 72,462, 72,463; *Sharpe*, 72,555, 72,560, 72,567, 72,579.

not Advocated, *Russell*, 71,270, 71,279, 71,316; *Hope*, 71,326, 71,355; *Nethersole*, 71,432, 71,477, 71,471, 71,479; *Rose*, 71,516, 71,519, 71,533; *Cowley*, 71,834; *Lewis*, 72,066; *Dorman*, 72,182–3; *Ellis*, 72,245; *Howley*, 72,253, 72,273; *Beale*, 72,369, 72,389; *Learoyd*, 72,509, 72,513, 72,525, 72,534, 72,538; *Harrison*, 72,589; *Ottley*, 72,657–8, 72,675.

Scale should be made identical with that for Provincial Civil Service, *Sharpe* ... ... 72,550.

Scale sufficient for Indians, *Cowley* ... 71,834

TRAVELLING ALLOWANCES:

Increase advocated, *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,286; *Swaminatha*, 72,312; *Framji*, 72,454.

on Transfer, increase advocated, *Framji* 72,454

Two-thirds of Europe-recruited engineers, and anomalies and defects, *Wazir Chand*, 71,563; *Framji*, 72,454.

(see also particular posts.)

Pensions, Imperial Service:

IMPROVEMENT IN SCALE:

Lengthening of time of service reasonable, *Finnimore* 71,791

should have Retrospective effect, *Hope*, 71,325; *Rose*, 71,515; *Cowley*, 71,833; *Howley*, 72,252; *Sharpe*, 72,555.

Inadequacy, increase advocated, *Russell*, 71,272; *Hope*, 71,325; *Bagley*, 71,362, 71,374; *Nethersole*, 71,431, 71,460, 71,464; *Rose*, 71,515, 71,527; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,741; *Finnimore*, 71,776; *Cowley*, 71,833, 71,845; *Annada Prasad*, 71,905; *Desenne*, 72,007, 72,020; *Lewis*, 72,065; *Edge*, 72,114, 72,138; *Dorman*, 72,160, 72,175, 72,191; *Ellis*, 72,202, 72,218; *Howley*, 72,252, 72,264; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,282; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,309; *Beale*, 72,368; *Learoyd*, 72,507, 72,519; *Sharpe*, 72,552; *Harrison*, 72,588.

Invalid, scale rendered inoperative by low maximum and increase advocated, *Russell*, 71,272; *Hope*, 71,325; *Rose*, 71,515; *Cowley*, 71,833; *Dorman*, 72,160, 72,196; *Lewis*, 72,065; *Howley*, 72,252; *Learoyd*, 72,507; *Harrison*, 72,588, p. 236.

Memorials of 1907-8, 1912, and 1913 and reply p. 250–2

One set of rules, irrespective of source of recruitment, advocated, *Atkinson*, 71,581, 71,595; *Cowley*, 71,833; *Dorman*, 72,160; *Sharpe*, 72,552; *Harrison*, 72,588.

RATE OF EXCHANGE:

1*s.* 9*d.* for man retiring in England and 1*s.* 4*d.* for man living, after retirement, in India objected to, *Ellis*, 72,239; *Howley*, 72,271.

Rs. 15=£1 advocated, *Sharpe* 72,552

Rules, history, *Dorman* ... ... p. 146–8

System under which part of money in form of pension and part in form of capital sum advocated, *Edge* 72,127

(see also particular posts.)

Pensions, Provincial Service:

Conditions satisfactory, *Finnimore*... ... 71,776

Maximum limit increase advocated, *S. N. Banarji*, 71,879; *Ellis*, 72,202; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,282; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,309.

Regulations, *Ellis*, 72,202; *Beale*, 72,368.

Rules should be left as they are for Indian Service generally, and European in India allowed to have preferential treatment, *Bagley* ... 71,386, 71,395, 71,397

Pensions, Provincial Service—*cont.*

SAME AS FOR ENGINEERS RECRUITED IN ENGLAND:

Advocated, *Raj Narayan*, 71,408, 71,413; *Wazir Chand*, 71,565, 71,572; *Purves*, 71,664; *Baij Nath*, 71,696, 71,705, 71,710; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,741, 71,743; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,871, 71,890, 71,895; *S. N. Mookerjee*, 71,931; *Hodgkins*, 72,039, 72,051; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,145; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,282; *Agashe*, 72,437, 72,442; *Framji*, 72,456.

not advocated, *Finnimore* 71,827

(*see also particular posts.*)

Pollard-Lowsley, Captain H. de L., C.I.E., R.E., evidence of 71,625–62

Poona Engineering College:

ADMISSION TO:

Age on, *Allen* 72,485

Not restricted to statutory natives of India, *Allen* 72,498

Qualifications for, *Framji*, 72,469; *Allen*, 72,484, 72,494.

Advisory Committee, *Framji*... 72,450

Cost of course, *Allen* 72,494

Course, *Framji*, 72,450; *Allen*, 72,486.

Curricula more suited to requirements of Department than many colleges of the United Kingdom, *Framji* 72,452

Entire re-organisation under consideration, *Allen* 72,486, 72,487, 72,488, 72,497

FINAL EXAMINATION:

Course made more comprehensive, and old degree of Licentiate of Civil Engineering converted into that of Bachelor of Engineering... p. 256

Wholly theoretical, *Allen* 72,499

Guaranteed appointment, factors taken into consideration in appointing students... ... p. 255–6

Laboratory fitted up on large and magnificent scale, *Framji* 72,450

List of distinguished engineers from, *Baij Nath* 71,699

Number of appointments should be increased in proportion to requirements of province, *Jnananjan Saha* 72,143

One guaranteed appointment, *Allen* ... 72,482

Perhaps not quite up to Rurki standard, *Allen* 72,495

MUHAMMADANS:

no Special scholarships for, *Allen*... ... 72,494

Two, students at present, *Allen* 72,494

STUDENTS:

Distribution, *Allen* 72,496

Number, *Allen* 72,486

Orders regarding practical course of training p. 256

Subordinate officers have often practically same qualifications as Provincial man, and had only failed by a few marks, *Allen* 72,487

no System of sending students for one year for practical training with private firms, *Allen* 72,500

Upper Subordinates and Provincial Service candidates all drawn from same class, but in future to be given two entirely different courses of instruction, *Framji* 72,450, 72,469

Well up to average of other Indian colleges, *Allen* 72,492

Precedence, table of (*see under* Conditions of Service).

Private work:

on Furlough (*see under* Leave).

taking up by Officers on active service should be strictly limited, *Finnimore* 71,802

Opportunity occasionally given, but encouragement not advocated, *Nethersole* 71,473

Probation and Training, Imperial Service:

Adequate proficiency in Indian languages attained, *Hope* 71,321

Apprenticing to Executive Engineers advocated, *Agashe* 72,433

Care should be exercised in placing newly joined recruits under efficient and sympathetic officers, and on suitable works, *Cowley* 71,829

Probation and Training, Imperial Service—*cont.*

DEPARTMENTAL EXAMINATION:

Considered sufficient, *Hope* ... 71,321, p. 235

Failure to pass, in accounts and engineering after appointment should entail loss of increment and seniority, *Cowley* 71,829

should be Directed to requirements of India, *Bagley*, 71,358, 71,374, 71,387, 71,389; *Raj Narayan*, 71,404; *Wazir Chand*, 71,561, 71,569; *Baij Nath*, 71,695, 71,710, 71,730; *Hodgkins*, 72,036, 72,055; *Edge*, 72,110, 72,133; *Dorman*, 72,184; *Framji*, 72,452.

European engineers should be placed under some specially selected, experienced, and capable Indian Executive Engineer, and Indians under European, *Radhika Narayan* 71,737

European standards of work not considered much superior to those in vogue in good practice in India, *Bagley* 71,374

Examination in reading native accounts might well be dispensed with, *Hope* 71,321

no Facilities given for learning vernacular, and suggestion, *Beale* 72,418

Method of dealing with subordinates and office establishment, necessity for sound training at beginning of engineer's career essential, *Radhika Narayan* 71,737

Officers should be required to pass examination in Law before being given charge of Irrigation or Embankment Division, *Cowley* 71,829

Period should count towards promotion, leave, pension, &c., *Lewis*, 72,065; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,279.

should be Placed on regular and systematic basis, *Radhika Narayan* 71,737

PRACTICAL:

in British Isles or Europe, and should be made condition of appointment, *Hope*, 71,320; *Rose*, 71,511; *Cowley*, 71,829, 71,840; *R. N. Mookerjee*, 71,926, 71,943; *Edge*, 72,110, 72,119, 72,132; *Dorman*, 72,156, 72,169; *Howley*, 72,248, 72,275; *Harrison*, 72,584, 72,596, 72,624.

in India, should be insisted upon, and free return passages given to rejected candidates, *Russell*, 71,296, 71,308; *Bagley*, 71,358; *Raj. Narayan*, 71,404; *Nethersole*, 71,427, 71,438, 71,451, 71,470; *Rose*, 71,511; *Wazir Chand*, 71,561; *Atkinson*, 71,581; *Baij Nath*, 71,695, 71,701; *Finnimore*, 71,787; *Ellis*, 72,198, 72,208, 72,229; *Desenne*, 72,003, 72,017, 72,028–9; *Hodgkins*, 72,036; *Lewis*, 72,061, 72,071, 72,081; *Craig*, 72,100; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,278, 72,298, 72,301; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,305; *James*, 72,330; *Framji*, 72,452; *Ottley*, 72,653, 72,662, 72,670–1; p. 235, 246–7.

Indian recruits should be sent to England for, *Atkinson*, 71,581, 71,591, 71,593, 71,624; *Annada Prasad*, 71,901, 71,913; *R. N. Mookerjee*, 71,927, 71,936, 71,939, 71,943, 71,952–3, 71,956–7.

Probationary period not advocated, *Hope*, 71,330; *Bagley*, 71,374; *Finnimore*, 71,772, 71,823; *Cowley*, 71,829, 71,840; *Lewis*, 72,061, 72,071–2; *Edge*, 72,110, 72,119; *Dorman*, 72,156, 72,173; *Howley*, 72,248, 72,257, 72,274; *Beale*, 72,364, 72,419; *Learoyd*, 72,503, 72,516, 72,526; *Harrison*, 72,584; p. 247.

Recruits should be consulted as to class of work desired, with view to specialisation, *Framji* 72,452, 72,466

Recruits should be posted under Indian-trained engineers, *Raj Narayan* 71,405

Sound training in judging subordinates and in arriving at decisions for and against them necessary during period of probation, *Radhika Narayan* 71,737

Specialities in India requiring special study, *Radhika Narayan* 71,760

Stress laid on necessity of making young engineer learn to sympathise with and know people among whom he has to live and work, and to be in real touch with them, *Radhika Narayan* ... 71,737

System, *Russell*, 71,268; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,767; *Ellis*, 72,198; *Beale*, 72,379.

System, advocated, *Learoyd*, 72,503, 72,532; *Sharpe*, 72,548, 72,559, 72,572.

Probation and Training, Imperial Service—*cont.*
TERMINABLE CONTRACT AS ALTERNATIVE:
not Advocated, *Craig*, 72,101; *Dorman*, 72,180, 72,187.
Probationary period, suggestion, *Lewis*, 72,072, 72,078–9, 72,083–4, 72,089–91, 72,095.

Probation and Training, Provincial Service:
APPOINTMENT ON PROBATION:
Advocated, *Raj Narayan*, 71,404; *Finnimore*, 71,772; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,875; *Beale*, 72,364.
no Further period necessary, *Srinivasa Ayyangar* 72,278
Unnecessary, *Jnananjan Saha* 72,144
Capable of improvement, *Ellis* 72,233, 72,235–6
Candidates appointed should be required to qualify for confirmation, *Cowley* 71,828, 71,829
Combination of theoretical and practical impracticable, *Heaton* 71,991
Comparison with English training, *Hope*, 71,339; *Raj Narayan*, 71,404, 71,413; *Ganga Ram*, 71,535; *Baij Nath*, 71,701; *Finnimore*, 71,771, 71,794, 71,811; *Cowley*, 71,856; *Annada Prasad*, 71,919; *Craig*, 72,106; *James*, 72,357; *Beale*, 72,409.
DEPARTMENTAL EXAMINATION:
Further, not advocated, *S. N. Banarji*... 71,875
Officers should be required to pass same, after appointment as Imperial Service Officers, *Cowley* 71,829
IN ENGLAND:
Advocated, *Nethersole*, 71,427, 71,438, 71,443, 71,450, 71,453, 71,466; *Ganga Ram*, 71,543, 71,547; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,753; *Finnimore*, 71,772, 71,787, 71,793, 71,808; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,875; *Desenne*, 72,033; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,144; *Beale*, 72,397; *Ottley*, 72,680.
not Advocated, *S. N. Banarji*, 71,868, 71,888, 71,897; *Heaton*, 71,973; *James*, 72,343.
on Irrigation works in India, better than could be obtained in Egypt or America, with certain exceptions, *Russell* 71,296
Officers should be put in charge of work, *Bagley* 71,380
Period not counted for promotion and distinction should be abolished, *Wazir Chand*, 71,563, 71,571; *Baij Nath*, 71,703; *Hodgkins*, 72,042; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,279.
Period too short, and extension advocated, *Heaton*, 71,964, 71,973, 71,981; *James*, 72,346.
PRACTICAL:
One year on large works advocated, *Desenne* 72,003, 72,017
Some students undergo, at own expense, *Annada Prasad* 71,922
should be Raised to highest possible standard, *Russell* 71,300
Rejection of man during period of probation, not known of, *Allen* 72,493
Second year's trial under different officer should be given before final rejection if unfavourable reports received on first year's work, *Raj Narayan* 71,404
Sufficient, *Bagley*, 71,396; *Heaton*, 71,981–2; *Hodgkins*, 72,036; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,144; *Srinivasa Ayyar*, 72,305, 72,320–2; *Framji*, 72,452, 72,461.
System, *Russell*, 71,268; *Ellis*, 72,198; *Allen*, 72,479.
System of deputing two candidates to one appointment should be abolished, *Hope*, 71,320, 71,331; *Raj Narayan*, 71,404; *Wazir Chand*, 71,561; *Baij Nath*, 71,712; *Atkinson*, 71,617; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,736.
Technical education, certain amount necessary as foundation, but counted as comparatively valueless, *Bagley* 71,379
Visit to engineering works outside country desirable, *Russell* ... ... 71,296, p. 241
Wholly directed to requirements of country, *Wazir Chand* 71,561, 71,569

Promotion, Imperial Service:
Age limit for Assistants should be raised to prevent block in, by proposals for increase in cadre, *Nethersole* 71,478
Confidential qualification reports objected to, *Agashe* 72,434
Economy in carrying out works taken into consideration, *Nethersole* 71,469

Promotion, Imperial Service—*cont.*
Recruitment should be regulated so as to ensure regular flow, *Hope*, 71,322; *Finnimore*, 71,798; *Cowley*, 71,830.
Rules, same for all recruits of whatever race or creed advocated, *Atkinson*, 71,581, 71,595; *Finnimore*, 71,810.
Selection system should be more closely followed, *Rose*, 71,512; *Ottley*, 72,659.
by Seniority, *Finnimore* 71,789, 71,795

Promotion, Provincial Service:
should be Borne on same list as Imperial Engineers, *Rose*, 71,516, 71,519; *Cowley*, 71,834.
Confidential qualification reports objected to, *Agashe* 72,434
to Imperial Service (*see under* Recruitment, Imperial Engineers).
on Merit alone and not on ground of seniority advocated, *Rose*, 71,522, 71,523; *Ottley*, 72,659.

Provident Fund:
Average proportion of salary contributed to, *Russell* 71,292
Government contribution advocated, *Finnimore*, 71,774, 71,789, 71,880, 71,819; *Harrison*, 72,615, p. 241.
should be Made more elastic as regards amount which can be deposited, *Lewis* 72,068
should be Permissible for balance at credit of account to remain for reasonable period after tender of payment has been made, and to continue to draw interest during period, *Cowley*, 71,836; *Dorman*, 72,160; *Harrison*, 72,591.
Replacing of pensions by, in case of new recruits advocated, *Desenne* 72,007, 72,020

Provincial Service:
Absorption of members of present Service into Imperial Service advocated if scheme adopted, *Sharpe* 72,547
no Analogy with other Provincial Services, *Baij Nath*, 71,699, 71,708; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,872; *Framji*, 72,453, 72,459.
Bulk of executive work could be performed by, with suitable re-adjustment of charges, *Sharpe* 72,549
Constitution, *Russell* 71,266
Department would have suffered if, instead of creating, Government had increased recruitment in India and reduced in England, *Russell* 71,312
Dissatisfaction and memorials, history, *Baij Nath* 71,733
Division of Department into Imperial Engineers and (*see under* Division into Imperial and Provincial).
Evils as at present existing, and inevitable result if continued on same lines, *Bagley* 71,367
Failure of experiment, *Radhika Narayan* ... 71,761
History, *Bagley*, 71,367; *Baij Nath*, p. 75–7, 79; *Wazir Chand*, 71,566; *Craig*, 72,096, p. 131–3, p. 233–4, 237–9.
Increase of relative proportion to Imperial Service not advocated, *Russell* 71,273, 71,297
Position compared with that of recruits from England ... ... p. 77–9
Same responsibilities and standard of education as Imperial Engineers not proposed, *Cowley* 71,861
below Standard of Imperial Service, *Hope*, 71,340; *Dorman*, 72,185; *Ellis*, 72,231–2, 72,243–4.
Unpopularity and reasons, *Hodgkins* 72,052–3
(*see also* Conditions of Service, Leave, Pay, &c.)

Punjab:
Civil appointments, on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 270
Comparison of number of Europeans and Indians, *Raj Narayan* 71,409
DIVISIONS AND SUB-DIVISIONS:
Number ... ... p. 230–1
Ratio of, should be altered... ... ... p. 232
Government, memorandum ... ... p. 227–8
Jungle allowance ... ... p. 227
IRRIGATION BRANCH:
Cadre:
no Appointments outside, held by Imperial or Provincial Service Engineers... ... p. 228
Estimated requirements ... ... p. 232
Increase to superior staff advocated ... p. 230–2
much below Requirements ... p. 228, p. 232

Punjab—*cont.*
IRRIGATION BRANCH—*cont.*
Cadre—*cont.*
Sanctioned, and provision for leave but not for training ... ... p. 227
Comparative statement showing average area of irrigation per Division and Sub-division and cost of establishment ... p. 230, p. 230–1
Divisions and Sub-divisions:
too Big and should be reduced, *Rose* ... 71,522
Statement showing how they are held at present ... ... p. 230
Executive posts, increase in number advocated, *Rose* 71,522
Number of engineers on deputation ... p. 228
Redistribution of charges advocated ... p. 231–2
Scheme outlined by Government of India, objections and alternatives proposed ... p. 228–9
Statement comparing with United Provinces p. 233
Temporary Engineers:
Date of last occasion of advertisements, *Purves* 71,692
Particulars ... ... p. 228
ROADS AND BUILDINGS BRANCH:
Cadre:
no Addition contemplated at present... p. 228
Sanctioned, and provision for leave but not for training ... ... p. 227
Number of engineers on deputation ... p. 228
Temporary Engineers employed, particulars p. 228
Temporary Engineers, memorials to Lieutenant-Governor of the, and to the Viceroy, with replies and connected correspondence ... ... p. 221–6
Three posts in Central Workshops of Department at Amritsar held by Covenanted Temporary Engineers ... ... p. 228
(*see also subject headings.*)

Purves, F. M., evidence of 71,663–92

Purves, R. Egerton, note by ... ... p. 230–3

R.

Radhika Narayan, Lala, evidence of 71,736–70

Railway Department:
Chief Engineers' pay, unfavourable comparison with men in similar position in different parts of world, *Dorman* 72,158
non-qualified Europeans should not be employed on higher pay in preference to qualified Indians, *S. N. Banarji*... ... ... 71,880, 71,893
Probation advocated, *Dorman* 72,156
Recruitment, not necessary to adopt different method from other branches of department, *Bagley* 71,394
Suggestion that permanent cadre should be fixed in accordance with normal rather than minimum requirements, illusory, *Bagley* 71,387
Training, needs no higher theoretical training than needed for work on buildings, roads, and irrigation, *Bagley* 71,375

Raj Narayan, evidence of 71,403–25

Rangoon House Allowance Scheme, should be extended so as to include bachelors and married men whose families are not in Rangoon, *Lewis* 72,068

Recruitment, Imperial Service:
AGE LIMIT:
Present, satisfactory, *Lewis*, 72,060, 72,070; *Dorman*, 72,167.
21-24, advocated, *Cowley* ... ... 71,828, p. 235
22-23, advocated, *Desenne*, 72,018; *Edge*, 72,119.
22-24, advocated, *Hope* 71,320
24 should be maximum, *Learoyd* ... 72,502, 72,530, 72,545
Appointments since 1st January, 1911, and method, *Haines* ... 72,626, p. 209–10, 72,632, 72,635
Average annual, and proportion to Indian Engineering Colleges, *Raj Narayan*, 71,403, 71,409; *Wazir Chand*, 71,560; *Baij Nath*, 71,728; *Finnimore*, 71,812; *Hodgkins*, 72,035, 72,050; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,277; *Beale*, 72,420; *Agâshe*, 72,432.
no Better plan suggested, *Ottley* 72,653

Recruitment, Imperial Service—*cont.*
CANDIDATES:
should have been at a Recognised engineering college for at least three years, *Hope* ... 71,320, 71,330
should have Resided at least five years in Europe, *Cowley* 71,828, 71,838
CENTRAL COLLEGE:
in England, advocated, *Hope*, 71,330; *Nethersole*, 71,426, 71,436, 71,455, 71,461, 71,475; *Rose*, 71,510; *Finnimore*, 71,772, 71,806; *Desenne*, 72,002, 72,011–15; *Dorman*, 72,155, 72,165; *Beale*, 72,413; *Harrison*, 72,583.
in India:
Advocated, *S. N. Banarji*, 71,886, 71,887; *R. N. Mookerjee*, 71,935, 71,947, 71,955, 71,960, p. 235.
Passed students from colleges should be given further training of two years in, and appointed to Superior Engineering Service as result of competition in final examination, *S. N. Banarji* ... 71,867, 71,868, 71,887
Training of all recruits both English and Indian at, and Rurki obviously fitted for, advocated, *Atkinson* 71,581, 71,591–2, 71,596, 71,602–3, 71,618
Colleges, giving certain number of places to, not practicable, *Ottley* 72,679
Comparison of recruits with those formerly recruited from Coopers Hill College, *Nethersole*, 71,467; *Finnimore*, 71,771, 71,780, 71,805; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,867; *Ottley*, 72,644–51, 72,662.
Comparative attractiveness of the Service, *Ottley* 72,683
COMPETITION:
Advocated ... ... p. 235
from Colleges where result is only attained after course of several years during which practical work is taken into consideration as theoretical, advocated, *Atkinson* 71,581, 71,590, 71,618
Combined with nomination advocated, *Russell*, 71,277; *Ganga Ram*, 71,535, 71,451; *Edge*, 72,119.
Difficulty, *Haines* 72,637
Number of appointments should not exceed one-third of candidates, *Raj Narayan*, 71,404; *Ganga Ram*, 71,536; *Wazir Chand*, 71,560; *Baij Nath*, 71,694, 71,701; *Hodgkins*, 72,036.
Objected to, *Ellis*, 72,207, 72,224; *Learoyd*, 72,531, 72,537; *Harrison*, 72,612, 72,614.
Subjects advocated, *Raj Narayan* 71,403, 71,413
Declaration required from candidates for all appointments ... ... p. 275
DEGREES:
Candidates should be graduates, or B.Sc. in engineering, or A.M.I.C.E.'s, or passed engineers from any Indian Engineering College, *Ganga Ram* 71,535
Honours Degree or diploma of some recognised Engineering College advocated, *Nethersole* 71,426, 71,437, p. 246
Qualifying, extract from regulations *re*, *Haines* 72,626, p. 210, 72,630; p. 239–40, 273
Recognised by Institute of Civil Engineers only, should be accepted, *Cowley*, 71,828, 71,839, 71,849, 71,851, 71,855, 71,857; *Dorman*, 72,168, *Learoyd*, 72,502.
in England and in India, advocated, *Atkinson*, 71,581, 71,597; *Annada Prasad*, 71,900, 71,909; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,143, 72,148; *Sharpe*, 72,547, 72,557, 72,563, 72,577, 72,582; *Framji*, 72,451, p. 234.
Improvements that may be recommended should have retrospective effect, *Sharpe* 72,555
Indian vernacular suggested as necessary subject, *Swaminatha Ayyar* 72,327
INDIANS:
Candidates, continuous improvement in standard, *Haines* ... ... 72,626, p. 209, 72,639
no Europeans at all would be ideal arrangement, and pay of experts for special occasions to be charged to work concerned, *Raj Narayan* 71,417
in India on recommendation of local governments and administrations, advocated, *Ottley* 72,656, 72,668

Recruitment, Imperial Service—*cont.*

INDIANS—*cont.*

Policy of excluding alumni of Indian Engineering Colleges unjust and should be abandoned, *Craig* 71,706, p. 75, 79, 80, 72,096, 72,097, 72,103, 72,108.

will be Possible to make larger proportion of appointments when terms are made good enough to tempt best class of domiciled European and Anglo-Indian and of Indians to whom kind of service is attractive, *Bayley* 71,357

Proportion, and history of proceedings, *Haines* 72,626, p. 208–9

Provision should be made for training Indians in some special institution recommended for English recruits, *Earle* ... ... p. 245

should be Recruited direct and on equal terms with Europeans, *Earle* ... ... p. 245

should be Residents of province to which they are posted as far as possible, *Earle* ... ... p. 245

Ten per cent. rule:

should be Abandoned, and recruitment in India from Indian colleges substituted, *Hope* 71,329

Absolute exclusion not advocated although recruitment confined to Indian colleges preferred, *James* 72,348

Advantage in Indians going to England, *Howley* 72,266

Alternative of appointment of Provincial Engineers to Imperial Service to extent of 10 per cent. of total recruitment in England, advocated ... ... p. 252

not meant to be Definite limit, but not exceeded in practice, *Haines* 72,629, 72,630, 72,631

Disadvantage in recruiting Indians in England, *Cowley*, 71,828, 71,839; *Learoyd*, 72,502.

Effect on recruitment of Indians, *Haines* 72,629–30, 72,636

should not be Exceeded at present, *Cowley*, 71,834; *Lewis*, 72,066, 72,093; *Edge*, 72,115, 72,121, 72,140; *Dorman*, 72,161; *Howley*, 72,253; *Harrison*, 72,589, 72,594, p. 246.

should Include all qualified men up to age of 30 years and embrace men already serving in Provincial or Subordinate Establishment, *Ellis* 72,197, 72,246

Increase, no objection, *Ellis* 72,273

Indians or Anglo-Indians should have studied at least three years in British Isles and obtained degree from one of recognised British Universities, *Harrison* ... 72,589, 72,594, 72,605, 72,607, 72,621

Limitation objected to, *Radhika Narayan*, 71,736, p. 241; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,874, 71,880; *Annada Prasad*, 71,906; *Dorman*, 72,171, 72,181; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,277; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,310, 72,314; *Learoyd*, 72,502; *Ottley*, 72,654–7, 72,666–7, 72,675–6.

Men failing for Provincial Service and having got in, heard of, *Edge*, 72,135; *Framji*, 72,452, 72,464.

Method and conditions, *S. N. Banarji* 71,874, p. 239

Necessity of having to go to England a limitation, but unavoidable, *Bagley* ... 71,363

Number of appointments compared with total number of officers so appointed, *S. N. Banarji* 71,874

Objected to, *Russell* 71,278

Open competition, advocated, *S. N. Banarji* 71,874

Particulars regarding certificate of age and nationality ... ... p. 273

and Percentage of total Indian recruitment, *Jnananjan Saha* 72,153

no Reason for not increasing, if candidates of requisite qualifications can be found, *Finnimore* 71,771, 71,777, 71,782, 71,797, 71,816

Record of entrants since 1880 ... ... p. 173

Recruitment in India by local Governments advocated, *James* 72,338 72,353

Reservation of 10 per cent. of vacancies, filled by Secretary of State, for Indians not objected to, *Nethersole*... ... 71,439, 71,481

if Retained, field should be made wider so that when no eligible candidate in England he could be drawn from India, *Dorman* 72,171

no Rule permitting more than 10 per cent. known of, *Ottley* 72,684

Recruitment, Imperial Service—*cont.*

INDIANS—*cont.*

Ten per cent. rule—*cont.*

Rules *re* qualifications recently revised, *Haines* 72,630

Selection from Provincial Service and not by direct appointment either in England or India, advocated, *Ellis*, 72,197, 72,203, 72,209, 72,221, 72,225; *Howley*, 72,258.

Standard of men varies considerably, *Ottley* 72,684

Standard reached by some barely qualified for appointment, *Haines* 72,636

Statistics, *Russell* 71,282

System of scholarships suggested, *Russell* 71,298

Training in India and then sending to England, advocated, *Edge* 72,135

Worst possible system, *Atkinson* ... 71,581

Training in England:

Advocated, *Desenne* ... 72,012–15, 72,034

not Essential, men from Indian Colleges more useful, *Ottley* 72,656, 72,675, 72,681, 72,686

Limitation to Europeans advocated, *Heaton*, 71,963, 71,965, 71,979, 71,997, 72,000–1; *Learoyd*, 72,542.

Madras and Bombay Colleges only given one place each, *Atkinson* 71,619

Method, *Russell*, 71,267; *Raj Narayan*, 71,406; *Wazir Chand*, 71,560; *Baij Nath*, 71,700; *Finnimore*, 71,771; *Hodgkins*, 72,035; *Edge*, 72,109; *Ellis*, 72,197; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,304, 72,317, 72,329; *James*, 72,330; *Framji*, 72,451, pp. 239, 242, 243–4, 246, 252, 255, 265.

Miscellaneous appointments, recruitment, method, *Haines* ... ... 72,625, p. 208

Nomination by Principal of College, who should submit to Selection Committee confidential report on general character and special qualifications of each candidate, advocated ... ... p. 246

Nominations, should be no limit, *Lewis* ... 72,060

Number of applicants and vacancies in certain years, *Ottley* 72,678

OPEN COMPETITION:

Advocated, *Russell*, 71,309, 71,314; *Nethersole*, 71,483; *Wazir Chand*, 71,560; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,736, 71,746; *Annada Prasad*, 71,900, 71,910; *R. N. Mookerjee*, 71,926, 71,943; *Hodgkins*, 72,035; *Agashe*, 72,432.

not Advocated, *Lewis*, 72,092; *Haines*, 72,637.

with no Racial limit, advocated, *Ganga Ram*, 71,535; *Baij Nath*, 71,694, 71,700, 71,710, 71,711, 71,715, 71,722, 71,725; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,736; *R. N. Mookerjee*, 71,926, 71,946; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,146.

Subjects which should be included in curriculum, *Ganga Ram*, 71,535, 71,555–6; *Wazir Chand*, 71,561, 71,569, 71,580; *Baij Nath*, 71,695, 71,701, 71,722; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,736.

Physical examination, regulations as to ... p. 274–5

not Possible to do away with recruitment of Europeans, and not suggested, *Framji* ... 72,472

Present system satisfactory, *Hope*, 71,320, 71,326, 71,329; *Bagley*, 71,357, 71,381, 71,391; *Cowley*, 71,828, 71,838; *Ellis*, 72,207; *Howley*, 72,247, 72,257; *Learoyd*, 72,502, 72,512, 72,537, p. 266.

PROMOTION FROM PROVINCIAL SERVICE:

Advocated, *Finnimore*, 71,771, 71,781, 71,801, 71,803, 71,818, 71,825; *Heaton*, 71,965, p. 241.

not Advocated, *Sharpe*, 72,547, 72,558, 72,570, 72,575; *Harrison*, 72,622.

too Great reliance should not be placed on, *Earle* p. 245

Proportions advocated, *Russell*, 71,313; *Hope*, 71,326, 71,329; *Bagley*, 71,372, 71,377, 71,388, 71,390, 71,396; *Raj Narayan*, 71,403, 71,413, 71,416; *Nethersole*, 71,432, 71,457; *Rose*, 71,516; *Ganga Ram*, 71,451, 71,535, 71,557; *Wazir Chand*, 71,560; *Atkinson*, 71,594, 71,618; *Baij Nath*, 71,694, 71,700, 71,706, 71,710, 71,711; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,748, 71,757; *Finnimore*, 71,771, 71,803; *Cowley*, 71,834; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,867, 71,872, 71,885; *Mookerjee*, 71,926, 71,932, 71,933, 71,962; *Hodgkins*, 72,035, 72,041, 72,044; *Craig*, 72,099; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,143; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,277, 72,283, 72,288, 72,289; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,314 72,329; *Agashe*, 72,432, 72,438; *Framji*, 72,451, 72,457, 72,465, 72,468, 72,473–4; *Learoyd*, 72,508, pp. 234–5, 266.

Recruitment, Imperial Service—*cont.*

Qualifications, advocated, *Lewis*, 72,060, 72,070; *Ottley*, 72,645, 72,647, 72,661, 72,668, 72,669, 72,674, 72,684, p. 235.
Record of entrants since 1880 ... ... p. 173
Recruits on whole satisfactory, but better class would be obtained on lines advocated ... p. 236
Regulations as to appointment of Assistant Engineers ... ... p. 272–5
Royal Engineers (*see that title*).
SELECTION:
must be Accepted as established fact, *Cowley* 71,828
Committee:
Candidates rejected should not be eligible for appointments in subsequent years, *Lewis* 72,060
Constitution advocated, *Hope*, 71,320; *Nethersole*, 71,426, 71,438; *Rose*, 71,510; *Ganga Ram*, 71,535; *Finnimore*, 71,771, 71,807; *Cowley*, 71,828; *Lewis*, 72,060; *Dorman*, 72,155; *Ellis*, 72,197; *Howley*, 72,247; *Beale*, 72,363, 72,375; *Learoyd*, 72,502; *Harrison*, 72,583, 72,612, pp. 235, 240–1, 246.
no Indian member, *Ottley* 72,677
does not make Point of approaching different Engineering Schools, *Ottley* 72,679
Responsible for Railways as well as Public Works Department, *Ottley* 72,682
Continuance of system advocated, *Lewis* 72,060, 72,070, 72,087
no Instances of defects known of, *Russell* 71,314
Special recommendation by Government of India, system, *Haines* 72,641
Supplemented by competitive examination, advocated, *S. N. Banarji* 71,867
System, *Haines* 72,635, 72,641
System faulty in practice, *Raj Narayan*, 71,403; *Framji*, 72,451, 72,464, 72,471.
Tests comparatively high, but not altogether sufficient to prevent certain amount of patronage, *Baij Nath* 71,727
Social qualifications should be treated as very important, *Russell*, 71,277, 71,309; *S. N. Mookerjee*, 71,932; *Lewis*, 72,060, 72,070; *Harrison*, 72,584, p. 246.
Specialists in one branch of engineering should not be barred from entering Service, *Harrison* 72,618
Statistics, *Russell* 71,282
System of series of examinations better than single one, *Beale* 72,414
Temporary Engineers (*see that title*).

Recruitment, Provincial Service:

AGE LIMIT:
22-26, advocated, *Cowley* 71,828
23, advocated, *Desenne* 72,018
Average annual, and comparison with English recruitment, *Raj Narayan*, 71,403, 71,409; *Wazir Chand*, 71,560; *Baij Nath*, 71,728; *Finnimore*, 71,812; *Hodgkins*, 72,035, 72,050; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,277; *Beale*, 72,420; *Agashe*, 72,432.
FROM COLLEGES:
should be Abolished and men taken straight into upper Service, *Craig*, 72,096 (p. 131–3, 135–6), 72,097, 72,103, 72,108.
Admission at 17, advocated, *S. N. Banarji* 71,886
should be Brought to highest possible standard, *James* 72,338
Central, for all India:
Advocated, *Finnimore*, 71,771, 71,782–3, 71,804, 71,809, 71,824; *Cowley*, 71,828, 71,841; *Heaton*, 71,969, 71,975, 71,992, *Desenne*, 72,002, 72,016, 72,023; *Hodgkins*, 72,035, 72,045; *Edge*, 72,123; *Ellis*, 72,212; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,289, p. 244.
not Advocated, *Raj. Narayan*, 71,422; *Nethersole*, 71,442, 71,478; *Baij Nath*, 71,713–4, *Radhika Narayan*, 71,747, 71,751; *Annada Prasad*, 71,911, 71,919; *James*, 72,337; *Beale*, 72,395; *Framji*, 72,470; *Allen*, 72,488.
Appointments should still be made on Provincial basis, *Finnimore* 71,817
Desirable, but not called for at present moment, *Bagley* 71,384
Engineers should obtain reduction in fees payable for education of sons, if established, *Desenne* 72,004

Recruitment, Provincial Service—*cont.*

FROM COLLEGES—*cont.*
Central, from all India—*cont.*
would be Good, but divisions in India necessitated more than one Central College, *Russell* 71,301
Certain number of appointments should be given to, in proportion to Public Works Establishments of the particular Provinces, *Bagley* 71,383
should be Confined to training of subordinates, *Atkinson*, 71,581, 71,591; *Finnimore*, 71,771, 71,804.
Co-ordination of work of various, desirable, *Russell* 71,297
Entrance to, should be by selection, combined with qualifying examination, *Hope* ... 71,320
Existing system satisfactory, and with gradual improvements in colleges, general standard of efficiency will be raised, *Harrison* 72,589, 72,593
should be Freely thrown open to Europeans when Imperial Service is again thrown open to Indian students, *Raj Narayan* 71,403
Government doing all possible to raise efficiency, *Russell* 71,313
by Governments directly from, advocated, *Sharpe* 72,547, 72,558
Marks in passing-out examination for riding and proficiency in gymnastics and games which tend to activity of mind and body and a sound physique suggested, *Bagley* 71,368
Requirements of country met, *S. N. Banarji* 71,892
Retention of four colleges, each specialising in separate subject, suggested, *Heaton* ... 71,969, 71,972, 71,992–5
Reversion to older system advocated, *Srinivasa Ayyangar* 72,277, 72,295
Searching medical examination, with particular attention to physical activity and hardiness before applicants allowed to go in for entrance examination, suggested, *Bagley* ... 71,368
Separate course for engineers from subordinates advocated, *Russell*, 71,281; *Hope*, 71,320; *Cowley*, 71,828, 71,841; *Edge*, 72,115, p. 241.
Standard, *Russell*, 71,281; *Bagley*, 71,374; *Raj Narayan*, 71,421, 71,422; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,874; *James*, 72,349; *Ottley*, 72,681.
Technical education given in all colleges about on an equality, *Bagley* 71,384
Theoretical and practical course extending over three years to be terminated by final University examination advocated, *S. N. Banarji* 71,867, 71,868
Unequal from four colleges, and guaranteed posts should be divided proportionately, *Radhika Narayan* 71,736
(*see also particular names of colleges.*)
COMPARISON OF CLASS OF MEN:
with Former class, *Bagley*, 71,378; *Rose*, 71,529.
with Imperial Service, *Radhika Narayan* 71,757
COMPETITIVE EXAMINATIONS:
Marking up papers found necessary, *Nethersole* 71,440
only Practicable system, *Bagley* 71,368, 71,382, 71,391
Declaration required from candidates for all appointments ... ... p. 275
Defects, *S. N. Banarji*... 71,867
no Difficulty in obtaining recruits, *Beale* ... 72,385
Europeans, record of entrants since 1880 ... p. 173
INDIANS:
Percentage, and percentage of total Indian recruitment, *Jnananjan Saha* 72,153
Record of entrants since 1880 ... ... p. 173
Keen competition, *Agashe*, 72,445; *Framji*, 72,461.
Method, *Russell*, 71,267; *Raj. Narayan*, 71,403; *Wazir Chand*, 71,560; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,874; *Hodgkins*, 72,035; *Ellis*, 72,197; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,277; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,304, 72,318; *Beale*, 72,363, 72,376, 72,394, 72,406; *Framji*, 72,451; *Allen*, 72,478, 72,499, 72,501; pp. 240, 242, 243–4, 246, 252, 255–6, 266.
Nomination, followed by qualifying examination advocated, *Hope* 71,331
should be Open to all British subjects equally, irrespective of caste, colour, or creed, *Jnananjan Saha* 72,146

Recruitment, Provincial Service—*cont.*

PROMOTION OF UPPER SUBORDINATES:

Advocated, *Radhika Narayan*, 71,749; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,149.

not Advocated in proposed re-organised department, *Agashe* 72,446

has not Attracted best of available men, *Srinivasa Ayyangar* 72,277, 72,302

should be no Bar to Service, *Baij Nath*... 71,716

Early in career as subordinates advocated, *Beale* 72,363, 72,376, 72,399

no Increase advocated, but promotion of exceptional man not objected to, *James*, 72,330, 72,340; *Beale*, 72,406.

not put on Probation, *Beale* 72,364

Objected to, *R. N. Mookerjee*, 71,937, 71,950; *Craig*, 72,108; *Learoyd*, 72,536.

Proportion of recruitment, *Agashe* ... 72,432

Provincial Service entirely manned by, advocated, *Craig* 72,108

Rate, *Ellis* 72,230

Record of entrants since 1880 ... ... p. 173

Reduction desirable, *Russell* 71,283

Stopping of, advocated, and creation of additional grade of Extra Assistant Engineers suggested, *Framji* 72,451, 72,467

System satisfactory, *Desenne*, 72,030; *Ellis*, 72,197.

10 per cent. of, 50 per cent, advocated, *Hodgkins* 72,035

Undesirable, and should form new Provincial Service, *Raj Narayan* 71,403

Proportion advocated, *Russell*, 71,313; *Hope*, 71,326, 71,329; *Bagley*, 71,372, 71,390, 71,396; *Raj Narayan*, 71,403, 71,413, 71,416; *Nethersole*, 71,432, 71,457; *Rose*, 71,516; *Ganga Ram*, 71,451, 71,535, 71,557; *Wazir Chand*, 71,560; *Baij Nath*, 71,694, 71,700, 71,706, 71,710, 71,711; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,736, 71,748, 71,757, 71,764–5; *Finnimore*, 71,771, 71,803; *Cowley*, 71,834; *S. N. Banarji*, 71,867, 71,872, 71,885; *R. N. Mookerjee*, 71,926, 71,932, 71,933, 71,962; *Hodgkins*, 72,035, 72,041, 72,044; *Craig*, 72,099; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,143; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,277, 72,283, 72,288–9; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,310, 72,314, 72,329; *Agashe*, 72,432, 72,438; *Framji*, 72,451, 72,457, 72,465, 72,468, 72,473–4; *Learoyd*, 72,508, pp. 234–5, 236.

Record of entrants since 1880 ... ... p. 173

not Restricted to statutory natives of India, *Beale*, 72,396; *Allen*, 72,498.

Restriction imposed on people of one province disabling them from competing for guaranteed appointments in other provinces should be removed, *Srinivasa Ayyangar* 72,286

Selection, system should be adopted, *Rose*... 71,516

System satisfactory and proportion suitable p. 266

Transferred from other Governments, record of entrants since 1880 ... ... p. 173

Relations with other Services:

Amalgamation scheme of Public Works and Civil Accounts recently introduced, but previous system more efficient, *Raj Narayan* 71,411

Improvement desirable, *S. N. Banarji*, 71,873, 71,881; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,285; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,311.

Independence in relation to other Services should be maintained, *Heaton*, 71,966; *Lewis*, 72,067.

Orders of local administration regarding departments should be dealt with only by Public Works Secretariat, *Desenne* 72,022

Resentment at putting officers under Accountant-General in drawing salaries and travelling allowances, *Raj Narayan* 71,411

Satisfactory, *Russell*, 71,274; *Bagley*, 71,366; *Nethersole*, 71,433; *Rose*, 71,517; *Finnimore*, 71,778; *Cowley*, 71,835; *Annada Prasad*, 71,907; *Desenne*, 72,009; *Lewis*, 72,067; *Edge*, 72,116; *Dorman*, 72,162; *Ellis*, 72,204; *Howley*, 72,254; *Beale*, 72,370; *Harrison*, 72,590.

Serious attempt should be made to equalise conditions of service, Sharpe 72,554

Tendency of Revenue officers to bring Public Works officers under their control, Raj Narayan 71,411

Rendel, Sir A. M., note on his procedure in getting and choosing candidates ... ... p. 211

Retirement:

Comparison between Indian and European officers, *Beale* 72,368, 72,404

COMPULSORY:

for Continued inefficiency, advocated, *Hope*, 71,322; *Cowley*, 71,830; *Ellis*, 72,199, 72,215, 72,220; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,279; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,306; *Beale*, 72,365, 72,403; *Harrison*, 72,585, p. 235.

at 50, if rank of Superintending Engineer not reached:

Abolition advocated, *S. N. Banarji* ... 71,879

should be Rigidly enforced, *Russell*, 71,269; *Nethersole*, 71,428; *Rose*, 71,512; *Cowley*, 71,830; *Lewis*, 72,062; *Dorman*, 72,157; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,286; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,306; *Beale*, 72,365; *Harrison*, 72,585.

at 55:

not Considered essential as long as rule made applicable to future entrants and applied to other services, *Russell*... 71,310

should be Rigidly enforced, *Russell*, 71,269, 71,291; *Hope*, 71,322, 71,336; *Rose*, 71,512, 71,525; *Finnimore*, 71,799, 71,820; *Lewis*, 72,062; *Dorman*, 72,189; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,279; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,306; *Beale*, 72,365; *Learoyd*, 72,504, 72,517, 72,523–4; *Sharpe*, 72,549; *Harrison*, 72,619.

OPTIONAL:

should be Given to officers whose claims for promotion have been continuously overlooked, *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,289; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,306.

Qualifying period should be reduced to 25 years, *Ellis* 72,202

after 20 years' service:

Abolition favoured if better terms were offered in way of pension, *Russell* 71,290

Advocated, *Wazir Chand*, 71,565, 71,572; *Sharpe*, 72,552.

no Case known of, *Beale* 72,407

Few, but no difficulties put in way of anyone who desired to go, and concessions valued, *Russell*, 71,290; *Ellis*, 72,218.

Inducement to men to join department and should be retained, *Lewis* 72,077

Premature, *Nethersole* 71,449

Privilege should be extended to Indians, *Radhika Narayan* 71,755

Roads and Buildings Branch, subject to unfair criticisms, but second to no other in efficiency, *Desenne* 72,009

Rose, F. C., evidence of 71,488–534

Royal Engineers:

Additional expenses of employing, should be charged to Military Department, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,660

Civil Department obtains considerable advantage by introduction, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,661

Expenses as compared with Civil Engineers, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,650, 71,656

General Provident Fund should be open to, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,631, 71,658

in Irrigation Branch not objected to, but should come in at proper place and in early years of service, *Baij Nath* 71,717

LEAVE:

Civil leave rules, *Pollard-Lowsley*... ... 71,652

Furlough:

Commutation of, part on half-pay into half period on full pay claimed, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,629

Rule prohibiting officer from taking, till an interval of not less than 18 months since return from privilege leave, should be abolished, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,629

Privilege:

Rule requiring officer taking, immediately before retirement to return to duty before he retires, should be abolished, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,629

Rule should be framed to allow accumulation up to maximum of six months, *Pollard-Lowsley*

Officers entering Department after military service, suggestions as to pay and seniority, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,625, 71,642, 71,643, 71,655

Royal Engineers—*cont.*

PAY:

Bar of Rs. 900 should not apply in case of officer reported as fit to hold charge but for whom no charge is available, *Pollard-Lowsley* ... 71,628

Conditions, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,628, 71,633–7, 71,654

Consolidated pay equal to civil pay plus net military pay, subject to no limitations claimed, *Pollard-Lowsley* ... 71,628, 71,632, 71,638–40

should not be Different from civilians, *Rose* 71,532

in Military Works Service, statement showing total pay drawn by officer, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,662, p. 63

Minimum higher than Civil Engineers, *Learoyd* 72,544

in Public Works Department, statement showing pay drawn by officer under rules of 1911, *Pollard-Lowsley* ... ... 71,662, p. 64

Statement comparing rates of pay of Royal Engineer Officers in Military Works Services and Public Works Department, *Pollard-Lowsley* p. 63, 71,641, 71,662

Statement showing comparison of different scales of pay of Imperial Civil Engineers and as revised from time to time, *Pollard-Lowsley* p. 60

Travelling allowance, existing rates, particularly in case of transfer, inadequate, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,627

PENSIONS:

Conditions, *Pollard-Lowsley* ... 71,630, 71,640

should not be Different from civilians, *Rose* 71,532

Proposals, *Pollard-Lowsley* ... 71,630, 71,657

Practice to count first year of Service in Department as commencing 2½ years after commission, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,646, 71,648

PROBATION:

no Period ordinarily necessary, and none laid down except in case of higher grade than Assistant Engineer, *Pollard-Lowsley*... 71,626

Rate of pay to which officer entitled if appointed permanently to Department should be drawn, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,626

RECRUITMENT:

Age limit, might be inconvenient to Government, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,644

to Bottom of list:

Advocated, *Russell*, 71,276; *Hope*, 71,335; *Beale*, 72,363, 72,377, 72,387; *Learoyd*, 72,502, 72,514, p. 235.

Objected to, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,645

Continuance favoured to certain extent, but has been rather overdone, *Bagley* 71,385

Date of appointment, if officers appointed direct to Department, should be date of landing in India, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,625, 71,642

Method, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,625

Proportion of, and proportion recommended, *Agashe* 72,432

Reason for employment in Public Works Department, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,659

Statistics, *Russell* 71,282

Supersession of Civil Engineers should be guarded against, *Rose*, 71,512, 71,524; *Radhika Narayan*, 71,750; *Cowley*, 71,830; *Desenne*, 72,004, 72,019; *Edge*, 72,111, 72,120, 72,134; *Dorman*, 72,157, 72,174, 72,186; *Harrison*, 72,585, 72,597, 72,669.

Retirement from Army under Army Regulations should not compel retirement from Public Works Department, *Pollard-Lowsley* ... 71,627, 71,649

Reversion to military employment, question of, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,653

Training, system produces officers in every way capable of undertaking duties in Public Works Department, *Pollard-Lowsley* 71,626

Rurki College:

AGE LIMIT FOR ENTRANCE:

European students have several chances, Indian students get only one chance, *Radhika Narayan* 71,736

Raising of minimum from 17 to 18 and maximum from 21 to 22 under consideration, *Atkinson* 71,613

Rurki College—*cont.*

AGE LIMIT FOR ENTRANCE—*cont.*

21 years, and candidate required to be a graduate, anomaly should be removed, *Wazir Chand* 71,560, 71,575–6, 71,578

Anglo-Indians would send children to, if conditions of service were improved, *Bagley* ... 71,400

Assam Provincial Service recruited from, *Desenne* 72,030

Candidates for Provincial Service should be sent to, *Russell* 71,281

Classes drawn from domiciled community and from Indians, *Atkinson* 71,584

Disparity between school-leaving certificate and B.A. and B.Sc. degree, *Atkinson* .. 71,575, 71,601

no Distinction made between different communities in India, *Atkinson* 71,614

ENGINEERING CLASS:

Cost to Europeans and to Indians, *Atkinson* 71,620, 71,623

Entrance examination, average number of candidates, *Atkinson* 71,614

Fees, *Atkinson* 71,620

Marks of student carried on from year to year, and no final competitive examination, *Atkinson* 71,615

Particulars, *Atkinson* 71,583

Percentage of Hindus and Muhammadans, *Atkinson* 71,614

Proportion of domiciled community, *Atkinson* 71,614

Europeans and Anglo-Indians attend, as a rule, and not other colleges, *Allen* 72,482, 72,495

Existing system of open competition for admission to, and for admission from college into service excellent, *Raj Narayan* 71,403

Final examination, marks given for sports and games, *Atkinson* 71,616

Further medical examination before leaving college, *Atkinson* 71,616

General education of students defective, and training inferior to course at Universities in England, which it is recommended recruits should undergo pp. 235–6

as Good practical training given as anywhere, *Atkinson* 71,588–9

Higher mathematics, large proportion of Indian students and very small proportion of Anglo-Indians capable of taking, *Atkinson* ... 71,611

Improvement in training unnecessary at present, *Raj Narayan* 71,422

Indian graduates from, should be nominated for Upper Subordinate Service, *Russell* ... 71,293

Indian students limited to Provinces of Upper India; Bengal, Madras and Bombay excluded, *Atkinson* 71,584

Indians trained at, should be given opportunity of practical work, *Russell* 71,315

List of distinguished engineers from, *Baij Nath* 71,699

LOWER SUBORDINATE CLASS:

Every man should be given year's practical training, *Atkinson* 71,598

no Guaranteed appointments to look to, *Atkinson* 71,598

Particulars, *Atkinson* 71,583

Madras, Bombay and Sibpur Colleges not as well equipped, *Russell*, 71,313; *Atkinson*, 71,619.

not Maintained at all from Imperial funds, entirely supported by Provincial funds, *Atkinson* 71,606

Marking for moral fitness done in negative way, *Atkinson* 71,607

no Means by which students not obtaining Government appointments could get apprenticed at other works, *Atkinson* 71,621

Mechanical engineering, difficult problem to face, *Atkinson* 71,604

Mechanical laboratory at University of Sheffield compared with, *Atkinson* 71,610

Medical test enforced for admission, *Atkinson* 71,616

Men of higher social status desirable, *Atkinson* 71,600, 71,602

Number of appointments should be increased in proportion to requirements of Province, *Jnananjan Saha* 72,143

Practical work apart from laboratory work done entirely outside building, *Atkinson* ... 71,587

Primary reason for establishment, *Russell*... 71,298

Rurki College—*cont.*
Privately managed railways do not utilise to any extent for supply of engineers and mechanics, *Atkinson* 71,608
Provincial Service men from, not so good as men who formerly entered Imperial Service, *Russell* 71,293, 71,312
Qualifications for entry, *Atkinson* 71,585
Recruitment area smaller than other colleges although allotted six posts, *Heaton* ... 71,984
RECRUITMENT FROM:
on Basis of continuous record of marks, *Sharpe* 72,569
Increase in, desirable, *Russell* 71,283
Nomination and competition advocated, *Rose* 71,521
Restrictions on admission not at present existing at other colleges, *Atkinson* 71,619
not Same class of men as formerly, *Russell* 71,312
Smaller number of Europeans entering, than formerly, *Sharpe* 72,569
Social standing of class of Indians going to, satisfactory, *Russell* 71,297
Standard as good as that at Woolwich in certain subjects, *Atkinson* 71,609
Students not wanting guaranteed appointments do not come to, *Atkinson* 71,599
Sufficient amount of practical experience in surveying included, *Bagley* 71,379
Sufficient on intellectual side, but does not train men for practical work as they could be trained in English colleges, *Hope* 71,346
Syllabus not complained of on whole except that it is little too wide, *Nethersole* 71,440
System of appointing two apprentices to each vacancy unsatisfactory ... ... p. 246
should be Thrown open to students from Burma and Assam, *Jnananjan Saha* 72,143
Training provided, particulars, *Atkinson*... 71,586
UPPER SUBORDINATE CLASS:
Certain number of students European soldiers being trained for Military Works Department, *Atkinson* 71,584
Particulars, *Atkinson* 71,583
16 or 17 out of 40 obtained guaranteed appointments yearly and remaining 23 obtained employment somewhere, *Atkinson*... ... 71,598

Russell, R. P.:
Evidence of 71,266–319
Note by ... ... p. 219

S.

Salary (*see* Pay).

Secretariat, not strong enough, *Desenne* 72,025–6

Secretary to Government of India in Public Works Department:
Appointment on Rs. 4,000 advocated, *Russell*, 71,270, 71,311; *Rose*, 71,513; *Pollard-Lowsley*, 71,628; *Cowley*, 71,831; *Dorman*, 72,158; *Harrison*, 72,586.
Local allowance of Rs. 250 as at present, advocated, *Hope*, 71,323; *Learoyd*, 72,505; p. 236.
should be Two secretaries, or post should be given to either branch in rotation ... ... p. 235

Sharpe, J. H., evidence of 72,546–82

Sibpur College:
Admissions should not be increased though number of appointments be increased, *Jnananjan Saha* 72,143
Advanced age at which students qualify for Service, and proposal, *S. N. Banarji*, 71,875, 71,882, 71,891; *Annada Prasad*, 71,901.
Age of admission, reducing, under examination by Bengal Government ... ... p. 241
Bachelor of Science, admissions will be affected by new age regulations of Matriculation Examination of University, *Heaton* 71,963
Bengali students not keen on engineering for its own sake, more interested in trying to obtain Government post, *Heaton* 71,963
Course in some respects much stiffer than old Coopers Hill course, *Annada Prasad* ... 71,919
Distribution of passed-students, *Heaton* ... 71,970
Final examination, *Heaton* 71,989
Four years' course could be reduced with advantage to three years, *Jnananjan Saha* ... 72,143, 72,149

Sibpur College—*cont.*
Guaranteed appointments should be increased to two every year, or to four if Rurki not thrown open to Assam and Burma, *Jnananjan Saha* 72,143
Higher standard of education of boys entering, desirable, *Finnimore* 71,814
Increased patronage would attract larger number of suitable students, *Heaton* 71,964
Keen competition for entrance, *Heaton* ... 71,971
Length of course combined with increase in practical training, created age difficulty, and admission to college over a certain age should be refused, whether B.Sc. read up to or not, *Heaton* 71,988, 71,990, 71,998
Number of recruits for Bengal, Bihar and Orissa should be increased to 50 per cent. of total number of annual recruits, *Jnananjan Saha* 72,143
Number of students admitted yearly and average number passing through, and qualifying at end of four years' course, *Heaton* 71,963
One guaranteed post only, and most of students have to accept posts in Subordinate Services, *Heaton* 71,963, 71,980, 71,985
Particulars, *Heaton* 71,968
Practical and theoretical training should be combined, *Annada Prasad* 71,918, 71,921
Qualification for entrance, *Heaton* 71,988
RECRUITMENT:
Area, *Finnimore*, 71,771; *Annada Prasad*, 71,921; *Heaton*, 71,963, 71,984, 71,986.
Rules for, and schedule of marks ... ... p. 240
System unsatisfactory, *Jnananjan Saha* ... 72,143
REMOVAL TO DACCA:
not Advocated, *Annada Prasad* 71,919
Proposed, and reason, *Finnimore*... 71,809, 71,813
UPPER SUBORDINATE SERVICE STUDENTS:
Course and qualifications, *Heaton* ... 71,974
no Objection to training in same building as engineers, so long as separate lectures given, *Heaton* 71,974
Schedule for competition ... ... p. 240
Training not so good as at Rurki, *Finnimore* 71,813

Sikhs, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 268

Srinivasa Ayyangar, Avargal, M. R. Ry., R.A., evidence of 72,277–303

Sub-divisional Charges (*see under* Charges).

Subordinate Service:
very few Anglo-Indians, *Ellis* 72,230
Listed appointments as Executive Engineers, advocated, *Srinivasa Ayyangar*... ... 72,286, 72,292
LOWER:
Abolition and replacing by Overseers, advocated, *S. N. Banarji* 71,876
Government should reserve right of dispensing with services of inefficient officers, *Earle* p. 246
Pay:
Conveyance allowance, revision advocated, *S. N. Banarji* 71,877
Rates ... ... p. 248
Rates inadequate and improvement advocated, *Earle* ... ... p. 245–6
Recruitment, method of ... ... p. 246
Standard of admission, *Earle* ... ... p. 245
Many subordinate officers possess Assistant Engineer qualifications, *Heaton* 71,963
RECRUITMENT:
Candidates should be sent to colleges other than Rurki, *Russell* 71,281
Open examination from Provincial Colleges, advocated, *Mookerjee* 71,932
(*see also under particular names of colleges.*)
Training, no improvement necessary, *James* 72,341
UPPER:
College training appreciably lower than that of engineer student, *James*... 72,330
Constitution of, improved, advocated ... p. 234
Creation of Provincial Service for, advocated, *Raj Narayan*, 71,403; *Annada Prasad*, 71,902.
Deputy Engineer Service to replace, advocated, *S. N. Banarji*, 71,876, 71,885; *Agashe*, 72,432.
Designation recommended, *Earle* ... p. 245
Employment in charges which could not be filled by Assistants in Imperial Service, suggested, *Raj Narayan* 71,415, 71,416

Subordinate Service—*cont.*
UPPER—*cont.*
Engineering students failing to obtain appointments in Superior Service accept appointments in, *Finnimore* 71,771, 71,784
Majority of Sub-divisional Charges must devolve on, *Russell* 71,266
Pay:
Conveyance allowance, revision advocated, *S. N. Banarji* 71,877
Improvement should be possible without raising pay of Provincial Service, *Russell*... 71,293
Increments should be subject to stoppage for repeated bad work, *Earle* ... ... p. 245
Rates ... ... p. 248
Scale and improvement advocated, *Earle* p. 245
Personnel stood in need of great improvement, *Baij Nath* 71,716
Power to dispense with services should be given to Local Governments, *Earle* ... ... p. 245
Promotion:
to Rs. 350-550 grade should be by selection, and officers not promoted should be eligible for two increments, *Earle* ... ... p. 245
to Provincial Service (*see under* Recruitment, Provincial Service).
Recruitment:
Method ... ... p. 246
Selection should be limited, *Swaminatha Ayyar* 72,312, 72,314
practical Training after leaving college, *Ellis* 72,213
Working satisfactorily, *Ellis* 72,213
Work, standard, *Craig*, 72,106; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,296.
(*see also* Overseers.)

Sudras, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 268

Superintending Engineers:
should be Heads of Departments, *Desenne* 72,004
One class only, advocated, *Edge* ... 72,112, 72,124
PAY:
Incremental scale should be extended to... p. 242
Less drawn than before change in 1908, *Edge* 72,112
Rates advocated. *Hope*, 71,323; *Rose*, 71,513; *Cowley*, 71,831; *Lewis*, 72,063; *Edge*, 72,112, 72,124; *Learoyd*, 72,505; *Harrison*, 72,586, 72,598.
Same whether recruited in India or England, advocated, *Rose* ... ... 71,517, 71,520, p. 266
Time scale advocated ... ... p. 267
PENSIONS:
no Difference should be made between pension of, and Chief Engineer, *Hope* 71,354
Extra, Provincial Engineers should have right to, *Bagley* 71,371
Special, advocated, *Russell*, 71,272; *Annada Prasad*, 71,905; *Ellis*, 72,202, 72,223.
no Provincial Engineer has yet qualified for, *Craig* 72,104
Two classes only, advocated. *Learoyd*, 72,505; *Rose*, 71,513; *Cowley*, 71,831.

Swaminatha Ayyar, Avargal, M. R. Ry., N., evidence of 72,304–29

T.

Temporary Engineers:
Agreements renewed yearly, *Beale* 72,410
Already employed for many years should be taken permanently into service—on separate list—or discharged, *Raj Narayan* 71,405
Appointment, 1913, particulars, *Haines* 72,626, p. 209
not Being permanently connected with service, might show tendency to succumb to temptations more than those on permanent staff, *Nethersole* 71,482
Cadre based on number of superior appointments, *Russell* 71,299
Certain number necessary, *Nethersole*, 71,444; *Rose*, 71,528; *Purves*, 71,682.
Charge of divisions should not be given to, *Hope*, 71,347; *Raj Narayan*, 71,405; *Desenne*, 72,004; *Sharpe*, 72,547.

Temporary Engineers—*cont.*
CONDITIONS OF SERVICE:
Main grievances, summary, *Purves* ... 71,667
Particulars and Declaration Form, *Griffith*, 71,245; *Russell*, 71,266; *Purves*, 71,667, 71,680, pp. 220–1.
should be Regarded as permanent non-pensionable service on incremental scale of pay, *Purves*, 71,668, 71,669, 71,675; *Baij Nath*, 71,699, 71,718, 71,708; *Hodgkins*, 72,042, 72,047; *Jnananjan Saha*, 72,150; *Framji*, 72,459.
Suggested improvements, *Russell*... ... 71,266
Unsatisfactory, *Radhika Narayan* ...
Definition, *Purves* 71,665
Difficulties of dispensing with services, *Russell* 71,266
Difficult to obtain, under existing conditions of pay, *Russell* 71,294
Distinct difference in level of efficiency as between permanent engineer and, *Nethersole* ... 71,468
Duties in Irrigation Department, *Purves* ... 71,691
Employment of great number constituted evil and led to discontent, *Nethersole* 71,468
Employment should be reduced to a minimum, *Hope*, 71,322, 71,347; *Beale*, 72,365; *Learoyd*, 72,502.
Exact position on entering Service not realised until too late, *Purves* 71,676, 71,678, 71,688, 71,689–90
Future appointments should be on understanding of non-appointment to permanent scale, *Rose*, 71,512; *Purves*, 71,668; *Cowley*, 71,830; *Dorman*, 72,157; *Howley*, 72,249; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,306; *Harrison*, 72,585.
no General demand to be brought under General Provident Fund, *Purves* 71,677
Greater security of tenure should be arranged, *Bagley* 71,373
Increase of cadre to absorb all, not possible, *Rose* 71,522
Increase in number of Divisions advocated so that permanent men have no just cause of complaint of introduction, *Purves* 71,668, 71,669, 71,674, 71,683
Increase in permanent cadre and reduction in, advocated, *Nethersole* 71,434, 71,444, 71,445, 71,454, 71,472
should not be Kept in service longer than five years as a rule, *Sharpe* 72,547
to Large extent permanently employed, *Russell* 71,266
LEAVE:
Conditions of, *Griffith* 71,245
Claim to be brought under European service rules, *Beale* 72,367
Rules should be in accordance with uncovenanted service rules generally, *Bagley* 71,373
Length of service, *Purves* 71,672
should be no Limitation in employment of, chargeable to works, *Sharpe* 72,547
Local Governments find increasing difficulty in getting, of as good quality as formerly, *Russell* 71,294
should not be Looked upon as source of recruitment for permanent service, *Lewis* 72,068
Main reason for employment—difficulty of finding sufficient number of upper subordinates qualified for permanent posts, and suggested remedy, *Russell* 71,287
Mechanical, Electrical, Architectural and Sanitary Engineers who are fully qualified and specialised should be given permanency after term of approved service, *Purves* 71,668, 71,669
Memorials of certain Temporary Engineers and connected correspondence, *Purves* 71,668, p. 221–6
Men should be transferred from one Province to another as needed, *Purves* 71,669
Number, *Purves*... 71,671
Number holding executive charge, *Purves*... 71,673
Number should be reduced to requirements of work of purely temporary nature ... ... p. 235
no Objection to admission to proposed new service. *Raj Narayan* 71,416
Organised on quasi-permanent basis and intended to eke out deficiencies of permanent establishment, *Russell* 71,299, 71,304
Particulars *re*, *Bagley*... 71,373
PAY:
Allowances drawn by permanent men claimed 72,366, p. 173

Temporary Engineers — *cont.*

PAY—*cont.*

Claim to 10 per cent. more than permanent men occupying same posts ... ... 72,366, p. 173
Conditions, *Griffith* 71,246
Contribution towards Provident Fund would meet part of demand, *Beale* ... ... 72,366, p. 136
Higher than officer of corresponding rank in Provincial or Imperial Service; reasonable in consideration of being employed on non-pensionable basis, *Russell*... 71,288
on Incremental basis claimed ... 72,366, p. 173
Scale should be at least that of permanent service, *Bagley* 71,373, 71,386
on Still higher basis to enable insurance for pension or contribution to Provident Fund 72,366, p. 173
should be Placed on permanent pensionable scale, by increasing cadre list suitably, *Purves*... 71,668, 71,669, 71,674, 71,683, 71,684
Position occupied, unsatisfactory 71,708
should be eligible for Promotion to higher rank than Assistant Engineer, *Bagley* ... 71,373, 71,386
Prospects of other employment, *Beale* ... 72,398
Provident Fund should be extended to, *Russell*, 71,292; *Bagley*, 71,373; *Harrison*, 72,585, 72,609.
Re-casting of cadre for certain Provinces which have gone far ahead of other Provinces in way of construction works, *Purves* 71,674

RECRUITMENT:

from Indian Colleges advocated, *Hodgkins*, 72,042; *Framji*, 72,458.
Method, and brief history, *Griffith*, 71,244; *Purves*, 71,666.
Method suggested, *Sharpe* 71,708, 72,547
should be Stopped altogether, or should be placed on some regular and systematic basis, *Radhika Narayan* 71,736
Statistics, *Russell* 71,282
Reluctance to employ upper subordinates as subdivisional officers cause of employment of, *Russell* 71,266
Rule of discharge of incompetent, with month's notice fairly strictly carried out, *Bagley* 71,392
Six months' notice of termination of service on either side should be minimum, *Purves* 71,668, 71,669
Some endeavour should be made by Government to secure men employment elsewhere, *Purves* 71,669, 71,687
Statement that work is markedly inferior to that of Permanent Engineers not agreed with, *Purves* 71,685–6
Sufficient number would be obtained in India, if establishment were improved or placed on more permanent footing, *Russell*... 71,294
Suggestion that in lean years there would be no difficulty in lending out to companies entirely illusory, *Bagley* 71,387
Three months' notice claimed, *Beale* ... 72,365

TRANSFER TO PERMANENT CADRE:

Absorption of certain number might be possible, *Nethersole* 71,446
not Advocated as general rule, but hard and fast rule inexpedient, *Beale* 72,363
Arbitrary selection made for transfer of men to permanent cadre, *Nethersole* 71,456
of Best men would in great measure remove present difficulty, *Rose* 71,528

Temporary Engineers — *cont.*

TRANSFER TO PERMANENT CADRE — *cont.*

should be put on Incremental scale of pay, *Learoyd* 72,502
Letters from Government of India to Bombay Government 174–5
on List of Extra-Assistant Engineers before new recruits admitted advocated, *Sharpe* ... 72,547, 72,575
Only possible by placing on list according to relative length of service, *Baij Nath* ... 71,732
Provincial Officers should also have been promoted *Craig* ... 72,096, 72,105, 72,107, pp. 132–3
Reconsideration of position on seniority list claimed, *Beale* ... ... 72,366, p. 173
Refusal by Supreme Government of recommendation of Local Government to appoint certain engineers to Imperial Cadre, *Griffith* 71,247–65
Supersession of permanent engineers should be guarded against, *Rose*, 71,512; *Cowley*, 71,828, 71,830, 71,852; *Dorman*, 72,157; *Ellis*, 72,214, 72,240; *Howley*, 72,249, 72,267; *Srinivasa Ayyangar*, 72,277; *Swaminatha Ayyar*, 72,312; *Beale*, 72,363, 72,403; *Learoyd*, 72,502, 72,514; *Harrison*, 72,585.
should not be Taken permanently into service in which pick of Indian and European colleges are appointed by competition, *Raj Narayan* 71,403
Vacancies should be filled as far as possible by p. 173
Value depends on method of appointment, *Raj Narayan* 71,423
Yearly selection as if service were one of regular sources of recruitment, advocated, *Radhika Narayan* 71,738, 71,752

Training (*see under* Probation and Training).

Travelling allowances (*see under* Pay).

U.

United Provinces of Agra and Oudh:

Civil appointments, on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians, 1st April, 1913 ... ... p. 270
Comparison of number of Europeans and Indians, *Raj Narayan* 71,409
Government memorandum ... ... p. 233–9
IRRIGATION BRANCH:
Comparative statement showing average area of irrigation per Division and Sub-division and cost of establishment ... p. 230, p. 230–1
Inadequacy of staff ... ... p. 236–7
Statement, comparing with Punjab ... p. 233
(*see also subject headings.*)

Upper Subordinate Service (*see under* Subordinate Service).

W.

Wazir Chand Chopra, Lala, evidence of 71,560–80; App. II.; p. 220

Work:

Method of calculating cost of, *Beale* ... 72,391
Nature of, *Annada Prasad* 71,920

ROYAL COMMISSION ON THE PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA.

APPENDIX TO THE REPORT

OF

THE COMMISSIONERS.

VOLUME XVII.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

RELATING TO THE

POST OFFICE OF INDIA AND TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT

Taken at Delhi, Calcutta, Madras, and Bombay,

WITH

APPENDICES.

Presented to both Houses of Parliament by Command of His Majesty.

OF THE BOMBAY BRANCH OF THE ROYAL ASIATIC SOCIETY

Ex. S. 45

LONDON:
PRINTED UNDER THE AUTHORITY OF HIS MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE
By EYRE AND SPOTTISWOODE, LTD., EAST HARDING STREET, E.C.,
PRINTERS TO THE KING'S MOST EXCELLENT MAJESTY

To be purchased, either directly or through any Bookseller, from
WYMAN AND SONS, LTD., 29, BREAMS BUILDINGS, FETTER LANE, E.C., and
28, ABINGDON STREET, S.W., and 54, ST. MARY STREET, CARDIFF: or
H.M. STATIONERY OFFICE (SCOTTISH BRANCH), 23, FORTH STREET, EDINBURGH: or
E. PONSONBY, LTD., 116, GRAFTON STREET, DUBLIN:
or from the Agencies in the British Colonies and Dependencies,
the United States of America and other Foreign Countries of
T. FISHER UNWIN, LONDON, W.C.

[Cd. 7905.]

CALCUTTA
SUPERINTENDENT GOVERNMENT PRINTING, INDIA
1916.

VOL. XVII. *Price Twelve Annas.*

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission	2
Minutes of Evidence	3
Appendices	64
Index	100

List of Witnesses examined before the Royal Commission.

At DELHI, Monday, 3rd November 1913.

	PAGE
W. Maxwell, Esq., C.I.E., M.V.O., Director General of Posts and Telegraphs in India	3
C. H. McMinn, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Kangra Division, Punjab	13
S. C. Sinclair, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Derajat Division, Punjab	13
Sri Ram, Esq., M.A., Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General, Punjab and North-West Frontier Province	13
N. W. Vaughan, Esq., Postmaster, Lucknow	23

At DELHI, Tuesday, 4th November 1913.

C. Streatfield-James, Esq., M.I.E.E., Director of Telegraphs, United Provinces	24
I. C. Thomas, Esq., M.V.O., M.I.E.E., Director of Construction, Telegraph Department	24
P. N. Mitra, Esq., Assistant Superintendent of Telegraphs, Lucknow Division	30

At CALCUTTA, Monday, 19th January 1914.

G. W. Schöneman, Esq., Deputy Director-General of the Post Office	33
R. W. Hanson, Esq., Officiating Assistant Director-General of the Post Office	37
C. D. Rae, Esq., Deputy Postmaster, Calcutta	37
H. K. Raha, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Midnapur Division	37

At CALCUTTA, Tuesday, 20th January 1914.

H. Mayston, Esq., Director of Telegraphs, Bengal	40
J. C. Shields, Esq., Acting Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, Telegraph Department	40
G. P. Roy, Esq., M.I.E.E., Officiating Director of Telegraphs, Eastern Bengal and Assam Circle	42
J. W. Thurley, Esq., Deputy Superintendent of Telegraphs (Traffic)	46
R. G. Walker, Esq., Deputy Superintendent of Telegraphs (General)	49

At MADRAS, Tuesday, 27th January 1914.

H. C. A. Goodall, Esq., Director of Telegraphs, Madras	54
J. G. Morgan, Esq., Superintendent, Telegraph Department, Trichinopoly Division	55
J. F. Rodrigues, Esq., Officiating Presidency Postmaster, Madras	57
P. A. Krishnama Charlu, Esq., Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General, Madras	57

At BOMBAY, Monday, 9th February 1914.

D. S. Captain, Esq., Superintendent of the Post Office, Poona	59
C. J. E. Clerici, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Rajputana Division	59
D. J. Murtrie, Esq., I.S.O., Presidency Postmaster, Bombay	59
R. T. Gibbs, Esq., Director and Superintending Engineer of Telegraphs, Bombay and Central Circles	62

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE

TAKEN BEFORE THE

ROYAL COMMISSION

ON THE

PUBLIC SERVICES IN INDIA

RELATING TO THE

POST OFFICE OF INDIA AND TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT

At Delhi, Monday, 3rd November 1913.

PRESENT:

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. *(in the Chair).*

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

H. N. HUTCHINSON, Esq., I.C.S., Postmaster-General, Punjab.
H. S. STYAN, Esq., Director of Telegraphs, Punjab Circle.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. *(Joint Secretary).*

W. MAXWELL, Esq., C.I.E., M.V.O., Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs in India.

Written statement relating to the Post Office of India.

75,144. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—Recruitment for the posts of Superintendent is effected in two ways, namely:—

(1) by the selection of qualified persons not already in the service of the Department, and

(2) by the promotion of officials from the subordinate ranks of the Department.

In the former case, the person selected is generally required to join as a Probationary Superintendent and is not appointed to the lowest grade of Superintendent until he has shown his fitness in every respect for the position and has passed the prescribed departmental examination. It is necessary, however, on occasion to appoint a non-domiciled European direct to the lowest grade of Superintendent and, when this course is followed, the person selected is placed on probation and is not confirmed until he has justified his selection, and has passed the departmental examination.

In the latter case, the official chosen is permitted to appear at the departmental examination, and if he passes he is eligible for a Superintendentship. When appointed as such, he is placed on probation for an appropriate period, usually a year.

During the last five years 60 officers were appointed permanently as Superintendents, and of these 27 began their service as Probationary Superintendents, and 29 were promoted from the subordinate ranks of the Department, while only four were appointed direct to the Superintendents' grade. During the same period four Probationary Superintendents and one non-domiciled European appointed direct to the grade of Superintendent were found unfit for the position of Superintendent, and were removed from their appointments.

An Indian who seeks admission to the Department as a Probationary Superintendent must as a general rule be a graduate of a recognised university, and in the case of all other candidates for Superintendentships the possession of adequate educational qualifications is insisted on. In all cases regard is paid to social standing and physical fitness.

I am of opinion that the selection of Superintendents should, as in the recent past, continue to be made approximately equally from among outsiders and officials in the subordinate ranks of the Department. There is also, I consider, no objection to the occasional appointment of a non-domiciled European direct to the grade of Superintendent, provided that it is laid down that the person selected cannot move up in the grade until he has passed the Departmental examination and has been confirmed.

Recruitment for the appointments of Postmaster is almost invariably effected by the promotion of officials from the subordinate ranks of the Department, such as sub-postmasters and clerks, who usually start their careers as probationers. The rare exceptions to this rule are the Probationary Postmasters, eight of whom, including five Indians, have been appointed as Postmaster since 1909, in order to improve the personnel in the higher appointments. No alteration is required in regard to the recruitment of Postmasters.

75,145. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—Ordinarily a Probationary Superintendent is not allowed to act as a Superintendent until he has had a year's training in the practical work of the Department, that is to say, he performs the actual duties of a Postmaster, accompanies a Superintendent on tour, and is given an insight into the general working of the Department in the office of a Postmaster-General, a Superintendent and a Postmaster. There is, however, no maximum period fixed after which a Probationary Superintendent must, as a matter of course, receive a Superintendentship if he has shown himself to be qualified in every way. During the last three years 16 Probationary Superintendents were permanently appointed as Superintendents, and the average period for which they remained Probationary Superintendents was two years and two months.

O (5)28849 Wt 1800 6/15 E & S

As stated under the head "Methods of recruitment," all persons appointed to the grade of Superintendent are required to serve on probation for an appropriate period, and the minimum period is six months.

I am of opinion that no change is called for in the present arrangements.

As regards Postmasters, I have nothing to add to my remarks under the head "Methods of recruitment."

75,146. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—In paragraph 27 of my predecessor's letter* No. 464-S.G., dated the 13th November 1912, to the Government of India regarding the proposed amalgamation of the Post Office and Telegraph Departments, copies of which have been supplied to the Commission, it has been proposed that the pay of Postmasters-General should be revised as shown below, so as to permit of the withdrawal of Exchange Compensation Allowance and the removal of all distinction between members of the Indian Civil Service and other Postmasters-General, and the abolition of the special rate of pay admissible for one Postmaster-General, 1st grade, if a member of the Indian Civil Service:—

Present.	*Proposed.*
1 on Rs. 2,250—50—2,500.	2 on Rs. 2,500.
3 on Rs. 1,750—50—2,000.	2 on Rs. 2,250.
6 on Rs. 1,500—50—1,750.	3 on Rs. 2,000.
(*plus* Exchange Compensation Allowance in the case of each officer personally eligible).	3 on Rs. 1,750.

The arguments in favour of this proposal are given in the letter referred to and I have no modifications to suggest.

The present rates of pay for Deputy Postmasters-General (including Inspectors-General, Railway Mail Service and Sorting) and Assistant Directors-General do not, in my opinion, require revision.

The recent history with regard to the matter of improving the pay of Superintendents is given at pages 6, 7 and 8 of the Memorandum on the Indian Postal Service that was prepared for the Commission by the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry. The time-scale actually proposed by my predecessor was one under which each Superintendent would rise from a minimum of Rs. 200 to a maximum of Rs. 700 by annual increments of Rs. 20; and I have no objection to its introduction provided that there is an efficiency bar at the Rs. 500 stage.

If, however, the existing system of grades is to be maintained, the following scale would probably be suitable, subject to the condition that promotion to the highest grade should be made solely by selection:—

Grades.	Number of appointments.	Percentage on total.
Rs. 500—25—700	17	10
„ 400—20—500	34	20
„ 300—20—400	51	30
„ 200—20—300	69	40

The great defect in the existing grading is that a Superintendent is required to remain on a fixed pay of Rs. 200 for an indefinite period and again on a fixed pay of Rs. 250 for a similar period. Every Superintendent should, I think, be certain of drawing a pay of Rs. 300 after five years' service, and this would be the case whether the time-scale or the revised grading shown above were adopted. Personally, I would have no objection if the only change made were the substitution of a Rs. 200—20—300 grade for the present grades of Rs. 200 and Rs. 250, the highest pay for a Superintendent remaining at Rs. 600 for some time to come.

Orders have recently been issued raising the minimum pay of Probationary Superintendents to Rs. 100 and I consider that this is sufficient, except in Burma, where there is a special rate of Rs. 150.

The following table compares the grading sanctioned for Postmasters at the present time with that in force in 1907:—

Grades.	Number of appointments in 1907.	Number of appointments at present time.
Pay—Rs.		
1,000—40—1,200	0	2
800—40—1,000	0	1
600—50—1,000	2	0
600—50—900	1	0
600—40—800	0	2
500—20—600	0	5
450—25—600	1	0
400—20—500	3	9
300—20—400	5	11
300—10—350	1	0
300	4	0
250—10—300	7	0
200—20—300	0	32
250	1	0
200—10—250	9	0
200	3	0
150—10—200	28	60
150	20	0
100—10—150	0	58
140	1	0
100—8—140	46	0
120	2	0
100	85	74
80	46	0
70	2	0
Average Pay	Rs. 146·9	Rs. 194

It will be seen that the position of these officials is incomparably better than it was six years ago, and I am of opinion that all that is now required is to effect small improvements in the grading from time to time as the necessity arises, and this is actually done.

75,147. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—There are no special leave rules for officers of the Post Office, and it is not necessary, in my opinion, that they should be treated differently in the matter of leave from other uncovenanted officers. I think, however, that the general leave rules need modification in certain respects.

Under the rules as they stand, an officer is eligible for the grant of three months' privilege leave after 33 months' uninterrupted service, and this amount of privilege leave is not increased if the officer remains on duty after the expiry of the 33 months. It seems to me that, while an officer who voluntarily postpones taking the privilege leave that is due to him deserves no special consideration, an officer who is called upon by the Local Government, in the interests of the service, to postpone such leave should be treated more liberally. My suggestion is that in the latter case the officer in question should be allowed to accumulate privilege leave beyond a period of three months, that is to say, the whole of the period for which he is required to remain on duty, over and above the 33 months which rendered him eligible for privilege leave for three months, should be treated as service counting for privilege leave at the accepted rate of one day's leave for every eleven days' service, and that he should be allowed, when his services can be spared, to take the whole of this accumulated privilege leave on full pay either by itself or in combination, if he wishes, with any other leave to which he is entitled under the leave rules.

My second suggestion is that the period of service which an officer subject to the European service leave rules must render before he is eligible for first furlough should be reduced from eight to five years.

* Appendix [illegible] (enclosure).

I also think that the maximum leave allowances prescribed in Articles 314 and 341 of the Civil Service Regulations as admissible under the European and Indian Service Leave Rules, respectively, should be abolished. Having regard to the fall in the value of money both in Europe and in India, it goes without saying that allowances that were considered sufficient twenty years ago cannot possibly be adequate at the present time. Moreover, a very large number of officers serving under both rules take furlough in order to obtain medical treatment in Europe, and on this ground, if on no other, they have a distinct claim for more liberal treatment on Government, who should be a model employer. I understand that at present the covenanted employés of some of the larger mercantile firms in India are treated much more liberally in the matter of leave and leave allowances than Government officers. It seems to me inequitable that the leave allowances of the more senior and, generally speaking, the more efficient, officers should be limited as they are at present, and there is little doubt, I think, that if the rule under which privilege leave can be combined with other leave had not been introduced, the necessity for increasing the maximum leave allowances would have been urged on Government many years ago.

Another respect in which I consider that the present leave rules require alteration is the amendment of the definition of the term "average salary" for the purposes of calculating the leave allowances for furlough. The term "average salary" is defined in Article 16 of the Civil Service Regulations as "the "average of the salary which an officer has earned "during so much of the three years preceding the "day on which he gives up office as he has passed on "duty or on privilege leave."

I consider that the leave allowances for furlough should be not less than half the salary earned by an officer during so much of the *two* years preceding the day on which he gives up office as he has passed on duty or on privilege leave.

75,148. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—There are no special pension rules for officers of the Post Office and it is not necessary, in my opinion, that they should be treated differently in this matter from other uncovenanted officers.

I have only two suggestions to make with regard to the existing general rules and orders relating to pensions. The first is that every officer should be entitled to commute one quarter of his pension for a lump sum *unconditionally*. The present rules lay down, among other things, that an applicant for commutation of pension must undergo a rigorous medical examination and that the Local Government should not only decide whether the commutation would be to the distinct and permanent advantage of the pensioner or his family but should also fix the proportion (not exceeding one-fourth) of the pension that may be commuted so as to leave sufficient to maintain the pensioner in accordance with his station in life after retirement. I am of opinion that, if an officer has earned his pension, he has served Government in full and the fact, for instance, that his health is broken possibly through that very service, is not a sufficient reason for imposing harder terms of commutation upon him. The Government of India do not deal with pensions on the principles of life insurance, and I consider it very desirable that, if the pension system is retained, all officers should be at liberty to commute without conditions of any sort one-fourth of the pensions granted to them on retirement, unless it is possible to introduce in India a system of superannuation allowances and gratuities similar to that prescribed in the English Superannuation Act of 1909 (9 Edw. VII., ch. 10), under which the proportion of annual salary on which the scale of pension is calculated was reduced from one-sixtieth to one-eightieth and the grant of a lump sum equal to one-thirtieth of the annual salary and emoluments of a retiring officer multiplied by the number of years' service rendered was introduced.

My second suggestion is that the exception in Article 644 (*b*) of the Civil Service Regulations, under which a period during which an officer officiates for another officer absent on privilege leave is not permitted to count as service qualifying for additional pension should be abolished. I do not think that the ordinary principle that two officers should not count service in the same appointment should be applied in this case, and I consider it desirable that the whole of the service rendered in a qualifying appointment should count towards the grant of an additional pension. The pension is given for approved service in the appointment, and there should be no distinction between service in a furlough vacancy and service in a privilege leave vacancy.

My own personal opinion is that the pension system should be abolished altogether and replaced by a system of deferred pay which might take the form of payments by Government into an officer's account in the General Provident Fund. The main disadvantage of the pension system is, that if an officer who has completed the period of service qualifying for full pension dies before the pension is sanctioned, or before he has drawn it for a reasonable period, neither he nor his family reap any benefit from the long service rendered by him to Government in the expectation of the receipt of a pension at the end of that service. Other disadvantages are the difficulty of giving effect to a set of rules which must necessarily be complex and, therefore, troublesome; the impossibility of dispensing with the services of an officer who is found to be no longer efficient without inflicting great hardship; the inequality of the system of granting additional pensions to a few selected officers which is in itself more or less a lottery; and the unfairness of limiting the pension of a thoroughly efficient officer who has attained a high position to the same amount as it admissible to an indifferent officer of a much lower standing. The last-mentioned disadvantage is most marked in the case of officers drawing more than Rs. 1,000 at the time of retirement, as from that stage onwards the pension admissible bears absolutely no relation to the average salary of an officer before retirement. Thus the pension admissible to an officer on Rs. 1,500 and an officer on Rs. 900 is exactly the same. The fall in the value of money to which I have already referred in connection with leave allowances must sooner or later be recognized by increasing the scale of pensions, and the whole position will have to be reviewed. It seems to me, therefore, that the time has arrived for considering whether a system cannot be devised which will not present the disadvantages described above and which will enable Government to gauge accurately their liability for non-effective charges.

75,149. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial.** — In the Post Office there is no division of the kind referred to above and no such division is, in my opinion, necessary. In addition to the appointments of Director-General and of Postmaster-General, ten per cent. of the total number of Superintendentships are open to non-domiciled Europeans because it is considered essential that there should be a leven of such persons in the ranks of Superintendents. With these exceptions, no appointment in the Post Office carrying a pay or minimum pay of Rs. 200 or more can be bestowed on a person who is not a Statutory Native of India, without the special sanction of the Government of India; and the occasions on which such sanction is asked for are very rare. In short, it may be said that, with the few exceptions mentioned above, appointments in the Post Office are practically reserved for Statutory Natives of India, and this, I think, is as it ought to be.

75,150. **(VIII.) Relations of the service with Indian Civil service and other Services.**—The recommendation of the Public Service Commission of 1886–87 was as follows, "That of the seven highest "appointments in the Department at present filled by "Covenanted Civilians, not less than three should "ordinarily be filled by promotion within the Depart-"ment."

In addressing the Secretary of State on the subject of this recommendation, the Government of India expressed themselves in the following terms: "We "accept the proposal to fill three of the seven highest "appointments in the Department by promotion of "departmental officers who do not belong to the "Indian Civil Service, subject to the reservation that "it shall be acted on only when men fit for this pro- "motion are available. The greatest importance is "attached to this reservation, as in view of past "experience and of the nature of the arrangements "under which it is proposed to recruit for the lower "supervising appointments it is considered by no "means improbable that there may sometimes be no "Deputy Postmaster-General, or other officer in the "Department below the rank of Postmaster-General, "fit for promotion to that rank. Indeed, the develop- "ment of the Post Office and the number of points "at which it is now being connected with other "branches of the administration render it perhaps "less likely than formerly that an officer trained "solely in the Department will make a thoroughly "efficient Postmaster-General."

The Secretary of State replied saying that the views expressed by the Government of India had his general concurrence.

The appointment of Director-General has hitherto been conferred on a member of the Indian Civil Service.

There are now ten appointments of Postmasters-General. Four of these are at present held by officers promoted from the ranks of the Department and probably there will soon be five, but the normal number is likely to be four. I am of opinion that it may properly be laid down that four Postmaster-General-ships should be filled by officers of the Post Office whenever men fit in every way to hold the position are available, but I should have no objection whatever if the number were fixed at five, subject to the proviso mentioned.

75,151. **(IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—The only other point which I consider it necessary to bring to the notice of the Royal Commission is a general question relating to the travelling allowance admissible for journeys on transfer.

It is definitely stated in Article 995 of the Civil Service Regulations that travelling allowance is given to officers to cover the actual travelling expenses incurred by them in travelling in the interests of the public service, but under Article 1094 *ibid.* any gazetted officer, or any non-gazetted officer whose salary after transfer exceeds Rs. 400 a month, is allowed on transfer from one station to another only double the fare of the class in which he is entitled to accommodation in the case of journeys by rail, the ordinary mileage allowance in the case of journeys by road, and his bare fare in the case of steamer journeys. I understand that in the United Kingdom, where transfers are few, the rules regulating the grant of travelling allowance on transfer are such that the State bears the whole of the actual expenses incurred by the officer concerned, and although I would not at present propose that Government should bear the whole of the actual expenses incurred by a married officer in breaking up his home at one station and installing himself at his new station, it appears to me to be only equitable that Government should relieve all its officers of a reasonable share of the heavy expenses caused by frequent transfers. The number of transfers in a service like the Post Office in India must of necessity be numerous, and there is no doubt that the present rules operate harshly on married officers and constitute a real grievance especially in the case of officers drawing less than Rs. 1,000 a month.

Under Article 1098 of the Civil Service Regulations, a non-gazetted officer whose salary after transfer does not exceed Rs. 400 a month is, if the transfer is to a station more than 200 miles distant and is made for a period exceeding three months, granted his actual travelling expenses, subject in the case of railway and steamer journeys to a maximum of four full fares of the class of accommodation to which he is ordinarily entitled for himself and his family, three full fares of the lowest class for his servants, and the actual cost of carriage of his personal effects within certain specified maxima; and in the case of journeys by road to three times the ordinary mileage allowance admissible and the actual cost of carriage of his personal effects within the scale laid down for railway and steamer journeys.

I recommend that the condition regarding the minimum distance to be travelled should be expunged from this rule and that the rule as thus modified should be made applicable to all classes of Government officials on transfer.

Written statement relating to the Indian Telegraph Department.

75,152. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—The orders under which recruitment to the superior service of the Indian Telegraph Department has hitherto been regulated are, briefly, that five-eighths of the superior establishment is to be recruited in England by the Secretary of State, one-fourth from the Engineering Colleges and Technical Institutes in India by the Government of India on the nomination of the Director-General, and the remaining one-eighth by the promotion of selected subordinates. These orders are, however, in abeyance at present pending a decision on the proposals for the amalgamation of the Telegraph Department with the Post Office submitted to the Government of India on the 13th November 1912,* copies of which have been supplied to the Commission, and no officers have been appointed to the Imperial Service of the department since 1906 or to the Provincial Service since 1910.

The predominant feature of the scheme of amalgamation is the separation of engineering and traffic work, which is now performed by the same officers. Under the proposals in paragraph 41 of the scheme, practically the whole of the staff of officers required for the superior Traffic Branch will be recruited in India by the promotion of qualified upper subordinates and subordinates of the Telegraph Department, and the prospects of the latter will be incomparably greater than at present. They cannot now rise above Rs. 500 a month whereas, with the creation of a separate Traffic Branch, thirteen appointments ranging from Rs. 800 to Rs. 2,000 a month will be open to them and three-fourths of these appointments will probably be held by promoted subordinates if they are qualified.

The staff of superior officers proposed for the Engineering Branch is very small and it is of the greatest importance that this staff should consist of highly trained and carefully selected electrical engineers. Instead of recruiting about four officers annually for an establishment of ninety-six, recruitment will be limited to the requirements of a staff of only forty-six and, after the claims of the subordinates of the Engineering Branch have been met by the promotion of three of them to the superior grades, it is probable that only two telegraph engineer officers will be required annually. It has been proposed in paragraph 38 of the amalgamation scheme that these should be obtained by the selection by the Secretary of State of one officer yearly in England, the selection by the Goverment of India of one officer every alternate year from an Engineering College or Technical Institute in India, and the promotion every alternate year of a selected subordinate of the Engineering Branch of the Telegraph Department. In this branch also provision has been made for the improvement of the prospects of subordinates and, in addition to the large number of superior appointments in the Traffic Branch for which they will be eligible, subordinates of the Telegraph Department will also be given in the reduced superior engineering establishment the same number of appointments for which they were nominally eligible when the total promotion of subordinates to the superior grades was limited to one promotion every two years.

I do not consider any modification of these proposals necessary or desirable.

* These orders have now been passed—*vide* Appendix I. *See also* Appendix VI.

75,153. **(II.) System of training and probation.**—The existing system of training is summarised in paragraph 39 of the letter* to the Government of India on the subject of the amalgamation of the Telegraph Department and the Post Officer. Owing to the cessation of recruitment it has not been necessary to apply the system for some years, but it has not proved satisfactory in the past and will no longer be suitable if amalgamation is sanctioned. The system of training and probation which I consider should be adopted for the future is stated in detail in paragraphs 39 and 41 of the letter referred to above, and it has been designed with the object of ensuring that only really suitable officers should be retained in the department, either as engineers or as traffic officers.

75,154. **(III.) Conditions of service.**—With the exception of pay and pension, the present conditions of service of superior officers of the Telegraph Department are generally identical with those of the ordinary civil establishments of the State, and I do not consider that any special conditions of service are necessary. It appears desirable, however, to introduce a rule, similar to that in force in the case of the Indian Police, that all officers appointed, either in England or in India, *direct* to the Engineering Branch or the superior Traffic Branch under the arrangements for direct appointments proposed in paragraphs 38 and 41 of the scheme of amalgamation of the Telegraph Department and Post Office, should be liable to removal from the service if they fail to pass the departmental examinations specified in paragraphs 39 and 41 of the amalgamation scheme within the prescribed period, or if, within the same period, they are found unfit for the duties of the service to which they are appointed. It should also be ruled that any officer so removed will, if he was appointed in England, be furnished with a free passage to England provided he utilises such passage within three months from the date of removal.

75,155. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—So far as I am aware, the salaries admissible to superior officers of the Telegraph Department under the resolutions of the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 913–918–115 and No. 4276—4280–133, dated the 2nd February 1910 and 4th June 1912, respectively (copies of which were furnished to the Commission with the memorandum prepared by the Department of Commerce and Industry), are generally suitable and I have no modifications to suggest beyond those proposed in section III. of the amalgamation scheme. The proposals contained therein include a recommendation that, as the post of Director-General of Telegraphs has been abolished, the pay of the highest appointment in the Engineering Branch of the amalgamated departments, which will in future be the highest ordinarily attainable by a telegraph engineer, should be fixed at Rs. 2,750, partly to compensate officers now serving in the Telegraph Department for the loss of the Director-Generalship and partly to provide reasonably good prospects for telegraph engineers appointed in future. The prospects of the superior officers now in the department and of future entrants will be sufficiently favourable if the proposals referred to above are accepted in their entirety, and I am not in favour of making any other changes. The question of the eligibility of officers of the Telegraph Department for the appointment of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs is referred to in section VIII. of this memorandum.

75,156. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—[Mr. Maxwell's recommendations under this heading are identical with his recommendations under the same heading in his preceding Written Statement relating to the Post Office—*see* paragraph 75,147.]

75,157. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—The ordinary maximum pension which can be earned by superior officers of the Telegraph Department is the same as for other uncovenanted services, *viz.*, £437–£10–£0 after 25 years' service, but this maximum may be specially increased in certain exceptional circumstances to £525 or £613 in the case of officers appointed in England. In reply to the memorials which were submitted to them in 1908 by the Imperial Service officers of the Telegraph Department the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry stated on the 15th September 1909 that "the question of the "revision of the rates of pension of various services "under Government, including the Telegraph Depart- "ment, is at present under the consideration of the "Government of India; but a considerable time must "elapse before a final decision is likely to be arrived "at on the subject."

There is no great inducement at present for an able officer to remain on in the service after he has earned his maximum pension; but in the past there has not been any marked tendency on the part of Telegraph Department officers to leave the service before they are 55 years of age and are obliged to go under the age clause, and the Provident Fund to which officers of the Telegraph Department are permitted to subscribe places these officers at the time of retirement in a more or less similar position to that in which members of the Indian Civil Service are placed by the contribution made by them towards pension. Recruitment for the superior service of the Telegraph Department has been stopped for some years, and it is not possible to form any well-founded opinion on the question whether the present scale of pensions is sufficiently attractive to induce suitable officers to join, and remain in, the Telegraph Department.

[The remainder of Mr. Maxwell's recommendations under this heading are identical with his recommendations under the same heading in his preceding Written Statement relating to the Post Office—*see* paragraph 75,148.]

75,158. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of divisions of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—In the resolution of the Government of India in the Public Works Department, No. 156 T. E., dated the 25th August 1892, it was laid down, when the Provincial Service for the superior establishment of the Indian Telegraph Department was first formed, that the candidates for appointment to that service should be natives of India as defined in Statute 33, Vict. c. 3, s. 6, and this limitation still holds good. As I have pointed out in section I (paragraph 75,152) of this memorandum, recruitment for the superior establishment of the Telegraph Department is at present suspended. When recruitment is re-opened there will be no limitation in the employment of non-Europeans in the superior Traffic Branch and, except in the case of the very small number of appointments to be made in England which is provided for in paragraph 41 of the amalgamation scheme, vacancies in this branch will be filled by the appointment of selected subordinates of the Indian Telegraph Department whether Europeans or non-Europeans. The majority of the officers selected will naturally be statutory natives of India and I do not consider any restriction desirable.

In the case of the Imperial and Provincial Services of the Engineering Branch the only racial restriction will be that candidates for the latter service should be statutory natives of India. Non-Europeans will be eligible for selection in England by the Secretary of State for appointment to the Imperial Service provided they have received the particular training which will be specified by the Government of India when they request the Secretary of State from time to time to make appointments to this service, and domiciled Europeans will be eligible for appointment to the Provincial Service provided they are statutory natives of India and have received a suitable professional training.

As regards the working of the existing system of division of the superior establishment into Imperial and Provincial Services, I would invite attention to paragraph 18 of the resolution of the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 913–918–115, dated the 2nd February 1910, referred to in chapter III. of the memorandum prepared for the Commission by the Department of Commerce and

* *Vide* Appendix I. (enclosure).

Industry. The officers recruited for the Provincial Service in the past were not selected with special reference to their suitability for the Telegraph Department and had not as a whole received the technical education and training which will be demanded from candidates for the Provincial Service of the Engineering Branch when recruitment is re-opened. This will, however, be remedied under the new system of nomination by the Director-General, and I do not consider that there will be any difficulty in selecting suitable candidates in India to fill the single direct appointment to the Provincial Service every alternate year which has been proposed in paragraph 38 of the amalgamation scheme. As I have already stated in other sections of this memorandum I do not consider it necessary to make any changes in the pay or general conditions of service of the Provincial Service of the Telegraph Department.

75,159. **(VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—There is, I believe, a feeling among a number of the officers of the Telegraph Department that their prospects have been materially injured by the decision that an officer outside the Telegraph Department should hold charge of the department and there is naturally some resentment that this officer should have been a member of the Indian Civil Service. No orders have, however, been passed that the appointment of Director-General of the amalgamated department of Posts and Telegraphs should invariably be held by a member of the Indian Civil Service and there is no reason, so far as I am aware, why at any time in the future the appointment should not be filled by an officer of the Telegraph Department if he is considered fit for it and is the most suitable person available.

So far as I am aware, the relations of the officers of the Indian Telegraph Department with other services are quite satisfactory and I have no remarks to offer in this connection.

75,160. **(IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—[Mr Maxwell's recommendations under this heading are identical with his recommendations under the same heading in his preceding Written Statement relating to the Post Office—*see* paragraph 75,151.]

Mr. W. MAXWELL called and examined.

75,161. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness said that he joined the Indian Civil Service in the year 1891 and served about nine years in Lower Bengal, entering the Post Office as Postmaster-General. He had been on special duty twice in regard to Telegraph matters, once in connection with the Amalgamation scheme and again on the Telegraph Committee. For a short time, in the year 1908, he acted as Secretary in the Finance Department, and in 1909–10 was Secretary in the Department of Commerce and Industry. In February last he took over the appointment of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs from Sir Charles Stewart Wilson, having already acted for about nine months in the year 1908 as Director-General of Posts. A despatch on the subject of the Amalgamation scheme had recently been sent to the Secretary of State, and he understood that practically no modification had been made in the proposals submitted to the Government of India. Care had been taken to safeguard the interests of all officers. The appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs would disappear from the cadre, but he presumed the joint appointment of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs would be open to the whole Service. In the Telegraph Department, so far as the subordinates were concerned, he considered that much greater prospects would be open to them. Any apprehensions which might exist with regard to the scheme he believed to be groundless, so far as the officers in the Service were concerned.

75,162. The Post Office side of the department would be recruited in India as it had been up to the present; there was no proposal to alter anything with regard to the Post Office. On the Telegraph side there would be two sections, one for engineering work containing a strong element recruited in England; and the other for traffic work, mainly recruited in India. About one-fourth of the latter would be recruited direct, and three-fourths by promotion from the subordinate ranks. Again, on the Post Office side there would be one single Service as at present, whilst on the Telegraph side the Superior Service would be divided into an Imperial and a Provincial Branch. It was proposed to reduce the proportion of the Imperial Branch by one-eighth, the present proportion being five-eighths. The Provincial Branch of the Telegraph Service would run parallel to the Imperial Service; it would not be an inferior service in any way. The duties would be precisely the same, the only difference being that the officers in the Provincial Service would receive two-thirds of the pay of the officers in the Imperial Service, on the ground that their expenses were not so great.

75,163. With regard to the Post Office of India, there were five Postmasters in the larger cities who drew salaries at special rates, which approximated to those of officers holding administrative rank. Below that came the first class or gazetted Postmasters, and below that the second class or non-gazetted Postmasters. The dividing line between the first class and the second class was a salary of Rs. 300, those drawing over that amount being gazetted and those drawing under non-gazetted. The number of first class officers was fixed with reference to the work of particular offices, and the pay of each office similarly depended on the volume of its work as was the case in the United Kingdom.

75,164. With regard to recruitment for the higher appointments of Postmaster until recently all officers had passed ordinarily through the lower ranks, but in the last four or five years the experiment had been tried of appointing a few men from outside at Rs. 150 rising to Rs. 200; it was not possible however to say yet whether the experiment had been justified. The change was made owing to the difficulty, which was occasionally experienced, of finding really efficient officers for the appointments. There was in practice an efficiency bar at the Rs. 500—Rs. 600 grade. Although it was not laid down in the rules, cases at that stage were very carefully scrutinised. For the highest appointments, that of Postmasters of the big towns, there was again selection. Twenty-five was the usual age limit for recruitment, but as a rule the men came in at about 21 or 22. The majority of Postmasters entered as subordinates, and the matriculation standard was generally the test. Men, however, who were brought in on the Rs. 150 to Rs. 200 grade were expected to have higher qualifications, some of them being graduates. The selection of the recruits was made by the Postmaster-General, who submitted the nominations to the Director-General, and frequently the latter saw the men himself. The men were on probation for a considerable time before being permanently appointed. Practically all Postmasters entered through the subordinate grade, being appointed as vacancies occurred. The work was gradually becoming more complex, and better men were needed than in the past. He did not advocate going any further than making an occasional appointment of an outsider, as if too many were appointed in the higher grades it would tend to lower the quality of the men who came in in the lower grades. He did not think it would be desirable to make a distinction between first class and second class Postmasters, with a view to recruiting a certain proportion of the former by direct appointment, because he thought the men who came in direct would probably be above their work. The highly educated man as a rule did not care for a Postmastership.

75,165. With regard to the distinction between Postmasters and Superintendents, postmasters as a rule were in charge of one large office in a big town, while the Superintendent was in charge of a large area,

probably extending over a couple of districts. The function of the Superintendent was the inspection and control of many offices, while the Postmaster's function was the direct control of one office. It could happen that a higher paid Postmaster might be inspected and reported upon by a lower paid Superintendent, but the inspection in such a case was confined practically to audit work and there was not in practice much friction. A Postmaster could become a Superintendent, but that did not often happen and was not encouraged, because the duties of the two classes were quite different. Superintendents were recruited to a certain extent from Postmasters, but not largely. The subordinates who became Superintendents were more frequently Inspectors, *i.e.* Assistants to Superintendents. Generally speaking, the two branches were kept in separate watertight compartments. The five prize Postmasterships had been occasionally filled in the past by Superintendents when it was thought there was no man of the right stamp amongst the Postmasters, but that was avoided as far as possible.

75,166. With regard to the large preponderance of Europeans and Anglo-Indians in the higher grades of Postmasters, he though that was due to the fact that in the past Indians were not recruited nearly so freely as was the case now. In the year 1893 out of 35 such appointments only 8 were held by indians, but now there were 34 out of 76. As a rule, highly educated Indians were not very anxious to take up Postmasterships, they preferred a Superintendent's appointment. The large preponderance of Anglo-Indians and Europeans in the higher grades of the Postmaster's branch would tend to decrease, though not perhaps very rapidly. There were certain places where it was desirable to have an Anglo-Indian or European, as, for instance, military stations. He had heard no complaint on the part of the Indian public on the subject.

75,167. Turning to the Superintendents, the witness said that officers of that rank were appointed partly directly and partly by promotion from the lower ranks. Recruiting was derermined by the number of vacancies likely to occur. The number of Superintendents in a circle was about 18 to 20 and probably there would be 2 vacancies in 5 years, and arrangements were made accordingly. Direct recruits were seen by the Postmaster-General, who sent up the names to the Director-General, who made the appointment. The men were kept on probation for about two years as probationary Superintendents, and afterwards on probation for about one year as Superintendents. The age limit was 25, but as a rule the men came in at about 22. There was no minimum fixed, but a man seldom became a graduate before he was 21 years of age. Sometimes a man was appointed on account of his physical qualities or family connections, though he might not be a graduate, and he thought it desirable to retain that discretion. It was not exercised in one case out of twenty, but it was a discretion worth having. No difficulty was experienced with regard to the nominations. The Postmaster-General, the Director-General, and probably the Deputy Director-General practically formed a Board of Selection. He should not recommend any form of competitive examination to take the place of the present system, because the men selected for the Service were now very good.

75,168. Generally speaking, the educational qualifications of Anglo-Indians were not as high as those of Indians, but they were sufficiently good for the purpose, and such officers had certain qualities, such as the power of controlling men, in a higher degree than Indians. In choosing Anglo-Indians it was better to take a man whose social standing was such that he would be received by ordinary society, and thus would be in a position to speak to a Magistrate or Deputy Collector on any matter of business on equal terms. Occasionally a mistake was made as to this, but he did not think there was much serious practical difficulty in deciding about a candidate's social standing, and he thought it well to leave it vague as at present.

75,169. He was against fixing any proportion for Indians. If a proportion were fixed, it might in practice work out to less than the department actually would give. Roughly speaking the numbers of Indians and Europeans holding higher appointments were now about equal, but if it were found necessary to vary the proportion that would be done. The half and half position had not been worked out by any rule. There was power, he added, to appoint 10 per cent. of the Superintendents from non-domiciled Europeans, and this was necessary principally for field service. It was occasionally necessary to send half-a-dozen men on field service during war, and Indians were very averse to going, and domiciled Europeans were not very keen. The non-domiciled Europeans selected were men who could mix on equal terms with British officers. The 10 per cent. proportion had been found sufficient and at present the figure was rather below that. The men were often the sons of officers serving in this country. No particular examination was prescribed for them, but they were interviewed and their general education enquired into. They came in at about the same age as the other men in the service, and at present amongst them were two University men, a B.A. of Cambridge and a B.A. of Oxford.

75,170. There was no fixed age for promoting subordinates, to higher appointments but as a rule a man was not promoted after the age of 40, on account of the fact that a Superintendent had to be an active man ready to move about on the shortest notice.

75,171. With reference to the preponderance of Europeans and Anglo-Indians in the higher grades, there was also the tendency there for the number of Indians to increase. Up to the 1st November the number of Indian Superintendents was 103 out of 172, so that since the 1st July the number of Indians had risen by 3, and he anticipated that that process would go on, although not so markedly in the future. In 1893 out of 118 Superintendents only 34 were Indians, so that there had been a marked tendency towards multiplying Indians in those appointments. He would not recommend reserving any definite proportion of the higher posts for Indians and he did not think that the Indians themselves considered that too few of them were employed.

75,172. The witness did not consider that putting probationary Superintendents on a single list instead of on circle lists would be a practical arrangement. At present in Bengal, when a vacancy of Probationary Superintendent occurred, a Bengali was appointed, but if he were on a general list, and it was his turn for promotion, and a vacancy of Superintendent occurred in the Panjab, he would have to go to the Punjab to take up the appointment, and consequently men would be rarely serving in their own Province. As things were, a Bengali served in Bengal, a Madrasi in Madras, and so on. The only men for whom a general list would be suitable would be Anglo-Indians or Europeans, who did not so much mind to what part of the country they went. There would be objection to taking a man from Bengal and appointing him to the Punjab or *vice versa*. Moreover the man would probably rather resign the Service than go.

75,173. For promotion to the higher administrative posts men could be drawn not only from the Superintendents but also from the Postmasters, but in practice the Superintendents obtained most of the appointments.

75,174. Indian Civil Service officers came into the department as Postmasters-General. They were usually put on special duty for a month or two before they finally took up their appointments, but a period of six months was really necessary. The maintenance of a certain number of Indian Civil Service officers was essential. In practice 12 men were required to fill the 10 Postmaster-Generalships, as 2 officers were ordinarily on leave. Two of these posts were to be given to the Telegraph Department, but one would be an acting appointment. It would work out, therefore, that there would ordinarily be 5 departmental, 2 telegraph, and 5 Indian Civil Service Postmasters-General, but 2 of the 12 would be acting men. At the present moment there were 3 Postmasters-General absent on leave.

75,175. Witness desired to remove all distinctions, as far as salaries were concerned, between the Indian Civil Service officers and the officers of the Post Office. The only distinction now made was in the first grade Postmaster-Generalship, which in practise was not

open to a non-Civilian. That was not fair. No difficulty was anticipated in attracting suitable civilians. They were usually taken from a Province where promotion was bad, and one of the great attractions was the priviledge of being allowed to spend five months every year in the hills. Also the officers had more independence and freedom than they had under a Local Government.

75,176. The Indian Civil Service officers received exchange compensation, but under the amalgamation scheme it was proposed to do away with that in pursuance of the admitted policy of Government.

75,177. With regard to the salary of the higher officers, he thought the pay of the Director-General had been put a little low, and that in the future it would probably have to be raised. It was an appointment at least as important as that of a Secretary to the Government of India, and should carry the same pay, namely, Rs. 4,000.

75,178. The witness then said that the graded system of Superintendents kept officers waiting unduly in the Rs. 200 and Rs. 250 grade, and he agreed with the arguments used by his predecessor in favour of a time-scale. It would be impossible, however, to apply a time-scale to Postmasters, so long as the system of fixing the pay according to the importance of the office was followed. When new appointments were created much discussion with the Government ensued, and sometimes a good deal worse was allowed than what was proposed. There was no satisfactory rule. The present Rs. 250 grade was an iniquity. Under the present graded system also an officer's prospects depended to a large extent on the expansion of the Service and the retirement of other officers. There would have been a very serious outcry on this subject but for the fact that the department had expanded so rapidly. If a time-scale were introduced for Superintendents, probably Rs. 500 would be fixed as the stage at which an officer's career would be examined to see if he should rise above that amount. There was no difficulty in obtaining and keeping suitable Indians for Superintendents on the present pay, but there had been a marked falling off in the personnel of the domiciled Europeans.

75,179. With reference to leave and pension proposals, witness thought the present rule with regard to the travelling allowance granted on transfer was unfair. Officers should not be put to any extra expense owing to a transfer but should be treated as a Government officer was treated in the United Kingdom, where practically all expenses were paid. In no circumstances when an officer was on tour, should he get less than the daily allowance. In certain circumstances men received considerably less than the minimum daily allowance. If an officer had to make a journey from Delhi to Rohtak for the purpose of inspection, he would either get single first class fare or the daily allowance *minus* the railway fare, whereas if he remained in the place he was halting at he would get Rs. 4. The rules for travelling by river steamer were excessively hard. It would be an easy thing to put the matter on a proper basis and see that an officer obtained his daily allowance and steamer fare.

75,180. With regard to the Telegraph side of the department, under the Amalgamation Scheme there would be a small engineering establishment consisting of 46 officers, 4 of whom would fill administrative posts, 24 executive posts, and 18 would be under training as Assistants. In order to maintain that cadre 2 officers would be recruited every year. The figure was, he believed, arrived at by the Public Works Department after actual experience extending over many years; they found that about one officer was required for every 24. The leave reserve was included in the 18 Assistants. The proposal was that one of the recruits every year should come from England and one from India, the Indian recruit being alternately appointed direct and promoted from the Subordinate ranks. The recruits would be officers who had undergone a technical course in a College in India, and would presumably be the best available technical men who could be obtained from any of the Colleges. He could not say how the selection was made in England, but he believed there was a Board at the India Office, consisting of the Telegraph Adviser to the Secretary of State and one or two officers of the department who happened to be on leave.

75,181. On the subject of promotion from the Subordinate Service to the new Provincial Service, he allowed that the officers selected would ordinarily be in the second and not the first grade of Deputy Superintendents, as those in the latter would be generally too old. It was desired to promote men who had not passed 40, and who gave promise of doing really well. A man who had served in the subordinate ranks until after 40 as a rule was not a success in the higher appointments. He admitted that this would not be popular with the first grade men, and that they might be discouraged by seeing their juniors go over their heads, but it was impossible to avoid this if men of a suitable age were to be taken. If there was any exceptional merit in an officer who was above the age, a special case would, no doubt, be made out in his favour. In practice, under this scheme the specially promising men would get a chance of promotion at a comparatively young age. A man of Rs. 370 as a Deputy Superintendent, when transferred to the superior service, would draw Rs. 370 whether he was an Assistant or a Superintendent, because there was no distinction in the pay; it was all on one time scale. The fact that such a man was brought into the gazetted ranks would be a sufficient reward, and he would go up on the time-scale. In fixing the Rs. 370 stage it had been borne in mind that if too many of such officers were brought in at too high a stage they would block the other officers, but it was thought that bringing them in not higher than the Rs. 370 stage would be doing as little damage to the others as possible.

75,182. The Upper Subordinate Service, the witness went on to say, bore the same relation to the Superior Service in the Telegraph Department as the Provincial Civil Service bore to the Indian Civil Service, except that the Provincial Civil Service officers held gazetted rank and the others did not. So far as the Provincial Service officers in the Telegraph Department were concerned, they did exactly the same work as the other officers of the Superior Service, the only difference being the name and the pay, and they were all on one list for the purpose of promotion. There had been a listed arrangement in force for about two years, but it was withdrawn and the men were put on the same list again. The object of the distinction was to get men cheap, but that could be done without calling them Provincial Service officers, and he did not think the term Provincial Service was appropriate in the Telegraph Department, seeing that the officers were not in any sense confined to a Province and therefore he should like to abolish the term.

75,183. With regard to the possibility of having two separate time-scales, one for Assistant Superintendents and one for Superintendents, there had been no difficulty since the time scale was introduced on the score of blocks in promotion in the Telegraph Department, and he thought having two scales might lead to some practical difficulty. He did not think it would be easier to select the men if there were two separate compartments, and with two separate compartments there would be some necessity to revise the pay. At present an Assistant Superintendent in charge of a division, provided he was continually in charge, was allowed to go up the scale, but if there was a compartment for Assistant Superintendents directly he got to the top of that compartment he would not be allowed to draw his increment. If the two systems were in force a good deal of modification would be necessary in all the rules. For instance, the Superintendent of Telegraphs in Delhi would lose considerably if there were two compartments in the time-scale.

75,184. With reference to the traffic side of the Telegraph Department, three-fourths would be recruited in India, possibly seven-eighths. The Department had asked to be allowed to recruit one-fourth from outside. In the main recruitment would be by the promotion of subordinates, and the only direct recruitment would be the one-fourth. One reason for

not bringing in a larger proportion of direct recruits was that special knowledge was required for the Department and it took 4 or 5 years to learn the work.

75,185. The witness considered that the officers of the Superior Traffic Branch should be borne on one list for the whole of India and that was the intention. Although officers might be on a general list it was very often possible to keep them in their own circle by taking a little trouble about it. In the Post Office very few transfers were necessary.

75,186. With reference to probation and training in the Telegraph Department, study leave ought to be compulsory. Unless an officer went to England once in every seven years to bring himself up-to-date, he would not be an expert. For instance, most of the officers knew very little about wireless telegraphy unless they had gone to England and studied it. He thought six months' study leave every seven years would not be excessive, and he would go so far as to say that it should be compulsory in the case of a Scientific Department.

75,187. On the subject of the Guarantee Fund the witness handed in the reply* which had been given to a question in Council on the subject, and this would furnish all the information the Commission needed.

75,188. A part of the fund was used for excellent purposes. In the year 1908 he asked the Government to be allowed to use one-fourth of the surplus for grants to widows and orphans of men who had not received a pension. He proposed to ask the Government to give him a freer hand in that matter and ultimately he would probably ask to be allowed to use the whole surplus.

75,189. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness said that he did not lay stress upon the Postmaster-General being allowed to live five months in the hills, but it was one of the great attractions of the service. He thought it would be preferable if he took only three months in the hills, and it might be varied a little according to the Province. In one case two months might be sufficient and in another case four months might not be excessive. It was found as a rule that the Postmaster-General did a fair amount of work while in the hills. As a rule the officer took with him two clerks, whose travelling allowance and batta were not paid by the Government. One of the conditions of living in the hill station was that there should be no expense to Government.

75,190. With regard to non-domiciled Superintendents, their pay on first entering the service was occasionally Rs. 200, but more frequently Rs. 100 a month. Men occasionally came from England to take up the appointments and there were a great number of applications from men in India, planters and officers of other services, for posts for their sons. It had been considered whether the appointments should be made through the Secretary of State, but it was thought on the whole that the existing arrangement was working fairly well. There would be practical difficulties in getting a man through the Secretary of State, and on the whole it was believed that the department was in a better position to judge what was required. Officers selected in England might think the prospects were a good deal better than they were, and it was now possible to explain clearly to the officer what he had to expect if he came out. The proportion of non-domiciled men in appointments turned out of the service might be about one in seven, no larger than that of other classes. The number of appointments of non-domiciled Europeans in the year would be something under one for the whole of India. There were 17 vacancies open to them, and the vacancies were about 3 every 4 years. The higher officers were always on the look-out for a likely man, and if such a man was found, although he might be in Madras, it was possible he would be appointed to the Punjab. Care was taken as far as possible not to appoint men who were not fit for the post. Waiting lists of appointments were kept by each Postmaster-General, and as the Director-General went round the country two or three times in the year he was told precisely how the matter stood and interviewed the likely men. Very often officers in India applied to the Director-General asking him to interview their sons for the appointments. There was no language test at present. Sometimes men were required for Burma or the Punjab as necessity arose, and it would be hard to propose any such test. For the work of the Post Office a knowledge of the vernaculars was important, and most of the officers picked up what was necessary, but he did not think it would be fair to impose any specific test on the non-domiciled European because he was more liable than any other class to move from one Province to another.

75,191. On the subject of allowances, witness thought it would be right that a man should receive his net daily allowance, *plus* his fare. He admitted that the allowance was given partly to cover the expenses of locomotion, but in practice there was a great deal of incidental expense which was not taken into account in the regulations, and the cost of moving had increased tremendously in the last few years. A man halting for a day received the same as he would receive if travelling by train. When living in camp he did not think the daily allowance meant an actual loss to the Indian officers, but he was not sure that the same would apply to the domiciled or non-domiciled Europeans. At the same time the desire was to raise no distinction but to treat them if possible alike. The expenses of transfer were so considerable that in any case it was only right a man should get a larger allowance than when ordinarily travelling. Transfers were particularly hard on the officers of the Telegraph Department, because as a rule they went from one Province to another, and the transfers in the Telegraph Department were more numerous than in any other Department owing to the fact that the staff was so small and had to be continually shifted about, especially in the leave season. In the Post Office it was not so bad, as there was always a local man to put in.

75,192. The work of Superintendents of the Post Office was hard. There was no absolute rule as to how much travelling Superintendents should do, but they were certainly expected to be out inspecting about 156 days during the year, and some probably were out for 200 days. Half their work was inspection, and in some divisions all the travelling had to be done by road. The Superintendents disposed of complaints received from the public, and sometimes the Postmaster-General himself would send complaints to them for investigation. When they went to larger towns they had to interview merchants and leading people in order to make convenient postal arrangements. They had also to do a certain amount of auditing, checking of receipts, and so on. The lowest pay of a Postmaster in complete charge of a post office might be Rs. 15 in a small branch office, which had only 20 letters a day to deliver, and there were post offices in which the number of letters was as low as three. In some cases the Postal Service was performed by the School-Master, but there might be cases where there was a Telegraph Office and a small number of letters, and in such cases the pay was generally Rs. 20 or Rs. 25. There was a certain difficulty in filling up appointments at the present time in the Central Provinces, but it was not very serious and was being met by improving the pay. The department had a very free hand in regard to raising pay up to Rs. 300 a month, and could not only raise the pay but could create new appointments to that amount.

75,193. The promotion of Postmasters to Superintendents did not very often occur, the Superintendents generally coming from Inspectors, some of whom rose from the ranks while others were recruited direct. Nineteen of the Punjab Inspectors were graduates and some of them were quite capable of becoming Superintendents. In the higher appointments, Deputy Postmasters-General and Assistant Directors-General were appointed from the Superintendents' grade chiefly.

* *Vide* Appendix II.

75,194. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness said that the Superintendent was regarded as a higher officer than the Postmaster. The salary of a first grade Superintendent was less than the salary of the highest Postmaster, but there were about 20 higher appointments, which were open to the Superintendents. Places above Rs. 1,000 were generally given to Superintendents. Postmasters in the three higher grades might be posted to the higher positions, if they were considered fit for the posts, but it was not the same class of work which they had been doing. The work of the Deputy Postmaster General more nearly resembled the work of Superintendents, and as a rule the Superintendent was more suited for the work. Many of the men rose from the ranks, having entered as clerks, and some were taken at Rs. 50 or Rs. 60. Graduates were often recruited for the Superintendent's posts. The positions were not advertised, as men could be obtained without doing so, and the matter was perfectly well known. Whenever there were Superintendentships vacant no advertisements or notifications were issued informing the public, and no intimation was given to the Heads of Colleges. As a rule, unsuccessful candidates for the Provincial Civil Service came straight to the Post Office.

75,195. With reference to his preference for the present system of recruitment over any system of competition witness said that ten years ago it was a system of competition. The Local Governments in Bombay and other Provinces held examinations for their Provincial Civil Services, and the Post Office would take the first or second man who just failed to get these posts. The men obtained by the present system were quite as good as the men obtained in those days. No particular educational qualification was prescribed for men in grades below Rs. 100, but an endeavour was made to obtain men who had passed the Matriculation, and of course higher pay was given to men with better qualifications.

75,196. With reference to Indians not being willing to take Postmasterships, he thought the whole Service looked upon the Superintendent's as the higher appointment. Many Superintendents, if asked to go as Postmasters on rates above their own salary, would not take the position, considering it to be an inferior appointment. The Postmaster had large pecuniary responsibilities, and this made the work unpopular.

75,197. (*Mr. Ramsay Macdonald.*) The witness said there was no objection to advertising a little more widely the fact that selections would be made for appointments. He preferred selection to competitive examination, and special care was taken in the Post Office to find good men. He believed the Post Office took more trouble in the matter of selection than most other Departments; there was a long period between the vacancies to find the best men and the Postmasters General were always looking out for the most suitable men. The selection was quite impartial, although considerations such as that of family came into the matter. Probably three-fourths of the probationers passed on the first occasion, but sometimes the man was appointed direct and went up for examination within 4 or 5 months, and it could be hardly expected he would pass. But where a man had had a reasonable chance the directly appointed man would pass in three cases out of four. He thought it would be a pity to limit a man to only one chance, because an officer might be good in three of the subjects, and deficient in one or two, and he preferred the present arrangement of giving the men a second chance.

75,198. As to the length of the probation, the longest period a man had remained as a probationary officer was about three years. The average of 2 years and 2 months had been taken from 16 cases extending over a period of three years. The matter, of course, depended upon vacancies, and if fewer were recruited the average period would be shorter. It did not depend only on success in departmental examinations but also depended on vacancies. The two years and two months did not mean the time taken by a man to pass the departmental examination; the average time for passing that examination was probably about 15 months.

75,199. Witness thought the efficiency bar was fairly effective in the department, and an officer's career was always reviewed before he was transferred from one grade to another. There was no great difficulty in applying the bar.

75,200. As to pension, he had not worked out what the financial effect of his proposals would be. The power of an officer to commute one-fourth of his pension for a lump sum was given now in many cases on medical certificate, and witness desired a man should have the right to commute a portion of his pension whether he was fit or unfit. He associated himself with what the service had said on the subject.

75,201. With reference to his suggestion that the exception in Article 644 of the Civil Service Regulations, under which a period during which an officer officiates for another officer absent on privilege leave is not permitted to count as service qualifying for additional pension should be abolished, witness pointed out that if he were an officer officiating as Postmaster-General for another officer who was qualifying for that pension, the period during which he officiated did not count in his period for qualifying for his own pension. His service qualified him for his own special pension of Rs. 5,000, but he would be officiating in an appointment which was entitled to Rs. 6,000.

75,202. It was possible it might be advantageous to the service to give men an earlier pension, but he thought the Decentralisation Committee's Report had suggested powers of turning out any inefficient officers. As a matter of fact, the tendency for officers was to stay on, and his trouble was occasioned by people imploring him to give them extensions. No doubt the service generally would like to go after 25 years, but if a man was fit he was only too glad to stay on.

75,203. On the subject of holidays, witness said the Post Office, especially the railway mail service, had a considerable amount of Sunday service for which they had no compensation and he should like to give them 50 per cent. extra privilege leave, the leave being allowed to accumulate up to three months. There was the possibility of paying people for Sunday duty, but that would be a very troublesome matter and lead to much difficulty.

75,204. On the subject of the Guarantee Fund he did not think the service really desired the surplus to be under the control of a Committee. He doubted whether any officer, who would give evidence before the Commission, had actually paid Rs. 5 into the Fund. He thought the men would be glad if a larger sum was given for widows and orphans; otherwise he did not think they were very much interested in the matter.

75,205. With reference to fines being handed over to the Committee for the general benefit of the subordinate staff, he would not object to that being done, but thought it would be a little difficult to work. The fines might be used for the purpose of helping Institutes, and so on, and in the course of time something like that might be suggested. In the Post Office there had been no great tendency to form mutual clubs and societies, but if that tendency occurred the idea of utilising money in that way might be considered.

75,206. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The witness thought that Government would appoint what they considered to be the best officer as Director-General whatever service he came from. With regard to selections made for Superintendents, the best men were selected for the position, everything being taken into consideration. In the Punjab it might be necessary to appoint a Hindu and Muhammadan alternately, with occasionally a Sikh or domiciled European. It was also necessary to see that a certain number were appointed from particular communities. That was one of the objections to examination. In Bengal the same course was taken. With regard to Indians not being adequately represented in the higher appointments in the Post Office, that matter was gradually being set right. He had received no complaints on the subject, nor had he seen much about it in the Press with regard to the Post Office. In fact, there had been frequent testimony that Indians had received very fair treatment in the Post Office. In the lower ranks of the Superintendents' grade there were more Indians now than there were before, and they would get promotion in course of time.

75,207. In the Telegraph Department, under the new scheme, one appointment would be made in England and one in India, and in the latter case the appointment would be from the subordinate service in one year and in the next year would be a direct appointment. The men would be taken from the engineering colleges or any college up to the proper standard at the time. The mode of selection would be nomination by the Director-General to Government, the Director-General seeing who were the best men available. The selection of an unfit man recoiled on the Director-General himself, as an inefficient man was of very little use and had to be turned out. Personally witness would not object if the so-called Provincial Service received the same pay as the others, if they went through the same technical training in England. There was no pending proposal to send candidates to England, but if there was any intention of levelling up the pay to that of the Imperial Officers the men would have to be equally competent, and in order to become equally competent it would be necessary for them to go to England, and take a proper course for two or three years. If they did that he had no objection to their getting the same pay.

75,208. One of the most important parts of the duty of the Superintendent was interviewing the public, and he kept diaries which were inspected by the Postmasters-General.

75,209. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The witness reiterated what was stated in his written answers that if an Indian was selected by the Secretary of State he should be eligible for the Imperial branch and should be paid full pay. The distinction made should depend entirely on the qualifications obtained in England. He would be willing to promote to the Imperial branch a man who was in the Provincial Service and went to England on study leave, but preferred that he should qualify straight away. In the Provincial branch in future he would have men recruited who were fit for the Imperial Service, or not recruited at all. The lower class work of the Telegraph Department could be done by the men already there, namely, the Deputy Superintendents. If the pay of Europeans and Indians was made the same, officers from Europe should get some special concessions as regards leave and as regards the expenses of their voyages to and from their homes. On a basis of that kind he did not see why an Indian officer doing the same work as another officer should not get the same pay, but he would make a training in England essential, and he thought the same would apply to the Civil Service also.

75,210. With reference to commutation and the right to commute, he meant commutation of actual, earned pension. An officer who retired should have the right to say that he wanted a lump sum in place of one-fourth of the pension; in other words, he would treat one-fourth of the pension as deferred pay. In England officers formerly received two-thirds pension whereas in India they received only half their pay or less. The pension should be more favourable in India. In the case of an officer of high rank the pension was nothing like half his pay. Commuting less than one-fourth would not be sufficient in India. The pension arrangements in India were not sufficiently liberal, and had no relation to the pay the man had drawn or the services he had done. He had two objections, the quantity of the pension and the method by which it was paid, and he laid special stress upon the second one, by which a man's family might be deprived of the whole of it. He wished to see a change in both directions, or in the alternative a General Provident Fund, which he should prefer. If an officer died after 15 years' service his wife would then get something, whereas at present she was left destitute. He should like to see a fairly liberal Provident Fund to which the Government would contribute something like the amount the officer paid in himself.

75,211. (*Mr. Hutchinson.*) The witness said that in default of a time scale he would be willing to have a Rs. 200—20—300 grade in place of the Rs. 200 and Rs. 250 grades and keep the graded system. The existence of the Rs. 250 grade was a tremendous hardship and it ought to be done away with.

75,212. (*Mr. Styan.*) The witness considered that two appointments of Postmaster-General for the Telegraph Department were as many as could be expected, seeing that there was no obligation to provide any at all, and he thought it was about as many as suitable officers would be available for at one time. Practically, the appointments were those which would otherwise have been given to civilians, and he thought on the whole the civilian would be the more efficient officer. In the circumstances of the case, however, the department had said they would provide two.

(The witness withdrew.)

C. H. MCMINN, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Kangra Division, Punjab;
S. C. SINCLAIR, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Derajat Division, Punjab; and
SRI RAM, Esq., M.A., Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General, Punjab and North-West Frontier Province.

[*These three witnesses were examined together upon the written statement given below.*]

Written statement on behalf of the Superintendents and Gazetted Postmasters of the Post Office.

75,213. **Introductory.** — The Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs circulated to all Postmasters-General and Inspectors-General, Railway Mail Service in India, a letter dated the 28th February 1913, from the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry, inviting the expression of a corporate opinion upon nine indicated heads from the Gazetted Officers of the service or from a section of them. The Postmasters-General and Inspectors-General circulated this letter among the Deputy Postmasters-General, Superintendents and Gazetted Postmasters throughout India.

These officers held local meetings in their respective circles, and deputed delegates to reprrsent them at a central conference for all India at Nagpur. This conference sat on the 21st, 22nd, and 23rd April 1913. There were present as delegates, Deputy Postmaster-General, Mr. M. P. C. Byrne, who presided, 18 Superintendents, and 2 Postmasters. In addition, two other officers, namely, Mr. W. A. Roussac, Inspector-General, Railway Mail Service, Western Circle, and Mr. R. W. Hanson, Officiating Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, attended the conference.

At that conference the following Resolutions (paragraphs 75,214–23) confined to the nine heads referred to above, were passed:—

75,214. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—1. That recruitment into the grades of Superintendents should be from two sources—(*a*) by direct nomination of candidates outside the department; and (*b*) by selection from departmental officials, in the proportion of two to one.

2. That the existing system of giving 10 per cent. of the appointments of Superintendents to non-domiciled Europeans is suitable and may continue.

3. That there should be one general list of candidates who have passed the departmental examination from which Superintendents should be appointed.

4. That Indian candidates, selected for the appointment of Superintendent, be ordinarily graduates of a recognised University, and that domiciled European candidates be ordinarily undergraduates, both classes of officers being men of good social standing.

5. That 1st class Postmasters should be recruited from postal officials, subject to the condition that they pass the departmental examination and that there be no restriction as to the age at which they can go up for the examination.

75,215. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—6.* That the minimum period of training of Probationary Superintendents should be one year, and maximum two years.

7. That non-domiciled Europeans selected for the Superintendents' cadre should be graded with Probationary Superintendents irrespective of their pay.

75,216. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—8. That the diem allowance of Superintendents of post offices should be raised from Rs. 4 to Rs. 5, that of Superintendents of the Railway Mail Service to Rs. 6 a day, and that when a Superintendent, Railway Mail Service, proceeds on deputation outside his jurisdiction he should be allowed travelling allowance at the same rate as Superintendents of post offices. That when an officer is transferred he should in case of railway journeys be allowed four fares in lieu of double the fare of the class he is entitled to at present.

9. (*a*) That 1st class Postmasters, in the grades of Rs. 300–400 and Rs. 400–500, should get first class travelling allowance on transfer; (*b*) that Probationary Superintendents should get first class travelling allowance.

10. That in divisions, where it is necessary, tents should be supplied to Superintendents of post offices and tentage granted.

11. Wherever difficulty is experienced by Superintendents in obtaining suitable house accommodation at a reasonable rent, Government should provide accommodation charging rent at the usual rates.

75,217. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—12.† That the pay of a Probationary Superintendent be fixed at Rs. 150 for the first year, and Rs. 200 thereafter.

13. That Superintendents of Post Offices be placed on the following graded scale of pay:—

1st grade	- Rs. 750 to 850	-	20	appointments.
2nd „	- „ 600 to 700	-	25	„
3rd „	- „ 450 to 550	-	40	„
4th „	- „ 300 to 400	-	50	„
5th „	- „ Fixed at 250	-	37	„

That if Government should be unable to accept this proposal or to sanction the number of appointments specified in each grade, Superintendents be placed on a time scale of pay starting from Rs. 300 and rising to Rs. 900 at the end of 22 years as shown below:—

1st year	- Rs. 300	12th year	- Rs. 575
2nd „	- „ 325	13th „	- „ 600
3rd „	- „ 350	14th „	- „ 630
4th „	- „ 375	15th „	- „ 660
5th „	- „ 400	16th „	- „ 690
6th „	- „ 425	17th „	- „ 720
7th „	- „ 450	18th „	- „ 750
8th „	- „ 475	19th „	- „ 780
9th „	- „ 500	20th „	- „ 810
10th „	- „ 525	21st „	- „ 840
11th „	- „ 550	22nd „	- „ 870
	23rd year - Rs. 900.		

14.‡ That the pay of Postmasters of gazetted rank should be improved so as to put them on a par with Superintendents.

15. That the pay of Deputy Postmasters-General and Inspectors-General should be Rs. 1,100–80–1,500.

75,218. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**§—16. That Privilege leave be allowed to accumulate up to four months.

17. That, in view of the fact that officials of the Post Office do not get complete relaxation on Sundays and gazetted holidays, 45 days' privilege leave be granted on 10½ months' service.

18. That so long as an officer has earned title to leave by the necessary service, he should be allowed to avail himself of it, provided that he can be spared; and there should be no proviso that he must be on duty for a specified period after return from last leave before he can be granted leave again.

19. That officers of the Post Office, drawing pay at Rs. 500 and above, should be granted the privilege of European Service leave rules.

20. That three years' furlough, leave on medical certificate or on private affairs spent in India should count as service for pension.

75,219. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—21. That in consideration of the hard and tedious work and the very few holidays enjoyed by the officials of the Post Office they should be allowed full retiring pension after a service of 25 years, and full invalid pension after a service of 20 years.

22. That for the purpose of calculating pension and leave allowances the average emoluments for two years be taken into account instead of for three years.

23. That the maximum amount of ordinary pension admissible to officers of the Post Office should be Rs. 6,000 per annum.

24. That the option of commutation of pension up to a limit of a quarter of the pension earned should be allowed as a matter of course, irrespective of the conditions set forth in the Government of India, Finance Department, Order No. 585–E. B. dated 27th September 1912. In the case of officials dying before retirement, the commuted value of a quarter of the pension which would have been admissible at the time of death should be paid to the widow and children, the nearest exact age of the officer, subject to a minimum of 50 years, being taken into calculation for determining the commuted value of pension.

25. That extension of service should not be granted to an officer who has attained the age of 55 years.

75,220. **(VII.) Such Limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—26. That there is at present no limitation to the employment of non-Europeans in the service and that it is neither necessary nor desirable to introduce any limitations.

75,221. **(VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—27. That, as recommended by the Public Services Commission of 1886–87, not less than 50 per cent. of the highest

---

* Mr. Sinclair submitted the following as an amendment in place of Resolution 6:—"That Probationary Superintendents who fail to pass the Departmental test after two attempts should be removed from the list."

† Mr. Sinclair submitted the following as an amendment in place of Resolution 12:—"That the pay of a Probationary "Superintendent appointed by direct nomination should be fixed at Rs. 200 per mensem during his probationary period, "while that of Probationary Superintendents selected from Departmental officials should be fixed at Rs. 150 per mensem for "the first year and Rs. 200 per mensem thereafter."

‡ Mr. Vaughan, who was examined after Messrs. McMinn, Sinclair, and Sri Ram had withdrawn, submitted the following as an amendment for Resolution 14:—

14 (*a*) That the pay of Postmasters of gazetted rank should be improved so as to put them on a par with Superintendents.

(*b*) That as Postmasters of gazetted rank are required to pass the same Departmental examination as Superintendents of Post Offices, the appointments of both should be interchangeable.

(*c*) That the pay of Presidency Postmasters, *i.e.*, officers in charge of the three Presidency Post Offices, should be the same as that of Deputy Postmaster-General and Inspectors-General, with whom they should also be graded.

(*d*) That Postmasters of gazetted rank and Superintendents of Post Offices should alike be eligible for the appointments of Deputy Postmasters-General, Inspectors-General, and Presidency Postmasters.

§ Mr. McMinn desired an addition to be made to the Resolutions under this head and wrote as follows:—

"The addition which I propose is in connection with the rules for leave out of India and is to the effect that such leave should be calculated as commencing from the date of departure from the nearest port of embarkation and as expiring on the date of return to such port. The object is to equalise, in the case of all officers, the amount of leave out of India. At present an officer who is stationed far up country is at a disadvantage in this respect. I trust that I am not out of order in making this suggestion, and as I have been selected to appear as a witness before the Commission, I shall be glad to give in full my reasons for the proposal."

posts in the department should be reserved for departmental postal officers.

28. That the Telegraph Service should not have any claim to or be given any of the highest posts in the Post Office. It cannot be urged too strongly that it would be most unfair to give any of these posts to officers of the Telegraph Department.

29. That in view of the amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department, it is apprehended that the opportunities of postal officials rising to higher appointments might be diminished. This conference therefore prays for an assurance that the prospects of promotion of officials of the Post Office will not be interfered with in any manner.

75,222. **(IX.) Any other points within the Terms of Reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding Heads.**—30. That fines recovered from officials and the interest of the Guarantee Fund should be used for the benefit of postal officials, and that a committee representing all grades of the service be appointed for considering the best means of utilisiug the amount.

31. That the rules for the encouragement of the study of languages of different tribes in India should be made applicable to Superintendents of post offices and Postmasters, and that they should be allowed to appear at examinations and earn rewards under those rules.

75,223. The following (paragraphs 75,224–31) is submitted in explanation of such of the Resolutions as may appear to need comment or elucidation. The Resolutions are dealt with seriatim.

75,224. (*I.*) *Methods of Recruitment* (*see also paragraph* 75,214). *Subhead* 1.—The fixing of the proportion of two to one in the filling up of vacancies among Superintendents is suggested for four reasons: (i) because it is desirable that the interests of the nominated candidates should be secured as against unlimited selection from a large number of subordinates, (ii) because it is desirable that there should be a steady infusion of new blood into the Department, (iii) because adhesion to the principle that only one in every three appointments shall be filled by selection from the Department would tend to determine the existing system of keeping Probationary Superintendents waiting unduly for preferment, and (iv) because, while at present the departmental subordinate has open to him two avenues of preferment, by either of which he can rise to the highest posts, namely, by adhering to the postmasters' line and working his way up by that means, or by entering into the Superintendent's grade; the Probationary Superintendent has only one avenue of preferment, and the suggested limitation would have the salutary effect of equalising the chances of promotion alike for nominated and departmental officers.

Subhead 3.—The general list here advocated is asked for on the ground that, at present, promotion in the various circles for qualified, departmental candidates and Probationary Superintendents is frequently local with the anomalous result that an officer of very junior standing gets preferment in his local circle to the grave disadvantage of his seniors in other circles. A rule abolishing circle promotion for such officers and promoting all officers from one general list according to seniority, no matter where employed, would act beneficially.

75,225. (*II.*) *Training and Probation* (*see also paragraph* 75,215.) *Subhead* 7.—While exceptional circumstances require that non-domiciled Europeans should occasionally be drafted into the Superintendents' cadre by selection and appointment in India, the interests of the service require that they should pass through a period of training before being entrusted with the duties and responsibilities of a Superintendent. These are many and onerous. The seniority of a Probationary Superintendent dates only from the time of his appointment as a substantive Superintendent; it is manifestly unfair that a non-domiciled European wholly unconversant with the duties of his post, should supersede a Probationary Superintendent who has, by actual training qualified himself for the post of a Superintendent.

75,226. (*III.*) *Conditions of Service* (*see also paragraph* 75,216). *Subhead* 8.—The proposal for an increase in daily, or halting, allowance is based upon the fact that owing to the general rise in the cost of living away from head-quarters the present allowance is insufficient.

The idea at present is that a Superintendent is entitled to a minimum daily allowance of Rs. 4. In many instances this is pure theory and nothing more. An illustration will suffice. A Superintendent travels by rail over a distance for which the railway fare is Rs. 2–8–0. If he claims his daily allowance of Rs. 4, from that is deducted his railway fare, so that he receives only a nett sum of Rs. 1–8–0. He has, however, the option of abandoning his daily allowance and of charging instead double railway fare or Rs. 5. From this sum is deducted the cost of a single railway fare, or Rs. 2–8–0, so that he receives a nett sum of Rs. 2–8–0 instead of Rs. 4. If, therefore, an officer starts by rail at 8 A.M., on a Monday, and, having reached his destination, say, at 10 A.M., works the whole of that day and the day following (Tuesday), and then leaves by rail at 11 P.M., on a further similar journey, arriving at his next destination, say, at 1 A.M., on the second day (Wednesday), he draws nothing for his actual halting expenses either for Monday, Tuesday or Wednesday, because of the rule that no daily allowance is claimable unless an officer halts from midnight to midnight at each station. If he claims his double first-class railway fare for the journey on the Tuesday, the result is that he is out of pocket for his actual halting expenses. And in this respect the officer has in truth no election. He cannot claim his Rs. 4 daily allowance for the second day (Tuesday). He has no alternative to charging the double fare less the usual deductions, and thereby ensuring his own financial loss. The claim is, accordingly, made that in no circumstances should an officer draw less for travelling allowances than his minimum daily allowance which, it has already been proposed, should be increased from 4 to 5 rupees a day. It may be added that a Superintendent of post offices is by departmental rules compelled to make shorter halts while on tour than other District Officers, and this places him at a financial disadvantage as seen above.

The Superintendent, Railway Mail Service, stands in a worse position than the Superintendent of post offices. He is treated as a railway officer, but is not given corresponding facilities, such as a specially fitted-up carriage with a kitchen and accommodation for servants. He draws a daily allowance of Rs. 4 if absent from head-quarters for over six hours. Being confined to the railway line, he has to pay for his meals in the dining cars and at the various railway refreshment rooms on the line, and on a journey involving an absence of over six hours from head-quarters these charges aggregate to an appreciable amount. He has in addition to pay for his sleeping accommodation, porterage, &c. He is, therefore, entitled to ask that his daily allowance be increased from Rs. 4 to Rs. 6.

Subhead 9 (*a*).—The position of a first-class Postmaster is in certain respects anomalous and invidious. He is not a first-class officer within the meaning of the Civil Service Regulations. His rank of first-class Postmaster is a departmental distinction. All Postmasters whose salaries are above Rs. 300 are first-class Postmasters. They are also Gazetted Officers. They are classified, however, for purposes of travelling allowances as second-class officers.

No Gazetted Officer is entitled to claim an allowance for transporting his family on a transfer. The first-class Postmaster whose pay ranges from Rs. 300 to Rs. 500 falls within the purview of this forfeiture. The honour of the Gazette operates on him as a fine.

Concurrently, as a second-class officer, the first-class Postmaster receives on transfer only a double second-class fare for himself, one-half of which is expended on the purchase of a ticket. The other half does not cover even the incidental expenses of the journey.

Subhead 9 (*b*).—The Probationary Superintendent is not infrequently sent on deputation. The cost of

locomotion is always constant and is never decreased to suit the Probationer's rank or purse. It seems but fair, therefore, that he should be provided with first-class travelling allowance.

Subhead 10.—In many localities which an officer is compelled to visit there is no accommodation, and tents are there absolutely necessary. In other localities the various bungalows belonging to the Public Works Department or other Departments are not open as of right to the officers of the Post Office. In Divisions where tents are necessary either from permanent want of proper buildings or when the permanent buildings are occupied, it is submitted that these officers should be provided with the cost of their upkeep and transport by the Department, as allowed by Article 1042 of the Civil Service Regulations.

Subhead 11.—In other Government Departments provision is made for house accommodation at a fixed rate; postal Superintendents often experience serious difficulty in securing accommodation. If Government were either to build or acquire suitable houses this would be obviated.

75,227. (*IV. Conditions of Salary* (*see also paragraph* 75,217.)

Subhead 12.—A Probationary Superintendent now starts on a pay of Rs. 80 or Rs. 100 a month. This scale is obviously too low to attract candidates of the required qualifications or to enable them to live suitably after entering the Department. In other Departments —*e.g.*, the Telegraph, Finance, Railways—no probationer starts on less than Rs. 150, and that is conceived to be the minimum on which an officer can support himself, and then only with difficulty. The proposed increase after the first year represents more nearly the lowest living wage.

Subhead 13.—Originally the pay of Superintendents in the lowest grade was fixed at Rs. 200. At the date of the Public Service Commission in 1887 the pay of the highest grade was Rs. 400–500, and the number of appointments in all grades was 120. The Sub-Committee of the Public Service Commission at that tims prefaced their report with the following observations:—"It will be apparent that not only are the "several branches of business undertaken by the "Postal Department of a more or less complicated "character, but that they demand even in the lowest "grades strict integrity and some intelligence, in "most grades education, method, energy, and tact, "and in the superior grades these qualities in a high "degree combined with administrative ability. In "some grades the necessity for economy has com-"pelled the adjustment of salaries on a scale which, "perhaps, errs on the side of inadequacy, but which "has not entailed a sacrifice of efficiency." However, it was not until 1904 that a new grade of Rs. 500 to 600 was introduced. At the present day there are 172 appointments, which are distributed thus:—

	Rs.	Rs.	Appointments.
1st grade	500 to	600	11
2nd ,,	400 ,,	500	33
3rd ,,	300 ,,	400	48
4th ,,	250		48
5th ,,	200		32

The scale of pay and grading are to-day totally inadequate. Since they were fixed the cost of living has risen greatly, and in consideration of this the salaries of officers holding similar rank in other Government Departments has been revised and increased. It is, therefore, necessary that the present grading and scale of pay of Postal Superintendents should be correspondingly improved. There has been of late years an enormous expansion in the business of the Post Office which has considerably augmented the labour and responsibilities of Superintendents. Concurrently with its increased scope the revenue of the Department has grown proportionately. It is not unfair to ask that increased duties and responsibilities should meet with the adequate remuneration from a flourishing Department which is now working at a large profit in spite of numerous substantial concessions to the public, which have made the Indian postal service the cheapest in the world. A statement showing the increase of business within the past 25 years is attached and marked A.

Whilst on the one hand the business and financial prospects of the Department have grown annually, the prospects of the Superintendents have been lessened and their hopes of advancement checked.

In 1887 the number of higher appointments held by uncovenanted officers in the Post Office was 19, being 15·8 per cent. of the total number of Superintendents. To-day the number of these higher appointments is 20, but the number of Superintendents has risen to 172, the percentage of posts to candidates being reduced to about 11·6. The prospects of the Superintendent are, therefore, worse now than they were 25 years ago. (*See* statement.)

	1887.	1912.
Postmaster-General	1	4
Deputy Postmasters-General	9	5
Assistant Directors-General	3	4
Presy. Postmasters	3	3
Inspector-General, R.M.S.	0	4
Comptoller P.O.	1	0
Deputy Comptroller P.O.	1	0
Assistant Comptroller P.O.	1	0
	19	20
Superintendents	120	172

Apart from the increased number of officers eligible for the higher appointments which have not themselves increased proportionately, Superintendents have now lost appointments once held in the Accounts Branch, which, since they have been lost, have increased in number. That is all dead loss.

In 1887 the Superintendents were entitled to fill 9 posts of Deputy Postmaster-General. Of these 4 have been abolished and 5 survive. Four new appointment of Postmaster-General were created and added to the 6 similar posts already existing, thus raising the number to 10. Of these appointments, departmental officers hold 4. The Public Service Commission of 1887 recommended that of the 7 higher appointments (1 Director-General and 6 Postmasters-General) the uncovenanted officers of the Post Office should ordinarily hold not less than 3. The Director-Generalship has in practice always been held by a Covenanted Civilian. The recommendation, therefore, meant that in practice the Uncovenanted officers of the Post Office should ordinarily hold *not less than half* of the total number of appointments of Postmaster-General. In this view they ought to-day to be holding at least 5 out of the existing 10, whereas they hold only 4. Their loss, therefore, on these much-prized posts is at least one appointment.

As above stated, 4 out of 9 appointments of Deputy Postmaster-General were abolished. The claim, therefore, of the Superintendents is that their total loss of the chief posts is at least 5. If it be objected that Government have after the abolition of the 4 appointments of Deputy Postmaster-General created 4 similar appointments of Inspectors-General, Railway Mail Service, and one of Assistant Director-General, all of which are at present held by officers promoted from the Superintendents' cadre, the objection, it is submitted, has no force. These 5 new appointments have all been solely necessitated by the constant increase and development of work in the Railway Mail Service and the Director-General's Office, work which always has been and still is supervised, and administered by officers from the ranks of Postal Superintendents. Statistics show beyond all contradiction that had not the Deputy Postmasters-General been abolished, the steady growth of business would have required the creation of the appointments referred to above, which, therefore, can from no point of view be regarded as in substitution of these abolished posts.

The nett loss, therefore, is, as stated, five chief appointments, which has also retarded the much needed flow of promotion amongst Superintendents.

The Superintendent of post offices is the sole administrative officer representing his Department in a Division which usually includes two or more Revenue Districts. He has therefore to associate on terms of equality with officers and Heads of other Departments and to maintain the dignity and repute of an important service, which enters intimately into the daily life of all classes of the public. To enable him to uphold his position and discharge functions from which he cannot escape, it is essential that his remuneration should be substantially increased. It is worthy of notice that the number of Superintendents is increasing and, with the continual development of Post Office business, must further increase. This increase is out of all ratio to that of the higher or prize appointments. While the aspirants for such prize appointments multiply, the number of these appointments practically remains stationary. Recognising that these higher posts must be reserved for the most expert of the Superintendents, there remains a large body of these officers who must be precluded from any fair expectation of preferment. To such men now, and in a greater degree in the future, their pay is inadequate both in itself and in its effect upon their pension. For such men the proposed enhancement of pay appears to be a reasonable and pressing need.

Subhead 14.—Gazetted Postmasters are executive officers. Their duties are many and difficult. They are personally and directly responsible for the custody, account and disbursement of very large sums of money. This increasing burden of responsibility furnishes sufficient grounds for the request that Postmasters who, like other members of the service, are met with the constant rise in the cost of living, should have an increase in their pay.

Subhead 15.—The Deputy Postmasters-General and Inspectors-General reside mainly in the largest towns where the cost of living is higher than in the Mufassal. Their responsibilities are greater, their duties socially and departmentally are exacting in consequence of their higher position. They also hold, in the Railway Mail Service, entire charge of circles containing a number of Superintendents' Divisions, where they in many respects exercise the powers of Postmasters-General.

75,228. (*V.*) *Conditions of Leave* (*see also paragraph* 75,218). *Subheads* 16 *and* 17.—These must be read together. Shortly the proposal is that in every 32 months, 4 months' privilege leave should be earned. The present system permits 1 month in every 12 to be earned up to a maximum of 3 months in every 36 months. The two resolutions combined formulate the proposal that in lieu thereof privilege leave should be earned at the rate of 1 month in every 8 months up to a maximum of 4 months.

The reasons for this concession are stated in resolution 17. The request for the longer holiday in the shorter period rests upon the fact that generally throughout the postal service the officers work on Sundays as well as on holidays. Broadly speaking, all officers lose about 30 days in every year which are enjoyed as holidays by other Departments of the Government. The proposed scheme asks that one-half of these lost days of rest be restored.

Subhead 18.—The restriction on leave under the existing rules, which forbid an officer who has returned to duty to avail himself of leave either already due to him or which he may subsequently earn, unless and until he shall have been on duty for certain specified and varying periods, are vexatious, embarrassing and unreasonable. Reference is invited to Articles 260 and 338 of the Civil Service Regulations. Subject always to the exigencies of the public service, every officer should be entitled to avail himself forthwith of all leave which, at the time of his application for leave, he has actually earned.

One example will illustrate the hardship complained of. By Article 338 above quoted, if an officer entitled to 2 years' furlough after 18 years service goes on leave for one year only and returns to duty, he is compelled to serve another 8 years before he is permitted to enjoy the balance of his one year's furlough, although he has already earned it by duty rendered to the State. The only device by which this can be evaded is for the officer to apply for leave on medical certificate when he is not sick. If, in such circumstances, the leave is granted, the privilege is won on a false issue; if it is refused the officer is robbed of his leave. In neither event is the Government well served. Neither result can be ethically upheld. It is morally impossible to uphold differential treatment applied to officers who fall under the European Service leave rules.

Subhead 19.—Short leave rules apply at present equally to all Government services. Long leave rules vary for European and Indian services, to the advantage of the former. They are not, however, founded on any purely class distinction. Thus, Deputy Postmasters-General, whether Europeans or Indians, fall under the European leave rules. All officers below the rank of Deputy Postmasters-General range under the Indian Service leave rules. Under these the maximum furlough for an officer's whole service is 2 years. The first furlough cannot be taken until the completion of 10 years' service and a second furlough until after a further service of 8 years. These rules press harshly upon the senior officers, who, by that time (generally 20 years and more), have earned, and in many instances have exhausted, the full period of their furlough. For instance, if an officer has a family of his own, the members of which are being educated out of India, he is unable to share in his children's society or personally to supervise their education at a period when the presence and influence of a father are most needed. To obviate this, it is proposed that officers drawing Rs. 500 and upwards should enjoy the privilege of the European Service leave rules, which entitle an officer to longer periods of leave at shorter intervals. Under the present rules officers below the rank of Deputy Postmaster-General can only claim 2 years' furlough in their whole service, which may extend to 35 years. Of this they can take 1 year after their first 10 years' service and another after a further service of 8 years. Should they serve, as they often do, a further 14 years after they have used up their 2 years' furlough, they are debarred from all further furlough. Their only hope then is to try their chance of being sent home on sick leave when not sick.

Subhead 20.—The rule to-day for reckoning service for pension, itself not due till after 30 years' service, is as follows. During that period only 4 years' leave on allowance count. This is the maximum. If the whole 4 years' leave is spent in India, only 2 years count. If the whole is spent out of India, the whole counts. If a portion be spent in India and a portion out of India the latter portion will count in full, and of the former not more than 2 years as a maximum. This is unfair to the officer to whom the Indian Service rules apply, and to any officer who, owing to financial or other rersons, is unable to spend his leave out of India. From this point of view 2 years' furlough counting for pension is wholly insufficient in consideration of the strain of work. The conditions under which such an officer labours are the same as those of an officer who spends his leave out of India. The present rule prolongs unfairly the period of effective service which the officer who spends his leave in India must put in for pension. While one officer who spends all his leave out of India need only serve 26 years, the other who does not is forced to serve 28. This resolution must be read with the next.

75,229. (*VI.*) *Conditions of Pension* (*see also paragraph* 75,219). *Subhead* 21.—The rules, as they now stand, permit only 3 years of leave with allowances to count towards pension earned after 25 years' service, and they lay down that if these 3 years are spent in India, only one shall count towards pension; if all be spent out of India all count.

An officer who spends 3 years' leave in India must, in order to earn his pension after 25 years' service, render an actual service of 24 years, whereas the officer who spends his leave out of India renders only 22 years' service. The combined effect of Resolutions 20 and 21 is to level up the differences pointed out and to place all officers on a footing of equality.

Subhead 23.—A maximum pension of Rs. 5,000 a year is inadequate to the needs of those officers who earn it. A fair proportion of the officers who attain their pension are in fact European though falling technically within the definition of "Natives of India." A definition, however, cannot change a fact, and the fact remains that these Statutory "Natives of India" are Europeans of European education, surroundings, traditions and needs. Like their non-domiciled European brothers in the Department their relatives live either in Europe or the British Colonies and as a rule when they themselves earn their pension they leave the country. To such men a pension of Rs. 5,000 means a ceaseless scrutiny of ways and means. Nor need this argument be confined to the European element. In several instances Indian officers of the Department have adopted European habits of life and are educating their children in Europe. These instances will increase in number year by year to a marked degree. Even the Indian officer who has not followed English habits of life in their entirety has often, by virtue of his official position, been compelled to adopt a standard of living which entails many extra expenses. It is a hardship that at an age when such habits have become crystallised into a custom he should be required to readjust his mode of living to an insufficient pension. To all these the same argument is applicable. The present pensionable limit was fixed half a century ago. In the interval the purchasing power of the rupee has been greatly diminished, the necessaries of life have been nearly doubled, and many of its minor luxuries placed permanently out of reach. The proposed increase would be but an equitable recognition that here, as elsewhere, there have been developments in the world which, while they are out of the control of the officers in the Post Office, weigh heavily upon the resources of these officers.

Subhead 24.—The request for permission to free from existing restrictions commutations of an officer's pension is based upon the feeling that these restrictions are inquisitorial and therefore objectionable. While recognising the wisdom of the policy upon which pensions and their freedom from attachment is founded and admitting that that policy should be supported, it also recognised in the Department that permission to commute a portion is rarely conferred except on reasonable grounds. The desire to advance a portion to a child in marriage, to purchase land which shall become the family homestead, to educate growing children, even to be quit of an accumulated burden of debt, is a commendable desire. The owner of the pension may safely be trusted as to his intent. Government have frequently stated that pension is deferred pay. That profession is accepted as sincere. If such be the case, it follows that the person who has earned such deferred pay should be able to lay his hands upon at least a portion of it for a conscionable purpose.

So, too, if an officer of 50 years of age and upwards dies in service before touching his pension, it does not seem unreasonable that his widow and children should have some claim upon a portion of that which authority has itself labelled as deferred pay. The exemption in such a case from the burden of a pension is a pure matter of gain to Government. The loss falls entirely upon the officer's family. The objection sometimes officially expounded that officers should make provision for their family during their lives is in the majority of cases a counsel of perfection. Where a widow—the resolution deals only with the case of the widow and children—applies for a commuted portion of her husband's pension, it may, despite such counsel, be *prima facie* and, as a rule, truthfully accepted, that her petition for help is due to unfortunate circumstances outside her husband's control. But, even were it not so, the request comes with exceptional force from persons suddenly deprived of the assistance of the chief breadwinner whose pension, it has been conceded, represents earnings in consideration of the postponement of which his salary throughout his service was based. The widow's claim is not purely eleemosynary; it is rooted upon an equity which cannot easily be ignored.

75,230. (*VIII.*) *Relation of Service with other Services* (*see also paragraph* 75,220).

Sub-heads 27, 28, *and* 29.—The Public Service Commission of 1887 recommended that the highest posts, exclusive of the Director-Generalship, in the Post Office, should be divided at least equally between the Indian Civil Service and the Department. Out of 10 such posts, the Department should hold at least 5. It has already been shown (*ante Subhead* 14) that the Department at the present moment hold only 4 against 6 held by the Indian Civil Service. Lately, 1 of these 6 posts, being temporarily vacant, has been filled by the appointment of a Superintendent of Telegraphs as Postmaster-General. The post should have fallen to the Post Office, under the recommendation of the Public Service Commission. The introduction of an officer from the Telegraph Department to officiate is, presumably, in anticipation of his confirmation. To that an emphatic, if respectful, protest is immediately necessary.

The Telegraph Department is gradually to be absorbed, it is believed, into the Post Office. Such officers as are at present in the service of the Telegraph Department have had, it is also believed, their prospects assured by the promise that they shall not personally suffer. Though their Department is numerically inferior to the Post Office, they hold 11 appointments rising from Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 2,250, as against 10 appointments rising from Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 2,000 in the Post Office, of which 6 are at present held by members of the Indian Civil Service. The obstacles to promotion in the Post Office have already been dealt with. A new obstacle now threatens by importation from the Telegraph Department. Resolutions 28 and 69 are directed against this new danger. It is essential that an effective protest be lodged while the end of the inserted wedge is still thin.

75,231. (*IX.*) *Other Points.*

Sub-head 30.—The present Guarantee Fund was started in 1883. It was fed by deductions from the salaries of all officials below the rank of Deputy Postmaster-General. At present no deductions are being made. Its object was, *inter alia*, to guarantee Government against loss arising from the negligence or dishonesty of Post Office officials up to a maximum on each loss of Rs. 3,000. It now amounts to nearly 11 lakhs of rupees in Government Securities and cash on which interest accrues annually. The uses to which the interest is put include many deserving objects, but it is under Government control and sanction, and the chief characteristic of the amount expended for the benefit of the subscribers is its disproportion to the interest which accrues yearly.

It is now proposed that the Fund should be handed over to a carefully selected departmental Committee for the benefit of the officials of the Department. Such a Committee being naturally in closer touch with the wants and claims of the men among whom they live and move, would be in a better position to put the money placed at their disposal to a more liberal use. A statement is hereto annexed as B showing the transactions of the Guarantee Fund for the year 1911–12. It forms an interesting comment upon the request now preferred.

Extraordinary as it may seem fines inflicted upon the subordinate staff are credited to Government. In view of the dubious legality of this procedure, it is suggested that fines should be handed over to the above Committee for the general benefit of the subordinate staff.

ANNEXURE A.

(*Vide paragraph* 75,227.)

Statement showing the Growth of the Indian Post Office between 1886–87 and 1912–13.

[N.B.—The figures supplied by the Witnesses were for 1911–12, but the later figures for the year 1912–13 have been obtained from the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, by whom the statement has been corrected and completed.

Classification.	Figures for 1886–7.	Figures for 1912–13.	Percentage of Increase.
Number of Post Offices	7,097	18,789	164·75
" of letter boxes	9,386	48,524	416·98
" of village postmen	4,455	8,190	83·84
Mileage of Postal Lines.			
Railway	12,710	32,062	152·26
Mail cart	3,933	11,122	182·79
Runners and boats	35,729	91,238	155·36
Steamer	11,683	20,071	71·80
Total mileage	64,055	154,493	141·19
Correspondence and Parcels.			
Postcards	67,756,098	435,786,354	543·17
Paid letters	125,871,580	403,190,056	220·32
Unpaid letters	27,562,688	36,043,619	30·77
(*a*) Registered letters	4,791,408	16,930,256	253·35
Newspapers	21,606,697	54,956,826	154·35
(*b*) Book packets	5,306,498	56,287,771	960·73
(*c*) Parcels	1,854,775	11,593,563	525·07
Inland Money Orders.			
Number	4,821,117	28,624,470	493·73
Amount	Rs. 10,68,49,151	Rs. 47,39,38,492	343·56
Commission	Rs. 13,37,820	Rs. 55,03,521	311·38
Savings Bank.			
Number of Head Banks	324	255	−21·30
" " Sub "	5,724	9,205	60·81
" " Accounts	219,010	1,566,860	615·43
Total balance at credit	Rs. 4,25,19,344	Rs. 20,61,14,502	384·75
Annual deposits	Rs. 4,44,40,499	Rs. 9,14,36,896	105·75
" withdrawals	Rs. 2,58,81,689	Rs. 7,99,28,312	208·82
Number of Government securities purchased	556	3,461	522·48
" " " " sold	28	807	2,782·14
Insurance.			
Number of Insured Letters	107,413	20,599,237	1,817·12
Number of Insured Parcels	174,263	647,199	271·39
Value of Insured Letters	Rs. 2,35,74,205	Rs. 51,96,42,403	2,104·28
Value of Insured Parcels	Rs. 5,26,06,770	Rs. 15,17,94,215	188·55
Total Value	Rs. 7,61,80,975	Rs. 67,14,36,618	781·37
Insurance Fees	Rs. 1,80,274	Rs. 8,69,414	382·27
Value Payable.			
Number of articles sent	596,296	8,815,915	1,378·45
Value declared	Rs. 58,78,016	Rs. 10,98,22,633	1,768·36
Telegraph Statistics.			
Number of combined Post and Telegraph offices	440	2,860	550·00
*Annual cost of Post and Telegraph establishment	Rs. 1,54,094	Rs. 14,03,266	810·66
Number of messegas sent	457,557	8,415,817	1,739·29
" " " received	489,949	7,152,269	1,359·80
Revenue	Rs. 5,27,462	Rs. 46,23,789	776·61

(*a*) Registered letters and packets (including insured and value payable).
(*b*) Ordinary unregistered packets only.
(*c*) Including value-payable unregistered packets.
* Cost incurred by the Post Office in working combined offices.

ANNEXURE A.—*cont.*

STATEMENT SHOWING THE GROWTH OF THE INDIAN POST OFFICE BETWEEN 1886–87 AND 1912–13—*cont.*

Classification.	Figures for 1886–7.	Figures for 1912–13.	Percentage of Increase.
Strength of Staff.			
Number of Superintendents	120	172	43·33
„ „ Inspectors	232	506	118·10
Departmental Postmasters	4,901	6,759	37·91
Extraneous Agents (Branch Postmasters)	2,214	12,279	454·61
Clerks	5,342	15,134	183·30
Postmen and other servants	9,566	27,392	186·35
Road Establishment	12,098	18,687	54·46
Village postmen	4,455	8,190	83·84
Signallers	294	1,172	298·64
Total	39,222	90,291	130·20
Financial results of the working of Post Office for the year.			
Amount of surplus (+) or deficit (—)	—Rs. 15,03,095†	+Rs. 28,02,918	

† Includes the cost of keeping up the savings bank accounts and also the charges connected with postal arrangements in Baluchistan Rs. 90,388.

ANNEXURE B.

(*Vide paragraph* 75,231.)

THE STATEMENT BELOW SHOWS THE TRANSACTIONS OF THE POST OFFICE GUARANTEE FUND, 1912–13(*a*.)

RECEIPTS.			CHARGES.		
——	Government Securities (nominal Value).	Cash.	——	Government Securities (nominal Value).	Cash.
	Rs.	Rs.		Rs.	Rs.
Balance of 1911–12	7, 7,300	(*b*)3,24,001	Refund of excess realisations.	—	—
Interest given by Government on Rs. 3,00,000 at 4 per cent. from April 1912 to March 1913.	—	12,000	Sums decreed against the Fund.	—	16,118
			Refund to subscribers on account of returnable subscriptions.	—	380
Interest on Government Securities in 3½ per cent. loans.	—	27,028	Rewards for information in in Post Office robbery cases.	—	2,574
Recoveries against awards made in previous years.	—	825	Compensation to postal servants for loss of private property.	—	231
Recoveries of special advances	—	7			
Recoveries of travelling expenses for medical examination for Post Office Life Insurance.	—	36	Compassionate gratuities	—	2,872
			Travelling expenses for medical examination for Post Office Life Insurance.	—	249
Government Promissory Notes purchased during the year.	15,000	—	Cost of purchase of Government Promissory Notes.	—	14,400
			Balance on 31st March, 1913	(*c*)7,82,300	3,27,073
Total	7,82,300	3,63,897	Total	7,82,300	3,63,897

(*a*) The Statement furnished by the witnesses was for 1911–12 : the figures for 1912–13 were afterwards obtained from the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.

(*b*) Differs from the closing balance shown in the Annual Report for 1911–12 by Rs. 251, owing to that amount having been charged to the Fund after the publication of the Report.

(*c*) Market value on 31st March, 1913, was Rs. 7,46,119.

3 *November* 1913.] [*Continued.*

Messrs. McMINN, SINCLAIR, and SRI RAM called and examined.

75,232. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) Mr. McMINN said he was one of the witnesses elected by the non-Indian Superintendents to give evidence. He joined the Department in September 1904 as a Superintendent direct, and had been a Superintendent since in different Divisions, in the Punjab only.

Mr. SRI RAM said he joined as a Probationary Superintendent in September 1904 at Rs. 100 a month. After 16 months he was appointed permanent Superintendent, and sent to take charge of the Division which he was holding before he was appointed. He was elected by the Indian Superintendents as one of the four witnesses to appear before the Commission.

Mr. SINCLAIR said he was appointed Reserve Superintendent in 1907 on Rs. 200, and was confirmed after passing the departmental examination. He had been Superintendent ever since, chiefly in the United Provinces. He had been elected as a representative of the non-Indian Superintendents.

75,233. Mr. McMINN said the written statement was drawn up on behalf of the Superintendents and Gazetted Postmasters, and although the Superintendents of Burma did not attend the Conference which was held, they had signed the written statement.

Mr. SRI RAM believed that at the Nagpur Conference the Burmans appointed the Punjab men as their representatives. There were 23 officers present at the meeting which drew up the Memorandum, only 2 being Postmasters. Each circle selected their representatives to attend at Nagpur, and he could not explain why so few Postmasters were selected.

Mr. SINCLAIR said the Gazetted Postmasters were very much fewer than the Superintendents, and therefore the representatives were less.

Mr. SRI RAM said that 13 Indian officers were present at the Conference out of 20, so that the written statement fully represented the views of the Indian members of the Conference.

75,234. With regard to the proportion of direct appointments to promotions from the subordinate staff in the case of Superintendents, Mr. McMINN said that of the 172 now on the list the proportion was 40 per cent. direct and 60 per cent. promotion. If there were two direct appointments to each promoted appointment, that would secure the interests of the Probationary Superintendents, who were often kept waiting for a permanent post owing to promoted subordinates going over their heads. This was because men from the department did not go through a probationary period. To have a larger proportion of direct appointments would also ensure the recruitment of a better class of men as Superintendents. This also appeared to be the opinion of the Directorate, as was evident from the fact that of late years the proportion of direct recruits had borne a rapidly increasing ratio to those appointed from the department. The Probationary Superintendent had to wait for appointment for something like two years, and it was thought that from one year to two years would be sufficient for his training and probation. At present a man had to spend too much time as a Probationary Superintendent.

75,235. With reference to the request made in the written statement that the Probationary Superintendents should be on one list instead of on circle lists, Mr. McMINN said he could give no specific instances of inequalities that had arisen as the result of the present system, and personally he did not agree fully with what was stated in the written statement on that point.

Mr. SRI RAM also said he did not agree personally with this portion of the written statement.

Mr. SINCLAIR remarked that he could not give specific instances, but he agreed with what was said in the written statement; he thought that Probationary Superintendents should be borne on one general list; otherwise the Department would be provincialised.

75,236. With regard to the distinction drawn in the written statement between the Indian direct recruits being graduates and members of the domiciled community undergraduates, Mr. McMINN said by undergraduates was meant men passing the Matriculation Examination, and not necessarily men going to the University. There were really very few Universities to which an Anglo-Indian could go at present, and hostels were not provided for the Anglo-Indians as they were for the Indians. For instance, at Lahore, the Indians could live in a very much cheaper manner than members of the domiciled community. The necessity for the distinction was based entirely on the educational facilities open to the two classes of officers.

Mr. SRI RAM thought that in time to come the distinction would disappear, but as at present the facilities were not the same the distinction might continue for some time.

Mr. SINCLAIR believed the reason for the distinction was that the European School Code provided that Europeans should be educated up to the Matriculation or Cambridge Local standards.

75,237. Mr. McMINN was of opinion that the present age limits for direct recruits to Superintendentships were suitable, and suggested selection first and competitive examination afterwards, the system that at one time existed in connection with the Police in India. The preliminary selection might be made by the Postmasters-General and be confirmed by the Director-General. It was not a selection for the post but selection for the right to go up for examination. The considerations to be borne in mind in making the selections should be somewhat the same as now, educational qualifications and good family, men well known in the Province and able to exercise a good influence. The number of candidates selected would have to be two or three times as large as the posts to be filled. At present there were numerous applications, and if the positions were advertised there would be a very much larger number, and it would not be necessary to weed out the applicants by examination. At present there was no regular system for the recruitment of Superintendents. There appeared to be no fixed pay for Probationary Superintendents. Out of those at present on the cadre of Probationary Superintendents some drew Rs. 80, some Rs. 100, one Rs. 140, one Rs. 150 and one Rs. 200 a month. It was unreasonable to expect to get good men on such a low monthly pay as Rs. 80.

Mr. SRI RAM agreed.

Mr. SINCLAIR said he did not believe in competitive examination at all. He thought that selection by the Postmaster-General and confirmation by the Director-General was quite sufficient, *i.e.*, the present system.

Mr. SRI RAM said opinion in the Conference was fairly divided on the question, especially on the proportion of the recruitment from outside and from the department, and also on the question of examination. There was a fairly strong opinion for examination after selection. The idea appeared to be that good social status, high educational qualifications, and strong physique should be the qualities insisted upon.

75,238. With regard to allowances, Mr. McMINN said officers of the department did not halt so long as officers belonging to other departments, and sometimes did not halt for twenty-four hours, and therefore did not draw a daily allowance at all. With regard to transfer allowances, they claimed the reimbursement of the actual expenses incurred. There was also the question of house accommodation. It was sometimes very difficult to get houses in military stations. He knew of an officer who changed his bungalow three times in one year, and in another year seven times, because it was required by a military officer. It was a grievance which was more or less common in many other departments.

Mr. SRI RAM said every other department received Rs. 5 a day, whereas the Postal Department only

received Rs. 4 a day. Almost every department was provided with tents except the Post Office. In many cases officers of that department had to inspect places where no bungalows existed, and had to do the double journey to get to get back to a bungalow, and then were refused travelling allowance.

75,239. With regard to pay, all three witnesses stated that they preferred a time-scale, Mr. McMINN observing that there could be no inequalities in that method.

Lord Ronaldshay then pointed out that in the witness's written statement it was asked first that Superintendents of Post Offices should be placed on a graded scale of pay, and that failing this a time-scale of pay, starting from Rs. 300 and rising to Rs. 900 should be introduced. In reply Mr. SRI RAM said that Conferences were held in different circles, and all decided on the time scale. Somehow or other the idea went round that perhaps the demand might not be accepted, and it would be better to put forward an alternative proposal, and it was only by an accident that the graded scale was put first. What was really wanted was a time-scale, and if that were not granted they would like a graded scale on the lines laid down in the written statement.

75,240. Mr. McMINN said that supposing a time-scale was granted it should be provided that special selection for promotion should take place at a particular stage, about the end of the twelfth year, for Superintendents. If a time-scale were introduced they would not press for officers to be retired compulsorily at the age of 55; that was only pressed for under the graded system. The creation of administrative posts to suit the requirements of promotion could hardly be granted, but pay might be raised on account of the fact that the chances of getting higher appointments were less. The prospects of obtaining higher appointments were less than they used to be; there were a greater number of Superintendents to fill the same number of posts, and therefore a smaller proportion of Superintendents would get those posts, and the others ought to be compensated by increase of pay.

Mr. SRI RAM and Mr. SINCLAIR agreed.

75,241. Mr. McMINN said it was not suggested that Superintendents of a suitable calibre were not obtainable at the present rates of pay. The work of the Post Office was getting more and more complex, and a better class of men was required. He did not think that from amongst the domiciled Europeans the department was getting quite the same class of men as it should get, and he attributed that to the present scale of salaries. Men went into the Railways or Finance in preference because the pay there was higher.

Mr. SRI RAM thought that in the case of Indians the class that was obtained was quite good, and even with increased pay the class would be the same. The men in the Service were not contented with the pay and prospects. Indians went into the Postal Service as freely as into the other Services.

Mr. SINCLAIR agreed with Mr. McMINN.

75,242. With regard to the differences in the pay under a graded system and a time-scale, Mr. SRI RAM pointed out that Rs. 300 to Rs. 900 was the scale of pay determined by most of the Provincial Conferences, but it only came in as an alternative proposal and nobody devoted much attention to it.

75,243. On the question of leave, Mr. McMINN said that the complaint in regard to Sunday attendance did not apply to Superintendents but only to Postmasters.

Mr. SRI RAM considered that it applied to a certain extent to Superintendents, as these officers had to make inquiries and investigations on Sundays.

75,244. With regard to the General Provident Fund, Mr. McMINN said it was open to officers of the department, and all who joined after a certain date were compelled to contribute to it.

Mr. SINCLAIR did not think so many men availed themselves of the privilege.

Mr. McMINN said that personally he preferred being insured in an ordinary Insurance Company.

75,245. On the subject of the amalgamation of the Telegraph and Postal Departments, Mr. McMINN said they had no knowledge of the subject as they had not been informed of the proposals. Superintendents certainly did telegraph work now, as they controlled a number of combined offices, and traffic questions were sometimes sent to them for enquiry. No extra payment had been made for the extra duties entailed.

75,246. With reference to the recommendation of the 1887 Commission with regard to the tenure of Postmaster-Generalships by officers of the department, it was a doubtful question whether the Commission meant that they should hold 50 per cent. of all Postmasterships, or that the number should be three. At the present time he thought they should have five.

75,247. With regard to the Guarantee Fund, it was contended that a Departmental Committee should manage the Fund, and that the greater part, if not the whole, of the interest accruing annually should be administered in the interests of the officers of the Department. The other witnesses agreed.

75,248. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) Mr. McMINN said they desired at least 50 per cent. of the positions of Postmasters-General, but advanced no claim with regard to the Director-Generalship.

Mr. SINCLAIR said the general feeling was that the position should be always held by an Indian Civil Servant, and with that he was perfectly satisfied, and did not require any change. It was only a question of the Postmaster-Generalships.

Mr. SRI RAM said the Departments should have at least 50 per cent of the Postmaster-Generalships, and if the Postal Officers proved themselves efficient for a larger number of appointments it was not necessary that any should come from outside at all.

Mr. McMINN considered that in the future, with a good class of man coming in, and with increased pay there was no reason why the men belonging to the department should not make efficient Postmasters-General.

Mr. SINCLAIR also agreed to at least 50 per cent.

75,249. On the subject of allowances, Mr. McMINN said the halting allowance and daily allowance were the same, and were only given when an officer stayed at any office outside his headquarters for a full 24 hours. If the mileage allowance was paid the halting allowance was not. The contention was that on the railway an officer should get the daily allowance of Rs. 5 plus the single railway fare and the actual expenses on the railway. A man might spend the whole of his day practically at one place, and all he would get would be his railway fare to that place. On a long journey double first-class fare was received, and that was quite fair.

Mr. SINCLAIR said that when the railway fare was less than the daily allowance the full daily allowance should be given.

Mr. McMINN claimed that nothing less than the daily allowance should be given.

Mr. SINCLAIR said an officer should have the option of claiming the daily allowance or double first class fare.

75,250. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Mr. McMINN said it might happen that an officer would halt at a place and then move on to another place and no halting allowance was given. At present the words were "from midnight to midnight," and it was thought desirable that the words should be "twenty-four hours." In that case if an officer reached his destination at eight o'clock he would get a waiting allowance if he was still there at eight o'clock the next day.

75,251. On the question of educational facilities for Anglo-Indians, Mr. McMINN said an Indian had several Universities to which he could go, and although the Anglo-Indian theoretically could go there also, practically he was unable to do so. Very often he could not afford it. The Indian had hostels provided, but none

were provided for Anglo-Indians in the Punjab. In the term "Anglo-Indians" he included Eurasians. A certain proportion of Anglo-Indians were required for Frontier work, field Service work, and work for which Indians were not particularly suitable and for which they did not care.

75,252. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Mr. McMINN said a large percentage of the Superintendents promoted from the ranks were Inspectors. The rest were either clerks in the Postmaster-General's office or Postmasters. The objection to promotion from Postmasters was that a Postmaster was generally promoted from the ranks, and was often a man who had joined the department on Rs. 15 or Rs. 20 a month, and it could not be expected to get a very good class of man on that pay. Also if Superintendents were taken from Postmasters they would be rather old on commencing their duties.

75,253. Mr. SRI RAM was of opinion that Probationary Superintendents should not be brought on to one general list. To take a Probationary Superintendent who had learnt his work in the Punjab, and send him to Bombay, would make the service very unpopular, as the Indian preferred to work, especially when on small pay, somewhere near his home. Most of the work of a Superintendent was done in English, and there was not much difficulty about language though there was a certain amount. In making enquiries and investigations Superintendents had to take the statements of men who did not know English and had to inspect branch offices, the work of which was conducted in the Vernacular.

75,254. With regard to the Indian Civil servant being the best man for the Directorship of Posts and Telegraphs, Mr. McMINN said he was an administrative officer without any bias or prejudice against the officers under him, and the department preferred to have a member of the Indian Civil Service in the position.

75,255. Mr. SRI RAM said it was well known that civilians would be employed, and the department merely wanted to protect themselves by seeing that at least 50 per cent. of the Postmaster-Generalships were given to the officers in the department.

75,256. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Mr. McMINN said the curriculum of the Anglo-Indian schools did not enable the candidates to pass the Matriculation or take degrees in the University so well as the curriculum followed in the Indian schools, and therefore very few Anglo-Indians went to the Universities. In the departmental examination of the Postal Service he did not think the Anglo-Indian passed as high as the Indian, but the examination test was not a very practical one.

75,257. Mr. SRI RAM said with regard to the popularity of the service, that the Post Office was not very well known, and he did not think it was popular. The Provincial Civil Service was popular because of the facilities it offered of rising and of being sent on Foreign Service in the different Native States. There were about 100 applications in the Post Office for one vacancy as Probationary Superintendent, and he thought by advertising a larger number of efficient candidates would be found.

75,258. (*Mr. Hutchinson.*) Mr. SRI RAM said the discontent in the department now was not chiefly because of slow promotion in the lower grades. Prospects were not very good generally, and in the lower grades the pay was not enough to allow a man to live decently.

The witness withdrew.

N. W. VAUGHAN, Esq.,* Postmaster, Lucknow, called and examined.

75,259. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness said he joined the Department in 1885, and was appointed Postmaster on Rs. 150 in 1887. He was specially chosen by the Conference to represent the views of the gazetted Postmasters. The written statement* put in did not deal with the case of the non-gazetted Postmasters, but the interests of the gazetted Postmasters were identical with those of the non-gazetted Postmasters. The former numbered only 34 altogether, and the smallness of the number explained why only two were represented at the Conference. They were satisfied that their views were adequately represented at the Conference with the exception of a few objections which were subsequently sent in. At the Provincial Meetings these objections were carried, but at Nagpur the questions objected to were thrown out as the majority at the Conference were Superintendents.

75,260. First-class Postmasters were selected from grades below Rs. 300 and Rs. 400; there were no direct appointments at all, and the reasons which had made direct appointment necessary in the case of Superintendents did not apply in the case of Postmasters. A first-class Postmaster had to be a very practical man, and must have learned his business by passing through the ranks, and it would therefore be impracticable to recruit first-class Postmasters by direct appointments. Suitable men, he considered, were not obtainable at the present rates of pay in the Postmaster's branch, and during recent years the personnel had been deteriorating owing to the fact that the pay was not sufficient to attract good men. The work was hard and trying both in hours and duties. The contention was that the pay of Postmasters of gazetted rank should be improved so as to put them on a par with Superintendents. If increased rates of pay were granted to Superintendents, the Postmasters hoped they would get the same in proportion. At present the pay of Postmasters went up to Rs. 800, and that of Superintendents to Rs. 600, and if the latter obtained Rs. 850, as proposed by them, the Postmasters would ask for a proportional increase in their pay. The pay of Postmasters depended entirely upon the volume of work in the office, and the importance of the town; at present there were only two officers on the higher grade of Rs. 600 to Rs. 800.

75,261. It had been urged that the posts of Postmaster and Superintendent should be interchangeable in order that the Postmaster might obtain the same number of higher appointments as the Superintendent was now getting. Postmasters were eligible for these higher appointments, but it had not been a settled procedure to appoint them, and if they were on the same list they would have a better chance. A first-class Postmaster practically did the same work as a Superintendent, as he had a number of town sub-offices under him, and the work was exactly the same, except that there was no travelling. In Lucknow he had 23 offices under him apart from the head office itself, and he administered those offices in every way as a Superintendent administered his own offices, but he only had to travel in the town. Rule 33, volume I., of the Post Office Manual, stated that, wherever the term "Superintendent" was used, it included a first-class Postmaster.

75,262. The Postmasters claimed to have special treatment with regard to leave because they had to work on Sundays and holidays. At present they had 10 holidays in the year, Christmas, Good Friday, New Year's Day, the King's Birthday, and six other gazetted holidays. The other branches of the service had about 30 to 32 days in the year, and half Saturdays or a full Saturday once a month, as well as Sundays, and it practically meant three months' holidays in the year. In the Post Office nearly every man had to be present on Sundays and holidays for at

* Mr. Vaughan was examined on the written statement put in by the three preceding witnesses—(*see* paragraphs 75,213–31).

least four hours. He quite agreed with the Director-General that 50 per cent. special leave might be a compensation.

75,263. With regard to the General Provident Fund, he believed that about 40 per cent. of the Postmasters joined it and he thought it was a good thing. There was no complaint among the officers who had to subscribe. He did not agree that a Departmental Committee should administer the Guarantee Fund; he thought it should be administered as at present by the Director-General, but a larger proportion of the interest should go towards the service, and he would like to see the money devoted to the families of Postal officers. A certain amount of the Fund at one time went towards meeting losses caused by robberies and so on, but it was found that that was illegal. He considered now that about half the money went towards meeting losses and half towards rewards.

75,264. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness said it should be left entirely with the Director-General as to whether the Guarantee Fund should be utilised to recover money losses. The income from the Fund was about Rs. 35,000, and before the Director-General could go beyond that sum he would have to refer the matter to the Government. A certain percentage of the Fund was returned to subscribers when they retired. He did not agree that a Superintendent was able to do the work of a Presidency Postmaster, although he could do the work of a big Post Office. Large Post Offices required men who had been engaged in the work for a long time, and it was not easy for Superintendents to learn it. A Superintendent would not work the office so successfully as a Postmaster, on account of lack of technical qualifications. If the higher appointments were exclusively reserved for Postmasters there would be no ground for objection. There was a feeling that Gazetted Postmasters' prospects were inferior to those of Superintendents.

75,265. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness said that in 26 years he had risen from Rs. 150 to Rs. 500, the usual time taken to rise to that grade. There were Superintendents who had salaries of Rs. 500 to Rs. 600, the lowest being Rs. 200. A Superintendent took about 22 years to rise from Rs. 200 to Rs. 600. Whilst Superintendents might find it difficult to carry on the work of Postmasters, Postmasters in the superior grades could very well perform the duties of Superintendents. For the higher offices above Rs. 1,000 he did not think men who had risen from the ranks up to Rs. 600 would be too old. In the gazetted ranks the prospects were not considered good for Postmasters as compared with the prospects of Superintendents. He agreed that 50 per cent. of the Postmaster-Generalships must be held by the Indian Civil Service in order that the service might be well managed. It was the nature of the duties that required the various officers to be kept separate, but he did not agree that the higher Postmasters and Superintendents should be kept separate on that ground. The manager of the Dead Letter Office might be a Postal man, but the Head Clerk of the Director-General's Office required special Secretariat training.

75,266. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness said that under present circumstances there was a slight diversity of interest between Postmasters and Superintendents, and he proposed to make the two offices interchangeable. It was not necessary for the scheme that Superintendents should also be appointed as Postmasters. He did not agree with the view that the duties of a Postmaster were such as to make him an incompetent Superintendent.

75,267. One of his objections to a Departmental Committee managing the Guarantee Fund was that in a few years' time the Committee would consist of men who had not subscribed to the Fund, and who would have no personal interest in it.

75,268. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The witness stated that the object of the Guarantee Fund was to provide a guarantee against losses. At one time the contribution was compulsory.

The witness withdrew.

At Delhi, Tuesday, 4th November 1913.

PRESENT:

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. (*in the Chair*).

Sir MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
Sir THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.
JAMES RAMSAY MACDONALD, Esq., M.P.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—
H. S. STYAN, Esq., M.I.E.E., Director of Telegraphs, Punjab Circle.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. (*Joint Secretary*).

C. STREATFEILD-JAMES, Esq., M.I.E.E., Director of Telegraphs, United Provinces; and
I. C. THOMAS Esq., M.V.O., M.I.E.E., Director of Construction, Telegraph Department.

(*These two witnesses were examined together upon the written statement given below.*)

Written Statement containing the Corporate Opinion of the Imperial Service Officers of the Indian Telegraph Department.

75,269. We, the under-mentioned* Imperial Service Officers of the Indian Telegraph Department, wish to invite the attention of the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India to the following conditions which we consider call for remedial measures.

75,270. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—In view of the present position of the Department in connection with its proposed amalgamation with the Post Office it is difficult to offer any remarks on this point. We

* This written statement was signed by the following officers:—
Messrs. C. Streatfeild-James, R. O. Lees, I. C. Thomas, H. S. Styan, R. T. Gibbs, and R. Meredith, Directors of Telegraphs; Messrs. H. Mayston and L. Truninger, Officiating Directors of Telegraphs; Mr. W. Sutherland, Officiating Postmaster-General (Superintendent of Telegraphs); Mr. J. C. Shields, Officiating Electrical Engineer-in-Chief: Messrs. C. W. Sowerby-Coo, S. Babington, H. S. Pike, G. E. Landon, G. P. Roy, G. W. Talbot, M. F. C. Smith, E. L. Bagshawe, B. C. Wernick, Sunder Singh, J. G. Berrie, M. E. Nigel Jones, C. T. Williams, F. T. de Monte, W. D. Macgregor, J. N. Parker, M. L. Pasricha, and G. A. Hopkins, Superintendents of Telegraphs; and Messrs. S. R. A. Wood, M. F. D. J. Sice, J. Fairley, C. Landon, C. Lawton, G. Burlingham, J. North, E. Green, R. S. Purssell, A. C. Board, G. B. Power, A. P. Manning, J. G. P. Cameron, W. S. McMillan, G. E. O. de Smidt, and C. N Garnier, Assistant Superintendents of Telegraphs.

have however been given to understand that under the scheme of amalgamation now under the consideration of the Government of India it is proposed to divide the superior staff of the Department into Engineering and Traffic sections—the former to be recruited in England and India, and the latter wholly in India, with perhaps one or two exceptions. Owing to the special technical requirements of the Telegraph Department and the lack of means of acquiring knowledge of the kind required in India we are of opinion that for many years to come three-fourths of the Engineering staff should be recruited from England, that one-eighth should be recruited from qualified subordinates and one-eighth from Indian Engineering Colleges. We are also further of opinion that all apppointments should be subject to open competition from amongst nominated candidates. It is considered that, in England nominations should be given by the Secretary of State and in India by his Excellency the Viceroy.

75,271. **(II.) Systems of Training and Probation.**—We feel that it is of the utmost importance to give the young officers of the Department a thorough training in the duties that they will have to perform.

We accordingly recommend that in future all Engineering Officers whether appointed in England or India should first be attached to the office of the Electrical Engineer in Chief for instruction in every branch of departmental technical work, theoretical and practical, including the more important processes in the Telegraph Workshops. Subsequently arrangements should be made to complete their Engineering training including instruction in the system of Accounts in force n the Department. All officers should be required to pass, within three years of their joining the Department, in addition to the existing examinations, a professional examination on the lines of that now in force in the Public Works Department.

We feel that in the past the omission to give young Officers of the Department any training in administration has severely handicapped them throughout their service. We consider that it is most important to entrust every officer with, and make him responsible for definite duties, and that this sense of personal responsibility cannot commence too soon. As far as possible they should also be attached to the Headquarters offices of the Director-General and the Heads of Circles. Everyone should also be encouraged to keep himself thoroughly up to date in his profession by the liberal grant of Study Leave in Europe and America.

75,272. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—A very large majority of the Imperial Service Officers at present in the Department were specially trained at Coopers Hill for service in India and the remainder are Electrical Engineers who have now been so long out of touch with the general branches of their profession that it is quite impossible for them, with few exceptions, to look forward to employment in those branches should they be compelled to leave the Telegraph Department; consequently they view with special apprehension anything which is likely to interfere with their present prospects. We have been given to understand, however, that, in the scheme for the amalgamation of our Department with the Post Office, which we believe is now under the consideration of the Government of India, our prospects have not only been safeguarded but that fair treatment has been accorded to us, including some compensation for the loss of the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs, and consequently we do not wish to allude further to this matter. In view, however, of that loss, and that in the past the permanent head of the Post Office has invariably been a member of the Indian Civil Service we wish for an assurance that should one of the officers at present in the Telegraph Department be considered to be capable of efficiently filling the post of head of the joint Department he would be eligible for that appointment.

75,273. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—The salaries admissible under Department of Commerce and Industry Resolution No. 913–918–115, dated the 2nd of February 1910*, are considered to be generally suitable and we have no remarks to offer beyond again drawing attention to the serious loss that the Department has sustained in consequence of the abolition of the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs. In view of this we consider that the pay of the head Officer of the Engineering or Traffic branches, whichever is senior, shall not be less than Rs. 3,000 per mensem if the amalgamation scheme is brought into operation, inasmuch as we were recruited with the definite expectation of attaining such an emolument.

75,274. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—It is considered that the conditions on which leave is taken, and the allowances during leave, should be improved. Frequently an Officer applies for leave and, owing to shorthandedness or other reasons, his request cannot be granted. In consequence of this some part of his privilege leave often lapses owing to the limit of three months up to which such leave can be accumulated. Presumably this restriction is in the interests of economy to the State but we respectfully submit that this result is effected at the expense of the individual officers. There appears to be no adequate reason for continuing the limit and we therefore desire to urge strongly that either this should be abolished and that it should be permissible to accumulate privilege leave to any extent or that if this is not found practicable suitable compensation should be given for all such leave which is lost. In our opinion suitable compensation would be the grant of a month's furlough on full pay for each month's privilege leave forfeited. In this event Government might have the option of ordering an Officer to take leave should his health and and work, in their opinion, demand it.

We also consider that an officer should be allowed to combine any leave with any other leave due to him and be granted this leave irrespective of when he was last on leave provided that he can be spared. Periods of leave on half-pay should also be commutable into leave on full-pay of proportionately reduced duration.

At present under Article 314 (*a*) of the Civil Service Regulations, members of the Indian Civil Service on furlough in England are paid leave allowances on certain conditions at a minimum rate of 500*l.* a year and at a maximum of 1,000*l.* a year. In the case of the Telegraph Department the maximum rate is 800*l.* a year, but there is no minimum except in the case of leave on Medical certificate. In the case of young officers, especially if they are married, these furlough allowances are wholly inadequate; many officers thus do not take leave as frequently as they might and their efficiency is impaired. For this reason we urge that the Department should be granted a minimum furlough allowance of 500*l.* a year and that the maximum should be raised to 1,000*l.* a year, subject to the conditions prescribed in Article 314 (*c*) of the Civil Service Regulations, and that furlough allowances should be calculated on half the salary at the time of taking furlough instead of on the average of the previous three years emoluments.

We also consider that the present restriction under which an officer cannot retire within three months of taking privilege leave without forfeiting such leave should be removed.

75,275. **(VI.) Conditions of Pension.**—The scale of pensions at present in force is entirely inadequate for our needs. Memorials to the Government of India have been submitted, but up to the present nothing has been done to improve matters. We understand that in England it is recognised that pensions are deferred pay and taking this into consideration, and the fact that of late years the cost of living both in England and in India has increased enormously, a fact which has been recognised as regards this country by the increased pay which has recently been sanctioned for us, we consider that the case for the grant to us of enhanced pensions is overwhelmingly strong. We therefore strongly urge that pensions on the

* Not reprinted.

following scale should be sanctioned for voluntary retirement:—

		£
On completing 20 years' service	thirty sixtieths of an officer's average emoluments for last three years subject to a limit of	350
„ „ 21 „ „		380
„ „ 22 „ „		410
„ „ 23 „ „		440
„ „ 24 „ „		470
„ „ 25 „ „		500
„ „ 26 „ „		540
„ „ 27 „ „		580
„ „ 28 „ „		620
„ „ 29 „ „		660
„ „ 30 „ „		700

The amount of leave with allowances counting for pension under Article 408 of the Civil Service Regulations also requires increasing. In our opinion a suitable scale would be:—

In 10 years' service - - -	1 year.
„ 15 „ „ - - -	2 years.
„ 20 „ „ - - -	3 „
„ 25 „ „ - - -	4 „
„ 30 „ „ - - -	5 „
„ 35 „ „ - - -	6 „

We do not propose to make any recommendations for the increase of the invalid pensions at present admissible as while they are also entirely inadequate fortunately very few officers have had to retire on them.

In addition to the above the special additional pensions, which are at present admissible to officers who have completed a term of approved service in certain administrative charges, should be continued.

We understand that in England retired Civil Servants are allowed the privilege of commuting a quarter of their pension for a lump sum unconditionally without a medical certificate and without specifying the object for which commutation is required. In a service like ours, in which the widow and children of a deceased officer are entitled to no pension from the State, it is very necessary that a similar privilege should be allowed to us so that their condition may be somewhat ameliorated. We accordingly strongly urge the desirability of this concession and in addition would ask that in the event of an officer dying before taking his pension or within a year of taking it, his family may receive the lump sum which he would have received had he commuted a quarter of the pension to to which he was entitled on the date of his death. Such a privilege would be a real boon to all officers and would materially assist them in the task of making adequate provision for their families, Needless to say since our pensions are paid in England at the rate of one shilling and nine pence to the rupee this commutation should be calculated at the same rate. It might also be considered whether it should not be permissible to commute more than a quarter of a pension. We understand that recently an officer of the Finance Department was specially permitted to commute one-third of his pension and we strongly urge that all officers be allowed to commute their pensions unconditionally up to a similar amount.

75,276. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans, and the working of the existing system of divisions of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—As in reply to question I. (paragraph 75,270) we have said that we consider that 75 per cent. of the engineering superior staff should be recruited in England and as we consider that few, if any, Indians would go through the necessary workshop and technical training in that country, we are of opinion that it is unnecessary to fix any proportion provided that the recommendation under which 75 per cent. of the staff are recruited in England is accepted.

We are of opinion that the existing division of service should continue but we consider that in the event of a Provincial Service Officer being selected as a Director of Telegraphs, he should be allowed to draw the same pay as an officer of the Imperial Service, We do not consider that the same concession should apply in the case of Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents as appointment to the administrative grades is made by selection whereas in the case of the other grades this is not so.

75,277. **(VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—We feel very strongly about the subordinate position which the Department of late years has had to take up. At present Directors of Telegraphs rank in the order of precedence far below Postmasters-General and Officers in other Departments with similar powers and responsibilities. This has reacted on the lower grades and as a result the status and prestige of the Department has been lowered with a consequent sense of discouragement and loss of efficiency. We trust that this delicate subject will receive sympathetic consideration and that Directors of Telegraphs will be placed in the same position in the Warrant of Precedence as Postmasters-General.

75,278. **(IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—The only other pressing questions to which we wish to allude are those relating to travelling allowance on transfer, daily allowance, and house and local allowances.

The travelling allowance admissible on the occasion of the transfer of an Officer is wholly inadequate. It is understood that in England the rules regulating the grant of travelling allowance on transfer are such that the actual expenses incurred by an Officer in breaking up his home and installing himself in his new one are borne by the State. In India, where transfers must of necessity be more numerous, there appears no reason why an Officer should, as at present, be put to a loss each time he is transferred. We would therefore ask that Officers on transfer be given actual expenses on similar lines to the rules now in force for Subordinates. If this cannot be granted it is considered that the minimum allowance which should be sanctioned is three first-class fares together with the free carriage of luggage up to 40 maunds in weight and of two ponies and a trap or motor, also incidental expenses for getting on board steamers and trains. The rules for journeys by rail should also apply in the case of steamer journeys during transfer. At present an Officer who has to make such a journey is entitled to only his bare fare for that part of his journey and from this is deducted a charge for his messing. Should he be a married Officer with a family he has himself to pay for their passages and on long journeys the expense of this may be considerable.

An Officer returning from furlough under the existing rules has to bear the cost of proceeding to his new station in addition to that of removing his personal effects from the station from which he proceeded on leave. This operates very hardly on Officers, as in addition to the heavy expense on return from leave they are often thereby precluded from the benefit of taking a return ticket by a Steamship Company. We accordingly recommend that in such cases Officers should be allowed travelling allowance from the port from which they left India or their old station, whichever is less, to their new station.

The rule in the Civil Service Regulations which lays down that an Officer must be absent for eight hours in a day before he can draw daily allowance is considered objectionable in that under Article 1067 it applies only to Officers attached to Railways and the Telegraph Department as a whole. The rates of daily allowance admissible to us are in excess of those drawn by Officers of similar standing in other Departments but in view of the fact that many of these Officers enjoy privileges which are not extended to us, the difference in the rates is often insufficient to meet the extra expense we are obliged to incur. We recognise that it may be impossible to increase the rates, but we consider that there is justification for excluding us from the ruling contained in the article quoted and we hope that it may be found possible to treat Officers of this Department in a manner similar to that accorded to Officers of other Departments not attached to Railways.

The effect of the house allowance rules at present in force for Officers stationed at Calcutta, Bombay and

Rangoon and the absence of any local allowances for the larger towns, which are the headquarters of the Local Governments (excepting Madras for which a small house allowance is admissible), is to make service at those places extremely unpopular as the increased cost of living there is tantamount to a punishment. At Calcutta, Bombay and Rangoon for Officers who have their families with them the present House Allowance is considered adequate as regards the cold weather season but there appears to be no good reason why the allowances during the summer should be reduced. House accommodation at these places is in most places procured on annual rents and not on rents varying with the season. Unmarried Officers or Officers who are married but have not their families with them are entitled to no allowance at all. An unmarried man feels the cost of extra house rent and the higher cost of living even although this may not be to the same extent as a married man while the latter who is alone, is not only hindered with the extra cost of high rents and expensive living but also has to pay rent for his wife or family at the same time wherever they happen to be. Generally speaking the work at these places is more important than elsewhere and thus the more efficient officers are adversely affected, in that, in addition to hard work, they have to live in very expensive stations for which they receive no compensation. It is considered that the only reasonable solution to this difficulty would be the provision by Government of suitable quarters at all the headquarter stations of the Local and Imperial Governments at reasonable rents and as a compensation for the more laborious duties, the grant of suitable local allowances. The need for house allowances would then disappear but in the interim it is considered that the grant of a reasonable house allowance to all Officers unconditionally is imperatively necessary. In this connection we also desire to invite attention to the system under which the less efficient Officers are given the easier appointments although their pay may be the same or larger than that of Officers holding more important charges.

Since the long delay in granting higher pensions and according more liberal treatment in the way of commutation and counting periods of leave with allowance towards pension, has occurred through no fault of the Officers concerned we would urge the desirability of applying any amelioration in these directions to all Officers who were in the service in August 1908 when the last Departmental general memorial on the subject of pensions was submitted to the Government of India—provided that they are still alive.

Messrs. STREATFEILD-JAMES and THOMAS, called and examined.

75,279. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) Mr. STREATFEILD-JAMES said he came out to India on the 26th January 1879 as an Assistant Superintendent from Cooper's Hill, and had gradually worked up to the position of the senior First Grade Director.

Mr. THOMAS said he joined the Service in the year 1881 as an Assistant Superintendent, after a two years' course at Cooper's Hill, and had been through every grade up to Director, Second Class.

75,280. Mr. JAMES said that both Mr. Thomas and he had signed the written statement put in by their colleagues and were prepared to be examined on the views expressed therein. They had not been given an opportunity as a service, of criticising the scheme of amalgamation, and they had only had a few hints as to what was in it. In any change that might be made by the scheme they naturally asked that their prospects and interests should be guaranteed.

Mr. THOMAS said he had been consulted on all details in the scheme of amalgamation, but that the question whether he was in agreement with the whole scheme was rather a big one which he was not prepared to answer at present.

75,281. On the question of recruitment to the engineering branch, Mr. JAMES thought that his brother officers would be willing to go a little further than they had gone in their written statement in the way of admitting Indians provided that the latter were selected young in India and then given a training in England. The present idea was that nobody but a graduate in Engineering or Science should be selected in England. If Indians, who were graduates either in Science or Engineering, and who had had a training for three years in England were appointed, it would be possible for Indian and English officers to come out on one scale of pay. He was not satisfied with the technical training the Indian was able to obtain in India, as he had no opportunity of visiting works and seeing what was going on in electrical engineering. In India electrical engineering was in its infancy and to get really good men it was necessary to have them trained in England. He thought the State might lend money to cover the expenses of Indians, who went to England, and recover it from them afterwards. The training should be for two or three years. The men should visit various works and make notes, which should be examined from time to time to see whether the work was being done properly. During the training they would have to be given some sort of subsistence allowance. The men now had to pick up their knowledge in the best way they could. There had been Natives of India who had gone to England, and who had been trained at Cooper's Hill, and they were on the same list as the European officer, and this had proved a success.

Mr. THOMAS agreed with Mr. James.

75,282. Mr. JAMES then discussed the point whether recruitment in England should be made by examination or nomination. He did not press the suggestion in the written statement in favour of the former method. He believed the Public Works Department advertised for men, and that enquiries were made about applicants by the Secretary of State and a Selection Committee, and from what he had heard from Public Works Engineers he believed the men they had been getting out in that way had done very satisfactorily. If a proper educational standard were enforced, suitable officers, whether Indians or Englishmen, could no doubt be obtained by a process of nomination. In fact he would waive the idea of a competitive examination, provided that certain educational qualifications were made compulsory.

Mr. THOMAS on the other hand favoured competition between selected candidates. The examination might be for one post only, but he saw no objection in this.

75,283. Mr. JAMES then turned to the question of training. He attached great importance to a better training for young Engineering officers than was given at the present time. After a man had been in India for five years he became rusty, and should be given about six months' study leave to go to England and bring himself up-to-date. Such leave might be tacked on to any other leave which the officer had earned. During his leave he should receive half pay and his expenses, and should be made to send in periodical reports on what he was doing. It would be open to the Head of the Department afterwards to say whether he was satisfied or not. The details of such a scheme would require to be worked out carefully.

75,284. Mr. THOMAS then dealt with the proposal that recruits for the new Traffic Branch should come mainly from the subordinate ranks. He thought such an arrangement sound and worth trying.

75,285. *Lord Ronaldshay* then pointed out that it had been suggested to the Commission that in order to get rid of the distinction between the Provincial and the Imperial Services in the Telegraph Department,

all officers should get the same pay, but that those recruited in England should draw in addition an "Exile Allowance" which would bring their pay up to the present level.

Mr. JAMES said that if officers were recruited in the way he had suggested, it would not be necessary to do that, because practically all would be appointed in England. Naturally that would be an expensive matter. But he saw no harm in the proposed arrangement.

Mr. THOMAS pointed out that special provision would have to be made for promoted subordinates. Under the amalgamation scheme it was proposed that one-eighth of the Engineering Branch of the service should be recruited from the subordinate ranks, and it was hardly likely that such men would be given the same pay as the Indians who had been to England, and received special training. Some distinction would have to be made between these two classes.

75,286. With regard to the difficulty of getting leave, Mr. JAMES thought that was probably due to the insufficiency of the cadre. He himself had not suffered in the way of furlough, but he had not always obtained the privilege leave he wanted. During the whole of his service he had been granted 54·8 per cent. of the privilege leave he had earned, and had lost 45·2 per cent., either because he could not be spared or for some other reason. That was rather a large amount to lose in 35 years. In some measure it was probably due to his waiting to take three months' leave, whereas if he had applied for two months he might have obtained it. That frequently happened throughout the service. For one reason or another he could get no privilege leave between April 1884 and April 1892. He had thus earned 8½ months' privilege leave, but as he could only take three months of it, he lost 5½ months. Quite recently he asked for privilege leave, but could not be spared. When he left the department in a few months there would be four months' privilege leave due to him, which he should not be able to take.

75,287. With regard to pensions, the present pension rules provided for Rs. 4,000 after twenty years' service, and Rs. 5,000 after 25 years, and there were extra pensions of Rs. 1,000 for three years' active service in certain grades, and a second extra pension of Rs. 2,000, which used to be given to the Director-General and the next senior officer, after 3 years' active service as such. It was now only given to the next senior officer, so that at the present moment he was the only officer earning it. The two last pensions depended entirely on the approval of Government, so that a man might retire after 85 years' service on Rs. 5,000 pension only. The average officer at the end of 20 years' service would be 41 to 43 years of age, but he might be in bad health. As a rule, after 20 years' service, if a man was going to be any good at all he was a very useful man, and was not a man the Government wished to get rid of. The officers of the department asked for a pension extending up to £700 a year after 30 years' service, on a non-contributory basis. Thirty years was a very long service to put in away from one's own country, and when a man went home he wished to live in a little comfort. The Indian Army after 32 years' service received £700, and the Indian Medical Service received the same amount after 30 years and had extra pensions as well. The cost of living in England was very much greater than it was when the present pensions were put into force. He did not think there would be any objection on the part of officers if they were allowed to contribute towards a greater pension. The pension was really so small that it was impossible to commute a portion of it to any useful purpose. Moreover at present pensions were commuted at a very different rate from that on which the pension was paid. The pension was paid at 1*s.* 9*d.*, and the officer had to take the money for the portion commuted in this country and send it home at the current rate of exchange and therefore lost very considerably. They were allowed to contribute to the General Provident Fund but that gave a poor rate of interest. Government borrowed money at 3½ per cent. and gave it to their officers at 4 per cent., whereas they wished to have 6 per cent. The General Provident Fund was a recent creation and was not of much use to the senior man. He himself would get at the outside probably about £1,500 from the Fund. Every officer who joined the service now had to subscribe 6¼ per cent. and might subscribe up to 12½ per cent.

Mr. THOMAS said he did not agree with Mr. James' remarks about commutation. The majority of officers would prefer to have the privilege of commuting a fourth of their pension, as it would take the place of insurance to a certain extent. They should be allowed to commute at 1*s.* 9*d.* unconditionally. At present, a medical certificate of good health was necessary before commutation could take place and even then a man was not entitled to commute without the sanction of the Government. Officers had to show that they had been unable to make any provision for their family owing to smallness of pay or for other reasons, and it was rather difficult to prove the case. The object no doubt was to prevent a man from unnecessarily alienating a part of his pension and there was a certain amount of reason in that contention, but he thought men should be allowed to accept that risk.

75,288. With reference to house accommodation, Mr. JAMES said the difficulty in obtaining houses was much greater in certain places than in others; it was more felt in large places. In Lucknow no officer could take a house except on a year's lease, and if one was transferred in the middle of the lease one might be let in for six or seven months' rent. The old arrangement by which a house could be taken by the month was dying out in India. He thought the Government might provide official houses at a reasonable rent, and it would probably pay them in the long run. When he left Calcutta he had to pay the difference in the rent, after sub-letting, and that difference amounted to Rs. 1,050, which was rather a large slice out of his salary.

Mr. THOMAS agreed.

75,289. In the matter of transfer allowances, Mr. JAMES considered that the Government should recognise the existence of an officer's family, and should reimburse him for the cost of transferring himself and his family and a reasonable amount of household goods. He himself had had a great many transfers, one being from Calcutta to Lucknow, which cost him, including the Rs. 1,050 already mentioned, Rs. 1,860, and he received a travelling allowance of Rs. 105, so that he lost Rs. 1,755, and that did not include breaking up the house, miscellaneous cartage, and other small charges.

75,290. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) Mr. JAMES said he knew of no officer who had attempted to commute his pension with an insurance company. Officers did not want to commute at the average expectation of life, and that was the point of the medical certificate to which they objected. They wanted to get more than an insurance office would give. Also the portion commuted was so very small that in the event of death it would not be sufficient to support the widow. The commutation was not a boon from the Government, if commuted at the average expectation of life, but was a very substantial boon if valued above the expectation of life. The boon that the widow should receive one-fourth the pension commuted when an officer died in service was a costly one, but on the other hand if the pension was not paid Government would not be very seriously hurt by paying a small commutation to the widow.

75,291. With reference to the qualifications for recruits, they should either possess a Science or an Engineering Degree. The possession of an Engineering Degree would enable a man to gain very rapidly all the information he required on any given subject. The proposal was to take a purely academic qualification and then train the man either in England or in

India. It would be very much better if he had a practical training in England before he came out. He would select men after they had taken their Engineering Degrees, at about 20–22, and give them either two or three years' training, probably two years would be sufficient. The Public Works Department recruits had not only to have an Engineering Degree, but also a year's experience of Works, and that would probably be part of the training in England. The Engineering Colleges in India generally did not give a training which would put a man on a par with the engineering training that was given in Glasgow or Manchester. Two years in visiting engineering works on the top of a training at Rurki would be quite sufficient; it would be a mistake to make it three years.

75,292. He had had experience of officers working under a time-scale and he could not agree that it caused men to become slack. If a man's confidential reports were unsatisfactory, his increments could be stopped, and that afforded quite a sufficient safeguard.

75,293. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The witness said he had not had any experience of Colleges other than Rurki.

75,294. With regard to the expenses of Europeans being greater than those of Indians in India, he admitted that the cost of living of educated Indians, who adopted European standards, had risen, but they had not the expenses involved in continually going to England and in sending their families there.

75,295. With reference to the remark in the written statement that few Indians had received technical train in workshops. he thought there was no disinclination on their part to visit large works, but they had not the opportunity given to them. Electrical works in Europe were on a very much larger scale than in India. As to whether the training should be two years or three, might be settled by the Head of the Department, but two years were absolutely necessary. He could not say what work promoted subordinate officers would be doing, but he took it they would come in at about Rs. 370 so as not to interfere with the promotion of officers already in the grades. At the time they were ready for promotion they would not have had the same experience as those recruited and trained in England, and it would probably be necessary to send them to England for a training when they were selected for promotion. He did not think there would be a great number of them.

75,296. (*Mr. Macdonald.*) The witness agreed that abstract scientific training could be given in Indian Colleges. The defect was really in the practical training in workshops. Telegraphy had become very specialised within recent years, and special training was required in telephone work, telegraph work, wireless work, lighting installations and power installations. There were no large workshops in India in connection with the Service and no experimental laboratories. Smaller workshops existed for instrument-making and repairing, but they were quite unable to give the necessary training.

75,297. With regard to the assertions in the written statement that it was most important to entrust every officer with, and make him responsible for, definite duties, and that a sense of personal responsibility could not commence too soon, what was meant was that recruits should have a good training in administrative work in offices as well as practical work. In the old days many an officer was in a sub-division probably for the first ten years of his service, and never saw the work in large offices, and consequently when cases were sent up to him he did not know how to deal with them from an administrative point of view.

75,298. As to the proposal for a salary of Rs. 3,000 as compensation for the loss of the Director-Generalship, that increase was simply asked for because a certain office had been taken away. The idea was that the senior officer, whether a Traffic or Engineering man, might be Director-General, if he was worthy of it, because he had lost an appointment which he had hoped to obtain. It was really compensation that was being asked for.

75,299. On the point of pay, Mr. JAMES said officers were willing to take the view that the Indian and the European should have the same scale, but that certain allowances should be made to the European.

Mr. THOMAS said the present arrangement was very objectionable from the point of view of the Indian, and it would be less objectionable to give 33 per cent. increase in the form of exile allowance than to give the Indian officer two-thirds the pay of the English officer, although it came to the same thing in the end.

Mr. JAMES said the Indian officer did not like to feel he was not receiving the same pay when he was doing the same work, but he would probably not object to the Englishman, as an exile, having a certain percentage added to his pay.

75,300. On the question of leave, it was a recognised thing that a man could accumulate three months and combine it with three months' furlough. When an officer had accumulated privilege leave, and it could not be granted to him, he should be allowed to go on accumulating it and take it when he could be spared. If the Government gave a month's privilege leave every year, and said that if it were not taken they would not guarantee that it could be taken later on, he thought the officer would have to take the leave when it was due to him.

Mr. THOMAS pointed out that the great distances in India made a month of very little use; a holiday meant probably several days' journey in going and coming and the breaking up of the house. The conditions were quite different from England, and a period longer than a month was necessary if the holiday was to be of any value.

75,301. Dealing with the subject of pension, Mr. JAMES said the officers had always been given to understand that it represented deferred pay and not a compassionate allowance, and it was upon that ground that they desired to commute one-fourth at their own free will. It should be recognised that the accumulation was the personal property of the officers to be disposed of by them, and that the Government had no power to interfere.

75,302. With reference to the remark in the written statement in favour of the distinction between the Provincial Service and the Imperial Service, Mr. JAMES said that this only applied if the present system of recruitment remained the same. If the system of recruitment were changed on the lines indicated by him, then the whole thing would be modified.

75,303. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Mr. THOMAS said that under the new scheme of Amalgamation it was intended that the Engineering work of the Telegraph Department should become entirely dissociated from the Traffic work, which was at present performed by Telegraph Officers. The staff of Engineers would be lessened by more than a half, and the Traffic staff would have to be increased, but there would be a considerable saving in the personnel.

75,304. With reference to the Provincial Service, Mr. JAMES said that the present Provincial Service consisted of officers who are appointed in India. Men who would be considered to be in the Provincial Service at present would be one Director, some Superintendents, and probably some Assistant Superintendents and one Assistant Superintendent apprentice. A man recruited in India received two-thirds of the pay of the Imperial Service and was considered a provincial man.

75,305. Mr. JAMES then said that in years to come it might be possible to have one examination for the Engineering staffs of the Public Works and Telegraph Departments, but he did not object to such an arrangement. In any case the training afterwards would have to be on different lines. A man who took an Engineering degree would be able to devote himself either to Civil Engineering or Electrical Engineering, as the

actual mathematical and scientific training was more or less the same for both, the specialisation coming afterwards.

75,306. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Mr. JAMES thought that the men promoted from the subordinate establishment into the Provincial Service would probably come from the same class socially as the men who might be appointed direct. The present Provincial staff lacked a sound knowledge of practical work, although they knew the ordinary A.B.C. of the work. Even trained men became rusty if they did not go to England occasionally. It would be really economical from the Public Service point of view to send the men to England, and it would be worth while paying them to get a good education in England. They should be given every opportunity to turn out the best work. The work required in the Telegraph Department would be much better done by men who had had a better training than could be obtained in India.

75,307. With reference to furlough pay at 1*s.* 6*d.* and pension at 1*s.* 9*d.*, that came into force somewhere about 1893 after he entered the Service, and arose from the agitation of the Service itself. At first furlough allowance was paid at the current rate of Exchange but shortly afterwards it was raised to 1*s.* 6*d.* With regard to privilege leave, if an officer was not allowed to accumulate his leave, and was forced to take a month every year, in the event of his wife and children being in England, he would be unable to go there to see them. It was only by accumulating his three months' leave that the uncovenanted service officer was able to get to England at all. Also it gave him an average of three-fourths pay when he was at home. If only the children were sent to England and the wife remained in India, if he had to take a month every year it would be necessary for him to take his wife to the hills and stay at a hotel or furnish a house, and break up his establishment in the plains, and thus add largely to the expense of living in India.

75,308. Mr. THOMAS said there were certain subordinates who were always provided with free quarters. There were very few houses which could be rented.

Mr. JAMES thought the Government might build houses and charge rents based on a percentage of salary.

75,309. (*Mr. Styan.*) Mr. THOMAS said he did not remember expressing agreement with any portion of the Amalgamation scheme. He was consulted on the drawing up of the scheme on every point, but it did not follow that he agreed with what was ultimately decided. With reference to experimental amalgamation in Bombay, the duties of Traffic and Engineering which were formerly carried on by one set of officers have now been separated. With regard to officers on on tour by steamer, he proposed that in journeys by steamer the allowance should be the same as in journeys by rail both for transfers and for ordinary travelling.

The witnesses withdrew.

P. N. MITRA, Esq., Assistant Superintendent of Telegraphs, Lucknow Division.

Written Statement on behalf of the Provincial Service Officers of the Indian Telegraph Department.

75,310. (I.) **Method of recruitment.**—For reasons to be explained later on, the Provincial Service should be entirely abolished. It is suggested that the Superior Establishment of this Department should, in future, be recruited as follows:—

(1) One half of the Officers will be recruited in England. Three-quarters of these should enter by open competitive examination in which only qualified men from the different Engineering Colleges will be admitted. The rest will be recruited from the different British engineering firms and junior officers of the British Post Office by selection.

(2) The other half will be recruited in India. Of these three-quarters will be by open competitive Examination in which only qualified men from the different Indian Engineering Colleges will be admitted. The rest will be recruited from the subordinate staff of the Department by selection.

Candidates for the open Examination in both countries should be between 21 and 25 years of age. They should submit medical certificates of fitness. The standard of examination should be the same in England and India, as far as practicable; the subjects should be the different branches of Electrical Engineering, Theoretical and Practical, Mechanism, Mathematics applied to Electrical Engineering, Chemistry and Surveying.

75,311. (II.) **System of training and probation.**—The recruitment by competitive Examination will guarantee a preliminary training sufficient to meet the requirements of the profession in India. The selections from engineering firms and the British Post Office and from the subordinate service in India will have to be made very carefully so as to secure the same end, viz., the efficient performance of the duties required of a Telegraph Engineer in India.

The college training of the recruits of the Indian Colleges is at present supplemented by a period of training on probation for one year in the Department. Recruits obtained from England do not pass through this supplementary training. This probationary period in the Department is absolutely essential and should be insisted upon as an indispensable condition in case of all recruits and it should in addition be a probationary period in the strictest sense involving selection and the possibility of rejection at the end of it. Any plea that it is unfair or will deter candidates from England by reason of the attached risk may be met by the grant of free return passages to rejected probationers.

The period of probation should be limited to one year at the end of which the recruit's fitness for service should be considered.

The passing of the Signalling test should be made a condition for the first increment instead of the confirmation as at present.

75,312. (III.) **Conditions of service.**—The conditions of service should be the same for all officers whether recruited in England or in India. At present the conditions differ very considerably and this is the sole cause of the great discontent which prevails among officers recruited in India. Notwithstanding the fact that both classes of officers are recruited for and are required to do exactly the same work and bear the same responsibilities, the conditions of service for officers recruited in England are, in every respect, better than those for officers recruited in India.

75,313. (IV.) **Conditions of salary.**—The present pay of the officers recruited in India is approximately two-thirds of the pay of the officers recruited in England. This is utterly unfair and unsuitable. Under the present system the minimum pay of an Indian trained Superintendent is less than the maximum pay of an Imperial Assistant Superintendent and the minimum pay of an Indian trained Director is less that the maximum pay of an Imperial Superintendent. It therefore sometimes happens that an Indian trained officer has under him an Imperial officer drawing more pay than himself. A case in point is the present Director of Burma Circle (who is an Indian trained officer) drawing less pay than the Superintendent of the Rangoon Division who is working under him. This position is absolutely untenable.

The present scale of pay sanctioned for the Imperial Officers appears to be adequate. The pay granted to the Indian trained element is absolutely

inadequate and is not commensurate with their work and responsibilities. It is therefore desirable that the rate of pay should be the same for all.

In consideration of the fact that the officers recruited in England are put to extra expenditure on account of they themselves and their family going home on leave or returning to India on expiry of leave, it is suggested that a first class return passage to England be given to all officers recruited in England once in 5 years.

Local Allowances.—The local allowances at present sanctioned for Indian trained officers are two-thirds of those sanctioned for officers obtained from England. This difference is unjust, for these allowances are given for specific reasons, *i.e.*, as compensation for local disabilities which affect both classes of officers equally.

Probation period.—Not only have the Indian trained officers to undergo a probationary period and thereby incur the consequent risk of rejection, but even after completing such probation, the period is not counted for increments and promotion. This causes inequality between the two classes of officers. There should be no distinction whatever in the matter of emoluments of any nature between the two classes of officers. The emoluments should depend solely on services rendered and not on the country of original recruitment.

75,314. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—Here again there is much disparity between the conditions prevailing as regards the two classes of officers. The leave rules should be the same for all classes of officers. The nature of the work performed being the same, an Indian trained Telegraph Engineer needs leave for his health quite as much as the officers from England.

The following modifications in the Leave rules are suggested:—

(1) Privilege leave may be allowed to accumulate to a maximum of 6 months.

(2) The minimum limit of 6 months for combined leave should be entirely abolished, no limit being fixed.

(3) Furlough up to a maximum of 2 years in the whole service may be allowed on full pay in lieu of 4 years ordinary furlough.

(4) The maximum furlough allowance admissible to officers on leave in India may be increased from Rs. 666 2/3 monthly to Rs. 12,000 yearly.

The leave rules that are now under the consideration of the Government of India are, in other respects, quite adequate; they should be made the same for both classes of officers.

In counting leave towards pensions, there should be no difference between periods spent in India and out of India vide C. S. R. Art. 408.

75,315. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—The Pension Rules should be the same for both classes of officers. It is a well and universally established principle that pensions are granted as a retiring provision for services rendered to the State and it is therefore illogical and unjust to create or maintain any distinction in this direction between persons who have in fact rendered exactly the same service. In other words pensions ought to be wholly and solely dependent on services rendered and not on the country of original recruitment, for this does not involve any special merit.

Some provision should be made for the families of officers dying in actual service. Though every officer joins the Provident Fund, the amount at his credit is not sufficient in the event of his death for the maintenance of his family or the proper education of his children, who are therefore left in a more or less destitute condition. It is therefore not unreasonable to ask that the amount of pension to which such an officer would have been entitled should be commuted for the benefit of his family.

The pension rules now in force require revision. Conditions of life have undergone many changes since the times these rules were framed. The cost of living has increased very much. The following scale of pension is suggested.

Years of Completed Service.	Scale or Fraction of Average Emoluments.	Maximum Limit.	
		£	Rs.
10	$\frac{20}{60}$ths	133⅓	2,000
11	$\frac{22}{60}$ths	146⅔	2,200
12	$\frac{24}{60}$ths	160	2,400
13	$\frac{26}{60}$ths	173⅓	2,600
14	$\frac{28}{60}$ths	186⅔	2,800
15	$\frac{30}{60}$ths	200	3.000
16	$\frac{23}{60}$ths	230	3,450
17	$\frac{26}{60}$ths	260	3,900
18	$\frac{29}{60}$ths	290	4,350
19	$\frac{32}{60}$ths	320	4,800
20		350	5,250
21		380	5,700
22		410	6,150
23		440	6,600
24		470	7,050
25	$\frac{30}{60}$ths	500	7,500
26		540	8,100
27		580	8,700
28		620	9,300
29		660	9,900
30		700	10,500

75,316. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—There should be no limitations whatever. Considerations of domicile, race, colour, or creed should have nothing to do with appointments. All should be allowed equal chances for competing in the examinations.

The division of the services into Imperial and Provincial is keenly felt by all Provincial officers of this Department. This distinction between officers who do exactly the same work and bear exactly the same responsibilities cannot be justified on any account and will result in splitting up the service into two hostile camps which will greatly injure efficiency. A deep and widespread feeling of suspicion and distrust will gradually spring up between the two classes of officers and this must wreck harmonious working. The Provincial service was the outcome of the Public Service Commission of 1886 and all Provincial service officers in this Department earnestly pray that the present Commission may be pleased to recommend the removal of this long and keenly felt grievance and restore the conditions of service to those that existed before.

75,317. **(IX.) Other points.** (1) *Analogy with other Provincial services.*—The case of the Provincial service officers of this Department is similar in every respect to that of the Provincial service officers of the Public Works Department and the Railways. The former have all been recruited from Roorkee and most of them would have got appointments in the Public Works Department if allowed to take them. Three of them beat the Public Work Department men of their years in the final examination and carried away most of the prizes, including some Civil Engineering subjects. The slight difference made in the conditions of service of the two Provincial services in the last reorganisation has caused a certain amount of disappointment. It is therefore hoped that Provincial service officers of this Department will receive the same treatment as Provincial service officers of the Public Works Department and the Railways. There is no analogy with other Provincial services. In other departments, Provincial service officers are not borne on the same list as Imperial officers, nor are they

entrusted with same class of duties and responsibilities.

(2) Great difficulty is experienced by the majority of officers in getting suitable house accommodation in most stations. It is suggested that the Government provide quarters for its officers more freely.

(3) The travelling allowances admissible on transfer under the present rules are universally recognised to be inadequate. More liberal allowances should be given to cover all reasonable charges incurred by an officer breaking up his home and having to move his family from one station to another. This may be limited to actual certified charges not exceeding 4 First Class Railway and Steamer fares, 2 Third class or Deck fares plus an allowance for 40 maunds of Luggage.

(4) Travelling allowances should be admissible to officers returning from long leave. In cases of officers on leave out of India, these should be calculated from the port of debarkation in India or the station from which leave was taken whichever is less. In case of officers on leave in India these should be given from the place where orders are received or the station from which leave was taken whichever is less.

Mr. P. N. Mitra called and examined.

75,318. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness stated that he joined the Department as Assistant Superintendent apprentice from Rurki in November 1903, and was confirmed in 1905 as Assistant Superintendent and was now in charge of a Division. The written statement sent in represented in the main the views of the whole Service, and he had been elected by vote as a representative of the Service. No conference was held. He drafted the written statement, and circulated it to all officers and asked for opinions and suggestions, which were incorporated, and then the document was printed. There were a few suggestions sent in, but the draft was generally approved.

75,319. With regard to recruitment, three-fourths of the recruits should be by competitive examination, whether in England or India. The written statement was based on the present system in the department, and he did not know anything about the new Amalgamation scheme. The recruitment was three and four every alternate year in England, and two and one in India. If the examination was held in England and in India, both Englishmen and Indians should be eligible to compete in either examination, and as far *as possible the examinations should be* of an equal *standard. He thought it would be* quite possible at *the present time* to carry out an examination in India which would be of the same standard as an examination in England. The curriculum of the Engineering Colleges in India was more or less the same as that of the Colleges in England. At present recruits from India were obliged to undergo a period of probation, whereas those recruited in England had not to do so. That was probably owing to the fact that when the system was introduced the curriculum in India was probably not so high, but it was very much higher now, and good progress had been made in teaching electrical engineering. At present it was necessary for both Indian and English recruits to undergo a period of probation in studying the technicalities of the department, but the period of training of the English recruits was not termed probation and counted for promotion in the service. His suggestion was that one-fourth of the recruits in India should be promoted from the upper subordinate service, the men being selected according to merit and not according to seniority. He did not think it would matter at what age they were selected if they could work properly. A man who had passed nearly the whole of his service in the subordinate grades, if a capable and energetic man, would be quite fit for promotion towards the end of his service. He was also in favour of comparatively young men being promoted, if sufficiently brilliant, and he did not think that would cause any discontent in the ranks of the subordinate service.

75,320. With regard to pay, he suggested it should be exactly the same for the Imperial and the Provincial Services, and that the Provincial Service should be abolished. He was not prepared to say it was necessary to recruit a certain number of Europeans for the Service, but there might be circumstances which would justify it. His own opinion was that a certain number of Europeans was desirable. Recognising that a European officer had certain expenses in the way of sending home his children to be educated, and had probably to have an establishment in England as well as in India, and pay large sums in passage money in going to and fro, a concession had been allowed in the written statement of a first-class return passage once every five years, and he thought that was sufficient to make up for the additional expenditure the Englishman had to incur. The Indian officer had also to train his children, and his cost of living was sometimes more than that of a European.

75,321. On the subject of pensions, the witness considered that if an officer died during the period of his service his family should be entitled to some consideration. The provision made by the General Provident Fund was not sufficient. The system of pensions was drawn up, no doubt, on an actuarial basis, and if the scheme put forward in the written statement was put into operation the actuarial calculations might be upset, and greater expense would be thrown upon the Government, but he thought that expense ought to be incurred. In connection with travelling allowances, the Service asked that a more liberal scale should be granted, and that the officers should not be put to expense when transferred from one place to another. He himself, for instance, had been transferred from Lucknow to Burma, where he remained for about nine months, and was then transferred back, and he estimated that he lost about 800 odd rupees. His pay was Rs. 535.

75,322. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The witness said he had taken a diploma from the Thomason College in Engineering. The age at which a diploma in Engineering was taken in Rurki was about 21 or 22. He had not been to England. His proposal was that the men should pass their examination in England and come out to India and go through a period of probation with the Indians who entered from the Engineering Colleges in India. He did not think any practical training in England was necessary. A man who had taken an Electrical Engineering degree in a University was quite able to enter the department and do the work at once. He was not aware that it was necessary for a boy who wished to have an electrical engineering career in England to spend at least three years in big works after leaving the University, and pay a heavy fee, in order that he might commence at the bottom of a department in some electrical company. Most of the officers were graduates in science of the different Universities, and obtained a three-years' training in an Engineering College, and he thought that was quite enough to make them of value to the Telegraph department in India.

75,323. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The witness considered that officers should obtain study leave to keep themselves up-to-date, and if they did not do so their increments should not be given. If facilities were given, men could go to England and visit large works there. He himself was a B.A. of the Calcutta University with Honours in Science, and he had some knowledge of the subjects which were taught in the Engineering Colleges for the Public Works Department. The B.A. Degree and the Engineering Course at Thomason

College he believed was sufficient to enable him to carry on his work when he was first employed in the department, and with that education and training he could have entered the Public Works Department. A class-fellow of his was in the Public Works Department at present.

75,324. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The witness said a certain amount of laboratory work was done at the Thomason College, but not much practical work in electrical engineering. The work was mostly theoretical with a small amount of practical, but was quite sufficient for the Telegraph Department.

75,325. (*Mr. Styan.*) The witness admitted that he himself asked to be sent back from Burma. He quoted his last transfer only to show the inadequacy of travelling allowances. During his ten years' service he had had about 18 transfers, and very few of these were at his own request. The views expressed with regard to Europeans in the Department were his own, but they had been approved by other officers. It was taken for granted that a certain number of Europeans was necessary, and that the question was not to be discussed. He thought everyone should be given some chance of keeping himself up-to-date, whether Provincial or Imperial, and study leave should be given to both branches. He believed it was a fact that there had only been one college that ever had a training class for telegraphic work, and that class was now closed, but it would reopen if it was found necessary. The College was told by the Department of Commerce and Industry that no more recruitment would be made from that class and the class was closed.

The witness withdrew.

At Calcutta, Monday, 19th January 1914.

PRESENT:

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. (*in the Chair*).

Sir MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioner:—

G. R. CLARKE, Esq., I.C.S., Deputy Director-General of the Post Office.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. (*Joint Secretary*).

G. W. SCHÖNEMAN, Esq., Deputy Director-General of the Post Office.

Written Statement relating to the Post Office of India.

75,326. **(I) Methods of Recruitment.**—The present method of recruitment for the appointment of Superintendent is as follows:—

(1) By nomination from outside the Department for the appointment of Superintendent or Probationary Superintendent.

(2) By selection and promotion from the subordinate ranks of the Department.

The nominations from outside the Department are ordinarily confined to statutory "Natives of India" as defined in Article 37 of the Civil Service Regulations, but the Director-General has power to appoint non-domiciled Europeans to the extent of 10 per cent. of the total staff of Superintendents. The Indian candidates selected are usually graduates of a recognised University.

This system is satisfactory, and, having regard to the qualifications required of a Superintendent and the nature of his duties, it is preferable to selection by competition.

75,327. **(II) Training and Probation.**—Men who are nominated for the appointment of Superintendent from outside the Department are appointed after a short period of training, the duration of which depends on the occurrence of a vacancy to which they can be appointed permanently. Usually they are first taken on as Probationary Superintendents, of which there are one or two appointments attached to each Postal Circle.

All candidates who have been selected for the appointment of Superintendent, whether from outside the Department or from the subordinate ranks, are required to pass a departmental examination, after which they become eligible for appointment.

The arrangement is satisfactory, and I have no suggestions to make.

75,328. **(III) Conditions of Service.**—I have no remarks to offer under this head.

75,329. **(IV) Conditions of Salary.**—The following are the existing grades of pay of Superintendents of post offices:—

1st grade	- -	Rs. 500—20—600
2nd „	- -	Rs. 400—20—500
3rd „	- -	Rs. 300—20—400
4th „	- -	Rs. 250
5th „	- -	Rs. 200

In my opinion this grading is inadequate, and should be revised as follows:—

1st grade	- -	Rs. 500—20—700
2nd „	- -	Rs. 400—20—500
3rd „	- -	Rs. 300—20—400
4th „	- -	Rs. 200—20—300

The two lowest grades of Rs. 200 and Rs. 250 (fixed) tend to retard promotion, and it takes a Superintendent a long time to reach the pay of Rs. 300. Considering the position he is required to occupy and the nature of his duties, it should not take him more than five years to reach the pay of Rs. 300.

As regards the highest grade, a maximum pay of Rs. 700 will be suitable for the most senior Superintendents who are not considered fit for promotion to the higher appointments.

Probationary Superintendents are entertained usually on Rs. 80 or Rs. 100, except in Burma, where the Probationary Superintendent draws Rs. 150. In my opinion Rs. 80 is not a suitable pay for a Probationary Superintendent. I do not consider it a sufficient

argument that we can get men on that pay, because we could, no doubt, get men on even less pay, and possibly on no pay at all if the period of probation was not too long. We should give a Probationary Superintendent a sufficient allowance to enable him to maintain himself with some regard to the position for which he is a candidate. He has sometimes to wait two or three years before being appointed as a Superintendent, and has in the meantime to remain at the headquarters of the Postmaster-General, which is always a large and expensive town. I recommend that the minimum pay for a Probationary Superintendent be fixed at Rs. 100, and that there should be another grade of Rs. 125 to provide for those Probationary Superintendents who have been kept waiting unduly long for appointment as Superintendent.

75,330. **(V) Conditions of Leave.**—6. Under Article 314 (*a*) of the Civil Service Regulations, relating to "Long Leave—European services," the leave allowance for ordinary furlough is *half the average salary*, and the term "Average salary" is defined in Article 16 to mean "the average of the salary which an officer "has earned during so much of the three years "preceding the day on which he gives up office as he "has passed on duty or on privilege leave."

There does not appear to be sufficient justification for taking "average salary" into account, and the leave allowance for ordinary furlough should be half the salary drawn by the officer on the day preceding that on which he gives up office,—or at all events, half the salary earned by him during so much of *the year* preceding the day on which he gives up office as he has passed on duty or on privilege leave.

In the case of pensions, the calculations in Article 474 (*b*) of the Civil Service Regulations take into account "Average emoluments," which term is defined in Article 487 as meaning "the average calculated upon the last three years of service." It is presumed that the ground for taking the *average for the last three years* into account in this case is that an officer might otherwise retire as soon as he had received promotion, and Government might then have to pay pension at a higher rate during the rest of the officer's lifetime.

In the case of furlough allowance, however, the payment at the higher rate would be for a limited period, and, ordinarily, the officer would return to duty at the end of his leave. Under the existing rule, an officer who has not been able to afford to take furlough until he has earned an increase of pay, is obliged to serve another three years after earning the increase before he can afford to take the furlough necessary for him to recuperate his health.

Moreover, in the case of furlough allowance the present rule operates against *all* officers, irrespective of the amount of their salary, whereas, in the case of pension, it operates only against those whose "average emoluments" amount to *less* than the maximum pension admissible to officers of his class. For instance, the rule would operate against an officer who had been drawing a salary of Rs. 2,000 for two years and was proceeding on furlough, whereas, in the case of an officer who had earned his full pension of Rs. 5,000 a year, equal to Rs. 416⅔ a month, the rule would operate against him only if his average emoluments amounted to less than Rs. 833⅓.

75,331. **(VI) Conditions of Pension.**—The *maximum* amount of ordinary pensions admissible under Article 474 (*b*) of the Civil Service Regulations should be raised from Rs. 5,000 a year (or Rs. 416⅔ a month) to Rs. 6,000 a year (or Rs. 500 a month), and this should not affect the additional pension of Rs. 1,000 a year which is at present allowed to the officers referred to in Article 475. It is obvious that a scale of pensions which was fixed half a century (or more) ago is not adequate in the present day. It needs no argument to show that the purchasing power of the rupee has diminished greatly in the interval and that the necessaries of life cost very much more now than when the present scale of pensions was fixed.

The grant of an additional pension of Rs. 1,000 a year to the officers referred to in Article 475 of the Civil Service Regulations is subject to the provisions of Article 464. Clause (*b*) of Article 464 lays down that all officiating and temporary service counts towards the minimum of three years effective service required before the concession can be granted, but excepts periods during which an officer officiates for another absent *on privilege leave*. There may possibly be some technical justification for this exception, but it is hardly equitable that an officer who actually performs the duties of the appointment in several privilege leave vacancies should be debarred from counting that officiating service, which may easily amount to a year, merely on the ground that the officer for whom he officiated was absent on *privilege leave*.

In my opinion, the exception in Article 464 should be abolished.

I am also of opinion that all officers should be allowed to commute a portion of their pension not exceeding ¼th without medical examination, and without reference to the purpose for which it is wanted, provided that the commutation is applied for within one year of retirement. A medical examination is necessary only if Government were dealing with the matter on actuarial lines, but it should not be necessary to do this. An officer whose health has suffered on account of strenuous work on behalf of Government during a long series of years has quite as much necessity for paying off his debts or providing for his family as another officer whose constitution was more robust.

As regards the particular purpose for which commutation is wanted, there is, in practice, no effective check on the disposal of the money. The endeavour to apply a check is unnecessarily inquisitorial and leads to much correspondence that should be avoided.

75,332. **(VII) Limitations in Employment of Non-Europeans.**—There is no such limitation and it is not required.

75,333. **(VIII) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—In 1886–87 there were, besides the Director-Generalship, six appointments of Postmasters-General and the Public Services Commission of that year recommended that "not less than three" of these appointments "should "ordinarily be filled by promotion within the Depart- "ment."

This was generally understood in the Department to mean that not less than one-half the number of the highest appointments referred to above should be open to officers of the Department, but, in practice, it has been intepreted to mean that, no matter how many appointments of Postmasters-General there may be at a given time, the officers of the Department had no claim to more than three of them. For the last two or three years only, have as many as four officers of the Department held appointments of Postmasters-General although the total number of appointments (including the Director-Generalship) was 8 before 1906, 10 from 1906 to 1908, and 11 since 1908.

In my opinion, it should be laid down clearly that not less than one-half the number of the highest appointments should be filled by promotion of officers *of the Post Office* and that if the total number of appointments is an odd number, the officers of the Post Office should be given the benefit of the extra appointment. This should, as at present, be subject to the reservation that Departmental officers fit for promotion are available. This will necessitate an explanation being furnished to Government whenever the officers *of the Post Office* are not given a proper share of the higher appointments.

A clear rule on the subject is even more necessary now than hitherto, in view of the proposed amalgama-

tion of the Post Office and Telegraph Departments. If any of the higher appointments of the Post Office are given to officers of the Telegraph Department (a telegraph officer has actually been acting as Postmaster-General for over 1½ years), it should be at the expense of the civilians and not of the officers of the Postal branch.

75,334. **(IX) Other Points, within the Terms of Reference to the Royal Commission.**—There are no other points on which I have any remarks to offer.

Mr. G. W. SCHÖNEMAN called and examined.

75,335. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness had been 33 years in the postal service, and had served as superintendent and Deputy Director-General. He had also officiated as Postmaster-General. As Deputy Director-General, he was included in the 10 Postmasters-General. He was recruited as an inspector and went through the superintendent's grade.

75,336. There was no rule as to whether appointments to the higher posts should be made from the superintendent or the postmaster branch. The higher posts were filled from either side, but the superintendents obtained most of them. It was a matter of selection, and there was no restriction as to the number of postmasters who might be selected.

75,337. He was satisfied with the present system of recruitment and did not think it desirable to lay down any fixed proportion of Indians. The majority of superintendents at present were Indians. Superintendents were recruited partly direct and partly by promotion. The present proportion was about half and half. This was satisfactory.

75,338. Two years was not too much for a superintendent to be on probation before being given a permanent appointment, but there had been cases in which the period had been three years. The minimum pay for a probationary superintendent should be Rs. 100 with a rise to Rs. 125 for those who were kept waiting for more than two years. Recently the minimum pay had been raised from Rs. 80 to Rs. 100, which was so much to the good.

75,339. An All-India list for probationary superintendents was not necessary. The present system of provincial lists should be retained on the ground that an Indian served better in his own province, and was not always willing to leave it. Any inequalities could be regulated by the Director-General in making appointments.

75,340. There was no objection to laying down a higher educational qualification in the case of Indians, as the field from which they were drawn was much larger than the field of the domiciled community.

75,341. The justification for raising the present maximum of pay to Rs. 700 was that the number of superintendents had largely increased. There were 172 now, as compared with 120 at the time of the last Public Services Commission, while the number of higher appointments was about stationary. Some compensation was needed for the men who did not get the higher appointments. There was no difficulty in securing an adequate supply of superintendents at the present rates of pay, but, looking at the higher appointments which would have to be filled later on, a better class of recruit should be obtained. To achieve that there should be an increase in the superintendent's pay.

75,342. In theory a graded was better than a general incremental system of pay for superintendents, as those who received their increments regularly had not a great incentive to work. At present officers were promoted *ordinarily* from one grade to another by seniority, but grade promotion could be withheld if necessary. It was true that, under a graded system, it was possible that a deserving man might be prevented from receiving promotion owing to the accident of non-retirement or lack of casualties in the higher grades. This being so he was prepared to accept a general incremental system of pay provided that it contained a selection bar at a given point. This might be put at Rs. 500.

75,343. Of late years the pay of the postmasters had been improved very considerably, and at present they had nothing to complain of.

75,344. The cadre was not large enough to enable men always to obtain the leave to which they were entitled. Furlough allowances were also so low that men did not take what they ought to take, and the rules on the subject ought to be revised. There could be no objection to commutation of furlough if it was left optional, and many members of the service would welcome such a provision.

75,345. Every kind of officiating duty should count towards the additional pension of Rs. 1,000 a year allowed by Article 475 of the Civil Service Regulations, so long as the officer had been actually on duty for three years.

75,346. At present a medical certificate was required for commutation of pension, and probably the man who had worked hardest, and was in bad health, was the very man who could not obtain it. No medical certificate should be required, and there should be no inquisitorial enquiries as to the purpose to which the commutation was going to be put. Commutation should be allowed for not more than a quarter of the pension, as now, but the present restrictions should be removed.

75,347. It was optional with officers who were in the service when the General Provident Fund was started to subscribe to it or not. The provident fund on the existing lines would not be a substitute for commutation of pension.

75,348. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) His main objection to the existing rules for commutation was that, if a man asked to commute a portion of his pension in order to secure provision for his widow, it would not be allowed by the Government. The establishment of a family pension fund would not obviate the necessity for commutation of pension, as there were many things for which a man might require money.

75,349. It was not necessary that opportunities be given to senior superintendents, or specially-selected men, to go to England to investigate postal arrangements. All that was necessary could be learned in India. Experience in England was more likely to be of benefit when a man had passed the grade of superintendent.

75,350. Superintendents did not take as much leave as officers in other services because they could not afford it. If paid as well as officers in other services, it might be possible to compel them to take furlough.

75,351. Ordinarily superintendents were promoted to be Deputy Postmasters-General. There might be one or two cases of postmasters being promoted to that line, but they usually went on to be Presidency Postmasters. The pay of the higher appointments in the postmaster's line was much the same as that of the Deputy Postmasters-General. There was no reason why men should not be selected from both lines to be Postmasters-General; but the training that a postmaster obtained in large post offices like Bombay or Calcutta was not sufficiently diversified to fit him for the work. The experience of superintendents made them better men for the post. The promotion of postmasters should be quite exceptional.

75,352. During the last 10 years the Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans, who had come into the department, were not as good a class as they were 20 years and more ago. In these days men could obtain appointments in private firms to a much larger extent than formerly, and also Indians were taken into the department in much larger numbers, and that had affected the recruitment of Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans. Also the educational facilities of the schools were not quite so good as they used to be. A definite set of appointments should not be put aside for the domiciled community in the Post Office. The matter should be left in the hands of the Director-General. There was no danger that the domiciled community would be lost sight of and that the department would cease to be manned in part from that class. The present 10 per cent. for non-domiciled Europeans was quite sufficient.

75,353. He did not think he had been very fortunate himself in the service as he obtained his present appointment only in August last at the age of nearly 52, after 33 years' service.

75,354. The superintendents were not absolutely discontented, but they felt they ought to receive better pay, the present pay, owing to the rise in prices, being insufficient.

75,355. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) At present there were 16 probationary superintendents. There was an Indian Assistant Director-General and an Indian Deputy Postmaster-General. On the 1st September 1912, there was no Indian in the higher posts. The fixing of 10 per cent. for non-domiciled Europeans was to meet the case of field service and of planting districts, where the planters preferred to have European superintendents. The superintendents had to meet the planters in connection with all postal arrangements. The planters had to arrange for post office accommodation, for example, and preferred to deal with a European superintendent. A proper understanding between them was essential.

75,356. Postmasters below Rs. 300 were not gazetted officers.

75,357. Men who came from the subordinate ranks to be superintendents might be inspectors or clerks who had passed the departmental examination. Postmasters below Rs. 300 also had the opportunity of passing the examination and of entering the superintendents' line. There should be no interchange between the two classes of work, as they were entirely different.

75,358. Nominations of men from outside the department were usually made by the Postmaster-General. No advertisement was issued, but a large number of applications came in from time to time and were entered in a register, which was consulted whenever an appointment had to be filled up. It was only once in about three years that it was necessary to select a man. Under the present system men could be obtained with all the qualifications necessary. There was no objection to advertising the posts, and if men possessed qualities suitable for the office, there could, of course, be no objection to their having higher educational qualifications than they frequently had at present.

75,359. The years taken by a subordinate to rise to superintendent's rank varied between seven and ten; but there was no reason why a really competent man, who had been three years in the service, should not go up for the departmental examination and become eligible for appointment as superintendent. He could not say off-hand how many years it took a man, at the present time, to rise from the lowest to the highest grade of superintendents.

75,360. His statement that it was not desirable to have one All-India list for superintendents and postmasters referred to probationary superintendents. There was at present an All-India register for promotion for superintendents.

75,361. Government officials looked upon pension as deferred pay; but he was not certain whether Government admitted that it was so. The fact remained, however, that men received a certain pension, and if they were entitled to it there was no reason why a portion of it should not be capitalised.

75,362. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The qualifications of a candidate for a superintendentship were education, physique, antecedent social status and power of controlling establishments. The minimum standard of education was matriculation or its equivalent. Men were usually graduates. If a graduate possessed the necessary qualifications for the post, there was no reason why he should not be selected. There was a rough idea of keeping up a proportion as between the various communities in making appointments of probationary superintendents; but otherwise Indians of all classes, Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans were all considered together. The matter was and should be left entirely in the Postmaster-General's hands. With the small number of such appointments it would be very difficult to lay down any fixed proportion for any community. If the Muhammadans or the Hindus complained, the Postmaster-General would consider the complaint. There was no fixed principle either in appointing postmasters, but as a matter of fact nearly all of them were Indians. The postmaster worked up from a subordinate appointment, and if an Anglo-Indian entered as a clerk he could work up in the same way. Postmasters usually began in the very lowest grades of postmasters, and were there practically clerks, and were interchangeable with clerks.

75,363. (*Mr. Clarke.*) The pay of the ordinary superintendent should rise to Rs. 700 a month, and the brilliant man should go beyond. The efficiency bar at Rs. 500 should not prevent the average man from rising to Rs. 700. He had no objection to a time-scale begining at Rs. 200 and going straight to Rs. 700, so long as there was a point at which the question of efficiency for a promotion to the higher grades was considered.

75,364. Certain Presidency Postmasters had been promoted to be Postmaster-General and there was nothing to prevent a good man in the postmasters' line becoming a Postmaster-General. The administrative work which a Presidency Postmaster had to do was as difficult as the work a Deputy Postmaster-General had to do, and a good postmaster, if fit for promotion, would ordinarily be selected for a Presidency Postmastership.

75,365. The list of applicants for the appointment of probationary superintendent in the department was a very large one, and more than was necessary. Probationary superintendents were selected in the province to which they belonged, and directly they became superintendents were put on to a general list for promotion.

75,366. A senior probationary assistant in charge of a division would, under his proposal to have a higher grade of Rs. 125, draw Rs. 165 (pay Rs. 125 *plus* acting allowance Rs. 40), but he would agree to their having the pay of the lowest grade of superintendent.

The witness withdrew.

R. W. HANSON, Esq., Officiating Assistant Director-General of the Post Office;
C. D. RAE, Esq., Deputy Postmaster, Calcutta; and
H. K. RAHA, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Midnapur Division.

(These three witnesses were examined together upon the written statement put in by Messrs. McMinn, Sinclair, and Sri Ram—vide paragraphs 75,213–31.)

75,367. Mr. HANSON also wrote:—

I agree generally with the memorandum on behalf of the superintendents and gazetted postmasters of the Post Office, India, which was submitted to the Royal Commission, in June last, by Mr. M. P. C. Byrne, Deputy Postmaster-General, Bombay, subject to the following modifications:—

Methods of Recruitment.—It has been stated that domiciled European candidates selected for the post of superintendents should be ordinarily under-graduates.

As the European schools in India teach according to the European Schools' Code, domiciled European or Anglo-Indian candidates should be required to pass the highest examination under this Code.

Conditions of Salary.—The pay of superintendents should be fixed according to the time-scale, rising from Rs. 250 to Rs. 800, after 22 years' service, by annual increments of Rs. 25.

The pay of Deputy Postmasters-General and Postmasters-General should also be increased proportionately.

Conditions of Leave.—The request for 45 days' privilege leave after 10½ months' service is, in my opinion, not justified.

75,368. Mr. RAHA wrote:—

To secure the admission of the best available candidates into the service, it is desirable that the principal avenue of admission into the service should be an open competition. All superintendents should be appointed from probationary superihtendents and no one should be appointed direct. The probationary superintendents should be recruited as follows:—

80 per cent. by competitive examination in India open to selected natives of India who must ordinarily be graduates of an Indian university.

10 per cent. from departmental officials by promotion after passing a departmental test.

10 per cent. by nomination of the Director-General or the Postmaster-General.

In this connection it is submitted that there is at present no necessity for the recruitment of non-domiciled Europeans to the service.

Conditions of Service.—The service should be constituted as a Superior Postal Service with pay from Rs. 300 rising to Rs. 1,500 in the manner mentioned below. (The pay of the service at present is Rs. 200 to Rs. 1,400, leaving out of consideration the appointments of Postmasters-General and Deputy Directors-General.) Rs. 300 to Rs. 500 by annual increments of Rs. 30 in 20 years and three grades of Rs. 1,100, Rs. 1,300 and Rs. 1,500, the three highest grades comprising the appointments of Deputy Postmaster-General, Assistant Director-General, Inspector-General, R.M.S., and Presidency Postmaster. The cadre of this service should include the appointments of postmasters on salaries of Rs. 500 to Rs. 800. Post offices for which such high pay is justified will be in charge of superintendents, as the officers in charge of such offices are expected to possess higher administrative qualifications than are necessary for postmasters in harge of offices on lower pay.

The appointments in the three highest grades referred to above should be filled up from among superintendents according to seniority. No officer who has risen to the top and is still working with diligence and integrity should be passed over. In regard to the pay proposed for the service, besides what has already been stated in the memorandum of Mr. M. P. C. Byrne, I would respectfully point out that, on account of the rapidly-increasing work of the department, it is inevitable that before long there must be considerable devolution of authority from the Postmaster-General to Divisional Superintendents. It is, therefore, absolutely necessary that the pay and status of the service should be raised and that the conditions of the service should be sufficiently attractive.

Postmasters up to the grade of Rs. 400—20—500 should constitute a subordinate service analogous to the subordinate service in the Telegraph Department Such officers and their offices should always be under the control of a superintendent.

I consider that the pay of the Paymasters-General and Deputy Directors-General should be raised to Rs. 2,000—100—3,000. Half of these appointments, as stated in Mr. Byrne's memorandum, should be reserved as prizes for the postal service and half for members of the Indian Civil Service. Appointments to this rank of departmental officers should, of course, be always by selection, two appointments at least being listed for Indians. Members of the Indian Civil Service selected for the department should be officers of at least 10 years' standing and they should elect for the department once for all. They should undergo a period of training before joining service in this department.

Messrs. R. W. HANSON, C. D. RAE, and H. K. RAHA called and examined.

75,369. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) Mr. HANSON was a second grade Superintendent of Post Offices and was at present officiating as Assistant Director-General. His permanent pay was Rs. 500 and his officiating allowance Rs. 160. The greater part of his service had been spent as Divisional Superintendent. He had worked up from a Deputy Postmastership. Mr. RAE was Deputy Postmaster of Calcutta in the first grade of postmasters and had held that appointment since 1909. Previous to that he was in the Government of India Secretariat and in the Director-General's office for about six or seven years. Mr. RAHA began as a probationary Superintendent in 1895 and had risen to be a first grade Superintendent of Post Offices with a pay of Rs. 540.

75,370. Mr. HANSON said the majority of the service accepted the present system of recruitment and Mr. RAE agreed with him. Mr. RAHA, however, preferred a system of competitive examination, as he believed it would secure a much better class of men than was now obtained. The prospects of the service were sufficiently good to attract the very best men. In order to be assured of obtaining the necessary qualities apart from educational qualifications, he would have competition amongst a certain number of selected men. That system would make an enormous difference in a few years in the personnel of the service.

75,371. Mr. HANSON said that at present probationary superintendents had to serve for not more than two years, and as they had to qualify for and pass a departmental examination, and some of them did not pass straight away, he thought the two years suggested in the written statement was a fair maximum. The period of probation should not be less than one year before a man was put in charge of a division. The representation made in the memorandum was practically carried out now. Mr. RAE and Mr. RAHA agreed.

75,372. Mr. HANSON said the number of vacancies for superintendents was not very large throughout India, and if 50 per cent. was given to men promoted from the lower grades, the 50 per cent. left for direct recruitments would give only a few vacancies. This would mean that probationary superintendents would

have to wait far longer than two years before they received an appointment. Everything depended on the number of vacancies that occurred. The position of postmasters in the higher grades had been greatly improved in recent years, and the bulk of the men had a better outlook than formerly, so that more men now elected for the postmasters' line.

75,373. Mr. HANSON then said that a general list for probationary superintendents was not a very important matter from the superintendents' point of view. He did not wish to press the point. Mr. RAE and Mr. RAHA concurred.

75,374. Mr. HANSON did not know why the distinction was drawn in the memorandum between the educational qualifications of Indians and members of the domiciled community. In his separate written statement he had made a suggestion that, as the European schools in India had a school code, domiciled European or Anglo-Indian candidates should be required to pass the highest examination under that code. He understood from the educational department that very few Anglo-Indian schools taught for the ordinary B.A. degree, and that there was no general desire on the part of Anglo-Indian scholars to go up for that examination. To insist on it for a member of the domiciled community would therefore tremendously handicap his chances, as very few took that degree. Mr. RAE agreed. Mr. RAHA, on the other hand, thought the same educational qualifications ought to apply and was not impressed by Mr. Hanson's reasons. He saw no reason why a domiciled European should not take a college after his school course.

75,375. Mr. HANSON was satisfied with the present age-limits for direct recruitment and asked for an increase in the daily travelling and transfer allowances and more tentage and house accommodation. With regard to travelling allowance, most departments had similar grievances. There were too many restrictions in the rules. When a man went on tour, he should be entitled to his daily allowances. At present, if a man travelled by sea and disembarked in the morning, he received no daily allowance for that day. The department thought it would be valuable to have a committee appointed to revise the Civil Service Regulations, and that such revision would not cause any great loss to Government. The officers who chiefly suffered were superintendents, who were given Rs. 4 a day. If they had to travel by road twenty miles or under, they had to pay their carting expenses, and that was common to all Government departments. The Superintendent of the Railway Mail Service was badly off because he had to travel by rail and have his food in the train or in refreshment rooms and Rs. 4 was quite insufficient. The midnight to midnight rule should also be abolished. If an officer showed that he halted for a certain number of hours, he should get the extra allowance to which he was entitled free of deductions. With regard to house and tentage allowances, the Director-General had provided tents in some divisions in a small percentage of cases and also houses. Other departments also suffered the same inconveniences. It was well known that, throughout the large towns in India, rents were going up and officers had to pay out of all proportion to their salaries. A senior man drawing Rs. 500 a month might be able to pay, but, when a junior man came to take his place, he could not pay the rent his predecessor paid, and the house was lost to the superintendent. Mr. RAHA concurred. Mr. RAE agreed generally, but said that postmasters had not the same grievances, as they received free houses.

75,376. Both Mr. HANSON and Mr. RAHA wished to have a time-scale rather than a graded system. MR. RAE said postmasters were paid in accordance with the responsibilities of the particular post office over which they presided and therefore a time-scale would not be feasible in that branch of the service.

75,377. Mr. HANSON said that, even if a time-scale were introduced, he would press for officers to be compulsorily retired at fifty-five. There were strong objections to Deputy Postmasters-General and Postmasters-General being given extension over the age of fifty-five.

75,378. The argument in the written statement about the scarcity of well-paid administrative posts was used to support the claim for an increase of pay for the superintendent. It was true that, with the growth of a department like the Post Office there were chances of the administrative posts being increased in the future. According to Messrs. HANSON and RAE, there had been a falling-off in individual recruits of late years, though some were above the average standard. Increased pay would undoubtedly attract a better class of non-Indians than was now obtained, especially if they knew they would rise on a time-scale with a pension sufficient to retire on. At present two-thirds of the men did not rise beyond the superintendent's grade, and received a pension of from Rs. 250 to Rs. 300 a month, and they knew that in other lines they could be sure of Rs. 800 as pay after twenty-five years' service. Mr. RAHA, however, thought that, if the system of recruitment was changed, it would be possible to obtain better men without increasing the pay, though an increase in pay was very necessary.

75,379. Mr. RAE said postmasters claimed special treatment in the matter of leave on the ground that they had to work on Sundays and holidays. The whole of the department was working, as letters had to be sorted and sent on to their destination, and in larger towns there was a modified delivery. In Calcutta, for instance, there were two deliveries of letters on Sundays. Even on gazetted holidays and Christmas Day, a proportion of the staff was at work. Men obtain relaxation on a holiday roster in turn, but the heads of the offices could take very few holidays, as they had to be present for a certain portion of the day when the mails were being received or were being distributed for delivery. Mr. HANSON and Mr. RAHA said there was no justification for superintendents asking for the same consideration.

75,380. Mr. HANSON said the officers asked for the option of a pension after a twenty-five years' service. It would take a man twenty-two years to rise to the full pay of a superintendent, and then he would have to draw that pay for three years before he got half the maximum, which would make it twenty-five years from the date of his appointment in the lowest grade of superintendent. If he had joined as a probationer, or had been in the lower ranks, he would have had to serve longer. Very few men now retire after twenty-five years' service as the pension was not sufficient.

75,381. Mr. HANSON also said that the General Provident Fund was compulsory for all new entrants, but he did not think it could be considered a substitution for permission to commute a portion of pension. Both Mr. RAE and Mr. RAHA agreed.

75,382. With regard to the Telegraph Department, Mr. HANSON said the posts of Director-General and Postmaster-General were the only two in which the Telegraph Department would compete with the Post Office. At present the department had five out of ten Postmaster-Generalships and it was hoped that the proportion would be continued. If the departments were given half the Postmaster-Generalships, they would have no objection to a telegraph officer's being occasionally given one also, provided it was taken from the Indian Civil Service. On the other hand, the whole department acknowledged that the recruitment of members of the Indian Civil Service into the department had been very beneficial.

75,383. Mr. RAE said he was in favour of interchangeability between superintendents and postmasters. The work did not differ much from, and in the higher grades became more and more like, that of a superintendent. The only difference was that the superintendent had a good deal of travelling to do. When the position of Presidency Postmaster was reached it would be found, as in the case of Calcutta, that he actually had two superintendents working under him. Mr. HANSON, on the other hand, said he was not in favour of interchangeability. A postmaster's life was a sedentary one, and it would be

difficult to find a postmaster who, after a number of years, was physically capable of taking up a superintendent's work, which entailed continuous travelling in all kinds of weather; and many postmasters would not care about it. He objected to its introduction in connection with the officers now in the service because many of the present postmasters had already failed as superintendents. A postmaster was paid according to the importance of the place he occupied, whereas a superintendent was remunerated on entirely different principles. Mr. RAHA agreed with Mr. Hanson.

75,384. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Mr. HANSON did not think the amalgamation scheme would hurt his service, if 50 per cent. of the Postmaster-Generalships were secured to it. As regards the officers of the Telegraph Department, they were no doubt very expert in their own profession; but a Superintendent of Telegraphs by the time he had attained the seniority which would make him a Postmaster-General, would generally have settled down into a groove; and would not be of so much benefit to the department as a younger man who was a member of the Indian Civil Service. A sound knowledge of law on both the Civil and Criminal sides was required in a Postmaster-General and also a good knowledge of banking.

75,385. Mr. HANSON said that, in asking for recruits of good social standing, they referred to men of good family, who had received a liberal education, and had had an all-round training in athletics, which characteristics generally produced the right stamp of officer. Amongst Indians there were some who had adopted the European standard of living, and they were far more acceptable to the department in many ways. He did not mean that men should necessarily have had an education in England. The men who adopted European methods were more respected by the subordinates than those who did not. Mr. RAE was in general agreement with these views. Mr. RAHA, however, said he had never known a Postmaster-General enquire into what style of living was adopted by a candidate, and he could not imagine that the method a man adopted in his dress had ever determined his selection.

75,386. Mr. RAHA then added that the competitive examination he advocated would be a purely academic one. For the work of a superintendent a fairly well-educated man was needed. Indians who are not graduates were not appointed at present, except in the case of a few men who had been taken from the department. A competitive examination would give the best men available and it should be an examination for the whole of India, confined to a certain number of candidates selected from the different centres. That would improve the efficiency of the department.

75,387. Mr. RAE explained that the fact of there being at the present moment no Indian postmaster above the Rs. 400 to Rs. 500 grade was purely accidental, because Indian postmasters had risen to the higher grades. An Indian officer had recently retired from the Postmastership of Delhi; a Madrasi gentleman was at Bangalore, while the Presidency Postmaster of Madras was another Madrasi gentleman.

75,388. Mr. HANSON said officers did not take a great deal of furlough, because they had not been able to afford it. If the pay was increased, it followed that the leave allowances would be increased, and men would take more furlough. More men probably took leave now than formerly, and two or three had gone to Europe to study post office methods at their own expense. That was not recognised as a particular advantage in the service, but it gave the officer a wider knowledge, and enabled him to acquire new ideas. There was no necessity to depute an officer specially to study European systems, but when an officer was on leave in Europe he might be considered to be on duty for a short period if he wished to acquire special knowledge. He himself had been to the Post Office in London, where there was a good deal to be learnt.

75,389. Mr. RAHA said there was a desire on the part of Indian members to go to Europe to study postal methods and some men would avail themselves of the opportunity, if given. The eight years' interval rule was very hard, as people could not take furlough in instalments. If, for example, a man had a month's privilege leave, he should be able to add a month's furlough and take two months' holiday.

75,390. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Mr. RAE said the promotion of postmasters was mainly by seniority up to the highest grade. There was no general affirmation of the principle of selection.

75,391. Mr. RAHA said that gazetted postmasterships above Rs. 300 were mostly held by Europeans and Anglo-Indians. Promotion did not go by seniority from the Rs. 200–300 to the Rs. 300–400 grade. In practice, selection was made from Europeans and Anglo-Indians, and that accounted for the absence of Indians in the higher ranks. There was a feeling amongst Indians that the higher posts were entirely governed by patronage, and it was in order to obviate that feeling that he suggested competitive examination amongst candidates selected from educational institutions. If that were done, perhaps some of the better class of graduates who now went into the executive and judicial services would be attracted into the Postal Department, because the salaries were quite as high.

75,392. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Mr. RAHA said that many more Indians had got into the department during the last ten years than formerly, and it was probably because Anglo-Indians and Europeans had held a much larger proportion of the service in the past that there were so many of them now holding higher posts. But even among the men recruited in late years the proportion of Europeans and Anglo-Indians had been too high. The proportion had decreased because a large number of Indians had been appointed to the superintendents' grade of late years, but, looking at the number of appointments made in the last five years, it would be seen that Anglo-Indians and Europeans had been appointed quite out of proportion, so that the proportion which at one time was decreasing was now increasing again.

75,393. With regard to the guarantee fund, Mr. HANSON thought the whole of the interest ought really to be utilised for the benefit of the subordinate staff, and others who subscribed towards the fund. The head of the department *ex officio* should have control of the funds. A good method would be for the Director-General to decide at the beginning of each year how much money could be given, and then the amount should be apportioned out. Mr. RAE and Mr. RAHA thought it would be better to have an advisory committee to assist the Director-General.

75,394. (*Mr. Clarke.*) On its being pointed out to him that out of forty-three postmasters there were twenty-three Indians and twenty Europeans in the Rs. 200–Rs. 300 grade, Mr. RAHA admitted that the proportion in the postmasters' line was very much better than it used to be. As the service now stood, Indians had 60 per cent. of the total number of appointments. He pressed for a larger percentage; but would not make it definite, as he wished to have a competitive examination by which anyone could get in quite apart from nationality.

The witnesses withdrew.

At Calcutta, Tuesday, 20th January 1914.

PRESENT:

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. *(in the Chair).*

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.

and the following Assistant Commissioner:—

J. M. COODE, Esq., Director, Traffic Branch.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. *(Joint Secretary).*

H. MAYSTON, Esq., Director of Telegraphs, Bengal; and

J. C. SHIELDS, Esq., Acting Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, Telegraph Department.

(These two witnesses were examined together upon the written statement put in by Messrs. Streatfeild-James and Thomas—vide paragraphs 75,269–78.)

75,395. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) Mr. MAYSTON had acted as Director of Telegraphs since December 1912. He joined the service in 1890 as an Assistant Superintendent from Cooper's Hill, and had gone through the ordinary grades to his present position. Mr. SHIELDS had acted as Electrical Engineer-in-Chief since February last. He was appointed originally by the Secretary of State as a temporary Assistant Superintendent of Telegraphs, and had been through all the grades in the department up to his present position. Both witnesses were signatories to the corporate memorandum, and supported the proposals made therein.

75,396. Mr. MAYSTON knew little about the scheme of amalgamation, except that a separation between the engineering and the traffic branch was proposed. His reason for proposing that three-fourths of the engineering department should be recruited in England, and one-fourth in India was that his experience showed that the more men obtained from England the more efficient the service would be. At present it was not easy to get qualified telegraph engineers in India. If half the engineering branch was recruited in India, it would lead to deterioration in the *personnel*. The recruiting, however, would be very small when the two branches had been separated. Mr. SHIELDS took the same view, but, provided the men recruited in India were sent to England for training for two years, he had no objection to half being recruited in England and half in India.

75,397. Mr. MAYSTON said no doubt training in England would give better officers, but he would still maintain that three-fourths should be recruited in that country. No recruits had come into the department since Cooper's Hill was abolished except those from Rurki, and they were recruited in the same way as Public Works officers.

75,398. Mr. SHIELDS explained that the Public Works Department advertised for men in England, and there was a committee to select the most promising candidates. He proposed a similar method of recruitment, except that, after the men had been nominated by the committee, they should have a competitive examination amongst themselves.

75,399. Mr. SHIELDS then said that he believed that only a very few officers of the department had seen the official scheme for amalgamation, or had been consulted upon it, but he had seen its working to a small extent in Bombay, and it appeared to him that the idea was to place the traffic branch, which previously had been looked upon as a most important part of the work, very much more under subordinates, and under officers who had had no experience of telegraph work at all. Skilled and well trained officers were required for the traffic branch just as much as for the engineering branch.

75,400. Mr. SHIELDS also said that he thought that about six months' study leave every five years on two-thirds pay should be made compulsory. That would necessitate an increase in the cadre, which was too small at present. Mr. MAYSTON considered it would be a good thing to send men on study leave to England as much as possible, but it should be left to the Government of India to decide how often an officer could be spared. They should go once in every five or ten years. Mr. SHIELDS said there were no facilities for electrical study in India, as there were so many new inventions continually being brought to notice, especially in wireless telegraphy, study leave in Europe was very important.

75,401. Dealing with the question of salaries, Mr. MAYSTON said they were sufficient, except with regard to the head officer of the engineering and traffic branches. He also claimed that if there was a suitable man in the Telegraph Department, he should be regarded as eligible for the Director-Generalship. Mr. SHIELDS said that, under the new scheme, the position of the Engineer-in-Chief would not be anything like that of the old Director-General, who was head of the department under the Government, and responsible to Government. The post of Engineer-in-Chief would be quite a small one compared with that of the Director-General of Telegraphs, even if the pay was raised. One officer at present was a Postmaster-General, and he believed that under the amalgamation scheme it was proposed there should be two. His branch considered they should have more such appointments. These appointments would be regarded as prize billets in that that they would enable Telegraph Officers to qualify in the work of both departments, and thus strengthen their claim for the appointment of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs. He understood that Telegraph officers holding the appointments of Postmaster General would draw their ordinary telegraph pay whether this was greater or less than that of Postmaster-General. Both Mr. MAYSTON and Mr. SHIELDS preferred a time-scale to a graded system of pay.

75,402. Neither Mr. MAYSTON nor Mr. SHIELDS saw any objection to the pay being the same for Indians and Europeans, provided that a foreign service allowance was given to the latter, and provided that this carried the same privileges as salary in all respects. MR. SHIELDS said the officers were afraid some accounts' officer might discover a flaw afterwards, and reduce the leave pay. Mr. MAYSTON said a foreign service allowance might be sanctioned if this would get over the drawbacks from which Provincial Service officers were said to suffer. Mr. SHIELDS, on the other hand, said he would rather see all officers receiving the same pay, if they had equal qualifications and training, which at present they had not. Perhaps, however, it was not possible to justify paying an indigenous officer the high salary it was necessary to pay a man to attract him from a foreign country. Both witnesses would not object to seeing the term "Provincial Service" abolished.

75,403. Mr. SHIELDS added that there was no friction in the department owing to the division into Imperial and Provincial services, but there was a certain amount of discontent amongst Provincial men. It caused, however, no impediment to the smooth working of the department.

75,404. With regard to the difficulty of obtaining leave, Mr. MAYSTON said it was due chiefly to the shortage of officers. Personally he had not suffered, except on one occasion when he applied for furlough and had to wait a year, which meant a loss of a month's privilege leave. Other officers, however, had suffered a

great deal. Mr. SHIELDS had never had any trouble himself, except that he had not been able to take leave owing to the insufficiency of the pay. He should like to see a system under which an officer would be entitled to commute his furlough. The recommendation of the Decentralisation Commission that an officer should have a sort of leave ledger, and be credited with all the privilege leave earned and be allowed to take it whenever he cared to do so, was a very sound one.

75,405. Mr. SHIELDS said that a pension at the end of twenty years' service was privilege which the officers had now, and would be sorry to give up, although it was rarely used. Men on twenty years' service would ordinarily be forty-one or forty-two years of age. It was very difficult to get pension on a medical certificate. Mr. MAYSTON said that after thirty years' service the pension should be 700*l.*, and should be on a non-contributory basis. Members of the Indian Civil Service drew as much in pension. It was true they contributed towards it, but their pension was 1,000*l.* a year.

75,406. Both witnesses agreed that if an increase in pension for 25 years' service and upwards was allowed, officers of their department would be prepared to give up the right to pension after twenty years' service.

75,407. Mr. MAYSTON said that it was compulsory to contribute to the General Provident Fund, but that did not altogether provide what was required, and therefore the officers desired to commute a portion of their pension in order to have a lump sum on retiring. Mr. SHIELDS said the amount received from the General Provident Fund was very small. The officers looked upon the pension as deferred pay to which they had a right. Several men in the service had died leaving nothing for their families. There should be no restrictions on commutation, which should be unconditional.

75,408. Mr. MAYSTON said that the difficulty in obtaining houses only really occurred in large presidency towns and headquarters of Local Governments. Mr. SHIELDS added that house rents in Calcutta were enormous. In the old days bachelors had a house allowance and a presidency allowance, but they now received nothing at all. No house could be obtained in Calcutta on a short lease. The same consideration applied to Bombay and Rangoon. He had spent about 50 per cent. of his service in Calcutta, but being under the old system he had a house allowance, though an inadequate one, when holding his ordinary appointment. In his present acting appointment he got no house or presidency allowance. Other officers, however, had suffered very badly. The present house allowance rules very unjust and officers were regarded it as a great hardship to have to serve in Calcutta.

75,409. Mr. SHIELDS said the State should bear the actual cost of moving an officer from one place to another.

75,410. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) Mr. SHIELDS thought that Government should commute pensions on more favourable terms than an insurance office. Officers had some claims on the Secretary of State, whereas they had none on an insurance company. Looking at pension as deferred pay there was a claim to be more favourably treated by the Governmnt than by an insurance company, though he did not think more could be claimed than approximately the actuarial value.

75,411. Mr. MAYSTON said that, if Indians were recruited in England, no proportion should be fixed. There were at present in the department only three or four Indians trained at Cooper's Hill. An Indian trained in an engineering college in Great Britain was much above an Indian who had been trained in India Mr. SHIELDS agreed.

Mr. SHIELDS said the reason he was recruited separately was that in 1893 an experiment was made of recruiting two officers through the Secretary of State as temporary Assistant Superintendents under a contract for five years, and afterwards they were appointed to the permanent establishment.

75,412. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Asked whether in view of the fact that the proportion of recruitment in England and India was considered by the Telegraph Committee in 1906, and a resolution was passed by Government in 1910, giving effect to the recommendations, Mr. SHIELDS replied that he could not say anything had occurred since then which called for a reconsideration of the question. Officers did not know what was coming under the proposed amalgamation scheme.

75,413. Mr. MAYSTON said that when the Committee inquired into the matter the traffic and engineering were all one branch, but now the proposal to separate them had come forward, and the written memorandum had reference to telegraph engineers. There were no means of training telegraph engineers in India.

75,414. Mr. SHIELDS considered that training for telegraph work could be obtained just as easily in England by an Indian as by any other man. There was no restriction at all. If there was a difficulty it would stand in the way of recruitment of Indians under the proposals that had been put forward.

75,415. Mr. SHIELDS said no appointment was made direct to the upper subordinate establishment, all appointments being made from the signalling establishment. The men in the latter started as telegraphists, and were gradually promoted, and were given a training at Sibpur College, before being appointed Deputy Superintendents.

75,416. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Mr. SHIELDS was of opinion that men trained in the Indian engineering colleges would benefit more by two years' training in England after they had served some time in the department. They should have a period of probation in India as at present, and that period would enable the superior officers to determine which men were fitted to go to England for training.

75,417. In the signalling establishment Mr. MAYSTON pointed out there were three different grades of Deputy Superintendents and in promotion seniority was taken into consideration, though if a man was not considered good enough he did not obtain promotion. In the higher grades they rose according to merit, seniority of course being considered.

75,418. He did not know why there was a preponderance of Anglo-Indians employed in the Telegraph Department, but the question of communal representation was in the hands of Government, and he was not aware upon what basis they proceeded. Out of 38 Superintendents there were seven Indians, who were either recruited from Cooper's Hill or from Rurki. If from Rurki, they joined the Provincial Service on probation.

75,419. He had had experience of the work of Indians trained at Rurki. He did not think the work of the traffic department could be taught in a college at all, but some of the technical knowledge required for the traffic department could be obtained in an Indian college.

75,420. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Mr. MAYSTON said that if Indians were as good as Europeans, they could be recruited in England, and the committee there would select from Europeans and Indians alike with due regard to the qualifications, certificates and degrees possessed by the men. If it were made obligatory that half the recruitment should be made in England from Indians, there would certainly be a great risk that inferior Indians would be sent when no better ones were available there. It would be better therefore, that Indians should be recruited in India by people who knew them, and then be given a thorough training in England.

75,421. Mr. SHIELDS preferred that it should be left entirely to the Secretary of State to send out the best men, whether Indians or Europeans, but if it was necessary to secure a fixed proportion of Indians they should be selected in India. It would be impossible to get 50 per cent. of suitable Indians in England.

75,422. Mr. SHIELDS considered that if the exile allowance was given to Europeans, it should also be given

to an Indian holding one of the upper appointments in the service, because those appointments were made by strict selection. That is to say, the pay for Superintending Engineers and officers of higher rank should be a fixed pay to be drawn by European or Indian alike.

75,423. If the Secretary of State agreed to commutation of pension, Mr. Shields said he would not object to a rule being made that Government should insist on every man in the service giving evidence that he had insured his wife against being left penniless, but for that purpose the pay of the officers should be increased. The officers would welcome a general Pension fund on the same lines as the Indian Civil Service for all the services outside the Civil Service, on a real acturial basis, to which all members should be obliged to contribute in order to provide for their widows and children but the pay would have to be raised to enable them to subscribe, as no one c ould save anything on the present rates of pay. The provident fund was quite insufficient for the purpose, and was being continually drawn upon for sickness, sending children to England, &c.

75,424. In the Upper Subordinate Branch of the Telegraph Service the promoted men came direct from the signalling establishment. The idea was to promote them by selection before they became too old.

75,425. (*Mr. Coode.*) Mr. Shields said he had seen the proposed amalgamation scheme confidentially, and a number of telegraph officers were consulted, but he did not know whether their recommendations were followed. The Department as a whole had had no opportunity of objecting to the separation. It seemed to him that the proposal to make over the control of traffic to the Postmasters-General was not likely to lead to increased efficiency, as these officers had no experience of telegraphic traffic. The pay of Rs. 2,750 for the Chief Telegraphic Officer was not a sufficient compensation for his loss of dignity. Only one telegraph officer had been tried as Postmaster-General so far, and he had been an unqualified success. If more officer were given a chance they would make good Postmasters-General.

75,426. It was considered to be a hardship that men with a temporary service of five years were not allowed to count that time in their seniority. In his own case, compared with the most junior Cooper's Hill man recruited in the same year, he had lost about Rs. 22,000 or 15 per cent of the total amount he had earned in pay since he came out, and he had been exceptionally fortunate in holding acting appointments.

75,427. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) When recruited as a temporary engineer no promise was made that after five years he would get permanent employment. But the Director-General of Telegraphs, when the incremental scheme was introduced, recommended that four out of the five years should be allowed to count towards incremental pay, quoting the case of certain temporary engineers who came out on short covenants with His Majesty's Secretary of State and were afterwards brought on to the permanent establishment of the Public Works Department and allowed to count their temporary service, less one year, in regulating their increments on the time scale of pay. The recommendation of the Director-General was disallowed by the Government of India. There had been, however, no breach of any promise made to him.

The witnesses withdrew.

G. P. Roy, Esq., M.I.E.E., Officiating Director of Telegraphs, Eastern Bengal and Assam Circle.

Written Statement relating to the Indian Telegraph Department.

75,428. The Imperial Service Officers of the Telegraph Department have already submitted a Joint Written Statement. The time allowed for the preparation of the Statement was too short. Further, they were not afforded sufficient facilities for a Conference for the consideration of the representation to the Royal Commission on Public Services in India. It is therefore considered necessary to submit a supplementary Statement.

75,429. **(I.) Method of Recruitment.**—In the corporate written statement reference has been made to the Proposed Amalgamation of the Department with the Post Office, and suggestion has been made only for the recruitment of the Engineering Branch of the Department, as the Amalgamation Scheme provides for the recruitment of Traffic Officers in India. No public pronouncement has been made of the details of the Amalgamation Scheme, but if it is finally decided to separate the Engineering from the Traffic, it is doubtful if this separation would lead to efficiency. The Traffic and the Engineering Branches of a Technical Department like the Indian Telegraphs, are so closely related, and inter-dependent on each other, that the separation of the two branches is undesirable. The Traffic Management is a profession demanding professional knowledge and scientific training, and Telegraph Engineering plays a very important part in the management of Traffic. Engineering Training cannot therefore be wholly divorced from the sphere of Traffic Management. It is therefore suggested that 75 per cent. of the Engineering and the Traffic Staff should be recruited from England, 12½ per cent. from qualified Subordinates, and 12½ per cent. from Indian Engineering Colleges. The qualifications and training of officers recruited from England, whether for the Engineering or for the Traffic Branch should be exactly the same, and specialisation of their duties should begin after they had gained some experience in the Department. All candidates should be nominated by the Secretary of State for India in Council, and after nomination they should pass a competitive examination. The establishment of a Central College for officers of all the Indian Services is considered very necessary, and it is suggested that all recruits for the Indian Telegraph Department should go through a course of practical training in the Central College referred to above.

75,430. **(II.) System of Training and Probation.**—The training of young officers is of vital importance to the Department, and the present system of training is not considered satisfactory. All first entrants should go through a regular course in Traffic, Technical and Engineering subjects. They should be attached to the Presidency Telegraph Offices, and should be made to undertake the duties of Operators, Supervisors and Technical Officers. On completion of this course, they should go through a higher practical training in electrical matters in the office of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, and then shonld be sent out on construction under competent officers. On completion of 12 months' training in the manner indicated above, they should be placed in charge of Sub-divisions, the re-introduction of which is a very important factor in the training of the Junior Officers, and in the efficient organisation of the Department. The abolition of the Sub-divisions has considerably handicapped the training of young officers. They have no longer the small units of charge to develop the habit of self-reliance, so indispensably necessary for their training. They are at present merely attached to the Divisional offices, with no very definite responsibilities or powers.

Young officers should be given an opportunity as far as far as possible of being trained in administrative work. There is at present no scope for such training. The number of Junior Officers attached to the Headquarters Office was three, but this number has recently been reduced to two by the replacement of a Telegraph Officer by a Secretariat Superintendent who has no practical Telegraph experience. The loss of this appointment is viewed by the Telegraph officers with some apprehension.

The maintenance of a very high standard of efficiency is absolutely necessary for an ever expanding Scientific Department like the Indian Telegraphs, and in order to accomplish this, every officer should be encouraged to keep himself thoroughly up to date in his professional subjects—General Engineering, Technical and Traffic, by liberal grant of study leave or leave on deputation with adequate allowance in Europe and America. The daily allowance at present granted during the period of study leave is 6*s.* a day, which is considered entirely inadequate to meet an officer's expenses. It is therefore suggested that it should be raised to 1*l.* a day, which is the ordinary daily subsistence allowance granted to officers of corresponding rank in England.

75,431. **(III.) Condition of Service.**—The conditions of the Service have been considerably altered. The Department was all along a part and parcel of the Engineering Establishment of the Public Works Department. In 1905, on the formation of the Department of Commerce and Industry, the Telegraph Department was separated from the Public Works Department and placed under the newly-created Department of Commerce and Industry. In 1908, a Traffic Officer of the British Telegraph Service was brought out to India to remodel the Traffic Branch of the Department, and in 1910 the Department was reorganised by the introduction of the Circle Scheme, and the abolition of Sub-divisions, which resulted in the decentralisation of the Upper half and the centralisation of the Lower half of the Service. In July, 1912, the experimental amalgamation was commenced. No other Department under the Government of India has gone through so many changes within so short a time as the Indian Telegraphs, and these continuous changes in the administration of the Department have caused a considerable amount of anxiety and apprehension amongst the officers of the Department. The Amalgamation Scheme under consideration of the Government of India is still in its confidential stage, and no definite pronouncement, either official or public, on the subject of prospects of the officers of the Department has been made. The officers are therefore not in a position to know how the amalgamation would affect their prospects, and they therefore make no further reference to the scheme under consideration. But they view the loss of the appointment of the Director-General of Telegraphs with great apprehension. The Imperial Officers were recruited and appointed to the Department on the direct understanding that they could aspire to the highest post in the Department. The loss of the appointment referred to above has caused loss of promotion in the lower grades affecting the pensions of some of the officers concerned. In paragraph 5 of the Resolution of the Government of India, Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 830–833, dated the 24th of January, 1913, an extract of which is reproduced,* the officers were distinctly given to understand that all possible protection would be afforded to the personal interests and prospects of the officers of the Department, and they view the non-fulfilment of the promise in the above Resolution with considerable disappointment. The officers of the Department therefore desire that further definite assurance may be given to them protecting their prospects and personal interests, both during the experimental stage of the Amalgamation Scheme, and after its introduction.

The Head of the Post Office has always been a member of the Indian Civil Service. The conditions of the new Service "Post and Telegraphs" will be considerably altered after the Amalgamation of the two Departments—one purely Non-technical and the other Scientific. In view of the sources from which the Telegraph Department draws the greater part of its members, the Telegraph Officers should be eligible, in future, for the appointment of the Director-General of the Amalgamated Department. Technical training and professional experience are indeed very important factors in the administration of a Scientific Service like the Indian Telegraph Department, which has to keep pace with the modern and progressive Telegraph Administrations in Europe and America. The Telegraph Officers by reason of their technical training and professional attainments must play a very important part in the future development and the Administration of the Combined Department. It is therefore suggested that every opportunity should be afforded to the Telegraph Officers to gain experience in the administration of the Post Office. They further desire a definite assurance that they should be eligible for the appointment of the Director-General.

75,432. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—The Indian Telegraph Department is so peculiarly constituted that it cannot be compared with any other service in India. The Service is an Imperial one, and the establishment being limited, the officers are liable to frequent, and very long transfers, often at a very short notice. The frequency and the length of the transfers are very much greater than in any other service. The enhanced travelling allowance suggested in the Joint Memorandum will only defray the cost of transfers, but it does not make any provision for the loss entailed in breaking up homes and setting up new ones. The nature of the duties of the Telegraph Officers is such that in addition to an absence on tour from the Head Quarters of a minimum period of 150 days during the year, they are liable to be sent out on the line at a moment's notice, in all kinds of weather. This necessitates the maintenance of Camp Establishment all through the year involving additional expenditure which is not covered by the travelling allowances.

In 1910 the salaries of the officers were very much improved, but there is still room for further improvement in this direction, on account of the special circumstances referred to above. The increased cost of living both in England and in India, the depreciation in the purchasing power of a sovereign, and the increased cost of education for children, justify further increase in the scale of salaries sanctioned for the officers of the Telegraph Department. The pay of the Executive Branch of the Service should, in the opinion of the officers, be raised to Rs. 1,500 by annual increment of Rs. 75 instead of Rs. 50 after ninth year of service, and the commencing salary of the Administrative Grade should be raised from Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 1,750. The salaries of the higher Administrative Grades should also be proportionately increased. The present and the proposed salaries are shown in the statement below :—

	Present.	Proposed.
	Rs.	Rs.
1st year	380	
2nd year	420	
3rd year	460	
4th year	500	
5th year	540	Same as at present.
6th year	580	
7th year	620	
8th year	660	
9th year	700	
10th year	750	775
11th year	800	850
12th year	850	925
13th year	900	1,000
14th year	950	1,075
15th year	1,000	1,150
16th year	1,050	1,225
17th year	1,100	1,300
18th year	1,150	1,375
19th year	1,200	1,425
20th year	1,250	1,500

* "The Government of India earnestly desire that in such steps as may be taken towards the amalgamation of the two Services, all possible protection should be afforded to the personal interests and prospects of the existing staff of both Departments in all grades."

Administrative Grades.

Present.	Proposed.
1,500	1,750
1,750	2,000
2,000	2,250
2,250	2,500
3,000	3,000

75,433. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—The conditions of leave have been fully explained in the Joint Memorandum already submitted. The only additional point which requires consideration is the grant of furlough combined with privilege leave, the study leave for one month to junior officers of four years' service. Under the existing conditions no furlough is admissible until an officer has served eight years. This period of absence from England is considered too long to enable the junior officers to be sufficiently in touch with the latest Scientific developments of their profession.

75,434. **(VI.) Conditions of Pensions.**—No suggestion has been made in the Joint Memorandum for the increase of the Invalid Pensions which the officers desire should be provided for. They prefer the following scale of pensions to that put forward in the Joint Memorandum:—

Length of Service.	Scale of Pension. (Proportion of Average emoluments.)	Maximum per Annum.	With Medical Certificate or Voluntary.
Years.		£ s. d.	
10	$\frac{20}{60}$th	218 15 0	With Medical Certificate.
11	$\frac{21}{60}$th	240 12 6	,,
12	$\frac{22}{60}$th	262 10 0	,,
13	$\frac{23}{60}$th	284 7 6	,,
14	$\frac{24}{60}$th	306 5 0	,,
15	$\frac{25}{60}$th	328 2 6	,,
16	$\frac{26}{60}$th	350 0 0	,,
17	$\frac{27}{60}$th	371 17 6	,,
18	$\frac{28}{60}$th	393 15 0	,,
19	$\frac{29}{60}$th	415 12 6	,,
20		437 10 0	Voluntary.
21		459 7 6	,,
22		481 5 0	,,
23		503 2 6	,,
24		525 0 0	,,
25	$\frac{30}{60}$th	546 17 6	,,
26		568 15 0	,,
27		590 12 6	,,
28		612 10 0	,,
29		634 7 6	,,
30		656 5 0	,,

75,435. **(VII.) Such limitation as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing system of divisions of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—This has already been dealt with in the Joint Memorandum, but it is considered that a Provincial Officer may be promoted to the Imperial Service under the following conditions:—

(1) That he has less than 10 years' service.

(2) That he has an excellent record.

(3) That he gone through a course of professional training in England for not less than 12 months.

A suitable candidate for transfer from the Provincial to the Imperial Service should be selected by the Head of the Department and every facility should be afforded to him for his training in England.

75,436. **(VIII.) Relations of the Service with the Indian Civil Service and other Services.**—No further remarks are considered necessary.

75,437. **(IX.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding head.**—The following additional points deserve consideration under this head:—

(1) Medical attendance on the families of officers.

(2) The rate of interest paid on the deposit in the Provident Fund.

As regards medical attendance, it is considered that the fees to be charged by Government Medical Officers for attendance on the members of an officer's family should be fixed. The usual fee charged by a Medical Officer ranges from Rs. 10 to Rs. 16, which is considered out of all proportion to the officer's emoluments. The following scale is recommended:—

Officer's salary.	Medical fees per visit.
Rs.	Rs.
250 and under	2
251 to 500	3
501 to 750	4
751 to 1,000	5
1,001 to 1,250	6
1,251 to 1,500	7
1,501 to 1,750	8
1,751 to 2,000	9
2,001 to 2,250	10
2,251 to 2,500	11
2,501 to 3,000	15

It is considered that the Provident Fund which at present represents the only provision an officer can make for his family or to supplement his pension, should be materially improved by allowing a higher rate of interest The present rate of interest is only 4 per cent. which is considered too low for India where business enterprise seldom considers a rate of less than 8 per cent. sufficiently remunerative. The rate of interest may therefore be raised to 6 per cent.

Mr. G. P. Roy called and examined.

75,438. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness joined the Indian Telegraph Department in 1904 from the Royal Engineering College, Cooper's Hill, as an Assistant Superintendent. He was first attached to the telegraph workshops and the electricians' office, and then to a Central Telegraph Office for training in traffic. He was placed in charge of a subdivision and worked as a Subdivisional Officer for nearly nine years, and held charge of many important subdivisions in different parts of India. He was personally responsible for the maintenance of telegraphic communication, the disposal of traffic and the execution of constructional and re-constructional works. He was a Superintendent for nearly nine years and Traffic Manager for 10 months. In 1905, when in charge of the Arrakan Division, he laid two cables joining the main land with Ramree Island, the longest cables laid by the department without the assistance of a cable ship. In 1907 he went through a course of traffic training in the United Kingdom and on the Continent at his own expense. In 1908 he was selected for the post of Traffic Superintendent. In April 1910 he was placed in charge of the Central Telegraph Office of Madras. In 1911 he studied the traffic system in London, Edinburgh, Manchester, and Birmingham, and before returning to India submitted a report on the British telegraph traffic system with recommendations for the improvement of the service in India. In 1911 he was posted in charge of the Rangoon Division and carried out the work of reorganisation of the Telegraph Department there. In June 1912 he was transferred from Rangoon to Nagpur and appointed Traffic Manager of the Central Circle under the Postmaster-General. In May 1912 he acted as Officiating Director of the Madras Circle, and two months later was transferred to the post he now held.

75,439. He was one of the signatories of the corporate memorandum put in by the officers of the department, and had also put in a statement giving his own personal views. The corporate memorandum

had been framed on the replies to a circular sent round to all the officers. There had, however, been no proper opportunity to discuss this memorandum as it was drawn up and sent in a hurry.

75,440. The reference in his written statement to the non-fulfilment of the promise contained in the resolution of the Government of India of the 24th January 1912 was based on the fact that the department had lost the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs, which they were given to understand from the beginning was one to which they could aspire. That amounted practically to a loss of 1,400*l.* a year. At the time the corporate memorandum was put in there had not been sufficient time to calculate the whole thing out. The additional posts in the higher grades did not afford any adequate compensation. The total number of Director's appointments under the amalgamation scheme was reduced from ten to five.

75,441. Three-fourths of the telegraph engineering staff should be recruited in England and one-fourth in India, instead of half and half, because there had not been sufficient development in electrical science in India, and it was necessary to protect the department against inefficiency. For some years to come it would be necessary to obtain 75 per cent. from England, but as electrical undertakings developed in India that percentage could be reduced. His opinion would not be modified if young engineering graduates were sent from India to England for two years' training.

75,442. His suggestion to promote, under certain conditions, a provincial officer to the Imperial Service, was only with regard to pay.

75,443. The higher pay given to the English recruited branch of the service was intended to compensate them, not only for serving in a foreign country, but for possessing higher qualifications.

75,444. He suggested that the Indian recruited in England should receive the same pay as an Englishman. At the same time, looking at the matter from the point of view of the Indian tax-payer, it was difficult to justify the payment of a foreign service allowance to Indians without European training working in their own country.

75,445. Recruitment should be by open competition from amongst nominated candidates. There should be a personal interview with the candidates, and when selection had been made an examination should be held. If the number of men who came up were not sufficient to fill the vacancies, they would probably have to be taken without a competitive examination.

75,446. Study leave should be given liberally, and should be spent in Europe or America. There were no facilities for acquiring high technical training in India. Men taking study leave should send in a report based on their study, and produce a certificate from the institution to which they had been attached.

75,447. The reason why the salaries asked for in his written statement were higher than in the original corporate memorandum which he had also signed, was because, when the latter was submitted, there had been no time to consider all the points. It might be true that a notification was published in the Gazette in February 1913, in which the officers of the Telegraph Department had been informed of the inquiry and of the points on which they would be questioned, but they had not taken action on this, or really considered their position until much later. This was also the reason why a larger demand for pensions was now being made as well.

75,448. After 20 years' service an officer's age should be about 42, and that was a fair age for a man to retire on a pension of 437*l.* The age-limit for retirement was 55, but an officer should certainly have the option of retiring after 20 years. At present the retiring pension was inadequate, as the cost of living both in India and in England had gone up considerably. It had been officially stated that the purchasing power of a sovereign was now only 16*s.* 3*d.*, and that affected the officer retiring to England, and the deterioration of the rupee affected the officer retiring to India. The hope held out in the Government of India's despatch No. 43, Public Works Department, dated 28th March 1870, had not been realised. In 1871 the Under Secretary of State for India, speaking on the subject of Cooper's Hill College, and the engineering service, claimed in the House of Commons that the Government had created a new profession on the level of the great Indian services, civil and military, and it was intimated that a grant of enhanced pension to the Imperial officers of the Telegraph Department was under contemplation.

75,449. The fees charged by Civil Surgeons for medical attendance on the families of officers were now too high. It would be cheaper to go to outside practitioners, but official etiquette required that the Civil Surgeon should be the only medical man consulted. The Government ought to be responsible not only for medicala ttendance on the officers but on their families as well.

75,450. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Personally he did not think the amalgamation was likely to increase the efficiency of the department, but the Government, of course, was not bound to consult the officers of the department. All that the officers desired was that the interests of the service should be well protected.

75,451. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) In India he had only had a preliminary education, and had then joined the University College School in England before going on to Cooper's Hill. He had seen none of the engineering colleges in India. His view that there was no sufficient development of electrical science in India to give the requisite training was based on his experience in practical work. An Englishman trained in England would turn out better work than an Indian trained in India, but Indians who had taken their education and training in England might be treated as Europeans. He had had experience of one gentleman, who had taken his education in British institutions outside Cooper's Hill, and he was an excellent officer.

75,452. Imported labour had always to be paid more than local labour in the ordinary business of life. He did not think there was much discontent in the service owing to the difference in pay, and he did not think it was likely to cause any discontent in the future.

75,453. Before sending in his personal statement, he had had discussions with several officers, and believed that his requests were regarded by many as reasonable.

75,454. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Efficiency was very important. It was also important that there should be colleges in India fitted to turn out men to discharge the work of the telegraph and other scientific departments. It was, therefore, necessary to encourage Indian colleges, and a beginning might be made by recruiting some appointments in India.

75,455. No doubt the Telegraph Committee took all the facts they had before them into consideration, but the Royal Commission could afford to take the responsibility of revising some of its recommendations.

75,456. That there were very few Indian Deputy Superintendents was explained by the fact that the service was not attractive to Indians. The number of Indian telegraphists was very small in proportion to the Anglo-Indian telegraphists. That was entirely due to the dislike on the part of Indians to the service, owing to the conditions being so severe. There were night duties, and officers had to go away at a moment's notice, and there was considerable hardship in the life.

75,457. There was a difficulty in securing Indians for the signalling establishment. There were two services, one local and one general, and an Indian recruited in Bengal would object to be transferred to Madras or Burma. There was a rule at present that a certain percentage of Indians should be in the signalling establishment, but he did not know what that percentage was. There was no such rule with regard to the upper subordinates. Sometimes great

difficulty was found in filling up the vacancies reserved for Indians.

75,458. It was the opinion of the majority of members of the service that the Telegraph Department would suffer from the proposed amalgamation. The Traffic Department also required engineering knowledge. In Europe the telegraph administration was divided into two branches, engineering and traffic, but the conditions prevailing in India prevented the European system of working being adopted in its entirety. In Europe the post office and telegraphs had been worked together from the beginning, whereas in India the two branches had grown up separately, and they were now two huge departments, quite different in character and constitution. In the British service the traffic officer, as a rule, rose from the rank of telegraphist, and went through several courses of technical training in electrical engineering, in polytechnics and similar institutions, and it was recognised that such a knowledge of engineering was indispensable for traffic officers. Facilities for such training were not available in India. In order to keep pace with the latest system of traffic management, it was necessary that a Traffic officer should be in touch with the latest European system of working.

75,459. Under the amalgamation scheme, the Telegraph Department would lose the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs, and that disqualified officers from earning the higher pensions. The amalgamation also caused some loss of emoluments in connection with appointments of Postmaster-General. When the experimental amalgamation in Bombay was introduced, a telegraph officer was appointed as Postmaster-General on deputation, and when that officer proceeded on leave shortly it was understood he would be relieved by an officer of the Indian Civil Service. It did not appear clear why the appointment should not be given to a telegraph officer.

75,460. As an example of the hardship arising from frequent transfers, the witness mentioned that during his service of nineteen years he had had no less than 22 transfers. The total mileage travelled alone was 16,913, or an average of 890 miles a year transfer travelling. He did not consider his transfers were unusually frequent, though they might have been slightly above the average. An officer should be recouped the whole of his expenses of transfer, and some compensation should be given him for breaking up one home and setting up another.

75,461. (*Mr. Coode.*) The details of the amalgamation scheme had not been communicated to him officially, but he had had an opportunity of seeing them confidentially.

75,462. In the Telegraph Department there were only two officers who had had experience of European traffic management.

75,463. The amalgamation scheme would bring about a reduction in the strength of officers, which would affect the service. Such a reduction was a mistake, and would hamper the growth of the service. The present strength of officers recruited in England and in India was 84, whilst the sanctioned strength was 96. The deficiency was 12½ per cent. and was already felt. Any reduction in the engineering establishment would certainly not improve the efficiency of the service. With the development of the country the Telegraph Department was bound to extend. If the traffic increased, as it had done in the last three years, the department would be confronted with a serious problem; it would not be in a position to meet the requirements of the public, especially as temporary engineers were not avilable in India. There had been a considerable loss of efficiency in the department during the last few years owing to the abolition of subdivisions. The present unit of a charge was a division and was much too large.

75,464. During the first three months of the experimental amalgamation in the Central Circle he was called upon to report on the experiment, and reported favourably, but at the time of reporting he was not aware of the ultimate *modus operandi* of the traffic branch, which he was under the impression would be entrusted to engineers with traffic knowledge. In submitting the Administration Report he emphasised the fact that traffic management was a profession and required technical knowledge and engineering training. The results obtained by engineering officers in the management of traffic could hardly be regarded as an assurance of the future success of the management of traffic by non-technical officers.

The witness withdrew.

J. W. Thurley, Esq., Deputy Superintendent of Telegraphs (Traffic).

Written Statement relating to the Telegraph Department.

75,465. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—Deputy Superintendents are recruited in three different ways, as there are three different classes of Deputy Superintendents, viz., Traffic, General, and Technical.

Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, are recruited from Telegraph Masters who have proved themselves thoroughly capable of dealing with Traffic matters. In this connection it is necessary to mention that before a Telegraphist is promoted to a Telegraph Master, the Telegraphist has to pass a Technical Examination and even then wait his turn for promotion, perhaps for years, while the Telegraphist who secures only a "pass" certificate (*i.e.*, obtaining 65 per cent. of marks) is liable to appear again for this Technical Examination before he is considered eligible for promotion if three years have elapsed between the date of his first examination and date of officiating as a Telegraph Master. It requires a Telegraphist to have about 20 years' service before he is promoted to a Telegraph Master, and perhaps another ten years before promoted to a Deputy Superintendent.

Deputy Superintendents, General, are, however, recruited from Telegraphists between the ages of 25 and 30 years old who have held the appointments of Inspecting Telegraphists or Inspecting Telegraph Masters. A Telegraphist can become a Deputy Superintendent, General, before his 15th year of service.

Deputy Superintendents, Technical, are recruited from Technical Telegraph Masters who had been elected to work in the Technical Branch having gone through a course of instruction in the Electrician's office.

For the purposes of recruitment the subordinate staff is divided into three branches—General, Traffic and Technical. Within the first five years of service or a little later a small proportion of the Telegraphists establishment finds admission into the General and the Technical Branches and the bulk remains in the Traffic.

The number of appointments of higher rank in the Traffic Branch in proportion to the lower is surprisingly small, as will be seen from the statement below:—

——	Deputy Superintendents.	Telegraph Masters—Telegraphists.
	1st. 2nd. Total.	
General -	24 + 48 = 72	78 There is no line between a Telegraphist and a Telegraph Master in this branch.
Technical	3 + 3 = 6	34
Traffic -	24 + 32 = 56	260 + 2,500.

The result is as may be expected stagnation.

For promotion to the grade of Telegraph Masters the conditions vary considerably in the three branches.

In the Technical Branch there is no bar between a Telegraph Master and a Telegraphist, and the latter goes on drawing a Telegraph Master's pay in due course of his service as a mere matter of routine.

In the General Branch such promotions are made on the recommendation of the Director of a Circle.

From what has been said above it will be seen the three branches, Traffic, General and Technical, are separated and the men in each branch trained on separate lines. This is not at all considered satisfactory as experience has shown each branch is interdependent on the others. An officer should be so trained as to be capable of performing the duties of all these branches,

To meet this the following suggestions are put forward for consideration:—

(1) Careful selection of Telegraphists of and over ten years' service and showing special intelligence and abilities in the performance of their duties as Telegraphists should be made and these Telegraphists put through a thorough examination in ordinary Traffic and Technical matters.

(2) Those securing 75 per cent. and over of marks should then be put through a course of a year's higher training in the Electrician's yard where they should be again examined at the end of this course.

(3) Successful candidates securing 75 per cent. or more marks should be put through a year's Construction training, and examined at the end of this period in all matters relating to the Engineering branch.

(4) Those who secure 65 per cent. or over of marks should be put through a year's training in higher Traffic matters and attached to large offices.

It will be seen that men who successfully pass these tests during a period of three years have really become thoroughly trained officers capable of efficiently conducting work in any of the three branches. The best of these successful candidates should be promoted to *Deputy Superintendent, second grade, as vacancies occur.*

They may elect to work in the Traffic, General, or Technical branches, subject to transfer to any other branch than their choice as found necessary by the Department. As vacancies occur in the 1st grade the most suitable man or men should be selected on probation for one year during which period his or their work should be very closely watched. As selections will necessarily be made from different circles it is proposed to send six of the Senior Deputy Superintendents so selected to the Presidency Offices (two each to Bombay, Calcutta, and Madras Offices) if required in the Traffic Branch, or to a large Division if required for the Engineering work and their work closely scrutinised.

Selected Deputy Superintendents should work in other Offices or Divisions than those in which they may be working at time of selection. The best men of these six should be then promoted to Deputy Superintendent, I, to fill existing vacancies.

This procedure if given effect to will bring the best men to the top.

75,466. **(II.) Method of training and probation.**—The system of training Deputy Superintendents varies according to the Branch the recruit is required to join.

In the Traffic Branch the selected Telegraph Master is placed in one of the Presidency Offices to acquire a thorough knowledge in Traffic matters. He has to study the nature and volume of traffic dealt with by that office, the means of forming up auxiliary outlets in the event of trouble on the normal routes, the arrangement of staff to deal evenly with the flow of traffic, &c., throughout the day and, in short, how to manage rapid disposal of traffic to and from all directions so far as his office is concerned.

When favourably reported on, his name is registered as eligible for promotion to Deputy Superintendent, Traffic. On a vacancy occurring he is placed on a year's probation generally in a large office.

In the General Branch the selected Telegraphists of 10 to 12 years' service are first attached to Divisions where they are employed in inspecting Railway and Combined Offices and other routine in the Engineering Branch.

At the end of 12 months they are put through a Departmental Examination in Engineering matters and successful candidates enter the Sibpur College for a 4½ months' course in higher mathematics, surveying, etc. On passing this examination they are straightway promoted to Deputy Superintendent II, General.

Deputy Superintendent, Technical, have no special training beyond that already gone through as Telegraph Masters, Technical.

The above shows the three Branches have been separated and work on separate lines. The remarks on this point under recruitment apply here.

75,467. **(III.) Conditions of Service.**—These may be reviewed under the following heads:—

(*a*) Nature of Service,
(*b*) Promotions, and
(*c*) Transfers.

(*a*) *Nature of Service.*—The nature of service rendered varies according to the Branch the Deputy Superintendent belongs to.

Traffic and Technical Deputy Superintendents work in Traffic Offices, the former are responsible for efficient handling of all Traffic matters while the latter attend to condition of lines, batteries, and all electrical apparatus.

(*b*) *Promotions.*—Promotion amongst the Upper Subordinates is very slow owing to the small number of appointments open to this grade.

In Government Resolution No. 913—918–115, dated 2nd February 1910, Department of Commerce and Industry, paragraph 20, sanction was accorded to the promotion of Deputy Superintendents to the Superior Branch of the Service to the extent of ⅛ of the appointments in that branch, *i.e.*, ⅛ of 84. This arrangement, if given effect to, would result in the promotion of a subordinate once in every two years on the average. The excess then in Superior Service has long been absorbed, yet no subordinate has been promoted to the Superior Service. There is a shortage of officers in the Superior Service, and yet no Upper Subordinate has been promoted to fill the vacancies up to the extent sanctioned in the Government resolution quoted.

It cannot be said with any degree of justice that men in the present subordinate ranks are not fully qualified to fill these vacancies in the Superior Service, while non-compliance with the ruling of Government is keenly felt by the Upper Subordinates.

Looking at the sister Service, the Postal Branch, it will be seen men have risen to much higher positions than it is possible for Telegraph subordinates to attain.

While giving these men all honour for their zeal and abilities it cannot be said they are in any way superior in intelligence to all the members of the subordinate rank of the Telegraph Service.

The Telegraph Department has lost its attraction for smart young men in India as the initial salary and general prospects are decidedly poor for the higher degree of proficiency required of them.

(*c*) *Transfers.*—Frequent transfers of members of the staff cause considerable pecuniary loss and inconvenience; while it is recognised that transfers must necessarily occur, these should be reduced to a minimum by each Circle maintaining the maximum number of men with a liberal percentage of reserves and thus avoid frequent temporary transfers.

Travelling allowances as controlled by the Civil Service Regulations are altogether inadequate, especially where a man transferred has a large family.

Since an official is transferred for the convenience of the Department, it is only reasonable to ask that the man concerned suffers no great loss in travelling.

Deputy Superintendents should be given the same concession as officers of the Provincial Service when travelling on duty or transfer. It is obvious if he

has to maintain the dignity of his office and command that respect so essential to control, he must be placed on a higher footing than his subordinates in this respect. At present a Sub-Inspector of the Telegraph Department is given a second-class pass for travelling purposes, thereby bringing him on the same footing as a Deputy Superintendent of the Department. Again, a man transferred to a station under 200 miles from his original station is restricted to only a double second class fare irrespective of the number of members in his family, and luggage he is bound to take with him. It does not appear reasonable that when the distance is under 200 miles the officer should serve public interest at his own cost.

75,468. **(IV.) Conditions of Salary.**—It is not known whether the pay of the Upper Subordinates is to be increased on the amalgamation scheme coming into force, but it is generally felt that the initial and maximum pays of officers of this branch are inadequate in consideration of the arduous duties performed by them and the great responsibilities they bear.

House rent allowances granted by Government are altogether inadequate to enable any member to secure decent house accommodation anywhere. This question has never received the serious consideration it deserves, nor has the basis on which this allowance is given been sufficiently examined. In the Presidency Towns particularly house rent is steadily increasing every year.

Many men are paying three to four times the allowance granted them for house accommodation. It is not expected that Government will pay full house rent to members of this Department, but afford reasonable relief in this direction, say to Rs. 50 per mensem. Postmasters in Calcutta receive from Rs. 50 to Rs. 100 per mensem as Presidency and House Allowance.

Deputy Superintendents of the General Branch attached to the Presidency Offices (Bombay, Calcutta, Madras) receive house allowance, while others of the same branch elsewhere receive none. Deputy Superintendents of the Traffic and Technical Branches where not provided with free quarters also receive house allowances.

As the position of all Deputy Superintendents is identical this distinction constitutes a grievance and ought to be removed. All Deputy Superintendents should be given house allowance where free quarters are not available.

Presidency Allowance.—Under existing rules Deputy Superintendents in the Technical and General Branches of the Telegraph Department are entitled to grant of Presidency Allowance in Calcutta and Bombay, but it is denied to Deputy Superintendents of the Traffic Branch and no reason is given for such denial. Presidency allowance is a local allowance as defined in Civil Service Regulations, 32 (*a*) given in consideration of exceptional local circumstances, such as the unhealthiness or expensiveness of the locality or duty or the specially arduous nature of the work. It cannot be said that the pay of the Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, has been fixed with special reference to their residence in Presidency Towns, and as a matter of fact a Traffic Deputy Superintendent draws the same pay whether employed at any station in the cheapest Presidency of Madras or at any other muffasil station or at Calcutta and Bombay. The nature of duties Deputy Superintendents have to perform in Presidency Signal Offices is of a specially arduous nature, and it is only fair that when employed in such offices they should get the Presidency allowance whether on consideration of the expensiveness of the locality or of the specially arduous nature of their duties.

The pay of Deputy Superintendents in all the three branches is equal and as there is no headquarters station in the muffasil for a Technical Deputy Superintendent it can be said that their pay was fixed in reference to residence in a Presidency Town but they get the allowance and Deputy Superintendents of the Traffic Branch are denied it, which is scarcely reasonable.

75,469. **(V.) Conditions of Leave.**—The restriction in Civil Service Regulations, 260, requiring an interval of six months to elapse between two periods of absence on privilege leave should be removed.

Privilege leave is kept in reserve to be enjoyed during sickness, but as often as not it happens that an officer falls sick within six months of return from one period of privilege leave and has to be placed on half pay, or if he has exceeded half pay limit on quarter pay even though he had privilege leave due and such dues are thereby forfeited.

The restriction in Civil Service Regulation, 233 (IV.), which requires that when privilege leave is combined with leave of any kind the combined leave must be for not less than six months should also be removed.

It may happen that an officer requires leave for a short period over the amount of privilege leave due at the time to recoup his health. Say an officer has two months and 20 days' privilege leave at a certain time and he falls sick, he requires 3½ months to get cured. If he takes 3½ months leave the whole period is counted on half pay and the privilege leave due is forfeited. In some cases an officer takes six months' leave in such circumstances simply to get advantage of the combined leave. This is not fair to the Department either as it loses the services of the man for the period in excess of 3½ months. Privilege leave is dearly earned and its forfeiture under the above restriction is most unfortunate.

It is only fair to expect that special conditions of service as in the Telegraph Department should ensure special privileges in respect of conditions regarding grant of leave and it is observed that Government recognise this as the condition regarding six months intervals does not apply to officers of the State Railway Revenue Establishment nor to Gazetted Officers of the Opium Department, *vide* note to Civil Service Regulations, 260.

75,470. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—For reasons set forth above the time at present allowed to count as service in respect of periods spent on leave with allowances in Civil Service Regulations, 408, should be increased.

The present and proposed periods are shown below:—

If the total service of an officer is not less than	Period to Count.	
	Present.	Proposed.
15 years - - - -	1 year	1 year
20 do. - - - -	do.	do.
25 do. - - - -	do.	2 years
30 do. - - - -	2 years	do.

MR J. W. THURLEY called and examined.

75,471. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness was transferred from the general to the traffic branch in 1902, and held the position of Deputy Superintendent in the traffic branch since that date. He was an ordinary telegraphist for about eight years, and they entered the technical branch, and was selected for Sub-Assistant Superintendent before being transferred to the traffic department. Before becoming Deputy Superintendent he himself had had 12 years' service, but at present in the general department a man became a Deputy Superintendent after about 15 years' service, and in the traffic department about 30 years.

75,472. All Deputy Superintendents were recruited from the ranks, there being no direct recruitment of any kind. All the larger telegraph offices were in

charge of Deputy Superintendents, except the three Presidency offices, which were under Superintendents. So far as work and responsibility went, the Deputy Superintendent corresponded with the gazetted Postmaster in the Postal Service, but not in the matter of pay and status. The difference in the duties of a Deputy Superintendent and a Telegraph Master was one of degree. The Telegraph Master had a small section of an office to manage, while the Deputy Superintendent was in charge of the whole office.

75,473. It was necessary that a Deputy Superintendent of Traffic should rise up through the ranks in order to learn the work of the department. The direct recruitment of untrained men would be impossible. A long training in the lower ranks was required.

75,474. The present rates of pay of Deputy Superintendents ran from Rs. 250 to Rs. 500. When the traffic branch was introduced in 1902, traffic officers were paid Rs. 350, but in 1908 the new scale came in, and the pay was raised to Rs. 400 or Rs. 500 for all Deputy Superintendents. There were only 16 officers in the two branches receiving the higher pay. The present pay would not be considered adequate, even if *the specific grievances with regard to house and transfer allowances were removed. The responsibilities of a Deputy Superintendent were equal to those of gazetted Postmasters, but the pay was very small in comparison.* Deputy Superintendents should be given the opportunity of rising to the same level as gazetted Postmasters. The most that Deputy Superintendents could rise to was Rs. 500, whereas gazetted Postmasters could rise to Rs. 1,200.

75,475. On the traffic side there were several posts above the Deputy Superintendents' class. The Superintendent's pay went up to Rs. 800 or Rs. 1,000, but no Deputy Superintendent was promoted to a Superintendentship. If that bar was removed, and Superintendents were recruited largely by promotion from Deputy Superintendents, the claims of the latter officers would be met.

75,476. A telegraphist selected to become a Deputy Superintendent should be trained for three years in the three different branches so that he might become an all-round competent officer.

75,477. The general branch was responsible for the lines, and the technical branch for the electrical apparatus, whilst the traffic branch dealt with the disposal of messages.

75,478. On the question of leave, the main desire was for greater elasticity. If the restrictions now imposed were removed, the representations put forward with regard to leave would be met.

75,479. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The officers would not press for an increase of salary if a considerable number of Superintendentships were thrown open to Deputy Superintendents, as they would then have something to work for. The proper proportion would be one-fourth. Generally speaking, a man would reach a Superintendentship after 25 years' service, so that he would have 11 or 12 years in the superior service, and would thus have a chance of rising nearly to the top.

75,480. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Assistant Superintendents were recruited from colleges in England or in India. There had been no promotion from the subordinate ranks to the Assistant Superintendent grade. In the same way the Superintendents came in through the colleges, and had never served in any of the subordinate ranks. The officers came in first as Assistant Superintendents in grades running from Rs. 250 to Rs. 800, and then were promoted to be Superintendents. At present the experience obtained by a Traffic Deputy Superintendent was not sufficient to enable him to discharge the duties of an Assistant Superintendent or Superintendent. A Deputy Superintendent of traffic would not know anything about engineering work, while an Assistant Superintendent might be called upon to do both. That was why qualifications were needed in all three branches.

75,481. (*Mr. Coode.*) There were nine Indians holding posts of Deputy Superintendents.

The witness withdrew.

R. G. WALKER, Esq., Deputy Superintendent of Telegraphs (General).

Written Statement relating to the Telegraph Department.

75,482. [NOTE.—The views embodied in this written statement have been formulated after consulting as many officers of the grade as it was possible to communicate with in the short time at my disposal. These views may, therefore, be taken as representing the general opinion of the entire body of Deputy Superintendents (General), *i.e., group* (i) *below.*]

75,483. With a view to prevent possible confusion of the different grades of Deputy Superintendents it seems necessary to explain here that there are three distinct groups of officers in the Telegraph Department bearing this designation, on the same scale of salaries, but on separate cadres for promotion, &c., as detailed below:—

(i) *Deputy Superintendents (General).*—These officers, whose duties are of an exacting character, are chiefly employed on arduous outdoor work as Assistants to Superintendents of Divisions. They are entrusted with the construction and maintenance of Telegraph and Telephone lines and cables, and the preparation of estimates and accounts for the same. They also exercise general technical supervision of Telephone Systems and of a large number of Telegraph Offices worked by Postal Agency. Seven officers of this group at present occupy the responsible positions of Assistants to Directors of Circles, four are attached to the Store Branch (two of these are in charge of the important Store Depots at Bombay and Madras) and one is on deputation to the Traffic Branch as Assistant Traffic Manager in the Central Circle.

(ii) *Deputy Superintendents (Traffic).*—These officers are almost exclusively employed in the larger telegraph offices on purely indoor traffic work, *i.e.*, all matters relating to the receipt and despatch of telegrams—including the supervision and control of the staff of Telegraph Masters and Telegraphists working under them. A few of these officers are attached as Assistants to administrative Traffic Officers.

(iii) *Deputy Superintendents (Technical).* — These officers are employed on purely technical duties such as the testing of telegraph lines and cables, the maintenance of telegraph and other apparata in the Presidency Offices and the fitting up of important telegraph and telephone systems and other electric installations.

Note.—Each of the above three groups is self-contained and transfers from one group to another are not permissible.

75,484. **(I.) Methods of Recruitment.**—As Deputy Superintendents (General) are now recruited and should continue to be recruited, from the Signalling Establishment, some remarks on the methods of recruitment of Telegraphists are called for.

All that is now required of a candidate for admission to a Telegraph Training Class is to qualify in writing from dictation and to furnish a school certificate up to such standard as the Head of the Circle may prescribe.

For ordinary signalling duties connected with the receipt, despatch and handling of telegrams, these preliminary qualifications may be considered as quite sufficient; but when it is borne in mind that officers of higher rank who might, before completing their career in the Department, be drafted into the Superior Service, are drawn from the ranks of Telegraphists, it

does not seem sufficient to be guided by these qualifications alone. The question of suitability as regards general deportment, moral tone and disciplinary training should also receive close consideration, as these are important factors in the development of responsible and trustworthy public servants.

While, therefore, not proposing any change in the present method of recruitment in regard to preliminary educational requirements, it is suggested that only lads who come from well-recognised Public Schools, and who give the impression by their general bearing that they would do credit to themselves and to the service, should be considered as eligible for subsequent promotion to Deputy Superintendents, for the reason that, while discharging their duties in that capacity, they will from time to time come in contact with Superior Officers of other services, both Civil and Military.

With this object in view Heads of Educational Institutions who present candidates for the Signalling Branch of the Department should be required to furnish information on these really important points, and Heads of Circles might be asked to interview all candidates and record their personal impressions of them, which opinion should subsequently appear in the Personal Rolls of Telegraphists; and only those who are considered of the right stamp should be ear-marked, so to speak, as eligible for advancement to the Deputy Superintendent grade.

What we certainly need as a prospective recruit for the Deputy Superintendent grade is a lad, be he Indian, Anglo-Indian or European, with an all-round mental, moral, physical, and disciplinary training approaching in some degree at least to the type of vigorous, manly, self-reliant middle class Public School boy at Home.

It is generally conceded that the difficulty in obtaining recruits of the right stamp is the low initial salary offered. It is, therefore, necessary to raise the commencing salary and to place increments for the first few years on a more liberal basis, in order that the Service may attract the sort of recruits we need for the higher posts. In most other Departments and on some of the more important Railways more lucrative openings to commence on are offered to those who are put through a special course of instruction, prior to appointment, and the better class of boys naturally turn to them.

It is, therefore, suggested that the initial salary of a Telegraphist be increased from Rs. 50 to Rs. 60, and that his first few increments be so arranged to make it possible for him to attain to a salary of Rs. 100 in five years, conditional, of course, on his passing what is now known as the "Technical Test."

All officers of the Deputy Superintendent grade are emphatically of opinion that recruitment for their grade should be made, as at present, from the Signalling Establishment. It is considered that direct recruitment from any source outside the Department would not be a sound policy, since, apart from other considerations, it would deprive promising Telegraphists of one of the avenues of advancement now open to them, causing a disastrous block in their ranks and creating a real hardship.

Suitable Telegraphists, with due regard to what has already been said, and with, say, from five to eight years' service as Telegraphists, who elect for the General Branch and have so far done well should before being detailed for a special course of theoretical and practical instruction, and with a view to weeding out possible detrimentals, be once again required to appear before the Head of the Circle. Further, for the sake of uniformity in selection, it is suggested that all candidates approved of by Heads of Circles should be required to appear before the Chief Engineer for final selection.

75,485. **(II.) Methods of training and probation.**—Some modifications are suggested in the present system. The theoretical course should precede the practical. The general opinion is that the present course at the Sibpur Engineering College is too short, and that it should be increased to nine months at least, and that it should comprise lessons in the practical use of all surveying instruments, including the theodolite. It is all suggested that some time should be spent in the Store Yard, in the Office of the Electrical-Engineer-in-Chief, and in a Presidency Telegraph Office for the purpose of acquiring useful knowledge of (1) the nomenclature of the various patterns of construction stores and tools, (2) technical matters, including cable testing, (3) testing telegraph lines, &c.

The course of instruction to extend over a period of two years, and to be arranged as under:—

(*a*) Course of instruction in the Sibpur Engineering College for nine months. To pass the examination at present prescribed at the end of that term.

(*b*) Course in the Store Yard, under the Superintendent of Stores, for three months.

(*c*) Course in the Office of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief for three months.

(*d*) Course in one of the Presidency Telegraph Offices for three months.

(*e*) To be employed on a large work of a telegraph line construction or reconstruction, under a capable officer for six months.

Note.—Only under (*a*) would the services of those under training be lost to the Department. Under (*b*), (*c*), (*d*), and (*e*) they will really be doing useful work while undergoing practical instruction.

On completing their training, as above, to the satisfaction of the Officers under whom they are trained, they should be appointed Inspecting Telegraphists (it would, perhaps, be better to designate them "Telegraph Inspectors"), and posted to Telegraph Engineering Divisions for duty in that capacity. While so employed they should be given every facility for acquiring a comprehensive knowledge of the duties and responsibilities of Deputy Superintendents (General) and of Divisional Office work and routine, including Cash and Store accounts; also of the rules in the various chapters of the Telegraph Code as now prescribed.

At the end of two years they should be required to pass the prescribed Departmental Examination, and, on passing that examination, their names should be brought on to a list of qualified men for promotion to Deputy Superintendent (General). Promotions should be made from this list as vacancies occur, with due regard to age, so that no case would occur of a man, after going through the mill, becoming age-barred. No man should be promoted who has less than 10 years' service and whose age exceeds the limit now fixed.

Until they are promoted to Deputy Superintendents they will continue to do duty as Inspectors (or Inspecting Telegraphists) on the progressive salary of Telegraphists, plus the usual allowance.

The period spent in training and as Inspectors should be considered as a sufficient probation, and no further probation should be imposed on promotion to Deputy Superintendent.

75,486. **(III.) Condition of Service.**—(1) Deputy Superintendents (General) labour under several disabilities, the chief of which are enumerated below:—

(*a*) *Non-gazetted rank.*—The nature of the duties of these officers is such that they are brought in contact with Superior Officers of other Government Departments and of Railways, in their relations with whom they are placed at a great disadvantage by not being recognised as Gazetted Officers.

(*b*) *Travelling Allowance.*—The Maximum salary attainable by the Officers of this class having been fixed at Rs. 500, they are technically debarred from any claims to first-class travelling allowances. Even a Deputy Superintendent holding charge of a Division, entrusted with all the powers of a Superintendent (usually a senior officer of the Superior Establishment) and bearing all the responsibilities and performing all the duties appertaining to that office, cannot claim first-class travelling allowances because his total emoluments, including charge allowance, are subject to a maximum of Rs. 500. In no other department of Government does this condition of things exist. Further, a Deputy Superintendent in charge of a

Division may have an Assistant Superintendent working under his orders, in which case the extraordinary anomaly is created of the officer in charge of the Division drawing inferior travelling allowances to those drawn by an officer working under him.

(*c*) *House Accommodation and House Rent Allowances.*—Quarters are not provided for Deputy Superintendents (General) nor is any house rent allowance granted to them, except in the three Presidency Towns and in Rangoon. On the other hand their *confrères* in the Traffic Branch (Group (2) under the head "Preliminary") who are on the same scale of salaries as themselves, are either provided with free quarters (and furniture) or granted house rent allowance in lieu thereof. Having regard to the indisputable fact that Deputy Superintendents (General) are subject to very frequent and inconvenient transfers, often to places where they cannot find suitable accommodation except at very high rentals, ranging from 12 to 15 per cent. of their incomes, their position in this respect is a very real hardship.

(*d*) *Conveyance and other Allowances.*—In respect of these also the Deputy Superintendent of the Telegraph Department usually fares worse than Officers of corresponding rank in other Government Departments.

(2) But the greatest hardship of all is the total exclusion of this class of Officers from advancement to Superior Service. An examination of the list of Superior Officers will reveal the fact that it does not contain the name of even a single officer recruited from the Upper Subordinate grade, Government Resolutions on the subject notwithstanding. In practically every other Department of Government Service, and in the Post Office in particular, capable subordinates have been advanced to Superior Service.

(3) It is fervently hoped that these matters will receive very careful and sympathetic consideration and that measures will be adopted without delay for the removal of these disabilities. It is suggested that the fairest and most effective remedy for (*a*) and (*b*), and incidentally for (*c*) and (*d*), is to place Deputy Superintendents of the Telegraph Department on the same footing as Superintendents of Post Offices. It cannot be denied that there is just as good material amongst the subordinates of the former Department as there is in the latter, and that the qualifications, responsibilities and duties imposed on Deputy Superintendent (General) are, in every respect, equal to those required of Superintendents of Post Offices, a large number of whom have been recruited from the Subordinate ranks.

(4) In the Post Office such of the Subordinate staff who pass what is known as the Post Office Departmental Examination are borne on a list for promotion to Superintendents, and such promotion carries with it advancement to Gazetted rank, and a title to first class travelling allowances. In the Telegraph Department subordinates who aspire to the rank of Deputy Superintendent (General) after a careful selection, are put through a special course of instruction and training, at the end of which they have to pass a searching Departmental Examination and a stiff medical test of fitness, and yet on promotion they are only reckoned as "Upper Subordinates."

(5) This unmerited slur on the subordinate staff of a sister Department has been very keenly felt for many years past, and has been the subject of memorials from time to time. Prominent attention was drawn to this differential treatment in paras. 9 to 12 of a memorial submitted to H. E. the Viceroy, in January, 1909, by practically the entire body of Deputy Superintendents (General), and the rejection of their prayer in this respect was a bitter disappointment to these officers. Now that a scheme for the complete amalgamation of these two departments has gone up to the Secretary of State for India it is earnestly hoped that it includes a provision for the advancement of this long-suffering class of officers to Gazetted rank and to the title to first class travelling allowances. Of course, in order that they may be technically entitled to these benefits it will be necessary to raise the maximum salary of the grade.

75,487. **(IV.) Condition of Salary.**—(1) Existing conditions of salary, for the three groups of Deputy Superintendents are shown below in a tabulated form:—

Groups.	Total sanctioned Strength.	2nd Class.		1st Class.			
		Sanctioned No.	Scale of Salary.	Sanctioned No.	Scale of Salary.	Sanctioned No.	Scale of Salary.
			Rs.		Rs.		Rs.
General - -	72	48	250–15–325	16	325–15–400	8	400–25–500
Traffic - -	56	32	250–15–325	16	325–15–400	8	400–25–500
Technical -	6	3	250–15–325	2	325–15–400	1	400–25–500

The disregard of proportion when allotting the number in the higher scales for the General Branch, as compared with the number allotted for the Traffic Branch, caused some irritation to the men in the former Branch when the above scale was given effect to, and it is largely responsible for the serious block in promotion that now exists in that Branch. Particular attention is drawn to the fact that there will be, on 1st April next, 10 men in the 325–400 scale of the 1st class and as many as 26 men in the 2nd class who will be on the *maximum* pay of these scales, waiting promotion! A feeling of uneasiness prevails amongst those affected that it is hopeless for them to go beyond the maximum of those respective scales. It seems imperative that something should be done immediately to relieve this block, and that extensions beyond the age of 55 years, another cause of stagnation in promotion, should be effectually stopped, for some years at any rate.

(2) In paragraph 75,486(4), under the head "Conditions of service" it has been pointed out that the subordinates of the Telegraph Department have at least as fair a claim to advancement to the Superintendent Establishment as their colleagues in the Post Office, and if what is therein suggested is given effect to, and Deputy Superintendents of the Telegraph Department are brought on to the Superior Establishment, on an equal footing and on the same scale or emoluments as may be arranged for Superintendents of Post Offices, as a result of the recommendations of this Royal Commission; no other revision of theif salaries need be asked for. It is urged, with the utmost emphasis, that this well-merited consideration be now extended to Deputy Superintendents in return for useful services rendered under most trying conditions and in the face of adverse and discouraging circumstances.

(3) In paragraph 6 of their memorial of 1909 to H. E. the Viceroy, Deputy Superintendents prayed for a revision of salaries, with very sound arguments in support thereof, as shewn below:—

Class III - - - Rs. 250–25–350
Class II - - - Rs. 350–25–450
Class I - - - Rs. 450–25–600
plus eight special appointments on a salary of Rs. 700/–.

(4) If, for some very cogent reason, it is found impossible to entertain the proposal made in paragraph 75487(2), it is urged that a revision of their

salaries somewhat on the above lines should now be given effect to, that the maximum attainable be raised to Rs. 900 and that classes be abolished and a time scale be substituted, as shown below:—

Upper Subordinate Service.

Deputy Superintendents, (General).	First five years	Rs. 250–20–350.
	Next six years	Rs. 350–25–500.

*Superior Service *(by selection).*

Superintendents special grade.	First five years	Rs. 500–40–700.
	Last four years	Rs. 700–50–900.

(5) The above scale would give a man entering the grade of Deputy Superintendent, at about 30 years of age, a tolerable chance of reaching the maximum attainable in time to enable him to retire on full pension.

(6) In considering the above revision due regard has been paid to the prospects of subordinates in other Departments and on State Railways. Even some Company worked Railways are now throwing open their superior Services to their subordinates: therefore, in submitting this scale of revised salaries, Deputy Superintendents (General) are only asking for equitable treatment.

(7) One important point to be borne in mind is that the purchasing value of the rupee is now only about half of what it was 20 or 25 years ago, and that a present day income of Rs. 900 is about equal to an income of Rs. 400 or 500 of a quarter of a century ago; and, moreover, that revisions now made will probably remain stationary for the next two decades, when conditions of life, from a monetary point of view, will probably be still more difficult.

75,488. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—*Privilege Leave.*—The present limitation of three months up to which privilege can be accumulated operates harshly, especially in view of the fact that privilege leave cannot always be granted at the time it is applied for. It is considered that such leave should accumulate up to six months.

Combined Leave.—Leave of this nature cannot now be taken for a shorter period than six months. This is another rule that operates harshly, for the season that, if a man goes on any period of privilege leave and has the misfortune to fall ill at the end of it, rendering a short extension of his leave necessary, the whole period of his leave is commuted to leave on half pay, and he thereby loses the benefits of the privilege leave he had earned. It is considered that combined leave should be allowed for any period.

Study Leave.—Leave of this kind is not granted to the subordinate grades. There seems to be no reason why such leave should be withheld from them. As study leave makes for efficiency it should be granted to all ranks under the same conditions as it is now granted to Superior Officers.

It is notorious that in the Telegraph Department privilege leave is frequently refused, and, owing to the limitations put upon it, leave earned is often entirely lost. It is, of course, admitted that the exigencies of the service may render such refusal of leave unavoidable, but in those cases where privilege leave is thereby forfeited altogether, some pecuniary compensation might be made in the shape of a month's or half a month's pay for every month of privilege leave thus lost.

Furlough.—It is recognised that officers recruited from England are entitled to some special indulgence in the way of more liberal furlough rules. Their homes are a long way off and they lose a considerable portion of their furlough in the voyage to and from England. The rigours of the Indian climate must also tell on them more severely than on persons born and brought up in the country. While, however, conceding all this ungrudgingly, it is considered that the disparity in the rules is too great, especially in their application to the subordinate grades. It is, therefore, suggested that the furlough rules and conditions, in so far as they relate to the subordinate grades, should be placed on a more generous scale.

75,489. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—The existing regulations regarding pensions appear to be reasonable, except in respect of the condition that retirement previous to the completion of 30 years' service entails the production of a medical certificates of unfitness. The unanimous opinion of all officers is that the rules should be amended so as to provide for retirement on full pension after completion of 25 years' service without the production of a medical certificate.

It sometimes happens that a man dies before retirement, after rendering between 20 and 35 years' service. Under the present rules the pension earned is, of course, in the nature of the case, entirely lost, and the man's family do not get the benefit they would indirectly derive if the man had lived to enjoy his pension. In such cases the family, even though they may receive a lump sum of money from the recently instituted Provident Fund or from an Insurance Company, are soon reduced to penury. It is thought Government should take this matter into consideration and devise some measure whereby the widow of the deceased officer would become entitled to a reasonable fraction of the pension her husband would have drawn had he lived.

75,490. **(VII) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-Europeans and the working of the existing division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—It is not known what limitations have been fixed for the employment of non-Europeans in the Telegraph Department but in recent years they have been admitted in larger numbers. Nor is it known if any restrictions on account of nationality are placed on candidates recruited in England for the Imperial Service. Apparently there are none.

As regards the Provincial Branch of the Superior Service, which, as it now stands, has been entirely recruited from the Rurki College, it may be pointed out that, of the 19 officers in that service only three are Europeans or Anglo-Indians and 16 are Indians. This is a ratio enormously in favour of the latter.

In the Subordinate Establishment there is no limitation apparently, and it is generally thought that the existing ratio is satisfactory.

As the controversy with regard to this question appears to be chiefly directed to appointments in the Superior Services further remarks under this head would be out of place and superfluous here.

The existing division of the service into Imperial and Provincial must necessarily cause much heart-burning in the ranks of the latter, but a little consideration would show that there are very sound arguments in favour of officers recruited from England being granted higher emoluments and certain additional privileges. These officers are working in a country thousands of miles away from the land of their birth and they incur enormous expenditure in the up-keep of two establishments very often, in going Home and returning from leave and in the numerous incidental expenses connected therewith, which the Indian recruited officer is saved. It has been argued that for men doing the same work there should be no differentiation in pay, but this argument falls to the ground when it is pointed out that senior and junior officers of the same service, doing the same work, are not paid the same salaries. Would the junior officer be justified in claiming the same remuneration as is paid to his senior since he turns out work of the same nature? However, in order to quench this heart-burning the question of placing all officers on the same scale of pay and granting a personal allowance, equivalent to one-third of his income, to an officer recruited from England, which allowance should be included in his emoluments in calculating leave allowances and pension, is suggested. Of course, the remedy would not, it is feared, be effectual but it seems to be the only way of meeting the case.

* 25 per cent of superior appointments to be reserved for this class.

It is thought that for purposes of administration the Superior Establishment should contain at least 50 per cent. of officers recruited from England, and further, the system of direct recruitment from outside the Department for the Superior Establishment in this country should be abolished. This would do away with the Provincial Service as it is now composed. The other 50 per cent. of the Superior appointments should be allotted to capable men in the subordinate grades—25 per cent. to Deputy Superintendents (General) and 25 per cent. to Deputy Superintendents (Traffic and Technical). It is emphatically asserted that there is excellent material in the Department itself for such recruitment.

75,491. **(VIII) Relations of the service with the Indian Civil Service and other services.**—No remarks as regards the Indian Civil Service except that it is considered that it would be a wise policy to always have an Indian Civil Service Officer at the Head of the two Departments which will necessarily require the control of an exceptionally capable officer, specially experienced in administration.

In so far as the Suborbinate Service of the Department is concerned, it compares, as already pointed out, unfavourably with the Subordinate Services of other Departments, especially in the matter of advancement to the Superior grades. A comparison on this point is invited.

75,492. **(IX) Any other points.**—If possible something might be done to reduce the large number of transfers which are more numerous in the Telegraph Department than in any other Department.

Mr. R. G. WALKER called and examined.

75,493. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness had held the position of Deputy Superintendent in the general branch for nearly 16 years, and was recruited from the signalling establishment. He was a telegraphist for eight years, and a Telegraph Master for seven. He did not represent the service, although he had consulted a good many of his brother officers in the general branch. Deputy Superintendents were divided into general, traffic and technical, and he spoke mainly for the general.

75,494. Signallers with five to eight years' service should be selected for training and instruction with a view to promotion. The present rule was that signallers might be selected for appointments as inspecting telegraphists, provided they had not less than four-and-a-half years' service. The course of training and instruction covered two years in all, and should be followed by two years' service as a telegraph inspector in a telegraphic engineering division. It was usual for theory to come before practice, and he considered a training in Sibpur College would be much more useful to a man before he was put on outdoor work. There might be something to be said in favour of having the practical training before the theoretical, but there was a general agreement amongst the officers that the training at Sibpur should come first. After serving for two years as telegraph inspector, an officer should go up for a departmental examination, and on passing should be eligible for promotion to a Deputy Superintendentship. By the time he was ready for promotion to a Deputy Superintendentship he would have had about ten and-a-half years' service, which was about the same as under the present system, except that a man did not now get the full training suggested. A man now selected as inspecting telegraphist must not be over 28 years of age, and when his turn came for promotion his age must not exceed 35.

75,495. The duties in the general branch of the service were of a very varied character. A considerable amount of technical knowledge was required, and a certain amount of traffic knowledge. When the engineering became separated from the traffic branch, the general Deputy Superintendent would go on to the engineering branch, so that a knowledge of traffic would not then be required. There were difficulties in the way of recruiting directly to the Deputy Superintendentship of the general branch, because a Deputy Superintendent, apart from his technical knowledge, had also to understand signalling, as he might be sent out at any time to open up a telegraph line that was interrupted. It was necessary, therefore, that a Deputy Superintendent should pass through the ranks.

75,496. The cadre was divided into two classes, and the first class was divided into two grades; but there was no difference at all in the work, men were doing from the bottom to the top. Unless a man did badly he would go up in rotation, but he would stop at Rs. 325 until there was a vacancy. The increments were given annually. By the time a man had reached the Rs. 325 grade he would have between 16 and 20 years service under the present method of recruitment. A signaller was recruited between 16 and 20 or an average of 18, and a man would be about 35 when he reached the Rs. 325 grade. Promotion from the second to the first class, and also from the second to the first grade in the first class was by seniority.

75,497. In 1892 a Government resolution provided as an occasional measure that deserving subordinates might be promoted to the superior establishment, and by a resolution in 1910 the subordinates were promised one-eighth of the superior posts. None of them, however, had yet been received. The reason no doubt was that the amalgamation scheme had not yet come into operation, but that did not help the men whose promotion was blocked.

74,498. By the time a man reached the top grade of Deputy Superintendent he would be between 42 and 50 years of age. One of the top men now was 54. He himself was in the second grade of the first class.

75,499. The responsibilities and powers of a Superintendent were greater than those of a Deputy Superintendent, but the work was the same, and he would promote Deputy Superintendents to be Superintendents by seniority tempered by selection. He did not think there was any objection to interchangeability as between Deputy Superintendents in the three branches, except that there was only one man now in the traffic branch, who had done work as a general Deputy Superintendent, and that was the previous witness, Mr. THURLEY. He had been drafted into the traffic department when the new resolution was published. There would be difficulties in transferring men from the traffic to the general branch as the traffic man had not done any outside work, but the general man could be transferred to the traffic because he had had a training in traffic.

75,500. The division of the service into Imperial and Provincial caused a certain amount of heart-burning; and though there was an unanswerable case for paying the imported a higher pay than the indigenous officer, the discontent might be mitigated by giving the same pay and allowing the European officer a foreign allowance to bring his emoluments up to the present scale.

75,501. It was the general opinion in the service that the head of the amalgamated department should always be an Indian Civil Service officer on account of the administrative work that would have to be done. That was on the supposition that the telegraph officer was going to be compensated for the loss of the Director-Generalship in some other way.

75,502. More elasticity was wanted in connection with leave.

75,503. His objections to direct recruitment in India for the Provincial Service was based on the fact that it was only fair to the subordinate staff that they should have an opportunity of being recruited The Postal Department was recruited in the same way. Quite 50 per cent. of the officers in the higher departments were recruited from the subordinate ranks.

75,504. The new branch of engineering telegraphists would be a much more specialised branch of work than postal work, and it might be a good thing to encourage the Indian Engineering Colleges by giving them some share in the recruitment to that branch, provided, of course, that a fair percentage went to the Signalling establishment.

75,505. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) He had been educated at the Lawrence Memorial School, Ootacamund. If the higher appointments were given by direct recruitment in India, boys of the domiciled community from such institutions would be shut out. Their education was confined to such schools and included a certain amount of technical education.

75,506. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Under the amalgamation scheme the group of officers now doing traffic work would go the traffic branch, and those in the general branch to engineering. The technical group would possibly go with engineering, though personally he thought it ought to go with traffic, because the work was largely inside telegraph offices.

75,507. The loss of the Director-General's post appealed to the Deputy Superintendents not from a monetary point of view, but from the point of view of loss of prestige to the whole service. Every officer recruited as an Assistant Superintendent or Superintendent could not possibly rise to the post of Director-General, but had hopes of doing so.

The witness withdrew.

At Madras, Tuesday, 27th January 1914.

PRESENT:

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. (*in the Chair*).

SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:—

S. C. MAULIK, Esq., Superintendent of Telegraphs, Vizagapatam Division.
J. C. SHERIDAN, Esq., Postmaster-General, Madras.

M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. (*Joint Secretary*).

H. C. A. GOODALL, Esq., Director of Telegraphs, Madras.

(*Mr. Goodall was examined upon the written statement put in by Messrs. Streatfeild-James and Thomas—vide paragraphs* 75,269–78.)

Mr. H. C. A. GOODALL called and examined.

75,508. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness was at present holding the post of director of telegraphs of the Madras circle. He was recruited from Cooper's Hill in October 1886, and attained his present position on the 10th April 1910. He was not a signatory to the corporate memorandum as he was on furlough at the time, but he accepted it as expressing his views.

75,509. He desired to lay special stress on the necessity for an education in England. To this end it was proposed that 75 per cent. of the service should be recruited in England. It was a matter not of colour or creed but of efficiency. If Indians would go to England for their training there was no objection to giving them 50 per cent. of the appointments, but he would prefer not to fix any racial proportions.

75,510. The request that recruitment to the engineering branch in England should be by competitive examination amongst nominated candidates had since been modified. The method now desired was that followed in the case of the Public Works Department, *plus* the requirement of an Engineering or Science degree to be held by the candidate.

75,511. He also attached importance to the grant of study leave to young engineering officers not less than once in five years, as in certain of the other departments. Without this he could not be expected to keep abreast of inventions and new discoveries. The electrical department of the engineering college in Madras was not organised to give a man the opportunity for advanced electrical studies.

75,512. The salaries proposed in the amalgamated scheme were generally suitable except with regard to the head of the engineering branch. If the pay of that post was raised to Rs. 3,000 it would meet the claims of the service with regard to pay, but not with regard to position. It would still be desired that an officer of the telegraph service should be eligible for the director-generalship of the combined department. It was true no officers were recruited with that promise, but they had always had the director-generalship of telegraphs before them.

75,513. He preferred a time-scale to a graded system. There was no objection to the pay of the provincial and Imperial services being the same, provided a foreign service allowance was granted to Europeans to bring their pay up to the present amount.

75,514. There was some feeling of dissatisfaction in the provincial service about the distinctions between the Imperial and provincial branches, and a solution would be to the advantage of the department. There was the same feeling amongst telegraphists in connection with the local and the general scale, under which they received different rates af pay while doing the same work, The general scale man, however, was liable to be transferred all over India, whereas the local scale officer was only liable to be transferred within certain limits,

75,515. At present there was not much difficulty in regard to leave, but no new officers were now being recruited, and unless the amalgamation scheme came in quickly officers would have to be taken on to relieve the strain.

75,516. The officers desired to retain their right to pension after twenty years' service. If a man desired to retire at forty-two years of age he should not be stopped, but very few would take advantage of the option. The fact, however, that it was there added to the attractiveness of the department.

75,517. The pension should extend up to 700*l* after thirty years' service and on a non-contributory basis. The figure was based on the pensions of a scientific department such as the Indian Medical Service.

75,518. The general provident fund was open to all officers of the service, and contributions were compulsory up to a certain percentage and voluntary over that. He believed every officer subscribed to the fund. The fund, however, could not take the place of

commutation of pension, though, if commutation was introduced, it might not be necessary to compel officers to join the provident fund. If the Government contributed to the provident fund as they contributed to the railway funds, commutation of part of the pension might not be necessary. Officers felt very strongly that they ought to have the right to commute a portion of their pension with the existing restrictions, because they looked upon pension as deferred pay. An officer who died lost his pension, but if he commuted a portion of it that portion remained for his wife and children.

75,519. The expense in connection with houses varied in different localities, and it was only in the large presidency towns that it was abnormal. In Madras it was not so bad as in Calcutta or Bombay, but houses are becoming more expensive. In Madras a small allowance was given. Superintendents received Rs. 45. He himself got Rs. 50.

75,520. In the matter of travelling allowances an officer's family should be recognised, and reasonable household effects allowed. The State should bear the whole cost of removal. He had been told by an officer that every transfer had cost him Rs. 500 over and above what he had drawn from Government. Transfers had not been so frequent of late years.

75,521. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) The Madras Engineering College had an electrical section, but the apparatus was very limited. Technical instruction in local institutions could not possibly be so good as that given in institutions in Europe, where every facility was offered for practical training. Book work might be done in India as easily as in England, but as large electrical machinery was not made in India men would have to go to England for that part of their training.

75,522. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Officers on furlough often visited telegraph workshops and other works to improve their knowledge, but if they wished to recoup themselves any part of the expense they had to obtain permission first. He did not know whether any officers had visited works at their own expense, but no doubt many men had done so. Outside the technical branch it was not of indispensable value to an officer to obtain technical experience on the present organisation of the department. Study leave was necessary to keep an officer's knowledge up to date.

75,523. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) The objection of a good many officers to the general provident fund was that it did not make any provision for a man's family in case he died young. Even if Government paid cent. per cent. to the fund, it would not amount to anything if a man died three years after entering the service. There was a rule that if an officer insured his life the premiums could be deducted from the subscriptions to the general provident fund, and there was a veto on his raising money on the policy. Officers drew upon the provident fund for the purpose of sending their wives or children to England, and that would not be possible under an insurance scheme, but that disadvantage was small compared with the advantage which must accrue in other directions. Any amounts drawn from the provident fund had to be repaid.

75,524. (*Mr. Maulik.*) Owing to the fact that the conditions of service were going to be altered, men who had to do with technical work as well as engineering would require training, but men who were not going to do technical work would not require technical training. At present there was no necessity for a very high technical training as a technical branch was in existence, but at the same time, if a man had a knowledge of the subject, it often saved the technical officers going out to do the work. Officers should be given an opportunity of keeping their knowledge up to date as the technical department was to be abolished after the amalgamation.

75,525. He was not prepared to say whether the amalgamation scheme would be a success, but the idea was that engineering officers would have to do all the technical work, and for that purpose it was necessary to have 75 per cent. of the men from England with a very high technical training, competent to carry out technical work. The training of young officers who came from Cooper's Hill was very insufficient. He himself went to Calcutta where he stayed for two months, and was then drafted off for field service in Upper Burma, and had no opportunity of learning anything. The Cooper's Hill men were not highly trained in electrical engineering, because this was then only in its infancy when he was at Cooper's Hill.

75,526. It was open to Government, if they saw fit, to give Imperial and provincial service officers the same pay when doing the same work. The provincial service man might get the same pay in the director's grade but not in the superintendent's grade.

75,527. The complaint with regard to the warrant of precedence was that the Directors of Telegraphs were graded considerably below officers of equal status in other services.

The witness withdrew.

J. G. MORGAN, Esq., Superintendent, Telegraph Department, Trichinopoly Division

Written Statement relating to the Indian Telegraph Department.

75,528. **(I.) Methods of recruitment.**—It is suggested that three-eighths of the officers be recruited from English Engineering Colleges, and one-eighth direct from Junior Officers of the British Post Office, who would be willing to join the Indian Service; three-eighths from Indian Engineering Colleges, and the balance one-eighth be recruited from the Indian Subordinate Staff.

75,529. **(II.) Systems of training and probation.**—That officers recruited from the English Engineering Colleges be appointed for a year on probation to the British Post Office, and officers recruited from the Indian Engineering Colleges be appointed for a year on probation to the Indian Service. Both officers recruited from the British Post Office and the Indian Telegraph Department be on probation for one year in the Indian Service.

75,530. **(III.) Conditions of service**—There should be no distinction between officers recruited in India and England.

75,531. **(IV.) Conditions of salary.**—That the rates of pay should be the same for all. No distinction should be made in the rates of pay given to officers recruited in England and to the officers recruited in India. That in place of any difference of pay, a first class return passage to England be given to all Non-Indians recruited in England once in five years, and that the number of free passages to be given be restricted as follows:—

2	return	1st	class	passages	after	1st	5	years' service.
3	"	"	"	"	"	10	"	"
4	"	"	"	"	"	15	"	"
5	"	"	"	"	"	20	"	"
5	"	"	"	"	"	25	"	"
5	"	"	"	"	"	30	"	"

75,532. **(V.) Conditions of leave.**—That all officers be permitted to accumulate privilege leave to the extent of five months when such leave is to be spent out of India, otherwise the present privilege leave rules to hold good. That the conditions for medical leave and furlough as at present hold for the European Service be granted to all alike.

75,533. **(VI.) Conditions of pension.**—That the conditions of pension as at present hold for the European Service be granted to all alike.

75,534. **(VII.) Such limitations as may exist in the employment of Non-European and the working of the existing systems of the division of services into Imperial and Provincial.**—That the distinction of services into Imperial and Provincial should be abolished. This distinction at present is deeply felt by all services. It leaves the impression that Government sanction and stamp the distinction of all services recruited in India known as Provincial Services as being inferior to and quite below the level of the Imperial Service. This treatment is silently very much resented.

75,535. **(VIII.) Any other points within the terms of reference to the Royal Commission not covered by the preceding heads.**—It is suggested that (*a*) Government provide private buildings for its officers more freely. (*b*) That the travelling allowances on transfer be more liberal, and extended to cover all reasonable charges incurred by an officer breaking up his home and having to move his family from one station to another. This may be limited to actual certified charges not exceeding six First Class and three Third Class fares, plus an allowance for 40 maunds of luggage.

Mr. J. G. MORGAN called and examined.

75,536. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) The witness was superintendent of telegraphs, Trichinopoly division, and had been elected to represent the members of the provincial service whose views were set forth in the written statement.

75,537. Members of the Imperial and provincial services were all on one list for promotion, and received promotion in turn, and the provincial service officers understood, when they joined, that they were to be treated on an equality. But when the department was reorganised in 1910 rules were brought in by which the provincial service officers lost eight years' seniority. That had now been rectified. Under the present system the pay, pension, furlough, and leave rules differed from those in the Imperial service, but there was one list for promotion. As a matter of policy and equity officers doing the same work should be paid alike. He admitted, however, that there was some difference in the circumstances of an officer recruited in England and of one recruited in India, but believed that the provincial service would object to a foreign service allowance being given to Europeans, and considered that this objection could be justified on economic and political grounds. A foreign allowance would stamp the recipients as "Foreigners" in India. It would be wise to get rid of this idea and avoid such a classification. It is strongly held that equality of opportunity of entering Government service and equality of treatment in all respects once in Government service would remove all grounds of discontent.

75,538. If under the amalgamation scheme a new traffic branch was created, quite separate from the engineering branch, the officers would no longer press for the recruitment of British post office men to the department. Failing that, the type of officers that should be taken from the British post office would be traffic men.

75,539. There was absolutely no difference between the standard of Cooper's Hill and the standard of Rurki College, where he himself was trained. In fact, the students, who passed out of Rurki, were better educated than the men who came from Cooper's Hill, and there was not much difference in practical training as between the two colleges. An engineer trained at the Rurki College had just as much chance of becoming a highly satisfactory engineer as an engineer who was trained at a college in England. That, however, did not apply entirely to the electrical branch, but only to the extent that electrical engineering was made use of in India. A certain amount of efficiency was required in electrical engineering in the telegraph department, but not a great deal, as the department had no work in setting up electrical installations, and all the training necessary could be acquired at an Indian college, supplemented by the training received in the department itself.

75,540. The number of higher posts to be allotted to the subordinate staff should be kept small. Really suitable subordinates were rare. Moveover they were not sufficiently educated, and had not the necessary social qualities.

75,541. The present rules with regard to leave were faulty in that they did not provide sufficient leave on full pay. Commutation of longer furlough on half pay to shorter furlough on full pay would meet the claims of the department.

75,542. On transfer the Government should meet the cost of moving an officer's wife and family and a reasonable amount of effects.

75,543. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) His recommendation with regard to pay did not mean that this should necessarily be that of the provincial service. What was asked for was equality of treatment, and that, whatever was given to the Imperial officers, should be given to the provincial officers.

57,544. The number of first-class passages recommended in the written statement assumed that the officer was a married man.

57,545. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The Indian college engineers were quite as efficient as any of those who came from England. If the department could be manned efficiently by men from Indian colleges, a suitable scale of salary would be one midway between the present Imperial and provincial scales. The cost of living had gone up, and Indian officers were adopting western styles of living, and they also had heavy expenses in connection with their families.

75,546. It would be possible to get suitable European officers from England on reduced rates of pay. Private firms obtained them on less favourable terms than those given by Government and without pensions.

75,547. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) If something between the Imperial and provincial scales of pay was introduced, Englishmen would still come out to India, because the pay would even so be higher than that which they would obtain in their own country. He objected to officers doing the same work and being paid differently. It was true that it was possible to obtain in India men for even lower salaries than were now given in the provincial service, but that was simply because it was a case of "Hobson's choice." If the question was one of market price he believed an Englishman could be obtained much cheaper than he was being obtained for now.

75,548. (*Mr. Maulik.*) Previous to 1895 the students from Rurki were appointed on the Imperial scale of pay in the Public Works Department, but the pension and leave rules were different.

75,549. The provincial service had progressed backwards as far as the aspirations of the natives of India were concerned, and this was keenly felt by them.

The witness withdrew.

J. F. RODRIGUES, Esq., Officiating Presidency Postmaster, Madras; and
P. A. KRISHNAMA CHARLU, Esq., Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General, Madras,
were called and examined together.

(*The witnesses were examined upon the written statement put in by Messrs. McMinn, Sinclair and Sri Ram—vide paragraphs* 75,213–31—*with which they generally agreed.*)

75,550. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) Mr. RODRIGUES was officiating presidency postmaster in Madras, and had held the position for five months. His service had been entirely in the postmaster's line, except for a period of two years when he was superintendent in the postmaster-general's office. He represented the postmaster's side of the department. Mr. CHARLU was personal assistant to the postmaster-general, and held the position of superintendent of post offices. He was recruited direct and had been a superintendent for fifteen years.

75,551. Mr. RODRIGUES held that half the recruits into the grades of superintendents should be by direct nomination from "outsiders" and half by selection from the departmental officials. The general consensus of opinion in the department was in favour of recruitment of outsiders by nomination, and no views in favour of competition or restricted competition had been put forward by the officers at the conference at which the memorandum was drawn up. Mr. CHARLU added that the idea of competition was not new. It had been actually acted upon in the department, for, in the past, candidates were selected from among those who had competed for the Provincial Executive Services but had failed to get one of the guaranteed appointments. Such men had to pass the departmental test for the superintendent's grade.

75,552. At present, Mr. CHARLU said, probationary superintendents were kept waiting for appointments for about two years. That term should be fixed instead of being allowed to vary, because a man ought not to be kept waiting longer than that period.

75,553. Mr. CHARLU did not support the demand contained in the written statement for a general list for promotion for probationary superintendents throughout India. Under the present system superintendents served in their own circles. If there was an all-India list, it might be necessary to enforce service in any part of India. There were great advantages in keeping a man in his own circle, and they would be thrown away if he was sent outside.

75,554. Mr. RODRIGUES thought it was a mistake to speak of undergraduates in connection with the domiciled community, because there was no European University in India. A pass by the matriculation standard satisfied the conditions required for service in the post office. The distinction between Indians and members of the domiciled community in the matter of Educational qualifications was made because the former needed a longer education to get on the same level with the latter in the matter of English. Again, Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans received their education in schools, which did not give a University course, and if they were compelled to graduate at an Indian University, they would practically be cut out of the field of recruitment. The European school course was that of a high school. Mr. CHARLU said that so long as some standard of education was prescribed for Anglo-Indians, he did not desire to object to a distinction between them and Indians. All he asked was that an Anglo-Indian should not be appointed a superintendent merely because he was an Anglo-Indian, and without regard to his education.

75,555. On the subject of travelling and transfer allowances, Mr. RODRIGUES pointed out that officers had to go from one end of India to the other. He himself had been transferred from Simla to Rangoon, from Rangoon to Lahore, from Lahore to Madras, and from Tuticorin to Calcutta, and had to transport the members of his family and his household effects in each case at his own expense. The allowance now given, whether double second or double first class, was quite inadequate. He had been put to a considerable loss on each transfer. Mr. CHARLU added that a superintendent of post offices had to travel through two districts and sometimes three, whereas an officer of similar standing in another department had to travel only through two or three taluks and could keep his own conveyances. A superintendent had often to pay for his food on a dining car and had expenditure in other directions. On that ground he claimed increased travelling allowance. He had not supported the claim for better daily allowances as he was asking for a higher rate of travelling allowance, and he thought it would perhaps be unwise to ask for too much.

75,556. Mr. CHARLU said that the statement in the memorandum as to the method of pay desired was misleading, as it appeared to show that the officers preferred a graded system. As a matter of fact they desired to have a time-scale.

75,557. Mr. RODRIGUES said it would not be possible to have a time-scale for the postmasters so long as the system of paying officers according to the volume of work in each office prevailed. What the postmasters desired was that, if the pay of superintendents was raised, their pay should be raised in proportion. Thus, if the top grade of the superintendents was made Rs. 700, the top grade of the gazetted postmasters should also be made Rs. 700. Both officers were of the same class, and gazetted postmasters really exercised the powers of superintendents in their own cities. He did not in these remarks refer to the postmasters at Lahore and Rangoon (pay Rs. 600—40—800). They ranked with Deputy Postmasters-General and Presidency Postmasters under the list of chief officers and not with superintendents.

75,558. Mr. CHARLU was of opinion that if a proper time-scale were introduced the officers of this department would probably not press for compulsory retirement at the age of fifty-five. As a matter of fact he thought that some of his colleagues agree with him that it was not necessary to insist upon it as it would be a waste of Government money to retire a capable officer before it was absolutely necessary. Mr. RODRIGUES did not agree and said that the majority at the Nagpur Conference held that officers should retire at the age of fifty-five. When they came to that conclusion they had before them the possibility of their being paid on a time-scale. They understood that the pay of the higher posts of Deputy Postmasters-General, &c., would continue to be graded.

75,559. The justification for increasing the pay, dispite the fact that good officers were being obtained on the pay now given, was that twenty years ago, when the pay was fixed, the rupee went much further than it did at present. The cost of living had risen all round. Mr. CHARLU agreed that the cost of living had increased, and maintained that the best class of man was not being obtained on the amount of pay at present offered. If the pay was raised, a much better class of man would join the department.

75,560. Mr. RODRIGUES said the postmasters claimed special treatment in the matter of leave on the ground that they had to work on Sundays and holidays. There was a roster under which officers took their turn at Sunday and holiday duty, but even so, two officers had to divide the day between them, one taking the morning and the other the afternoon. Mr. CHARLU did not think the question of holidays affected the superintendents to the same extent as the postmasters.

75,561. Mr. RODRIGUES then referred to the fine fund, and said the contention was that it should be thrown in with the guarantee fund and utilised for the good of the officers.

75,562. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Mr. CHARLU said that the reservation of 10 per cent. of the superintendentships for non-domiciled Europeans was necessary because European superintendents were required in certain emergencies, as, for instance, working with a field force, for famine work, for going out with expeditionary forces, and in hilly divisions where it would be neither convenient nor advantageous for a native of India to be employed. There was no attempt to work out the ten per cent. for each province. It applied to the whole of India.

75,563. Mr. RODRIGUES said that superintendent had to pass a certain length of time on probation, and they were given training in postmaster's work as well as superintendent's work. A gazetted postmaster was quite able to do the work of a superintendent, and a superintendent would not be unfit for the work of work of a postmaster. Interchangeability might improve the general prospects of both postmasters and superintendents. The training, however, which a probationer received as a superintendent, was not enough to make him a valuable postmaster, and he would have to be in charge of an office for some time after his probation before he could be considered to have a thorough knowledge of a postmaster's duties. Mr. CHARLU said a superintendent was quite as much a postmaster in his own way, because the duties of a superintendent included the inspection of post offices, and he could not inspect unless he knew the postmaster's work thoroughly. The postmaster also exercised the functions of a superintendent except in the matter of travelling from place to place. His own opinion was that it would be much better not only for the officers concerned but for the administration if postmasters and superintendents ran on two parallel lines until the one officer rose to be presidency postmaster and the other deputy postmaster-general. Postmasters should be debarred from promotion to deputy postmaster generalships and similar posts altogether, because they had posts which were more advantageous. The position of a presidency postmaster not only gave him the pay of a deputy postmaster-general, but also conveniences which the deputy postmaster-general did not enjoy. Interchangeability below these positions would not be suitable.

75,564. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Mr. RODRIGUES said that in asking that domiciled European candidates should be undergraduates the idea was to fix some educational standard, as at present there was none. Most, however, had reached the high school standard. They started with two years' advantage over Indian candidates. There were certain duties which the European was better fitted to perform owing to his mother-tongue and whole environment having been English. A lower standard was not fixed in order to obtain a larger field of recruitment amongst Europeans

75,565. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) Mr. CHARLU said the graded scale put forward would have been a little more beneficial than the time-scale one, considering number of appointments suggested for each grade, but if the number of appointments in the higher grades were reduced, the officers concerned would not profit ar all, and it was therefore now thought wiser to accept the incremental system.

75,566. Mr. CHARLU then said that it was a fact that a presidenncy postmaster could only rise to Rs. 1,200, whereas the deputy postmaster-general went up to Rs. 1,400, but the presidency postmaster had a free house, which was often worth more than Rs. 200. Mr. RODRIGUES said that the postmaster was given rooms in the post office building which was sometimes situated in a noisy and thickly populated quarter of the town. If left to himself, a presidency postmaster would not pay anything like a Rs. 200 rent and would live in a more quiet and salubrious part of the town. The original object in requiring the postmaster to live at the post office was in order that he might be able to deal with any urgent mails coming in and going out, and guard the large amount of cash in his office.

75,567. (*Mr. Sheridan.*) Mr. CHARLU said there had been a great increase in the work and responsibility of postmasters since the original rates of pay were fixed, and this was why the pay of postmasters was raised from time to time. The recommendations made on behalf of the postmasters and superintendents were also intended to apply to railway sorters. The railway sorters were hard-worked men and should be much better treated than they were at present. They were invalided much earlier than most post office officials, especially in connection with eyesight. Therefore they were entitled to some consideration.

75,568. Mr. CHARLU then stated that in any scale of pay adopted there should be an efficiency bar. In a graded scale he would place the efficiency bar at Rs. 500, after which a man should only be promoted if found efficient. There should be no departmental examination at this stage, promotion being determined by the head of the circle. Mr. RODRIGUES said there should be a similar bar in the case of postmasters at Rs. 500. It would be rather late in life to hold a departmental examination, but some sort of test was needed. Mr. RODRIGUES said that it would be a fair plan to have a provincial and imperial list of gazetted postmasters, one consisting of those willing to serve only in one province, and the other of those willing to serve anywhere. The rates of pay should not be the same. The man, who was prepared to go wherever he was sent, should receive more consideration than the man who did not wish to leave his province. Mr. CHARLU considered it unnecessary to have a provincial and an imperial list for superintendents because a superintendent was liable to be transferred to any part of India, and if he refused to go, would risk losing his place. A superintendent, however, should be allowed to work as far as possible within his own province, where he had the advantage of a knowledge of the language and of the people.

The witnesses withdrew.

At Bombay, Monday, 9th February 1914.

PRESENT:

THE EARL OF RONALDSHAY, M.P. *(in the Chair).*

SIR MURRAY HAMMICK, K.C.S.I., C.I.E.
SIR THEODORE MORISON, K.C.I.E.
MAHADEV BHASKAR CHAUBAL, Esq., C.S.I.
ABDUR RAHIM, Esq.

And the following Assistant Commissioners:

S. C. W. ROSE, Esq., Officiating Deputy Postmaster-General, Bombay.
G. W. TALBOT, Esq., Superintendent of Telegraphs, Central Telegraph Office, Bombay.
M. S. D. BUTLER, Esq., C.V.O., C.I.E. *(Joint Secretary).*

D. S. CAPTAIN, Esq., Superintendent of the Post Office, Poona;
C. J. E. CLERICI, Esq., Superintendent of Post Offices, Rájputána Divison; and
D. J. MURTRIE, Esq., I.S.O., Presidency Postmaster, Bombay;
were called and examined together.

(The witnesses were examined upon the written statement put in by Messrs. McMinn, Sinclair, and Sri Ram—vide paragraphs 75,218–31.)

75,569. *(Lord Ronaldshay.)* Mr. MURTRIE started in the department as a probationer on Rs. 15 a month in July 1884, and remained in the subordinate line till 1900, when he was appointed a Superintendent after examination. Five years later he was appointed an Assistant Postmaster in the Rangoon Post Office, and then came to Bombay, where he acted for 18 months as Presidency Postmaster. He was then transferred to Simla, and acted as Assistant Director-General and Inspector-General of the Railway Mail Service, and was Chief Superintendent and Postmaster of the Coronation Durbar, 1911. He then returned to Rangoon as Postmaster, and was now substantive Presidency Postmaster in Bombay. Mr. CAPTAIN entered the department in 1897 as a probationer on Rs. 60, and after three months' training was appointed an Inspector, and held the position for three years. He then acted as Head Clerk to the Postmaster-General for 18 months. He then passed the Superintendent's examination, and in 1901 was made Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General. In 1902 he was confirmed as Superintendent of Post Offices, and continued to act as Personal Assistant. He was next put in charge of a division and was now Superintendent, second grade, Rs. 400 to Rs. 500. Mr. CLERICI started in the Railway Mail Service 13 years ago, and then went on to the Director-General's Office and to the Postmaster-General's Office, Nágpur. He was now Superintendent in Lower Rájputána, third grade, Rs. 300 to Rs. 400.

75,570. Mr. CAPTAIN said that, under the present system, the Postmasters were recruited exclusively from the subordinate ranks, and although some were very good the average was not quite satisfactory. As the operations of the Post Office became more complicated, and the duties more responsible, it was necessary to have a sprinkling of young and energetic men, who would make competent Postmasters after a suitable training. Therefore a limited number of men should be recruited as Probationary Postmasters, starting on Rs. 100 a month. Mr. MURTRIE favoured this suggestion, but considered that Superintendents should be recruited in the same way. In his written statement he had said that the proportion should be as two to one, but he was inclined to think now that it ought to be in equal proportions, because, if it was made two to one, a larger number of outsiders would be brought in, and the men in the department would be discouraged. The work of a Postmaster was of a technical character, but not so much so that it required men to come from the bottom grade. If a man was placed in a large office, and had intelligence, he soon picked up the work, and on passing the departmental examination ought to make a good Postmaster. Direct recruitment would give a class of men better educated than those at present in the service. On the small pay now given it could not be expected that highly educated men would join the service. Mr. CAPTAIN added that, during the last seven years, 16 probationary Postmasters had been appointed, but recently it had been decided to discontinue the system. It should, however, be continued, in order to obtain a good class of Postmaster in the future. He believed it was discontinued because the selection was not very happy in some cases, but that might be due to exceptional circumstances, and the difficulty could be overcome by taking suitable precautions in the selection.

75,571. ALL THREE WITNESSES then said that the general sense of the department was in favour of recruitment by nomination. There was no special demand for any system of competition.

75,572. Mr. CAPTAIN explained that probationary Superintendents were kept waiting for appointments for about two years on an average. This was a satisfactory period. In some cases men had to wait for three years, while in others they were appointed within six or 12 months. No one should be appointed to the permanent charge of a division, unless he had gone through at least one year's training, and the maximum should be two years. If a man did not pass the departmental test and give satifaction within two years he should be asked to leave the department. If a vacancy was not available at the end of two years he would naturally have to wait. Mr. CLERICI concurred.

75,573. Mr. CAPTAIN desired to withdraw the recommendation made in the corporate memorandum in favour of an all-India system of promotion for probationary Superintendents. There was now one list and this might be continued, but the practice by which the Director-General ordinarily appointed a man recruited in a particular province to work in that province, unless the interest of the service required him to serve in another, was advantageous, and should not be given up. A man working in his own province had the advantage of a good knowledge of the vernacular and of the local conditions. Mr. CLERICI, on the other hand, wished for an all-India system because it gave more justice all round. Otherwise a junior might rise above a senior man. A case of the kind had occurred in Bengal, where a Mr. Datta was kept waiting for four years, whilst junior men passed over his head. With an all-India system Mr. Datta might have been sent to serve on the North-West frontier, and he might or might not have liked that personally, but a man who joined the post office ought to be ready to go anywhere. To this Mr. CAPTAIN replied that the circle system was not now slavishly adhered to, and this gave the necessary elasticity. The Director-General, if he found that a man in a particular circle had to wait too long, occasionally drafted him into another circle, and in this way a man from Bengal and a man from the United Provinces had been brought into the Bombay Circle. Another way of meeting the difficulty would be to date seniority from the day that each officer passed the Superintendent's examination, provided he was satisfactory in all other respects. If a man had to wait for four years, he should be graded, when his turn for appointment came, above the men who were junior to him as candidates. Mr. MURTRIE said the department as a whole were now in favour of Mr. CAPTAIN'S view, and therefore the recommendation

in the written statement might be regarded as practically withdrawn.

75,574. Mr. MURTRIE said that the European school course did not give to the domiciled community the advantages which Indians possessed. The schools for the domiciled community did not give the instruction necessary for their scholars to become graduates in the Indian Universities. The Cambridge senior examination for the domiciled lad compared very favourably with an Indian graduate's examination for the Indian, and members of the domiciled community passing the Cambridge senior, would, from an intellectual point of view, be on terms of equality with Indian graduates. Mr. CAPTAIN believed that the Cambridge senior was on a par with the Bombay Matriculation or School Final examination, and did not come up to the B.A. standard. His reason for proposing the Matriculation or the Cambridge senior test as suitable for Anglo-Indians was on account of the backward education of the domiciled community, which laboured under special disadvantages. Their education, for one thing, was more costly. The present standard, however, should be gradually raised and brought up to the B.A. standard. If the standard were raised at once, the members of this community would be debarred from getting appointments in the department.

75,575. Mr. CAPTAIN said that the claim for an increased diem allowance was based partly on grounds which were common to other services and partly on special grounds. The charge of a Superintendent was much larger than that of most other executive officers. It usually included two districts. Also the nature of the work was such that only very short halts were made at different places, whereas officers of other departments usually halted for about a week at each place. It was laid down in the departmental rules that a Superintendent should not ordinarily take more than two days for the inspection of a fair-sized sub-office, and one day for the inspection of a branch office. Superintendents had to go round their charge twice a year, whereas most other officers went round only once.

75,576. Mr. MURTRIE allowed that Postmasters received their houses rent-free.

75,577. Mr. CAPTAIN preferred a time-scale of pay, and said that that was the general view of the service. It was only on the assumption that a time-scale would not be granted that the graded system was put forward in the written statement. If the graded system was adopted a suitable number of appointments should be given in the higher grades. When the present first grade of Rs. 500 to Rs. 600 was created it seemed on paper that the officers had an increase, but as the number of appointments in it was only eleven few got a chance of rising to that grade. He did not consider that any efficiency bar was necessary in the case of Superintendents. Every man who worked satisfactorily should have the prospect of rising to the top of the Superintendent's grade. For the higher grades of Deputy Postmaster-General, Presidency Postmaster, Inspector-General, etc., there should be selection. Mr. CLERICI endorsed Mr. CAPTAIN'S remarks.

75,578. Mr. MURTRIE said that the time-scale could be applied even to Postmasters to a certain extent. For instance the pay of the Lucknow Post Office was fixed at Rs. 500 to Rs. 600, and supposing a time-scale was in existence, it would be for the Director-General to say that no man should be put into the office unless he had nine year's service. The Director-General could fix a schedule as to the number of years' service a man must have to qualify him to hold charge of some important offices.

75,579. Mr. CAPTAIN said that, if a time-scale were introduced for Superintendents, he would not press for the rigorous application of the fifty-five years' rule for retirement although that was desirable, but he would make it compulsory in the higher offices, because otherwise promotion would be blocked. Mr. CLERICI thought there should be one rule for all, and that all officers should retire at the age of fifty-five, and that was the view held by the bulk of his colleagues.

75,580. Mr. MURTRIE pointed out that in the year 1907, when Postmasters were drawing a commission on the sale of stamps, they were on the whole better off than the Postmasters of to-day. The commission on the sale of stamps amounted to something like 3½ lákhs, whereas the revised grades of pay, which were fixed for Postmasters on the abolition of the commission system, only cost 1½ lákhs. Therefore, the total emoluments of Postmasters were less to-day than they were before. That had resulted in no deterioration in the personnel because recruitment had been solely from the ranks.

75,581. Mr. CAPTAIN said there would be an improvement in the personnel if the pay was raised. At present a suitable class of men was obtained simply owing to the fact that in the struggle for existence a young man had to accept what was offered, but when he was placed in a responsible position he should be given a suitable wage.

75,582. Mr. CAPTAIN said that the rules did not lay down that officers had to work on Sundays, but the circumstances of the department were such that they had to do so at least on half the Sundays in the year. Mr. MURTRIE added that the hardship was greater in the case of Postmasters than in that of Superintendents. A Superintendent was not bound to work on Sundays except to make up arrears, but a Postmaster had to do so because he was in charge of the office. There was a roster for the clerks, who took so many Sundays off, but every Postmaster had to be at his office for at least two hours in the morning and two hours in the afternoon on every Sunday and on holidays.

75,583. Mr. CAPTAIN said that subscription to the General Provident Fund was compulsory for Europeans, but optional for Indians. In the upper grades, the fund was availed of largely, but not in the lower grades. If the pension scheme were modified, and a suitable Provident Scheme introduced, it would be in the interest of the service as a whole. The work in the post office was very hard, and in many cases officials broke down, after putting in twenty-five or twenty six years' service, before they received their pensions, but if a Provident Fund were introduced, and an officer died before completing his service, his family would get some benefit, instead of, as now, being left destitute.

75,584. Mr. CAPTAIN said that the guarantee fund had been built up by annual deductions from the salaries of postal officials up to about ten years ago, when deductions ceased. At that time eight annas a year were deducted from the pay of every officer, and a large fund had accumulated, the interest of which was mainly utilised in meeting losses which the department suffered through the dishonesty of postal officials. He had no objection to its being utilised in that way, but there was a large balance left over each year, and that balance should be utilised in the interests of the men who had contributed towards the fund, and should not be allowed to go on accumulating as at present. It should be administered by a departmental committee, representing the higher officers and Superintendents and Postmasters. At present the Director-General himself administered the fund. The balance went on accumulating simply because no one had taken the trouble to formulate a scheme for utilising it. Mr. MURTRIE thought there was no fear that the interest would be swallowed up in meeting defalcations, as dishonesty in the post office was quite an exception. Year by year the deductions from the guarantee fund on account of the losses sustained were lessening. Also there was hardly any need to meet the demands from the guarantee fund, because every subordinate gave security, either in cash or by a bond. The Empire Life Assurance Company issued guarantee bonds up to the amount of ten times an officer's salary, and these held good for ten years. After ten years' approved service a man was exempted from furnishing any further security.

75,585. Mr. MURTRIE considered that interchangeability as between Postmasters and Superintendents would make for efficiency. Men working in the Postmasters' line gained very little experience of a Superintendents' work. In the same way a Superintendent had little opportunity of making himself acquainted with postal traffic. If both appointments were interchangeable, when men reached the top, they would be good all-round men. Mr. CAPTAIN, on the other hand, considered that in the present circumstances interchangeability would not make for efficiency, because Postmasters were recruited exclusively from the subordinate ranks, and when a Postmaster reached gazetted rank he was fairly advanced in age, and not active enough to take charge of a division, and he would not care for the change. He thought the two branches should be kept in watertight compartments. Mr. CLERICI did not see any need for interchangeability as matters were working all right now. To this Mr. MURTRIE replied that the younger Postmasters were in favour of interchangeability, and this feeling would grow stronger, if the suggestion for the direct recruitment of first class Postmasters was adopted. At present, when a Superintendent reached high office, he had only seen the work in his own line, and knew nothing of the work of a Postmaster.

75,586. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) Mr. MURTRIE thought both Postmasters and Superintendents suffered by not knowing each other's work. Promotions to Deputy Postmaster-Generalships were made mostly from the Superintendents, and if Postmasters qualified as Superintendents they would have a better chance of being promoted to the higher appointments. Out of 171 Superintendents the records showed that 34 began life as Postmasters, whilst out of 35 gazetted Postmasters 6 were Superintendents, so that there was interchangeability to some extent already.

75,587. The question of travelling allowances was very much affected by the rule with regard to the day being counted from midnight to midnight. If officers travelled by rail, they received a free pass and a single fare. If they travelled by road, they received mileage, limited to the diem allowance of Rs. 4, unless the journey was beyond twenty miles, when the allowance was eight annas a mile. The officers would be satisfied with either an alteration of the rule governing the twenty-four hours halt, or an increase in the day allowance or the mileage allowance. There were many incidental expenses such as bullock-carts, tongas, coolies and expenses of meals at refreshment rooms, and also their servants had to be paid for. As a rule a Superintendent made out a programme, for three months, and moved from one post office to another as far as possible, but very often circumstances arose which compelled him to change his dates. It paid an officer much better to go a long distance to a post office than to take a short journey. At a head post office it might be necessary to stay a week, and then the officer could draw Rs. 4 for each day's stay, but that only happened once in six months.

75,588. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Mr. CAPTAIN said that all probationary Superintendents were attached to a head post office for about six months to learn post office work, so that they had a fair knowledge of a Postmaster's work, sufficient to enable them to do the duties of a Postmaster satisfactorily. Head post offices were also inspected by Superintendents twice a year. A probationary Superintendent would not give so much attention to accounts as a probationer who was destined for a Postmastership. For the gazetted Postmasters there were places ranging from Rs. 300 to Rs. 800, whilst the pay in the Superintendents' ranks ranged from Rs. 200 to 600. The higher posts of the Postmasters were not given to Superintendents, but were kept exclusively for the Postmasters. There were many Superintendents who did not wish to be Postmasters, and many Postmasters, who did not like, and were not qualified, to be Superintendents. The qualifications for the two officers were quite different. A Postmaster's work was mostly sedentary and he had not to act in sudden emergencies as a Superintendent often had to do. Unless the system of recruiting Postmasters was radically changed, interchangeability was bound to be a failure. There were instances in which officers, appointed as Superintendents, had been found unsuitable, and had been drafted into the Postmasters' line, and occasionally, if the Director-General saw that a Postmaster was a competent and active man, he would draft him into the Superintendents' line. He did not mean that both branches should be absolutely watertight, but that interchangeability should be allowed only in exceptional cases at the discretion of the Director-General.

75,589. Under the old system of appointing probationary Postmasters, the Postmaster-General selected a suitable man from amongst the applicants who came forward. Sometimes a man who applied for a Superintendent's appointment and who was considered by the Postmaster-General to be unsuitable for that appointment was offered the post of a probationary Postmaster. The posts were not advertised.

75,590. Inspectors were appointed from the ranks of subordinate Postmasters and clerks in post offices, and to a very limited number by direct recruitment. In the Bombay Circle the pay of Inspectors was Rs. 60, Rs. 80 and Rs. 100. When a man reached the grade of Rs. 40 as a Sub-postmaster or clerk, if the Divisional Superintendent thought he was likely to make a good Inspector, he recommended him to the Postmaster-General, and the Postmaster-General might appoint him. After working for a few years he might be allowed, if competent, to go up for the Superintendent's examination, and on passing the test might, in exceptional circumstances, be appointed Superintendent. Otherwise after reaching the grade of Rs. 100, he remained there until all his juniors came up to the grade and then went to the Postmasters' line on Rs. 100 or Rs. 150, if young enough for promotion.

75,591. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) Mr. CAPTAIN said, that in making the selection of Superintendents or Postmasters, the Postmaster-General was not assisted in any way by the deputies, unless the Postmaster-General knew that the Deputy had seen the man and knew him. There was no hard and fast rule with regard to educational qualifications, but it was generally insisted that an Indian should be a graduate. Directly appointed men were recruited usually between the ages of twenty-one and twenty-five. Superintendents recruited from the department had an age limit of thirty-five years

75,592. There was no rule prohibiting interchangeability, but in practice Superintendents and Postmasters were kept separate. A young man usually took his degree in the Bombay University between the ages of twenty and twenty-three and the Cambridge senior examination between eighteen and twenty.

75,593. Mr. MURTRIE said that for the Anglo-Indian recruit an education up to the Cambridge senior was good enough, because the field of selection was small, and a concession had to be made in their case. He would not say that a man who had taken the Cambridge senior would be fit to compete for a degree with any chance of success.

75,594. (*Sir Theodore Morison.*) Mr. MURTRIE said there was no difference between a first class Postmaster and a gazetted Postmaster.

75,595. Mr. CAPTAIN said that, when a Postmaster reached the Rs. 200 grade, he entered an all-India list. Up to Rs. 200 he was on a Provincial list. He did not mean that a probationary Postmaster should be appointed a gazetted Postmaster on the completion of his probationary period, but that he should be drafted into the ranks of second class Postmasters, and remain in that rank for about five or ten years before going into the gazetted rank. The pay of a probationary Superintendent should be Rs. 150, and that of a probationary Postmaster Rs. 100. A probationary Postmaster need not be an honours graduate, but probationary Superintendents might be. There were many honours graduates from the Indian Universities in the service now, men who had taken first class and second class degrees. The present class of recruit was suitable for the work, and he would admit

that, if the work was efficiently done now, there was no advantage in having a better personnel.

75,596. Mr. MURTRIE said the fact that a bond was required from Postmasters reduced the necessity for having a guarantee fund to meet losses, because the company, which issued the bond, paid for losses up to the extent of the bond, if a fraud was proved against the individual, who had given it. There were not a large number of cases in which the loss could not be traced to any individual, and the department bore such losses.

75,597. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) Mr. CAPTAIN said that the rule that 10 per cent. of the appointments of Superintendents should be reserved for non-domiciled Europeans had been in existence for at least twenty years. It was made for special classes of work, such as field service, and service in frontier provinces, where non-domiciled Europeans were considered to be more suitable. He believed the Anglo-Indian and the Indian Superintendents could do the work satisfactorily. The non-domiciled European was quite ignorant of the vernacular, and therefore could not do the work as well as a man recruited in India. Another objection was that, he was recruited straight into the grade of Rs. 200 and placed above men recruited in India, and he did not go through the same training as Superintendents recruited in India.

75,598. (*Mr. Rose.*) Mr. CAPTAIN believed there were men who would not join the service, if they were recruited on one list for Postmasters and Superintendents, as some came in purely for the Superintendents' line. There were Postmasters getting from Rs. 100 to Rs. 200, and also Postmasters on Rs. 300 and upwards. Their duties in the main were the same, but the importance of the offices differed. The duties of Postmasters on Rs. 300 and upwards were more like those of second class Postmasters than those of Superintendents. Postmasters on Rs. 300 and upwards had Superintendents' powers with regard to their own office, and in some cases town offices were under them. In some cases it might happen that a good man, who could not obtain a Superintendent's appointment, would take a Postmastership, but others would rather join other departments than work as Postmasters.

75,599. Candidates recruited from outside the department would have to have some educational qualification, a good physique and certain social qualifications. For a Superintendent more importance should be attached to social qualifications than for Postmasters, because the Postmaster had not to mix with the district officers to the same extent. The nature of the work compelled a Superintendent to mix with the Commissioner, Collectors, Assistant Collectors, Engineers, Superintendents of Police, Forest officers, etc. Mr. MURTRIE did not agree that a Superintendent was a better man than a first class Postmaster. A first class Postmaster had to be as resourceful a man as a Superintendent. Mr. CLERICI said that a first class Postmaster had much more routine work than a Superintendent. The Postmaster had to deal with a number of men on the spot, whereas a Superintendent had his men scattered about in two or three districts. Mr. CAPTAIN said that the Cambridge senior and the Matriculation should be the lowest educational qualification for the domiciled community, but if any other suitable standard was introduced he would have no objection to it. Mr. CLERICI thought it was not necessary to have a fixed standard for the domiciled community. Mr. CAPTAIN said that the request for an increase of pay for Superintendents was justified on the ground that the cost of living had risen all round, and that pay which was suitable thirty or forty years ago was not now sufficient. Mr. CLERICI said that the work was also growing more difficult and was of a much higher standard. Mr. MURTRIE said he had no figures to show that the calls on the guarantee fund were lessening, but he found from the annual reports that they were somewhat less than they were in years past. Mr. CLERICI pointed out that the interest on the fund was growing, and that therefore the demands must be less. Mr. MURTRIE said that the fund might be disposed of according to the suggestions in the written statement, but if that could not be done it might be donated to Government to form the nucleus of the money needed for building a post office at the Imperial Capital, with a rotunda to hold the records of the history of the post office in India.

The witnesses withdrew.

R. T. GIBBS, Esq., Director and Superintending Engineer of Telegraphs, Bombay and Central Circles, called and examined.

(*Mr. R. T. Gibbs was examined upon the corporate written statement put in by Messrs. Streatfeild-James and Thomas—vide paragraphs* 75,269–78.)

75,600. (*Lord Ronaldshay.*) Witness said he came out from Cooper's Hill in 1886, and was appointed an Assistant Superintendent, and went through the various grades of the department. He was appointed Director and Superintending Engineer of Telegraphs, third class, last year. He agreed with the general memorandum, which had been put in, subject to a few modifications.

75,601. Under the proposed scheme of amalgamation the engineering branch was responsible for the construction and maintenance of telegraph lines. Given a sufficient number of trained officers, it would prove a success and give an efficient service. It was already an improvement over the circle scheme in that it allowed officers to concentrate their energies on engineering matters, without their time being taken up by going into traffic details. The life of an engineering officer was a very strenuous one. He had to be continually on tour, and could seldom halt for more than one day at any one place. The posts in his division covered 5,400 miles, and he had only two officers under him.

75,602. With regard to the traffic branch he could not speak with any certainty, but he thought that under the new scheme there was bound to be a certain loss of efficiency. It appeared to be a retrograde step to give the charge of that branch almost entirely to promoted subordinates. Such officers could not exercise as good a control over the staff as the officers were able to do under the old system. Before the circle scheme came into force in 1910 officers were posted at all the more important stations from a traffic point of view, and had a very close control over the staff at their head-quarters offices. When the circle scheme was introduced all officers were concentrated at the most important stations, and there was a loss of efficiency and control. The Telegraph Masters had no superiors near at hand to whom to refer in cases of difficulty. Under the amalgamation scheme he thought matters would not be better. The traffic officers would have far larger areas than they had before, and would have to rely on the Telegraph Masters to a much greater extent than under the circle scheme.

75,603. His suggestion was to bring out officers from the British post office, after ten years' service in England, to serve in India for a period of two years at Rs. 600 or Rs. 1,000 a month. If they could not be obtained at Rs. 600, terms would have to be made with them which might might amount to as much as Rs. 1,000. They would not be on any cadre, and they would simply revert to the British post office at the end of the time. Practically they would be in India on deputation.

75,604. An English training was very necessary for engineering officers as there were no adequate facilities in India for electrical instruction. In future there would be still greater difficulty in training officers in India, because electrical science was going ahead very rapidly, and all the best trained officers would be men trained in Europe. He attributed this difficulty both to the deficiencies of the Indian Engineering Colleges, and to the lack of facilities for studying applied electrical engineering in India. He

was acquainted with the standard taught at Rurki, and did not think it was adequate. There was no chance of seeing large electrical works in India, such as wireless telegraphy, large telephone exchanges, or cable work. At the age of eighteen a native of India should go, either to an English University, or to an English Engineering College, and take the regular course prescribed for an Electrical Engineer, and pass the B.Sc. If that were done, he would see no objection to half the recruitment being in England and half in India.

75,605. He recommended the promotion of subordinates to the amount only of one-eighth. He did not think it followed that, if more chances of promotion were given to Deputy Superintendents, a better class of men would be obtained. The experience officers obtained as Deputy Superintendents was valuable to them, and qualified them for the higher grades of the service, but he was of opinion that promotion to the extent of one-fourth for them would be too much.

75,606. He did not distrust pure nomination but preferred an open competitive examination in order to ensure the best stamp of man being obtained. A certain number of nominated men had come from England since Cooper's Hill closed, and there were six men in the service at present who had not come from Cooper's Hill. He did not think that his scheme of selecting candidates, after they had passed a competitive examination, would lead to invidious distinctions. The needs of the departments were so great that the best stamp of man had to be obtained, and that could only be done by selecting from those who had passed the competitive test.

75,607. In order that engineering officers might be thoroughly trained they should be given six months' study leave every three years, until they became Superintendents. The six months would consist of three months' privilege leave, and three months on deputation, and Government should pay the fare one way and the officer the other. He did not think six months every three years was too long a period for a man to be absent from his work.

75,608. If the Head Telegraph Officer's salary was raised to Rs. 3,000 he did not think he could still press for the Director-Generalship.

75,609. A time-scale was preferable to a graded scale.

75,610. He had read the written statement sent in by the members of the Provincial service, but did not agree with it, and he did not think there was any real grievance in the department. Certainly the Provincial officer had no ground for complaining of the manner in which he was treated by the Imperial officers. The term Provincial service might well be abolished, and the pay might be raised.

75,611. There was no justification for a man recruited in India claiming the same pay as the man recruited from Europe, as the Indian-recruited man had no expense in the way of sending his family to England or of going to England himself. He would not object to the pay being made the same, and a foreign service allowance being given to men recruited in England, and that might mitigate any feeling which might exist in the Provincial service.

75,612. There was some difficulty in obtaining leave, and this was due to the shortage of officers produced by the failure to recruit pending the introduction of the amalgamation scheme. But there was no acute grievance.

75,613. If retirement was allowed after twenty years' service, a man might then be about forty-one years of age, and this was rather young for him to draw a pension from the State. Few, however, would take advantage of the opportunity, as it would not be worth their while to do so. But the possibility of being able to retire on pension after twenty years' service should not lightly be thrown away, and the possibility appealed to men to join the department. There had, in practice, been very few cases in which men had retired after twenty years.

75,614. The pension asked for of 700*l.*, after thirty years' service, should be on a non-contributory basis, as in India men could save nothing from their pay, whilst in England it was impossible to make both ends meet on 437*l.* 10*s.*, which was the ordinary pension of a man of over twenty-five years' service. The Indian Medical Service had 700*l.*, and the Telegraph Department, like the Indian Medical Service were liable to be called upon for service in the field.

75,615. The difficulty of obtaining houses varied very much in different localities. In giving transfer allowances an officer's family should be recognised, and a reasonable amount of effects allowed for.

75,616. The Provident Fund did not take the place of commutation of pension, and the officers desired power to commute a portion of their pension without any of the restrictions which were now imposed.

75,617. (*Mr. Abdur Rahim.*) The only facility in Bombay for studying electrical engineering was the Tata Electrical scheme, which would be opened shortly. At present it was only at Rurki and Sibpur that instruction in electrical engineering could be obtained, and at Sibpur subordinates were also educated. The training at Rurki and Sibpur was not sufficient, and for a long time to come it would be necessary for students to go to England.

75,618. He agreed with the principle that men doing the same work should be given the same pay, but he thought the Sate should take into consideration the expenses to which an officer might be put. He would not, however, carry that so far as to say that the Government would be justified in paying members of aristocratic families higher salaries than were paid to officers belonging to other families. The expenses of a European in India were not on the same footing. They were inherent in their position as exiles from their own country.

75,619. (*Mr. Chaubal.*) He was in favour of an officer being paid what he would receive in his own country, plus a certain amount for serving in a foreign country.

75,620. (*Sir Murray Hammick.*) The best men for the department would be men who were educated in England, and afterwards chosen by the selection board. He would have no selection in India, so that an Indian would have to go to England for training. He would insist upon Indians being educated in England up to the B.Sc., which should be taken in some good University.

75,621. A certain minimum of Europeans was necessary in the telegraph department, and the question of pay depended entirely upon what the best Europeans would take to come out to India.

75,622–77,743. (*Mr. Talbot.*) It was not correct to say that the reason why not more than two Postmaster-Generalships were provided for the telegraph department was that no more than two officers could be found who were duly qualified. The only telegraph officer who had been tried was admittedly successful, and there were other telegraph officers who were just as capable. Young civilians were appointed Postmasters-General without any special training, whereas telegraph officers had a thorough knowledge of their own department, and as telegraph traffic would be amongst the duties of future Postmasters-General, telegraph officers would seem to be eminently fitted for the appointment.

The witness withdrew.

LIST OF APPENDICES.

I. CORRESPONDENCE relating to the SCHEME for the PERMANENT AMALGAMATION of the POSTAL and TELEGRAPH SERVICES in INDIA; viz.:—

(i) Despatch from the Government of India to the Secretary of State for India, No. 324, Finance Department, dated Simla, 30th October 1913.

(ii) Despatch from the Secretary of State for India to His Excellency the Right Honourable the Governor-General of India in Council, Telegraph, No. 5, dated India Office, London, 6th March 1914.

(iii) Government of India Resolution No. 3062—3066-101 (Department of Commerce and Industry, Post and Telegraph Establishments), dated Simla, the 24th April 1914.

II. EXTRACT from the GAZETTE OF INDIA of the 20th September 1913, regarding the POST OFFICE GUARANTEE FUND.

III. LETTER from the DIRECTOR-GENERAL of POSTS and TELEGRAPHS, No. 168 P.G., dated Calcutta, 11th March 1914, regarding the POST OFFICE GUARANTEE FUND.

IV. STATEMENT of the CIVIL APPOINTMENTS on Rs. 200 a month and over held by EUROPEANS, ANGLO-INDIANS, and INDIANS, on the 1st April 1913, in the POST OFFICE of INDIA.

V. STATEMENT of the CIVIL APPOINTMENTS on Rs. 200 a month and over held by EUROPEANS, ANGLO-INDIANS, and INDIANS, on the 1st April 1913, in the TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT.

VI. INDIAN TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT: NOTICE REGARDING FUTURE RECRUITMENT.

VII. OFFICIALS and NON-OFFICIALS who furnished WRITTEN EVIDENCE to the ROYAL COMMISSION in connection with their INQUIRY into the POST OFFICE of INDIA and TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT, but who were not ORALLY EXAMINED.

APPENDIX I.

(Referred to in paragraphs 75,146 and 75,152–3—Mr. Maxwell's Evidence.)

CORRESPONDENCE relating to the SCHEME for the permanent AMALGAMATION of the POSTAL AND TELEGRAPH SERVICES in INDIA.

(i) *Despatch from the Government of India to the Secretary of State for India, No. 324, Finance Department, dated Simla, the 30th October 1913.*

MY LORD MARQUESS,

IN our despatch No. 39 (Telegraph Establishment), dated the 13th July 1911, we submitted for Your Lordship's approval a proposal for the combination of our Post and Telegraph Departments under a single head, and we explained that this proposal was a preliminary step towards the amalgamation of those two great Departments, an object which Lord Morley, in his despatch No. 24–Telegraph, dated the 3rd December 1909, desired us to keep steadily in view, taking into consideration the advantages from the points of view of administration, public convenience and economy which might be derived from such amalgamation.

2. As a further step in the same direction, following upon a suggestion made by Your Lordship, we introduced during last year a scheme of experimental amalgamation in the Bombay and Central Circles (to which Your Lordship's assent was conveyed in your Telegraph despatch No. 21, dated the 16th August 1912), and this arrangement has since continued in operation.

3. After a few months' experience of the working of this experimental amalgamation, our late Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs submitted in November last a complete scheme for the amalgamation of the two Departments throughout India, and we have now the honour to forward the scheme for Your Lordship's approval. Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson has formulated his proposals with the greatest thoroughness and the most complete mastery of his subject, but we have thought it desirable in this despatch to recapitulate in a more concise form the main points at issue, which we shall endeavour to do in the following paragraphs.

4. The fundamental principles of the scheme are the separation of the engineering and traffic work of the Telegraph Department, the transfer of the latter to the control of Postmasters-General, and the recruitment of engineers for engineering work only and of traffic officers for traffic work only. Under the existing organization, the administrative and executive officers of the Telegraph Department are responsible for both engineering and traffic work, the latter occupying rather more than half of their time. Under the present proposals, telegraph traffic will be transferred to the control of Postmasters-General, who will be assisted in the discharge of their new and additional duties by a group of officers of different degrees of importance and occupying positions corresponding to those of the officers performing analogous duties in the Post Office. These officers will be provided by the reduction in the present numbers of the administrative and executive officers of the Telegraph Department, which will become possible when the latter no longer have to deal with traffic work as well as engineering. Their relief from traffic duties and specialisation in engineering will enable these latter to take over a part of the duties now performed by the superior officers of the Technical Branch, the strength of which will thus become susceptible of some reduction.

5. It will be convenient now to give a summary of the details of the proposed organisation. The present constitution of the Post Office is not affected by the proposals, except in so far as the Director-General of that Department will become also the permanent (as he is now the provisional) head of the Telegraph Department. (This will involve a slight amendment of the Post Office and Telegraph Acts, which will be undertaken in due course.) Under his control, in connection with telegraphs, in the Telegraph Department, will be three branches—Engineering, Traffic, and Technical. A separate Traffic Branch exists already, but it consists only of a small group of Deputy Superintendents—56 in number—and the greater portion of the subordinate staff; and the fact that the engineering staff will in future undertake no traffic duties makes it necessary to provide for a considerable strengthening of the Traffic Branch. Similarly, a Technical Branch consisting of one Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, five Electrical Engineers, six Deputy Superintendents, and 34 subordinates is already in existence; but, as explained above, a part of its duties will in future be taken over by the engineering

staff, and the Technical Branch will consist only of subordinates working under the orders of the engineers. The Engineering Branch, on the other hand, will be, in effect, a new creation. It will be formed by selection from the present administrative and executive grades of the Telegraph Department, but will be considerably less numerous, since these officers at present deal with traffic as well as engineering work.

6. The proposed constitution of the Engineering and Technical Branches is described in detail in paragraph 15 of our late Director-General's letter, to which we beg to invite Your Lordship's attention. The total sanctioned strength of the superior staff of the Indian Telegraph Department, as sanctioned in Lord Morley's despatch No. 24 (Telegraph), dated the 3rd December 1909, consists of 96 officers exclusive of a Superintendent of Workshops and a Chief Storekeeper. Of these, six officers formed the headquarters staff, viz., the Director-General, two Directors for Traffic and Construction, respectively, and three Assistant Superintendents; and the remaining 90 officers were employed in the traffic and construction work of the Department or in the Technical Branch. There are in addition 78 Deputy Superintendents engaged in engineering and technical duties. It will be seen that the Director-General proposes that the staff for the engineering and technical branches, which will be relieved of all traffic duties, should be reduced to 111 inclusive of a Chief Engineer and his assistant and a personal assistant to the Director-General, but exclusive of the Superintendent of Telegraph Workshops and the Chief Storekeeper. We are of opinion that no further reduction can safely be made in this direction. Out of this total of 111 officers, the Director-General proposes that the "superior service" should consist of 46 appointments, which is less by four, approximately, than the number admissible for 28 administrative and executive appointments under the proportion adopted in the reorganisation of the Department in 1910. This small saving is obtained by dispensing with the usual leave reserve, which, the Director-General explains, is unnecessary in the Department owing to the fact that there are, below the superior service, a number of Deputy Superintendents performing functions precisely similar to those discharged by the junior members of the superior service, for whom these Deputy Superintendents will, as required, be appointed to officiate, without receiving acting promotion in rank—the total number of officers present on duty always being maintained at the sanctioned strength by the appointment, when necessary, of additional Deputy Superintendents in the lowest grade. The present sanctioned strength of the superior service being 96, the Director-General's proposals will involve a reduction, in this line, of 50 appointments. The questions of the pay and method of recruitment of the Engineering and Technical Branches will be referred to in a later paragraph.

7. Turning now to the subject of Telegraph traffic, we would invite a perusal of paragraphs 17–21 of the Director-General's letter, which explain in detail the constitution of the proposed superior Traffic Branch, to be organised to assist Postmasters-General in the control of telegraph traffic which they will take over from the hands of Telegraph Directors. It is proposed to give each of the eight Postmasters-General an Assistant of the same rank as a Deputy Postmaster-General in the sister Department. The most important telegraph offices, viz., those at Calcutta, Bombay, and Madras will be entrusted to the control of officers of the same rank, while the five offices next in importance, viz., Agra, Rangoon, Lahore, Karachi, and Delhi will be under the supervision of a class of officers to be created, corresponding, approximately, to Superintendents of Post Offices. The first four of the above offices are at present in charge of Telegraph Superintendents (who draw from Rs. 850 to Rs. 1,250 a month), and the last four are now under Deputy Superintendents in the existing Traffic Branch of the Telegraph Department (a class of officers in increments' grades rising from Rs. 250 to Rs. 500). The raising of the status of the officers henceforward to be in charge of these officers is due to the fact that, under the new scheme, the control of all town departmental offices is to be transferred to the officers in charge of the central telegraph offices. The remaining appointments in the new Traffic Branch will consist of three officers at the headquarters of the Director-General, 19 Assistants to the Chief Traffic officers in Postmasters-General's offices, and an Assistant to each of the officers in charge of the telegraph offices at Calcutta and Bombay.

The 19 officers referred to above will be constantly engaged in the inspection of subordinate offices, a task which will involve a large amount of touring; and the growing size and importance of the principal telegraph offices will make the work of the Superior Traffic Branch altogether more arduous nnd responsible than that of the staff at present employed in traffic work.

The new branch will be under Postmasters General, and the Director-General will be assisted in the control of the work of the branch by an officer whom Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson proposed to style "Deputy "Director-General of the Post Office of India, Traffic," but for whom we (agreeing with the present Director-General) prefer the designation "Deputy Director-"General of Telegraph Traffic," as indicating more precisely the nature of his duties in the Director-General's office.* This officer, who will replace the existing Director of Traffic, will be assisted at headquarters by two officers, who will be styled, respectively, "Assistant Director-General of Telegraph Traffic," and "Assistant to the Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic." The result is a total of 40 appointments in the special or superior Traffic Branch, five of which are at present filled by Deputy Superintendents in the ordinary Traffic Branch (whose number will consequently be reduced from 56 to 51), and the final effect of the proposals regarding the three branches of engineering, technical and traffic work, is shown in the latter part of paragraph 20 of the Director-General's letter to be a net reduction of 28 appointments in the total sanctioned strength of the gazetted staff of the Telegraph Department.

Here also the scale of staff proposed does not provide for a reserve for leave and other contingencies, and acting appointments in the lowest grades of the Superior Traffic branch or of Deputy Superintendents will have to be made to maintain the total number of officers present on duty at the sanctioned strength. We have dwelt at some length on the constitution of the new Traffic Branch, in order to bring out as clearly as possible the considerations which have led to the proposal to introduce special conditions of pay and recruitment for this branch, to which we shall refer again in paragraph 13 below.

8. It will be seen that the Director-General proposes to have the following officers at headquarters to assist him in the control of the Telegraph Department: a Chief Engineer with his assistant, an Engineering Personal Assistant to the Director-General, a Deputy Director-General for Traffic with his assistant, and an Assistant Director-General for Traffic. These, combined with the Post Office headquarters staff (which consists of 2 Deputy Directors-General, 4 Assistant Directors-General, and 2 Personal Assistants) make a total of 15 officers at headquarters. We were at first disposed to regard this staff as somewhat excessive, but further consideration has led us to modify our opinion. The proposed strength of the headquarters staff is the same as at present, owing to the fact that it was found necessary early last year to increase the staff of superior telegraph officers in the Director-General's office by abolishing a division, and attaching the Superintendent of Telegraphs, thus set free to assist the Director of Traffic in place of the Assistant Superintendent provided in the reorganisation of 1910. Two Deputy Superintendents employed in the Director-General's office were also replaced early last year by a single Deputy Superintendent, holding a temporary appointment created by us, with the title

* Corresponding alterations will be made, where necessary, in the designations of the other Traffic officers specified in paragraph 23 of the Director-General's letter.

of Assistant Director of Traffic. When the amalgamation is introduced, the services of both these officers will still be required, since the fluctuating character of traffic work renders necessary a considerable amount of centralised supervision to arrange, in the interests of economy, for the due distribution of staff to meet local variations in the amount of traffic, and the proposals do not involve any increase in the number of officers at headquarters. The extra expense of the headquarters staff is accounted for partly by the high salary proposed for the Chief Engineer. It must, however, be remembered that this appointment will represent not only the post of Director of Construction on the present headquarters staff, but also the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs, which it is now proposed to abolish. Moreover, fully half the work now done by the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief will in future be performed by the Chief Engineer, and if in comparing the cost of the present and the proposed headquarters staff, allowance is made for half the pay of the former office, the result is a small saving.

We realise that the control of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department, which are constantly in direct communication with corresponding administrations in different parts of the Empire and foreign countries, necessitates much centralisation of work. We recommend, therefore, the Director-General's proposals in this regard for Your Lordship's sanction, subject to our undertaking to examine the position afresh after two years' time, with a view to considering whether in the light of the experience which will have been gained, any reduction can be effected in the staff at headquarters.

9. The pay and allowances proposed for the new appointments are clearly set forth in paragraphs 26-36 of the Director-General's letter, and we consider his proposals to be suitable throughout and recommend them for Your Lordship's sanction. This is subject to the remark that some of the officers for whom Calcutta house allowances are proposed will probably have their headquarters eventually fixed at Delhi, and such officers will then cease to draw the allowances. It is also necessary to explain that the rates of pay proposed for Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, and for Deputy Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering (*vide* paragraphs 30 and 31 of the Director-General's letter) are those sanctioned in Your Lordship's despatches No. 24-Tel., dated the 3rd December, 1909, and No. 10-Tel., dated the 3rd May 1912, respectively.

We have shown, in paragraph 7 above, that the duties and responsibilities which will devolve upon the second division of the new Traffic Branch are of an exceptional character, and we support the proposal to introduce a special time-scale of pay in their favour, the effect of which will be to give them an average salary of Rs. 458 per mensem, the average pay enjoyed by the ordinary Traffic Branch being Rs. 359 per mensem. The further reasons adduced by the Director-General in the latter part of paragraph 35 of his letter constitute an additional justification for the proposed time scale.

10. We attach to this letter a statement showing in tabular form the proposed organization of the Telegraph Department, the various branches being clearly distinguished from one another, and their designations and scales of pay specified. This conspectus will, we trust, make the general outline of the scheme more readily comprehensible.

11. It will be observed that, whereas there are at present in the Telegraph Department 11 appointments carrying a pay in excess of that of the executive grades (the maximum of which is Rs. 1,250 per mensem in the cases of the Imperial Service and Rs. 850 in the case of the Provincial Service), there will be only five such appointments for some time, and, ultimately, four when the new Deputy Director-Generalship is called up from the Traffic Branch. This would adversely affect the position of officers now in the service were some steps not taken to protect their interests. We are pledged by the declarations made in our Resolutions of 1910 and 1912, announcing the reorganisation of the Department and the improvement in its conditions of service, to guarantee to officers now in the Department a position and prospects after the amalgamation not worse than those which they have hitherto enjoyed. In fulfilment of this guarantee, we recommend that the scales of pay now attached to the eleven administrative appointments above referred to, be continued in force so long as there remain in the Department any officers who would, but for the amalgamation, have risen to enjoy them.

12. This proposal is, however, subject to an important restriction. It will be seen that, after taking into account the actual strength of the Department as compared with its sanctioned strength, and the retirements which will take place before the introduction of the scheme, and after providing for the distribution of the new appointments among the existing staff in the manner proposed in paragraph 43 of the Director-General's letter, there remains a surplus of fourteen officers for whom no appointments can suitably be provided in the Department after the introduction of the proposed scheme. Of the 14 surplus officers one, Mr. Elrington, has retired; a second, Mr. Streatfeild-James, retires in the ordinary course in April next; a third, Mr. Overton, is likely to retire at the end of his present leave; and a fourth officer will probably be required for employment in a State Railway telegraph appointment which is now under consideration. Ten officers must, therefore, be induced to retire under conditions which will not afford a ground for reasonable complaint. The Director-General in paragraph 46 of his letter proposes, with this object in view, to offer special pensions on conditions similar to those which were sanctioned, in the case of the Public Works Department in 1887, by Viscount Cross in his despatch No. 13-Tel., dated the 25th August 1887. To this proposal we would add the further recommendation that officers retiring on these special pensions should further be permitted to avail themselves of any leave that might be due to them. We make this recommendation because we consider it of the utmost importance that the inducements to retire should be effectual in the required number of cases.

The premature retirement of a large number of officers, who will be among the senior officers of the Department, would, however, give unduly accelerated promotion to the remaining officers unless some artificial bar were introduced to confine promotion to its normal course. The Director-General proposes, therefore, in paragraph 37 of his letter, to restrict the enjoyment, after amalgamation is effected, of the existing higher rates of pay by the imposition of a time-limit upon promotion to those rates, in the manner described in the table contained in the paragraph referred to. As the Director-General explains, the existing organisation of the Department is of too recent a date to admit of a correct calculation of the probable decrement rate and prospects of promotion; he has, therefore, taken the cases of a few officers now in the Department, the dates of whose promotion to higher grades can be forecasted with reasonable certainty, and has adopted the average rate thus ascertained in fixing the periods of service at which officiating and permanent promotion to the various grades may suitably be allowed, subject, as hitherto, to the operation of selection.

We have carefully considered alternative methods of protecting the interests of officers now in the Department, while guarding against undue advantages being obtained from enforced retirements, and have come to the conclusion that the device adopted by the Director-General is, in all the circumstances, the best practicable.

We would add that, while we do not wish to attach undue weight to actuarial calculations in such a matter, we have such calculations made in order to compare the normal flow of promotion with that assumed by the Director-General in his proposed time-limits, and the result is exhibited in the subjoined table.

APPENDIX I. *(continued).*

No. of Appointments.	Rate of Pay.	Conditions of Appointment			
		Permanent.		Officiating.	
		Normal.	As proposed by Director-General.	Normal.	As proposed by Director-General.
	Rs.				
1	2,250 Imperial -	Not less than 30 years' service.	Not less than 30 years' service.	Not less than 29 years' service.	Not less than 27 years' service.
	1,800 Provincial -				
2	2,000 Imperial -	Not less than 28 years' service.	Not less than 27 years' service.	Not less than 27 years' service.	Not less than 24 years' service.
	1,600 Provincial -				
3	1,750 Imperial -	Not less than 26 years' service.	Not less than 24 years' service.	Not less than 25 years' service.	Not less than 22 years' service.
	1,400 Provincial -				
4	1,500 Imperial -	Not less than 24 years' service.	Not less than 22 years' service.	Not less than 23 years' service.	Not less than 20 years' service.
	1,200 Provincial -				

Allowing for the operation of selection, we think that the comparison justifies the Director-General's proposals.

There is one further point of which mention must be made in this connection. The time-limits above described have been imposed in restraint of promotion, which would otherwise be unduly accelerated by the premature retirements induced by the offer of special pensions. This cause will cease to operate after a limited number of years, and before the disappearance of all the officers for whose benefit the existing higher rates of pay are proposed to be continued. We consider, however, that the time-limits should remain in force until the end of the period for which the higher rates of pay continue. Considering the liberal and indeed quite exceptional manner in which it is proposed to protect vested interests, and the serious extent to which the prospective economies to be attained by the scheme of amalgamation will be postponed by the continuance of these special rates of pay, we do not consider it unduly severe to maintain a check upon excessively rapid promotion in individual cases.

13. We would next refer briefly to the question of recruitment. This subject has been fully dealt with in paragraph 38 of the Director-General's letter, and we support his proposals that the proportion of officers to be recruited in England for the Engineering Branch should be reduced from five-eighths to one-half, the remaining half being obtained, in equal proportions, by direct recruitment in this country, and by promotions from subordinate ranks. This matter will, however, shortly come under the consideration of the Public Services Commission, and we desire to add that our recommendations in this respect are provisional, and subject to the result of the enquiries made by the Royal Commission.

14. In our letter No. 300 (Financial), dated the 17th October 1912, while proposing the inclusion of a Royal Engineer Officer in the superior service of the Telegraph Department for the charge of wireless stations in India, we explained that that proposal did not involve any extra expenditure in the Department as the superior staff was then below its sanctioned strength. Under the proposed reorganisation, however, this appointment will constitute a net addition to the strength of the superior engineering establishment described in paragraph 6 above, and we take this opportunity of requesting sanction to the continuance of the appointment as a part of that establishment. The extra expenditure involved will be the amount of the pay to which the officer holding the appointment in question will be entitled according to the time-scale referred to in paragraph 2 of our despatch No. 300 Salaries, &c., dated the 17th October 1912.

15. In paragraphs 47 and 48 of his letter the Director-General has proposed a scale of enhanced pensions attainable after a certain term of service in prescribed appointments. We support his proposals in this respect. The corresponding pensions now in force were sanctioned in Your Lordship's Despatch No. 12-Tel., dated the 26th August 1910.

16. There are certain minor matters dealt with in the Director-General's letter, such as the question of his financial powers, and the clerical and menial establishments required after the introduction of the scheme, to which we have not yet been able to devote full consideration, and, in referring to these matters, we would ask that we may be permitted to deal with separately, so far as they lie within our powers, after Your Lordship's orders on the general scheme have been received.

17. The amalgamation scheme, which we have the honour to lay before Your Lordship in this letter, was, in its main features, foreshadowed in paragraph 2 of our Commerce and Industry Department letter No. 39, dated the 13th July 1911. The acutal combination of postal and telegraph functions has not been carried lower down the scale than Postmasters-General, and it would be more correct to describe the scheme as one of redistribution of staff and duties than as one of actual amalgamation. A considerable degree of fusion has already taken place, inasmuch as nearly all combined offices (which represent the larger, and constantly increasing, proportion of telegraph offices throughout the country) are under the control of postal officials. We do not anticipate that any further fusion can take place for many years to come. The scheme exhibits in a striking manner the fundamental distinction between engineering and traffic work, and even the differences between postal and telegraph traffic are so pronounced that there is no prospect at present of the two sets of duties being performed by a common establishment. These considerations do not, however, in our opinion, lessen the advantages which we confidently expect will ensue upon the introduction of the scheme. The experimental amalgamation, introduced last year in the Bombay and Central Circles (upon the lines of which the present proposals proceed), has been favourably received by the public, and the officers engaged in the experiment have testified to its beneficial effects upon both engineering and traffic. Each of these branches of work receives under the new system its due share of attention. The existence of a staff specially devoted to engineering encourages the introduction and application of scientific methods and inventions. We have no doubt, in short, that the administration of the Telegraph Department will become more efficient, and the public convenience

be thus benefited, by the introduction of the proposed scheme.

Financially, as well as administratively, the proposed distribution of duties will tend to economy, and the Director-General in paragraph 58 of his letter estimates the ultimate savings at not less than three and a half lakhs a year, though these anticipated savings will be postponed to a considerable extent by the measures (which we have described in paragraph 12 above) proposed to be taken for the protection of existing interests. In this connection, it is necessary to observe that we have not adopted the figure for the average pay of an Imperial service officer as calculated at the end of paragraph 58 of the Director-General's letter, but have adhered to that shown in Appendix IV, Statement A., to the despatch from Lord Minto's Government, No. 153-Salaries, dated the 1st July 1909. The alteration does not, however, affect the final estimate of the cost of the proposals.

The effect of the proposed scheme upon the personnel of the Department has received our anxious consideration. One measure for the protection of existing interests has been described in paragraph 12 above. Another measure, having the same object, is the proposal (contained in paragraph 31 of the Director-General's letter) to effect the necessary reduction of Deputy Superintendents General, by making it in the lowest grade. The Director-General has expressed his belief that the amalgamation will not excite serious opposition or discontent among the members of either Department, providing that existing interests are adequately protected, and we are prepared to accept this view, though we cannot hope that a scheme of this magnitude can be introduced without giving rise to some individual grievances.

With these remarks we have the honour to commend the scheme for Your Lordship's sanction. We request the favour of early orders, as we are anxious to introduce the scheme with effect from the 1st of April 1914, if it is possible to give the Director-General before that date the necessary time for effecting the preliminary arrangements referred to in paragraph 60 of his letter. A further reason why in our opinion delay beyond the date mentioned above is undesirable, is that recruitment has been stopped pending the receipt of Your Lordship's orders on these proposals.

We have the honour to be,
My Lord Marquess,
Your Lordship's most obedient,
humble Servants,

(Signed) R. W. CARLYLE.
" HARCOURT BUTLER.
" S. A. IMAM.
" W. H. CLARK.
" R. H. CRADDOCK.
" W. S. MEYER.

ENCLOSURE IN ABOVE.

Letter from the Hon'ble SIR CHARLES STEWART WILSON, K.C.I.E., Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs (No. 464-S.G., Simla, the 13th November 1912) To the SECRETARY to the GOVERNMENT of INDIA, Department of Commerce and Industry.

SIR,—I have the honour to refer to the correspondence ending with Mr. Ley's letter No. 4393-101, dated the 7th June 1912, in which the Government of India sanctioned the experimental amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department in the Bombay and Central Circles from the 1st July 1912. In accordance with the instructions contained in paragraph 4 of that letter full details of the experimental arrangements were communicated to the Bombay and Karachi Chambers of Commerce, the Bombay Millowners' Association, the Indian Merchants' Chamber and Bureau and the Bombay Trades Association with a request that I might be favoured not later than the end of October 1912 with the opinion formed by their members regarding the experiment; and the general public were also invited, by means of a Press Communiqué and notices exhibited at all telegraph offices and post offices in the two circles, to communicate before the end of October their views on the success of the experiment. I presume that the remarks of the Government of Bombay and the Chief Commissioner of the Central Provinces on the subject have been communicated direct to the Government of India.

2. **General opinion regarding experimental amalgamation in Bombay and Central Circles.**—I submit for the information of the Government of India copies of the letters received from the public bodies specially addressed (Annexure I)* and also copies of the opinions expressed by the Postmasters-General and the Superintending Engineer, Telegraphs, Bombay and Central Circles, and by the Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs (Annexure II).* from which it would appear that the general opinion in the two circles affected by the experiment is in favour of the scheme of amalgamation. No letters have been received from the general public in response to the invitation mentioned above and it may be assumed, therefore, that the experiment in amalgamation has caused no inconvenience to any one. The references to the question of amalgamating the two departments that have appeared in the press since the experiment was undertaken have been uniformly favourable.

The progress of the experiment has been most carefully watched departmentally and has been freely discussed with all the senior officers and many of the juniors and subordinates of both the departments in my charge. The advantages to be gained from separating the traffic from the engineering work of the Telegraph Department are freely admitted by practically all the officers of that department and it is generally agreed that the separation can best be affected by the application to the whole of India as a permanent measure of the arrangements that have been in force experimentally in the Bombay and Central Circles since the 1st July last. The feeling of opposition to amalgamation on the part of the telegraph staff which, as the Government of India are aware, was in existence at the time of the publication of the Resolution in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 830-833, dated the 24th January 1912, arose from the suspicion that this measure might result in a wholesale reduction of establishment; but, so far as I have been able to ascertain, there would now be no feeling on the part of the officers or the subordinate staff of either the Telegraph Department or the Post Office against the permanent amalgamation of the two departments, provided that the interests and prospects of officers of all grades now serving in the departments are adequately protected.

3. **Effect of combination of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department under a single Director-General.**—Amalgamation on the basis of separating the engineering and traffic branches, if a suitable scheme could be evolved, has already been recognised as desirable by the Government of India, and my experience in the past few months has satisfied me of the correctness of this view. The Government of India should not, in my opinion, hesitate to abandon the existing administrative organisation of the Telegraph Department which is unnecessarily expensive. The Circle Directors have not been required to perform sufficient work of an important nature, on account of the difficulty of decentralising traffic and the failure to delegate powers when possible. This is due to the tendency to centralisation which has long been a characteristic of the Telegraph Department, and the result is that the Directors have not in fact occupied a position corresponding in responsibility to that of a Postmaster-General as was intended, and there has been much unnecessary correspondence between the two departments. The combination of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department under a single Director-General has already resulted in much greater co-operation between the officers of the two departments, in considerable economies under various heads and in a marked reduction of correspondence and clerical labour owing to the various directions in which work has been simplified.

* Not reprinted.

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

In my opinion, therefore, the success of the experiment in the Bombay and Central Circles and the views expressed by the public bodies consulted amply demonstrate that amalgamation in itself is not only desirable but is obviously the proper step to take in the interests both of efficiency and economy. It will undoubtedly lead to greater telegraph and telephone facilities to the public and will also result in an improved telegraph service owing to the closer control which it will be possible to exercise over the traffic arrangements of the department.

4. **General features and advantages of scheme of amalgamation proposed.** — Under the scheme of amalgamation now proposed, which is on the lines suggested by me in 1905 and follows closely the systems in force in the United Kingdon, Holland, Belgium and Italy, both the engineering and the traffic officers of the future will be solely employed on duties for which they are recruited and specially trained, and the dual control of combined offices which now exists will cease.

The inspection of combined offices and the disposal of correspondence connected with the opening, maintenance and closing of such offices will be transferred to Superintendents of post offices, who are now in a position, with the help of a few subordinates having a knowledge of instruments, to supervise and control the entire work of these offices after they are fitted up. It will thus be possible to effect large economies in respect of supervision and inspection and at the same time to provide not only a suitable staff of specially selected officers solely for the supervision and control of the operating establishment of the more important telegraph offices and of the traffic dealt with in those offices, but also an adequate staff of engineers who will be free to devote the whole of their time and energy to telegraph engineering work and to the proper maintenance and efficient working on the lines of the department.

The existing system under which officers and subordinates trained for telegraph engineering are required to spend half their time on traffic duties, which many of them dislike, is far from satisfactory and has led to some laxity of supervision over the work of the line staff, with the result that the maintenance of lines has been somewhat neglected. I am proposing to provide, for engineering work only, a liberal staff of upper subordinates of the rank of Deputy Superintendent, and, with this provision, maintenance work and petty reconstructions will be much more closely supervised than at present. I am confident, therefore, that under the new system engineering as well as traffic work will be performed more efficiently than now.

Another outstanding feature of the scheme is that competent subordinates will, for the first time, be afforded prospects of advancement to well-paid appointments, both in the engineering and in the traffic branches, with the result, we may hope, that the recruitment of telegraphists, which at present is by no means satisfactory, will be greatly stimulated and improved.

Finally, as shown in paragraph 58 of this report, the scheme will result in a large ultimate saving to Government in salaries of staff. The saving shown in that paragraph is likely to be exceeded, as it is anticipated that closer control will result in further savings on stores, stationery and printing as well as on staff and travelling allowances.

5. **Points of difference from the experimental arrangements in the Bombay and Central Circles.** —The scheme has been tested for some months now in the course of the experimental arrangements sanctioned for the Bombay and Central Circles, and the only point in which it is proposed to depart materially from those arrangements is in respect of the transfer to the proposed Engineering Branch of a portion of the work and duties of the superior staff of the present Technical Branch. This transfer was, however, all along intended. It was actually made experimentally in these two circles from the 1st October, and the experience gained since that time shows that the redistribution works well. In my opinion, and in the opinion of the senior officers of the Telegraph Department, including the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief himself, it would be extremely wasteful under the altered conditions to provide a special touring staff of electrical engineers to supervise the maintenance of dynamos and batteries, the adjustment of instruments and apparatus, the provision and maintenance of electric lights and fans, the installation and maintenance of telephones, &c., when such work can be done by the ordinary engineering staff now recruited and trained for this very class of work. Even in the case of the smaller wireless telegraph stations the ordinary engineering staff is capable of supervising their erection, maintenance and working and special assistance would usually be necessary only in the case of the establishment of new high-power stations. When the engineers are relieved entirely of traffic duties, there is no reason why they should not undertake all the work ordinarily falling within the scope of electrical engineering, and they are anxious that these classes of work should be allotted to them. I have accordingly provided in my proposals for the abolition of the appointment of Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, the reduction of the staff of electrical engineers from five to three, the distribution among the divisions of most of the subordinate staff of the Technical Branch, and the transfer to the divisional engineers and their assistants of all the duties of the present Technical Branch, except research work, the instruction of candidates for appointments in which technical knowledge is required, the conduct of technical examinations, and the testing of instruments at the store depôt at Alipore.

Engineering officers and upper subordinates will be encouraged to avail themselves fully of study leave, and so keep themselves abreast of the progress in electrical science.

I.—STAFF AND DUTIES UNDER THE PROPOSED SCHEME.

(a) Engineering.

6. **Administrative Staff in Circles.**—It has already been indicated in the preceding paragraphs that the fundamental principles of the scheme of amalgamation advocated by me are the separation of the engineering and traffic work of the Telegraph Department, the transfer of the latter to the control of Postmasters-General, and the recruitment of engineers for engineering work only, and of traffic officers for traffic work only. It is generally agreed throughout the Telegraph Department that, roughly speaking, traffic work at present occupies rather more than one half of the time and energy of the administrative and executive officers of the department, and it follows that if this work is handed over to Postmasters-General the present number of administrative appointments in the Telegraph Department must be reduced considerably. Excluding the Directors of Construction and Traffic and the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, whose duties will be dealt with later, the circle scheme provides eight officers of the rank of Director of Telegraphs, each of whom is directly subordinate to the Director-General, for the administration of the Telegraph Department, in respect of both engineering and traffic, in an area co-terminous with a postal circle.

After careful consideration I am of opinion that the administrative control of the purely engineering work of the Telegraph Department should comprise the following four charges :—

I. The Bombay Circle (less the late Karachi Division), and the Central and Madras Circles.

II. The Punjab Circle (with the addition of the late Karachi Telegraph Division) and the United Provinces Circle.

III. The Bengal and Eastern Bengal and Assam Circles (the Provinces of Bengal and Bihar and Orissa and the Administration of Assam).

IV. The Burma Circle.

7. The first three of these charges must, I consider, be placed under officers of the standing of the present Circle Directors, and I am satisfied that their time

will be fully occupied. The officers selected will control the entire engineering staff within the limits of their extensive charges, and be responsible not only for the design, construction and maintenance of telegraph and telephone lines, but also for the first fitting of telegraph offices, the fitting up of telephone exchanges, the erection and maintenance of power plant, and all the other circle work which at present devolves on the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, while they will exercise in respect of these duties all the powers which have been delegated to Circle Directors. The responsibilities and duties of these appointments will therefore be of an onerous nature, and it is necessary that they should be in the hands of senior and experienced officers. It would not not be wise to centralise control of telegraph engineering work at the headquarters of the Director-General, nor could it be placed in the hands of Postmasters-General having no engineering training; but, even if this were not the case, it is essential, in my opinion, that this branch of the amalgamated department shall be so constituted as to provide within itself a sufficiently attractive career for officers appointed to it, and this would not be possible unless engineering work were decentralised in the manner outlined here.

8. In the case of the Burma Circle, however, I propose that, for the present, the local administrative control of telegraph engineering work should be in the hands of the Postmaster-General. This circle cannot conveniently be linked for engineering purposes with any of the other provinces, its postal and telegraph work is light, and can all be undertaken by one officer with engineering knowledge and administrative ability, while the engineering duties alone would not justify the employment of an administrative engineering officer. Again, the conditions prevailing in Burma are such that special treatment under the scheme of amalgamation is demanded in another respect. Over 66 per cent. of the telegraph lines lie away from railways, and travelling along such lines is extremely difficult. At the same time these lines are of considerable importance, and must be carefully inspected at regular intervals by the engineering staff. The number of engineering officers of executive rank provided for Burma is therefore proportionately larger than in the other circles, but in the case of this circle I am proposing (*vide* paragraph 9) that these officers should give some assistance in traffic work. As I shall show elsewhere in this letter it will be possible for some years to come to provide a telegraph engineer as Postmaster-General, Burma, and, by the time this is no longer possible, Burma and Assam may be linked by railway, and a suitable redistribution of the engineering administrative charges can then be made. I have, therefore, thought it unnecessary to provide a separate administrative engineer for Burma after the appointment of Postmaster-General there ceases to be held by a telegraph officer.

9. **Executive Staff and Assistants.** — Directly subordinate to the engineering administrative officers there must be a sufficient number of executive officers to perform, in respect of telegraph engineering work, the functions now vested in Divisional Superintendents. The question of the number of officers required for this purpose has been minutely discussed with each of the present Circle Directors, and, after the most careful consideration of their views, I am of opinion that, to secure efficient supervision and control, there should be 20 charges, in each of which the engineering work should be under the control of an officer of the same standing, and with the same powers as a Divisional Superintendent of Telegraphs under the present system of administration, assisted by a sufficient staff of junior officers. The extent of each charge is shown in the map appended to this letter and the number of attached officers to be provided for each division would be approximately as follows:—

I.—BOMBAY, CENTRAL AND MADRAS CIRCLE.

(*a*) Late Bombay Division and greater portion of late Belgaum Division—Three attached officers, *i.e.*, Assistant Superintendents and Deputy Superintendents, General.

(*b*) Late Ahmedabad Division with small portion of the late Karachi Division and greater portion of late Ajmere Division—Three attached officers.

(*c*) Late Nagpur and Jubbulpore Divisions—Two attached officers.

(*d*) Trichinopoly and Calicut Divisions—Two attached officers.

(*e*) Bangalore Division with portions of Madras Division and late Belgaum Division—Two attached officers.

(*f*) Remainder of Madras Division with whole of Vizagapatam Division—Three attached officers.

II.—PUNJAB AND UNITED PROVINCES CIRCLE.

(*a*) Greater part of late Karachi Division and present Quetta Division—Three attached officers.

(*b*) Amballa Division with portions of Lahore and Bareilly Division—Three attached officers.

(*c*) Remainder of present Punjab Circle—Four attached officers.

(*d*) Remainder of Bareilly Division, with greater portions of Lucknow and Agra Divisions—Three attached officers.

(*e*) Allahabad Division with remainder of Lucknow and Agra Divisions—Two attached officers.

III.—BENGAL AND EASTERN BENGAL AND ASSAM CIRCLE.

(*a*) Greater portion of Calcutta Division with small portion of Dacca Division—Three attached officers.

(*b*) Cuttack Division with greater portion of Bankipore Division and remainder of Calcutta Division—Three attached officers.

(*c*) Darjeeling Division with portion of Bankipore Division—Three attached officers.

(*d*) Remainder of Dacca Division and portion of Chittagong Division—Two attached officers.

(*e*) Shillong Division and remainder of Chittagong Division (Assam Administration) — Three attached officers.

IV.—BURMA CIRCLE.

(*a*) Portion of Rangoon Division and greater portion of Moulmein Division—Two attached officers.

(*b*) Akyab Division and greater portion of remainder of European Division — Three attached officers.

(*c*) Greater portion of Maymyo Division and remainder of Moulmein Division—Two attached officers.

(*d*) Sagaing Division and remainder of Maymyo Division—Three attached officers.

The officers holding charge of these divisions will occupy, as regards engineering and technical work, exactly the same position as that now held by Divisional Superintendents of Telegraphs in respect of engineering and traffic work. In the case of Burma they will, in addition to their engineering duties, continue to be responsible, as already explained, for some of the traffic work which in other circles is to be separated entirely from engineering. This combination of duties will extend to the inspection of all departmental telegraph offices in that province, except Rangoon (with its local departmental offices), Mandalay, Moulmein and Bassein, and to the submission to the Traffic Branch of the Postmaster-General's Office of the inspection reports of these offices. It would have been necessary in any case, as already explained in paragraph 8, to provide a proportionately larger number of engineering divisional charges in Burma than in other circles, and the arrangement of giving divisional engineers a certain amount of traffic work will be economical, for the addition of this work to the duties of these officers will not increase their numbers nor necessitate any special training, while it will save at least one appointment in the superior Traffic Branch and will avoid a great deal of expenditure and waste of time in travelling. The Burma circle is peculiar in regard to the number of isolated offices which, though important, have but little traffic, and the long distances to be covered would render the inspection by separate traffic officers alone of even the more important telegraph offices a matter of con-

siderable difficulty and expense. The retention of as large a number of divisional charges as four in a circle in which there are under the present system only five divisional superintendents is, therefore, in my opinion fully justified.

10. **Administrative Staff at the Headquarters of the Director-General.**—There now remains for consideration, so far as the Engineering Branch is concerned, the question of the staff required to assist the Director-General at headquarters and to fill the various miscellaneous appointments outside the ordinary divisional cadre. At headquarters I propose that there should be a senior engineer corresponding with the present Director of Construction, who, as head of the Engineering Branch, will hold the most highly-paid appointment in the branch. This officer will be the official adviser of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs on all engineering and technical matters and will be responsible under him for the efficient execution and maintenance of all engineering works; for preparing the specifications for, and carrying out mechanical and electrical tests of, all material and stores in connection with which such tests are required; for the control of all expenditure connected with engineering works; and for inspections which will include investigations regarding the execution of works, maintenance of lines, the control of stores, the operations of the workshop and the keeping up of records. The Superintendent of Workshops, who will, as at present, be recruited from outside the ranks of the Telegraph Department, will be directly under his orders.

11. The head of the Engineering Branch, or, as I shall propose later on in this letter to term him, the Chief Engineer, Telegraphs, will require the help of one engineer officer as assistant, and I am of opinion that this officer should be of equal rank with the executive officers in charge of engineering divisions. The Chief Engineer will be frequently absent from headquarters on tour, and it is important that his assistant should be competent to relieve him at all times of the duty of dealing with the less important references on engineering questions. The tenure of the appointment of this assistant must, I consider, be limited to three years, and it would be extremely difficult to find an officer of lower rank than a Superintendent who would possess sufficient experience to be of real help to the Chief Engineer, and at the same time be sufficiently junior to render it possible to retain his services as assistant to the Chief Engineer for any appreciable time without injuring his prospects of promotion to divisional rank. One more telegraph engineer will be required at headquarters as Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, and, for the reasons stated in my letter No. 147*s*—G, dated the 29th May 1912, I recommend that this officer also should be of equal rank with the officers in charge of divisions. The tenure of this appointment also will be limited to three years as at present.

12. **Technical Staff.**—The other superior officers required for the Engineering Branch are those whose duties will include the research and instructional work now performed by the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief and the officers of the Technical Branch. As already stated, I do not propose the abolition of this branch, but merely the allocation to divisions of the Deputy Superintendents and other subordinates now employed on technical duties in the various telegraph offices, and the transfer to the executive telegraph engineers of a great part of the work of the electrical engineers of the present Technical Branch. The duties of the Deputy Superintendents and other subordinates of the Technical Branch now employed directly under the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief at Alipore would remain unchanged. If this transfer of duties is effected, it will be necessary to provide only a sufficient number of technical engineers to assist and advise the Director-General and the Chief Engineer in special technical matters, to carry on research work and test instruments at the store yard at Alipore, to conduct classes for instruction in technical matters and to hold technical examinations. For these purposes I consider that the services of three officers, of whom two should be of the rank of Superintendent of Telegraphs, will be required for six months, while two will be necessary for the remainder of the year. Thus for half the year one of these three officers will be at the disposal of the Director-General for employment on specially important works, such as the fitting of large telephone or telegraph offices, which the local officers could not be expected to undertake. In view of the large amount of instructional work which will devolve upon these officers, especially during the summer months, I recommend that they should be given the assistance of an additional technical Deputy Superintendent, the sanctioned establishment of Deputy Superintendents in the Technical Branch being increased by one appointment for this purpose, making the total strength of Deputy Superintendents and subordinates of lower rank in that branch seven and 34, respectively. Of the seven Deputy Superintendents two will be required at the headquarters of the technical engineers at Alipore, one each at Calcutta, Bombay, Madras and Lahore under the orders of the administrative engineers and one at Rangoon under the orders of the Postmaster-General, Burma. The sanctioned establishment of 34 subordinates is just sufficient to meet existing requirements and will remain unaltered.

13. **Duties of Technical Staff.**—The actual duties of the three technical engineers, assisted by two Deputy Superintendents and one subordinate of the Technical Branch, will be—

(*a*) *Instruction.*—Under this head the technical engineers will be responsible, under the Chief Engineer, for the instruction of classes for candidates for the appointments of Deputy Superintendent in the Engineering Branch and of technical telegraphist. The course prescribed for these classes will ordinarily extend to about six months and will include instruction in repeaters, Wheatstone and Baudot apparatus, oil engines, accumulators, electric lights and fans, telephones, cable testing, wireless telegraphy apparatus, elementary mathematics, electricity and magnetism. These officers will also be required to arrange for the instruction of training class instructors, telephone inspectors, and the line staff required for telephone work, as well as of newly-recruited superior officers and of any other officials, including traffic Deputy Superintendents, to whom it may be considered desirable to afford opportunities for acquiring technical knowledge.

(*b*) *Testing.*—The technical engineers will be in charge of the instrument testing room at Alipore and will be required to carry out all the testing and designing work now performed by the present Technical Branch under the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief.

14. These duties together with the office work connected with the staff serving permanently or temporarily under their orders, will ordinarily occupy about half the time of the technical engineers and the remainder of their working day will be devoted to research and the study of electric science. This will be connected principally with wireless telegraphy and telephones, but both the research work and the instruction will be practical and suited to the conditions of India. I assume that the services of Captain Evans or some other officer of the Royal Engineers will continue to remain at the disposal of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs so long as required.

15. **Total staff of Engineering Branch.**—The total staff proposed for the Engineering Branch in the foregoing paragraphs is—

Administrative	1 Chief Engineer 3 Circle Engineers
Executive	20 Divisional Engineers 2 Technical Engineers 1 Personal Assistant to the Director-General 1 Assistant to the Chief Engineer
Assistant and Deputy Superintendents' appointments.	54 Attached officers, *i.e.*, Assistant and Deputy Superintendents 1 Assistant Engineer, Technical

a total of 83 officers. To this number have to be added four Deputy Superintendents required as Personal

Assistants to the three Circle Engineers and as Engineering Personal Assistant to the Postmaster-General, Burma, and six Deputy Superintendents for employment in the four telegraph store depôts at Calcutta, Madras, Bombay, and Rangoon. I consider it essential to provide also a special staff of 11 Deputy Superintendents, of whom the services of three can be placed at the disposal of each of the Circle Engineers and of two at the disposal of the Postmaster-General, Burma, for employment on special works. During the past four years it has been necessary to allot on an average about 14 officers annually for such works, and, although under the amalgamation scheme the ordinary divisional staff of engineer officers will have more time to undertake special works in addition to their usual duties than hitherto, there will generally be a number of projects for which the services of special additional officers will be necessary, and it is desirable that there should be officers in each engineering circle available for this purpose without dislocating the ordinary engineering staff of divisions. These Deputy Superintendents will also, when necessary, take the place of divisional officers whom it may be found necessary to employ on special works, and when not employed either in this capacity or directly on special works, they will be utilised in taking the place of officers on leave. This increases the number of Assistant and Deputy Superintendents from 55 to 76 and brings the total number of officers required for the proposed Engineering Branch to 104, excluding the additional Deputy Superintendent for the Technical Branch. Of this total 28 will hold administrative and executive appointments and, calculating on the proportion of 100 : 178 adopted in the reorganisation of the Public Works Department in 1908 and that of the Telegraph Department in 1910, the strength of the superior service of the Engineering Branch should be $28 \times 1 \cdot 78 = 49 \cdot 84$, that is, with four administrative appointments and 24 executive appointments, there should be a staff of 22 assistants of the superior service. The proportion used, however, provides for a leave reserve of about 18 officers for every 100 executive appointments proposed, but such a reserve is not required in the Telegraph Department and I am of opinion it will be sufficient to provide 18 junior appointments against 28 administrative and executive appointments, making a total establishment of 46 in the superior engineering service.

15. **Proportion of Assistant Superintendents.**—From the application of the Government of India Life and Service tables shown in the statement attached to this letter (Annexure III., Statement A) it would appear that a staff of 23 Imperial Service officers and 23 Provincial Service officers should provide 28 officers with more than 10 years' service, and the present time scales of pay, which I shall propose to continue for engineers, were based on the assumption that executive rank would usually be attained in the 11th year of service. The statement also shows that if, as will probably be the case, the officers appointed direct to the Provincial Service in future are about 21 or 22 years of age, there should be, theoretically, a sufficient number of officers with six years' service and upwards to take the place of the seven administrative and executive officers, who may be expected to be absent on leave at the same time, and the remainder, consisting of 11 officers with less than six years' service, is in my opinion a sufficient number to have in training. According to the statement already referred to a total strength of 46 engineer officers would not ordinarily suffice to provide officers with the proper amount of service to take the place of those unfit for promotion, but in a small service of 46 it should be possible as a general rule to weed out unsuitable officers long before they reach their seventh year of service. Moreover, as I shall explain more fully later in this letter. I propose that one-fourth of the vacancies in the superior engineer establishment should in future be filled by the promotion of qualified subordinates. This arrangement will tend to a slight preponderance of officers of six years' service and upwards over the figures given under the Life and Service tables owing to the fact that promoted subordinates would frequently have to be brought on to the time-scale of pay of the superior service at a point very near the pay of the sixth year of service. This consideration in itself renders it desirable to fix the total strength of Assistant Superintendents as low as possible, in order to prevent any risk of a serious block in the promotion of young officers appointed direct to the superior establishment.

16. **Proportion of Deputy Superintendents.**—The remaining fifty-eight appointments required in the Engineering Branch will be filled by Deputy Superintendents, General, of whom there are at present seventy-two sanctioned. The balance of fourteen Deputy Superintendents-General will be provided for in a manner which will be described in paragraph 45. As the total number of appointments is fixed on actual requirements, it follows that, when one of the forty-six superior officers proceeds on leave, it will be necessary to appoint a subordinate to officiate as additional Deputy Superintendent during his absence; that is, the total number of officers present on duty will always be maintained at sanctioned strength by the appointment, when necessary, of additional Deputy Superindents, but Deputy Superintendents will not be appointed to officiate as Assistant Superintendents.

(*b*) *Traffic.*

17. **Staff of superior traffic officers to assist Postmasters-General.**—In the foregoing paragraphs I have dealt with the question of the staff required for the control and supervision of the engineering and technical work only. The traffic work of the department, under the recommendation made in this letter, will pass to the control of Postmasters-General, and it has now to be considered what additional staff should be provided to assist Postmasters-General in the disposal of this important addition to their duties. By traffic work is meant the disposal of all questions connected with the establishment of Government telegraph offices, whether departmental or combined, the supervision and control of all telegraph work performed inside such offices, except the maintenance of wireless and other special telegraph apparatus (such as Baudot, Wheatstone, repeaters, &c.), and the testing of lines in offices in which Technical Branch men are permanently employed; in short, all work which does not come under engineering. The question of the additional staff required when all the traffic work at present performed by Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents is transferred to the Post Office has been discussed in detail with Postmaster-General and Director of Telegraphs and the unanimous opinion, in which I agree, is that each circle should be given the services of one fairly senior officer of about the same standing as a Deputy Postmaster-General with the following staff of assistants:—

Bombay Circle - - -	Three.
Central Circle - - -	Two.
Madras Circle - - -	Three.
Punjab Circle - - -	Three.
United Provinces Circle - -	Two.
Bengal Circle - - -	Three.
Eastern Bengal Circle and Assam	Two.
Burma Circle - - -	One.

These proposals are based on the experience of the actual work which has been gained during the progress of the experimental amalgamation in the Bombay and Central Circles and I am convinced that they represent the smallest additions to the staffs of Postmasters-General compatible with efficient working. As a matter of fact the Postmasters-General of both these circles at the beginning of the experiment were of opinion that a considerably larger staff of assistants would be needed, but, when they realised that it would be unnecessary for the officers of this branch to inspect the smaller combined offices, they voluntarily reduced their requirements to the number proposed which they have in practice found sufficient. The question of the exact duties to be performed by each officer must be left to the respective Postmasters-General to decide, but it is intended that the officers allotted to

each circle for the superior Traffic Branch in the offices of Postmasters-General will ordinarily divide their time about equally on inspection and office duties, for this branch will also deal with the work connected with the telegraph side of combined post and telegraph offices now performed by the existing staff of Postmasters-General. The services of Inspecting telegraph masters and telegraphists and of Superintendents of post offices will be utilised in the inspection of the less important combined offices. It will be observed that the Deputy Postmaster-General, Traffic (Traffic Manager) in the Burma Circle will be given only one assistant, the reason being, as explained in paragraph 9, that the telegraph engineering officers in this circle will deal with a certain amount of the traffic work.

18. **Staff of Superior Traffic Branch Officers at the Headquarters of the Director-General.**—As head of the Traffic Branch at the headquarters of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, I propose that there should be a senior officer whose duties will correspond with those now performed by the Director of Traffic. This officer will be designated Deputy Director-General of the Post Office of India, Traffic. He will exercise under the Director-General the entire control of telegraph traffic and the staff employed in telegraph offices, and, although his duties will not be so responsible as those of the Chief Engineer, they will be such as to demand the services of a thoroughly efficient and experienced officer. It is desirable that the officer holding the highest appointment in the superior Traffic Branch should be of practically equal rank with the Postmasters-General, whose work, so far as telegraph traffic is concerned, he will to a certain extent control.

Every endeavour has been, and will continue to be, made by me to reduce the number of references on telegraph traffic and establishment questions, but this branch of my office is still very heavily worked and must remain so. As it will also be necessary that the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, should spend a considerable portion of his time on tour, I consider that he should be given the services of two assistants as at present. One of these should be of about the same standing as an Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, and would take the place of the Superintendent of Telegraphs at present attached to my office to assist the Director of Traffic; the second assistant would be a more junior officer holding an appointment corresponding to that of Assistant Director of Traffic recently sanctioned by the Government of India as a temporary measure. I am satisfied that the work which must necessarily come to this branch of my office will occupy the time of these officers very fully.

19. **Miscellaneous appointments in superior Traffic Branch.**—In addition to the officers at the headquarters of the Director-General and of Postmasters-General it is necessary to provide in the proposed superior Traffic Branch for officers to take the place of the Superintendents of Telegraphs in charge of the Calcutta, Bombay, Madras and Agra central telegraph offices, and the Assistant Superintendents in the Calcutta and Bombay offices. An important feature of the scheme of amalgamation is the transfer of the control of all town departmental telegraph offices to the officers in charge of the central telegraph offices, and as a result the Calcutta, Bombay and Madras offices will be very important and responsible charges. I consider it desirable, therefore, that the appointments held by the officers in charge of these three offices should approximate as closely as possible to those held by the senior officers in the proposed superior Traffic Branch of Postmasters-General's offices, as well as by postal officers in corresponding charges. The four next largest offices, *viz.*, Rangoon, Lahore, Karachi and Delhi, will also be important charges which should be held by officers of higher standing than the Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, now in charge. For this reason, and also to ensure that all the officers in the separate superior Traffic Branch, which I propose should be created, shall have ample practical opportunities of acquiring a thorough knowledge of traffic work, I recommend that special appointments should be provided in this branch for the officers in charge of these four offices also and that these appointments, together with those of the officer in charge of the Agra office, the assistants to the officers in charge of the Calcutta and Bombay offices, the junior assistant to the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, and the nineteen assistants to the officers in charge of the traffic work in Postmaster-General's offices should be placed together in one grade, with approximately the same position and prospects as Superintendents of post offices.

20. **Total Staff of superior Traffic Branch.**—The total staff proposed for the superior Traffic Branch is:—

1 Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.
2 assistants to Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.
8 officers in charge of the traffic work in Postmaster-General's offices.
19 assistants to officers in charge of the traffic work in Postmaster-General's offices.
8 officers in charge of the Calcutta, Bombay, Madras, Agra, Rangoon, Lahore, Karachi, and Delhi telegraph offices.
2 assistants in the Calcutta and Bombay central telegraph offices.

Or a total of 40 appointments; against which there will be a reduction of 50 appointments in the present superior establishment of the Telegraph Department, a reduction of 13 appointments in the sanctioned establishment of Deputy Superintendents, General, after providing for an additional Deputy Superintendent in the Technical Branch, the abolition of the present temporary appointment of Assistant Director of Traffic in the office of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, and the reduction of four appointments in the sanctioned establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, on account of the creation of four special appointments for the charge of the Rangoon, Lahore, Karachi and Delhi offices referred to in the preceding paragraph. My proposals, if accepted, will therefore result in a decrease in the total sanctioned strength of the department of twenty-eight appointments. The proposed grading of these new appointments is shown in paragraph 35.

21. **Separation of superior Traffic Branch from establishment of existing Traffic Branch.**—In order to ensure quicker promotion to, and in, the superior Traffic Branch, embracing the appointments specified above, I consider it essential that it should be kept entirely separate from the existing establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, employed in Telegraph offices. The branch will eventually be recruited as far as possible from subordinates selected at any stage of their service; but it may also be necessary, as the surplus staff of superior officers is exhausted, to recruit a certain number of officers from outside the ranks of the Telegraph Department in the manner explained in paragraph 41 of this letter, in order to ensure a sufficient reserve of officers specially fitted for the higher administrative traffic appointments, and it is essential to provide a separate cadre to which such officers can be appointed direct with prospects of advancement such as will attract suitable men. The grading for the superior Traffic Branch will facilitate the transfer of men between this branch and the ordinary grades of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, when necessary, and the branch will therefore consist entirely of specially selected and trained traffic officers.

II.—DESIGNATIONS AND HEADQUARTERS OF REVISED STAFF.

22. **Designation of the Director-General of the combined Departments.**—In paragraph 4 of their Resolution No. 830–833, dated the 24th January 1912, the Government of India decided that I should be

styled Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs while administering the Telegraph Department in addition to my own duties as Director-General of the Post Office of India, and I recommend that this title be permanently adopted for the head of the amalgamated departments. As, however, there will in this case no longer be a separate Telegraph Department or a separate Post Office, it will probably be necessary to undertake some simple legislation to provide for the change of title.

23. **Designations of other Officers employed on Telegraph Work.**—As regards the officers employed on telegraph work, I propose that in the case of the Engineering Branch the present designations should be altered as little as possible, and that the designations of the superior Traffic Branch appointments should follow those of the corresponding appointments in the Post Office.

The highest appointment in the Engineering Branch may, I consider, be styled Chief Engineer, Telegraphs.

For the remaining officers of the two new branches I propose the following designations:—

ENGINEERING BRANCH.

At Headquarters—
Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.
Assistant to the Chief Engineer, Telegraphs.

In Circles—
Director, Telegraph Engineering.
Personal Assistant to the Director, Telegraph Engineering.

In Divisions—
Officer in charge.—Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.
Attached officers.—Superior Service — Assistant Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.
Upper Subordinates—Deputy Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.

Technical Branch—
Chief Electrician.
Assistant Electrician.
Deputy Superintendent, Telegraphs (Technical).
Technical Telegraph Master (or Telegraphist).

SUPERIOR TRAFFIC BRANCH.

At Headquarters—
Deputy Director-General of the Post Office of India (Traffic).
Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.
Assistant to the Deputy Director of the Post Office, Traffic.

In Circles—
Senior Officer in Traffic Branch of the Postmaster-General's office — Deputy Postmaster-General, Traffic.
Assistants to ditto.—Superintendent of Post Office (Traffic). Officers of the present superior service employed under Deputy Postmasters-General (Traffic) should, however, be styled Assistant Postmasters-General (Traffic).
Officers of the superior Traffic Branch in charge of telegraph offices may be styled Superintendent, "———" office, and the assistants in the Bombay and Calcutta Offices may be designated "Assistant Superintendent, $\frac{\text{Bombay}}{\text{Calcutta}}$ Office."

24. Upper subordinates of the existing Traffic Branch in charge of telegraph offices other than those specified above will continue to be styled Deputy Superintendent, "———" Office.

25. **Headquarters of Officers.**—The headquarters of officers in the Traffic Branches, except in the cases of officers employed in telegraph offices, should be the headquarters of the Director-General or the Postmaster-General, as the case may be. In the case of the Engineering Branch, the headquarters of the Chief Engineer and his assistant and of the Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, should be those of the Director-General. All the officers employed at the headquarters of the Director-General should, I consider, be permitted to accompany the Government of India to Simla every year with the exception of the assistant to the Chief Engineer and one of the assistants to the Deputy Director-General, Traffic. The headquarters of the three Directors of Telegraph Engineering should be fixed at Bombay, Lahore (ultimately Delhi) and Calcutta, and those of the Divisional Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering at the following places:—

1.—BOMBAY, CENTRAL AND MADRAS CIRCLE.

(*a*) Bombay.
(*b*) Ajmere.
(*c*) Nagpur.
(*d*) Trichinopoly for the present, but Coimbatore when office accommodation is available.
(*e*) Bangalore.
(*f*) Madras.

2.—PUNJAB AND UNITED PROVINCES CIRCLE.

(*a*) Karachi.
(*b*) Ambala for the present, but Delhi when accommodation is available.
(*c*) Lahore.
(*d*) Lucknow.
(*e*) Allahabad.

3.—BENGAL AND EASTERN BENGAL AND ASSAM CIRCLE.

(*a*) and (*b*) Calcutta.
(*c*) Darjeeling.
(*d*) Dacca.
(*e*) Shillong.

4.—BURMA.

(*a*) Rangoon.
(*b*) Akyab.
(*c*) Maymyo.
(*d*) Mandalay.

The area of the divisions generally will be increased greatly under this scheme and it will probably be necessary in the majority of divisions to station at least one attached officer of the Engineering Branch at some place other than the headquarters of the division. This matter should be left to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs to decide according to actual requirements when the scheme of amalgamation is introduced.

III.—PAY AND ALLOWANCES.

26. **Pay of Director-General, Posts and Telegraphs.**—The pay of the appointment of Director-General of the Post Office of India, which was fixed at Rs. 3,000 in 1853, was raised in the despatch from the Secretary of State No. 59-Financial, dated the 27th March 1903, to Rs. 3,000 a month for the first five years' tenure (including periods of officiating service) rising thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 100 to Rs. 3,500 a month. As a member of the Indian Civil Service, the Director-General also draws exchange compensation allowance at the rate of Rs. 138–14–3, the maximum admissible under rule, and in Mr. Ley's letter No. 1800—33, dated the 27th February 1912, the Government of India sanctioned the grant to me, while administering the Telegraph Department in addition to my own duties as Director-General of the Post Office, of a personal allowance of Rs. 300 a month subject to the condition that my total salary should not exceed Rs. 3,500 a month. Excluding this allowance, the average value of the appointment of Director-General of the Post Office, with the present rate of pay and inclusive of

exchange compensation allowance, is about Rs. 3,305* a month. If it is finally decided to amalgamate the Post Office and the Telegraph Department on the lines recommended in this letter, the responsibilities and duties of the Director-General in charge of the combined departments will practically equal those of the two Directors-General in the past. Both of the departments are expanding rapidly and the officer selected for the combined appointment will necessarily be one possessing high qualifications as an administrator, and ordinarily he will have no further prospects of advancement. As it has already been decided that the earliest opportunity should be taken to withdraw exchange compensation allowance by revising the pay of the appointments in respect of which the allowance is admissible, I am of opinion that there is ample justification for fixing the pay of the appointment of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs at Rs. 3,500 —100—4,000. Exchange compensation allowance would cease to be admissible and the net increase in the pay of the appointment over that of the Director-General of the Post Office of India would amount to about Rs. 528 a month only.

27. **Pay of Postmasters-General.**—In the case of Postmasters-General also there will be a large increase of work under the proposed scheme as, in addition to their postal duties, these officers will be required to deal with all telegraph traffic questions arising in their circle and to control the staff of all telegraph offices. It would shortly have been necessary as regards these appointments also to propose that the rates of pay should be revised so as to permit of the withdrawal of the exchange compensation allowance, and I consider that this opportunity should be taken to remove all distinction between members of the Indian Civil Service and other Postmasters-General and to abolish the special rate of pay admissible for one Postmaster-General, 1st grade, if a member of the Indian Civil Service. The present pay and grading of Postmasters-General is—

1 on Rs. 2,250—50—2,500 = Rs. 2,417
3 on Rs. 1,750—50—2,000 = Rs. 5,750
6 on Rs. 1,500—50—1,750 = Rs. 10,000

and, of the officers permanently holding these appointments, all but two draw exchange compensation allowance. The average pay of these two officers is Rs. 3,584 and the amount of exchange compensation allowance drawn by the other eight officers is Rs. 901. The average cost of the ten appointments is, therefore, 18,167 + 901 = 19,068. Post Office work is becoming more important every year and the same may be said of telegraph traffic work. Considering the pay given to heads of departments under Local Governments and Administrations and the additional responsibilities that will be imposed on Postmasters-General in connection with telegraph traffic work, I am of opinion that there are good grounds for fixing the minimum pay at Rs. 1,750 and that there is ample justification for allowing two of the Postmasters-General to rise to Rs. 2,500, without compensation allowance, instead of one as at present with compensation allowance. It will be more convenient administratively and also for the purposes of audit if the general practice of giving fixed rates of pay is followed in the case of Postmasters-General, and I strongly recommend the adoption of the following scale of pay without exchange compensation allowance—

2 on Rs. 2,500 = Rs. 5,000.
2 on Rs. 2,250 = Rs. 4,500,
3 on Rs. 2,000 = Rs. 6,000.
3 on Rs. 1,750 = Rs. 5,250.

Total - Rs. 20,750.

This scale provides for a total increase of Rs. 1,682 a month or an average increase of Rs. 168 in the value of each appointment. The two Postmasters-General holding the appointment of Deputy Director-General of the Post Office should continue to draw the local allowance of Rs. 200 a month attached to that appointment and it will be advisable to rule that, if necessary, an officer should be given a personal allowance equal to the difference between his pay under the present scale *plus* exchange compensation allowance and his pay under the revised grading, if the latter is less.

28. In the Engineering Branch, I propose that the pay of the Chief Engineer, Telegraphs, should be fixed at Rs. 2,750. The post of Director-General of Telegraphs having been abolished, this appointment will be the highest ordinarily attainable by a telegraph engineer and it is necessary to fix the pay at such a rate as will provide reasonably good prospects for existing officers and future entrants. Apart from this consideration, however, the duties and responsibilities of this officer, as explained in paragraph 10, fully justify the pay here proposed. These duties and responsibilities will comprise not only those of the present Director of Construction but also those of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, and his work will include the maintenance of an increasing number of important wireless stations. The average expenditure of the Engineering Branch during the past three years, which would be controlled by this officer under the Director-General's orders, exceeded 40 lakhs a year and his position will correspond closely with that of a Chief Engineer to a Local Government. Exchange compensation should not be admissible.

29. **Pay of Directors, Telegraph Engineering.**—As regards the three Directors, Telegraph Engineering, I recommend that ultimately there should be one appointment on Rs. 2,000 and two appointments on Rs. 1,500 each without exchange compensation allowance. For some years to come these particular rates of pay must remain in abeyance, as the appointments will be held by three of the eleven officers in receipt of the pay of the present administrative grades of the Telegraph Department, which it is proposed elsewhere in this letter should be allowed to remain in force for all officers of the department now in the service. As in the case of the present directorships an officer of the Provincial Service should be eligible for appointment as Director, Telegraph Engineering, if fully qualified to perform the duties attaching to the appointment, and the pay of the appointment, when held by a Provincial Service officer, should be the same as the pay of the corresponding appointments shown in Appendix I. to the Government of India Resolution in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 913-918—115, dated the 2nd February 1910, viz., Rs. 1,200 and Rs. 1,600 respectively.

30. **Pay of Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering.**—For Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, including the officers employed in the Technical Branch, the Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, and the assistant to the Chief Engineer, who will be recruited from exactly the same sources as the existing superior service of the Indian Telegraph Department, I recommend the continuance of the Imperial and Provincial Service time-scales of pay sanctioned in Resolutions No. 913-918—115, dated the 2nd February 1910, and No. 4276-4280—133, dated the 4th June 1912, with the conditions stated in paragraph 4 of the latter resolution. As the number of divisional charges will be reduced, and some officers must be deprived of the charges which they now hold, it will be necessary, in the case of efficient men already in the service, to waive the condition that no officer shall draw more than the pay of the eleventh year of service unless he is in divisional charge. The officers mentioned above should also be granted any local allowances (including house allowances) for which officers of the existing superior service are eligible. I recommend, however, that the two Superintendents of Telegraphs employed as Chief Electrician and senior Assistant Electrician should each be granted a local allowance of Rs. 100 a month and the Assistant Superintendent of Telegraphs

* Average value $\frac{\text{Rs.}}{\frac{3,000 + 3,333}{2}} = 3,166{\cdot}6$

Exchange compensation allowance $\frac{138{\cdot}9}{3,305{\cdot}5}$

employed as junior assistant, a local allowance of Rs. 50 a month in addition to their pay under the time-scales of their service and the allowance admissible to them under the Calcutta house allowance scheme. Except in very special circumstances, these officers will be stationed permanently at Calcutta and their duties will be arduous and of a less varied nature than those of officers employed on ordinary engineering work. Moreover they will always be specially selected or specially recruited officers, and the experience of the past two years has shown the necessity of fixing the emoluments of superior officers employed on technical work on a slightly higher scale than those of the other officers of the Engineering Branch. The Superintendents employed as Personal Assistant to the Director-General and as assistant to the Chief Engineer will have heavier work and responsibilities than those of Superintendents in divisions, and, as they will be stationed at expensive places, I recommend that these officers, as in the case of Personal Assistants in the Post Office, should be given a local allowance of Rs. 100 each in addition to their pay under the time-scale and should be admitted to the Calcutta house allowance scheme.

31. **Pay and grading of Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering.**—In the case of the Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, I recommend that the rates of pay sanctioned in the Resolution of the 2nd February 1910 for Deputy Superintendents, General, should be retained and that, in order to meet the undertaking given to the subordinate staff of the Telegraph Department by the Government of India in their Resolution in the Department of Commerce and Industry No. 830-33, dated the 24th January 1912, and in Mr. Ley's letter No. 1262-38, dated the 9th February 1912, the reduction of fourteen appointments, which it is proposed to effect in the sanctioned establishment of Deputy Superintendents, General, should eventually be made in the lowest grade of Rs. 250—15—325. The ultimate grading for the 58 appointments, which it is proposed to retain for Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, will then be—

8 on Rs. 400—25—500.
16 on Rs. 325—15—400.
35 on Rs. 250—15—325.

Any other arrangement would affect adversely the prospects of the Deputy Superintendents of the Engineering Branch in the lowest grade, but, apart from this, I consider that a proportion of eight better paid appointments on Rs. 400—500 and sixteen on Rs. 325—400 is not too high in a cadre of 58 officers, especially in view of the greatly improved prospects on the traffic side. As will be explained later in this letter, of the fourteen Deputy Superintendents, General, who will not be required for engineering work, thirteen will be employed in traffic appointments and one in the Technical branch and, if necessary, on their present scales of pay.

32. **Local allowances for Personal Assistants to Directors, Telegraph Engineering.**—The four Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, employed as Personal Assistants to the Directors, Telegraph Engineering, and the Postmaster-General, Burma, will all be stationed in expensive towns, and, as their duties will generally be of a more important nature than those of Deputy Superintendents employed on engineering work, I recommend the grant to each of these four officers of a special charge or local allowance of Rs. 50 a month in addition to their grade pay and the allowances for which they are at present eligible under rule, such as the Presidency and Burma allowances. Under the existing rules Deputy Superintendents, General, are not admitted to the benefits of the house allowance schemes. Superintendents of post offices employed as Personal Assistants to Postmasters-General receive a special allowance of Rs. 100 each in addition to the ordinary local allowances.

33. **Pay and grading of Deputy Superintendents, Technical.**—In the case of the upper subordinates and subordinates of the Technical Branch also, I recommend the retention of the existing rate of pay and allowances. The additional appointment of Deputy Superintendent in this branch recommended in paragraph 12 of this letter should, I consider, be made in the lowest grade, and the cadre will then stand as follows:—

1 on Rs. 400—25—500
2 on Rs. 325—15—400.
4 on Rs. 250—15—325.

The additional appointment will not, however, be filled up by the promotion of a Technical Telegraph Master so long as it is necessary to hold it against one of the supernumerary Deputy Superintendents, General, not required for the Engineering Branch.

I have carefully considered the question of amalgamating this small cadre with that of Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, but I have decided to make no proposal to this effect at present as the prospects of promotion of some of the Deputy Superintendents, Technical, would be materially injured if this change were made. Later it may be possible gradually to merge the two cadres into one as vacancies occur in the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Technical.

34. **Pay of Deputy Director-General of the Post Office Traffic.**—In the superior Traffic Branch I recommend that the pay of the appointment of Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, should be fixed at Rs. 1,750—50—2,000. As I have already explained in paragraph 18 of this letter, this appointment should be held by a thoroughly efficient and experienced officer who should be practically of equal rank with Postmasters-General, but he will usually be an officer who has spent the greater portion of his service in the superior Traffic Branch and I do not consider that he should be actually graded with Postmasters-General. I have, therefore, proposed an incremental scale of pay representing a combination of the rates proposed for the two lowest grades of Postmasters-General. It will be unnecessary to grant the Deputy-Director-General, Traffic, a local allowance similar to that given to the other Deputy Directors-General of the Post Office, but his appointment should be admitted to the Calcutta house allowance scheme.

35. **Pay and grading of first division of superior Traffic Branch.**—The remaining thirty-nine appointments proposed for the superior Traffic Branch should in my opinion consist of two divisions, in the first of which there would be the three officers in charge of the Calcutta, Bombay and Madras telegraph offices, the eight Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic, and the Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic. The work and the duties of the twelve officers holding these appointments will correspond closely with those of Presidency Postmasters, Deputy Postmasters-General, and Assistant Directors-General of the Post Office, respectively, and I recommend that they should be graded as follows:—

2 on Rs. 1,200—40—1,400.
4 on Rs. 1,000.
6 on Rs. 800.

These officers should be treated for the purpose of all local allowances (including house rent allowances) in exactly the same way as officers of corresponding rank in the Post Office—the Assistant Director-General, Traffic, being given a local allowance of Rs. 150 a month and excluded from the benefits of the Calcutta house allowance scheme.

Pay and grading of Second Division of superior Traffic Branch.—The second division would consist of the five officers in charge of the Agra, Karachi, Rangoon, Lahore, and Delhi telegraph offices, the assistant to the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, the nineteen assistants to Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic, and the two assistants to the officers in charge of the Calcutta and Bombay telegraph offices.

The position and status of these officers should approximate to that of Superintendents of post offices, but I do not think it is advisable or practicable, to fix the pay of the former on exactly the same rates as those of Superintendents of post offices. There is no reason why the rates of pay of these two classes of officers should be identical for there is no intention of

transferring officers from the one service to the other, nor will the source of recruitment be the same in the two cases. On the other hand, there are practical difficulties in adopting the Post Office grading which is in my opinion unsuitable even in the case of the Post Office. In the first place, the minimum pay of a Deputy Superintendent of Telegraphs is Rs. 250, and, as none of the appointments in the second division of the superior Traffic Branch will be inferior to that of a Deputy Superintendent, the minimum pay fixed for the former should not be less than Rs. 250. Further, it is highly desirable that the pay of the officers in the second division of the superior Traffic Branch should be such as will facilitate transfers from and to the grades of Deputy Superintendents of Telegraphs, for it will frequently be necessary to try officers of the latter class in the superior Traffic Branch and to revert them if they prove unsuitable. I strongly recommend, therefore, the adoption of a time scale of pay rising from Rs. 250 by ten annual increments of Rs. 15 to Rs. 400, and thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 20 to Rs. 600 a month. This scale of pay is based, up to the Rs. 500 stage, on that sanctioned for Deputy Superintendents, while, in continuing to rise to Rs. 600 a month, it provides some prospects with a view to attract capable officers to this important branch of the department, and makes the maximum pay of the scale the same as that now obtainable by Superintendents of post offices. Under the time scale of pay proposed by me the maximum pay of the twenty-seven officers in the lower division of the superior Traffic Branch will exceed Rs. 500 a month, and they will, therefore, under Article 1002 of the Civil Service Regulations be officers of the first class for the purpose of the travelling allowance regulations and will thus all be placed in the same position in this respect as Superintendents of post offices to all of whom first class travelling allowances were specially granted in 1881. The nineteen officers who will be assistants to the Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic, (Superintendents of post offices Traffic,) will have much arduous inspection to perform and it is important that they in particular should be eligible for first class travelling allowances.

I should have greatly preferred to recommend a maximum pay of Rs. 700 for these officers, but I recognise that probably this proposal could not be agreed to by Government without involving the reconsideration of their recent decision on the proposal to increase to Rs. 700 the maximum pay of Superintendents of post offices. I may, however, state here that in my opinion that the latter officers should eventually be granted a time-scale of pay rising to Rs. 700 stronger than ever. When this change is effected, the maxmum of the time-scale of pay of the second division of the proposed superior Traffic Branch should also be increased to Rs. 700. I might add that the cost of the latter proposal would be less than Rs. 7,000 a year.

As regards house rent allowances I recommend that the twenty-seven officers in the second division of the superior Traffic Branch should be granted the allowance admissible to the present Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, with the exception of the officer holding the appointment of assistant to the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, at headquarters, who should be granted, in lieu of house allowance, a local allowance of Rs. 100 a month similar to that admissible for a Superintendent of post offices holding the appointment of Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.

36. **Pay and grading of Deputy Superintendents of the ordinary Traffic Branch.**—The establishment of Deputy Superintendents in the existing Traffic Branch will be reduced by the four appointments provided by the superior Traffic Branch for the charge of the Karachi, Rangoon, Lahore, and Delhi Offices, and I recommend that this reduction also should be effected in the lowest grade. This establishment will then be graded as follows:—

8 on Rs. 400—25—500.
16 on Rs. 325—15—400.
27 on Rs. 250—15—325.

37. **Continuation to officers now in the service of the higher rates of pay at present in force for the eleven administrative appointments.**—In the preceding paragraphs proposals have been put forward for the provision of five administrative appointments carrying salaries in excess of the maximum of the time-scales of pay which it is proposed to retain for telegraph engineers. Under the existing organization, however, there are at present, omitting the appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs in respect of which the Government of India have exercised their right to select an officer outside the ranks of the Telegraph Department, eleven appointments on salaries varying from Rs. 1,500 to Rs. 2,250 a month to which officers now in the superior service of the Telegraph Department may reasonably expect promotion, if qualified, and, in accordance with instructions conveyed to me in paragraph 5 of the Resolution of the Government of India in the Commerce and Industry Department No. 830–833, dated the 24th January 1912, that, in such steps as might be taken towards the amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department, all possible protection should be afforded to the personal interests and prospects of the existing staff of both departments in all grades, I propose that the pay and prospects of existing officers of the department should not be affected apversely and that the present grading of eleven high appointments should be maintained for them, except in the case of the highest post, namely, that of Chief Engineer which should take the place of one of the appointments on Rs. 2,250. This arrangement necessarily involves temporary extra expenditure on Government, as for some years a larger number of highly paid appointments must be maintained than is required for my scheme, but this is unavoidable if the interests of existing officers are to be safeguarded, as I understand is the intention of Government. The plan adopted to meet the case must ensure as far as possible that the emoluments of a qualified officer remaining in the service shall not at any stage of his career be less than they would have been if the existing system had remained in force; and on the other hand measures have to be taken to prevent the immediate reduction in the staff of superior officers which I shall propose elsewhere in this letter from resulting in unduly rapid promotion to the higher grades. The latter difficulty could, it is true, be overcome by maintaining an imaginary cadre in which the places of officers who, owing to amalgamation, leave the department permanently, would be taken by dummies who would be moved up in the imaginary cadre in the proper order and would in course of time be shown as filling in their proper turn officiating and permanent appointments in the present administrative grades on the existing rates of pay. Under this system no officer remaining in the service would attain the pay of the existing administrative appointments earlier than if there had been no reduction of staff owing to amalgamation; but the system is undoubtedly objectionable from an audit point of view, and it would be exceedingly difficult in actual practice. Moreover, it has the disadvantage of failing to afford officers the officiating promotions which they would have received if the dummy appointments had continued to be held by the present incumbents, and also of failing to differentiate between dummy appointments representing officers who have prematurely retired, and those representing officers who, even if they had remained in the service, would not have been permitted to proceed beyond the maximum pay of a Divisional Superintendent of Telegraphs. Further the officers affected would not understand the arrangement clearly and there would always be the danger of their considering that they had been dealt with illiberally.

After careful consideration of the matter, I am of opinion that the only satisfactory manner in which the difficulty can be overcome is the adoption of a system of promotion under which the imposition of a service limit would act as an automatic check on unduly rapid promotion to, and in, the administrative grades.

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

These grades are at present filled as follows:—

Name.	Rank.	Pay of Substantive Appointment.	Year of Service on 1st October 1912.	Date of Birth.	Date on which obliged to retire.	REMARKS.
		Rs.				
1. F. E. Dempster -	Director, 1st Class -	2,250	35th	9–7–58	9–7–13	On leave.
2. C. Streatfeild-James. - -	Ditto. -	2,250	34th	18–4–59	18–4–14	
3. R. O. Lees - -	Director, 2nd Class -	2,000	34th	17–10–58	17–10–13	Officiating, 1st Class.
4. I. C. Thomas -	Ditto. -	2,000	32nd	4–4–61	4–4–16	
5. J. W. Hensley -	Director, 3rd Class -	1,750	34th	10–3–58	10–3–13	On leave.
6. H. S. Styan - -	Ditto. -	1,750	31st	16–12–61	16–12–16	Officiating, 2nd Class.
7. H. E. Chappel -	Ditto. -	1,750	30th	8–3–63	8–3–18	
8. J. M. Coode - -	Director, 4th Class -	1,500	28th	13–11–65	13–11–20	Officiating, 3rd Class.
9. R. T. Gibbs - -	Ditto. -	1,500	27th	20–5–65	20–5–20	On leave.
10. M. G. Simpson -	Electrical Engineer-in-Chief.	1,600 in the 1,500–2,250 grade.	26th	3–11–66	3–11–21	
11. H. C. A. Goodall -	Director, 4th Class -	1,500	27th	9–6–66	9–6–21	On leave.
12. R. Elrington	Superintendent -	1,250	31st	22–6–61	22–6–16	Superseded.
13. W. P. Henderson -	Ditto. -	1,250	25th	6–6–68	6–6–23	Superseded.
14. R. Meredith -	Ditto -	1,250	24th	21–5–67	21–5–22	Officiating Director, 3rd Class.
15. C. W. Sowerby-Coo	Ditto. -	1,250	23rd	15–3–69	15–3–24	Officiating Director, 4th Class.
16. H. Mayston -	Ditto. -	1,250	23rd	30–1–68	30–1–23	On leave.
17. W. Sutherland -	Ditto. -	1,250	22nd	16–12–70	16–12–25	Officiating Postmaster-General and considered as absorbing one officiating vacancy in 4th Class of Telegraph Director.
18. L. Truninger -	Ditto. -	1,250	22nd	29–9–70	29–9–25	Officiating Director, 4th Class.

The circle organisation was in force for too short a time to afford trustworthy data of the years of service in which officers could fairly expect officiating and permanent promotion to the various administrative grades. It seems, therefore, best to consider the cases of a few individual officers. Mr. Meredith, for example, who has just entered his 24th year of service, is already officiating as Director, 3rd Class, on a salary of Rs. 1,750 and, if he remains in the service, must become substantive Director 4th Class, on the 10th March 1913, when Mr. Hensley has to retire. He would receive substantive promotion to the 3rd Class on the 18th April, 1914 in his 25th year of service after the retirement of Messrs. Dempster, Lees and Streatfeild-James and would probably have been officiating in the 2nd Class before that date. His promotion to the substantive rank of Director, 2nd Class, would be due at the latest on the 8th March 1918 in his 29th year of service and his substantive promotion to the 1st Class on the 13th November 1920 in his 32nd year of service. It is almost certain, however, that Mr. Gibbs will retire before he attains attains 55 years of age and in view of this and other unforeseen casualties it is not only possible, but highly probable, that, if the present system of administration remained untouched, Mr. Meredith would reach the 2nd and 1st Class considerably earlier than in his 29th and 32nd year of service, respectively, and he would certainly officiate in those classes before March 1918 and November 1920.

Mr. Sutherland was appointed to officiate as Director, 4th Class, on the 13th July 1911 in his 20th year of service and, even if no unforeseen casualties occurred, would become substantive Director, 4th Class, on the 18th April 1914 in his 23rd year of service; 3rd Class on the 8th March 1918 in his 27th year of service; 2nd Class on the 13th November 1920 in his 30th year of service; and 1st Class on the 21st May 1922 in his 31st year of service. Mr. Coode, who is already Director, 4th Class, must attain the rank of Director, 3rd Class, on the 10th March 1913, in his 28th year of service; 2nd Class on the 18th April 1914 in his 29th year; and 1st Class on the 16th December 1916 in his 32nd year. Mr. Gibbs, if he remains in the service, must receive promotion to the 3rd Class of Directors at the latest on the 9th July 1913 in his 27th year of service, to the 2nd Class on the 4th April 1916 in his 30th year; and to the 1st Class on the 8th March 1918 in his 32nd year of service.

Taking the cases of these particular officers as examples, it would seem necessary to allow the various rates of pay of the existing administrative appointments to be attained in the following years of service provided that vacancies existed and that the officers to be promoted were considered fit for administrative rank:—

Grade of Rs. 1,500 = officiating 21st year: substantive 23rd year.

Grade of Rs. 1,750 = officiating 23rd year: substantive 25th year.

Grade of Rs. 2,000 = officiating 25th year: substantive 28th year.

Grade of Rs. 2,250 = officiating 28th year: substantive 31st year.

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

I therefore propose the adoption for all officers now serving in the Telegraph Department of the following scale of pay above Rs. 1,250.

No. of Appointments.	Rate of Pay.	Conditions of Appointments.	
		Permanent.	Officiating.
	Rs.		
1	2,750	No condition	No condition.
1	2,250 Imperial / 1,800 Provincial	Not less than 30 years' service	Not less than 27 years' service.
2	2,000 Imperial / 1,600 Provincial	„ „ 27 „ „	„ „ 24 „ „
4	1,750 Imperial / 1,400 Provincial	„ „ 24 „ „	„ „ 22 „ „
3	1,500 Imperial / 1,200 Provincial	„ „ 22 „ „	„ „ 20 „

In this scale the value of the appointment of Electrical Engineer-in-Chief has been taken at rather less than the mean of the sanctioned pay and has been converted into a fourth appointment on Rs. 1,750 a month. The present incumbent, Mr. Simpson, would have to be given the option of remaining on his present incremental scale of pay or of electing for the revised rates of pay. In the latter case he would take his place in the seniority list immediately below Mr. Gibbs, and his pay would be regulated accordingly.

The officer holding the appointment of Chief Engineer would receive the pay fixed for that appointment (Rs. 2,750) without any restriction as to length service, but all other officers now in the Telegraph Department would draw pay strictly in accordance with the above scale, irrespective of the duties on which employed, and subject only to the proviso that Government were satisfied that they were in every way fit for promotion and that they had the qualifying service. The ten officers in receipt of these special rates of pay would, however, always be employed as far as posible in the more important appointments under the scheme of amalgamation. Three would hold the proposed appointments of Director, Telegraph Engineering, and, so long as more than four of the present superior officers remained in the service, one of the excess would hold the appointment of Deputy Director-General of the Post Office of India, Traffic, another would be employed as Postmaster-General, Burma, and a third would practically always be employed as officiating Postmaster-General in some other circle. The remainder of the officers drawing the special rates of pay would be employed in the most suitable manner possible, probably as Chief Electrician and in charge of the telegraph offices at Calcutta, Bombay and Madras, but as the total number of officers now in the service fell below eleven, these appointments would be filled by officers on the rate of pay fixed for such appointments under the amalgamation scheme. If my proposals in respect of the continuation of the present administrative rates of pay are sanctioned, it will be necessary to provide that, if a vacancy in the proposed scale of pay (whether permanent or officiating) cannot be filled owing to the next senior qualified officer being ineligible by length of service, the remaining vacancies in the chain should be filled as if the ineligible officer had been promoted. For example if there were an officiating vacancy on Rs. 2,250 and the next senior officer fit for promotion had not completed 27 years' service, the vacancy on Rs. 3250 would remain unfilled, but officiating promotions would be made to the Rs. 2,000 and lower grades, if qualified officers were forthcoming, exactly as if the vacancy on Rs. 2,250 had been filled.

It is of course practically impossible to calculate with any degree of accuracy the financial effect of the adoption of the foregoing proposal, but, as I shall show later in this letter, the services of about 71 of the present superior telegraph officers will be retained after amalgamation is affected, and all these officers have to leave the service before normal conditions will be attained. This will probably take over 20 years and the maximum cost of continuing these higher rates of pay in the manner recommended by me, over and above the cost of the ultimate establishment proposed for the combined departments, should therefore be Rs. 3,750* a month or Rs. 45,000 a year to commence with, decreasing annually after a certain number of years until it finally disappeared in about 24 years. Against this extra expenditure has to be set the saving on account of the Postmaster-Generalships which one, and later two, telegraph officers will hold.

IV.—RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING.

38. **Proportion of subordinates to be promoted to superior establishment of Engineering Branch.**—In connection with the last reorganisation of the Telegraph Department the Government of India in paragraph 31 of their despatch to the Secretary of State, No. 153-Salaries, dated 1st July 1909, laid considerable stress on the desirability of the admission of subordinates to the superior grades of the department and recommended that, while five-eighths of the superior establishment should be recruited from England, one-fourth should be obtained in India and one-eighth by promotion from the subordinate ranks. On the assumption that the annual recruitment of four officers would be necessary to keep the department up to strength this arrangement would result in the promotion on the average of a subordinate once in every two years. I consider that the arguments stated in the despatch referred to above in favour of the promotion of subordinates to an establishment responsible for both engineering and traffic work, apply with equal force to their promotion to a purely engineering cadre, and I am firmly convinced that it will always be possible to select one subordinate every two years who is qualified for promotion to the superior establishment of the proposed Engineering Branch. This establishment will, however, be reduced under the proposals contained in this letter by slightly more than one-half, and it is unlikely that the annual recruitment of more than two telegraph engineer officers will be necessary in future. I recommend therefore that the proportion of the superior staff of the Engineering Branch to be recruited by promotion from the subordinate ranks should be fixed at one-fourth, and that one-half of the establishment should be recruited from England and the remaining one-fourth in India. In paragraph 20 of the Resolution of the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 913–918–115, dated the 2nd February 1910, a promise was made to the subordinates that one-eighth of the vacancies in the superior establishment would be filled by promotions from the subordinate ranks as soon as the excess in the sanctioned strength of officers then existing was absorbed. As, however, recruitment has

* Cost of present 11 administrative appointments (Rs. 20,000) less cost of four proposed administrative appointments (Rs. 7,500) less maximum pay of seven telegraph superintendents (Rs. 8,750).

been stopped for a considerable time pending the decision on the question of amalgamation, no such promotion has been made as yet, although the excess was absorbed some time ago, and in consequence there is a general feeling among the subordinate staff that the undertaking of the Government of India in this respect has not been fulfilled. There are several upper subordinates now in the service who are believed to be in every respect fitted for appointment to the superior Engineering Branch and I propose, in pursuance the undertaking given by Government in 1910, that before the method of recruitment described above is brought into effect, three of them should be promoted in the first three vacancies that occur in the superior establishment of the Engineering Branch after the scheme is sanctioned. With this exception the procedure for recruitment described in the Government of India despatch in question, modified as regards appointments in India in the manner directed in paragraph 7 of the despatch from the Secretary of State No. 24-Tel., dated the 3rd December 1909, should remain unaltered and, ordinarily, one officer will be recruited from England annually, the second vacancy yearly being filled by the appointment direct to the Provincial Service of a candidate selected in India and by the promotion to that service of a selected subordinate, alternately.

The question whether the proportion of appointments to be filled by promotions from the subordinate ranks is sufficient should, in my opinion, be reconsidered at the end of seven years, by which time the Director-General will be in a position to report fully on the manner in which these officers have acquitted themselves in their higher appointments and the number of subordinates who have been found qualified to fill these appointments, and also whether any improvement in the class of recruits has resulted from the promotion of subordinates to the superior grades.

I may add that the subordinates selected for promotion to the superior engineering establishment will invariably be men of marked ability, and they will almost invariably be Deputy Superintendents whose pay in their own grade does not exceed Rs. 370 a month. Thus they can be brought on to the time scale of pay of the Provincial Service at the point prescribed by the Civil Service Regulations without affecting adversely the prospects of superior officers of six years' standing and upwards then in the service.

39. **Training and Examination of Officers appointed direct to superior establishment of Engineering Branch.**—As regards the training of officers appointed direct to the superior establishment of the proposed Engineering Branch I consider it necessary, with the object of ensuring that only really suitable officers are retained in the department, to recommend the adoption of more stringent and definite rules than those at present in force. Under the existing system officers appointed direct to the present superior establishment are attached to some large construction work for three months' training in construction duties and then to one of the Presidency telegraph offices for twelve months for training in signalling, traffic management and signal office routine. They are not eligible for their third increment under the time scale of pay until they have qualified in signalling and (if not Indians) have passed in Hindustani by the lower standard, but they are not required to pass a professional examination nor are they required to show that they have any knowledge of accounts. I consider, however, that on the amalgamation of the Telegraph Department with the Post Office and the separation of engineering and traffic work, an officer appointed direct to the superior establishment of the Engineering Branch, whether in England or in this country, should first be attached for a period of six months to the office of the Chief Electrician for a course of instruction in signalling, technical telegraphy (including the adjustment of instruments and apparatus), the nomenclature and care of telegraph stores, and the more important processes of the telegraph workshops. He should then be employed on divisional engineering work in such a manner as will afford him every opportunity of gaining experience of the work of a telegraph engineer, and should be required to pass, within three years of joining the department, not only the examination in signalling and the lower standard examination in Hindustani required by the existing rules, but also a professional examination similar to that prescribed for assistant engineers of the Public Works Department. The examination should be such as to show that he has an intimate knowledge of the modes of telegraph and telephone construction in use in India; the material used and the sources from which obtained; the management of line staff; the testing of lines; the adjustment and care of all telegraph instruments and apparatus in use in India; and that he is thoroughly acquainted with the accounts rules of the department and the forms of account in use. The examination may be conducted by the Director of Telegraph Engineering in whose administration the candidate is serving; but, as in the case of the Public Works Department, a candidate should not be permitted to appear for it until a special report by his Divisional Superintendent of Telegraph Engineering on points of qualification which cannot be tested by examination such as physical energy, efficiency in practical work and capacity to manage subordinates has been submitted to, and found satisfactory by, the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs. Any increments falling due after the prescribed period of three years should be withheld until the examination is passed, subject, however, to the conditions that the Director-General may, in special cases, afford an officer a reasonable extension of the period of three years without enforcing the penalty of the loss of increments, and may, at his discretion, restore an officer whose increments have been withheld to the position in the incremental scale which he would have held but for his failure to pass the prescribed examination within the prescribed period.

40. **Recruitment and Training of Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering.**—Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, should, I consider, be recruited and trained in exactly the same manner as the present Deputy Superintendents, General, except that subordinates of the Technical Branch as well as inspecting Telegraph Masters and Inspecting Telegraphists should be considered eligible, and should be encouraged to qualify, for selection as Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering.

41. **Recruitment and Training of Officers for the superior Traffic Branch.**—In the case of the superior Traffic Branch the majority of the appointments will be filled, as the surplus staff of officers belonging to the present superior and upper subordinate establishment is exhausted, by the selection of specially qualified officers from the upper subordinate and subordinate signalling staff of the department. I consider it necessary, however, partly in order to guard against any possibility of a dearth of suitable officers for the highest traffic appointments and partly with a view to obtaining from other sources, including other telegraph administrations, the services when necessary of officers possessing special qualifications, that the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs should be at liberty to make direct appointments to the superior Traffic Branch from outside the ranks of the signalling establishment. It appears to me to be undesirable to place any restrictions on the powers of the Director-General to make such appointments but, if the Government of India consider a limit necessary, I would suggest that he should be given authority to recruit from outside sources not more than one-fourth of the total establishment sanctioned for the superior Traffic Branch. Ordinarily these outsiders would be appointed on probation on a pay of Rs. 200 a month, but it might be advisable occasionally to obtain from England an officer who would enter the scale at any stage considered suitable and take his position accordingly in the seniority list. The probationers as well as the officers selected for trial in the superior Traffic Branch from other branches of the Telegraph Department should be attached to the Chief Electrician's office at Alipore for a course of instruction in signalling and in technical subjects and be employed

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

subsequently during the early stages of their service in the superior Traffic Branch in such a manner as will afford them opportunities of making themselves thoroughly acquainted with traffic control and the management and administration of telegraph offices. All of these officers should be required within two years of their appointment to the branch to pass an examination which will be such as to test their knowledge of the Traffic Instructions, the Telegraph Guide, the code rules relating to the management of telegraph offices and the control of office establishment, the system of accounts and the various forms connected therewith. An officer who fails to pass this departmental examination within the prescribed period, unless it is specially extended by the Director-General, should be reverted to his permanent appointment and in the case of a probationer his services should be dispensed with.

An officer selected from the British Post Office for service in this branch otherwise than as a probationer would ordinarily be brought out on an agreement for a term of years and provision would be made in his agreement that the retention of his services in India on its termination would be dependent on his passing the departmental examination within the prescribed period. An officer appointed on probation on the special pay of Rs. 200 a month would be transferred to the sanctioned establishment of the superior Traffic Branch in the first permanent vacancy that occurred after he had passed the departmental examination. Subordinates promoted to the superior Traffic Branch will be considerably older than probationers and if the casualties in the branch average about seven in four years as may be assumed, it would not ordinarily be necessary to recruit a probationer more frequently than about once in four years, and the probationary appointment on Rs. 200 will therefore usually remain unfilled for about two years out of four. Provision has accordingly been made in estimating the financial effect of the amalgamation scheme for only one-half of the cost of this appointment.

42. **Appointments and Promotions requiring the sanction of the Government of India.**—All first appointments to the superior service of the Engineering Branch and promotion to administrative posts in that branch should in my opinion be approved and notified by the Government of India as in the case of the existing superior establishment of the Telegraph Department. As regards the proposed superior Traffic Branch, however, I recommend that the procedure followed in respect of the higher appointments in the Post Office should be adopted, and that the sanction of Government should be obtained only in the case of first appointments (permanent or officiating) to the post of Deputy Director-General of the Post Office of India, Traffic, or to the upper division of the branch and in the case of grade promotions in that division which involve supersessions. All other appointments and promotions should, I consider, be left to the Director-General to deal with as in the case of corresponding officers in the Post Office.

V.—UTILISATION OF EXISTING STAFF.

43. **Number of superior officers of the Telegraph Department now in the service who can be employed in appointments provided under the scheme of amalgamation.**—Under the proposals contained in the preceding paragraphs the sanctioned establishment of superior officers of the Telegraph Department will be reduced from 96 to 46, the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, General, from 72 to 58 and that of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, from 55 to 51, while the temporary appointment of Assistant Director of Traffic will be abolished, making a total reduction of 69 appointments against which it is proposed to create one appointment of Deputy Superintendent in the Technical Branch and 40 appointments in the superior Traffic Branch. Included in the latter are 21 important appointments which can suitably be filled by superior officers not required for the separate Engineering Branch, namely, those of the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic; the Superintendents in charge of the telegraph offices at Calcutta, Bombay, Madras and Agra; the Deputy Postmasters-General in charge of the Traffic Branch in each postal circle; and the senior assistant to each of these Deputy Postmasters-General. For these appointments I propose to select 21 of the superior officers now in the service who are considered best fitted for traffic work. These officers will be retained in the Traffic Branch for the remainder of their service on the pay which they would get under the existing system, that is, their pay under the time scale of pay or the special rates of pay which I have proposed in paragraph 37 of this letter to provide for the 11 senior officers so long as any of the present superior officers remain in the service. As far as possible these selections will be made with the consent of the officers. The advantage of utilising the services of the surplus officers in this way is obvious and the arrangement also ensures that the Traffic Branch will be administered properly from the first, and that the selection of subordinates for these higher appointments will be a gradual process as it ought to be. Except in very special circumstances no officer, who is selected for traffic work, should be transferred subsequently to the Engineering Branch, as otherwise promotion to executive rank in that branch would suffer and recruitment would be interrupted. Moreover, the work of the officers selected for the superior Traffic Branch will be more efficient if their future prospects are bound up with that branch. The more junior of the superior officers now serving will be selected as far as possible for appointments as assistants to Deputy Postmasters-General, or as these particular officers will be styled, Assistant Postmasters-General, Traffic, but in order that their prospects of advancement may be as good in the Traffic Branch as if the present system had remained in force, it will be necessary to abolish in their case the bar in the time scale of pay under which an officer is not permitted to go beyond the pay of the eleventh year of service unless he is in charge of a division or its equivalent and to rule that all officers belonging to the present superior service employed in the superior Traffic Branch should be granted all increments under the time scale of pay as they become due, provided their work is satisfactory. Without this provision it would be impossible to induce officers of the existing cadre to join the Traffic Branch, and it is but fair to maintain the present prospects of the officers who will be selected for this branch from the existing superior staff.

One other of the surplus superior officers can be suitably employed as Superintendent of Stores in the appointment of Chief Storekeeper sanctioned in the despatch from the Secretary of State No. 24-Tel. of the 3rd December 1909, and I recommend that a second superior officer should be employed to assist the Superintendent of Stores so long as the services of a surplus officer of the rank of Assistant Superintendent are available. The Store Branch of the Telegraph Department is in urgent need of a complete reorganisation, and this opportunity should be taken to afford the officer in charge, who is greatly overworked, some relief so as to enable him to devote more time to the really salient questions of administration. This important branch of our organisation, I am bound to say, has not received proper attention in the past, and it is essential in the interests of economy that it should have an adequate controlling staff. It should be directly under the Director-General.

If the proposal in paragraph 37 to retain 11 highly paid appointments for the existing staff of telegraph officers is sanctioned, I recommend that one of the officers on such pay should be employed as Postmaster-General, Burma. The appointment will be an acting one for some time as the first three permanent vacancies in the staff of Postmaster-General should be filled by departmental officers. Messrs. Tulloch and C. C. Sheridan would certainly have been recommended to Government for substantive promotion to Postmaster-General to fill the vacancies caused by the retirement of Mr. Jardine and myself in 1913, and Mr. Schone-

man would have been recommended for similar promotion when Mr. Tulloch retired in March 1914. I consider, therefore, that in view of the undertaking given by the Government of India that all possible protection should be afforded to the personal interests and prospects of the staff of both the Post Office and the Telegraph Department, these three officers should be provided for before a Postmaster-Generalship is permanently filled by one of the telegraph officers referred to above. Further, I propose that when a suitable opportunity occurs, another of these telegraph officers should be utilised in filling one leave vacancy of Postmaster-General which would not in the ordinary course be due to a departmental officer of the Post Office, and thereafter it is likely that it will always be practicable to provide for this second officer of this rank without affecting the prospects and claims of departmental officers of the Post Office. In effect, these two telegraph officers will take the place of civilians for the time being.

While holding the appointment of Postmaster-General a telegraph officer will draw his telegraph pay, whether he is filling a permanent or an officiating vacancy. In the former case he will absorb one appointment of Postmaster-General in the grade to which he would have been promoted from time to time if he had been appointed Postmaster-General on the ordinary scale of pay, and his name will be shown accordingly in the seniority list. The proposal that a telegraph officer holding a Postmaster-Generalship should draw his own pay is made in order to ensure that existing telegraph officers should have as nearly as possible the same prospects of promotion as at present. This would not be the case if it were decided that a telegraph officer appointed Postmaster-General should draw the postal pay as he might at some stage be in receipt of less than his telegraph pay, and acting promotions of telegraph officers would also be affected. It can be arranged without difficulty that the officer selected for appointment as Postmaster-General will be drawing not less than Rs. 1,750, the minimum pay proposed for Postmasters-General, thus avoiding any risk of the complaint that such an officer is inadequately remunerated for the class of work he has to perform.

44. Under the above proposals the services of 25 of the surplus superior officers of the Telegraph Department who will become supernumerary to the authorised establishment can be utilised with advantage until they retire or die. The question of the treatment to be accorded to the remainder of the surplus has been dealt with separately in paragraph 46.

A statement is attached (Annexure III., Statement C) showing exactly how it is proposed to dispose of the existing staff of superior officers and Deputy Superintendents.

45. **Number of upper subordinates of the Telegraph Department now in the service who can be employed under the amalgamation scheme.**—After providing for the employment of 21 superior officers of the Telegraph Department 19 appointments in the proposed superior Traffic Branch remain unfilled. Two of these, namely, the Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, and the assistant to the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, I propose should be filled by the appointment of one officer outside the establishment of the Telegraph Department and of the existing temporary Assistant Director of Traffic. The remaining 17 appointments will be filled by specially selected Deputy Superintendents of the present Traffic, Technical and General Branches. Fourteen appointments of Deputy Superintendent, General, will remain surplus after the requirements of the Engineering Branch have been met, but two or three of these appointments which are now vacant will not be filled in the meantime, and it will be possible to select about nine Deputy Superintendents, General, for permanent appointment to the superior Traffic Branch. Thus there will remain only two or three Deputy Superintendents, General, unprovided for, and the services of these officers will be utilised temporarily, one in the Technical Branch against the additional appointment of Deputy Superintendent proposed for that branch, and the remaining one or two in telegraph offices in place of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, selected for the superior branch. These officers will remain on their present scales of pay, and will be treated in every way as if the present cadre of 72 Deputy Superintendents, General, had remained unaltered, that is, they will be treated as supernumerary Deputy Superintendents, General, temporarily employed as Deputy Superintendents, Traffic or Technical. They will return to engineering work as soon as there are suitable vacancies for them in the reduced cadre of Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, and the appointments in the Traffic and Technical branches temporarily held by them will then be filled up in the ordinary way. The reduction by four of the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, necessitated by the transfer to the superior Traffic Branch of the charge of the Rangoon, Lahore, Delhi, and Karachi telegraph offices will be effected immediately by the transfer of four Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, to the new superior branch, and the promotion of junior Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, to take their places in the higher grades, leaving four vacancies in the lowest grade unfilled. I may point out in this connection that the reduction of four appointments in the present establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, will not affect adversely the prospects of men already in the service, owing to the fact that the total number of higher appointments, for which members of the signalling branch will be eligible, will be materially improved by the formation of the superior Traffic Branch.

VI.—REDUCTION OF EXISTING STAFF.

46. **Retirement on Special Pensions of Surplus Staff of Superior Officers.**—In the preceding paragraphs, I have shown that the establishment proposed for the combined Post and Telegraph Departments will absorb the whole of the sanctioned staff of both departments, with the exception of 50 officers of the superior establishment of the Telegraph Department, and that the services of 25 of these officers can be suitably utilised in Postmaster-General's appointments, in the new superior Traffic Branch and in the Stores Branch. Including one apprentice Assistant Superintendent, who will very shortly qualify for permanent appointment, the total strength of the superior establishment of the Telegraph Department, owing to the cessation of recruitment during the last few years, is at present only 88 against a sanctioned establishment of 96. The actual surplus staff of superior officers for whom it is not possible to provide appointments under the amalgamation scheme is, therefore, only 17, and against this surplus has to be set the compulsory retirement during 1913 of Messrs. Hensley, Dempster and Lees on attaining 55 years of age. It would be extremely wasteful to retain for an uncertain period 14 highly paid officers as supernumerary to the proposed establishment, and, in view of the undertaking given to the staff of both departments in January last that their interests and prospects would be protected, I would be averse from selecting 14 officers for compulsory discharge with compensation pensions under Article 427 of the Civil Service Regulations. I therefore recommend the offer in general terms for a specified period from the date on which amalgamation is effected of such special pensions as will be likely to induce the requisite number of officers to retire voluntarily. In 1887 it was decided to provide some special inducements for the retirement of officers of a certain standing in the Telegraph Department in order to remove a block of promotion, and the terms offered in the Resolution of the Government of India in the Public Works Department, No. 136-T. E., dated the 21st October 1887, were that for a period of six months all officers who had served for 18 years, of which not less than 16 years had been spent on active service, would be considered eligible for retirement on the following terms:—

(*a*) The pension which would be due if the officers were retiring on medical certificate.

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

(*b*) An additional pension calculated at the following rate :—

To officers under 50 years of age—Rs. 1,000 per annum.

To officers in their 51st year—Rs. 900 per annum.
" " 52nd " " 800 " "
" " 53rd " " 500 " "

Officers who had completed their 53rd year were given no extra pension, but were permitted to retire within the prescribed period under the provisions of clause (*a*) above, and the special terms were applicable subject to certain conditions to officers who completed the qualifying period of service at a date subsequent to that of the resolution quoted.

On the 1st April next the 31 officers shown in the statement annexed to this letter (Annexure III., Statement B.) will have completed 18 years' total service. Of this number, two will retire in the ordinary course in July and October 1913, and one other, Mr Streatfeild-James, will be nearly 54 years of age, and will be due to retire in April 1914. Of the remainder I have every reason to suppose that at least 13 officers whose services could be spared would apply to be permitted to retire if special inducements were offered similar to those sanctioned in 1887, and I strongly recommend that they should be given an opportunity of doing so. I do not think that it would be necessary to extend these inducements to officers who had not actually completed the qualifying service on the date on which the orders regarding amalgamation are published. I propose that the concession should be granted subject to the conditions in clauses III. and IV. of the Resolution of the 21st October 1887, and that it should be limited to officers who have the qualifying service on the date of the publication of orders on this scheme, and who submit their resignations within six months from that date.

I am not in a position to say which officers would tender their resignations if the above proposals were accepted, or which of the resignations submitted would be accepted, and I am, therefore, unable to estimate the financial effect of the proposal. It seems probable, however, that the majority of the 13 officers, whose retirements it is hoped to effect by these special inducements, would retire in any case as soon as they had completed the qualifying service for the maximum pension admissible under Article 641 of the Civil Service Regulations, and the effect of offering the special terms proposed will probably not add very greatly to the pensionary charges of the Telegraph Department. If 16 officers do not retire by the time the scheme of amalgamation is brought into effect, the number of supernumerary officers referred to in paragraph 44 will be increased temporarily.

VII.—SPECIAL ADDITIONAL PENSIONS.

47. **Special Additional Pensions now Admissible.**—Under the provisions of Articles 642 and 643 of the Civil Service Regulations, special additional pensions of Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 1,000 a year are admissible to officers of the Telegraph Department appointed in England as rewards of approved service in certain positions, and on the reorganisation of the department in 1910 the Government of India ruled, in Mr. Ley's letter No. 4010–108, dated the 31st May 1910, that the following officers should be considered eligible for these pensions :—

(*a*) Officers appointed not later than 1897—

(i) Additional pensions of Rs. 2,000 a year to those who have rendered three years' approved services as Director-General or as next senior officer in the department (two appointments).

(ii) Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year to those who have rendered approved service as Directors of Telegraphs, 1st, 2nd and 3rd class; the senior Director of Telegraphs, 4th class; or the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief (eight appointments).

(*b*) Officers appointed later than 1897—

Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year to those who have rendered not less than three years of effective service as Director-General; Directors of Telegraphs, 1st and 2nd class, or the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief, provided that in the case of the latter the three years of service have been rendered on a pay of not less than Rs. 1,950 a month (six appointments).

Special additional pensions proposed for officers now in the service.—These special additional pensions should continue to be admissible to officers appointed in England now serving in the Telegraph Department, and I accordingly recommend, subject to the present conditions :—

(*a*) In the case of officers appointed not later than 1897—

(i) Additional pensions of Rs. 2,000 a year for three years' approved service as Chief Engineer or in any capacity on the proposed Rs. 2,250 grade.

(ii) Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year for three years' approved service in the grades of Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 1,750, or as either of the two senior officers in the grade of Rs. 1,500, the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief's appointment being considered as on Rs. 1,750.

(*b*) In the case of officers appointed later than 1897—

Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year to those who have rendered not less than three years of effective service as Chief Engineer; in the grades of Rs. 2,250 and Rs. 2,000; or as either of the two senior officers in the grade of Rs. 1,750.

I have already proposed that all superior officers of the Telegraph Department should retain their telegraph pay irrespective of the duties on which they are from time to time employed, and if this proposal is accepted, there is no necessity specifically to provide in the terms of Articles 642 and 643 of the Civil Service Regulations for telegraph officers holding the appointments of Postmaster-General or Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, and it should be understood that the provisions under "Postal Department" in Article 475 do not apply to telegraph officers holding the appointments mentioned if such officers are ineligible for pensions under Articles 642 or 643 as modified above.

48. **Special additional pensions proposed for officers joining the service after amalgamation is effected.**—As regards the future I consider that the provisions in Article 643 of the Civil Service Regulations should cease to apply to officers appointed to the Telegraph Department after the amalgamation of that department with the Post Office, and that, from that date, the special additional pensions admissible to telegraph officers should be governed by the terms of Article 475 by the alteration of the sub-heading in that article from "Postal Department" to "Posts and Telegraphs" and the inclusion under the revised sub-heading of the appointments of Chief Engineer, Telegraphs, and Director, Telegraph Engineering, the Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic, thus being eligible for the extra pension of Rs. 1,000.

VIII.—POWERS.

49. **Powers of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.**—I recommend that, for the present, the powers of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs should be, as regards the Post Office and its establishments, those which have from time to time been delegated to the Director-General of the Post Office, and, as regards Telegraphs and the establishment connected therewith, the present powers of the Director-General of Telegraphs increased, in respect of the appointment of signal office clerks and telephone operators, to the extent recommended in my letter No. 221-C. T., dated the 29th July 1912. A

statement of these powers, so far as expenditure of post office and telegraph funds is concerned, is annexed to this letter (Appendix IV., Statement A). The only important difference between the powers exercised by the Director-General of the Post Office and the Director-General of Telegraphs, respectively, is in regard to the entertainment of additional establishment, and I do not consider it possible to assimilate the powers of the Director-General in this respect under the two heads until greater experience of the requirements of the Telegraph Department has been gained and trustworthy data accumulated.

50. **Powers of Directors and Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, and Postmasters-General.**—The powers now exercised by the Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents of Telegraphs should, I consider, be delegated to Directors and Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, and the powers of the latter officers, where applicable, should also be exercised by the Chief Electrician, the Superintendent of Stores (or Chief Storekeeper) and the Superintendent of Telegraph Workshops. Postmasters-General should be given the powers, in respect of telegraph traffic, exercised by Directors of Telegraphs under the existing system. I recommend, however, that these powers as defined in Appendix II. to the despatch to the Secretary of State No. 153-Sals., etc., dated the 1st July 1909, should be modified, from the date on which the amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department is effected, to the extent shown in italics in the further statement annexed to this letter (Annexure IV., Statement B). These modifications, so far as items 1, 4, 9, 13, 14, 19, 21, 26, 38 (in the case of Divisional Superintendents' powers only), 42 (in the case of the Superintendent of Workshops only), 43, 45, 48, 50, 53, 58, 60, 62, 71, 72, 75, 79, and 80 are concerned, have already been effected and the remainder are alterations which the experience gained during the last few months has shown to be necessary.

51. **Additions to powers of Postmasters-General in respect of Post Office Administration.**—I recommend that the powers mentioned in items 12, 61; and 77 of this statement should also be exercised by Postmasters-General in the local administration of the Post Office in order to bring their powers in this respect into line generally with the powers which it is proposed should be exercised by Postmasters-General in the administration of telegraph traffic.

IX.—ACCOUNTS AND BUDGET ALLOTMENTS.

52. **General procedure for the preparation of accounts and allotment of budget grants.**—I recommend that, for the present, separate accounts should be maintained for the Post Office and for the Telegraph Department, and that the budget estimate for the two departments should be prepared separately. The details of the alterations in accounts procedure that will be necessary will be settled in communication with the Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs, when the orders of the Government of India on the proposals contained in this letter have been received. The general arrangement will be that Directors and Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, will be provided with funds in respect of engineering work only, including the first fitting of offices. The balance of the funds at present allotted to Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents which will represent establishment and contingent charges on account of the traffic staff and telegraph offices, will be placed at the disposal of the Postmaster-General. Postmasters-General will take the place of Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents in all accounts matters pertaining to traffic management and the maintenance of telegraph offices, and the additional funds necessary for this purpose will be allotted to them from the budget grants provided under the head "Telegraphs." They will keep the separate accounts of the expenditure of these funds now maintained in the Telegraph Department, including a cash book, and will submit these accounts direct to the audit office. The re-allotment of funds to telegraph offices now effected by Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents will be made by Postmasters-General from the grants placed at their disposal. All officers in charge of telegraph offices will send their accounts direct to the audit office as at present. Practically the whole of the telegraph expenditure controlled by Postmasters-General will be chargeable to "Revenue."

53. **Allocation of salaries of staff.**—The salaries of all officers and menials employed solely in connection with telegraph work, including the clerical establishment of the traffic branch of Postmaster-General's offices, should be debited to "Telegraphs," and should, as far as possible, be paid in such a manner that no accounts adjustments between that head and the head "Post Office" will be necessary.

The Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs and the Postmasters-General will be engaged on both postal and telegraph work and their salaries should, therefore, be debited partly to "Post Office" and partly to "Telegraphs." Under the instructions contained in Mr. Ley's letter to the Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs, No. 3026–33, dated the 17th April 1912, my salary, whilst I am in charge of the current duties of the office of the Director-General of Telegraphs, in addition to my duties as the Director-General of the Post Office of India, is being divided between the heads "Post Office" and "Telegraphs" in the proportion of two-thirds and one-third, respectively, and the same proportion has been adopted for the division of the salaries of the Postmasters-General, Bombay and Central Circles, during the experimental amalgamation in those circles. On the other hand the salary of the Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs, and the charges on account of his office establishment are divided between the two heads in the proportion of four-fifths and one-fifth. I am not aware of the considerations on which the latter proportion was based, but the Accountant-General informs me that considerably more than one-third of his time is taken up by telegraph work and he suggests that a proportion of two-thirds and one-third should be adopted for all cases in which a division of charge on account of salaries is necessary. In 1911–12, the gross revenue receipts of the Telegraph Department amounted to Rs. 1,42,74,275 and those of the Post Office to Rs. 3,20,40,516, and according to these figures the proportion suggested by the Accountant-General appears to be justified. It might reasonably be argued that amalgamation with the Telegraph Department should not relieve the Post Office of anything more than the cost of the revision of salaries necessitated by this measure, and this amounts to Rs. 24,983·3—22,772·5 = 2,210·8, or rather more than one-eleventh of the total of the salaries proposed in this letter for the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs and Postmasters-General (including the two Deputy Directors-General of the Post Office of India). It is desirable, however, that the allocation should be the same in every case and it is suggested, as a fair arrangement, that the salaries of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, the ten Postmasters-General and the Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs, and the cost of the Accountant-General's office establishment should all be debited to "Post Office" and "Telegraphs" in the proportion of four-fifths and one-fifth, respectively.

A fixed contribution (Rs. 28,800) towards the cost to the Post Office of central, controlling and accounts offices is already made by the Telegraph Department in the grant provided by the latter for the working charges of combined offices, and this will continue to be made. No other adjustment between the accounts of the two departments appears to be necessary.

X.—CLERICAL AND MENIAL ESTABLISHMENTS.

54. **Strength and Grading of Clerical Establishment.**—The question of the clerical establishment required for the offices of the three Directors and twenty Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering and

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

for the traffic work in Postmaster-General's offices under the scheme of amalgamation has been discussed in detail with each Postmaster-General and Circle Director and the unanimous conclusion, in which I agree, is that the existing establishments should be distributed as follows:—

Present Distribution.		Proposed Distribution.	
Bombay Circle	44	Director, Telegraph Engineering	7*
Central Circle		Postmaster-General, Bombay	12
Madras Circle	30	,, ,, Central	6
		,, ,, Madras	12
		Bombay Division	6
		Ajmere Division	5
		Nagpur Division	5
		Coimbatore Division	4
		Bangalore Division	4
		Madras Division	4
Total	74	Total	65
Punjab Circle	31	Director, Telegraph Engineering	6
United Provinces Circle	26	Postmaster-General, Punjab	12
		,, ,, United Provinces	10
		Karachi Division	5
		Delhi Division	5
		Lahore Division	5
		Lucknow Division	5
		Allahabad Division	6
Total	57	Total	54
Bengal Circle	29	Director, Telegraph Engineering	6
Eastern Bengal and Assam	24	Postmaster-General, Bengal	14
		Postmaster-General, Eastern Bengal and Assam	9
		Calcutta, West Division	5
		,, East Division	5
		Darjeeling Division	5
		Dacca Division	4
		Shillong Division	5
Total	53	Total	53
Burma Circle	28	Postmaster-General (for Engineering and traffic work)	11
		Akyab Division	4
		Mandalay Division	4
		Maymyo Division	4
		Rangoon Division	5
Total	28	Total	28
Grand Total	212	Grand Total	200

With the above distribution there will be a saving of 12 clerks on the present sanctioned establishment of 212 clerks shown in Statement C. of Appendix IV. to the despatch to the Secretary of State, No. 153-Salaries, dated the 1st July 1909. The reduction should, in my opinion, be made in the first instance in the lowest grade of circle and divisional office clerks on Rs. 35 a month, in order to prevent injury to the prospects of the clerks already in the service, and later it may be possible to make a proportionate reduction in the higher grades. Some additional clerical assistance will, however, be required in the majority of the offices detailed above during the transition period, and it may be found necessary to allot temporarily an additional clerk to those engineering divisions in which an attached officer has to be permanently stationed away from headquarters (for example at Quetta in the Karachi Division) I recommend, therefore, that the present sanctioned establishment of 212 clerks should remain unaltered on the understanding that it will be reduced as much, and as quickly, as circumstances will permit. The reductions effected will be reported to Government, and I anticipate an eventual saving under clerical establishment of at least 12 appointments on Rs. 35 a month representing Rs. 5,040 a year.

The appointments of the clerks allotted permanently to Postmasters-General for telegraph traffic work will be added to the sanctioned establishment of their offices, and the clerks themselves should be graded for promotion in these establishments. The appointments of the clerks allotted permanently to the offices of Directors, Telegraph Engineering (the Engineering Branch of the Postmaster-General's office in the case of the Burma Circle), and to Divisional Offices should be graded in four separate cadres under the heads of the four engineering circles, by whom promotions, postings, grant of leave, payment, &c., should be controlled in exactly the same manner as the cadres of circle and divisional office clerks are controlled by the present Circle Directors.

The clerical establishment sanctioned in Mr. Ley's letter No. 7391-91, dated the 18th October 1910, for the office of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief should, I consider, be transferred to my office, where the greater part of the clerical work of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief (deputations, postings and promotions of the staff of the Technical Branch) will in future be performed, and in this case arrangements will be made to supply from my office a suitable clerical staff for the Chief Electrician at Alipore. The latter officer will require the assistance of about two clerks, and a separate establishment for this purpose would not be satisfactory.

55. **Grant of concessions to clerks transferred from one station to another.**—I also recommend that, as in the case of the experimental amalgamation in

* Two of these to be transferred from the office of the existing Director of Telegraphs, Madras Circle.

the Bombay and Central Circles, any clerk, whom it may be necessary under the amalgamation scheme to transfer to another station, should be granted an advance of one month's pay recoverable in six equal monthly instalments; and that any clerk transferred over a distance exceeding 500 miles should be granted a bonus of two months' pay, subject to a maximum of Rs. 100, and on the understanding that the concession will be refused by the head of the office from which such clerk is transferred should no extra expenditure be caused to the clerk by the transfer.

56. **Distribution of menial establishments.**—As regards menial establishments arrangements will be made to provide a suitable staff of peons, etc., for the offices required under the amalgamation scheme from the establishment of the existing circle and divisional offices. The experimental amalgamation in the Bombay and Central Circles has resulted in a slight reduction in the number of office servants, and it is probable that a corresponding saving will be effected in each of the other circles, but the establishment cannot be definitely fixed until amalgamation has been effected, and the actual requirements of officers and offices are known. It is probable, however, that it will be possible under peons alone to dispense eventually with the services of twenty of the men included in the present sanctioned establishment of 163 on rates of pay varying from Rs. 9 to Rs. 15 a month.

57. **Grant of concessions to peons transferred to new stations.**—It will be necessary to transfer a certain number of divisional office peons from places at which there will be no divisional offices under the amalgamation scheme and, as such men will be entitled to one fare only of the lowest class, I recommend the grant to them of a bonus of—

(*a*) one month's pay, if the distance over which the man is transferred is not more than 500 miles, and

(*b*) two month's pay, if the distance exceeds 500 miles.

XI.—FINANCIAL EFFECT.

58. **Ultimate and immediate financial effect.**—The financial effect of the foregoing proposals, as shown in the proposition statement annexed to this letter (Annexure III, Statement D), will be an ultimate saving of about Rs. 2,98,472 a year, but this amount does not include the savings which have already been reported to the Government of India as actually effected in the Telegraph Department since the 1st April last, when the administration of that Department and of the Post Office were brought together under one Director-General, *viz.*, Rs. 12,000 a year on account of the reduction of temporary clerical establishment in the offices of Circle Directors and Divisional Superintendents and Rs. 3,828 a year in the cost of the office establishment of the Director-General of Telegraphs. Moreover, it does not take into account the savings which will be effected in travelling allowances by the reduction in the number of superior officers of the Telegraph Department and the abolition of the touring staff of the Technical Branch, the savings in the rental of office accommodation which will result from the reduction in the number of circle and divisional telegraph charges, nor the savings on account of the anticipated reduction in the permanent clerical and menial establishments sanctioned for the Telegraph Department. The first of these items of saving cannot be estimated; the second will probably exceed Rs. 15,000, the present average expenditure under this head being over Rs. 20,000 a year; the third will amount to Rs. 7,524, the rent of the buildings shown in the margin, and the last will be not less than Rs. 7,500 a year. The total ultimate saving effected by amalgamation will therefore amount to at least Rs. 344,324 a year. This sum leaves out of account the saving of Rs. 50,000 already effected this year in the printing and stationery charges of the Telegraph Department, as it cannot be definitely stated that this saving will be permanent although I have every hope that it will be so, especially as I have arranged to depute an officer for some months to reduce the number of forms and to check the waste which undoubtedly takes place in the larger telegraph offices.

	Rs.	
Belgaum Division	45	a month.
Burma Circle Rangoon Division	300	,,
Moulmein Division	52	,,
Jubbulpore ,,	50	,,
Eastern Bengal and Assam Circle	70	,,
Calicut Division	30	,,
Vizagapatan Division	30	,,
Bareilly Division	50	,,
	627	

Against the savings has to be placed the expenditure involved in the grant to clerks and menials of the bonus recommended in paragraphs 55 and 57 of this letter. The cost of this concession cannot be calculated, but it will probably be less than Rs. 7,000. The estimated saving will also be reduced for a number of years by additional pensionary charges on account of officers retiring prematurely under the provisions proposed in paragraph 46; by the continuation to officers now in the service of the rates of pay of ten of the existing administrative appointments referred to in paragraph 37; and by the employment, so long as the superior engineer officers are in excess of the establishment proposed for the Engineering Branch, of a number of officers whose emoluments will exceed the salaries which will eventually be attached to the traffic and minor engineering appointments in which the services of these officers have to be utilised in the manner described in paragraph 43. The effect of these three proposals cannot be estimated with any degree of accuracy, but it is certain that the adoption of my scheme for the amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department will result in an immediate substantial saving to Government, which will increase materially as the officers now in the service retire or die.

I would explain that, in estimating the financial effect of my proposals, the average value of each appointment, under both the existing and the proposed scales, has been calculated in accordance with the usual rules except in the case of the superior service (Imperial and Provincial) of the Engineering Branch and the superior Traffic Branch. In the case of the Provincial Service of the Engineering Branch the average value of Rs.621 calculated in the enclosure to the dispatch to the Secretary of State No. 11-Sals., etc., dated the 18th January 1912, has been adopted; while in the case of the Imperial service of the Engineering Branch and in the case of the second division of the superior Traffic Branch, the average value of the time scales of pay has been calculated in a similar manner (Appendix III, Statement E) by taking the distribution of officers over each year of service according to the Life and Service tables of the Government of India. This explains why the figure now adopted for the average pay of the superior officers of the Imperial Service differs from the average value shown in Appendix IV, Statement A, to the despatch to the Secretary of State No. 153,-Sals., dated the 1st July 1909.

XII.—DATE OF EFFECT AND PROVISIONAL ARRANGEMENTS.

59. **Necessity for introduction of scheme at earliest possible date.**—In paragraph 4 of Mr. Ley's letter No. 4393–101, dated the 7th June 1912, the Government of India directed that the experimental arrangements sanctioned for the Bombay and Central Circles should remain in force until the question of their permanency had been decided. Under the scheme now recommended the Madras Circle will be linked with these circles for engineering and technical work, and it would obviously be inconvenient to make any change in the experimental arrangements in force in the latter until the orders of Government on the proposals made in this letter are received. In the case of the other six circles, however, the cessation of recruitment during the past few years has reduced the establishment of superior telegraph officers to a number considerably below that actually required, and the continuance of the present system of telegraph administration for anything more than a short period

will certainly necessitate either the resumption of recruitment for the superior staff of the Telegraph Department or the stoppage of all leave to officers of the department. Moreover the staff of both the departments under my charge are naturally extremely anxious about their future position and prospects, and it is very desirable, in my opinion, that amalgamation should be effected at the earliest possible date. I therefore strongly recommend that, if the Government of India approve generally the arrangements now proposed by me, they may be introduced from the 1st April 1913, if practicable; and that if, as seems possible, it is decided to refer my proposals on the subject of the establishment to the Royal Commission which will shortly commence their enquiries in respect of the public services in India, I may be authorised to proceed with the amalgamation of the Post Office and the Telegraph Department on the lines proposed, including the reduction of superior staff and appointments to the superior Traffic Branch on the rates of pay recommended for that branch, as a provisional arrangement subject to such alterations as regards personnel and pay as may be decided upon after consideration of the recommendations of the Commission.

60. **Period required for preliminary arrangements.**—The arrangements for amalgamation recommended in this letter are such that they can be introduced at any time without risk of dislocation of public business, and I need only request that, if the proposed amalgamation is approved, whether provisionally or permanently, the date of effect fixed by the Government of India may be one that will leave me two months in which to form an idea as to the officers of the Telegraph Department who can be permitted to avail themselves of the special terms for retirement which it is proposed to offer to officers for a certain standing, to select the most suitable of the remaining officers for the new administrative and executive charges, and to make all other preliminary arrangements.

XIII.—CONCLUSION.

61. In conclusion, I desire to express the great obligation under which I lie to the Honble. Mr. W. Maxwell, C.I.E., M.V.O. My task of administering the two departments, reorganising the Telegraph Department, and working out the scheme contained in this letter has been an extremely heavy one and, but for his efficient help, in every direction, it would not have been possible to avoid delaying this scheme so long as to promote discontent and suspicion. It is also only right that I should say that most of the details of the scheme have been devised and worked out by Mr. Maxwell from beginning to end, my share in them being confined to criticism and approval.

Mr. Ivor Thomas, M.V.O., and Mr. R. Meredith have all along been in the closest personal touch with us. They have been consulted on every detail, every point has been discussed with them at length, and their valuable counsel and assistance have been ungrudgingly given on all occasions.

I have, &c.,

C. STEWART-WILSON,

Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.

SCHEDULE OF ENCLOSURES.

ANNEXURE I.—Letters from public bodies in Bombay and Central Circles regarding experimental amalgamation. (*Not reprinted.*)

ANNEXURE II.—Letters from Postmasters-General and Superintending Engineer, Telegraphs, Bombay and Central Circles, and from the Accountant General, Post Office and Telegraphs, regarding experimental amalgamation. (*Not reprinted.*)

ANNEXURE III.—Statements A, B, C, D, and E. General and financial effect of proposals. (A, B, C, and E *not reprinted.*)

ANNEXURE IV.—Statements A and B. Schedules of powers of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, Postmasters-General, and Directors and Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, &c. (*Not reprinted.*)

ANNEXURE III.

STATEMENT D.

Statement showing the ultimate cost of the revised Establishment.

PRESENT SCALE.				PROPOSED SCALE.			
Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total.	Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total.
		Rs.	Rs.			Rs.	Rs.
Director-General of the Post Office of India.	1	3,000 for 5 years and thereafter Rs. 3,000—100—3,500.	3,166·6	Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs.	—	3,500—100—4,000	3,833·3
Postmaster-General	1	2,250—50—2,500	2,416·6	Postmaster-General -	2	2,500	5,000
,, ,,	3	1,750—50—2,000	5,749·8	,, ,, -	2	2,250	4,500
,, ,,	6	1,500—50—1,750	9,999·6	,, ,, -	3	2,000	6,000
				,, ,, -	3	1,750	5,250
Two Local allowances for Deputy Directors - General, Post Office.	—	200	400	Two Local allowances for Deputy Directors-General of the Post Office.	—	200	400
Exchange compensation admissible on the average pay of *permanent* Director-General and Postmasters-General.	—	6¼ per cent.	1,261·7				
		Remainder of Post Office appointments unchanged.					
				ENGINEERING.			
Director-General of Telegraphs.	1	3,000	3,000	Chief Engineer, Telegraphs.	1	2,750	2,750
Exchange compensation allowance.	—	—	138·9	Director, Telegraph Engineering.	1	2,000	2,000
Director of Telegraphs.	2	2,250	4,500	,, ,,	2	1,500	3,000

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

STATEMENT D.—*cont.*

PRESENT SCALE.				PROPOSED SCALE.			
Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total.	Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total.
		Rs.	Rs.			Rs.	Rs.
Director of Telegraphs.	2	2,000	4,000	Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering (including Chief Electrician and one Assistant and also the Personal Assistant to the Director-General and the assistant to the Chief Engineer.)	24	21 Imperial at 866·5.	18,196·5
,, ,, ,,	3	1,750	5,250			21 Provincial at 621.	13,041
,, ,, ,,	3	1,500	4,500				
Electrical Engineer-in-Chief.	1	1,500—50—1,750 100—2,250	1,875	Assistant Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.	18		
Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents. Imperial officers	48	866·5	41,592				
Superintendents. Provincial.	36	621	22,356				
				Two local allowances for the Chief Electrician and his senior Assistant.	—	100	200
				Two local allowances for the Personal Assistant to the Director-General, the assistant to the assistant to the Chief Engineer.	—	100	200
				One local allowance for the junior Assistant Electrician.	—	50	50
Superintendent of Telegraph Workshops.	1	700—50—1,250	1,030	Superintendent of Telegraph Workshops.	1	700—50—1,250	1,030
Chief Storekeeper -	1	600—40—800	733·3	Chief Storekeeper -	1	600—40—800	733·3
Deputy Superintendents, General.	8	400—25—500	3,785·6	Deputy Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.	8	400—25—500	3,785·6
,, ,, ,,	16	325—15—400	6,000	,, ,, ,,	16	325—15—400	6,000
,, ,, ,,	48	250—15—325	14,400	,, ,, ,,	34	250—15—325	10,200
				Four local allowances for Personal Assistants to Directors, Telegraph Engineering.	—	50	200
Deputy Superintendent, Technical.	1	400—25—500	473·2	Deputy Superintendent, Telegraphs, Technical.	1	400—25—500	473·2
,, ,,	2	325—15—400	750	,, ,, ,,	2	325—13—400	750
,, ,,	3	250—15—325	900	,, ,, ,,	4	250—15—325	1,200
				Traffic.			
				Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.	1	1,750—50—2,000	1,916·6
				Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic.	2	1,200—40—1,400	2,666·6
				Superintendents, Calcutta, Bombay and Madras offices.	4	1,000	4,000
				Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.	6	800	4,800
				Local allowance for Assistant Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.	—	150	150

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

STATEMENT D.—*cont.*

PRESENT SCALE.				PROPOSED SCALE.			
Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total.	Designation.	No.	Rate.	Total.
		Rs.	Rs.			Rs.	Rs.
				Assistant to Deputy Director-General of the Post Office Traffic. Superintendents, Agra, Karachi, Rangoon, Lahore, and Delhi offices. Superintendents of post offices, Traffic, in offices of Postmasters-General. Assistant Superintendents, Calcutta and Bombay offices.	27	250—15—400 400—20—700, at Rs. 458·5	12,379·5
				Local allowance for Assistant to Deputy Director-General of the Post Office, Traffic.	—	100	100
				Probationary appointment, superior Traffic Branch.	—	¼ of 200 = 100	100
Deputy Superintendent, Traffic.	8	400—25—500	3,785·6	Deputy Superintendents of Telegraphs, Traffic, in other offices not named above.	8	400—25—500	3,785·6
" " "	16	325—15—400	6,000	" " "	16	325—15—400	6,000
" " "	*32	250—15—325	9,600	" " "	27	250—15—325	8,100
		Remainder of Telegraph Appointments unchanged.					
Total - -	243	—	1,57,663·9	Total - -	215	—	1,32,791·2

Saving of 28 appointments and of Rs. 24,872·7 a month or Rs. 2,98,472 a year.

Certified that the entries in the column "Present scale" have been checked and found correct.

S. LEVETT-YEATS.
Accountant-General, Post Office and Telegraphs.

CALCUTTA,
7th November 1912.

* One of these appointments is held vacant against a temporary appointment of Assistant Director of Traffic at the headquarters of the Director-General.

(ii) *Despatch from the Secretary of State for India, To His Excellency the Right Honourable the Governor-General of India in Council, Telegraph No. 5, dated India Office, London, 6th March* 1914.

AMALGAMATION OF THE POSTAL AND TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENTS IN INDIA.

MY LORD,

I HAVE received and very carefully considered in Council the letter from Your Excellency's Government, No. 324, Finance, of the 30th October last, submitting for my approval a scheme for the permanent amalgamation of the postal and telegraph departments in India.

2. I agree with your Government that the proposals have been formulated by Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson with great thoroughness and mastery of the subject, and, subject to the following observations, I sanction them. I have already communicated to you my general approval of them in my telegram quoted in the margin.*

3. There are certain matters referred to in the 16th paragraph of your letter, such as the Director-General's proposals regarding the financial powers of certain officers and regarding clerical and menial establishments which you state that you have not yet fully considered. I am willing that you should deal separately with these matters so far as they are within your powers, but for such as may be beyond those powers I will await your specific recommendations.

4. You also state in paragraph 5 that the new scheme will make necessary some slight amendments in the Post Office and Telegraph Acts, and that these will be undertaken in due course. You further promise (paragraph 8) in connection with the proposals for the staff at headquarters that you will examine the position afresh after two years' time with a view to considering whether any reduction can then be effected. I will await your report on the result of this examination.

5. In paragraph 13 you refer to the question of recruitment, and your recommendations in the matter are provisional, and subject to the result of the inquiries of the Public Services Commission. It is on this understanding that my sanction is given.

6. In paragraph 14 you request sanction to the continuance as part of the Telegraph Establishment of the appointment of a Royal Engineer Officer for the charge of wireless stations in India. I approve this arrangement.

7. The proposals summarised in paragraph 12 of your letter for determining the future salaries of officers at present in the Department appear to me adequate if not generous; and I consider that promotions to a higher rate of pay according to the scale proposed should be subject to the continued efficiency of the officer in question, and that if an officer has been passed over for an appointment which if held by an officer not at present in the service would be paid at Rs. 1,750—2,000, he should not be allowed to draw higher pay than Rs. 1,750, unless subsequently promoted.

8. In respect of compensation pensions, it will no doubt be your intention that inefficient officers should be compulsorily retired under the ordinary rules and should not be considered entitled to the additional pensions now proposed. In reference to the proposal that officers desirous of accepting the special terms of retirement should be allowed to take any leave they may have to their credit, I have no objection provided that the compensation pension is that due in respect of the age of the officer in question when he actually retires.

9. While agreeing to your proposals for the special pensions of Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 1,000 to officers at present in the service, I desire that the qualification of "approved service" should be strictly insisted upon, and that no officer who has been passed over for promotion from the Rs. 1,750 grade, and no officer in that grade at the end of his service who is not declared by the Director-General to be fitted for promotion, should be considered entitled to the special pension.

10. Referring to the statement in the twelfth paragraph of your letter that it is hoped to find employment for one of the redundant officers in a State Railway Telegraph appointment, I desire that the advantage of such transfers should carefully be borne in mind so long as the redundancy of officers continues.

11. Finally, I take note of the belief you express that the amalgamation of the Post Office and Telegraph Departments will not excite serious opposition and discontent among the members of either Department, and I trust that this will be found to be the case.

I have the honour to be,
My Lord,
Your Lordship's most obedient
humble servant,
(Signed) CREWE.

* *From Secretary of State to Viceroy, Finance Department, 17th February* 1914.

Your Despatch, dated 30th October, No. 324, Post Office and Telegraph Department. I sanction introduction of scheme from 1st April next, subject to modification that special pensions granted to officers under paragraph 12, clause 1, of your letter shall be determined by their age on actual retirement, and subject also to my further orders regarding pay of Chief Engineer and appointments which are to qualify for special pensions under Articles 642 and 643, Civil Service Regulations.

(iii) *Government of India Resolution No.* 3062—3066-101 (*Department of Commerce and Industry, Post and Telegraph Establishments*), *dated Simla, the 24th April* 1914.

In the Resolution of the Government of India in the Department of Commerce and Industry, No. 830-833, dated the 24th January 1912, it was announced that, as a preliminary step in the direction of the ultimate amalgamation of the postal and telegraph services in India, the administration of the two existing Departments of Posts and Telegraphs, would, as an experimental measure, be brought together under one head. It was further decided that a single officer of tried administrative capacity should be entrusted with the duty of formulating and carrying out an experimental scheme for the fusion of the two services. Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson, who was then Director-General of the Post Office of India, was selected to hold charge of the combined office of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs with effect from the 1st April 1912.

2. The scope of the experimental scheme devised, with the assistance of the Honourable Mr. Maxwell, C.I.E., M.V.O., by Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson, and sanctioned by the Government of India, was restricted to the Bombay and Central Postal and Telegraph Circles. It was introduced with effect from the 1st July 1912, and has continued in force since that date.

3. The main principles of the scheme referred to above, and the question of its extension to the whole of India as a permanent measure, were fully discussed with numerous officers of all ranks of the two departments and with members of the commercial community. Expressions of opinion on the experiment were also invited from the general public. Opinion, both official and non-official, has been uniformly and thoroughly favourable. The Government of India have therefore had no hesitation in concluding that the experiment has yielded a full measure of success. Accordingly, with the assent of His Majesty's Secretary of State for India, they have decided that the system which has been in force in the Bombay and Central Postal and Telegraph Circles since the 1st July 1912, shall, sub-

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

ject, particularly in Burma, to certain modifications in minor matters of detail, be finally adopted throughout British India with effect from the 1st April 1914.

4. It was explained in the Resolution of January 1912, referred to above, that the amalgamation of the two services in question involved a complete separation of the Engineering from the Traffic work of the Telegraph Department. The following details indicate the manner in which this is to be effected :—

I. The appointment of Director-General of Telegraphs will be finally abolished, and that of Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, which was tentatively created with effect from the 1st April 1912, will become a permanency. The pay of the Director-General will be Rs. 3,500 rising by annual increments of Rs. 100 to Rs. 4,000 a month, and he will not be entitled to exchange compensation allowance.

II. At Headquarters the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs will be assisted in the administration of the telegraph service by the following staff of officers :—

1 Chief Engineer of Telegraphs.
1 Superintendent of Telegraph Engineering as Personal Assistant to the Director-General.
1 Superintendent of Telegraph Engineering as Assistant to the Chief Engineer.
1 Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic.
1 Officer of the first division of the superior Traffic branch which will now be formed, as Assistant Director-General of Telegraph Traffic.
1 Officer of the second division of the superior Traffic branch as Assistant to the Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic.

The tenure of the appointments of Personal Assistant to the Director-General and Assistant to the Chief Engineer will ordinarily be limited to three years.

III. The appointment of Electrical Engineer-in-Chief will be abolished, but three engineering officers will be provided to assist and advise the Director-General and the Chief Engineer in special technical matters, to carry on research work and test instruments in the Store Yards at Alipur, to conduct classes for instructions in technical matters, and to hold technical examinations. Two of these officers will be of the same rank as Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering, and will be designated "Chief Electrician" and "Assistant Electrician" respectively, while the third officer will be of the rank of Assistant Superintendent of Telegraph Engineering, and will be designated "Assistant Electrician." The services of an officer of the Royal Engineers will continue to be placed at the disposal of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs so long as required.

IV. The administrative control of the telegraph engineering work will comprise four charges, namely :—

(*a*) The Bombay Postal Circle (less the late Karachi Telegraph Division), and the Central and Madras Postal Circles.
(*b*) The Punjab Postal Circle (with the addition of the late Karachi Telegraph Division), and the United Provinces Postal Circle.
(*c*) The Bengal and Assam and the Bihar and Orissa Postal Circles (which take the place of the Bengal and the Eastern Bengal and Assam Postal Circles).
(*d*) The Burma Postal Circle.

The three first-named charges will be placed under officers of the standing of the present Directors of Telegraph Circles. These three officers will be styled "Directors, Telegraph Engineering." They will control the entire engineering staff within the limits of their charges, and will be responsible not only for the design, construction, and maintenance of telegraph and telephone lines, but also for the first fitting of telegraph offices, the fitting up and working of telephone exchanges, the erection and maintenance of power plant, and all other circle work which at present devolves on the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief. The administrative control of telegraph engineering in the Burma postal circle will be placed in the hands of the Postmaster-General, who will, for the present, be one of the surplus telegraph officers referred to in paragraph 8 of this Resolution. This circle cannot conveniently be linked for engineering purposes with any of the other provinces; its postal and telegraph work is at present comparatively light, and can all be undertaken by one officer with engineering knowledge, while the engineering duties alone would not justify the employment of an administrative engineering officer.

V. Directly subordinate to the Engineering administrative officers, there will be 20 charges, in each of which the Engineering work will be under the control of an officer of the same standing as a Divisional Superintendent of Telegraphs under the present system of administration, assisted by a sufficient staff of junior officers (Assistant and Deputy Superintendents). The officers holding these charges will be designated Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering. They will occupy, in regard to Engineering and Technical work, exactly the same position as that now held by Divisional Superintendents of Telegraphs in respect of Engineering and Traffic work. In Burma they will, in addition to their Engineering duties, continue to be responsible, as explained in VII. below, for some of the Traffic work which in other Circles is to be separated entirely from Engineering duties. The designations of officers appointed to assist the Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, will be, for officers of the superior service, Assistant Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering, and for upper subordinates, Deputy Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering. The sanctioned staff of such officers will consist of 17 Assistant Superintendents and 37 Deputy Superintendents. Four more Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, will be employed as Personal Assistants to Directors of Telegraph Engineering and the Postmaster-General, Burma, six in the Store Depôts at Alipore, Rangoon, Bombay, and Madras, and 11 as a special staff, from which three will be allotted to each of the Directors of Telegraph Engineering, and two to the Postmaster-General, Burma, for employment on special works. The time scales of pay now in force for the superior establishment of the Telegraph Department will be retained for Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering; but in the case of efficient officers already in the service, the condition will be waived that no officer shall draw more than the pay of the 11th year of service unless he holds a divisional charge or a charge which is recognised as of equal importance.

VI. The greater part of the duties hitherto assigned to the superior staff of the Technical branch will be transferred to the Engineering branch, and the Technical branch will in future consist only of the Deputy Superintendents and subordinates employed in the branch. The number of Deputy Superintendents will be increased from six to seven. Their designation will be changed to Deputy Superintendents—Telegraphs (Technical), and they will be employed, two at Headquarters under the orders of the Chief Electrician, and one each in the Bombay, Madras, Calcutta, Lahore, and Rangoon Telegraph offices under the orders of the Directors—Telegraph Engineering (in Burma, the Postmaster-General). The present sanctioned staff of 34 subordinates, styled Technical Telegraph Master or Telegraphist, will remain unaltered.

VII. Traffic work will be controlled at Headquarters, under the Director-General, by the Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic referred to under sub-paragraph (II.) above; and the Traffic work which has hitherto been performed by Directors and Divisional Superintendents of Telegraphs will pass to the control of the Postmasters-General in charge of the eight existing Postal Circles. Each Postmaster-General will be given the services, for Telegraph Traffic work, of an officer of about the standing of a Deputy Postmaster-General, with the following staff of Assistants :—

Bombay Circle	3
Central Circle	2
Madras Circle	3
Punjab Circle	3
United Provinces Circle	2

Bengal and Assam Circle - - -	4
Bihar and Orissa Circle - - -	1
Burma Circle - - - -	1

By Traffic work is meant the disposal of all questions connected with the establishment of Government Telegraph Offices, whether departmental or combined, the supervision and control of all telegraph work performed inside such offices excepting the maintenance of wireless and other telegraph apparatus (such as Baudot, Wheatstone, repeaters, &c.), and the testing of lines in offices in which Technical branch men are not permanently employed. In the Burma Circle some Traffic duties will devolve on officers of the Engineering Branch. These officers will be required to inspect all departmental telegraph offices in that Province except Rangoon (with its local departmental offices), Mandalay, Moulmein, and Bassein, and to submit to the Traffic Branch of the Postmaster-General's office the inspection reports on these offices.

VIII. To provide a suitable staff of officers to control the larger telegraph offices and to assist the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs and Postmasters-General, a separate superior Traffic Branch will be created consisting of the following 40 appointments :—

(*a*) Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic, pay Rs. 1,750—50—2,000.

(*b*) Superior Traffic Branch, First Division :—

8 Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic.*

3 Superintendents in charge of the Calcutta, Bombay, and Madras Telegraph Offices.*

1 Assistant Director-General of Telegraph Traffic.*

(*c*) Superior Traffic Branch, Second Division :—

2 Assistant Superintendents in the Calcutta and Bombay offices.†

19 Superintendents of Post Offices, Traffic, as Assistants to Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic.†

5 Superintendents in charge of the Agra, Rangoon, Karachi, Lahore, and Delhi telegraph offices.†

1 Assistant to the Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic.†

Eventually this branch will consist of specially selected and trained traffic officers, and will be recruited as far as possible from subordinates selected at any stage of their service. All officers appointed to the second division of the branch, excluding the superior officers referred to below, who will draw travelling allowances at the rates at present admissible for Superintendents or Assistant Superintendents of Telegraphs, will be treated as officers of the first class for purposes of the travelling allowance regulations the daily allowance admissible being that prescribed in Appendix 25 of the Civil Service Regulations for Superintendents of Post Offices, viz., Rs. 4 a day.

To commence with, 21 appointments in the superior Traffic Branch will be filled by superior officers now serving in the Telegraph Department, who would otherwise form a surplus owing to the reduction of the establishment of Directors, Superintendents, and Assistant Superintendents of Telegraphs. Such officers will serve on the pay to which they would have been entitled if they had been employed in the Engineering Branch, and will remain, except in very special circumstances, in the superior Traffic Branch, but, as far as possible, the selections for this branch will be made with the consent of the officers. Officers so selected will be granted all increments under the existing time scale of pay for Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents of Telegraphs as they become due, provided their work is satisfactory, and the rule under which an officer is not permitted to go beyond the pay of the 11th year of service, unless he is in charge of a division or its equivalent, will be waived in their case. Officers belonging to the superior establishment of the Telegraph Department who are employed as Assistants to Deputy Postmasters-General, Traffic, will be designated Assistant Postmasters-General, Traffic.

5. The distribution and ultimate strength, pay, allowances, &c. of the staff of superior officers and upper subordinates sanctioned for telegraph work, will be as shown in the Annexure to this Resolution. The ultimate effect of the decisions set forth in the preceding paragraph will be the substitution of a staff of 46 Telegraph Engineers for the existing establishment of 96 superior Telegraph officers (excluding the Superintendent of Workshops and the Chief Storekeeper); the reduction of the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering (hitherto termed Deputy Superintendents, General), from 72 to 58; the increase of the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Technical, by one appointment; the reduction by five of the establishment of Deputy Superintendents, Traffic, employed in Telegraph offices, caused by the removal from this cadre of the appointments of Assistant Director of Traffic (temporary) and of Deputy Superintendents in charge of the Rangoon, Karachi, Lahore, and Delhi offices; and the creation of a new superior Traffic Branch consisting of 40 appointments; in all a net reduction of 28 appointments.

6. The establishments now sanctioned do not include leave reserves. In the case of the Engineering Branch the total number of officers present on duty will always be maintained at sanctioned strength by the appointment, when necessary, of additional Deputy Superintendents in the lowest grade to take the place of superior officers absent on leave, &c. Deputy Superintendents will not, however, be appointed to officiate as Assistant Superintendents. Temporary vacancies in the superior Traffic Branch caused by the absence of officers on leave, &c., will be filled by officiating appointments to that Branch, and any vacancies caused by such appointments will be filled in the usual manner.

7. On the Post Office side the only officers directly affected by the scheme of amalgamation herein described are the Postmasters-General. A revision of their pay has already been under contemplation. In view of their increased work and responsibility under the amalgamation scheme, it has been decided to adopt the following scale of pay of these officers, to whom no exchange compensation allowance will be admissible in future :—

	Rs.
2 appointments on - -	2,500 a month.
2 „ „ - -	2,250 „
3 „ „ - -	2,000 „
3 „ „ - -	1,750 „

The pay of these grades will be attainable by any officer holding the appointment of Postmaster-General, whether he be a member of the Indian Civil Service or promoted from the ranks of departmental postal officers. Officers of the Telegraph Department appointed to be Postmaster-General will continue to draw the pay to which they would ordinarily be entitled on the scales laid down for Telegraph officers.

8. The reductions in establishment referred to in paragraph 5 above cannot be effected at once owing to the pledge which has been given by the Government of India that in such steps as may be taken towards the amalgamation of the two services all possible protection should be afforded to the personal interests and prospects of the existing staff of both Departments in all grades. The reductions in the establishments of Upper Subordinates will be made in the lowest grades, and will be effected at once, without detriment to the prospects of subordinates, by the transfer of 18 Deputy Superintendents from the present General and Traffic Branches to the superior Traffic Branch, and the temporary employment of three Deputy Superintendents, General, in vacancies in the revised cadres of Deputy Superintendents, Technical and Traffic. The surplus staff will be confined entirely to the superior establishment. Of this surplus 21 officers will be employed in the Superior Traffic Branch in the manner described in paragraph 4 (VII.) above; one will be employed as Chief Storekeeper, and one as Assistant to the Chief Storekeeper; one will be employed as Postmaster-General, Burma, and another will be employed as

* First grade, two on Rs. 1,200—40—1,400; second grade, four on Rs. 1,000; third grade, six on Rs. 800.

† On a time scale of pay rising from Rs. 250 by annual increments of Rs. 15 to Rs. 400 and thereafter by annual increments of Rs. 20 to Rs. 600 a month.

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

Postmaster-General in some other circle as soon as a leave vacancy occurs which would not in the ordinary course be filled by a departmental officer of the Post Office. Other excess officers, who will mainly be officers on leave, will be treated as supernumerary to the sanctioned superior establishment of the Engineering Branch. To reduce this excess as rapidly as possible, the following rates of pension and leave concessions are offered as a special concession to senior officers in the Department:—

(I) All efficient officers of the Telegraph Department who have on the 1st April 1914 served for 18 years, of which not less than 16 years have been spent on active service, are eligible for retirement from the Department. Pension on the following scale will be granted to those officers whose resignation may be accepted:—

(*a*) The pension which would be due under existing rules if the officers concerned were retiring on medical certificate.

(*b*) An additional pension calculated at the following rate—

	Per annum. Rs.
To officers under 50 years of age -	1,000
To officers in their 51st year - -	900
,, ,, 52nd ,, - -	800
,, ,, 53rd ,, - -	500

Provided that the resignation of the officers concerned is submitted to the Government of India within six months from the date of this resolution.

(II) When an officer has tendered his resignation through his superior officer, it is obligatory that the application should be submitted for the orders of the Government of India, and it cannot be cancelled except with the approval and sanction of Government.

(III) The Governor-General in Council reserves the right to accept or to refuse any application for retirement under these terms, or to postpone the date on which such retirement is to take effect, according to the interests of the public service.

(IV) Officers taking advantage of these concessions will be admitted to any leave that may be due to them preparatory to retirement, but the compensation pension granted will be that due in respect of the actual age on retirement.

9. There are at present 11 superior appointments of which the pay exceeds Rs. 1,250, and to which officers now in the service could reasonably have expected promotion under the present system. It will be seen that, in place of these, only five superior administrative appointments have been provided. In order to safeguard the interests of officers now in the service, and at the same time to guard against unduly rapid promotion consequent on the reduction in the cadre which the concessions mentioned in the last paragraph are expected to effect, it has been decided to adopt the following scale for all officers serving in the Telegraph Department on 31st March 1914.

Number of Appointments.	Rate of Pay.	Condition of Appointment.	
		Permanent.	Officiating.
1	Rs. 2,750 - -	No condition -	No condition.
1	Rs. 2,250 Imperial. / Rs. 1,800 Provincial.	Not less than 30 years' service.	Not less than 27 years' service.
2	Rs. 2,000 Imperial. / Rs. 1,600 Provincial.	Not less than 27 years' service.	Not less than 24 years' service.
4	Rs. 1,750 Imperial. / Rs. 1,400 Provincial.	Not less than 24 years' service.	Not less than 22 years' service.
3	Rs. 1,500 Imperial. / Rs. 1,200 Provincial.	Not less than 22 years' service.	Not less than 20 years' service.

The first appointment is that of Chief Engineer and is unconditional. The remaining appointments will be held, irrespective of the duties performed, by officers who have the necessary qualifying service. If a vacancy (whether permanent or officiating) in this scale cannot be filled owing to the next senior qualified officer being ineligible by length of service, the remaining vacancies in the chain will still be filled as though he had been promoted. For the purposes of this scale temporary officers who have been taken on to the permanent cadre will date their service from the time of joining the permanent establishment. This scale will continue in force as long as there remain in the Department any officers now in service who would, but for the amalgamation, have risen to enjoy the rates of pay hitherto admissible to the officers now holding the 11 administrative appointments in question. Promotions to a higher rate of pay according to the scale prescribed above will be subject to the continued efficiency of the officer in question.

10. All officers in receipt of pay at the rate of Rs. 1,500 and upwards, or the Provincial Service equivalent, will be eligible, irrespective of the duties on which they are employed, for daily allowance at the rate of Rs. 7.8.0 a day prescribed for Directors of Telegraphs in item 46 of Appendix 25 to the Civil Service Regulations.

11. Subject to any changes which may be necessary as the result of the inquiries instituted by the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India, the following principles will be observed in the recruitment of officers for the superior telegraph appointments. For the Engineering Branch, approximately one-half of the superior staff will be recruited from England, one-fourth in India, and the remaining one-fourth by promotion from the subordinate ranks; that is to say, ordinarily one officer will be recruited from England annually, the second vacancy in each year being filled alternately by the appointment direct to the Provincial Service of a candidate selected in India and by promotion to that service of a selected subordinate. In the case of the superior Traffic Branch the majority of the appointments will be filled, as the surplus staff of officers belonging to the present superior and upper subordinate establishments is exhausted, by the selection of specially qualified officers from the upper subordinate and subordinate staff of the Department. In order, however, to guard against the possibility of a dearth of suitable officer for the highest Traffic appointments, and with a view to obtaining when necessary from other sources, including other telegraph administrations, the services of officers possessing special qualifications, the Director-General will be at liberty to make direct appointments to the superior Traffic Branch from outside the ranks of the signalling establishments at any position in the scale which may be considered suitable. Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering, will be recruited in exactly the same manner as the present Deputy Superintendents, General, except that subordinates of the Technical Branch as well as Inspecting Telegraph Masters and Inspecting Telegraphists will be eligible, if qualified, for selection as Deputy Superintendents, Telegraph Engineering.

12. The introduction of the scheme described above will necessitate a redistribution of the clerical and menial establishments of the present Telegraph Department. Any clerk whom it may be necessary to transfer to another station will be granted an advance of one month's pay recoverable in six equal instalments, and any clerk transferred over a distance exceeding 500 miles will be granted a bonus of two month's pay, subject to a maximum of Rs. 100, provided that it is shown that the clerk has actually incurred extra expenditure owing to his transfer. Ultimately certain reductions will be effected in the strengths of the clerical and menial establishments, but their extent cannot at present be determined. In any case due regard will be paid to the interests of men now in the service. The appointment of the clerks allotted permanently to Postmasters-General for Telegraph

Traffic work will be added to the sanctioned establishment of their offices, and the clerks themselves will be graded for promotion in these establishments. The appointments of the clerks allotted permanently to the offices of Directors, Telegraph Engineering (the Engineering Branch of the Postmaster-General's office in the case of the Burma Circle) and to the Divisional Offices will be graded in four separate cadres under the heads of the four Engineering Circles, by whom promotions, postings, grant of leave, payment, &c., will be controlled in exactly the same manner as the cadres of Circle and Divisional Office clerks are controlled by the present Circle Directors. The clerical establishment sanctioned for the office of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief will be transferred to the Director-General's Office, where the greater part of the clerical work of the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief will in future be performed, and arrangements will be made to supply from the Director-General's Office a suitable clerical staff for the Chief Electrician at Alipore.

13. The headquarters of officers in the Traffic Branch, except in the cases of officers employed in telegraph offices, will be the headquarters of the Director-General or the Postmaster-General, as the case may be. In the case of the Engineering Branch, the headquarters of the Chief Engineer and his Assistant and of the Personal Assistant to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs will be those of the Director-General. All the officers employed at the headquarters of the Director-General will, as at present arranged, accompany the Government of India to Simla every year, with the exception of the Assistant to the Chief Engineer and either the Assistant Director-General of Telegraph Traffic or the Assistant to the Deputy Director-General of Telegraph Traffic. The headquarters of the three Directors of Telegraph Engineering will be fixed at Bombay, Lahore (ultimately Delhi), and Calcutta, and those of the Divisional Superintendents of Telegraph Engineering at the following places:—

1. Bombay, Central and Madras Circle—(*a*) Bombay; (*b*) Ajmere; (*c*) Nagpur; (*d*) Trichinopoly for the present, but Coimbatore when office accommodation is available; (*e*) Balgalore; and (*f*) Madras.
2. Punjab and United Provinces Circle—(*a*) Karachi; (*b*) Delhi; (*c*) Lahore; (*d*) Lucknow; and (*e*) Allahabad.
3. Bengal and Eastern Bengal and Assam Circle—(*a*) and (*b*) Calcutta; (*c*) Darjeeling; (*d*) Dacca; and (*e*) Shillong.
4. Burma—(*a*) Rangoon; (*b*) Akyab; (*c*) Maymyo; and (*d*) Mandalay.

The area of the divisions generally will be greatly increased under this scheme. It will, therefore, probably be necessary in the majority of divisions to station at least one attached officer to the Engineering Branch at some place other than the Headquarters of the Division. These postings will be left to the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs to be made according to actual requirements in each case.

14. Under Articles 642 and 643 of the Civil Service Regulations certain officers of the Telegraph Department, in accordance with present orders, are eligible for certain special additional pensions. The reorganisation of the Department and the abolition of certain posts render a revision of these orders necessary. It has accordingly been decided that additional special pensions shall continue to be admissible as follows to officers who were eligible for special additional pensions under Articles 642 and 643:—

(*a*) In the case of officers appointed not later than 1897—

(i) Additional pensions of Rs. 2,000 a year for three years' approved service as Chief Engineer or in any capacity on the Rs. 2,250 grade.

(ii) Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year for three years' approved service in the grades of Rs. 2,000 and Rs. 1,750, or as either of the two senior officers in the grade of Rs. 1,500, the Electrical Engineer-in-Chief's appointment being considered as on Rs. 1,750.

(*b*) In the case of officers appointed later than 1897—

Additional pensions of Rs. 1,000 a year to those who have rendered not less than three years of effective and approved service as Chief Engineer in the grades of Rs. 2,250 and Rs. 2,000, or as either of the two senior officers in the grade of Rs. 1,750.

(*c*) No officer who has been passed over for promotion from the Rs. 1,750 grade, and no officer in that grade at the end of his service who is not declared by the Director-General to be fitted for promotion, will be considered entitled to the additional special pensions referred to above.

15. The terms stated in the preceding paragraph are applicable to those officers who were employed in the Telegraph Department on the 31st March 1914, and who are eligible to attain to the special rates of pay mentioned in paragraph 9 above. The grant of additional special pensions to officers appointed subsequently to that date in the posts of Chief Engineer, Telegraphs, Director, Telegraph Engineering, and Deputy Director-General, Telegraph Traffic, will be governed by the provisions of Article 475 of the Civil Service Regulations.

16. The scheme of amalgamation above described closely resembles the systems in force in the United Kingdom, Holland, Belgium, and Italy, where Engineering and Traffic Officers are as far as possible employed solely on duties for which they are recruited and specially trained, and it is believed that a threefold advantage will accrue therefrom. From the point of view of the State, the redistribution of duties, and in particular the abolition of dual control in combined offices, will undoubtedly result in increased economy and efficiency. The public at the same time will reap the advantage of the greater telegraph and telephone facilities which may be expected to result from the increased efficiency of the administration. Finally, the scheme not only assures adequate protection of their prospects to all Telegraph officers now in service, but it also offers them a more congenial range of duties, while affording, for the first time, to competent subordinates a prospect of advancement to well-paid appointments. The Governor-General in Council desires to take this opportunity of expressing his very high appreciation of the manner in which Sir Charles Stewart-Wilson and the Hon. Mr. Maxwell have dealt with the many important and difficult problems involved in the formulation of the scheme of amalgamation now finally approved. In the opinion of the Government of India the scheme adequately provides for the interests of the officers of both Departments while affording an improved service to the public, combined with an ultimate saving in annual expenditure.

APPENDIX I. (*continued*).

ANNEXURE.

Statement showing the Designation of, and other Particulars relating to, the Appointments of Officers to be employed exclusively on Telegraph Work.

Designation.	Number of Appointments.	Rate of Pay.	Local or other Allowances.	Remarks.
Engineering and Technical Branches.		Rs.		
Chief Engineer, Telegraphs - -	1	2,750		
Director, Telegraph Engineering -	1	2,000		
" " " -	2	1,500		
Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering (including Chief Electrician, and one Assistant; also the Personal Assistant to the Director-General, and the Assistant to the Chief Engineer).	24	380—40—700—50—1,250 (Imperial Service) 21 appointments.	Rs. 100 each, as local allowances for the Chief Electrician and his senior Assistant, the Personal Assistant to the Director-General, and the Assistant to the Chief Engineer.	
Assistant Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.	18	250—25—450	Rs. 50 as local allowance for the Junior Asssistant Electrician.	
		500—35—850 (Provincial Service) 21 appointments.		
One officer of the Royal Engineers for work in connection with the Wireless Telegraph Stations in India.	1	*	- - - - - -	*On scale of pay admissible to Royal Engineer Officers employed in the Public Works Department.
Superintendent of Telegraph Workshops.	1	700—50—1,250		
Chief Storekeeper - - - -	1	600—40—800		
Deputy Superintendent, Telegraph Engineering.	8	400—25—500	Rs. 50 each, as local allowances for the Personal Assistants to the three Directors, Telegraph Engineering, and the Postmaster-General, Burma Circle.	
" " "	16	325—15—400		
" " "	34	250—15—325		
" " "	1	400—25—500		
Deputy Superintendent, Technical -	2	325—15—400		
" " " -	4	250—15—325		
" " " -				
Traffic Branch.				
Deputy Director-General, Telegraph Traffic.	1	1,750—50—2,000		
Deputy Postmasters - General, Traffic.	2	1,200—40—1,400		
Superintendent(s), Calcutta, Bombay, and Madras Offices.	4	1,000		
Assistant Director-General, Telegraph Traffic.	6	800	Rs. 150, as local allowance for the Assistant Director-General, Telegraph Traffic.	
Assistant to the Deputy Director-General, Telegraph Traffic - -	27	250—15—400, 400—20—600.	Rs. 100, as local allowance for Assistant to the Deputy Director-General, Telegraph Traffic.	
Superintendent(s), Agra, Karachi, Rangoon, Lahore, and Delhi offices - - - - -				
Superintendent(s) of Post Offices, Traffic, in offices of Postmasters-General - - - - -				
Assistant Superintendent(s), Calcutta and Bombay offices - -				
Deputy Superintendents of Telegraphs, Traffic in other offices not named above.	8	400—25—500		
" " "	16	325—15—400		
" " "	27	250—15—325		

APPENDIX II.

(*Referred to in paragraph* 75,187—*Mr. Maxwell's Evidence.*)

EXTRACT from THE GAZETTE OF INDIA, dated September 20th, 1913, regarding the POST OFFICE GUARANTEE FUND.

The Hon'ble Mr. Abbott asked :—

Is there a fund termed "The Guaranteed Fund" accumulated from the earnings of the employees of the Postal Department?

"Will the Government be pleased to state what the present value of this Fund is?

"Is it a fact that it has become so unwieldy, that a new Fund has had to be opened to divert some of the accumulations for the better handling of the same?

"Will Government kindly say what it is proposed to do with this sum of money?

"Will the Government kindly say if to its knowledge a similar Fund exists in any other country in the world?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Clark replied :—

Owing to the length of the answer to this question, the information required is laid on the table in the form of a statement :—

(1) There is a Fund called the "Post Office Guarantee Fund" which was started on the 1st January 1883 with the sanction of the Government of India. The following subscriptions were required to be paid by persons employed by the Post Office in appointments below the grade of Deputy Postmaster-General :—

(i) By superior servants excluding postmen and village postmen—the sum of one rupee half-yearly.

(ii) By postmen or village postmen, whether superior or inferior servants, and by inferior servants drawing monthly salaries of more than Rs. 5 (subsequently raised to Rs. 7)—the sum of eight annas half-yearly.

(iii) By inferior servants drawing monthly salaries of Rs. 5 (subsequently raised to Rs. 7) and less, and by any person receiving allowances of Rs. 5 (subsequently raised to Rs. 7) and less from the Post Office, —the sum of four annas half-yearly.

These rates of subscriptions were reduced by one-half in 1894 and the collection of subscriptions to the Fund has been suspended altogether since 1905. Thus a large proportion of the officials now in the service of the Post Office have never subscribed to the Fund.

This Fund took the place of another Fund known as the "Post Office Security Fund," which was established on the 1st April 1873. The latter was of the nature of a Departmental Mutual Society and provided for the realization of enforced subscriptions from persons in the employ of the Post Office, in lieu of the Security which they had previously been required to furnish. Subscriptions from the pensionable class were returnable on resignation or death of subscribers in the proportion borne by the surplus income to the total income of the Fund, but subscriptions from the non-pensionable class were not returnable at all.

Having regard to the serious pecuniary responsibilities devolving on postal employés owing to the introduction of the insurance, money order, value-payable and Savings Bank branches of business, it was decided, in December 1882, *that the return of subsequently paid subscriptions should be stopped.* This necessitated the institution of the Guarantee Fund on the 1st January 1883.

(2) The balance of the Guarantee Fund on the 31st March 1913 was Rs. 11,09,372-8-0. Of this sum Rs. 7,82,300 was held in Government Securities, the market value of which on that date was Rs. 7,46,118-10-0.

(3) The Fund, which was started in 1873, was replaced by the Post Office Guarantee Fund in 1883 as explained in paragraph 1, but not for the reasons given in the question. The Guarantee Fund has not become unwieldy nor has any new Fund been opened.

(4) The proceeds of the Fund were originally intended to be applied to the making good, up to a prescribed limit, of losses caused to Government by the neglect or misconduct of any person in the employ of the Post Office and to the cost of keeping the accounts of the Fund. The limits referred to were, at first, Rs. 1,500 in the case of "Superior" servants and Rs. 750 in the case of "Inferior" servants, but these were subsequently increased to Rs. 3,000 and Rs. 1,500 respectively. In view of the prosperous condition of the Fund, it was decided, from time to time, to allow the proceeds to be utilized also for other objects, namely :—

(i) The payment of rewards for furnishing information in Post Office robbery cases, and for specially honest and courageous service on the part of any persons in the employ of the Post Office while in the discharge of their duties.

(ii) The grant of compensation (not exceeding one month's pay) to servants of the Post Office for loss of their private property.

(iii) The payment to certain classes of officials of the Post Office of the actual travelling expenses incurred by them in their journeys to the head-quarters of the district in which they are stationed to be examined by the Civil Surgeon for Postal Life Insurance.

(iv) The payment of rewards to the subordinate staff of the Simla-Kalka line (now abolished).

(v) The payment of gratuities in very special circumstances, to the families of deserving Post Office servants left in indigent circumstances by the premature death of the individuals upon whom they depend for their support, and to Post Office officials who are, owing to no fault of their own, physically or mentally incapacitated for further service before they have earned pension. During the current year the sum of Rs. 3,733 has been already sanctioned on this account.

It is not proposed, at present, to utilize the money for purposes other than those mentioned.

(5) It is not known whether a similar Fund exists in any other country.

APPENDIX III.

LETTER from the DIRECTOR-GENERAL of POSTS and TELEGRAPHS to the JOINT SECRETARIES, ROYAL COMMISSION on the PUBLIC SERVICES in INDIA, No. 168 P.G., dated Calcutta, 11th March 1914, regarding the POST OFFICE GUARANTEE FUND.

GENTLEMEN,

WITH reference to the accompanying extracts* from the Memorandum submitted to the Royal Commission on the Public Services in India on behalf of the Superintendents and Gazetted Postmasters of the Indian Post Office, I have the honour to append for the information of the Commission a copy of Rule 5 of the rules relating to the Post Office Guarantee Fund, which describes the purposes to which the interest of the fund is applied.

2. It will be seen from clause (c) of paragraph II. of the rule that the total amount placed each year at

* Paragraphs 75,222 and 75,231.

APPENDIX III. (*continued*).

ay disposal for the purpose mentioned therein has itherto been limited to 25 per cent. of the surplus of he fund for the preceding year. This limit has now een raised by the Government of India, at my instance, o 75 per cent. of the surplus in question, as will be een from the copy of the correspondence on the subject hich I send herewith. It is anticipated that with this change the annual unexpended balance of the income of the fund will be reduced to a comparatively small amount. I have thought it right to bring the matter to your notice in case the information might be of use.

I have, &c.,
W. MAXWELL,
Director-General.

ENCLOSURES IN ABOVE.

(*i*) *Rule 5 of the Post Office Guarantee Fund.*

5. *Purposes to which Fund may be applied.*—This Fund shall be applied in the first place to the purpose of making good any loss that may be caused to Government by the neglect or misconduct of any person in the employ of the Post Office, provided that the sum that may be decreed against the Fund on this account by the Director-General of the Post Office shall not exceed Rs. 3,000 in the case of a superior servant, or Rs. 1,500 in the case of an inferior servant or of a postman or village postman.

II. The Fund shall then be applied to the purpose—

(*a*) of meeting the cost of keeping the accounts of the Fund;

(*b*) of paying rewards that may be granted from time to time for the giving of information in Post Office robbery cases and for specially honest and courageous service on the part of any persons in the employ of the Post Office while in discharge of their duties;

(*c*) of granting compensation to servants of the Post Office for loss of their private property, subject to the condition that not more than one month's pay may be awarded to any officer;

(*d*) of paying, to certain classes of officials of the Post Office, the actual travelling expenses incurred by them in the journey to the head-quarters of the district in which they are stationed to be examined by the Civil Surgeon for Postal Life Insurance (*see* rule 2A of the subsidiary rules in Appendix No. 17 of the *Post Office Manual*, Volume V.); and

(*e*) of paying gratuities, in very special circumstances, to the families of deserving Post Office servants left in indigent circumstances by the premature death of the individuals upon whom they depend for support and to Post Office officials who are, owing to no fault of their own, physically or mentally incapacitated for further service before they have earned pension, subject to the conditions that in no single case shall the gratuity exceed Rs. 500 and, that the total amount of the gratuity sanctioned in any one year shall not exceed 25 per cent. of the surplus of the Fund of the preceding year.

III. The balance of the Fund, after meeting the aforesaid charges, at the close of the official year may be spent, with the sanction of Government, for the benefit of the persons in the employ of the Post Office who subscribe to it.

(ii) *Copy of a communication from the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, To the Secretary to the Government of India, Department of Commerce and Industry, No.* 309, *C.F.R., dated* 21*st January* 1914.

With reference to the correspondence ending with Mr. Rainy's letter No. 9705–265, dated the 23rd October 1908, I have the honour to submit, for the favour of consideration and orders of Government, a proposal to increase the limit of the amount which is placed annually at my disposal out of the surplus of the Post Office Guarantee Fund for the grant, in very special circumstances, of compassionate gratuities to deserving postal officials or their families.

2. At present, the amount placed at my disposal each year is limited to a sum equal to 25 per cent. of the surplus of the Post Office Guarantee Fund for the preceding year, and as the surplus of the Post Office Guarantee Fund for last year was Rs. 17,471, the sum allotted to me during the current year was Rs. 4,367.

3. In spite of a strict observance of the prescribed conditions, the claims on the allotment for the current year were so numerous that I was obliged to sanction smaller compassionate gratuities than would otherwise have been justifiable. Nevertheless, the allotment for the current year was practically exhausted on the 6th November 1913 by which date the balance available was reduced to Rs. 5. I append a statement *marked A* giving details of the cases in which gratuities were sanctioned up to that date. Since then, I have received other applications for gratuity, details of which are given in the accompanying statement *marked B*, which cannot be dealt with at present for want of funds.

4. During the last three years, the average annual surplus of the Post Office Guarantee Fund amounted to Rs. 19,771 the unexpended balance of that surplus averaging Rs. 16,375 and by the 31st March 1913, the balance of the Fund itself rose to Rs. 11,09,373. The staff of the Post Office on that date consisted of over 92,000* men and in so large an establishment, it is inevitable that there will always be a considerable number of cases of real hardship caused by the death of the bread-winner of a family for which provision has to be made from the sum placed at my disposal, and I find that the amount is now insufficient to enable me to give assistance in all the really deserving cases.

5. In this connection, I would draw attention to the fact that, in the Memorandum submitted to the Public Services Commission by Superintendents of Post Offices and Postmasters, it has been represented as a grievance that the amount from the Post Office Guarantee Fund which is expended for the benefit of postal officials is disproportionate to the amount of the surplus of that Fund. In my opinion, the relief of distress amongst deserving postal officials or their families is the best object to which the surplus of the Fund could be devoted.

6. I beg, therefore, to ask that Government may be pleased to sanction the limit of the allotment in question being raised from 25 to 75 per cent of the surplus of the Guarantee Fund for the preceding year, or to 50 per cent. of that surplus, should Government consider that a smaller proportion than 75 per cent. will suffice for the present; and that the increased grant may be allowed for the current year.

(iii) *Letter from G. S. Hardy, Esq., B.A., I.C.S., Officiating Under Secretary to the Government of India, To the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, No.* 1001–11–*C., Government of India, Department of Commerce and Industry (Post Office), Delhi, dated the* 20*th February* 1914.

In reply to your letter No. 309, C.F.R., dated the 21st January 1914, and in modification of the orders contained in Mr. Rainy's letter No. 9705–265, dated the 23rd October 1908, I am directed to say that the Government of India are pleased to raise, with effect from the current financial year, the limit of the amount which may be expended by you annually out of the Post Office Guarantee Fund on the grant of compassionate gratuities to deserving postal officials or their families, from 25 per cent. to 75 per cent. of the surplus of that Fund for the preceding year.

* Actually 92,870.

APPENDIX IV.

STATEMENT of the CIVIL APPOINTMENTS on Rs. 200 a Month and over held by EUROPEANS, ANGLO-INDIANS, and INDIANS on the 1st April 1913, in the POST OFFICE of INDIA.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.														
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).											
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs, and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	123	36	18	16	8	9	2	1	4	40	2	5	47	20	2	—
300—400	64	18	8	14	4	4	—	2	1	25	—	4	29	6	3	—
400—500	44	20	4	4	2	4	—	1	2	13	—	4	17	3	—	—
500—600	16	6	7	—	1	1	—	—	1	3	—	—	3	—	—	—
600—700	2	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
700—800	1	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
800—900	5	3	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	1	—	—
1,000—1,200	8	8	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,400—1,600	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	5	5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,800—2,000	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
3,000—3,500	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	277	106	39	35	15	18	2	4	8	82	2	13	97	30	5	—

APPENDIX V.

STATEMENT of the CIVIL APPOINTMENTS on Rs. 200 a Month and over held by EUROPEANS, ANGLO-INDIANS, and INDIANS on the 1st April 1913, in the TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT.

Pay.	Number of Employés in each Grade or Class.														
				Hindus (including Sikhs and Parsis).											
	Total.	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians.	Brahmans (including Shenvis).	Kshatryas.	Kaiyasthas (including Prabhus).	Baniyas and Vaisyas.	Sudras.	Other Hindus (*i.e.*, other than those shown in cols. 5 to 9).	Total Hindus (cols. 5 to 10).	Sikhs.	Parsis.	Total Hindus, Sikhs, and Parsis (cols. 11 to 13).	Muhammadans.	Indian Christians.	Buddhists.
1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	9.	10.	11.	12.	13.	14.	15.	16.	17.
Rs.																
200—300	474	70	366	9	1	10	1	3	4	28	1	1	30	5	3	—
300—400	78	16	53	3	1	1	—	1	1	7	1	—	8	1	—	—
400—500	24	5	14	3	1	1	—	—	—	5	—	—	5	—	—	—
500—600	9	1	7	1	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
600—700	13	9	—	2	—	—	—	1	—	3	1	—	4	—	—	—
700—800	11	10	—	—	—	1	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
800—900	13	12	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	1	—	—	1	—	—	—
900—1,000	5	4	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,000—1,200	13	12	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—	1	—	—	—
1,200—1,400	13	12	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	1	—
1,400—1,600	3	3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
1,600—1,800	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
2,000—2,500	4	4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Total -	664	162	441	18	4	13	1	5	5	46	4	1	51	6	4	—

APPENDIX VI.

(Referred to in paragraph 75,152—Mr. Maxwell's Evidence.)

INDIAN TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT.—NOTICE REGARDING FUTURE RECRUITMENT.

There are at present no vacancies in the superior establishment of the Indian Telegraph Department, and it is considered unnecessary for the present to recruit any Assistant Superintendents from the United Kingdom.

The arrangements for the future recruitment of the Department, whenever necessary, have not yet been finally settled, but an extract from the Report of the Committee which inquired into the expediency of maintaining the Royal Indian Engineering College at Coopers Hill is appended for general information.

India Office,
April 1912.

EXTRACT FROM REPORT ABOVE REFERRED TO.

(Paragraphs 32–34.)

Paragraph 32. *Method of recruiting Engineers.*—First, as to the recruitment of Engineers (for the Public Works Department). Our recommendation is that the Secretary of State should, by advertisements in the public press, call for candidates having the following qualifications:—

(*a*) That their age does not exceed 24 years.

(*b*) That they have obtained a degree or diploma, or other distinction equivalent thereto, at some recognised and approved institution for engineering education.

(*c*) That they have had at least one year's subsequent experience as assistant in the preparation of the designs for, or in the execution of, some engineering work of importance.

(*d*) That they satisfy the usual requirements as to character and nationality.

Selection should be made from the candidates in such way as the Secretary of State may think fit, but we advise that the selection should be entrusted, subject to the final approval of the Secretary of State, to an Advisory Board of which at least one eminent representative of the engineering profession should be invited to become a member. The duty of the Board would be to select the best from amongst the candidates by examining their testimonials and distinctions, by personal interview, and by making such inquiries as to their history and character as might in their opinion be advisable.

Paragraph 33. *Same Method of recruiting for the Telegraph Department.*—The recommendations which have been made in the foregoing paragraph apply equally to the selection of officers for appointment to the Telegraph Department, except that these officers will be required to have spent at least one year as an electrical engineer or in other similar capacity.

Paragraph 34. *Selected Candidates to proceed at once to India.*—Candidates selected for appointment to the Public Works Department and the Telegraph Department should proceed immediately to India without undergoing any further training in this country.

17th August 1903.

APPENDIX VII.

OFFICIALS and NON-OFFICIALS who furnished WRITTEN EVIDENCE to the ROYAL COMMISSION in connection with their INQUIRY into the POST OFFICE OF INDIA and TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT, but who were not orally examined.

1. Munshi Shuja-ud-din Khan, Superintendent of Post Offices, 4th grade, Sind Sagar, near Jhelum.

2. J. A. H. Potter, Esq., 1st grade Sub-Assistant Superintendent, Indian Government Telegraph Department (retired).

3. The Representative Committee of Superintendents of Post Offices, Burma Circle (F. A. V. Sausman, Esq., Chairman, and six Superintendents of Post Offices, being a Representative Committee of Superintendents of Post Offices, Burma Circle).

4. E. A. Doran, Esq., Postmaster-General, Bombay.

5. A. C. Banerjee, Esq., Superintendent of Telegraphs, Nagpur Division.

6. Babu Motilal Ghosh, Editor of Amrita Bazar Patrika, Calcutta.

7. Krishan Rao, Esq., and 12 other members of the Signalling Establishment of the Indian Telegraph Department.

8. Nikku Ram, Esq., Officiating Superintendent of Post Offices, Gujrat Division, Punjab.

INDEX.

(The numbers refer to paragraphs.)

POST OFFICE OF INDIA AND TELEGRAPH DEPARTMENT.

A.

Administrative posts, Post Office, recruitment, method, *Maxwell*, 75,173; *Schöneman*, 75,336, 75,351.

Allowances (*see under* Leave and Pay).

Amalgamation of Post Office and Telegraph Department (*see under* Telegraph Department).

Anglo-Indians, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98

B.

Baniyas and Vaisyas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - p. 98

Brahmans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - - - - p. 98

Buddhists, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - - - - p. 98

C.

Captain, D. S., Clerici, C. J. E., and Murtrie, D. J., joint evidence - - - - 75,569–75,599

Charlu, P. A. Krishnama, evidence of (*see* Rodrigues, J. F., joint evidence).

Civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by Europeans, Anglo-Indians, and Indians on 1st April 1913 - - - - - - p. 98

Clerici, C. J. E., evidence of (*see* Captain, D. S., joint evidence).

Conditions of Service, Post Office:

House accommodation should be provided where necessary, *McMinn*, 75,216, 75,226, 75,238; *Hanson*, 75,375.

Improvements advocated, *Raha* - - - 75,368

Tents should be supplied where necessary and tentage allowed, *McMinn*, 75,216, 75,226; *Hanson*, 74,375.

Conditions of Service, Telegraph Department:

House accommodation, provision advocated, *Streatfeild-James*, 75,278, 75,288, 75,308; *Mitra*, 75,317; *Mayston*, 75,408; *Goodall*, 75,519; *Morgan*, 75,535; *Gibbs*, 75,615.

Particulars, *Maxwell*, 75,154; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,272; *Roy*, 75,431.

Same for all officers, whether recruited in England or India, advocated, *Mitra*, 75,312; *Morgan*, 75,530.

(*see also under* Upper Subordinate Service.)

D.

Deputy Inspectors-General, pay, scale advocated, *McMinn* - - - - - 75,217, 75,227

Deputy Postmasters-General, pay, scale advocated, *McMinn*, 75,217, 75,227; *Hanson*, 75,367.

Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs, Recruitment:

System, *Maxwell*, 75,206; *Hanson*, 75,382.

System advocated, *McMinn*, 75,248, 75,254; *Mayston*, 75,401.

E.

Europeans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98

F.

Fines, should be utilised for benefit of postal officials, *McMinn* - - - - - 75,222, 75,231

Fund (*see* Post Office Guarantee Fund *and* Provident Fund).

Furlough (*see under* Leave).

G.

Gibbs, R. T., evidence of - - 75,600–75,622

Goodall, H. C. A., evidence of - 75,508–75,527

Guarantee Fund (*see* Post Office Guarantee Fund).

H.

Hanson, R. W., Rae, C. D., and Raha, H. K., joint evidence - - - - - 75,367–75,394

Hindus, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98

House accommodation (*see under* Conditions of Service, Telegraph Department, *and under* Upper Subordinate Service, Telegraph Department).

I.

Imperial Service, Telegraph Department, Division of Department into Provincial Service and (*see under* Telegraph Department).

Indian Christians, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - p. 98

Indians:

Limitations in employment in Telegraph Department, *Maxwell*, 75,158; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,276; *Mitra*, 75,316; *Roy*, 75,435; *Morgan*, 75,534.

no Limitations in employment in subordinate service of Telegraph Department, *Walker* - - 75,490

no Limitations in employment in Post Office, and none needed, *Maxwell*, 75,149, 75,206; *McMinn*, 75,220; *Schöneman*, 75,332.

Telegraph Department not attractive to, *Roy* 75,456–7

(*see also* Recruitment, Telegraph Department.)

K.

Kaiyasthas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - - - - p. 98

Kshatryas, civil appointments on Rs. 200 and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - - - - - p. 98

L.

Leave, Post Office:

Allowances, increase advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,147, *Schöneman*, 75,330, 75,344, 75,351; *Hanson*, 75,388.

Cadre not large enough to allow men always to obtain leave to which entitled, *Schöneman* - 75,344

Earned, should be granted irrespective of when officer was last on leave, provided he can be spared, *McMinn* - - - - - 75,218–75,228

European service rules to officers drawing Rs. 500 and upwards advocated, *McMinn* - 75,218–752,28

Furlough, qualifying period, reduction advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,147; *Hanson*, 75,389.

PRIVILEGE:

Cumulative period, extension advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,147; *McMinn*, 75,218, 75,228.

45 days on 10½ months' service:

Advocated, *McMinn*, 75,218, 75,228, 75,243; *Vaughan*, 75,262.

not Justified, *Hanson* - - 75,367, 75,379

Three years' furlough, leave on medical certificate or on private affairs spent in India should count as service for pension, *McMinn* - 75,218, 75,228

Leave, Telegraph Department:

Abolition of minimum limit of combined leave advocated, *Mitra* - - - - - 75,314

Allowances inadequate, and increase advocated, *Streatfeild-James*, 75,274, 75,307; *Mitra*, 75,314 *Shields*, 75,404.

Leave, Telegraph Department—*continued.*
Counting towards pension, should be no difference between periods spent in and out of India, *Mitra* 75,314
Earned, should be granted irrespective of when officer was last on leave, provided he can be spared, *Streatfeild-James* - - 75,274, 75,286, 75,300
Furlough, commutation of period on half pay to half period on full pay advocated, *Mitra*, 75,314; *Morgan*, 75,541.
Furlough, reduction in qualifying period advocated, *Roy* - - - - - - - - 75,433
PRIVILEGE:
Cumulative period, extension advocated, *Streatfeild-James*, 75,274, 75,286, 75,300; *Mitra*, 75,314; *Shields*, 75,404; *Morgan*, 75,532.
Restriction under which officer cannot retire within 3 months of taking, without forfeiting, should be removed, *Streatfeild-James* - 75,274, 75,286
Retrospective effect should be given to any improvements which may be granted, *Streatfeild-James* 75,278
Study, advocated, *Roy*, 75,433, 75,446; *Goodall*, 75,511, 75,522, 75,524; *Gibbs*, 75,607.
(*see also under* Upper Subordinate Service.)

M.

McMinn, C. H., Sinclair, S. C., and Sri Ram, joint evidence of - - - - - - 75,213–75,258

Maxwell, W., C.I.E., M.V.O., evidence of 75,144–75,212

Mayston, H., and Shields, J. C., joint evidence of 75,395–75,427

Medical attendance to families, and scale of fees advocated, *Roy* - - - - - 75,437, 75,449

Mitra, P. N., evidence of - - - 75,310–75,325

Morgan, J. G., evidence of - - 75,528–75,549

Muhammadans, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - - - p. 98

Murtrie, D. J., evidence of (*see* Captain, D. S., joint evidence).

P.

Parsis, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over, held by, 1st April 1913 - - - - p. 98

Pay, Post Office:
Daily, or halting allowance, increase advocated, *McMinn*, 75,216, 75,226, 75,238, 75,249–50; *Hanson*, 75,375; *Captain*, 75,575; *Murtrie*, 75,587.
Rates, *Maxwell*, 75,146; *Schöneman*, 75,328.
Scale advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,145, 75,175–8, 75,183, 75,211; *McMinn*, 75,217, 75,239–42, 75,258; *Schöneman*, 75,328; *Raha*, 75,368; *Hanson*, 75,376, 75,377; *Rae*, 75,376; *Charlu*, 75,556, 75,559, 75,565–8; *Rodrigues*, 75,557, 75,559, 75,566, 75,568; *Captain*, 75,577, 75,579, 75,581; *Murtrie*, 75,578, 75,580
TRAVELLING ALLOWANCES:
Increase advocated, *McMinn*, 75,216, 75,226; *Hanson*, 75,375; *Charlu*, 75,555; *Murtrie*, 75,587.
on Transfer, inadequate and increase advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,151, 75179, 75,191; *McMinn*, 75,216, 75,226, 75,238; *Hanson*, 75,375; *Rodrigues*, 75 555.
(*see also under particular appointments, and under* Leave Allowances *and* Superintendents.)

Pay, Telegraph Department:
Daily allowance, rule that officers must be absent eight hours before drawing, removal advocated, *Streatfeild-James* - - - - - 75,278
no Justification for same scale of pay for European-recruited and for Indian-recruited men, *Gibbs* 75,611, 75,617–9
Scale advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,155; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,273, 75,292, 75,294, 75,298–9; *Mitra*, 75,313, 75,320; *Mayston*, 75,401–2; *Shields*, 75,401–2, 75,422; *Roy*, 75,432, 75,443–4, 75,447, 75,452, 75,454; *Morgan*, 75,531, 75,537, 75,543–9; *Goodall*, 75,512–3, 75,608–9.

Pay, Telegraph Department—*continued.*
Temporary service should be allowed to count in seniority, *Shields* - - - - - 75,426–7
TRAVELLING ALLOWANCES:
should be Permissible to officers returning from long leave, *Mitra* - - - - - 75,317
on Transfer, inadequate and increase advocated, *Streatfeild-James*, 75,278, 75,289; *Mitra*, 75,317, 75,321, 75,325; *Shields*, 75,409; *Roy*, 75,460; *Goodall*, 75,520; *Morgan*, 75,535, 75,542.
(*see also under* Leave Allowances, *and under* Upper Subordinate Service.)

Pensions, Post Office:
Abolition and substitution of system of deferred pay advocated, *Maxwell* - - - - - 75,148
Commutation of one quarter for lump sum unconditionally advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,148, 75,200, 75,210; *McMinn*, 75,219, 75,229; *Schöneman*, 75,331, 75,346, 75,348, 75,361.
Regulation that period during which an officer officiates for another officer absent on privilege leave is not permitted to count as service qualifying for additional pension should be abolished, *Maxwell* 75,148, 75,201, 75,229
Scale and qualifying periods advocated, *McMinn*, 75,219, 75,229; *Schöneman*, 75,331, 75,345; *Hanson*, 75,380; *Charlu*, 75,558; *Rodrigues*, 75,558.

Pensions, Telegraph Department:
Commutation of one quarter for lump sum unconditionally advocated, *Streatfeild-James*, 75,275, 75,287, 75,290, 75,301; *Mayston*, 75,407; *Shields*, 75,401, 75,423; *Goodall*, 75,518, 75,523; *Gibbs*, 75,616.
Commutation for benefit of families advocated, *Mitra* - - - - - 75,315, 75,321
Retrospective effect should be given to any improvements which may be granted, *Streatfeild-James* 75,278
Scale and qualifying periods advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,157; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,275, 75,287; *Mitra*, 75,315; *Shields*, 75,405; *Mayston*, 75,406; *Roy*, 75,434, 75,448; *Goodall*, 75,516–7; *Morgan*, 75,533; *Gibbs*, 75,613–4.
(*see also under* Upper Subordinate Service.)

Postmaster-General:
Competition of Telegraph Department with Post Office for appointments, *Hanson*, 75,382; *Gibbs*, 75,622.
Living five months in hills one of the attractions of service, *Maxwell* - - - - - 75,189
PAY:
Revised scale on amalgamation of Telegraph Department and Post Office - - - p. 92
Scale advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,146; *Hanson*, 75,367.
Recruitment, method, *Schöneman* - 75,351, 75,364

Postmasters:
Appointments not popular with Indians, *Maxwell* 75,196
Functions, *Maxwell*, 75,165; *Vaughan*, 75,261.
Leave, special treatment claimed on ground of having to work on Sundays and holidays, *Rae*, 75,379; *Rodrigues*, 75,560; *Captain*, 75,582; *Murtrie*, 75,582.
PAY:
Rates, *Maxwell*, 75,146; *Schöneman*, 75,343.
Scale advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,146; *McMinn*, 75,217, 75,227; *Vaughan*, 75,260; *Captain*, 75,595.
Preponderance of Anglo-Indians and Europeans in higher grades, *Maxwell* - - 75,166, 75,171
Probation and Training, system, *Captain* - 75,572
Prospects, and higher appointments desired and interchangeability with superintendents advocated, *Vaughan* - - - - - 75,261, 75,264–6
RECRUITMENT:
Method, *Maxwell*, 75,144, 75,164; *Vaughan*, 75,260; *Rae*, 75,390; *Raha*, 75,391; *Captain*, 75,570, 75,589.
Method advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,164; *McMinn*, 75,214; *Captain*, 75,570–1, 75,599; *Vaughan*, 75,570, 75,599; *Clerici*, 75,599.

Post Office:
Amalgamation with Telegraph Department (*see under* Telegraph Department).
Constitution, *Maxwell* - - - - - 75,163
Relations with I.C.S. and other Services, *Maxwell*, 75,150; *McMinn*, 75,221, 75,230, 75,246, 75,248; *Schöneman*, 75,333.
Service not popular, *Sri Ram* - - - 75,257
Statement showing growth between 1886–7 and 1912–13 - - - - - - - p. 19–20
Sunday duty, compensation should be given for, *Maxwell* - - - - - - 75,203

Post Office Guarantee Fund:
Calls on, lessening, *Murtrie*, 75,599; *Clerici*, 75,599.
Extract from "Gazette of India" regarding - p. 96
Handing of fines over to Committee, advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,205; *Rodrigues*, 75,561.
Interest should be utilised for benefit of postal officials, *McMinn* - - - - - 75,222
Management, schemes, *Hanson*, 75,393; *Murtrie*, 75,599.
MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE:
Advocated, *McMinn* - - - 75,231, 75,247
not Advocated, *Vaughan* - - 75,263, 75,267
no Great desire for, *Maxwell* - - 75,204
Objects and history, *Maxwell*, 75,188; *McMinn*, 75,231; *Vaughan*, 75,268; *Captain*, 75,584; *Murtrie*, 75,584.
Recovery of money losses should be left to discretion of Director General, *Vaughan* - - - 75,264
Rules - - - - - - - - - p. 97
Statement showing transactions, 1912–13 - p. 20

Probation and Training, Post Office:
System, *Maxwell*, 75,145, 75,198; *Schöneman*, 75,327.
System advocated, *McMinn* - - 75,215, 75,225
(*see also under particular appointments, and under* Superintendents.)

Probation and Training, Telegraph Department, system advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,152, 75,186; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,271, 75,283, 75,297; *Mitra*, 75,311; *Roy*, 75,430; *Morgan*, 75,529.
(*see also under* Upper Subordinate Service.)

Provident fund:
no Complaint among officers who had to subscribe, *Vaughan* - - - - - - - 75,263
Compulsory for all new entrants, *Hanson* - 75,381
Interest, higher rate advocated, *Roy* - - 75,437
Subscription optional, *Schöneman* - - - 75,347
Subscription compulsory for Europeans, but optional for Indians, *Captain* - - - - - 75,583

Provincial Service, Telegraph Department:
Analogy with Provincial Services of Public Works Department and Railways, *Mitra* - - 75,317
Suggested abolition of, and re-organisation of superior staff, *Mitra* - - - - 75,310, 75,316
Division of Department into Imperial Service and (*see under* Telegraph Department).

R.

Rae, C. D., evidence of (*see* Hanson, R. W., joint evidence).

Raha, H. K., evidence of (*see* Hanson, R. W., joint evidence).

Recruitment, Post Office:
Anglo-Indians and domiciled Europeans not as good class as formerly, *Schöneman* - - 75,352
of Indian Civil Service officers, method, *Maxwell* 75,174
Indians, proportion larger than formerly, *Raha* 75,392
Method, *Maxwell*, 75,144; *Schöneman*, 75,326.
System advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,197; *McMinn*, 75,214; *Hanson*, 75,367, 75,370, 75,374–5, 75,385; *Raha*, 75,368, 75,370, 75,374, 75,385–6, 75,394; *Murtrie*, 75,574; *Captain*, 75,574, 75,590–1, 75,593.
(*see also under particular appointments, and under* Superintendents.)

Recruitment, Telegraph Department:
Method, *Maxwell* - - - - - - 75,152
Notice regarding future recruitment - - p. 99
System advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,152, 75,161–2, 75,174, 75,180–2, 75,184–5, 75,207, 75,209, 75,212; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,270, 75,281–2, 75,284–5, 75,291, 75,295–6, 75,302–6; *Mitra*, 75,310, 75,319, 75,322–5; *Mayston*, 75,396–7, 75,411, 75,413, 75,418–20; *Shields*, 75,396, 75,398–400, 75,412, 75,414, 75,416, 75,421; *Roy*, 75,429, 75,435, 75,441–2, 75,445, 75,451; *Walker*, 75,504–6; *Goodall*, 75,509–10, 75,521, 75,525; *Morgan*, 75,528, 75,538–40; *Gibbs*, 75,603–6, 75,617, 75,620–1.
(*see also under* Upper Subordinate Service.)

Reorganisation of Superior Staff (*see under* Provincial Service, Telegraph Department).

Rodrigues, J. F., and **P. A. Krishnama Charlu,** joint evidence - - - - - - 75,550–75,568

Roy, G. P., M.I.E.E., evidence of - 75,428–75,464

S.

Salary (*see* Pay).

Schöneman, G. W., evidence of - 75,326–75,366

Shields, J. C., evidence of (*see* Mayston, H., joint evidence).

Sikhs, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - - - - p. 98

Sinclair, S. C., evidence of (*see* McMinn, C. H., joint evidence).

Sri Ram, evidence of (*see* McMinn, C. H., joint evidence).

Streatfeild-James, C., M.I.E.E., and **Thomas, I. C.,** M.V.O., M.I.E.E., joint evidence - 75,269–75,309

Sudras, civil appointments on Rs. 200 a month and over held by, 1st April 1913 - - - - p. 98

Superintendents, Post Office:
Functions, *Maxwell*, 75,165, 75,192, 75,208; *Vaughan*, 75,261.
INTERCHANGEABILITY WITH POSTMASTERS:
Advocated, *Rae*, 75,383; *Murtrie*, 75,585–6.
not Advocated, *Hanson*, 75,383; *Captain*, 75,585, 75,588, 75,598; *Clerici*, 75,585.
Question of, *Rodrigues*, 75,563; *Charlu*, 75,563.
no Rule prohibiting, but in practice kept separate, *Captain* - - - - - - 75,592
PAY:
Rates, *McMinn*, 75,227; *Schöneman*, 75,328.
Scale advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,146; *McMinn*, 75,217, 75,227; *Schöneman*, 75,328, 75,341–2, 75,354, 75,363, 75,366; *Hanson*, 75,367, 75,378; *Raha*, 75,378; *Captain*, 75,595.
PROBATION AND TRAINING:
All-India list:
Advocated, *Sinclair*, 75,235; *Clerici*, 75,573.
not Advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,172; *Sri Ram*, 75,253; *Schöneman*, 75,339, 75,360; *Charlu*, 75,553; *Captain*, 75,573.
not Important point from Superintendents' point of view, *Hanson* - - - 75,373
System, *Maxwell*, 75,145; *Schöneman*, 75,327, 75,365; *Hanson*, 75,371.
System advocated, *Schöneman*, 75,327, 75,338, 75,349; *Hanson*, 75,371.
RECRUITMENT:
Anglo-Indians, system advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,168; *McMinn*, 75,236, 75,251.
Indians:
Method and proportion, *Maxwell* 75,144, 75,169
System advocated, *McMinn* - - - 75,214
Method, *Maxwell*, 75,144, 75,167, 75,170, 75,190, 75,193–4; *McMinn*, 75,234, 75,252; *Schöneman*, 75,326, 75,357–9, 75,362.
System advocated, *Maxwell*, 75,144, 75,206; *McMinn*, 75,214, 75,224, 75,234, 75,236–7, *Schöneman*, 75,326, 75,340; *Hanson*, 75,372; *Rodrigues*, 75,551–2, 75,554, 75,564; *Charlu*, 75,551–2, 75,554, 75,562; *Captain*, 75,599; *Murtrie*, 75,599; *Clerici*, 75,599.
10 per cent. reserved for non-domiciled Europeans, *Schöneman*, 75,355; *Captain*, 75,597.

T.

Telegraph Department:

AMALGAMATION WITH POST OFFICE:
- Accounts and budget allotments, proposal - p. 84
- would not Affect Post Office injuriously, *Hanson* - 75,384
- Clerical and menial establishments, proposal, and scheme adopted - - - p. 84–6, 93–4
- Correspondence relating to scheme - p. 64–95
- Date of effect and provisional arrangements, proposal - - - - - - - p. 86–7
- Designation and headquarters of revised staff, proposals, and scheme adopted - p. 73–4, 94
- Effect - - - - - - - p. 68–9
- Engineering staff and duties, proposals, and scheme adopted - - - p. 69–72, 91, 92
- Experimental amalgamation in Bombay and Central circles, general opinion - - - p. 68
- Financial effect of proposals - - - p. 87
- General features and advantages - - p. 69
- Head should be Indian Civil Service officer, *Walker* 75,501, 75,507
- Increase in efficiency doubted, *Shields*, 75,425; *Roy*, 75,429, 75,450.
- Pay and allowances, proposals, and scheme adopted p. 74–9, 93
- Points of difference from experimental arrangements in Bombay and Central circles - p. 69
- Powers, proposal - - - - - p. 83–4
- Probable effect on engineering and traffic branches, *Gibbs* - - - - - - - 75,601–2
- Recruitment and training, proposals, and scheme adopted - - - - - - p. 79–81, 93
- Redistribution of clerical and menial establishments, scheme - - - - p. 93–4
- Reduction of existing staff, proposal, and scheme adopted - - - - p. 82–3, 92–3
- Special additional pensions, proposal, and scheme adopted - - - - - - p. 83, 94
- Statement showing ultimate cost - p. 87–9
- Statement showing designation of, and other particulars relating to appointments of officers to be employed exclusively on telegraph work p. 95
- Summary of details of proposed organisation, and scheme adopted - - - p. 64–8, 91–92
- Telegraph Department will lose by, *Roy* 75,458–9, 75,463–4
- Traffic, staff and duties, proposal, and scheme adopted - - - - - p. 72–3, 91–2
- Utilisation of existing staff, proposal - p. 81–2

DIVISION INTO IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL:
- Abolition advocated, *Mitra*, 75,316; *Morgan*, 75,534.
- Dissatisfaction in Provincial Service, and solution would be to advantage of department, *Walker*, 75,490, 75,500; *Goodall*, 75,514, 75,526
- no Friction in department owing to, but certain amount of discontent among Provincial men, *Shields* - - - - - - - 75,403
- Maintenance advocated, *Streatfeild-James* - 75,276

Relations with I.C.S. and other services, *Maxwell*, 75,159; *Streatfeild-James*, 75,277; *Goodall*, 75,527.

Transfers, reduction in number advocated, *Thurley*, 75,467; *Walker*, 75,492.

Thomas, I. C., M.V.O., M.I.E.E., evidence of (*see* Streat feild-James, C., M.I.E.E., joint evidence).

Thurley, J. W., evidence of - - - 75,465–75,481

Training (*see* Probation and Training).

Travelling Allowances (*see under* Pay.)

U.

Upper Subordinate Service, Telegraph Department:
Cadre, divisions and increments, *Walker* - 75,496

CONDITIONS OF SERVICE:
- Disadvantages, and improvements advocated, *Thurley*, 75,467; *Walker*, 75,486.
- Exclusion from advancement to Superior Service, hardship of, *Thurley*, 75,467, 75,480; *Walker*, 75,486, 75,497–9, 75,503.

LEAVE:
- Combined, should be allowed for any period, *Walker* - - - - - - - 75,488
- Privilege:
  - Cumulative period, extension advocated, *Walker* 75,488
  - Restriction requiring interval of six months between two periods should be removed, *Thurley* - - - - - - 75,469
  - Special conditions of service should ensure special privileges, *Thurley*, 75,469, 75,478; *Walker*, 75,488.
- Study, advocated, *Walker* - - - - 75,488

PAY:
- House rent allowance inadequate, and increase advocated, and should be given in all cases where free quarters are not available, *Thurley*, 75,468; *Walker*, 75,486.
- Presidency allowance should be granted to all grades, *Thurley* - - - - - 75,468
- Rates, *Walker* - - - - - - 75,487
- Scale advocated, *Thurley*, 75,468, 75,474–5, 75,479; *Walker*, 75,487.
- Travelling allowance on transfer, increase advocated, *Thurley*, 75,467; *Walker*, 75,486.

PENSIONS:
- Commutation of lump sum for families advocated, *Walker* - - - - - - - - 75,489
- Scale and qualifying periods advocated. *Thurley*, 75,470; *Walker*, 75,489.

Probation and training, system advocated, *Thurley*, 75,466, 75,476; *Walker*, 75,485, 74,494.

RECRUITMENT:
- Method, *Shields*, 75,415, 75,424; *Thurley*, 75,465, 75,472; *Walker*, 75,484.
- System advocated, *Thurley*, 75,465, 75,473; *Walker*, 75,484, 75,494–5.

Relations with other services, *Walker* - - 75,491

V.

Vaughan, N. W., evidence of - - 75,259–75,268

W.

Walker, R. G., evidence of - - 75,482–75,507

00109141

Digitized with financial assistance from
Government of Maharashtra
on 13 March, 2020